PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

OF THE

PUNJAB

1919

(WITH INDEX)

Volume X

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMB... LIB. ARY
LAHORE.



Lahore :
PRINTED BY THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.
1920.

CONTENTS.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 6TH FEBRUARY 1919.

	Page.
Oath of office ...	2
Resolution of sympathy to their Imperial Majesties the King-Emperor and Queen Empress in the bereavement sustained in the death of their youngest son Prince John of Windsor ...	2—4
Tribute to the late Hon'ble Mr. James Currie ...	4
Questions and Answers ...	4—22
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ...	22—25
District Boards Act Amendment Bill ...	25—27
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ...	27—36
Punjab Adulteration of Food Bill ...	36—38
Resolution *re* meeting of three-fourths of Educational Expenditure from Provincial Revenues ...	39—46
Resolution *re* meeting of three-fourths of Sanitary Expenditure from Provincial Revenues ...	47—49
Adjournment ...	49
Statement showing the number of students who commencing their education in Vernacular Schools, changed over to the Anglo-Vernacular Course during each of the last five years ...	50
„ showing the number of municipalities in the Punjab where the system of communal representation is in force	51
List of districts in the Punjab in which the system of registration of marriage has been introduced ...	52
Statement showing the salaries of the office establishment of the Financial Commissioners, Punjab ...	52-3
„ showing by religion the number of Deputy Postmasters-General, Superintendents and other subordinate officers of the Post Office ...	53
„ showing by religion the numbers of officers and other subordinate officials at present employed in the Forest Department, Punjab ...	54
„ showing by religion officials of Police Department ...	*ibid.*

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 7TH FEBRUARY 1919.

Punjab Primary Education Bill ...	55—96
Adjournment ...	96

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 7TH MARCH 1919.

Oath of Office ...	98
Papers laid on the table ...	*ibid.*
Questions and Answers ...	98—104
Amended Draft Financial Statement for 1919-20 ...	104—125
Adjournment ...	125
Statement showing the number of applications under section 41 (3) of the Punjab Courts Act during the five years 1914—18 ...	126
Statement showing the aggregate amount of increase in the expenditure on clerical staff due to its revision ...	127
Scale of fees to be charged in the private wards and Indian Family Wards of the Mayo Hospital ...	128
Memorandum by the Finance Member ...	129—168
Statement of reappropriations exceeding Rs. 10,000 which have been sanctioned by the Local Government since the beginning of the financial year ...	169

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 13TH MARCH 1919.

Papers laid on the table ...	171
Questions and Answers ...	172—86
Revised Financial Statement for 1919-20 ...	186—203
Resolution *re* allotment of 5 lakhs of rupees more to the expenditure already budgetted for sanitation, and a corresponding decrease under the heads 10, 11, 32 or 45 ...	207—16
Adjournment ...	216
Statement showing by religion the number of Tahsildars, Naib-Tahsildars and Superintendents of Deputy Commissioners' Vernacular Offices ...	217
„ showing results of the final examination of the Sub-Overseer class held by the Government School of Engineering at Rasul in the years 1916 to 1918 ...	217-18
„ showing the numerical strength of Ludhiana town by religion ...	219
Copy of Punjab Government Circular No. 32-76, dated 7th May 1897, *re* grant by District Boards of compensation for dearness of provisions ...	*ibid.*

	Page.
Statement showing by Divisions the number of Girls' Schools in the Province	220
„ showing the distribution of Inspectresses by Divisions ...	221
„ showing the number of Aided Secondary Schools for Indians in each Division of the Punjab ...	*ibid.*
„ showing the number of Private Recognized Secondary Schools for Indians in each Division of the Punjab ...	222
Percentage of the cost of carrying out the 5-year programmes for the expansion of Vernacular Education to be borne by Provincial Revenues ...	223
Proceedings of the 14th March 1919.	
Resolution *re* allotment of ten lakhs of rupees more to the expenditure already budgetted for 22—Education, and a corresponding decrease under heads 10, 11, 32 or 45 ...	226—44
Adjournment ...	244
Proceedings of the 7th April 1919.	
Oath of Office ...	246
Questions and Answers ...	246—57
Budget debate for 1919-20 ...	257—97
Adjournment ...	297
Rules regarding the private wards of Mayo Hospital ...	297
Copy of diet scale for Indian Patients in Mayo Hospital ...	298
Proceedings of a meeting held on 11th June 1918 of the Grain Compensation Allowance Committee ...	299-300
Memorandum ...	301—04
Proceedings of the 10th November 1919.	
Oath of Office ...	306
Address of welcome ...	306—11
Questions and Answers ...	311—39
Papers laid on the table ...	339
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ...	340
Punjab Limitation (Custom) Bill ...	341—44
Adjournment ...	344
Proceedings of a committee appointed to consider the subject of the increased employment of Zamindars in the Civil Departments ...	345—51
Statement showing the grades, with the number in each, of the Forest Rangers in the Punjab from the year 1890 to date ...	351
List of students of the King Edward Medical College punished in May 1919, for going on strike ...	352

INDEX

TO THE

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

OF THE

LIEUTENANT-GOVERNOR OF THE PUNJAB.

1919.

Volume X.

A

Page.

ACT—
See "Arms Act."
"Income Tax Act."
"Juvenile Smoking Act."
"Primary Education Act."
ADDRESS OF WELCOME ... 306—11
ADJOURNMENTS ... 49, 96, 125, 216, 244, 297, 344.

AFTAB NEWSPAPER—
See "Musalmans."
AGE RESTRICTION—
See "Education."
AGRICULTURAL ASSISTANTS—
Question *re* employment of — ... 255
AGRICULTURAL SCHOOLS—
See "Education."
ALBERT VICTOR WING—
See "Mayo Hospital."
ALEXANDRA BRIDGE—
Question *re* shortening of the — on the Chenab at Kothala ... 102
ALLOWANCE(S)—
Questions *re*—
Famine — to Ludhiana District Board servants ... 177
Grain Compensation — ... 254
Grant of special temporary — on account of dearness ... 10
Travelling —to Sub-Engineers ... 174
ARBORICULTURE—
Question *re* income from — Department ... 330
ARMS ACT—
Questions *re* exemption of Provincial Darbaris from the provisions of — ... 103-04
ARMS LICENSES—
Question *re* proposal for the amendment of procedure for renewal of — ... 102
ARTS COLLEGES—
See "Colleges."
ASSISTANT SURGEONS—
Questions *re*—
Pay of — promoted as Civil Surgeons in the Punjab and United Provinces ... 14
Punishment of certain Civil and — without enquiry ... 316
Starting pay of — in the Punjab and United Provinces ... 14
ATTESTATION FEES—
See "Fees."

Page.

B

BAHRAM KHAN, HON'BLE NAWAB SIR—
Budget Debate ... 265-66
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 65, 73
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ... 25
See "Resolutions."
BHAGAT RAM, HON'BLE RAI BAHADUR RAIZADA—
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 62, 66, 67, 71, 78-9.
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ... 25
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 34, 35
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s)."
BILLS—
See—
"District Boards Act Amendment Bill."
"Punjab Adulteration of Food Bill."
"Punjab Compulsory Education Bill."
"Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill."
"Punjab Limitation (Custom) Bill."
BIOLOGY—
See "Government Colleges."
BUDGET—
Debate on — ... 257—97

C

CANALS—
See "Foot Bridges."
CASES—
Question *re* number of criminal — from certain villages ... 330
CASHIERS—
Questions *re* — and Patwaris of Rawalpindi Division ... 312-13
CATTLE—
Question *re* death of — by starvation ... 15
CHEMISTRY—
See "Government Colleges."
CIVIL SURGEONS—
See "Assistant Surgeons."
CLERICAL ESTABLISHMENT—
Questions *re* pay of— ... 17, 338, 339
CLERICAL STAFF—
Questions *re*—
Discontent among the — ... 100
Increases to — on account of high prices ... 252
Raising the salaries of — ... 314
Revision of — ... 99
See "Rewards."
CLERKS—
Questions *re* —
Appointment of Committee to consider question of salaries of — ... 252
Comparison between the salaries of — and labourers ... 100
Memorials by — for increase of pay ... 252
Raising of — initial pay ... 100
COLLEGES—
Questions *re*—
Place of location of new Arts — ... 256
Time when — will be started ... *ibid.*
CONSTITUTIONAL REFORMS—
Question *re* publication of Local Government proposals *re*— ... 17
COOLIES—
Question *re* rate of — wages in Kulu ... 319
CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETIES—
See "Inspectors."
COTTON—
Question *re* produce of American— ... 329
COUNCIL PROCEEDINGS—
Question *re* supply of other — to members of Council ... 184
COUNCILS—
See "Sikh(s)."

Page.

C—*concluded.*

CRAIK, HON'BLE MR.—
District Boards Act Amendment Bill ... 25-7
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 75, 77
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 27-31, 32, 34
CRIMINAL CASES—
See "Cases."
CURRIE, HON'BLE MR. JAMES—
Tribute to the late— ... 4

D

DARBARS—
Question *re* order of seats in the— ... 5
DAULAT RAI, HON'BLE DIWAN BAHADUR DIWAN—
Budget Debate ... 278-81
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 71, 73, 79-81, 86, 90-91, 92
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ... 25
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 24
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s)."
DEPUTY CONSERVATORS—
Question *re* posts of Extra — of Forests ... 333
DEPUTY POSTMASTERS-GENERAL—
Question *re* number of —, Superintendents and other subordinate officers of Post Office ... 19
DISTRICT AND SESSIONS JUDGES—
Question *re* eligibility of Advocates and Pleaders for posts of — ... 7
DISTRICT BOARD(S)—
Question *re*—
Agricultural and non-agricultural profession in Amritsar District and their representation in — 180
Expenditure from — funds or from the Provincial and Imperial grants for improvement of village sanitation... 247
Inter-village ways within jurisdiction of — ... 315
Modification of rules of election to ensure adequate representation of all interests in the Amritsar— ... 180
See "Road."
DISTRICT BOARDS ACT AMENDMENT BILL—
Motion for leave to introduce— ... 25-7
Introduced ... 27
Passed ... *ibid.*
DISTRICT INSPECTORS—
See "Sikh(s)."
DISTRICT OFFICERS—
See "Pay."
DISTURBANCES—
Questions *re*—
Punjab— ... 336
Rustication of Medical Students during— ... 357

E.

EDUCATION—
Questions *re*—
Age restriction upon appointment of ladies to — Department ... 174
Age restrictions upon appointment of ladies in the Punjab Subordinate Educational Services ... 180
Aided Secondary Schools in the Punjab ... 178
Decrease in the number of scholars in Vernacular Schools 183
Detention of log books of Girls' School by the Inspectress of Rawalpindi Schools ... 178
Erection of new school buildings ... 186
Fifth classes of rural Primary Schools ... 98-9
Increased expenditure in connection with appointments in the Punjab Educational Services ... 181
Indian Inspector of Schools ... *ibid.*
Inspectresses of Girls' Schools in the Punjab ... 177

Page.

E—*concluded.*

EDUCATION—*concluded.*
Questions *re*—
Lady members of the Punjab Subordinate Educational Service ... 180
Number and pay of appointments in the Punjab Educational Service ... *ibid.*
Number of Muslims amongst the Inspectors of Schools, &c. ... 183
Opening of Agricultural Schools ... 11
Raising of pay of Primary School teachers ... 246
Raising of pay of Vernacular Teachers, lowest gra e ... 296
Percentage of total expenditure on Primary Education ... 184
Recommendations of Committee on Technical and Industrial— ... 10
Rules under the Primary Education Act ... 99
Scheme of Agricultural— ... 11
See—
"Colleges."
"Technical Education."
ELLIS, HON'BLE MR.—
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 65, 66, 77, 93
EMISSARIES—
See "Sikh(s)."
ENGINEERING SCHOOL—
Questions *re*—
Mode of giving appointments to students from—, Rasul ... 175
Results in order of merit of final examination Sub-Overseer Class ... 176
EVIDENCE—
See "Medical Officers."
EXCISE INSPECTING STAFF—
Questions *re*—under Police in Multan and Lyallpur ... 313—14
EXCISE INSPECTORS—
Questions *re*—
Pay of— ... 336
Selection of — for Extra Assistant Commissionership ... 334
EXHIBITIONS—
Question *re* agricultural— ... 330
EXTERNMENT—
See "Internment."
EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS—
Questions *re*—
Initial pay of— ... 178
Proposal to raise initial pay of— ... *ibid.*
See—
"Excise Inspectors."
"Sikh(s)."

F

FAGAN, HON'BLE MR.—
Oath of Office ... 306
FAMINE ALLOWANCE—
See "Allowance(s)."
FAZL-I-HUSSAIN, HON'BLE KHAN BAHADUR MIAN—
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 32, 33-4, 34-5, 340.
Revised Financial Statement ... 187—89, 189—91, 191-92, 192-93.
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s)."
FEES—
Question *re* Attestation — to Superintendents, Vernacular Offices ... 311
FEVER—
Question *re* — epidemic in Kulu ... 315

Page.

F—*concluded.*

FINANCIAL STATEMENT—
Presentation of the amended draft — for 1919-20, by the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden ... 104—10
Remarks by the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard on— ... 110—11
Ditto Hallifax on— ... 111—14
Ditto French on— ... 114—18
Ditto Woods on— ... 118—20
Ditto Townsend on— ... 120-21
Ditto Colonel MacWatt on— ... 121—23
Ditto Hon'ble Richey on— ... 124-25

FINANCIAL STATEMENT, REVISED—
Presentation and discussion of the— ... 186—207

FLOODS—
Question *re* loss by — in 1917 in Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts ... 325-26

FOOD-STUFFS—
Questions *re*— ... 9
Fixing of prices of— ... 9, 16
Rise in prices of—

FOOT BRIDGE—
Question *re* width of — over Canals ... 103

FORESTS—
See "Deputy Conservators."

FOREST GUARDS—
See "Sikh(s)."

FOREST OFFICERS—
Question *re* list of — by religion ... 20

FOREST RANGERS—
Question *re* salaries of— ... 333

FOREST SERVICES—
Question *re* salaries of Imperial and Provincial— ... 332

FRENCH, HON'BLE MR.—
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 72, 73, 74, 76, 93
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ... 22—4, 25
Remarks on amended Financial Statement ... 114—18

G.

GAJJAN SINGH, HON'BLE SARDAR BAHADUR SARDAR—
Budget Debate ... 262—65
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 62-3, 66, 67, 69, 71 72, 74, 93.
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 32, 32-3, 35-6
See "Resolution(s)"

GIBSON, HON'BLE MR.—
Budget Debate ... 257, 282-83
Oath of Office ... 246

GOLDEN TEMPLE—
Questions *re*— ... 21
Auditing of accounts of —, Amritsar ... *ibid.*
Tenure of Manager of —, Amritsar

GOPAL SINGH, HON'BLE CAPTAIN SARDAR—
Address of welcome ... 311
Budget Debate ... 281-82
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 70, 71
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s)."

GOVERNMENT COLLEGES—
Question *re* Chemistry and Biology in new — ... 256
See also "Colleges"

GRAIN COMPENSATION ALLOWANCE—
See "Allowance(s)."

GRANT-IN-AID—
Question *re* — to local bodies for sanitation ... 8

H.

HACKNEY CARRIAGES—
Question *re* inspection of — in Lahore ... 323

HALLIFAX, HON'BLE MR.—
Remarks on amended Draft Financial Statement ... 111—14

H—*concluded.*

HIGH COURT—
Question *re* — for the Punjab ... 17
HINDUS—
See "Legislative Council."
HOLIDAYS—
Question *re* observing the birthdays of Guru Nanak and Guru Gobind Singh as — 325

I.

IMPERIAL GRANTS
See "District Board(s)."
IMPERIAL RELIEF FUND—
Question *re* subscription for — ... 319
INCOME TAX ACT—
Question *re* appeals to Financial Commissioners under— ... 247
INFLUENZA—
Questions *re*—
Appearance of — epidemic ... 179
Appointment of a Committee of medical men in connection with the above *ibid.*
Ravages by — epidemic in the Punjab ... 18
INSPECTRESSES—
See "Education."
INSPECTORS—
Questions *re* —
Eligibility of — of Co-operative Societies for the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner ... 329
Grade pay of — of Co-operative Societies ... 328
Pay of Veterinary — ... *ibid.*
INTERNMENT—
Question *re* number of — and externment orders ... 255
INTER-VILLAGE WAYS—
See "District Board(s)."
INUNDATION CANAL—
Question *re* transibility of an — ... 826
IRRIGATION DEPARTMENT—
Questions *re*—
Temporary establishment of — ... 175
Revision of schedules of permanent establishment of — *ibid.*
IRRIGATION SCHEME—
Question *re* — in the Punjab ... 15

J.

JAGIRS—
Question *re* eligibilities of officials to grants of— ... 6
JAWAHAR LAL BHARGAVA, HON'BLE RAI BAHADUR PANDIT—
Budget Debate
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 275, 78
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 63, 65, 66, 67, 71, 88—5, 91.
Revised Financial Statement ... 81-2, 83
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s)."
JIRGA LAW—
Question *re* — in the Mianwali District ... 197-98
JOSEPH, HON'BLE MR.—
Oath of Office ... 16
Punjab Limitation (Custom) Bill ... 306
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 341—44
JUVENILE SMOKING ACT—
Question *re* operations of the — ... 340

K.

KING EDWARD MEMORIAL HOSPITAL—
Question *re* admission of in-door patients in the — ... 101

L.

LACHHMAN DAS—
Question *re* cases of Doctor — and Paras Ram ... 318

L.—*concluded.*

		Page.
LADY DOCTORS—		
Question *re* — at Sultanpur	...	316
LAL CHAND, HON'BLE RAO BAHADUR CHAUDHRI—		
Budget Debate	...	270—75
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill	...	63, 66, 69, 71, 73, 76, 81—3, 91, 93, 95-6.
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill	...	35
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s)."		
LAND(S)—		
Questions *re*—		
Distribution of grants of waste — to officials	...	6
Reservation of — for pasture purposes	...	16
LAND REVENUE—		
Question *re* payment of — in tahsils	...	19
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL—		
Question *re* special representation of Hindus in the Punjab —	...	17
LIQUOR—		
Questions *re*—		
Licensed — shops at Kangra	...	333
Restriction and prohibition of — in the Punjab	...	184
LOG BOOK—		
See "Education."		
LUDHIANA—		
Question *re* numerical strength of — town by religion	...	176
LUMSDEN, HON'BLE MR.—		
Presentation of Amended Draft Financial Statement	...	104—10
Presentation and discussion of Revised Financial Statement	...	186-87, 191, 204—06.
Punjab Adulteration of Food Bill	...	36—8
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill	...	70
See "Resolution(s)."		

M.

MACWATT, HON'BLE COLONEL—		
Remarks on the Amended Financial Statement	...	121—23
Revised Financial Statement	...	202
See "Resolution(s)."		
MAYNARD, HON'BLE MR.—		
Budget Debate	...	283—85
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill	...	67, 71, 75-6, 77, 92, 93, 94, 96.
Remarks on Amended Financial Statement	...	110-11
Revised Financial Statement	...	189, 198—202
MAYO HOSPITAL—		
Questions *re*—		
Change in the rules regarding the charges for occupying private wards of —	...	248
Diet scale for Indians in —	...	250
Foot-wear of Indian patients in —	...	*ibid.*
Free medical attendance in the private and family wards of the — for those whose income is less than Rs. 2,000 a year	...	251
Inspection of diet for Indian patients in —	...	250
Non-official Indian members on the Committee of —	...	249
Old private wards in —	...	250
Scale of medical fees in private wards of — as well as Albert Victor Wing	...	248
Sponging of Indian patients in —	...	252
Suitability and sufficiency of bed and bed clothes provided in —	...	251
Time when private wards in — will be opened	...	*ibid.*
MEDICAL COLLEGE—		
Questions *re*—		
Admission in —	...	336
Admission of the students in —	...	318
Chair of physiology in —	...	337
MEDICAL GENTLEMEN—		
Question *re* cases of certain —	...	318

M.—*concluded.*

	Page.
MEDICAL OFFICERS—	
Questions *re*—	
Independent evidence of — in Medico Legal cases ...	317
Punishment of — in time of Colonel Hendley ...	318
MEDICAL SERVICE—	
Question *re* itinerant — in Kulu ...	316
MEHDI SHAH, HON'BLE KHAN BAHADUR SAYAD—	
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ...	61-2, 66
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ...	25
Revised Financial Statement ...	202
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s),"	
MELA RAM—	
Questions *re* cases of Doctor — ...	317
METALLED ROADS—	
See "Roads."	
MILK—	
Questions *re*—	
— sellers' societies ...	328
— supply in towns ...	*ibid.*
MILITARY DEPARTMENTS—	
See "Rations."	
MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN, HON'BLE KHAN BAHADUR MALIK—	
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ...	62, 66, 71
See "Questions and Answers."	
MUHAMMAD IKRAM ULLAH KHAN, HON'BLE KHAN SAHIB MIRZA—	
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ...	62, 68, 85-6, 91-2
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ...	340
See "Questions and Answers."	
MUNICIPALITY(IES)—	
Questions *re*—	
Figures of Muslim population of Bhera — ...	7
Memorial of Muslim residents of Bhera — ...	7, 28
Principles in fixing, increasing or reducing members of — ...	184
Separate electorates for Muslim residents of Bhera — ...	7
Separate representation of Muslims on Municipal Committees	12
Standing of a voter for election in two different wards of a —	4
MUSALMANS—	
Question *re* articles headed "Punjab Education Department and the —" in the *Aftab* newspaper ...	181
MUSLIMS—	
See "Education."	

N.

NEWSPAPERS—	
Question *re* — whose entry in the Province is prohibited ...	256
NIKAH KHANI—	
Question *re* — system ...	12
NORMAL SCHOOL—	
Question *re* prospectus of — for men ...	319

O.

OATH OF OFFICE ...	2, 98, 246, 306
OCTROI—	
Question *re* — on coal ...	102

P.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE ...	98, 171, 339
PARAS RAM—	
See "Lachhman Das"	
PARKER, HON'BLE MR.—	
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ...	66
PASTURE PURPOSES—	
See "Land"	
PATWARIS—	
Questions *re* —	
Insufficiency of — pay ...	173
— Memorial for increase of pay ...	101

P.—*concluded.*

Page.

PAY—
Question *re* revised scale of — in district offices ... 254
See also —
"Clerical Establishment."
"Clerks."
"Education."
"Patwaris."

PHOTEDARS—
See "Cashiers."

PHYSIOLOGY—
See "Medical College."

PLATFORM TICKETS—
Question *re* — at Amritsar Railway Station ... 103, 179

POLICE DEPARTMENT —
Question *re* Hindu, Muhammadan, Sikh and Christian officials of— 20
See "Religion."

POOR CLASSES —
See "Dearness."

POST OFFICES —
Question *re* irregular deliveries in the Punjab — ... 254
See "Deputy Postmasters-General."

PRESIDENT, HIS HONOUR THE —
Address of Welcome ... 306—09
Budget Debate ... 286—97
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 56—60, 61, 65, 67, 68, 70, 71, 75, 76, 77.
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ... 25
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill ... 32, 36, 340
Revised Financial Statement ... 188, 189, 190, 191, 192, 198, 202, 206-07.

PRICES—
See "Food-stuffs."

PRIMARY EDUCATION ACT —
Question *re* rules under — ... 99, 315

PROVINCIAL CIVIL SERVICE —
Question *re* Advocates and Pleaders in the — ... 6

PUBLICITY BOARD —
Question *re* Punjab — ... 11

PUBLIC PROSECUTORS —
See, "Sikh(s)."

PUBLIC SERVANTS —
Question *re* official confidential remarks against — ... 321

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT —
Questions *re* — Reorganization Committee's Report ... 315
Upper Subordinate Service of the — ... 174

PUNJAB ADULTERATION OF FOOD BILL —
Report of the Select Committee presented ... 36
Report considered ... 38
Bill passed ... *ibid.*

PUNJAB COMPULSORY EDUCATION BILL —
Report of the Select Committee presented ... 55-6
Bill considered and amendments moved ... 60—96
Bill passed ... 96

PUNJAB COURTS ACT AMENDMENT BILL —
Motion for leave to introduce — ... 22—4
Introduced ... 24
Passed ... 25

PUNJAB CUSTOM (POWER TO CONTEST) BILL —
Motion for leave to introduce — ... 27—30
Introduced ... 30
Circulated to elicit public opinion ... 36
Referred to Select Committee ... 340

PUNJAB LIMITATION (CUSTOM) BILL —
Motion for leave to introduce — ... 341—43
Introduced ... 343
Referred to Select Committee ... 344

Page.

Q.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—

Bhagat Ram, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada—

Admission of students in Medical College (2 Questions) 318-19
Cases of certain medical gentlemen ... 318
Cases of Doctors Lachman Das and Paras Ram ... *ibid.*
Case of Doctor Mela Ram (3 Questions) ... 317
Fever epidemic in Kulu ... 315
Forced subscription in certain districts ... 320
Independent evidence of Medical Officers in Medico Legal Cases ... 317
Itinerant Medical Service in Kulu ... 316
Lady Doctor at Sultanpur ... *ibid.*
Official confidential remarks against public servants ... 321
Prospectus of Normal School for men ... 319
Punishment of certain Indian Civil and Assistant Surgeons without enquiry ... 316
Punishment of Medical Officers in time of Colonel Hendley ... 318
Rate of Coolies' wages in Kulu ... 319
Recruitment for the Army (3 Questions) ... 320-21
Subscription for the Imperial Relief Fund ... 319

Daulat Rai, Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan—

Death of cattle by starvation ... 15
Enhanced taccavi advances in connection with the death of cattle by starvation ... *ibid.*
Jirga Law in the Mianwali District ... 16
Reservation of Land for pasture purposes ... *ibid.*
Rise in prices of food-stuffs ... *ibid.*

Fazal-i-Hussain, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian—

Newspapers whose entry in the Province is prohibited 256
Number of internment and externment orders ... 255

Gopal Singh, Hon'ble Captain Sardar—

Appointment of Sikhs to the post of Munsif ... 21
Appointment of Sikhs in Government appointments ... *ibid.*
Auditing of Accounts of Golden Temple, Amritsar ... *ibid.*
Exemption of Provincial Darbaris, &c., from Arms Act provisions (3 Questions) ... 103-04
Fair share of Sikhs in Councils ... 323
Gang of Sikh Emissaries ... 324
Gazetting of Sikh Holidays as Public Holidays ... 21
Hindu, Muhammadan, Sikh and Christian officials of Police Department ... 20
Inspection of hackney carriages in Lahore ... 323
List of Forest Officers by religion ... 20
More posts of Public Prosecutors to Sikhs ... 321
Number of Deputy Postmaster-General, Superintendents and other subordinate officers of the Post Office ... 19
Number of Tahsildars, Naib-Tahsildars and Superintendents, Vernacular Offices, by religion ... *ibid.*
Observing the birthdays of Guru Nanak and Guru Gobind Singh as holidays ... 325
Payment of land revenue in tahsils ... 19
Punjab Police according to religions ... 323
Recommendation of genuine Sikhs for Extra Assistant Commissionerships ... 20
Sikhs as clerks in District Judges' Offices and as Forest guards ... 322
Sikhs as Superintendent, Vernacular Offices ... *ibid.*
Sikh District Inspector of Schools ... 321
Sikh Inspectors of Schools, Jullundur and Rawalpindi (2 Questions) ... 322
Sikh interned immigrants ... 324
Tenure of Manager of Golden Temple, Amritsar ... 21

Jawahir Lal Bhargava, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit—

Admission in Medical College ... 336
Chair of Physiology in Medical College ... 337
Irrigation Scheme in the Punjab ... 15
Pay of Assistant Surgeons promoted as Civil Surgeons in the Punjab and United Provinces ... 14

Q.—*continued.*

	Page.
QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—*continued.*	
Jawahar Lala Bhargava, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit—*concld.*	
Pay of Clerical Establishment ...	338, 339
Percentage of total expenditure on Primary education ...	184
Place of location of new Arts Colleges ...	256
Principles in fixing, increasing or reducing members of municipalities ...	184
Punjab disturbances (3 Questions) ...	336
Restriction and prohibition of liquors in the Punjab ...	*ibid.*
Rewari Water Works ...	13
Rustication of Medical Students during the disturbances	337
Starting pay of Assistant Surgeons in the Punjab and United Provinces ...	14
Supply of other Council Proceedings to Members of Council ...	184
Technical education in the Punjab ...	338
Time when new colleges will be started ...	256
Lal Chand, Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri—	
Agricultural exhibitions ...	330
District Board Road of Hissar District ...	327
District Board Road of Rohtak District ...	*ibid.*
Eligibility of Inspectors of Co-Operative Societies for the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner ...	329
Grade pay of Inspectors of Co-operative Societies ...	328
Income from Arboriculture Department ...	330
Loss by floods in 1917, in Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts (2 Questions) ...	325-26
Milk-sellers' Societies ...	328
Milk supply in towns ...	*ibid.*
Number of criminal cases from certain villages ...	330
Pay of Veterinary Inspectors ...	329
Produce of American cotton ...	*ibid.*
Promotion of Sub-Overseers (2 Questions) ...	331-32
Transibility of an Inundation Canal ...	326
Medhi Shah, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad—	
Articles *re* Punjab Education Department and the Muhammadans in the Aftab newspaper ...	181
Decrease in the number of Muslim scholars in Vernacular Schools ...	183
Number of Muslims amongst the Inspectors of Schools ...	*ibid.*
Muhammad Amin Khan, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik—	
Cashiers and Photedars of Rawalpindi Division (6 Questions) ...	312-13
Figures of Muslim population of Bhera Municipality ...	7
Memorial of Muslim residents of Bhera Municipality ...	*ibid.*
Separate electorate for Muslim residents of Bhera Municipality ...	*ibid.*
Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan, Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza—	
Advocates and Pleaders in the Provincial Civil Service ...	6
Attestation fees to Superintendent, Vernacular Offices ...	311
Distribution of grants of waste lands to officials ...	*ibid.*
Eligibility of Advocates and Pleaders for posts of District and Sessions Judges ...	7
Eligibility of officials to grants of jagirs ...	6
Erection of new School buildings ...	186
Metalled roads in Sialkot District ...	312
Octroi on coal ...	102
Order of seats in the Darbars ...	5
Operations of the Juvenile Smoking Act ...	7
Overcrowding of through trains ...	5
Platform tickets at Amritsar Railway Station ...	103
Proposal for the amendment of procedure for renewal of licenses for arms ...	102
Rewards to members of the Provincial Civil Services for rendering war services (3 Questions) ...	5-6
Shortening of the Alexandra Bridge on the Chenab at Kothala ...	102
Standing of a voter for election in two different wards of a Municipality ...	4
Width of foot bridges over the canals ...	103

Q.—*continued.*

Page.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—*continued*—

Rajan Shah, Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum—

Muslim residents of Bhera Municipality ... 12
Nikah Khani system (2 Questions) ... *ibid.*
Selection of Excise Inspectors for Extra Assistant Commissionership (5 Questions) ... 334-35
Separate representation of Muslims on Municipal Committees 12
Sufferings of poor classes on account of dearness of necessaries of life ... *ibid.*

Ram Saran Das, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur—

Admission of in-door patients in the King Edward Memorial Hospital 101
Age restrictions upon the appointment of ladies in the Punjab 180
Appointment of a Committee to consider questions of salaries of clerks ... 252
Appointment of Zamindars in Public Service ... 314
Change in the rules regarding the charges for occupying private wards of Mayo Hospital ... 248
Comparison between the salaries of clerks and labourers ... 100
Contribution by Sanitary Board for sinking of new wells ... 254
Daily rations on cheap rates in Military Departments ... 252
Diet scale for Indians in Mayo Hospital ... 250
Discontent among the clerical staff ... 100
Employment of Agricultural Assistants ... 255
Excess of receipts over estimates ... 315
Excise Inspecting Staff under Police in Multan and Lyallpur (3 Questions) ... 313-14
Fixing of prices of food-stuffs ... 9
Foot wear of Indian patients in Mayo Hospital ... 250
Free medical attendance in private and family wards of the Mayo Hospital for those whose income is less than Rs. 2,000 a year ... 251
Grain compensation allowance ... 254
Grant-in-aid to local bodies for sanitation ... 8
Grant of special temporary allowance on account of dearness ... 10
Importation of Australian wheat in the Punjab ... 9
Increased expenditure in connection with appointments in the Punjab Educational Service ... 181
Increases to clerical staff on account of high prices ... 252
Indian Inspectors of Schools ... 181
Inspector of diet for Indian patients in Mayo Hospital ... 250
Irregular deliveries in the Punjab Post Offices ... 254
Lady members of the Punjab Subordinate Educational Service 180
Memorials by clerks for increase of pay ... 252
Modification of Amritsar District Board Election Rules ... *ibid.*
Non-official member on the Committee of Mayo Hospital ... 249
Number and pay of appointments in the Punjab Educational Service ... 180
Old private wards in Mayo Hospital ... 250
Opening of Agricultural Schools ... 11
Patwaris' memorial for increase of pay ... 101
Promotion of Sub-Overseers ... 181
Public Works Department Reorganization Committees' Report ... 315
Punjab Publicity Board ... 11
Purchase of wheat by Government ... 99
Raising of clerks' initial pay ... 100
Raising the salaries of clerical staff (2 Questions) ... 314
Recommendation of Committee on Technical and Industrial Education ... 10
Representation of Sub-Overseers ... 181
Revised scale of pay in District Offices ... 254
Revision of clerical staff ... 99
Revision of water-rates on the Upper Bari Doab Canal ... 10
Rewards to clerical staff for services in war time ... 314
Rise in prices of food-stuffs ... 9, 16
Rules under the Primary Education Act ... 99, 315
Rural Primary Schools, 5th classes (3 Questions) ... 98-9
Sanitary survey of the Province ... 253
Sale of medical fees in Mayo Hospital as well as Albert Victor Wing ... 248

Q.—*concluded.*

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—*concluded*—
Ram Saran Das, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur—*concld.*
Scheme of Agricultural Education .. 3
Sponging of Indian patients in the Mayo Hospital .. 252
Suitability and sufficiency of bed and bed cloths provided in Mayo Hospital ... 251
Time when private wards in Mayo Hospital will be opened ... *ibid.*
Whether inter-village ways are within jurisdiction of District Boards ... 315
Sohan Lal, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi—
Age restrictions upon appointment of ladies to Education Department ... 175
Aided secondary schools in the Punjab ... 178
Agricultural and non-agricultural professions in Amritsar District and their representation in District Boards (2 Questions) 180
Amritsar Railway Station platform tickets (2 Questions) ... 179
Appeals to Financial Commissioners under Income Tax Act ... 247
Appearance of influenza epidemic ... 179
Appointment of a committee of medical men in connection with the appearance of influenza .. *ibid.*
Damming of the Sutlej River in the Kangra District ... 173
Detention of log books of girls' schools by the Inspectress of Rawalpindi Schools ... 178
Expenditure from District Board funds or from Provincial and Imperial grants for improvement of village sanitation ... 247
Famine allowance to Ludhiana District Board servants ... 177
High Court for the Punjab ... 17
Improvement of road between Kangra and Hoshiarpur Districts ... 172
Improvement of road lying in British territory between Jullundur and Hoshiarpur Districts ... *ibid.*
Initial pay of Extra Assistant Commissioners ... 178
Inspectresses of Girls' Schools in the Punjab ... 177
Insufficiency of Patwaris' pay ... 173
Licensed liquor shops at Kangra (3 Questions) ... 333—34
Mode of giving appointments to students from Engineering School at Rasul ... 175
Numerical strength of Ludhiana Town by religion ... 176
Pay of clerical establishment ... 17
Posts of Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests ... 333
Post of Under-Secretary to Government, Punjab ... 331
Proposal to increase percentage of registration fee ... 176
Proposal to raise initial pay of Extra Assistant Commissioners 178
Publication of Local Government's proposals *re* Constitutional Reforms ... 17
Raising of pay of primary school teachers ... 246
Raising of pay of vernacular teachers, lowest grade ... *ibid.*
Ravages by influenza epidemic in the Punjab ... 18
Remuneration of Sub-Registrars ... 176
Results in order of merits of the final examination of the Sub-Overseer class, &c. ... *ibid.*
Road between the Punjab and Tibet ... 172
Revision of schedules of permanent establishment of Irrigation Department 175
Salaries of Forest Rangers ... 333
Salaries of Imperial and Provincial Forest Services ... 332
Special representation of Hindus in the Punjab Legislative Council ... 17
Temporary establishment of Irrigation Department (2 Questions) ... 175
Travelling allowance to Sub-Engineers ... 174
Upper Subordinate service of the Public Works Department ... *ibid.*
Waller, Hon'ble Mr.—
Acquisition of wheat by Government at Okara and Montgomery under Ordinance of 1914 ... 257

R.

RAJAN SHAH, HON'BLE SAYAD MAKHDUM—
Address of welcome ... 310
Budget Debate ... 260—62
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 63—5
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolution(s)"

Page.

R.—*continued.*

RAM SARAN DAS, HON'BLE RAI BAHADUR—
Budget Debate ... 266—70
Revised Financial Statement ... 193—97, 202, 204
See " Questions and Answers " and " Resolution(s) "

RASUL—
See " Engineering School."

RATIONS—
Question *re* daily — on cheap rates in Military Departments ... 252

RECEIPT—
Question *re* excess of — over estimate ... 315

RECRUITMENT—
Question *re* — for the army ... 320-21

REGISTRATION FEE—
Question *re* proposal to increase percentage of — ... 176

RELIGION—
Question *re* Punjab Police according to— ... 323

RESOLUTION(S) *re*—

I. Allotment of a further sum of 5 lakhs to the expenditure budgetted for sanitation, and a corresponding decrease under the heads 10, 11, 32 or 45—(put to the vote and lost)—
Fazl-i-Hussain, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian—(moving) ... 207—10, 211, 213, 215.
Jawahar Lal Bhargava, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit—(supporting) ... 212
Lal Chand, Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri—(supporting) ... *ibid.*
Lumsden, Hon'ble Mr.—(Raising objection as to the form of the Resolution) ... 212-13, 213-14, 215.
MacWatt, Hon'ble Mr.—(speaking) ... 214-15
Maynard, Hon'ble Mr.—(speaking) ... 210, 215, 216

II. Allotment of a further sum of ten lakhs to the expenditure budgetted for 22—Education, and a corresponding decrease under heads 10, 11, 32 or 45—(withdrawn).—
Bhagat Ram, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada—(supporting) ... 232
Fazl-i-Hussain, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian—(moving) ... 226—31, 238, 239—41, 242, 243-44.
Gopal Singh, Hon'ble Captain Sardar—(supporting) ... 233
Jawahar Lal Bhargava, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit—(supporting) ... 231-32
Lumsden, Hon'ble Mr.—(Raising objection as to the form of the Resolution) ... 237-38, 241, 242, 243, 244
Maynard, Hon'ble Mr.—(speaking) ... 238-39, 241, 242, 243.
Mehdi Shah, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad—(supporting) ... 233
Rajan Shah, Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum—(,,) ... 231
Ram Saran Das, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur—(,,) ... 232
Richey, Hon'ble Mr.—(not supporting) ... 234—37, 239
Sohan Lal, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi—(supporting) ... 232, 244
Woods, Hon'ble Mr.—(speaking) ... 233, 241
Yusaf Shah, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja—(opposing) ... 233-34

III. Meeting of three-fourths of Educational expenditure from Provincial Revenues—(lost)—
Daulat Rai, Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan—(seconding) ... 42-3
Fazl-i-Hussain, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian—(supporting) ... 40-41
Jawahar Lal Bhargava, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit—(supporting) ... 41-2
Lumsden, Hon'ble Mr.—(speaking) ... 39, 40, 44—6
Maynard, Hon'ble Mr.—(speaking) ... 40, 44
President, His Honour the—(speaking) ... 39-40
Richey, Hon'ble Mr.—(opposing) ... 43-4, 46
Sohan Lal, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bukhshi—(moving) ... 39, 46

IV. Meeting of three-fourths of Sanitary expenditure from Provincial Revenues—(withdrawn)—
Lumsden, Hon'ble Mr.—(suggesting the Resolution to be withdrawn) ... 47

Page.

R—*concluded.*

RESOLUTION(S) *re*—*concluded*—

IV. Meeting of three-fourths of Sanitary expenditure from Provincial Revenue—(withdrawn)—*concld.*
Maynard, Hon'ble Mr.—(giving certain information) ... 48
President, His Honour the— ... 48, 49
Sohan Lal, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi—(moving) ... 47, 47-8, 49

V. Sympathy to Their Imperial Majesties the King-Emperor and Queen Empress in the bereavement sustained in the death of their youngest son Prince John of Windsor—(carried)—
Bahram Khan, Hon'ble Nawab Sir—(moving) ... 2
Bhagat Ram, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada—(supporting) 3
Fazl-i-Hussain, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian—(supporting) ... *ibid.*
Gajjan Singh, Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar—(supporting) 2
Jawahar Lal Bhargava, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit—(supporting) ... *ibid.*
Mehdi Shah, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad—(supporting) ... *ibid.*
President, His Honour the—(speaking) ... 3-4
Sohan Lal, Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi ... 2-3
Yusaf Shah, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja—(supporting) ... 2

REWARDS—
Question *re*—to clerical staff for services in war time ... 314

RICHEY, HON'BLE MR.—
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 55-56, 60, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 73, 74-5, 76, 77, 86—90, 92, 94, 95.
Remarks on amended Financial Statement ... 124-25
Revised Financial Statement ... 187, 202—04
See "Resolution(s)"

ROAD—
Questions *re*—
District Board—of Hissar District ... 327
" " —of Rohtak District ... *ibid.*
Improvement of—between Kangra and Hoshiarpur District... 172
" " —lying in British territory between Jullundur and Hoshiarpur District ... *ibid.*
Metalled—in Sialkot District ... 312
—between the Punjab and Tibet ... 172

S.

SALARIES—
See "clerks."
SANITARY SURVEY—
Question *re*—of the province ... 253
SANITATION—
See "Grants-in-aid."
SANITATION, VILLAGE—
See "District Board."
SHEO NARAIN, HON'BLE RAI BAHADUR PANDIT—
Oath of Office ... 306
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 62, 65-6, 67, 75
SIKH(S)—
Questions *re*—
Appointment of—in Government appointments ... 21
" " —to the post of Munsifs ... *ibid.*
Fair share of—in Councils ... 323
Gang of—Emissaries ... 324
More posts of Public Prosecutors to— ... 321
Recommendation of genuine—for Extra Assistant Commissionership 20
——as clerks in District Judges Offices and as Forest Guards 322
——as Superintendents, Vernacular Offices ... *ibid.*
——District Inspectors of Schools ... 321
——Inspector of Schools, Jullundur and Rawalpindi ... 322
——Interned immigrants ... 324

S.—*concluded.*

	Page.
SOHAN LAL, HON'BLE RAI BAHADUR BAKHSHI—	
Address of welcome ...	309
Budget Debate ...	357—60
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ...	66, 67, 68-9, 70, 71, 72, 74, 77-8, 90, 92-3, 93-4, 96
Punjab Court Act Amendment Bill ...	24
Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill	35
Revised Financial Statement ...	167
See "Questions and Answers" and "Resolutions."	
STUDENTS—	
See "Disturbances".	
SUB-OVERSEERS—	
Questions *re*—	
Promotion of — ...	331-32
Representation of — ...	181
SUB-REGISTRARS—	
Question *re* remuneration of — ...	176
SUBSCRIPTION—	
Question *re* forced — in certain districts ...	320
See "Imperial Relief Fund."	
SUPERINTENDENT, VERNACULAR OFFICES—	
See "Fees."	
"Sikh(s)."	
"Tahsildars."	
SUTLEJ RIVER—	
Question *re* damming of the — in the Kangra District ...	173

T.

TAGCAVI ADVANCES—	
Question *re* enhanced — in connection with the death of cattle by starvation ...	15
TAHSILDAR(S)—	
Question *re* number of — and Naib-Tahsildars and Superintendent, Vernacular Offices, by religion ...	19
TECHNICAL EDUCATION—	
Question *re* — in the Punjab ...	338
THOMPSON, HON'BLE MR.—	
Oath of Office ...	98, 306
Revised Financial Statement ...	190
TIBET—	
See "Road."	
TOWNSEND, HON'BLE MR.—	
Remarks on amended Financial Statement ...	120-21
TRAINS—	
Question *re* overcrowding of through — ...	5
TRAVELLING ALLOWANCE—	
See "Allowance(s)."	
Tribute to the late Hon'ble Mr. James Currie ...	4

U.

UNDER-SECRETARY—	
Question *re* post of — to Government, Punjab ...	331

V.

VETERINARY INSPECTOR—	
See "Inspectors."	

W.

WAGES—	
See "coolies."	
WALLER, HON'BLE MR.—	
Oath of Office ...	98
See "Questions and Answers."	
WAR-SERVICES—	
Questions *re* rewards to members of the Provincial Civil Services for rendering— ...	5-6
WASTE LANDS—	
See "Land."	

W.—*concluded.*

Page.

WATER-RATES—
Question *re* revision of — on the Upper Bari Doab Canal ... 10
WATER-WORKS—
Question *re* Rewari— 13
WELLS—
Question *re* contribution by Sanitary Board for sinking of new— ... 254
WHEAT—
Questions *re*—
Acquisition of — by Government at Okara and Montgomery under Ordinance 9 of 1914 ... 257
Importation of Australian — in the Punjab ... 9
Purchase of — by Government ... 99
WOODS, HON'BLE MR.—
Oath of Office ... 2
Remarks on amended Financial Statement ... 118—20

Y.

YUSAF SHAH, HON'BLE KHAN BAHADUR KHWAJA—
Address of Welcome ... 309-10
Punjab Compulsory Education Bill ... 67, 69, 73
Punjab Courts Act Amendment Bill ... 25
See " Resolution(s). "

Z.

ZAMINDARS—
Question *re* appointment of —— in Public Services ... 314

111 LR—200—184-20—S.G.P. Lahore

PUNJAB GOVERNMENT.

LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

Abstract of Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1915.

THE Council met at the Government House, Lahore, at 10-30 A.M., on Thursday, the 6th February 1919.

PRESENT:

His Honour Sir MICHAEL FRANCIS O'DWYER, G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.C.S., Lieutenant-Governor, *Presiding*.

The Hon'ble Mr. LEWIS FRENCH, C.I.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. JAMES ALEXANDER RICHEY.

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar GOPAL SINGH.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja YUSAF SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. HERBERT JOHN MAYNARD, C.S.I., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. OSWALD FARQUHAR LUMSDEN, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri LAL CHAND, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar GAJJAN SINGH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir BAHRAM KHAN, MAZARI, K.C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad MEHDI SHAH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit JAWAHAR LAL, BHARGAVA.

The Hon'ble Mr. FRANK WAVERLING WOODS.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada BHAGAT RAM.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur BAKHSHI SOHAN LAL.

The Hon'ble Sayad MAKHDUM RAJAN SHAH.

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan DAULAT RAI.

The Hon'ble Mr. CREWE ARMOND HAMILTON TOWNSEND, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. CHARLES JOSEPH HALLIFAX, O.B.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian FAZL-I-HUSSAIN.

[*Sir Bahram Khan ; Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava ; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza MUHAMMAD IKRAM ULLAH KHAN.

The Hon'ble Mr. EDWIN WOODALL PARKER.

The Hon'ble Mr. HENRY DUFFIELD CRAIK, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN.

The Hon'ble Colonel ROBERT CHARLES MACWATT, C.I.E., M.B., F.R.C.S., I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. THOMAS PETER ELLIS, I.C.S.

OATH OF OFFICE.

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods took the prescribed oath of allegiance to the Crown.

Resolution of sympathy to Their Imperial Majesties the King-Emperor and Queen-Empress in the bereavement sustained in the death of their youngest son Prince John of Windsor.

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan spoke in Urdu a translation of which is as follows :—"Your Honour,—The parent-like love and affection which Their Gracious Majesties the King-Emperor and the Queen-Empress bear towards their subjects is known all over the world. They fully realize the pleasures and pains of their people of all grades of society. We will be considered ungrateful if we do not participate in their pleasures and sorrows.

"I therefore with feelings of highest regret move the following resolution :—

> 'This Council requests His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor to convey to Their Imperial Majesties an expression of its respectful sympathy in the bereavement they have sustained in the death of their youngest son His Royal Highness Prince John of Windsor.'"

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah :—"Your Honour,—I rise to support the motion now before the Council with much sincere regret. Their Imperial Majesties have by their kindly interest in this country won over the hearts of the people, who are to-day mourning with them over the loss of their youngest and beloved son."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava :—"Your Honour,—The Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan has voiced the opinion of the whole country and I associate myself with the motion."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh :—"I associate myself with the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"Your Honour,—The very sad and sudden bereavement suffered by Their Gracious Majesties The King-Emperor and the Queen-Empress in the premature and untimely demise of their youngest son Prince John of Windsor is deeply felt by all classes in this country, where there is such great personal devotion and esteem for the members of Their Royal Families and specially for their Gracious Majesties, who have won the affection and love of the people in such a manner and to

such a degree that no other sovereign in the world in the present and in the past times have ever had. Their Gracious Majesties' hearty sympathies towards the people of this country have endeared them to all classes and communities who share their sorrow and grief in the bereavement to the same extent as they feel in the bereavement of their own dear son. As the oldest elected representative in this Council I beg to offer heartfelt sympathy on behalf of the people of this Province in the bereavement which has been suffered by Their Most Gracious Majesties and I heartily support the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Sir Nawab Bahram Khan and seconded by the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khawaja Yusaf Shah. I would also beg Your Honour to cause the resolution to be conveyed to Their Most Gracious Majesties."

The Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram :—"I associate myself with the resolution which has been moved by the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh :—"YOUR HONOUR,—On behalf of the community and Indian Army to which I have the honour to belong I beg to associate myself with the sentiments and feelings which have prompted this resolution. My community have already demonstrated in every possible manner how our hearts beat in absolute harmony with those of the British and our attachment and devotion to the persons of their Imperial Majesties no longer require any expression in words. Years ago, as Prince of Wales, His Majesty the King-Emperor was pleased to send to India, after the termination of his tour in this country, a message of sympathy, and when in the fulness of time His Majesty was crowned King-Emperor he was graciously pleased to send us a message of Hope. These messages, the fulfilment of which has been so well demonstrated in recent years, have gained for Their Majesties and Their family a deep seat in Indian hearts, and it is but natural that our sympathies should go forth to Their Majesties in Their sad bereavement. A youngest son always engages the most tender affections of his parents, and it must have been a terrible shock to Their Majesties to lose the object of their affections just when they, in common with their humble subjects, were rejoicing over the victorious end of the gigantic struggle between right and brute force in which the Empire has been engaged during the last four years and-a-half. But God's will is supreme.

"Let us hope and pray that Their Majesties will bear this shock with the same fortitude and resignation with which they endured the numerous sacrifices of their subjects, who were no less dear to them, during the past few years. Let God's will be done.

"*Tera Bhana mitha lage,*"

'May thy will be sweet unto me,'

says my Satguru.

"With these words I beg to support the resolution which has been moved by the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"I also beg to associate myself with this resolution, Your Honour."

The Hon'ble Sayad Mehdi Shah :—"I also support the resolution."

His Honour the President :—"I may say a word on behalf of the Government and that is this. There are two qualities by which during the last five years Their Majesties have particularly endeared themselves to the people of India. One is their sense of public duty. Their complete sympathy with the people in their sorrow and distress has been examplified during the last 4½ years when every household in India was in sorrow. Their Majesties have

shown kind sympathy and affection for the relatives of Indian soldiers. We in India have seen that Their Majesties sent a touching message of Their affection and sympathy to the wives and sisters of the Indian soldiers who fell in the war. It is no wonder therefore that we should feel for Their Majesties now that they are in sorrow. There is, another lofty example which Their Majesties have set throughout. That is the noble ideal of the sanctity of the family and purity of family life. Now that sorrow has struck them in their own home and death has taken away their youngest son who has been, as pointed out, the dearest and nearest, I am sure the Council is anxious to reciprocate the feeling of Their Majesties and to convey their respectful assurance of sincere sympathy in Their Majesties' bereavement."

The motion was put to the Council and carried, all the members standing.

Tribute to the late Hon'ble Mr. James Currie.

His Honour the President:—"Before we proceed with the business further I have another sad duty to perform. Hon'ble Members are aware that since we last met death has carried away from among us the Hon'ble Mr. James Currie. I believe he was one of the oldest members of this Council. He had been a continuous member since 1910. He was a regular attendant at our meetings, and though he did not take perhaps a very great part in debate, still his tact and his knowledge of business affairs and wide sympathy always gave his opinion the greatest weight. I am sure the Council will wish me to put on record an expression of their regret on the sad death of one of the oldest Members of the Council and desire that a message of sympath be conveyed to his family."

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked:—

Standing of a voter for election in two different wards of a municipality.

1. "(*a*) With reference to the election rules for the municipalities in the Punjab published from time to time beginning with notification No. 17877 dated 25th September 1917, will the Government be pleased to state if a registered voter of one ward of a municipality can stand for election as a member for any other ward of the same municipality?

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to explain why voters are confined to their particular wards while their representatives are free to stand for election over the whole municipality?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied:—

"(*a*) A registered voter of one ward of a municipality can stand for election as a member for any other ward in the same municipality, provided that the special rules which apply to the municipality contain no specific provision forbidding this.

"(*b*) The fact that voters are allowed to choose their representative from a wider circle than their own wards does not appear to Government to be inconsistent with the policy of excluding them from using their votes outside their own wards. It is obviously desirable that voters should be permitted to select their own representatives from the best talent available in the whole municipal area. There appears to be no corresponding advantage in the suggestion that they should be allowed to take part in the election of representatives of wards other than their own."

[*Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan; Mr. Lumsden; Mr. French.*]

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Overcrowding of through trains.

2. "(*a*) Is the Government aware that the through trains north of Lahore are generally overcrowded to the inconvenience of the III and Intermediate class passengers who contribute mostly to the Railway income and who suffer mostly for want of any through fast trains ?

"(*b*) Will the Government be pleased to consider the advisability of recommending to the Railway authorities to resume running of the Calcutta Punjab Mail north of Lahore as before ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

2. "(*a*) Government is aware that all classes of passengers throughout the Province have suffered inconvenience in consequence of the restrictions in the Railway service which the war rendered necessary. As soon as conditions admit the Railway administration will no doubt resume its ordinary service.

"(*b*) It is understood that the running of the Calcutta Punjab Mail north of Lahore has been resumed. I would, however, call the attention of the Hon'ble Member to the reply given by Mr. Barron to a somewhat similar question asked by Rai Bahadur Hari Chand at the meeting of Council held on the 13th March 1914. A copy* of the question and the reply thereto is laid on the table for easy reference."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Order of seats in the Darbars.

3. "Will Government be pleased to state what position in Darbars held in the Province has been assigned to the holders of various ranks in the Order of the British Empire ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"Seats in Darbars are regulated by orders which are reproduced in Punjab Government Circular No. 21, a copy of which is laid on the table.*

"It has been recently decided that members of Orders not below the rank of C.B.E. and Knights Bachelor should sit in Darbars below, but in the same group with, the officials mentioned in Group I of paragraph 13 of the Circular. Such members and Knights sit in order of their seniority, *e.g.*, K.C.I.Es. above K.B.Es., and K.B Es. above Knights Bachelors, and so on. Members of the same rank in the same Order sit according to their seniority by appointment. O.B.Es. sit below M.V.Os. of the 4th class at the bottom of group II and M.B.Es sit below M.V.Os. at the bottom of Group III."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

4. "Will Government be pleased to state whether admissions to the Order of the British Empire will be closed after the war or whether these will be kept open for distinguished services of a non-military character ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"The Order of the British Empire was instituted primarily for the recognition of services rendered in connection with the war. Government is not aware whether it is intended to keep the Order open for future admissions."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Rewards to members of the Provincial Civil Services for rendering war services.

5. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table the names of such members of the Provincial Civil Service as have rendered exceptionally good services in connection with the war, classifying them as under :—

"(*a*) those promoted from subordinate services ;

*Not printed.

"(*b*) those selected from the bar through the Chief Court ; and

"(*c*) those appointed direct by nomination ?"

Rewards to members of the Provincial Civil Services for rendering war services.

6. "Will Government be pleased to state, in general terms, what special rewards are in contemplation for them ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"With your permission, Sir, I will answer questions 5 and 6 together. It is not possible at present to supply a complete list of members of the Provincial Civil Service who are considered to have rendered exceptionally good services directly in connection with the war, as final reports have not yet been received from the majority of district officers. Until they have been received and the nature of the services of the gentlemen recommended for reward has been considered it is obviously impossible to say what special rewards, if any, will be given to them.

"A statement is laid on the table classifying the names of those members of the Provincial Civil Service who have been already rewarded for conspicuous war services and showing the rewards granted to them."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Rewards to members of the Provincial Civil Services for rendering war services.

7. "Will Government be pleased to state whether, in the case of junior members of the Provincial Civil Service, who rendered exceptional war services, reward in the shape of special grade promotion will not be desirable ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"It is not considered desirable to reward exceptional war services rendered by junior members of the Provincial Civil Service by giving them special grade promotion. Such a method of reward would be unfair to, and provoke discontent among, other officers of that service, who, owing to the exigencies of the Public Service, were afforded no special opportunities of performing direct war services."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Distribution of grants of waste lands to officials.

8. "Will Government be pleased to state whether, in view of the early termination of the war, it is not desirable to distribute at once the 16 grants of waste land sanctioned for officials for the years 1919 and 1920 ?"

Eligibility of officials to grants of Jagirs.

9. "Will Government be pleased to state whether officials are eligible for grants of Jagirs in consideration of war services ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

8. "The rewards for 1918 were sanctioned only at the end of last year and those for 1919 are now under consideration. It is not considered advisable to antedate the consideration of the rewards for 1920.

9. "*Ex*-officials are eligible for grants of Jagirs as a recognition of public services rendered after retirement."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Advocates and Pleaders in the Provincial Civil Service.

10. "Will Government be pleased to state—

"(*a*) the total number of advocates and pleaders who have, so far, been admitted into the Provincial Civil Service, through the Chief Court ;

"(*b*) how many of such advocates and pleaders are, at present, in the Provincial Civil Service ?"

[*Mr. French ; Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan ; Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"The reply is—

"(*a*) seven advocates and pleaders ;

"(*b*) six advocates and pleaders."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Eligibility of Advocates and Pleaders for posts of District and Sessions Judges.

11. "Will Government be pleased to recommend to the Government of India that members of the Provincial Civil Service selected from the bar, through the Chief Court, who show exceptional aptitude and ability, be held eligible for such posts of District and Sessions Judges as may, in the future, be reserved for direct appointment from the bar, as recommended in the report of the Public Services Commission ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied —

"The eligibility of members of the Provincial Civil Service who have been recruited from the bar for such posts of District and Sessions Judges as may be reserved for direct appointments from the bar under any scheme framed by the Government of India will be examined when the question of these appointments comes under the Local Government's consideration."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Operations of the Juvenile Smoking Act.

12. "Will Government be pleased to state (*a*) how many prosecutions of juveniles have been undertaken in the Punjab under section 3, Act VII of 1918, since the Act was passed into law ?

"(*b*) How many seizures have been made, if any, under section 4 of this Act ?

"(*c*) Have the powers of summary trial under section 5 of this Act been since conferred on any Magistrate in the Punjab ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"(*a*) Only one prosecution (in the Mianwali District) has been instituted under section 3 of Punjab Act, VII of 1918 (Juvenile Smoking Act) since the Act was passed.

"(*b*) No seizures have been made under section 4 of the Act.

"(*c*) Summary powers under section 5 have not been conferred on any Magistrate in the Punjab."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan asked :—

Memorial of Muslim of Bhera Municipality.

13. "Will Government be pleased to say whether any memorial on behalf of the Muslim residents of the Bhera Municipality regarding their representation on that municipality and the injurious character of the newly proposed higher franchise has been received by it ?"

Figures of Muslim population of Bhera Municipality.

14. "Will Government be pleased to state separately the figures of Muslim, Hindus and Sikh population residents within the limits of the Bhera Municipality and also the extent of the elective representation enjoyed by those various communities on that municipality ?"

Separate electorate for Muslim residents of Bhera Municipality.

15. "Is Government aware that Muslim representation on the Bhera Municipality is much below the numerical strength of the community, and that the proposed franchise is likely to weaken their position further ? Will Government be pleased to ensure, whether by the method of separate electorate or otherwise, that the Muslim residents of the Bhera Municipality shall enjoy a representation proportionate to their number ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

13. "Government has received various memorials from the Muslim residents of Bhera on the subject of their representation in that municipality and the qualifications to be prescribed for voters. The Commissioner of the Division has been asked for a report on the points raised by these memorials and his reply is being awaited."

14. "At the census of 1911 there were 10,015 Muhammadans, 4,626 Hindus and 547 Sikhs resident within the Bhera Municipality. The number of elected members on the committee at the present time is ten, of whom five are Muhammadans and five are Hindus.

15. "Government has not yet accepted, either provisionally or finally, any proposals regarding the future representation of communities or regarding the qualifications of voters in the Bhera Municipality. Before confirming the new election rules which are to be framed before the next election, Government will give full consideration to the desire of the Muslim residents that their interests shall be adequately safeguarded.

"The Hon'ble Member, however, no doubt realises that numerical proportion is not the only factor to be taken into consideration."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

16. "Will the Government kindly say whether the information asked for by me in the Council meeting of the 20th November 1918 and in question No. 37 has been now received? If so, will they lay it on the table?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"Statement* giving the information is laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Report of the Public Works Department Re-organization Committee.

17. "With reference to question No. 44 asked by me in the Council meeting of the 20th November 1918, will Government kindly state whether they have now received a report from the Public Works Re-organization Committee, said to have been appointed by them? If so, will they kindly lay a copy of the report on the table?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"Government has not yet received the report of the Committee appointed to consider the recommendations of the Public Works Department Re-organization Committee. It is understood that the Committee has held several meetings and that its report will be submitted at an early date."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Grant-in-aid to local bodies for sanitation.

18. "With reference to question No. 48 (*c*) asked by me in the Council meeting of the 20th November 1918, will Government, after enquiry from the Commissioners, kindly lay on the table for the information of this a Council statement showing the applications for grant-in-aid made by local bodies for sanitation and not forwarded by the Commissioners to the Sanitary Board for disposal."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"Replies have been received from all Commissioners that there are no applications for grants-in-aid made by local bodies which have not been forwarded by them to the Sanitary Board."

*See Appendix A.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Rise in prices of food-stuffs.

19. "Will Government kindly state what action they propose to take in mitigating suffering due to extreme rise in prices of food-stuffs? Have exports for military purposes, or under certificates, continued from this province during the last four months?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"Government is doing all in its power to mitigate the "suffering" due to the rise in prices. The pay of many Government officials of the lower grades has been substantially raised. And only those food-grains are allowed to leave the Province of which it has a surplus. Every effort is made to import food-grains of which it stands in need, but some difficulty is being found in obtaining them, as nearly every other province in India, is worse off than the Punjab.

"Considerable quantities of Burma rice have, however, been recently made available for this Province from Calcutta and Karachi.

"Government has recently taken possession, under Ordinance IX of 1914 of considerable quantities of wheat, at a price well below the inflated market price, mainly for military purposes and partly for sale to local bodies, and it is believed that this action has discouraged the speculation and profiteering which unduly inflate prices.

"To the second part of the question the reply is in the affirmative. Had such exports not been made, the soldiers of India, half of whom are Punjabis, or the inhabitants of other provinces, would have suffered generally. But these exports have been kept under strict control, and well within the surplus available."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Importation of Australian wheat into the Punjab.

20. "Does Government propose to import Australian wheat into this province? If so, to what extent? Will the re-sale of this wheat in the province be accompanied by the fixing of a maximum price?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"To the first part of the question the reply is in the negative : there appears no reason whatever to think that the Punjab stocks of wheat will be insufficient for its own requirements. The import of Australian wheat into India will materially help the Punjab by lessening the drain on it to other provinces.

"It is unnecessary, in view of what has been said, to give a reply to parts two and three of the question."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Fixing of prices of food-stuffs.

21. "Is the Government now prepared to take action under the Defence of India Act for the purpose of fixing maximum prices for food-stuffs including ghee and milk?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"Government is not, as at present advised, prepared to fix maximum prices for food-stuffs, on account of the extreme difficulty of enforcing them. And it would be even more difficult than in the case of food-grains to enforce such rates in respect of milk and ghee."

[*Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram ; Mr. Lumsden ; Mr. Richey ; Mr. Woods.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Grant of special temporary allowances on account of dearness.

22. "In view of the fact that employees of Government, with fixed incomes, are suffering great hardships, and are unwilling to purchase foodstuffs from cheap grain shops, will the Government consider the desirability of granting to them special temporary allowances ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"Government is not unaware of the hardships suffered by the employees of Government on fixed incomes and has obtained the sanction of the Government of India to several measures of relief, the announcement of which the Hon'ble member has evidently omitted to notice. An all-round increase of Re. 1 in the rates of grain compensation allowance admissible under Article 72 (*b*) of the Civil Account Code is now paid whenever the prices of the common staple food grains are dearer than Re. 1 for 8 seers. Besides this a permanent increase of Re. 1 has been given to all whole-time servants of Government drawing from Rs. 5 to Rs. 7 per mensem and a sliding scale of war allowance, with a minimum of Rs 5 per cent. of pay, is in force for all Government servants drawing Rs. 50 per mensem or under. In addition Government has during the past year revised the rates of pay of most of the clerical and many of the other establishments in the Province.

"With regard to the 'unwillingness' to purchase food stuffs from cheap grain shops to which the Hon'ble member calls attention, I am left in some doubt as to whether the Hon'ble member complains about the lines on which these shops are conducted. If so, I shall be glad to make enquiries on further information being supplied by the Hon'ble member. It is of course impossible for Government to control sentiment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Recommendations of Committee on Technical and Industrial Education.

23. "Will the Government kindly lay on the table, for the information of this Council, recommendations made by the standing committee on Technical and Industrial Education, and recently said to have been accepted by the Government ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to Circular Memo.* No. 32, dated January 20th, a copy of which appeared in the *Punjab Government Gazette* of January 31st."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Revision of water-rates on the Upper Bari Doab Canal.

24. "Is it a fact that water rates on the Upper Bari Doab Canal are about to be enhanced ? If so, will Government kindly state whether enquiries justifying such enhancements have been made ? If any such enquiries have taken place, will Government kindly lay on the table, for the information of this Council, the results of such enquiries, if any ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"Enquiries are in progress with the object of revising the water rates on the Upper Bari Doab Canal, but no final decision on the subject has been arrived at, and until the enquiry is complete Government is not prepared to lay the papers on the table."

---

*Not printed.

[*Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram ; Mr. French ; Mr. Richey.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

25. " Will the Government kindly state whether they intend to continue the Punjab Publicity Board ? If so, what are its functions to be in future and wherefrom is the expenditure of the Board to be financed ? " Punjab Publicity Board.

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

" The question of the future of the Punjab Publicity Committee is at present under the consideration of Government. "

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

26. " Will Government kindly state whether they intend to inaugurate a comprehensive scheme of agricultural education for the masses ? Will they kindly indicate the broad features of such scheme if any ? " Scheme of agricultural education.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

" A comprehensive scheme for agricultural education in the Punjab based mainly on the proposals of a special committee which met last summer has been approved by the Local Government and a non-recurring grant of Rs. 4,69,000 has been received from the Government of India towards its initial cost. A general circular describing the scheme is at present under issue and will be published at an early date.

" Briefly stated the scheme is as follows :—

" The ordinary Vernacular Middle Schools of the Province will be utilised as the chief vehicle for the diffusion of agriculture education. It is proposed to start the experiment at twenty such schools next year. Land for practical work will be purchased at each centre and equipment provided. Twenty selected senior vernacular teachers are at present undergoing a course in agriculture at Lyallpur Agricultural College to fit them for the work of agricultural teachers and will be ready for work by June next. This arrangement is however of a temporary nature and it is intended to open a second training college at Lyallpur, which, in addition to the ordinary course of training for Senior-Vernacular Teachers, will also provide agricultural courses for both Vernacular and Anglo-Vernacular Teachers, the institution being in close touch with the Lyallpur Agricultural College.

" For agricultural teaching in high schools it is proposed to provide facilities by means of agricultural centres, similar in character to the manual training centres which have been opened. These centres can be attended by boys from the various local high schools who are taking agriculture for matriculation. Provision has been made for the opening of twenty such centres next year.

" To meet the needs of individual high schools which wish to teach agriculture, but are not in the neighbourhood of any agriculture centre, applications for special grants for the purchase of land and equipment and for the provision of qualified teacher will be considered favourably.

" The foregoing is a very brief outline of the scheme which is described in detail in the circular which will soon issue. "

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on behalf of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

27. " Will Government kindly state whether or not it would be desirable to open a large number of independent agricultural schools in the Province ? " Opening of agricultural schools.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to my answer to his previous question. It is not proposed to open a number of independent agricultural schools. It is believed that the number of boys who would be willing to attend such schools would be small, and their intellectual quality probably poor, since attendance at such a school would mean the definite renunciation by the student of any hope of higher education. The introduction of agricultural teaching into the ordinary vernacular middle course will affect a very large number of boys without prejudicing the future educational prospects of those amongst them who wish to proceed to a high school and college career."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Sayad Rajan Shah asked :—

Muslim residents of Bhera Municipality.

28. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it has recently received any memorial on behalf of the Muslim residents of the Bhera Municipality and if so what action it proposes to take thereon ?"

Separate representation of Muslims on municipal committees.

29. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a list of the Municipalities in the Province where the Muslims enjoy the right of separate representation, showing in each case the numerical strength of the Hindu or Muslim community resident within the Municipal limits ?"

30. 'Will Government be pleased to say whether it is prepared to extend the right of separate representation to the Muslim community of Bhera in the municipality and thereby satisfy strong local Muslim feelings ?''

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"With His Honour's permission I will answer Questions 28, 29 and 30 at the same time.

"As regards questions 28 and 30 will the Hon'ble Member please refer to the replies given by me to similar questions asked by the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan at this meeting.

"The statement* asked for in the question No. 29 is laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah asked :—

"Nikah Khani" system.

31. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a list of districts in the Province where the Registration of 'Nikah Khani' system has been introduced for the Muslim population ?"

"Nikah Khani" system.

32. "Does Government consider this system to be beneficial in preventing litigation ? If so, will Government be pleased to invite the local authorities to consider extending this system in other districts of the Province where it has not already been introduced ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik replied :—

31. "A list† of the districts in which the system obtains is placed on the table.

32. "The attitude and policy of Government on this matter will be explained in the remarks which I shall make shortly in introducing the District Boards Act Amendment Bill."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Sayad Rajan Shah asked :—

Sufferings of poor classes on account of dearness of necessities of life.

33. "(*a*) Is Government aware of the daily increasing sufferings of the poor classes on account of the artificial dearness of the necessaries of life ?

"(*b*) If so, will the Government be pleased to say what action it proposes to take to check excessive prices and bring them down to normal level ?

---

*See Appendix B.
†See Appendix C.

"(*c*) Will Government be pleased to consider the enactment of a law to prevent dealers in wheat and gram from withholding their stocks from the market with a view to obtaining excessive profits ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"(*a*) It is a fact that the dearness of the necessaries of life certainly causes suffering to the poorer classes, specially those on small fixed incomes. But the rise in prices is far from being altogether artificial, and is in many cases less than the rise which has taken place in many parts of the world. Where the people of this province are themselves the producers of the articles that have risen in price, the rise in question goes, to a large extent, into their pockets.

"(*b*) As regards food-grains, the policy of Government has been explained in my reply to question No. 4 standing in the name of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das.

"Cotton cloth, salt, iron and oil are the other principal articles which have risen in price. Cloth fell considerably in price about two months ago, and the poorer classes were then able to replenish their stock. But as an upward tendency in the price of cloth has again shown itself, a large indent for Government standard cloth is being forwarded to the Cloth Controller, Bombay. Its cost will be considerably below the present price of bazar cloth.

"As regards salt, the output from the Khewra mines, which provide nearly all the salt consumed in this province, has been considerably increased of late. But the demand on these mines from the United Provinces and Bihar and Orissa for salt,—provinces which prior to the war used English or German salt, which has not been imported since 1915—is so great that some time must elapse before prices drop to their old level. Meanwhile Government is doing what it can in the matter by arranging that indents for salt on the mines from Municipal bodies and Co-operative Societies should receive priority of supply over ordinary indents.

"Iron fell considerably in price when the Armistice was declared. And arrangements have been made with the North-Western Railway to provide the Registrar of Co-operative Societies with old steel and iron, up to, it is hoped, 100 tons, for use as agricultural implements by members of these societies.

"As regards oil Government has instituted a system of control over the sub-agents, designed to prevent the profiteering on their part which undoubtedly took place. It is certainly an improvement on the system it replaced. Special attention is being paid to the matter by the Director of Civil Supplies, and he will be glad to investigate any reasonable complaints in the matter that are made to him. The salient fact as regards oil is however that the supply, specially from America, is very short, on account of the shipping difficulty. Until that becomes normal, it is impossible to expect a return to pre-war prices.

"(*c*) Should the present excessive profiteering by dealers in food grains not be checked by the acquisitions recently made under Ordinance IX of 1914, Government will be prepared to consider the necessity of further executive and legislative measures to meet the situation."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Rewari Water-Works.

34. "In reply to Question No. 24 asked by me in the meeting of the Council held on 13th March 1918, regarding completion of the construction of the Water-Works at Rewari, the Government was pleased to state that the work

was expected to be completed in July 1918. As nearly six months more have elapsed, and the construction is not completed, will the Government be pleased to state :—

" (*a*) the reasons for the delay in the completion of the construction of the Water-Works ;

" (*b*) when the completion may now be expected ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

" The reasons for the protracted delay in the completion of the Water-Works are the heavy floods of September 1917, the scarcity of labour owing to the severe epidemics of malaria and plague, followed by the recent influenza epidemic, which affected not only the supply of labour but also the contractors and the engineering staff.

" It is now reported that the work will be completed in May."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa, asked :—

Pay of Assistant Surgeons promoted as Civil Surgeons in the Punjab and United Provinces.

35. " (*a*) Is it a fact that the Civil Surgeons promoted from the grade of Assistant Surgeons in the Punjab get Rs. 400—20—500 a month, whereas the officers of the same class and qualifications in the United Provinces are paid Rs. 400—40—600 ?

" (*b*) In view of the meritorious services and sacrifices of the medical department of the Punjab during the war, the general efficiency and equal qualifications of the Civil Surgeons of the said class with those of their fellow-officers in the United Provinces, will the Government be pleased to consider the advisability of bringing the Civil Surgeons of that class to the level (as regards pay and prospects) of the Civil Surgeons of that class in the United Provinces immediately, and of securing for them an equality in pay and prospects in future whenever the grades are inaugurated in accordance with the recommendations of the Public Services Commission or otherwise ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

" (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

" (*b*) The scale of pay of Civil Surgeons promoted from the rank of Assistant Surgeons at present prevailing in the Punjab was fixed by the Government of India in 1913. In the case of the United Provinces, the Government of India sanctioned a pay of Rs. 400—40—600 for members of the same class. Government has never accepted the principle that rates of pay should be uniform in different provinces, as they must vary with local conditions and the laws of demand and supply, but the suggestion of the Hon'ble Member will be considered in connection with the recommendations of the Public Services Commission."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa, asked :—

Starting pay of Assistant Surgeons in the Punjab and the United Provinces.

36. " (*a*) Is it a fact that the Assistant Surgeons in United Provinces start with Rs. 130 per month, whereas officers of equal qualifications and position in the Punjab start with Rs. 100 only ?

" (*b*) If so, will the Government be pleased to consider the advisability of bringing the Assistant Surgeons of the Punjab in the same line with those of the United Provinces ? "

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

" (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

" (*b*) The question of the revision of the pay and prospects of Civil Assistant Surgeons is under consideration in connection with the recommendations of the Public Services Commission."

[*Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa ; Mr. Woods ; Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai ; Mr. Maynard.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa, asked :—

Irrigation scheme in the Punjab.

37. "Will the Government be pleased to state for the information of this Council and the public at large —

"(*a*) what great irrigation projects are under the consideration of the Government, referred to in His Honour's budget speech on 26th April 1918, which aim at primarily benefitting the dry districts of the South-East Punjab ; and

"(*b*) what is the probable period by which they can be expected to be carried out ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"(*a*) The irrigation scheme referred to in His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor's Budget speech on 26th April 1918 is the Bhakra Dam Project on the Sutlej. It aims at extending irrigation in Hissar District, and possibly in Rohtak District, by means of a dam on the Sutlej at Bhakra.

"(*b*) The project, which is an exceedingly costly and difficult one, entailing the remodelling of two existing canal systems, is still under preparation. It has not yet reached the stage when it is possible to say that it will be finally accepted, and if so at what date its construction will be carried out and the length of time it will take to complete."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai asked :—

Death of cattle by starvation.

38. "Is the Government aware that during the last few months a large number of cattle has died of starvation or of disease brought on by starvation in the Punjab ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"In consequence of the scarcity of fodder due to the failure of the last monsoon rains, cattle are generally in a poor condition in 14 out of the 28 districts of the Punjab, but it would be misleading to suggest that in the last few months a large number has died of starvation or of disease brought on by starvation."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai asked :—

Enhanced Taccavi advances in connection with the above.

9 "If so, will the Government be pleased to give such assistance to those who have thus suffered as it thinks fit over and above the relief which may be given under the ordinary Taccavi law of the land, as relief under such law would not adequately meet the situation ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"Apart from the grant of Taccavi loans for fodder, for which Rs. 5,00,000 have been allotted, the following measures have been taken by Government to relieve the scarcity :—

"*First*, the grant of concession rates for import of fodder by rail to the 14 districts in which the situation is bad and to the Kapurthala State ;

"*Secondly*, a Fodder Controller has been appointed, who works in conjunction with the Deputy Commissioners of the districts in which fodder is plentiful, on the one hand, and with those of districts in which it is scarce, on the other, so as to facilitate purchase and transport. It is understood that a quarter of a million maunds of bhusa are surplus in the Lyallpur District, and it is mainly from this source that the requirements of the scarcity districts must be made up ;

"*Thirdly*, the Controller of Fodder has been authorized to seize stocks of fodder unreasonably withheld from the market.

"Government have recently addressed the Army Department and have asked that all military purchases of fodder in the Punjab may be stopped."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai asked :—

Reservation of land for pasture purposes.

40. "Will the Government be pleased to direct (*a*) that sufficient area of land be reserved for pasture purposes for each village or group of villages where Government land is available, (*b*) that where such land is not available, sufficient area of land be acquired by Government for such purposes ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The suggestion made in paragraph (*a*) was made on two recent occasions by Hon'ble Members. The Hon'ble Member is referred to my answers given to Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das on February 6th, 1918, and to the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram on April 24th, 1918.

"The answer to paragraph (*b*) is that the reduction of the common pasture lands in villages is due to the superior economic advantage of breaking up land for agriculture. In tracts in which it is economically advantageous to break up land for cultivation, the tendency is to feed cattle upon the straw of food-grains. The conviction of Government is that it would be mischievous to interfere with that use of land which is economically most advantageous, and that from the point of view of cattle-rearing, the merits of the system of common pasture grounds are open to grave question both as regards the quality and quantity of the food supply, and as regards the risks of the spread of infectious disorders. Government are not, therefore, prepared to acquire agricultural land for the purpose of reconverting it into pasture."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai asked :—

Rise in price of food stuffs.

"41. Is the Government aware that the prices of all food stuffs have risen to an unprecedented scale? If so, will the Government be pleased to take such steps as it may deem fit to fix prices at a reasonable rate as early as possible to meet a situation which is becoming graver day by day?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"I would refer the Hon'ble Member to the replies given to similar questions asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das and the Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai asked :—

Jirga Law in the Mianwali District.

42 "(*a*) Is Government aware that the Jirga Law in the Mianwali District was originally intended to apply to the Pathan and the Bilochi tribes only, with power to the Local Government to extend it to any other tribe in that district ?

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to state on what ground or grounds it extends the application of the Jirga Law to any tribe other than the Pathans and the Bilochis and upon what ground or grounds it will cancel such an extension ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik replied :—

"(*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

"(*b*) The application of Jirga Law to Pathans or Balochis exclusively would in practice be insufficient owing to the large extent to which men other than Pathans and Balochis are mixed up in frontier crime, in consequence of the relations which prevail between them of landlord and tenant, patron and

dependent, master and servant, banker and client. Great difficulties and glaring inequalities of treatment would follow any attempt to separate off the population into tribes or clans and to restrict the application of Jirga Law to any particular sections of the community.

"So far as I have been able to ascertain, no tribe or community has hitherto applied to be exempted from the operation of the Frontier Crimes Regulation."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Publication of Local Government's proposal *re* Constitutional Reforms.

43. "Is it a fact, as stated in the Public Press, that the Government of India have instructed the Local Governments to make public their proposals regarding Constitutional Reforms to be introduced in the various provinces? If so, have the Punjab Government also been asked to publish the proposals made by them in this behalf? Will the Government be pleased to lay the same on the table for the information of this Council?"

Special representation of Hindus in the Punjab Legislative Council.

44 "Will the Government be pleased to state whether the Hindus, who form an important minority in the Punjab, have been recommended for a special representation in the Punjab Legislative Council to be constituted under the coming Constitutional Reforms, so as to secure seats for Hindus more in number than their numerical ratio of population in this province just as Muhammadans have got special representation in other Provinces."

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik replied:—

"No such instruction has been received from the Government of India, and in the circumstances the Punjab Government is not prepared to publish its proposals.

"The Punjab Government accepts the view stated in paragraph 232 of the Montagu-Chelmsford Report that there should be a special electorate for Sikhs. It also accepts generally the principle of the resolution passed by the non-official members of this Council on 21st November 1918 that Muhammadans should be allotted a definite proportion of the elected Indian membership, a principle accepted by all the Hindu members present. If communal electorates are given for Sikhs and Muhammadans, it would follow automatically that the remaining constituencies will be practically entirely Hindu. Government at this stage is unable to state what will be the representation of each community if communal representation is decided upon, but Government would endeavour to secure to each community a representation adequate to its numerical strength, its interests and its importance generally."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

High Court for the Punjab.

"45. Will Government be pleased to state whether the Government of India have been moved by the Local Government to take the necessary action during the Delhi Session for the establishment of a High Court in the Punjab; or when does the Local Government propose to move in the matter?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"The Secretary of State for India has been moved in the matter by the Government of India, and it is hoped that the necessary sanction to the conversion of the Chief Court into a High Court with effect from the 1st April 1919 will be received shortly."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Pay of Clerical Establishment.

46. "With reference to the reply given by the Hon'ble Mr. J. P. Thompson on 24th April last to my question regarding salaries of the Clerical Establishment in the various Government offices, will the Government be pleased to furnish this Council with a brief statement of the salaries of the clerical establishment of the offices named therein, the scale of pay of which

[*Mr. French ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; Colonel MacWatt.*]

has been raised in pursuance of the recommendations of the Kettlewell Clerical Committees. Whether the question of rise in regard to certain appointments was kept in abeyance ; and, if so, when will this question be taken up for consideration. Whether the proposals regarding the offices mentioned in Part C of the Hon'ble Mr. Thompson's reply have since been considered ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

" A statement* of the salaries of the clerical establishments of the offices of the Financial Commissioners, Legal Remembrancer and Forest Department, the pay of which was raised in pursuance of the recommendations of the Clerical Establishment Committees report, is laid on the table.

" The consideration of an increase in the pay of two appointments in the Legal Remembrancer's office was kept in abeyance. A proposal to raise the pay of the Superintendent of that office has already been received and is under consideration.

" Revision of the Director of Public Instruction's office establishment was sanctioned with effect from the 1st January 1919. A statement* showing the present scales of salaries is laid on the table.

" Proposals for the revision of the office establishments of the Inspector-General of Police, Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals and Sanitary Commissioner have been received and are under consideration.

" No proposals have been received from the other offices, *viz.*, those of the Inspector-General of Prisons, Directors of Agriculture and Land Records and Chief Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department."

The Hon'ble Bai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Ravages by Influenza Epidemic in the Punjab.

47. " Will Government be pleased to state for public information which districts in the Punjab suffered most during the Influenza Epidemic, and whether the usually healthy and climatically superior district of Kangra is among them, and whether it is a fact that the epidemic is still rampant in certain parts of this district ?

" Are there any other districts in the Province which still suffer from this epidemic, and is there adequate medical establishment in all such districts ?

" Is it a fact that there is no Civil Surgeon just now in Kangra District to guide and control operations against this epidemic ?

" If so, how long has the Kangra District been without such officer ? "

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

" The districts in the Punjab which suffered most during the Influenza Epidemic were Gurgaon, Rohtak, Karnal, Ferozepore and Hissar.

" The district of Kahgra is not among those which suffered most. The epidemic is no longer rampant in any part of Kangra District. By the end of November the disease had already ceased in the tahsils of Nurpur and Palampur. In most places the virulence declined during the first week in December, and by the 25th of that month the epidemic had completely disappeared from the greater part of the valley. Dharmsala was not free until the 1st January.

" In other places the disease lingered on into 1919, and in Kulu it still exists, though not in epidemic form.

" The epidemic exists in no other district. Each district has its own normal medical establishment. Captain R. W. G. Kingston, I. M S., is now Civil Surgeon of Kangra District, and has been so throughout the epidemic of influenza."

---

*Appendix D.

[*Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Mr. Maynard ; Mr. French.*]

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

48. "Will Government be pleased to consider the advisability of taking some steps to relieve lambardars of the present inconvenience to which they are put when tendering payment of Government revenue in the tahsil or Sadar by the menial clerical establishment ?"

Payment of land revenue in tahsils.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to the answer given by me to his similar question on November 20th, 1918. In addition to the facilities for payment of land revenue by money order, to which reference was there made, lambardars are at present allowed in all districts to pay in their land revenue by currency notes sent through the post insured. This second system has been sanctioned experimentally for a period which comes to an end in April 1919."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

49. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement by religion (Hindus, Muhammadans, Sikhs and Christians), showing—

"(*a*) the number of Superintendents of Deputy Commissioners' Vernacular Offices ;

"(*b*) the number of Tahsildars ;

"(*c*) the number of Naib-Tahsildars ;

"(*d*) also the number of men of Zamindar classes holding these appointments ?"

Number of Tahsildars, Naib Tahsildars and Superintendents Vernacular Offices, by religion.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The information required as regards Tahsildars and Naib Tahsildars, who do and do not belong to the notified agricultural tribes, will be found in Statement A attached to the proceedings of the recent Committee on Zamindar employment of which a copy is laid upon the table. The information as regards Head Vernacular Clerks (formerly known as Superintendents of Vernacular Offices) is not separable from the information regarding pensionable clerks drawing 50 rupees per mensem and more. But this information will be found in full detail in Appendix B to the same proceedings. Information regarding the number of each of these classes of officials by religions was not tabulated by the Committee because it was considered to be outside the terms of their reference. The figures are being tabulated and when ready will be laid on the table."

Number of Deputy Postmasters-General, Superintendents and other Subordinate Officers of the Post Office.

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

50. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement by religion (Hindus, Muhammadans, Sikhs and Christians), showing the number of—

"(*a*) Deputy Postmasters-General ;

"(*b*) Superintendents of Post Offices ;

"(*c*) Inspectors of Post Offices ;

"(*d*) Head Clerks to Superintendents of Post Offices ;

"(*e*) Post Masters ;

"(*f*) Deputy Post Masters ;

"(*g*) also the number of men of Zamindar classes holding these appointments ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

The statement asked for* is laid on the table.

---

* Appendix E.

[*Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Mr. Craik ; Mr. French.*]

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

List of Forest Officers by religion.

51. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement by religion (Hindus, Muhammadans, Sikhs and Christians), showing the number of—

"(*a*) Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests;
"(*b*) Forest Rangers;
"(*c*) Deputy Rangers;
"(*d*) Foresters;
"(*e*) Lower Subordinates and Head Clerks of Divisional Offices;
"(*f*) also the number of men of Zamindar classes holding these appointments?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik replied :—

"A statement* giving the information asked for other than that concerning Forest Guards is laid on the table.

"In regard to Forest Guards the necessary data are being collected and will be supplied to the Hon'ble Member when available."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

Hindu, Muhammadan, Sikh and Christian officials of Police Department.

52. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement by religion (Hindus, Muhammadans, Sikhs and Christians), showing the number of—

"(*a*) Superintendents of Police (permanent and officiating).
"(*b*) Deputy Superintendents of Police;
"(*c*) Inspectors of Police;
"(*d*) Sub-Inspectors of Police;
"(*e*) Head Constables of Police;
"(*f*) Percentage of Hindus, Muhammadans, Sikhs and Christians in the Punjab Police Force;
"(*g*) also the number of men of Zamindar classes holding these appointments?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"The statement† asked for is laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

Recommendation of genuine Sikhs for Extra Assistant Commissionerships.

53. "Will Government be pleased to arrange that a sufficient number of genuine Sikhs should be annually recommended by the Hon'ble Judges of the Chief Court for Extra Assistant Commissionerships?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik replied :—

"The Hon'ble Judges invariably endeavour to allocate appointments fairly among candidates from the different classes of the community otherwise suitable for appointment; in the past comparatively few Sikhs with the necessary educational and other qualifications have been forthcoming, but the fact that it was found possible, at the recent selection for the Chief Court list of candidates suitable for the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner, to give to Sikhs three out of the twelve places vacant should be an assurance that the claims of this community are not being lost sight of.

"It is not possible for the Hon'ble Judges to discriminate between Sikhs who are regarded in certain quarters as 'genuine' and Sikhs who are not so regarded."

---

*See Appendix F.

†See Appendix G.

[*Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Mr. French.*]

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

54. "Will the Government be pleased to arrange that the Hon'ble Judges of the Chief Court should kindly give a very liberal and fair share of appointments of Munsifs to genuine Sikhs ?" Appointment of Sikhs to the post of Munsif.

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"A copy of the Hon'ble Member's question will be forwarded to the Hon'ble Judges for consideration, but he must remember that in making appointments to the public services Government has to consider primarily the qualifications possessed by the individuals appointed and not only the adequate representation in proportion to their total numbers of the different religions and communities."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

55. "Will Government be pleased to issue instructions to all the Heads of Departments that in future Sikh candidates selected for any Government appointment should be Sikhs in reality and not simply men who bear the word Singh after their names ?" Appointment of Sikhs in Government appointments.

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"Government believes that the issue of instructions in the sense suggested in the Hon'ble Member's question would lead to difficulties in practice. It is a fundamental principle of Government's policy not to interfere in any way with the religious belief and creed which a man professes. Every one is entitled to profess the religion of his choice, and if a man declares himself to be a Sikh, Government must accept that declaration in default of an order of court or of a definition universally accepted by the Sikh community of what constitutes a Sikh.

"It is, of course, well known to Government that many persons (*e.g.*, Rajputs and certain Jats of the South Punjab) bear the cognomen of Singh without professing the Sikh religion and such persons are not considered to be Sikhs."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

56. "Will Government be pleased to fix a period for the tenure of the office of Manager of the Golden Temple, Amritsar ?" Tenure of Manager of Golden Temple, Amritsar.

57. "Will Government be pleased to arrange that the accounts of Golden Temple, Amritsar, be annually audited and published for public information." Auditing of accounts of Golden Temple, Amritsar.

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"It has not hitherto been the practice to fix a period for the tenure of the office of Manager of the Golden Temple, Amritsar, and Government, as at present advised, sees no reason to do so now.

"Government has no objection to the accounts of the Golden Temple, Amritsar, being audited : and in fact they have been audited by the Local Fund Accounts officers who found them to be in admirable order. The accounts are printed every year in English, Urdu and Gurmukhi, and distributed widely to all concerned in the Province. Anyone who raises specific objections in regard to them is at liberty to ask the Deputy Commissioner or any other officer deputed by Government to enquire into such objections. No further action in the direction of audit appears to be required."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

58. "Will Government be pleased to consider the question of declaring Guru Nanak and Guru Gobind Singh's birthdays to be general public holidays such as are granted to commemorate similar events in the history of the Hindu, Muhammadan and Christian religions ?" Gazetting of Sikh Holidays as Public Holidays.

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"The Sikh population differs from the Hindu and Muhammadan in the fact that it is not diffused over the Province generally, but is mainly concentrated in certain districts ; and this fact explains why Sikh festivals have not been gazetted as holidays to be observed throughout the Province. Local holidays are already granted on—

(1) Guru Nanak's birthday ;

(2) Guru Gobind Singh's birthday ; and

(3) The Hola Mohalla

in the following eleven districts : —

Ambala, Ludhiána, Jullundur, Hoshiárpur, Ferozepore, Lahore, Amritsar, Gurdáspur, Siálkot, Gujránwála and Lyallpur.

"Besides these, the birthdays of Guru Nanak and Guru Gobind Singh are local holidays in the Montgomery District and that of Guru Nanak in the Ráwalpindi and Simla Districts.

"The districts named are those in which, according to the Census figures of 1911, the population contains a considerable Sikh element and in which a local desire for the observance of the festivals in question has been shown to exist. It must be remembered that every general holiday causes inconvenience to the business community ; and Government does not see any sufficient reason for making the suggested additions to the existing list of such holidays."

THE PUNJAB COURTS ACT AMENDMENT BILL.

The Hon'ble Mr. French.—"Your Honour, I move for leave to introduce a Bill to amend the Punjab Courts Act, 1918.

"Apart from any forensic or judicial experience that they may have of its provisions, many Hon'ble Members of this Council are far more familiar with the Punjab Courts Act than I can claim to be. Since the original measure was placed on the Statute Book in 1865 the Act has been considered afresh by the Legislature on no less than 11 occasions, 4 of them within the last 7 years, and Hon'ble Members may perhaps not unreasonably complain that we have the Act, like the poor, always with us. On some of the previous occasions on which it has been under discussion with a view to repeal or amendment of certain of its provisions considerable controversy has been aroused ; but in making my *début* in this Council as sponsor to a Bill I am in the fortunate position of being able to introduce a measure which I may safely say is not only non-contentious, but thoroughly popular in every quarter. The object of the Bill now before the Council is given in the printed Statement of Objects and Reasons which is in the hands of Hon'ble Members. To put it briefly, it is to facilitate the institution of the High Court of Judicature at Lahore which, as I have explained in answer to a question this morning, we expect to see supersede the present Chief Court on the 1st April next. I have been tempted to give this Council a short history of the Chief Court from its inception : but I refrain from doing so both because the time of Hon'ble Members will be otherwise fully occupied during these two days and also because an even more appropriate opportunity will probably arise for explaining the evolution of the Supreme Court of the Province. It will perhaps further economise time if I now briefly explain the provisions of the Bill which I seek to introduce. As will have been seen it is mainly concerned with legal technicalities, establishes no novel principles and consists of two clauses only.

"Although the High Court of Judicature will not in any case be instituted before the 1st April next it is desired to pass this Bill into Law at this meeting of Council for a special reason. It is intended that the High Court should exercise the same jurisdiction as is exercised at present by the Chief Court over the Provinces of the North-West Frontier and Delhi. This jurisdiction will, in so far as the former Province is concerned, be maintained under sections 6 (1) (*c*) and 10 of the North-West Frontier Province Law and Justice Regulation. But as regards Delhi the position is somewhat different. The amendments proposed in clause 2 of the Bill obviously cannot take effect until the High Court is actually established: but under section 7 of the Delhi Laws Act the Governor-General in Council is precluded from notifying in the *Gazette of India* the extension to the Delhi Province of any Act unless it is in force at the date of such notification. In order therefore that this Bill, when enacted, may be extended to the Delhi Province by the 1st April next it must come into force in the Punjab at such interval beforehand as will allow of the necessary notification in the *Gazette of India*: and if the Bill is not passed until the next meeting of Council in March it is feared that it will not be possible to comply with all the requisite formalities.

"Turning to clause 2, I will deal briefly only with the sub-clauses which require explanation. It is proposed in (*i*) to repeal the table of contents and chapter 2 in part II. The position of the table of contents in part II is an awkward one. The appropriate place for a table of contents of an Act is at its beginning: and a new table will accordingly be prefixed to the amended Act. I may here remark that it may be advisable at some future date to trouble this Council once more with a consideration of the Punjab Courts Act which will not be left in an altogether satisfactory state, containing, as it will, two parts with the numbers of certain sections duplicated. It may subsequently be found convenient to repeal the whole Act and merely re-enact part II duly modified. But this is a matter which need not be examined further now when time is short.

"Chapter II concerns the Chief Court and will become superfluous when the High Court has been instituted.

"*Sub-clause* (*ii*).—The words 'the Chief Court' in section 18 of part II of the Act must be omitted as the establishment of the High Court is effected by Letters Patent issued by His Majesty the King-Emperor.

"*Sub-clause* (*iii*).—Following the practice elsewhere the suspension or removal of Munsifs will be entirely at the discretion of the High Court. I believe I am correct in saying that the change proposed is in effect a verbal one only, as the Local Government has always accepted the recommendations of the Chief Court in such disciplinary cases.

"*Sub-clause* (*iv*).—Section 43 of the Act, which confers power on the Chief Court to determine issues of fact in second appeals becomes redundant, as in the case of a High Court the same power is conferred by section 103, Civil Procedure Code. On the other hand, the present section 44 of the Act which relates to revision cannot be repealed because when it was enacted in 1884 its prototype, section 622 of the old Civil Procedure Code, replaced by section 115 of the present Code, was definitely repealed as regards the Punjab: and, as Members of this Council who pursue the legal profession are aware and the Second Punjab Courts Amendment Act of 1912 showed, the repeal of a section which has repealed another section does not operate to revive this latter section. Section 48 of the Act which relates to transfer of proceedings is superfluous in view of the existence of sections 526, Criminal Procedure Code, 24, Civil Procedure Code, and 107 (B) of the Government of India Act, 1915.

[*Mr. French ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahir Lal, Bhargawa ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

"*Sub-clause (vi).*—It is obviously desirable for the Supreme Court to retain control over petition-writers, and although it might claim to exercise this power by virtue of its inherent authority it has been thought advisable to follow the Bombay precedent and make the position quite clear.

"*Sub-clause (vii).*—The approval of the Local Government will no longer be required for the list of holidays prepared by the Supreme Court for subordinate courts. General orders may be issued by Government on the subject, but such orders will not apply to the High Court itself which will regulate its own sittings.

"*Sub-clause (viii).*—This is required in order that cases pending in the Chief Court shall, on the institution of the High Court, continue in the latter as if they had been instituted therein.

"There is no need to explain the other sub-clauses of the Bill."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. French introduced the Bill.

The Hon'ble Mr. French :—"Your Honour in introducing this Bill, the details of which I have explained, I move that it be taken into consideration by this Council at once.

"I am aware that in making this motion I may appear to lay myself open to the reproach of using undue haste : but I have already explained the particular need of expedition in this case. Hon'ble Members will have noticed that the Bill has already been published in the last *Punjab Gazette* under Rule 8 (*i*) of the Rules for the introduction, consideration and making of laws, etc., in this Council. This was done in order to give them an opportunity of studying its provisions. I have only to add that the Bill is the fruit of a very careful consideration of the necessities of the case by a Committee consisting of the Hon'ble the Chief Judge, the Hon'ble Mr. Justice Shadi Lal, the Hon'ble Legal Remembrancer and myself. The Hon'ble Judges have expressed the hope that it will be possible to pass this Bill without delay in order to obviate any unnecessary postponement of the institution of the High Court until after the 1st April, before which date it is believed that the Letters Patent will have been signed and the formal sanction of the Secretary of State have been communicated to us."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargawa:—"I support the motion that has now been made. It is a matter of sincere joy to the people and congratulations to the Government that the boon which the people desired and the Government promised to grant as soon after the war as possible is within sight. As has been pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. French it is expected that the High Court will be established in the Punjab by the 1st April 1919. The inferiority of status which is attached to the present highest judicial tribunal of the Province will be a thing of the past. I am particularly glad to observe that Your Honour's name will be associated with this reform to be followed by others which will form a land-mark in the History of the Punjab. For the establishment of the High Court it is necessary that there should be a Bill or rather an Act ready at hand to be applied as soon as the Letters Patent are signed so that there may be no difficulty or delay in applying the Punjab Courts Act to the Courts subordinate to the High Court. I therefore lend my support to the motion that has now been made."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"I have been advocating from the very time I entered this Council that the Chief Court, Punjab, be raised to the status of High Court, and I heartily support the introduction of the Bill."

[*Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram; Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai; Nawab Sir Bahram Khan; Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah; Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah; Mr. French; His Honour the President; Mr Craik.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram :—"Your Honour, so far as the members of the Bar are concerned I think there will be no two voices, and so far as the public is concerned I am sure they will hail the news of the establishment of a High Court with joy. I therefore support this Bill."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai :—"I support the motion, Your Honour."

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan supported the motion.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah:—"I support the motion."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah :—"Your Honour, I also support the motion."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. French :—"Your Honour, in view of the sentiments of the Council I move that the Bill be passed."

His Honour the President :—"It is a matter of pleasure to note the unanimity of opinion in the Council, and I am glad that the Hon'ble Mover has satisfied the Council that there is no objection to the hurrying through of the Bill in order to enable the machinery of the High Court to be put in operation as soon as the Letters Patent are received. I therefore put to the Council the motion that the Bill to amend the Punjab Courts Act, 1918, be passed."

The motion was put and agreed to.

DISTRICT BOARDS ACT AMENDMENT BILL.

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik :—"Your Honour, the Bill which I now ask leave to introduce is a very small and simple one, its object being to enable district boards to charge fees for the registration of marriages, but it will be covenient if I summarise for the information of the Council the reasons which led to the introduction of this Bill.

"Marriage registration in some form or other is in force in 20 out of the 28 districts in the Province. In some districts only Muhammadan marriages are registered, in others those of all religions. In some districts the system is worked by the Deputy Commissioner through his revenue staff, in others by district boards. Some of these district boards have been authorised by the Local Government under section 20 (2) (1) of the District Boards Act to take control of marriage registration. Others again have apparently started the system of registration without any such legal authority. In no case so far as I am aware is registration compulsory, but where a system of registration is in force refusal to register is, I believe, practically or completely unknown, and the general consensus of opinion among those best qualified to judge is that the system has been very efficacious in checking false matrimonial cases, both civil and criminal, and in making the marriage tie more secure by providing documentary evidence of the fact of marriage. Now it is obvious that it would not be fair to impose on local bodies the cost of this system of registration. The actual registrar naturally expects a small fee for his services, whether he is a *nikah khwan*, as in some districts, or a lambardar, as in others. Moreover, to make the system effective, there must be some agency to make periodical inspections of the registers and to maintain a central register at headquarters into which entries from the local registers are copied. I understand that in all districts a small fee is in practice charged and paid without any difficulty; the person registering never makes any objection to the payment. Usually I believe the fee is about 4 annas, of which the *nikah khwan* or lambardar keeps

3 annas, while the one anna is credited to the district board, which, out of the funds so received, pays for an inspecting Kazi and a clerk who keeps up the headquarters register. Hitherto where the system is worked by the district board, fees so received are credited to district funds under section 35 (*k*) of the Act and to that, we are advised, there is no legal objection whatever.

"Such, Your Honour, is the legal position at the present moment, and though in actual practice it works satisfactorily enough, it is obviously desirable that it should be put on a more permanent and legal basis. Should a number of persons decline to pay the fee for registration, the whole system would obviously break down, the Kazi would naturally refuse to keep the register without getting his fee, and the courts would be deprived of a valuable piece of documentary evidence in dealing with matrimonial cases. Government accordingly decided a little less than 2 years ago that it was desirable to have the system put on a legal basis. There was no intention, we carefully explained, of compelling district boards to adopt a system of registration where none is now in force, nor was there or is there any intention of making registration compulsory. All we wanted to do was to legalise the existing system, but not to modify it in any important particular. Accordingly we pointed out to district officers that the proper legal procedure was for the district board to apply to the Local Government to be empowered under section 20 (2) (1) of the Act to assume control of marriage registration. Having obtained the necessary sanction, the district board should then submit draft regulations under section 56 which should be confirmed by Government and published as provided by section 56 (*ii*). We also pointed out that there was no provision in the District Boards Act for the levy of fees for registration, and that therefore the levy of such fees should be discontinued. We explained, however, that there was nothing to prevent a charge being made for copies of entries in the, register, and we accordingly suggested that in order to cover the working cost of the system the draft regulations should fix appropriate fees to be charged for such copies.

"Well, the Chairman of a certain district board, where a very effective system of registration is in force, pointed out that the prohibition against the charge of fees for registration might wreck the whole system. He explained that to charge fees only for copies of entries would be of very little practical use, because copies are as a rule only taken when the marriage is the subject of judicial procedure. In that particular district only Muhammadan marriages are registered, and the Chairman told us that the Hindu and Sikh members of his board, who receive no benefit from the system of registration, would very naturally object to the whole system being made a charge against the general revenues of the board. That, I think, the Council will agree is a very cogent objection, and we therefore felt that it was necessary to continue the existing practice whereby a fee is charged not for the copy but for the actual process of registration. But here we came up against a difficulty.

"A district board can only charge fees for the purposes defined in section 33 of the Act and those purposes do not include marriage registration. Government felt and still feels, as I have already stated, that it would be unsatisfactory when we are putting the whole system on a proper legal basis to allow the payment of fees to remain as hitherto a purely voluntary matter. We therefore decided that there was nothing for it but to amend section 33 so as to include marriage registration as one of the purposes for which a district board may levy fees, and that is the object and the sole object of this Bill. As we now propose to amend it section 33 will read as follows: 'With the previous sanction of the Government, or of such officer as the Local Government may authorize in this behalf, a district board or local board may fix and levy school-fees and fees for the use of, or benefits derived from, any of the works specified in section 20, clauses (*c*), (*e*), (*h*), (*i*) and (*j*), fees for the registration of marriages, and fees at fairs, agricultural shows and industrial exhibitions held under its authority.'

"As I have already said there is not the slightest intention of compelling district boards to introduce the system of registration where none is already in force. It will still be entirely a matter within the discretion of the board to apply to Government under section 20 (2) (1) to be empowered to take control of marriage registration, and it will still be within the board's discretion to fix and levy fees for such registration. The Council will observe that section 33 says that a district board *may* fix and levy fees and not *must* fix and levy fees. If the board prefers that no fees should be charged, it is not byund to charge them Then again the effect of this Bill will not be in any way whatever to make registration compulsory. That again will be within the discretion of the board. The board will frame regulations under section 56, as it can do at present, and those regulations can, if the board so wishes, provide that registration should be compulsory. Under section 57 the board may fix a fine for a breach of the regulations. That power is not affected in any way by the present Bill. All the Bill does is to provide that where a board so wishes it may charge fees for registration. In all other respects it leaves matter exactly on the same footing as at present. I now ask that leave be given for the introduction of the Bill."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik introduced the Bill and moved that it be taken into consideration.

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik moved that the Bill be passed.

The motion was put and agreed to.

THE PUNJAB CUSTOM (POWER TO CONTEST) BILL.

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik :—"Your Honour, the Bill which I now ask leave to introduce is the first legislative fruit of the Conference which assembled at Simla in September 1915 to consider the thorny and much discussed problem of codifying the Punjab Customary Law. That Conference, to quote the words of the Government Resolution on its report 'represented the best judicial, legal and administrative talent of the Province,' and it may be hoped that though no positive result has yet accrued from their deliberations they will in time have far-reaching and beneficial effects. The Conference approved generally of the principle of codification, but the general question is not a matter with which we are at present concerned. What the present Bill aims at doing is to give effect to certain subsidiary recommendations of the Simla Conference. Those recommendations I will briefly recite.

"The first was that no one should be enabled to sue to set aside an alienation unless he fulfils two conditions, firstly, that he is descended from the same great-great-grandfather as the alienor; and, secondly, that he was alive when he alienation took place.

"The second recommendation was that the same principle should apply to suits for the possession of land where the setting aside of an adoption is the question involved, and also to suits for a declaration that an adoption is invalid.

"Tlhe third recommendation was that no one should be entitled to contest an alienation by a male of non-ancestral property.

"As regards all these three propositions the Conference of September 1915 was unanimous and the present Bill is designed to give effect to them all.

[*Mr. Craik.*]

"The drafting of this Bill has been a very difficult and protracted task First of all a Bill was drafted by the late Secretary of this Council, Mr. Gracey, which in addition to embodying the three propositions which I have just recietd also altered the law of limitation as regards certain customary suits. Mr. Gracey's draft was submitted for criticism to the standing Codification Committee, a body appointed by the Lieutenant-Governor to deal with the general question of codification. Its President is the Chief Judge and its members at that time were the Hon'ble Messrs. Fagan, Gracey and Muhammad Shafi and three members of this Council, the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain, Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh and Mr. Ellis. The Codification Committee felt that it would be better to have two Bills, one dealing with restrictions on the power to contest and one dealing with the law of limitation. It accordingly split up Mr. Gracey's original draft into two Bills and made certain other alterations. The Codification Committee's draft Bill, which differed very considerably from the Bill now introduced, was then circulated widely in the Province for opinion and special efforts were made to ascertain the views not only of all members of this Council and all experienced officials, but also of such local bodies as District Boards, Bar Associations and Agricultural Associations and all gentlemen who by their position, character and attainments were qualified to represent rural opinion.

"Well, that first draft Bill was circulated in June 1917. We received an enormous number of opinions, the majority being in favour of the principle of the Bill, though considerable objection was taken to its phraseology and to certain of its specific provisions. The clause which aroused perhaps more opposition than any other was one providing that the Bill should apply only to 'members of such groups, classes or other bodies of persons as the Local Government might notify in the official Gazette,' that is, it was to rest with the Local Government to decide what classes were to be governed by the provisions of the Bill. That clause, Hon'ble Members will observe, has disappeared from the present Bill.

"The opinions received, which amounted to a formidable mass of documents, were considered by a small committee consisting of an eminent Judge of the Chief Court, the late Mr. Gracey and myself. I am not sure if I am at liberty to mention the name of the Judge, but I would like to take this opportunity of acknowledging the generous manner in which he placed his great legal skill and experience at our disposal and the time which he devoted to by no means an easy task of revising the draft. Perhaps it would not be out of place if I also made a reference to the great debt which I and indeed this Council as a whole owe to the late Secretary—Mr. Gracey—for his exceptional powers of draftsmanship and for the patience and impartiality with which he approached the various intricate questions raised in this legislation. It is a great loss to the Council that it will not have Mr. Gracey's skilled assistance and advice during the passage of this Bill and of the connected Bill regarding limitation which will shortly be introduced.

"From the deliberations of that small committee of three the Bill emerged in a third form, very substantially changed. The clause regarding notification by the Local Government has disappeared entirely, and its place has been taken by something very similar to clause 3 of the present Bill, the effect of which will be to make it an issue in the suit whether the person making the alienation or appointment of an heir was or was not governed by custom. The title was changed and the expression 'reversioners,' which we felt was a rather loose word with no exact legal connotation, was dropped. In fact the whole form of the Bill was substantially modified, and we felt it necessary to circulate it once more for opinion. This was done in March 1918. The Bill then circulated differed very little from that which I now ask leave to introduce. Opinions were received throughout the summer months of last year

and again were generally favourable to the principle to the Bill. Criticism was confined to a few points. There was a good deal of criticism on the term 'agricultural custom' which then appeared in clause 3. Some jurists urged that what was meant was not '*agricultural*' but '*agriculturist*' custom. The difficulty of defining such custom is almost insuperable, and finally it was resolved that it was better to drop the adjective altogether and to use the expression 'custom' without qualification.

"Then again there has been a certain amount of criticism on clause 5 which excludes from the scope of the Bill alienations or appointments of an heir by a female and the right of a female to contest such alienations or appointments by another heir. It is argued that this exclusion may have the effect of placing females in a stronger position than males standing in the same degree of relationship to the alienor. I frankly admit that this is a possible effect, but the question is a difficult and controversial question, and we felt that it was on the whole better to leave the clause in its present form in the Bill and to let the matter be thrashed out in Council or in Select Committee. I should explain that the Simla Conference of 1915 was evenly divided on a suggestion that legislation should be undertaken with the object of preventing a female from contesting an alienation by a male. Government is disposed to think that a universal rule to this effect would conflict with popular sentiment. Among certain tribes a daughter is recognized as a better heir than even near agnates, and any measure designed to curtail the rights of a female to sue would be strongly opposed by such tribes. Our object in this legislation is two-fold, to curtail *mala fide* and infructuous litigation and to give statutory force to certain recognized rules of custom. We don't want to go beyond that and to crystallise as law customs which are actually in a fluid and shifting state.

"Lastly a good deal of criticism was directed to clause 6 (*b*), the point taken being that it is a hardship and a breach of actual custom to prevent a posthumous son of the alienor from contesting an alienation by his father. That again, I admit, is a controversial point in which opinion is bound to differ and we accordingly decided to leave this matter to be settled in the Council.

"On the whole the Bill was very little changed after its second circulation. The word 'agricultural' was, as I have explained, omitted from clause 3 and the title was changed from 'Customary Alienations Act' to 'Customary Suits Restriction Act.' We then in August last submitted the Bill for the approval of the Government of India and perhaps the Council will allow me to quote briefly from the letter which we sent to the Government of India, as this explains the broad general objects underlying this legislation :—

> "'As the Government of India are doubtless aware, a very large proportion of the civil litigation in the Punjab consists of suits in which the parties are agriculturists governed by custom in regard to the matters specified in section 5 of the Punjab Laws Act, 1872. Of this general mass of customary litigation, again, a very large proportion consists of suits either for a declaration that the alienation of ancestral property by its owner is void on the ground that it has not been so alienated. Some of such suits are of a blackmailing or speculative character or are brought with the collusion and support of the alienor, while many of them are under the existing law of limitation brought many years after the alienation impugned has taken place. Such litigation obviously has the effect of rendering title uncertain, as the alienee of property which was, or which is alleged to have been, ancestral so far as the alienor is concerned, cannot be confident that his possession

> will not be attacked till many years have elapsed since the date of the alienation; while even if his possession is legally secure, he is exposed to blackmailing claims on the part of alleged collaterals or heirs of the alienor who have little to lose if their suit is unsuccessful.'

"The Government of India in turn took a hand in criticising the Bill and it was in deference to a suggestion of theirs that the title has again been altered to 'the Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Act.' While giving leave to introduce the Bill the Government of India stipulated that it should again be circulated for opinion although, as I have explained, the Bill in its present form differs very little from that circulated in March last year, and that the opinions received should be forwarded for the consideration of the Government of India. That is why I do not propose to-day any motion beyond that the Bill should be introduced and circulated.

"That the Bill will give rise to a certain amount of controversy in this Council is, I fear, inevitable. Fortunately we have available an exceptionally bright array of legal talent eminently qualified to deal with the intricate and difficult questions involved, and I feel sure that there will be no difficulty in getting a Select Committee which will command the confidence of the rural public and do all that is humanly possible to improve the present form of the Bill. Of my own unfitness for the difficult task of steering the Bill through Council I am deeply conscious, but I admit that my regret in the fact that I shall in a few days be no longer a member of this Council is tempered by the knowledge that I shall at any rate escape from the duty of taking charge of this Bill, a task which I am conscious is far beyond my powers.

"I now formally move that leave be given for the introduction of the Bill."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik:—"I now beg to introduce the Bill and to move that it be circulated for opinion. It will perhaps be convenient if I run briefly through its clauses.

"The preamble, for which in its present form I am not responsible, would, I think, be improved if it ran as follows:—

> "'Whereas it is expedient to enact certain restrictions on the power of descendants or collaterals to contest an alienation of immoveable property or the appointment of an heir on the ground that it is contrary to custom; and whereas the previous sanction of the Governor-General in Council has been accorded under section 79 (2) of the Government of India Act, 1915, to the passing of this Act . . . .'

"The alterations I suggest are merely verbal but in its present form the preamble strikes me as capable of improvement.

"*Clause* 1—Gives the title of the Act. We have had great difficulty in getting a satisfactory title. The following have been from time to time suggested, firstly, 'Reversioners' Suits Act,' secondly, 'Reversioners' Claims Act,' thirdly, 'Customary Alienations Act' and fourthly, 'Customary Suits Restriction Act.' All these are open to some objection or other, but I cannot claim that the present title is entirely free from objection and the matter is no doubt one that will be discussed again in Select Committee. It is important to connote if possible by the title that the Act will apply not only to suits brought but to pleas raised in defence.

"*Clause* 2—Is the definition clause. I think there is no doubt that the term 'alienation' includes sale, mortgage, exchange and gift, but we also

have felt it should be made clear that it included testamentary bequests. The reason for defining 'appointment of an heir' as including adoptions was to simplify the wording throughout the Bill. In the original draft wherever the words 'appointment of an heir' occurred they were followed by 'or adoption of an heir.' That made the clauses somewhat clumsy in form and it saves much repetition to include adoptions in the general term 'appointment of an heir.'

"*Clause* 3—I have already mentioned. It limits the operation of the Bill to immoveable property and to alienations or appointments made by persons governed by custom. What we mean is of course what is generally known as agricultural custom, but as I have already explained there are objections to qualifying the word 'custom' in any way If, however, the Select Committee feels that it ought to be made clear that the Act will not apply to those who follow urban custom, where special urban customs exist, it may be able to devise some form of words to make that purpose clear.

"*Clause* 4 – Is the saving clause. Here again we had considerable difficulty in drafting but I think we have made it quite clear that the Act will not affect any pending litigation of any kind whatever.

"*Clause* 5—I have also mentioned. It is perhaps one of the most controversial provisions of the Bill. As drafted it governs the case both of a female who has alienated and a female who wishes to contest an alienation. A certain school of thought would like to omit the last 16 words of the clause, which would then run—'nothing in this Act shall apply to any alienation or appointment of an heir by a female.' In that case the female descendant's right to contest an alienation would be exactly the same as that of a male descendant under the Act. That, however, is a matter which must be left to the Council.

"The first two lines of *clause* 6 have been inserted at the suggestion of the Government of India, which pointed out that the Bill is inconsistent with the provisions of section 5 of the Punjab Laws Act. That is no doubt a perfectly correct criticism.

"*Clause* 7—Merely gives statutory effect to a custom which is, I believe, universally accepted, namely, that there is no customary limitation on the power to alienate non-ancestral immoveable property or to appoint an heir to such property. The clause is perhaps unnecessary if I am right in thinking that the custom is universally recognised.

"Nevertheless the Simla Conference of 1915 recommended that statutory force should be given to the custom and we have accepted this view.

"I now move that the Bill be circulated for opinion."

The Hon'ble Pandit Jawahir Lal, Bhargava :—"Your Honour, while not touching the specific provisions of the Bill at this stage, which is not the stage for that, I support the motion which has been made on the principle that underlies the present legislation. The Bill embodies two broad principles of Customary Law relating to alienation and succession of immoveable property by persons who are governed by agricultural custom which has been established beyond doubt by a series of rulings of the Chief Court. The power of dispensation of non-ancestral property is well recognised by all systems of law and by custom even in its incipient stage of development and so far as I know it is very rare that the power to control alienation of self-acquired property is set up in courts, or at least there are very few cases in which it has been found to exist. So far as the alienation of ancestral land is concerned the Bill amply provides for the protection of reversionary rights. The principle of the agnatic theory is also well recognised in the Bill in its proper limits. That theory if carried too far or pushed too far is liable to render the

title relating to immoveable property insecure and such a Bill will discourage all collusive suits and aims at the destruction of unnecessary litigation and at the same time protects the rights which are really to be protected. I submit that the sooner it is passed the better for the society at large. With these words I lend my wholehearted support to the Bill."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh :—"Your Honour, I support the motion which has been put forward by the Hon'ble Mover. In fact as has been pointed out by Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahir Lal, I am one of those members who were very anxious to see this Bill passed as soon as possible and in fact I addressed an official letter to the Member-in-charge that instead of circulating the Bill again for opinion it would be better that a motion for referring it to the Select Committee be made at this meeting, but the Hon'ble Member-in-charge has explained that the Bill is to be circulated for opinion under orders of the Government of India. Therefore I find that there is no remedy. Anyhow I press the necessity of passing this Bill as early as possible. We have already been discussing and deliberating over the measure for the last three or four years and opinions have been obtained more than once and the sooner we pass it the better. By so doing I am sure, Sir, that Your Honour will be doing an act of very great good to the peasantry who will be saved from needless litigation and expense. Therefore I submit, Sir, that I associate myself with the remarks that have fallen from the Hon'ble Pandit Jawahir Lal, Bhargava, and join with him in requesting this Council that steps should be taken that this Bill should be passed as early as possible by going through the proper formalities. With these remarks I beg to associate myself with the motion."

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik :—"Your Honour, I see no objection to any Hon'ble Member proposing an amendment that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee for report. Of course it is desired by the Government of India that it should be circulated for opinion, but that is not binding upon this Council to do so necessarily."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—"Your Honour, after hearing the Hon'ble Member-in-charge of the Bill, I had made up my mind not to say anything on the subject as it would come up again for an expression of opinion, but inasmuch as my two Hon'ble colleagues have expressed undue haste in having the Bill enacted into Law at a very early date, I think it is necessary for me to express my views on the subject. That is to say, if the Hon'ble Mr. Craik's suggestion that it is open to any Member to move a reference of the Bill to a Select Committee is going to be entertained then I will discuss it just now. If it is not, it is far too early to discuss inasmuch as there will be plenty of time for so doing when we have received the opinions of different bodies and persons. It is an exceedingly important subject and I think we are taking up the question of the interference with the existing rights of people who are under the Punjab Laws Act bound by custom. It is at this stage to my mind too early to enter upon that discussion. Therefore if Your Honour rules that a reference to a Select Committee is open then I will place my protest against the Bill being referred to a Select Committee."

His Honour the President :—"Does any Member desire at this stage that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee?"

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh :—"With your permission, Your Honour, I beg to move that this Bill may be made over to a Select Committee for report and the report of the Select Committee might be produced in any of the meetings which are to be held in March next. As regards the personnel of the Select Committee, I can leave that in the hands of the Hon'ble Member-in-charge or I can suggest the names myself. For the reasons which I have just submitted to this Council and for the reasons

that the unanimous opinion of the learned Judges of the Chief Court and of the two special committees and, as has also been made clear by the Hon'ble Mr. Craik, that opinions are also unanimous on this report, I submit that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee. As regards the views of the Hon'ble Members of the Council, they of course can be expressed after the Bill has emerged from the Select Committee. It is quite possible that the Bill will be returned in a shape which will not need much discussion. But anyhow I think it is absolutely necessary that the Bill may be made over to a Select Committee with the express direction that the result of their deliberations be referred to the Council at as early a date as possible."

The Hon'ble Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava :—"I second this motion."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—"Your Honour, now that a definite proposal has been made to refer this Bill to a Select Committee in modification of the proposal of the Hon'ble Member-in charge that the Bill in compliance with the wishes of the Government of India be referred to the public for an expression of opinion, I take this opportunity of opposing the motion that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee and support the motion that the Bill be circulated to the public for opinion.

"The first point which I beg to place before the Council, Your Honour, is, what is the object of the Bill and what advantage it in fact intends to achieve. Firstly, it is obvious that at present under the custom governing different parts of the Province, different tribes are governed by various rules restricting alienation of ancestral immoveable property by proprietors. That custom, as has been very rightly pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Craik, is in a fluid condition, which is as it should be. It is in the course of evolution. No doubt the highest judicial authority of the Province, as one might say with some truth, on and off tried to mould that custom not always to the best advantage of the people. However that may be it is clear that any interference with the growth of custom and with its development by legislation is certainly fraught with serious danger. But to say that the Hon'ble Members of this Council representing the people are in a position to lay down what the custom is or what it ought to be is in my humble opinion appropriating to themselves a power with which they are not really invested. I believe it was in the light of these facts that the Government of India insisted that when this Council is going to interfere with the existing custom, however slightly it may be, it is necessary that again and again this Council should be satisfied that the people whom this legislation is going to affect are willing to submit to this alteration, amendment or even codification. If it is said that this legislation is simply going to codify the existing custom then with due deference I would say that it is not quite correct. The rulings of the Chief Court show that on and off there are cases where collaterals more frequently interested in the alienor than the degree which is fixed secure at all events a verdict from the Chief Court in their favour. The Chief Court may be responsible for the conflicting decisions on these debateable questions of custom. I believe that from time to time they do give conflicting rulings on the subject. But the second question is are we justified in saying that the collaterals of an alienor who is not probably one of our constituents, should be bound by the custom which we are going to lay down for him. That is practically what it comes to and it is for these reasons that I support circulation once more before the matter is referred to the Select Committee. We should be in a position to find out from the people whether they are in favour of this codification or not.

"It was suggested that the Simla Committee on which a large number of Judges were acting decided that legislation should be resorted to. As a matter of fact the motion that is before this Council—the motion made by the Hon'ble Mr. Craik, is certainly not to the effect that there should be no legis-

lation. We should once more try to find out what the public has to say in the matter of this Bill and if after taking that into consideration and referring the matter to a Select Committee we find that legislation is needed there is no reason why we should not do so. But as to the second point urged by the Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh that the Bill be passed as opinion is unanimous, with due deference I would say that it is not correct. The Hon'ble Mr. Craik told us that the views were conflicting on the subject and he very properly pointed out the particular provisions in this Act, on which there was some conflict of opinion. Take for instance section 4. He told us that they did their very best to formulate these savings, but there were persons I remember who suggested that even those transactions which have taken place before the enactment of this Bill should be allowed to be governed by custom and should not be governed by this Bill. Why should this Bill come into force and deprive them of their claim. Therefore we have to see whether the people want this section 4 or not.

"*Section* 5.—As the Hon'ble Mr. Craik pointed out very properly, the second half of the section is really, as it stands at present, an extension in favour of females which is not warranted by the Customary Law as understood at present. If there is a male heir of the fifth degree he has not got the right to contest, but it is open under the provisions of this Bill for a female of the fifth or sixth degree to contest the alienation as this Act does not apply to her."

The Hon'ble Diwan Daulat Rai :—"It does not recognise her right."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—"It does not exclude her right. There is an express exclusion so far as the male heir is concerned, but so far as the female heir is concerned there is no exclusion."

The Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram :—"By implication it does."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—"Then we come to clause 6. Section 6 is surely a violent opposition to the law as known at present. Take the case of the man possessed of a whole ancestral village having no son but a brother with whom he is quarrelling furiously. On the 1st of December, 1918, he has alienated the whole of this village to a very obliging well-to-do zamindar. On the 15th of January, 1919, his wife presents him with a son. Now according to the provisions of the Bill this unfortunate son who comes upon the scene one month and fifteen days after the alienation has no right to contest that alienation. Now both the uncle and the nephew are deprived of the right to inherit their ancestral village. Does not the family suffer in that case ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik :—"I do not follow the argument."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—"I mean to say that if the son had not come into existence the uncle would have succeeded and the son would have succeeded in due course of time. Now that this son has come in both the son and the uncle have no chance of ever succeeding to that property."

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik :—"Why not the uncle ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain.—"The uncle cannot because the next heir is the son."

The Hon'ble Diwan Daulat Rai :—"The son is the heir, but the uncle still retains the right to contest the alienation."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—"Does it not become patent to the Council what interests has this uncle who has always been quarrelling with his brother to have this alienation set aside in favour of his own nephew ? What has he got to do with it ? In any case so far as I can see this provision does not make for clearness of title. It does not certainly make for a reduction

of litigation which I understand is the object of the enactment, and to my mind it certainly interferes most substantially with the rights of persons. Under the Customary Law they are entitled to see that the custom which has been followed for generations is not interfered with. I believe these are the reasons which have very strongly influenced the Government of India in trying to lay a press upon the progressive tendencies of this Council. I must say that in this matter the people most concerned are not the well-to-do professional men nor are they rich and well-to-do zemindars. A provision like that is for the protection more or less of middle classes who are in very affluent circumstances and it is on account of their necessities and more or less habits like drinking and so on which are not always commendable, that they have a recourse to alienation to the prejudice of the best interests of their family. I trust that this Council, which of course knows nothing about those characters and has no sympathy with them, will hesitate before taking any hasty step in the matter. Therefore I support the original motion and oppose the reference of the Bill to a Select Committee."

The Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—" Your Honour, I think the Select Committee should have the greatest advantage of the available opinion of the public and press before it sits to examine. Therefore it would be better to collect that opinion before a reference to a Select Committee, especially when such a motion is not included in the List of Business of to-day's meeting. The call of public opinion and material for consideration of the Select Committee are both an advantage rather than a disadvantage."

The Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram :—" Your Honour, I oppose the motion put forward by the Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh. This is the first attempt of its kind to codify the customs of the Punjab and I humbly submit that this should be done with great hesitation. There are numerous difficulties which have been pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain who has just opposed the motion. The Hon'ble Mover himself admits that from the beginning to the end a few provisions of this Bill are full of difficulties. There are difficulties in choosing the name and there are difficulties in the substantial part of the Bill. Therefore I am sorry to oppose the motion that has been put forward by Sardar Gajjan Singh and I support the motion that the Bill should be circulated for opinion."

The Hon'ble Chaudhri Lal Chand :—" Your Honour, a good deal has been said by the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain and I think the Hon'ble Sardar Gajjan Singh is over-zealous and I oppose his motion."

The Hon'ble Sardar Gajjan Singh :—" Your Honour, it has been said in opposition to my motion by the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain that the provisions of this Bill are calculated to interfere with the development of custom. I beg, Sir, to take the liberty of differing from him. It has been very rightly pointed out by the Hon'ble Mover that the articles of this Bill are based upon almost such rulings of the Chief Court which on these points are unanimous. In Simla the views of the Hon'ble Judges who were members of the Conference of 1915 and also the articles were based upon the judicial discussions of the Hon'ble Judges of the Chief Court. As a matter of fact when I joined the Bar as late as 1884 the rulings of the Chief Court then were that everyone who went into the court to contest an alienation he had to prove that there was a custom which empowered him to contest the alienation. For some time the Chief Court was unanimous in this view. In 1887 by a well-known ruling of the Chief Court this opinion was changed. Since then, the Chief Court has been holding the view, at least about the central districts of the Punjab, that there right of alienation is vested in the heir. Now

Sir, to what degrees of heir this right is extended is the question, which this Bill wants to provide. As we all know according to the Hindu Law the right extends to sons of grandsons and no more.

"Of course occasionally it has been held that relations or collaterals in the sixth or seventh degree have the right to contest the alienation but such rulings are very few. Therefore I submit, Sir, that as in every enactment the benefit of the majority is to be concerned the view expressed in this Bill is the best that under the circumstances could have been allowed.

"Then something has been said about the posthumous son—

His Honour the President :—"Will the Hon'ble Member confine himself to the question of the motion to refer the Bill to a Select Committee ?"

The Hon'ble Sardar Gajjan Singh :—"I began to discuss because Mr. Fazl-i-Husain referred to these points. I would only say that all these objections by the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain can be considered by the Select Committee ; it would be quite open to him to advance all these views and they would be considered. As far as the taking of opinion is concerned I understand that it has already been done twice, and I believe the members of the district board and municipal committee and all Members of this Council have been consulted. And as has been pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Craik this present Bill is the result of those opinions and all controversial points have been eliminated from it. Several problems, as has been pointed out, have been eliminated. Therefore I submit, Sir, that no case has been made out to show that this Bill should not go to a Select Committee."

His Honour the President :—"The general feeling of the Council appears to be as follows :—The Hon'ble Member who has recommended that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee and the Hon'ble Member-in-charge of the Bill who has for years been following the course of this Bill and is intimately conversant with its provisions, are convinced of the excellence of the provisions and they naturally desire the matter to end as soon as possible. I notice that some members are of this opinion. Again some of the distinguished lawyers are diametrically opposed to one another. Now owing to this obscurity and fear of haste, owing to the fact also that there are a few changes made by the Government of India and by the special committee and owing to the advice given by the Government of India, perhaps opposition of the members to the motion that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee at this stage is justified. That appears to be the general feeling of the Council. It is very desirable that we should not take any false steps at the start which would prejudice public opinion. These are my remarks and the matter is left in the hands of the Council."

The motion that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee was put to the Council and lost.

The original motion that the Bill be circulated for opinion was put and carried.

PUNJAB ADULTERATION OF FOOD BILL.

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"Your Honour, I beg to present the report of the Select Committee appointed by this Council on the 25th of April 1918, to examine the Bill which I introduced on that date to make provision in the Punjab for the sale of food in a pure and genuine condition, and to prevent its adulteration.

"In its deliberations the Select Committee had the advantage of considering the opinions of many gentlemen and bodies who had been consulted and also of comparing the present Bill with similar Bills framed or Acts passed

in other Provinces. It will be noticed that the report is unanimous. The alterations which have been made in the Bill are of a simple character and I do not think I need detain this Council by going into them at any length. I will just very briefly supplement what has already been said in the report.

"The first alteration in clause 1 is a mere clerical alteration. In the definition of 'food' the Select Committee were of opinion that on the whole it is desirable to add the words 'and colouring' in view of the fact that some of the colouring matter in general use was in the case of tea, for instance, extremely deleterious.

"The next alterations introduced the words 'or keeps' after the word 'exposes' in clause 3 (1). The idea in the minds of the Committee was this: It might be quite possible for a man to keep some pure ghee on the counter and at the same time to have a quantity of adulterated ghee underneath it. If the latter were detected he might plead, with some plausibility, that the ghee under the counter was not exposed for sale. Consequently the Committee considered that to get over a difficulty of this kind it would be well to add the words thus providing for the mere keeping for sale.

"As regards the next alteration in section 3 (2) the Select Committee were of opinion that on the whole it was better that a strict provision of this kind should be made in the Bill. When the Bill was originally framed we considered that the provisions of the Criminal Procedure Code would probably be sufficiently comprehensive to cover the matter of this kind, but in deference to the unanimous wish of the non-official Members of the Select Committee this clause has been inserted.

"In clause 4 the word 'conveyance' has been added after the word 'preparation.' This word finds a place in the other Acts and Bills which the other Provinces have passed or are considering and I think it is only reasonable that this addition should be made. It is obviously impossible to prevent a certain amount of dust or foreign bodies becoming unmixed with the articles in transit. This addition would prevent any prosecution for an accident of this kind. In clause 4 there is an important amendment to which I would call the special attention of this Council. In the original Bill the clause ran as follows:—'Where any matter or ingredient not injurious to health and not intended fraudulently to increase its bulk, weight or measure, or to conceal its, inferior quality, has been added to or mixed with such food.'

"In the Select Committee there was a very strong opinion expressed by the non-official Members that an exception should be made in the case of ghee milk, cream and khoa. The reason for this opinion was as follows:—It was considered that no mixture of any kind should be allowed in respect of these articles. I pointed out that in the case of ghee atany rate there was some difficulty in accepting amendments of this kind on the ground that there probably was a demand for a cheaper form of ghee which could be only sold cheaply because it was not pure ghee, and I quoted in support of this contention the experience of the Registrar of the Co-operative Societies who had made considerable efforts to make arrangements for a supply of pure ghee. His experiments were not very successful and he reported as follows:—'Our experience is that townspeople will not buy pure ghee when it is offered to them and we have been unable to find dealers to sell our pure ghee as pure ghee, though they are prepared to buy it for sale after adulteration. These difficulties nearly brought our ghee societies to an end. If people will not pay for pure ghee now, they will be still less likely to pay for it at a price which will be higher than at present, for a large portion of the demand for 'ghee' is met by adulterants, and if we cut off the adulterants the remaining supply will be short of the demand.'

"This was the experience of the Registrar of the Co-operative Societies. On my quoting this sad experience the non-official Members were still unani-

mous in considering that this change should be made. The question of demand is not perhaps of great importance because this Bill will be introduced very gradually. It can only be introduced progressively into various local areas as local areas must first desire that it should be introduced and we may feel confident that the measure will only be partially enforced for some time to come. With regard to the question of price the non-official Members urged that the Indian public who use ghee would prefer to buy a small portion of pure ghee at a higher price and do the mixing themselves. I understand the adulteration of ghee can be performed quite easily in the domestic circles.

"As regards khoa, which is a substance with which I confess I am altogether unfamiliar, non-official Members expressed a strong desire that it should be introduced into the Bill. I understand that the term is well known to all Indians in this Province and that the food consists or ought to consist merely of the constituents of pure milk. I understand that khoa is obtained by the continuous boiling of milk until it becomes inspissated. I endeavoured to find an English substitute for this word but without success and the word 'khoa' has therefore been retained. After all we have a precedent in the word 'ghee' which also is not an English word.

"The other change in the same clause 4 (3) is self-explanatory. The marking or labelling of commodities would not really assist a large number of the purchasers who are unable to read or even recognise labels, and consequently we considered it necessary that these illiterate purchasers should be protected in some way and we have added the words 'and by orally informing the purchaser.' I think the Council will agree that this is a most reasonable amendment.

"The change in clause 14 proviso is a mere clerical amendation and I have already made some explanation as regards the word 'khoa' which the Hon'ble Members on the Sub-Committee were most anxious to see introduced.

"Then the last change that has been made is the introduction of a new section 19 which runs as follows :—'No prosecution under this Act shall be instituted except on the complaint of the purchaser or at the instance of a person authorised under section 10 to procure samples.' It was felt that the Bill should have some direct provision explaining how prosecutions were to be instituted and we found that similar provisions have found a place in some of the similar enactments which have been passed or are being passed in other Provinces.

"These are the changes that have been made in the Bill which I am glad to say has been received with a chorus of approval from those who have been consulted.

"With these few remarks I beg to move that the report be now taken into consideration."

The motion that the report of the Select Committee be taken into consideration was carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"Your Honour, I beg to move that the Bill as amended be now passed. I explained the object of the Bill and the reasons for its introduction at some length when I introduced the Bill some ten months ago, and I do not think it is necessary for me to add to what I have already said. Criticisms directed against the Bill have been extremely few, and most of them have been met by the small changes which have been made in the Select Committee. When the Bill was introduced I had the support of many of the Hon'ble Members of the Council who expressed themselves only too delighted that the measure had at last taken shape. I think therefore it is unnecessary for me to do more at present than move that the Bill as amended by the Select Committee be now passed."

The motion was put and agreed to.

54 LR—200—25-2-19—SGPP Lahore.

[*His Honour the President; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Mr. Lumsden.*]

RESOLUTION *RE* MEETING OF THREE-FOURTHS OF EDUCATIONAL EXPENDITURE FROM PROVINCIAL REVENUES.

His Honour the President :— "It will be more convenient for the Council if we take the discussion on the Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal's Resolutions to-day and postpone the discussion on the Compulsory Education Bill till to-morrow."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :— "Your Honour, the Resolution which I have the honour to move in this meeting of the Council is as follows :—

"'This Council recommends to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, that henceforth not less than three-fourths of the educational expenditure of Local Bodies be met from Provincial Revenues.'

"I have not got with me the figures of the expenditure on primary education during the last year 1917-18, but from the four years (1913 to 1917) average expenditure on the primary education as given in the Government reports on the progress of education in the Punjab, it appears that not more than one-fifth of the total expenditure on primary education is contributed by the municipal committees and not more than one-fourth of such expenditure is contributed by the district boards as shown by the following statements :—

(1) Municipalities :—

	Total expenditure on primary education in the Province.	*From Local Funds.*
	Rs.	Rs.
1913-14	1,45,661	44,766
1914-15	1,93,274	44,427
1915-16	2,25,023	63,552
1916-17	2,36,437	58,717
4	8,00,395	2,11,462
	2,00,099	52,865

Government grant about three-fourths.

(2) District Boards :—

	Rs.	Rs.
1913-14	10,48,592	2,94,497
1914-15	12,04,885	3,97,642
1915-16	13,57,349	5,10,314
1916-17	13,77,226	4,32,650
4	49,88,052	16,35,103
	12,47,013	4,08,770

Government grant about three-fourths.

In view of the very strained financial conditions of our local bodies in this Province it is not fair to require them to contribute more than one-fourth of the expenditure which on the passing of the Punjab Primary Education Act, 1919, is expected to swell very largely; and notwithstanding the power of imposing additional taxation to meet part of the cost of providing primary education for the children residing in the local area, at least three-fourths of the cost must be met from the Imperial and Provincial Revenue. In the absence of a guarantee on the part of the Government to aid the local bodies handsomely the Punjab Primary Education Act extending compulsory and free education in the Province is certain to remain a dead letter in the statute book of this Province. Therefore the demand made by the above Resolution is very modest, and it is hoped that the Resolution will receive support from all Members, official and non-official, and will be passed unanimously.

His Honour the President left the chair and the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard, Vice-President, took the chair.

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :— "I should like to rise to a point of order before the discussion proceeds any further. It seems to me that as this Resolution involves very serious financial liabilities the Council is not in a position

to discuss the Resolution until these liabilities have been placed before it. As far as I have heard the Hon'ble Member's motion nothing has been said regarding these liabilities. I think it is for the Hon'ble mover of this Resolution to show first of all what the liabilities will be, both as regards recurring and non-recurring expenditure, both now, after a period of 5 years and after a further period of 10 years, so that the Council may have some idea what this Resolution really involves, and it is then, I think, for the Hon'ble mover to show that these sums of money, whatever they may be, can be diverted or can be rather devoted to this particular head without unduly interfering with the normal development of the Province in other directions. For instance, we might divert the money to education at the expense of medical relief. We have just passed through a very severe epidemic of influenza which cost the Province some three-fourths of a million of lives, and it is obvious that the supply of medical treatment is one of the most important points requiring consideration. Now if we divert the money, say all the available money, to education, medicine must be left uncared for. Similarly we have the question of roads. Communications must not be neglected. Consequently before the discussion proceeds, Sir, I would ask the Hon'ble Member to let us have some figures of the liabilities, both present and future; and that he should make out a case showing that this money can be devoted to the purpose he desires, without interfering with the normal development in other directions which may be equally as important."

The Hon'ble Mr Maynard :—" It is for the Hon'ble mover to establish his own case. There is no point of order. The discussion will continue."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Hussain.—"The point raised by this Resolution, Sir, is one of very great importance indeed. Next to the one thing, that is to say, medical relief, which means existence, to my mind the most important thing is the health of the mind, the development of the mind. Therefore to my mind there is no other mode of expenditure which can possibly come in rivalry with it or in opposition to the subject matter of this Resolution. The importance of this Resolution in view of the Compulsory Education Bill cannot possibly be over-estimated, and I take this opportunity of saying a few words in support of this Resolution in order to clear such misapprehensions as there may be as to the Bill which is coming for discussion before us to-morrow. In the first place it is apprehended that the Government's share of the expenditure to be incurred on the scheme of extension of primary education is not specified in the Bill. That is quite correct, but when the Council is told that this is done, not because the Government is not prepared to incur its own share of the expenditure, but because the legal advisers of the Government were of opinion that such a liability cannot be entered in the enactment or it is not at all necessary to do so, I think such misapprehensions as prevail at present will disappear. I think, Sir, that, roughly speaking two-thirds of the total expenditure on primary education is at present incurred by the provincial funds and one-third by the local bodies. Therefore what it comes to practically is this that this Resolution demands that the difference between two-thirds and three-fourths be also met by provincial revenue. To my mind whether the money comes from provincial revenues or from local bodies is not very material as long it is forthcoming. But there are two reasons why provincial revenues should be tapped rather than the funds of the local bodies. The first reason is this that the Bill that we are going to consider to-morrow, and hope to pass, is not a measure which compels local bodies to start schools or to maintain them. It only gives them the option to open schools if they like, and having extended the Act to the area within their jurisdiction then to enforce compulsion in order to secure the attendance of pupils in those schools. In other words, the local bodies, which are faced not only with the administrative problem but also with the liability to maintain these schools will, to my mind, be disinclined to move in the matter with the result that all the benefits that this Bill is intended to confer on the backward parts of the Province will be unavailed of. No doubt the money, whether it comes from the provincial revenues or from the funds of the local boards, has to come out of the pocket of the people in any case. But

to my mind if it is to be found from amongst the coffers of the provincial revenue the danger that the local bodies will be slow to move within their jurisdiction will be obviated. No doubt, if the existing funds are not sufficient, this Council will have to move in the matter in the way of imposing further taxation. But that taxation for the purpose of the Education Bill will be indirect, and I think it is a well known proposition that an indirect tax does not hurt the people so much as a direct tax does.

"Then the second thing that I wanted to point out was that a case is to be made out that not three-fourths of the revenue should be made available, but that the difference between two-thirds and three-fourths will be available, inasmuch as under the existing practice, I understand, by the more or less tacit direction of the Government of India at least two-thirds of the expenditure on primary education has to be met by provincial revenues. Here, Sir, I may mention in passing that there is a position which has been taken by critics of this Bill and by those who are keenly interested in the direction of primary education as distinct from secondary or high education, as also distinct from other administrative departments of the Government, that primary education is a function which is more or less the foremost function of a Government, and for the reasons that it is needed by those who are absolutely ignorant and who constitute what we call the ignorant masses. To say that those ignorant masses should have the right of self-determination without first having the preliminary education to my mind is an unfair extension of the principles of self-determination. These ignorant masses have really to be brought up to a particular standard of intelligence. Therefore any attempt to curtail this obligation of the Government or its duty to impart primary education as distinct from secondary or higher education is not a move in the right direction. I apprehend, Sir, that these local bodies, which are not so much alive to the need of the removal of ignorance, will not be as keen to bring themselves within the purview of the Bill as one might have expected or as one might have desired. And it is for this reason that there is a keenly felt need in certain quarters more or less to force their hands. But at the same time I find that it is not easy to do so, knowing how varying the conditions of life in different parts of the Province are. If a local body sets itself up against the mandates of this Council and refuses to move, no particular method has been found by us, Sir, to force the local bodies to move in the matter. Therefore it is all the more necessary, Sir, that the purport of this Resolution should find favour at the hands of this Council. The only other alternative is to more or less help them financially and make it easy for them to do what we think these bodies ought to do. Now the next point I will touch is that these local bodies should be given as much to do as they can manage. If you give them really too much to do at the very beginning, I am afraid they will not benefit by the opportunity afforded them to do their best in the matter. I am referring here to the matter of the amount of work that they have to do. It is not my wish that calling upon the local bodies to do a great deal maintains a school right up to the middle standard or matriculation standard. We may expect them to do something which they are not likely even to attempt because it rests with them whether to bring themselves under the Bill or not. Therefore, although strongly in favour of giving them as much financial help as provincial revenues may enable us to do, I am not in favour of putting so much on their shoulders that they may not carry half the burden. So, Sir, I heartily support the principle of the Resolution which has been placed before the Council, and I hope our Finance Minister, who has always been willing in the cause of primary education, will find his way to give as much additional money over and above 66 per cent. as is possible, realising that barring the question of epidemic there is no graver or greater than the need for primary education in this Province."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahir Lal, Bhargava:—"Sir, fortunately I come of a constituency which His Honour has, comparatively speaking, treated generously in the matter of giving the Government quota towards the cost of education owing to the backwardness of that constituency in edu-

cation as well as His Honour's solicitude for the welfare of the people of that constituency, but all the same I think it to be my duty to ask the Government to contribute as liberally as possible towards the cost of education and in no case less than three-fourths of the total expenditure incurred by the local bodies.

"The Government is fully aware that the local bodies in the province have very limited resources, and as often as not the amounts they do and can invest on education can at best meet a small fraction of the total contemplated outlay on education.

"The people in every country and specially in India look up to Government for the realisation of such large projects as popular primary education. The provision of an adequate number of schools and freedom from cost of education are matters second only in importance to compulsion, but they are the *sine qua non* of the realisation of compulsory education in a poor country like India, and it is needless to say that these cannot be provided for without considerable expenditure.

"It is not unlikely that local bodies may think discretion to be the better part of valour and not undertake the responsibilities and an amount of expenditure the required fraction of which they may find themselves unable to cope with. I would, therefore urge that the Government should take the liability of contributing at least three-fourths of the total expenditure on education incurred by the local bodies.

"With these words I support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai :—"Sir, I have great pleasure in seconding the resolution which has been just moved by my friend, the Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal. I am sure the demand he has put forward, *viz.*, that three-fourths of the cost of elementary education in this province shall, in future, be met out of provincial revenues will not be regarded as an excessive demand by this Council. As the Hon'ble Members of this Council must be aware, only as late as September last, the Government of India laid down that two-thirds of the cost under the voluntary system should be paid by Government in addition to the expenditure incurred in the training of teachers, as well as in providing for the inspection of elementary schools. In the Bombay Presidency, the Government contribution under the voluntary system has been three-fourths of the total cost. It is true that under the compulsory system of primary education which has recently been introduced in the Bombay Presidency, the Government contribution will not exceed 50 per cent. of the aggregate expenditure on primary education. But I submit that in this connection we must bear in mind the important fact that the operation of the Bombay Act will be confined to municipal areas only, the financial resources of which are much greater than those of rural areas for which the Bombay Government will continue to pay a three-fourths grant. Moreover, on account of the liberal policy adopted for many years past by the Bombay Government in regard to the extension of popular education, the Bombay Presidency, is in many ways, ahead of this Province. Although the population of the Bombay Presidency is almost the same as ours the Bombay Government has during the past eight years spent as much as 27 lacs a year in excess of what we in the Punjab have done on elementary education. We have this much lee-way to make before we can come into line with our sister Province.

"In England again, where compulsory elementary education has been in force since 1870, the Parliamentary grant, which corresponds to our Government grant, was two-thirds of the total cost before the war. In Scotland it was more than two-thirds, while in Ireland nearly the whole cost was borne by the State. This was before the war began. The war has further emphasized the importance of popular education. It has of late been recognised more and more clearly that children are a national asset and money spent on their proper education is not only a national investment but that it is the

duty of the State to protect the interest of children against the self-seeking short-sightedness of parents. The economic struggle is becoming harder day by day, and international competition is going to be very much keener than it has ever been before.

"Sir, even from the purely utilitarian point of view, it will be recognised that a State will be lacking in its duty if it fails to fit its future citizens for the heavy tasks that await them. In England, as elsewhere in the west, vast schemes of educational development costing enormous sums of money have been taken in hand As an example, I might refer to the recent Education Act of Mr Fisher. According to this Act, education has been made absolutely free in England between the ages of 2 and 18, that is, for a period of sixteen years, and compulsory between the ages of 6 and 18.

"For every rupee per head of population that England was spending before the war, India was spending about half an-anna. With the greatly increased financial responsibilities which Mr. Fisher's Act will throw on the Government the disproportion will become very much greater unless we in this country are also prepared to make adequate provision for the expansion of elementary education. Sir, I plead for the poor people of my Province, and I hope and trust that my appeal will meet with an enthusiastic response from the Council.

"I was simply astonished to hear Mr. Lumsden remark when rising to a point of order that the Hon'ble mover of the resolution should have given figures of the liabilities before he could press his Resolution. I fail to see where comes in the point that the mover of the Resolution should point out the funds. There is nothing abnormal in the Resolution. There is a certain amount of money which the mover definitely said should be spent on elementary education. You will be pleased to see that we are asking the municipalities in the legislation of Primary Education Bill to make primary education compulsory. Are we not to assure them that if primary education is to be made compulsory it is not only the municipal resources that have to be looked to, but the Government should certainly be able and willing to afford a very proper portion of the cost? Otherwise the whole thing will be a dead letter.

"I pointed out, if I rightly remember, even in the Select Committee that the municipal board shall pay from its own funds. What does that fund mean? The fund included the contributions from the provincial revenue. With these remarks I give my hearty support to the Resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—

"Sir, although the Financial Secretary might expect me to support a motion which is intended to give more money to education I support him in opposing it.

"I do so first because it is based on a misconception. The Hon'ble mover and other members who have supported him, have spoken of Government's promise to meet two-thirds of the cost of vernacular education. They imploy that this resolution merely raises the proportion of Government's contribution from two-thirds to three-quarters. But Government has made no promise whatever to meet two-thirds of the cost of vernacular education. What it has promised to do is to meet two-thirds of the cost of a particular programme ; to assure the liability for a definite sum of about eight lakhs. And Hon'ble members seem to be under a misunderstanding as to how that two-thirds was arrived at. It was not an arbitrarily chosen proportion. It was arrived at in this way— The Committee on District Board Educational Finance recommended that Boards should be graded for contributions on the basis of their resources, expenditure, etc. Well, they were so graded by Government; the richest getting only 50 per cent., the poorest getting 100 per cent. When an average was

struck it was found that the share of Government over the whole Province would be two-thirds of the cost of the programmes. It might have turned out to be five-eights or three-quarters but, when a reasonable gratis had been introduced it turned out to be two-thirds. The Hon'ble mover of this resolution clearly means by it to give Boards more money for education. But do they need more? They cannot move faster than the programmes which they themselves have submitted and which include for the next five years all the schools they are likely to open with success. But if it did result in giving Boards more to spend on education I might be inclined to support it. But it will not do so. The extra money given by Government would relieve the Boards of some expenditure they had promised; but they would not spend the money on education. Suppose a Board, which was receiving two-thirds of its expenditure from Government, were to be given three-quarters instead, do not imagine that it would spend the difference on education. If would still go on with its programme and spend the money it had saved owing to the Government grant on roads or sanitation or something else. It would not be spent on education. As we have got a definite programme for the next five years of which District Boards have promised to meet their share, I see no advantage to be gained by passing this resolution.

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai.—"May I say one word with your permission ——?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden.—"On a point of order I submit that it is only the mover of the resolution who is allowed the opportunity of speaking twice."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai—"I wish to say only one word that some misapprehension seems to exist in the mind of the Hon'ble Mr. Richey. We are not going to have the whole thing throughout the Province compulsory at once. It will be by gradual stages."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard.—"That is a sort of reply which the Hon'ble Member is not entitled to give and the Hon'ble mover can only do so."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden.—"Sir, as I have explained, very considerable difficulty is involved in replying to a Resolution moved in such extremely vague terms, without any efforts having been made to point out the liability which it seeks to impose on Government. As Financial Secretary it is of course impossible for me to accept any indefinite liability, and such indefinite liability would be accepted by no Government in the world. In the absence of all facts criticism from the financial point of view is naturally impossible.

"On other grounds I find it difficult to understand the object of this resolution. Apparently the Hon'ble Member is not satisfied with what Government has been doing. Yet he has been pointing out how generous the Government has been in the matter of education, and he has pointed this out rightly because this Government has been extremely generous in the cause of education. I do not know if the Hon'ble Member has considered what is done in other countries by Government towards bearing the expenses on education. If he will refer to the state of affairs in the United States of America—a nation which has always regarded itself with some pride as being one of the most advanced nations in the world,—he will find that in some of the States the State does not contribute one single penny towards primary education, not one single penny."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai.—"Is it not a fact that in some of the States in the United States not only primary education, but also secondary and higher education is absolutely free?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden.—"I said only in *some* of the States. Then over the whole of the United States of America the proportion of the expenditure borne by Government as distinct from local bodies amounts to 15 per cent. In this resolution the proportion asked for is 75 per cent.

"When I read the Resolution and considered it from its financial point of view as I have said I was unable to proceed any further, but it struck me at the time that this was an insidious attack upon local self-government. I do know if that was the intention of the Hon'ble Member. I can hardly believe it was so in view of the fact that the Hon'ble Member himself is a representative of the local bodies, but the resolution certainly lends itself to that point of view. We have at the present moment in this Province local bodies at various stages of development. Some of them have almost approached manhood, while others are, so to speak, still in their mother's lap. The resolution proposes to emasculate the advanced local bodies and let the backward be maintained in their mothers' lap for the rest of their lives. If the Hon'ble Member's intention is that local bodies should be abolished then let him bring forward a straightforward Resolution to abolish the local bodies. I shall oppose it most strongly and the Council will give little support to it. But the present insidious method of cutting at this independence of local bodies is, I think, much to be deprecated. What sort of local bodies has the Hon'ble mover in mind? Does he assume that they are to be mere parasites in the body politic? Is there any development possible under such conditions? Is there never to be any such thing as sturdy independence among them? I do not know if the Hon'ble Member has considered that aspect of the resolution, but it is an aspect which cannot be ignored.

"Leaving that aside, there are various other small objections which I put before the Council. As I have said, the main objection is the financial one which I am unable to touch, but there are other objections which I would recommend to the consideration of those who are feeling any desire to support this Resolution. The Resolution takes no account of the difference between the status of local bodies. At the present moment, as has been explained by my Hon'ble colleague, who is in charge of the subject, we have prepared with considerable care and trouble a programme for primary education under district boards. In that, as he has explained, we have graded the distribution of the grants according to the resources of the district boards. Certain district boards favoured by nature or by artificial improvements made by Government are in a very much better position than others which command less affluent areas. It seems to me it is most essential that this discrimination between affluent and non-affluent local bodies should be maintained. As a matter of fact in the case of certain district boards we propose to give not 75 per cent. but 100 per cent. The programme has been drawn up with the greatest care, and it involves Government in a very considerable expense, the details of which we most carefully examined in the Financial Branch before we were able to commit ourselves to it. This discrimination would apparently be swept away by the Resolution and the affluent bodies who have more money than they know what to do with, would be placed on an equality with those struggling bodies which require every penny they can get.

"Then there is another point and that is that no distinction is made in the Resolution between bodies which are spending at the present time a large proportion of their income on education and those which are spending very little. For instance, take the case of municipalities. Municipalities on the average spend, I think, between 8 and 9 per cent. of their income on education whereas some district boards spend up to 30 per cent., or I think even 33 per cent. in one case, of their income on education. Now it stands to reason

that when municipalities are easily able to devote more money to education if more is required there is no object in treating them in the same way as those boards which are already devoting a very large proportion of their funds to this head.

"There is another point which deserves consideration, and that is this that the vast majority of the provincial finance is derived from the rural areas. When, as is probable, income-tax becomes a purely imperial head the provincial funds will be provided in even greater measure by the rural population. Is there any reason why we should divert rural funds to assist municipalities which are in a position to finance their own system of education?

"I feel, Sir, that in the absence of any details I have been unable to criticise this Resolution as fully as I should have wished, but I think that apart from the financial standpoint, the questions I have suggested deserve some consideration from the mover."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"So far as the Resolution is understood by the Hon'ble Finance Member to insult the principle of self-government, I respectfully submit that such perfect self-government has not yet been contemplated to be given to the local bodies, which are still incapable of providing funds or to carry on all the schemes according to their own will and wish. They have yet to depend very much or to a very large extent on the support of the Government. As to the other point, that no definite liability of Government has been put forward, I respectfully submit that even at present the Government has undertaken to provide about or not less than two-thirds of the expenditure on primary education. That proportion has to be increased in view of the Compulsory Education Bill being on the anvil of this Legislative Council. The time when that liability was limited to two-thirds at that time."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"I rise to a point of order. It is all very well to say that Government has undertaken to find two-thirds of the expenditure, but it has only undertaken to meet two-thirds of a specific amount which has been worked on a certain programme."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"Now that it has been contemplated to introduce compulsory and at the same time free education and that education has to be placed in the hands of the local bodies we must strengthen the hands of the local bodies, so that they may be able to carry on the provisions of the Act. We do not mean that on the one hand we give them authority to introduce compulsory education and on the other hand we contract our pecuniary help which we have already been giving them. As the system now stands, if all the schools be closed the Government is not liable to pay anything, neither the local bodies are responsible to maintain any school. Every primary school or secondary school could be closed. It is altogether optional to maintain those schools, but since we are making those schools permanent institutions and when we are inviting or rather commanding the people to come forward and to send their children of certain age for compulsory education we must see that the local bodies have got means to carry out those provisions, and as their pecuniary circumstances are very well known to all the Members of this Council, I submit that it is absolutely necessary that not less than three-fourths of the cost must be met by Government."

Here His Honour the President returned and resumed the chair.

The resolution was put to the Council and lost by 12 votes to 9.

RESOLUTION *RE* MEETING OF THREE-FOURTH OF SANITARY EXPENDITURE FROM PROVINCIAL REVENUES.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"Your Honour, the second Resolution standing in my name is as follows :—

"'This Council recommends to His Honour the Lieutenant Governor that henceforth not less than three-fourths of the sanitation expenditure of local bodies be met from provincial revenues.'

"Notwithstanding the very heavy tolls of death rate in this Province due to fever, tuberculosis, plague, cholera, small-pox, influenza, diarrhœa and dysentery, the local bodies have not been able to utilize during the last decade greater parts of the annual grants from the Imperial and Provincial Government to help this Province in sanitary expenditure. So far as I have been able to think this inability on the part of the local bodies seems to be due to the fact that their own resources are so very limited that they are not capable of contributing their half share, that is, rupee to rupee, in schemes for sanitary improvements of the areas under their respective control. The fact that the local bodies do not initiate any such schemes, nor do they avail of any Sanitary Schemes suggested to them, is due to their straitened financial circumstances. It is hoped that the sanitary condition of the country, specially of the rural areas, will be materially improved if the ratio of Government help be raised to the minimum of three-fourths. In this way it is expected that the amount which the local bodies spend on sanitary improvement at present will be automatically doubled and that there will be very little chance of grants from Imperial and Provincial Government lapsing at the close of the year wholly or partly. Therefore the demand made by the above resolution is based on absolute necessity, and it is hoped that the resolution will receive hearty support from the Hon'ble Members who are interested in the sanitary improvement of the rural as well as of the Urban areas of this Province."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"I want to point out again that the Hon'ble mover quotes no figures to show the expenditure of the liability to which the Government is asked to commit itself. Let us suppose, for instance, that the Lahore Municipality decides to introduce a widespread drainage and water-supply scheme costing 50 lakhs. Are we expected to supply three-fourths of that amount there and then thus depriving all other local bodies of any support, absorbing the whole of our unallotted expenditure and arresting progress in every other direction simply because the Lahore Municipality has decided to embark on an ambitious scheme of the kind? Until the Hon'ble Member can show what the extent of the liability is or is likely to be and that such liability can be met from surplus funds at the disposal of the Government, I cannot really see the use of discussing this Resolution. For one thing the resolutions put forward by the Hon'ble mover seem to be self-contradictory, because if the money is to be applied to one it is not available for the other. Until figures are placed before the Council to show what the Resolution involves from a financial point of view I cannot see how it can be discussed with advantage. I am personally unable to criticise the Resolution usefully from this important standpoint. I would suggest that the Hon'ble mover might withdraw his Resolution and ask permission to bring it forward at some future meeting of the Council when he has got the information, supposing the information is not available to-day."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"As a matter of fact the object of my Resolution is that the expenditure should not be limited to one-quarter. Supposing the demands of Lahore Municipality are much greater than the municipality of any other small town. It is not necessary that every municipality should have the three-fourths expenditure of their sanitary

schemes, but it should be guaranteed that for the whole Province it should get three fourths the cost of the sanitary improvements to be borne by Government. It being an absolute necessity my object is to represent to the Government that funds be created, if there are no funds, by additional taxation or in any other way. But simply to shelve the matter because we must first show the funds and then bring the Resolution is simply to put the matter behind for ever. At present all the heads of income and expenditure are equalised, and to find out out of those heads any additional expenditure is impossible. The Government has to take this responsibility, and it must see its way to raise the funds by new taxation or in any other way."

His Honour the President.—" Could the Financial Commissioner inform us at this stage what surplus the local bodies have at the present time? Before we give them grants from the provincial revenues we have to see what surplus the local bodies have already at their disposal. I understand last year the municipalities had 20 lakhs of surplus with them. Both the district boards and municipalities owing to the war have been accumulating large surpluses, and I understand the surplus last year was very considerable. If district boards and municipalities have a surplus they should first of all utilise it. Perhaps the Financial Commissioner will enlighten us on that point. The Government is only too glad to help if the case is first made out."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard.—" There is one thing that I should like to say, that is this, that it seems to me that the Hon'ble mover of this Resolution really meant something rather different from what he said. What he really meant was something of this sort. It is in practice, and there is a general instruction to that effect, that Government ordinarily limits its grants-in-aid to a sanitary work to one-half in the case of municipalities and to rather more than one-half in the case of rural boards. I think this is what the Hon'ble Mover really meant. If he had put the Resolution in that form it would rather have facilitated matters. Assuming that the Hon'ble mover had some such meaning as this I want to point out to this Council that in actual practice something even more is being done. If it is found that any particular municipality is really not in a position to give effect to a particular measure or to a particular scheme it is almost invariably the rule with the authority which deals with these matters to go a great deal beyond the ordinary rule of the half-way limit. That has been done only recently in two cases, one in the city of Ambala, the municipality of which has always had great difficulties about its water-supply. It received from the Sanitary Board not only on one occasion but on two or three occasions grants-in-aid within my recent memory. Another instance in which this half-way rule has been put aside by reason of the obvious inability of the municipality to provide the financial assistance required is that of Dera Ghazi Khan. The new creation of Dera Ghazi Khan caused by the destruction by the River Indus has been actually financed in the matter of its sanitary expenditure by the provincial grants. Not only in the case of towns such as these is it the practice to go beyond the half-way limit, but also in the case of places which are so situated that they are virtually roads of approach to other places so that there is an interest other than purely local interest in their sanitation. It has been, and still is, the regular practice of Government acting through the Sanitary Board to contribute a great deal more than one-half, and sometimes as much as the whole of the money required by the local bodies. In these circumstances I think that the actual practice of Government may be said to go a good deal beyond what the Hon'ble mover has asked for. The objection to what he asks for is that he requires the Government to bind itself to a particular figure without regard to the requirements of other towns. It would be quite impossible for any Government to accept it."

[*His Honour the President ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

His Honour the President.—" Does the Hon'ble mover still press his Resolution ?

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.—" My request is that if I am to withdraw, I may be allowed to move it again after I have obtained the proper facts and figures. For the present I would withdraw the Resolution."

The Resolution was withdrawn.

ADJOURNMENT.

The Council adjourned till the 7th February 1919, 10-30 A.M.

LAHORE : T. P. ELLIS,

The 14th February 1919. *Secretary.*

APPENDIX A.

(See Answer to Question No. 16.)

Statement showing the number of students who commencing their education in vernacular schools changed over to the Anglo-Vernacular course during each of the last five years.

Division.	1913-14.		1914-15.		1915-16.		1916-17.		1917-18.		Total.	
	Changed at the close of the primary school course.	Changed at the close of the Middle school course.	Changed at the close of the primary school course.	Changed at the close of the Middle school course.	Changed at the close of the primary school course.	Changed at the close of the Middle school course.	Changed at the end of the primary school course.	Changed at the close of the Middle school course.	Changed at the close of the primary school course.	Changed at the close of the Middle school course.	Changed at the close of the primary school course.	Changed at the close of the Middle school course.
1. Ambála Division	536	124	539	165	577	126	703	143	864	150	3,224	708
2. Jullundur Division	1,229	229	1,248	174	1,203	193	1,378	259	1,530	247	6,588	1,102
3. Lahore Division	1,426	160	1,488	201	1,327	199	1,643	210	1,756	213	7,645	1,003
4. Ráwalpindi Division	946	53	955	52	925	36	1,118	57	1,053	68	4,997	265
5. Multán Division	612	70	494	63	501	105	639	99	690	106	2,936	443
Total ...	4,749	655	4,694	655	4,533	659	5,486	768	5,923	784	25,925	3,521
Number of boys who took the Anglo-Vernacular courses without finishing the vernacular primary or the Middle courses (Multan Division).	392		906		325		342		353		1,728	

APPENDIX B.

(*Vide* ANSWER TO QUESTION No. 29.)

Statement showing the number of the Municipalities in the Punjab where the system of communal representation is in force.

Serial No.	Name of Municipality.	Population according to Census, 1911.			Number of elected members.		
		Hindus, including Sikhs Jains, etc.	Muhammadans.	Sikhs.	Hindus.	Muhammadans.	Sikhs.
1	Bhiwáni	25,603	6,907	...	8	2	...
2	Rewári	13,821	10,910	...	4	4	...
3	Palwal	6,152	3,280	...	4	2	...
4	Firozpur-Jhirka	2,668	3,050	...	3	3	...
5	Thanesar	3,193	1,518	...	4	2	...
6	Faridabad	3,039	1,466	...	4	2	...
7	Ambála	9,620	14,851	...	4	4	...
8	Hoshiárpur	8,898	7,975	...	6	4	...
9	Banga	6,743	859	...	5	1	...
10	Nakodar	3,520	5,224	...	3	3	...
11	Jagraon	6,375	8,653	...	3	3	...
12	Raikot	9,038	4,436	...	3	3	...
13	Ludhiána	14,093	26,932	1,638	6	9	1
14	Ferozepore	9,388	13,235	1,896	7	8	1
15	Lahore	71,166	122,765	9,617	8	9	1
16	Amritsar	58,736	71,540	20,160	7	8	3
17	Gujránwála	12,249	15,922	...	6	6	...
18	Wazirábad	5,300	11,736	...	4	7	...
19	Eaminabad	1,585	3,936	...	3	2	...
20	Sharakpur	904	3,574	...	1	3	...
21	Sargodha	3,568	4,034	964	3	2	2
22	Pind Dadan Khan	3,685	6,903	...	5	5	...
23	Bhakkar	2,868	2,437	...	4	4	...
24	Montgomery	3,282	4,845	...	4	3	...
25	Jhang-Maghiana	18,195	12,707	...	8	8	...
26	Multán	34,869	50,518	...	8	8	...
27	Shujabad	4,108	2,226	...	7	3	...
28	Muzaffargarh	2,314	1,787	...	5	3	...
29	Khángarh	1,813	1,536	...	4	4	...
30	Alipur	1,800	1,507	...	2	2	...
31	Leiah	3,607	4,562	...	4	4	...
32	Murree	426	626	...	1	1	...

APPENDIX C.

(See Answer to Question No. 31).

List of the districts in the Punjab in which the system of Registration of Marriage has been introduced.

Jullundur Division.—Ludhiána, Ferozepore, Jullundur, Hoshiárpur.

Ambála Division.—Karnál, Ambála, Hissar (Town of Hansi only).

Lahore Division.—Siálkot, Gujránwala, Gurdáspur.

Ráwalpindi Division.—Jhelum, Gujrát, Miánwali, Attock.

Multán Division.—Dera Ghazi Khán, Multán, Lyallpur, Jhang, Muzaffargarh, Montgomery.

APPENDIX D.

(See Answer to Question No. 46.)

Statement showing the salaries of the Office Establishment of the Financial Commissioners, Punjab.

A—Division.

1	Superintendent on Rs. 370—10—400 for present incumbent only.
*2	Assistants on Rs. 250—10—350 per mensem.
3	" on Rs. 225 per mensem.
2	" on Rs. 200 "
2	" on Rs. 175 "
2	" on Rs. 150 "
3	" on Rs. 125 "
3	" on Rs. 100 "

*Will be increased by 1 on retirement of Superintendent.

B—Division.

2	Assistants on Rs. 100 per mensem.
5	" on Rs. 80 "
8	" on Rs. 70 "
5	" on Rs. 60 "
2	" on Rs. 45 "
3	" on Rs. 30 "

Statement showing salaries of the Legal Remembrancer's Office Establishment.

1	Superintendent on Rs. 200—20—300 per mensem.
1	Head Clerk on Rs. 100—10—150 per mensem.
1	Clerk on Rs. 80-4-120 per mensem.
1	" Rs. 75 per mensem.
1	" Rs. 45 "
1	" Rs. 40 "
1	" Rs. 35 "
1	" Rs. 30 "

Menial Establishment.

1	Dafíri on Rs. 15 per mensem.

Statement showing the salaries of the Forest Department Establishment.

2	Superintendents on Rs. 200—10—300 per mensem.
3	Clerks on Rs. 120—5—150 per mensem.
5	" " 100 per mensem.
6	" " 80 "
9	" " 65 "
16	" " 50 "
20	" " 40 "
15	" " 30 "
12	" " 25 "

MENIAL ESTABLISHMENT.

2 Daftries on Rs. 16 per mensem.

Statement showing salaries of the Director of Public Instruction's Office Establishment as sanctioned by Punjab Government with effect from the 1st January 1919.

A—DIVISION.

1 Superintendent on Rs. 300—10—400 per mensem.
4 Head Assistants on Rs. 200—10—250 „
4 Assistants on Rs. 125—5—150 „
6 Assistants on Rs. 100—4—120 „

B—DIVISION.

4 Clerks on Rs. 80 per mensem.
6 „ „ 60 „
6 „ „ 40 „
6 „ „ 30 „
2 Assistants on Rs. 30 per mensem for 4 months every year.

MENIAL ESTABLISHMENT.

18 Total Rs. 172 per mensem.
3 Record-lifters at Rs. 12 per mensem each.

APPENDIX E.

(SEE ANSWER TO QUESTION No. 50.)

Statement.

	Hindus.	Muhammadans.	Sikhs.	Christians.
(a) Deputy Postmaster-General	10			1
(b) Superintendents of Post Offices	8	10	2	3
(c) Inspectors of Post Offices	38	18	6	
(d) Head Clerks to Superintendents of Post Offices ...	11	7	1	
(e) Postmasters	18	9	3	11
(f) Deputy Postmasters	18	7	1	
(f) (a) Assistant Postmasters	10	2		

(g) The number of men belonging to the zamindar classes holding these appointments = 28, detailed below:—

(a) Deputy Postmaster-General ... ...
(b) Superintendents of Post Offices 7
(c) Inspectors of Post Offices 6
(d) Head Clerk to Superintendents of Post Offices 1
(e) Postmasters 2
(f) Deputy Postmasters 5
(f) (a) Assistant Postmaster 1

APPENDIX F.

(See Answer to Question No. 51.)

Statement showing by religion the number of officers and other subordinate officials at present employed in the Forest Department, Punjab.

Class of employees and their total sanctioned number.	Number held by				Number held by agriculturists (Zamindars).
	Hindus.	Muhammadans.	Sikhs.	Christians.	
I.—Provincial Forest Service.					
Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests (14).	8	4	1	1	7
II.—Subordinate Forest Service.					
(i) Forest Rangers (54) ...	23	21	10	...	24
(ii) Deputy Rangers (31) ...	17	11	3	...	15
(iii) Foresters (88) ...	52	28	8	...	55
(iv) Forest Guards ...	...	...	...	...	...
III.—Clerical Establishment.					
Head Clerks of Divisional Forest Offices (12).	7	4	...	...	8

APPENDIX G.

(See Answer to Question No. 52.)

Statement.

Rank.	Christians.	Hindus.	Sikhs.	Muhammadans.	Zamindars.
(a) Superintendents, permanent and officiating.	88	...	...	2	1
(b) Deputy Superintendents ...	6	7	5	24	6
(c) Inspectors ...	26	34	25	78	67
(d) Sub-Inspectors ...	4	225	131	430	381
(e) Head Constables ...	1	656	273	1,721	1,372
(f) Percentage of (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e) appointments held by various sections.	2%	25%	12%	61%	...
(g) ...	...	...	...	...	1,827

54 LE—200—5-3-19—SGPP Lahore.

Abstract of Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1915.

THE Council met at the Government House, Lahore, at 10-30 A.M., on Friday, the 7th February 1919.

PRESENT :

His Honour Sir MICHAEL FRANCIS O'DWYER, G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.C.S., Lieutenant-Governor, *Presiding*.

The Hon'ble Mr. LEWIS FRENCH, C.I.E., I.C.S.
The Hon'ble Mr. JAMES ALEXANDER RICHEY.
The Hon'ble Captain Sardar GOPAL SINGH.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khawaja YUSAF SHAH.
The Hon'ble Mr. HERBERT JOHN MAYNARD, C.S.I., I.C.S.
The Hon'ble Mr. OSWALD FARQUHAR LUMSDEN, I.C.S.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri LAL CHAND, O.B.E.
The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar GAJJAN SINGH, O.B.E.
The Hon'ble Nawab Sir BAHRAM KHAN, Mazari, K.C.I.E.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad MEHDI SHAH, O.B.E.
The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit JOWAHAR LAL, Bhargawa.
The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit SHEO NARAIN.
The Hon'ble Mr. FRANK WAVERLING WOODS.
The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi SOHAN LAL.
The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada BHAGAT RAM.
The Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum RAJAN SHAH.
The Hon'ble Dewan Bahadur Dewan DAULAT RAI.
The Hon'ble Mr. CREWE ARMAND HAMILTON TOWNSEND, I.C.S.
The Hon'ble Mr. CHARLES JOSEPH HALLIFAX, C.B.E., I.C.S.
The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza IKRAM ULLAH KHAN.
The Hon'ble Mr. EDWIN WOODALL PARKER.
The Hon'ble Mr. HENRY DUFFIELD CRAIK, I.C.S.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN.
The Hon'ble Colonel ROBERT CHARLES MACWATT, C.I.E., M.B., F.R.C.S. I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. THOMAS PETER ELLIS, I.C.S.

THE PUNJAB PRIMARY EDUCATION BILL.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"SIR,—I beg to present the report of the Select Committee on the Punjab Compulsory Education Bill.

"I do not propose at this time to go into the details of the various amendments made by the Select Committee. I will only supplement to some extent the printed report which has already been published. I have to explain some of the larger features of these changes. In the first place we have changed the title of the Bill from the Punjab Compulsory Act to the Punjab Primary Education Act, 1919. That may seem a mere verbal change, but in adopting the wider term we are following the precedent of other countries, and we thereby signify that this is not the last Act on this subject to be passed in the Punjab, though it is the first, and I hope that Hon'ble Members will bear that fact in mind. There have been no less than 10 Primary Education Acts in England since the passing of the first Act in 1870. We may hope that a new Act will not be needed every 5 years, though we shall have to make constant modifications if the Act is really to be brought up to date.

"Next, clause 3 which describes the procedure to be followed by local bodies for extending provisions of Part I has been completely changed. The original procedure was that followed by the district boards in dealing with ordinary matters. It was closely copied from the procedure laid down in the District Boards Act, 1883. It was felt by the Select Committee that in dealing with the subject of such importance as compulsory education it should be discussed at a special meeting. Consequently in sub-clause 2 we have provided for a special meeting to be called to take into consideration the objections if any protest against the introduction of compulsion has been made. I

think it is open to argument whether it will be also desirable to suggest a special meeting in clause (*i*) in which the proposal is first made. Otherwise the procedure is very much the same as was originally suggested.

"Clause 5 deals with the application of this Bill to girls. On this question there is, I think, as the Hon'ble Members know, a great difference of opinion. The only change that the Select Committee has made is by adding 'with such modifications as the local authority, subject to the sanction of the Local Government, may prescribe.' That is to say, the Act in Part II can apply to girls when certain modifications may have been made. This was added in order to simplify the difficulties which arise when we deal with clause 11,

[*Mr. Richey; His Honour the President.*]

"Clause 11 prescribes that a boy shall be required to go to school two miles away from his home. It was generally felt by the public and by, I think, all members of the Select Committee that two miles was too long a distance to require a girl to walk to a school. We find it difficult for technical reasons to introduce any change in section 11. We, therefore, prefer to make this addition in clause 5, which means that in the case of Part II being applied also to girls modifications can be carried at the time of introduction. With regard to the general question whether clause 5 should be left out or not the matter was left for this Council to decide.

"In clause 9 we have left out sub-clause (2) entirely. I do not know that the reason why this is being done is good, for, of course, such a sub-section is usually included in Acts of a similar nature.

"Clause 10 has been very largely amended. As there has been an amendment tabulated to clause 1 of this section I will not deal with it now. Clause 2 is explained in the printed report. The district boards which would apply this part of the Act will naturally be expected to fix the period of attendance so as to allow holidays at harvest time and other suitable occasions and also the hours each day, so that the boys will not be required to attend at midday during the hot weather. That must be left to the local bodies. In sub-clause (3) of this clause we have allowed the alternative age period of attendance to be 7 to 12 for the ordinary prescriptive period of 6 to 11. It has been found in some rural countries, for example, in Canada, that it is advisable in rural areas where the boys may possibly have to travel over rough ground not to require boys to start education at too early an age. The Select Committee do not think that there is likely to be any alternative provision needed. They came to the decision that the boy should either go from 6 or from 7 years.

"Changes in clause 11 are explained in the printed report.

"Clause 13 will be discussed later.

"Clause 15. It has been pointed out that in clause 15 unless we put in the phrase 'any person other than the parent of a boy' the parent who is required under clause 10 to cause his attendance will be liable to prosecution. It was obviously intended by the framers of the Bill that the parent should only be liable to prosecution for not sending the boy to school, but he would also have been liable to prosecution as employer but for the provision of this section.

"Clause 16 has been added that the money realised in respect of any fines should go to the local bodies which impose them.

"The other changes have, I think, all been explained in the report."

His Honour the President:—"Before the Bill is taken into consideration by Council; I desire to explain the attitude of Government, towards the measure, which I regard as perhaps the most important that has yet received our attention.

[*His Honour the President.*]

"It is the first measure involving compulsion in the matter of education which has been undertaken by Government. It places a great responsibility both upon the Council which has to enact the measure, and upon the Executive Government which has to enforce it. In view of its importance and in order to deal with certain criticisms which it has brought forth I propose to say something on the Bill, and the report of the Select Committee in regard to which Government is unable to see eye to eye with the Committee in all particulars before they are discussed by Council.

"There are four main issues which we have to deal with :—

"*First.*—'What is the existing position in the Province with respect to the primary education of boys ?'

"*Second.*—'What is the object which we wish to achieve ?'

"*Third.*—'What are the difficulties in our way ?'

"*Fourth.*—'What should be our present policy in coping with those difficulties ?'

"What is the existing position as regards the education of boys ? The male population of the Province is about 11 millions. If we take 10 per cent of this number to represent boys between the ages of 6 and 10 we have a total of 11 lakhs which should be brought within our school doors. At present there are only 3¼ lakhs getting vernacular primary education.

"In the last five years the facilities for education have been rapidly increased, but the attendance has not been increasing in the same proportion. In this period there has been an increase of 600 per cent. as compared with the previous 5 years in the facilities afforded, but only a smaller increase in the number of boys. Last year there was actually a decrease in the number of boys attending school. The reason for this in the minds of some people is that fees are charged for primary education. These fees are only nominal, they amount throughout the Province to only 1½ lakhs out of a total of 25 lakhs spent on primary education, and it is a most significant fact that last year the decrease occurred among the agricultural classes who are exempted from paying fees.

"The payment of fees is not the obstacle and in reality the reasons are more far-reaching. One reason is the conservative character of the poorer classes, especially the rural ones, who are apt to look on education as something not meant for them. Then again parents of these classes are unwilling to lose the services of their children in their work.

"There is also the fact that there is in some districts an absence of educational facilities, and these it is our first business to provide.

"Further, the rural classes have not full confidence in the system of education offered them in the past, and until we have inspired them with confidence in what we offer, it will be very difficult to progress.

"The object which we have in view is that local bodies, with the aid of Government, should provide increased facilities first, and if these facilities are not availed of, they will have to resort to compulsion until we get nearly all children of the prescribed age attending school. That is a worthy object, and all of us sympathize with it. If after we have provided educational facilities by increasing the number of schools and improving the system of education and if after we have made reasonable efforts to impress upon the people the advantages to be derived they are still found unwilling to avail themselves of them, we propose to resort to compulsion.

"But we must not forget the difficulties which lie in our way. Compulsion is an ugly word. Compulsion in any form is an evil. Compulsion applied to millions of people might prove an evil of great magnitude and involve very serious consequences. If we wish to avoid the dangers of compulsion we

should endeavour to persuade the people by reason that it is to their advantage and to that of their boys that they should send the latter to school at some sacrifice to themselves, rather than coerce them by force

"Government is accused of being unduly cautious in giving effect to the principle of compulsion. Government has always been, and I hope will always be, cautious in the matter of compulsion.

"Take the case of vaccination. We all admit its benefits. Logically there were good grounds for making it compulsory here as in England. But India is not England. So when the Vaccination Act was passed its compulsory operation was entrusted to local bodies until local opinion was ripe for it. No District Boards and only some municipal bodies have as yet made vaccination compulsory. Meantime people are realizing its advantages and now adopt it generally as a voluntary measure, and come forward to support the principle of compulsion. When that state of mind has been reached we have public opinion on our side in favour of making it compulsory, and our object is achieved. That seems to be the correct procedure. It is not intended to rush people and arouse their opposition, but to enlist their sympathy and support.

"It is easy for educational enthusiasts on a public platform in Lahore or any other city to attack the provisions of this Bill as inadequate and to criticize Government for not going further and faster. People who preach in cities are preaching to the converted. Their work is a work of supererogation. That is not how we converted people in our recruiting campaign. We went to every village and explained to the villagers it was their interest as well as their duty to come forward and give recruits, and that was why we succeeded. That propaganda was conducted by people who understood village conditions, and had the confidence of the villagers—the same should be done with education.

"What I should like to see educational enthusiasts do is to transfer their propaganda to the villages, get up in the *chaupal*, *dara* or *hujra* and convert to their views the great masses, particularly the lower classes, now apathetic or hostile—the Jat and Arain, the Tarkhan and Lohar, the Mussalli and Chamar—show them that this measure is beneficial to them, and allay their suspicion that Government is going too far and too fast. Nine-tenths of our population is rural. The measure must, therefore, be considered in its bearing on the rural classes. We know how all classes in villages look to their children to help them in rural work. We propose to go to them and ask them to make a great sacrifice, and to have their children educated in their own and their children's interest, to get on without their children for say eight months of the year for a great part of each day. It is not an easy thing to do, but we have got to convince them. We must appeal to their reason and take the line of least resistance.

"Tell them you are going to take away their boys from the age of 6 to 11 or 12, and you will certainly arouse opposition; if you say you are taking them away for only 4 years you may carry them with you.

"Say you will take away their girls as well, and you will come into conflict with some of the most powerful oriental traditions and arouse the antagonism of whole classes, among whom the purdah system is held sacred. At present the number of girls in school is only one-sixth the number of boys and we should therefore await further voluntary effort. I leave this question to the opinion of Council, but my own opinion is that public opinion on the question is not yet ripe. The number of girls attending school is small, and their schools and their teachers few. It seems wise therefore to decide that

while the primary education of girls requires extension and every encouragement compulsion in their case is premature.

"The ideally best is not always practically expedient; statesmen realize this. Some enthusiasts do not. In most countries the period of compulsion began with 4 years. Mr. Gokhale's Bill made it 4 years, and did not, I think, apply to girls. Four years is the present average of attendance.

"Such is the attitude of Government generally to the measure, and I would apply it to some of the specific provisions of the Bill. The Select Committee has considerably improved the Bill, but I do not think all their amendments are quite sound.

"In the notes on the amendment to clauses 3 (5) and 7 it is stated that the provision that the Local Government should give its reasons was inserted, because an apprehension exists that it might refuse to sanction the proposals of a local body arbitrarily or without reason. I regret to see this note of suspicion, and I (perhaps not being of a suspicious nature myself) can see no reason for it.

"The suspicion appears to have two grounds, one that Government will throw the whole the greater part of the cost on local bodies and thus defeat the objects of the scheme, and the other that Government is only half-hearted in pressing the measure.

"Now what has been the attitude of Government to this question? In regard to the question of cost, compare the scheme for expansion of primary education. Government has offered to bear two-thirds of the whole cost for the Province but it differentiates according to the needs, services and claims of each district. Government is not prepared to accept the liability for any hard and fast contribution which would not take account of the resources of local bodies as explained in yesterday's debate. If the action already taken by Government arouses suspicion, I wonder what action would arouse confidence.

"Consider also the fact that Government has taken the initiative in introducing this Bill in spite of its many other pre-occupations. In the course of my recent tour I have taken some trouble to ascertain local opinion in the matter. I have found no suspicion of arbitrary action by Government, perhaps it would not be disclosed to me if it existed. But I did find suspicions that local bodies in their enthusiasm might be inclined to move too fast, and by their action antagonize the people we want to convert to our views. That was said by more than one person who could speak with weight and the opinion was expressed that Government control was necessary to prevent too precipitate a policy.

"Hence the necessity for safeguards. After all Government is responsible for enforcing the measure, and must see that the discretion given to local bodies is exercised with judgment for the advantage of all concerned.

"Again as regards the modification in clause 4 (5) that Government on receiving proposals and statements relating to school accommodation, equipment and educational staff, etc., from a local authority may sanction the same or for reasons to be stated by it ——————————)either refuse to sanction them or return them to the local authority for further consideration.

"Government, when unable to accept the proposals of a local body, would no doubt usually give its reasons as it does at present. But I see no justification for the novel provision that Government must give its reasons. Even Mr. Gokhale's scheme did not contemplate that Government should publish its reasons. In fact, Government cannot always do so. Occasion might arise when it would be against public policy or might further embitter faction or sectional feeling

which we know exists, if Government were to publish the facts which determined its action. Take, for instance, a small town, chiefly Hindu in composition, but including important communities of Syads, Kureshis or Pathans. In such a case if the local body wished to make female education compulsory, the Muhammadans would object that it would interfere with their seclusion of women. Is Government to publish all this ?

" Hence just as Government has the discretion, very rarely exercised, to refuse to answer questions in this Council Government should have the same discretion in regard to this provision.

" Another matter in which the amendment suggested by the Select Committee is unacceptable is section 6. If Government exemptions can only be based on the recommendations of local authorities we shall have conflicting decisions. We may have a small majority enforcing its will on a minority or even the other way round. A man need only move from one area to another to escape the provisions of the Act. Unless we are to stultify ourselves in this way we must have a uniform or nearly uniform policy of exemption for the Province, and the exemption must be laid down by Government which would of course consult local opinion. The action of Government can be criticized in this Council, but the responsibility must rest with it, while it is responsible to the people as a whole. We hope that many of the exemptions will be only temporary.

" Remember that Government is becoming more and more amenable to Indian opinion and under the Reforms Scheme with an enlarged Council and Indian members as ministers in the Government as a whole or in charge of transferred heads (of which Primary education is likely to be one) there is no probability of responsible Indian opinion being disregarded, though the eagerness of enthusiasts may be restrained.

" We all wish to make this Bill a success in practice. I look on it as the most important legislative measure in my term of office. But we must regard it as a tentative, not a final measure. There have been no less than ten Acts in England dealing with primary education in little over 40 years The Bill may not be an ideal one. Our successors will amend it where it needs amendment, and remedy any of its defects in the light of experience. Its success in the initial stage will depend on hearty co-operation between Government and educated Indian opinion, urban and rural, but especially rural, working for the same end and object. The first aim must be to overcome the apathy, indifference or hostility of the great masses affected by the Bill, the struggling villager, the poor artizan, the humble and often despised menial. Unless we proceed with tact and caution, they may look on our action as an infringement of their natural rights over their children and an interference—a serious interference—in their domestic and economic life. If we can carry them with us we succeed, if we cannot, we fail."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—" Sir, I beg to move that the Bill be now taken into consideration clause by clause."

The motion was put and agreed to.

His Honour the President :—" In view of the importance of the Bill it would be better if we take it clause by clause. I think any member should be at liberty to move any amendment irrespective of the fact whether he has given notice or not. I want the matter to be thrashed out thoroughly."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—" Your Honour,—May I suggest that we take clause 5 first. It is the one dealing with the application of the Bill to girls."

[*His Honour the President ; Khan Bahadur Syed Mehdi Shah.*]

His Honour the President :—"I think we should discuss the question of girls first."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Syed Mehdi Shah :—"Your Honour,—I most heartily support the Bill so ably presented by the Hon'ble Mr. Richey and agree with the Hon'ble mover even in its minor details, subject, of course, to two or three remarks, where we, the members of the Select Committee, were chiefly divided.

"The first and the most important point is the question of compulsory education for the girls.

"Your Honour,—The idea of compulsion is new to the Province and though during the last two decades wonderful progress has been made by the Punjabis, in the acquisition of Western arts and sciences, but the rural classes who form the bulk of the population are mostly quite illiterate and uneducated and therefore cannot appreciate the advantages of education and the blessings it confers.

"They are as a class awfully conservative and there is likely to be some discontent and uneasiness amongst them in the case of boys even. I therefore apprehend a greater alarm and unrest, if the girls are compelled to attend the school.

"Your Honour,—Religious prejudice and the social customs in the present state of the society are another great obstacle, far more formidable than the idea of compulsion itself. The people of the Punjab are not yet prepared to see their girls going to the schools at the age of nine or ten which, under the tropical climate of India, is almost the age of puberty, and especially the *purda nashin* families.

"Moreover, it is well-nigh impossible for the Government or for any other local body whatsoever, to arrange for the religious education of the multifarious classes, castes and creeds, which, as experience showed, must be an essential element in the future educational curriculum. Therefore, in my opinion, the question of female compulsory education may be dropped for the present, but the various communities may, however, be encouraged with liberal aids, grant of school sites, etc., to establish their own denominational institutions according to their peculiar needs and requirements, and when the voluntary system has obtained ground, compulsion will follow as a natural consequence.

"Your Honour,—The compulsory education of boys alone will involve in its inception an extra expenditure of some lakhs of rupees, and therefore the funds which a local body can spare for educational purposes may with advantage be spent for the first few years at least on boys' education, so that a network of schools may be spread throughout the length and breadth of the Punjab in order that we may be able to have a reading and comparatively intelligent public within a very short period to cope with the new responsibilities created by the exigencies of the time.

"Your Honour,—If the boys and the girls of a zamindar are both sent to school, an agrarian problem is sure to arise in the rural areas, which it will be difficult to solve.

"Your Honour,—If it be urged that the measure is simply optional and shall not be applied, unless called for, I would beg to submit that why we should legislate for a measure which we know from the very nature of the circumstances is to remain a dead letter for sometime to come at least, and where will be the harm if we pass it after we have got the experience of the

[*Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan ; Malik Muhammad Amin Khan ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain ; Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram ; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh.*]

actual working of the Bill in the case of boys and extend it then to the girls in the light of the experience so gained.

"The word 'parent' should not include mother, otherwise the Act will work great hardship on a poor widow who is to support a family of some 6 or 7 boys and is being constantly fined and harrassed on their account."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan :—"I support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Malik Muhammad Amin Khan :—"I also support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain :—"Your Honour,—I have to speak on this matter with regard to the extension of this Act to girls. In my humble opinion we have first to make the present Act, so far as boys are concerned, a success, as Your Honour has so ably dealt with the matter, on the least resistance principle. It is a new measure and various suspicions might arise in the minds of the public even as regards boys and it is difficult yet to conceive whether we could convince very easily the rural population as to the utility of the measure. But what will be the effect on the public mind so far as compulsory education of girls is concerned? Perhaps I may say that the oriental mind is suspicious more or less. I do not mean any aspersion on their mental attitude, but it is sometimes regarded as a defect, and if it is so, my strong objection to the measure in regard to girls is why should we allow an occasion for the creation of a suspicion of that sort? Besides, the measure of compelling girls to attend school at a particular age is beset with certain difficulties. People have serious objections even in an advanced community to sending their girls to school. Some sections of the Muhammadan community would like to give only Qoranic education, some Sanatanists would like to give religious education to girls in their own homes, but because there is a general desire for education, many people looking to the exigencies of time consider it better to give some sort of secular education, but if left to them-selves, they will not. Many people would like their girls to be within the four walls of their houses attending to domestic work and receiving purely religious education as in ancient times. This is by the way, of course, but I for one would be certainly not for giving any compulsion to the education of girls. Time might come and Councils will sit again, measures will be introduced hereafter, and when we find a great demand there will be no harm in extending compulsion to girls. The question is not whether it should not be permitted hereafter but the question is whether at the present moment this Bill should affect in any way female education. I strongly protest against any enactment with regard to girls in this Act."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram :—"Your Honour,—The constitution of this Council is such that I may say the time may come when there be some lady members who will perhaps speak for themselves and may be able to espouse their cause. I have no intention at this stage, and seeing the general attitude of my Hon'ble friends, to make any speech, but I must say that we are beginning at the wrong end if we are enforcing compulsion on boys and not on girls. My humble opinion is that it would perhaps be the right step, and a step which would pay in the long run, if we began with compelling girls to go to school and get education. The boys' education will follow automatically. So I am not content to see nobody espousing the cause of ladies. With these remarks I oppose this amendment."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh :—"Your Honour,—I think every educated Indian gentleman must necessarily be in favour of the education of girls. But the question of compulsion is quite a different one,

[*Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Khan Bahadur Khawaja Yusaf Shah ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava ; Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah.*]

I think for the reasons stated by my Hon'ble friends who have just spoken and for the reasons given by Your Honour I would not advise this Council to adopt any measure of compulsion of education to girls. That is not advisable. It is likely to lead us into difficulties. Therefore my opinion is that although section 5 has certain restrictions before it can be applied, there will be no harm if we drop it altogether. I am not for compulsion."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand :—" Your Honour,—I associate myself with all that has been said by my Hon'ble friend on my right (Sardar Gajjan Singh) and I support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khawaja Yusaf Shah :—" Your Honour,—Considering the circumstances of the country, as explained by Your Honour and some of the Hon'ble Members, I think it will be desirable for the present to drop this clause altogether."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava :—" Your Honour,—As section 5 contains many safeguards against the apprehensions which have been now expressed and makes the application of Part II to girls subject to the rules which the Local Government will consider appropriate, and the local bodies will also be consulted, I do not think there is any harm in keeping the section as it is."

The Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah spoke in Urdu, a brief translation of which is as follows :—

" Your Honour,—I heartily support the provisions regarding the compulsory education of boys. The municipal committee of Multán of which I have the honour to be the Vice-President has also already expressed its concurrence in this matter, but it has not moved in respect of the education of the girls. The municipal committee of Lahore also, if I am not misinformed, has not supported compulsory education of girls, and probably several municipal committees hold the same view in this matter.

" Ignoring even the above fact the *pardah* system is very strictly followed by all well-to-do and respectable Indian families and to compel their daughters to attend schools for education will be tantamount to giving their parents a punishment greater than that of hanging, and if this Bill be passed in its present form, it would mean that well-to-do and respectable parents will be compelled to break the rules of their ancient custom by sending their girls to schools, or if they act in contravention thereof to undergo the punishment prescribed by law. If the removal of the *pardah* system be considered a social reform in accordance with certain ideas, it will be a reform effected by the coercion of law while such a reform, as the history of the world indicates, has never been effected by such a constraint.

" I therefore very deferentially but emphatically beg to bring to Your Honour's kind notice that if this Bill be passed in its present form it will cause a great sensation amongst well-to-do and respectable families in the country and will be unprecedented in the history of the Punjab.

" Another defect in passing the Bill in its present form will be that thousands—nay, millions of people will by non-compliance with the provisions of this law come into the clutches of the criminal law. No law has been held in esteem by the people which a great number of them by observance of their customs and by following their historical traditions might be compelled to break. Such an enactment is utterly against the policy of Government if it compels the people to break it, and there will be danger of its creating a sensation amongst the people.

[*Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah.*]

"Probably on this ground my Hon'ble friend Sayad Mehdi Shah, who is a respectable member of the old fashioned party and who has a perfect experience of the ideas, sensation and emotions of the people of this country, dissented from the report of the Select Committee in this matter.

"I think it my duty to declare openly in this Council that the *pardah* system is considered especially by the Muhammadan element of the population as the soul of their society and they value it more than their lives in pursuance of their religious traditions, and if the Bill be passed in its present form it will be considered as a cruel measure against the old fashioned Muhammadan community of the Punjab who adhere to old ideas and tenets and the ancient Muhammadan religion. At this juncture when Government has to face several unpleasant agitations it will prove dangerous to create a novel and additional material for such meetings. I, therefore, not only on account of being a Punjabi Muhammadan but in the capacity of a very faithful and loyal subject of our Gracious Majesty the King-Emperor, urge very strongly the exclusion of girls from compulsory education and very humbly and respectfully request Your Honour that no such action should be taken by Government which may create a misunderstanding amongst the people that Government is also in favour of the compulsory education of girls; so that men who are on the look out to spread disaffection against Government may not get an opportunity to extend the sphere of their mischief.

"I have not overlooked the point that local authorities have been given discriminating powers in respect of the education of girls; but in such assemblies there is a danger of opinions preponderating whenever expressed by gentlemen of new and modern ideas, who consider it their foremost duty to eradicate the *pardah* system, and I am afraid that they may by their inexperience give preference to their sensational ideas of reform over the general public opinion of their countrymen. This point is also, at all events, not free from apprehension.

"The *pardah* system does not only indicate that women should observe *pardah* before men but that they should remain concealed from other women of a certain type. Men of course are not required to keep *pardah* from members of their own sex.

"It is possible that some men of modern type and modern ideas who are ardently opposed to the *pardah* system may jeer at it and ridicule its principles with contempt, but I think it sufficient for the present to reply only that the *pardah* system has been deemed in a way by our Local Governments to be a fit custom for our country.

"It cannot be denied that the Local Governments of India are composed of highly experienced, wise and capable officers, and they have also in some of the Provinces issued orders to the effect that a certain kind of men whose company with the people of the country produces a harmful effect may be precluded from entering into those Provinces—which simply implies that the people of those Provinces may be kept apart from them. Thus a European lady has been prohibited ingress by Government order into certain Provinces. There being a principle on which it has been held that men should be kept aloof from a particular sort of their fellow men it will not be strange if on the same principle our women should be enjoined to keep *pardah* not simply from men but from certain sort of women also in pursuance of the traditions of our creed and country. On the contrary, if this system be looked into deeply it will be found to have been based on a very wise policy.

I have, Your Honour, briefly submitted the real ideas of your subjects according to my humble abilities, and being fully confident of Your Honour's capability and sagacity, I hope that Your Honour will kindly look with an

[*Nawab Sir Bahram Khan, Mazari ; Mr. Ellis ; Mr. Richey ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava ; His Honour the President ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain.*]

eye of sympathy on the grievances of your numerous *pardah* observing subjects and I assure Your Honour that if a motion for the exclusion of girls be made by the official members it will prove one of the best mementos of your splendid rule."

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan, Mazari, supported the amendment.

The motion that clause 5 be omitted was put and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Ellis :—"The omission of clause 5 leads to certain consequential amendments. In the title and preamble the word 'children' has to be replaced by the word 'boys.' In clause 2 in the definition of parent' the word 'boy' will have to be substituted for the word 'child.' Similarly in clause 4 'children' will have to be replaced by 'boys.'"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"I accept the amendments as they are merely consequential."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava :—"Another consequential amendment will be that the number of sections will have to be changed."

His Honour the President :—"Yes, that will have to be done. Such suggestions will be welcome."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"There is no amendment to clause 1, so I propose that the section as amended by the Secretary be passed."

His Honour the President :—"Has any member to make any remark about clause 1 ?"

There being no remarks by any member the motion that clause 1 as drafted by the Select Committee with the consequential amendment be passed was put to the Council and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"In clause 2 there is only one small amendment made by the Select Committee leaving out the words 'or has the custody of' in the definition of 'parent.' The reason for that is explained in the printed report of the Committee. It was thought that a certain number of charitable societies—people or persons who take charge of orphan children—would not be willing to do so on account of the application of this Act, though it would affect a very small number of children. Otherwise the clause remains as it was originally drafted. I beg to move that the clause as amended be passed."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain :—"Your Honour,—In this clause 2 with your permission I ask Your Honour's leave to add the word 'male' before the word 'guardian' and also instead of the words 'every person' I would substitute 'every male.' In the Select Committee I suggested this and my reason was that if there is a female guardian and she is guilty of not sending her ward to school she will have to be brought to be punished before a Magistrate, and I urge the same reasons which we have just been discussing about compulsion being not extended to girls, I submit that the very same reason will apply to this also. It is all very well if a male guardian does not obey the directions of the Act. Then he is liable to be punished for his neglect. But to make a female guardian or any other who is liable to maintain a boy equally guilty of that offence will be introducing into the village system a sort of compulsion which I for one would not be for. I request the Members of this Council to give this matter their consideration, and surely this compulsion is not to be exercised with, what we call, vengeance. The least resistance should be the principle and no woman in a village should be under the impression that in case she neglects to send her boy or any boy in her custody to school she will be eventually hauled up before a

[*Mr. Parker; Khan Bahadur Syed Mehdi Shah; Mr. Richey; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava; Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh; Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Mr. Ellis.*]

Magistrate to be punished. On the grounds of peace and harmony I suggest that the word 'male' be added before the word 'guardian' and 'every male person' be substituted for 'every person.'"

The Hon'ble Mr. Parker:—"I support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Syed Mahdi Shah:—"I support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"I think the Hon'ble Mover of this amendment seems to presuppose that the parent, if she is the mother of the child, will have to appear in court in person. That is not the case. I proposed myself in the Select Committee that a clause should be added, as in the English Act, that a parent need not appear in person but can be represented by a relation, but I was told there by legal authorities that that is already the rule in India and there is no necessity for a mother of a child to appear in court in person. This Act is framed on behalf of children and I think we must consider them. Why should the child of a widow be deprived of education? I shall be very sorry to see this amendment passed. I do not know how many children it would affect, but it would affect a large number of children in the Punjab. A great number of Punjabis have fallen in the war and I would be very sorry to see any of their children suffer. I think the fears of the Hon'ble Member were largely due to this that the parent will have to appear in court in person and be put to trouble. I therefore oppose this amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava:—"I agree with the Hon'ble Member-in-charge and am of opinion that the word 'guardian' should remain as it is and the word 'male' should not be added to it."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan:—"I oppose the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhari Lal Chand:—"I oppose the amendment."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh:—"I also agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Richey. By accepting this amendment we should be depriving the sons of widows of the benefits of this Act. Therefore I oppose the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram:—"I submit that no sufficient case has been made out by the Hon'ble Pandit Sheo Narain for the amendment which he wishes to introduce."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"I also oppose the amendment. If this amendment be carried out the penal clause of the Act will have no effect whatever. In every case the offender will give the excuse that he is not the guardian but such and such a woman is the guardian."

The Hon'ble Mr. Ellis:—"If this amendment is carried a boy might be compelled to attend school under the provisions of the Act but no guardian could be punished for not sending the boy to school. I do not think it would be necessary for a woman to attend court in answer to a charge of this nature, and though a Magistrate might have power to do so, it would be rare that he would compel a woman to go to court."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram:—"It would not be a cognizable offence."

The Hon'ble Mr. Ellis.—"No, certainly not."

"The Hon'ble Pandit Sheo Narain's amendment that the word "male" be added before the word "guardian" and the words "every male" be substituted for the words "every person" was put to the Council and lost.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram.—"Your Honour,—I beg to propose that the original definition of 'parent' should remain instead of the definition that has been proposed. The only apprehension which the members of

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava; Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain; Mr. Richey; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh; Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah; Mr. Maynard; His Honour the President; Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram.*]

the Select Committee think is this that if this original clause remains there may be some people who will not take charge of an orphan boy, and for that reason it is proposed that this clause should be abandoned and the new clause proposed should take the place of the original clause. My submission is that if a person who takes charge of an orphan boy is a person who is not willing to have him properly educated he has no business to be in charge of that boy; and it will be a great pity that those children who have lost their parents should lose the benefit of education because they are in the charge of a person who is not fit to give them education."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"I second the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava :—"I also support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain :—"Your Honour,—I oppose this amendment for the obvious reason that it might frustrate the very object for which this Bill is framed. For the reason that any person has actual custody of any boy, to make it incumbent on him to send that boy to school or for neglect of it to risk the pain of punishment might result in this that the moment he hears that any such law exists he will give up the custody of the boy. Consequently we should leave it to his good sense if he has any interest in the boy to keep him in school or not. He may temporarily have the custody of the boy, but when he knows the liability and obligation created by the Act he is likely to give him up."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"I myself was in favour of the restoration of the original definition of 'parent.' I am not convinced by the opinion of the Select Committee that it would affect any large number of cases, but it is a matter of which I have not sufficient knowledge. I think the argument used by the Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram is very sound, that a person who will not send a boy to school is not fit to have custody of the boy."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh :—"The main object of this Council is what is the best interest of the public. No doubt education is a great boon, and we should try to give education to boys. It is quite possible, as has been suggested by Hon'ble Pandit Shiv Narain, that those persons who are not bound to keep those boys may desert them. That was the main reason why the Select Committee abandoned the original definition of 'parent,' and we feared lest we should be troubling those boys instead of helping them."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah :—"Your Honour,—I am in favour of restoring the original clause as proposed by the Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"I think in the Select Committee we had no strong opinion on the subject, but we accepted the view that it was a regular practice for people to take charge of children, and it is just possible they might find some special burden by reason of their charitable inclinations, and they might decline to retain the custody of the children. It is not a thing in which the Select Committee had very strong feeling one way or the other."

His Honour the President :—"The matter is one which may very well be left to the Council, as the Government has no definite opinion on the subject."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram :—"Your Honour, I should like to say one word more. It should not be forgotten that all over the country there are orphanages maintained by different societies, and there are very few cases of boys being kept by one man as a guardian. Twenty years ago people used to keep boys under their charge, but it is no longer the practice. Now the boys are mostly in orphanages, and they are properly looked after and their education is taken care of."

[*His Honour the President; Mr. Richey; Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

The motion to restore the original definition of "parent" in place of the one introduced by the Select Committee was put to the Council and carried.

His Honour the President:—"Any other amendment as regards clause 2?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"I propose that clause 2 as amended be passed."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan:—"I support the motion."

The motion that clause 2 of the Bill as amended be passed was put to the Council and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"Your Honour,—I now move that clause 3 be taken into consideration."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.—"I beg to move that in clause 3 (1) and (3) the word 'non-official' be inserted between the words 'the' and 'members.' Your Honour, if the application of the provisions of part II of the Bill, which provide for the compulsory education for the children, is to depend on popular desire, and such desire is to be studied from the views of the local bodies, we wish that the voice of the representatives of the people on the local bodies, as distinguished from that of the official, semi-official and nominated members, must have substantial weight in determining whether compulsory education should or should not be introduced in any local area; but this is not practicable so long as our local bodies are, as at present constituted, invariably presided over by official presidents and swamped by *ex-officio* officials and members nominated by officers. Clause 3 (1) and (3) of the Bill requires a majority of two-thirds of the members present in the meeting to determine whether compulsory education should or should not be introduced. The District Boards, as they are constituted at present, are governed more by the official and semi-official element in the Board rather than by the real representatives of the people. The Deputy Commissioner, all the Tahsildars of the different tahsils in the district, the Revenue Assistant, the District Inspector of Schools, and the Civil Surgeon are all *ex-officio* members of the Board and regularly attend all the meetings of the Board. Ordinarily one-third attendance in the Board consists of these official members. Most of the remaining members belong to the semi-official class of Zaildars, Sufedposhes and Lambardars, who are paid out of the land revenue and are always in the hands of the official members and have to support the official view in every matter coming before the Board rather than the view of their own constituents. Therefore the question of extending part II of the Act will lie exclusively with the official rather than with the non-official element in the Board if it is to depend on the two-third majority of the members present in the Board. In case the official view is against the extension of compulsory education in the district, one-third official votes will overrule two-third non-official votes, as if the official vote has double the value of a non-official vote, and the latter even though unanimous will always be helpless against the unity of the official members against them. The condition of the Municipal Boards, though not, as a rule, so bad as that of the District Boards, is not so independent as it is desired, so long as they are presided over by official presidents and contain *ex-officio* and nominated members in the Board. Therefore, if it be desired that the popular will rather than official command is to determine whether compulsory education is to be introduced by applying part II of the Bill to any local area, it should be determined by a majority of the two-third of the non-official members present, the official members having no votes in the matter; and this object can be gained by inserting the word 'non-official' between the words 'the' and 'members' in clause 3 (1) and (3) of the Bill. In any case, if the amendment moved by me be not

[*Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah ; Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram ; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh ; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Richey.*]

carried, I respectfully submit that the following words be omitted altogether so as to make the official vote have the same value as the non-official vote: 'By a majority of two-thirds of the members present at such meeting.'"

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah :—"Your Honour,—I strongly oppose this amendment as the Hon'ble Member is drawing an invidious distinction between officials and nominated members and other members. I think this clause must stand as it is."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram :—"Your Honour,—I support the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Bakhshi Sahib. I only give one reason. I do not draw any invidious distinction. Officials as a rule will not be affected by this resolution, and simply because they are not residents of the district it will not interest them whether this measure is recommended for adoption or not. They are not likely to take much interest."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh :—"Your Honour,—After giving the matter my best consideration I feel constrained to oppose the amendment. In the first place my Hon'ble friend wants that the word 'non-official' should be added with a view that only persons who are officials may be excluded from the Board. Now the term 'non-officials' requires, I think, some sort of definition. If it is adopted as far as the District Boards are concerned the majority are perhaps Lambardars and Zaildars. They are all officials. If those persons are excluded there will be no man to vote. And for the further reason that this is a measure in which we can hardly separate officials from non-officials as we want compulsion to be introduced and therefore we need official co-operation. When some sort of compulsion is intended to be applied this can only succeed if there is full co-operation between officials and non-officials. Therefore to secure that co-operation I think we cannot very well exclude the officials. For this reason I oppose the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand :—"Your Honour,—I think it hardly wise to refuse the right of vote to those members who will have the greatest hand in the matter. The members on whose activities the success of this Bill will depend should not be distrusted, and I oppose this amendment. I also protest against the remarks made by the Hon'ble Mover against the Zaildars and Sufedposhes. I don't say that they should always oppose the officials, for why should they do so? But I regard them as more independent in expressing their views than the Municipal Commissioners. They are, moreover, less selfish. In all local bodies the officials are in a minority, and most of them being Indians or Panjabees; they have the same sympathy with and knowledge of the masses as we have. The District Boards of to-day are not the District Boards of 15 years ago and the members have ceased to be mere "*ji hazurs.*" I therefore oppose this amendment."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"Your Honour,—I am afraid I cannot accept this amendment. Most effective arguments have already been advanced by the Hon'ble Members who have opposed it. I have only one further argument to advance, and that is, that the Hon'ble Member is proposing to create a new statutory body of non-official members of local bodies. Whether such a body is necessary or not I do not know, but certainly it is not the part of an Education Bill to introduce the constitution of such a body. There is no precedent for such a thing, and it is a most undesirable proposition. I think the Hon'ble Member has been misled by the fact that non-official members of this body have before now been consulted, been asked their opinion on certain matters. To give an opinion is a very different thing from passing a binding resolution. By such action the non-official members would be able to represent the whole local body and carry out a scheme of such importance as the introduction of Compulsory Primary Education. I think it creates an impossible position. Now

imagine the position of officials in that Board, who have no right to vote. Will they be allowed to express their opinion? Will they attend and do so if they cannot vote? Take the case of the District Inspector of Schools. As an official he is not entitled to vote, and surely he is the man most conversant with the subject. I am not impressed with the argument of the Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram that this question would chiefly concern non-officials. Is he prepared to carry the proposal to its logical conclusion and recommend that on questions chiefly affecting, *e.g.*, Muhammadans, the vote of the Muhammadan members only should be binding on the Board? Obviously the Board cannot be split, as thereby the whole constitution of local bodies will be undermined."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :— "Your Honour,—Before the amendment is put to vote, I might perhaps quote the figures for district boards as regards officials and non-officials' membership. The number of non-official members in District Boards is 860, officials number 267. Of the whole membership, 1,067 are Indians and 60 Europeans. I have had some experience of District Boards and Municipalities, and I may say that I never found such a condition as the Hon'ble Mover of the amendment has suggested. I have always found that the non-official members were quite ready to express their opinion. And personally as a President of the Committee or District Board I have always paid the utmost attention to any opinions the non-official members ever expressed. Here I must say that the attitude taken by the Hon'ble Mover in this amendment is much to be regretted."

The Hon'ble Captain Gopal Singh.—Your Honour,—If official members are excluded from District Board and only non-official members are left as proposed by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal in clause 3 (1) and (3) then there will be left no (except very few) non-official members, because the Zaildars, Sufedposhes and Lambardars are all semi-officials.

"Does the Hon'ble Member, the Mover of the amendment, mean to say (as he said) that all the Zaildars and Sufedposhes and Lambardars, the members of the District Boards, will like to kill their conscience under the influence of the Deputy Commissioners while giving votes. Are all of them unfit, and if so, why they are taken on the District Boards?

"I strongly oppose the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :— "Your Honour,—I never meant that the opinion of the Lambardars, etc., should not be taken; I simply wanted to exclude the vote of official members who form, ordinarily, one-third of the members present in the Board, the remaining two-thirds consisting of the non-official members including Lambardars, Zaildars and Sufedposhes."

His Honour the President :— "The Financial Secretary has shown by figures that the proportion of official members is one-fourth on the District Boards."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"Ordinarily many of the non-officials do not attend."

His Honour the President :—"That is their own fault."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"I may change my amendment. I also have suggested that in no case the majority of two-thirds should be continued. Either the amendment should be carried, or the clause as it stood in the original Bill should be restored, and the words 'by a majority of two-thirds of the members present at such meeting' be omitted. Both the points are to be considered."

His Honour the President :—"We will take both the points separately."

The motion that in clause 3 (1) and (3) between the words "the" and "members" the word "non-official" be added was put to the Council and lost

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh; Mr. Maynard; His Honour the President; Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai; Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand; Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram; Captain Gopal Singh.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"The second amendment is that the words which have been inserted by the learned Select Committee 'a majority of two-thirds of the members present' be omitted and the original clause of the Bill be restored, so as to make the extension depend upon the ordinary voting of the meeting and not for the special restrictions of the majority of two-thirds being required to carry out such a measure."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahir Lal, Bhargava:—"Your Honour,—I think the Mover does not mean that the whole section 3 as originally drafted should be specified, but he simply means that instead of the words 'by a majority of two-thirds of the members present' the words 'by a majority of the members present' be substituted; and so far as this amendment that a majority of two-thirds should not be insisted on but that a majority of the members should be considered sufficient is concerned, I support it."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh:—"Your Honour,—I think this clause requires some sort of amendment, but I am afraid I cannot support the amendment proposed by my Hon'ble Friend Bakhshi Sohan Lal. He wants that a bare majority should be sufficient instead of two-thirds members as laid down in the clause. That, I submit, Sir, is very dangerous as a meeting may have only a few members present, and they may pass such a resolution and the people may not regard them as their representatives. I move another amendment that the words 'at a meeting specially convened for the purpose' be added to the sentence. It may be known to all that the point is coming for consideration in the meeting. I think this will meet all objections, and this will put all the members on guard and they will express their views. But surely it ought not be a bare majority of any meeting."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"Does the last speaker mean two-thirds of the members present or two-thirds of the total number of members."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh:—"I mean two-thirds of the members present."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"Your Honour,—I repeat the same thing that there is nothing special which requires the insisting upon of two-thirds majority, and in ordinary course there is no need of calling a special meeting for the purpose."

The amendment that the words "of two-thirds" in the sentence "by a majority of two-thirds of the members present" be dropped from clause 3 was put to the Council and lost.

His Honour the President:—"Does any Hon'ble Member wish to speak on Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh's amendment?"

The Hon'ble Dewan Bahadur Dewan Daulat Rai:—"I support this amendment, Your Honour."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan:—"I also support this amendment, Your Honour."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand:—"Your Honour, I think this amendment will meet the case."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram:—"No opposition, Your Honour."

The Hon'ble Captain Gopal Singh:—"I also support the amendment, Your Honour."

His Honour the President:—"I think it is a very desirable safeguard."

The amendment that in section 3, sub-section (1) the words "at a meeting specially convened for the purpose" be added was put to the Council and carried.

[*Mr French ; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. French—"You, Sir, have to-day given the Council some weighty advice, as to the caution with which this great experiment we are discussing should be handled in this Council. The Select Committee have amended the original Bill by inserting before the word 'refuse' the words 'for reasons to be stateded by it either' in clause 3 (5). I desire to move as an amendment that these words be deleted and the original sub-clause be restored as it stood in the original Bill.

"The wording of the sub-clause as it now stands in the Bill amended by the Select Committee embodies a provision which Government is unable to accept. In this and similar cases Government may be and should be trusted to exercise its discretion wisely and cannot agree that it should in all cases without exception state its reasons for the course of action which after full and mature consideration of all the circumstances it decides to pursue.

"The apprehension, or misapprehension as I should prefer to call it, which is stated in the report of the Select Committee to exist that the Local Government might arbitrarily and without sufficient reason refuse to sanction the proposals of a local authority is - I put it emphatically—a baseless one, and is inadequate as a ground for seeking to control Government's discretion. Suspicions and misapprehensions as to Government's action and policy, however unreasonable or unjustifiable, will always exist in the minds of some people: but in view of Government's recent action (to which my Hon'ble colleagues Messrs. Lumsden and Richey referred yesterday) in sanctioning a scheme for the wide expansion of primary education in rural areas and in promising to bear two-thirds of the cost of this scheme, I beg leave to doubt whether the misapprehension mentioned by the Select Committee is in any way extensively prevalent or indeed exists outside certain political circles. Under the rules of this Council the President, who is the head of the Government, may disallow any or any part of the question without giving any reason therefor other than that in his opinion it cannot be answered consistently with the public interests. *A fortiori*, in a matter of such importance as a proposal involving *ex hypothesi* interference with the liberty of action of a large mass of people, Government must retain its discretion as to whether it shall or shall not make public its reasons for refusal to sanction a local authority's proposals to apply Part II of the Act to the whole or any part of the area within the local limits of its authority. No doubt Government would as a rule give its reasons for refusal; but, as Hon'ble Members will on reflection readily recognise, cases may occur where divulgation may be undesirable. I therefore move the amendment that the words 'or for reasons to be stated by it either' be omitted from the Bill."

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh:—"Your Honour,—I think I must support the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. French. I was a Member of the Select Committee, and I very clearly stated that the idea underlying was not to suspect the Local Government in any way. So far as I was concerned the idea was that if the Government finds itself in a position to explain the reason as to why the application of a local body is refused that would give better satisfaction to the people concerned. But after hearing the weighty reasons of Your Honour to-day I find that Government should not be compelled to express their reason on almost every occasion. Of course, as far as we are concerned, we have never failed to trust the Government, and so I find no difficulty in supporting the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. French."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"Your Honour,—I also support the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. French. When the decision of the Local Government is to be final, there is no reason why the Local Government should be required to give reasons."

[*Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand; Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah; Nawab Sir Bahram Khan; Mr. Richey; Mr. French; Dewan Bahadur Dewan Daulat Rai.*]

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand:—"Your Honour,—I support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah:—"I am in entire agreement with the amendment, Your Honour."

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir Bahram Khan.—"I agree also, Your Honour."

The amendment that in section 3, sub-section 5, the words "for reasons to be stated by it either" be omitted was put to the Council and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey.—"Your Honour,—I beg to move that section 3 with the amendments in sub sections 1 and 5 may now be passed."

The motion that section 3 with amendments in sub-sections 1 and 5 be passed was put to the Council and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey.—"Your Honour,—I beg to move that clause 4 be now taken into consideration."

The Hon'ble Mr. French.—"The Select Committee have explained their deletion of the words 'the whole or' in the original Bill as intended to remove an existing apprehension that the whole cost of providing primary education might be placed on the local authority. How far again this misapprehension extends I am of course unable to judge: but the tendency of the inclusion of this amendment in the Act will be to prevent any local body which may be constituted in the future, such as the committee of a small town or notified area, from attempting to meet the whole of the cost of primary education within its area even in a case where otherwise it would be willing and able to do so. Consequently Government is not prepared to accept this clause as it now stands, and I move to substitute for the words 'to meet part of' the words 'towards meeting' in clause 4."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai.—"I am afraid there seems to be a great deal of misapprehension. As the clause now stands they seem to understand it to mean that only a part of the expenditure will be raised by the local bodies, but if we take off these words it would read like this, that the whole of the cost will be met by the local bodies. Of course there is no statutory provision in the Act that the Local Government shall undertake to be responsible to meet any part of the expenditure on the introduction of primary education. It will raise the apprehension that the Government is not going to take any burden, and that the whole cost will fall on the local bodies."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey.—"I do not think Mr. French has made it quite clear that the change proposed by him—the actual change of the words—would not in any way alter the meaning as it stood before. It does in no way limit what the Government should give. It only makes the matter a little wider. I do not think that the apprehension which the Hon'ble Member mentions is a sufficient reason for rejecting the amendment."

The amendment that in clause 4 (1) the words "to meet the part of" be omitted and the words "towards meeting" in its place be substituted, was put to the Council and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey.—"I beg to move that clause 4 as amended be passed."

The motion was put and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey.—"Clause 5 has already been dealt with. I beg to move that clause 6 be now taken into consideration."

[*Mr. French; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh; Mr. Richey.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. French.—"In this clause, Sir, the Select Committee have added the words 'on the recommendation of a local authority' and 'within the area of such local authority.' It is explained that the addition is made in order that proposed exemptions should proceed from the initiative of the local authority. Government is unable to accept this amendment which would leave it to local authorities to make fluctuating recommendations on matters which should obviously be governed by a uniform policy. I may instance the case of tenants, nomadic or immigrant criminal tribes, depressed classes, etc., who will usually have no voice in the counsels of the local body. The exemption of classes and communities from the operation of this Act, is, therefore, as I venture to think Hon'ble Members generally will recognise, a question which Government is in the best position to determine and which must be left to its decision. I therefore move that the original clause 6 be restored in place of the amended clause."

The discussion of this amendment was postponed.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"The next amendment which I have to move is in connection with clause 6 of the Bill which empowers the Local Government, on the recommendation of a local authority, to exempt, by notification, any particular class or community within the area of any local authority, from the operation of this Act. The object of my amendment by adding after the word 'Act' in clause 6 the words 'either for the whole period or for a part thereof' is to provide a lesser course of primary education extending only to 1, 2, 3 or 4 years for such classes or communities who may not be prepared for the whole five years' course but may desire to have compulsory education for a shorter period than that provided for in section 10. This object will be best gained by removing clause 6 from its present position and transplanting its provisions (with amendment proposed by me) as proviso 2 under section 10 of the Bill in the following words:—

"'Provided also that the Local Government on the recommendation of a local authority may by notification exempt, particular classes or communities within the area of such local authority, from the operation of this Act either for the whole period of five years or for a part thereof.'"

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh.—"Is the Hon'ble Member withdrawing the amendment?"

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.—"No, I am pressing the amendment."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey.—"I submit that the Hon'ble Member perhaps means that the Local Government might exempt particular classes or communities either for the whole period of attendance or a portion of it. As the amendment actually runs, it means nothing. Also, as he says, if that amendment is adopted it will have to be put in the second part. We have nothing about the compulsory period in the first part at all, and it would be meaningless in the first part. This is a question which I do not think the Select Committee considered at all—the question of exemping certain classes from a period of attendance. My own personal feeling is against it. But it has been tried—it has been tried in England—where agriculturists at first had to put in 250 attendances a year and town boys 300. They have now altered that. They have placed the agriculturists on the same level with others. There is no reason why certain sections of the community because they are originally backward should always be kept in that backward position. The whole history of English education has been a struggle to make the national schools equally efficient with board schools, to introduce a uniform system. The Hon'ble Member by introducing this amendment will allow a certain community to lag behind

others. I do not know if he would be thanked for the gift by the people to whom he offers it. I am not quite sure whether Government would be justified in making this differentiation. There have been certain communities who have preferred to rely on State-aided inferior classes of schools rather than to join the ordinary State system of education. It seems to me that this system keeps a particular community backward, but I do not think the Government would object to having this power of relaxing the attendance."

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik.—"Before discussion proceeds, I should like to know for my own information what the effect of this amendment will be. Does the Hon'ble Member mean to reduce the years, that is, from 4 or 5 years to 3 or 4 years, or is it his intention to reduce the hours or days of compulsory attendance?"

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.—"I meant the reduction in the period of 4 or 5 years and not the hours. The Local Government may have the power to reduce the period not the hours."

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik:—"There is another point. The effect of exemption under clause 6 would also be to exempt classes from taxation imposed by clause 4. So it is not only the question of compulsory attendance, but also the question of bearing a share of the burden."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"But it will exempt them for the whole period or reduce their period of tuition."

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik:—"What about taxation?"

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"That will follow as a matter of course, that they will be exempted consequently from taxation also."

His Honour the President:—"Then they will all try to be exempted."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Sheo Narain:—"With Your Honour's permission I would like to ask the Hon'ble Member who has proposed the amendment—Bakhshi Sahib—what are those practical cases to which that exemption would apply. On the one hand, there is a desire to have a good period of education, namely, from a certain number of years to a certain number of years. That is a general desire. But I cannot understand that there can be any cases—there may be some hypothetical cases or something of that sort—where the Local Government will allow two years' course to a particular community. What benefit will it be to the community or to the public? In my opinion either we must have the full term of education whatever that may be, 4 years or 5, or the total exemption of a community. I would like the Bakhshi Sahib to be more explicit on the point and ask the Hon'ble Member Bakhshi Sahib to let us have the result or the practical value of such an exemption."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"I wish simply to reconsider the case of those particular classes or communities which are intended to be exempted from the operation. If there are any classes who may ask the Government 'Let us have three years' course of lower primary,' and under the provisions of section 6 as it now stands there will be no other alternative but to refuse them altogether or to compel them for the whole period of 5 years or whatever that may be. It is for the benefit of these classes that I have proposed the amendment.

I think, something is better than nothing.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"Your Honour,—Quite apart from the question of the form of this amendment the object is to provide for the possibility of Government insisting upon a shorter period of compulsion for certain particular classes. I oppose that on the ground that it is not true in this case that something is better than nothing, for a course must be a complete course lasting long enough to give something which is of real value or there should be no course at all. Anything shorter than 4 or 5 years or

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; His Honour the President ; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Richey ; Mr. French.*]

whichever this Council ultimately decides would be altogether useless. It will mean that a boy will be made to spend 2 years in the infant class of the primary classes learning very little, and there will be all the irritation of compulsion without any of those advantages which are aimed at by this piece of legislation. I therefore strongly oppose the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"After hearing Mr. Maynard I withdraw the amendment."

His Honour the President :—"We now resume the discussion on the original amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. French."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand :—"Your Honour, I rise to support this motion. In some local areas there may be classes which are in a minority there or have no representation in the local body governing it. If the amendment as proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. French be not accepted, it would mean that such minor communities cannot represent their grievances to the Government. The idea of imparting education is a very noble one, but we should not ignore that compulsion is after all forcing others to do something against their will. I think in some cases there may be administrative difficulties and the resolution of a local body may embarrass the Government in many ways. Is the Government to approach the local body with a request to make recommendations to it for a modification of its resolution? Are we going to put the Government in the position of an applicant before a local body or is the Government to tell the memorialists, who have approached the Government with their grievances, that Government has no jurisdiction in the matter and the local body is their highest tribunal? What will be the result of this? It will simply mean that might is right, and the aggrieved party will naturally depend upon their mighty *lathis* with all the consequences which follow the free use of *lathis*. The Government will now come forward and say that although we were helpless in giving you a hearing, although we had full sympathy with you, although your cause was just, yet we must entertain you in jails.

"Your Honour, I have tried to give a rough idea of the consequences that might follow if the Government is shorn of its inherent powers, and support the amendment so ably moved by the Hon'ble Mr. French."

The motion that clause 6 as originally drafted be restored was put to the Council and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"Your Honour, I beg to move that clause 7 be now taken into consideration."

The Hon'ble Mr. French.—"In clause 7 of the original clause the Select Committee have made two amendments. One is, the words 'after reference to the local authority and for reasons to be stated by it' have been inserted, and the other the words 'suspend or cancel the application of Part II of this Act in any local area' have been substituted for the words in the original Bills. For reasons already given by me while moving the amendment under clause 3 (5) Government is unable to accept the proposal to insert in the Act the words 'and for reasons to be stated by it.' I therefore move that these words be deleted from the amended clause."

His Honour the President :—"The principle has already been accepted in clause 3 (5)."

The motion that clause 7 be amended by the exclusion of the words "and for reasons to be stated by it" was put to the Council and carried.

The motion that clause 7 as amended be passed was put to the Council and carried.

[*Mr. Richey ; His Honour the President ; Mr. Craik ; Mr. Ellis ; Mr. Maynard ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—" Your Honour, I now move that clause 8 be taken into consideration."

The motion that clause 8 as framed by the Select Committee be passed was carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—" I beg to move that clause 9 be now taken into consideration."

His Honour the President :—" Has any member any suggestion or amendment to move ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Craik :—" I should like to know why the Select Committee omitted sub-clause (2)."

The Hon'ble Mr. Ellis :—" We are following the precedent of the Bombay Act."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—" The reason was that it simply appeared to be entirely an unnecessary addition."

The motion that clause 9 as amended by the Select Committee be passed was put and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—" Your Honour, I beg to move that clause 10 be now taken into consideration."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—" The third amendment that the word ' fifth ' be substituted for the word ' fourth ' in proviso to clause 10, which I move, is in connection with the proviso to clause 10 (1) of the Bill which exempts, all boys who have completed the course prescribed for the 4th Primary standard in a recognized school, from attending such school. If it is meant by section 10 that the compulsory course in the primary schools is restricted to four classes only instead of five, no such school will allow any student to continue to attend its 4th class after he has passed the final examination of that class, and no such proviso to section 10 will serve any useful purpose ; but if it is meant by section 10 that the age for compulsory education provided by it from 6 to 11 years is to be reduced for the children who complete the course earlier, the exemption from attendance after completing the tuition of the 4th primary class will have the effect of reducing the present course of primary education from 5 years to 4 years, while the more intelligent children who complete their course of four primary classes at the age of 8 or 9 will have to be discharged from the school at such an early age as to render them incapable of retaining their literacy for a long time. If Hindu tradition is to be believed, and from such materials as are available to throw any light on the state of things existing in this country in ancient times, it is clear that India had attained a high standard of literacy in those days. Recent publications by Vincent Smith and Havell show that the Hindus had solved the question of free and compulsory education in a satisfactory manner. As an instance, I might cite the description of Ajodhya in Valmiki's Ramayan Balkand, chapter VII, Shlokas 8, 14 and 15, wherein it is stated that in those ancient days no illiterate persons could be found in the city of Ajodhya A similar state of universal literacy in India was prevalent during the period of Asoka, Chandargupta, Vikarmaditya and Bhoj But what has been the effect of relaxation of the compulsory and free education system in this country during the last 1,000 years ? Gradually the ratio of literacy in this country has fallen from cent. per cent. to 6 per cent., while European countries, Japan and America, during the last century, by introducing the system of compulsory and free education have increased their literacy from an insignificant proportion to the high proportion of about 96 per cent. At present India, in comparison with other civilized countries of the world, has hardly got 1 literate person out of

her 20, while other civilized countries have got 19 literate persons out of their 20. In order to bring India in line with other progressive nations it is absolutely necessary that compulsory and free education should be provided for a much longer period than 5 years, but a 5 years' course can only be accepted as a first step towards increasing the age limit of compulsory and free education to the ideal age of 25. Other countries are gradually increasing the age limit for compulsory education and are expected to bring it as near as possible to the Vedic ideals of 25 years' age for compulsory education. In England, Wales and Scotland the age for compulsory education is at present from 5 to 14 years, but it has been proposed by Mr. Fisher, the Head of the Education Department, that the age limit be extended to 18 years and to make 14 years' course of education both free and compulsory. In no other country where free and compulsory education is provided for a specified age, there is any condition of exempting the children earlier if the prescribed course is completed by them before reaching the age limit. On these facts the object of the proviso, restricting compulsory education to a standard of 4 years or of 4 classes is anything but satisfactory. The proviso is absolutely unnecessary as no student who has passed the final examination of the Primary Standard will be allowed to continue his studies in that standard. If the proviso has to be continued the 3rd paragraph of my amendment requiring the word 'fifth' being substituted for the word 'fourth' will have the salutary effect of making the proviso consistent with section 10 (1) which requires every child between the ages of 6 and 11 to attend a recognized school for education. No shorter course of studies than that of five primary classes is expected to impart such education to a child as to make him capable of retaining such literacy for his lifetime. Therefore it is respectfully prayed that the amendment moved be carried."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram :—"Your Honour, I rise to support the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal. On a cursory glance it appears that the Select Committee has considerably improved clause 10 of the draft Bill. The raising of the age of attendance from 10 to 11 years is a step in the right direction and for which the Select Committee deserves our thanks.

"But looking into the proviso to clause 10, one finds that the Select Committee has not only not extended the *period* of study from which it stands at present, but has actually reduced it. What the committee gave us with one hand by raising the age of compulsory attendance, it has more than taken away by this reduction of the period of study.

"The reason for this reduction of the period of study from a five to a four years' course as given by the Select Committee is that 'in a very large number of rural schools it will be impossible to provide education above the fourth standard.'

"I fail to see why it should not be possible to keep the education in these schools up to a five years' course.

"The Select Committee adds perhaps as a justification of the reduction of period of study that the fourth standard was that adopted for exemption by the English (Compulsory) Education Act. I may be pardoned for reminding the Select Committee that this Act was passed in 1876 over 42 years ago, and that the fourth standard in England stands for a much higher education than ours, and that at present the age of compulsory attendance in England extends from 5 to 14 years.

"We do not ask for this period of nine years as in England, nor 8 years as in Japan and Germany, nor 7 years as in France, but only for the retention of the present period of primary education for 5 years.

[*Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram ; Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai.*]

"In Bombay and the United Provinces the period of compulsory education extends to five years. If the comparatively advanced provinces think it fit to have a five years' course I fail to see the reason for a four years' course in the Punjab. In such matters we were under the impression that it was better to follow the lead of advanced countries and provinces—but no, the Punjab must follow the lead of the most backward of provinces, the North-West Frontier Province.

"In this connection it is interesting and the instructive to remember that when Mr. Gokhale brought forward his Bill for Compulsory Education it was attacked by the Government on the ground that the period of compulsion of 4 years, as proposed in it, was too short. The Government brought forward statistics to show that even after undergoing a five years' course 39 per cent. of the students lapsed into illiteracy. If that was the result after a five years' course what would be the result after a 4 years' course? And yet the Select Committee is here proposing the very thing that the Government condemned some years back.

"Not only will this 4 years' course be insufficient for those educated under it, but it will have a disastrous effect on the whole primary education of the province as it stands at present. There are at present about 5,000 primary schools in this province. Nearly 600 of these teach up to the Lower Primary Standard, the rest, about 4,400, teach up to the full primary standard. The effect of the recognition of what will amount in practice to a four years' study will be to reduce the period of primary education all over the province from 5 to 4 years.

"Not only this, but along with it is the hint given in the report of the Select Committee that in a large number of rural schools the number of classes will be cut down from 5 to 4.

"If this is what Compulsory Education is to secure us we shall have to seriously consider whether we shall not be better without it.

"Your Honour, I would urge in the end that as we are agreed on the need of compulsion in primary education, and as we are going to adopt this measure, would it not be better to make a change worth the name, a change that will lead to some real advance rather than to retrogression, a change that will be in consonance with the line of policy of progressive countries and provinces rather than of the most backward of provinces.

"I, therefore, support with all the emphasis at my command the amendment of my Hon'ble colleague to substitute 5th standard in place of the 4th standard in clause 10 of the amended Bill."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai :—"Your Honour, I rise to support the amendment moved by my Hon'ble friend Bakhshi Sohan Lal, that in the proviso to section 10 of the Bill the word 'fifth' be substituted for the word 'fourth.' When the Bill was in the committee stage I ventured to oppose the inclusion of this proviso. This is in effect the same thing, for if the amendment is carried it will render the proviso redundant and of no effect for any practical purpose. The first sub-clause to section 10 makes education compulsory between the ages of six to eleven, that is, for a period of five years. If the proviso be allowed to stand, the effect will be that if a boy completes in four years the fourth standard of the primary course, he shall thereafter be exempt from the operation of the Act. In other words, the fifth year's compulsion will apply only to a boy who in four years had failed to complete a four-year course. It is only the unintelligent and the inefficient who will normally fail to accomplish this as the number of such boys will be very small, the provision relating to the fifth year's compulsion will to a large extent remain inoperative.

[*Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai.*]

"Your Honour, the regular primary course under the voluntary system at present extends over five years. If, therefore, under the Act, compulsion operates only for four years as it will do in the case of a large majority of boys of average intelligence, all the schools will teach a four years' course, and to that extent, the Act will prove a retrograde measure. In fact, what is now known as the primary standard meaning a five years' course of instruction will become a standard with four years' instruction only. It is beyond question that a very considerable number of boys leaves off study when they attain the primary standard. The primary standard is for them a terminal stage. Now if this stage is reduced from five years to four, it is obvious that the general level of intellectual progress in the province will be appreciably lowered.

"Your Honour, as will be apparent that under the proposed scheme the period of instruction will be to the end of the tenth year of a boy's life, the seventh and a considerable part of the eighth year are practically wasted and no serious notice can be taken of the instruction imparted during this period. It is only in the ninth and the tenth year that the child begins to learn anything useful. There can be no doubt that the State ought to do its best towards enabling the younger generation to develope itself and equip itself for the battle of life, and can it be seriously contended that the knowledge that a boy acquires in his ninth and tenth year is calculated to do that in any appreciable measure? In England before the war the period of compulsory instruction was between sixth and fourteenth year and it was stated that during all that period even the instruction imparted was not at all efficient, and that a good many children lapsed into illiteracy. It is for these reasons that the period in England has been extended to eighteen years under Mr. Fisher's Bill. In this country where the primary standard is a terminal stage for a considerable portion of the school-going population the argument applies with still greater force. Of the boys that under the present voluntary system remain at schools for five years, it has been calculated that 39 per cent. of them lapse into illiteracy, and it is a fact that the standard of literacy of the remaining is deplorably low.

"Your Honour, there are at present more than 5,000 primary schools in this province. Of these five-sixths were teaching up to the fifth primary standard in the year 1916-17, and in the following year this figure rose to six-sevenths. As I have shown under the proposed scheme all the schools will be teaching a four years' course with the result that the progressive tendencies indicated by these figures will be checked and indeed the case of popular education will receive a distinct set back.

"Your Honour, I may add that the experiment of a four years' course in the Bombay Presidency, which includes the backward province of Sind proved a failure with the result that they have again reverted to the five years' course. The same is the position which the United Provinces Government is taking up having benefited by the experience of the sister province.

"Your Honour, to the best of my belief in no country in the world is the period of compulsion less than six years and in most it is eight. The argument that the present scheme should follow what was started in England in 1870, is hardly convincing since after a trial of but five years the position was definitely given up notwithstanding the fact that the fourth standard in England meant something much higher than what is contemplated here.

"It was stated by His Honour in opening the discussion to-day that Japan started with four years' compulsion. That probably is correct, but are we going to compete in our international struggle, in our economic struggle internationally with the Japan of 60 years ago or are we going to compete with the Japan of to-day? We should take note of the progress which the other nations

of the world have made by adopting free education long, long ago. In my humble opinion it will be a serious mistake to reduce the period to anything lower than 5 years. After all what is the sum total of the classification of a boy who starts his education in a primary school in the Punjab. He reads a few vernacular books, and if he is lucky enough to be admitted to a vernacular school he starts English in the 4th Primary. Then another year in the 5th Primary and there it ends. Unless his parents are rich enough to send him to a town school the boy has to attend in the majority of cases the vernacular primary school which teaches very little of any value to make him a young man fit to fight his battles of life. We have got to compete with the people who got compulsion half a century ago. With these remarks I beg to support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand :—" Sir,—I had to say a good deal on behalf of the rural classes, when we were discussing the Reform Scheme, the other day. I must confess that a handful of people living in towns was very much enraged at my asking for an equal treatment for villagers. The villagers were styled 'illiterate' and 'ignorant' by them. Unfortunately the same sort of question has again cropped up before this Council. The question now is how best to remove illiteracy and ignorance from the Province. Having once styled the villagers ignorant and illiterate, we could expect a preferential treatment for them to-day at the hands of the townspeople. They again deny us an equal treatment and hence I rise again to perform the painful duty of opposing a brother representative of the rural classes who has unfortunately taken a fancy for townspeople and gives them his support.

" However, before I proceed to examine the effect of the amendment on our scheme of education, I must confess that in principle I regard the amendment a very sound one and any opposition to it would look contrary to the interests of general advancement of the Province. It would even look contrary to the general wishes of the people, for who does not wish that his countrymen should get more and more education. The reason why I have ventured to oppose the extension of the proposed primary course from 4 to 5 years is not because I am less eager in the cause of education than the Hon'ble mover, but because I am anxious that justice be done to those whom we both have the honour to represent here. For the sake of people living in towns I cannot see the interests of that large majority which lives in villages and which is no less than nine-tenths of the whole population of the Province sacrificed, and hence this opposition.

" Under the present 5 years' course which the Hon'ble mover wants to continue or to be perpetuated, there are many drawbacks for village boys. In villages there are Vernacular Primary Schools and a boy has to come to an Anglo-Vernacular Middle School after finishing his course there. Here he finds that he cannot join the Middle Class, as in this school they have been teaching English in 4th and 5th Primary Classes. The poor boy has now to undergo a special course of lectures in English alone and has to attend the Junior 'special' class for one year. He has thus to spend 4 years instead of 3 before he can sit in the Entrance Class. He spends 11 years in all for the matriculation examination, while his brother, who happens to live in a town, spends only 10 years. The 4 years' Primary course is calculated to remove this difficulty as English teaching will begin with the 1st Middle Class. It has been said that the number of students going in for secondary education from villages is very small and their interests may be sacrificed for the sake of that vast majority which will remain in villages and which is being deprived of one year's education ; that already a large number of them become illiterate after a few years

and the shortening of the course will add to their number. I admit all these difficulties. But I regard the interests of those few villagers who go in for secondary education with greater sanctity than my Hon'ble friend, the mover. May I remind him what the prospects of village school boys are? Most of them join the Vernacular Middle Schools simply because they cannot afford to spend one extra year in the Junior special class. At that time they hardly realise the difference of prospects in the two schools. They pass their Vernacular Middle School Examination and are doomed to serve either as village schoolmasters with pay rising up to Rs. 20 or to serve as Patwaris with their pay ranging from Rs. 10 to Rs. 15 per mensem. Even the topmost boys have to content themselves with this lot. Are there not among them boys who, if given equal opportunities, would adorn the chairs of the Lahore Colleges instead of the village schools and who would become Under-Secretaries to the Government instead of Patwaries? It is this desire to better their prospects that has compelled me to differ from my Hon'ble friend. Outwardly my friend's position is that out of love for that vast majority of villagers who are not likely to go to school but for this Bill, he wants the few of their number who go in for secondary education to make a little sacrifice of one year. For what is one year as compared with the benefit it will confer upon thousands of their brethren? In reply, I would simply ask the Hon'ble mover who represents the views of the towns to move the urban classes to make a little sacrifice for the sake of the vast population living in villages. Let there be a provision in the Bill or an undertaking from the heads of Education Department that English teaching will not begin in the Primary Department. Let there be one uniform method for all schools and let the English begin from 1st Middle Class, and I won't mind whether you have a compulsory primary course for 4 years or for 5 years. This I am afraid the vocal section of the towns is not prepared to admit. The other day they gathered together in large numbers in Lahore and passed a number of resolutions. Among other things they urged in the strongest possible terms that the period of compulsion should not be less than 6 years. This sounds very generous, but when we go further we find another resolution which demands that the study of English in Anglo-Vernacular Schools should begin from the 4th Primary Class. Anglo-Vernacular Schools, I need hardly point out, are synonymous with town schools. It may pertinently be asked whether they made any suggestions regarding the village schools and the disability under which boys from those schools are labouring. To this the reply is 'no.' They want them only to make some sacrifice and that is all.

"I may here point out that that august body passed a few resolutions regarding the general educational activities of the Government and although they are not directly relevant to the present question, yet they show very clearly that that body was composed of men living in certain towns and could not be regarded as representatives of the Province as their name implied.

"One of their resolutions asks for industrial schools in important centres which means important towns and another demands a college of commerce for the Province. I am not against these two healthy demands, but the want of similar resolutions for more agricultural schools and colleges compels me to point out that that body does not represent the whole of the Province, but only one-tenth of the Province.

"Sir, my opposition is simply based upon the inequality of treatment which underlies the amendment. If the amendment put forward by the Hon'ble mover is accepted, then I would earnestly appeal to the Government and to the heads of the Educational Department to give the villagers an equal chance with the townspeople. This can be done either by making provision

[*Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand*; *Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava.*]

for English teaching in all village Primary Schools or by beginning English after the Primary course is over. The first alternative seems to me the best, if we can simply afford to have it. To me, the cost of providing an English teacher in every Village School seems prohibitive, as there is unfortunately a limit to our resources, as well as to our power of bearing the burden of fresh taxes. We should have high ideals no doubt, but it would be unwise to spend beyond our means. I would, therefore, earnestly request the Government to follow the second alternative.

"One word more and I have finished. Education is expanding in villages and we should not be led away by past figures, calculated to show how few will suffer, if the standard for village and town schools is not the same. In future we should expect that villages will send students for higher education in proportion to their numbers. They have now realised that their interests are not safe in the hands of the townspeople and that they must equip their own men for every branch of work. With this prospects in view we can fairly ignore past figures and legislate according to the present requirements of the Province.

"With these few words, Sir, I oppose this amendment."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal Bhargava :—Your Honour,—I also rise to support the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhsi Sohan Lal.

"The provisions of section 10 (1) of the Bill under discussion show that children between the age of 6 and 11 shall be caused to attend school, and if it be conceded that the inherited intelligence of an average Punjabi student is such as would under proper training enable him to pass upwards from one class to another every year, the course of 5 years at school would ordinarily be sufficient for such students to pass the Upper Primary Standard Examination. It would thus appear that under the said section without a proviso, an average student shall not leave the school before he has passed the 5th Upper Primary Class.

"The proviso to section 10 (1), however, makes a reservation in favour of students who have completed the course of 4th Primary Standard or a course recognised by the Local Government as equivalent to that Standard.

"The practical effect of this proviso is to restrict compulsion to the 4th standard only, and as a consequence the period of compulsory education is, in general, thereby reduced to 4 years.

"If Primary Schools on the lines of 4 years' course, as suggested by the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab, in his 'Note on School courses of the Punjab' are established in the Province, and their course is recognised by the Government as the one equivalent to the 4th standard, it is plain that the practical period for Primary Education will be reduced to 4 years. It will be too much for children reading in such schools to complete their studies there and then resort to other schools for making up the 5 years' period contemplated by the section. The compulsory education period will thus be generally 4 years, and may in particular cases be three years or less.

"Your Honour, it is idle for me in this Council to expatiate on the advantages of raising the popular intelligence to higher levels. The intelligence of the people is an asset of the highest value for a State, and it is the recognition of this principle which underlies legislation like the present. Almost all the Governments of the civilised countries of the world have recognised the education alone qualifies a nation to hold its own in the race of life. Even in the midst of the engrossing preoccupations of the titanic war Lord

[*Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal Bhargava.*]

Fisher's Educational Budget proclaimed to the world how essential and vital the claims of education were. The period of compulsory Primary Education is a matter of supreme moment, and I feel I would be failing in my duty to my countrymen if I did not insist upon 5 years (for the present) as the least period or 5th Upper Primary Standard as the least education in less number of years.

"The contest is therefore practically speaking between four and five years, and my reasons for five years are the following :—

"(1) In no advanced country is the period of Primary Education less than five years. There is no reason why they who need education most should lag behind the others in providing for it.

"(2) All the countries of the world are increasing the period of such education.

"(3) With the inauguration of the reform scheme the public in general will be invited to exercise responsibility in many essential matters. In fact, popular Government is not a boon without proper popular education. To make the reform scheme a success we require a diffusion of intelligence among the people alike intensive in quality as extensive in quantity.

"(4) If the dream of the well-wishers of the Punjab among whom none is so ardent as Your Honour is to be fulfilled and the agricultural and industrial regeneration of the country is to be realised in fact, the educational equipment of the ordinary citizen should be if he wish or not as high as can be made conveniently or inconveniently.

"(5) This one year from 10 to 11 if devoted to study is productive of more than proportionate advantage in the future life of the student, and every student will bless his parents for the petty sacrifice in comfort and want of work which they will suffer for the little ones acquiring something which may ultimately redound to their own material advantage also. Moreover in my opinion it is too early to take work from a child of 10, and if parents and guardians can afford under statutory sanction not to bar the way of children attending the schools till the age of 10, I am inclined to believe that they will not be disinclined to leave their children at school till 11 if they are made to understand the significance of a year's stay more at school.

"(6) In the interests of the investment that we are making as prudent businessmen we ought to put in a bit of more capital if the outturn is proportionally greater, or put it better, the ultimate wastage is lessened. Students who after 4 years' training will only learn the merest something are liable to more readily forget that something and lapse into initial ignorance than those in whom interest for such education has been created by a longer course.

"(7) It is more likely that students educated to the 5th standard will care to prosecute their studies higher up than those educated to the 4th Primary Standard. Thus indirectly too the 5th standard will act as a stimulus for secondary and higher education.

"(8) As Hon'ble Members are aware the Bombay Act of 1918 provides for a full five years' course and the U. P. Bill sent to the select committee makes a similar provision. I think the other parts of India will not be content with less than five years. I would, therefore, very strongly urge that we should not in the good name of the Punjab lag behind other Provinces in this particular. I am not unmindful, Your Honour, of the 'note on school courses' to which I have already referred and other considerations in favour of four years' course and I fully realise that platitudes, pious wishes or even urgent necessities have to yield to the stern and paramount consideration

of Rupees, Annas and Pies. But, Your Honour, I cannot resist saying that to my mind this subject is of towering importance and I can deem no sacrifice which the people and the Government can make too great for enlarging the period of compulsory popular education.

"This is the basic foundation of all our future progress and we ought to lay it as deep as possible.

"Every blessed rupee that can be saved from other heads and devoted to the head of education will be at once well saved and well spent. I for one would not grudge if the over-taxed people were still more taxed for education sake.

"We will fain be without luxuries of large buildings and elegant furniture (which are all undoubtedly necessary), we will gladly have open air schools under kutcha masonry nay even under the traditional Pipal tree, but we should not have the 4th Primary Standard as the practical culmination of an average Punjabi student's career.

"Your Honour will be laying the Punjab under a deep debt of gratitude if Your Honour would go so far as even to strain the resources of the Government (which I think will not be necessary to do) to give effect to the five years' rule of compulsory education instead of the practically four and theoretically five years' contemplated by the section with the proviso. As the amendment moved serves to attain the object in view, I support it wholeheartedly."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Ikramullah Khan :—"Your Honour,—I rise to support the amendment that in the provision of exemption under section 10, clause (*i*), the word 'fifth' be substituted in place of the word 'fourth.' This will only exempt the boys who have completed the course prescribed for the 5th Primary Standard or a course recognized by the Local Government as equivalent to that standard. I feel it my duty to impress and to advocate with all the force at my command the necessity of maintaining the present course of primary education for five years. It must in no case be less than five years and the necessity stands in need of no demonstration. The contemplated four years' period of preliminary compulsory education is nowhere known in the present educational life of nations. It is nowhere less than seven years and in England, I am told, the period of compulsory training is of not less than nine years. In the Punjab the primary course has hitherto been for five years and to lower it to four years would mean a very serious reduction. If it were argued that the present ground of five years would be covered in four, it would mean an additional strain on the already much taxed brains of tender children to the detriment of their general health and would not be a worthy thing to aim at. On the other hand I am strongly of opinion that if you wish to get some tangible result out of compulsory education then raise the course of primary standard to six years ; but in no case would it appear wise to accept for exemption from school a boy who has not completed the course prescribed for the 5th Primary Standard.

"The Select Committee has found it necessary to make some provision for exemption for efficiency, but I do not see any efficiency in a boy educated up to the 4th Primary Standard. As soon as he would be out of touch with student life he would naturally relapse into ignorance and stupidity and would not be able in his after-life to read or write anything beyond his own name. Again, it is said that the age of voluntary admission to a school being 5 in the Punjab a boy admitted in that age cannot reasonably be detained in school till he is 11 years old ; but he will not be detained after he has completed his course up to 5th Primary Standard. Then, it is argued that in a very large number of rural schools it will be impossible to provide education

[*Khan Sahib Mirza Ikramullah Khan; Mr. Richey; Diwan Daulat Rai.*]

above the fourth standard. But why it will be impossible is not said. Is the present primary course in the existing rural schools for four years or five years? If for five years, where is the impossibility for the extension of the same provision of education especially when it is to be free.

"Moreover, the proposed system will go directly against the decision of the educational conference, which was held at Simla in August 1917. It was resolved there by the most prominent educationists of India that the study of English should begin in the 4th year of the academic career of a student and not later than that (*vide* Resolution No. 4). It will be of special benefit to the rural population to learn some English in the 4th and 5th Primary Classes. The technical words will be very useful to them in their after-life. I am of opinion that the object of this Bill to impart knowledge as wide as possible will be frustrated if the primary standard is lowered to a course of four years. The first Punjab Educational Conference held at Lahore in December last has also voiced the feelings of the whole educated Punjab in passing the resolution that the period of compulsory primary course of instruction in the Province should in no case be less than five years and I therefore appeal to this Council to accept the amendment."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"Sir, I am afraid I cannot accept this amendment. Before dealing with the arguments I should like to correct a number of facts and figures which have been given this morning. The Hon'ble mover of the amendment has said that there is no other country where there is exemption before the completion of the full compulsory period. On the contrary to speak of England alone, exemption was up to quite recently allowed after the 5th Standard. I am not quite sure what the standard now is. I am not referring to 1870 but to the present century.

"Again the Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram said that there were 600 schools teaching only up to the 3rd Primary Class. There are actually nearly 1,600 such schools.

"Messrs. Daulat Rai and Jawahir Lal Bhargava have stated that only unintelligent and inefficient boys would not be promoted every year. It is a great exception for a boy to pass the 1st Primary Standard in one year and it is the exception not the rule for a boy to complete four standards in four years. This is partly due to the fact that boys join the 1st Class at all periods of the school year."

The Hon'ble Diwan Daulat Rai :—"May I know whether figures support that statement?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey : —"I could get the figures if you wished from the District Inspector of Schools. I have not got them now with me.

"The boys do take more than one year to get out of the 1st Primary Class.

"Then I oppose this amendment on general grounds. When this Bill was circulated not a single municipality or district board proposed the extension of the period. Now it is to local bodies that we look to carry out this Act. We must not put on them more responsibility than they are willing to undertake. Not even one of the local bodies expressed an opinion in favour of a longer period. You must remember that if at present only 40 per cent. or 50 per cent. of your boys are in school that means that the rest of the 50 per cent. or 60 per cent. of the parents are going to be irritated by the measure of compulsion. Let us start with something that is reasonable—that the local bodies will undertake. It is true that the parents who will be irritated will be humble and illiterate people, but that is no reason why their interests should not be considered. On the contrary the more enlightened people should

consider the interests of the people who are directly to be affected by the Bill. As I said in the beginning there have been no less than 10 Bills in England since 1870 and I understand that there will be further Bills in this Council extending the period as education grows, but we must begin with the minimum consistent with efficiency. I took it for granted that the Hon'ble Members meant that a five years' course was not sufficient. A boy passing the 4th Primary Class can of course read and write, he has also a knowledge of the geography of the Punjab, arithmetic and the vernacular. To quote a quite recent circular from the Government of India :—

" 'It has hitherto been ordinarily assumed that if a child has received education for four years and has gained promotion annually from one class to the next, he may be considered to be literate; and although the truth of this assumption has been impugned in certain quarters, the Government of India see no reason why, for practical purposes, it should not be accepted as a fair working hypothesis.'

" Well, that is possibly not true in all countries, but it is true of the Punjab. A boy passing the 4th Standard is literate. But you say that the boys drop into illiteracy. True, knowledge is only retained by use. If I may take my own personal case there was a time not very long go when I was able to read and write Dutch with some fluency. I am now illiterate in Dutch. To take the case of classical languages. We were probably all taught classical languages in our youth and I myself studied Greek. But I should be extremely sorry to have to write a few consecutive original sentences in that language now and I dare say Hon'ble Members would find an equal difficulty in Arabic and Sanskrit. Literacy is a matter of use. It is unfortunately only too true of the rural boy that he often becomes illiterate and that is owing to the fact that he has little opportunity of making use of his knowledge. It is not the fault of our education. We cannot do more than turn out men from primary schools capable of reading and writing vernaculars. We lose our knowledge of the classics by disuse, so also do these boys who do not use their knowledge of reading and writing lose their literacy.

" Now I will turn to the general question. It has been so very clearly put by one or two members and amongst others by Chaudhri Lal Chand—the question of a four years' course. Diwan Daulat Rai and Pandit Jawahir Lal Bhargava have asked why it is impossible to provide a five years' course. We shall have to begin by raising some 1,500 schools from three year to four year schools. It is indeed a part of the five year programme for rural areas that lower primary schools and elementary schools shall be raised up to the status of the 4th Primary Standard, but it can only be done gradually as teachers can be supplied.

" The introduction of compulsion is only a climax of a period of expansion. You cannot force children to attend schools unless the schools are there. Therefore the first step that you have to take is that of providing schools. Before we start to expand the schools it is absolutely essential that we see that we expand efficient schools. Two years ago in this Council a motion was made by an Hon'ble Member, who is unfortunately absent to-day, calling attention to the inefficiency of our vernacular schools. On behalf of Government I was obliged to admit that his charge was correct. Shortly afterwards a committee on district finance met. It decided that one of the chief defects of our primary schools was that one teacher had to take more than four classes. There were several Indian Members on it—the Hon'ble Syed Mehdi Shah and the Hon'ble mover of this amendment himself besides Lala Sundar Das Suri. They all agreed and we passed a resolution that no teacher shall be allowed to teach more than four classes. The Government has accepted that resolution. It remains to be seen, however, how that resolution can be put into effect.

Now, the majority of the schools in the province at the present day, namely, 2,709 of the 5,084 schools, are single teacher schools. We are proposing ultimately to open some 4,000 more schools according to the programmes submitted. When they are complete, of these 4,000 schools it is quite safe to say that 2,500 will be single teacher schools. We have already provided all the large centres with schools. We are now providing schools for small centres. The problem is how to make efficient schools. To provide inefficient schools and compel boys to go to inefficient schools for five years would be a crime. Moreover the mere opening of schools which we knew would be bad schools, would be wrong. We must not throw away Government money. To quote the Government of India's last Review on Education. 'It is impossible to rest content with an expansion of mass education on present lines or with a system under which a large proportion of the pupils are infants stagnating in a crèche, the remainder glean only an acquaintance with the 3 R's. and only a small residue continue to the stages where some of the fruits of the initial labour can be reaped.' It would be a sheer waste of money to open 4,000 schools of this kind. How are we going to improve the defects of these schools which were described in my last quinquennial report? There appear to be three ways. The first one is by supplying assistant teachers in all single teacher schools, thereby converting them into two teacher schools. That is of course the ideal way. When we get education improved we shall be able to provide a second teacher in all existing schools, but to do so now would of course mean the postponement of all expansion. It would be impossible for us to provide assistant teachers for all the schools and to fill up our annual vacancies without giving up expansion. This is not a step which I think would commend itself to this Council. It is certainly not acceptable to Government. The second alternative to improve these primary schools is to adopt the lower primary school or three-class school as a unit. It is a system actually adopted in other provinces. For example in Bihar and Orissa there are 21,000 lower primary schools to 1,800 upper primary. It is not a step which would commend itself to Hon'ble Members here. It would mean the reduction of a very large number of schools and I am sure it would be unpopular. Mind you, what we are asked to do is to fulfil the recommendations of the district board committee that one teacher shall not teach more than four classes without trying to provide an assistant for every single teacher school. How can we carry out the Hon'ble gentleman's proposal that we should at the same time provide teachers for five classes? Some figures may be interesting in this connection. There are less than 18,000 boys in 5th Primary Classes in rural schools. Of these over 6,000 go on to secondary schools. All these 6,000 boys will of course be the gainers if the new system comes in. Of the remainder 12,000 at least 6,000 will be attending schools which will be either vernacular middle or lower middle schools because we propose to open ultimately 300 full middle schools. These also are gainers. There are 2¼ lakhs of boys attending vernacular primary schools. Are the interests of the tens of thousands in the lower primary classes to be sacrificed for the sake of the remaining 6,000 boys? I do not wish to elaborate the argument because it is not really affected by the arguments which have been brought by the Hon'ble mover and by several others on this question of a four years' course. The amendment as it stands really, as I have pointed out here, is impracticable because it pre-supposes that the boys will have to stay on for five years in a school which contains only four classes. I understand that in certain parts of Germany they had a six years' compulsory course in schools where there are only four classes. I do not think that is an example to imitate. It seems to me to be meaningless to state that there should be compulsion to the 5th Standard when there are only four standards in a school. For that reason I object to the passing of the amendment."

[*Mr. Richey.*]

The amendment that in sub-clause (1) of clause 10 the word "fifth" should be substituted for "fourth" was put to the Council and lost.

The Council divided as follows:—

For the amendment—

The Hon'ble Diwan Daulat Rai.
The Hon'ble Mirza Ikramulla Khan.
The Hon'ble Pandit Sheo Narain.
The Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram.
The Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal.
The Hon'ble Pandit Jawahir Lal.

Against the amendment—

The Hon'ble Mr. L. French.
The Hon'ble Mr J. A. Richey.
The Hon'ble Captain Gopal Singh.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusuf Shah.
The Hon'ble Mr. H. J. Maynard.
The Hon'ble Mr. O. F. Lumsden.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand.
The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh.
The Hon'ble Nawab Sir Behram Khan.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayed Mehdi Shah.
The Hon'ble Mr. F. W. Woods.
The Hon'ble Sayed Makhdum Rajan Shah.
The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt.
The Hon'ble Mr. T. P. Ellis.
The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend.
The Hon'ble Mr. C. J. Hallifax.
The Hon'ble Mr. H. D. Craik.
The Hon'ble Malik Muhammad Amin Khan.

The motion that clause 10 as framed by the Select Committee be passed was put to the Council and carried.

His Honour the President left the chair and the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard took the chair.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"Sir, I beg to move that clause 11 be now taken into consideration."

The motion that clause 11 as framed by the Select Committee be passed was put and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"I move that clause 12 be now taken into consideration. I might perhaps state here that I would much prefer the original words 'Education Department' to 'Director of Public Instruction'

introduced by the Select Committee. The Select Committee was of opinion that the discretion should not be left to subordinate officers. I do not think this matter is of any importance."

The motion that clause 12 as framed by the Select Committee be passed was put and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"I beg to move that clause 13 be now taken into consideration."

The Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"The fourth amendment which I have to move is in connection with clause 13 (1) which leaves it optional with the local authority to make compulsory education free. If it is intended to make Primary education for the children up to a certain age or up to a certain standard compulsory, it is absolutely necessary that it should also be free. It is one thing to tell the people that any one desiring to have education must pay for such education, but it is a different thing to force the people for education up to a certain standard under the penalty of criminal prosecution and require them to pay for such compulsion. It being inequitable to demand fees for compulsory education, I think that no other civilized country where compulsory education has been introduced charges any fee for such education.

"In the notice for amendment I suggested simply to substitute 'shall' for 'may,' but this renders the following word 'determine' quite meaningless. Therefore, I move that in clause 13 (1) the word 'shall' be substituted for the word 'may determine to.'

"The Local body that choses to introduce compulsory attendance at its recognized schools for the minimum standard of education must be held responsible for all the expenditure of such education from its funds augmented by additional taxation and by contribution from Provincial and Imperial Revenues without demanding fees as has been provided in the Bombay Act I of 1918 and the United Provinces Compulsory Education Bill which make Primary education not only compulsory but also free in the areas to which Part II of the Act is extended."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai :—

"Sir, I rise to second the amendment moved by my friend, the Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal. This will in effect make Primary education not only compulsory but also free.

"Sir, it is a fact too well known to all that in all civilised countries the primary education of children is both free and compulsory and the State looks upon the education of the young as one of its paramount duties. It recognises the fact that the young of to-day will be the responsible citizens of to-morrow and looks upon them as a national asset. In England before the war education was absolutely free between the ages of 2 and 14. Under Mr. Fisher's Bill it has been extended to 18 years and this notwithstanding the infinitely better financial position of the population there. If people in England with an average yearly income of over £40 are getting free education for a period of 16 years, is it unreasonable to demand that the Indian with an average yearly income of not more than Rs. 40 should be taught at the expense of the State for but five years? Is it too much to ask that when in England and Wales one rupee is being spent on educational expenditure to every half anna in India, that a larger proportion of the public money should be devoted to the uplifting of the intellectual condition of the masses?

"Sir, it is pleasing to see that in Bombay this principle has been definitely recognised and that in the United Provinces a Bill on the same lines is on the anvil. This is an example the force of which we cannot fail to appreciate.

[*Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai; Rai Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahir Lal Bhargava; Khan Sahib Mirza Ikramullah Khan.*]

"Sir, I have always regarded education as a national investment. Society is more interested in educating the individual than the individual himself, for it is in the education of the individual alone that the State has its best guarantee of progress.

"But the claim for education does not rest on this narrow view alone. There is a universal tendency to democratize all institutions. The masses while they remain ignorant have to fight a very unequal battle with the employers of labour. I venture to believe that with a universal system of education, even to the limited extent proposed by the Act, some safeguard for the masses shall be provided, the distinction of wealth will become more even and the division of classes less sharp. Lord Haldane said recently that it was only by securing an advance in democratic education that the position in the future could be made secure. The true meaning of democracy is to provide the fullest opportunities for development to all and we would be failing in our trust to posterity if we did not undertake all reasonable sacrifices in approximating to that end, and in the words used by Mr. Fisher in the House of Commons the other day 'allowed our vision to be blurred by a catalogue of passing inconveniences.'

"Sir, I take it that free education is the logical outcome of compulsion and indeed it has been so recognised in most countries. Our industrial and economic competition will be with nations where a high standard of literacy and, therefore, of intellectual development prevails. It has been clearly demonstrated that technical education absolutely apart, the literate workman is more efficient than his ignorant brother. International competition will now be keener than ever, and unless we are prepared to take timely note of these conditions I am afraid we shall have only ourselves to blame. It was for these reasons that I put forward the proposal before the Select Committee that Elementary Education be made free on the lines of the Bombay Act but I did not succeed there. I, however, hope that a better fate awaits this amendment. I may add, Sir, that we are not making education free all at once in the province. It will be by gradual steps that the desired goal will be reached in any part of the province where the demand is insistent and conditions favourable, there alone will the voluntary system be replaced by one of free and compulsory education. With these remarks I support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand:—"I support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Pandit Jawahir Lal Bhargava:—"I also support the amendment."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Ikramullah Khan.—"Your Honour,—I now support the amendment that in clause 13 (*i*) the word 'shall' be substituted in place of the word 'may.' The reasons for it are obvious. No education can be compulsory unless it is made free. The two conditions must go hand in hand. One without the other will lead to an automatical downfall of the whole system of Primary education. The compulsion with payment of charges would be an anomaly. I have no objection for those who would like to pay for their children's education, but why should the poor be made to pay while compelled to send their children to school. The imposition of fees would be felt as a hardship by a very large section of the people. The required funds must be found somehow or other as is done for so many other less important purposes. The object of the Bill is to make literacy as wide as possible, and it cannot serve the purpose unless the elementary instruction is imparted free of charge.

"Primary education in the Punjab should therefore be both compulsory and free as has been provided in Bombay under Act I of 1918. It is compulsory and free in all the progressive countries of the world and if we

wish to make any progress in this respect we should make the compulsic acceptable by the large masses of poor and ignorant parents by offering useful education to their children free and without any charges whatever as it is the only method to make education popular.

"With these words I beg to move the amendment for the acceptance of the Council."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"Sir, I am inclined to favour the principle underlying the Hon'ble gentleman's amendment. The only objection to it that I have is the question whether it will not deter local bodies from enforcing Part II of this Act. A local body will think twice if it has not only got to charge no fees but also to compensate the aided schools for any fees that they charge from their children."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai:—"So far as I am concerned I do not mind if that clause is taken off."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"If that is done I would oppose it on general grounds. I think India claims to have as strong a feeling for religious education as England. There is in England a great number of secular or board schools and of denominational or national schools and the Government has to be very careful that no concessions are extended at the expense of national schools. If the local authority is to make education free in its own schools and does nothing to help the denominational schools, it will obviously mean that the denominational schools or at least some of them will have to follow suit in their primary department. I only have the figures of Multán with me. I think they worked out that there would be a loss of about Rs. 1,800 in fees, of which Rs. 460 would be by Government, Rs. 716 by the municipality and Rs. 611 in the other schools. But they proposed to compensate the other schools for loss of fees. These figures were worked out by the Multán Municipality. If the Hon'ble mover means that education is to be made free only in municipal schools strictly speaking maintained by municipalities and that they are not liable in any way to pay for the cost of children reading in denominational schools, then I would oppose it. On the other hand if he only means that they should charge no fees in recognised schools and if the Hon'ble Members are convinced that it will not deter local bodies then I have no objection to accepting the amendment."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"It is rather important that this Council should realize that the local body does not control the fees of the schools which are located within its area, also that there is a number of aided schools which do at present charge fees and those Schools are very often denominational. We have to consider the possible effects of the measure of the remission of fees in municipal schools on those denominational schools. I am not sure from what I have heard whether the Hon'ble Members realize what the true position is. It is not a matter quite open to the local body to say to the managers of schools which are not under their control that they shall not charge fees. On the other hand if the local body remitted fees in its own schools it will virtually compel the other schools to do so also as there will be a risk of their losing their students. It is important that this question should be realized. I am not certain whether it has been realized."

The amendment in clause 13 (1) that the word "shall" be substituted for the words "may determine to" was accepted by the Hon'ble mover and passed by the Council.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"The second clause of this section runs as follows:—

> "'The local authority so determining in respect of all schools maintained by it shall also pay from its own funds the whole or part

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Mr. Richey; Mr. Ellis; Mr. Maynard; Mr. French; Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand.*]

of any fees, up to the maximum scale of fees provided by the Punjab Education Code, payable for primary education in respect of any boy or boys attending any school within its local area not maintained wholly out of provincial or local funds.'

"I would propose that instead of the words 'so determining' we may substitute the words 'shall determine.'"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"I think you will have to say 'if not paid by the parents,' or otherwise it will mean that it will make it necessary for the local authority to pay fees for all boys attending schools besides their own schools. However by adding the words suggested by me it will not make it necessary to do so in every case, for instance, in the case of Aitchison College."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"It is in the case of primary schools within the local area."

The Hon'ble Mr. Ellis:—"I would suggest that the words 'if required' be added after the words 'the local authority.'"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"Required by whom? I think we ought to limit the authority."

The Hon'ble Mr. Ellis:—By the authorities of the school.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"Supposing we say that the Lahore Municipality decided to remit fees in all schools. Now in respect of boys of the Aitchison College the question would arise that the Aitchison College fees may be remitted, but that College will not probably claim them. The object is to point out that the Hon'ble member would not propose in that case to remit the fees as regards the boys of the Aitchison College."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"They will not claim. If they do claim, then, there is a provision 'wholly or partly' in the section. It is not necessary that the whole fee should be remitted, but the local authority may settle with the institution. That question has to be settled by the local body with the managers of those schools. This is a matter which must be left for settlement between the managers of the local schools and the local authorities."

The Hon'ble Mr. French:—"May I suggest that some member of a rural area should inform us whether this proposed amendment is likely to *deter* a local body from applying the Act or not?"

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh:—"It has already been pointed out by the Hon'ble Chaudhri Lal Chand."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand:—"To some extent the chances of the local body will be diminished."

The Hon'ble Mr. French:—"Would it be wise to introduce the amendment?"

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand:—"I am supporting the amendment on other grounds."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"The Hon'ble mover has the right to reply to the objections."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"I respectfully submit that no difficulty will arise as regards the particular cases of denominational schools which are managed by either societies or private managers because, if they find any difficulty they will ask the local body to pay for such boy

or boys as are not capable of paying any fee to that school and that will remove the difficulty. Of course this will put an additional burden on the local body to pay fees for the boys who are not receiving any tuition in their own schools but in the schools of private bodies. But I do not think it will be a very large expenditure. Most of the students who attend those denominational schools will either go to a free school provided by a local body or stick to the denominational school and pay the fees; if there is any student who wants to stick to the latter school, in that particular case the private body will require the local body, municipality or district board, to pay for that particular boy. No doubt this may have the effect of closing some denominational schools, but there will be no difficulty of payment for such boys as like to continue in the denominational schools. Supposing there is a large number of boys in a D.A.-V. School, where they pay some fee and there is a school in the locality where no fee is charged. No doubt it may have the effect of a large number of boys getting discharge certificates and going to the district board schools where no fee is charged. Those who wish to have the education given by the D. A.-V. School will continue there and if there is any particular boy or class of boys whom the managers of the D. A.-V. School represent that they do not like to go to district board or municipal schools and that they cannot pay the fees, in that particular case there will be no difficulty in ascertaining the amount to be paid by the municipality or by the district board as the case may be. This amount, I do not think, will be very large and can be settled amicably between the district board or municipality and the managers of the schools. Clause (2) will only have to be slightly changed to make the local body—municipality or district board—responsible not only for expenditure on their own schools but also for the fees of such boys."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"The Hon'ble mover of the amendment will probably accept this form drafted by the Secretary:—

"'The local authority of any area to which this part is applied shall charge no fees in any recognized school for primary education maintained by itself, and if required by the authorities of any school within its local area not maintained wholly out of provincial or local funds shall pay from its own funds the whole or part of any fees, up to the maximum scale of fees provided by the Punjab Education Code, payable for primary education in respect of any boy or boys attending such school.'"

The Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal accepted the form. The amendment was put to the Council and carried unanimously.

The motion that clause 13 as amended by the Council be passed was put to Council and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"There are no amendments to the further clauses 14 to 20 and there is nothing controversial in them. With your permission, Sir, the remaining clauses from 14 to 20 may be passed as they are."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"Does any Hon'ble Member wish to move any amendment to these clauses?"

The Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"I second the proposal that the remaining clauses 14 to 20 as amended by the Select Committee be passed."

The motion that sections 14 to 20 as amended by the Select Committee be passed was put and carried.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahir Lal Bhargava:—"The question remains as to the numbering of the clauses."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"That is of course a consequential change."

[*Mr. Richey ; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"Sir, I beg to move that the Punjab Primary Education Bill as amended by this Council be passed. Education Bills in every country are controversial measures and this Bill is no exception to the rule. In other countries the dividing line mostly lies between religious and secular issues, but in this country it would seem to lie between town and country. I cannot help feeling that this Council has come to a wise decision that there shall be no distinction in the matter of education between urban and rural areas. It will of course be impossible to introduce compulsion evenly throughout the Province. We cannot compel boys to go to school until the schools have been provided for them. In this matter no doubt the municipalities will take the lead. At the same time the Government is doing its best to help the rural area to catch up in the matter of educational facilities, and this point I should like to make clear. There is a general misapprehension which I have heard voiced to-day and expressed elsewhere that the introduction of compulsion is an expensive measure. There is very little expense connected with compulsion itself. The expense is all entailed by the provision of schools. So far as the rural areas are concerned, we are now embarking on a definite programme of providing schools for the children of the agricultural population. When those schools have been provided the introduction of compulsion will cost little more than entertaining a certain number of clerks and a few officials and if these officials are energetic a certain part of the expense may be borne by the fines. As regards municipalities, I am sorry to say that hitherto very few municipalities have realized their responsibility in the matter of primary education. It is only now in connection with this Bill that any municipality has undertaken a detailed survey of the conditions of primary education in its local area. I think Hon'ble Members hardly realise how much leeway has to be made up. The Multán scheme, which is the only scheme I have seen, proposes during the next three years to open primary schools and the introduction of compulsion is not anticipated before 1921-22 and all that they propose to do is to open primary schools. If that is the case of Multán, the case of others will be still worse, and I hope the first effect of this Bill will be that all municipalities will look well to the state of education within their areas and see how many schools will be needed. It may be that they will find that compulsion is impossible for some time to come. I hope not. I hope there are certain towns in which education is sufficiently diffused to make some measure of compulsion practicable and I appeal to the gentlemen here to urge those bodies, both district boards and municipalties, to take this matter in hand in their areas. The difficulties in the way of this Bill being put in force are not lack of money, not lack of Government support (and I do not think any of you really fear that), they are indifference on the part of local boards and fear and lack of courage. It has been feared that local bodies might adopt the scheme too readily. I wish I were so optimistic. I hope that all the members of the district boards and municipalities present will do their best not to let this Bill remain as it is, merely an Act in the statute book but will give it vitality and force."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand :—"Sir,—the present Bill is a great boon to the Province and I take this opportunity of thanking the Government for the conferment of the same on the people. That the Bill has reached its final stage to be passed into law, just after the close of the great war, in which Punjab claims a very proud share, adds to the value of this boon. I think we can safely regard this gift as a fitting recognition of our services. The Bill was greatly improved by the Select Committee and our thanks are due to them. The Hon'ble Mr. Richey deserves to be congratulated for his timely and wise action in devising a course of studies in which boys attending village schools may be saved the trouble and expense of attending a special course in English after passing their Primary test, before joining the

Anglo-Vernacular Middle class. I presume that all the Hon'ble Members have read his masterly note on school courses in the Punjab. In that he has described in detail how the scheme will work. I take this opportunity of sincerely thanking him on behalf of the rural classes for removing the inequality of treatment and support the motion that the Bill be now passed into law."

The Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"I also support the proposal that the Bill be passed into law as it has been amended by this Council."

The motion that the Bill as amended be passed was put and carried.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"Before the Council separates I should like to say on behalf of Government that the Council is to be congratulated on the achievement of to-day's work, more particularly Mr. Richey, who has shepherded the Bill through all its difficulties, is to be doubly congratulated on the successful issue to which he has brought it.

"We all have got to realise something which I think is very frequently overlooked, that education is a boon not only to the person who receives it, to his family and to those who may hope to benefit by his increased efficieney, but is an asset to the community of which he forms part. That is the true value of education and that is the true reason for extending it without regard to the individual and without regard to the benefit which is conferred thereby to the community. If local bodies rise to the height of the position to which they are entitled under this Act, if they do all we hope that they will do, then we may expect to see a considerable advance in primary education within the next few years. But I must conclude with this warning note because it is something which all of us have to bear in mind, particularly those who in one manner or another have the means of influencing the action of local bodies whether this Act remains a dead letter or whether it becomes that beneficial agent which we all hope it will become, is a matter which rests entirely with the local bodies and with the people who elect them."

ADJOURNMENT.

The Council was adjourned till the 7th of March 1919, 10-30 A.M.

LAHORE: T. P. ELLIS,

The 24th February 1919. *Secretary.*

60 LB - 200—20-3-19—SGPP Lahore.

PUNJAB GOVERNMENT.

LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

Abstract of Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1915.

THE Council met at the Government House, Lahore, at 10-30 A.M., on Friday, the 7th March 1919.

PRESENT:

His Honour Sir MICHAEL FRANCIS O'DWYER, G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.C.S., Lieutenant-Governor, *Presiding*.

The Hon'ble Mr. JOHN PERRONET THOMPSON, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. JAMES ALEXANDER RICHEY.

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar GOPAL SINGH.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja YUSAF SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. HERBERT JOHN MAYNARD, C.S.I., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. OSWALD FARQUHAR LUMSDEN, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri LAL CHAND, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar GANJAN SINGH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur RAM SARAN DAS, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit JAWAHAR LAL BHARGAVA.

The Hon'ble Mr. FRANK WAVERLING WOODS.

The Hon'ble Mr. FREDERICK CRIGHTON WALLER.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur BAKHSHI SOHAN LAL.

The Hon'ble Sayad MAKHDUM RAJAN SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. CREWE ARMOND HAMILTON TOWNSEND, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. CHARLES JOSEPH HALIFAX, O.B.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian FAZL-I-HUSSAIN.

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza MUHAMMAD IKRAM ULLAH KHAN.

The Hon'ble Mr. EDWIN WOODALL PARKER.

The Hon'ble Mr. LEWIS FRENCH, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN.

The Hon'ble Colonel ROBERT CHARLES MACWATT, C.I.E., M.B., F.R.C.S., I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. THOMAS PETER ELLIS, I.C.S.

OATH OF OFFICE.

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson and the Hon'ble Mr. Waller took the prescribed oath of allegiance to the Crown.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE.

Answer* to Question No. 52 asked by the Hon'ble Chaudhri Lal Chand at the Council Meeting of the 20th November 1918.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Rural primary schools, 5th classes.

1. "Will Government kindly state, for the information of this Council, whether during the course of the next financial year it is proposed to abolish the 5th classes of rural primary schools ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"A copy of Circular Memo. No. 76, dated the 18th February 1919, dealing with this subject is laid upon the table.† Rural schools with effect from April 1st next will consist of either four or six classes ; the ordinary small village school consisting of four classes, schools at large centres containing six."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Rural primary schools, 5th classes.

2. "If so, will Government kindly state whether opinions on this proposal have been obtained from local bodies, or whether recommendations of this nature have been made by such bodies ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The opinions of all local bodies on this change were invited in a letter No. 1382-S. of June 19th, 1918, issued by the Chief Secretary to the Punjab Government. Of the opinions received only four were unfavourable while over forty local bodies, including the larger Municipalities and District Boards such as those of Amritsar, Multan and Rawalpindi passed resolutions in favour of the change. These resolutions are unequivocally and in many cases strongly worded, *e.g.*, describing the new scheme as a vast improvement on the present system.

"In addition the opinions of associations and of individuals, both official and non-official, who were consulted on the Primary Education Bill were also invited on this scheme. In the case of associations the majority of opinions sent in was ten to two in favour of the changes, while of forty-four individual opinions received thirty-six welcome the scheme, five suggest its adoption with certain modifications, and only three would prefer the retention of the present system."

*See Appendix A.

†Not printed.

[*Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Mr. Richey ; Mr. Townsend ; Mr. French.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

3. "If no such opinions have been taken, or recommendations of this nature made, will Government consider the desirability of inviting opinions before deciding to abolish the 5th classes of rural primary schools ?" Rural primary schools, 5th classes.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"In view of the answer to question 2 the Hon'ble Member will see that the Local Government has not introduced the change without being assured that an overwhelming majority of the local bodies who administer primary education are in favour of the change."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

4. "Will Government kindly state, whether rules under the newly passed Primary Education Bill have been framed by the Local Government ? If so, will they kindly lay the draft of the rules on the table of this Council, before putting them in force ?" Rules under the Primary Education Bill.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"Rules under the newly passed Primary Education Act have not yet been framed by the Local Government. This need not deter any local body, which may resolve to take action under Part I of the Act, from submitting its proposals to Government where they will be sympathetically considered."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

5. "Will Government kindly state whether or not it is a fact that Government has been purchasing large stocks of wheat in some of the districts of the province ? If so, will Government kindly acquaint this Council with the objects with which such purchases are being made ? Will some of these stocks be available for sale at cheaper rates ?" Purchase of wheat by Government.

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"Government has made no purchases of wheat in this province other than those mentioned by me in the concluding paragraph of my reply to the first part of question No. 4 addressed to me by the Hon'ble Member at the last meeting of this Council. The total purchases made amount only to 16,600 tons approximately ; of which 14,800 tons were for military purposes and 1,800 tons for cheap grain shops.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

6. "Will Government kindly lay on the table of this Council a statement showing— Revision of clerical staff.

(*a*) the number and names of Government Departments in the province,

(*b*) the Departments where there has been a revision in the clerical staff,

(*c*) the aggregate amount of increase in the expenditure on clerical staff due to such revision,

(*d*) the reasons for not undertaking similar revisions in the pays of clerical staff in case of those departments, where there has been no revision ?

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"For the information required in (*a*) of the question I will refer the Hon'ble Member to the expenditure portion of the printed budget, a copy of which is laid on the table.

" (*b*) and (*c*). The Hon'ble Member does not mention any period with reference to which he requires statements of revisions. Government is daily confronted with questions regarding alterations in clerical establishment, which are too numerous to describe in detail. A statement* is laid on the table showing the most recent revisions of clerical staffs with their cost.

" (*d*) The form of the Hon'ble Member's question suggests a system under which the employer must go round explaining to his servants his reasons for not granting unsought increases in pay. Financial rules and common-sense alike debar this procedure in the case of Government departments which, in the public interest, are required to justify all proposals for increased pay. I am aware of no case in which a reasoned and reasonable request for revision has been absolutely refused.

" I may add for the Hon'ble Member's information that the sanction of the Secretary of State has just been received to the revision of the pay and prospects of clerical establishments of district offices in the Punjab at an estimated annual cost of over Rs. 1,63,000.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Comparison between the salaries of the clerks and labourers.

7. " Is it a fact that monthly salaries of clerks in the lowest grades are at present even less than the monthly incomes of ordinary day labourers ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

" The monthly income of ordinary day labourers is not only a varying but a precarious one, and cannot be compared with the security of a salary paid by Government and the leave and pensions rights, which ordinarily attach to Government service. It is quite possible that the monthly salaries of some clerks of the lowest grade may, in a given period, prove to be less than the average monthly income of some classes of ordinary labourers, but this fact, besides being not general, is not as anomalous as the Hon'ble Member seems to think. It may and does occur in any country in the world, and depends on the ratio between supply and demand, both of manual and clerical labour."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Discontent among the clerical staff.

8. " Is Government aware that this state of affairs is causing a great amount of discontent among the clerical staffs of different Government departments ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

" All employment rests on a contractual basis. Government offers and its employees accept definite terms, and while the lowest paid clerks accept appointments on the terms offered they have no reasonable cause of complaint. The discontent to which the Hon'ble Member alludes is due to exceptional and temporary circumstances, which Government has taken steps to meet by the grant of war and grain allowances and is not by any means confined to clerical establishments."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Raising of clerk initial pay.

9. " Will Government kindly state whether or not it proposes to raise generally the initial pay of clerks in proportion to their standard of living, which is much higher than that of labourers ? "

---

*See Appendix B.

[*Mr. French ; Rai Bahadur Ram Sarn Das ; His Honour the President ; Mr. Hallifax ; Colonel MacWatt.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

" Government does not propose to issue general orders raising the initial pay of clerks. Each case must be treated on its own merits. The cases of the clerical establishment in Secretariat and district offices have been taken up already, and as I have just mentioned the sanction of the Secretary of State has been received and in other offices the question is under consideration As a matter of fact where establishments have come under revision such initial pay has usually been raised. "

Supplementary question asked by the **Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das** :—

" I say, Sir, that no reference has been made to the standard of living. I wanted to know whether their pay was enough for their livelihood. That has not been answered."

The Hon'ble Mr. French :—"I wish to point out that the standard of living is an extremely vague term, and I do not know who is to decide the standard ".

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das :—" Well, Sir, I can give figures."

His Honour the President :—" Order, order. The Hon'ble member can ask another question next time."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Patwaris' memorial for increase of pay.

10. " Has Government received a memorial from Patwaris regarding an increase in their pay, and the grant of other privileges, such as pensionary rights, provision of residences at Government expense, etc.? If so will it kindly state what action it proposes to take in the matter ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Hallifax replied :—

" No such memorial has reached Government. The question of improving the pay and prospects of Patwaris has for some years been under consideration, but action was deferred owing to the War. Proposals to raise the pay of patwaris, and also to establish a provident fund scheme for their benefit, are now under the consideration of the Financial Commissioners and will shortly be submitted to Government. Proposals regarding the gradual provision of patwarkhanas at Government expense for all patwaris not provided with them already have lately been submitted by the Financial Commissioners and are now under the consideration of Government. "

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Admission of in-door patients in the King Edward Memorial Hospital.

11. " Will Government kindly lay on the table, for the information of this Council, a copy of the existing rules, or of the proposed new rules governing the admission of in-door patients to the private and family wards in the King Edward Memorial Hospital, Lahore, together with a copy of the scale of the ordinary and medical fees levied from this class ? "

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

" On account of the shortage of Surgeons, Physicians and Nurses on the staff due to the War and for want of sanction from the Secretary of State for the additional Establishment required, no Private and Indian Family Wards of the new Mayo Hospital have been taken into use, and no rules governing admission into these Wards have been drawn up.

" The scale* of fees approved by Government for the Private Wards and Indian Family Wards is laid on the table."

---

*See Appendix C.

[*Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan ; Mr. Lumsden ; Mr. French ; Mr. Maynard*].

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Octroi on coal.

12. " (*a*) Is Government aware that in spite of the Punjab Government Resolution No. 115, dated 13th February 1909, paragraph 5, octroi is still being charged on coal in certain municipalities in the Punjab ?

" (*b*) If the reply is in the negative, will Government be pleased, after enquiry, to name the municipalities, which are making such charge and state under what authority they are doing so ?

" (*c*) If the levy of octroi on coal is unauthorised, will Government be pleased to direct such municipalities to expunge the item of coal from their Schedules of articles on which octroi is chargeable ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

" There is some reason to believe that an octroi on coal is still levied at Simla. Specific enquiries will be made on the point.

" Government is not aware that the rules are being disregarded in any other case, but the attention of Commissioners will be called to the orders referred to by the Hon'ble Member so that any irregularity in this matter may be detected and remedied."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Proposal for the amendment of procedure for renewal of licenses for arms.

13. " (*a*) Is Government aware that in certain districts in the Punjab all the license-holders under the Arms Act are required to be present personally at head-quarters at the time of renewal of their licenses ; if so, will Government kindly name the districts where this practice is in force ?

" (*b*) The charge for renewal of the license of any arm being only eight annas, will Government be pleased to take into consideration the trouble and expense caused to license-holders in coming from remote distances and to issue orders for the inspection of such arms, if necessary, by the nearest Magistrate or Police station officer ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

" Government's information on the subject is incomplete and enquiry is being made from all Deputy Commissioners. An answer will be given to the Hon'ble Member's questions when the replies of the Deputy Commissioners have been considered. "

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Shortening of the Alexandra Bridge on the Chenab at Kathala.

14. " (*a*) Is it a fact that the Railway authorities have shortened the Chenab bridge at Kathala in the Gujrat District by 11 spans out of 28, and, if so, has this been done with the consent of the Punjab Government ?

" (*b*) If so, will Government be pleased to state if it has received assurance that by thus closing the width of the river the flood water will not be so dammed up that the crops on lands situated upstream will suffer damage from over-flooding ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

" (*a*) It is a fact that the North-Western Railway have in progress the work of reducing the number of spans of the Alexandra Bridge over the Chenab River, from 28 spans to 17 spans, and this proposal of the North-Western Railway has received the approval of the Punjab Government.

" (*b*) The calculations made by the Engineers of the North-Western Railway, on which the above proposal is based, show that the reduction in the number of spans will not produce any great afflux of the river and will not

tend to any further flooding of the lands bordering the river than is normally the case during floods.

"It is brought to notice that similar treatment of the Beas and Sutlej bridges has not resulted in any flooding of land, beyond what usually occurs."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

15. "(*a*) Is it a fact that the width of all foot bridges over the canals is about 4½ feet, and that of their entrances at abutments between the wing walls is even less ? Width of foot bridges over canals.

"(*b*) Is Government aware that the zamindars experience great difficulties in taking their ploughs across canals, and will it be pleased to consider the advisability of widening the bridges so as to allow a pair of bullocks under yoke to pass easily ?

"(*c*) In case Government does not at present see its way to alter the existing foot bridges, will it be pleased to order the widening of space between the wing walls in order to bring the width in conformity with that of the bridges ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"(*a*) It is a fact that foot bridges on canals are usually constructed so as to furnish a minimum width of about 4 feet for local traffic other than vehicular traffic.

"(*b*) The Government is not aware that any appreciable hardship is inflicted on zamindars in the matter of the conveyance of their ploughs over foot bridges across canals; and it is not prepared to widen the roadway over all such existing bridges for the purpose stated, as such an operation would be one involving great expense to the State, for an inadequate reason.

"(*c*) The Government does not see its way to alter the designs of existing foot bridges in the manner suggested, because structural considerations require that the width of way between the masonry wings of the bridges shall be less than the width between the iron railings of the bridges. If, however, the zamindars of any particular locality should bring to the notice of the engineers of the Canal Department serious inconvenience that may be felt in the case of any particular foot bridges, the latter will be prepared to consider what improvements may be practicable without involving too great an expenditure in comparison with the extent of benefit conferred thereby."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

16. "Has the complaint of the public of Amritsar with regard to the stoppage of platform tickets by the Railway been brought to the notice of Government; if so, will Government be pleased to state what action it has taken in the matter ?" Platforms tickets at Amritsar Railway Station.

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"Government has received complaints from certain members of the public of Amritsar in regard to platform admission tickets and has asked the Railway authorities to take the matter into consideration. It is understood that this has been done and that more satisfactory arrangements are being made for the admission of passengers to the Amritsar station platform."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

17. "Will Government be pleased to recommend to the Government of India that Provincial Darbaries, who belong to the Punjab Chiefs' families and aristocracy, and whose loyalty to Government is well known, may be exempted from the provisions of Arms Act ? Exemption of Provincial Darbaries, &c. from Arms Act provisions.

Exemption of Provincial Darbaries, &c., from Arms Act provisions.

18. (*a*) "Will Government be pleased to recommend to the Government of India that persons who are granted arms in recognition of their services during the great War should be allowed to keep such arms for life without license in their own districts ?

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to recommend to the Government of India that, after the death of a donee, swords of honour or other such arms may be allowed to be kept by the most suitable and fittest member of the deceased's family on the usual license ?

Ditto

19. "Will Government be pleased to recommend to the Government of India the deletion of paragraph No. 613, Army Regulations, Volume II, India, and the sanction of a rule that after the death of such military officers their swords should remain in the possession of their sons or other fit member of the family free of license fee ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. French replied :—

"With His Honour's permission I will answer questions 17—19. The amendment of the existing rules under the Arms Act is at present under the consideration of the Government of India to whom the Local Government has made certain recommendations, and until the orders of the Supreme Government have been received it is not considered desirable to make any further proposals on the subject."

AMENDED DRAFT FINANCIAL STATEMENT.

The Hon'ble Mr. O. F. Lumsden :—"Your Honour, I beg to present the amended draft Financial Statement* of this Government for the year 1919-20. Before passing to the consideration of the figures there are two small matters to which I should like to refer. In the first place, I feel that some explanation is necessary for my presence here to-day. At the budget discussion last year I sang what I intended to be a swan song, and members will not unnaturally desire to know why I have made this reappearance. I can only plead that my reappearance here is due to circumstances beyond my control, and that any feelings of disappointment which they may feel are fully shared by me. I had hoped that after the severe strain of the past three budgets I should have been permitted to occupy some less arduous, if less honourable, post, but it was considered desirable for the sake of my successor that I should complete this budget rather than leave him to take over the work during the rush which necessarily accompanies the preparation of the budget. The second matter to which I wish to refer is the change in the procedure. According to the old rules the amended draft Financial Statement was presented about a week before the 15th of March. On the 15th of March the revised Financial Statement was presented along with the Financial Memo. Immediately thereafter it was open to members to move any resolution they pleased in connection with the Statement. Then a month or two later there was a budget discussion of a general character. This procedure had two obvious objections. In the first place, members were expected to move their resolutions before they had had any time to study the Memo. It is true that last year we did provide the Memo. before the 15th of March meeting, but we did so by committing a breach of the rules and even that breach of the rules did nothing to remove the second objection. The new procedure will I think do away with both the objections. The Financial Memo. is now in the hands of members. They will be able to hear what the Financial Secretary has to say and what the various members in charge of the important heads have to say and they will then have practically a week to consider the matter. They will then be able to move any resolution they consider advisable, and will be able to hold their discussion while the facts are still fresh in their minds.

"There is, however, one word of caution which I would venture to offer. Although the month of March is one which is traditionally associated with

*Appendix D.

hares, the new rules make it necessary that during this month a strict close season should be observed and my Hon'ble colleague, who occupies a post of vantage and who may in some respects be regarded as the policeman of this Council, has been instructed to keep a sharp look out and immediately to arrest any member who, unable to curb his sporting proclivities, seeks to disturb the innocent animals. In other words, the motto of the meeting of the 13th must be finance and nothing but finance. I understand, however, that this year the close season will not extend beyond this month, and that in April facilities will be afforded for a discussion on more familiar lines.

"Turning now to more serious matters I cannot do better than introduce my remarks by quoting a well-known Scotch M. P. who when addressing his first political meeting began: 'Gentlemen, I shall be brief but tedious.' I am afraid the latter adjective is inseparable from any consideration of financial matters. It is true, or at least it is reported, that Modjeska the great Polish actress once moved her audience to tears by declaiming the Polish alphabet, but there are few Modjeskas in this world, and it is doubtful whether if she had tried figures instead of the alphabet she would have succeeded in rousing any feelings of emotion beyond those of boredom. I am not sure, however, that I cannot myself claim to have performed some miracle of that kind. Hon'ble Members will recollect that last year in meeting some criticisms as to the length of my address I pointed out that after speaking for more than one hour I was taken to task by one of the local papers on the ground that the Financial Secretary in this Council merely got up, introduced his heads and sat down. I think in these circumstances I might perhaps fairly claim that the absorbing interest of my remarks had caused the time to pass extremely quickly. Possibly, however, the incident is less a tribute to my powers than a proof of the reporters' capacity for slumber. In any case to-day I shall not only follow my past practice of extreme moderation, but I shall improve upon it and this for two reasons. The first is that an extremely good example has been set by the Hon'ble Member in the Imperial Council. In the second place there is no reason, now that members have full opportunity of studying the Memo. at leisure, why I should go into minute details at this stage. Any member who wishes to go into such details will have no difficulty in obtaining the information he wants from a study of the Memo. supplemented by the remarks from the various members in charge who are about to introduce their heads, and those who do not wish to make themselves acquainted with these details will certainly not wish to hear them from me.

"It is expected that the year's working will result in a balance of 32¼ lakhs. At first sight this may seem to be a very satisfactory result, and I have in my Memo. described it as satisfactory. But in order to ascertain the real facts of the situation some further analysis is necessary. I have been repeatedly taken to task in this Council for under-estimating revenue and over-estimating expenditure. I have as consistently replied that so long as the Province continues to be mainly dependent upon climatic conditions it is impossible to prepare a budget without exercising due caution. I have also explained that the Financial Secretary is not responsible for the failure of other departments to fulfil their programme of expenditure. Well, the present year, despite the existence of this balance 32¼ lakhs, fully justifies the position I have taken up. This I think will be clear from the following analysis of the balance. Of the 32¼ lakhs 4¾ lakhs have nothing to do with this year's working at all. They are due to an improvement in the final accounts of the previous year as explained in paragraph 2 of my Memo. Of this sum 6½ lakhs is the result of transfers from the Government of India—grants which we could not use this year and which have gone straight into the balance. Another 12¼ lakhs is due simply to the fact that according to the orders of the Government of

India we had to curtail materially the programme which had been prepared for the Public Works Department in the Buildings and Roads Branch. If members will refer to the last head on page 3 of the statement they will see that out of the estimated expenditure of Rs. 67,29,000 only 55 lakhs is now expected to be spent. The reduction is not the result of any failure on the part of the department to fulfil their promises; it is a deliberate revision of the whole programme in accordance with the orders of the Government of India. There is also another item of 2½ lakhs under the head 3—Land Revenue not due to any savings but to the fact that sanction of the Secretary of State to the long deferred project of a new district of Sheikhupura and for the re-organization of the district offices have not been received in time to make any use of the provision for this year. If these deductions are made, that is to say, deductions for sums which do not belong to this year's working or do not belong to provincial revenues and the amount by which we have had to curtail expenditure, the total balance that remains is only 6½ lakhs, and that 6½ lakhs is represented by the extraordinary rise under the head Excise. In other words, had the Excise head only fulfilled expectations—and we allowed for a very considerable increase under that head—there would have been no balance at all in this year's working. Another way in which this balance may be analysed is to consider the amount of capital which is included in it. Making deductions of 4¾ lakhs for past actuals and 6½ lakhs for grants from the Government of India which could be used there remains practically an equivalent of the amount of capital which is included in our receipts, namely, 21½ lakhs. That means to say that, apart from capital, our revenue and reduced expenditure would have simply balanced each other. But the position is not even as good as that, because one cannot overlook the fact that the Excise head, which has really saved the situation, has behaved in an altogether extraordinary way. As a rule Excise follows very closely the land revenue head, that is to say, if the land revenue comes in freely it means that crops are good, that there are few suspensions, and that people have money to spend on luxuries. In this particular case the suspensions for the past kharif amount to no less than 16 lakhs. Notwithstanding this the excise head is 9½ lakhs above the actuals of last year. The only way to account for this is the fact that very large sums of money have been coming into the Province from abroad. Any of the members, who have read the Memo. presented in the Imperial Council, will have noticed how the silver has been absorbed, and there is no doubt that this Province is one of the chief, if not the chief, offender in that respect. Then, strangely enough, although prices for wheat have been very high throughout the year, the rabi harvest was quite good. As a rule when prices rule high it means that there is a scarcity or a shortage of that particular grain, but the high price of wheat has this year corresponded with a bountiful harvest, and the zamindar, the producer, was able to obtain not only a good price but a good price for a large quantity. Generally of course the price varies inversely with the quantity.

"Altogether then so far as the revised is concerned I think that members will admit that our balance has been achieved by a combination of compulsory curtailment and extraordinary luck. As a matter of fact, the revenue, after deducting transfers, is only Rs 48,000 better than was anticipated, and as I have already said the improvement under the head Excise amounts to 6½ lakhs. Apart from this we would have been no less than 6 lakhs down on our revenue. This, as you will observe, is the result of one bad harvest. Had the rabi harvest failed to fulfil expectations the position of course would have been very much more serious. I think when these facts are considered Hon'ble Members will agree that my remarks as to the necessity for caution in the budget of this Province have been fully justified.

"The only head in the revised I wish to say a word about is I—Land Revenue. As I have mentioned the sanctioned suspensions amount to 16 lakhs, and we have been bound to make that provision for this deficit. But at the same time I personally believe that the figures under this head may prove too low. The facts that I have already mentioned regarding the plentifulness of money throughout the Province make it probable that some considerable proportion of these suspensions will be paid in voluntarily. If even 25 per cent. is thus paid in our figures will be low by a couple of lakhs. That I think is all that I wish to say regarding the revised.

"As regards the budget I would first of all ask members to make a small correction in the figures. Under the head VIII—Income-tax, the budget figure is Rs. 24,92,000. For that figure should be substituted Rs. 20,62,000. On the other hand, under the head Transfers at the bottom of the page a sum of Rs. 4,30,000 should be added The reason for this is obvious. Hon'ble Members will remember that Sir James Meston in the Imperial Council announced that the Government of India had decided to release all assessees of income-tax who paid tax on incomes less than Rs. 2,000. The Government of India have decided—and I think only fairly decided—that the losses thereby entailed should be sustained by imperial funds and should not fall on provinces. The value of this change has been now estimated by the Government of India, as far as this Province is concerned, at Rs. 8,60,000, of which Rs. 4,30,000 is the Provincial share. I only received the figures yesterday, and consequently it was not possible to make the correction in the present amended Draft Statement which had already issued. The result is therefore that our provincial figures for income-tax have to be reduced by Rs. 4,30,000, while we shall receive from the Government of India by transfer a grant of the same amount. The balance thus remains unchanged and, so far as this Province is concerned, the change will make no difference to our funds.

"When framing the budget we received instructions that due economy was to be observed. It was pointed out that, although the signing of the armistice had improved the situation, the strain during the period of demobilisation will be very severe. We were asked to arrange as far as possible to limit our expenditure by our income. At the same time the Government of India agreed that for certain specified purposes we might be allowed to draw to a limited extent upon our provincial balance. It might have been thought that, after our experience during the present year, we should have been very cautious in our estimates of revenue. But we have taken the other tack. In the hope that the next kharif will not fail us we have made very large increases on various heads which depend largely or mainly on climatic conditions. And we have also made allowance for certain arrears in connection with the non-payments during the current year. We have, for instance, an increase of 13¼ lakhs under the head Forest, in view of the great developments in prospect, 10½ lakhs under Irrigation, 8¼ lakhs under Land Revenue, 3 lakhs under Excise, even despite the phenomenal figures of the present year, 1½ lakhs under Agriculture and 1 lakh under Stamps, or a total, exclusive of transfers, of 41 lakhs in excess of our estimated income of the present year. I think all members will agree that we could hardly have gone further; in fact the budget transgresses the limits that due caution would have suggested. But for several years our progress was hindered by the war, and we felt that we should this year endeavour to make up some of the lee-way. Similarly our expenditure is no less than 70 lakhs above our revised estimate for the present year.

"In his speech in the Imperial Council the Hon'ble Finance Member explained the object upon which increased expenditure would be allowed—

> "(*a*) the extension of education in directions where it has been specially hampered by war economies;

(*b*) the development of industries;

(*c*) the repair of actual damage which the financial stringency of the last three years has caused to public institutions and services, and

(*d*) purposes which, though not immediately remunerative, will secure an improved and not greatly deferred return to the State or the country at large, such as capital outlay on the development of forests, agricultural experiments and the like.'

"We have endeavoured as far as possible to take advantage of this concession. If members will refer to the expenditure statement in the budget, they will see the truth of this remark. As regards the development of industries we were handicapped by the fact that the whole question of the development of industries in this Province is still under consideration and no definite scheme of progress has yet been formulated. Consequently we were unable to budget for any greatly increased expenditure under this head. But as regards the other three heads we have made generous provision. I would call the attention of this Council to the figures under the head 22—Education representing as they do an increase of 16 lakhs above the actuals of the past year and of 7 lakhs above the estimated expenditure of the present year. Similarly with regard to the repair of actual damage which has suffered through the financial stringency. For instance a very large amount has been entered in the budget for the improvement of communications. No less than 5 lakhs have been included under the head Civil Works—Civil, *plus* an item of 4 lakhs for colony roads. In addition it includes generous provision in the Public Works budget for improving, repairing and generally setting in order the main roads of this Province. As regards the development of forests, agricultural experiments, etc., which may be regarded as a form of investment, I would quote the figures in 26-A—Agriculture, representing 13¼ lakhs above the actuals of the past year, 9¼ lakhs above the estimated expenditure of the present year. Further under the head Forests we have an additional provision of 14½ lakhs as compared with the actuals of the past year, and 7¼ lakhs as compared with the very large expenditure of the present year. I think, therefore, members must admit that the present budget, which involves drawing upon the Provincial balance to the extent of 13¾ lakhs, goes as far as it possibly could have gone in the direction of making up lee-way. Our total expenditure is, as I have said, some 70 lakhs above the estimated expenditure of the present year. It cannot be denied that this increase is very large, and it is quite possible that my successor will find himself in possession of a *damnosa hereditas*. As most of the important receipts depend upon the climatic conditions we can only hope for the best. Excise went up like a rocket, but it may come down like a stick. Taking all in all I think the non-official members will agree that the budget has been framed on most generous and daring lines. The only fault that in my opinion can be found with it is that it may tend to stifle the discussion on the 13th.

"Before I resume my seat there are one or two heads which I have to introduce, and it may save time if I do so at present. Owing to the absence of the Revenue Secretary there has been some redistribution of heads. Following the usual precedent in this province anything that nobody else will take is passed on to the Financial Secretary. Consequently I have been allotted the head of registration. But I have failed to find any facts of interest in connection with it. So I must merely content myself with formally introducing head X on the receipt side Registration and XII on the expenditure side. The figures show no important variations. As regards the head XII—Interest on the receipt side as compared with the head XIII—Interest on the expenditure side, I would just point out that while there is a steady decrease on the income side

the expenditure side tends to rise. Perhaps a word of explanation is desirable. As members know, the Government of India has raised the rates very considerably since the war began and we have to pay more for our money than we used to. We still pass it on to the municipal bodies at the usual extra percentage, but these bodies have been somewhat chary about taking loans at the present rates of interest. They are hoping that the rate of interest will soon be lowered. Consequently we have not been doing much business on the higher rates The reason for the decrease of income, as compared with the expenditure, however, lies in the fact that we have not raised our rates of taccavi in the case of agriculturists and, as the taccavi rate was fixed at a time when the rate paid to the Government of India was comparatively small, our continuance of the old rate for such advances involves us, perhaps not in actual loss, but at least with little or nothing in the way of profits. However, I am sure the Hon'ble Members will agree that it is very desirable that these loans should be given out at as low a rate of interest as possible, even if it involves some loss of profit to provincial revenues."

"As regards my next head XXI-B—Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments, I have nothing to say. As regards XXVI-B, I have merely to call attention to the paragraph in my Memorandum which explains the disappearance of the minor head Fisheries which was my one ewe lamb. I regret to say it has now been absorbed in the Industry head and will be dealt with by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Townsend. As regards Stationery and Printing, there is nothing to say on the receipt side. On the expenditure side I might explain that the increased expenditure is due partly to the fact that the Government Press has been sadly in need of replacing some of the machines that are worn out, and has been unable to do so owing to the war conditions, and in the second place to a change in the accounting owing to the fact that Financial Commissioners will now purchase their stationery for the copying agency through the Central Stores. The result is that instead of being debitable to Land Revenue this stationery is now entered under XXX—Stationery and Printing.

"As regards Superannuation Allowances I have nothing to say on the receipt side. On the debit side I have merely to mention that the expenditure this year has been somewhat less than was anticipated, owing to the fact that the rush for commutation did not continue. In the previous year we had a large demand for commutation partly with a view to investment in the Indian War Loan. As the War Loan was again available through a part of the present year, we thought it prudent to make a generous provision on this account. As a matter of fact applications for commutation were very much less than during the previous year, and consequently there is an appreciable reduction in the amount of expenditure under this head.

"I do not think the head Miscellaneous calls for any special remarks. On the expenditure side there is a considerable increase. As members are aware this head of the budget includes the general reserve of the Government, which is gradually distributed during the year, and ordinarily the head shows in the revised a very marked reduction from the original figure. In the present case the reduction is a comparatively small one. The reason for that is that Government provided 1 lakh for grain shops to assist local bodies in financing the grain shops and 1 lakh for the Victory celebrations, while the expenditure on copying agency, which is counterbalanced by corresponding increase in revenue and the disbursements on war boards, comes under this head. Next year the actual expenditure will probably be somewhat less. The figures of Rs. 24,72,000 include 6 lakhs on account of the Government reserve and a special grant to the Kangra District Board for improving the road from Palampur to Alampur. There is also included a further lakh to assist local bodies with their grain shops.

"This brings me to the last head XXXIII—Famine Relief. I have nothing to say in regard to this except to explain that though concessions for fodder were granted to more than one-half of the districts in the Province, the amount of expenditure has been surprisingly low. It is not clear what the reason is, but probably the economies effected by the Fodder Controller have had a great deal to do with the result. It is not at present evident that even the whole Rs. 75,000 now entered will be required under this head. I think the members will agree that this is very satisfactory considering the marked fodder scarcity.

"With these few remarks I beg to present the amended Draft Statement and introduce the heads standing against my name."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard.—"Your Honour, my Hon'ble friend Mr. Lumsden has dealt so completely with all the interesting features of the Draft Financial Statement that he has really left me very little to say in introducing my particular heads.

"In introducing head IV—Stamps, on the expenditure side there is really nothing to say except that the slight reduction which the revised budget shows is in my opinion probably due to the influenza epidemic. Ordinarily I think at the end of the long vacation there is a rush into the courts; this year, owing to the influenza epidemic, there was presumably no such rush, or at all events, it was considerably deferred. There must be a good many Hon'ble members in this Council who have better reason than I to know that there was a considerable diminution in the volume of litigation that time.

"In introducing head V—Excise on the receipts side and VII—Excise on the expenditure side, I am afraid I have to go through a process which I have had to go through on several occasions of condoling with this Council on the large windfall under the head Excise which the accounts of the year now ending presents? A very large increase in the receipts of excise over the expectation is not a very easy matter to explain. I think that probably my Hon'ble friend Mr. Lumsden is right in believing that it is due to the extraordinary high prices of agricultural produce combined with a very substantial volume in the rabi of last year. Whatever Hon'ble members may say and whatever they may think to the contrary it remains a fact that when there is money in the pockets of the ordinary cultivator there is an increase in the receipts from excise. The cultivator has not yet learnt to turn in his leisure to more refined pursuits than the use of drugs and intoxicants. It is for the social reformer to direct his attention to those other things on which he may with advantage spend his money. So long as the social reformers are not able to provide him with those opportunities, which will lead to a different form of amusement, it will continue to be the case that the cultivator will spend his money where it is expended at present. In the case of the budget for the next year it will be observed that there is an increase over the large figures of the revised of the present year—an increase of some 3 lakhs. That I may say is a very cautious estimate. My Hon'ble colleague has said that he has been rather bold and generous in framing his estimates, but under this head I have very good reason to believe that these 3 lakhs do not represent the whole of the increase. I have very good reason for saying so because we already know the result of the excise auctions for the coming year. The increase, I think, is partly due to the expectation of the return of troops and followers of Labour Corps in the Punjab, as well as to the very large amount of money which they have been bringing into the Province. For some reasons, among which these may be included, there have been a startling increase in the sums bidden for the excise licenses. That increase amounts to something like 50 per cent. on the bidding of last year, a rise from 34 lakhs to something

like 51 lakhs. It is not by any means all due to liquor, but a very large portion of it is on account of opium. For the coming year we will have something like 18 lakhs for opium instead of 10 lakhs in the past year. I have had a good deal of difficulty in explaining that to myself, because one very startling feature of the position has been this, that we have of late curtailed the quantities of opium which are supplied to the licensed vendors. It almost looks as though in reducing the quantities which we allow the vendors we gave a sort of increased stringency to a sort of monopoly which they possessed, so that they actually make the sale a more profitable business per seer. Under the head Excise on the expenditure side the increase is due to the larger provision for an additional detective establishment, which it is now proposed to put on a permanent footing. The functions of that detective establishment are partly in connection with illicit distillation and importation and partly in connection with opium smuggling.

"In introducing head VIII—Income-tax on the receipts side and X—Income-tax on the expenditure side I have only to say that the change has been made owing to the exemption from assessment of all incomes below Rs. 2,000. This is a matter on which, as my Hon'ble colleague (Mr. Lumsden) has stated, the Hon'ble members may well rejoice, both for the sake of the assessees concerned and of the officers who have the duty of working the assessment, and the Province as a whole is to be congratulated on it. As has been pointed out this particular change does not affect the totals for our Province figures in any way. The very large rise in the figures of this year and between the revised of the last year and this year and the budget of the next year is due very largely to the operations of the special income-tax assessing staff. During the whole of the last year or during a part of the last year, because the orders were received too late for effect to be given in the very beginning, we had at work certain special agencies. There are two such agencies in the Lahore Division, one for the west of the Province, *i.e.*, Rawalpindi and Multan, and one for the east of the Province, *i.e.*, Ambala and Jullundur. These special staffs consist of one Extra Assistant Commissioner with certain assistants, and the work which they do is that of ascertaining all the sources of incomes of a large number of those who formerly escaped assessment and the ascertaining of the incomes of many rich persons who were formerly under-assessed. The work which these agencies have done results in a very large addition to the income-tax receipts. And it is now proposed to increase the number of these special staffs so as to give one for each revenue Division and to retain two in the revenue Division of Lahore so that there will be altogether six units at work instead of four as hitherto. That Your Honour is all I have to say in introducing my heads.

The Hon'ble Mr. Hallifax :—"Your Honour, it falls to me to introduce the heads of the budget relating to land revenue and provincial rates.

"The latter calls for no comment. It is a minor head concerned with charges for management levied by the Court of Wards from estates under its control.

"Under the head Land Revenue the figures for ordinary revenue have, in the revised budget, been reduced by a little over 12½ lakhs. This is due entirely to the effect of the last monsoon upon fixed land revenue. Fixed land revenue accounts for annas five per rupee of the total revenue of the province and, as it was found necessary to suspend for kharif 1918 anna one per rupee of the year's demand for fixed land revenue these suspensions are the outstanding feature of the revised budget. The monsoon of 1917 was good and endowed the soil with moisture practically sufficient to assure the rabi. Canal supplies were abundant, and measures were taken to encourage the extension of cultivation so as to

bring under food-grains as large an area as possible. As a result the rabi area sown for 1918 was 25 per cent. in excess of the normal. The excess in the case of unirrigated lands was as much as 37 per cent. An excellent harvest was realised, including record areas of 10 million acres under wheat and 6 million acres under gram. A delay in the winter rain was the cause of some anxiety, but the crops came to maturity and were harvested under favourable conditions. And, as the Finance Member has told us, it was disposed of at a good price. In addition to the land revenue due for the rabi itself we were able to realise, as anticipated, about 2½ lakhs of arrears. Conditions, however, changed for the worse with the kharif of 1918. The monsoon of 1918 began favourably, but it failed lamentably in its promise. The harvest was very bad and the necessity for heavy suspensions has for some time been evident. The budget anticipating a normal kharif allowed only Rs. 60,000 on this account, but suspensions actually reached the total of 16 lakhs mentioned by the Finance Member. The major part of this, over 11 lakhs, was suspended in the Ambala Division where two districts, Rohtak and Gurgaon, account for nearly 9 lakhs. The failure of the monsoon was particularly marked in these districts. In Rohtak the Jhajjar Tahsil had practically no kharif. Gurgaon which suffered in 1917 from floods, necessitating a suspension of over 2¾ lakhs, suffered the opposite extreme of seasonal calamity in 1918. It had only one week of good rain and that in the middle of August. Its sowings on unirrigated land decreased from 700,000 acres in 1917 to 500,000 acres, and the whole of this practically failed, while the canal irrigated part of the district did not do so well as lands dependent elsewhere on canals. The failure of the kharif also affected the budget figures by the postponement of new assessments which, under normale onditions, would have been introduced from that harvest in the districts of Ambala and Dera Ghazi Khan.

"The history of the kharif of 1918 affords another instance of the effect of the seasons on finance in India. But it also brings clearly into light the consideration with which Government uses its land revenue administration as a means for mitigating hardships due in unirrigated tracts to the utter dependence of agriculture upon the weather. In view of the high prices prevailing for agricultural produce and the large sums which flowed into the districts from men on military service and the handsome earnings realised by the people generally, owing to the scarcity of labour, it might perhaps have been expected that suspensions would not this year have been so considerable. They were given on assessments made when prices and other important factors were not so favourable to zamindars as at present, and in many cases zamindars prefer to pay rather than accept proposed suspensions; and such payments may be considerable, but heavy suspensions have been essential, as is proved by the very considerable assistance which zamindars, for instance in Gurgaon, have accepted in the form of taccavi loans,—another means by which Government relieves distress.

"Except for fixed land revenue the other items included under the land revenue head exhibit increases. Fluctuating land revenue reflects the efforts which were made to increase the cultivation of food grains and the extensions which are taking place in canal irrigation in the Lower Bari Doab. It reflects also the efforts which zamindars are making in the colony tracts to increase the cultivation of American cotton which they have found to be so profitable. The canal irrigated areas of the four districts of Lyallpur, Montgomery, Multan and Jhang now account for nearly half the cotton area of the province and contrast with the rest of the province in having cultivated more cotton in 1918 than in the preceding year; their cotton acreage for 1918 approached double their average for the preceding five years. The increase in

fluctuating land revenue would indeed have been much more than the lakh and a quarter entered in the revised budget, had it not been for an extraordinary hailstorm in the Gujranwala District, which called for the remission of as much as Rs. 3,79,000 of revenue under this head.

"Under the head of miscellaneous revenue the budget has been revised by an addition of Rs. 2,27,000; and the main reason for this is the measures, already noted, to induce zamindars to cultivate food grains to the fullest possible extent. It is due mainly to these measures that realisations from lands leased for temporary cultivation increased by Rs. 1,14,000. Other items show no very considerable change; though, as might have been expected, the action taken by Deputy Commissioners to keep every one up to the mark and secure the maximum possible war effort from the province resulted in an increase in the fines and forfeitures realised from men who failed to appreciate the gravity of the situation.

"Receipts from the sale of Government estates are payments made by crown tenants in colonised lands for the purchase of proprietary rights. These receipts increased during the current year on account of the extension of the privilege of purchase at favourable rates to certain tenants on the Sohagpara and Sidhnai Canals.

"The sale-proceeds of waste lands depend on the auction of colony lands. The prices realised during the current year have been higher than was anticipated and in the revised edition we have raised the budget figure of 25·45 lakhs to 28·38 lakhs. The Colonisation Officer explained the high prices by a reference to the great rise which has taken place in the value of cotton—American cotton—and the consequent speculation in that commodity. When the budget for 1919-20 was framed there was no reason to anticipate any considerable decline in prices, while these were already standing at a figure on which it would be unsafe to anticipate any considerable advance. But we proposed to sell in 1919-20, 2,000 acres more than in the current year. Accordingly the budget figures were put at 34·92 lakhs. Auction sales, however, have been held within the last few days, and the results of these are so extraordinary that it will probably be necessary during the course of the year to suggest to the Government of India a reconsideration of the figures budgetted. Colony auctions have always been characterised by an optimism, which bidders inspire, with the local atmosphere of progressive prosperity; and they have also revealed extraordinary financial resources at the back of bidders and an eagerness to convert them into land investments at prices which appear to yield little interest on a commercial basis. No one, however, could have ventured to predict the height to which these factors have pressed up prices in the recent auction. As much as Rs. 1,018 per acre was bid and the average price realised was Rs. 493 per acre for 9,000 acres. I will remind the Council only that many of the bidders are practical zamindars who own land, and that the bids are a very practical and most emphatic refutation of the criticism sometimes levelled against the land revenue policy of Government, that it handicaps agriculture and tends to impoverish the country. Further comment may I think well be reserved till details of the auction have been reported.

"In budgetting for 1919-20 allowance has been made for the prospects of the present rabi. Its area is restricted, and although it is anticipated that the yield from irrigated lands will be normal, considerable suspensions will be inevitable. We anticipate that the kharif which follows it will be an average harvest; but in accordance with the policy of Government it will not be possible, even if the harvest should be abundant, to press revenue payers for the collection of arrears since Government desires that they should be given time for recovery after a succession of two bad harvests. Allowance, however, has been made for progressive assessments and the introduction of revised

assessments, and for the extension of cultivation which may normally be expected. The budget accordingly anticipates an advance, but only a small one of under $2\frac{3}{4}$ lakhs on the figures for ordinary revenue of the favourable budget with which the current year started: but as the land revenue head includes an expected increase of over 11 lakhs from the sale of Government estates and waste lands, its total is estimated at Rs. 15,28,000 in advance of the corresponding budget figure for the current year, an advance which I think the Council will agree to be perfectly justified.

"The provision for expenditure under the land revenue head no longer includes expenditure on the Thal survey to which the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard directed the attention of the Council last year. That important project now appears under a more appropriate head. But even allowing for its transfer, expenditure under the land revenue head falls short of the amount anticipated in the budget. This in part is due directly to conditions created by the war, for though the war involved increased expenditure in compensation for dearness it also resulted in a saving of the salaries of officers who were privileged to answer the call of the army. Another reason for the saving is the circumstance that the Punjab Government has not yet received sanction to its proposals for the creation of a new district at Shekhupura and for the improvement of the pay and prospects of the land revenue establishment. Their urgency, however, has in no way decreased, and the appreciation of this is marked by the retention of provision for these proposals in the budget for 1919-20. It is trusted that next year it will be possible to advance also another scheme which has long been deferred by reason of financial stringency. This is the extension of action under the Chos Act in Hoshiarpur and Ambala. Provision has accordingly been made for the payment of compensation in tracts to which will be extended the restrictions on grazing, cultivation and disposal of forest produce which have been proved to be measures of the greatest value in securing the improvement of the Siwaliks and the prevention of further damage by the torrents which originate in them. The budget figures also reflect the progress of settlements. The Kangra settlement has just been completed. Those of Ambala, Multan and Dera Ghazi Khan are in progress. Next year will see the commencement of operations in Sirsa where settlement was due to commence in kharif 1918, but was deferred on account of the agricultural situation and in consideration of excellent war services. It is also probable that settlement operations will commence in the coming year in the Sutlej tahsils of Montgomery lying outside the area irrigated by the Lower Bari Doab Canal.

"The expenditure head II—Assignments and Compensations which also I have to introduce calls for no comment and has no connection with ordinary jagirs and muafis. These are accounted for under the land revenue head and in deciding to confer such benefits as rewards on individuals and villages for conspicuous war services, Your Honour justly estimated the value which attaches to them. The action taken by Your Honour in this connection has been brought home to all by the historic pronouncements made at the Darbars at which Your Honour has summed up and rewarded the remarkable war services which the Punjab, under Your Honour's guidance and stimulation, has rendered to the Empire."

The Hon'ble Mr. French:—"The heads which I will introduce are—

XVIII—General administration.
XVI A & B—Law and Justice, and
XVII—Police.

The first head is ordinarily taken charge of by the Chief Secretary, but as my colleague the Hon'ble Mr. Thompson has only just resumed charge of the duties of that office I have undertaken the duty of introduction for to-day.

With regard to expenditure on General Administration there is as usual little to say on the subject. The only point for explanation concerns the savings out of Rs. 40,000 provided for the revision of the Civil Secretariat establishment. These are accounted for by the fact that when the budget was framed, the cost in the initial years of the revised incremental scale of pay, the maxima of which will be worked up to gradually, was over-estimated.

Law and Justice.—Turning to income under XVI-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law, I see the conjecture is hazarded at page 13 of the memorandum that there is a growing tendency of Magistrates to inflict sentences of imprisonment presumably rather than fines. In regard to this I have only to remark that personally I doubt whether the decline under general fees, fines and forfeitures is due to anything more than purely temporary causes.

As to expenditure on Courts of Law Hon'ble Members are familiar with the appointment of a Liquidation Judge of the Chief Court, whose work is expected to end very shortly. The new High Court will start with seven permanent Judges: whether the strength of that personnel will have to be temporarily supplemented is a question under consideration. In any case, I am sure no Hon'ble Member will grudge the increased expenditure on the new Court which has been budgetted for.

I pass to Jails (XVI-B). The record of the Punjab Jail Department during the War has been an exceptional one; and I may be pardoned for giving the Council a short narrative of the more salient facts of the closing years, in order to bring up to date the activities of the Department which were described in some detail by the Hon'ble Mr. Craik last March. Since June 1916 the Punjab Jails have furnished 5,510 voluntary recruits for the Jail Labour and Porter Corps employed in Mesopotamia. Of these, 5,152 men were actually despatched, the remaining 358 being held in readiness when, on the signature of the armistice, further recruiting ceased. The motto of the Department so ably administered by Colonel Ward is evidently *semper paratus* for whatever demands were made upon it, the Department met them promptly and fully. The Military authorities have stated that the arrival of the Indian Jail Corps saved the labour situation in Mesopotamia: and in a recent report received from their Inspector of Disciplinary Corps, that officer in recording his especial appreciation of the work done by No. 6 Punjab Jail Corps, adds that were he asked to name the best of all the Jail Labour Battalions in Mesopotamia he would, undoubtedly, select No. 6 Punjab. That Sir, is one more laurel added to the war wreath that our Province so proudly wears.

Four Commissioned Medical Officers in charge of Jails were surrendered for Military duty—3 non-gazetted officers obtained Commissions in the Indian Army Reserve of Officers and 6 subordinate officers were deputed to the Military Department as Accountants and Supervisors. Since February 1917 the Department has continued to supply labour from the Borstal Jail to the Dhariwal Mills in Gurdaspur District, which throughout the war have been engaged solely on Government work. At the desire of the Manager of the Mills the number of youths employed from the Borstal Institution was increased until a daily average of 341 was reached, of whom 331 were employed day by day in the Mills. The work done has been so highly valued that the management of the Mills has offered prisoners on their release permanent employment, with free quarters, and instruction in the higher, and more remunerative forms of labour. It is estimated by the management that the labour provided by Government from the Jails and other official sources, has saved Government between 80 and 90 lakhs of rupees, being the difference in the cost of the purchase of the articles made in India and their cost in England,—a sum of Rs. 35,000 was realised on account of wages for the Borstal prisoners apart

from over Rs. 6,000 credited as bounties to the lads' accounts. Several prisoners earned as much as Rs. 27 per mensem, of which Rs. 17 were credited to their private accounts : while some of them did such good work that a bonus of Rs. 100 each was given them by the Mills Authorities on release. The continued success of the Khewra Camp Jail was evidenced by the further demands of the Salt Authorities for labour. The prisoners became so skilled in the work of loading salt at the Depôt that, at times, the output of the mines could not keep pace with the prisoners' disposal of it. The total expenditure on this Camp was Rs. 20,000 and the income realized nearly Rs. 19,000. During 1918 the Jail population of 166 men cleared 31¾ lakhs of maunds of salt; bagged nearly 9 lakhs of maunds and stacked over 3 lakhs of maunds. So appreciative of the labour supplied is the Commissioner of Northern India Salt Revenue that he desires the establishment of a permanent jail at Khewra.

The Arsenals at Rawalpindi and Ferozepore, as well as Grass Farms, and Military buildings in various Cantonments, have been supplied with labour amounting in the aggregate to 1,000 men daily. Within the Jails, except for paper-making and essential work necessary for the up-keep of the jails, the labour has been entirely devoted to army work. Many thousands of blankets have been woven, and numbers of tents and a large amount of army equipment supplied.

The scheme of conditional release of youths confined at the Borstal Jail with long term sentences has again proved successful, and much has been done in the Jail towards the reformation of the inmates.

The Department still experiences difficulties in finding a sufficient number of recruits for the warder establishment, despite the revision of pay and other allowances sanctioned in 1918 : but it may be hoped that with the cessation of the War matters will improve.

The cash profits of the Department—increased from Rs. 86,000 in 1917 to Rs. 2,82,000 in 1918 and the gross profits from Rs. 2,42,000 to Rs. 4,29,000. The budgetted income was Rs. 5,96,000 and the decrease is due to :—

(1) a decline in the daily average number of convicts by 1,371 ;

(2) the prevalence of influenza during the latter part of the year, and

(3) the large stocks of materials in hand worth Rs. 3,18,000.

The Council will agree with me that the history of the Jail Department during the last year, and indeed throughout the war, has been in every way highly satisfactory and reflects the greatest credit on the Inspector-General and his energetic staff.

As to income derived under Head XVII—Police—I have no comments to make. Passing to expenditure, although the memorandum explains the increase of Rs. 59,000 in expenditure this year, I may make a few supplementary remarks. First, as to superintendence. When the call for officers for the war seriously depleted the cadre of experienced executive officers of the higher ranks, it was thought necessary, as a temporary measure, to strengthen the administration by increasing the number of the Ranges (so as to make each one co-terminous with a Revenue Division), and appointing 2 additional Deputy Inspectors-General. This re-organization was also required for the due working of the internal security schemes. It is not at present intended to maintain it beyond next October ; but the severity of the strain on the executive may be gauged from the fact that, even when all officers of the Imperial Police have returned to the Province, the cadre will still be 30 per cent. under strength, owing to short recruitment during the war.

"The excess under District Executive Force, in so far as the payment of allowances is concerned, is explained on page 26 of the memorandum and calls for no remarks from me. As regards the cost of railway warrants on which the police travel, the increase is really nominal only, because the budget was incorrectly framed. I am doubtful myself whether the increase of Rs. 70,000 for this year will not be found to be an over estimate. In any case, the whole question of railway warrants seems to be in a rather unsatisfactory state and is at present under examination.

"The closure of the Police Training School last year was one of the Province's sacrifices to the war. The school is being re-opened from the 1st April next in order that the necessary instruction of the rank-and-file and the training of directly appointed Sub-Inspectors, who will join the police force with war service in the army to their credit, may be resumed. As the result of the appointment of a small committee, of which I was a member, it has been found possible to effect considerable economies in the railway police by their redistribution on more modern lines and to avoid proposed increases in the office establishment of the Criminal Investigation Department.

"There remains for mention only the Criminal Tribes reclamation scheme and at the risk of detaining the Council 2 or 3 minutes I should like to give a brief outline of what has been done during the year under the Deputy Commissioner, Criminal Tribes.

"The eleven settlements of last year with a population of 4,000 have expanded now to 16 settlements with a membership of nearly 6,500. These include the Reformatory at Amritsar, 11 industrial and 4 agricultural settlements. One of the most striking successes has been the Moghalpura settlement near Lahore which supplies labour on a large scale to the North-Western Railway and bears promise of considerable developments in the near future. A very satisfactory feature of this settlement is that the North-Western Railway authorities have agreed to take on 100 youths with the object of training them as mechanics. If this experiment turns out well there should be scope for the employment in the railway of over 3,000 workers. The agricultural settlement at Montgomery has also proved an unqualified success. Three other similar settlements have just been initiated and others are under contemplation. One of the latest settlements will be on the estate of a private landowner in the Gujranwala District, who has agreed to engage criminal tribesmen as tenants and provide them with suitable accommodation. These developments naturally cost money, but the increase of the budget for 1919-20 by Rs. 1,20,000 represents an advance of only Rs. 47,000 over the original budget for this year, which was cut down owing to delay in executing works due to the influenza epidemic and other causes. The proposals for next year include the outlay of Rs. 40,000 on constructing a Central Boys School.

"It will be seen from the *resume* I have given that the Deputy Commissioner for Criminal Tribes, Rai Bahadur Pandit Hari Kishen Kaul, and his Assistants are pursuing a vigorous policy with much success and Government's cordial acknowledgments are due to them and to the various religious bodies which have so generously aided its efforts to reform these tribes. I must not omit, in conclusion, to mention the remarkable success attained in recruiting criminal tribesmen for the army. The Punjab criminal tribesman is a Punjabi first and a criminal tribesman afterwards. And so he too has played his part in loyally shouldering the Empire's burden. No less than 2,086 members of criminal tribes have joined the army, 1,100 of them as combatants and 200 as artillery drivers. This represents the high figure of 1 in 14 of the adult male population; and indeed the small tribe of the Aheris in the Hissar District enlisted as many as 1 in 10. The remarkable success achieved by Mr Cooke, Superintendent Police in Hissar, and his assistants in their case,

and, to a lesser degree by Mr. Wall, Superintendent Police, Ferozepore, and his Assistants in the case of the Bauriahs, who have done so well in the 2-35th Sikhs, prove that with patience and tact these shy, wild men can be brought within the pale of ordinary society: and warm congratulations are due to all whether Civil or Military officers who were concerned in this important and interesting experiment of converting semi-civilized tribesmen into highly disciplined soldiers.

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods:—"In introducing the Public Works heads I will first deal with those of the Buildings and Roads Branch by quoting from a note supplied by the Chief Engineer of that Branch.

PROVINCIAL CIVIL WORKS IN CHARGE OF PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

"The Budget grant of Rs. 67,29,000, under head 45—Civil Works, was increased during the current year to Rs. 72,28,000.

"2. The increase of some 5 lakhs was mainly due to emergent repairs and improvements to roads, owing to the insistence of the Military Department that the main lines of communication in the Province should be improved and maintained at a very high standard, which necessitated the construction of new road bridges over the Chenab and Phulku rivers at Wazirabad. The increase was also partly due to progress made on the urgently needed scheme for housing officials at Simla.

"3. The revised estimate is, however, expected to fall to Rs. 55 lakhs; the short expenditure being due to the continued difficulties in obtaining transport, short supplies of coal, scarcity of both material and labour, and depletion of the supervising staff.

"4. In the next year it is expected that 71 lakhs will be spent, and some of the more important projects on which this sum will be expended are detailed below:—

"A sum of 2 lakhs is to be expended on the much needed residences for officials at Lahore and Simla; the necessary extension to the present cemetery in Simla will also be carried out, at an estimated cost of a lakh. The construction of a new High and Normal School at Multan is expected to cost over a lakh and twenty thousand, and a similar sum may be utilised on the erection of the Government buildings, which will be required for the New Civil District of Sheikhupura.

"Educational buildings, consisting of New High and Normal Schools and Hostels at Lahore, Gakkar, Lala Musa, Hissar, Rohtak, Karnal and Jhang, will absorb 5 lakhs.

"The road which is to link up the Attock oil-fields with the railway at Fatehjang will require another two lakhs for completion; while works for the much-needed improvement of the Rawalpindi-Murree Road will aggregate to over 1¼ lakhs.

"In addition to this a sum of 3 lakhs is being expended on the construction of the new road bridges over the Chenab river and Phulku nalla at Wazirabad; and a similar amount is being utilised to complete the bridging of the Tangri and Omlah nallas on the Grand Trunk Road near Ambala.

"In order to improve communications between the Kangra Valley and Kulu, the construction of the second section of the road from Mandi to Larji (the first half of the road having already been completed) is in hand, and will cost 4½ lakhs, the proposed expenditure for the coming year being Rs. 95,000.

"With regard to the Irrigation heads the latest figures show a decrease of 7½ lakhs under 'XXIX—Major Works,—Direct Receipts,' compared with the Budget estimate. This is due in a large measure to adverse weather

conditions. The excessive rainfall at the beginning of the rabi season, 1917-18, lessened the demand for canal water, and reduced the canal irrigated area. The greater portion of the deficit occurs in this crop. The dry kharif season, 1918, which followed, was on the whole favourable to growth of revenue. The demand for canal water was unusually keen, and was met with difficulty owing to low river supplies. The areas irrigated by canals were well above the average, except those of the Sirhind and Western Jumna Canals. On these two Canals the cotton crops suffered, in consequence of the failure of the monsoon.

"The estimate for 1919-20 has been fixed at Rs. 2,92,00,000; which allows for normal weather conditions and some expansion of irrigation on the Triple Canal system.

"The rabi area irrigated to end of January 1919 is 400,000 acres larger than that irrigated to end of January 1918; which, however, was about 600,000 acres smaller than the records of the two preceding years. The rainfall of January and February 1919 has practically assured the prospects of the rabi crop of 1918-19, and we are justified in taking credit for the increase in income to be expected therefrom.

"The revised estimate for the current year under "Indirect Receipts" shows an increase of 2½ lakhs over the Budget figure. This increase occurs chiefly on the Lower Chenab and Lower Bari Doab Canals. On the former the areas actually booked proved to be higher than originally anticipated. On the latter the increase is due to credit now being taken for arrears of Land Revenue and Malikana, which had not been assessed for some years.

"For the ensuing year, 1919-20, the Indirect Receipts have been put at 136·16 lakhs, or 3·16 lakhs more than the current year's revised estimate. The increase is accounted for by the inclusion of credits expected on the Upper Jhelum Canal.

"Under the head '42—Major Works—Working Expenses,' the revised estimate is 104 lakhs, compared with 106·55 lakhs provided in the Budget. The latter, however, included a 'reserve for unforeseen charges,' amounting to Rs. 1,85,000. By reason of deficient rainfall, and the infrequency of floods in rivers and torrents, there has been less expenditure on maintenance than was originally anticipated. Other causes which have contributed to the lapse are, acute shortage of labour, transport difficulties, credits for sales of surplus Tools and Plant to the Military Department, and to economy being practised during the currency of the War, as promised last year.

"The budget for next year is approximately the same as the current year's revised estimate; and allows only for a small increase under 'Extensions and Improvements,' where a 'reserve' of 2,00,000 has been provided for this purpose.

GENERAL REMARKS.

"It is estimated that the value of the crops raised by canal irrigation in the Punjab during the year under review was about 34 crores of rupees, or about 50 per cent. greater than the probable capital expenditure on all Punjab Canals down to the end of the year 1919-20.

"The revenue derived from Direct Receipts of all these Canals is estimated to amount to about 8 per cent. of the value of the crops raised by canal irrigation.

"Projects are being prepared for the construction of several irrigation works of great magnitude. The chief of these are—

"*The Thal Canal Project*,—which is being designed to irrigate annually an area of nearly 2 million acres, in the Doab between the Indus and

the Jhelum and Chenab rivers. It is estimated that it will cost about 10 crores of rupees, and yield a return of more than 7 per cent. on that capital cost.

"*The Sutlej Valley Canals Project*—which is designed to irrigate annually an area of about 1,400,000 acres, partly in British territory and partly in Bahawalpur and Bikanir territory, at a cost of about 10 crores of rupees.

"*The Bhakra Dam Project*—of a high reservoir dam across the River Sutlej in the Bhakra Gorge, to impound about 110,000 million cubic feet of water during the monsoon, for irrigation during the rabi season. It is expected to cost about 10 crores of rupees and to permit of the irrigation of about 1 400,000 acres annually.

"*The Wular Barrage Project*—of a Barrage across the River Jhelum in Kashmir, at the exit of the Wular Lake, for the storage of water during the monsoon for irrigation in the Punjab during the rabi season. It is expected to cost about 15 lakhs of rupees to construct, and negotiations for its construction are being carried on with the Kashmir Durbar."

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend :—"Your Honour, the principal heads for which I am to-day responsible are, on the income side, forest and agriculture, and on the expenditure side, in addition to these, industries, and minor departments, such as factory and steam boiler inspection. I only propose to speak briefly, and not to trouble the Council with details which they already have in the financial statement.

"As regards forests, the receipts this year of this expanding department are, roughly, about half a lakh more than was anticipated, and in the coming financial year it is hoped they will bring in no less than some 13 lakhs more than in the present year. Income this year would have been still greater by 6 lakhs of rupees but for the cancellation of orders for fuel, colophony and turpentine placed by the Indian Munitions Board. But even so, I think, the Council will agree with me that the results are very satisfactory, and that the Department is to be congratulated on them. The large increase in revenue expected next year is due to various causes, the principal of which are that a large stock of timber from the 1918 launching in Bashahr is expected to reach the sale depôts next year, more extensive sales at higher prices of timber or fuel are anticipated in Kangra, Shahdara and Changa Manga, and the resin industry will continue to expand. An increase in expenditure is also expected next year, when it is anticipated that some seven lakhs more will be spent than was the case this year. It will be sufficient here to say that the greater part of this increase, some 4 lakhs, will be incurred on floating and rafting the timber from Bashahr already referred to, and on the duplication of the plant at the extremely successful Jallo resin factory.

"To turn now to agriculture. The receipts next year are expected to be about a lakh and a half more than this year, and expenditure shows an increase of about nine lakhs. I have no doubt but that the Council will agree with me that expenditure on this department, which has already so materially added to the prosperity of the cultivators of the canal colonies, is well justified. I would here only make special mention, apart from the large and very important work done by the Agricultural Department of providing pure wheat and cotton seed for the cultivators of this province, work which in England or America would be done by ordinary seed merchants, of two lines of work on which it is proposed to spend money. The first is an experiment in the reclamation of bara land in the Lower Bari Doab Colony, on which over 2½ lakhs will be spent. Should these experiments—they are in reality a continuation of the kallar reclamation work at Narwala near Lyallpur instituted by the late Mr. Barnes—be successful, the return not only to Government,

but to the people of this province, will be many times that amount. The second is the adoption of an energetic policy of agricultural education. This really falls more within the sphere of my Hon'ble friend Mr. Richey than mine, so I will only say that I think it is a line of work which is fraught with possibilities of great benefit to the cultivation of this province. Additional establishment is also being entertained next year to deal with the expanding activities of the Co-operative Department. This I am sure Hon'ble members will agree is most thoroughly justified.

"As regards industries, Sir, steps are being taken to give effect to the proposals of the Industrial Commission so far as they affect this Province. The first and most essential of these is the appointment of a wholetime Director of Industries, and this is a matter now engaging the attention of Government. No difficulty is anticipated in providing, next year, money for his pay and also for such proposals designed to help the industries of this province as he may find himself able to submit to Government. I am glad to say that our whole time Inspector of Factories has just returned to us from the army.

"Before I close, it may interest the Council if I devote a few minutes to telling it the amount of work done in this province by the Provincial Munitions Department for the Munitions Board. I will not mention the 8,000 miles of woollen cloth serge and flannel, and many other articles, turned out for the army by the Dhariwal Mills. They work directly under the Board. Nor do I mention the admirable work done by the Jail Department for the Munitions Board and the war generally. The Hon'ble Mr. French has already spoken of it. I speak now of the work done by the Provincial Department of Munitions. It has supplied articles, in the last three and a half years, to the army of a value of over £4,00,000. Of this about one-third was saddlery, and the rest consisted principally of carpentry and metal articles, as tables, chairs, hospital furniture, railway material, ambulance stretchers, camel kajawahs, doors, windows, entrenching tools, general service wagon fittings, wheels and spokes, transport carts and fittings, picketting pegs and rings, and the like. All these articles were made nearly altogether by Punjab artizans under the general supervision of Mr. Scott, Deputy Controller of Munitions, who also carried on his work as Signal Engineer of the North-Western Railway. I cannot, as Provincial Controller of Munitions, speak too highly of that officer's ability, administrative capacity and devotion to duty.

"In addition to these items, over £1,00,000 worth of woollen blankets has been made by Punjab village weavers, in their villages for the army in the last 2½ years, principally at Panipat, £40,000 worth of horse jhools, and £6,000 worth of cutlery, principally at Nizamabad and Wazirabad. The greater part of the last item consisted of large clasp knives, for cavalry sowars. I have one here, which I will gladly show Hon'ble members. Over 61,000 of these were made, at an average cost of about Re. 1-10-0 each. They have been described by the Munitions Board as 'extremely good and remarkably cheap.' They were made by men who previously used to make the rather futile pocket knives that were hawked about for sale at Wazirabad Railway Station. We are now trying to keep these men employed on the much more useful line of work on which they have embarked, and I am glad to say that one of the two principal firms engaged in this work has just been successful in securing two large contracts for knives and other stationery requirements from the Controller of Stationery and the Bombay Government."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt:—"Your Honour, I am responsible in whole for the receipt and expenditure heads XX-A and XXIV-A—Medical; and inpart for the receipt head XX-B and Expenditure head XXIV-B—Sanitation. There is little to say regarding the receipts heads as the Medical and Sanitary

Departments are not money earning ones ; though, as their activities are concentrated on saving the lives and preserving and restoring the health of the people, they may fairly be considered as instrumental in maintaining and increasing the revenues of the Province.

2. "Under the receipt head XX-A a few explanatory remarks with reference to the funds of the Medical College and Medical School will suffice. Hitherto these funds have not been credited to Government. They consist of fees for practical classes and scholarships received from Municipal Committees, District Boards and Native States which, until the present year, have been treated as private funds and administered by the Principal of the Medical College. From an accounts point of view this arrangement was considered to be unsatisfactory ; so, after consultation with the Principal of the Medical College and the Accountant-General, it was decided to credit the items to Government, and make a corresponding provision on the expenditure side.

3. "My remarks in connection with receipt head XX-B—Sanitation will be confined to the subject 'Sale-proceeds of Quinine.' This year a provision of one lakh was made for the purchase of Quinine, and its conversion into tablets. So far, 3,483 pounds have been distributed at a cost of over Rs. 97,500 : and there is still a balance of 963 pounds in stock. All demands have been met. The question of improving the method of free-distribution of the drug is under consideration ; and it is hoped that it may be possible to bring it within the reach of a much larger number of the people. The price of Quinine still rules high.

4. "Under Expenditure head XXIV-A. The increase under item 'Medical Establishment' is chiefly due to a return to normal conditions, as, consequent on the cessation of hostilities, Medical Officers are being reverted from military duty, and it is necessary to provide for their pay and allowances ; so the expenditure is not new.

"The provisions for the revision of the office of the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, and increase of pay of Sub-Assistant Surgeons call for no special remarks. The last revision in both cases was made in 1910, since when circumstances have greatly altered ; and no arguments to justify an increase of pay would appear to be required.

5. "Under item 'Hospitals and Dispensaries' Hon'ble Members will probably welcome some amplification of the Hon'ble Finance Member's Memorandum. The sanction of the Secretary of State has been applied for to entertain the extra establishment which will be necessary to carry on the work of the enlarged Medical College and Mayo Hospital at an annual recurring cost of Rs. 82,600. The proposals in regard to this extra establishment were subjected to a very thorough scrutiny and criticism both by Government, and by a Special non-official Committee of this Council who visited the institutions and discussed the proposals with my predecessor and the Principal. The establishment asked for represents the minimum with which the work of the College and Hospital can in future be maintained with any degree of efficiency. It is hoped that within the next few months the sanction of the Secretary of State will be received and the staff entertained.

6. "Adverting to the provision of new dispensaries. As explained by Major-General Hendley at the last budget session of this Council, Government increased the amount placed annually at the disposal of the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals to assist local bodies to open and equip new dispensaries from Rs. 20,000 to one lakh, with effect from the current year. The whole amount has been allotted, and for the next year it has been increased to 1½ lakh. In addition, half a lakh is being provided for itinerating dispensaries. Originally the provincial itinerating dispensaries were in operation for three

months in the year; but for the past two years their activities have started earlier and they have been kept going till later in the year. It is now intended that they should remain at work throughout the year. It is hoped to have at least forty of these travelling dispensaries this year, in addition to those for which Local Bodies will be responsible; and that the number will be gradually increased.

"The need for more dispensaries, both fixed and itinerating, is real and urgent; and many more could be advantageously utilised. There is reason to hope that local bodies, on seeing that Government is ready to assist, will do their best to foster and further the growth of medical institutions; and, in fact, from the number of applications being received for financial aid, there is every indication that this will be the case.

7. "The addition of a Genito-Urinary Department to the Mayo Hospital is the result of the report of the Royal Commission on Venereal Diseases in the United Kingdom. At the suggestion of the Government of India enquiries were made as to their prevalence in India, which elicited the fact, which is well-known to the medical profession, that in the Punjab, as in other parts of India, there is much venereal disease. From want of treatment, or from inefficient or improper treatment, there is a great deal of preventible suffering from these ailments and their after effects. With a view to treat and control venereal disease Government has sanctioned the establishment of a Genito-Urinary Department at the Mayo Hospital, and contemplates providing Civil Head-quarter's hospitals with special modern apparatus and drugs for effective and curative treatment. Assistant Surgeons from the mufassil will be required to attend Special Classes and cliniques at the Medical College and Hospital to render them capable of dealing properly with these diseases and their various manifestations.

8. "The next item of Expenditure is in connection with the transfer of the Medical School to Amritsar. This is a pressing need, and each year the position in regard to admissions to the course, and facilities for clinical instruction tends to become more embarrassing. It is satisfactory to know that the question has assumed an active phase; and it is anticipated that an excellent and spacious site will very shortly be acquired, and that commencement of building operations will not be long delayed.

9. "The grants to the Ludhiana School for Women are for additional buildings, such as a Maternity block; and for provision of apparatus for teaching purposes, and extra establishment.

10. "The acquisition of land for the Lunatic Asylum is necessary to carry out extensions to prevent over-crowding, and to provide new buildings for carrying out the measures suggested by Lieutenant-Colonel Forster, I.M.S., for the prevention of the spread of tuberculosis.

11. "The revision of the pay of the attendant and menial staff of the Lunatic Asylum has been necessitated by the difficulty—practically amounting to impossibility, of attracting suitable recruits for the arduous, unremitting, and uncogenial duties associated with the care of the insane.

12. "The expenditure under 24-B—Sanitation calls for no special remarks. Fortunately, Plague has existed to a slight extent this year and has been confined to a few localised outbreaks of short duration. On account of this and the absence on Military service of Plague Medical Officers it has been possible to keep down expenses.

13. "With these remarks I beg to present the heads for which I am responsible."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—" Your Honour, I am responsible for the receipt head XIX—Education and expenditure head XXII—Education. XIX—Education does not form a large feature of receipts estimates of the Financial Secretary, although I am firmly convinced that there is no more reproductory expenditure than that on education. This is not shown by budget figures. On the contrary, we had a slight loss in the receipts under Education which are practically limited to fees. During the next year we have budgetted for an increase of receipts of Rs. 22,000 on the estimated receipts of this year. These are expected to come from fees from two new Government Colleges which we hope to open. As I shall show you later I am afraid this estimate is optimistic. I now turn to expenditure XXII—Education. If Hon'ble Members will look at page 27 of the Memorandum it will be easier for me to make my remarks clear. I have to justify myself in the eyes of the Council for falling short of my budget by nearly 1½ lakhs this year and in the eyes of those who advocate economy that inspite of this I am asking for an increase of nearly 6 lakhs for next year. There has been a small inevitable falling off in expenditure under the heads Inspection and Government Colleges,—General, owing to the absence of certain officers on general military duty. Under the head Government Colleges—Professional, we had hoped during this year to have received sanction for the revised scale of staff for the Central Training College, and we therefore provided for certain stipends for new Anglo-Vernacular students to be under training. This sanction was not received in time. Hon'ble Members will be glad to hear that it has been received now for students to start their training during the present year. Under Government Schools—General, the apparent deficit of Rs. 2,41,000 as explained in the Memorandum, has almost all been spent under Grants-in-aid. The largest item is, however, under head Government Schools—Special, where we have spent Rs. 2,60,000 less than we budgetted. A major portion of this represents the Imperial grant for the training of teachers and the improvement of salaries. As I have explained more than once in this Council this money we propose to expend on the revision of the Subordinate Education Service, the improvement of the staff of the Central Training College, the opening of additional Normal Schools and special grants for provident funds. The revision of the Central Training College staff has only just received sanction during the present month. I hope to be able to recruit men to enlarge the College staff next year. As to the revision of the Subordinate Education Service, that largely depends on the revision of the Provincial Education Service which is in the hands of the Government of India. However, towards the close of the year, feeling that the needs of the poorer teachers could no longer be neglected, the local Government, in accordance with the promise which it made over a year ago in this Council that these claims would be sympathetically considered, has revised the Subordinate Educational establishment so far as the junior posts are concerned. That involves an increased expenditure of Rs. 20,000 per annum. It has also utilised some portion of the Imperial grant in opening four Normal Schools for women at centres outside Lahore, which I am glad to say have all been filled and the result is very gratifying, and the opening of an additional Normal School in hired buildings in Gujranwala. The remainder of the grant we offered the Public Works Department to erect buildings for Normal Schools at Rohtak, Karnal, Sargodha and other places. I am sorry to say they have not been able to utilise the money. That is due to the high cost of material. I hope they will be able to utilise it next year.

" Under Grants-in-aid we have not only spent all the money that we have provided for district board grants for primary education, but we have been able to give additional grants for Anglo-Vernacular education to local bodies which we had not made in previous years. There has been a certain amount of saving under this head, though it does not appear in the head Grants-in-aid

for building to private institutions. Hon'ble Members who may be connected with private schools know that they have been unable for the same reason as the Public Works Department to undertake any large building schemes for their schools. These I think are the reasons for the under-spending of my budget in the present year.

"Now if you look to the next year's budget, you will see that under practically every head there is an increase of expenditure. That is very satisfactory. Under direction we have provided for an Assistant Director and for a revision of my office establishment, and I believe the Council will agree that this expenditure is justified. Under Inspection, there is nothing new. In Government Colleges—General, we have provided Rs. 85,000 towards opening two new secondary colleges. I am sorry to say that I feel very doubtful whether sanction will be obtained in time to open these this year, but we shall be able to spend the money on providing the sites and making the necessary arrangements for the ensuing year. Under Government Schools—General, we have an apparent drop, but as a matter of fact we have a very large increase. The Lawrence Military Asylum, Sanawar, is at present maintained partly from Provincial funds, partly from Imperial funds and partly by the Army Department of the Government of India. It is now being taken over by the Army Department of the Government of India thereby saving Rs. 65,000. Under Government Schools—Special, we have provided the whole of the amount of the Imperial grant for the training of teachers and also the arrears which have not been spent during this year. Under Grants-in-aid, we have provided, as shown in the Memo., 2 lakhs for building grants to local bodies for Vernacular Schools, and 2 lakhs for our programme of extension of vernacular education in rural areas. These figures are based on the actual budgets of the local boards as to what they will need for carrying out their programme of vernacular education next year. We have in addition provided 2 lakhs out of the 4,69,000 given by the Government of India for agricultural education, as we do not anticipate that more than 2 lakhs will be asked for during the next year. So Hon'ble Members will understand that, apart from this budget, we have also in hand for expenditure during the ensuing year 2,69,000 for agricultural education. We have also a sum of Rs. 75,000 provided under this head for the Carpentry School at Jullundur, and we have since then received a further sum of Rs. 75,000 for the same project. So we have no less than 1,50,000 available for this scheme. It is not likely that we shall spend more than Rs. 75,000 of the amount during the next year. There is nothing that would call for comment under Scholarships and Miscellaneous. I see that in the Memorandum mention is made of the revision of the staff of Lawrance School, Ghoragali, at a cost of Rs. 9,000. I might explain to Hon'ble Members that the fees in schools have been raised, so that in a few years' time the whole of the cost will be met by fees.

"With these few words I introduce the heads for which I am responsible."

ADJOURNMENT.

The Council was adjourned till the 13th of March 1919, 10-30 A.M.

LAHORE : T. P. ELLIS,

The 19th March 1919. *Secretary, Legislative Council.*

APPENDIX A.

ANSWER TO QUESTION No. 52 ASKED BY HON'BLE CHAUDHRI LAL CHAND AT THE COUNCIL MEETING DATED 20TH NOVEMBER 1918.

Statement showing the number of applications under section 41 (3) of the Punjab Courts Act during the five years 1914—18.

District.	1914.		1915.		1916.		1917.		1918.	
	Instituted.	Granted.	Instituted.	Granted.	Instituted.	Granted.	Instituted.	Granted.	Instituted.	Granted.
Ambala	23	1	6	...	6	...	13	...	10	1
Simla										
Karnal	3	...	6	...	3	...	7	2	3	...
Rohtak										
Ludhiana	1	...	5	3	23	4	6	3	17	3
Jullundur	42	3	19	14	45	27	20	8	17	1
Hoshiarpur	42	14	13	1	12	2	6	1	15	...
Kangra										
Kala	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Amritsar	...	...	20	3	...	...	...	...	3	1
Gurdaspur	2	...	...	...	...	...	1	1	5	2
Sialkot	12	1	2	...	6	...	11	...	5	...
Gujranwala	...	...	...	...	...	...	2	...	...	...
Gujrat										
Montgomery	5	1	6	2	3	2	1	...	5	2
Lahore	4	3	5	1	1	...	3	...	2	...
Ferozepore	3	1	12	...	11	...	2	...	1	1
Hissar	5	...	...	...	5	...	6	...	3	3
Gurgaon										
Multan	6	2	...	...	...	...	2	1	1	1
Muzaffargarh	8	7	1	...	...	...	2	...	...	...
Dera Ghazi Khan	6	6	8	...	2	...	1	...	...	...
Jhelum	17	...	43	12	30	9	33	20	11	6
Rawalpindi (A)	...	...	...	...	...	...	4	...	2	...
Attock	3	...	9	1	6	...	11	1	11	1
Mianwali	2	...	2	...	4	...	6	3	...	3
Shahpur	...	...	1	...	8	4	3	...	3	2
Jhang (Civil)										
Lyallpur	2	1	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Jhang (Criminal)	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Total ...	186	43	187	42	165	48	147	40	114	26

(A).—The Records for the years 1914, 1915 and 1916 perished in the fire of November 30th, 1915, the figures for these three years are therefore not available.

APPENDIX B.

(See Answer to Question No. 6.)

Statement showing the aggregate amount of increase in the expenditure on clerical staff due to its revision.

Name of Department.	Aggregate amount of increase per mensem.	Remarks.
	Rs. a. p.	
Civil Secretariat	3,656 10 8	
Public Works Department Secretariat, Buildings and Roads Branch.	828 0 0	
Public Works Department Secretariat, Irrigation Branch.	812 0 0	Scale sanctioned in 1914. Revision has been held over during the war for reasons of economy.
Chief Court, Punjab	1,165 0 0	
Financial Commissioners ...	....	Regrading and reduction of one appointment.
Director of Public Instruction ...	701 10 8	
Conservator of Forests	607 0 4	
Sanitary Commissioner, Punjab ...	663 1 2	
Deputy Commissioner for Criminal Tribes.	208 8 0	On account of additional establishments.
Government Press	15 0 0	
Director of Agriculture and Land Records Offices.	214 0 0	Three additional clerks have been added. General revision is under consideration of Director of Agriculture.
Registrar, Co-operative Societies ...	187 8 0	
District Offices	11,531 0 0	Our proposals have been submitted to Government of India, but have not yet been sanctioned.
Civil Surgeons' clerks	2,610 0 0	Appointments have been provincialized.
Total ...	23,199 15 10 per mensem or 2,78,393 14 0 per annum.	
Increase of one rupee per mensem in pay of all whole-time Government servants whose pay is Rs. 7 per mensem or less.	11,533 0 0 per mensem or 1,41,996 0 0 per annum.	This is not a clerical establishment, but has been shown here in case mention is to be made of it.
(1) Inspector General, Civil Hospitals.		
(2) Inspector-General, Prisons...		
(3) Director of Agriculture and Director of Land Records.		
(4) Clericalization of Central Police Office and Deputy Inspector-General's Offices.		Are underconsideration.
(5) Private Secretary to His Honour's Office.		

APPENDIX C.

(See Answer to Question No. 11.)

Scale of fees to be charged in the private wards and Indian Family wards of the Mayo Hospital.

A.—Room fees.—

(i)—Private Wards—

Rs. 1 per diem for room and diet.

(ii)—Indian Family Wards—

Government servants drawing Rs. 300 per mensem or less, Rs. 3 per diem.

Government servants drawing over Rs. 300 per mensem, Rs. 5 per diem.

All others, Rs. 5 per diem.

B.—Medical and Surgical fees.—

In addition to the room fee the following medical and surgical attendance fees will be required to be paid in advance by patients.

(1)—For Medical attendance—

	Rs.
Day visit	5
Night visit	10

(2)—Fees for operations.

Abdominal sections	250
Strangulated Hernia or radical cure ...	200
Amputations at or above wrist or ankle, stone in the Kidney or Bladder, Piles	150
Tumours, Cysts, Cataracts	100
Iridectomy, Fractures, Dislocations and other minor operations	50
Gynæcological abdominal operations ...	250
Curettage	75
Vaginal and perineal operations	100
Confinements	100

In unusual cases reference will be made to the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Punjab.

APPENDIX D.

Amended Draft Financial Statement of the Government of the Punjab for the year 1919-20.

Amended Draft Financial Statement of the Government

(Figures in thousand

Heads of account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Opening balance	1,22,75	1,89,78	1,94,52	2,23,35
Provincial Revenue and Receipts.				
I—Land Revenue	1,55,91	1,43,82	1,40,31	1,43,68
IV—Stamps	30,00	30,75	29,15	30,25
V—Excise	42,82	45,74	52,20	55,28
VI—Provincial Rates	21	31	24	32
VIII—Income Tax...	17,18	17,50	17,50	24,92
IX—Forest	21,18	22,58	23,00	26,35
X—Registration	3,81	3,84	3,60	3,75
XII—Interest	2,47	2,48	2,44	2,38
XVI-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law	6,81	7,60	6,20	6,60
XVI-B—Law and Justice—Jails...	6,77	5,96	6,56	6,22
XVII—Police	2,27	1,76	2,13	2,11
XIX—Education	5,25	5,49	5,24	5,46
XX-A—Medical	45	42	75	7
XX-B—Sanitation...	1,27	96	1,32	1,0
XXI-A—Agriculture	3,32	6,74	6,30	7,9
XXI-B—Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments ...	29	34	30	3
XXII—Receipts in aid of Superannuation	86	90	85	8
XXIII—Stationery and Printing...	1,00	93	90	9
XXV—Miscellaneous	7,08	6,38	7,43	7,4
XXIX—Irrigation—Major Works. — Direct Receipts—				
Civil	4	3	4	
Public Works ...	1,35,69	1,40,75	1,37,00	1,46,0
Indirect Receipts—				
Portion of Land Revenue due to Irrigation.	58,39	65,25	66,50	68,0
XXX—Irrigation—Minor Works and Navigation. — Civil	24	18	3	
Public Works	1,02	85	1,19	1,3
XXXI—Civil Works ... — Civil	1,44	1,52	1,68	1,4
Public Works... ...	2,32	2,25	2,40	2,4
Transfers between Imperial and Provincial (*vide* Appendix A).	47,21	34,77	45,11	27,1
Total Provincial Revenue and Receipts ...	5,50,30	5,50,01	5,60,81	5,88,3
Grand Total ...	6,73,05	7,39,79	7,55,33	8,14,3

of the Punjab for the year 1919-20.

of rupees.)

No.	Heads of account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
	Provincial Expenditure.				
1.	Refunds and Drawbacks ...	1,24	98	1,16	1,29
2.	Assignments and Compensations ...	34	37	35	35
3.	Land Revenue ...	46,59	55,45	50,65	54,75
6.	Stamps ...	93	1,02	93	99
7.	Excise ...	1,18	1,30	1,19	1,48
10.	Income Tax ...	16	41	31	54
11.	Forest ...	11,58	15,72	18,92	26,15
12.	Registration ...	1,27	1,30	1,34	1,37
13.	Interest on Ordinary Debt ...	1,93	2,04	2,67	2,26
18.	General Administration ...	12,40	12,87	12,54	12,63
19-A.	Law and Justice—Courts of Law ...	44,48	47,14	45,81	48,18
19-B.	Law and Justice—Jails ...	19,44	20,44	21,72	20,45
20.	Police ...	66,22	69,40	70,08	72,33
22.	Education ...	44,47	54,77	53,42	60,44
24-A.	Medical ...	9,26	11,57	11,11	17,84
24-B.	Sanitation ...	9,81	8,18	7,79	10,64
26-A.	Agriculture ...	13,63	18,54	17,60	26,87
26-B.	Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments ...	1,40	1,57	1,71	2,07
29.	Superannuation Allowances and Pensions ...	25,78	27,20	26,04	27,11
30.	Stationery and Printing ...	7,10	8,15	7,90	8,96
32.	Miscellaneous ...	15,20	20,94	20,29	24,72
33.	Famine Relief ...	1	1,50	75	1,00
42.	Irrigation—Major Works { Working Expenses— Civil ...	...	...	1	...
	Public Works ...	52,11	53,27	52,00	52,64
	Interest on debt ...	37,42	36,07	37,76	38,08
43.	Minor Works and Navigation { Civil ...	37	45	30	29
	Public Works ...	2,96	1,50	3,47	3,95
45.	Civil Works { Civil ...	4,33	9,10	6,76	13,60
	Public Works ...	40,89	67,29	55,00	71,38
	Total Expenditure ...	4,76,53	5,42,61	5,31,98	6,02,28
	Closing balance	1,94,52	1,91,18	2,23,35	2,09,57
	Grand Total ...	6,73,05	7,33,79	7,55,33	8,11,85

Transfers between Imperial and Provincial Revenues.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

	Accounts, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Bget, 1919-20.
TRANSFERS FROM IMPERIAL TO PROVINCIAL—				
Recurring—				
(1) Fixed adjusting entry	4,86	4,86	4,86	4,86
(2) In connection with the surrender by the Local Government of Rs. 1 crore out of the Provincial balances.	3,50	3,50	3,50	3,50
(3) On account of the Imperial share of the sale-proceeds of sites for shops and residences in towns in the Punjab.	1,76	1,86	2,28	1,41
(4) For education	8,38	10,38	10,38	10,38
(5) For maintenance and equipment of science laboratories of the Islamia College, Lahore.	30	30	30	30
(6) For University	35	35	35	35
(7) For a grant to the Lawrence Military Asylum, Sanawar	40	40	40	40
(8) For the Lawrence Memorial School, Murree	12	12	12	12
(9) For the improvement of pay and training of teachers	1,75	1,75	1,75	1,75
(10) For Government Training Class at Sanawar	...	...	...	25
(11) For sanitation	4,00	4,00	4,00	4,00
(12) For the improvement of the sanitary services	22	22	22	22
(13) In connection with remission of appropriations from cesses ...	2,08	2,08	2,08	2,08
(14) To compensate Provincial revenues for the loss of income from the recovery in stamps of fees for the inspection of records.	10	10	10	10
(15) For remission of certain recoveries from local bodies	3,04	3,04	3,04	3,04
(16) For relieving municipalities of police charges	5,22	5,22	5,22	5,22
(17) To meet the expenditure for the grants of Rs. 100 per annum each to the holders of titles of Mahamahopadhyaya and Shams-ul-Ulma.	1	1	1	1
(18) Provincialisation of the salaries of officers of the Civil Veterinary Department and of the charges of the Camel Specialist.	1,00	1,00	1,00	1,00
(19) In connection with the creation of the new Province of Delhi ...	13	13	13	13
(20) In connection with the scheme for the import of charas and bhang in bond from the Punjab into Delhi.	13	13	13	13
(21) On account of payments to be made to Chiefs of Keonthal and Koti ...	2	29	2	29
	37,37	39,34	39,84	39,34
Non-recurring—				
(22) Share out of the profit from the wheat scheme	11,70	...	...	...
(23) On account of the Imperial share of the contribution to the Walker Hospital, Simla.	6	6	6	...
(24) For archæological expenditure	5	...	6	...
(25) For a grant to the Khalsa College, Amritsar	...	...	1,50	...
(26) To bring the net Provincial revenue from Irrigation to 41 lakhs ...	...	...	...	...
(27) Towards the construction of buildings for Government training class at Sanawar.	50	50	50	...
(28) To meet non-recurring expenditure in connection with the provincialisation of the appointment of Camel Specialist at Sohawa.	6	...	...	...
(29) For agricultural Education	...	...	4,69	...
(30) Towards Bemloe Estate Sewage scheme, Simla	40	...	...	...
(31) For stipends to students to undergo training in pottery and paper manufacture.	...	1	2	...
(32) For Sanitary grants to Amritsar and Rawalpindi municipalities ...	80	...	...	...
(33) For Carpentry School, Jullundur	...	...	1,50	...
(34) For Punjab Publicity Board	...	...	1,70	...
(35) Towards the cost of Director of Civil Supplies, Punjab ...	...	...	28	24
	13,57	57	10,81	24
Total Transfers from Imperial to Provincial ...	50,94	39,81	50,15	39,58
TRANSFERS FROM PROVINCIAL TO IMPERIAL—				
Recurring—				
(36) On account of change in classification of the charges of P. W. Section of the Account Office.	23	23	23	23
(37) On account of the Provincial share of the enhanced receipts from excise.	55	55	55	55
(38) On account of the Provincial share of the enhanced receipts from Income-tax.	2,43	3,75	3,75	10,74
(39) On account of cost of treasure guards (police or barkandaz) employed in the Public Works Department.	52	51	51	51
Total transfers from Provincial to Imperial ...	3,73	5,04	5,04	12,03
NET TRANSFERS FROM IMPERIAL TO PROVINCIAL ...	47,21	34,77	45,11	27,55

Memorandum by the Finance Member.

Part I.

1. The first part of this memorandum which, in consequence of the changes in procedure detailed in *Punjab Gazette* Notification No. 1075, dated the 13th January 1919, is based on the provisional orders of the Government of India on the second edition, deals with the general financial position of the Province in the current and ensuing years. The second part which has, as usual, been prepared by the Under-Secretary, Finance (Mr. Badenoch) explains the estimates of revenue and expenditure under the different major heads as well as any important variations under minor heads.

2. The following table affords a general view of the position :—

(Figures in thousands of rupees).

	1917-18.		1918-19.		1919-20.
	Revised.	Actuals.	Budget.	Revised.	Budget.
Opening balance	1,22,75	1,22,75	1,89,78	1,94,52	2,28,85
Revenue	5,46,86	5,50,80	5,50,01	5,60,81	5,88,50
Expenditure	4,79,83	4,78,53	5,48,61	5,81,98	6,02,28
Closing balance	1,89,78	1,94,52	1,91,18	2,28,85	2,09,57

It will be observed that while the revised estimate of expenditure in 1917-18 approximated fairly closely to the actual figures there was a difference of 3½ lakhs on the receipt side. The latter is accounted for by a reduction, when the more detailed figures became available, of 1½ lakhs in the share payable by transfer to the Government of India in connection with the enhanced proceeds from Income-tax, an unexpected improvement of 1½ lakhs under the head Forest and smaller increases under the heads Income-tax, Law and Justice, Jails and Miscellaneous, partly counterbalanced by slightly diminished returns under the heads Law and Justice,—Courts of Law, Agriculture and Irrigation Major Works, Direct Receipts. On the expenditure side the difference was chiefly due to the failure to complete the full programme allowed for under the head 45—Civil Works—Public Works.

Revised Estimates.

3. The current year has not passed without financial anxieties. The failure of the rains and consequent loss of a large part of the kharif harvest has led to a serious diminution in the receipts of ordinary revenue while the continued high prices of food-grains have involved much greater expenditure than had been anticipated on account of grain compensation allowance. Moreover, during the course of the year it was found necessary to sanction a special war allowance to Government servants drawing Rs. 50 or less per mensem. At one time indeed it appeared probable that an application would have to be made to the Government of India for permission to indent on the provincial balances. However, thanks to unexpected and substantial betterments under certain of the other minor land revenue heads and a large surplus under the excise head, our receipts, exclusive of transfers, are expected to be above the estimated figure by about half-a-lakh ; while owing partly to large savings in establishment but mainly to the careful compliance by the Public Works Department with the instructions of the Government of India that the sanctioned budget expenditure should be as far as possible restricted, the total on the expenditure

side should fall short of anticipation by some 16½ lakhs. Including the 4¾ lakhs improvement in the opening balance, the closing balance of the year is now expected to be over 32 lakhs above the estimate. Allowance must, however, be made for the extra sums received by transfer from the Government of India and the net result on the year's working so far as can be seen at present will not exceed on purely provincial figures the sum of 18 to 20 lakhs. Taking into consideration all the factors, adverse and otherwise, this result must be regarded as highly satisfactory.

4. It may again be asserted with some confidence that the war has exercised no unfavourable influence on the provincial receipts. In fact on this side of the account the effect would appear to be exactly the reverse. The only doubtful case occurs under the head Stamps. Even in this case, however, it would be rash to attribute the decrease to the war. By far the largest drop in monthly receipts occurred in the month of November and it would seem more probable that this decrease was due to the widespread epidemic of influenza rather than to the fact that the armistice had been signed. The diminution, it is interesting to note, is confined almost entirely to the minor head Court Fee Stamps. On the other hand the extremely useful surplus anticipated under V—Excise probably reflects the almost entire cessation of supplies from abroad owing to the war rather than any absolute increase in the drinking habits of the population. Moreover, the expansion under IX—Forest would almost certainly have been greater had hostilities not come to an end. The decreases under I—Land Revenue and XXIX—Irrigation—Major Works are of course entirely due to climatic conditions.

5. As regards expenditure, several of the factors detailed in paragraph 4 of last year's memorandum continue to affect the figures. There are considerable savings on salaries owing to the absence of many officers on military duty. In addition the Buildings and Roads Branch of the Public Works Department were compelled for the reasons already given to modify very materially their programme of original works. All departments indeed were asked to maintain the policy of strict economy, but the high range of prices in respect of food-gains involving a very large increase in the amounts spent on grain compensation allowance has contrived in many cases to obscure the results. Moreover, in view of the enhanced cost of living it was felt that well-founded proposals to improve the pay of suborbinate establishments should not be delayed. Consequently had it not been for the large decreases under 45—Civil Works—Public Works and 3—Land Revenue there is every probability that the expenditure would have reached, if not exceeded, the generous provision made in the budget. Under the head Education, for instance, the figure of the revised is expected to exceed by nearly 9 lakhs the actuals of the preceding year, while the heads Land Revenue, even despite the savings on Establishment, Jails, Police, Agriculture and Miscellaneous, all show increases of from 2½ to 5 lakhs. Under the Forest head the expenditure is expected to reach a total some 7½ lakhs above the figures of 1917-18 and even with the modified programme the Public Works Department, Buildings and Roads Branch, anticipate extra disbursements to the extent of over 8 lakhs as compared with the previous year.

6. The nett result of the year's working according to present expectations shows an increase in the balance of nearly 32¼ lakhs, a result which, as has been stated may on the whole be regarded as satisfactory in view of the various adverse conditions of the year. The figure of 32¼ lakhs, however, does not quite accurately represent the provincial surplus as several special grants were received from the Government of India during the course of the year which cannot be expended at once and therefore go to swell the balance. For instance, the non-recurring grants of Rs. 4,69,000 sanctioned for agricultural education and that of 1½ lakhs for the Carpentry School at Jullundur may be cited. Further, the enforced savings on establishment with the consequent loss in efficiency can hardly be regarded even as a temporary source of profit to the Province, while part of the revenue is, as has been frequently pointed out, essentially capital and should therefore be excluded from the calculation. But

even after making allowance for these factors and the depleted Buildings and Roads Branch programme it is gratifying to find that despite the failure of the monsoon the general financial position of this agricultural province has not really suffered.

7. A few details of the differences between the budget and the revised may be of interest. On the receipt side the changes are in the case of almost all the heads of minor dimensions and the only heads that seem to call for explanation are I—Land Revenue, IV - Stamps, V—Excise, XVI-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law, XXV—Miscellaneous and XXIX—Irrigation—Direct Receipts—Public Works.

8. The serious shortage of rain during the last monsoon amounting on the average to 51 per cent. has naturally adversely affected the figures of ordinary revenue and large suspensions have been found to be desirable despite the high prices obtainable for agricultural produce. In three districts alone—Gurgaon, Rohtak and Sialkot—a total of no less than 11 lakhs has been temporarily sacrificed. Fortunately the losses have been largely offset by unexpected improvements, amounting to nearly 3 lakhs in each case, under the minor heads Sale of Government Estates and Sale-proceeds of waste-lands, while the expansion of temporary cultivation has caused a betterment under the ordinary head Miscellaneous. Thus the figure eventually reached over the whole head shows a deficit of only 3½ lakhs (provincial share) which is much better than what might have been expected especially when allowance is made for the extra 1¼ lakhs added to the Indirect Receipts under XXIX Irrigation—Major Works.

9. It is somewhat difficult to account for the falling off under IV—Stamps—a head which despite the war had been rising steadily for the past few years from Rs. 27,19,000 in 1914-15 to 30 lakhs in 1917-18. The comparative decrease under this head amounted to over a lakh in November and as has already been suggested the cause may be found to be the influenza epidemic, but all through the year the figures have shown a tendency to fall below the previous year's figures. The diminution occurs almost exclusively under the minor head Sale of Court Fee Stamps, but the inter-connection between the sale of stamps and the general economic conditions of the year is not evident. At any rate it does not appear to be entirely due to the adverse agricultural situation in the latter part of the year as in the month of May when an excellent harvest had just been secured the receipts under this head were extremely poor.

10. The figures under V—Excise are somewhat startling and have quite exceeded budget expectation. Allowance was made for a substantial growth under this head in view of the presence of large bodies of troops in this province and the difficulty of obtaining supplies of the imported articles. But this allowance, though it appeared at the time to be generous, has proved quite inadequate and it is now anticipated that receipts will exceed the budget estimate by not less than 13 lakhs (provincial share 6½ lakhs). While the largest absolute increase should appear under Still-head Duty (country spirit) considerable additions are expected under the sub-heads Still-head Duty (foreign spirit) and Duty on Malt Liquors. These figures seem to indicate that money is plentiful and no doubt the high prices obtained for agricultural produce and the large remittances from abroad have enabled consumers of liquor to indulge freely in this luxury. The presence of large bodies of troops and the almost complete cessation of outside supplies must not be overlooked while it may be hoped that the efforts of the special agency by means of which a large number of stills have been captured have contributed to the result by the substitution of licit for illicit consumption.

11. In any case the excise figures do not appear to be influencing those under head XVI-A where the expected reduction in receipts is almost entirely due to a falling off in the aggregate of magisterial fines. No explanation has been furnished for the anticipated drop of half a-lakh as compared with last year's actuals under this sub-head, but presumably it may be taken as indicating a general diminution of the more petty forms of crime.

12. Under XXV—Miscellaneous the increase of one lakh is largely the result of the new copying agency system which is now in full working order, but in regard to which no reliable data were available at the time the budget was framed. The revised figures under XXIX—Irrigation, though frankly disappointing, compare not unfavourably with the past year's actuals. The set back is due partly to the excessive rains in the late autumn of 1917 which, on some canals, either prevented sowings or rendered the use of canal water unnecessary and partly to the failure of cotton crops on the Western Jumna Canal owing to the scanty monsoon.

13. Under transfers the large difference is accounted for by special grants for agricultural education, for the Publicity Board, for the Khalsa College and for the Carpentry School at Jullundur, while the Imperial share of the sale proceeds of sites which is assigned to this Province shows a betterment of nearly one lakh.

14. On the expenditure side the most important changes will be found under 3—Land Revenue, 11—Forest, 19-A and B—Law and Justice—Courts of Law and Jails, 22—Education, 24-A—Agriculture, 43—Minor Works and Navigation in charge of Public Works Officers and 45—Civil Works in charge of Public Works Officers. The improvement in the land revenue figure is partly nominal as the expenses of the Thal Survey have been debited to 43—Minor Works and Navigation Public Works and account for the increase of expenditure under that head. The postponement of the new Sheikhupura District and the non-utilisation of the allotment for the reorganisation of district office establishments together with savings on salaries explain the total now adopted.

15 The excess under the head Forest is caused partly by larger expenditure for the extraction of timber to meet military indents and partly by the large expansion of the Jallo Resin Factory both in regard to plant and buildings. A considerable increase in temporary cultivation has naturally led to correspondingly greater demands by the Irrigation Department on account of water rate.

16. The decrease under 19-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law is a result of savings on establishment charges and contingencies partially counterbalanced by improvements in the pay of menials and heavy expenditure on grain compensation allowance The allotment under Jails is expected to prove insufficient mainly owing to the high prices of raw materials and enhanced demands by the military authorities.

17. Under the Education head the extra grant of 3 lakhs to the Khalsa College will be counterbalanced by the inability to distribute fully the grant for the improvement of the training of teachers, by the lapse of the lump provision for the education of the children of soldiers who have fallen in the war and by the delay in the establishment of Carpentry School at Jullundur for which a special grant of $\frac{3}{4}$ lakhs, now increased to $1\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs, was sanctioned by the Government of India towards the end of October 1918. The betterment under Agriculture is due to the fact that the whole lump provision under the wheat profits grant will not be utilised, while the Bara Reclamation Scheme has not so far cost as much this year as was expected.

18. The increase under 43—Minor Works—Public Works and the decrease under 45—Civil Works—Public Works have already been explained. In the latter case the difference would have been even greater had the estimate for repairs not been considerably exceeded.

Budget.

19. While the cessation of hostilities has naturally eased to some extent the strain on the finances the period of demobilisation must still affect the position unfavourably, and caution had therefore to be exercised when preparing the budget. Permission was, however, obtained from the Government of India to draw to a limited extent on the accumulated balances for certain specified purpose, and effect has been given to this concession in the estimates for next year, thus enabling the expenditure to be distributed on generous lines. Receipts, too, have been framed in the hope that the coming monsoon will make up for the deficiencies of its predecessor and consequently in respect both of land revenue and of irrigation large improvements have been entered. The Forest figures are most sanguine while the very high prices obtained at the recent excise license auctions justify the further expansion even over the present year's exceptional figures. On the expenditure side very large allotment have been made to Education, Sanitation, Agriculture and Civil Works The budget as framed provides for a closing balance of Rs. 2,09,57,000 or 13¾ lakhs below the anticipated opening balance.

20. The land revenue estimates assume a good kharif harvest, recovery of a fair proportion of the current year's suspensions and an increased return from sales of waste lands. Excise figures are based partly on the results of the recent auctions and partly on the supposition that the process of demobilisation will be very gradual and that large stocks of the imported article will not for some time be available. Under income-tax the high estimate is due partly to the increasing prosperity of the Province coupled with the strengthening of the special assessing agency and the more searching methods of enquiry under the provisions of the new Act and partly to the fact that owing to delay consequent on the passing of the new Act the work of assessment this year has been retarded so that part of this year's assessment will probably not be realised before the commencement of the new financial year. The budget under the head XXI-A—Agriculture allows for more extensive seed operations. The high figure under XXIX—Irrigation anticipates a restoration of normal conditions on the old canals with further expansion on the triple canals. Excluding transfers the estimated income for 1919-20 is 561 lakhs as compared with a revised for this year of 516 lakhs, the actual improvement thus amounting to 45¼ lakhs. The figure, however, must be regarded as entirely contingent on a good monsoon.

21. Allowance has been made on the expenditure side for more normal conditions as regards establishment and it has been necessary to allot large sums under the various heads for payment of grain compensation allowance though it may be hoped that before many months have passed the general range of prices will more nearly approach normal. Under 3—Land Revenue the long-deferred projects for the new district of Sheikhupura and for the reorganisation of the district office establishment have again been included. The Forest head reflects the large expansion on the revenue side. 'New' expenditure to the extent of 2 lakhs is entered while there is an increase of 3½ lakhs under Conservancy and 37,000 under establishment. Under 19-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law, provision has been made for the conversion of the Chief Court into a High Court and for the revision of the process-serving establishment. Under Jails the probable lessening of military demands justifies a decrease in the amount allotted for the purchase of raw materials. The Police head includes extra provision for the reclamation of the criminal tribes. The Education figures comprise 2½ lakhs for the improvement of the pay and training of teachers, 2 lakhs as part of the five-year programme for the extension of primary Education by district boards and a further sum of 2 lakhs to assist these bodies in the erection of primary schools. Under Medical 1½ lakhs have been provided for grants towards the opening of new dispensaries and half-a-lakh has also been entered for travelling dispensaries. Other projects to which funds have been allotted under this head are the transfer of the Medical School to Amritsar, the extension of the Ludhiana School for Women and additions to the Punjab Lunatic Asylum. The Sanitation figure

includes a grant of 2 lakhs for Simla improvement according to the terms of the general scheme, while it is expected that the special departments for Plague and Malaria will again be at full strength. The greatly increased allotment under Agriculture is intended to cover a year of marked development. *Inter alia* 5 lakhs have been provided for seed operations, 2½ lakhs for the *bara* reclamation experiments and 2 lakhs for agricultural education. The Miscellaneous head is swollen by the Government reserve of 6 lakhs and 1 lakh has also been provided to assist local bodies which have opened cheap grain shops.

22. Under 45 —Civil Works in charge of Civil Officers large allotments amounting to 9 lakhs have been made for the improvement of communications, while 2½ lakhs are included for towns and notified areas in the colonies. The programme under 45—Civil Works in charge of Public Works Officers is very extensive and includes new bridges over the Chenab, the Phulku Nala and the Ghaggar River, the widening of the Leh bridge on the Rawalpindi-Murree Road, lump provisions for the buildings which are required for the new district of Sheikhupura and for the residences for officers at Lahore, while nearly 18 lakhs are ear-marked for works in progress and a further sum of some 10 lakhs for new departmental major and minor works.

23. Of the works in progress referred to in the preceding paragraph the most important are the following :—The construction of a road from Fateh Jang to Khaur and of the second section of the Larji-Mandi road; the bridging of the Tangri River and Umlah Nala on the Grand Trunk Road ; the erection of a new Government High and Normal School at Multan and Normal Schools at Ghakkar, Sargodha and Rohtak ; the building of hostels for the Government College, Lahore, and the High School of Karnal ; the completion of the new police lines at Amritsar ; and the provision of laboratories for the Chemical Examiner to Government, Punjab, and the Chief Malaria Medical Officer.

24 The year has been marked by considerable activity in financial matters, although apart from important questions connected with the Reforms Scheme the decisions arrived at are not perhaps of much public interest.

25. A change that will, it is hoped, meet with general acceptance is that relating to the rules of business in this Council, as detailed in Gazette Notification No. 1075, dated the 13th January 1919. The procedure as now revised permits of a discussion on the financial statement about the middle of March, thus enabling members to offer criticism before the budget has become crystalised. To enable this to be done this memorandum has to be prepared in accordance with the provisional orders of the Government of India on the second edition of the estimates. But this drawback is not of a serious nature though it involves some extra pressure on the Financial Branch at a very busy period.

26. In accordance with the wish expressed by one of the non-official members, an annual review of the accounts of our financial year is now published as soon as the final figures for March are received. The first review issued in December, and it would be interesting to know whether the extra work entailed by the production is justified by the interest taken in the information thus furnished.

27. A new minor head on the receipt side entitled "Receipts from Industrial Operations" has been opened, and Fishery Receipts which formerly constituted a minor head will now appear as a sub-head under this new minor head. Similarly on the expenditure side a new minor head "Development of Industries" has been approved under the major head 26-B and the minor head Fisheries has been reduced to the status of a sub head under this new minor head. The works on the bunds in the Gurgaon District have been classed as Public Works in charge of Public Works Officers and the accounts have been incorporated in the Irrigation Branch. Budget receipts will consequently henceforth be taken to the head XXX—Irrigation—Minor Works Public Works and expenditure to the head 43—Irrigation—Minor Works The bunds will, however, continue to be under the control of the Deputy Commissioner of Gurgaon who will be supplied with the necessary funds under the system laid down in paragraph 1460 (1) of the Public Works Department Code.

28. During the year the Government of India issued revised rules for distributing the expenditure incurred by the Public Works Department on establishment and tools and plant. *Inter alia* Local Governments have been empowered to fix percentages to be charged for works executed for local bodies and for contribution works. The percentage so fixed shall not be less than the average percentage borne by the cost of establishment to that of works during the previous five years and the audit officers are to be consulted before any decision is announced. Even so, the new system will allow considerable latitude in regard to the actual percentages to be charged though the necessary calculations may prove somewhat troublesome. *Per contra* the powers formerly enjoyed by Local Governments of waiving such departmental charge have been withdrawn as the exercise of these powers tended to falsify the accounts of the Public Works Department.

29. Certain delegations have been made empowering provincial governments to grant compensation to officers for the accidental loss of property in accordance with certain principles which have been laid down. Provincial governments may also delegate their powers to subordinate authorities under certain limitations.

30. The long pending question of Public Works Department accounts has at last approached a final settlement, and it is hoped that the new system will be introduced so as to govern the preparation of all the accounts of 1919-20.

31. Wher fixing the rates for road maintenance in connection with the consolidated grants for district boards considerable difficulty was experienced owing to the fact that no proper record of the expenditure on repairs had been maintained by the boards. To obviate this difficulty a simple system of road tables has been evolved in consultation with the Public Works Department and all boards have been asked to introduce the system with retrospective effect from 1st April 1917, so that more reliable data may be available when the grants are revised at the end of the five years period for which they have been sanctioned.

32. The procedure introduced tentatively under which, as explained in paragraph 30 of the memorandum for 1917, the local Accountant-General prepares the estimates in the case of all permanently sanctioned establishments thus relieving officers of this part of the budget preparation, has proved a success and has now been permanently approved by the Government of India.

33. In Financial Circular No. 12286, dated the 8th June 1918, revised instructions were issued regarding the reporting of defalcations and losses of public money, stamps, and opium, and also of losses of municipal or district board funds. Previous orders on the subject were passed under an edition of the Civil Account Code which has since been superseded. With a view to preventing possible mistakes in respect of the double countersignature of the same travelling allowance bill, orders have been passed enjoining *inter alia* the maintenance by countersigning officers of a register of all bills of which they have authorised payment.

34. In the hope of ensuring adequate disciplinary action without loss of time, the Comptroller-General suggested that the Accounts Officer should immediately report to the Financial Secretary all cases in which the action taken by the department concerned on irregularities brought to its notice was not considered sufficient. This Government has agreed to the proposal.

35. Certain orders which had been in force since 1891 requiring a Treasury Officer to refuse payment of contingent bills when an excess over the contract grant was thereby caused have been cancelled. The orders were not in keeping with Articles 161 and 162 of the Civil Account Code or the general principles of audit and accounts and really operated to conceal over-expenditure.

36. The rates of pay of several establishments have been revised during the course of the year and some further cases of the kind are now under consideration. With effect from 1st October 1918 a special graded war allowance was granted with the sanction of Government of India to all whole-time establishments drawing Rs. 50 or less per mensem while the addition of

Re. 1 per mensem has been sanctioned as a temporary measure to all chaprasis and menials drawing from Rs. 5 to Rs. 7 per mensem pending orders of the Secretary of State regarding the conversion of this allowance into an increase of pay.

Part II.

REVENUE.

I—Land Revenue.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Ordinary revenue	3,72,35	3,75,94	3,68,40	3,78,64
Sale of Government estates ...	7,41	5,01	7,93	6,65
Sale-proceeds of waste lands and redemption of land tax.	26,97	25,45	28,38	34,92
Assessment of alienated land less quit-rents—service commutations.	1,70	1,75	1,84	1,84
Rents, etc., of fisheries	12	13	12	13
Miscellaneous	10,06	9,87	11,96	11,35
Total ...	**4,18,61**	**4,18,15**	**4,13,63**	**4,33,53**
Deduct—Portion of land revenue due to Irrigation transferred to XXIX—Irrigation—Major Works.	1,06,79	1,30,50	1,33,00	1,36,16
Net total shared ...	**3,11,82**	**2,87,65**	**2,80,63**	**2,97,37**
Deduct—Imperial share—one-half ...	1,55,91	1,43,83	1,40,32	1,48,69
Provincial share—one-half ...	1,55,91	1,43,82	1,40,31	1,48,68

When the Estimates were presented to the Council last March there was every reason to frame the Budget on optimistic lines. The prospects of the coming rabi harvest were excellent. The prices, both of food-grains and fodder, were exceptionally favourable to the cultivator and it was probable that with a normal monsoon, the suspensions would not be above the average, while the collections of arrears would be well maintained. The estimate of an increase of nearly Rs. 3½ lakhs on the income of 1917-18 was therefore very conservative in view of these considerations and of the progressive enhancement of demand in various districts, and of the extension of canal irrigation. Hopes have been disappointed by the vagaries of an Indian climate. In consequence of the complete failure of the monsoon there was practically no kharif harvest on unirrigated lands. The improvement in rabi collections of nearly Rs. 4½ lakhs has been completely swept away by the large suspensions amounting in all to about 16 lakhs which the changed circumstances have necessitated and which in Gurgaon, Rohtak and Sialkot rise to a figure of Rs. 5,44,000, 3,49,000 and 2,28,000, respectively. What would have been a very decided improvement of nearly 6 lakhs in fluctuating has been largely discounted by *khazaba* remissions of Rs. 3,79,000 in Gujranwala due to damage from hail-storms and by minor decreases in other districts owing to the bad kharif. The Revised for ordinary revenue therefore is Rs. 12,14,000 less than anticipated.

In framing the estimates of revenue for 1919-20 collections have been based on the prospect of a normal monsoon. High prices are likely to continue and the large influx of money from those serving with the colours will make recovery quicker than otherwise might be expected. Suspensions in the rabi will be higher than normal, but a decided improvement is likely in kharif collections involving a payment of some arrears and in certain districts of enhanced demands. The bulk of the increase occurs under fixed collections although under fluctuating also allowance is made for an improvement of Rs. 2 lakhs which the extension of irrigation will bring in.

Under "Sale of Government Estates" again the receipts in Lyallpur have exceeded expectations. The March auctions in the Lower Bari Doab Colony will dispose of nearly 11,000 acres this year against 7,500 acres auctioned last year and the larger area affects the receipts of this year as well as those of the ensuing year. Under "Miscellaneous," "Fines and Forfeitures," and "Rent of land leased for a single year or harvest" show higher figures by Rs. 1,02,000 and Rs. 1,14,000 respectively, but as the increase in the first case is due to special causes it has not been carried forward into next year.

*IV—Stamps.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Sale of general stamps	19,12	19,30	19,50	19,50
Sale of court-fee stamps	38,32	39,45	36,46	38,48
Sale of plain paper to be used with court-fee stamps.	78	82	65	75
Duty on impressing documents ...	1,35	1,50	1,30	1,35
Fines and penalties	42	42	37	40
Miscellaneous	1	1	2	2
Total ...	**60,00**	**61,50**	**58,30**	**60,50**
Deduct—Imperial share—one-half ...	30,00	30,75	29,15	30,25
Provincial share one-half ...	30,00	30,75	29,15	30,25

*Not open to discussion

The general circumstances and stringency of the last few months of the war, which have given a temporary check to the course of development and growth of prosperity in the Punjab, account for the drop in the estimated receipts under this head. As the figures indicate, these conditions are reflected more in the stagnation of law-court business than in the sphere of ordinary commercial transactions. The actuals of the last two months show, however, a decided recovery, and it is expected that the improvement will be continued into next year.

V—Excise.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
License and distillery fees and duties for the sale of liquors and drugs.	75,42	79,78	91,63	97,31
Acreage on land cultivated with poppy ...	2	2	1	1
Transit duty on excise opium ...	8,75	10,29	11,50	11,70
Gain on sale-proceeds of excise opium ...	1,39	1,30	1,22	1,50
Fines, confiscations and miscellaneous ...	5	8	4	5
Total ...	**85,63**	**91,47**	**1,04,40**	**1,10,57**
Deduct—Imperial share—one-half ...	42,81	45,73	52,20	55,29
Provincial share—one-half ...	42,82	45,74	52,20	55,28

The phenomenal growth in the excise receipts serves to indicate that despite agricultural depression and a certain stagnation of business there is no lack of money in the Province. The year 1918-19 has not generally been so prosperous as the previous year, but an increase of nearly Rs. 13 lakhs is nevertheless displayed under a head which is quick to reflect the general condition of the people.

A considerable proportion of the higher receipts under the first minor head is due to the increased consumption of malt liquors by the large British garrison at present stationed in the Province. "Still-head duty," however, shows an increase of about 6 lakhs of rupees, license fees about Rs. 2 lakhs, sale-proceeds of excise, opium and other drugs about Rs. 1¼ lakhs. There is no doubt that the large remittances made by those serving with the colours in India or overseas have had an appreciable effect on the income.

The result of the auctions of licenses made in February shows a very large improvement of Rs. 17,28,000 on those of last year, so large indeed that some allowance must be made for speculative bids. Despite this however and even on a conservative estimate it is difficult to see how the income of 1919-20 can fall below the figure now adopted in the Budget. The increase would have been greater had not allowance been made for a certain falling off in the receipts from the duty on malt liquors.

*VI—Provincial Rates.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Rates and cesses on land	21	31	34	32

*Not open to discussion.

*VIII—Income-Tax.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Super Tax—Imperial	1,67	1,50	2,00	2,00
Income-tax	34,36	35,00	35,00	49,85
Deduct—Imperial share—one-half ...	17,18	17,50	17,50	24,93
Provincial share—one-half ...	17,18	17,50	17,50	24,92

*Not open to discussion.

A new stage in the history of income-tax administration was introduced by the Income-tax Act, VII of 1918, which came into force on 1st April last year and which re-constituted the whole law and procedure. In the current year also the Punjab Government extended the policy of utilising a specialised machinery to assess the tax, the collection of which has always presented peculiar difficulties in India. The result was what might logically have been expected; while the assessing agencies have brought to light enormous income hitherto untaxed and have therefore largely enhanced the demands, the disloca-

tion caused by the adoption of a new procedure has made it impossibe to collect all the dues before the close of the financial year. Although the demand will be well over Rs 40 lakhs the revised owing to these considerations has been adopted at the same figure as the budget. It must be understood that the income is stationary only in appearance and the percentage of increase would, other circumstances being equal, have exceeded even that of 1917-18.

The effect of these conditions is clearly displayed in the budget which includes very large outstandings from the current year amounting at least to Rs. 5 lakhs. Besides allowance has been made for normal growth, but in view of the doubtful agricultural prospects the estimate has been made with caution.

IX—Forest.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
I—Timber and other produce removed from the forests by Government agency.	9,36	14,41	12,68	26,79
II—Timber and other produce removed from the forests by consumers or purchasers.	8,69	6,19	6,97	6,00
III—Confiscated drift and waif wood ..	34	24	30	25
IV—Revenue from forests not managed by Government.	1	1	5	3
V—Miscellaneous	2,78	1,73	3,00	3,28
Total ...	21,18	22,58	23,00	36,35

The cessation of hostilities has caused some temporary dislocation in the Forest Department arrangements and the income would have been greater by six lakhs of rupees but for the cancellation of orders for fuel, turpentine and colophony placed by the Indian Munitions Board with the department, which has caused the receipts on departmentally worked forests to fall by Rs. 1,73,000. A slight improvement can, however, still be shown over the estimates made at this time last year and comprises an extra Rs. 78,000 under head II due to better prices obtained for standing trees in Kangra, increased sales to Messrs. Spedding & Co. in Kulu, the enhancement of the contract prices on grazing leases in the Thal Range rakhs and the increased browsing required by the Camel Corps in Jhelum. The improvement under head V (Rs. 1,27,00) is chiefly due to larger amounts recovered from temporary cultivation leases of irrigated plantations on account of land revenue and water rate, and to higher receipts expected for sales from the departmental grain godown maintained by Government for supply of food-grains to workmen employed on works in Bashahr.

No difficulty will be found in obtaining markets for turpentine and colophony in which commodities Jallo can compete with America throughout the East; and it is hoped that next year the machinery of the department will quickly be diverted to supplying the new demands, *e.g.*, for sleepers, which peace will make possible. The increase in the budget under head I is due chiefly to a large stock of timber from the 1918 launchings in Bashahr being expected to reach the sale depôts in 1919-20, more extensive sales of timber anticipated in Kangra, sale of fuel wood to be obtained from the clearing of Shahdara and Changa Manga, better prices for Changa Manga and Shahdara wood, rapid expansion of the resin industry and to the extension of departmental working in Multan Division.

X—Registration.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Fees for registering documents ...	2,92	2,95	2,73	2,85
Fees for copies of registered documents ...	67	69	63	66
Miscellaneous	22	20	24	24
Total	3,81	3,84	3,60	3,75

Uncertain agricultural prospects and stagnation of trade have reduced the receipts from registration this year, so that the budget, which followed fairly closely the actuals of 1917-18, is likely to prove too high by Rs. 24,000. Some recovery is expected next year, but not sufficient to bring the income up to that of the last financial year.

XII—Interest.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Interest on loans to municipal and other public corporations (excluding Presidency Corporations).	1,25	1,27	1,27	1,10
Interest on loans to land-holders and other notabilities.	1	1	5	9
Interest on advances to cultivators ...	1,09	1,09	1,08	1,08
Interest on advances to Co-operative Credit Societies.	7	7	4	7
Interest on miscellaneous loans and advances	5	4	5	4
Total ...	2,47	2,48	2,44	2,38

Although the amounts advanced to cultivators and to co-operative societies will be greater than was expected by 3 to 5 lakhs, the failure of the kharif and the poor rabi prospects will militate against large recoveries of interest. An allowance has, therefore, been made for a drop in receipts under this head.

Next year on the assumption of a normal monsoon we may hope that interest on loans to cultivators will be paid more promptly. On the other hand the higher rate of interest has debarred municipalities from taking loans freely during the past few years. As instalments of the old loans continue to be paid off, the amount of interest recovered is subject to a progressive decrease; with the return to normal conditions, however, a recovery may be anticipated in this minor head.

*XVI-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Sale-proceeds of unclaimed and escheated property.	23	22	24	24
Court fees realized in cash	6	7	6	6
General fees, fines, and forfeitures	5,17	5,88	4,65	5,05
Miscellaneous fees and fines	1,31	1,39	1,22	1,22
Miscellaneous	4	4	3	3
Total ...	6,81	7,60	6,20	6,60

*Not open to discussion.

Of the decrease of Rs. 1,40,000 by far the greater part (Rs. 1,23,000) appears against general fees, fines and forfeitures. It is difficult to say how far this is due to the general reduction of court cases, to the growing tendency of magistrates to inflict sentences of imprisonment or to the inability of convicted persons to pay a fine. On the return of normal conditions and of soldiers from the army next year we may expect some rise in the receipts.

XVI-B—Law and Justice—Jails.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Jails	89	66	1,02	72
Jail manufactures...	5,88	5,30	5,84	5,50
Total ...	6,77	5,96	6,86	6,22

Jail labour has played a notable part in assisting the Province to meet the large demands which the army and war conditions have imposed upon it. The Camp Jails at Dhariwal and at Khewra have been continued throughout the year and jail labour at the Ferozepore and Rawalpindi arsenals has proved of great assistance to the military authorities. To the payments for these establishments the increase of Rs. 36,000 under Jails is mainly due, while the almost insatiable army demand for blankets and the high prices of wool account for the augmentation by Rs. 54,000 of the income from jail manufactures.

The budget has presented peculiar difficulties as the large jails income has depended so much on war conditions. Since however the demand for army blankets must continue until demobilisation is further advanced and since there is a probability that the camp jails will remain open for a considerable part of the ensuing year a figure, only Rs. 64,000, below the revised has been adopted.

XVII—Police.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Police supplied to public departments, private companies and persons.	1,45	99	1,49	1,55
Cash receipts under the Arms Act ...	...	1	...	...
Fees, fines and forfeitures	51	48	26	27
Superannuation receipts	2	1	2	2
Miscellaneous	29	27	36	27
Total ...	2,27	1,76	2,13	2,11

Under the first minor head the establishment of a large punitive police post in Shahpur and Gujranwala account for the increase in the current year, while the sale of tents to the Military Department has inflated receipts under Miscellaneous. The deterioration of receipts under fees, fines and forfeitures is due mainly to the fact that the management of cattle-pounds has been handed over to local bodies who consequently benefit by the fines on stray cattle.

XIX—Education.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Fees, Government Colleges, General ...	66	75	67	80
Ditto ditto Professional ...	2	3	2	2
Fees, schools, general	3,86	3,88	3,84	3,90
Ditto special	11	10	10	10
Miscellaneous	60	64	61	64
Total ...	5,25	5,40	5,24	5,46

The numbers of scholars have shown a tendency to drop during the current year, particularly in the case of "Government Colleges—General," probably because hard times have compelled the middle and agricultural classes to economise on schooling. In the budget allowance has been made for a certain recovery and also for the fees from two new secondary colleges which it is hoped to open in the course of the ensuing year.

XX-A—Medical.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Medical School and College fees ...	27	24	66	67
Lunatic Asylum receipts	10	12	10	11
Medicines sold by Civil Surgeons ...	1	...	1	1
Miscellaneous	7	6	6	6
Total ...	45	42	75	75

The increase under this head is more apparent than real, since it is due to the addition of certain medical school and college funds which have not hitherto been credited to Government, and is counter-balanced by a corresponding addition on the expenditure side.

XX-B—Sanitation.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Sale-proceeds of vaccine lymphs ...	29	30	33	32
Ditto quinine packets ...	85	54	80	60
Ditto articles from Plague Disinfection Depôt.	4	8	5	4
Other receipts	9	4	18	13
Total ...	1,27	96	1,36	1,09

The receipts under this head depend on the state of public health during the year. The influenza epidemic stimulated the demand for quinine packets and the receipts have further been swollen by the unexpected addition of Rs. 26,000. In the budget allowance has been made for the continuance of the present high price of quinine.

XXI-A—Agriculture.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Agricultural receipts	1,78	5,26	4,47	6,40
Veterinary receipts	1,54	1,48	1,83	1,53
Total ...	3,32	6,74	6,30	7,93

Receipts under the first minor head depend in a large degree on the transactions connected with the purchase and sale of pure seed. In the budget an amount of Rs. 5 lakhs from the wheat profits grant was set aside mainly for this purpose, and recoveries to the extent of Rs. 4,25,000 were anticipated. In the current year the Director of Agriculture has actually drawn Rs. 3,97,000, partly for wheat and partly for cotton seed. The experience of 1917-18 has shown that while the whole amount utilised for the purchase of wheat seed may be expected to return in the same year, three fifths of the recoveries on cotton seed are deferred till the ensuing year. On this calculation the budget figure of Rs. 4,25,000 will be too large by Rs. 96,000. The income of the Agricultural College at Lyallpur has also been over-estimated by Rs. 2,000. On the other hand, the income from departmental farms and well-boring receipts has improved by Rs. 11,000 and Rs. 10,000, respectively, so that the net difference between the current year's budget and the revised is Rs. 79,000. The rise in veterinary receipts is due mainly to a big sale of cattle from the Hissar Farm to the Brazil Government.

In the budget the most important item—sale of seeds—largely determines the final figure. Again we are assuming that 5 lakhs will be required for this purpose and we anticipate that of this amount recoveries to the extent of Rs. 3,70,000 would be possible during the ensuing year. In addition arrears of Rs. 1,51,000 will be outstanding from this year, and of the total income of Rs. 6,40,000 under Agricultural receipts Rs. 5,21,000 will be due to the sale of seed. The other figures have been based on the revised, exceptional items having been excluded.

XXI-B—Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Examination fees	2	2	2	2
Fees for inspection of boilers	22	22	22	23
Receipts from Industrial operations ...	1	...	1	1
Miscellaneous	4	10	5	6
Total ...	29	34	30	32

The variation in this small head occurs under "Miscellaneous."

XXII—Receipts in aid of Superannuation, Retired and Compassionate Allowances.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Contributions for pensions and gratuities ...	86	90	85	85

The difference between the revised and budget calls for no detailed comment.

XXIII.—Stationery and Printing.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Sale of Gazettes and other publications	9	8	7	8
Other Press receipts	91	85	83	84
Total	1,00	93	90	92

XXV.—Miscellaneous.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
War Boards	...	...	40	50
Unclaimed deposits	1,14	95	1,13	1,09
Sale of old stores and materials ...	4	5	3	3
Sales of lands and houses	56	50	80	80
Fees for Government audit	10	11	12	12
Rents	9	8	8	9
Miscellaneous fees, fines and forfeitures ...	25	20	26	25
Miscellaneous	4,36	4,38	5,10	5,30
Percentage on capital cost of furniture supplied to high officers.	1	1	1	1
Total	7,05	6,38	7,43	7,43

Receipts under the minor head War Board are due to the activities of the Punjab Publicity Committee, the formation of which was not contemplated at this time last year. Budgetting in the case of unclaimed deposits and sales of lands and houses is somewhat of a speculation and we are fortunate to find that the under-estimate in one case was corrected by an over-estimate in the other. It was difficult accurately to reckon for the last budget the receipts under the new copying agency scheme as this had been introduced only a few months before the close of the financial year. The income is likely to exceed anticipations by Rs. 64,000. The budget has been framed on the basis of the revised except in the case of the copying agency where a certain allowance for growth has been made.

XXIX—Irrigation—Major Works.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Direct receipts—				
In charge of Civil Officers (owner's rate)	7	6	8	8
Imperial share—one-half	3	3	4	4
Provincial share—one-half	4	3	4	4
Direct receipts—				
In charge of Public Works Officers ...	**2,71,37**	**2,81,50**	**2,74,00**	**2,92,00**
Imperial share—one-half ...	1,35,68	1,40,75	1,37,00	1,46,00
Provincial share—one-half ...	1,35,69	1,40,75	1,37,00	1,46,00
Indirect receipts—				
Portion of Land Revenue due to Irrigation (transferred from I—Land Revenue).	**1,06,79**	**1,30,50**	**1,33,00**	**1,36,16**
Imperial share—one-half	53,40	65,25	66,50	68,08
Provincial share—one-half ...	53,39	65,25	66,50	68,08

As compared with the sanctioned budget the revised estimate shows a decrease of 7½ lakhs. It occurs chiefly on the Sirhind, Western Jumna, Lower Jhelum and Upper Chenab Canals where excessive rainfall at the beginning of last winter prevented early rabi sowings and consequently reduced the demand for canal water. The Western Jumna Canal was affected adversely during the current year as the cotton crops suffered somewhat severely owing to the failure of the monsoon. The decreases on these canals are however partly counterbalanced by increases on the Lower Chenab and Lower Bari Doab Canals. On the former owing to the failure of the monsoon the demand for canal water has been unusually keen and the area irrigated during the kharif was in consequence the best on record. On the latter the increase is due to the development of irrigation beyond the point which was thought possible at the time of framing the budget estimate. The increase in indirect receipts is due to the large areas irrigated on the Lower Chenab and Lower Bari Doab Canals, and but for the fact that the question of indirect revenue on the Upper Jhelum Canal was not settled in time to allow of credits being afforded during the current year, the difference would have been greater.

The budget has been framed on optimistic lines on the anticipation of normal conditions on the old canals and further expansion of irrigation on the triple canals, while in the case of indirect receipts the extra revenue is due chiefly to provision made for the credits expected from the Upper Jhelum Canal next year. The estimate would seem to be justified by the keenness of the demand for water during the present rabi.

XXX—Irrigation—Minor Works and Navigation.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
In charge of Civil Officers	24	18	3	3
In charge of Public Works Officers ..	1,02	85	1,19	1,80

The difference between the revised estimate and the sanctioned budget is due both in the case of works in charge of civil officers and of works in charge of public works officers to the transfer of the Gurgaon bunds from the control of district officers to that of the Irrigation Branch. The income under the second minor head has been increased also by larger receipts expected from the Namal dam. In the budget additional revenue is expected from the Shahpur Inundation Canal where the receipts in the current year have been below normal.

XXXI—Civil Works.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
In charge of Civil Officers ..	1,44	1,52	1,68	1,49
In charge of Public Works Officers ..	2,32	2,25	2,40	2,40

Transfers between Imperial and Provincial.

(Figures in thousands of rupees)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19	Budget, 1919-20.
Net contribution from Imperial to Provincial (Details in Appendix A to Financial Statement.)	**47,21**	**34,77**	**45,11**	**27,55**

In the case of recurring assignments from Imperial to Provincial revenues the only variations occur in the credit of the Provincial share of sale-proceeds of sites for shops and residences in towns in the Punjab, where there is a difference of Rs. 87,000 to the advantage of the Provincial revenues and in the adjustments incidental to the acquisition of certain areas of Koti and Keonthal States where the assignment falls below expectations by Rs. 27,000. There has, however, been this year a large increase in non-recurring assignments. A sum of Rs. 4,69,000 has been transferred to the Punjab Government to be utilised for the encouragement of agricultural education. Provincial revenues have also benefitted by an assignment of Rs. 1,50,000 for a carpentry school at Jullundur, Rs. 1,50,000 as the Imperial share of the non-recurring grant of Rs. 8 lakhs to the Khalsa College, Amritsar, Rs 1,70,000 towards the expenses of the Punjab Publicity Board and Rs. 28,000 to pay for the Director of Civil Supplies, Punjab.

In the budget a recurring assignment of Rs. 25,000 takes the place of the non-recurring contribution in connection with the Government Training Classes at Sanawar. The Imperial share of the increased receipts under the income-tax head accounts for a considerable increase in the transfer from Provincial to Imperial on account of the income due to the increased taxation imposed in 1916. The remaining differences between the budget and the revised are accounted for by the omission of the special assignments which the Punjab Government received during the current year.

EXPENDITURE.

1—Refunds and Drawbacks.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Refunds—Provincial	1,24	96	1,16	1,29

The allowance made for expansion in the income-tax refunds has proved to be insufficient by Rs. 40,000 in view of the very important part played by refund in the new income-tax administration. This increase is partly counterbalanced by a drop of Rs. 8,000 in the case of excise refunds.

The budget includes an item of Rs. 23,000 on account of refunds of land revenue to certain jagirdars of the Lahore District. Allowance for further expansion in the case of income-tax refunds has been made.

*2—Assignments and Compensations.

(Figures in thousands of rupees)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Assignments and Compensations ...	34	37	35	35

*Not open to discussion.

3—Land Revenue.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Charges of district administration ...	23,67	27,96	25,17	29,49
Survey and Settlement	6,59	10,59	7,46	7,26
Land records	16,18	16,77	17,89	17,87
Allowances to district and village officers ...	12	10	10	10
Management of Government estates ...	3	3	3	3
Total ...	46,59	55,45	50,65	54,75

The delay in the receipt of sanctions from the Secretary of State to the formation of the new Sheikhupura District and to the introduction of the reorganisation scheme for district office establishments has made it impossible to proceed with either of these projects during the current year and the sums of Rs. 1,33,000 and Rs. ,00,000 provided for these purposes have therefore not been utilised. Rs. 1,00,000 included in the sanctioned budget for increase of pay to menial establishment will be expended under this head to the extent of Rs. 25,000 only. The remainder of the savings occur in salaries under general

establishment, particularly in the case of Assistant Commissioners, many more of whom joined the army during the current year. These causes contribute to a saving of Rs. 3,89,000 which is partly counterbalanced by the payment of war allowance (Rs. 22,000), larger expenditure under compensation for dearness of provisions (Rs. 47,000) and by the refund of Rs. 53,000 in connection with the Hissar Treasury frauds. Under survey and settlement most of the reduction is nominal, charges of Rs. 2,54,000 on account of the Thal Survey having been recorded in the accounts under "43—Minor Works and Navigation in charge of Public Works Officers." On the other hand savings (Rs. 25,000) have been affected owing to the postponement of settlement operations at Montgomery. The balance of the decrease under this head is due chiefly to the speedy progress of the Ambala and Dera Ghazi Khan settlements. War allowance and high charges on account of grain compensation allowance are responsible for the rise in expenditure under land records.

In the budget for next year under the first minor head provision for the following schemes has been included :—

	Rs.
(1) Reorganisation of district office establishment	1,27,000
(2) Establishment and contingencies for the new Sheikhupura District	1,33,000
(3) Preventive measures to arrest denudation of the Siwaliks in Ambala and Hoshiarpur ...	1,50,000

the balance of the increase over the revised estimates being due to larger expenditure under salaries and war allowance. The decrease under survey and settlement is mainly due to the progress made in the various settlements and to the possibility of reducing establishments. Lump provisions of Rs. 32,000 and Rs. 50,000 have been entered for the Sirsa and Montgomery Settlements which are expected to begin next year.

6—Stamps.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Superintendence	31	41	31	36
Charges for the sale of general stamps ..	75	75	74	75
Charges on the sale of court-fee stamps ...	27	29	27	30
Discount on plain paper	5	5	5	5
Stamp paper supplied from Central stores ..	48	53	49	52
Total ...	**1,86**	**2,03**	**1,86**	**1,98**
Deduct—Imperial share—one-half ...	93	1,01	93	99
Provincial share—one-half	93	1,02	93	99

The largest individual savings under this head occur in the case of contract contingencies (Rs. 9,000), discount on sale of general stamps (Rs. 2,000) and stamp paper supplied from central stores (Rs. 4,000). The increase of Rs. 12,000 in the budget is due to a number of small variations under the several minor heads.

7—Excise.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
District executive establishments ...	2,02	2,24	2,03	2,58
Distilleries	33	36	36	38
Total ...	**2,35**	**2,60**	**2,39**	**2,96**
Deduct—Imperial share—one-half ...	1,17	1,30	1,20	1,48
Provincial share—one-half	1,18	1,30	1,19	1,48

During the current year expenditure on the opium detective establishment will be about Rs. 12,000 less than was anticipated, while the provisions for contingencies and for the re-organisation of the excise preventive establishment will in neither case be fully utilised.

The Financial Commissioners have proposed to place the detective establishment on a permanent footing and to create a permanent staff and it is expected that this will cost Rs. 19,000 more during 1919-20. Contingencies have been raised by Rs. 12,000, particularly under rewards.

10—Income-Tax.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Collection of Income-tax	33	82	62	1,08
Deduct—Imperial share—one-half ...	17	41	31	54
Provincial share—one-half ...	16	41	31	54

The sanctioned budget included provision for four assessing units during the current year but partly owing to some delay in obtaining the provisional sanction of the Government of India, it was found impossible to organise the staff before July. There are therefore certain savings in the revised estimates of expenditure. Next year it is anticipated that six units will be employed throughout and provision has been made accordingly.

11—Forest.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
A—Conservancy and Works—				
I—Timber and other produce removed from the forests by Government agency.	3,90	6,85	7,76	12,18
II—Timber and other produce removed from the forests by consumers or purchasers.	4	6	4	4
III—Confiscated drift and waif wood ...	19	9	15	13
IV—Revenue from forests not managed by Government.	...	...	...	...
V—Rent of leased forests and payments to shareholders in forests managed by Government.	31	30	35	31
VI—Live and dead stock	31	47	45	67
VII—Communications and buildings ...	56	82	1,27	2,18
VIII—Demarcation, improvement, and extension of forests.	1,05	1,25	1,22	1,58
IX—Miscellaneous	47	65	2,25	2,82
Total Conservancy and Works ...	6,83	10,49	13,49	19,91
B—Establishment—				
I—Salaries	1,25	1,46	1,45	1,64
II—Establishments	2,19	2,29	2,32	2,88
III—Allowances	93	1,03	1,24	1,22
IV—Contingencies	38	45	42	50
Total Establishment ...	4,75	5,23	5,43	6,24
Total ...	11,58	15,72	18,92	26,15

The cessation of hostilities and the cancellation of Munitions Board orders for timber, firewood and resin came too late to prevent the Forest Department from incurring a very heavy expenditure against the original demands, and Government has had to provide larger sums than the circumstances might otherwise have justified. It is anticipated that Rs. 95,000 more than the budget grant will be spent in the Eastern Range on the extraction of firewood and on the resin industry. The construction of additional quarters and sheds at Jallo and of forest guards' quarters at Chichawatni are mainly responsible for the heavier expenditure (Rs. 44,800) on communications and buildings. In the Bashahr Division the department has found it necessary to make arrangements to feed the large gangs of workmen collected there and the transactions of the grain godown are now regularly brought to account on both the receipt and expenditure sides. In the case of the land in rakhs leased out for temporary cultivation debits for water-rate are in the first instance made against this head. The combined effect of these causes is to raise expenditure under Miscellaneous by Rs. 1,65,000. B—Establishment shows higher expenditure chiefly on account of War allowance (Rs. 6,800) and grain compensation allowance (Rs. 13,500).

Next year heavy charges, Rs. 3,91,000 in excess of the revised, will be incurred on floating and rafting the timber from Bashahr cut in 1918-19, and also on the resin industry. It is proposed to duplicate the plant at a cost of Rs. 75,000. The tram lines and rolling stock which have long been required for the proper exploitation of Changa Manga plantation and the motor lorries required for Rawalpindi will, it is hoped, be forthcoming next year and a provision of Rs. 85,000 has accordingly been made. These will facilitate economical working in the areas for which they are destined. The forest programme includes, besides several minor projects, *e.g.*, the erection in Kangra District of a plant for the production of pyroligneous acid for distillation of chir wood, the construction of forest roads and building of range and forest quarters, of which the aggregate cost will amount to Rs. 30,000. Savings on salaries and establishment will now be neither expected nor desired, so that expenditure based on existing sanctions is likely to be higher by Rs. 19,000 and Rs. 13,000 against each sub-head, respectively. Government has further submitted to the Secretary of State proposals both to increase subordinate staff and substantially to improve their pay and prospects. The additional cost of the scheme during the next financial year will be Rs. 43,500.

12—Registration.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
District charges	1,27	1,30	1,34	1,37

The small enhancements under this head are attributable to war allowance and larger payments of grain compensation allowance.

*13—Interest on Ordinary Debt.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Interest on Provincial Advance and Loan Account.	1,93	2,04	2,07	2,26

*Not open to discussion.

The estimates on interest are based on the forecasts of borrowings by the Provincial from the Imperial Government under the various classes of the provincial loan account. Takavi advances, both in the current and ensuing years, are expected to exceed the normal and with the easing of the financial situation municipal committees are now proposing to take up loans more freely. The interest charges therefore are expected to increase by Rs. 19,000 next year and will probably continue to grow in succeeding years.

18—General Administration.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Salary of the Lieutenant-Governor ...	96	96	96	96
Sumptuary allowance	6	6	6	6
Staff and household expenses of the Lieutenant-Governor	55	71	61	70
Expenditure from contract allowance ...	20	18	19	18
Tour expenses	33	50	45	45
Legislative Council	5	9	8	9
Civil Secretariat	3,72	4,01	3,80	3,82
Financial Commissioners	2,50	2,30	2,43	2,35
Commissioners	3,08	3,06	3,03	3,07
Civil office of account and audit ...	95	1,00	93	95
Total ...	12,40	12,87	12,54	12,63

It is probable that expenditure from the furniture allowance and tour funds of His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor will fall below the amount provided by over Rs. 7,000 and Rs. 5,000 respectively. Lump provisions of nearly Rs. 40,000 made for the revision of Secretariat Establishment and for leave allowance for clerks will be utilised to the extent of Rs. 13,600 only, although against these savings must be set off a small increase in salaries on account of privilege leave allowances. A higher expenditure in the Financial Commissioner's office occurs under "Establishment" owing to leave arrangements, and under contingencies—"Charges in connection with the auction of town sites." Salaries and travelling allowance in the case of the office of the Examiner of Local Funds will fall short of the sanctioned budget figure by Rs. 4,200 and Rs. 3,000 respectively.

The variations in the estimate for next year are too small to call for detailed notice. The most considerable of them, occurring under staff and household expenses of the Lieutenant-Governor, is due to the fact that provision has been made for the complete disbursement of the various allowances.

19-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Chief Court	4,88	5,12	5,40	6,09
Law Officers	3,18	3,18	3,11	3,16
Administrator-General and Official Trustee	2	2	3	3
Civil and Sessions Courts	16,64	18,21	17,40	18,39
Courts of Small Causes	53	52	52	54
Criminal Courts	18,21	19,09	18,45	18,97
Refunds	1,02	1,00	90	1,00
Total ...	44,48	47,14	45,81	48,18

The Chief Court has enjoyed the services of more than usual the number of Judges during the year, as the Liquidation Judge has continued to hold

office throughout and the period of the Inspection Judge has been extended to 31st March. The appointment of an Assistant Registrar and the payment of leave allowances have still further exaggerated the difference which would however have been greater had not the appointment rendered vacant by the death of the late Mr. Justice Shah Din remained unfilled for nearly two months.

In the sanctioned budget provisions of Rs. 30,000, Rs. 16,800 and Rs. 16,500 were made for the revision of process-service establishment, for making revenue records more accessible to litigants and for shorthand writers for district courts. In the first case the revision project has not yet materialised, in the second charges have been transferred to "3—Land Revenue" and in the third only half the Sessions Judges availed themselves of the privilege open to them. Other savings under Civil and Sessions Courts are anticipated under (1)—Salaries of District and Sessions Judges (Rs 23,600) due partly to officers at present on duty drawing lower rates of salaries than the budget provided for and partly to the discontinuance of exchange compensation allowance; (2) Subordinate Judges, due to the fact that certain appointments of Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioners were not filled up while the permanent incumbents were acting as District and Sessions Judges; (3) Munsifs (Rs. 11,400) and (4) Contingencies (Rs 26,200). These savings are, however, partly counter-balanced by the payment of war allowances (Rs. 17,000), increase in the pay of menials (Rs. 23,000) and a larger expenditure on account of compensation for dearness of food (Rs. 32,000). Reference has already been made to savings on salaries specially on Assistant Commissioners' salaries in discussing the land revenue estimates and the same reasons apply in the case of "Criminal Courts," which share these charges with "3—Land Revenue." Under Diet and Road-money to witnesses Rs. 17,500 less but under Grain compensation and War allowances Rs. 28,500 more than budget provision will be spent.

The Chief Court budget for 1919-20 shows the financial effect of the elevation of the Chief Court to the status of a High Court, a measure to which the sanction of the Secretary of State is daily expected. It is believed that the revision of the process-serving establishment will be completed during the next year and Rs. 75,000 have been set apart for this purpose. Rs. 10,600 have been entered for shorthand-writers, Rs. 7,000 for additional Extra Assistant Commissioners; and allowance under Civil and Sessions Courts has been made for increased expenditure on war allowance (Rs. 7,000), salaries of Sub-Judges (Rs. 9,600) and contingencies (Rs. 14,200). In the case of Criminal Courts the difference is made up by larger expenditure on salaries (Rs. 11,600) and Contingencies (Rs. 31,500).

19-B—Law and Justice—Jails.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Jails	15,14	16,68	17,33	16,88
Jail manufactures	4,29	3,76	4,39	3,57
Refunds	1	...	...	...
Total ...	19,44	20,44	21,72	20,45

Revised estimates for jails framed by the Accountant-General in consultation with the Local Government contemplated a small saving chiefly under central jails, contingencies, contract and countersigned, under lock-ups and under warder establishments, but the Government of India on the orders on the first edition and basing their calculation on the actuals of the first eight

months increased our forecast by one lakh. It is presumed that the Government of India expect the bulk of this increase under dietary charges owing to the prevailing high level of prices. The facts that the present jail population is small and that large stocks of food were accumulated during the early months of the year, while prices were lower, will, however, militate against the increase of expenditure in this direction. In the case of jail manufactures the activity of the Central Jail factories and the high prices of raw materials have compelled the authorities to overdraw their account.

The end of the war has made it possible for officers of the Indian Medical Service to return to civil duty, and our estimates have been framed accordingly. A number of minor variations, too numerous to mention, occur under the various items of countersigned contingencies. A large reduction of Rs. 80,000 has been made in the case of jail manufactures owing to the certainty of the contraction of army demands.

20—Police.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Superintendence	1,85	1,85	2,24	2,06
District executive force	55,09	57,95	58,72	60,75
Special police	1,27	1,35	1,41	1,42
Railway police	5,00	5,03	4,91	5,10
Criminal Investigation Department ...	2,80	3,05	2,59	2,81
Cattle-pounds	13	16	6	4
Miscellaneous	7	9	9	9
Refunds	1	1	6	6
Total ..	66,22	69,49	70,08	72,33

The increased expenditure under this head may at first seem to be an unwelcome feature of the administrative and financial situation, but an examination of details will disclose the fact that the difference is due to general financial causes which have tended to push up charges under all heads. The following will show the balance of increases and decreases which give a net enhancement of Rs. 59,000 :—

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

			+ better. — worse.
Superintendence...	—39	Railway Police ...	+12
District Executive Force	—77	C. I. D. ...	+46
Special Police ...	— 6	Cattle-pounds ...	+10
Refunds ...	— 5		
Total	—127		+68

In the case of Superintendence the departure of officers on military duty and the depletion of the Police Force owing to recruitment for the police battalions, rendered necessary in the interests of closer control, the creation of two temporary appointments of Deputy-Inspectors-General whose salaries, establishments and contingencies have caused the expansion in this sub-head. A formidable excess of Rs. 3,36,000 under district executive force to which the payment of grain compensation and war allowances contribute Rs. 2,66,000,—the balance being due

to an under-estimate of the cost of railway warrants—has been reduced by economies to the extent of Rs. 1,89,000 under Police Force (Phillaur Training School), travelling allowances, contingencies and expenditure on the reclamation of criminal tribes. The increase in the case of special police is due in the main to higher payments of compensation for dearness of food and in the case of refunds to the refund of half clothing money formerly debited to the detailed head "Clothing." The sanctioned budget included a provision of Rs. 12,000 for extra police for Delhi Main and Sabzi Mandi stations which will not now be entertained, and despite the enhancements in grain compensation and war allowances and contingent charges there is likely to be a net reduction of Rs. 12,000 under "Railway Police." Savings on salaries, Rs. 16,000, partly owing to the transfer of an Assistant Superintendent of Police to the Railway Police, under Police Force (Rs. 9,000) and under "Rewards" (Rs. 10,000) and the non-utilisation of the lump provision for re-organisation, contribute to a sensible reduction in the case of Criminal Investigation Department; and as has already been explained the transfer of cattle-pounds to local bodies affects the accounts on both sides of the balance sheet.

The figures show that the largest contributor to the difference in the estimates for 1919-20 is the minor head "District Executive Force." For the reclamation of criminal tribes alone the grant in the budget has exceeded by Rs. 1,20,000 the forecast of the revised. Salaries, Police Force, travelling allowance, contingencies all have a share in the excess. Under the other minor heads heavier police force charges appear to be anticipated and in the case of Criminal Investigation Department Rs. 10,000 for rewards, which were omitted in the revised, are replaced in the budget. It must be remembered that throughout all the minor heads war allowance payments will be heavier than in the current year, that compensation for dearness of food will remain high and contingent expenditure must increase in order that some of the ground lost during the last few years may be regained.

22—Education.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
University	88	88	88	88
Direction	73	74	74	97
Inspection	3,40	3,55	3,41	3,57
Government Colleges, General... ...	1,82	1,90	1,86	2,65
Government Colleges, Professional ...	1,03	1,06	87	92
Government Schools, General	8,65	11,47	9,06	8,97
Government Schools, Special	3,41	6,68	4,06	7,67
Grants-in-aid	22,57	26,36	30,41	32,55
Scholarships	1,65	1,65	1,70	1,77
Miscellaneous	33	48	43	49
Refunds	...	...	...	...
Total ...	44,47	54,77	53,42	60,44

Economies on education have been enforced rather than planned. Under the minor heads Inspection and Government Colleges, Professional, the

causes which have operated during the past few years have again produced a reduction in salaries and allowances. It will be noted that the expenditure on Government Schools—General is Rs. 2,41,000 less than the budget and on Grants-in-aid is Rs. 4,05,000 more. Part of this difference is due to a book adjustment as the charges against the Government of India assignment of 2 lakhs for the encouragement of vernacular education have been recorded under the latter minor head. There is also included here a special grant of 3 lakhs to the Khalsa College at Amritsar, recently announced by the Lieutenant-Governor, towards which the Government of India have contributed an assignment of half the total amount. Very few applications for assistance have been made on behalf of the children of soldiers who have fallen in the war and the lump provision of Rs. 20,000 for this purpose remains practically untouched. It has been possible to disburse only Rs. 57,000 against the accumulations of the assignment for the improvement of pay and training of teachers, and the expenditure under Government Schools—Special has, therefore, fallen far short of the sanctioned grant.

In the estimates for 1919-20 the following are the most notable additions :—

(1) Building grants to local bodies for vernacular schools, Rs. 2,00,000.

(2) Grants to local bodies for vernacular education, Rs. 2,00,000. These provisions are made in accordance with the Government programme for the encouragement of vernacular education.

(3) The acquisition of land for and the establishment of two new secondary colleges, Rs. 89,000.

(4) The construction of a carpentry school at Jullundur, Rs. 75,000.

(5) Revision of the clerical staff of the Director of Public Instruction's office, Rs. 10,000.

(6) Revision of the staff of the Lawrence School, Ghora Gali, Rs. 9,000.

It is anticipated that throughout the minor heads sanctioned scales of salaries will next year be more fully worked up to and full provision has been made. The unspent balance of Rs. 2,32,000 of the assignment for improving the pay and training of teachers has again been entered.

24-A—Medical.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Medical establishment	3,44	3,62	3,51	4,81
Hospitals and dispensaries	2,33	3,60	3,33	5,77
Grants for medical purposes	5	5	5	8
Medical school and college	2,73	3,36	3,42	6,00
Lunatic asylum	65	87	73	1,09
Chemical Examiner	6	7	7	9
Refunds	...	...	...	...
Total ...	9,26	11,57	11,11	17,84

The revised has been adopted at a figure only Rs. 46,000 less than the budget, the following explanations accounting for the difference. Under "Medical Establishment" it occurs entirely under salaries and allowances and for the usual reasons. Under "Hospitals and Dispensaries" it is accounted for by the fact that only half of the lump provision of Rs. 60,000 for the Mayo and Albert Hospital has been utilised. In discussing a corresponding receipt head it was explained that the addition of Rs. 32,000 to both sides of the Medical School and College balance sheet was necessary on account of the funds not previously brought to account in Government books. Savings on salaries and on certain grants for the Medical College and the bacteriological laboratory, and an over-estimate of the amount payable to the Northern India School of Medicine for Women, Ludhiana, have reduced what might have been an inconvenient increase in this minor head. In the case of the lunatic asylum it has not been possible to acquire the land for which a provision of Rs. 23,500 was made in the sanctioned budget.

The ensuing year's estimates illustrate Government's readiness to pursue an extensive policy now that the cessation of hostilities has relaxed financial stringency. Budget for medical establishment was framed on what was then the chance and now is the certainty that Indian Medical Service officers would speedily return to duty. An additional allotment of Rs. 71,000 has been apportioned to salaries, while for establishment allotments have been made of Rs. 12,000, for the revision of the office of the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, and of Rs. 33,000 representing the cost to provincial revenues of proposals, now sanctioned, to increase the pay of Sub-Assistant Surgeons. A lump provision of Rs. 60,000 for the Mayo and Albert Hospital has again been included under "Hospitals and Dispensaries" and Rs. 1½ lakhs for new dispensaries have been entered against a single lakh of the current year, while an additional half lakh for itinerating dispensaries has been provided. A Genito Urinary Department will be added to the Mayo Hospital at the cost of Rs. 29,000. The balance of the excess in the case of hospitals and dispensaries is directly due to increases under salaries and establishments and to the necessity of repairing the depleted supplies of medicines. A further expenditure of Rs. 1,33,000 is contemplated in connection with the transfer of the Medical School to Amritsar and special grants of Rs. 1,40,000 for the Ludhiana Medical School for Women are proposed. A sum of Rs. 23,548 for the extension of the asylum has been entered in the estimates and new expenditure will include higher pay to this establishment in accordance with a recently sanctioned revision.

24-B—Sanitation.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Sanitation and Vaccination Establishment...	62	64	77	1,06
Grants for sanitary purposes	6,26	4,21	4,52	6,22
Expenses in connection with bubonic plague, malaria and epidemics.	2,68	3,08	2,26	3,14
Bacteriological laboratories and Pasteur Vaccine Institutes.	25	25	24	22
Refunds	...	...	...	...
Total ...	9,81	8,18	7,79	10,64

The budget for grants for sanitary purposes as sanctioned last year included 4 lakhs to be distributed by the Sanitary Board and Rs. 21,000 for other grants. Government paid from its own reserve an additional lakh towards the Simla Improvement Scheme. It is anticipated, however, that the grants drawn against the Sanitary Board's sanction will fall short of the total provided by about Rs. 70,000. The arid character of the climate during the

past year brings its compensation in a reduction in plague and in correspondingly lessened plague charges.

In the Sanitation budget also provision has been made for the return of Indian Medical Service officers and money has been found to pay for a revision scheme for the Sanitary Commissioner's office. Government intends to contribute next year, at the request of the Government of India, two lakhs towards the Simla Improvement Scheme. Generous provision has been made for the staffs of the special Malaria and Plague Departments.

26-A—AGRICULTURE.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

HEADS OF ACCOUNT.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Agriculture	7,53	11,87	11,18	19,44
Veterinary charges	5,14	5,41	5,26	5,72
Co-operative credit	96	1,26	1,16	1,71
Total ...	13,63	18,54	17,60	26,87

(*a*) *Agriculture.*—A sum of 5 lakhs was set apart for expenditure on schemes to be financed under the wheat profits account. In discussing the estimates under "XXI-A—Agriculture" it was pointed out that Rs. 3,97,000 had been spent on transactions in pure seed. It was intended to utilise the balance in the establishment of district board demonstration farms, but the schemes likely to materialise in the current year will compel the withdrawal of Rs. 65,000 only; Rs. 38,000 accordingly will remain unspent at the close of the year. It was anticipated that about Rs. 28,000 of the provision for reclamation of *bara* lands in the Lower Bari Doab Canal colony will be unutilised. Savings on establishments account for the remaining difference.

In a recent letter the Government of India suggested that for certain departments, *e.g.*, Forest, Education and Agriculture, financial restrictions might suitably be relaxed and a progressive policy initiated. In the case of all these departments Government has endorsed this programme of liberality and in the case of agriculture has placed a very largely increased grant at the disposal of Director. The following details will serve as an illustration:—

	Rs.
(1) Grant for operations in pure seed ...	5,00,000
(2) Re-grant of lapses from the wheat profits assignment and provision for miscellaneous schemes financed therefrom.	1,00,000
(3) Bara reclamation experiments in the Lower Bari Doab Colony.	2,56,000
(4) Lump provision from the Government of India grant for agricultural education.	2,00,000
(5) Installation of water supply plant at the Agriculture College.	40,000
(6) Serai for visitors at Gurdaspur Farm ...	41,000
(7) Machines and tools required for the new workshop of the Agricultural College.	25,000
(8) Agricultural show-shed at Sargodha ...	11,000

(*b*) *Veterinary charges.*—The difference here is due to comparatively unimportant variations under a number of detailed heads, particularly affecting salaries and contingencies. In the budget also salaries and contingencies largely account for the anticipated increase since there is full expectation that it will be possible to work up to the sanctioned scales.

(*c*) *Co-operative Credit*—It was expected that a projected revision of establishment would cost Rs. 22000 whereas the provision was utilised to

the extent of Rs. 5,000 only for contingencies. The Registrar has now informed Government that the work of his department has out-grown his present staff and additions costing Rs. 43,000 per annum have recently been sanctioned. Higher provision for travelling allowance has also been made in the budget and it is proposed to give a grant-in-aid of Rs. 6,000 to the Punjab Co-operative Union for expenditure on the agricultural training of the inspecting staff of Co-operative Societies.

26-B.- Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Provincial museums	10	10	11	12
Donation to Scientific Societies ...	1	1	1	1
Examinations	4	4	5	5
Gazetteers and statistical memoirs ...	1	2	1	2
Provincial statistics	11	12	12	11
Preservation and translation of ancient manuscripts.	...	...	...	...
Inspector of Factories	9	2	3	14
Registrar, Joint Stock Companies ...	32	35	38	41
Steam Boilers Inspection establishment ...	17	17	18	19
Development of Industries	44	72	52	76
Director of Civil Supplies	...	...	28	24
Miscellaneous	11	2	2	2
Refunds	...	...	...	...
Total ...	1,40	1,57	1,71	2,07

A glance at the figures will show that there are a number of unimportant changes under this major head. The variation from the final total is due to the debit of the charges on account of the Director of Civil Supplies, which are, it may be added, passed on to Imperial by means of an equivalent assignment which the Government of India allows to provincial revenues for this purpose. The Director has not been able to spend the whole of his allotment for the encouragement of industries.

It is expected that the Inspector of Factories who has been absent on military duty will shortly return to the Province and his salary will therefore next year be a charge against provincial revenues. The minor head development of industries includes Rs. 40,000 for encouragement of industries and Rs. 25,000 for fisheries. It is likely that the appointment of Director, Civil Supplies, will continue well into next year.

29—Superannuation Allowances and Pensions.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Commuted value of pensions	1,46	1,60	1,25	1,25
Superannuation and retired allowances ...	23,49	24,75	24,00	25,00
Compassionate allowances	40	45	39	47
Gratuities	37	34	32	33
Pensions for distinguished and meritorious services.	6	5	5	5
Refunds	....	1	3	1
Total ...	25,78	27,20	26,04	27,11

The expected growth in our pensionary liabilities has not been so great as was anticipated last year; for the future, however, provision must be made

for an increase in these non-effective charges. With the cessation of the attractions of war loans commutations of pensions show a tendency to lessen.

30—Stationery and Printing.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Stationery purchased in the country ...	1,19	1,24	1,29	1,28
Government Presses	2,04	2,63	2,28	2,92
Printing at private presses	23	34	30	33
Lithography	51	72	38	46
Stationery supplied from Central Stores ...	3,13	3,22	3,65	3,97
Refunds	...	...	...	...
Total ...	7,10	8,15	7,90	8,96

The real savings under this head are the result of economies in the composing and imposing branch of the Secretariat Press. The other changes under Stationery purchased in the country, Lithography, and Stationery supplied from Central Stores are the result of a discovery of the Director of Land Records that he could purchase his paper for patwaris and for patwari forms more cheaply through the Controller of Stationery than otherwise, and are therefore mere book adjustments from the one minor head to the other.

The variation in next year's estimates is, however, substantial both under Government Presses and under Stationery supplied from Central Stores. In the case of the former it occurs mainly under "Press" and "Supplies and Services" in connection with the Secretariat Press where, it is hoped, to instal some new machines. In the latter case the decision of the Financial Commissioners and of the Director of Land Records that it is cheaper to obtain paper for the copying agency and for patwaris from Central Stores will add considerably to the expenditure to be brought to account here, but will of course cause a corresponding reduction elsewhere, particularly under "3—Land Revenue." In the expectation that stationery will soon become more easily obtainable Government has dealt leniently with the indents submitted by local officers. The increase in the number of officers, *e.g.*, Director of Industries, Conservator, Western Range, &c., has not been without its effect.

32—Miscellaneous.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Rents, Rates and Taxes ...	3	3	3	3
Rewards for proficiency in Oriental languages and allowances to Language Examination Committees.	10	10	7	10
Donations for charitable purposes ...	3	15	1,07	1,15
Charges on account of European vagrants ...	2	3	2	3
Rewards for destruction of wild animals ...	2	3	2	3
Petty establishment	3,69	3,98	4,90	5,11
Irrecoverable temporary loans written off ...	2	...	1	1
Miscellaneous charges for treatment of patients at Pasteur Institute, Kasauli.	13	15	13	14
Contributions	10,66	10,52	10,44	10,99
Miscellaneous and unforeseen charges ...	56	5,83	1,44	6,76
Miscellaneous refunds	2	10	5	5
Annual stipends to holders of literary titles	1	1	1	1
Books and periodicals	...	1	...	...
War Board	...	...	2,10	...
Lump provision on account of new Travelling Allowance rules.	...	...	...	31
Total ..	15,20	20,94	20,29	24,72

As its description implies this major head includes such a conglomeration of minor heads repudiated by the more homogeneous major heads that it is difficult to enter into a detailed explanation of changes. It is possible only to indicate exceptional charges which have been brought to account here. The amount against "Donations for charitable purposes" includes a sum of one lakh which has been placed at the disposal of the Provincial Branch of the Imperial Relief Fund for distribution to municipalities which have opened shops for the sale of cheap provisions, &c. The heterogeneous items of "Petty establishment" are dominated by "Copying agency" and the increase from Rs. 3,51,000 to Rs. 4,50,000 thereunder has determined the ultimate variation in the minor head. Contributions have been made approximately in accordance with expectations, and unforeseen charges include one lakh for peace celebrations. Expenditure on Publicity has been recorded under War Boards.

Changes in the budget appear mainly under the minor head Miscellaneous and Unforeseen charges where for various reasons Government determined to hold a reserve of Rs. 6 lakhs instead of the usual five. It is intended again to contribute one lakh towards charitable relief by local bodies if the circumstances demand this measure, and "Donations for charitable purposes" are accordingly maintained at the figure shown. An additional development grant of Rs. 41,000 to the Jullundur Division will be allocated to the Kangra District Board for the improvement of the road from Palampur to Alampur.

33—Famine Relief.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Famine Relief	—4	6,00	3,00	4,00
Imperial share—three-fourths ...	—3	4,50	2,25	3,00
Provincial share—one-fourth ...	—1	1,50	75	1,00

Despite the fact that more than half the districts enjoy the privilege of concession rates for fodder surprisingly small debits against Government have been recorded in the Accountant-General's books to the end of January, the probable explanations being (*a*) the economies in transport secured by the fodder controller, (*b*) the continuation of military purchases which, however, ceased in January. Actuals indicate that three lakhs for the revised and four for the budget will be sufficient provision.

42—Irrigation—Major Works.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
Working expenses—In charge of Civil Officers—				
Owners' rate refunds	...	...	2	1
Imperial share—one-half ...	...	...	1	1
Provincial share—one-half ...	...	...	1	...
Working expenses—In charge of Public Works Officers—	1,04,22	1,06,55	1,04,00	1,05,28
Imperial share—one-half ...	52,11	53,28	52,00	52,64
Provincial share—one-half ...	52,11	53,27	52,00	52,64
Interest on debt*	74,84	72,14	75,52	76,17
Imperial share—one-half ...	37,42	36,07	37,76	38,09
Provincial share—one-half ...	37,42	36,07	37,76	38,08

*Not open to discussion.

(1) *Working Expenses.*—A year of scanty rainfall and low river levels is one of comparative security for the canal engineer, and apart from accidents expenditure on major works is likely to follow the course one would logically expect. The whole reserve of Rs. 1,85,000 at the disposal of the Chief Engineers for unforeseen works remains untouched; the postponement on account of labour difficulties of some smaller works also contributes to a saving of over four lakhs of rupees on "Extensions and Improvements." Receipts from sales of surplus tools to the Military Department have reduced expenditure on "Other items" to a figure, Rs. 56,000, below the budget. A portion of these savings has been utilised on "maintenance and repairs"; and establishment charges, owing to the development of irrigation on the triple canals, but chiefly owing to expenditure on War and Grain Compensation allowance, have risen by Rs. 1,38,000.

There is, however, a balance in our favour of Rs. 2,55,000.

In the estimates for 1919-20 there are certain readjustments which leave the total approximately the same. "Extensions and Improvements" and "Other Items" have been increased at the expense of "Maintenance and Repairs" and "Establishment,' although in the latter case sums of Rs. 10,000 have been entered for the re-organisation of the Provincial Clerical Establishment of the Irrigation Department and Rs. 18,000 towards additional peons for Zilladars.

(2) *Interest on debt.*—The current year is expected to add 16 lakhs and the ensuing year 24 lakhs to the total debt incurred on capital outlay which by the end of 1919-20 will, according to forecasts, amount to 21 crores, 96 lakhs. As has been explaimed in previous memoranda, the rate of interest is communicated during the financial year by the Comptroller-General, and this, though maintaining an unexpected downward tendency during the war, has recently begun to rise.

43—Irrigation—Minor Works and Navigation.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
In charge of Civil Officers	37	45	30	29
In charge of Public Works Officers ...	2,96	1,50	4,47	3,95

(*a*) *In charge of Civil Officers.*—The transfer of the Gurgaon Bunds to the Public Works portion of this head has still further diminished the expenditure controlled by Civil Officers, and has increased correspondingly that not under their control. Indeed in both Revised and Budget the provisions are almost confined to the Rs. 25,000 grant to the Ferozepore District Board for the Grey Canal which was not covered by the consolidated grant.

(*b*) *In charge of Public Works Officers.*—Apart from the change mentioned immediately above the whole difference here is due to the charges on account of the Thal Survey which have been transferred from the Land Revenue head. The same remark applies to the 1919-20 forecast.

45—Civil Works.

(Figures in thousands of rupees.)

Heads of Account.	Actuals, 1917-18.	Budget, 1918-19.	Revised, 1918-19.	Budget, 1919-20.
In charge of Civil Officers	4,38	9,10	8,76	13,60
In charge of Public Works Officers ...	46,89	67,29	55,00	71,30

(a) *In charge of Civil Officers.*—The changes in the revised estimates are few and unimportant. Three special contributions of Rs. 15,000 to the Municipal Committee, Montgomery, Rs. 10,700 to the Lahore Committee and Rs. 4,000 to the Simla Committee, all for special works, have caused some enhancement of "contributions to district boards and municipalities," but, on the other hand, economies on encamping-ground contingencies (Rs. 10,000), and the unwillingness of the Rana of Koti to accept a compensation of Rs 46,000 on account of the infringement of his territorial rights in one or two areas near Simla, have resulted in a net saving of Rs. 34,000.

Besides including larger grants for "Petty construction and repairs" and for payment to the North-Western Railway to compensate for the abolition of tolls on railway bridges the budget contains the following special provisions—

	Rs.
(1) Colony roads	4,00,000
(2) Towns and notified areas in colony tracts ...	2,50,000
(3) Recurring charges in the places mentioned immediately above.	8,900
(4) Grants for the improvement of metalled roads.	5,00,000

(b) *In charge of Public Works Officers.*—The departmental officers in charge of this minor head entertain somewhat sanguine expectations of the sums which they will be able to disburse before the close of the financial year, and it is very hard to persuade the Government of India to share their optimism. Thus while it was found necessary to place large additional grants at their disposal for repairs to roads, for gazetted officers' houses, and for the Chenab Bridge the actual progress of actuals was considered by the Provincial Finance Department to justify a reduction in the revised by Rs. 7 lakhs and by the Finance Department of the Government of India of a further five lakhs. These occur largely under original works and to a certain extent under establishment, while an increase of 2 lakhs is exhibited under "Repairs." Difficulties of transport, straitened supplies of coal, scarcity of labour, and depletion of the supervising staff—all contribute to make the present task of the Buildings and Roads Branch an extremely difficult one.

Next year it is hoped to make up some of the leeway sacrificed during the war, and the programme of special works has been considered by the Finance Committee. A considerable proportion of the expenditure is destined for the improvement of communications, a welcome feature of the programme being the construction of new road bridges over the Phulku Nallah and over the Chenab near Wazirabad. The total provision for new Major and Minor Works amounts to Rs. 9,85,000; Rs. 17,89,000 have been entered against works in progress, and Rs. 3,20,000 for works included in the current year's programme, but which it has been impossible to undertake. The total budget reaches the gigantic figure of over 81 lakhs, but Government proposes to make a lump deduction of 10 lakhs for probable lapses, in view of the unlikelihood of the Department's being able to complete the whole programme. In this way, while every financial facility is given to the department to undertake construction and expedite progress, Government avoids the disadvantage of locking up money which will probably remain unutilised.

Provincial Balances.

In the estimates which the Council passed last March it was assumed that at the opening of the current year, the Punjab Government would have a balance of Rs. 1,89,78,000 and at its close Rs. 1,91,18,000. The actual closing balance improved by Rs. 4,74,000 on the forecast. In the current year caution has been amply justified, and the province may congratulate itself that despite retardation in normal progress, and a deterioration in the general economic position which, as may be surmised from recent speeches by the Hon'ble the Finance Member in the Imperial Legislative Council, has affected

adversely the whole financial situation of India, the provincial finances have maintained their stability. The estimated closing balance will for reasons which have been explained in detail throughout the memorandum, show an improvement of Rs. 32,17,000 on the original forecast, although it must be noted that of this amount a large part (Rs. 18,15,000) is the provincial share of the proceeds from the sale of Government estates and waste lands which should properly be treated as capital.

The Provincial balance also includes the following unspent accumulations of Imperial assignments for special purposes :—

	Rs.
For general Education—	
Recurring	1,08,000
Non-recurring	2,00,000
For Agricultural Education—	
Non-recurring	4,69,000
For Sanitation—	
Recurring	2,43,000
Non-recurring	7,90,000
Wheat profits grant	5,46,000
Total ...	23,56,000

The sanction of the Government of India has been obtained to the adoption of a deficit budget for 1919-20. Expenditure is expected to exceed revenue by Rs. 13,78,000. It is hoped to reduce appreciably the unspent balances of assignments which are anticipated to amount to Rs. 14,74,000 at the close of 1919-20. With this deduction from the total closing balance of Rs. 2,09,57,000, an amount of Rs. 1,84,83,000 apart from the minimum balance of ten lakhs will still remain in the provincial coffers for the development of the province.

LAHORE: O. F. LUMSDEN,

The 7th March 1919. *Financial Secretary to Government, Punjab.*

APPENDIX.

Statement of re-appropriations exceeding Rs. 10,000 which have been sanctioned by the Local Government since the beginning of the financial year.

		Rs.
3—Land Revenue ...	To meet refunds of deposits in certain pre-emption cases in Hissar which were paid to men other than rightful payees.	53,000
11—Forests ...	Grant for ropeway for Bashahr Forests	15,000
Ditto ...	Grant to Conservators of Forests to meet anticipated increased expenditure	3,73,000
18—General Administration—Salary of the Lieutenant-Governor, etc.	Purchase of furniture for Government House, Lahore, and Barnes Court, Simla.	11,717
22—Education—Grants-in-aid.	Grant to the Khalsa College, Amritsar (Provincial share) ...	1,50,000
24-A—Medical—Medical School and College.	Additional grant to Medical School and College on account of the funds not previously brought to account in Government books.	32,000
24-B—Sanitation ...	Grant towards Simla Improvement Scheme	1,00,000
32—Miscellaneous ...	Additional grant for Copying Agency, Gujranwala	10,674
Ditto ...	Ditto ditto Ferozepore	18,200
Ditto ...	Additional grant for Copying Agency accounts	39,019
Ditto ...	Grant to Imperial Relief Fund for cheap grain shops	1,00,000
43—Minor Works—Navigation Public Works.	Grant for completion of surveys in connection with Bhakra Dam project.	14,500
45—Civil Works—Civil ...	Grant to Municipal Committee, Montgomery, for construction of roads in the mandi at that place.	15,000
Ditto ...	Grant to Municipal Committee, Lahore, for new roads and footpaths within boundaries of the Lahore Museum.	10,700
Ditto ...	Grant to the Municipal Committee, Simla, for construction of road from the United Service Club to the Christ Church.	20,000
45—Civil Works—Public Works.	Road bridge over the Chenab at Wazirabad to meet the debit for the work done by North-Western Railway.	75,000

NOTE.—Re-appropriations which are merely the result of an item of expenditure being debited to some head other than that under which budget provision had been made have been omitted

55 LR—200—7-4-19—SGPP Lahore.

Abstract of Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1915.

THE Council met at the Government House, Lahore, at 10-30 A.M., on Thursday, the 13th March 1919.

PRESENT :

His Honour Sir MICHAEL FRANCIS O'DWYER, G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.C.S., Lieutenant-Governor, *Presiding.*

The Hon'ble Mr. JOHN PERRONET THOMPSON, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. JAMES ALEXANDER RICHEY.

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar GOPAL SINGH.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja YUSAF SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. HERBERT JOHN MAYNARD, C.S.I., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. OSWALD FARQUHAR LUMSDEN, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar GAJJAN SINGH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri LAL CHAND, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad MEHDI SHAH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit JAWAHAR LAL, BHARGAVA.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur RAM SARN DAS, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Mr. FREDERICK CRIGHTON WALLER.

The Hon'ble Mr. FRANK WAVERLING WOODS.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur BAKHSHI SOHAN LAL.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada BHAGAT RAM.

The Hon'ble Sayad MAKHDUM RAJAN SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. CREWE ARMOND HAMILTON TOWNSEND, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. CHARLES JOSEPH HALLIFAX, C.B.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian FAZL-I-HUSSAIN.

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza MUHAMMAD IKRAM ULLAH KHAN.

The Hon'ble Mr. LEWIS FRENCH, C.I.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN.

The Hon'ble Colonel ROBERT CHARLES MACWATT, C.I.E., M.B., F.R.C.S., I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. THOMAS PETER ELLIS, I.C.S.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE.

(1) Answer to Question No. 49 asked by the Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh on the 6th February 1919.*

(2) **The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—**

"At the meeting on the 7th of March the Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan was informed by the Hon'ble Mr. French in reply to Question No. 2 put by him on that day that Government's information on the subject was not complete and enquiry was being made. An answer was promised when the inquiry was complete.

---

*See Appendix A.

"It now appears that license-holders are required to attend in person at headquarters when their licenses are to be renewed in six districts—Lahore, Gurdáspur, Gujránwála, Hissar, Jullundur and Ambála. In Ludhiána licensees are required to attend at the headquarters of their tahsils. In other districts attendance appears to be optional. There is nothing irregular in an order requiring personal attendance, and where the local authorities consider such attendance necessary the Lieutenant-Governor does not propose to interfere with their discretion. A copy of the Hon'ble Member's question and of this reply will, however, be sent to Commissioners for such action as they may consider necessary."

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Road between the Punjab plains and Thibet.

1. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not—

"(*a*) that the road between Jejon Railway Station in Hoshiárpur District to Mandi State is the main road for traffic between the Punjab plains and the hills extending as far as Thibet?

"(*b*) that the portion of the road which lies within the limits of British territory in Kángra and Hoshiárpur Districts is at present in some places in such a bad state of repair as to make it difficult and dangerous for use by a camel or pony or even by a foot passenger?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"It is probably incorrect to say that the road between Jejon Railway Station *viâ* Mandi and Largi is the main road from the plains of the Punjab to the hills extending as far as Thibet. The Hills and Thibet can be reached by the route mentioned, but there are other and better roads. For example, *viâ* Pathánkot-Kángra Valley, Mandi and Kulu; or by the Kálka-Simla Road and thence by the well known Hindustan-Thibet Road. Both these routes are kept up by Government, so far as the portions which lie within British territory are concerned, for the convenience of travellers.

"1 (*b*) Government has no direct knowledge of the condition of the road referred to by the Hon'ble Member, as the portions thereof which lie within British territory are not in charge of the Public Works Department. But the question will be brought to the notice of the Local Bodies concerned, which receive grants-in-aid from Government intended *inter alia* to assist them in maintaining communications."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Improvement of road between Kángra and Hoshiárpur Districts.

2. "If so, will Government be pleased to state whether there is any proposal under its consideration to have the portion of the road lying within the limits of Kángra and Hoshiárpur Districts improved and maintained as a cart road fit for wheeled traffic?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The reply to Question 1 (*a*) not being in the affirmative, Question 2 does not arise, but I may mention, for the information of the Hon'ble Member, that there is no proposal before Government for improving or maintaining the road mentioned as a cart road."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Improvement of road lying in British territory between Jullundur and Hoshiárpur Districts.

3. "Will Government be pleased to state whether in view of the increased traffic on this road due to the extension of the Railway in the Hoshiarpur and Jullundur Districts it is not opportune to metal that portion of the road which lies within the limits of British territory in those two Districts?"

[*Mr. Woods ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"As the object of the Hon'ble Member's question appears to be to ascertain what Government is doing to improve communications between the plains of the Punjab and the Hill States of Mandi, Suket, Biláspur and the Kulu Valley and thence to Lahaul and Thibet, I may mention that schemes are being investigated for making roads from Mandi to Suket, Bilaspur and thence to either Rúpar or *viâ* Nálaghar to Kálka. The routes have been inspected by an experienced Public Works Department officer, and the conclusions arrived at will, later on, be placed before Government for consideration.

"Government has also under consideration a road from Mandi to Largi, which will link up Mandi State with the Kulu Valley."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Damming of the Sutlej River in the Kángra District.

4. "Will Government be pleased to state —

"(*a*) whether the proposal of damming the Sutlej River in connection with the canal project by some sort of construction work within the limits of Kangra District is under consideration ? and, if so, when the work is expected to be started ?

"(*b*) whether it is correct or not that the damming of the river will deprive a large number of residents in the hills of Kángra and Hoshiárpur of their houses, land and other property ?

"(*c*) If so, whether having regard to the peculiar habits of the hill people and the climate to which they are accustomed, there is any proposal under consideration to arrange for the re-settlement in suitable localities in the hills of the persons who will be rendered homeless ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"(*a*). Reference is invited to the reply given on the 6th February 1919 to the similar question asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa.

"(*b*). and (*c*). The Bhakra Dam Project estimate has not yet been completed and consequently has not been considered by the Local Government. Due consideration will, however, be given by Government to the points brought to notice by the Hon'ble Member."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadar Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Insufficiency of Patwaris' pay.

5. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not—

"(*a*) that the grades of Patwaris' pay at Rs. 10, Rs. 12 andRs. 14 per mensem were fixed more than 30 years ago, and have not been revised during the last 30 years though the cost of living all round has increased and the prices of commodities and labour has risen so high that the salary is not now enough to maintain a married man ?

"(*b*) that heretofore Government has been providing the Patwari without any charge with a Patwarkana or a house for his office as well as for his lodging, but that this concession has recently been withdrawn ?

"(*c*) that the Patwaris have been representing to the authorities that the grades of the salaries be increased ?

"(*d*) that they submitted a memorial to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor for the same purpose ? "

6. "If so, will Government be pleased to state whether there is any proposal for consideration before it for raising salaries of Patwaris to such an extent as to enable them to maintain themselves and their families decently ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Hallifax replied :—

"The present grades of pay for Patwaris, Rs. 10, Rs. 12 and Rs. 14 per mensem were fixed in 1899 or 20 years ago.

"The present rules as regards Patwarkhanas are that a Patwari is required to make his own arrangements for housing himself and for providing a separate room for his records and office at some village within his circle. Where, however, special circumstances exist which make it impossible for a Patwari to provide himself with a residence a Patwarkana is built and provided free of cost to the Patwari on the condition that he keeps it in repair. These rules were issued in 1895, and no change has recently been made in them.

"A memorial from the Patwaris regarding increase in their pay was received in 1902, but, as stated in reply to part (*a*) of this question, new standard grades of pay had been sanctioned only in 1899, and no further action was then thought necessary. Since then no similar memorial has reached Government.

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to the reply given at the meeting of this Council on March 7th to Question No. 10 asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Upper Subordinate Service of the Public Works Department.

7. "With reference to the reply of the Hon'ble Mr. Holms to my Questions Nos. 15 and 15 in the meeting of this Council held on 6th February 1918, will Government be pleased to state its decision on the representation made by the members of the Upper Subordinate Service of the Punjab Public Works Department regarding the prejudicial effect on the prospects of senior men caused by the adoption of the revised scale of pay sanctioned in the reorganization scheme for that service ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to the reply given by the Hon'ble Mr. Holms to his Question 15 (*a*) in this Council on the 6th February 1918, wherein it was stated that no Upper Subordinate in the Irrigation Branch was getting less pay under the revised scale than he would have been getting under the previously authorised scale. The Government does not propose to make further alterations in the scheme of salaries of the Upper Subordinate Service, Public Works Department, pending the decision of the Government of India, on the recommendations made by the Public Services Commission and the Public Works Department Reorganization Committee."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Travelling allowance to Sub-Engineers.

8. "With reference to the reply of the Hon'ble Mr. Aikman to my Question No. 28, in the meeting of the Punjab Legislative Council held on the 24th April 1918, to the effect that the question of the grant of first class travelling allowance to Sub-Engineers would again be brought to the notice of the Government of India, will Government be pleased to state whether any such reference was made to Government of India after 24th April 1918 ; if so, whether a final decision has been arrived at ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"A reference to the Government of India was made in July 1918, and the Government of India replied that the question of the grant of travelling allowances to Sub-Engineers at rates admissible to Assistant Engineers had been

deferred pending consideration of the details of such reorganization of the establishment of the Department as may be decided on as the result of the recommendations made by the Public Services Commission and the Public Works Department Reorganization Committee"

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

9. "Will Government be pleased to state whether there are any and, if so, what age restrictions on the appointment of ladies to the Provincial and Subordinate Educational Services, and whether these restrictions are incorporated in the rules and regulations for such services?" Age restrictions upon appointment of ladies to Education Department.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"I will answer this question along with Question No. 33 which will be asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

10. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not that in the Irrigation Department, Revenue Divisions, a large number of temporary clerks, Sub-Overseers, Overseers and Draftsmen are entertained to supplement the permanent establishment?" Temporary establishment of Irrigation Department.

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The reply is in the affirmative."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

11. "If so, will Government be pleased to lay on the table of this Council a statement showing the number of such temporary employees who have been entertained for more than three years without being brought on to the permanent establishment?" Temporary establishment of Irrigation Department.

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The information is not at present available, owing to the shortness of notice of the question, but the facts will be ascertained and the figures tabulated at some future meeting of the Council."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

12. "Will Government be pleased to state whether there is any proposal to revise the schedules of permanent establishment for these classes so that they may have the prospect of being brought on to the permanent establishment with the benefit of leave and pension rules under the Civil Service Regulations?" Revision of Schedules of Establishment.

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The revision of the scale of the permanent clerical and draftsman establishments of the Irrigation Branch, Public Works Department, is under the consideration of Government.

"The revision of the scale of the Overseer and Sub-Overseer establishment is not at present contemplated."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

13. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct that in the Engineering School at Rasul appointments are given not in accordance with the order of merit of the candidates who pass the final examination, but with reference to communal and religious professions of such candidates." Mode of giving appointments to students from Engineering School Rasul.

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The Local Government aims at recruiting, for its own needs, from among the qualified candidates so as to secure, as far as possible, a distribution of appointments corresponding in some measure to the main religious divisions of the population of the Province, and with this object in view the passed students have been usually selected for permanent appointments in the proportion of $\frac{1}{2}$ or fewer Muhammadans, $\frac{1}{3}$ to $\frac{1}{4}$ Hindus and $\frac{1}{4}$ or fewer Sikhs."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Results in order of merits.

14. "If so, will Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the results according to the order of merit of the final examination of the Sub-Overseer Class during the last three years and the selections made by Government for appointment during the last three years?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The statement* called for by the Hon'ble Member is laid on the table. It will be seen that practically all the qualified candidates, not selected by Government, have received employment elsewhere."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Remuneration of Sub-Registrars.

15. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not whether the remuneration of Sub-Registrars, Departmental as well as honorary, was fixed more than 30 years ago? If so, is such remuneration unsuitable to present conditions under which the cost of living has so largely increased."

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"No change has occurred in the system of remuneration for Honorary Sub-Registrars since 1887. The system whereby Departmental Sub-Registrars receive generally a fixed monthly salary of Rs. 30 *plus* 15 per cent. of the income derived from registration fees was introduced in 1906, and as the amount received by them from fees rose from Rs. 34,344 in 1907 to Rs. 52,657 in 1917, Government does not consider the scale of remuneration unsuitable to present conditions."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Proposal to increase percentage of registration fee.

16. "Is there any proposal under the consideration of Government to increase the percentage of registration fees or the monthly salary payable to a Sub-Registrar under paragraphs 16 and 17 of the Registration Manual, and to defray the cost of stationery used as well as the wages of pankha coolies in the summer months and the cost of firewood in the winter months all of which are now paid by the Sub-Registrar out of his own pocket under paragraphs 44 and 46 of the Manual?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"No proposals are under the consideration of Government for raising the salary or the percentage of registration fees payable to a Sub-Registrar. Before 1910 contingent expenditure of all kinds was defrayed by non-official Sub-Registrars from their share of the fees; but since that year such expenditure, with the exception of the cost of stationery, hot and cold weather charges and other expenses incurred for their personal convenience is borne by Provincial funds. It is not, therefore, intended at present to alter the rules relating to the contingent expenditure of Sub-Registrars."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Numerical strength of Ludhiana town by religion.

17. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table of this Council a statement showing the numerical strength in Ludhiana town of each of the communities Hindu, Muhammadan and Sikh) :—

in the total population of the town?

---

* See Appendix

[*Mr. Lumsden*; *Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal*; *Mr. Richey.*]

"(*b*) in the voters' list of the Municipal Committee?

"(*c*) in the list of the members of the Municipal Committee classified as—

"(*i*) *Ex-officio* Members?

"(*ii*) Nominated Members?

"(*iii*) Elected Members?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied:—

"The required statement* is laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked:—

Famine allowance to Ludhiana District Board servants.

18. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not—

"(*a*) that the concession of famine allowance for Government servants drawing Rs. 30 per mensem or under has been extended to District Boards employees?

"(*b*) that District Board school teachers drawing Rs. 30 per mensem or under in Ludhiana District are not given the benefit of the famine allowance by the District Board?

"(*c*) that the applications of teachers in Ludhiana District for such concession made to the Deputy Commissioner who is the *ex-officio* President of the Board were refused?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied:—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to Punjab Government Circular No. 32-760, dated 7th May 1897, which regulates the grant by District Boards to their employees of compensation for dearness of provisions. A copy of this circular† is laid on the table. Government has no information on the matters mentioned in the second and third parts of the question.".

Famine allowance to Ludhiana District Board servants.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked:—

19. "If the concession of famine allowance has not been extended to District Boards will Government be pleased to take necessary steps by moving the District Boards of the Province or otherwise to help the low paid servants of the District Boards during the present days of high prices in such a way as to enable them to maintain themselves and their families decently?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied:—

"It is contrary to the policy of Government to fetter the discretion of District Boards in respect of the granting or withholding of the concession beyond the extent laid down in the circular which is referred to in my answer to the previous question."

Inspectresses of Girls' Schools in the Punjab.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked:—

20. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table of this Council a statement showing—

"(*a*) the total number of girls' schools in each Division of the Province?

"(*b*) the number of Inspectresses of Schools in each Division?

"(*c*) the number of such schools inspected by the Inspectresses of Schools in each Division of the Province during the year 1918?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied:—

"The statements‡ asked for are laid on the table."

---

* See Appendix C.

† See Appendix D.

‡ See Appendix E (I) and F (2).

Aided secondary schools in the Punjab

The Hon'b'e Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

21. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table of this Council a statement showing—

"(*a*) the total number of private recognised secondary schools in each Division of Province ?

"(*b*) the number of such schools which are given aid by Government or by Local Bodies in each of the Division ?

"(*c*) the number of such schools whose applications for grant-in-aid have not yet been accepted ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"(*a*) and (*b*). The statements* asked for are laid on the table.

"(*c*) So far as Government is aware no application for a grant-in-aid has been finally refused."

Detention of log books of Girls' Schools by the Inspectress of Rawalpindi Schools.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

22. "Is it a fact that the Inspectress of Schools, Rawalpindi, has detained for a considerable period the log books of Girls' Schools inspected by her during the year 1918 and has not returned them as yet ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"Government has no information on the subject. An enquiry has been made ; but the subject is one which might well have been referred to the Inspectress or to the Head of the Education Department before it was brought before this Council."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Initial pay of Extra Assistant Commissioner.

23. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not that the initial pay of an Extra Assistant Commissioner was fixed at Rs. 250 per mensem in the very early days of British rule in this Province, and that it has not been raised during the last 70 years although the initial salaries of all other services have been increased in view of the increased cost of living ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"It is a fact that the initial pay of Extra Assistant Commissioners was fixed at Rs. 250 per mensem 70 years ago and has not been altered since. Without further investigation Government is not prepared to say that the initial salaries of all other services have been increased during that period. The Hon'ble Member is possibly aware that the Royal Commission did not propose any increase in the initial salary in the case of the executive branch of the Provincial Civil Service"

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Proposal to raise initial pay of Extra Assistant Commissioner.

24. "Will Government be pleased to state whether there is any proposal under consideration to raise the initial pay of an Extra Assistant Commissioner from Rs. 250 to Rs. 300 per mensem."

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"The question of the salaries of Extra Assistant Commissioners is now engaging the attention of the Punjab Government in connection with the recommendations of the Public Services Commission. The Commission proposed that officers on the judicial side of the Provincial Civil Service should start on Rs. 300 per mensem."

---

* See Appendices F. (1) and F. (2).

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; Colonel MacWatt ; Mr. Lumsden.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Appearance of influenza epidemic.

25. "Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not that another cycle of influenza epidemic has made its appearance in some part of the British Empire and also in the Ports of Bombay and Karachi ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"Although no official intimation has been received, it is understood from newspaper reports that influenza in virulent form appeared about the middle of February 1919, in Scotland, in the north of England, and in Australia, and was spreading, but to what extent it is not known.

"Influenza, has not, so far as Government is aware, re-appeared in epidemic form in the Ports of Bombay and Karachi or in other parts of India."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Appointment of a committee of medical men in connection with the above.

26. "If so, will Government be pleased to appoint a committee of experienced medical men to devise protective measures as well as to arrange for medical help promptly when the disease spreads in any part of this province."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The appointment of a committee of experienced medical men by Government would not appear to be necessary. The Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals and the Sanitary Commissioner are competent to advise Government and district officials as to what measures should be adopted ; and have already in their respective reports on the influenza epidemic of 1918, indicated the directions in which action should be taken by local authorities. These reports have been circulated to all Commissioners, Deputy Commissioners and medical men in the Punjab, and to the Postmaster-General, Punjab, for information and guidance.

"Every endeavour will be made to render medical help, should the disease, unfortunately, again spread in any parts of this Province. The extent to which Government can render actual assistance by supplying medical men will naturally depend on the severity of the epidemic, the area of the Province affected at one time, and the number of medical men available to meet the demand."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :

Amritsar Railway Station Platform Tickets.

27. "Is the Punjab Government aware that the issue of platform tickets to Indian citizens of Amritsar was prohibited by the Station Superintendent of Amritsar Railway Station, and that it was only after many representations from the citizens to the Railway authorities that the prohibition was withdrawn ?"

28. "If so, will Government be pleased to state whether it has received any representation from the residents of Amritsar on the subject, and whether Government considers it proper to move the Railway authorities to permit access to the station without platform tickets having regard to the hardship felt by Indian citizens of Amritsar who have been prohibited by order from seeing off or receiving their friends and relations on the railway platform ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"With reference to questions Nos. 27 and 28 I would call the attention of the Hon'ble Member to the reply given by me to a similar question asked by Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan at the meeting of the Council held on the 7th March 1919. A copy of the question and the reply thereto is laid on the table for easy reference."

[*Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das; Mr. Lumsden; Mr. Richey.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Agricultural and non-agricultural professions in Amritsar District. Representation of above in District Board. Modification of rules *ex* above.

29. "Will Government kindly say what is the proportion of people of agricultural and non-agricultural professions in Amritsar District?"

30. "Will Government kindly state, for the information of this Council, whether the non-agricultural population is represented in the district board of Amritsar, proportionately to its population in the district?"

31. "If the answer to question No. 30 be in the negative will it kindly state whether or not it would be desirable to modify the rules for election in such a way as to ensure adequate representation of all interests in the district board?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"With the Hon'ble Member's permission I will answer Nos. 29, 30 and 31 together. The population of the Amritsar District inclusive of the city at the census of 1911 was 860,726 of whom 343,373 persons were returned as dependent upon agricultural and pastoral pursuits. In addition a large number are partially dependent upon agriculture. The members of the District Board of Amritsar are not separately appointed or elected, as representatives of the agricultural and non-agricultural communities respectively, but in the case of elected members, who constitute a majority, they represent geographical areas. Certain qualifications for voters and for members are, however, prescribed by the election rules including the payment of a certain minimum amount of local rate. The election rules of the Amritsar District Board are at present being revised, and in Notification No. 5537, dated 26th February 1919, a copy of which is laid on the table. Government has agreed to take into consideration any objections or suggestions to the draft rules published with that notification which are received not later than 24th March next.

"As regards the advisability of ensuring adequate representation of all interests the policy of Government is that as a rule only those interests should be represented which pay taxes under the District Boards Act."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Lady Members of the Punjab Subordinate Educational Service.

32. "Is it a fact that lady members of the Punjab Subordinate Educational Service are not shown in the Civil List? If so, will Government kindly give reasons for omitting their names?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"There are no ladies in the Punjab Subordinate Educational Service. Posts held by ladies, with the names of the incumbents, are printed separately in the same volume as the Subordinate Educational Service."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Age restrictions on the above ladies.

33. "Will Government kindly state whether there are any age restrictions upon the appointment of ladies in the Punjab Subordinate Educational Service? If not, will it inform this Council whether or not it is considered desirable to impose any such restriction?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"There are no age restrictions for the appointment of ladies to Government service other than those laid down in the Civil Service Regulations for the appointment of all Government servants. It would be most undesirable to make the age restrictions for the recruitment of ladies, whom it is difficult to recruit at all, more stringent than those for the recruitment of men."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Number and pay of appointments in the Punjab Educational Service.

34. "Will Government kindly lay on the table of this Council a comparative statement showing side by side the pay and number of appointments in each class of the Punjab Educational Service under the old scale, and under the scale recently sanctioned?"

[*Mr. Richey ; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Mr. Woods ; Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The statement* asked for is laid upon the table. The reorganisation of the service has been designed to improve the pay and prospects of teachers of classical languages and other lower ranks of the Educational Service. It has been carried out in fulfilment of a promise made by me in this Council that Government would do what is possible to alleviate the condition of those teachers without waiting for such reorganization of the upper grades of the Subordinate Educational Service as may be possible when the Government of India sanctions a revision of the Provincial service."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Increased expenditure in connection with the above.

35. "Will Government kindly state the net increased expenditure, if any, incurred by the adoption of the new scale as compared with the old one ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The net increased expenditure of the introduction of the new scale is calculated to be Rs. 19,160 per annum."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Representation of Sub-Overseers.

36. "Will Government kindly state whether its attention has been invited to the representation embodying grievances of Sub-Overseers, qualified as Overseers, from Roorkee College ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The reply is in the affirmative."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Promotion of Sub-Overseers.

37. "Is it a fact that the promotion of Roorkee passed Sub-Overseers is retarded as compared with those who start as Overseers direct ?"

38. "If answer to Question No. 37 be in the affirmative, will Government kindly state what action it proposes to take in the matter in order to remove what is felt to be a grievance ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"The rate of promotion of Sub-Overseers is not conveniently comparable with that of Overseers ; as these two classes of subordinates belong to different establishments and possess different qualifications."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Indian Inspectors of Schools.

39. "Will Government kindly state whether or not it is a fact that an Indian Inspector of Schools is now appointed in every Division ? If so, will Government kindly state whether Indian Inspectors possess independent powers or whether they act as subordinates to European Inspectors ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"There is an Indian Inspector in each Division. Three (at Jullundur, Multan, and Rawalpindi) are in independent charge of a division, and two (at Lahore and Ambala) are Second Inspectors."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah asked :—

Articles re Punjab Education Department and the Muhammadans in the *Aftab* newspaper.

40. "(*a*) Has the attention of Government been drawn to a series of articles headed 'Punjab Education Department and the Musalmans' in the *Aftab* newspaper of Lahore, dated January 15th, 28th, 30th and February 5th, 1919 ?

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to direct an inquiry into the allegations made therein ?"

---

* *Vide* Appendix G.

[*Mr. Richey.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"(*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

"(*b*) The allegations in the articles referred to fall into three categories—

"(*i*) Those which are of a vague and general character: for examples, that in the remission of tuition fees, prize distributions, admission of students to educational institutions, in examination results, and so forth, Muhammadans are worse off than other communities.

"Such charges hardly require refutation: but the Hon'ble Member's attention is invited to Articles 114 and 148—153 of the Punjab Education Code, which provide special educational facilities for Muhammadans alone of all communities.

"Under this category may also be classed the allegation that Muhammadan teachers in Government service are badly treated in the matter of transfers. The writer has even been at the pains to quote a certain number of instances. He has not been very fortunate in his selection. Newly appointed candidates are naturally entitled to least consideration in the matter of postings. The Department tries as far as posible to bring men who have done good and faithful service in remote districts as near to their native towns as possible in the closing years of their service. Had the writer been pleading the cause of the Hindus he would have found it easy to make an even stronger case on the same lines since there are larger number of transfers among Hindus than Muhammadans owing to the larger number in the service and since all communities are treated alike in this matter. All transfers of teachers are dealt with by the Director personally, and are not, as the writer seems to imply, in the hands of Inspectors.

"(*ii*) The second class of allegation is that based on the small proportion of Muhammadans in the higher ranks of the Educational Service. This I deal with in my reply to the next question.

"(*iii*) The third class consists of specific accusations of miscarriages of justice in connection with the Simla Government High School. It is regrettable but true that the discipline of the Simla High School has been far from satisfactory in recent years. The state of indiscipline may be said to have culminated at the close of 1917 when, owing to a case of cow-driving by some of the Hindu boarders, the feeling between the two communities both among the boys and teachers became acute. The Headmaster who was a Christian was transferred on the recommendation of the Deputy Commissioner; and he has since left the service. A Sikh Headmaster of long experience has been sent in his place. The Hindu Superintendent of the Boarding House was also transferred, and has since died. But during the course of last year, no doubt owing to the state of ill-feeling which still existed, there were two cases of indiscipline among the staff, which resulted in the transfer of two Muhammadan teachers. Both these cases were investigated by Mr. Knowlton, the Inspector of Schools of the Ambala Division, and exhaustive reports sent in. These were examined by me, and after further enquiries on points of detail, the action to be taken was decided upon.

"No further enquiries into these cases would serve any useful purpose. All the facts known to both sides have been reported. The writer of these articles, who appears to be inspired by one of the transferred teachers, has, I regret to say, cast aspersions on the integrity and reliability of Lala Hari Das, 2nd Inspector, Bhai Mohan Singh, the new Headmaster, and Mr. Knowlton, Inspector, three officers of long and highly meritorious service in the Education Department of this Province. These accusations are in themselves a confession of the weakness of his case."

[*Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah*; *Mr. Richey*.]

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah asked :—

41. "(*a*) Is it a fact that out of 7 Inspectors of Schools, 29 District Inspectors, 10 Headmasters of Normal Schools and 29 Headmasters of Government High Schools in the Punjab and Delhi, only 1, 8, 1 and 8, respectively, are Muslims? Number of Muslims amongst the Inspectors of Schools, etc.

"(*b*) Does Government think that this is an adequate representation of the Muslims who constitute 55 per cent. of the population of the Province and are also backward in education?"

"(*c*) What steps does Government propose to take to safeguard Muslim interests?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"(*a*) The figures quoted by the Hon'ble Member are correct so far as they go. He has, however, omitted the figures for Assistant Inspectors who rank above Headmasters and District Inspectors. Of fourteen Assistant Inspectors seven are Muhammadans.

"(*b*) The Hon'ble Member bases his claim to a larger representation of Muhammadans in the higher ranks of the Educational Service of this province on the census figures for the population of the Punjab, both literate and illiterate. This is not a correct basis for calculation. Clearly only men possessing high educational qualifications can be employed in the higher appointments in the Education Department.

"Now, if the Hon'ble Member will turn to the records of the University examinations, which form our only data for calculating the number of men possessing high educational qualifications, he will find that in recent years of the students passing degree examinations only one-fifth are Muhammadans, the proportion being even lower in earlier times.

"This proportion would only entitle Muhammadans, supposing appointments were made on a strictly communal basis, to 18 of these 89 appointments whereas they actually hold 25.

"These figures show that in order to encourage education among an educationally backward community Muhammadans have been specially treated in the filling of vacancies. For example, within the last few years two Muhammadans have been appointed direct from outside Government service to Headmasterships of Government High Schools. But the special efforts made to recruit Muhammadans are strikingly illustrated by the figures for Assistant District Inspectorships. For these posts also trained graduates are required since they lead to District Inspectorships. There are 52 Assistant District Inspectorships in the Punjab. Of these 24 are held by Muhammadans, 18 by Hindus, 9 by Sikhs and 1 by a Christian. These results have only been achieved by special recruitment of Muhammadans, and considering the counter-attractions of other Departments, the Education Department can consider itself very successful in its recruiting efforts.

"(*c*) The preceding figures show that Government has taken special pains to safeguard the interests of Muhammadans, and that educated Muhammadans occupy inspecting posts under the Education Department quite out of proportion to their numbers."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah asked :—

42. "Is it a fact that there has been a constant decrease in the number of Muslim scholars in Vernacular Schools in the Punjab during the last few years and, if so, will Government be pleased to consider the advisability of appointing more Muslim District Inspectors, preferably from the agricultural classes?" Decrease in the number of Muslims schools in vernacular schools.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member in his question suggests a remedy for an evil which does not exist. So far from there having been a constant decrease in the number of Muslim scholars in vernacular schools in the Punjab during the last few years, there was an increase in the number of such scholars during the quinquennium 1912 to 1917 of 31,807.

"It is true that there was a falling off during the year 1917-18, but this was due to general causes affecting the rural population of the Province not peculiar to Muhammadans.

"The figures for Assistant District Inspectors given in answer to the last question show that the Education Department is already encouraging the recruiting of Muhammadan inspecting officers, and the department will be glad when other claims are equal to give preference to members of the rural classes."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargawa, asked :—

Supply of other Council proceedings to members of Council.

43. "In reply to question No. 50 asked in the meeting of this Council, dated 6th November 1917, Government was pleased to say 'the supply of other proceedings has been discontinued as a war measure in order to economise paper. It is intended to resume the supply after the war.' Now that the war is over will Government be pleased to consider the advisability of resuming the supply of the said proceedings as soon as possible?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"I would remind the Hon'ble Member that although hostilities have ceased the war is not yet over. The difficulties with regard to the supply of paper and stationery are as great as they were in 1917, and until the situation improves, Government is not justified in resuming the issue of printed proceedings. The position will, however, be reconsidered at the earliest possible date."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa, asked :—

Percentage of total expenditure on Primary Education.

44. "Will Government be pleased to lay upon the table a statement showing the percentage of the total expenditure of Primary Education which it has decided to contribute separately for each district of the Province?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The statement* asked for is laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa, asked :—

Principles in fixing, increasing or reducing members of municipalities.

45. "Will Government be pleased to state the principles which are observed in fixing, increasing or reducing the number of members in municipalities?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden replied :—

"In fixing the number of members of municipal committees Government takes into consideration the size, population, wealth, importance and situation of the town, the standard of civic responsibility evinced by its citizens, the number and variety of communities and interests which need to be represented, and the number of members of which the committee has hitherto been composed, care being taken to avoid as far as possible any large increase or reduction of numbers at one time."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal, Bhargawa, asked :—

Restriction and prohibition of liquor in the Punjab.

46. "In view of the progressive increase in the consumption of liquor in the Punjab and the beneficent policy of total prohibition of liquor in the United States of America, will Government be pleased to consider the advisability of taking immediate and practical steps at least to restrict substantially (if not to prohibit totally) the consumption of liquor in the province?"

---

* *Vide* Appendix H.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied:—

"The material for the distillation of spirit abounds throughout the Punjab. The quinquennial average area under sugarcane is 385,794 acres distributed over 23 out of 29 districts. In these circumstances prohibition could only result in the replacement of licit by illicit drinking. Illicit drinking is worse than licit drinking because it lends itself more easily to excess and the habit of defying the law is demoralising.

"It is the policy of Government to combine the maximum of revenue with the minimum of consumption. The principal measure taken with this object is taxation. As a result of taxation, spirit which costs at present prices Re. 1-6-0 per gallon to make, was selling in the last year, of which complete records are available, at an average retail price of Rs. 12-4-0 per gallon. It is obvious that this enormous addition to what may be called the natural price must prevent large numbers of persons from obtaining spirit in the quantities in which they would otherwise obtain it. The policy of increasing price by increasing taxation is limited only by the consideration that the price must not be raised to a figure at which the temptation of illicit importation and distillation would be stronger than the fear of punishment. But the question of increasing taxation further is under consideration.

"The regulations, which are in force at licensed places of sale, are an other instrument for the restriction of the consumption of liquor. An important feature in these regulations is the system, now in force in 21 districts or portions of districts (*i.e.*, completely in 6 districts and partially in 15 districts), of selling liquor only in sealed bottles and only for consumption off the premises. This system would have been extended more rapidly but for the shortage of bottles due to the War. The number of shops for the sale of country liquor which was 712 in 1916-17 will be 683 in 1919-20, approximately one for 30,000 inhabitants. The sale of spirit at fairs has been discontinued at 73, and continued only at 3 places, where the dangers of illicit importation are held to justify continuance.

"It is the belief of Government that the restriction of the consumption of liquor is only in part a matter which lies within the power of Government. The matter is one for social reformers, drawing attention to the evils of the abuse of drink and providing means of wholesome recreation and harmless counter-attractions. But certain measures have been taken by Government itself, or by institutions aided by or connected with Government, for the education of public sentiment. The use of tobacco and intoxicants by school pupils is forbidden in Article 242 of the Education Code. Rules on this point are strictly enforced in school hostels. Lessons on temperance, conveyed through simple stories and poetry, have been included in the Vernacular readers from the 3rd primary class upwards. In the higher classes the effects of intoxicating liquors and drugs are explained more scientifically: the subject of temperance is dealt with in connection with health and sanitation. Lectures and addresses are occasionally given in schools by the representatives of temperance societies, and their usefulness has been referred to by more than one Divisional Inspector. Lectures on temperance are delivered and literature on the subject is provided in one of the Colleges in the Province. In the Forman Christian College there is a 'social service organisation,' an important part of whose activities is to encourage the students to be temperate and to urge temperance upon others during the long vacation. The Health Officer, Lahore, delivers a course of 20 lectures on Hygiene to the students in the Central Training College. Smoking and the use of intoxicating liquors are strictly prohibited. Two other Colleges impart religious instruction, including lessons on temperance which form part of the curriculum.

[*Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan; Mr. Richey.*]

"A report was submitted to Government on the proposals to provide counter-attractions to drink. A large weight of opinion—Indian opinion—was found to be condemnatory of any direct subsidising of public entertainments and Government preferred to leave reform to come to the people through their own leaders and societies."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Muhammad Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Erection of new school buildings.

47. "(*a*) Will Government be pleased to state whether the circumstances, explained by the Hon'ble Mr. Richey in reply to my question No. 12 made in this Council on 24th April 1918, have since so changed as to justify Inspectors pressing Managers of private aided schools to erect new buildings ?

"(*b*) If not, will Government be pleased to issue orders that until the prices of building materials become more reasonable house rent be not disallowed and deductions for inadequate accommodation be not made, from the maximum grants allowable to such schools ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"(*a*) The orders contained in my Circular No. 3169 of May 27th, 1918, directing Inspectors not to press the Managers of aided schools for the erection of school buildings while the prices of building material are so high, are still in force.

"(*b*) If the Hon'ble Member means that no deductions shall be made from maintenance grants for overcrowding, this would obviously not be in the interests of the pupils for whom schools exist. Government could hardly pay schools large capitation grants earned by admitting children in excess of the number for whom there is healthy accommodation ; especially when there are other schools which the children can attend."

REVISED FINANCIAL STATEMENT FOR 1919-20.

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"Your Honour, I beg to present the Revised Financial Statement. As compared with the amended Draft Financial Statement which I had the honour of presenting at the last meeting, there are only a few changes. First as regards the Revised,—the first of the changes I foreshadowed when making a few remarks on the amended Draft Financial Statement. I expressed my personal belief that in view of the prosperity of the Province it would be found that a number of suspensions of ordinary land revenue would be voluntarily paid in. I have ascertained from the Accountant-General that the actuals for February suggest that this view is correct. A very large amount of ordinary land revenue found its way into the treasury during that month and in fact the totals up to the end of February practically represent the totals expected for the whole year, and as further payments amounting to 4 lakhs are expected during the month of March we have raised the budget by 4 lakhs, the Provincial share of that being 2 lakhs.

"The change in the transfer head is due to the raising of the item on account of the Imperial share of the sale-proceeds of sites for shops in colony towns in the Punjab, the budget for which was only Rs. 1,36,000. The figure has now been raised still further to Rs. 3,73,000. The reason is that there has been a very large demand for town sites chiefly in the Montgomery District and very high prices have been realised.

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Mr. Lumsden; Mr. Richey; Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain.*]

"As regards the budget, the receipts under Land Revenue have been raised by 3 lakhs Provincial share for reasons similar to those affecting the revised. We not only expect payments on a large proportion of the suspensions for the present year but also the recent land sales in Montgomery have produced an unexpectedly high average. As regards the change under Income-tax, I explained that at some length at our last meeting. The change as far as the provincial balance is concerned is purely formal. We lose Rs. 4,50,000 as direct income from income-tax and that sum is placed at our credit by transfer by the Government of India. Hon'ble Members will remember that the change is due to the fact that assessees on incomes under Rs. 2,000 are to be exempted. I do not think I need detain the Council any longer in respect of the Revised Statement."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—As regards one item under head 22—Education, the budget provision for the year 1919-20 is Rs. 60,44,000 and the last budget estimation for the year 1918-19 was Rs. 54,77,000. So it appears that Rs. 5,47,000 has been added. But at the same time the expenditure which the Government has taken the responsibility to add in this year is : 3 lakhs for Khalsa College, Amritsar, Rs. 1,50,000 for Carpentry School at Jullundur and Rs. 2,25,000 for the improvement of pay and training of teachers. The total of these 3 items becomes Rs. 6,75,000 and the addition is only Rs. 5,67,000. The question therefore is how to make up all these items and also wherefrom the 2 lakhs promised for the expansion of free and compulsory education is to come."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"Might I just say a word of explanation? The Hon'ble member has got rather confused over the figures. The 3 lakhs in respect of the Khalsa College grant is payable this year. It has nothing to do with next year's figures. We have provided our own share of the money and the grant will be paid this year. As regards the Carpentry School we do not expect bills of more than Rs 75,000 in the next year and therefore a sum of Rs. 75,000 is included in the budget. Rs. 3,75,000 must therefore be deducted from any calculation that the Hon'ble Member may make."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"Your Honour, still I think that the expansion of primary and free education will require much more than 2 lakhs and I think that the amount provided will fall short of the requirements which can be expected to be provided for in the next year's budget.

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"Your Honour, these figures are calculated on the estimates supplied by district boards. It is no use providing more money than the district boards can spend. According to their 5 years programme the calculation comes to about 8 lakhs in the 5 years as the Government contribution. That comes to about little less than 2 lakhs every year. Consequently this sum of 2 lakhs is rather over than under the estimate."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain :—"The first point to mention, Your Honour, is that this is the first year during which a wholesome change has been introduced with reference to the budget discussion. I suppose it will have the effect of reducing the discussion in this Council considerably. When we used to be able to talk of everything else in connection with the budget but the budget figures we took a great deal of time over it, but when we have only to deal with the figures, as our Financial Member has very rightly pointed out, it will not take so long. But inasmuch as it is my first budget speech in this Council, as somehow I missed these budget debates formerly, I think I will be justified in taking a little more time,

[*The President; Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain.*]

His Honour the President :—"Is the Hon'ble Member moving his resolution or speaking generally on the budget ?"

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain :—"As I am to move three resolutions, I will not deal with the subject matter of those resolutions in this general discussion. My resolutions are about Sanitation, Education and Industries.

"The first observation I have to make, Your Honour, with reference to the budget is the peculiar feature of our budgets, that is to say, the *growing balances*. Now ordinarily the Finance Member would be congratulated in running the administration in a very cautious manner. One would naturally congratulate him that we have been doing wonderfully well every year. This cautious handling of our finance has enabled us to put by a good store for a rainy day. But Provincial finance is in a peculiar position. It is not an independent corporation standing by itself with no other source of income excepting Provincial revenue. My complaint, Your Honour, is that because of this cautious and careful handling, this Province, according to my way of thinking, is deprived of such help which as it would otherwise have derived from the Indian Government. The Indian Government apparently considers this Province as a very good, cautious individual, never running into any extravagance, never even spending what was doled out to it for consumption. I have no doubt that the Indian Government has a very great regard for our power of economy. But what has been the result of this ? We have been depriving the Indian Government of pleasure of helping us if we got into a scrape. Take the case of a particular department, say agricultural department. Has not the Government of India been giving us the huge grant of Rs. 4,69,000 which they expected us to spend ? But what did we do with it ? We dealt with it in a very economic fashion, one might also say after the style of a *Bania*. Instead of spending the amount on agriculture we invested the amount in the purchase of certain seeds for sale to the agriculturists with the object of realizing a profit. Is not this spending of money in a business-like fashion ? We are, however, very thankful to our Finance Member for doing things in a careful manner. As I should say it is not really a policy which might be called a policy of enterprise. If this Scotch economy had been combined with American enterprise, I have no doubt I would have been happier than I am. So the first point is with reference to the growing balances. That gives, to my mind, an inaccurate notion of our prosperity to the parent Government, and the parent Government may think very well of us, but for the same reason it does not give us the help which has been given to other provinces which have not been so very cautious and so very careful as we have been.

"The next point is one of Excise. Year after year we find our revenues under the head of excise growing. Year after year our Finance Member tells us that this is an index of prosperity. Year after year the Financial Commissioner also says that there is but one explanation for it : high prices and prosperity of the agricultural classes lead to more investment in luxuries. He says that two things coincide : growing revenue coincides with growing revenue from excise. And the theory and inference is there that they have got something to do with each other. Now, Your Honour, to my mind this position is fraught with serious danger. If once the position is admitted that drinking is a luxury, that that luxury is on the increase, that this increase shows prosperity of the agricultural classes, then we are very near solving the great problem of how to fix the position of a country in the scale of civilization. Very few people up till now have been able to get a sound index of prosperity, and if we adopt this theory, you have just to see what your excise revenue is, and if the revenue from excise is high you might have it that the country is pros-

perous and therefore we have nothing to be sorry for. Now I for one do not accept this theory. To my mind drinking is not a luxury but a vice. The increase of vice is no index for prosperity or wealth of a province. Therefore instead of congratulating ourselves on the increase under this head of revenue from excise, we should indeed be very sorry for it, and it seems to me that if it continues to grow, time may come, Your Honour, when the successors of this Council will feel rather hesitating in curtailing in part or in doing away with this source of revenue altogether. This morning the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard told us that though the cost of producing a gallon of liquor was Re. 1-6-0 it fetched as much as Rs. 12-4-0 per gallon showing very considerabe profits. A part of it is no doubt taken by us as revenue. At the last meeting the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard told us that although the quantity was decreased, yet the income by way of revenue continued to increase, that is to say, reducing the quantity did not result in reducing the revenue as well. Well, if that is correct then, to my mind, the solution lies this way : fix a maximum limit to which country liquor should be distilled and no more, and let its price be raised so that at all events the poorer classes may not have access to it. It is well known, Your Honour, that, so far as the habit of drinking is concerned if the individual is educated and is able to exercise control over himself the chances are that that person will not go to excess, but if drink really becomes popular amongst the illiterate and uneducated people who are not able to exercise self control, I am afraid that very soon in an ignorant country like this the menace will really become very great and the money which would otherwise go to buying food will be diverted to this horrible drinking. So I hope Your Honour's Government will take into consideration the possibility of limiting the production of liquor altogether and thus do something towards making it impossible for the persons who hold licenses to either make money or render the cause of drink more popular. It is painful to know that during the last 10 or 12 years the number of shops has risen from 112 to 683. It is also painful to know.....

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"May I just explain, Sir, I think, I heard that the Hon'ble Member said that the number of shops has risen from 112 to 683. At least I am under that impression. The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Hussain must have misheard what I said this morning in answer to a question. The number of shops has fallen from 712 to 683."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain :—"I beg your pardon. I stand corrected."

His Honour the President :—"May I inform the Council that when I took charge of the office the number of shops existing at the time was over 800 which has steadily been reduced."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Hussain :—"I am very glad to learn that there has been such a considerable reduction in the number of shops. But the other point, that is to say, the prosperity of these shops apparently has increased. Though their number has decreased considerably, yet apparently they are doing more business than they have been doing before. In any case I should indeed be very glad to hear that the money they are making they are not making because they sell more liquor but because the higher classes are patronising it. That is to say, it is not the quantity that has increased : it is the value of liquor that has increased in the estimation of people. At all events that is not quite as bad as the danger of liquor becoming popular among the masses who really cannot afford it.

"This danger is all the more threatening, Your Honour, because the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard has told us that not only it was an increase in the liquor line but it was an increase in the opium line as well. One might have

said that this drinking is a thing that we have not taken from the east but from the west, but opium is essentially an oriental vice and it is very regrettable to learn that in spite of liquor also coming in the opium habit is on the increase. I do not remember that any particular explanation was given why the sale of opium is on the increase. It is quite possible that it may be the case because of export of opium. I do not know whether it is correct, but if it is due to export, it is not quite as bad as consumption within the province, although we do not want other provinces to consume it either. I should like, later on, to be enlightened on that subject whether the increase on the opium side is due to increased consumption in the province or due to export of opium from the province. There again I would suggest, if it is not already done, that it would be advisable to restrict the quantities of its production.

"The next head to which I beg to invite Your Honour's attention is VIII—Income-tax. Now, our Financial Member told us that the Government of India has reduced taxation by increasing the taxable income from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 2,000 and there is no doubt when Sir James Meston made that announcement it was hailed with delight which I believe the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden also shared. I for one venture to dissent from that view.....

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson :—"Is the Hon'ble Member in order in discussing head VIII—Income-tax ? It seems to me that rule 11 of the rules for the discussion of the Annual Financial Statement excludes Income-tax from being the subject of discussion."

His Honour the President :—"I would ask the Hon'ble Member to deal lightly with the subject of income-tax which is not a provincial head."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"I really do not intend to discuss except to say that there are possibly two opinions on the subject. Everybody is not agreed that by increasing the taxable limit from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 2,000 we are doing something that is for the best. To my mind it would have been much better if taxation would have remained as it is, so that the burden of taxation would be shared by all. Instead of such taxation going into the pockets of the people it could have gone to a good cause like education. As there seems to be some doubt as to this head being capable of discussion, I proceed to the next head which was introduced in this Council by the Hon'ble Mr. French, that is, Jails and Criminal Tribes. Under this head it is really very interesting to note and very gratifying to discover that the inmates of our jails have done so well, both as fighters and also as members of labour corps. Now this incident brings to one's mind one or two possibilities. First of them is what sort of people these are who come to the jails and why do they come to them at all ? Is there no possibility on the administration side to render their approach to this place less easy ? Are they the sort of people who really should remain in jails ? Now so far as I can see they are of two sorts ; one who come to the jails out of sheer exuberance of spirits. I am referring to those who come under the head of riots and so forth. It seems to me, Your Honour, that the country is sadly lacking in proper outlets for accumulated energy—one might say this of the people of Jhelum, Salt Range, Gujrat, Rawalpindi and similar places, also of the Rajputs and Jats of Rohtak and Hissar. A large number of these people merely drop into jails. I venture to think that they should not come there at all ; if they had really well organised sports like the Punjabi sports, *saunchi and kabadi* which are falling into decay ; or if they had a resort to manly games like hockey, football and rugby, to my mind, their chances of rioting so frequently would be minimised and instead of coming to jails they would give vent to their feelings in the lines of game and sports. It is that type of prisoner who in this country has distinguished himself and has shown that really he is

not the fit person to be confined in the jails. The second sort is the criminal. Of course allied to the first class of riots are also the dacoits. I believe some of these dacoits, especially of the Jhelum and Rawalpindi side, are also very adventuresome, enthusiastic and anxious to give vent to their energy rather than bent upon making money. Some of them, no doubt, get recruited and there enjoy themselves, but others do not have the same chances. To my mind it is quite possible that if better chances of recruitment are given to these fighting classes then no doubt the chances of the prisons being well populated will become less. Let us now take the other class, that is to say, the pilfering class. There again it seems to me the record they have left in the courses of this war shows that a great deal could be done to prevent their coming into jails. If they had some outlets or some occupations, and were not simply walking about doing nothing, they would not become criminals. It is here that it seems to me the question of criminal tribes comes in. The great success which this Government has achieved in the management of criminal tribes is gratifying on the one hand, but it seems to me that it is also fraught with certain dangers. We find that the criminal tribes have always been looked down upon in this country. It is believed that there is some taint in their blood that cannot be cured—once a man is a member of a criminal tribe he is doomed and there is no chance of his ever recovering the dignity of humanity. The recent experiments at the Dhariwal Mills and also at the Railway Workshops during the course of the war have shown that these members of criminal tribes have certain leanings towards becoming mechanics."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"I rise to a point of order. I fail to see any financial aspect in the discussion of the Hon'ble Member. The speech does not seem to be connected with the Financial Statement at any rate."

His Honour the President :—"The Hon'ble Member might leave these general subjects to the final debate."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl i-Hussain :—"Your Honour, I am coming to the point of figures. If we are going to make all the provision for criminal classes, then there is a serious danger of a large number of people being enrolled among the criminal tribes so that they may avail themselves of the benefits of education, etc. There are two divisions of the subject (1) the figures of the statement and (2) questions of principle in connection therewith. It seems to me that my point (the latter) is not divorced from the financial aspect."

His Honour the President :—"If we go into the question of principle so deeply we shall not get to the financial question. The Hon'ble Member will perhaps keep more to the financial aspect."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain :—"I will bow to that, Your Honour. I want to sound a note of warning that a very large number of people who are not criminals are wanting for themselves advantages similar to those provided for criminal tribes. Can it not be so arranged that there may be industrial instruction given in various parts of the province to youths whether belonging to the criminal classes or not? We have seen that the rather bad stuff of jails and criminal tribes has done wonderfully well when given an encouragement. Is it not possible that a large number of people who do not go either to jails or belong to criminal tribes, if given similar opportunities, would do equally well if not better? That is the reason why I thought it necessary to bring this point forward. Have we not ignored our opportunities of advancing the cause of industrialism and agriculture by doing nothing? We find that those people who are comparatively bad when given opportunities in workshops and given a little industrial training, do wonderfully well to the surprise of everybody.

[*The President ; Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain.*]

"The next head that I would touch upon is that of forest, and in passing I would say that in 1917-18 the actuals were on the income side 21 lakhs and on the expenditure side 11 lakhs. Speaking generally we were to be good to the extent of 10 lakhs. In 1919-20 our budget makes provision on the income side 36 lakhs and on the expenditure side 26 lakhs. Again roughly speaking a net income of 10 lakhs is expected. It does seem to me strange why a much higher investment of 15 lakhs should not result in more profit. It is possible that the result of this investment may come a year or two later, but it does seem to me that there is a risk of a Government department not being run quite as inexpensively as one would like it to be. Of course, I have no data one way or the other but I simply mention this for what it is worth, and it would be advisable to safeguard against that possibility.

"The next head I will deal with is that of agriculture 26-A. Now under the head we find that there is a welcome increase of about 10 lakhs This increase, I understand, is mainly due to the keen interest the Government of India is taking in the advancement of this department. It is in this connection that I draw Your Honour's attention to that special grant—I believe it was of 10 lakhs—which was given to this province with the object of spending on agriculture and which I understand has not yet been spent to any appreciable extent. The little trading that we did from that part of the grant has not enabled us to spend any appreciable portion of it. In 1917 our Finance Member told us that Rs. 9 lakhs odd were there, and schemes were under consideration as to how to utilize this amount to the best of advantage for the classes concerned. In 1918 again we were told that the business we did with a part of the money has been very useful and has really rendered very useful help to the agricultural classes. This year we are told at the last page of the Statement by the Financial Secretary that we have wheat profits grant of Rs. 5,46,000. I understand that a portion of this grant could be used on possibly giving agricultural education or generally improving the condition of village life.

His Honour the President :—"I might remind the Hon'ble Member that he has 3 minutes more to speak."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain :—"Is there any time limit, Sir ?"

His Honour the President :—"Yes, the maximum time allowed is half an hour."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain :—"The next head I will take up is Medical 24-A. There again there is a welcome increase to be noticed and one is indeed grateful for the expansion in that department—opening of new dispensaries, etc., and removal of medical school to Amritsar. But there are two things which really stand out prominently under this head. One is that up till now the accommodation in the Medical College is absolutely inadequate and insufficient. We want much more accommodation than the college at present provides for the pupils. And the second is with reference to the college hostel. It has been, to the knowledge of some of us, as a sort of peculiarity of this Government Institution, not to provide any hostel of its own for the pupils. That is the only institution in the Province affiliated to the University which does not provide a hostel of its own for its pupils. Again and again this matter has been agitated by the University and the Inspection Committees have adverted again and again in pretty strong terms and at times the Syndicate has considered the advisability of disaffiliation inasmuch as the conditions of affiliation are not complied with. I hope this scheme of the removal of the Medical School from Lahore to Amritsar will enable the College authorities to remove this stigma on the administration of the College. There is room for further work under this head so far as the tuberculous diseases are concerned.

"The next point is that of famine relief. We were told that although there has been fodder scarcity yet the administration of this fund has been such that it has not been exhausted. The meaning of that observation was not quite clear to me. It could only mean that either there was no fodder scarcity or if there was fodder scarcity then the person who had the charge of that fund did not utilise it to the best advantage. If that is so, it cannot but be regretted. Under the heads Education, Sanitation and Scientific and Miscellaneous, I do not now wish to make any remarks inasmuch as they fall within my Resolutions."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das:—"Your Honour, this year's budget also has its usual features, *i.e.*, improvement in receipts and diminution in expenditure. In spite of the failure of the monsoon last year, the Land Revenue Head has not materially suffered. The orthodox policy of our Punjab Finance branch is always very conservative and overcautious in budgetting receipts. As has been admitted by the Finance Secretary the actual rabi collections proved to be better than the estimates by no less than 4½ lacs. Had there been no failure of rains last year, the estimates would have been exceeded still further. But in spite of bad kharif, which compelled Government to suspend collections to the extent of 16 lacs the actual deficiency in collections of land revenue has not been more than 8 lacs, which has been amply made good by larger receipts under other minor Heads. I hope this year's proposals for receipts in the ensuing year are more optimistic.

"Another phenomenal increase is under Excise. But, Your Honour, I must point out, that the growth in excise receipts does not in all countries always indicate prosperity of the people. We, who live in the country, mix more freely with the people, and have more intimate relations with the different grades of society; we know as a matter of fact that such prosperity, if at all, exists mainly among Government War contractors. What we laymen find is that the cost of living is rising every year with surprising rapidity, that incomes of individual workers are lagging far behind, and that until recently before the unemployment problem had been solved to some extent by enlistment in large numbers of people in the army, crime was ever on the increase. And yet in the midst of such financial stringency the people of this province, in order to show their strong and deep attachment to the British Raj, subscribed most liberally the 2 war loans, and several other Relief and other funds. Your Honour is probably aware that to some extent such loans and funds were subscribed either by taking private loans or by means of commutations of pensions and deductions from salaries. Such a state of affairs, Your Honour, cannot be interpreted to indicate net savings of money in the province. Your Honour in this respect the Finance Branch of the Punjab Secretariat appears to be under serious misapprehension. In my humble opinion increase under the Head Excise is not quite due to the general prosperous condition of the people, but to heavier Still Head duties levied by Government, cessation in the import of foreign liquor due to shipping difficulties on account of war, and largely to the presence of large numbers of military forces in the province, who consume this commodity to a large extent. These latter causes which have very little to do with the prosperity of the people is admitted by the Financial Secretary also. It is therefore a matter of still greater surprise why Government should impute this increase mainly to imaginary causes such as prosperity of the people, etc., which perhaps nowhere exists. Your Honour, Excise cannot be the only index to reflect economic condition of the people in an eastern land like India where the habit of drinking is considered to be a vice and not a luxury. It can serve such an index only in western countries. Here in India the true index indicating economic condition of the people is the Registration Head, and the minor Head Sale of Court Fees under Head Stamps. Your Honour will observe that there has been decrease under both these Heads. Under Court Fees the estimates are

reduced by 3 lacs, *i.e.*, by about 8 per cent., and the estimates from fees for registering documents have been diminished from Rs. 2,95,000 to Rs. 2,73,000, *i.e.*, again by about 8 per cent. Your Honour, perhaps the orthodox secretariat view is that on account of high prices obtainable for foodstuffs, there is abundance of money among agriculturists. Now this is again not quite correct. No doubt the agriculturists have been receiving high prices for their goods, but the question is what about their cost of living. If the economists are correct, cost of living is increasing more rapidly than the incomes. Moreover, had the agriculturists, an overwhelming majority of whom are cultivators in the Punjab, been possessed of large amounts of money, surely they would have been able to pay up at least the interest on advances made by Government to them. The budget figures, however, tell a different story. This is again an index to reflect the exact economic condition of the people. If the people are prosperous, why should not the Government be able to recover interest for taccavi and other advances? From all these facts then we can draw the following conclusions :—

"(1) During the year now closing Registration figures tell us that during the year few people have invested money in the purchase of urban or non-agricultural property.

"(2) The figures for sale of Court Fees tell us that civil litigation has been diminished very much. In other words, so far as possible, people have refrained from filing suits for the recovery of money due to them, and have not tried to establish their rights in property claimed by them. Probably this was due either to inability to spend money on litigation, or to fear of non-recovery of money from their debtors even after the award of decrees in their favour.

(3) Again, interest figures and Courts of Law figures tell us that people are not able to pay even the interest of their debts, and that, in the administration of criminal justice, people prefer to go to jail rather than pay fine. Is it not due to the fact that by going to the jail they save the money payable in fines, as well as save the cost of their own maintenance, at least for the period of their imprisonment? Such a state of affairs, I am sure, cannot be possible under an abundance of wealth.

"Coming towards the expenditure side of the budget, Your Honour, the prospects are again gloomy. The only expenditure heads which involve social and economic well-being of the people are Education, Medical Relief, Sanitation, Encouragement of Agriculture, Development of Industries, Famine Relief and improvement in the salaries of those Government servants, who are feeling most the pinch of high prices. Let us examine what has been done or proposed to be done by Government in these matters. I shall take up these points seriatum :—

"(*a*) In Education the current year's estimates for Government schools—General were 11·47 lacs. In revised estimates, including 2 lacs, Government of India grant for the encouragement of vernacular education, which is now put under Minor Head Grant-in-aid the figures for Government Schools—General are 11·06 lacs, *i.e.*, a deficiency of Rs. 41,000. Under Government schools special there is a deficiency of 2·64 lacs. Under grants-in-aid the revised estimates are 30·41 lacs. But this amount includes 2 lacs for vernacular education, and 3 lacs for Khalsa College, which were not included in budget estimates. So deducting these 5 lacs the amount expected to be spent in grants-in-aid is 25·41 lacs. The budget figures were 26·36 lacs. So here also there is a deficiency of Rs. 95,000. On the other hand, very little is being spent on improvement of teacher's salaries out of the Government of India.

grant of Rs. 1,75,000. There is a crying need for better paid and trained teachers, but the special grant made to us for the purpose is being accumulated, and goes only to swell our already huge balances. Your Honour, what is required is a radical overhauling of the teacher's salaries. The recent announcement regarding the revision of salaries of the subordinate educational service is quite inadequate. Your Honour, what is required is a sufficiently bold and imaginative policy in the expansion of educational expenditure. In my humble opinion half measures and a tinckering here and there in the teacher's salaries is even worse than stagnation. The only hopeful feature is the new educational proposals of Government with respect to Government schools special. Here an increase of over 3 lacs is proposed. If this provision means larger expenditure on industrial and technical education, I must express my gratitude to Government for this. My only wish is that at the end of the year the Financial Secretary will not come forward to tell us that the amount could not be spent and that it has lapsed. As regards the provision of a further sum of 2 lacs for primary education, the only thing I can say is that it is too inadequate. I have said so repeatedly and in my humble opinion the 5 year's programme is too halting. If the finances of local bodies under the present rules could not afford to undertake bigger programmes, it was but proper for Government to come to their help by taking upon itself a larger share of the cost of primary education. I have to express my deep regrets that Government could not see its way to accept in this connection a resolution moved by my friend Bakhshi Sohan Lal in the last council meeting. I am afraid at the present rate of progress suggested by the existing programme, illiteracy will not be removed from the land even in another 100 years.

"In sanitation also I find that the grants drawn against the Sanitary Board's sanction will fall short of the total provided by about Rs. 70,000. Here again there is a lapse. I presume the Government will probably come forward and explain the deficiency by saying that sufficient number of applications for grants were not made to the Sanitary Board, and that under the rules the full allotted amount could not be spent. Your Honour, this would always be, so long as Government sticks to its present rate of grants, and so long as the financial condition of local bodies remains in the present deplorable condition. In my humble opinion our local bodies, district as well as Municipal Boards, are too poor to embark even on such necessities of life as sanitary projects. In order to tackle this problem successfully and in order to make a distinct improvement in sanitary condition of the province, it is necessary for Government to come to their help and itself embark on a more liberal policy. The scale of Government grant-in-aid should be increased. I am sorry Government did not see its way to accept the resolution moved in this connection by my friend Bakhshi Sohan Lal in the last Council meeting. The new proposal for sanitary grants for the year 1919-20 are also disappointing. It is the same old 4·22 lacs plus 2 lacs for Simla improvement. And perhaps in this amount also there would be a lapse at the end of the year. Your Honour, in this way no appreciable progress can be made in the sanitary affairs of the province. It is now time that our Government should embark on a comprehensive scheme of sanitary reform. We should overhaul the system of grants-in-aid. The sanitary board should take more initiative in the matter. A regular sanitary survey of the province should be undertaken and really decent amounts should be provided for rural sanitary schemes, such as construction of masonary parapets for wells, sinking of wells for drinking purposes, rural drainage schemes, filling up of depressions, and such like hundred other little things. Unless money is not provided liberally for sanitary purposes and comprehensive schemes of sanitation are not undertaken the present high death rate will continue, and disease cannot be bahished from the province. Again, in

medical relief also I would submit provision of Rs. 1,50,000 for new dispensaries and hospitals and Rs. 50,000 for travelling dispensaries is too small. Moreover it must be observed that the bulk of the people are treated under the unani and vedic system. No provision is made for this in the budget. The unani and vedic classes in the Islamia and D. A.-V. Colleges respectively are dragging on practically a half-starved existence. It is but proper that the Government should come to their help, and it would have been in the fitness of things had larger assignments for the promotion of study in the unani and vedic systems of medicine been made for expanding the scope of existing schools and award of scholarships tenable in Delhi and Calcutta.

"(*c*) Next, the most important and pressing problem of the present times is the revision of salaries of lower grade clerical and other staff of Government. Your Honour, in most cases the cost of food stuff has been doubled, but salaries have remained practically the same, or been increased slightly. This has produced a great amount of discontent. No amount of philosophic reasoning explaining this phenomenal rise in prices and imputing them to world causes will satisfy those who are feeling the pinch of these prices. The ordinary clerks and other low-paid staff of Government do not care to diognose, they want remedies and they expect their difficulties to be solved. Your Honour, we are observing with great anxiety that the poor paid servants of the Government are not in a contented mood at the present moment. The organisation of societies such as Clerks' Association, &c., indicate great amount of discontent at the back. Your Honour, statesmanship I humbly submit, requires a very early solution of the problem, and I would humbly advise Government to take immediate steps in this matter. It is all very well for Government to say that all employment rests on a contractual basis and that Government offers and its employees accept definite terms and that while the lowest paid clerks accept appointments on the terms offered they have no reasonable cause of complaint. Your Honour, in the absence of openings other than Government service and in the absence of Industries and commercial regeneration of the country, Government holds the monopoly of offering means of livelihood to its subjects. Does the Government seriously believe that under a Government monopoly its employees have no cause of complaint? Your Honour, in western countries where big trusts or pools hold monopolies in industries and the employees in such industries accept low wages offered to them by their employers do we find the Government not interfering. If all employment rests on contractual basis why are minimum wages prescribed by Government in western countries? Simply because it is the duty of the State to protect the weak employees. In the case of the ordinary private employers the employees have a remedy open to them in the shape of strikes. It occurred recently in Bombay and the British Isles. When Government holds the monopoly as employers, may I ask what are the remedies open to their employees? Your Honour, correctly speaking distinctions cannot be made between Government as employers and the Government as State responsible for peace and order in this country. I have worked out figures which show that the minimum subsistence allowance of a family consisting of man, his wife and two children can in no case be less than Rs. 55 a month in normal times. Is the Government as employers offering that amount? If it is not, then they are taking advantage of their monopolist position, and this state of affairs, they are responsible for keeping peace and order in the country are bound to remove. Your Honour, Government has not probably realised the full gravity of the situation. A complete revision of the pay and prospects of clerical establishment in all departments is an immediate necessity. May I ask what provision has been made by Government in the budget proposals of the ensuing year? I am glad that the sanction of the Secretary of State has arrived for the revision of the pay and prospects of clerical establishments in the district offices in the Punjab at an estimated annual cost of over

[*Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargava.*]

Rs. 1,62,000. For this the Government is to be thanked. But, Your Honour, other departments and offices are also in need of immediate revision and some adequate amount should be provided in the budget for this purpose.

" (*d*) Again under head Agriculture, I am glad to find Government proposes to spend 2 lacs on agricultural education. I hope Government have already settled a comprehensive scheme, and that the whole budgetted amount will be spent during the ensuing year. Under the head Development of Industries I again find that during the current year there has been a lapse, *i.e.*, no less than 28 per cent. of the budgetted amount. It seems here also as in other departments of national reconstruction, very little effort is being made. For the ensuing year also, I fear the sum of Rs. 76,000 for development of industries is too small. Really Government should be more liberal in this matter. In famine relief also, I observe that in spite of failure of rains and famine staring us in the face, the amount budgetted for the ensuing year is less than what was budgetted last year under optimistic conditions."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargava :—"Your Honour,—I congratulate the Hon'ble Finance Member on the general nature of the Financial Statement which in spite of bad harvests and effects of influenza continues to be a prosperity budget.

"However, I cannot refrain from remarking that in certain matters the budget cannot be said to be satisfactory, both on its income and its expenditure side.

"Your Honour, we have been looking forward with eagerness for the day when with the cessation of hostilities every rupee saved from necessary expenditure was to be devoted to education, which is the paramount and primary need of the country at the present hour. The public in general has been expecting an inauguration of compulsory and free primary education on an extensive scale and the general development and growth of education in all departments and branches.

"It is really deplorable that when the country is so backward in education the allotted sums remain unspent and go to swell the next year's budget.

"The provision in the present budget of an increase of about seven lacs over the revised of 1918-19 is certainly very inadequate to meet the exigencies of the situation, and the provision can in no case be said to be generous.

"Your Honour, this state of things is not one on which congratulations may be offered to the Government. When we throw a glance at the budget of the sister province of the United Provinces for educational purposes, the comparison looks like a contrast, and one is constrained to remark that the claims of education in this province are not recognised by the Government to the extent they deserve.

"Your Honour, the head of Education requires the special fostering care of the head of the province, and I would earnestly request Your Honour to insist and insure that the tender plant of free and compulsory primary education so fondly sought to be reared by Your Honour's Government in the shape of the Punjab Compulsory Education Act receives its proper nourishment during the next year to bourgeon forth and develop in times to come.

"The next item to which I would wish to refer is sanitation whose claims are only next to education on the purse of the Government. Influenza, plague and other epidemics claim their victims by lakhs. The squalid surroundings of the poor as well as the rich in villages call for special attention.

The use of pond water for drinking purposes by the inhabitants of villages is a constant source of many malignant diseases, and I would press for more generous provision in the budget for this head.

"It is also necessary and desirable to provide for more money to be allotted to relieve distress in famine-stricken areas and to reduce the hardships due to abnormally high prices of the necessaries of life.

"*Income.*—On the income side the item of excise revenue cannot be lightly passed by.

"Your Honour, I cannot but view with alarm the growing income from excise. It may or may not represent growing prosperity, but what matters most it unmistakably indicates increase in drunkenness and use of intoxicating drugs.

"When every civilised country in the world is thinking of diminishing the evil of drunkenness, we cannot view with equanimity the annual rise by leaps and bounds of the income from excise. This income is practically an evidence of the increasing poverty of a nation from another and more important standpoint and not of its prosperity. The increase under this head represents in money value the corresponding deterioration of the character of the people which is the real capital of the nation.

"This prosperity in income is thus drawn from the capital fund, and if we do not safeguard and insist that in future no such drawing upon capital shall be encouraged we shall be running a losing concern, and before long we shall be confronted with a dangerous situation.

"Your Honour, I am not doubtful of my choice if education, sanitation and other kindred blessings, howsoever felicitous, are to be the price of drunkenness and the evils arising therefrom.

"In a country like ours in which the liquor habit is certainly not indigenous and in which all the religions condemn drunkenness it will be the height of misfortune if the habit is allowed to grow. A lesson may be taken from the United States of America where though, as Your Honour is fully aware, the climatic and other conditions are materially different from those obtaining in India yet the government is doing its level best to banish liquor.

"To my mind the spheres of work of the social reformer and the legislator in this matter are not so sharply defined as they are suggested to be.

"It is the Government to which the subjects are primarily accustomed to look for direction in the cultivation of tastes and the utilization of opportunities. I would, therefore, submit with all the emphasis at my command that Your Honour may be pleased to look with disfavour at the increase in excise revenue and to arrange matters in such a way that the habit of drunkenness may not increase. The Government has lent its countenance to the Juvenile Smoking Act, and I have no hesitation in suggesting that the Government may be pleased to invite public opinion upon the desirability of legislalation for prohibition of the use of liquor and to restrict liquor consumption as far as possible in the near future. If my suggestion is accepted, the income from excise shall suffer, and this head shall not yield the income now estimated.

"With these few words I resume my seat with the hope that the points emphasised by me shall receive due consideration and the budget will be revised in accordance with them."

His Honour the President.—"Has any other Hon'ble Member any observations to make ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard.—"Your Honour, it falls to my lot to give certain minor explanations as to certain statements made by several Hon'ble Members. It is possible that the opinions expressed are shared also by other

Hon'ble Members who have not uttered their feelings. I have the strongest sympathy with those who desire to see the habit of drinking diminished, but it is not a matter which is so easily to be attained as certain of those who have addressed us are prone to fancy. In answering this morning a question that was put to me I drew attention to the fact that there are something like 400,000 acres of sugar-cane in this Province scattered over a very large area. In these circumstances prohibition can only result in the replacement of licit by illicit drinking. Illicit drinking is worse than licit drinking because it lends itself more easily to excess and because the habit of breaking the law is demoralising.

That argument is persistently ignored by all Hon'ble Members who are in the habit of discussing the subject in the Council and speaking against Government's policy in the matter. They take no account of the fact that there are practical difficulties. In these circumstances the suggestions which are put before this Council will continue to be devoid of any practical value. They will be mere words, and will make no impression on the evil of which complaint has been made. This is the first error which is made by our critics. They ignore the fact that the problem is not merely one of licit drinking. That is the first great error. The second great error is that they habitually confuse two entirely different things altogether. It is habitually urged before this Council, it is habitually urged by many who write and speak on the subject outside the Council, that the one test to which we have to look is the increase or the diminution of excise revenue. That, Your Honour, is a totally fallacious suggestion. It is not the revenue which we derive from the excise which makes the difference ; it is the consumption of the deleterious article. If Hon'ble Members look more closely at the figures which are available in the periodical excise reports, they will see that there has been some decrease in the consumption of spirits. The facts do not justify the kind of construction which is put upon it so often.

"I have recently examined the figures for the past five years. I find that in 1913-14 the consumption of liquor was about 20,000 gallons per annum in excess of what it was in the latest year for which figures are available. That is one fact to which I invite the attention of Hon'ble Members.

"Next as regards another matter which has been referred to by certain Hon'ble Members, but which generally escapes attention. That is, the extent of the use which is made of opium in this Province. Recently I drew the attention of the Council to the fact that there had been an actual reduction in the quantities of opium issued to particular shops. When I was searching about for an explanation of the extraordinary increase in the bids for opium licenses which have taken place in the end of the year which is now concluding, one of the possible explanations which suggested itself was that the mere fact of reducing the quantity of a particular drug created a greater stringency in the monopoly of the sale and so gave greater profit to the licensee and induced him to bid higher for his license. It is quite possible that I did not put this explanation forward with sufficient clearness, but I now repeat it. I draw the attention to the fact that in spite of the increase to which a reference has been made, which is indeed an extraordinary one, that is, to the increase in the bids, there has actually been a diminution in the issue of opium to shops and a substantial diminution in the aggregate of consumption in the Province amounting to eight per cent. on the figures of 1913-14.

"There is one other thing which is included in excise, but it is very seldom that Hon'ble Members have paid any attention to it. I refer to what is particularly an Asiatic habit, and is very largely an Indian habit, the consumption of hemp drugs. The consumption of hemp is probably as great an evil as the consumption of liquor. I think many medical men think that it is a far greater evil. But it is a habit of a comparatively

small class of people. It seems to have escaped the attention of reformers. Under the head of hemp drugs there is the most startling confirmation of the value of the policy which Government follows in connection with the excisable articles. That policy, as I have explained in the earlier part of the day, consists in so increasing the taxation as to raise the price and to put the article out of the reach of as many people as possible. That is the policy on the subject. We have applied that policy with marked success to charas, which is the worst of the hemp drugs used in the Punjab. In the course of my experience in the Punjab the duty on that particular article has been raised from 8 annas per seer to Rs. 18 per seer, and I find on examining the figures for the past 25 years that in that period the consumption of this particular article has been so much reduced that it is now only three-fifths of the quantity which it was 25 years ago. There, Your Honour, is a very startling proof of the great value of that feature of the excise policy which consists in increasing the taxation on an excisable article. I think I heard from my Hon'ble friend opposite some suggestion, I am not quite sure, but I believe he said that, if that is the right policy why is it that the Government does not raise the price to put it out of reach of every one? We are at present considering considerable further increases in price by the medium of taxation. It is probable that very shortly there will be substantial increases in direct taxation under all the heads of excisable articles, and I confidently look forward to the result of a check in the increase of consumption if not to an actual diminution.

"Your Honour, on many occasions I have put before this Council and put before other bodies the consideration that it is the prosperity of the country which accounts for very great increases in consumption of excisable articles where such increases take place. This argument has today been attacked from two different directions. It has been attacked on the one hand as being untrue. It is said that there is no prosperity. How should prosperity account for this supposed rise in the consumption of excisable article? Your Honour, when I heard this I thought to myself here is a strange illustration of the extraordinary difference between town and country. Certain of us have our eyes fixed upon the conditions of the middle classes of the town and on those who have fixed incomes. So completely is our attention restricted to urban areas that we cannot see what is going on outside. Now, Sir, I sympathise profoundly with those Hon'ble Members whose tours are, in the nature of things, restricted to a journey along the Mall between their lodgings and the courts in a comfortable motor-car. It cannot be expected of them to know what is going on outside in the great country which lies beyond the urban area. But I trust that they will be willing to listen to those whose duties bring them in constant contact with rural classes. They will fancy that the difficulties which they see in the urban area are shared by the whole Province. If they have any difficulty in believing what I have said, I would draw their attention to the enormous prices which have recently been paid, very largely by members of the town classes, for lands which have been auctioned in the Lower Bari Doab Colony. Nine thousand acres of land has been sold at an average price of Rs. 493 an acre, and in some cases prices went up to Rs. 1,010 per acre. Well, Your Honour, some of us may think that it is a pity that land should be so valuable as to be placed beyond the reach of the ordinary man, but surely no one will deny when prices of this kind are paid that there is money somewhere that makes it possible to buy. And if that is not an evidence of prosperity nothing can be taken to be such. That is not the only test of which a demonstration can be given of the presence of the extraordinary quantity of money in the country. A short time ago there was another kind of auction held in the Montgomery District. It was an auction of the right of the temporary cultivation of land by its occupant for one single year. Well, Your Honour, I would inform this Council that sums ranging up to Rs. 81 per acre were paid for the right to cultivate land for one single

year that is to say that people expected to make in one single year, that is to say in two harvests, a net profit of more than Rs. 81 per acre out of that land. If that is not an illustration of the prosperity of the agricultural classes it will be very difficult to find any which could be such. Then, Sir, there is another argument which has been adduced on the subject of prosperity. It is urged that if it be true that the increased consumption of excisable article is a demonstration of prosperity what more can be asked than that the world should demonstrate its prosperity by increasing its consumption. The more drink the more prosperity. But this is not in the least like anything which I have said. The consumption of liquor demonstrates prosperity *if the people are so unfortunate as not to have higher tastes,* and it demonstrates the necessity for my Hon'ble friends here to-day and others like them to attempt the task of the social regeneration of their fellow countrymen. I would call upon Hon'ble Members to collaborate in the efforts of the Government to restrict social evils by coming forward and helping to give their fellow countrymen a better and more refined method of spending their money and spending their time. That is the true lesson which is to be learned.

"Now, Sir, if I am not exceeding my limit there are one or two other topics which I would like to touch very briefly. One Hon'ble Member has spoken in connection with the subject of agriculture. He remarked about the bania-like transactions of the purchase of seeds to be sold at a slightly higher price. If the Hon'ble Member had extended his tours some distance away from the urban area he would have discovered that this item has very much more meaning than that. He would have known, as one whose eyes are really open, whose imagination is cultivated, that this item is one of extraordinary significance. Five lakhs are put into budget for the purchase of seed, selected seed. May I inform the Council of one single item of the results of that expenditure? One of the kinds of seed which is thus provided is the seed of a particular variety of cotton. It is known as 4-F. cotton. (That is one single item out of the whole of 5 lakhs because a great portion of it is expended on wheat). Well, the profits reaped (not by Government but by the people), by the cultivator of this particular kind of cotton in one year by reason of the use of this superior variety, were over 60 lacs. The additional value obtained from that cotton by reason of the provision of this selected seed by Government with a small portion of that 5 lakhs was 60 lacs of rupees.

"One other thing, and that is one with which I am personally closely concerned. That is the sanitation expenditure. Sir, we have been criticised for our failure to spend the total amount which has been budgetted. Well, Your Honour, I have here in the Council a colleague on the Sanitary Board who knows well enough that we have been making efforts for some time past to find means of expending our balance. We have written to almost every Commissioner, we have stirred up every local body, in spite of that we have been unable to spend. A great error which the Hon'ble Members make in their criticism on the sanitation policy of Government and the educational policy of Government is this, that they do not understand that the spending of money is not merely the throwing of money about, without regard to the value of the object upon which we spend it. If that is what the Hon'ble Members desire, they can have it with the utmost ease. It is because we try and endeavour that our money should be spent in a manner which would actually benefit the people, it is for that reason that we have difficulty in spending the whole of it.

"One thing more on the subject of sanitation. It has not been mentioned before this Council, but to me the matter is of the utmost importance, and is fraught with great consequences in the future. The Sanitary Board has been

occasionally criticised because it has not done enough for the rural schemes. Well, Your Honour, I think that that particular error is now in the course of being set right. It has been set right by a method which is perhaps the most effective, that is to say, a new special body has been created—a Drainage Board, upon which Chief Engineers and Sanitary Officers as well as certain officers of special administrative experience will sit. The creation of this Drainage Board is designed to give special attention to this particular problem of the great sanitary evil of rural areas, that is, water-logging and failures in the matters of drainage."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das:—"May I ask one question? What amount of money has been spent on the sinking of drinking wells and many other things which are so vital for the rural areas? Not a pice has been spent as far as I know."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"The Hon'ble Member is not quite correct in saying that not a pice has been spent. He is quite correct in saying that not many thousands of rupees has been spent."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das:—"Yes, I mean not many thousands of rupees."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"Do I understand that the Hon'ble Member means that a pice is an equivalent term for thousands of rupees? As a matter of fact in the course of the last few years there has been a very great difficulty in finding good schemes. Particular Deputy Commissioners, particularly the late Deputy Commissioner of Sialkot, have been able by their efforts to cause local bodies and the inhabitants of village to come forward and produce the schemes. Whenever we have had the chance of giving money for the purpose we have given it. We have been only too delighted and even anxious to make use of our balances for a useful purpose."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah:—"Your Honour, I have been member of the Sanitary Board for a long time, and do not remember that an application has ever been rejected by the Board. It is the fault of the local bodies or the people who do not send their applications. Therefore the Board is unable to spend the money. The Board cannot throw away money without any application."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das:—"Under the present rules of allotment of the Sanitary Board, Your Honour, I do not think many schemes will be forthcoming."

His Honour the President:—"The Sanitary Board will relax the rules where necessary. I think that is a very salutary solution."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"The Sanitary Board has been authorized to relax the rules. The present practice in rural tracts is to give ¾ths of the total cost. If the people ask for so much, the Board would be prepared to give ¾ths and in certain cases the whole amount."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt:—"Your Honour, I think there is every endeavour on our part to increase the provision for worthy objects, but we have got to consider that we sail between the Scylla of extreme caution and Charybdis of extravagance. The budgetting of a large amount for sanitation, if we have not got a good scheme to spend the money on, is unnecessary; but we can spend the money more largely if there are definite sanitary schemes."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey:—"Your Honour, I would like to answer one of the criticisms made by the Hon'ble Ram Saran Das and the Hon'ble Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargava. Both these gentlemen have made an error which Mr. Maynard has already criticised, that is to say, that the mere provision of money in the budget means expenditure. I should have thought that the

lapses during the current year are a sufficient disproof of this statement. In the education budget, if the Hon'ble Members will look closely, they will see that very little money on schools is spent directly by the Education Department. As a matter of fact the Education Department maintains altogether 68 educational institutions, including the Government College, out of 6,000 institutions in the whole of the Province. The expenditure is done indirectly by means of grants-in-aid to private institutions and by means of grants to boards and municipalities for primary institutions. This, I think, is familiar to all the members. The Education Department is therefore attempting to provide in this budget such sums as may be asked by the managers of private institutions, the district boards and the municipalities for the coming year. I have provided under the head Grants-in-aid for the salaries of staffs of aided schools all the money that has been asked for, and we always make every year liberal provision for new extended grants. It is only under the head of Grants-in-aid—Capital Grants-in-aid, where we do not provide the total amount which is promised, because we have found by experience that although we have promised large sums of money very little of those sums are asked for. We have outstanding promises of about 2½ lakhs towards aided secondary schools, but during the present year I do not think under this head we shall have a demand of more than half lakh. That is of course due to war conditions and the price of building material being actually so excessive.

"Again, as regards primary education several members have criticised the budget by saying that for free and primary education more money should be provided. Well, the district boards and municipalities can only move at a certain pace. Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das said that they should move faster. They can only move on a certain 5 year programme which has been drawn up by them on the basis of their needs. I do not know how the Hon'ble Ram Saran Das has said that it will take us a hundred years to remove illiteracy from the Province. The Government contribution is only calculated on the number of schools that can be opened with success during the next 5 years. I may be allowed to illustrate this fact from another Province where we had a similar state of affairs. There we drew up a five-year programme for the number of schools in it. It is a small Province and the number of primary schools needed was only about 450. We started opening at the rate of 70 or 80 schools a year. At the end of 4 years there were something like 350 new schools. I am sorry to say that a certain number of them have failed. We moved too fast. You cannot open schools indefinitely under the voluntary system. It is on this basis that our 5-year programme has been drawn up by the District Inspectors. They have drawn up the programme and included only those schools which they think will have good attendance. You may have read in the quinquennial report on education in India and seen in some statements made in the Imperial Council that the additional number of scholars in rural areas during the last quinquennium is out of all proportion to the additional number of schools. That is also a fact in this Province. Consequently we limit our expenditure to that which we are asked to provide by district boards and municipalities. Even so I am afraid that a certain amount of money will lapse. What is the use of our providing large sums of money when at the end of the year it is to lapse unspent? There is still money lying in the balances of certain local bodies for capital expenditure.

"There is one more criticism by the Hon'ble Ram Saran Das and with which I have the greatest sympathy. That is, the raising of teachers' salaries all-round. That I think is felt by every member of the Education Department from top to bottom. I have already explained more than once why we were precluded from going further. The raising of the pay of the higher ranks of the Indian Educational and Provincial Educational Services rests with the Government of India, and the raising of the pay of the higher ranks of the

Subordinate Educational Service also is closely tied up with the proposals made by the Government of India. Consequently we have not been able to spend the money which has been provided under the head Government Schools—Special for the improvement of salaries pending sanction from the Government of India.

"Then again Pandit Jawahir Lal Bhargava made a comparison with another Province. The comparison is invidious. I would only point out that the expenditure of the other Province is still not in proportion to numbers so large as that of this Province. I think that is all I have to say."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das :—"What Mr. Richey has asked me to explain is how I come to a figure of 100 years as far as the removal of illiteracy is concerned in masses. I think the cost of a primary school is Rs. 300 and I take Government share at Rs. 200. I take the number of students in each school as 20. Two lakhs (the Government contribution) means 1,000 schools. It means 20,000 pupils. The Punjab has a population of 2 crores. Taking 10 per cent. to be the proportion who would go to school it comes to 2,000,000, and as we propose sending only 20,000 to the schools every year it will mean 100 years before illiteracy is removed as far as grants-in-aid are concerned. I believe that grants-in-aid have been refused in certain cases to private schools."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"No grant-in-aid has ever been finally refused."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das :—"I had complaints from certain places where they said that they have not been able to get grants."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"It is probable that the conditions have not been fulfilled. We have certain conditions to be fulfilled. Then as regards the removal of illiteracy, it may take 100 years before all the girls in the Province are educated, but it will not take so much time in the case of boys."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden,—"Your Honour, When I had the honour of introducing the Amended Draft Statement I explained the rules which were to govern the discussion to-day, and at the same time I expressed the fear that the excellence of the budget would more or less stifle discussion. I see to-day that my fears have been realised. I can only congratulate the heroic spirits who ventured to enter the arena of this discussion, albeit with forlorn hopes, and sympathise with the Council generally on the fact that the new procedure was initiated at a time so inauspicious to any real financial criticism. My Hon'ble friend Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal made some remarks as regards the Education head. I would just like to correct the figures which he quoted. Under the head Education the difference between this year's revised and the budget should exclude the special payment of 3 lakhs (the donation to the Khalsa College) so that the difference between the two is not 5 lakhs but 10 lakhs.

"Then the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Hussain made some criticisms as regards the balance. He complained that the usual procedure of piling up balances is continued this year. At the last meeting I explained at some length the reason why we had a balance at all this year, and pointed out that had it not been for receipts of capital as offered to revenue *plus* Government of India generosity there would be no balance at all. I also pointed out at the same time that the receipts were only Rs. 48,000 more than we had anticipated despite the enormous rise under the head Excise which has gone up to no less than 6½ lakhs. Setting aside that head our receipts are no less than 6 lakhs below expectation. I cannot make the position plainer than that, but I would again lay stress upon this fact because it is most important that this Council should not go away with any wrong idea as regards the character of

the balance. Most of the other remarks of the Hon'ble Member had only a remote connection with finance, and I think little is needed in the way of reply. It was pointed out that under the head Forest the proportion between income and expenditure was at present not as good as it was in 1917-18. That is perfectly true. We cannot enter upon any great scheme of development and expect to realise the full benefit immediately. That is an ordinary principle which applies to all commerical undertakings, and there is no reason why forests should prove an exception in that respect. In other words, the return to our investments under that head are partially deferred. We shall reap the full benefit of our expenditure at a later date.

"I need not touch upon the wheat grant as the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard has already explained what is being done. The total expenditure is only about half the original grant, and obviously a grant of that magnitude cannot be spent profitably in a hurry.

As regards fodder famine relief, the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Hussain took exception to the fact that our expenditure under that head had been rather less than had been expected. I do not know why this should be a matter for regret. In point of fact we declared fodder famine in about one-half of the districts of the Province thus rendering them eligible for the concession. Thanks to the excellent arrangements of the Fodder Controller, the expenditure has not been as high as had been anticipated. I do not understand what the Hon'ble Member meant by speaking of a separate fund. The ordinary procedure is simply this that when anybody wants to make use of the concession generally several people club together, an application is made to the Deputy Commissioner, who issues as a matter of course the necessary certificate. There is no question of a separate fund and there is no difficulty in obtaining the benefits of the concession.

"The Hon'ble Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargava has objected to the inadequate provision for famine relief. I would explain that the famine relief head comes into operation only when a state of famine is notified by Government, and it is only after such notification that any expenditure on relief is chargeable to this head. The allotment is not applicable to cases such as the assisting of grain shops or anything of that kind. So long as the famine is not notified any expenditure by way of relief is shown under other heads such as miscellaneous. We have, for instance, under head 32 in the current year a sum of 1 lac for assisting grain shops and a similar sum in next year's budget.

"I confess that when the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das had finished speaking my financial brain was in a whirl. I do not refer to his grandiose notions of finance, regarding one pice as equivalant to a thousand rupees and a difference of 18½ lakhs as nominal, but I do refer to the extraordinary position he has adopted. He has taken me seriously to task for under-estimating the revenue. I have already explained that the revenue was within Rs. 48,000 of our estimate. That is a very small amount compared with 5½ crores. But putting that aside the Hon'ble Member proceeded to paint a picture exhibiting the state of the Province in most gloomy colours, so that after the piteous canvas had been completed, I fully expected that he would have at once proposed that the estimated revenue for next year should be cut down by half. Instead of this he proceeded to grumble because we had only raised the sum by 42 lakhs as compared with the revised. I confess that I am quite unable to see how the position can be reconciled or how to fit in these different factors into any comprehensive scheme of finance, and perhaps it would be better to say nothing more on the subject.

On the expenditure side too I found some difficulty in understanding the Hon'ble Member. Under the head 25-B.—Scientific, for instance, I was severely censured because the department had been given too much money this

year and had consequently failed to spend the sum allotted to it. With the same breath I was even more severely censured because I had not supplied the department with a great deal more money for the next year. A position like this is somewhat difficult even for a Financial Secretary. It reminds me of an amusing article which I read a few weeks ago describing an imaginary meeting held to protest against the doings of the Simplified Spelling Society. This meeting was attended chiefly by monosyllables, and the chair was taken by Revd. Mr. D.—a gentlemen whom I must describe by his initials. The reverend gentleman opened the proceedings by explaining how seriously he could be affected etymologically by the charge, and ended by saying that he would find it extremely awkward to be mistaken for a joyous mother of lambs. After other monosyllables had addressed the meeting this lamb was called on to speak. In the course of her remarks she referred to the Chairman's difficulties, but suggested that while his position was certainly awkward it was not nearly as bad as her own as she would be given two mothers which would be absurd. In fact she concluded: 'I must decline to be doubly damned.' I do not think that my position with regard to the Hon'ble Member's complaints on this point could be described more accurately.

"I do not think I need detain the Council longer. I trust that members will not be discouraged by the fact that this year this discussion had not produced so many speakers as might have been hoped. I feel sure that in future years when members are more accustomed to the new procedure they will find this discussion is of real benefit and a great improvement on the old so-called budget discussion so far as financial matters are concerned."

His Honour the President:—"Before we proceed with the discussion on the resolution, I would just like to say a word on the general discussion of the Financial Statement. I do not propose to discuss any individual heads which have been criticised by Hon'ble Members and to which the official Members have replied. All Hon'ble Members will admit that the separation of the discussion in its financial aspect from the general aspect of the administration is a great financial reform, and though, as the Financial Secretary has just mentioned, this year the discussion has not produced so many speakers as we expected still the procedure is new, and it is as much a testimony to the excellence of the budget as to the difficulties which the Hon'ble Members may have in adjusting their ideas to the new procedure. But there is one word of caution which I would like to address to Hon'ble Members in view of the great importance of this discussion not only in the present year but in future years, and that is the necessity of bringing to this discussion accurate knowledge and well-informed criticism. It is not sufficient to take the memorandum and supplementary memorandum and to base on them arguments and deductions and criticisms. If this discussion is to be of any real use to the administration of the country it must be supplemented by careful study not only of the heads here but of the working of the various departments which these heads refer to. I would give you an illustration. To-day more than any other department Excise has been criticised. Those criticisms have been answered with his usual conciseness and force by my friend Mr. Maynard. It was assumed throughout that because the Excise head showed an enormous increase therefore the vice of drink was increasing by leaps and bounds. It was also assumed that Government was doing nothing to restrain this rampant vice. One Hon'ble Member began his criticism by mentioning the fact that the number of shops for sale of country liquor had increased from 112 to 633. When he was contradicted by the Hon'ble Member he withdrew that statement. I refer to this as an example of the lack of following the working of the departments by certain Hon'ble Members of this Council. If there is one thing more than any other that the Government has at least during my term of office steadily been pursuing, it is the reduction in the facilities for drink. In

every annual report, not only in the Financial Commissioner's report but in the Government Reviews, the Government has taken care to state to what extent the number of shops for the consumption of liquors has been reduced and to what extent the consumption of liquor in gallons has gone up or has gone down. I think in the first year when I took over as Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab the number of shops exceeded 800. Since then it has been reduced to 683. I should have hoped that every member interested in Excise would have realised that fact and noted it as an instance of the policy which the Government has pursued with steadiness. Similarly take the question of Excise income. In the year 1913-14 before the war the Excise income was 34½ lakhs our share, which means a total of 69 lakhs. It is now 55¼ lakhs, that is, an increase of about 60 per cent. At first sight it seems that the Government is encouraging drinking and driving the people to waste their substance on drink. I was just going to ask the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard to quote the pre-war figures and the figures for the last year when he himself quoted them. It appears from those figures that while as compared with 1913-14 the income from Excise has risen by 21 lakhs (60 per cent.), in the same period the consumption of liquor has actually gone down. These are broad facts which I think Hon'ble Members should bear in mind. They can ascertain from the departmental reports supplied to them and published in the Gazette before coming here to criticise the workings of the various departments. We are only too glad to receive such criticisms. The Government is often willing to shape its policy in deference to criticisms, provided those criticisms are founded on up-to-date knowledge. The Council under the Reforms Scheme may look forward to very great increase in power and responsibility. The chief method by which that increased power and responsibility will be given effect to is by means of the control of finance. If finance is to be controlled it cannot be controlled by uninformed criticism. It must be controlled by means of an intimate knowledge of the working of every department of the administration. I would therefore appeal to Hon'ble Members to keep in closer touch with the working of the administration by means of the departmental reports, the Finance Committee and by other methods for which I hope facilities will soon be given. I have nothing more to say except on behalf of the Council generally to congratulate the Financial Secretary one the care with which he has prepared the budget and the general approval it has received."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"The first resolution which stands in my name runs as follows :—

> 'That this Council recommends to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor that Rs. 5 lakhs more be budgetted for 24-B—Sanitation expenditure, and a corresponding decrease effected under the heads 10, 11, 32 or 45.'

"I think it was in the year 1918, on the 7th February, that I proposed a resolution in connection with the subject of Sanitation and in the course of a speech introducing the resolution certain figures were quoted and certain statements were made which elicited a great deal of very valuable information from our Finance Member and from the President of the Sanitary Board who also laid down the general principles or stated the general principles—which guided the Sanitary Board in its administration of matters sanitary. In the course of my speech I had made one or two suggestions and I believe some of them have met with approval. One of the suggestions made was with regard to greater time being given for the conception and development of sanitary schemes. It appeared that at that time the department was in the hands of an officer who was also managing the medical department as well, and naturally could not give the same amount of attention to the sanitary department which he would have otherwise been in a position to give. It was towards the end of 1918 that the offices were separated and a separate whole-

time Sanitary Commissioner was appointed presumably to look after that department and to develop it. Now my complaint with reference to this department is that it does not really receive that amount of consideration at the hands of the Government that it really deserves; that the Government of India gives special grants to be utilised by the Local Government for sanitation, and that the Local Government has not been spending those grants. Whether it is due to the inefficiency of the local boards or whether it is due to the Sanitary Board refusing to take the initiative and waiting to receive the recommendations of the local boards, whatever the cause may be the result is there that the Government of India's wishes in the matter of pushing sanitary schemes have not been as well attended to as in my humble opinion they should have been done. I will go back to March 1917 when the Financial Member's note on the last page stated that Rs. 11,17,000 represented the unspent balance of the Government of India assignment for Sanitation. That was in March 1917, two years ago. Again next year in March 1918, our Finance Member stated towards the end of his statement that Rs. 10,17,000 have been ear-marked as the unspent balance of the Government of India grant for Sanitation. This year for some reason or other the Financial Member's Statement is absolutely silent on this point. This year when this head was introduced by the Hon'ble Member-in-charge of this department the only observation he had to offer was that this head called for no remarks. Now I fail to see why when in 1917 and 1918 we were told by the Finance Member that this unspent balance of the Government of India had amounted to nearly 11 lakhs, this year's note should have been silent and why the Member in-charge when introducing this head should have thought that the omission of that amount from the note, in his words, 'called for no comment.' I take it that if any portion of it had been utilized it ought to have formed part of the statement, which enlightens us on the subject, in paragraph 2 of the note. At all events we might have expected some sort of information on the subject. Now so far as this subject is concerned, turning to the income side of it we find that that brings in about a lakh of rupees. So far as the expenditure side is concerned—24-B—I have already mentioned that it is uncommunicative. The complaint of this part being uncommunicative gains strength when we remember that only a year ago the President of the Sanitary Board, while dwelling on the general ignorance prevailing as to the working of the Sanitary Board, himself promised that in future it would be necessary in the interests of sanitation as a subject that the working of this Board should see the light of the day to a greater extent than it had been doing hitherto. Those of us who are more or less confined within the area of the civil station of Lahore may not possibly know what is the condition of sanitation in villages and towns outside Lahore, but most of us have interests outside Lahore and have opportunities of coming across villagers as well as townsmen who are not *Lahoris*. And I for one can state that the sanitary condition of villages as well as towns is far from satisfactory. When I make that statement I find that the last Sanitary Conference held in this Province did not appear to me to say that they did not agree with the view that I am expressing. One of the most crying needs that I brought out in February 1918, was this very complaint of inundations in canals during the rainy seasons and water-logging resulting in all sorts of defects that it leads to and the diseases that it propagates. I am very glad indeed to learn of the existence or creation, if it is subsequent to February 1918, of this Drainage Board which I hope will render the greatest possible service to the cause of not only the cultivator but help the improvement of the Province generally. Besides that very general sanitary problem, there are other problems, *e.g.*, drinking water-supply and drainage that require more generous treatment than has been meted out to them up till now. I understand, the view taken by the Sanitary Board is that money invested in presenting a well to a village, to which the people living in that village do not contribute, is money thrown away—at least that was what was stated by the President of the Board. I beg

to differ. Drinking water-supply, to my mind, is such an absolute necessity such a preventive of disease that even when presenting a well and running the risk of that village not learning the principle of self-government, it is worth supplying. It is better than waiting till the people of that village are in a position to contribute one-half or one-fourth, as the case may be, of the money required for the construction of a well. As I stated before it is not the case of the village doing something to improve its sanitary condition and the Government coming to its help to do so but it is the case of villages being cured of what looks like an incurable disease. And it appears to me that such grants should be on principle more generously made than they are made now. To see that local bodies do not come out with their suggestions and that balances are left in our hands when the money provided is 9 lakhs or so, it seems to me that there is something wrong somewhere. To my mind, the defect lies in expecting the district officers to do far too much than the time at their disposal allows them to do. The local bodies as they stand are not in a position to move themselves. They look for guidance from the district officers and the district officers have so much to do that they cannot devote much time to every such scheme and the result is that there is no initiative from the district board or municipal bodies. I think the Sanitary Commissioner should be vested with some powers; if his suggestion means something to the district officer, if he is a whole-time officer entrusted with this work: surely he should have powers which may enable him to suggest schemes to local bodies and make certain recommendations with the object of getting them more grants. It may be that the rules which guide the Sanitary Board do not encourage the local bodies to come to it for help or it may be that the present Sanitary Board has been in existence too long. I do not know how it is constituted or how vacancies thereon are filled but it seems to me that it is always an advantage to have what is called fresh blood. It is said, some members have been on it for over 10, 12 or 15 years; it may be that the introduction of new men will bring in possibly more life and, anyhow, fresh ideas.

"Now it seems to me that so far as this department is concerned, at all events, there is one definite thing being done by it. I am referring to the preparation of vaccine in the Vaccine Institute. Can it be said that the Vaccine Institute as it stands at present is sufficient for the requirements of the department? Does it not stand in need of extension? And is it not a really suitable object on which much more money should be spent than is being spent on it at present? So I should say for the development of Vaccine Institute of this Province, which is a credit to this Province as well, as I should say, to India, inasmuch as I understand that vaccine is sent out from this Institute to places outside the Province, we should not be stingy but should spend more money on it. In the second place it seems to me that local bodies cannot possibly be expected to make experiments and to plan out new schemes It would be necessary to have a central laboratory for sanitary experiments. To my mind it is a growing need of the Province that a whole-time man be placed at the head of this affair and that a central laboratory be started which will do a great deal of good."

(*At this stage His Honour the President left the chair and the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard took the chair.*)

"There seems to me no reason why, if we have what we call agricultural farms with the object of familiarising the people with the advancement in our agricultural problems, we should not have similar sanitary farms with the object of showing and demonstrating to villages as well as towns how sanitary arrangements can be made. It does not appear to me why we should not have a sort of model village as a model town with the object of practically demonstrating how a village can be kept clean, how the comforts of that village can in every way be improved and how it can be made more or less immune from diseases which are so prevalent amongst villagers.

[*Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain ; Mr. Maynard.*]

"Now if we are to do all these things it is necessary to have certain funds at the disposal of this Department. The one object of having a whole-time officer in charge of the Department as distinct from a part-time man is that the Department should be developed and, as I said before, I congratulate the Government on having arrived at that decision. But if you are not going to place any fund at the disposal of that Department surely the creation of that whole-time officer is, to my mind, a waste of money on that Department. I find that last year we had about 9 lahhs of rupees for this Department : this year we find that an additional lakh has been thrown in. Does that represent in part the pay of the officer or does it mean to say that that officer is going to utilize the 9 lakhs and similar amount this year to better purposes, or is he going to extend the operations of his Department ? So far as I can see we will not be able to put the money to the best purpose unless we place at the same time a larger amount for the development of this Department and the figure I have suggested, that is to say, 5 lakhs of rupees is, if I may say so, quite modest.

"Now I will try to show that these 5 lakhs of rupees do not necessitate a curtailment under any head and to that extent I believe my resolution stands modified. At the time of my giving notice for my resolution I did not know that the Revised Statement will bring in a new increase of 3 lakhs under the head I—Land Revenue. This brings a total increase under the head at 6½ lakhs. Therefore there is no impediment in the way of the Government spending 3½ lakhs if they feel there is an expenditure which need be incurred So that out of the 5 lakhs, I have proposed, are concerned at all events 3½ lakhs are forthcoming. The question is then how to find another 2 lakhs without in any way curtailing the efficiency of any other department. In this connection I will invite the attention of this Council to head 11—Forest. Therein the proposed increase of expenditure over the Budget of 1918-19 amounts to over 10 lakhs, and in the Revised for 1918-19 the provision under this head was 18 lakhs whereas in the Budget for 1919-20 it is 26 lakhs. So at any rate I propose that this fresh investment of 8 lakhs be reduced to 6½ lakhs and 2 lakhs be taken out of this department and spent on Sanitation. This will not necessitate my dealing with heads 10, 32 or 45. As a matter of fact I was bringing in head 10 for the consideration of the Finance Member, as we find that incomes to the extent of Rs. 2,000 are going to be exempted from taxation it will involve several thousands of tax-payers being disfranchised and thus not being considered. Would it not necessarily involve some reduction of the staff necessary to enquire into those cases ? I think that is one of the justifications for raising the taxable amount. In any case head 10 is not of any consequence and under head 11 a reduction to the extent of 2 lakhs can be easily effected without in any way interfering with the efficiency of the Forest Department. Therefore money is forthcoming. The only point is, is there a need made out for it ? I have tried to explain that what are supposed to be mistakes on the part of non-official members in connection with Sanitation are not mistakes. Nobody wants anyone to throw away money much less a body which is a custodian of the money of the public. What we do feel is that in asking the Government to present such necessities of life as are preventive of disease we are not asking too much. The Department should be given greater importance and sometimes mere show of efficiency is useful. Sanitation is not yet a department of importance in the eyes of the public as Government has not yet given it a status by giving it a generous grant and by giving it out that the Government attaches a great deal of importance to it. That by itself has a great effect on the public and the local bodies as well. With these remarks I place that resolution before the Council for consideration."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard: —"Do I understand the Hon'ble Member that he modifies his resolution and proposes to find 3½ lakhs from the savings under the head Land Revenue and 2 lakhs from head 11—Forest ?"

[*Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"Yes, Sir."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"Sir, I accord my hearty support to the Hon'ble Mian Fazal Hussain's resolution regarding further allotment of 5 lakhs of rupees to the expenditure already budgetted for Sanitation. The budget estimate under this head exceeds the Revised Estimates for the year 1918-19 by Rs. 1,85,000 and the actuals for 1917-18 only by Rs. 83,000. The year 1917-18 as well as the year 1916-17 were exceptionally healthy ; and we had hoped that after the glorious termination of war which retarded sanitary progress, and after the recent influenza epidemic which during the last quarter of the last year has carried away several lakhs of young and healthy persons, our budget would be liberal in providing for larger funds for Sanitation than it ever did before. But unfortunately this is not the case. The country is threatened with another outbreak of this epidemic, for medical men are of opinion that the third or last cycle of influenza epidemic is anticipated during the current year.

"Sir, in the neighbouring Provinces of Agra and Oudh, the Sanitary Department is much better organized than in the Punjab. In the United Provinces, so far as my information goes, they have got qualified Sanitary Engineers in almost every district. Although our Province is blessed by Nature with a better climate yet the toll of human life every year is simply appalling.

"Sir, it is time that our benign Government took practical measure to alleviate the lot of the common village folk who form the backbone of the society and contribute the main support of the State It is often urged that there are no schemes before Government for which funds may be allotted. But how can such schemes come forward until funds are at hand and the department is efficiently manned, which persons, who are capable of preparing and carrying on such schemes. I would crave permission to suggest that Sanitary Engineers should be engaged for every district forthwith to prepare sanitary schemes, and that Government should contribute substantially to the expenditure involved in the execution of such schemes ; and that no schemes if practicable and reasonable should be given up if the sanitary needs of the locality be of a crying nature, even though the people of the locality or the local bodies concerned may not be able to raise their full quota of half share of the expenditure.

"Sir, the time has surely come now when Government, having funds to spare should consider the health of the people as of the greatest importance. There are, in this Province, more than 40 towns with a population of over 10 thousands but it is a matter of surprise that only 15 of them including hill stations and cantonments should have Water Works for the supply of pure water. The number of those having proper drainage arrangements is still smaller. Under these circumstances no fair-minded person will question the advisability of allotting larger sums for sanitation than has been done in the next year's budget.

"The addition of Rs. 1,85,000 in the budget of 1919-20, to that of the last year is hardly adequate to meet the requirements for the necessary equipment and improvement of the Health Department. The abnormal mortality in rural areas due to malaria, plague, tubercolous, cholera, dysentery and other stomach and liver complaints can only be traced to want of a pure supply of drinking water and to want of necessary drainage. It is a sad feature of almost all our villages that dirty water stagnates around the village abadi. Improvement in this direction will certainly require a very large amount of money before it is completed, but a beginning has to be made as early as possible with such an amount as can be provided for and within such limited local area as may be selected every year for this purpose. I may venture to suggest that

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargava ; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Townsend ; Mr. Lumsden.*]

the current year is the proper time to make a beginning when war is over, and there has been appalling mortality due to the ravages of influenza epidemic which has cost the Province about three quarter of a million of life what is 10 times the number of deaths caused during the 4½ years of the great war amongst the Punjabi combatants and non-combatants in all the theatres of the war throughout the world. The influenza epidemic is reported to have reappeared in certain other parts of the British Empire giving a warning to this Province to be forearmed with protective and remedial measures to meet the epidemic more strongly and effectively than during the last quarter of 1918 when we were overtaken by surprise. Under all the circumstances an additional 5 lakhs demanded by the resolution is a very modest amount and can be easily provided for by transferring such amount partly from one and partly from another of the heads 10, 11, 32 and 45 as proposed by the Hon'ble Mover of the resolution. With these few words I support the resolution or from the closing balance of Rs. 2,16,07,000."

The Hon'ble Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargava :—"Sir, the resolution now before the Council has my full support. I have already in my short speech on the amended Draft Financial Statement pointed out that there was a necessity for more generous provision under the head Sanitation. That recommendation was in general terms. Now the resolution embodies a definite proposal and the Hon'ble Mover has pointed out how the increase is necessary and how it can be affected. The introduction of water works and drainage schemes in municipal towns and the sinking of wells in villages will be acknowledged as a great boon and will tend to improve the health of the people. Any amount thus spent cannot be considered to be mis-spent. Any loss that may be caused will be amply recouped by the gain in the health of the people and looking to the nature of the subject and the amount sought for I hope that the recommendation made in the resolution will meet with Government's approval. With these words I lend my support to the resolution."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das :—"Sir, I also support this resolution."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand :—"I also support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend :—"I would like to say a word in connection with drinking water supply. There are certain parts of the Province like Hissar and others where drinking water wells are no use as the water there is salty. In many of the villages the sinking of wells would be an admirable project if it could be carried out but it cannot be carried out as a whole. Nothing that Government can do can make the water sweet. The alternative is to make drinking water tanks. That is done in certain cases but unfortunately in nine cases out of ten the village people use the water for purposes other than drinking. So it does not work in actual practice. It is all very well to pass resolutions and make rules to be adopted by people of higher scale of education, but you have to consider the situation of the village people and the practical impossibility of carrying out these rules."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"Sir, as regards the form of the resolution I must point out that both in its original and in its amended form it is open to serious objection. I do not wish to raise a point of order on the subject but I would call the attention of Hon'ble Members to the fact so that in framing such resolutions they may avoid the mistake which has been made - a mistake which would probably mean that the resolution would be ruled out without further discussion if a formal point out of order was raised. A resolution must be clearly and precisely expressed and raise a definite issue. The present resolution runs : 'That this Council recommends to His Honour the

Lieutenant-Governor that rupees ' lakhs more be budgetted for 24-B.—Sanitation expenditure, and a corresponding decrease effected under the heads 10, 11, 32 or 45.' That, Sir, I submit is not a definite issue. We do not know under what head the expenditure is to be found. It is obvious members while approving of the resolution might hold diverse opinions as to how the money was to be found so that we do not get clear and definite issues in connection with this resolution. As regards the amended form I have to point out the fact that we expect to get an extra 3½ lakhs revenue this year, does not entitle us to exceed the expenditure which has been passed by the Government of India. Consequently the amended resolution contravenes a rule and for that reason it cannot be considered. The resolution must therefore can be retained in its original form. So far as the object of the resolution is concerned I may say that I have every sympathy with it and I have no hesitation in saying that my official colleagues share my feelings in this respect. But that is a different thing from saying that the resolution should be accepted. There are two tests which must be applied to a resolution of this kind. The first is the direct test and the second is the comparative test. Judged by both these tests the resolution will be found wanting. In the Imperial Council Sir Thomas Holland in replying to a resolution of a similar kind moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma suggested two principles. He said: 'The Finance Minister who fail to distinguish between what is important for the future and what is absolutely essential to-day will bring his country to grief in his first year of office.' That is the first principle and the second runs as follows:—'. . . . in business administration take care that all parts of the organisationare duly balanced.' These two principles which laid down by Sir Thomas Holland roughly correspond with my direct and comparative tests. The direct test is this. Can the money asked for be profitably spent during the year in question. Now I may safely say so far as I know there is little or no likelihood that the money will be spent at all. It is practically certain that it cannot be profitably spent. We have not cut down the demand made by the Sanitation Department on behalf of sanitation by a single penny. Consequently there is a very strong presumption that any extra money will not be utilised and it is obvious that money which cannot be so utilised should not be removed from a head where it can be utilised.

"This brings me to the comparative test. We have to consider whether the extra money suggested for the sanitation head can suitably be placed there at the expense of one of the other heads. There are four heads mentioned by the Hon'ble Member in his original resolution . . . ."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"I only discussed one head with reference to Land Revenue. I did not deal with the other three at all."

The Hon'ble Mr Lumsden :—"Do I understand that the Hon'ble Member has reduced his resolution to 1½ lakh? I have already explained that the extra 3½ lakhs under 1—Land Revenue cannot be utilised as the orders of the Government of India. If Sanitary expenditure have been passed this 3½ lakhs is given up, the demand is only for 1½ lakhs."

The Hon'ble Kkan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"No, Sir. My demand is for 5 lakhs and my resolution may stand in its original form."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—' Very well The first head is 10. I must confess that I find it very difficult to understand how 5 lakhs are to be got from a head which consists altogether of half lakh The Hon'ble Member has made no attempt to explain how that is to be done and I am unable to suggest any method. As regards the head Forest the reduction of 5 lakhs would have most serious consequences. Our forest head is one of the few which are really remunerative and if we do anything to reduce this head we are committing the

old mistake of killing the goose that lays the golden eggs. The immediate advantages of the expenditure under this head may not be so great as they will subsequently be but expenditure under this head is a very sound form of investment which cannot but be of great benefit to the Province. To remove 5 lakhs from this head in order to put it under a head where it is not likely to be utilised would be the height of folly. Then the next head which the Hon'ble Member suggests is 32. Here again I am faced with great difficulties, as to how the Hon'ble Member proposes to find 5 lakhs. We can abolish the copying agency, but I cannot think that the country at large and the Hon'ble Members present and who belong to legal profession in particular would view this abolition with equanimity. But even this sacrifice would not be possible because we should have to reduce the income correspondingly with the expenditure or even to a greater extent. Consequently the copying agency cannot be abolished. Then comes the item Grants to District Boards. We can certainly reduce that by half. But perhaps members representing the district boards may have something to say on the subject. They have already made complaints that the grants are inadequate and if they are cut down by half a lakh I do not see how that will improve the position. Then we have the Miscellaneous and Unforeseen Charges. I have already explained that this amount is the Government reserve and we cannot interfere with that without serious inconvenience. Another item under this head is Rewards for killing wild animals but this would give a very small proportion of the 5 lakhs required. I fear, therefore, that the money cannot be found from 32—Miscellaneous. The last head is 45—Civil Works—Civil. As regards this I would point out that this head has suffered severely during the war. It was most drastically down and even this year the figure (71 lakhs) is very considerably under the pre-war figure which the budget in 1913-14 contained, namely, 88 lakhs. Consequently I should be very loath to disturb the very moderate provision under this head. I am sure the members will agree that the repairs of roads and matters of that kind which have been sadly neglected in the past should receive immediate attention. I do not think that we should be doing the budget any good by transferring 5 lakhs from this head to a head where as I have already stated the prospects of its utilisation are extremely small. For these reasons therefore I must oppose this resolution. At the same time I should be very glad to find any reasonable sum which may be found necessary during the year provided the department can spend it. We have a considerable reserve and it is possible that there may be other savings so that I may assure the Hon'ble Member that if any scheme which involves a reasonable sum of expenditure is forthcoming during the coming year it should be possible to finance it."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt:—"As Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals I may say something about sanitation, that if this 5 lakhs could be utilised this year it would deserve every support. But already the complaint is that the grants made to the district boards have accumulated in large unspent balances. Unless we have a scheme ready cut and dry and know how money can be expended it would be a mistake to put more money under a head to lapse at the end of the year. I understand the Hon'ble Member to mean that more money should be spent on Vaccine Institute but in my opinion money is very much cramped in this Institute. With regard to the Institute of Hygiene which the Hon'ble Member foreshadows, unless we had a complete Institute it would not do. Then again such an Institute would only affect the urban area and would not benefit the masses at all There is no doubt that village sanitation is extremely bad in many cases but it is simply a matter in which much could be done by local bodies themselves and that is by employing a large number of sweepers. I was at Lala Musa some little time ago. There

was an excellent drainage scheme being carried – out surface drainage—but the state of the town and the village was exceedingly dirty and untidy simply because there was not a sufficient number of sweepers employed and no use was made of the Sanitary Inspector.

" As regards influenza, I can assure the Hon'ble Members that influenza is not a dirty disease. It is not a disease of sanitation or insanitation any more than plague is. Therefore the argument of the Hon'ble Mover falls to the ground. It is better to have a large medical staff and a healthy purse than a large sanitary staff to meet any future outbreak of influenza."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—" In giving my reply, Sir, my task is very simple. The resolution has been so well received by the Hon'ble Members of this Council that on the question of merits I am simply to refer to one or two things. One was with reference to drinking wells. It has been pointed out that in some places Government cannot present wells because the water is salty. That, of course, cannot be helped ; but that does not apply to the whole of the Province. And for such parts of the Province as have salty water, drinking water tanks can be constructed, and this to my mind, would supply the deficiency. Then with reference to what has fallen from the lips of the Inspector-General of Hospitals I think it is very gratifying to learn that both these points—the development of the Vaccine Institute and the possible erection of the Institute of Hygiene are favoured. This will be welcomed by the Province with gratitude. So far as the possible improvement by providing better supervising agency in the matter of cleanliness is concerned, that again is a matter with which the Sanitary Department can deal.

" Coming to the Finance Member's difficulties, Sir, I do not understand why 3½ lakhs is not available for being utilized over the Budget of 1919-20. I understand that our income for .918-19 has increased by 3½ lakhs. If that is so, I presume it is a valuable piece of information which has been conveyed to us by means of this Revised Statement."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—" I might explain to the Hon'ble Member that what is sanctioned by Government of India is not the balance but the expenditure. If you spend an extra 3½ lakhs say under 3—Land Revenue during the year you are increasing the total expenditure and consequently you are exceeding the sanction of the Government of India. This is under rule No. 13-G."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—" If that is so as the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden has explained that the increases which come to our knowledge after the 7th March cannot be utilized and only go to swell the balance then I am restricted to the proposal contained in my resolution that is to say to take money from some of the other heads. He pointed out that so far as head No. 10 is concerned that can only supply a small amount. The amount that can be spared is, say, 10 or 15 thousand rupees. That is a trifling figure and need not detain me any longer. Then the Hon'ble Finance Member laid down two tests which are unexceptionable. One is that there should be chances of spending the amount during the year and the other is that something better deserving should not be starved. That is quite sound. Now when he proceeded to say that my proposal amounted to killing the goose that laid the golden egg, I do not agree and I differ. I never intended to starve that goose at all. My idea was that it should not be over-fed. So giving it the same amount that it has been receiving in the past and a little more I thought it would be feeding it properly. And there is no assurance that the large amount—I think it is 8 lakhs extra—which is being given her and which is more than she ever had, is not likely to disturb her life.

[*Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain* ; *Mr. Maynard.*]

"Taking the next head 32, the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden began to talk about the copying agency and grants to local bodies. That was only an attempt at mincing the issues. I had not the slightest notion of reducing the head. We had only Rs. 20,29,000 under head 32 in the Revised of 1918-19 which has been increased to Rs. 24,72,000 in the Budget for next year. But so far as this particular head is concerned I believe the increase is of 5 lakhs. That increase has any justification for it. There are provided Rs. 6,76,000 under the sub-head 'Miscellaneous and Unforeseen Charges.' That itself may be reduced by 5 lakhs without starving any other department at all. Therefore that objection will not come in my way and I will preserve the next head 45 for my other resolutions."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"Before the Council proceeds to vote on the resolution, I might explain briefly that in spite of its sympathetic attitude the Government is not able to accept the resolution. It is for two reasons : one is that new schemes for the utilization of money cannot be prepared in time to be useful during the coming year and the second reason is that money cannot be provided from the heads which are indicated by the Hon'ble Mover. These are the two reasons for which in spite of its sympathetic attitude the Government is not able to accept the resolution. As regards the attitude of the Government I think the remarks which have fallen from the Finance Member and from the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals have made it quite plain that it is the desire of the Government to push on all reasonable sanitary schemes, well thought out and matured, as rapidly as possible."

The resolution was put to the vote and lost.

Adjournment.

The Council was adjourned till the 14th of March 1919 at 10-30 A. M.

LAHORE :
The 1st April 1919.

T. P. ELLIS,
Secretary, Legislative Council, Punjab.

APPENDIX A.

ANSWER TO QUESTION No. 49 ASKED BY THE HON'BLE CAPTAIN SARDAR GOPAL SINGH ON THE 6TH FEBRUARY 1919.

Statement showing by religion, the number of Tahsildars, Naib-Tahsildars and Superintendents of Deputy Commissioners' Vernacular Offices in the Punjab.

Serial No.	Name of appointments.	Hindus.	Sikhs.	Muhammadans.	Christians.	Total.
1	Tahsildars	51	19	59	...	*129
2	Naib-Tahsildars ...	88	41	114	2	*245
3	Superintendents, Deputy Commissioners' Vernacular Offices.	11	...	17	...	28

*NOTE.—The number of these appointments varies from time to time in accordance with Settlement and other requirements.

APPENDIX B.

(SEE ANSWER TO QUESTION No. 14.)

Statement showing results of the final examinations of the Sub-Overseer Class held by the Government School of Engineering at Kasul in the years 1916 *to* 1918.

Order of Merit.	1916.	1917.	1918.	REMARKS.
1	Ram Kishan ...	Chandan Singh ...	Harbans Lal, Minocha	
2	Bahadur Singh ...	Lekh Singh ...	Ram Labhaya Mal	
3	Fazl Karim ...	Gauri Nath, Sehgal ...	Kartar Chand Parmara.	
4	Gurdit Singh ...	Bhola Nath ...	Babu Ram, Gupta.	
5	Abdul Ghani (2) ...	Har Charan Singh ...	Sarda Ram.	
6	Kashi Ram ...	Kartar Singh ...	Jagat Singh.	
7	Mulk Raj ...	Harbans Lal, Talwar ...	Kashi Ram.	
8	Farid Chand ...	Kidar Nath, Khosla ...	Muni Lall.	
9	Abdul Karim ...	Rahmat Ullah ...	Ajit Singh, Sohal.	
10	Ghulam Hussain ...	Ishar Singh ...	Sardari Mal.	
11	Faqir Chand ...	Dewan Chand, Bhatia ...	Bhagwan Das (1).	
12	Amar Nath Sharma ...	Mohan Lal ...	Muhammad Yaqub.	
13	Asa Singh ...	Labhu Ram, Baharadwaja	Sant Singh, Rahi.	
13	Garan Ditta Mal ...	... ...	...	
14	Harbans Lal, Khurrana ...	Labha Mal ...	Narsingh Das, Bajaj.	
15	Mukand Lal ...	Amar Nath, Puri ...	Bhakhi Ram, Sikka.	
16	Raja Ram ...	Khuda Bakhsh ...	Gaupat Rai, Bhatra ...	
17	Sardar Ali ...	Chhotu Ram ...	Allah Ditta.	
18	Mehr Chand ...	Abdul Aziz ...	Nazar Ullah.	

1916.

Nos. 1, 2, 3, 6 and 10 secured permanent appointments, and Nos. 6, 8, 14, 15, 17 to 19, 26, 30, 33, 34 and 35 (Sikandar Lal) temporary posts in the Public Works Department, Punjab.

The remainder all secured employment elsewhere.

1917.

Nos. 1, 3, 9, 12, 16 and 18 secured permanent appointments and Nos. 2, 4, 6, 7, 11, 13, 14, 19, 20, 23 to 27, 29, 30, 35 and 44 temporary posts in the Public Works Department, Punjab.

With the exception of No. 33, Natha Singh, who remained unemployed and No. 46 Parma Nand, Puri, who had to pass in Levelling all the rest obtained employment elsewhere.

Order of Merit.	1916.	1917.	1918.	Remarks.
19	Makhan Lal ...	Sardar Muhammad ...	Vidya Rattan.	
20	Kehar Singh ...	Wali Muhammad ...	Sundar Lal.	1918.
20	... ...	...	Abdul Hakim.	Nos. 1, 2, 6, 12 and 17 secured permanent appointments, and Nos. 3 5, 7, 8, 10, 13 to 15, 18 to 20, 22 to 25, 28, 30, 33 and 34 temporary posts in the Public Works Department, Punjab.
21	Hakim Singh ...	Karm Chand, Behal ...	Muhammad Rafiq.	
22	Ghulam Muhammad ...	Majid Ullah ...	Sajjad Hussain.	
23	Ram Nath ...	Daulat Ram ...	Sundar Singh, Puri.	
24	Parmeshri Das ...	Rasaul Lal ...	Balak Ram, Sharma.	The remainder secured posts elsewhere.
25	Umr-ud-Din ...	Karam Ilahi ...	Atta Ullah Sadiq.	
26	Ghulam Qadir ...	Atta Ullah ...	Durga Das Bomby.	
26	... ...	Abdul Wahid ...	...	
27	Mohan Ram ...	Gurdit Singh ...	Bhagwan Das (2).	
28	Daulat Ram ...	Ghulam Sabdar ...	Inan Ullah Haq.	
29	Harbans Lal, Sehgal ...	Muhammad Yaqub ...	Behari Lal, Khanna.	
30	Allah Ditta ...	Sultani Ram ...	Ratton Singh.	
31	Nabi Ahmad ...	Mehr Chand, Puri ...	Nand Singh.	
32	Rup Lal ...	Ghulam Abbas ...	Lajpat Rai, Gandhi.	
33	Surjan Singh ...	Natha Singh ...	Gian Chand, Shrikanth.	
34	Faiz Muhammad ...	Manzur Ellahi ...	Amar Singh.	
35	Chandar Bhan ...	Behara Singh ...	Jahan Dad Khan.	
36	Sadiq Muhammad Khan	Ghulam Rasul ...	Narsojan Das, Salwan.	
36	Sikandar Lal ...	...	...	
37	Hari Chand ...	Labh Singh ...	Chhajju Ram.	
38	Wazir Chand ...	Nagina Singh ...	Sant Ram.	
39	Atma Singh ...	Pindi Jan ...	Badri Nath.	
40	Jawahir Singh, Puri ...	Mangi Raj ...	...	
41	Abdur Salam ...	Beni Parshad ...	...	
42	... ...	Mohindar Singh ...	...	
43	... ...	Muhammad Husain ...	...	
44	... ...	Hashmat Ali ...	...	
45	... ...	Diwan Chand, Behal ...	...	
46	... ...	Faqua Nand, Puri ...	...	

APPENDIX C.

(See Answer to Question No. 17.)

	Hindus.	Sikhs.	Muhammadans.	Remarks.
(a) Population ...	14,736 (including Jains).	1,684	27,197	
(b) Voting strength ...	2,407	135	2,661	
(c) Members on the Municipal Committee—				
1. Elected ...	6	1	9	
2. Nominated ...	1	1	2	
3. *Ex-officio* ...	1	...	1	

APPENDIX D.

(See Answer to Question No. 19.)

Circular No. 32-760, dated Lahore, 7th May 1897.

From—M. W. Fenton, Esq., Revenue Secretary to Government, Punjab,

To—All Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners in the Punjab.

The Committee of a certain Municipality in the Punjab having granted compensation for dearness of provisions to their establishment otherwise than in strict accordance with the rules laid down by Government on the subject, the Lieutenant-Governor is pleased to decide that District Boards and Municipal Committees shall in those cases in which they grant the allowance, and financial conditions admit of this being done, restrict and limit it by the rules in question, which are contained in Article 72 of the Civil Account Code, and by the supplementary orders issued by the Local Government in connection with those rules. It is not necessary that a District Board or Municipal Committee should apply for the special sanction of Government before granting the allowance, but it should not be granted except when the Government has by general orders brought the rules into operation, and it should be confined to those Divisions or Districts in which the grant of compensation to Government servants may from time to time be allowed.

APPENDIX E (1).

(See Answer to Question No. 20.)

Statement showing by Divisions the number of girls' schools in the Province.

	Secondary Schools.					Primary Schools.					Grand Total.
	Government.	Board.	Aided.	Unaided.	Total.	Government.	Board.	Aided.	Unaided.	Total.	
Lahore Division	1	7	18	1	27	...	181	77	10	268	295
Jullundur Division	...	4	5	3	12	...	126	70	6	202	214
Rawalpindi Division	...	2	5	...	7	...	109	76	13	198	205
Multan Division	...	7	2	...	9	...	110	41	...	151	160
Ambala Division	...	2	3	...	5	...	97	30	8	135	140
Total ...	1	22	33	4	60	...	623	294	37	954	1,014

APPENDIX E (2.)

(See Answer to Question No. 20.)

The following shows the distribution of Inspectresses by Division :—

Lahore Division	...	Chief Inspectress and one assistant.
Multan	...	One Inspectress.
Rawalpindi Division	...	One "
Jullundur "	...	One "
Ambala "	...	One " (temporary and attached to the Normal School for Women, Lahore, temporarily).

Visits were paid to 770 Schools. Many schools were visited a second time and city schools often more than twice.

Name of Division.	Number of Schools inspected.
Lahore	265
Jullundur	173
Rawalpindi	143
Multan	99
Ambala	100

APPENDIX F (1).

(See Answer to Question No. 21.)

Statement showing the number of aided secondary schools for Indians in each Division of the Punjab.

Serial No.	Name of the Division.	Number of boys' schools.	Number of girls' schools.	Total.
1	Ambala	13	3	16
2	Jullundur	21	4	25
3	Lahore	51	18	69
4	Multan	13	1	14
5	Rawalpindi	24	6	30
	Total ...	122	32	154

APPENDIX F (2).

(See Answer to Question No. 21.)

Statement showing the number of Private Recognised Secondary Schools for Indians in each Division of the Punjab.

Serial No.	Name of the Division.	Number of boys' schools.	Number of girls' schools.	Total.
1	Ambala	19	3	22
2	Jullundur	46	9	55
3	Lahore	62	25	87
4	Multan	16	2	18
5	Rawalpindi	32	6	38
	Total ...	175	45	220

APPENDIX G.

(*Vide* Answer to Question No. 34.)

Statement asked for in question No. 6 asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das, C.I.E., in the Punjab Legislative Council on the 13th March 1919.

Old Scale.		New Scale.	
Class.	No.	*Anglo-Vernacular Section.* No.	*Classical and Vernacular Section.* No.
Class I (400 grade)	2	2	...
Class I (350 grade)	2	2	...
Class I (300 grade)	2	2	...
Class I (250 grade)	5	5	...
Class II (150—10—200)	35	34	...
Class III (100—8—140)	64	68	5
Class IV (75—3—90)	118	112	15
Class V (55—3—70)	147	118	42
Class VI (35—3—50)	260	132	146
Class VII (20—2—30)	289	...	215

APPENDIX H.

(See Answer to Question No. 44.)

Statement.

Percentage of the cost of carrying out the 5 year programmes for the expansion of Vernacular Education to be borne by Provincial Revenues.

No.	Name of district.	Grade assigned.	No.	Name of district.	Grade assigned.
1	Lahore	50	17	Simla	No grade assigned. Government will consider proposals as submitted annually by the Board.
2	Amritsar	60			
3	Gurdaspur	60			
4	Sialkot	60			
5	Gujranwala	60	18	Kangra	80
6	Gujrat	60	19	Hoshiarpur	60
7	Shahpur	60	20	Jullundur	60
8	Jhelum	100	21	Ludhiana	70
9	Rawalpindi	100	22	Ferozepore	60
10	Attock	90	23	Montgomery	50
11	Mianwali	80	24	Lyallpur	50
12	Hissar	70	25	Jhang	60
13	Rohtak	80	26	Multan	60
14	Gurgaon	60	27	Muzaffargarh	60
15	Karnal	50	28	Dera Ghazi Khan ...	50
16	Ambala	60			

N.B.—Government will also contribute to the extent of Rs. 2 lakhs annually towards the capital expenditure of district boards. The Government grant will be a proportion of 75 per cent. in the case of boards graded for recurring grants at 70 per cent. or more, and of 50 per cent. in the case of other boards.

Abstract of Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1915.

THE Council met at the Government House, Lahore, at 10-30 A.M., on Friday, the 14th March 1919.

PRESENT:

The Hon'ble Mr. HERBERT JOHN MAYNARD, C.S.I., I.C.S., Vice-President, presiding.

The Hon'ble Mr. JOHN PERRONET THOMPSON, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. JAMES ALEXANDER RICHEY.

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar GOPAL SINGH.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khawaja YUSAF SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. OSWALD FARQUHAR LUMSDEN, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad MEHDI SHAH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit JAWAHAR LAL, BHARGAWA.

The Hon'ble Mr. FRANK WAVERLING WOODS.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur RAM SARAN DAS, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada BHAGAT RAM.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur BAKHSHI SOHAN LAL.

The Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum RAJAN SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. CREWE ARMOND HAMILTON TOWNSEND, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. CHARLES JOSEPH HALLIFAX, C.B.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian FAZL-I-HUSAIN.

The Hon'ble Mr. LEWIS FRENCH, C.I.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN.

The Hon'ble Colonel ROBERT CHARLES MACWATT, C.I.E., M.B., F.R.C.S., I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. THOMAS PETER ELLIS, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard.—"Before we begin the proceedings to-day, I want to make a few remarks to the Council about the resolution on the subject of expenditure on sanitation with which we dealt yesterday. No doubt the Hon'ble Mover and those who supported him had in view rather the immediate sanction of works on sanitation than additions to sanitation staff, but of course we can only have works when we have the men who will draw attention to the defects and who will design the improvements and give effect to them. Therefore in providing for men a step is made towards the execution of works. I felt at the end of yesterday's proceedings that there was something in the nature of misunderstanding between Government and those members of Council who are anxious for a more vigorous policy of expenditure on sanitation, and I am authorised to tell you that Government fully recognises that the pace of improvement in sanitation is at present less rapid than it should be. That is due largely to the apathetic attitude of local bodies. It is also due in part possibly to the weakness of the staff which deal with these matters. Therefore in order that there may be no misunderstanding as to the true attitude of Government which is one entirely identical with that of Hon'ble Members who are eager for the extension of sanitary works, I am authorised to tell you that Government is now considering the proposal to appoint Health Officers in rural areas. The function of those Health Officers will be to draw attention to the defects, and when attention is drawn to specific defects, that is the first step to remove them. In addition to that the Government is quite prepared to consider the question of increasing the strength of the Sanitary Engineer's staff. At the present time it is quite true that our one Sanitary Engineer is very often not able to get round the Province sufficiently rapidly. Works are occasionally held up for a time because of the fact that he is not able to visit the places himself nor to send any of his subordinates.

"Government therefore is prepared to consider the question of strengthening the sanitary staff or possibly to entertain a second engineer.

"In addition to this there are certain matters to which Colonel Mac-Watt drew attention for the improvement of the Vaccine Institute, and so forth. It is of course not possible to have a great scheme matured during the coming year, but I am authorised to inform you that the possibility of carrying out measures of this kind will be considered in a sympathetic spirit. As regards funds it was quite clear from Mr. Lumsden's speech that every attempt will be made to provide funds for any reasonable demand."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Husain :—"Sir, the Resolution which I am to place before the Council is Resolution No. 2 which stands in my name and which runs as follows :—

> 'That this Council recommends to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor that rupees ten lakhs more be budgeted for 22 Education expenditure, and a corresponding decrease effected under heads 10, 11, 32 or 45.'

"Now it is not necessary for me to introduce this subject in the sense of emphasising its importance because the importance of this subject is recognised on all hands. It is also, I believe, fully appreciated that this is the one subject in which Indians of all shades of opinion are most enthusiastically interested, and it is the one subject for which they have already made sacrifices of time as well as money ungrudgingly, and they are prepared to make further sacrifices as well. On the other hand, it is also fully recognised that the Government has been doing its very best in order to promote the cause of education, that it is doing a great deal now, and that it is prepared to do a great deal more in the future. The object of this Resolution is two-fold : one to draw a small amount comparatively speaking towards this object and in the second place there seems to be some misunderstanding connected with this subject

and I should very much like to have it removed. I may state at the very outset that after carefully studying the subject and keeping in view what has been happening during the last year and the year before, if, Sir, you will permit me to do so, I would reduce my demand of 10 lakhs to 5 lakhs. Now I may mention that the subject for the sake of clearness be divided into two parts, say, education general and education special. By education special I mean more or less education connected with agriculture, industries, commerce and so forth. In education general I no doubt include primary, secondary and higher education and also scientific education, the art of teaching (Training College) and so forth. It is generally understood, Sir, that local bodies and Government are generally responsible for primary education. It is also well understood that so far as secondary education is concerned the responsibility lies not with the local bodies as a rule nor, I believe, it has been sufficiently recognised to be the duty of the Government. And yet a third body has come in, that is to say, the public either in the shape of denominational institutions or general institutions to undertake the work of organising secondary education, and this body has been very largely helped by the Government by means of grants-in-aid both for building purposes and for recurring expenditure. When we come to higher education we find that there are no local bodies to shoulder that burden, and I am rather glad these are not. But there again the Government has not expressly stated that it is responsible for higher education. Then again a third body, that is to say, the public, has come in and borne most of the expenditure incurred on that part of education. There again the Government has been helping this body—the public—by giving them grants in-aid for building purposes as well as in some cases for recurring expenditure. At the top of this higher education is the University for which I understand Government and Government alone is responsible. Dealing with this part of my subject, that is to say, education general, I want just to mention—as it will be necessary for the purposes of my argument later on—that the Government of India has also been making special assignments for the purpose of promoting the cause of education. Some of these began at the time of Coronation. These primary education grants and local grants were expected to push on the cause of education. Later on special recurring grant was made in 1917 with the object of increasing the salaries of teachers and improving their teaching or improving the training institution. Now this particular item has been the subject of a great deal of criticism and comment. It has been said that in 1917 this recurring grant was made by the Government of India with particular and definite instructions. One of the directions was to improve the salary of teachers—the emoluments of teachers, I believe the word 'emolument' was used, and the second was the training of teachers. Therefore obviously when this grant was sanctioned there was no difficulty in the way of finding out as to what was to be done in this matter. Similarly there was no question of the Government having to take the trouble of organising any particular scheme in order to disburse this money in accordance with the instructions received from the Government of India. And yet we find in the Budget of 1917-18 it was stated that here is a lump sum given us by the Government of India to be utilised for particular purposes. When we come to the next year, 1918-19 Budget, we find therein stated that out of this fund—I believe—40,000 rupees have been utilised and the rest is there unspent. Later on in that Budget we find under the head of education schools that during the course of 1918-19 not more than 67,000 rupees have been disbursed out of this fund. That would bring the arrears out of this fund to something like very nearly 3 lakhs—there was 2,53,000 rupees which is very nearly the figure. This year we have another 1,75,000 rupees coming in for the same purpose, thus swelling the credit of this fund to a very large amount, that is to say, above 4 lakhs. Naturally the Government of India had made this grant feeling that it is needed, that is to say, the financial position of teachers was considered so bad that the Government of India

thought it necessary to make a special grant in order to improve it in the year 1917. I understood the Director of Public Instruction to say that that was really a thing that was felt, and that it was a necessity, and yet we find during the year 1917-18 no outlet was found for these large sums. Either there was no need or if there was need there was certain slackness in the disbursement. The only explanation up till now offered is: we were waiting for the re-organization of the general scheme of the Indian Educational Service and the Subordinate Educational Service, so that the various steps in the promotion of teachers may fit in the gradation of the Educational Service as a whole. That may be, Sir, a very good idea to have the gradation effected at one time, but if the Government of India were justified in making this grant in 1917, that was because of their being under the impression that it was a sore necessity. And yet the money has not been utilised and the teachers have been feeling the pinch during all these years, and they had to wait not because they do not deserve an increase or need it but simply because there is a scheme pending which it would be the best for the Goverment to deal within all its three grades: subordinate, provincial and Imperial. I beg to submit, Sir, that it is hardly fair to the teaching department at all. I may mention here that a large number of teachers are in the grade of 20—30 rupees, and I believe I am not overstating the case when I tell the Council that these Vernacular School teachers remain in this grade of 20—30 rupees normally for about ten years, and further when I tell the Council that these Vernacular School teachers teach all the subjects in the primary department and in several cases in the middle department. Therefore, Sir, the sooner the Government decides to take measures to spend a moiety of this large sum in improving the emoluments of the teaching staff—and for the present the lower part of it—the better for the department as a whole, especially for the poor teachers. In the second place this grant was designed to increase the efficiency of the teaching institutions, that is to say, the Normal Schools and the Training College. There again it was a need which was badly felt. Here we find that the schemes of xepansion of secondary and primary education are impossible to execute without the help of the trained teachers. It has been found that the proportion of trained teachers up till last year was not more than 50 per cent. of the whole teaching establishment, that is to say, the existing institutions stand in need of more trained teachers and new institutions need more trained teachers than the already existing ones. Therefore it was absolutely essential that more Normal Schools for men should have been added in 1917, more added in 1918, and active schemes for further expansion of these Normal Schools executed during this year. That was, to my mind, the object with which the Government of India had made that grant. There again the Education Department may have done its best, but so far the result does notshow much done in that direction. We might possibly be told that money is forthcoming, and there is the Department willing to utilize it, but what is the good of having both unless there are men forthcoming to get into these institutions. There again I will say, Sir, that so far as the Training College is concerned, not one-third of the total candidates get into that institution, that is to say, very nearly two-thirds of the applicants. I may be exaggerating but not less than one-half have to go away without getting a seat in that institution. That has been happening for at least 3 or 4 years. Therefore it cannot be said that there is no need for another institution. I have submitted, Sir, that there is the need so far as the expansion problems are concerned, there is the need so far as the candidates are concerned, there is I believe the wish, then there is no reason when money is forthcoming, when need is there, that that wish be not translated into actual starting of these schools. The reason why I am emphasising this point of normal schools and Training College is that without their help really no scheme of expansion can possibly prosper. Proceeding now to take up the question of primary education it is obvious that no primary education

expansion can possibly take place unless it has been preceded by expansion of vernacular middle school education, for the obvious reason that all vernacular teachers come from vernacular middle institutions after they have been trained well at a normal school. So far as I know, Sir,—I say subject to correction—there has been next to nothing in the line of expansion of vernacular middle education during the last 3 or 4 years, with the result that a ground has not been prepared for a vigorous policy of expansion so far as primary education is concerned. Now it is absolutely essential that Government in order to carry out the policy of primary education should do two things. One is to extend vernacular middle education and the other is to afford facilities for training to those men who have obtained vernacular middle school education and are prepared to go into the educational line. That can only be done, Sir, if we increase the number of our vernacular middle schools, and so far as I can see there is no scheme for these schools, though the Director of Public Instruction in his last Report has acknowledged that we need a larger number of vernacular middle schools than are existing at present. I do not see in the Budget any scheme stated here, though I have no doubt that the scheme is conceived in his mind and probably exists in his office for the expansion of vernacular middle school education. I submit, Sir, that this vernacular middle school expansion scheme would require not less than a lakh of rupees during the year. How I have worked out is like this: for every two primary schools that have lost their 5th class I expect the Government to put in at least one school with six classes and at least one of these three schools with six classes should have a full middle department, that is to say, the 7th and 8th class added to it. This means that there should be started 100 schools with two classes added to them and at least 30 schools with full middle department. The total expenditure on this will not be less than a lakh of rupees. My submission is that without this expenditure all our efforts to extend primary education will prove fruitless. At the same time I recognise that so far as normal schools are concerned the money at the disposal of the Government in the Budget is sufficient, but so far as the expansion of vernacular middle school education is concerned a lakh of rupees is needed to be added. This addition of 5th and 6th classes to 100 primary schools a year and a full middle department to 30 schools a year will be an effectual reply from the Government to those critics of the Primary Education Bill who had said that this measure is going to do away with good primary education inasmuch as it reduces its period from 5 to 4 years and is likely to make for illiteracy rather than for literacy.

"Now proceeding further having dealt with primary and secondry education and normal schools, I beg to draw the attention of the Council to the Budget wherein they will find that year after year under minor head 1, *i. e.*, University, there has been no change for better or worse that is to say 87 or 88 thousand is provided year after year. One would have thought our recent experience has shown that higher education is as important for astate as primary education or secondary education. One would have thought that with our expanding revenue we would be prepared to devote larger amount of money for higher education but nothing of the sort has been done. I need only mention this much that in other places like Calcutta a great deal is being spent in turning the University into a residential University and a University that teaches.

"Here we find that no such attempt is made by making grants for that object to the University. We badly need making a beginning in that direction. It is well known to you, Sir, that we can certainly do well with at least five professors as University professors, a scheme which to begin with requires a lakh of rupees. If the amount is forthcoming, I claim, that this revenue will be put to the best possible use. Therefore I claim, Sir, that one lakh be added to minor head 1 under 22—Education.

"Now I forgot to mention at the proper place that so far as training institutions are concerned the main institution is, of course, situated in the capital of the Province, Lahore. It has been complained year after year that the institution wherein our teachers are being trained is not only cramped with pupils but it has got no playing fields whatsoever. That is the objection which has been taken against this Institution year after year by Inspecting Committees of the University, and I understand a few years ago the Government was anxious to supply this defect and a scheme was taken in hand of finding extensive playgrounds for the Training College as well as for other institutions between the Veterinary College and the Ravi. Apparently the war came in and that scheme was shelved. I claim that it is time that that scheme be taken up again, and I expect that in the Budget for this year provision will be made for this growing demand of the Central Training College. I understand that that scheme requires very nearly 2 lakhs of rupees. To my mind that object is also a very good object, and if the teachers who are going to be the managers of a large number of institutions all over the Province do not get full benefit of their stay in the Training College especially with reference to out-door life and when they become teachers, and in some cases headmasters of some institutions much cannot be expected from them in this direction. Thus you will see, Sir, that at least 5 lakhs of rupees are badly needed for the additional programme which I have ventured to place with reference to head 22—Education.

"The other branch to which I made a reference is education special, that is to say agricultural education, industrial education and commercial education. You are fully aware of the fact, Sir, that a large number of people interested in commercial education have from time to time approached with the request that it is high time that Lahore should have a Commercial College of its own. Now taking everything into consideration it is fit and proper that the Government should patronise and subsidise a Commercial College. I may also mention that the grant that has been made by the Government of India for carpentry school at Jullundur is a very welcome grant, but is it not time, Sir, that an institution of the same type be inaugurated in Sialkot for metal work? Similarly one might multiply these suggestions, but I do not want to take the time of the Council inasmuch as I do not claim any money to be set apart for those purposes. I cannot close this part of my speech without acknowledging that the year that has just come to a close has been a year of a great educational activity in this Province. That activity has been chiefly an activity in the way of laying a foundation stone. It was more of conception than execution. Great schemes of primary education and for other departments have been conceived, planned and laid out. That is one reason, Sir, why I claim that a large amount should be placed at the disposal of the head of Education Department who has taken all the trouble to conceive and plan out all the schemes.

"Now, Sir, the next point is wherefrom the money is to come—an amount of 5 lakhs. Here with your permission I will not touch head 10 and head 11 either of which, we are told, is the goose that is going to lay the golden eggs. But I will definitely ask you, Sir, to effect a reduction under head 32—Miscellaneous, not in the Copying Department which is a money bringing department, not under the head of grants-in-aid which are badly needed by the institutions which get them, but under the head 'Miscellaneous and Unforeseen Charges.' Now taking into consideration the fact that the Revised (1918-19) had only Rs. ,44,000 to provide Rs. 6,76,000 in the next year's Budget is far too much and is certainly contrary to the two general principles which our Finance Member laid down. There is no reason why a very small reduction of 3 lakhs under this head which is a head of unforeseen charges may not be made and in any case even after this reduction, an amount of Rs. 3,76,000 will remain therein.

[*Khan Bahadur Fasl-i-Husain; Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah; Pandit Jawahar Lal Bhargava*].

"Now for the remaining 2 lakhs of rupees, I beg you to look to head 45—Civil Works—Civil. Now I always believe, Sir, in one and the same principle governing all cases. There is no reason why our Finance Member should be hopeless with reference to some departments and hopeful with reference to others. I mean he has no hope as to the capacity of spending money in a particular department like Education, but he does hope and believe in the Public Works Department spending a large amount. That is not fair when his repeated strain is to the effect that that department does not run through the money that it promises to run through in the beginning of the year, for instance, last year well-knowing that the war was on they expected to spend a large amount of money. The year before it was the same. Therefore it is not fair to assume that this Department will spend the large amount of money which is being allotted to it keeping in view the fact, Sir, that although the war is over it would be very difficult during the course of the next year to obtain the expensive machinery which was not forthcoming during the course of the war. More than this I find, Sir, that there is a technical term used 'works in progress,' and we are told that 'works in progress' will suffer if there were no money for them at the disposal of the Public Works Department. I tried to find out what 'works in progress' mean, but I was not successful. Take the case of the hostel for Government College, Lahore. I was rather interested in that institution, and I agitated the matter during the year 1916 and urged that the hostel was very badly needed. After two or three efforts at interpellations in the Council I eventually got some sort of promise that this was really necessary, and it was said that the Government was contemplating to put it up. In the year 1917, I believe, the Government invested Rs. 1,25,000 in purchasing the necessary site for that purpose. Last year in 1918 actual provision was made in the Budget for completing this badly needed hostel in Lahore. I understand in 1918 this scheme became a 'work in progress.' This year it is especially mentioned in the Budget as 'work in progress.' It is possibly known to even those who do not go out of the Civil station of Lahore, and I have noticed it many times when passing the site on my way to Shahdara that there is no trace of any structure or foundation of any kind, although it is not necessary to import large machinery with the object of putting up this building nor is it necessary to have iron girders to demolish the existing building. I would draw the attention of the Council to the fact that months have elapsed and the work has not yet been commenced by the Department. The subject though interesting is very difficult to follow. My complaint is that Rs. 7,13,000 which is being placed at the disposal of the Public Works Department is really far too much for them to be able to run through. As a matter of fact the Head of the Education Department also expressed his disappointment which he said was natural but which was beyond his control, and that the Public Works Department did not do all that the Education Department expected it to do, but he believed that the Public Works Department had good reasons for not so doing. When I propose that 2 lakhs be taken from 45—Civil Works, I believe that none of the works in progress will suffer."

"With these remarks I place the Resolution before the Council."

The Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah—"supported the resolution."

The Hon'ble Pandit Jawahar Lal Bhargava:—"I cordially support the resolution which has been put before the Council. Yesterday too it was remarked by me that education was the paramount need of the country at the present hour. It has always been so, and it will remain so. No problem can be of greater importance for the people and more deserving of Government's attention than the education of the subject, for education may really be considered to be a cure for all the ills to which the flesh is subject. No doubt the

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Raizada Bhagat Ram; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das*].

Head of the Department and the Hon'ble Financial Member are to be thanked for the increase of 7 lakhs in the budget of 1919-20 over the revised of 1918-19, but I confess I do not consider it a generous increase. However, even assuming it to be so, I submit that this head deserves a still more generous treatment at the hands of the benign Government. Education like sanitation does not require any elaborate or cut and dry schemes before money is allotted to that head. Schemes can be prepared at any time when the money is available. If no money is available or forthcoming, schemes, however eleborate and cut and dry, can be of no practical value. There is ample room for expansion of education, and there is a vast field for properly utilising any amount that may be spared from other heads in order to promote the cause of education. The Hon'ble Mover has pointed out the necessity of his demand and has given very cogent and sound reasons in support of it. I need not go over the same ground again, but would simply emphasise one special demand of the public and which is agricultural and industrial development. These branches of education should no longer be allowed to suffer on account of want of funds. The Hon'ble Mover has also pointed out the means by which an increase which he recommends under this head can be effected by economising expenditure on certain other heads. I apprehend the Hon'ble Financial Member will present the same difficulties which he did yesterday on the resolution of sanitation, but looking to the importance of the subject we can look to him alone for solving this difficulty, and as the amount originally proposed has been reduced to half we may hope that the Hon'ble Financial Member will enable the Government to find out the amount and accept the resolution."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal:—"Sir, after hearing the able and exhaustive speeches of the Hon'ble Mover and of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal I do not think I need make a long speech in support of the resolution, beyond saying that the Compulsory Educational Bill having recently been passed into Law, it becomes essential that more funds should be alloted for education than is the case in the present year's budget. One Normal School should, in my humble opinion, be opened in every district without any further loss of time to meet the heavy demand of good trained trachers for the village primary schools. There should be another Training College opened in the Province outside Lahore to meet the demand for trained teachers in the secondary schools, the solitary Training College at Lahore being insufficient to accommodate all the qualified candidates seeking admission and to supply the very large number of teachers required by the secondary schools every year. The salary of the lowest grade teachers must be raised to a level higher than the ordinary wages of a common coolie. In order that all these proposals may be fully carried into execution, large funds are required. The War which hampered the rapid expansion of education having now come to a glorious termination, this Province which has contributed most in securing the victory deserves recognition of its War services by a liberal budget for education. The further allotment of 5 lacs proposed by my Hon'ble Colleague will meet only a small part of the cost of the above schemes which are of paramount importance to the future well being of the people. With these few words I beg to support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Raizada Bhagat Ram:—Sir, I also beg to support this resolution, and in doing so I am giving expression to a popular demand that enough money is not being spent on education. More should be spent. I am aware of practical difficulties in the way of Financial Member, but difficulties of that kind should not be allowed to stand in the way of substantial and good objects. I, therefore, beg to submit that I support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das:—"I also heartily support the resolution."

[*Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah ; Mr. Woods ; Khwaja Yusaf Shah*].

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh :—" Sir, the Education Bill has been passed. Ths conditions have now been changed. There is now real desire for education. Even our soldiers having spent years in European countries, where there is plenty of education, would realise that they should spend every money on the education of their sons. In Military service now-a-days, an illiterate cannot get on. Education is being felt as the sole need of country. It is a great surprise to me to find officers of Education Department finding themselves unable to spend money. It is known to Government that there are many villages where there is no school. Education should be placed within reach of everybody. I am therefore in favour of increasing the allotment for education. I would, however, suggest that Head No. 5 may not be touched as roads are as badly needed. The Government might, if necessary, draw upon its balances. The greatest boon that Government could now bestow upon the villages and martial classes for their heroic sacrifices would be to give them sound education and raise them to the level of other Provinces by educating them. Economy in this matter is neither good for the people nor for the Government.

" With these few words, Your Honour, I support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah :—" I support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods :—" The Hon'ble Mover of this resolution proposes to find money for education by cutting down the grant under 45—Civil Works by 2 lakhs, I understand. He says that Rs. 71,30,000 has been provided for in the coming year's budget. He says that in the past year the Public Work Department was not able to spend the whole of the amount allotted to it. Therefore, he says, it is not probable that it will be able to do so in the coming year. Well, Sir, the reasons why the Department was unable to spend this grant during the past year are reasons which may reasonably be expected not to recur during the coming year. There was the influenza epidemic which deprived us of labour, there was a general labour scarcity on account of the War. We may expect that the influenza will not recur next year, and now that the War is over we may hope that the stringency in the labour market will be eased off. There is also the question of the cost of building material owing to the shortage of rolling stock We may hope that these conditions will not recur during the coming year. There was also the depletion of the staff of the Department both amongst the Officers and Subordinates ; which will be eased off during the coming year. Therefore there is every reason to expect that the Department will be able to spend during the coming year the amount which is budgeted for it. As one of my Hon'ble friends has pointed out, roads and communications in the Province are just as important a matter for the public good as education, and I think several of my friends will agree with me that this item should not be cut down.

" The Hon'ble Mover of the resolution has referred to the cost of a hostel for Government College, Lahore, the construction of which, I understand, has been delayed. I do not know whether he proposes to delay that still further in order to obtain money for education. But the Department proposes to go on with that construction, and hopes to keep up to its programme in the coming year. I think that is all I have to say."

The Hon'ble Khwaja Yusaf Shah :—" Well, Sir, there is no one keener than myself on education, but I am afraid I am unable to follow the policy of robbing Peter to pay Paul. I cannot understand how it is possible to deduct this sum in order to meet the expenditure on education from other heads, when those heads of the financial statement have been carefully gone into and with

the greatest possible economy certain sums have been adopted under those heads. Therefore I regret I am not in a position to support this resolution for these grounds alone. Otherwise I would be only too delighted to vote for any expansion in education that was practical."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey—"Sir, it is not unnatural for me to feel great sympathy with the feelings expressed by the Hon'ble Mover in moving this resolution. It is a feeling of impatience almost amounting to irritation at the slow rate at which education moves. I must thank him not only for what he has said about the activities of the Department during the past year but also for the detailed suggestions made by him in treating his subject. It makes it much easier for me to explain the working of the Department and the reasons why we cannot move faster than we are doing at present The Hon'ble Mover began by giving specific instances of delay. He spoke of the Government of India grants for the improvement of the pay of teachers and for the training institutions He drew attention to the large amount which had lapsed and which has now accumulated to a sum of over 2½ lakhs. He began by saying that the money had not been spent though it is not difficult to provide a scheme at once. The same remark was made by the Hon'ble Pandit Jawahar Lal Bhargava, who said that once given the money, it is easy to get a scheme at once on which to spend it. I may begin by taking exception to that argument. My own experience has shown that the best way of getting money is to draw up a good scheme. We have done so in one notable instance, in the case of Agricultural education in this Province. We started as soon as the Government of India had its Conference in 1917. The local Departments of Agriculture and Education took the subject up. A Conference was held last year under the presidency of Mr. Hallifax. A very large scheme costing 40 lakhs of rupees was devised. We did not know at the time whether any money was going to be given us. Just as we completed the scheme the Government of India asked us if we wanted money for Agricultural education. Our scheme was so complete that we got more money than any other Province in India. That is the advantage of drawing up a good scheme to get money. The same was the case with primary education. The Education Department drew up the primary education scheme without knowing in the least what amount we should have to ask the Government for. I am glad to say, now that the scheme is complete, that we have all the money that we asked for. Now to revert to this grant for the training of teachers which was made before I came. As soon as I arrived I put up proposals for the different headings under which it should be expended. Obviously the first was the extension of the Central Training College. The Hon'ble Mover of this resolution and other Members called attention to the great need for this, but this extension unfortunately entailed a great amount of money which was not within the power of the Local Government to sanction. A year ago a proposal was submitted to the Government of India, the sanction to which is shortly expected. We hope that it will be received in time for a start to be made next year. Indeed I took steps last year to provide for stipends to students in order to prepare for the expected sanction for the additional staff of the Training College. We shall, I hope, be able to start this work next year. That is one scheme.

"The second scheme was the revision of the Subordinate Educational Service. The Hon'ble Mover has acknowledged that I have before now explained that the delay in this matter has been due to our waiting for the orders of the Government of India on the Indian Educational Service and Provincial Educational Service, but he feels that there are difficulties of detail and he says why should we wait any longer. Well, as I explained yesterday, we have not waited any longer as regards the junior posts. We have already revised those. The only method by which we could do so was by creating a separate branch for classical and vernacular teachers. As regards the senior grades, the revision must be closely connected with the Provincial Educational Service. It is not an easy matter to revise a Service. The Hon'ble Members spoke as if giving of money

to revise salaries would immediately result in a revision of salaries. Everyone knows that it entails a very great deal of detailed work to see that there are no supersessions, that there are the right number of posts of each particular class to meet the present and future requirements. It is a matter of great difficulty. Unless we have an idea as to the grade of the Indian Educational Service and how many posts there are to be, I for myself, see great difficulties and insuperable obstacles in revising the senior posts of the Subordinate Educational Service. The third heading under which we proposed to expend this grant was in the expansion of Normal Schools, and, as the Hon'ble Member has himself said, it is undoubtedly a very important thing if our programme of vernacular expansion in rural areas is to be attended with any useful results. I think I have said before that we propose to open a normal school every year. We have opened one at Gujranwala. We will open one in the Jullundur Division next year. But I must say that I am doing this under very unsatisfactory conditions. We have been unable to have buildings for them. We can only open schools in such hired buildings as we can get. The Inspector of Schools at Jullundur has reported that they have very great difficulties in finding accommodation for the proposed school to be opened next year. But I can assure the Hon'ble Members that I do propose opening one normal school each year, but more than that it would be impossible for us to do with success ; we cannot provide schools for which applicants cannot be forthcoming. For example, in the Rawalpindi Division, we cannot at present open a second normal school, although there is the need for trained teachers. Therefore the rate of one normal school a year is as fast as we can move. We opened a normal school last year, besides that we opened four normal schools for women which have relieved the great pressure for admissions in the normal school at Lahore, and, as I told this Council at the last meeting, all our four normal schools have been filled up by candidates and no doubt they would turn out some 20 new teachers next year.

"The need for a second Training College has been recognised by Government in the past and the Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal has made a reference to it just now. He does not seem to have read our long letter on Agricultural education in which it is definitely stated that a second Training College will be opened as soon as possible, as soon as the buildings can be erected. The money provided for buildings has temporarily lapsed or would have lapsed, but appears next year in the provision for the training of teachers. The Public Works Department have not been able to erect the buildings owing to the difficulties which Mr. Woods has just mentioned that they have not been able to carry out work as rapidly as they would have wished.

"The improvement of the pay of primary teachers as has been mentioned by the Hon'ble Mover and the Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal. Provision for that was made under the ordinary programme of expansion. A part of the conditions of this programme was that each district board should submit and maintain its own scale of salaries of teachers. Hitherto there has only been a fixed minimum of pay of Rs. 15 for headmasters and Rs. 12 for trained assistants, but under this scheme we have also made it incumbent on district boards to provide a graded scale, and I am glad to say that they have adopted a running scale of Rs. 15—25 or Rs. 15—30 according to the wealth of the board and the number of teachers.

"Then, Sir, the Hon'ble Mover made a strong point of the need for new middle schools, and I was disappointed to hear it, because it showed he had not read the Government circular on the expansion of vernacular education. He would have seen that the Local Government proposes to treble the number of middle schools under the vernacular education programme, while it proposes to double the number of primary schools. I have not the figures with me, but I think I am right in saying that there are 150 vernacular middle schools at the present moment, and we propose to raise the number to 490. If you will look at the figures in the statement attached to that circular

for the expansion of vernacular education in rural areas you will see that we had to make a very large provision for vernacular middle schools, and according to the pragramme at least 30 middle schools will be opened next year. A great deal of money is not needed during the first year, as only one or two classes are opened during the first year, and he may be assured that the provision of 6 class schools will be very liberal and the number of vernacular middle school will, I hope, be only limited by the demand. Hitherto the demand for vernacular middle schools has not been very great owing to the desire of the population in the rural areas for English education, but I hope that by the system of introducing optional English in Vernacular middle schools we will thus be breaking down the rigid line between the Vernacular middle and the Anglo-vernacular schools. It is a great improvement in our vernacular middle schools to introduce Agricultural education, and at the same time I look to the introduction of optional English as an additional means of popularising these schools and thereby getting these boys for Agricultural education.

"There are one or two other points to which the Hon'ble Member has alluded. The first is the playing grounds for the Central Training College. Here I am entirely in agreement with him that it is unfortunate that there was no adequate playing field attached to the Central Training College or the Central Model School. This need was only brought to my notice this year at the Divisional Tournament. This came as a shock to me, and I asked the Principal of the Central Training College and we have together been around since then looking for sites for playing fields, and I have since asked him to find out what the site would cost, but at the time of framing the budget I had no knowledge that there was any need.

"With regard to the question of a Commercial College, the proposal started, as the Hon'ble Members are aware, from a suggestion made by the Education Department that a Commercial Diploma should be instituted by the University. It has now been expanded by means of a Special Committee appointed by the Syndicate into a somewhat ambitious scheme for an institution to be called a Commercial College. At present the scheme is very much in its initial stages. I do not think that we shall be able to utilize any very large expenditure on this item during the next year There is at the same time a proposal to transfer the commercial classes from Amritsar to Lahore, but no expenditure on that head was anticipated during the ensuing year. Then it is mentioned that like the Industrial school which we are starting at Jullundur we should start other schools of this nature in other places. The policy of the Standing Committee of Industrial education is, as the Hon'ble Members are aware, drawn up on certain lines on which Industrial education should expand, and it may be interesting to this Council to hear that our circular letter has produced some effect and that we are already receiving applications from the municipalities to start Middle Industrial schools, which I hope will be as successfull as those already working at Amritsar and Multan. The larger type of Technical schools such as that of Jullundur Carpentry school are projects involving a great deal of expense. I think it will be necessary for us to proceed with a certain amount of caution and see whether the schools already opened are running properly before we open new schools.

"I think I have dealt with most of the points mentioned by the Hon'ble Member. I thank him for making suggestions with regard to the working of the Department, and can assure him that if I do find that my funds are short I shall ask for more, but I do not anticipate, judging from my past experience, that I shall not be able to meet any demands made upon me this year, from the present budget provision. I should have been very glad if during last year more schemes had been submitted to me by the municipalities. I very much hope that the Compulsory Education Bill will inspire the municipalities to open more schools in areas under their control and to ask for money to open

Vernacular schools. At present the demands made by municipalities are very much less than I should wish. In conclusion I say in thanking the Hon'ble Members that I do not anticipate that I shall need more than is provided already."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden.—"Sir, in connection with a similar resolution moved by the same Hon'ble Member yesterday, I raised various objections as to the form of the resolution. These objections apply equally in this case, but I do not propose to repeat them. As regards the speech made by the Hon'ble Mover it is rather a criticism on the Department than a reflection on the financial arrangements made. Consequently it will not be necessary for me to detain the Council with any lengthy remarks. The criticism on the Department has been answered very convincingly and very completely by the Member-in-charge, and it is now for Hon'ble Members to decide whether or not this resolution is based upon any resonable foundation.

"In connection with the financial aspect I suggested two tests yesterday and need not repeat them. I cannot say that they have been met in any way by the speech of the Hon'ble Member, though I admit that in this particular case some effort has been made to show that there are definite schemes to which money could be applied, and he has also suggested that the funds could be supplied from certain definite minor heads. As regards the possibility of expending money we have the statement of the Member-in-charge that he does not consider it likely that he will be able to spend more than he has already got. We are pretty safe to accept that statement. The Head of a Department knows more about the capabilities of the spending power of the Department than anybody else, and I have never in my experience as Financial Secretary found the Education Department in any way backward in asking for money and for next year we have been able to meet their claims in full. The estimates represent a difference of 10 lakhs on the money which is likely to be spent this year—an increase amounting to 20 per cent. Hon'ble Members will remember that the special grant of 3 lakhs for the Khalsa College can hardly be included as ordinary expenditure, and should be deducted for purposes of this comparison. The increase is very considerable and one which will tax the energies of the Department to overtake.

"As regards the re-appropriations suggested by the Hon'ble Mover, I must admit that his remarks as regards the sub-head Miscellaneous are somewhat bewildering. He suggests, as far as I could gather, that because the revised represents a considerable diminution on the budget figure, therefore it was likely that there would be savings under the head. This criticism must be founded upon a misapprehension of the meaning of the word 'reserve.' The reserve fund is a fund kept by Government from which any unforeseen demands are met, and the money budgetted under this minor head is gradually dissipated during the year to a number of other heads. If the Hon'ble Member will refer to the head 32—Miscellaneous itself, for instance, he will notice an enormous increase under the minor head 3—Donations for Charitable purposes, seeing that against a budget of Rs.15,000 there is a revised of Rs. 1,07,000. He has evidently not asked himself where this one lakh has been obtained from. It had to be found from somewhere, and as a matter of fact it formed part of the Government reserve. Every demand for similar unforeseen requirements reduces the reserve which is shown under the minor head Miscellaneous and Unforeseen charges. The Rs. 1,44,000 shown in this year's revised is made up of certain items which are classified under that particular head, but which do not form part of the reserve fund. Consequently a reappropriation of 3 lakhs from this head is absolutely impossible. No Government can face the numerous unexpected demands of a year without having something at its beck and call, and the provision of a substantial reserve is essential unless progress is to be retarded. If some opportunity occurs during the year for expenditure in

a certain direction and if there is no money available for it then that project has to be postponed to the next year. The provision of the reserve fund is to enable us to prevent such delays which might have undesirable consequences.

As regards the Public Works head, I would again point out that this is not a head in which we can make any reduction. I do not know if the Hon'ble mover has taken the trouble of reading through the Memorandum for if he had done so he would have seen that the Financial Branch has already made a net reduction of 10 lakhs from that head. The actual budget was 81 lakhs and we have, in view of the fact that 81 lakhs was a very considerable sum to spend, reduced that by a lump sum of 10 lakhs. I would also point out in addition to what the Hon'ble Mr. Woods has said that the main reason for the very great difference between this year's budget and the present revised is that stated in the Memorandum, namely, that after the budget had been worked out we were asked by the Government of India to curtail our year's programme. That is to say, the main cause of difference was not in the failure on the part of the Public Works Department to overtake their programme, but it was due to a direct order of the Government of India that as many projects as possible were to be struck out. Consequently there is every likelihood that this year's figure will be very largely exceeded. Another point in connection with this particular head is this: our present figure of 71 lakhs compares with the pre-war figure of 89 lakhs. Now take the case of Education. Our pre-war figure was Rs. 33,31,000 and our present figure is Rs. 69,44,000. That is to say, whilst the Education figure has nearly doubled its pre-war size the Public Works Department which has been drastically cut down during the war has not even yet reached its old allotment. All through the war too we interfered as little as possible with Education and indeed allowed for such expansion as we could; whereas in the case of Public Works we reduced the figures to a minimum sufficient merely to maintain the service with reasonable efficiency. Consequently there is a great leeway to be made up in the Public Works Department, and I should much regret if anything is done to prevent this Department from making up part of this leeway. I think I need say no more as regards this resolution. I must confess however that I was much disappointed with the voting on the similar resolution that was rejected yesterday. I had listened to all the speeches with considerable care, and there was little to show that any of the members had any definite ideas as to how the extra money was to be applied or that they had really considered the comparative merits of the projects which were to be deprived of that money. As a matter of fact the Hon'ble mover himself was extremely vague on the subject, and he apparently assumed that our estimates are of a very casual nature. On the contrary these estimates are framed with the greatest care. They are the results of most careful study by the heads of the respective departments, by the Accountant-General and by the Financial Branch, and unless there are very good and definite reasons they should not be meddled with or reduced. Sentiments and theories are all very well in their own way, but I would ask the Hon'ble Members to come down occasionally to stern facts and to recognise the practical difficulties of the situation."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain:—"In replying, Sir, I must first ackowledge with gratitude the unanimous support that has been offered to this resolution by my non-official collcagues and the sympathy that has been offered by my official colleagues. The Hon'ble Member-in-charge has dealt at length with most of the points that I brought forward in my first speech but there was a distinct omission of any plea on the point of my charge on this Budget neglecting the claims of the University. I do not know whether that was an omission or whether it was ....."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard:—"I may perhaps remove that feeling from the Hon'ble Member's mind. I think it was an oversight. It is a fact that the

proposal for the appointment of University Professors at an annual recurring cost of 60,000 rupees is at present under the consideration of the Government and I, for one, trust it will have a very sympathetic consideration."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey :—"And there is a grant sanctioned for University Appointment Board also."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"Very glad to hear, Sir, that a small amount for the Appointment Board has been sanctioned, and I hope the University will appreciate that grant very much. So far as my plea for University Professors is concerned I am glad that it is now under the consideration of the Government. I do hope that this Council will agree to make some sort of addition to the provision already made in the Budget if I am able to satisfy them that no other head will suffer in any way. I will presently be able to show that the careful preparation of the Budget and all the other things said in support of it need not be upset by me to get a little amount of money that I desire for education. Of course, so far as the amount needed for the University is concerned I was of opinion that a good start is needed and that a good start with anything less than a lakh can hardly be made, but this is a matter which finally rests with Government to decide. I have counted five professors at Rs. 20,000 a year. I need not elaborate that point here to-day. I am very glad to hear, Sir, that a programme of middle school extension is ready, and that district boards are coming forward to undertake that burden. Further, I am glad to hear that normal schools, it is intended, are to be opened : one every year. I was told one was opened last year and one this year. Am I right, Sir, that this year was overlooked."

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey : - "One was opened last year in the beginning of 1918, one in the course of the ensuing year. One school will be opened every year."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain :—"It seems to me, Sir, that our Primary Education Bill which was received with mingled feeling because of certain misapprehensions will not be a success unless we make sure of lightening the burdens of the district boards.

"I have always apprehended that if we want the district boards to do a great deal they will not do even a little bit, therefore it is necessary for us to encourage them and at all events in the beginning to give them as much help as possible. It is proposed to give them help to the extent of at least two-thirds throughout the Province, but taking into consideration that they have not only to extend primary education but also vernacular middle school education and it may be later on optional English in middle schools, as has been pointed out by the member-in-charge, will their resources be up to it? It is quite possible that their resources will be up to it, but do you think the rural population is so keenly alive to the need of expanding primary and middle school education that they will be ready to tax themselves in order to furnish sufficient resources? Therefore I beg to submit that I have very serious doubts, and that is the reason why I urge that we should make it easier for them to come within the folds of Education Bill by starting schemes which may be carried out. It was suggested later on by the member-in-charge that he cannot spend the money because the local bodies would not come to him. For the obvious reason that they have to do a good bit, the local bodies if they come to a scheme, are not prepared under the circumstances to do all that is required of them. What is the result? The local bodies hold back and the member-in-charge cannot spend money. Well, Sir, will it be too much to ask the member-in-charge to be a follower of the Prophet of Islam for the time being inasmuch as the English proverb has it, 'if the mountain would not go to Muhammad, Muhammad should go to the mountain.' In case the local bodies do not send up the schemes to him and he advances towards them, I think he will be able to get some scheme out of them. What I am suggesting

to him, Sir, was actually practised by one of his predecessors whose name will always remain associated with the creation of the Education Department in this Province—one who evolved this department out of what it was, *i.e.*, practically nothing. I think it was within two or three years during the time of Sir Charles Rivaz that education really made great progress in the Province and the foundation of the present department was laid.

"I am glad, Sir, that the need for the grounds of the Central Training College is realised. I can assure this Council that the predecessor of the Member-in-charge did a good deal and worked considerably at this scheme, and I have no doubt that he left some record of all the efforts he made in preparing a plan for the sight which he intended to acquire, through the agency of the Government no doubt, for the Central Training College and other kindred institutions. That scheme also, Sir, can be executed during the course of the next year.

"Then another interesting point needs some remarks from me, and it is this. The trouble is what should come first, the scheme or the grant. Does the scheme get the grant or does the grant get the scheme? I suppose they react upon each other. I agree with the Member-in-charge that a scheme carefully prepared by a trained officer is bound to elicit money from even the hard-hearted Finance Member. But the other position, that is to say, if there is money there can be no lack of schemes is, I think, equally true. Given the money, given the goal you have only to aim at, you have only to find the necessary funds. I suppose the Hon'ble Member means when he says that if you have got the will to spread education, he does not see the difficulty in the way of getting at schemes. I fully recognise the difficulty of works of detail, that is, the revising of lists and grades of pay and things of that kind. But I regret I do not see the need for waiting either for higher Provincial Service or for Indian Educational Service scheme to be carried out to enable the Member-in-charge to do something for Subordinate Educational Service. د تریاک از عراق آورده شوده مار گزیده مرده بود I have not the slightest doubt that oriental and classical teachers feel very grateful for an increase in their pay from Rs. 20—30 to Rs. 30—0, but as is always the case it is a favour like this, or to be more accurate a recognition of the right of that class which encourages others who are equally entitled to cry for a similar favour being shown to them. We find that vernacular teachers now that they have realised that Government can see the right and do the right are coming forward to say: 'Kindly better our lot too,' and it was that which I mentioned in my opening speech. Vernacular teachers work not only in the Primary Department but also in Middle School Department. Is it not right and proper that they should be taken from the old grade of Rs. 3—50 and placed in the higher grade. Again here I do not see any difficulty in the way of doing that. No doubt cases of individual hardships and so on may arise; no doubt the office of the Member-in-charge will be able to do something towards decreasing the chances of any hardships, but the fact remains that if you have got the money to spend on improving the pay of your staff there could be really no obstacle in your doing it within a few months as these people have been waiting for over two years.

"So, Sir, I cannot help thinking that it is rather on account of his modesty than on account of his incapacity to spend that the Hon'ble Member-in-charge does not accept our humble effort to get him more money for his Department. It is always a very difficult task for those who are so anxious to help and support him that he should say that really he has got all that he wants. That really does not satisfy us. We who are, I confess, more or less enthusiastic in the matter of education, want to supplement as far as it lies within our powers. As it is due to his modesty therefore I do not think simply the Hon'ble Member-in-charge's saying that he has got all he wants

and that he does not think he will be able to spend more than is actually at his disposal really and truly debars us from placing more at his disposal.

"Now, Sir, I do not wish to offer any remarks as to the various points which were urged by the Hon'ble Member-in charge with reference to Commercial College and Industrial College and so on as they do not arise for purposes of this Resolution.

"Turning to what was said by the two Hon'ble Members responsible for the Civil Works and Finance, I quite recognise, Sir, that influenza epidemic which did prevail for three months could be a sufficient excuse for not starting works if they were to be started in the month of October or September. I believe that the Government College hostel was awaiting the attention of the Department even in the month of April—a pleasant month to start work. I can also see the labour scarcity was responsible for it."

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods :—"Just a word of explanation, Sir. You talk about the month of April. Then there is the difficulty because of the rabi harvest in that month and we cannot get labour."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Husain :—"I quite recognise, Sir, that during the months of April and May the rabi harvest is on. What I was saying was that during the same months of the year the Department was able to spend a few thousand rupees on purchasing buildings....."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"I draw the attention of the Hon'ble Member to the fact that he has been speaking for 18 minutes."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Husain :—"That locality of the Government College hostel was not particularly unhealthy for labourers in any way. As for material I have no doubt that that was scarce, but I do not believe, Sir, that any material was required to pull down the old tumbling building. However, I quite recognise that inasmuch as the conditions as to scarcity of labour and difficulty of getting material are concerned, no doubt they will be less, but it cannot be said that they will be altogether removed. We will have rabi harvest this year also."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"I would ask the Hon'ble Member to bring his remarks to a close."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Husain :—"Now as to Mr. Lumsden's remarks that the money cannot be spent I have already said that what the Member-in-charge says is because he must say. Our wish to get him more money will not in any way become less because he does not join us in clamouring for more. As to the question of wherefrom this sum of 5 lakhs is to come, it was suggested that under the head Miscellaneous there are 6,56,000 rupees out of which I claim to get 3 lakhs. The Hon'ble Member-in-charge of Finance observed that it is wrong to make such vague suggestions and do away with carefully prepared estimates in this way. Well, Sir, I have tried to go very carefully through this Budget Note and also three or four Budget Notes that have preceded this year. I have not yet been able to lay my finger on the data on which the 'unforeseen charges' are prepared. I have no doubt that there may be a theory of probability, but there is nothing definite on which the estimate can be raised by 1 lakh as has been done by the Government last year, and these 'unforeseen charges' were 5 lakhs this year and they are 6½ in the Revised. The Hon'ble Finance Member may have good reasons for that but to my mind ....."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"I may point out that in the 'unforeseen charges' 5 lakhs from the reserve fund."

[*Mr. Maynard ; Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Husain ; Mr. Lumsden.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard (addressing the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Hussain) :—

"I may point out that the Hon'ble Member is exceeding his time limit."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Husain :—"What I meant was that here we have 5 lakhs but there is no reason to believe that the money allotted will be sufficient at all because there is nothing known to the Financial Member what expenditure would be charged to that fund.

"As to the 2 lakhs that I claim from Civil Works it is not my intention that any work that can be managed by the Department during the course of the year should not be done. What I claim is that the 84 lakhs - 71 and 13 lakhs under the two heads—will not be needed, and that taking into consideration the fact that this is the first year after the war they will not be able to spend the whole of the amount in the course of the year. Therefore if 2 lakhs are taken away from the head 45 - Civil Works the Department will not suffer in any way."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"Before the Council proceeds to vote on this Resolution I should like to point out that the position is very much the same as that it was yesterday in regard to a similar resolution on Sanitation. It is quite obvious that the objects which the Government and the Hon'ble Members of this Council have in view in regard to the speeding up of expenditure on education are absolutely identical. It has been quite plain from the speech of the Hon'ble Member-in-charge of education that he is anxious to spend and advance the cause of education as rapidly as may be. The difference arises when a larger expenditure than is considered necessary by a Department is pressed upon it and another Department is cut down to that extent against the desire of that other Department. What Hon'ble Members are asking is that Government should assign to a department a sum which its head does not think he will be able to spend. It is quite plain that the Government cannot accept a resolution of that kind. It is very anomalous situation : the Hon'ble Members both officials and non-officials are in complete agreement upon the question of principle, both are actuated by the same identical objects, and yet officials are compelled by the form of the resolution and the nature of it to vote on the opposite side. That is the position in regard to the resolution moved to-day

"Do I understand that the Hon'ble Mover is still desirous of pressing his resolution ?"

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Fazl-i-Husain :—"Sir, I really do not see why any resolution on the Budget can possibly under the circumstances be proposed and if proposed ever carried, because all members-in-charge are Government ministers and would naturally not be saying that what has been given them by the Government is insufficient and that they want more. Then, Sir, what is the use of proposing any resolution if that is going to be the deciding point.

"I have no keen anxiety to press the resolution to a division, but it seems to me that if the power of proposing resolutions has any meaning then this difficulty will arise unless Government authorises all members to vote as they will. Possibly that may be the way out of it."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"May I ask the Hon'ble Member to explain how he proposes to adjust."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"I would not let the Council enter into any discussion at this stage.

"As regards the particular point raised by the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain, I should like to point out that it may happen this way: if an Hon'ble Member, moving a resolution, proposed the execution of a scheme which would be carried out during a particular year, and funds were available, there would be good grounds for a resolution on the subject being carried."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—"I should like to ask for an explanation because the resolution is now in a form different from the original form. The Hon'ble Member has suggested to cut down head 45 or to utilize the sum which may be expected as savings of the year under that head. He has now said that he does not wish to interfere with any work that can be carried out during the year. I really do not know how the Hon'ble Mover or the Hon'ble Member-in-charge of Public Works Department is going to decide at this stage what works can be carried out during the next 12 months. The Budget is framed on the assumption that the works included in the budget will be carried out. It is impossible to say what works will not be carried out till March next year. I do not see how the Hon'ble Mover can possibly now suggest that these savings are to be taken into consideration in connection with the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"The resolution now proposed is that Rs. 5 lakhs more be budgeted for 22—Education and a decrease of Rs. 3 lakhs be effected under head 32 and of Rs. 2 lakhs under head 45."

The motion was put and lost by 10 to 9.

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—"The last resolution standing in my name is resolution No. 3 which runs as follows:—

> 'That this Council recommends to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor that rupees two lakhs more be budgeted for 26-B—Expenditure and a corresponding decrease effected under 32 or 45.'

"The particular item in budget head 26-B which I have in view in proposing this resolution is put down as 'development of industries' and 'Director of Civil Supplies.' When this head was introduced on the 7th of March we understood that the Director of Civil Supplies was a temporary official. We also learned with considerable gratification that a great deal of industrial work during the course of the war was done in the Province, that blankets worth a considerable amount were made not in factories only but also in villages showing thereby the capacity of the village people in having a recourse to industries as well. We also learned that there was a good deal of metal work done in the province as well. It seems to me, Sir, that up to now enough has not been done in the Province in this particular department of industries. What we were told about the mechanical aptitude of criminal tribes and certain other things led me to believe that if the weavers of the villages were given a training in industries and mechanism, then a good deal of poverty will be removed and the Province would take a prominent place not only in India but in the world at large.

"I am glad to notice from the budget note that already this head of industries is going to be turned into a minor head. That by itself emphasises its importance, and I trust that Government will take particular care to make the department an important one. We all know that a department cannot become an important department unless it has a whole time officer presiding over it. Of course we should encourage the industrial class to make full effort in that direction. It is also necessary that we should put the producers of the industrial articles into touch with the markets of the country and outside India. This can best be done by an officer of experience who has studied the question and dealt with it. Therefore I trust, Sir, that the Government will not only be able to make this office a permanent office but also be in a position to place a fairly large amount at the disposal of

this office in order to carry out its useful work. It seems to me that the encouragement of village industry is one of very great importance, if we want to avoid the possibility of all manufactures being centralised in towns. This is a thing which to my mind is worth considering. With these few remarks I introduce the resolution for the consideration of the Council."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—" Sir, the point raised by the third resolution moved by the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Husain that Rs. 2,00,000 more be budgeted for head 26-B (Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments) which includes industrial development of the province has my hearty support. The experience of the 4½ years' prolonged war leaves no doubt that in industrial matters this province is the poorest of all the provinces in British India. The provision of Rs. 2,07,000 only under head 26-B far from providing for any future development of industries in the province, is grossly inadequate to meet even the absolutely necessary demands for liabilities heretofore incurred in preceding years. My friend the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Husain has for this very important purpose made a very modest demand of only Rs. 2,00,000 being added to Rs. 2,07,000 already provided in the revised Financial Statement ; and I am sure, Government, with the present state of Finances, will easily be able to spare this small amount, either by transferring the amount from heads 32 and 45 as proposed or from the closing balance of Rs. 2,16,07,000 given in the Revised Financial Statement for the year 1919-20."

The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden :—" Sir, while I cannot accept the resolution, I have great sympathy with the objects in view. The reason why the resolution cannot be accepted is simply this that there is no probability or even possibility of anything like the sum mentioned being required during the year. The whole question of the development of industries is on the anvil. We cannot take any step forward until we have got our foundation secure. In this connection I would quote the words used by Sir Thomas Holland in the Imperial Council in connection with a similar resolution proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma. He said that he could not accept the resolution because it was useless to make a horse gallop unless his head was in the right direction. That is exactly the position here and I trust that the Hon'ble Member will not press his resolution. I may say that if during the course of the year any money is required for this purpose we shall certainly make every effort to find it. It is not likely that the Financial Secretary will object to any expenditure on objects which in the long run are bound to prove to be remunerative. I can assure the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das who also animadverted on this point that every effort is being made to push on the industrial scheme, and that if during this year any money can be properly spent for this purpose it will be found."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Husain :—" I have reasons to feel satisfied with such assurances as have been vouchsafed on the subject by the Hon'ble Member-in-charge and in the circumstances wish to withdraw the resolution."

ADJOURNMENT.

The Council was adjourned till the 7th April 1919, 10-30, A. M.

LAHORE :
The 5th April 1919.

T. P. ELLIS,
Secretary, Legislative Council.

PUNJAB GOVERNMENT.

LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

Abstract of Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1915.

THE Council met at the Government House, Lahore, at 10-30 A.M., on Monday, the 7th April 1919.

PRESENT :

His Honour Sir MICHAEL FRANCIS O'DWYER, G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.C.S. Lieutenant-Governor, *Presiding.*

The Hon'ble Mr. JOHN PERRONET THOMPSON, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. JAMES ALEXANDER RICHEY.

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar GOPAL SINGH.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja YUSAF SHAH.

The Hon'ble Mr. HERBERT JOHN MAYNARD, C.S.I., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. BASIL THEODORE GIBSON, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar GAJJAN SINGH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri LAL CHAND, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir BAHRAM KHAN, Mazari, K.C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad MEHDI SHAH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit JAWAHAR LAL, Bhargava.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur RAM SARAN DAS, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Mr. FRANK WAVERLING WOODS.

The Hon'ble Mr. FREDERICK CRIGHTON WALLER.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada BHAGAT RAM.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi SOHAN LAL.

The Hon'ble Sayad MAKHDUM RAJAN SHAH.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian FAZL-I-HUSSAIN.

The Hon'ble Mr. CREWE ARMOND HAMILTON TOWNSEND, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. CHARLES JOSEPH HALLIFAX, C.B.E., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan DAULAT RAI.

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza MUHAMMAD IKRAM ULLAH KHAN.

The Hon'ble Mr. EDWIN WOODALL PARKER.

The Hon'ble Mr. EUSTACE ALEXANDER AGWORTH JOSEPH, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN.

The Hon'ble Colonel ROBERT CHARLES MACWATT, C.I.E., M.B., F.R.C.S., I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. THOMAS PETER ELLIS, I.C.S.

OATH OF OFFICE.

The Hon'ble Mr. JOSEPH and the Hon'ble Mr. GIBSON took the Oath of Allegiance to the Crown.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

"5. With reference to question No. 25 asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das and answer given by the Hon'ble Mr. Craik in the meeting of this Council held on 13th March 1916, will Government be pleased to lay on the Council table copies of the following Punjab Government letters to Financial Commissioner, Punjab :—

(*a*) No. 595, dated 1st May 1860, recited in Appendix A. of the proceedings at page 58, last paragraph.

(*b*) No. 323, dated 22nd April 1862, recited in the same appendix at page 59, last paragraph."

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"A copy* of the letters asked for is laid upon the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

*Raising of pay of Primary School teachers.

"6. Will Government be pleased to state whether they have received any representation on behalf of the lowest grade vernacular teachers in primary schools for raising the minimum rates of their pay ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"No representation has been received by Government on behalf of vernacular teachers in primary schools."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Raising of pay of Vernacular teachers, lowest grade.

"7. With reference to the reply of the Hon'ble Mr. Godley to my question No. 30 in the meeting of the 13th March 1916, will Government be pleased to state whether, having regard to the increase in the cost of living and of labour, there is any proposal under consideration to raise the minimum rates of pay of the lowest grade vernacular teachers in the primary schools of the Province—

(*a*) Senior and Junior vernacular certificated,

(*b*) Uncertificated ?"

*Not printed.

[*Mr. Richey; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal; Mr. Gibson; Mr. Maynard.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The latest reform in the pay of vernacular teachers of primary schools has been the general introduction of a time-scale by District Boards in place of fixed pay.

"(*a*) Though the Punjab Education Code only fixes a minimum pay for certificated teachers, the Government Circular of last year on the expansion of vernacular education laid down as a condition of Provincial grants that an incremental scale of pay should be introduced, and a model scale was attached to that letter. This scale which provides for a minimum pay of Rs. 15 per mensem for Junior Vernacular teachers and of Rs. 20 per mensem for Senior Vernacular teachers has been adopted by several District Boards and similar good scales have been introduced by the remainder.

"In view of these recent changes which have sensibly ameliorated the lot of primary school teachers any further revision at the present time is not contemplated.

"(*b*) The pay of uncertificated teachers must be regulated by the supply of candidates for such posts. It must be remembered that they are only temporary incumbents of their posts and are replaced by trained teachers as soon as these become available. Their pay varies in different districts but is generally about Rs. 9 per mensem."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Expenditure of District Board Funds from Provincial and Imperial grants.

"8. Will Government be pleased to state how much money has been spent from the District Board funds or from the Provincial and Imperial grants during each of the last 10 years, in Kángra District for the improvement of—

(*a*) Village sanitation,
(*b*) Industrial development,
(*c*) Agricultural development ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"The information asked for by the Hon'ble Member is being collected and will be furnished at the next meeting of this Council."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Appeals to Financial Commissioners under Income-Tax Act.

"9. Will Government kindly state whether refusal by Deputy Commissioners and Commissioners to forward appeals to Financial Commissioners under the new rules for the hearing of appeals in income tax assessments do not cause hardship to the people ? Is Government prepared to kindly amend this present procedure ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"9. The Indian Income Tax Act, 1918, like its predecessor, provides for no appeal from the order of a Commissioner passed upon the petition of an assessee against the assessment. Unlike its predecessor, it gives to the Financial Commissioners a power to call for records and revise an assessment. A rule under section 43 provides that a petition to the Financial Commissioner praying him to exercise this power shall be presented to the Collector, who, in the exercise of his discretion shall withhold such petition unless he is of opinion that the grounds on which it is based call for consideration by higher authority, in which case he shall forward the petition to the Commissioner who shall exercise a similar discretion. The Financial Commissioners do not understand this rule as debarring him from the exercise of his jurisdiction under section 23, otherwise than upon reference from subordinate authority; and Government has no reason to suppose that hardship is caused by it."

[*Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Colonel MacWatt*].

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Scale of medical fees in private wards of Mayo Hospital as well as Albert Victor Wing.

"**10.** Will Government kindly lay on the table a statement showing the scale of fees, medical and other, charged both from Government servants and non-official individuals in the private wards of the Mayo Hospital as well as the Albert Victor Wing of the Mayo Hospital, when these wards were first opened."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"There have never been any private wards in the Mayo Hospital. Occasionally a patient of the better class was allotted a special room at the discretion of the Physician or Surgeon in charge of the general wards. These rooms were not originally intended for that purpose, but were observation wards used for special cases, and it was only when they happened to be vacant that they were sometimes utilised as private wards. In such cases a charge of Re. 1 per day was made for the room ; no visiting or other fee was charged. When the private wards in the Albert Victor Wing were first opened only room fees were charged. Government servants and Railway employés drawing less than Rs. 250 per mensem paid Rs. 3 ; all others Rs. 5 per diem.

"A copy* of the Rules regarding the charges for occupying these private wards when first opened is laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked a supplementary question :—

"May I, with Your Honour's permission, ask a supplementary question. What was the scale of medical fees ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The scale of medical fees was nil for those wards, as I said."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Time and circumstances when charges made.

"**11.** Will Government kindly state the time when and circumstance under which changes were made in these rules ? Will it also kindly state what the revised scales of fees were on each such occasion ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The scale of medical fees to be charged from patients not entitled to gratuitous medical attendance while under treatment was first introduced in 1905 ; since when no change has been made beyond the addition in 1914 of fees for certain obstetrical and gynæcological operations. For the scale of fees the Hon'ble Member is referred to the statement furnished with the reply to Question No. 11 asked by him at the meeting of this Council held on the 7th March 1919.

"Fees for medical and surgical attendance in the private wards of the Albert Victor Hospital were introduced to conform with the practice existing in similar large institutions in other provinces."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Time and circumstances when charges made.

"**12.** Were the subscribers or their representatives, or the King Edward Memorial Hospital Committee consulted at the times these revisions in scale of fees were made ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"No revisions in the scale of fees have been made. Government does not admit the right of the subscribers or their representatives or of the King Edward Memorial Hospital Committee to be consulted in the matter of any future revision that may be considered necessary, which is a question of internal hospital administration."

---

*See appendix A.

[*Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Colonel MacWatt ; The President.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das :—

"With Your Honour's permission may I ask a supplementary question: —

"As Colonel MacWatt has already replied that the medical fees are nil, am I to understand that the same rule will apply ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt :—

"I do not quite follow the question."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das :—

"You have just said that there has been no revision in the charges, and as you have said that the medical fees were nil, there will be no medical fees now ?"

His Honour the President :—

"The Hon'ble Member has said that in certain cases fees are charged and in other cases the fees were fixed in 1905."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt :—

"Yes, the fees were fixed in 1905, but there are special fees for certain operations."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das :—

"In the beginning there were no fees, but certain changes have been made from time to time."

His Honour the President :—

"The Hon'ble Member must put his question in the form of a question. If the Hon'ble Member wishes to make out that certain persons who cannot afford to pay fees were made to pay fees he must put it in the form of a question."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Non-official Indian Member on the Committee of Mayo Hospital.

"**13.** Is it not a fact that originally on the Mayo Hospital Committee there used to be one non-official Indian member ? If so, will Government kindly say why no such person sits on the committee now ? Will they also state whether they intend to restore the practice again ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"A Hospital Committee was formed in February 1910 by the then Principal of the Medical College, without reference to Government; and consisted of various members of the Hospital staff and a non-official Indian member of the Lahore Municipal Committee nominated by the Deputy Commissioner, Lahore, on the request of the Principal of the Medical College. The committee met once—on the 9th April 1910—and has not again met since then.

"Committees of the nature contemplated by the Hon'ble Member exist only—

(*a*) In Bombay—confined to St. George's Hospital, Bombay—its object being to bring the non-official European community into closer touch with the Hospital and the needs of the institution and the European patients.

(*b*) In Bengal—confined to the Presidency General European Hospital, Calcutta, and the Campbell Hospital, Sealdah—the duties of these committees are to visit the Hospitals periodically, inspect the internal arrangements and offer suggestions.

"Government proposes to appoint a similar committee for the Mayo Hospital."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Sarn Das asked :—

Old private wards in Mayo Hospital.

"**14.** Is it a fact that in the old private wards where a charge of Re. 1 each is made in the Mayo Hospital, now only select patients are admitted and that consequently these wards do not serve the purpose for which they were originally put up."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"As stated in reply to Question No. 10 there were no private wards, as such, in the original Mayo Hospital."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Sarn Das asked :—

Indian diet scale in Mayo Hospital.

"**15.** Will Government kindly lay on the table the existing diet scale for Indians in the Mayo Hospital, and also state when this scale was fixed, and whether it now stands in need of revision ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"A copy* of the Diet Scale is laid on the table. This scale was fixed in 1915, and is not in need of revision."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked a supplementary question :—

"May I ask why ghee is not included in the diet scale, it being one of the central ingredients of Indian food ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt :—

"The scale was fixed by the medical officers in connection with the Mayo Hospital and no doubt that question was taken into consideration, but I shall inquire from the Medical Superintendent of the Hospital and find out if the Hon'ble Member's suggestion may be adopted."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Sarn Das asked :—

Inspection of diet.

"**16.** Will Government kindly state whether or not the diet offered by the contractor for Indian patients is properly inspected by a suitable medical authority ? Will they kindly state what is the rank of officers entrusted with this work."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The diet is inspected in the verandah or kitchens by the Deputy Medical Superintendent, and in the wards by the House Physicians and House Surgeons in charge. These officers are Assistant Surgeons."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Sarn Das asked :—

Foot wear of Indian patients.

"**17.** Is it a fact that Indian patients in the Mayo Hospital are not provided with any sort of foot-wear, particularly in winter, to walk on marble floors ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"No foot-wear is provided in the Mayo Hospital. Those who wish to do so, and they are many, bring their own shoes ; and serious cases are not allowed out of bed."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked a supplementary question :—

"I should like to ask whether private shoes were allowed or stopped under the existing orders. As far as I have learned, under the existing rules, nobody is allowed to bring his own shoes."

*See appendix B.

[*Colonel MacWatt ; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; the President.*]

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt :—

I have it on the authority of the Medical Superintendent and also as a fact that the patients are certainly allowed to bring their own shoes whenever they like."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

"**18.** Will Government kindly state whether bed and bed clothes provided in the Mayo Hospital are suitable and sufficient ?" Suitability and sufficiency of bed and bed clothes.

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"Government is satisfied that the provision of bedding and bed clothes is ample and suitable."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked a supplementary question :—

"I should like to know whether the *gadela* provided for the patients is a *parali gadela* or an ordinary one. The *gadela* filled with *parali* is very hard."

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt :—

"I am afraid I am not in a position to answer that question at the present moment."

His Honour the President :—

"It is hardly fair to expect an Hon'ble Member to go into these minutes without notice."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

"**19.** Will Government kindly state when the newly built private and family wards in the Mayo Hospital will be opened to the public ?" Time when private wards in Mayo Hospital will be opened.

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The new private and family wards of the Mayo Hospital will be opened when the sanction of the Secretary of State for the necessary staff, which is awaited, is received."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked a supplementary question :—

"Until this extra staff is provided will the Indian patients be included in the private wards of the Albert Victor as they have hitherto been, because at present the Albert Victor is closed to the Indians ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt :—

"I shall ask the Medical Officer of the King Edward Medical College and the Superintendent of the Mayo Hospital if this can be arranged."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

"**20.** Will Government kindly consider whether or not it is desirable to provide free medical attendance in the private and family wards of the Mayo Hospital for those whose income is less than Rs. 2,000 a year ?" Free medical attendance to those whose income is less than Rs 2,000

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"It is not considered desirable to provide free medical attendance in the private and family wards of the Mayo Hospital for persons whose income is less than Rs. 2,000 per annum. This would bring the hospital into competition with independent private practitioners, Assistant Surgeons and Sub-Assistant Surgeons, a large part of whose practice is derived from persons of this class. A Hospital being a charitable institution, should not be utilised directly or indirectly to hamper or inhabit the growth and development of independent medical practice and private practitioners."

[*Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das; Colonel MacWatt ; the President ; Mr. Thompson.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Sponging of Indian patient.

"**21.** Is it a fact that sponging of Indian patients by nurses has now been stopped in the Mayo Hospital ? "

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The sponging of Indian patients by nurses has not been stopped. All patients, irrespective of race, caste or creed, are sponged as necessary."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked a supplementary question :—

"I should like to ask whether or not it is a fact that the Principal has issued an order to this effect."

His Honour the President :—

"The Hon'ble Member has given a direct reply to the question and I do not think that a supplementary question should be asked. The Hon'ble Member has been told distinctly that sponging is permitted."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :

Appointment of Committee to consider question of salaries.

"**22.** Has Government calculated the minimum scale of expenditure per month on cost of living for an educated Indian family, consisting of, on an average, a man, wife and two children ? If so, will they give an approximate analysis of their expenditure ? If not, will it not be desirable to calculate one for the purpose of revising salaries of clerks ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"A committee has recently been appointed to examine the general question of salaries with reference to the cost of living. Two non-official members of this Council, one of whom is the Hon'ble Member, who has put this question, have been asked to serve on the committee."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Memorials by clerks for increase of pay.

"**23.** Will Government kindly state whether they have received any memorials from clerks regarding revision of their salaries through the Heads of Departments ? If so, will they kindly say what steps are proposed to be taken with respect to them ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"Some memorials from the clerks have been received and will be examined by the committee."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Increases to clerical staff on account of high prices.

"**24.** Will Government kindly state whether the recent increases proposed by them for clerical staff in different departments are in proportion to the rise in prices and cost of living ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"The recent increases sanctioned for the clerical staff in different departments have not been sanctioned with a view to meeting conditions which it is hoped will prove merely temporary. Such conditions are better met by the grant of allowances."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Daily rations on cheap rates in Military Departments.

"**25.** Is Government aware that in the Offices of the Military Department in the Punjab the scale of daily rations on cheap rates as per list given below has been laid down for their clerical staffs ? Will they kindly say whether they propose to take these calculations into consideration in the award and evision of war allowances ?"

[*Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Mr. Thompson ; Mr. Maynard.*]

Statement showing actual daily rations required by an individual and monthly cost thereof.

Articles.	Quantities required per diem.	Quantities required per month.	Cost of monthly requirements at prevailing rates.	III.—Lahore Division. Remarks. Recovery rates.
	S. Ch.	S. Ch.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.
Atta ...	0 10½	19 11	2 15 0	0 1 0 per lb.
Rice ...	0 1½	2 13	1 2 0	0 1 1 „
Ghee ...	0 1	1 14	4 0 0	0 11 3 „
Vegetables of sorts ...	0 4	7 8	1 14 0	Potatoes 0 0 9
Dals of sorts ...	0 3	5 10	2 4 0	0 1 0
Sugar ...	0 1½	2 13	1 2 0	Rs. A. P. 0 2 9 Gur 0 10 2
Salt ...	...	0 10	0 1 3	0 0 4
Chillies ...	...	0 6	0 4 0	0 2 7
Turmeric ...	...	0 6	0 4 0	0 2 6 „ (0 3 6)
Spices ...	...	0 4	0 4 0	...
Milk ...	0 6	11 4	2 13 0	...
Firewood ...	1 8	45 0	1 2 0	0 0 6
		Total cost per head	19 1 3	
Kerosine oil ...	...	Per family 2 gallons	1 9 0	Rs. 0 12 6 a gallon.
Tea ...	...	½ lb.	0 3 6	Rs. 0 7 0 per lb.
		Total ...	20 13 9	

N.B.—No meat or fish or any luxury is included in the above and the quantities represent minimum requirements being below the standard shown in "Elementary Hygiene for India" by Sir Charles R. Bedford Knight, LL.D, M.D., D.Sc., Lieutenant-Colonel, I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"Government has no knowledge of what has been done in military offices in the Punjab. The Hon'ble Member will have the opportunity of inviting the attention of the committee to any facts which he thinks they should have before them."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

"26. Will Government kindly state whether or not they would consider the desirability of inaugurating through the agency of their Sanitary Engineering Department, a sanitary survey of the province so far as the question of sinking wells or of water-supply for drinking purposes, constructing masonry parapets for wells, filling up of depressions, near habitations, drainage and prevention of water-logging are concerned ?" Sanitary Survey of the Province.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The recently established Drainage Board is now collecting materials for a survey of the conditions of the Punjab as affected by the sub-soil water table and by water-logging. A portion of the materials in the form of records of the depth to water in wells maintained by the Irrigation Department over a long series of years already exists but may require to be supplemented and systematised.

[*Mr. Maynard ; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Mr. Gibson*].

"The question of appointing rural Health Officers and Health Staffs in a certain number of districts is now engaging the attention of Government and has been referred for the opinion of the Sanitary Board. Among the important function of such rural Health Staffs, if and when appointed, will be to draw attention to the existence of unhealthy depressions near habitations, to the absence of proper arrangements for water-supply for drinking purposes, and to such matters as the lack of proper protection to wells."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Contribution by Sanitary Board for sinking of new wells.

"**27.** Will Government kindly state what amounts have during the year just closed been contributed by the Sanitary Board in aid of the sinking of new wells for drinking purposes?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"During 1918-19 the Sanitary Board has made grants, aggregating Rs. 1,48,293, for the purpose of drinking water supplies."

"Precise figures are not available for the answer to this question; when available they will be laid on the table. In the meantime I can inform the Hon'ble Member that the expenditure on water-supply from funds of the Sanitary Board during the past year has been approximately Rs. 1,48,000."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Grain Compensation Allowance.

"**28.** Will Government kindly state what has been the result of the enquiries undertaken by the Grain Compensation Committee appointed by Government last year? Has it made any report to Government? If so, will they lay it on the table?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"After careful consideration of the proceedings of the meeting held at Simla on the 11th June 1918 and of the note furnished subsequently by the Hon'ble Member, dated 5th November 1918, Government accepted the conclusion of the majority of the Committee that the existing system not only provided a fair working basis but also on the whole operated to the benefit of establishments entitled to grain compensation allowance. Copies* of the proceedings and of the note referred to above are laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Irregular deliveries in the Punjab Post Offices.

"**29.** Has the attention of the Government been invited to the fact that from some time past there have been great irregularities in the delivery department of the Punjab Post Offices. If so, do they intend to move the Government of India to remove the causes of such irregularities?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"Government has received no complaint in regard to irregularities in the delivery department of the Punjab Post-Office. The Postmaster-General, Punjab, has, however, been furnished with a copy of the Hon'ble Member's question and of the reply given, for such action as he may deem necessary."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Revised scale of pay in district offices.

"**30.** Will Government kindly lay on the table a statement showing the new revised scale in the district offices for all kinds of appointments, the increase in annual cost of which is estimated to be Rs. 1,63,000 comparing the new scheme with the old in detail?"

*See appendix C.

[Mr. Joseph ; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das ; Mr. Maynard ; Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl i-Husain ; Mr. Thompson.]

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"The statements* asked for are laid on the table. They indicate an additional cost of Rs. 11,531 per mensem or Rs. 1 38,372 per annum. A gradually diminishing sum which in the first instance will approximate to Rs. 25,000 will be incurred in addition to that shown in the statement on account of personal allowances of the nature recommended by the Clerical Establishments Committee in paragraph 294 of their report, a copy* of which is also laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Employment of Agricultural Assistants.

"**31.** Will Government kindly state whether in order to give encouragment to agricultural work in the province they have in contemplation to engage Agricultural Assistants on higher salaries and better prospects?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Manyard replied :—

"In 1913-14 there were no entries to the first year class of the Agricultural College at Lyallpur and it was realised that the prospects of Agricultural Assistants must be improved in order to attract a sufficient number of suitable students to the study of Agriculture. Since then changes of an important kind have been made. The cadres of Agricultural Assistants and Research Assistants have been amalgamated, and the assistants have the prospect of rising, if qualified, to a higher status. The pay of the amalgamated cadre begins at Rs. 60 and rises to Rs. 250. The Agricultural College has been affiliated to the Punjab University and offers the prospect of a University Degree to those students who pass beyond the stage of study which qualifies for appointment to the rank of Agricultural Assistant. These changes have profoundly altered the position of the College. The difficulty now is to find room for all the applicants for admission, and it is necessary at present to refuse 3 out of 4 applications.

"The reason why a sufficient number of Agricultural Assistants is not immediately available is that these changes have not yet had time to take their full effect. It is recognised however that still larger demands for the services of men of this type are impending : and a Conference, at which one or more members of the Legislative Council will be invited to be present, will be held at Lyallpur this month to consider plans for the extension of the Agricultural College and its teaching facilities.

"There is no reason for thinking that the salaries and prospects of Agricultural Assistants are now inadequate to produce a sufficient supply of qualified candidates for the service."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain asked :—

Number of Internment and Externment Orders.

"**32.** Will Government be pleased to state—

(*a*) the total number of persons against whom orders of internment or externment were in force on 25th March 1919?

(*b*) the total number of persons against whom orders of internment or externment have been cancelled during the period 11th November 1918 to 25th March 1919?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"(*a*) 7 persons were interned, and orders of exclusion were in force against 5 on the 25th March 1919.

(*b*) 12 persons were released from internment and exclusion orders were cancelled in respect of 2 between the 11th November 1918 and the 25th March 1919.

*Not printed.

[*Mr. Thompson ; Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain ; Mr. Richey ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargawa.*]

"I am not sure whether the Hon'ble Member also wishes for information regarding restriction orders. 463 such orders were cancelled during the period mentioned, and only 188 such orders were in force on the 25th March."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussain asked :—

Newspapers whose entry in the Province is prohibited.

"**33.** Will Government be pleased to state—

(*a*) the names of the newspapers whose entry into the Punjab is prohibited at the present time ; and

(*b*) the names of the newspapers whose entry into the Punjab was prohibited during the war, but whose entry is now allowed ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"Prohibition is still in force against "the Commonweal," "New India," and "Jamhur" (defunct), and has been withdrawn against the "Iqdam," "Tarjuman," "Risalat," "Sadaquat" and "Naqqash" all of which are now defunct."

The Hon'ble Mian Fazl-i-Hussain asked :—

Chemistry and Biology in new Government Colleges.

"**34.** Will Government be pleased to state whether in the proposed second grade Government Colleges, it has been decided to teach Physics and Chemistry and Biology or whether it is proposed that only non-science subjects shall be taught ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"Although it will be impossible to introduce science teaching in the new second grade colleges at once, it is intended to include science in their courses as soon as accommodation for teaching it can be provided."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargawa asked :—

Place of location of new Arts Colleges.

"**35.** Will Government be pleased to state if it has been finally settled where one of the two new Arts Colleges is to be located : at Ambála or Ludhiána ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"The Committee which reported to Government on this matter expressed the opinion that while a strong case has been made out by the local committees for the establishment of colleges both at Ambàla and Ludhiána, there were practical difficulties in connection with the water-supply at Ambála which made the establishment of a Government College there less advisable than at Ludhiána."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargawa asked :—

Place of location of new Arts Colleges.

"**36.** Will Government be pleased to state if the matter referred to in the preceding question has not been finally settled which place out of the two Ambála and Ludhiána has been recommended by the Government to the Government of India for locating the said College ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"Consequently the Punjab Government in submitting its scheme to the Government of India recommended the opening of the second college at Ludhiána."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jowahar Lal Bhargawa asked :—

Time when Colleges will be started.

"**37.** Will Government be pleased to state when the two Colleges may be expected to be started ?"

[*Mr. Richey ; Mr. Waller ; Mr. Townsend ; Mr. Gibson ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Richey replied :—

"It is now too late for the Colleges to be opened this year. But it is hoped that the sanction of the Government of India to the proposals for the necessary addition to the Indian Educational Staff may be received during the course of the year, which would enable Government to open the Colleges in May 1920."

The Hon'ble Mr. Waller asked :—

"**38.** Will Government be pleased to state whether it is correct or not—

(*a*) That wheat purchased at Okára and Montgomery against Priority Certificates issued by Director of Civil Supplies was acquired by Government at a lower rate than original purchase price (in January and February last) and that inspite of an appeal, the Deputy Commissioner refused to release it ?

(*b*) If the reply is in the affirmative, will Government be pleased to issue definite orders for future guidance."

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"(*a*) It is understood that the Hon'ble Member refers to four consignments of wheat purchased in the Montgomery District by the Ganesh Flour Mills of Delhi, which were acquired by the Deputy Commissioner of Montgomery, last February, under Ordinance 9 of 1914. Whether the wheat in question was held under a certificate or not is immaterial, Delhi, for the purposes of the Director of Civil Supplies, being regarded as part of the Punjab ; nor does it matter, so far as the Ordinance is concerned, whether the wheat was acquired at a price lower than that paid for it. The question of the release of the wheat was one essentially for the decision of the Deputy Commissioner. When the Mills referred the matter to the Director of Civil Supplies, he explained to them, in some detail, the right of appeal they had under the Ordinance, leaving it to them to decide whether they would exercise that right or not.

(*b*) No orders of Government appear to be necessary. The procedure to be followed by persons wishing to appeal against action taken under the Ordinance was published some time ago in the *Punjab Gazette*. Many such appeals have been lodged, and there is no reason to suppose that the procedure in question is not widely known."

BUDGET, 1919-20.

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson :—"Your Honour, for the reasons given in the memorandum attached to the budget* for the year 1919-20, which is in the hands of the Hon'ble Members, it was, under Rule 29 of the Rules of the Discussion of the Annual Financial Statement of this Council unnecessary to hold a special meeting for the presentation of the budget, and all I need do is formally to introduce it."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—"Your Honour. In rising to make observations on the budget I consider it my pleasant duty first to pay my hearty congratulations to my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden on his very able and lucid Financial Statement, and an all-round prudent budget for the year 1919-20 on the eve of his laying down the charge of his most arduous and onerous duties, as the last link in the chain of 4 similarly prosperous and generous ones presented by him during his tenure of the

*See Appendix D.

office of the Financial Secretary. I wish he had been present at to-day's meeting to enable us to present our congratulations and to express our gratefulness to him personally. The present one is, I am glad to be able to say, like his preceeding budgets not only a prosperity budget so far as income heads are concerned but also a liberal one under the expenditure heads. I on my own part had never expected that this year's budget would be so hopefully prosperous considering the depressing signs in the form of delayed winter rains and other inauspicious prognostications which had been so dreadfully threatening, before the welcome showers dispelled the gloom about the middle of January last, and made the prospects of the standing Rabi crops somewhat better though not quite satisfactory as it had then become too late to cultivate a greater portion of the *barani* areas in the Province. The very high prices and scarcity of almost all the articles and commodities of life presented another depressing feature of the year. Under these adverse circumstances one is surprised to find in the budget the actual figures of abundance on all the 3 heads:—

(1) Opening balance Rs. 2,26,85,000.

(2) Total Provincial income Rs. 5,95,50,000.

(3) Closing balance Rs. 2,16,07,000.

"The explanations of the Financial Secretary and of the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard for this improvement of the prospects beyond expectation are quite satisfactory and it is hoped that the budget will eventually, on the expiration of the year prove itself to be ample to make the two ends meet. The prosperity of the budget being a proof of the general prosperity of the province I must also congratulate the Province as a whole as well as the Punjab Government on the same. The next thing for which the peoples are grateful to Government is the exemption of income under Rs. 2,000 from Income-tax. Though the welcome announcement of raising the limit of assessable income for the purposes of Income-tax from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 2,000 has been hailed with joy throughout the whole of India inasmuch as it releases the middle class poor who have to maintain large families from the burden of taxation; the authorities who have laboured to bring this concession about are also to be congratulated for getting release enforced during these very hard times of scarcity and high prices and for bringing a great relief to the people of this province from the worry to which persons with small incomes had to be subjected for not being able to keep or produce regular accounts in support of their objections to the assessment.

"The third matter requiring Government's immediate notice in these hard days is the straitened circumstances of the persons belonging to the lowest strata of the Government service. Your Honour, I would beg, on this occasion, emboldened by the brilliant prospects before us, to repeat most respectfully my humble prayer so often put forward before this Council during the last 6 years, that the minimum of the salaries of the following classes of public servants, which are by far too low to enable them to make the two ends meet, may at once be raised and the concession added to the numerous boons of Your Honour's 6 years' most successful rule in this province:—

(1) Patwaris who occupy a respectable position in the village life and are the trusted custodians of the Revenue and Settlement Records of the village and according to the Zamindars the originators of the forecasts for all the Revenue Settlements, and of the proposals for the suspension and remission of the Revenues on partial or total failure of the harvests in the village. In my humble opinion their present pay of Rs. 10 to

Rs. 14 per mensem is not adequate to their official position and responsibilites. Their minimum monthly pay requires to be raised to Rs. 20.

(2) The lowest grade teachers in the Primary Vernacular schools requires also to be raised to Rs. 20 per mensem to attract proper persons to take charge of our children in the first stage of their upbringing for lessons of morality as well as of religious and intellectual development.

(3) The lowest class of English clerks and Vernacular muharrirs and ahalmads whose residence at district and tahsil headquarters costs them more for their living in urban areas than the above 2 classes who live in the rural areas. For these I beg to suggest the minimum pay of Rs. 30 per mensem.

(4) Girdawar Qanungos who are generally men of education and come from good families and whose duties require them to be constantly touring about in a large area and make it absolutely necessary for them to keep a horse and 2 servants, cannot possibly live upon the present pay of Rs. 25. For them I beg to suggest a minimum salary of Rs. 40 per mensem.

(5) The peon and chaprasi class including court orderlies and jamadars who have to attend on respectable high officials and on respectable non-official visitors and have therefore to keep up a decent appearance. I suggest Rs. 12 per mensem rising to Rs. 20 per mensem for this class of the public servants.

"In this meeting of the Legislative Council which during the *régime* of Your Honour's good Government is expected to be the last one I must not omit to remind Your Honour of the gracious assurance which Your Honour gave to the inhabitants of the Kángra District on the occasion of your first visit to that district on the way back from Dharmsála when Your Honour made a couple of hours' stay at Núrpur on 25th July 1914, that Your Honour when gracing the district with the next visit it would be by rail, at least up to Núrpur. The unfortunately untoward events of the great war which broke out immediately after have prevented the fulfilment of the hope thus held out, but now that the war has ended in the complete and glorious victory of the British and Allied Arms which we have been celebrating so joyfully for the last six months, and that the Kángra men have taken a highly meritorious part in bringing this brilliant victory about, and now that a liberal budget provision has been made by the Government of India for the extension of Railways, I venture to represent that the first instalment of the recognition of Kángra's war services should be a very early extension of Railway communication from Pathánkot to Núrpur as broad gauge line and from Núrpur to Pálampur as a metre gauge one. This, I think, will have the effect of emancipating Kángra District from the pains of poverty and at the same time supply a need-felt and pressed for so many decades in the interest of hill trade and passenger traffic. I must call attention in this connection to the fact that Kángra District is the only district in the Province that has not so far had the advantage of Railway communication within any part of its areas inspite of its great importance as a military recruiting ground and one of the premier districts in many other ways, political as well as industrial and commercial. I would like to have this boon of the British Government to be extended to the Kángra District and associated with the events of Your Honour's *régime* in this province.

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; Makhdum Sayyad Rajan Shah.*]

"I beg next to be allowed to call the attention of Your Honour to the extreme necessity of strengthening the finances of the local bodies with a view to enable them to carry out effectively and promptly the much needed reforms for which the Province has been praying and which are noted below :—

(1) Extension of part II of the provisions of the Primary Education Act, 1919 and making Primary education compulsory as well as free in every part of the Province without further delay.

(2) Extensions of sanitary improvements in rural areas specially under the headings of the pure water supply and of the drainage of stagnant water collected round the village abadi to which the virulence of epidemic diseases in the villages has been mostly due.

(3) The development and encouragement of indigenous industries to make it possible for the province to depend on its local products and manufactures.

"The last but not the least submission that I will make is to express my gratitude to Your Honour on my behalf and on behalf of my constituents of Jullundur Division for the great blessings that have been conferred on the Province during Your Honour's glorious *régime*. It was Your Honour's presence at the helm of the affairs of this Province at such a critical time that not only saved it from so many shoals with such consummate statesmanship but made it the sword arm of the Empire, it had the reputation to be, in fact and indeed to be a lasting monument of Your Honour's illustrious rule. But for the presence of such a Governor at the helm at such time it would not have been possible to raise this Province to the exalted position, it has been able to attain among the other parts of British Empire and the colonies and to place it on an equality with the older, bigger and w ealthier sister Provinces. As instances of such equality I beg to mention (1) the elevation of the highest court of justice in the Province to the status of the High Court of Judicature at Lahore, opening ceremony of which Your Honour was pleased to celebrate the other day (2) the introduction of compulsory and free Primary education in this Province simultaneously with sister Provinces of Bombay, Bengal, Madras and the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh (3) Introduction of military training in colleges and among the so-called non-military classes under the Indian Defence Force system.

"These few instances amongst many others I am sure will prove to be the foundation stones of much greater reforms and improvements to come in the very near future.

"In the end I as the oldest elected member of the Council ask my colleagues to join me in praying to the Almighty Father to grant Your Honour and Lady O'Dwyer, who has done so much to improve Lady Aitchison's Hospital for Women at Lahore, and to ameliorate the condition of her Indian sisters in the Punjab, and to alleviate their sufferings during the last Influenza epidemic, and to carry comfort to the Indian soldiers engaged in distant theatres of the war of the Empire in Europe, Africa and Mesopotamia, and relief to the wounded and disabled Indian soldiers in the Ambulance Hospitals in and out of India, a long term of prosperous and happy life."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Sayyad Rajan Shah spoke in Urdu (a translation of which is as follows) :—

"Your Honour, although many of the Indian politicians of the day are of opinion that the Budget speeches of non-official members are no better than the sound of a 'Tuti' in the 'Naqarkhana,' I am an optimist by nature and have always kept myself free of disappointment.

I live in the hope that the future will be bright and prosperous. The word 'disappointment' nowhere exists in my dictionary. It is with this view that I cannot but make the following remarks :—

"That Mr. Lumsden, Financial Member, is well versed in the matters of his vocation is clearly exhibited in the budget prepared by him. I admit that to write a book is no easy task and that it is easier to criticise it, but since the beginning of the authorship in the world the critics have along been their old chums. It is admitted on all hands that although the authors are to be regarded with great esteem, the critics have also proved themselves very useful for authorship. There is no doubt the authors when attacked by the critics get into high temper and challenge them to come forward with a better work. But I am justified in hoping from the forebearance and patience of the Hon'ble Member that he will excuse the critics of the budget prepared by him.

"The financial position of the Province has been admittedly adverse during the last year. The stoppage of work, failure of the monsoon and spread of epidemics have badly affected the financial position. There has been advance in Excise receipts but it cannot count for the prosperity of the Province. The increase has been due to the fact that consumption of Excise articles increased as it was used by Military serving during the recent war.

"The public feel great necessity for a budget which contains measure for prevention of epidemics, advancement of sanitation, education and industries and for opening cheap shops in time of famine.

"There has been increase under head 'Sanitation' and it will appear satisfactory on a superficial view. But in view of the last year's disastrous results on account of the lack of medical aid to the poor subjects of His Majesty, the public stand in need of full aid on a large scale. The present world wide spread of epidemic makes it necessary that the local body should get sufficient help out of the income of the Province so that they may be able to open dispensaries in towns and villages at large. Native Hakims and Vaids may be encouraged by pecuniary help and stipends.

"The Government advanced one lakh of rupees towards the sanitary requirements at Simla last year and is willing to advance two lakhs next year. Most respectfully I venture to say that the Government of India may be moved to make this advance out of the Imperial Fund, for Simla is its Hill Station now-a-days and that the surplus may be expended on sanitation in those cities of the Punjab where it is most needed.

"Compulsory education has been the theme on which the whole country is discussing. I would respectfully say that the budget allotment for vernacular education is too little.

"Special attention is needed towards Industrial education, because this is the only means of removing idleness and poverty.

"Besides I cannot but draw attention towards the genuine complaint in behalf of the low pay of the teachers in Primary Schools.

"In the end I beg to draw the attention of the Government to the fact that the population at large is suffering very badly and that the allotment for providing cheap shops of grain is quite insufficient, specially in view of the fact that all the necessities of life, *i e*, wood, oil, cloth, etc., have grown too dear. There is no reason why a considerable sum should not be allotted, out of the income of the Province, for the same purpose so that the Municipal and District Boards may be able to start cheap shops of grain and other necessities.

[*Makhdum Sayyad Rajan Shah ; Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh.*]

"With these few remarks I beg to finish my speech. As this meeting of the Council in the last one of the tenure of your Honour's office and after this Your Honour will be leaving us for good for your home, I pray that Your Honour might reach home safe and sound and live a happy and prosperous life."

Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh :—"Your Honour, I beg leave to associate myself wholeheartedly with my Honourable colleague Rai Bahadur Sohan Lal in congratulating the Honourable Mr. Lumsden, the Finance Member, for presenting a well considered and prosperous Financial Statement.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden has been in charge of the Finance Portfolio for above 4 years and in spite of the fact that the exigencies of war and the consequent troublous time and occasional scarcity caused by the failure of rains, the Finance Member has very skillfully husbanded the resources of the Province.

"Your Honour as this is the last meeting on which Your Honour is going to preside I would like to give a very brief summary of the invaluable and solid work done by Your Honour in improving the administration of this Province. Your Honour's *régime* has been marked by a vigorous compaign against the forces of disorder and corruption and it is a matter of great gratification that Your Honour's noble and untiring efforts at the extermination of corruption and disorder were crowned with a glorious success.

"The British Government is broadly based on the peoples will and the unfailing and intense loyalty of the people finds a substancial support and encouragment in Your Honour's unique and undefiled administration of justice. Your Honour in the interests of State as well as in the interests of humanity under the stimulus of the kindly emotional characterestic of Your Honour's breadth of vision and large heartedness vigorously set about purifying the spring of Justice; and although the task was unpleasant and of a Herculean nature Your Honour has won the everlasting obligation and gratitude of the people by stamping out corruption with a firm hand. I hope that Your Honour's work in this connection would be productive of lasting benefit to the cause of Judicial administration in this Province.

"The statesmen like and bold manner in which Your Honour dealt with the troublesome question of immigrants who appeared to threaten the peace and tranquility of the country is worthy of our commendation. The bold and constitutional measures adopted to restrain and control the turbulant immigrants succeeded in achieving the desired end, the maintenance of peace and order. I can affirm without any fear of contradiction, that although the majority of immigrants belonged to the Sikh community, the latter co-operated with the Government in the above cause with a remarkable sense of duty and unflenching devotion to the cause of Government. Being encouraged by the clemency shown by Your Honour to the convicts of the Multan special tribunal, I might be permitted to put in at this juncture, when all fear of any trouble from the immigrants has died away, an humble appeal on their behalf to treat their case with consideration and order some modification and remission in their sentences if deemed advisable by the Government. This manifestation of mercy and kindness on Your Honour's part would tend to stimulate and strengthen the faith that people cherish about Your Honour's warmth of heart and generosity.

"As regards the General administration of criminal justice in the Punjab it is a matter of extreme satisfaction that there has been a general decline in crimes since 1913. The figures for reduction are explained as follows:—Number of true cognizable cases per lakh of population was 241 in 1912, 239 in 1913, 236 in 1914, 233 in 1915, 202 in 1916 and 174 in 1917.

This is largely due to the hearty co-operation of the people with the administration. This co-operation I can boldly assert is characterestic of Your Honour's *régime*.

"This is a record of which you can justly be proud.

"Your Honour made a praiseworthy effort to reduce the needless and ever increasing civil litigation due to uncertainty of customs and appointed a large and representative conference to consider the desirability of codification of customs. The Conference submitted their report some years back, but on account of the very heavy work which Your Honour's Government was called upon to do, the further progress in the matter had to be postponed. It is indeed a pity that even the two Bills that arose out of the deliberations of the Conference could not be placed on the Statute Book during the tenure of your office.

"Next I turn to the phenomenal advancement made in the educational domain during Your Honour's *régime*. It was under the healthy encouragement held out by Your Honour that the Compulsory Primary Education Bill was passed and the foresightedness and breadth of vision displayed by Your Honour in facilitating the passage of this Bill through your Council is a striking proof that Your Honour always had the interests of the people in view. The Compulsory Primary Education Act is expected to give a strong and healthy stimulus to the cause of education in general in the Province and the leaders of public opinion have declared this act as a substantial boon. Then Your Honour has generously sanctioned the establishment of two second grade College in the Province which measure shall be fruitful of immense benefit to the people. It will make higher education easily accessible to several students who for want of means and other circumstances could not avail of it in the already overcrowded Colleges at Lahore. The cause of education is indissolubably bound up with the cause of people's advancement in all sphere of life and no patriotic and right minded Indian would hesitate to express his profound sense of gratitude to Your Honour for sanctioning the above unmixed blessings to the Province. On learning to-day from the Hon'ble Mr. Richey that my District, Ludhiána, has been selected for the location of one of the new Colleges, I on behalf of the people of my district and also of the neighbouring districts who are likely to be benefited by the institution offer my most sincere thanks to Your Honour for this invaluable boon.

"The people of this Province had been clamouring since a long time for the establishment of a High Court at Lahore and it is a matter of great rejoicing that through Your Honour's keen and sympathetic interest in the question the idea has been realised and Your Honour's association with the opening ceremony of the High Court was a befitting culmination of the various stages through which the idea of the establishment of the High Court had to evolve itself. This brings me to the strenuous work done by Your Honour during the world wide war, which through the grace of God has terminated in glorious victory to the allies. It was only after 15 months from the assumption of the reins of Government of this Province by Your Honour that Germany by her blind and agressive policy created a gigantic commotion and hurled practically the whole world in the vortex of warfare and the vigorous action taken by Your Honour in mobilising and collecting the sinews of war and other necessary resources of the province is simply unparalleled. It was under the inspiring leadership of Your Honour that the people came out in a most liberal manner to the help of the Government and no sacrifices whether in men, money or material were grudged. It gladdens me to remark that people of this Province identified themselves whole heartedly with Your Honour's Government and the co-operation and sympathy evinced by them in the work of enlistment and war loan are an unfailing testimony to the deep rooted loyalty

and unwavering confidence inspired in the people by Your Honour. The contributions made by this Province in men, money and foodstuffs are indicative of the continuous and zealous interest taken by Your Honour in the successful prosecution of the war and I can affirm without any spirit of affectation and flattery that during the troublous times while the interests vitally affecting the welfare of the Province were never allowed to suffer Your Honour kept the momentous, issues involved in the war ever in the forefront. It must have been a matter of great consolation and encouragement to you to see that your devoted life companion Lady O'Dwyer identified herself with this great cause and organised a Fund to provide comforts to the soldiers who stood firmly against the enemy in the service of the Empire, and no work is more glorious and noble than the supplying of articles of comforts to soldiers who were at front. It was only in the fitness of things that a Lady endowed by nature with a tender heart should undertake and organise this kind of work. Our best thanks are due to her.

"The martial races in the Punjab supplied more than 60 per cent. of the recruits to the Indian Army. My Province though very poor as compared with the other Provinces, maintained its 3rd position in both the war loans. It is also worth mentioning that ⅔rds of the foodstuffs and other necessary material for the British Army was supplied by Your Province.

"Coming to my community, I say with legitimate pride that it stood head and shoulder above the sister communities, and beat its own record in the service of Government. The Sikhs rallied round the British flag, one and all, from prince to peasant, with an enthusiasm quite their own. It is a well known fact that the Sikh Princes, Their Highnesses the Maharajas of Patiala, Nabha, Jind, Kapurthala and Faridkot and the Raja of Kalsia, made willing sacrifices in upholding the honour of the British Raj, in a manner unknown in the history of the Indian States. Contribution in men by the premier Sikh State is greater than any other State throughout India. Similarly recruiting of the Sikhs in the Sikh districts, when compared with other communities, was out of all proportion to their number.

"My community has won the largest number of military distinctions out of all proportion to their numerical strengh. I am really very glad that all these services have been publicly acknowledged by Your Honour in many of your public utterances on the occasion of State Banquets, Victory Darbars and other public gatherings.

"Sikhs are much grateful to Your Honour for the princely donation of three lakhs to our national institution, the Khalsa College at Amritsar, in recognition of the valuable war services of the Panth as a whole. I assure Your Honour that Your Honour's name will go down to the future generations of the Sikhs as one of their great benefactor.

"The Panth is also grateful to Your Honour for removing their old grievance as regards the kirpan, their religious symbol. By securing its exemption from the Arms Act Your Honour had laid them under a deep debt of gratitude. Your Honour would have been pleased to see that the orders of exemption were extended from the Punjab to the United Provinces, and then to the whole of British India. I hope Your Honour's Government will use its great influence in favourably setting the controversy at rest which has only a few months back arisen about this symbol of ours in certain military quarters. Sikhs shall highly appreciate such a privilege.

"Your Honour's solicitude in the cause of temperance was conclusively proved by Your Honour's casting vote to restore clause 4 of the Juvenile Smoking Bill. I personally [illegible] all the temperance workers in the Punjab

are sincerely thankful to you for placing the measure on the Statute Book. The Bengal has followed and the Madras is about to follow the example of Your Honour's Province in this measure of social reform.

"Your Honour, The sacrifices in men, money and other materials of war were mostly made by the zamindar classes of the Province who reside in rural areas. I feel constrained to point out that in the matter of education, sanitation, and medical aid, they are far behind their more fortunate fellow subjects in the cities. Though something has been done in this direction, it is admitted on all hands, that much remains to be done to restore the villagers to their proper and just place in these matters. Your Honour is practically the first Governor to realize their great importance to the state ; it is, therefore, natural that we look to your Government to secure for them their just and due share, proportionate to their number and the revenues paid by them to the State coffers, in the reform scheme which is now before the Government. Unless they are given proper representation in the Councils there could be no hope of improvement in their deplorable condition.

"You, Sir, soon after the declaration of the war, added the Crown Lands by, 75,000 acres to the already sanctioned reserve of 103,000 acres. Your Honour also opened a Technical School for the wounded and disabled soldiers ; and made adequate provisions for the education of the children of those soldiers who had fallen in the war. For all these boons military classes are much grateful to Your Honour.

"After this brief reference to some of the important phases of Your Honour's *régime*—the time at my disposal not allowing me to describe several other things for which we are all grateful, it is with a sad and sinking heart that I contemplate Your Honour's departure from our midst to enjoy your well deserved rest in Your Honour's mother country. The courtious and cordial treatment accorded by Your Honour towards the members of this Council and the friendly attitude towards them had inspired in them feelings of profound attachment and devotion and the idea that we shall no longer have the privilege of working with Your Honour in the common cause can not but engender feelings of sadness. The only idea to sustain us at this hour of parting is the hope that your Honour would not cease to take an active interest in the welfare of this Province and while at home would employ Your Honour's valuable influence in securing for this Province an equal measure of reforms along with other Provinces. Your Honour must have realised that the Punjab the sword-arm of India yields at none in her loyalty to the British Government and as regards intellectual advancement it is making rapid strides and in view of the large and ungrudging sacrifices made by the people of the Punjab it would be barely consistent with the British sense of justice to treat this Province on an unequal footing from other Provinces.

"I hope that Your Honour would leave this Province with pleasant memories that would linger in Your Honour's heart and we on our part assure Your Honour in a most sincere and earnest manner that Your Honour's kindly and friendly attitude towards us has made such deep impressions upon our minds which efflux of time can never efface."

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir Behram Khan spoke in Urdu (the purport of which is as follows) :—

"Your Honour, my-esteemed Hon'ble colleagues have made very eloquent speeches and there was no necessity for me to rise to give a similar speech but actuated by feelings of cordiality I beg to say a few words as this is the last Council meeting over which Your Honour will preside.

"The advantages gained by the Punjab during the term of Your Honour's rule not only bring credit to Your Honour but indicate a splendid future for it. Our province has always been faithful to the British Crown, and it is well

known to Your Honour that it is adjacent to the Frontier Province which is inhabited by warlike nations. By means of Your Honour's astute skill, powerful hand and great courtesy this province showed its fidelity by sacrificing life and money in the cause of the Sovereign and for which this province feels proud. By the grace of God and Your Honour's skilful administration crime has decreased. That is as clear as daylight and I need not expatiate upon this subject. I therefore with Your Honour's permission beg particularly to express special gratitude on behalf of the Sardars and other inhabitants of my own District of Dera Ghazi Khan where Your Honour thanks to your benevolent nature has taken thought for the recovery and prosperity of the afflicted city.

"By your graciousness and benevolence Your Honour has helped the prosperity of that town greatly in having it paved with metalled roads and getting trees planted on either side of them. Other improvements that were contemplated by Your Honour could not be realised on account of the outbreak of the War. After all, much has been done for Dera Ghazi Khan and it is hoped that Government will in future also be benevolently inclined towards it.

"Finally, I conclude this speech with the prayer that the shelter of His Gracious Majesty the King-Emperor may remain for ever on our heads and that Your Honour may reach your dear and sweet home quite safe and may live a long, prosperous and healthy life."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das:—YOUR HONOUR.—"The chief characteristic of Punjab budgets, in fact of all Indian budgets, is that in estimating receipts the Finance Branch of our Secretariats is over cautious and in case of expenditure too optimistic. The result is that our balances go on accumulating year after year. This phenomenon I have been personally observing in this Council ever since I became its member, and it has been existing, I believe, from even before that time. The Government I am sure knows this fact too well, but let me for the benefit of my non-official colleagues of this Council illustrate this peculiar phenomenon by means of certain figures compiled from Government reports. Your Honour, we are on the eve of a new Reform Scheme. Let us take stock of what we have been doing with our finances during the currency of the Morley Reforms. These Reforms were introduced from the beginning of the calendar year 1910. In that year our opening balance was Rs. 27,75,857. Four years hence on the 1st of April 1914 our opening balance became 1,70,91,590 rupees. We then decrease our this huge and inconvenient balance, not by spending it on objects of public utility such as extension of education, improvement in sanitation, organisation of greater medical relief, or in encouragement of local industries, but by the surrender of one crore out of it to Government of India on a bare annuity of 3½ lakhs. I protested at this, but my remarks went at that time unheeded. Since then the same story of accumulation of balances has again been repeating. In 1914 as I have stated the opening balance after the surrender of one crore of rupees was Rs. 70,91,590. This year it is estimated to be Rs. 2,23,35,000. Actually it may turn out to be much larger than even this. Your Honour, this policy of piling up balances year after year, at least I have been observing it from the last 9 years, is in my opinion prejudicial to the best interests of this Province. Our methods of estimating are rather faulty. When we underestimate our receipts we prevent ourselves from providing larger grants for objects of public utility. That is to say we starve out our reconstruction programmes. Under these circumstances while we compel ourselves to live on scarcity rations, the outside world thinks that our needs are very few and that therefore smaller revenues would do for us. This gives them an entirely false idea of our needs and necessities. Your Honour, it may have been observed that the financial proposals made in Montague Chelmsford Scheme are very

prejudicial to the Punjab. It was with a view to draw pointed attention to this defect in the new Reform Scheme that I moved in the November meeting of this Council a resolution on the subject. During the discussion on that resolution I was very glad to learn from Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden that the Punjab Government had already protested against these proposals in the Reform Scheme. But Your Honour, the argument of facts is always stronger than mere protests. Facts and figures show that our expenditure has been at too low a level. It was not low as has been alleged, particularly in the year 1917-18 but has been so if I mistake not always. For this reason we have always suffered in our quinquennial settlements with the Government of India, and for this very reason, I fear, we may also suffer under the new Reform Scheme. Our policy in matters of national reconstruction, or for providing money for works of public utility has been too halting. My Hon'ble friend Mian Fazal Hussain while moving his resolution last year on sanitation, showed by means of figures compiled from Government reports, that the Government of India grants for sanitation had not been utilised fully and that large sums out of these grants which in subsequent quinquennial settlements became absorbed in the general revenues of the Province were diverted elsewhere and went to accumulate balances. Our Finance Secretary, while doubting the accuracy of these figures, has not so far shown them to be unreliable. In fact he has not even attempted to do so. The orthodox official answer for not spending larger sums on sanitation is that there is no demand for it. In this connection Your Honour, let me make myself clear that I am not criticising the policy of the Sanitary Board at which my respected friend the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard presides. I have nothing particular to say against the work of the Board. My chief complaint is against the Finance Branch of the Secretariat who are to provide funds to the Board. My point is that the funds allotted to the Boards for Sanitary grants are too small. It is their remark for lack of demand that I am at this moment trying to answer. Your Honour, may I ask whether there was any demand in this Province for modern system of education in the fiftees and sixtees of the last century? That demand I believe was created by the British Administration, and to-day we are in a position to pass a compulsory education bill. Again was there any demand for the European system of medical relief in the earlier years of British rule in this Province, and yet to-day we press the Government to open larger and ever larger number of dispensaries. Your Honour unless we demonstrate to our ignorant and illiterate fellow-countrymen the utility and necessity of sanitation, unless we prove to them that it is a prevention against disease and bodily infirmity how on earth can we create demand for sanitation. To a merchant his ever pressing problem is an increase in his capital. In order to do that he creates demand for his goods, popularises his merchandise and employs all means to demonstrate the utility of his manufactures. In the same way to the State increase in the health of the people is its ever pressing problem. In order to bring about this, taste must be created among the people for sanitation. Is the Sanitary Board doing anything in this direction? To my knowledge the only thing it is doing in this line is a certain amount of grant-in-aid it is giving to the S. P. S. K. But what more is the Board doing beyond this? Last year the President of the Sanitary Board gave us some idea of the work done by it. Probably it is doing all it can within the money it has at its disposal. But since it suffers from lack of money, it seems it is compelled to have no vigorous policy of initiative. Unless more money is put at its disposal and unless thereby the Board is enabled to give grants-in-aid at more liberal rates say for instance 75 per cent. of the cost of sanitary works, I think much cannot be done for sanitation.

"I am glad to observe that this year about Rs. two lakhs have been provided for ordinary and travelling dispensaries. This is a move in the right direction, but Your Honour, here also I must submit, the pace is rather slow.

The resources at our disposal are much larger, and we could if we liked spend larger sums on medical relief. This question of dispensaries brings me to the premier dispensary in the Province, I mean the Mayo Hospital. Recently I tabled a set of questions on this Hospital, which have been answered this morning. Some people may think that my questions convey a racial tinge about it. Your Honour, I am the last person to indulge in such things. My real object in bringing this question to the Council is to remove racial differences wherever they may exist, for I believe that way does not lie national well being. I have therefore considered it my duty to attract prominently the attention of Government towards this. I am quite sure whatever misapprehensions there might be in the public mind amount this affair will be removed.

"The next object which requires increased expenditure at the hands of Government is greater encouragement for the study of indigenous system of medicine. Your Honour, we Indians are by habit, temparament, and physical constitution, different from our European brethren. I need not take pains to prove that our indigenous drugs and medicines properly applied are usually better suited to us and much cheaper in cost than their European substitutes. The indigenous system is at present suffering simply from lack of study, and yet it is this system that for treatment attracts the bulk of people in this country. The English system of medicine attracts mostly the English educated people, but since, Your Honour, they only form a minority it would not be right to ignore the interests of the vast majority of the people. Under these circumstances then, what is required is, the establishment of a College imparting indigenous system of medical education. Funds should be provided for the establishment of such a College, and I earnestly hope Government will seriously consider this question. In this connection I would also request Government to remove the disabilities placed on practitioners of indigenous medicine. If a properly certificated Vaid or Hakim grants medical certificates to his patients, there is no reason why it should not be recognised. At the same time I see no reason why the discretion of local self-governing bodies should be fettered in the employment of medical officers for dispensaries under their control. If some local bodies desire to employ in their service some Vaids and Hakims, I think it is not right that Government should insist upon very low salaries being paid to them. Does this not interfere with the powers of self-governing bodies? In the extension of Sanitary Reforms the Government does not force sanitary schemes on local bodies for fear of interfering with their self-governing powers. I fail to understand why should it do so in case of the employment of Hakims and Vaids. I am sure the local self-government committee recently sitting in Lahore has taken this question also into consideration, and have arrived at satisfactory solution of this problem.

"The next question that requires our serious attention is the encouragement and promotion of local industries. I think it is admitted now on all hands that unemployment problem requires serious consideration. Solve this problem satisfactorily and I am sure you will ease the situation considerably. This can only be done by opening to our young men avenues other than Government service and professions. Up to this time I am afraid the Government has done not much for the promotion of local and home industries. I am glad Government has recently framed a scheme of industrial education. It remains to be seen how far it will meet the situation. But Your Honour, mere provision of industrial education will not solve the problem. That will only create and produce in our young men capacity for industrial work. But unless capital remains shy, and unless our manufacturers command market, these industrially educated young men will not be able to turn their education to any use. In the beginning we will require for these home and local industries some model factories to be set up by Government. When these industries have proved a success then they can be transferred into the hands of non.

official proprietors. Your Honour, industrial regeneration of the country is a very pressing problem, and I am sure very early steps will be taken to tackle this problem satisfactorily. In this connection I would also urge upon Government the necessity of encouraging technical education in the Province. Education of this sort lacks very much amongst us. Award of scholarships to suitable candidates would popularise this education to some extent, and I hope Government will kindly take this question into favourable consideration.

"The most pressing and immediate necessity of these days is a revision in the salary of Government servants. I am very glad to observe that Government has appointed a committee to look into the question of these revisions. The best thanks of the people are due to Your Honour for this. In order that this committee should be able to discharge its functions properly and in order to be better able to arrive at right conclusions, I think it would be necessary for them to call witnesses both official and non-official and Indians as well as Europeans. I hope Your Honour will be pleased to issue necessary instructions to the committee in this matter. In this connection I would urge upon Your Honour's attention that question of revision in salaries of our subordinate and provincial services also. To their lot falls the most important portion of the administrative work. It is they who have to come in direct touch with the masses, and consequently as representatives of Government before the people they have to maintain a certain amount of dignity and position. I hope Your Honour will take their case also into consideration and refer their question as well to the newly appointed revision of salaries committee.

"Your Honour, in connection with financial affairs of this Province there is one more question that demands attention, and that is the increase in water-rates over canal areas. In answer to a question put by me on the subject in a previous Council meeting, I was given to understand that it was in contemplation to revise water-rates on the Upper Bari Doab Canal. I believe an officer must have been placed on special duty to look into the matter. He must have made his report by this time. Your Honour, if we the non-official members of this Council are to influence the actions of Government in any way it is but necessary that we should be consulted and given necessary information in proper time. If information is supplied to us after the whole thing has been settled, it can possibly serve no useful purpose. I would therefore request Your Honour's Government to make such information accessable to non-official members of this Council, for it is only in that case that our co-operation with the administration can prove of any utility."

His Honour the President.—"The Hon'ble Member has exceeded his time ; I will give him a few minutes more."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das continued :—

"Turning now to questions other than strictly financial, I must again refer to one feature of our educational policy. Your Honour, it must be admitted, th at the educated section of population is strongly opposed to the reduction of Primary Schools to Four Classes Schools. I understand that in Frontier Province also, where this system of Four Classes Primary Schools has been in existence for some years, they are now reverting back to Five Classes Schools. I do not know how far this is correct, but information has reached me from that Province to this effect. Your Honour, Bombay adopted this system of Four Classes Schools, but after a short time it had to give it up. If it is correct that Frontier Province is also going to give it up, it looks strange that we should be introducing the system discarded by others. Your Honour, under the circumstances I would therefore urge upon your Government to kindly order the postponement of the abolition of fifth class in the Primary Schools at

least for sometime more. There is also another course open to Government. They can convert the existing five classes Primary Schools into Lower Middle Schools of the new scheme. Your Honour, this boon will be greatly appreciated, and I earnestly hope Government will not yet abolish the 5th class of the Primary Schools.

"It is a matter of great pride to Your Honour that through Your Honour's able guidance our Province excelled all other Provinces in rendering glorious services to Government in connection with the war.

"Your noble consort Lady O'Dwyer has taken a keen interest in the welfare of the fair sex, and in providing comforts for the troops our grateful thanks are due to her for this noble work.

"Your Honour has placed the orthodox Hindus of Punjab under a deep and everlasting gratitude by interest taken in the establishment of Sanatan Dharam College at Lahore.

"Scale of Grain Compensation Rules needs revision and we hope Your Honour's Government will refer this matter to the Committee appointed.

"Your Honour, I have one more point to refer to. We are to-day on the eve of obtaining large and important reforms in the constitution of our country's Government. We are just on the point of receiving representative system of Government, and the essence of all such Governments is that all classes and interests should find adequate representation in the country's national assembly. In the Punjab it seems the Government has thought fit to retain and grant separate representation on sectarian basis. As this had been done, I feel quite sure Your Honour's Government has proposed adequate representation of my community the Hindus. The Hindus in this Province form a very important, minority, and in point of wealth, education, position, and influence, they are the most important. The danger with which we are at present faced is whether while other communities are receiving their due or more than their due representation, it should not be at the cost of the Hindus. I am sure, a wide awake and impartial ruler like Your Honour, must have taken this aspect of the question into full consideration, and I hope your proposals with respect to Hindu representation in the future Council of the Punjab will prove satisfactory to the community concerned.

"In conclusion I must now come to the approaching end of Your Honour's term of office. Practically throughout the period of my membership of this Council, we have had the pleasure of working under your presidency. We non-officials have always been treated with kindness and consideration. Your Honour has always been anxious in this Council to meet our point of view and concede it if possible. That has made our task a pleasant one. During your term of office, Your Honour, we have had also to pass through the greatest crisis in history. You had been confronted with the most difficult task of keeping peace and order in our land during one of the most troublous periods of world's history. During the earlier years of the late war now happily ended some disturbances had arisen in the Province, and a critical situation had actually been produced, but thanks to the energetic and timely action of Your Honour the situation was controlled ably. The best thanks of the people are due to Your Honour for piloting the Province safely during these critical times. This meeting of the Council would be the last at which we will have Your Honour as our President and we feel all of us very much your approaching departure. Your Honour has now earned a well deserved rest after 35 years' strenuous service in this country, and we wish you a safe voyage home, and a happy, peaceful and prosperous life in your retirement."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand :—"Your Honour, when we met to discuss the budget last year, the Empire was face to face with the gravest crisis in its history. The German War Lords had met with strik-

ing success in the initial stages of their onslaught and the general outlook for the Empire was decidedly gloomy. It is a matter for sincere congratulations that we meet to-day under entirely altered conditions. The success of the enemy proved wholly temporary and the last desparate effort of the autocracy to crush democracy proved futile, and the right triumphed over might once more as it has done so many times in the history of human progress and civilisation. The allied forces not only saved the world from an impending calamity but also gave autocracy its last quietus, and to-day the banner of liberty has been carried aloft to the banks of the Rhine and across and is now waving on the ramparts raised by a haughty and proud race as sallying points from which to pounce on the liberties of weak nations and unsuspecting neighbours.

"The strain which the Empire had to bear in the dark days of the year was naturally great. The patriotism and resources of the whole Empire were taxed as they had never been taxed before. How did the Punjab meet the tremendous call which had to be made upon its manhood and chivalry? The answer to this query is writ in letters of gold in the recruiting history of India. The sword arm of India met all its commitments right manfully, and the chief credit of the way in which the Land of the Five Rivers rose to the full height of its opportunity belongs to the President of this Council, whom a merciful Providence had sent to guide the destinies of the Province in the trying times of the War, and a wise Government had retained at its head beyond his ordinary terms of office. It is in no strain of conventional courtesy that I say these words, but I am convinced that it was the inspiring example and the capable leadership of Your Honour which enabled the Punjab to secure such a high and honourable position among the various units of the Empire for sacrifices in the cause of humanity and liberty. Your Honour will be laying down the reins of your high office very shortly, but you will be leaving behind a memory of rich sacrifices and valuable services to the cause of the Empire and you will always be able to look back upon your career as head of this province with genuine pleasure and natural pride. May I congratulate Your Honour on the brilliant record of services which you are leaving behind as a source of inspiration to the future generations of administrators, who will be called upon to rule over large masses of men in this country in the times to come.

"Turning to the budget itself, I heartily welcome the change in the rules of business, which enables the Hon'ble Members of this Council to offer criticism and make useful suggestions before the budget becomes crystallised. Non-official members had been pressing for this change and the Government is to be congratulated on their decision to accede to the demand. Personally, I am afraid I have not been able to take advantage of this change this year on account of various other pressing engagements, but my inability to make use of the opportunity thus offered heightens rather than lessens my gratitude for the change.

"The budget as a whole is eminently satisfactory. The Hon'ble the Financial Member has indicated the adverse conditions of War and Famine which effected the budget under discussion. However, the general financial position as disclosed by the budget is one on which we may well congratulate ourselves and particularly the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden. I will now offer a few observations on some of the heads of the budget.

"On the side of receipts I shall confine myself to the heads Land—Revenue, Excise and Income-tax only. As regards Land—Revenue it is a matter for sincere congratulation that in spite of unfavourable agricultural conditions due to the general failure of the monsoon the drop in the receipts of ordinary revenue has not been so serious, as might have been apprehended. The item under the Land—Revenue head which fixes my attention most is the one which appear as sale of Government estates and sale-proceeds of waste

lands. It is, no doubt, true that the income derived from the sale of Government estates and waste lands is very tempting and it is no easy task to persuade the Finance Member to forego it altogether. But when regard is had to the claims for recognition of the services of those gallant Punjabi soldiers who have fought and died in the service of their King and who have brought eternal glory and undying fame on the Province of their birth by suffering death, receiving wounds, or winning distinctions by their heroic deeds in the battle field, there should be no disinclination to sacrifice at least a portion of this income. It should not be difficult for the blood sacrifices of the brave Punjabi soldiers to induce the Finance Member to agree to a sacrifice of a part of the immense income which the Government derives every year from this head under Land—Revenue. The land reserved for distribution among deserving warriors of His Majesty's Forces is clearly inadequate. It is only 178,000 acres. It was decided to reserve this area of land at a time when we had no definite idea of the duration of the devastating war which has now happily ended or of the dimensions to which the Indian Army grew as a consequence of the incessant demands of the Military situation during the four years that the War lasted. Roughly speaking twelve thousand Punjabis have died in the War. There must be nearly three thousand who have won distinctions. The number of those who received wounds and survived without securing any recognised honour or distinction such as an order or a medal may safely be put down at twice the number of those who suffered death or won a distinction put together. This gives a total number of approximately thirty thousand. What proportion of these men we can safely leave out and what proportion we should select for land grants is an extremely important and difficult problem to solve. I will not hazard an opinion specifying the exact proportion of these men who should be selected for land grants but as one who has been associated with recruiting from the very outset and who has been constantly moving among the classes of men concerned I think it my duty to express my emphatic disagreement with the view of the Financial Commissioner referred to at page 1 of the Annual Report on the Punjab Colonies for the year 1918. The Financial Commissioner is of opinion that the difficulty in regard to the shortage of land suitable for Military grantees is less acute than had at one time been feared. I feel that the difficulty is as acute as ever and the shortage more serious than has so far been recognised. We have only 7,120 rectangles at our disposal, and I honestly feel that unless a very substantial increase is made to the area which is proposed to be distributed among Military men there will be very keen disappointment. I will not say any more on the subject, in the Council Chamber at any rate, but before I leave this topic I will earnestly advise the Finance Member to forego the income from the sale of waste lands for the next three or four years and allow as much of the land proposed to be auctioned as possible to go to increase the area placed at the disposal of the Commander-in-Chief for distribution among men who have shed their blood so ungrudgingly in the defence of the Empire.

"Under the head Excise I find an ominous increase in the financial year which is just closing and a further increase which is likely to be exceeded is expected in 1919-20. The Finance Member seems to view with satisfaction this heavy increase and observes that 'these figures seem to indicate that money is plentiful and no doubt the high prices obtained for agricultural produce and the large remittances from abroad have enabled consumers of liquor to indulge freely in this luxury.' But this is only one side of the question. The figures certainly indicate increasing prosperity of the people but they also indicate that the habit of drinking is very decidedly on the increase in the Province and if allowed to grow unchecked no amount of money, however plentiful, will be sufficient to meet the demands of this pernicious habit and people may have

to sell or mortgage their lands and other property for the fun of indulging in this luxury. Drinking habit is sure also to lead to increased crime, debased morals, and deteriorated physique. I hope that the Finance Member will in future look with more concern and less complacency on any increase in the receipts under Excise.

"The increase under the head of Income-tax is to be heartily welcomed as it indicates a burden on the right shoulders. The Government of India also deserves the heartfelt thanks of the people for having raised the amount of assessable income from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 2,000. The wise and sympathetic decision of the Imperial Government in this behalf exonerates from the liability to pay income-tax the only class of persons who felt the burden of this tax. The new agency which has been created to enquire into and assess incomes to a fair and reasonable tax will result in a very sustantial increase in the receipts from this head. Except in the lower grades income-tax payers were almost universally under-taxed and there is every reason to hope that a diligent working of the new system by honest officers specially selected for the purpose will impose on wealthy shirkers a revised scale of income-tax which will be equitable both to the State and to the subject.

"On the expenditure side I will deal briefly with the heads Education, Medical, Sanitation and Agriculture. Under the head Education one cannot but regret that practically the whole sum set apart for the help of the children of Indian soldiers who have fallen in the War remains unspent, I doubt whether if any sum, however large, had been appropriated for the help of the children of clerks or subordinate officers in the Educational Department, any portion of it would have remained unspent. It cannot be said that there are no children of Indian soldiers entitled to the benefit of this sum reading in Schools or Colleges. Nor can it be maintained that the children of such soldiers are too rich to care for monetary help so kindly provided by Government. The fact seems to be that no effective steps have been taken to ascertain the number of scholars entitled to the benefit of this provision or to make known the existence of such a provision in the Mufassil from which most of these children come.

"It is also a matter for regret that 'it has been possible to disburse only Rs. 57,000 against the accumulations of the assignment for the improvement of pay and training of teachers.' So far, at any rate, as the improvement of the pay of teachers is concerned there could have been no insurmountable difficulties in framing a revised scale of salaries for the classes of teachers whom it was contemplated to benefit by the scheme of improvement.

"Your Honour's Government deserves the sincere thanks of the Province for its decision to open two more Arts Colleges of the second grade. The additions of Rs. 2,00,000 for building grants to local bodies for vernacular education and of an equal sum for vernacular education and an assignment of Rs. 75,000 for the construction of a Carpentry School at Jullundur in the estimates for 1919-20 are welcome. Equally welcome is the fact that the unspent balance of Rs. 2,32,000 of the assignment for improving the pay and training of teachers has again been entered, and we earnestly hope that the full amount of the assignment will be spent in the ensuing year.

"Under the head Medical there is a really substantial increase budgetted for the next year. In view of the possible recurrence of influenza this increase is a very wise provision, and as the depletion of the medical staff will shortly be remedied in consequence of demobilisation now in progress it is hoped that liberal arrangements for the starting of travelling dispensaries will be made.

[*The President; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand.*]

"Sanitation is another subject which needs the immediate and close attention of the Government, and it is a little disheartening to find that the revised figures for 1918-19 are only Rs. 7,79,000 and fall short of the actuals of 1917-18 (Rs. 9,81,000) and the sum budgetted for 1918-19 (Rs. 8,18,000). The sum entered for 1919-20 is hardly encouraging. The assignment of Rs. 10,64,000 shows an increase of only Rs. 83,000 over the actuals of 1917-18. The grants for sanitary purposes are actually less than the actuals of 1917-18 under this sub-head, *i.e.*, Rs. 6,22,000 as compared with Rs. 6,26,000. If a sum of 2 lakhs for the Simla Improvement Scheme is to go out of this meagre allotment we shall have precious little left for the rest of the Province. A liberal programme for the improvement of sanitation in the Province is urgently needed. The whole sanitary department requires overhauling. An adequate and competent supervising staff should be provided and a large number of Sanitary Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors needs to be brought into existence. There should be at least one Sub-Inspector for every tahsil, one Inspector for every district, and one Superintendent for every division. A vigorous campaign for explaining to the people the elementary principles of hygiene and sanitation should be undertaken. Model *bastis* should be erected by the Government at convenient centres and the drainage of the country-side should be improved. All this means an immense increase in expenditure, but the results that will follow on this expenditure will be a hundred times more precious than the money spent to secure them. A large number of preventible deaths will be avoided, epidemics will be less frequent and less formidable and the people will be stronger and healthier.

"There is another side of expenditure on sanitation to which I desire to draw the attention of the Government. Hitherto the rural areas of the Province have been almost wholly neglected. Towns get more or less liberal grants for water works and drainage schemes which they may decide upon. But 90 per cent. of the population which lives in villages has so far failed to attract the attention which it deserves. So far as the South-East Punjab is concerned I have seen nothing worthy of mention done by the Sanitation Department to improve the squalid surroundings of villages or to better the insanitary conditions in which villagers live. The Sanitary Department cannot claim to have done anything appreciable in the way of securing a pure supply of water or improving the drainage of any rural area in the Ambala Division which I have the honour to represent in this Council. There are hardly any reasons to suppose that the activities of the Sanitary Department have been more conspicuous in any other part of the rural Punjab. Under the circumstances I have a right to complain of the attitude of apathy which has been maintained by the Department towards the needs of the rural population in the Province. I will earnestly appeal to the Government to provide a separate sub-head for rural sanitation under the main head Sanitation."

His Honour the President:—"The Hon'ble Member has exceeded his time; I will give him a few minutes more."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand:—"I now turn to the head of Agriculture. Having regard to the immense potentialities of the premier industry of India I cannot but feel that the assignments for this head have by no means been liberal in the past and though there is a substantial increase in the sum provided for the new year in comparison with the revised of 1918-19, the fact that assignments have remained unspent year after year causes some natural misgivings in my mind. To my mind there seems to be no sufficient excuse for the full assignments not being worked up to. The War and the conditions produced by it are but a partial explanation of the assignments remaining unspent. The real explanation seems to be a lack of

vigorous enterprise in the department of agriculture and I trust that earnest efforts will now be made to remedy this defect. But I think I shall be ungrateful, if I were not to acknowledge with feelings of gratitude the decision of the Government to introduce practical agriculture in secondary schools of the Province. This is a beginning in the right direction and for this our thanks are due to Your Honour.

"Before I leave this head I wish to point out that the desire for education in agriculture is becoming keen and people are very dissatisfied at the number of rejections for admission at the Agricultural College, Lyallpur. Time has come when there should be one Agricultural College in each division and at least one High School in each district. I hope the Government will take early steps in this direction.

"The sub-head Co-operative Credit continues to show progressive improvement. The assignment under this sub-head has risen from Rs. 96,000 (actuals) of 1917-18 to Rs. 1,71,000 provided in the budget for the next year. The increase is welcome but I doubt whether it will prove sufficient for the growing demands of co-operation. Education, Co-operation and Sanitation are the three pressing needs of the country. I have already had something to say on education and sanitation. I now desire to press the claims of co-operation, with even greater warmth. If poverty is to be chased away from the midst of our agricultural classes increasing attention must be paid to the Development and spread of the co-operative movement in the Province. If the unsuspecting, ignorant and over-trustful zamindars are to be saved from the clutches of unscrupulous and greedy money-lenders intensive and incessant work must be done to expand, strengthen and improve the activities of the Co-operative Department. This necessarily involves a very considerable increase in the ranks of Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors entertained by the Department. Further as men of special qualifications, special aptitude and special mental attitude are required to initiate and supervise the movement a higher scale of salaries is needed to attract men of the proper stamp. The requirements of the Department will thus appear to demand larger sums of money than have so far been provided and I feel sure that with the return of normal times and normal conditions the Government will be able to do all that is needed for the speedy development of this important Department.

"Before I take leave of this subject I wish to thank Your Honour on behalf of the peasantry of the Province for making provision for Cattle Insurance staff. This will I hope prove a great boon to the small farmers.

"I have now finished but before I close I will urge upon the attention of the Government the claims of the low-paid servants of the Crown, such as patwaris, girdawars and the clerical and subordinate staff of every Department. Their plight is woeful and no body who sees them struggling to live a precarious life can fail to sympathise with them. The high prices of all the necessaries of life during the past few years have added immensely to their difficulties. The prices are not likely to resume their pre-war level, and it is of the utmost importance that their case should receive sympathetic attention at an early date and increase in emoluments should be granted to them. The budget under discussion shows that the Government has already done something in the case of some of the classes whose cause I advocate. I hope that the Government will take speedy action to improve the pay and prospects of the rest."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, :—"Your Honour,—Last year when we parted on the budget day there were dark clouds of impending danger hovering over us and in Your Honour's words the critical stage was reached, and the existence of the Empire and of every thing for which it stood was at stake and the security of Indian hearths and homes was menaced.

[*Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava.*]

"By the Grace of God, to-day at the close of the year, not only this menace stands averted but the Armies of the Allied Powers have achieved glorious Victory and the foundations of an enduring peace are being laid.

"The services of India in the world's struggle have been acknowledged and recognised by His Majesty the King-Emperor and the Premier of Great Britain and other authorities.

"It is a matter for pride for us all that the Punjab acquitted itself splendidly at the Empire's call and in bringing about this consummation Your Honour has contributed in no mean degree. In fact behind all the activities Your Honour's personality was visible too clearly.

"No satrap of any other Province can boast of greater amount of work and with greater results. Your Honour's touching appeals ring in our ears. Your Honour's appreciation of work, encouragement and exhortation to perform our duties and Your Honour's admonitions and reprimands, if they were due, Your Honour's extensive tours at the sacrifice of great personal comfort and convenience galvanised the Punjab into a state of unexpected activity. The glory and the good name which the Punjab has won is attributable in a great measure to Your Honour's indifatigable activities and the Punjab feels proud that it has steered through the troublous waters of the War under Your Honour's helm.

"But among the pre-occupations of War Your Honour has not been the less vigilant of the arts of peace. Your Honour's efforts at uprooting corruption and bribery, the establishment of settlement for criminal tribes, the inauguration of the Faculty of Agriculture and many other boons call for the gratitude of the people. The opening of the High Court of Judiciature at Lahore, the future palladium of justice, shall always remain associated with Your Honour's name, which is an unmistakable indication of Your Honour's solicitude for seeing the Province brought to the level of equality so far as judicial machinery of the Government is concerned. But what shall be remembered with by far the greatest gratitude are Your Honour's efforts to bring within the reach of every Punjabi the boon of primary education.

"Your Honour,—Though the Compulsory Primary Education Act has been passed, yet as Your Honour is fully aware, it contains no provision for the Government's insisting upon local bodies to exercise the option left to them in case they fail to do so during a certain period. I am sanguine in my hope that the local bodies of the Province in general will rise to the height of their duty and exercise this option. But the circumstances and the resources of some of them may not allow of such exercise. I would under the circumstances suggest that an Educational Board be constituted and charged with the mission of studying the educational wants of the Province and providing such a network of schools in the Province that after a period of say two or three years there may be no local body in existence which may not have been baptised by the endorsement of the Compulsory Primary Education Act which stands out as a monument of Your Honour's *régime*. In this connection I will not hesitate to say that the provision for education in the budget is not adequate to meet the wants of a growing department. The Hon'ble Member-in-charge of education may in the absence of schemes ready at hands and special demands by the local bodies rightfully say that he does not stand in need of more generous provision in the budget. But Your Honour and the Hon'ble Mr. Richey will, I earnestly hope, forgive me if I indulge in a little plain speaking in this matter.

[*Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava.*]

"The attitude of the Government is liable to be misunderstood. A man in the street does not discriminate between the absence of demand by public bodies for provision in the budget and the non-allotment in the budget. To him both spell the same way. In fact, Your Honour, the public expects that the Government instead of being approached by the local bodies which are generally devoid of initiation and enterprise to move in the matter will order the local bodies to bestir themselves to an appreciable degree. Viewed from this standpoint the attitude of the Hon'ble Member-in-charge of Education may look to be a little disappointing. I hope I will not be misunderstood. However it may be said that the amount of provision for the future may be a matter of opinion. But, Your Honour, it is very strange that the budgetted amounts for education remain unspent in a Province like ours which is so backward in education. May I express a hope that this shall not be said in the next year of the budgetted amount of this year.

"Your Honour, it is a pity that the Compulsory Primary Education Act applies to boys only and some of us did not see their way to accept its applications to girls. Be, as it may, it requires hardly any logic to say that the backwardness in female education is a serious drawback on our progress and if we mean to make serious progress we shall have to make stupendous efforts in this direction. Paucity of female teachers is a great obstacle in the path of female education and the provision for more training schools for female teachers is a great necessity.

"I hope the claims of Agricultural education will be duly recognised in the scheme of compulsory education. I welcome the proposal of opening the Carpentry Schools at Jullundur and hope that this school shall be a forerunner of many like institutions at different important centres.

"Now that the War is over I would urge upon the attention of the Government the claims of Industrial and Commercial Education. The Technological Institute should now drift onward from the dreamland into the realm of practicability. Without questioning the advantage of the possession of a bold peasantry and the blessings of comfortable rural life, I can not but ask the Government in this age of industrialism to do its level best to encourage the existing industries and do the pioneer work of starting new ones. The advantage should be taken of the lessons of the War and the experience so derived should be put to use. In this connection a plea for improving and encouraging the sugar industry will not be out of place. In the Punjab where sugarcane is cultivated in 23 out of the 29 districts in large areas, if the sugar industry were thriving no import from other countries would be necessary. The Java and Mauritious sugar which is imported in so large a quantity can be driven out of market if the Government were pleased to tackle the question seriously.

"Your Honour,—It is admitted on all hands that Sanitation is one of the prime needs of the country yet in this matter we are constantly told that the budgetted amounts are not spent because the local bodies do not submit ready made schemes. May I request Your Honour in this connection that the Sanitary Board be required to equitably distribute the allotted amounts with proper regard to various heads of the expenditure and local necessities to insist on local bodies to spend the amounts. If local bodies are inert the Sanitary Board should shake off the lethargy of the local bodies and enliven them to a sense of their duty.

"Your Honour, I have had something to say in the last meeting of the Council about the rise of income from liquor. I quite see the force of the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard's argument that the plentiful existence of materials which make illicit distillation of liquor so easy make the prohibition the more

difficult and unsuccessful and I do realise that the difficulty is not so easy of solution. Yet I hope Your Honour and other Hon'ble Members will agree with me when I say that the increase in drinking habits is not one which in the present state of the society is susceptible of being checkmated in its progress by cultivation of better and more refined tastes only.

"The evil is increasing and platitudes, however, altruistic, will fail to arrest its progress. Efforts at cultivation of higher and more refined tastes commensurate with the increase in drink are not visible. The temperance preacher and the Government have identically the same interest and aim and it would not do to say that so much the Government will do and the rest will be left to the pious teachings of the preacher. I hope the Government will realise the gravity of the situation and devise some more effective means of grappling with the evil.

"Your Honour,—The last crop was a disappointment and but for some timely rains some portions of the Province would have been within the grip of a severe famine. Let us hope that the providence will make amends for the last crop in the coming one. The people of my constituency are very gateful to Your Honour for Your Honour's assurance that big schemes of irrigation are under the contemplation of the Government which would irrigate the arid South-Eastern Districts of the Punjab and under the circumstances what remains for me to urge on their behalf is that the Government may be pleased to order the Engineers and the Canal Department to expedite the matter and bring the long expected boon within the range of early realisation.

"Your Honour,—The selection of Lord Sinha (of Raipur) to the Under-Secretaryship for India of the Government of the United Kingdom by that prince among statesmen Mr. Lloyd George and the delegation of Lord Sinha and His Highness the Maharaja of Bikaner at the Peace Conference have given wide spread satisfaction and demonstrated how earnest the statesmen at the helm of affairs are in their desire and efforts to do justice to the claims of India.

"It is hoped that in recognition of the same principles Indians will be accorded their rightful place in all posts of responsibility in the Government of India and Provincial Governments.

"Your Honour,—While referring to these good things I cannot but refer to the Rowlatt Bills which have evoked so much opposition from the public and the non-official Members of the Imperial Legislative Council. The Punjab is quite peacful and the drastic and extraordinary provisions of the Act, I hope will never require to be enforced in this Province.

"Your Honour,—As it is the last occasion on which Your Honour is to preside over the deliberations of this Council, I express a hope and wish which I trust will be shared by all the Members of this Council. The Punjab which has endeared itself so much to Your Honour, we may well hope will always evoke feelings of affection and awaken sweet memories in Your Honour's mind. It need hardly be said that in Your Honour's future activities, Your Honour shall never forget the Punjabis and their interests shall always be nearest Your Honour's heart. May Your Honour and Lady O'Dwyer who took so kindly and keen interest for the women of the Punjab live long to enjoy the well-earned rest and happiness is my sincere wish."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai.—"Your Honour, I also associate myself with the other Hon'ble Members' remarks in congratulating Mr. Lumsden on another prosperity budget which he has been able to present to the Council and I hope the Hon'ble Mr. Gibson will be quite

as lucky in future years to present budgets as prosperous as the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden has been doing for the last four years. Your Honour, it has been stated by some of the Hon'ble Members that there are some urgent needs in the Province to which special attention has not been devoted by the Financial Secretary and I have no doubt that the needs of education, the needs of sanitation and the more pressing needs of agricultural improvments in the country will require better attention in the future than has been given to it in the present budget.

"One very important remark which I noticed in the speech of my Hon'ble friend Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, was the request for the appointment of an Educational Board. I absolutely agree with him in his suggestion. I am afraid the Education Bill will not be very successful in its operations unless such a Board is brought into existence.

"Your Honour, this is the last occasion on which you can preside at the deliberations of this Council and I heartily associate myself with the feelings of regret expressed by Hon'ble Members who have preceded me.

"Having had the privilege of knowing Your Honour for the last 32 years, this feeling is naturaly all the stronger with me.

"Your Honour's tenure of office will remain ever memorable in the annals of this Province not only for the vastness of the programme undertaken, but also for the successful manner in which Your Honour carried out that programme in the face of great and numerous difficulties. It was during this time that the great War came upon us like a bolt from the blue and its glorious termination was in no small degree the result of Your Honour's efforts. It was due to Your Honour's untiring zeal, energy and ability that this Province has been able to maintain its martial traditions and to justify the proud title of the Sword Arm of India.

"It was not in men alone, of whom this Province was able to supply nearly a third of a million in the fighting line besides those doing work subsidiary to the War, that the Punjab was guided by Your Honour to the help of the Empire in her hour of need. Poor as she was, she was proud to take an honourable place in the War Loan Lists, besides subscribing generously to the various war funds like the Red Cross, the Aeroplane and the Lady O'Dwyer Funds.

"The glorious achievements of the Province under Your Honour's leadership during the War would by themselves make Your Honour's tenure of office the most memorable of any, but that is not all. It was no ordinary task to maintain peace and order during these troublesome times. In the early part of the War, there were no doubt two eruptions one in the Multan and Jhang Districts, and the other in the central districts of the Province, but these were speedily put down in a swift and stern manner. As Your Honour then remarked the revolutionary doctrine was 'a poisonous exotic planted in the foreign soil of India,' and it was a source of gratification to all lovers of this country that only a small section of the population was disaffected and the people as a body were loyal to the core. Your Honour's prompt action checked serious crime in its very early beginnings and effectively avoided what might have become a crisis.

"In spite of the engrossing demands of the War on Your Honour's time and attention, it is a matter of sincere satisfaction to us that all-round progress has been a marked feature of Your Honour's administration. The cause of education has received great impetus during the last six years. I am personally aware of Your Honour's solicitude in this direction and can well remember Your Honour regretting in 1915 that the circumstances created by the War

[*Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai; Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah.*]

did not allow Your Honour to spend as much on education as you would have desired. The last Bill on the subject passed by Your Honour's Council will serve as an important landmark in so far as it introduces the principle not only of compulsory, but of free education in the Province. The level of education is as high in this Province as any other Province except Bengal, and our University is turning out an even increasing stream of graduates every year. While the professions are tending to become glutted new openings are being made and the schemes which are in hand and those that are projected will I hope in time direct the activities of the educated classes into new channels. It is further gratifying to note that agricultural education too has come in for its proper share of attention, as also have the important problems of sanitation.

"Your Honour, another topic in which Your Honour has been taking keen and statesmanlike interest is the scheme for resuscitating old families, and thus creating a barrier of influential public opinion against the dangers of revolutionary tendencies. Next to the War, perhaps the most momentous incident during Your Honour's tenure was the announcement of August 1917 culminating in the now famous Montagu-Chelmsford Report on Constitutional Reforms. Though we do not yet know the exact extent of the reforms to be inaugurated in this Province we are aware of the liberal spirit which animates those proposals, and I have every confidence that when they are given effect to, with necessary modifications which have been suggested by responsible public opinion, they will be important landmarks in the progressive development of the country, towards the realization of the ultimate goal of self-government.

"Your Honour, I might here be permitted to make a passing allusion to the vigorous campaign against bribery and corruption that Your Honour undertook with the result that the fountain of justice is clearer to-day than it was a few years ago. The coming of the High Court marks the culmination of a slow process, and, as was said by the Hon'ble Chief Justice the other day, Your Honour laboured hard and successsfully to expedite the conversion of the Chief Court into a High Court.

"In bidding farewell to Your Honour we trust that Your Honour will ever remember this Province in which much the greater part of your official life has been spent, which has, under Your Honour's guidance, given undboubted proof of its loyalty and good will, and which has been ever ready to subordinate its interests to the higher interests of the Empire as a whole. We trust and pray that when Your Honour is called upon to play your part in the higher councils of the Empire, your advocacy will ever be used in the interests of your old province.

"I am, I believe, voicing the sentiments of all Punjab in wishing long life and prosperity to Your Honour and to Lady O'Dwyer who has so largely contributed to the success of the social side of the administration.

"In the end I must acknowledge the very great kindness and courtesy which Your Honour has always been pleased to extend to members of this Council during the tenure of your office and I wish and pray that Your Honour and Lady O'Dwyer who has done so much on the social side of the administration may live long and prosperous lives."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah.—"Your Honour, I heartily join my Hon'ble Colleague in congratulating the Hon'ble Mr. Lumsden, the Finance Member, on presenting to this Council a prosperity budget. During Your Honour's term of office the Punjab has made progress in every direction and this Council has done some good and solid work. I must also

not fail to congratulate the Punjab Government on their decision to give the Punjab an enabling Act in favour of compulsory primary education. Now the matter entirely rests with the members of the local body. The success or failure of the extension of primary education in this Province will rest entirely with them. If they will take the masses with them I am sure education will prosper. The same may be said about sanitation. The great thing is to take the people with us either in the extension of education or sanitation. Unless and until we take the people with us instead of doing some good to the people I think there is some danger. We must take the people with us if we want to do some good. Your Honour, last year this Council congratulated Your Honour most warmly on the extension of your term of office for one year. That year is now drawing very near to a close and Your Honour will be within the next two or three weeks making over charge to your successor. During all these years of trouble the magnificent work which Your Honour has done needs no adjectives from me. It is too well known to the public. More particularly I would be failing in my duty if I were not to mention in connection with Your Honour's work the good work that Lady O'Dwyer has done in connection with the war and the comforts for the troops, and I think also her splendid work was a labour of love and the good work that she has done in the Punjab will be remembered with gratitude or many years. With these few remarks I take my eat."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh :—"Your Honour, as so many my Hon'ble friends of this Council have gone through each details of the budget and have said enough on it I need not go into it. Your Honour, your time was a glorious one. The gigantic World War commenced in Your Honour's time and it was ended by the Grace of God with glorious victory in Your Honour's time. Your Honour's meritorious services during the Great World War were fully and justly recognised by His Majesty's Government and the term of Your Honour's office was extended for one year, which Your Honour fully deserved. It was on Your Honour's recommendations that a special electorate was given to the Sikh community. It was in Your Honour's time that special attention was paid towards zamindars' claim. Your Honour fully and liberally recognised the people's services rendered during the War, by bestowing titles on them and granting suitable and substantial rewards to the people of the Province.

"It was—(1) in Your Honour's time that the Punjab Chief Court status was raised to that of High Court; (2) the Indian soldiers shall ever remain grateful to Lady O'Dwyer who had opened the Indian Soldiers Comfort Fund and worked hard in carrying out that noble task so satisfactorily.

"The Punjabis also on their part gave thorough proof of their ever undoubted loyalty. The number of soldiers' supplied by the Punjab during the War, their casualty list (which shows how many precious Punjabi lives were lost, while fighting for their Emperor and Empire) and the number of Military honours won by the Punjabis, are proof of Punjabis' devotions towards the British Crown. But I cannot help saying that even in Your Honour's time the Punjabis in general and Sikhs in particular did not get their shares. It is a recognised fact that the Punjabis are called the protectors of India, thus no sister Province could rightly and justly grudge against the Punjabis if their services are specially recognised and they are given more share than or even an equal share with other sister Provinces in Military service. When at first time in the history of India, and that in Your Honour's time, the King's Commission was opened to Indians, the Punjabis and the Sikhs were not given a full share, according to their Military qualifications, their Military services and to their proportioned strength in Indian Army. I do hope that Your Honour while at home will also help the cause of the Punjabis and your Sikh

devotees. The Sikhs were always much grateful and satisfied when they read Your Honour's speeches made in different Durbars, in which Your Honour always appreciated and spoke very highly of the services rendered by the Sikh soldiers during the Great War and of their loyalty, and now they are waiting impatiently to see that the expression occasionally made by Your Honour will take a practical shape in a near future, and that they get their share in the administration of the country according to their importance and status.

"The Sikhs are much grateful to Your Honour for the grant of 3 lakhs recently made by Your Honour to the Khalsa College, Amritsar. I also hope that Your Honour, trusting in the loyalty of the Sikhs, will be pleased to deal with the Sikh emigrants still interned (save those whose disloyal spirit had ever been proved, if there are any) so liberally as Your Honour's Government dealt with Muhammadan interned emigrants in the Multan Ilaqa, before Your Honour leaves for England.

"I wish Your Honour and Lady O'Dwyer a happy voyage and prosperous time at your dear home and hope that Your Honour will not forget the Punjab which you ruled for full six years and your Punjabi friends."

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson :—"Your Honour, it must be a matter of great regret to all (and to none more than to myself) that, owing to unavoidable circumstances, my distinguished predecessor is unable to be present at the discussion of the budget to-day. In the circumstances it is inevitable that my replies to the criticisms of Hon'ble Members must be brief and, perhaps, uninformed, and for any shortcomings in this direction I must crave the indulgence of the Council. In the first place I should like, on behalf of Government, to express thanks to the Hon'ble Members who have spoken, for the generally appreciative tone in which they have referred to the budget proposals. There are only a few points on which I need make any specific reply. The Hon'ble Bakhshi Sohan Lal pressed for increases in the pay of low-paid classes of Government servants. With regard to patwaris, I may say that the Financial Commissioners have under consideration proposals to raise patwaris' pay very appreciably, though perhaps not to the figure suggested by the Hon'ble Member. In addition, however, it is proposed to give them a provident fund, and the whole scheme will add at least three lakhs to our recurring charges. As regards clerks and muharris, the Secretary of State has sanctioned the introduction of a scheme based on the report of the Clerical Establishment Committee the extra cost of which will amount to about Rs. 1,70,000 annually. The lowest substantive pay is Rs. 20 but improvements in grading have been effected. It is believed also that the Judges of the High Court have under consideration proposals to increase the pay of the establishments administered by them. Nearly every headquarter office establishment has been recently overhauled and in every case have the pay and prospects of clerks been generally improved. These changes have added considerably to our recurring charges. It cannot be conceded that it is desirable at once to introduce as initial pay the amounts proposed by the Hon'ble Member. Initial pay in Government service cannot be fixed irrespective of the rates of pay offered by commercial firms and other private agencies, but in most of the recent proposals the opportunity of raising the initial pay has been taken. Although the applications to the Government of India for a special budget grant to meet increases in allowances proposed in consequence of the present rise in rents and prices was submitted too late for incorporation in the accounts of this financial year, the Government of India have promised to allow a special grant for this purpose should our budget provision prove inadequate.

[*Mr. Gibson ; Mr. Maynard.*]

"The question of the Kangra Valley Railway communications has been represented to the Railway Board and it is hoped that the Nurpur extension will soon be started. In regard to the Simla improvements I would remind Hon'ble Members that the Government of India contribute Rs. 2 lakhs to each lakh provided by the Punjab Government.

"The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das made two grave charges against the Financial Branch, firstly, that it starved education and sanitation and other departments, and secondly that it seeks to pile up unnecessarily large balances. With regard to the first charge, I would remind the Hon'ble Member once again that the Finance Department cannot take the initiative in the provision of money, and that it has provided all that was asked for, and no reasonable claim has been refused. The Finance Department can only keep pace with the spending departments and it cannot possibly go further. Further it has agreed to find the money for schemes likely to mature within this financial year and for which no provision has been made in the budget. In regard to the Hon'ble Member's second objection the late Finance Member has many times explained to this Council the reasons for the growth of balances. In the first place, they are directly due to the war. We were asked as a deliberate policy to save money to help the Empire through its time of stress. Again of the existing balances approximately 1 crore represents capital receipts from the sale of lands. This sum must be set apart for remunerative investment, which it has so far been impossible to arrange owing to the war. The balance also includes the unspent balance of imperial assignments regarding which the position is that they cannot be diverted to other purposes and they are available for expenditure by the departments concerned whenever opportunity occurs. Excluding these sums the net balance would amount to only about 1 crore, and in the current year a step has been taken towards utilising the balance by framing a deficit budget.

"Your Honour, in conclusion I am desired by my distinguished predecessor to express his sincere regret at his unavoidable absence to-day and to convey his thanks to all the members of the Finance Sub-Committee for their valuable assistance in framing the budget, and also to his Under-Secretary (Mr. Badenoch) without whose ability and unremitting industry it would have been impossible for him to cope with the heavy work of the department (applause)."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard :—"Your Honour, as I have to deal with four subjects, I shall touch very briefly on each of them. I begin with agriculture. My Hon'ble friend Chaudhari Lal Chand has been very severe on the Agricultural Department. I think he said we had obviously been remiss in pressing a scheme of a valuable character and neglecting the duties which lay before us. I confess that I felt considerable surprise when he spoke in those terms. A little while ago I informed him of large schemes which are now in progress, large schemes which if accepted by Government will very nearly double the size of the Agricultural College of Lyallpur and lead to a very great increase in the agricultural work of the Province. I had also informed him that he himself was among those who would be invited to be present in order to assist us in the discussion of these schemes. I therefore naturally felt, as I have said, a good deal of surprise and some little touch of indignation that he should have totally ignored the information which I had thus given him.

"The next subject on which I shall touch is the long standing subject of sanitation. I have had the pleasure, Sir, quite recently of presiding at a conference which included a large majority of non-officials on the subject of Local Self-Government; and the gentlemen who were there present pressed upon me, and through me upon Government, the desirability of extending in every possible way the scope of Local Self-Government. That appeared to me

to be most natural; it was what I expected; it was a feeling with which I myself profoundly sympathised. But when I come to discuss with Hon'ble Members, the same or approximately the same Hon'ble Members, such questions as sanitation and education, I find to my surprise that they have thrown down the weapons with which they fought in the cause of Local Self-Government and have taken up a completely new set of weapons altogether and their cry is that Government compel, that Government lead the people, that Government drive the people into the paths of wisdom. One Hon'ble Member distinctly used the expression, I think to-day, that Government or the Sanitary board should insist upon the local bodies adopting suitable measures. That, Sir, is language which one would expect to hear from the supporters of paternal Government; it is not quite the language which one would expect to hear from the champions of Local Self-Government. But I do not jibe at Hon'ble Members because of these contradictions. We all of us are aware that now and then there are contradictions which are capable of lying side by side like the lion and the lamb in our intellects. All that I do urge upon them is that when these contradictions are pointed out to them they should realise that the true course lies between the two extremes. The true course is one in which the Government will be co-operating with the people, in which it may lead but must not drive. There is a further matter in connection with the subject of sanitation on which my Hon'ble friend Chaudhari Lal Chand laid stress. He said it was most important that we should have all over the Punjab a sort of net work of sanitary officials who would be perpetually poking at the people, urging them on to do this or that or the other in the way of sanitation. I think he drew an ideal picture in which there would be at least one Sub-Inspector in each tahsil doing this admirable and doubtless useful work. Now my Hon'ble friend Chaudhari Lal Chand is himself a resident of the rural tracts; he is himself an agriculturist and I think he must know, although he has not thought fit on this occasion to mention the subject, that it occasionally happens that when people of the type of Sub-Inspectors or the like go poking at the rural population and pressing them to do this or the other that there are some slight drawbacks to that process and the results are not always the admirable results which this Council would wish to see produced.

"One small matter on which I would touch is another matter on which my friend Chaudhari Lal Chand has spoken. He said he has observed in the report on the colonies a remark to the effect that the Lieutenant-Governor was extremely pleased to find that the Financial Commissioner had no longer those apprehensions about an acute shortage of land for the military classes which had formerly existed. The position, Sir, in regard to this allotment of land for the military classes is this. In the first place the Government decided to allot 103,000 acres in reward to soldiers. Your Honour, shortly after taking over charge increased this area to 178,000 acres. Two or three years ago surveys which were conducted in some detail by the then Colonisation Officer disclosed the fact that the good land in the colony was of a far smaller area than had hitherto been supposed. In consequence of this it became necessary to cut down a great part of our colonisation programme. Reductions were made under every head: under the amount to be auctioned, under the amount to be allotted to Central Punjab peasants and in almost all the heads for which we had made provision, but Sir, there was one head under which no reduction was made and that was the head of allotments to soldiers. That remained absolutely intact and there has been no diminution of it in consequence of the diminution of the available land.

"And now I come to a topic on which I myself am very frequently on my legs; I refer to the subject of excise. The last time I spoke on this subject of excise I drew very pointed attention to the difference between the receipts

from excise revenue and the consumption of liquor or other excisable articles. I had supposed that that distinction had been brought home to the Hon'ble Members of this Council in a very clear manner. I thought they had understood, if, for instance, 100 gallons had been the consumption hitherto and the revenue from 100 gallons had been Rs. 500 and if at some future time you raise the tax upon each gallon so that the revenue from that 100 gallons is no longer Rs. 500 but Rs. 600 the consumption remains the same. I had supposed that Hon'ble Members had been able to realise the fact that the mere fact that the revenue had risen from Rs. 500 to Rs. 600 was not in itself a proof that there had been any increase in consumption. That was my impression. That is what I hoped I had been able to achieve. But, Sir, to-day one after another no fewer than three Hon'ble Members got up and repeated the same old fallacy. They said we look at the figures and we find that there has been an increase in the revenue, how deplorable it is that there should be this terrible increase in consumption. But, Sir, it so happens that I am to-day in a singularly strong position on this particular subject. I have taken out carefully the figures for the last year before the beginning of the war and the figures of the last year of which we have complete figures and I have compared together the number of retail shops, that is the places where the liquor is to be obtained, the consumption of the excisable article, I say article because I have done the same in the case of opium as with liquor, the revenue in thousands of rupees, and the incidence of the revenue per gallon, or per seer in the case of opium, so as to show precisely what the amount derived from each unit of consumption is. In the first place I will give you the figures of country liquor, which is of course vastly the largest and the most important of the excisable articles consumed in the Punjab. During the period of which I speak the number of retail shops has been diminished, reduced, by 8·8 per cent., that is the reduction in the number of shops. The consumption has been reduced, diminished, by 4·5 per cent. The revenue has been increased by 9 per cent., and the incidence of the revenue per proof gallon has been increased by 14 per cent. And now I turn to the similar figures in respect to opium. Here again I follow the same course, I give you separately the results for number of retail shops, for consumption, for revenue and the incidence of revenue per seer of opium consumed. The number of retail shops has decreased, diminished by 5·6 per cent. The consumption of opium has decreased by 7·4 per cent., the revenue has increased by 42·5 per cent., and the incidence of revenue per seer has increased by 52·5 per cent. Those are the figures and I trust that the effects of quoting them will be to bring home to the Hon'ble Members the fact that it is not only possible that there should be a diminution of consumption coincidently with an increase in revenue, but that, that result has actually been achieved in the Punjab during the term of Your Honour's office. (Applause).

"And now, Sir, since the time has come to say farewell, the time has also come when those who have followed so long in silence may say something of what they have felt for their leader. We are losing a leader in whom were the qualities of leadership; we have felt that he saw and knew our work for what it was, for better or worse; that if there were faults in it they were seen, that if it was good the good was recognised. We have known and felt throughout that there would be no desertion, no betrayal so long as duty was done. We have felt that the guidance was a wise, intuitively wise one, and that it led toward success, and that if we followed we followed to a good issue. We have known that we were sharers in that honour that his success brought to the Punjab to its people and those who served them. His strong and genial personality has breathed strength and courage into all of us and in time of danger and crisis the faint-hearted and the doubter regarding him plucked comfort from his looks. (Applause)."

[*His Honour the President.*]

His Honour the President:—"Though the discussion on the Budget Estimates took place last month, I think the decision to retain the general discussion which usually follows the Budget has been fully justified by to-day's debate. Before dealing with more general matters I will say a few words about our finances.

"In spite of the War we have not been standing still. Compared with the pre-War year 1913-14 our Provincial income has risen from 461 to 564 lakhs in the past year, our expenditure from 468 to 582 while our balance has risen from 178 to 226 lakhs excluding one crore invested with the Government of India.

"In 1913-14 the total revenue raised within the Province was about 9 crores of which the Provincial share was less than 5 crores.

"In the year just begun the total receipts are estimated at 10⅔ crores the Provincial income at nearly 6 crores (591 lakhs), and by pursuing the bold but justifiable policy of drawing to the extent of 11 lakhs on the large balances accumulated during the War for reasons which have been just explained, we expect to spend 602 lakhs, closing the year with a reserve of 216 lakhs.

"To those who criticise our slow rate of progress generally I would say compare the pre-War figures of 1913-14, with the post War figures of 1919-20. To those who complain of our niggardly policy in regard to certain heads, I would reply take a long view, make a broad survey and compare the figures of 1913-14 with those of 1919-20.

"The expenditure on education has gone up from 44 to 60 lakhs—exclusive of the very large outlay on Buildings, on Medical and Sanitary from 14 to 28 lakhs, on Agriculture from 8½ to 27 lakhs, on Forests from 9 to 26 lakhs, on Police from 59 to 72 lakhs, on Irrigation from 78 to 94 lakhs; while Civil Works have declined from 97 to 85 lakhs.

"Thus assuming that our estimates will be worked up to, and I hope after the exhortations to-day they will, our expenditure as compared with 1913-14 will have risen by 134 lakhs or 28 per cent., while our income will have risen in the same proportion.

"Having regard to our large balances the financial position may therefore be regarded as secure and satisfactory though no small part of those balances are due to capitalisation of our assets by sales of waste lands and Government estates. The sale of waste lands has been criticised by one Hon'ble Member, but I think the reply given by the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard will have satisfied him, that we do not sacrifice the interests of the Punjabi soldier.

"Finance has rightly been termed the vehicle of administration, and in congratulating our late Financial Secretary on his careful management of our resources during the last 4 years and on the budget which he has framed for the current year, and his successor Mr. Gibson on his very successful appearance to-day, I would also congratulate the Council and the Province on the financial prosperity which, now that the strain and restrictions of War have passed away, will enable the Province to quicken the pace of administrative progress.

II.—Economic Situation.

"Though the outlook is now brighter the economic difficulties that attended the last year of the War have been many and serious.

Last year's Rabi crop was an unusually good one and, for some months after it was reaped, prices were easier. Unfortunately the general failure of the monsoon, not only in this Province but over most of India, plunged us in fresh difficulties. The kharif harvest—except cotton on irrigated lands—was a

very poor one, and the want of moisture and the outbreak of the terrible influenza epidemic in October and November led to a great reduction of Rabi sowings on unirrigated areas. The Canals, though their supplies were much reduced by the lowness of the rivers, again came to our relief. Over 5½ million acres, half a million more than last year—nearly all foodstuffs—were sown on canal lands, and owing to the timely rains of January to March, a magnificient crop is now assured on that area and the 2 million acres of well irrigation. At the same time a normal barani crop may now be expected in the North-West the Sub-montane and the Centre of the Province.

"The result of these improved prospects is already apparent in the steady fall of prices of foodstuffs. I need hardly assure the Council that the high prices of all the necessities of life, especially during the last six months has been a matter of deep concern to Government and we have done what we could to ease matters. When the failure of the monsoon was established in September last, export of food grains, except for our troops in the East, was at once closed down and up to date only one-fifth of last year's wheat crop—an unusually small proportion—has left the Province of an unusually large crop. Much of that has gone to other parts of India where the scarcity was more acute than here, and though recognising that the resources of the whole Indian Empire must be pooled in such an emergency, my Government has steadily urged and not without success that the interests of the producing Province have the first claim. The high prices were partly due to profiteering and combination among large holders of stock, and to deal with them the policy of requisitioning stocks at reasonable rates was resorted to. Those stocks were acquired not for export to Europe, as some malicious mischief-makers represented, but to meet the needs of our Army and also of certain Municipalities. The policy was not wholly successful. One result was to keep supplies from coming into the market where they were likely to be requisitioned, another was to encourage holders to send their stocks out of such markets by road, thereby evading the control we exercised over railway traffic. The suggestion was frequently made that Government should fix maximum prices. That was seriously considered but experience elsewhere showed the enormous difficulties of enforcing such a measure, and the danger, that, as in the case of the currency, it might lead to even greater concealment or hoarding.

"The only satisfactory method of working the system would be for Government to take over all stocks of substantial size.

"This would have involved an enormous Government agency and serious interference with the public; but if the situation had continued Government was ready to contemplate such a step. Fortunately matters are now righting themselves under the law of supply and demand by the promise of an abundant harvest, and by the action of Government in importing large wheat supplies from Australia—where it holds some millions of tons—in reserve and in declaring that none of this year's stock shall be exported to Europe. If the result of these measures is to cause loss to those who were speculating on the continuance of famine prices, they will not, I am sure, receive much sympathy from Government or the public. But apart from foodgrains, the high prices of cloth and kerosine oil have also caused serious hardship. The fall in the excessive price of cotton has somewhat eased the cloth difficulty and the large supplies of standard cloth from Bombay—which will be distributed through the agency of Government, Local Bodies and Co-operative Societies—will further help matters. The oil shortage is for the time even more serious. It is due to failure or delay in the supplies from Burma which are outside our control, and Government is therefore the more anxious to further the scheme for raising oil in the North Punjab, which if they succeed would not only make us independent of outside supplies but would also give a great stimulus to the industries of the Province.

[*His Honour the President.*]

"Many Hon'ble Members in their questions and speeches have dwelt on the sufferings caused to large sections of the population by these economic difficulties.

"The rural classes and the labouring classes have on the whole benefited by the higher prices of produce and the great increase in wages. Those classes have also gained by the employment in the Army and subsidiary services of nearly 500,000 Punjabis, whose home remittances are estimated at some Rs. 50 lakhs a month. It is true that these remittances will fall off as demobilisation proceeds, but there is ample employment for the demobilised men on their own lands as those of others; indeed they are urgently needed to fill up the terrible gaps caused by the influenza epidemic which reduced our population by $\frac{3}{4}$th of a million. It is the poorer middle classes in the towns and the lowly-paid Government servants that have been the chief sufferers. The cheap grain shops opened by so many Municipalities with grants from Government and the Relief Fund have done something to help the general public. Government has also endeavoured to help its servants by raising the minimum wage, by the grant of more liberal grain compensation to employees on less than Rs. 30 per mensem and of a War allowance to those on Rs. 50 or less. These are however only temporary palliatives, Government fully recognises that the increased cost of living—or to put it in another way—the reduced purchasing power of money, quite apart from the War necessitates a revision of the rates of pay in the services generally where these were fixed many years ago. As stated in reply to question to-day and in the concluding remarks of the Hon'ble the Finance Member such revision is being steadily proceeded with and in the last few years the increase allowed to the Police, establishments of District Offices, Commissioners' Offices, of nearly all the head-quarters offices in Lahore, Civil Surgeons' Clerks, Subordinate Educational Service, Naib Tahsildars, Agricultural Assistants, Jail Warders and others whom I need not mention comes to several lakhs of rupees.

"The case of other establishments whose pay was fixed many years ago is also being considered. Thus in the case of Patwaris to which reference has been made by several Hon'ble Members Government has agreed to an extra expenditure of about 3 lakhs, which will be an addition of about 25 per cent. to present emoluments, and the Kanungo establishment and that of the Sub-Assistant Surgeons are being dealt with on similar lines, and in all such cases substantial improvements are contemplated.

"Considering the restrictions imposed by War conditions up to now, I think it is clear that Government has not dealt illiberally with its subordinate services, and I am confident that the removal of those restrictions and the return to normal conditions will enable an even more liberal policy to be pursued in the future.

III.—Industrial Progress.

"I was glad to see the growing interest shown in the subject of industrial progress by to-day's debate. The War has done much to make us realise the industrial backwardness of the Province and also to stimulate the desire for such industrial progress as will make us less dependent on other countries for manufactured articles. Last year I put before the Council my views on the industrial prospects of this Province. We have now got the proposals of the Industrial Commission, and have already made suggestions for the creation of a separate Director of Industries with the necessary staff and establishment—small at first but to be expanded, in the same way as our Agricultural Department is steadily expanding, as circumstances justify. New industries however cannot start ready-made from the report of the Commission or the brain of the Director. We must begin by creating an industrial spirit based on an economic survey of the opportunities available and stimulated by the support of capital and trained intelligence. In other words experts and enterprises are the motive forces to be supplied.

"The failure of many Banking enterprises in 1913 strangled industrial enterprise in its infancy, but the successful liquidation of the People's Bank and other concerns within the last year should do much to restore public confidence and attract the enormous hoards of money which the Province is putting away at the rate of about £15 million sterling per annum, into industrial fields.

"The great increase in the price of land in recent years and the present inflated values are partly due to the absence of other forms of investment, and there is now a great field open for the enterprise of our capitalists.

"Last year I referred to the fact that little or none of the capital employed in the development of the Punjab oil-fields came from within the Province; and since then I notice that capitalists even from outside the Empire are steadily establishing themselves in the Province, and that the machinery of one of our biggest Cotton Mills just outside Lahore has been purchased by capitalists of another Province for transfer to Bombay. These facts are not creditable to local enterprise. No doubt the absence of coal, iron and other mineral wealth places us at a disadvantage here as compared with certain other Provinces, but that is all the more reason for utilising to the full the resources that we possess.

IV.—Internal Security.

"Last year I was able to congratulate the Council and the Province on the steady fall of crime from 1913 to 1917 amounting to as much as 30 per cent. The improvement was maintained in the first half of 1918. But in the second half owing to unfavourable economic conditions the tide turned and the year as a whole shows a rise of 5 per cent. as compared with 1917 in reported crime. That is due to temporary conditions and does not in my opinion indicate any serious increase in the forces of disorder. On the whole the people, the Police and the Magistracy are working well together and are successful in keeping the criminal elements in check. The only form of violent crime that shows a serious increase is dacoity. There were 60 dacoities in 1918 as against 47 in 1917 but the number was lower than that of any previous year since 1912 and only half the average of the 5 years 1912–16. Only a small proportion of the cases were traced to organised gangs, and the 3 or 4 formidable bands that disturbed the Central Punjab have been wiped out or brought to justice. Some increase of petty thefts and burglaries is inevitable in a season of serious scarcity and will, I hope, disappear with the return to normal conditions. The active attempts to obtain recruits from an ignorant and home-loving population who had not yet learnt the elementary duty of helping to defend their country led to some serious riots and lawless outbreaks in the Multan Division and in Shahpur. The offenders were speedily brought to justice and when the need of men for the Army grew less they were leniently dealt with except in the Shahpur cases which were marked by open defiance of authority culminating in murder.

"Those dark episodes however only serve to show up the splendid martial record of the Province as a whole in brighter relief.

"As a result of the prompt measures taken in previous years to quell revolutionary and anarchic movements, the Province has continued to be free from political crime, and Government was in consequence able to pursue its policy of relaxing the restrictions imposed in the public interest.

"A year ago there were 84 persons restricted under the Defence of India Act. Seven were so restricted during the year making a total of 91 but 64 were released and there are now only 24 under restriction and 13 of these are only under the obligation to report their movements. There were also on 1st April 5 persons and 2 newspapers excluded from the Province, and 1 newspaper in the Province under an order of precensorship.

"The cases of 61 persons restricted under the Defence of India Act were examined by two Judges of the Chief Court during the year and their conclusion was that in all cases the orders were fully justified. They recommended relaxation of restriction owing to improved conditions in 14 cases, but Government had already anticipated their suggestions and even went far beyond them after hostilities ceased. The result of the enquiry by two high Judicial Officers is a striking vindication of the action taken by Government and an eloquent commentary on the unreasoning and ignorant agitation against the Rowlatt Act as giving unlimited scope for arbitrary executive action.

"A year ago there were 29 persons interned under the Ingress Ordinance; 14 more were interned during the year but 36 were released, and there are now only 7 interned. These few left are dangerous revolutionaries who have yet not satisfied us that they have changed their views and can safely be released. A year ago there were 628 restricted to their villages under the Ordinance—160 more were so restricted during the year, but no less than 524 have been released and there are now only 124 restricted exclusive of 37 released on probation. I would remind the Council that from the beginning of the War we have had nearly 10,000 returned emigrants to deal with, the majority of whom on their return were found to have been infected by the enemy's propaganda with revolutionary ideas. Altogether about 400 were at one time or another interned in Jail. The number is now only 7. These were the most desparate characters. Some 3,000 who were less dangerous were restricted to their villages, and in regard to the rest no special measures, beyond the salutary influences of their own people, were deemed necessary. It is clear therefore that as the internal situation improved, Government did not delay to relax restrictions and even to take risks. At the same time I must make it clear that if conditions should recur threatening the public peace Government will not delay to use all the means at its disposal to repress disorder. We have lately had public meetings at Lahore and Amritsar,—I am not speaking of yesterday's meetings of which I have not yet had the details—where some of the speakers used wild and inflammatory language distorting the acts and misrepresenting the policy of Government. We have had similar violent language in some organs of the Indian Press. In fact a section of agitators who kept very much in the back-ground during the War when loyal citizens were helping to fight the common enemy, are now coming forward to show their valour by attacking Government and its agents and endeavouring to intimidate and coerce quiet law-abiding people by their propaganda of so-called passive resistance. I have already said publicly that the Punjab repudiated what is or was known as 'passive loyalty.' It will repudiate even more emphatically that veiled disloyalty which while hiding itself under the cloak of passive resistance leads on its dupes (as we have seen at Delhi) into open defiance of authority and the penalties which such defiance entails.

"The Government of this Province is, and will remain, determined that public order which was maintained so successfully during time of War shall not be disturbed in time of peace. Action has therefore already been taken in the last few days under the Defence of India Act against certain individuals at Lahore and Amritsar who whatever their motives were endeavouring to arouse public feeling against the Government. The British Government which has crushed foreign foes and quelled internal rebellion could afford to despise these agitators, but it has the duty of protecting the young and ignorant whom they may incite to mischief and crime while themselves standing aside. I therefore take this opportunity of warning all who are connected with political movements in the Province, that they will be held responsible for the proper conduct of meetings which they

organise for the language used at and the consequences that follow such meetings. Subject to these provisos Government has no desire to restrict the right of public meeting, but it is a matter of common knowledge that those who organize such meetings, even with quite legitimate objects, often lack the moral courage or the authority to restrain some of the more violent speakers. It is also, I fear, only too true that owing to the wild and reckless language which a handful of noisy agitators habitually indulge in, sober and reasonable men with a regard for their '*izzat*' shrink from attending them. Restraining influences are therefore either absent or are not exercised. Hence the necessity for these words of warning which is addressed to the Press as well as to the platform. It may not be out of place to repeat Æsop's story of the enemy trumpeter who begged the soldier of the victorious army to spare him on the ground that he was a non-combatant. The soldier refused on the ground that without the trumpeter's summons the enemy's soldiers would not have advanced. The moral is clear.

"I would ask in all seriousness is this the calm and reasonable atmosphere which is needed to prepare the way for Constitutional Reforms? It certainly is not—and those who are creating that unhealthy atmosphere are the most dangerous enemies of the cause of reform which they propose to champion. Fortunately their influence does not correspond to the noise they make. They do not speak with the voice of the Punjab.

"It may remove some misconceptions if I say a few words about the Rowlatt Act which is the outcome of the Rowlatt Committee's Report. The Committee consisted of five members of whom two were distinguished Indian lawyers, one a Judge from England and one the Chief Justice of Bombay. It was therefore a body peculiarly strong in Judicial and legal talent and experience. The Report established clearly the prevalence of widespread anarchical and revolutionary conspiracy in parts of India. The sole object of the Act is to enable Government to deal promptly and effectively with such conspiracies, should they occur, in the same way as—but with much more restriction—the Defence of India Act, which will soon lapse, enabled this Government to deal with the Ghadr Conspiracy in parts of the Punjab. The Act is not of general application. It can only come into force on the special order of the Governor-General in Council. It can only be applied to parts of the country where anarchical and revolutionary movements exist, and it is only concerned with certain 'scheduled offences' such as murder, dacoity and sedition. It confers on the police no powers of arbitrary arrest, search or interference. Action can only be taken on the written order of the Local Government when there are reasonable grounds for believing that the person arrested has been concerned in, or the place searched is being used for the commission of such offences. The people of Lahore and Amritsar should and do know what bloodshed and disorder were avoided by the prompt arrest of the Ghadr conspirators in February 1915, and the search for and seizure of their bomb factories in Lahore and Amritsar. The recent puerile demonstrations against the Rowlatt Act in both these cities would therefore be ludicrous, if they did not indicate how easily ignorant and credulous people—not one in a thousand of whom knows anything of the measure—can be misled. Those who wantonly mislead them incur a serious responsibility. I would remind them of President Lincoln's famous saying—

"'You can, if you are very clever and very unscrupulous, mislead all people for some time, and some people for all time, but you cannot mislead all the people for all time.'

Those who appeal to passion and ignorance rather than to reason have a day of reckoning in store for them.'

[*His Honour the President.*]

V.—Constitutional Reforms.

"That brings me to the question of Constitutional Reforms. Within the last year the public of the Province and this Council have been given the opportunity of expressing their opinions on the Reform Scheme generally and on the specific matters investigated by the Southborough Committees.

"It has been suggested in some quarters that the Punjab Government is opposed to the Reform Scheme. I need hardly say that statement is absolutely unfounded. I should have no hesitation in putting this Council in possession of my views, but higher authority has decided that such a course is not advisable, I will say that the Punjab Government like every other Local Government has gladly accepted and endeavoured to carry out loyally the policy of higher authority as embodied in the declaration of 20th August 1917. But it is the duty of this Government to advise how that policy should be given effect to, having regard to the local conditions and the interests of the various classes concerned. The object of the scheme is to associate the people as a whole more closely with both the policy and the working machinery of Government. That is an object which I have endeavoured steadily to keep in mind during the last 6 years. But there are great masses of the people who are not yet in a position to grasp the wider aspects of self-governing institutions, and till their political education is more advanced—and we are endeavouring to hasten it by spreading education, extending local self-Government and other means—Government cannot in fairness to them renounce its rôle as trustee of their interests till it can transfer the responsibility to those who are their genuine and deliberately chosen representatives.

"It is therefore the duty of Government, before transferring part of the functions which it has hitherto exercised for the good Government of all, to make sure that the powers so transferred pass into the right hands and do not become the monopoly of any one class or section. Above all it is necessary in such transfer to safeguard the interests of minorities and of the politically backward classes till they are capable of voicing and protecting their own interests.

"In pursuance of those obligations this Government has strongly supported the proposal in the Reform Scheme for separate representation of the Sikhs who hitherto, inspite of their historic position, martial record and great stake in the Province have rarely succeeded in getting an elected representative in this Council. Government has also put forward suggestions to adjust the balance between rural and urban interests which do not always coincide, and in this matter has been glad to find itself in substantial agreement with the great majority of non-official members of this Council. All I personally have tried to do is to put before those with whom the decision rests such knowledge of the conditions of the Province and of the various classes and interests affected as I possess; and I may say that no officer who has spent a generation in close touch with the people of all classes would be worth his salt if he had not succeeded to some extent in entering into their minds and interpreting their feelings and aspirations

VI.—Internal Administration.

"There are many other matters connected with the Reform Scheme and the report of the Public Service Commission to which I need refer but briefly.

"A representative Committee has recently sat under Mr. Maylard's expert and sympathetic guidance to consider the further extension of local self-Government on the lines of the Government of India Resolution of last year. That Resolution postulates that the representation of minorities can be

better secured by nomination than by communal representation. I doubt if that view will be found applicable to or acceptable in this Province, for where sectarian feeling runs high, as it often does especially at election time, we have found that the best remedy at least in the eyes of those concerned is to give separate representation to each community. We may deplore the necessity of that, but it would be folly to shut our eyes to facts, and it seems to me that to refuse separate representation where all parties or nearly all desire it would be contrary to the basic principle of local self-Government. In District Board elections though the rural electors are supposed to be less intelligent than the urban the question fortunately does not arise, and if other bodies such as voters in Municipal and University elections were to rise superior to class and sectarian influences, the task of Government would be considerably lightened and the progress of self-Government much accelerated.

"We look to education, and I hope not in vain, as the best solvent of those class and sectarian animosities. The educational policy has been much discussed in this debate, and on the whole has been very favourably received. We can congratulate ourselves on the passing of the Compulsory Education Act, the first Government measure of its kind. But its success will depend as Hon'ble Members have said mainly on the action to be taken by Local Bodies to give effect to it. In this connection I may say that the suggestion for the appointment of an Education Board is one which is worthy of consideration. Two years ago I told the Council that we were endeavouring to reconcile education with agriculture. Last year I said I would have hesitated to sanction the introduction of the Compulsory Education Bill were I not assured that measures would be taken to make the system of primary education suitable to the needs and wishes of the people.

"I think we may claim to have, and I think Hon'ble Members admit that we have, made substantial progress in both directions. Under the capable guidance of Mr. Bichey who has for the last two years been working in close and constant co-operation with all interested in education, we have, I hope, now laid a sound foundation for Vernacular, Industrial and Agricultural education. We have a fixed policy—a definite objective which will, I hope, remove the reproach that our educational system was too theoretical, too much divorced from realities. Our secondary education is now to be directly associated with practical agriculture for those who desire it, and I hope we shall secure increasing association with crafts and industries as well. The Punjab University has appropriately given a lead by affiliating the Agricultural College, Lyallpur, and establishing a Faculty of Agriculture, and is now contemplating large developments in the directions of Industrial Chemistry. More ambitious schemes which have been referred to to-day for a Commercial College and Technological Institute have been mentioned. These are perhaps for the future; for the present we are contenting ourselves with a practical and promising scheme for a School of Carpentry at Jullundur, which will be followed I hope by a school for Metal Work at some other centre.

"In the matter of legislation apart from the Education Act the council during the year has passed the Food Adulteration Bill and some small amending measures. The measures still in embryo are those dealing with Punjab Customary Law, the Small Towns Bill and the Borstal Institutions Bill. The last named will round off our policy in regard to the criminal tribes which has been so successfully pursued during the last 2 years. Over 6,000 members of those tribes are now lodged in Settlements controlled by Government or by various communal organizations financed by Government, and are earning a decent livelihood by honest labour. The work of reformation is

steadily progressing especially among the young. Over one thousand enlisted in the Army during the War and thus earned exemption from restriction and wiped out their bad name.

"Nothing gives one more faith in humanity than a visit to those Settlements of which there are 15 or 16 now established—Reformatory, Industrial and Agricultural—and I would suggest to Hon'ble Members to take the opportunity of seeing those that are within easy reach.

"I must add a word about the services. The strain on all of them owing to the depletion of the superior cadres and the extra duties imposed on all grades by the War has been exceptionally severe. It has been sustained with a loyalty and a devotion to the public interest which I cannot adequately acknowledge. The services too have felt in all grades the hardships resulting from the War and the increased cost of living. Now that the War is over they are entitled to expect that the proposals to improve their prospects which have been held in suspense owing to the War should be given effect to. I have already referred to what is being or has been done for the Subordinate Services. As regards the superior service the Police and the I.M.S. have recently received much needed relief. The case of the P. W. D. Imperial and Provincial is now under the consideration of the Government of India, and we hope that the strong claims of the Educational Services, Imperial and Provincial will receive early attention, for among other reasons till their case is settled we cannot complete our scheme for the improvement of the Subordinate Educational Service.

"The Indian and Provincial Civil Services as well as many other Departments have also to be dealt with. I gladly take this opportunity of testifying to the splendid work of the Provincial Civil Service during my term of office, both in connection with the War and in other directions. Many of its members have won honours and special rewards, but the Service as a whole deserves and will, I trust, receive a substantial improvement in respect of pay and conditions of service which were fixed 30 years ago.

VII.—The War.

"I have spoken so often about the War and the Punjab's share in it during the last year, that I need say but little to-day.

"In 1917 I was able to tell you that in the first 2½ years of the War we had raised 124,000 combatants. In the next year we raised over 127,000 and a year ago our total was therefore over a quarter of a million. We were then as Hon'ble Members have reminded us in the most critical stage of the War, and in response to His Majesty's August Message and the Premier's appeal I asked the Province a year ago to raise another 200,000 men including 180,000 fighting men within a year. Many people thought that was an extravagant demand. Those people did not know the spirit of the Punjab. April and May 1918 were the harvest months, and we advisedly did not push recruiting. But 21,000 men were enrolled in those two months.

"From June to September the recruiting campaign was carried on everywhere with great enthusiasm, and in those 4 months 78,000 men or over 19,500 per month joined the Colours. In October owing to the influenza epidemic the number dropped to 14,426, and in November when we were about to make a fresh effort our enemies collapsed and hostilities came to an end—the number fell to 6,313. But in six months from June to November we had raised 99,000 men or half of the total promised and in the 8 months—April to November—our total was 121,000 men including 1,00,000 combatants. If the need had continued we should have completed our quota of 200,000. As it is we can claim to have raised

about 360,000 combatants during the 4 years of War, or more than half the total raised in the Indian Empire, excluding of course the splendid contribution from our gallant neighbours and allies in Nepal.

The distribution of the 355,000 combatants by main religions and tribes is roughly, as follows :—

Muhammadans	1,70,000, *viz.*—	
Pathans		5,000
Muhammadans from N. and C. Punjab ...		1,36,000
Muhammadans from South Punjab ...		25,000
Kashmiris...		1,500
Other Muhammadans		2,500
Sikhs		90,000
Hindus	90,000, *viz.*—	
Jats		30,000
Dogras		24,000
Other Rajputs		10,000
Ahirs		10,000
Gujars		6,000
Gaur Brahmans		5,000
All other Hindus		5,000
Punjabi Christians		4,000

"The Muhammadans forming $\frac{1}{6}$th of the population gave 48 per 100 of the recruits, Hindus with $\frac{5}{6}$th of the population furnished $\frac{1}{4}$th, while the Sikhs though only $\frac{1}{9}$th of the population also furnished one-fourth. As I said last year the fighting men were drawn almost exclusively and the non-combatants mainly from the rural population. The towns folk made but a slight response to the call for men, both for the Army and for the Defence Force though they helped generously in the War Loans. But most of the rural Hindus did splendidly in recruiting and their proportionate recruitment though much below that of the Sikhs is nearly equal to that of the Punjabi Muhammadans.

"Of 37,000 death casualties on service up to 11th November 1918, about 14,000 belong to the Punjab Districts and States, and even though hostilities have ceased in Europe our Punjab troops are still fighting bravely for their country and their flag on the borders of Persia and Central Asia whereas the latest accounts show the exploits have struck terror into the Bolshevists who had hoped to spread ruin and anarchy in India.

"The Punjab is now welcoming back its brave defenders, and it is with deep regret I have heard of what has just taken place at Multan.

"A gallant Punjab regiment has just returned there from service abroad, and it was arranged that on the morning of the 5th the regiment was to receive an address of welcome from the Municipal Committee at one of the City Gates, march through the city and be entertained in the public gardens.

[*His Honour the President.*]

"The organisers of the so-called passive resistance however thought that any such welcome or honour to the troops on the 5th would interfere with their demonstration on the 6th. They arranged that if the regiment marched through the city on the 5th the shops were to be closed and so far from a welcome being given to those brave and loyal men, a number of mourning symbols gangs were to be paraded before them. Naturally the regiment was not prepared to accept such an insult and the arrangement was cancelled. The incident is not creditable to the people of Multan. On reflection I am sure that those who arranged it will be thoroughly ashamed of it. Anyhow I am sure their example will not find imitators elsewhere. It also indicates what I have already said, *viz.*, that the passive resistance movement is being used to cover disloyalty and disaffection.

"I have no time to-day to dwell on the great deeds of the Punjab—the Punjab soldiers. As complete a chronicle as is possible is being prepared for the Province and for each District. All I need say here is that India and the British Empire owe much to the fighting races of the Punjab whose fame for loyalty and valour has never stood higher than to day.

"The Government has not been slow or niggardly in recognising those services. The Army Department is now taking measures to distribute the 178,000 acres of canal land which we have put at their disposal to reward distinguished service in the field. In recognition of the splendid efforts made by the rural classes Government has remitted 15 lakhs of the land-revenue to selected villages, awarded to individuals Rs. 20,000 in Jagir in the last two years, and Rs. 25,000 in life Mafis, allotted over 60,000 acres of Canal land to the landed gentry who as a body have rendered such signal services during the War, and about 12,000 acres to non-officials and 2,000 acres to selected officials for eminent War services.

"The great part played by the Pindi and Jhelum Districts in the War has been recognised by the extension of their terms of Settlement from 20 to 30 years, and of the Talagang Tahsil from 20 to 25 years—and in other districts or portions of districts the War services have been one of the main arguments for fixing a 30 years' term.

"Where the services have been memorable the recognition has, I think been prompt and generous. The four years of War are a splendid illustration of what can be achieved by the Government and the people working in close co-operation for a common object; they also add another glorious chapter to the annals of the Punjab.

"Gentlemen! I have often been criticised for dwelling on the achievements of the Punjab in season and out of season. But my pride in the Province is based on no narrow parochial spirit. I have spent 15 years away from it during which I have seen many other parts of India.

"I might say—

'Much have I seen and known—cities of men,

And manners, climates, councils, governments.'

"But nowhere did I find the same qualities as the Punjab can show from the Prince's palace down to the peasant's hut. (Applause). I found I could meet the Punjabi, whatever his class or condition, as man to man without suspicion or mistrust. I found him in the mass—and I refer primarily to the rural masses loyal but not subservient, brave but not boastful, enterprising but not visionary, progressive but not pursuing false ideals or mistaking the shadow for the substance. These are the qualities which have made the Punjab among the Provinces of India

'not least but honoured of them all,' and these are the qualities which combined with the moral courage that will be so essential in the time before you, will keep the Punjab in the vanguard of progress and prosperity.

"I regard it as a great privilege to have lived and worked with such a people and to be closing my service amongst them. And now, Gentlemen! I must thank you for the kind words you have used with regard to myself and my wife, and for your kindly but over-generous reference to my work in this Council and in the Province during the last six years. They have not been easy years for any of us, but my task has been made lighter by the wise counsel and hearty support I have received on all critical occasions from Hon'ble Members not only in this Chamber but outside. Naturally we have not always seen eye to eye. The object of this Council is not to secure unanimity, but to provide opportunities for the free and frank expression of all shades of opinion. All of us has much to learn each of us I hope has something to teach. None of us claims to be infallible, not even the youngest of us, and none of us is the worse for criticism as long as it is honest and fair. Every one in a responsible position who says what he believes to be true and does what he thinks to be right must be prepared to face that. But while I have never tried to influence the honest convictions of any Member of this Council, I hope and believe that you in your turn will give me credit for one thing that in whatever I have said and done I have been moved by the single desire to serve what I considered to be the true interests of the Punjab and its people. That will continue to be my object even after I leave the Province. (Applause)!"

ADJOURNED.

The Council adjourned *sine die*.

LAHORE:
The 7th April 1919.

T. P. ELLIS,
Secretary, Legislative Council, Punjab.

APPENDIX A.

ANSWER TO QUESTION No. 10.

Rules regarding the private wards.

1. The private wards of the Albert Victor Hospital are open to Europeans and Natives on payment of the following charges :—

	Rs.
For Government officials or employés of the North-Western Railway on salaries of less than Rs. 250 per mensem	3 per diem.
For all others	5 per diem.

2. The daily charge covers the cost of diet according to the Hospital scale; and when alcoholic stimulants are prescribed, patients must provide these at their own expense. This also applies to articles of food not included in the Hospital dietary as well as to medical comforts such as jellies, meat essences, biscuits, etc., and firewood. Stimulants must be made over to the charge of the House Surgeon who will see that they are administered at the prescribed hours and in the prescribed quantities.

Patients are not allowed to treat visitors to any form of spirituous liquors.

3. Patients occupying private wards must within 24 hours of admission pay 10 days' fees in advance. No exception can be made to this rule, and patients who fail to comply with it will be transferred to the general wards. Fees are payable to the House Surgeon who will furnish a receipt for the amount paid.

4. Patients requiring punkha coolies must within 24 hours of admission pay 10 days' punkha coolie's wages in advance; otherwise the coolies cannot be supplied.

5. Patients on regular diets are supplied with three meals daily which will be served at hours fixed by the Principal; and no patient is allowed to have food of any kind except that ordered on the bed-head tickets. Patient's friends are earnestly requested to observe this rule strictly; as fatal results have followed its neglect.

APPENDIX B.

(See Answer to Question No. 15.)

Mayo Hospital, Lahore.

DIET SCALE FOR INDIAN PATIENTS.

Ordinary Diets.

1		2		3	
	Chattaks.		*Chattaks.*		*Chattaks.*
Atta	8	Rice	6	Atta	8
Dal	2	Dal	2	Curds	4
Vegetables	4	Vegetables	4	Salt	1
Oil	1	Oil	1	Fuel	8
Salt	1	Salt	1		
Condiments	1	Condiments	1		
Fuel	8	Fuel	8		

Milk Diets.

1		2		3	
	Chattaks.		*Chattaks.*		*Chattaks.*
Atta	8	Rice	6	Milk	24
Milk	16	Milk	16	Sugar	3
Sugar	1	Sugar	1	Fuel	6
Fuel	8	Fuel	8		

Meat Diets.

No. 1.		No. 2.	
	Chattaks.		*Chattaks.*
Atta	8	Rice	6
Meat	6	Meat	4
Ghi	1	Ghi	1
Salt and condiments of each	1	Salt and condiments of each	1
Vegetables	4	Vegetables	4
Fuel	12	Fuel	8

Soup Diets.

No. 1.		No. 2.	
	Chattaks.		*Chattaks.*
Meat	12	Meat	12
Salt and condiments of each	1	Rice	4
Fuel	16	Salt and condiments of each	1
		Fuel	16

Miscellaneous Diets.

Arrowroot.		Sago.		Curd and Kishrt.		Gluten.	
	Chattaks.		*Chattaks.*		*Chattaks.*		*Chattaks.*
Arrowroot	2	Sago	2	Rice	6	Meat	8
Milk	16	Milk	16	Dal	1½	Gluten	8
Sugar	1	Sugar	1	Curd	4	Green vegetables	4
Fuel	6	Fuel	6	Ghi	1	Ghi	2
				Salt	1	Salt, oil and condiments of each	1
				Fuel	6	Fuel	12

Extras.

	Chattaks.		*Chattaks.*		*Chattaks.*
Atta	4	Dal	1		
Milk	2	Sugar	1		
Ghi	½	Curd	2	Eggs (boiled)	2

APPENDIX C.

(See answer to question No. 28.)

Grain Compensation Allowance Committee.

Proceedings of a meeting held at Ellerslie, on 11th June 1918.

Present :

The Hon'ble Mr. C. J. Hallifax, C.B.E., *Chairman.*
The Hon'ble Mr. O. F. Lumsden, Financial Secretary.
The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Lala Ram Saran Das, C.I.E.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad Mehdi Shah.
Lieutenant-Colonel H. T. Dennys, C.I.E., Inspector-General of Police.

The Committee read a note presented to it by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das. This discusses the determination of the grain to be adopted as a basis for calculating grain compensation allowance purely from the point of view of the class of grain produced in each district of the Province. In view however of the movements of trade and the considerable part that production for export plays in grain production the Committee was of opinion that figures of grain production by themselves are not a reliable guide for the determination of the food-grains appropriate for use as a basis for the calculation of grain compensation allowance. At the same time the Committee thanked the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das for putting before it information of considerable value in the discussion of the question which has been referred to the Committee.

The grant of grain compensation allowance must be dealt with strictly according to the terms of article 72, Civil Account Code, and the Committee observed that note 1 to that article is particularly important in the determination of the extent to which grain compensation allowance is permissible. The criterion is the cheapest food of any kind commonly used by the people, which the Committee understood to mean the majority of the agricultural community. Special consideration cannot be paid to any difference that, say, exist between the food-grains commonly used in towns and in rural areas and no regard can be had to the preference of Government servants or particular classes for particular kinds of food-grains. The cheapest grain of any kind commonly used by the agricultural community varies in all districts at different times of the year. Therefore if a single food-grain is used as the basis of calculation it is necessary to ascertain for each district, what is the cheapest grain commonly used by the agricultural community at different times. The reports, however, which have been made to Government on this matter have not differentiated with sufficient exactitude between such grain and the food-grain which is in demand and is preferred in urban areas. The system under which grain compensation allowance is now calculated is of the nature of a compromise, and in that it is based on an average of prices in the determination of which the prices of the dearer grains, wheat, gram and barley are factors throughout the year, the majority of the Committee was of opinion that the existing system while providing a fair working arrangement acted probably to the benefit of the establishments entitled to grain compensation allowance. The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das dissented and the Committee was of opinion that a test of its opinion might with advantange be made by a detailed examination of the case of one district. It selected the district of Lahore for test.

If the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das will furnish the Committee with a statement showing of the Lahore district what he considers to be the cheapest food-grain of any kind commonly used at different times in the year by the agricultural community, the Committee will take steps to have the statement checked by the local officers. It will then express its opinion as to the grain which should be used as the basis of calculation at different times of the year and will give the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das an opportunity of working out figures to show in detail for, say, the year 1918 the difference which would have resulted if grain compensation allowance had been given on the basis of the grain so fixed as compared with the grain compensation allowance given according to the system at present in force.

C. J. HALLIFAX,

The 11th June 1918. *Chairman.*

APPENDIX C.

Dated Lahore, 5th November 1918.

From—The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur RAM SARAN DAS, C.I.E., Member, Legislative Council, Lahore,

To—The Hon'ble Mr. C.J. HALLIFAX, C.B.E., Lahore.

WITH reference to the question of Grain Compensation rules I beg to submit as below :—

In Lahore District I made local enquiries and found that in each of the Tahsils of Kasur, Chunian and Lahore the mass of the people prefer wheat as their staple food. Among all the food grains wheat is grown to the greatest extent. In Lahore Tahsil, for instance, I am informed that out of area of 160,000 acres under the chief food crops of wheat, gram, maize and rice, the area under wheat is 97,000 acres.

The position of the Government that most of the wheat crop in the country is produced for the purpose of export cannot be verified. In the Inland Trade reports figures are not given by districts, and therefore it cannot be said how much of the wheat crop in every district is exported. Unless these figures are available it cannot be definitely said what portion of the crop remains in every district. Evidently only the surplus amount is exported, and in some cases I imagine where zamindars are heavily under debt and feel difficulties in paying their debts or land revenue all wheat crops of the holding are sold to satisfy their obligations. In such cases it is possible for zamindars to use coarser grains. But it cannot be denied that the general habits of the people are to use wheat as their staple food. This was testified by all the Deputy Commissioners in the Jullundur, Lahore, Rawalpindi and Multan Divisions where enquiries were made in the matter in the year 1915. In the presence of this overwhelming evidence furnished by officers on the spot it is difficult to understand why Government should have gone out of its way to introduce a highly artificial system for the calculation of Grain Compensation Allowance. The note that I submitted to the Committee appointed to enquire into this matter shows that excepting some districts in the Ambala Division wheat is cultivated to the great extent in all the districts. Unless the Government proves that a major portion of the wheat crop in every district is exported it is not correct to hold that the people who put the largest portion of their land under wheat cultivation do not do so for their own consumption but for the purpose of paying land revenue and discharging their debt obligations. Really it is very difficult to swallow this theory.

Under these circumstances I must therefore hold that wheat is the staple of all Punjab districts in the four northern divisions and consequently the rules for the grant of Grain Compensation Allowance require modification.

APPENDIX D.

BUDGET OF THE PUNJAB FOR THE YEAR 1919-20.

MEMORANDUM.

As the budget for 1919-20 makes no change in the figures of the Revised Financial Statement, presented to the Council on the 18th March 1919, and as no resolution recommending any such change was passed, a meeting of the Council will not be held for the presentation of the budget, and the general discussion of the budget in Council will take place at the meeting to be held on the 7th April 1919 (*vide* rule 29 of the rules for the discussion of the Annual Financial Statement in the Legislative Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab).

LAHORE: } O. F. LUMSDEN,
The 31st March 1919. } *Financial Secretary to Government, Punjab.*

Budget of the Punjab

(Figures in thousands

Heads of Account.		Budget, 1919-20.
Opening balance		2,26,85,000
Provincial Revenue and Receipts.		
I—Land Revenue		1,51,68,000
IV—Stamps		30,25,000
V—Excise		55,23,000
VI—Provincial Rates		32,000
VIII—Income Tax		20,62,000
IX—Forest		30,56,000
X—Registration		2,75,000
XII—Interest		2,88,000
XVI-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law		6,60,000
XVI-B—Law and Justice—Jails		6,22,000
XVII—Police		2,11,000
XIX—Education		5,45,000
XX-A—Medical		75,000
XX-B—Sanitation		1,00,000
XXI-A—Agriculture		7,93,000
XXI-B—Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments		32,000
XXII—Receipts in aid of Superannuation		85,000
XXIII—Stationery and Printing		92,000
XXV—Miscellaneous		7,43,000
XXIX—Irrigation—Major Works	Direct Receipts—Civil	4,000
	Public Works	1,48,00,000
	Indirect Receipts—Portion of Land Revenue due to Irrigation	63,09,000
XXX—Irrigation—Minor Works and Navigation	Civil	3,000
	Public Works	1,30,000
XXXI—Civil Works	Civil	1,40,000
	Public Works	2,10,000
Transfers between Imperial and Provincial (*vide* Appendix A)		31,85,000
Total Provincial Revenue and Receipts		5,01,50,000
Grand Total		8,18,35,000

for the year 1919-20

of rupees).

Heads of Account.	Budget, 1919-20.
Provincial Expenditure.	
1—Refunds and Drawbacks	1,29,000
2—Assignments and Compensations	95,000
3—Land Revenue	54,75,000
6—Stamps	99,000
7—Excise	1,48,000
10—Income Tax	54,000
11—Forest	26,15,000
12—Registration	1,37,000
13—Interest on Ordinary Debt	2,26,000
18—General Administration	12,68,000
19-A—Law and Justice—Courts of Law	15,18,000
19-B—Law and Justice—Jails	10,45,000
20—Police	72,83,000
22—Education	60,44,000
24-A—Medical	17,84,000
24-B—Sanitation	10,04,000
26-A—Agriculture	26,67,000
26-B—Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments	2,07,000
29—Superannuation Allowances and Pensions	27,11,000
30—Stationery and Printing	8,96,000
32—Miscellaneous	84,72,000
33—Famine Relief	1,60,000
42—Irrigation—Major Works { Working Expenses—Civil / Public Works / Interest on debt	52,64,000 / 38,09,000
43—Minor Works and Navigation { Civil / Public Works	29,000 / 5,95,41
45—Civil Works { Civil / Public Works	13,60,000 / 71,30,000
Total Expenditure	6,02,23,000
Closing balance	9,16,07,000
Grand Total	6,15,39,000

Appendix A.

Transfers between Imperial and Provincial Revenues.

(Figures in thousands of rupees).

	Budget, 1919-20.
TRANSFERS FROM IMPERIAL TO PROVINCIAL—	
Recurring—	
(1) Fixed adjusting entry	4,86,000
(2) In connection with the surrender by the Local Government of Rs. 1-crore out of the Provincial balances.	3,50,000
(3) On account of the Imperial share of the sale-proceeds of sites for shops and residences in towns in the Punjab.	1,31,000
(4) For education	10,36,000
(5) For maintenance and equipment of science laboratories of the Islamia College, Lahore.	30,000
(6) For University	35,600
(7) For a grant to the Lawrence Military Asylum, Sanawar	60,000
(8) For the Lawrence Memorial School, Murree	12,000
(9) For the improvement of pay and training of teachers	1,75,000
(10) For Government Training Class at Sanawar	25,000
(11) For sanitation	4,00,000
(12) For the improvement of the sanitary services	22,000
(13) In connection with remission of appropriations from cesses	2,08,000
(14) To compensate Provincial revenues for the loss of income from the recovery in stamp of fees for the inspection of records.	10,000
(15) For remission of certain recoveries from local bodies	3,04,000
(16) For relieving municipalities of police charges	5,22,000
(17) To meet the expenditure for the grants of Rs. 100 per annum each to the holders of titles of Mahamahopadhyaya and Shams-ul-Ulma.	1,000
(18) Provincialisation of the salaries of officers of the Civil Veterinary Department, and of the charges of the Camel Specialist.	1,00,000
(19) In connection with the creation of the new Province of Delhi	13,000
(20) In connection with the scheme for the import of charas and bhang in bond from the Punjab into Delhi.	18,000
(21) On account of payments to be made to Chiefs of Keonthal and Koti	29,000
(22) To compensate Provincial revenues for the loss of income on account of the imposition of an excess profits duty and the exemption of incomes below Rs. 2,000 per annum from income-tax.	4,30,000
Non-recurring—	
(23) Towards the cost of Director of Civil Supplies, Punjab	24,000
Total Transfers from Imperial to Provincial	43,86,000
TRANSFERS FROM PROVINCIAL TO IMPERIAL—	
Recurring—	
(24) On account of change in classification of the charges of P. W. Section of the Account Office.	28,000
(25) On account of the Provincial share of the enhanced receipts from excise	55,000
(26) On account of the Provincial share of the enhanced receipts from income-tax	10,74,000
(27) On account of cost of treasure guards (police or Barkandaz) employed in the Public Works Department.	51,000
Total Transfers from Provincial to Imperial	12,08,000
NET TRANSFERS FROM IMPERIAL TO PROVINCIAL	31,35,000

2 LR.—200—12-5-18—SGPP Lahore.

PUNJAB GOVERNMENT.

LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

Abstract of Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1915.

THE Council met at the Government House, Lahore, at 10-30 A.M., on Monday, the 10th November 1919.

PRESENT:

His Honour Sir EDWARD DOUGLAS MACLAGAN, K.C.I.E., I.C.S., Lieutenant-Governor, *Presiding*.

The Hon'ble Mr. JOHN PERRONET THOMPSON, C.S.I., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar GOPAL SINGH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja YUSAF SHAH, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Mr. HERBERT JOHN MAYNARD, C.S.I., I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. BASIL THEODORE GIBSON, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri LAL CHAND, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir BAHRAM KHAN, Mazari, K.C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Sayad MEHDI SHAH, O.B.E.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit JAWAHAR LAL, Bhargava.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur RAM SARAN DAS, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble Mr. FRANK WAVERLING WOODS.

The Hon'ble Mr. FREDERICK CRIGHTON WALLER.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ruizada BHAGAT RAM.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi SOHAN LAL.

The Hon'ble Sayad MAKHDUM RAJAN SHAH.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian FAZL-I-HUSSAIN.

[*His Honour the President*:]

The Hon'ble Mr. CREWE ARMOND HAMILTON TOWNSEND, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan DAULAT RAI.

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza MUHAMMAD IKRAM ULLAH KHAN.

The Hon'ble Mr. EUSTACE ALEXANDER ACWORTH JOSEPH, I.C.S.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur MALIK MUHAMMAD AMIN KHAN.

The Hon'ble Colonel ROBERT CHARLES MACWATT, C.I.E., M.B. F.R.C.S., I.M.S.

The Hon'ble Mr. PATRICK JAMES FAGAN, C.S.I., I.C.S.

OATH OF OFFICE.

The Hon'ble Mr. THOMPSON, the Hon'ble Mr. FAGAN and the Hon'ble Pandit SHEO NARAIN took the Oath of Allegiance to the Crown.

ADDRESS OF WELCOME.

His Honour the President—

"GENTLEMEN,—I have much pleasure in welcoming you to this the first session of our Legislative Council during my tenure of office. I do not know how many more sessions the Fates have in store for this Council, but I am glad that I shall be privileged to meet you once or twice again in your present familiar form before you merge into the large Provincial Council of the future.

"I could have wished to have seen among you on this occasion a face which we shall not now see again, that of the late Mr. Edwin Parker, who was for some few years past a member of this Council. He was nominated to the Council as a representative of the European and Anglo-Indian communities, but while faithfully representing those communities his sympathies were by no means bounded by them. He seldom spoke in our meetings but we always felt that we had among us a councillor of good judgment and ripe experience. He had spent a great deal of his life in Lahore and was well-known to those of us who live here as a man of many interests, a courteous listener, unflagging in his duties, and ever anxious to alleviate suffering or distress. We of this Council have lost in him a colleague whom we shall long regret.

"Since you last met, gentlemen, many things have happened both inside the Province and outside it. The disorders which occurred in the Province have not directly come within the cognizance of this Council, and I do not propose to say anything regarding them this morning. Nor would I trouble you with any remarks on other matters if it were not for the fact that the restoration of peace has given us opportunities for progress which I think you can, each in his several sphere, help the Province to utilize. The signing of the peace has relieved us of the strain which the war entailed and we now hope as soon as circumstances will permit to resume the lines of development on which the Punjab had already started. There are many lines on which the Punjab is destined to develop, but I should wish to-day to allude briefly to the line of industrial advance. We have of late recognized that the Government has its responsibilities in this sphere and we have as you know for some

years had an officer who was termed Director of Industries, but during the war the special duties imposed on him in respect of munition work and the control of civil supplies have rendered it difficult for him to devote as much of his time as he would have wished to industrial matters. We have now strengthened his office by the appointment of Mr. Scott, a trained Engineer, who knows the Punjab well and who for some time was Deputy Controller of Munitions: and after a short interval we hope that this officer may be able to work as a whole time Director of Industries. When the Government of India have also recast their Industrial organization, we hope to be in a position to move forward so far as the conditions of the Province will allow in the directions indicated by the recent Industries Commission. The Government of course cannot do everything. Industrialists must make themselves masters of their trades or engage qualified men as managers. But Government will do what it can to provide technical and expert advice. Its resources in this respect are not at present large, but they will increase as time goes on and these should constitute a very real asset to the Province. What I wish to be realized is that we have a Department of this character, and that it is intended to help people and will always be ready to give such advice and assistance as it can.

"The war has given us a very valuable experience. It has shown us possibilities of which we did not dream before. We were able during the war to provide the Munitions Board with 60 lakhs of rupees worth of materials, and we provided them, I am told, at rates considerably lower than those paid for similar articles in other Provinces. The expansion of industry has shown itself in many notable ways and it is for us to see that with the cessation of military requirements we shall not lose the start which we have so far gained. This applies in many branches of industry but it is of most importance along two lines, namely, tannery and forest produce.

"It is an obvious fact that if we can tan our hides and skins we are wasting great opportunities by exporting them raw or half tanned. The war has shown us that we have openings before us here. We have hitherto been taunted with making good hides into bad leather, and our methods are still to a large extent primitive, but of late years we have seen the gradual adoption of improved processes and with such good material in the way of skins and hides as the Punjab possesses it is to be hoped that before it is too late a substantial and up-to-date tanning industry may be established. I was glad to see on visiting one of the Lahore tanneries the other day that a good beginning was being made there, and Mr. Townsend showed me recently a suit case made entirely in the Punjab which has a leather and a finish which are most promising. Our Government Officers are anxious to do all they can to help the tanning industry and they contemplate visiting the Central Provinces at an early date to study the manner in which the problem has been tackled there.

"Then there are the Forests. The demand for timber during the war has been considerable and although our Punjab Forests are as a rule difficult of access something has been done to bring their produce into use for military purposes. As a result of the war a shortage of timber is now being felt throughout the world and we must try to maintain and extend the opening which the war has given us. The forests are mainly in Government hands and the best methods for utilization of the produce are now being carefully considered. The enterprize and tenacity of Mr. Gibson of the Forest Service have placed the resin factory at Jallu on a satisfactory footing and in other directions also our officers and the non-official firms connected with the Department have made a promising start, but as you can readily understand there is much yet to be done before we can say that we are making the best use of our forests.

[*His Honour the President.*]

"The Punjab is not looked on as an industrial Province and I doubt if it can ever become—or if it would be altogether good for it to become—a province dependent mainly on industries. But its people have in many ways—and more especially as mechanics—an aptitude for certain lines of industrial advance and the country itself has some marked natural advantages which it is wrong for us to neglect. Chief among these are its supplies of water and the recent survey started by the Government of India has indicated that the Punjab possesses several possible sites for useful hydro-electric schemes. For one of them in the neighbourhood of Kiratpur in the Hoshiarpur District a project is already under preparation. I visited the site recently myself, and from what I saw and from the expert advice which I have received I have every hope that we may there initiate a first class source of electric power, from which a very wide area of country may be supplied. Should the scheme turn out as we expect, the results will be far-reaching. In the meantime I am glad to see that our chief municipalities are bestirring themselves on the subject of local electric supplies—a matter in which we have hitherto been woefully behind hand, and I understand that a move has been made or will shortly be made in this direction in Rawalpindi, Jullundur, Ferozepore, Sialkot, Multan, Lyallpur and Ludhiana. I need hardly add that so far as this Government is concerned every effort will be made to facilitate the progress of any reasonable schemes which municipalities or other bodies may put forward for providing electric power. Similarly I know that in the matter of telephones—another sphere in which we are much behind the times—the Post and Telegraph Office is anxious to do all it can to meet public demands.

"As regards Railways the Government has, as you know, much leeway to make up in the matter of maintenance and we cannot look to much in the way of new mileage at Government expense in the near future. But there is plenty of opening for lines financed by private enterprize or by the Punjab States, an opening the value of which is, I am glad to see, already being fully realized by His Highness the Maharaja of Patiala. At the same time motor transport, which the war has brought so greatly into prominence, has in various parts of the Province begun to establish itself, and this in its turn has drawn attention to the necessity for more and better roads. The whole question of communications will shortly be placed under the control of a special board. The functions of the proposed board are still under deliberation but I may mention that its duties are, according to the programme drawn up by the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard to extend to communications of all kinds by land, by river or by air. This may seem to some of you a little premature but in such matters it is better to be before than behind the times. I see for instance that our present Director of Agriculture, Mr. Jacob, has been arranging with the authorities of the Air Force for the experimental survey of crops by aerial photography and I have recently learnt that similar experiments are about to be undertaken in another province to ascertain the possibility of employing this agency to assist in the process of Cadastral Survey.

"So far therefore as Government is concerned we are trying to keep as far as possible abreast of the times: and I have little doubt that the public will also do its share. There are plenty of enterprizing men in the Punjab, there are plenty of men with reasonable supplies of money, and there is a growing supply of men with practical knowledge of industry. For enterprize combined with money and practical knowledge there are good openings and the man who seizes these openings has the satisfaction of knowing that he is working not only for himself but for his fellow countrymen and his Province.

"You will I hope excuse me for intruding on your time with remarks which are not strictly germane to anything which we are to discuss to-day, but I feel that nothing which affects the welfare of the Province is ot uside the sphere of our interests in this Council and I was anxious to bring to your

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah.*]

special notice a phase of our development which does not always receive its due. I will not keep the Council any longer from its proper duties and I again offer you my most cordial greetings and all good wishes for the success of your labours in every aspect of your work."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal :—

"YOUR HONOUR,—This being the first meeting of the Council at which we are going to have the privilege of assembling under Your Honour's regime and Presidentship, I as its oldest elected member ask the permission to rise on behalf of all the different communities of the Punjab which this Council has the honour of representing to welcome you to this province with which you have been associated by the happiest and most revered of ties and memories for more than half a century.

"Need I say, Sir, that in having this opportunity of welcoming Your Honour, we have the proud privilege of congratulating ourselves inasmuch as we look forward to the most safe guidance, at the deliberations and proceedings of this Council, of a statesman of your virtues of the head and heart.

"It is in no language of conventionalism that I say that there would be no other whose appointment as the head of the Government of this Province would have been welcomed and acclaimed at this juncture with such satisfaction and enthusiasm as that of Your Honour has been.

"Your Honour's connection with the Punjab is a matter of popular knowledge. Your illustrious father General Maclagan's name is honoured and his memory cherished in the Punjab to this day, and those who came in contact with your elder brother, 'The Hon'ble Colonel R. S. Maclagan, C.S.I.,' like me who had the privilege of having been one of his collegues in this Council for about three years, entertained the highest respect for his equanimity of temper and his straightforward and justice loving nature, and his affability of manners.

"The fact that you have been connected with the Province from your infancy, when indelible impressions are received, and most lasting affections engendered, and that the greater part of your service has lain in the Punjab, has endeared your goodself to the heart of every Punjabi, as one of his own kith and kin.

"Your Honour has ever since 1886 when you joined the Punjab Commission earned a unique popularity among all classes and creeds.

"Our next great aspiration which we hope to see fulfilled in the near future is to have the privilege of congratulating Your Honour as our First Governor under the new constitutional scheme. In conclusion I offer my heartfelt prayer in which my colleagues join me most cordially, for the health, long life and happiness of Lady Maclagan and yourself."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Khwaja Yusaf Shah :—

"YOUR HONOUR,—I rise to accord my cordial welcome to Your Honour to this Province and to give expression to the feelings with regard to your return to this Province. We are highly gratified at your appointment as Lieutenant-Governor of this Province. Having spent the best portion of your service in this Province you can realise their steadfast loyalty to the British Raj and their needs and aspirations are not unknown to Your Honour. The tenure of Your Honour's office begins at a time when the Indian Reforms Scheme is to be introduced into this country very shortly and we hope and trust that the different interests and the different communities will be properly and adequately represented on those institutions.

[*Makhdum Sayad Rajan Shah.*]

"In conclusion, Your Honour, I sincerely trust that in the interests of good administration there may be genuine co-operation and good will between Indians and Europeans and that during your tenure of office the relations may be brought closer still."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Sayad Rajan Shah spoke in Urdu, translation of which is as follows :—

"I am aware that the occasion of extolling the praises of one who is praiseworthy is not usually one where the eulogized and the eulogiser are happy and at ease, but there are exceptions to every rule and indeed it happens on some of these exceptional occasions that a person cannot check the effusion of his strong feelings and emotions just as a vessel cannot check boiling water from overflowing its brim. Words fall short to adequately express the immense joy and gratitude with which the United Punjab without any difference of caste and creeds has welcomed the appointment of Your Honour to this exalted post. In short it would suffice to say that from every quarter, from the palatial residence of the rich and from the unassuming tenements of the poor, we hear a united voice expressing

ع آمدن تو باعث آرزوی ما ذکر تو بود زمزمهٔ شادی ما

(Couplet :—"O thou who hast come for our welfare

"We rejoice when we speak of thee.")

For these reasons the words of welcome involuntarily flow from the lips of those who have the honour of being members of Your Council and who represent the public.

ی م تراود چه کنم آن چه دراو ددل است

(Couplet.—"What can I do

The feelings of my heart burst out.")

"As we expected, as soon as Your Honour took up the reigns of Government, you brought to us a message of conciliation and co-operation and publicly announced that it was Your Honour's strong desire to restore confidence between the public of the Punjab and the Government and to carry on the work of administration with co-operation. We take this opportunity of now assuring you that the public of the Punjab fully feels its responsibility in the task. Unless the inhabitants of the Punjab forget the recent unhappy incidents and assist Your Honour we cannot hope for the fulfilment of your sacred mission.

"In this first meeting of the Council which is held under Your Honour's Presidentship we beg to offer a hearty welcome to you and to again assure you that under the patronage of a ruler with so excellent a nature and with so merciful and sympathatic a heart which can conquer the minds of people and who has been gifted by God with justice tempered by mercy we are bound to succeed in all our noble ambitions.

"This is not the occasion for a lengthy speech, and I would conclude with a prayer that Almighty, the King of Kings, the Ruler of Rulers, the Master of hearts, and Who controls all that is open and hidden in the universe and without Whose help no man can succeed in his task, may He bless Your Honour's noble intentions with success and make your reign a source of prosperity to the Punjab and the people of the Punjab ; and may the people of this Province be imbued with that faithfulness and loyalty that under Your Honour's reign they may prove themselves the brightest jewels in the British Crown and may they enjoy to their hearts content the blessing of the British Rule bringing with it peace, liberty and prosperty.

این دعا ازمن و از جمله جهان آمین باد

"Let this prayer by me be realised

By all the World."

[*Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan ; Mr. Maynard.*]

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh :—

"YOUR HONOUR,—This is the first meeting of the Punjab Legislative Council since Your Honour assumed the reign of Your exalted Office, and I deem it a duty on behalf of my Zemindar brethren in general, and of the Sikh community in particular, to congratulate Your Honour on assuming charge of the destinies of this Province. I am confident that during Your Honour's term of office the land of the five rivers will receive accessions of prosperity and economic strength and will march rapidly on the path of enlightenment and tranquillity. Your Honour's regime has indeed well begun, for it has for the first time been recognised that the Zamindar of the Province who constitute the backbone of the Indian Army have a special claim on the attention of the Government and deserve to be accorded a special representation in the Public service of the Province. I thank Your Honour for the resolution which Your Honour's Government has been pleased to issue on the subject of the increased representation of the Zemindars in the Public Service and I am confident that this mark of justice will stimulate the Zamindar classes, making for the sacrifices for the Government, the rural sections of the population of this Province have always exhibited staunch and steadfast loyalty.

"Your Honour, it is my privilege and duty to represent the Sikh community in your Council of this Province and I wish to take this opportunity of assuring you that you may depend on our steadfast loyalty and that we shall always pride ourselves that though our number is small the same devotion to the Crown inspires us in the present as in the past.

"Your Honour, with these observations I resume my seat wishing an era of increased happiness and contentment and prosperity during Your Honour's time."

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Attestation fees to Superintendents, Vernacular Offices.

1. "(*a*) Is Government aware that under orders recently issued by the Financial Commissioner examiners are to be appointed in District Offices and the Superintendents of those offices are to be deprived of the copying fees which they have enjoyed for years and which in effect have been supplementary and permanent emoluments of the Superintendents to make up for their low-pitched substantive pay ?

"(*b*) If so, has Government considered that such orders will inflict hardship in these days of scarcity on the individuals concerned whose emoluments will be reduced without notice and without properly safeguarding the interests of existing incumbents ?

"(*c*) Has Government also considered that recently the responsibilities of Superintendents of Deputy Commissioner's offices have been vastly increased on the one hand while, on the other, their emoluments are to be reduced. That if it is contemplated to increase the pay of the Superintendents as a result of the deprivation of copying fees would Government consider whether the two schemes ought not rightly to take effect together in order fully to safeguard the interests of the existing incumbents ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"(*a*) The Government is aware of the orders which were passed after consulting all Commissioners and district officers. It was ascertained that the attestation of copies was very unsatisfactory and the only possible conclusion was to appoint separate paid examiners."

"(*b*) and (*c*). The Government is considering the question of revising the pay of clerical establishments and the Financial Commissioner will take the loss of these fees into consideration when proposing a revised scale of pay for Superintendents. In the meanwhile Superintendents will share in the temporary additional allowances which Government has proposed for all non-gazetted establishments. It is not considered appropriate to pay Superintendents for work that is not done by them, and it is not desirable to postpone the employment of paid examiners till such time as the pay is revised. The unsatisfactory nature of the copies granted to the public for production in courts was noticed by the Hon'ble the Judges of the High Court. One district officer reported that a copy of 15 lines had four bad mistakes, while another copy had 91 mistakes, and most officers commented on the loose manner in which copies were examined. Sanction has already been given for the employment of paid examiners in the Lahore and Jullundur Divisions."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan asked :—

Metalled roads in Sialkot District.

2. "(*a*) Is it a fact that in the important district of Sialkot there are only two metalled roads connecting Daska and Pasrur with Sialkot and they are generally in a bad condition ?

"(*b*) Is it also a fact that the non-metalled roads in the same district are generally 2 to 3 feet below the level of the country around, so that during the rains they become mere channels for flood water and impassable for three or four months in the year ?

"(*c*) If so, will Government be pleased to consider the desirability of connecting at least the main tahsils with one another and with the city of Sialkot by metalled roads, and take necessary steps to improve the general state of the roads in the district ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"In addition to the metalled roads mentioned in the first part of the question there is a metalled road from Wazirabad to Sialkot. This is a provincial road. The remaining metalled and unmetalled roads are maintained by the district board, and Government has no information as to their condition which is the concern of the local body.

"The desirability of constructing metalled roads where such do not at present exist is also a question for the district board and Government does not propose to take any steps in the matter."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan asked :—

Cashiers and photedars of Rawalpindi Division.

3. "Is it a fact that the strength of cashiers and photedars in the treasuries and sub-treasuries of the Rawalpindi Division was sanctioned during 1863, and in spite of an extraordinary increase in the amount of work has not been revised since 1868 ?

4. "Is it a fact that they have been drawing salaries ranging from Rs. 12 to Rs. 20 per mensem only according to the scale originally fixed in 1868 ?

5. "Is it a fact that beyond the general increase in the treasury work, the introduction of currency notes of Re. 1 and Rs. 2-8-0 has further increased the work ?

6. "Is it a fact that (*a*) in order to cope with the heavy work the treasurer is compelled to employ extra men and on higher salaries ?

(*b*) The treasurer receives no payment from the Government for the additional expenditure incurred by him ?

7. "Will Government kindly inform the Council whether similar conditions prevail in the other districts of the province and the same scale of pay of the cashiers and photedars is in force throughout the Punjab ?

[*Mr. Maynard ; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das.*]

8. "Will Government kindly take into consideration the question of revising the strength of the cashiers and photedars of all the treasuries and of sanctioning adequate increments in their pay ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

3. "The Hon'ble Member's question is based on the misconception that the Rawalpindi Division of to-day is the same as the Rawalpindi Division of 1863. The facts are otherwise. The Division now comprises three new districts (Mianwali, Attock and Sargodha), that did not exist in the 19th century. It does not now include Gujranwala and Sialkot which it did as late as 1886. The creation of new districts and tahsils has naturally involved an addition to the strength of cashiers and photedars in the treasuries and sub-treasuries concerned. It is also a fact that after 1866 the strength of assistant treasurers and money-testors was revised in 1886.

4. "The pay in some cases was revised in 1886 and ranges between Rs. 12 and Rs. 24.

5. "The answer is in the affirmative.

6. "(*a*) Occasionally extra men are needed to cope with rush of work and Commissioners of Divisions are empowered to sanction employment of temporary photedars for periods not exceeding one month in each case.

"(*b*) The Hon'ble Member is misinformed. The cost of all additional temporary men is met by the Government.

7. "The conditions are similar in all districts of the Province.

8. "The question has been virtually decided and a comprehensive scheme is likely to come into force from April 1st, 1920, to place on a proper footing all matters relating to the strength and remuneration of the Treasury Staff."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

9. "Will Government kindly explain what advantages are expected to accrue from placing the Excise Inspecting Staff of Multan and Lyallpur Districts under the Superintendents of Police of those districts ?" **Excise Inspecting Staff under Police in Multan and Lyallpur.**

The Hon'ble Mr. H. J. Maynard replied :—

"The Excise Inspecting Staff of Multan and Lyallpur have been placed as a tentative measure under the Superintendent of Police only for purposes of detection and prevention. In these two matters and in the prosecution of cases in court the Excise Inspecting Staff will, in the two selected districts, be under the orders of the Superintendent of Police. This system is already in force in the Delhi Province, and it is expected that the formation of the Police and Excise staff into virtually one establishment for the prevention and detection of excise offences and opium smuggling will secure a better organisation of raiding campaigns and a more useful co-ordination of information against actual or potential offenders. Friction and jealousy between the Excise and Police establishments have been a cause of inefficiency in the Excise administration, and it is hoped to minimize these evils by placing both under one head for the purposes of work which is common to both."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

10. "Is it not possible for the Excise Inspecting Staff to discharge their functions without being placed under the Police." *Ibid.*

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied : —

"It is possible for the Excise staff to discharge their functions without being placed under Superintendent of Police. The measure which forms the

Excise Inspecting Staff under Police in Multan and Lyallpur.

subject matter of the Hon'ble Member's three questions is designed to secure, if possible, a greater efficiency in the discharge of those functions by the diminution of friction and mutual jealousy."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

11. "In what matters will the Excise Inspecting Staff be expected to work under the orders of the Superintendents of Police."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to the answer given to his first question".

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Appointment of zamindars in public service.

12. "Will Government lay on the table of this Council and issue to the Press the report of the Committee appointed to consider the question of the representation of zamindars in the public services of the province, which report is said to have been submitted to Government in December last ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"No formal report was submitted by the Committee, but copies of their proceedings* and of the Government resolution† are laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Raising the salaries of clerical staff.

13. "Will Government kindly state what action has so far been taken on the recommendations made by the Committee appointed to examine the question of raising the salaries of the clerical staff of Government in view of the unprecedented rise in prices ?

14. "Will Government kindly state how long will it take for these recommendations to be put in force ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"At its first meeting held on 10th April 1919 the Committee recommended the doubling of the existing war allowance for 6 months as an urgent, temporary and provisional measure. This proposal was accepted by the Local Government and sanctioned by the Government of India with effect from 1st April 1919. On receipt in July of the final recommendations of the Committee which, as the Hon'ble Member will remember, was appointed to deal with clerical and menial establishments only, the Local Government recommended to the Government of India a comprehensive scheme of temporary allowances for all non-gazetted officers at a total estimated cost of 35 lakhs per annum. Sanction has been asked for from 1st October 1919, but orders have not yet been received from the Government of India. The allowance has been asked for for a period of 2 years within which it is hoped to revise permanently the pay of all establishments."

"As it is not within the competence of the Local Government to sanction the allowances, it is impossible to answer this question, but it is expected that the orders of the Government of India will be received very shortly."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked :—

Rewards to clerical staffs for services in war times.

15. "Will Government kindly state whether clerical staffs of the Government have been given rewards for the exceptionally heavy work they had been called upon to do in war time in addition to war allowances that were paid to them for rise in prices. If not, does the Government consider it desirable to do so now ?"

---

*Not printed.
†See Appendix A.

[*Mr. Thompson; Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das; Mr. Gibson; Mr. Maynard; Mr. Wood; Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied:—

"No general rewards have been given to the clerical staffs of the different Civil Offices. But clerks who did good work have been rewarded with watches, cash and sanads."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked:—

16. "Will Government kindly state whether the estimate of receipts of the current year are likely to be exceeded; if so, under what heads?" Excess of receipt over estimate.

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied:—

"The actuals up to the end of August show an increase of 9½ lakhs in the Revenue over the Proportionate Estimate based on the Budget figures. The chief increases are under Stamps, 2 lakhs; Excise, 3 lakhs, and Income-tax, 3 lakhs. It is, however, too early in the financial year to say whether the estimates of receipts for the whole year are likely to be exceeded or not."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked:—

17. "Will Government state whether or not the function of maintaining inter-village ways of communication passing through village common lands fall within the jurisdiction of the District Board?" Whether inter-village ways are within jurisdiction of District Boards.

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied:—

"Inter-village ways of communication when they constitute public roads or ways of communication are placed by section 20 (1) (*b*) of the Punjab District Boards Act, 1883, under the control and administration of District Boards."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das:—

"I wanted an interpretation of the section which has been quoted by the Hon'ble Member. I wanted to know whether the inter-village ways of communication fall within the section in practice."

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson:—

"I asked for a notice of this question."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked:—

18. "Will Government kindly lay on the table of this Council and issue to the Press rules framed under the Punjab Primary Education Act?" Rules under Primary Education Act.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied:—

"Rules framed under the Primary Education Act were published for criticism in the *Punjab Gazette* of September 19th."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Das asked:—

19. "Will Government kindly state whether they have now received the Report of the Committee appointed to consider the recommendations of the Public Works Department Reorganisation Committee as far as they are applicable to this Province. If so, will they kindly lay it on the table of this Council?" Public Work Department Reorganization Committee's Report.

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied:—

"The Report has been received and is laid on the table."*

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked:—

20. "Is Government aware that some fever in an epidemic form is alleged to prevail in the Kulu valley and that on account of scarcity of Medical aid the majority of patients get no relief and suffer a great deal?" Fever Epidemic in Kulu valley.

*Not printed.

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"On the 28th of August 1919, the Civil Surgeon, Kangra District, reported that the villages of Lenode and Uveri in the Palampur Tahsil were infected with Typhus Fever and that he had seen one case at Palampur on his way back from Kulu. On the 26th September he intimated, in response to an order of the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Punjab, dated 12th September 1919, calling for the submission of daily progress reports showing seizures and deaths and measures taken to combat the disease, in accordance with standing orders, that no case or death had since been reported from either the Palampur or Seoraj Tahsils; while in a letter dated 24th September 1919, he asked for the Sub-Assistant Surgeon incharge of the dispensary at Keylong, which was about to be closed, to be placed on special duty 'to combat Typhus and fevers in Seoraj.' This was sanctioned. The Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals has called upon him to explain his contradictory statements and to furnish a full and complete report on the epidemic, the extent to which it still prevails, and what additional staff, if any, he requires to deal with the outbreak. The question of inadequacy of medical aid in the Kulu valley has not been represented by the local authorities or the public ; the extension of which is a matter for the consideration of the District Board which is being addressed with a view to rendering as much assistance as possible."

The Hon'ble Bai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Itinerant medical service in Kulu.

21. "Will Government be pleased to make special arrangements for itinerant medical service for the valley as it is impossible for the only medical gentleman—the Assistant Surgeon at Sultanpur—to go about in villages and hamlets to give the necessary aid ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"Sanction has been accorded to the establishment of 32 permanent itinerating dispensaries in the Punjab in the current year ; and, as soon as the Government of India release Punjab Civil Sub-Assistant Surgeons from military duty, Kulu, along with other districts, will be provided with itinerating medical service."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Lady Doctor at Sultanpur Kulu.

22. "Will Government be pleased to appoint a Lady Doctor at Sultanpur for the relief of female patients ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The matter is one for decision by the Kangra District Board which has not so far approached Government on the subject. In the event of such an application being received Government is prepared to accord it sympathetic consideration."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Punishment of certain Indian Civil and Assistant Surgeons without enquiry.

23. "Is it a fact that the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Punjab, has punished without proper departmental enquiry certain Indian Civil Surgeons, Assistant and Sub-Assistant Surgeons with reference to their conduct as witnesses in medico-legal cases or for some other matters ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The only recent case in which a full departmental enquiry is not on record is that of an Assistant Surgeon officiating as a Civil Surgeon who was considered unsuitable at the time for the duties which devolved upon him, and, who, under the orders of Government, was transferred last year to a less elevated and responsible appointment for which he was then considered more fitted.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

24. "Has the attention of Government been drawn to the case of Dr. Mela Ram, Assistant Surgeon, who in 1918, was a Civil Surgeon at Montgomery and who was degraded by the Inspector-General on account of certain remarks made by Mr. Barron, the Sessions Judge of Montgomery, in case Crown *versus* Sarboo (Appeal No. 56 of 1918) without instituting any proper enquiry from Mela Ram and although Mr. Barron's remarks were expunged by the Hon'ble Mr. Justice Chevis on revision by Dr. Mela Ram on 19th October 1918 ?" Case of Dr. Mela Ram.

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"Government is fully conversant with all the facts of the case of Senior Assistant Surgeon Mela Ram who of his own accord submitted fully explanatory letters rendering further enquiry superfluous."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadar Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

25. "Will Government be pleased to state for the information of this Council whether Dr. Mela Ram asked for an open enquiry and applied to be allowed to prosecute those officers who were supposed to have made accusations against him, and on what grounds the Government refused the sanction asked for by Dr. Mela Ram to vindicate his character ?" Case of Dr. Mela Ram.

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"Senior Assistant Surgeon Mela Ram asked for the case to be brought before a Medical Board. He also asked to be allowed to prosecute a certain official whom he named and others whom he did not, who he alleged made accusations against him. Government refused the sanction asked for as the action of the official named was fully covered by Exception 2 of section 499, Indian Penal Code."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

26. "Will Government be pleased to say whether the present Inspector-General of Hospitals' opinion was taken on Dr. Mela Ram's case ? And if the answer be in the affirmative will Government be pleased to inform this Council whether the Inspector-General's opinion as to the medical aspect of the case was in agreement with that of Dr. Mela Ram ?" Case of Dr. Mela Ram.

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The answer is in the affirmative. The opinion of the present Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals was not in agreement with that of his predecessor regarding the evidence given in court by Senior Assistant Surgeon Mela Ram and the opinion passed on the value of the evidence by the Sessions Judge ; but the further explanation given by the Assistant Surgeon contained medico-legal inaccuracies which were apparent to the present Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals ; and a reference to a medico-legal expert, who emphasised the fact, justified Government in upholding its decision that Senior Assistant Surgeon Mela Ram should not be appointed to the post of Civil Surgeon until the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Punjab, was satisfied of his capacity and judgment in dealing with medico-legal cases.

"He has since, on the advice of the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, been appointed again to officiate as Civil Surgeon."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

27. "Will Government be pleased in view of the extreme desirability of securing independent evidence of the Medical Officers in medico-legal cases to issue instructions that before taking any action against the Medical Officer proper departmental enquiry should be instituted and explanation taken from him ?" Independent evidence of Medical Officers in Medico Legal cases.

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"As this procedure is already in force Government sees no necessity to issue further instructions."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Cases of Dr. Lachhman Das and Paras Ram.

28. "Has the attention of Government been called to the cases of Dr. Lachhman Das, Civil Surgeon of Muzaffargarh, who was transferred to Multan as Assistant Surgeon and was superseded, of Dr. Paras Ram who was degraded to the lower grade on adverse comment made by a Magistrate on his statement despite the fact that Dr. Paras Ram's opinion was supported by Colonel Smith, C.I.E., when forwarding Dr. Paras Ram's appeal, and of two Sub-Assistant Surgeons who were the subjects of Inspector-General's Circular order dated 4th June 1918, and were punished without any proper departmental enquiry ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"All the cases cited were duly considered and dealt with by Government after proper departmental enquiry with the exception of that of the then officiating Civil Surgeon the circumstances of whose case are narrated in answer to question 10."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Punishment of Medical Officers in time of Colonel Hendley.

29. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing how many Medical Officers were punished during 1917-18 in the time of Colonel Hendley, I.M.S., on account of adverse remarks made against the said officers by Magistrates or Judges with regard to their conduct in medico-legal cases, and whether in every case those statements were against the view taken by the police in those cases ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"In no case were statements against the view taken by the Police, made by Magistrates or Judges."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Cases of certain Medical Gentlemen.

30. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table all the papers with reference to the following medical gentlemen :—

"1. Dr. Mela Ram, Assistant Surgeon.

"2. Dr. Kirpa Ram Kora.

"3. Dr. Paras Ram.

"4. Messrs: Lachhman Das, Abdul Aziz Farooqi, Mahfooz Ullah, Hari Das Kataria, Ram Tikaya, Muhammad Ramzan, Trilok Nath and Muhammad Fazal ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"Government is not prepared to lay the papers asked for on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Admission of students in Medical College.

31. "Is Government aware that students with the best academic and physical qualifications have been refused admission by the Principal, Medical College, during the last few years, in favour of students of far inferior qualifications ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to the answer given to question No. 8 asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lall."

[*Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram ; Colonel MacWatt ; Mr. Maynard ; Mr. Thompson.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Admission of students in Medical College.

32. "Does the Government realize the consequences to the general public from the exclusion of the best available intellect from the profession ?"

The Hon'ble Colonel MacWatt replied :—

"Government does not admit that the rules regarding admission to the Medical College has the effect of excluding the best available material from the profession."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Rate of coolies wages in Kulu.

33. "Will Government be pleased to state the rate fixed for payment of a cooly per day in the Kulu Valley, and whether the amount is or is not four annas a day? Will Government consider the question with a view to increase the rate of cooly wages?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The rate per stage for a cooly in the Kulu Sub-Division of the Kangra District is four annas for an ordinary march. For marches of more than ordinary length or difficulty the rates vary between five annas and nine annas. The revisions of the rate is under consideration."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Prospectus of Normal School for men.

34. "Is Government aware that in the new prospectus of Normal Schools for men Hindi has been ordered to be omitted from the list of optional subjects in districts where Hindi is not the spoken language, although Persian and Panjabee are retained without any restriction ?

35. "Will Government be pleased to state the reasons which led to this change ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The answers to questions 34 and 35 are combined, as both questions deal with the same point.

"Government is aware of the fact. The new prospectus contains the following words. Hindi should be taught only in areas where it is a spoken language of the people. The object of the insertion of this note was not to discriminate unfairly between different languages in the Normal School curriculum but merely to discourage the taking of Hindi by a student preparing for a teachership in a Primary School in cases where the study of the language would be of no use to him in his vocation. The number of cases affected is likely to be very small. The statement that Persian and Panjabee are retained in the Normal School curriculum without any restriction is incorrect, for the taking of these languages continues to be subject to the condition that the student should have an adequate knowledge of the languages already."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Subscription for Imperial Relief-Fund.

36. "Will Government be pleased to state whether subscriptions for Imperial or other Relief Fund are being realized in the Province ; if so, in how many districts a list has been opened, and will Government also kindly state whether the agency employed for collecting subscriptions is official or non-official ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"Government has no definite information on the subject. But a letter dated 3rd May 1919 from the Indian Soldiers' Board in connection with the Viceroy's appeal for further subscriptions to the Imperial Indian Relief

Fund was circulated to Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners, and it is presumed that subscriptions for the Imperial Indian Relief Fund have been invited. The letter in express terms discountenanced the idea of putting any pressure on those unwilling to give, and no quota was fixed for the Province.

"The co-operation of the Provincial Committee of the fund was also invited in July last, but it was explained that any appeal which the Committee desired to make should be made direct to the public and not through Deputy Commissioners. Government is not aware of the agency employed in each district. But as in the past, the agency, if any, must, it is presumed, be mainly non-official."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Forced subscription in certain Districts.

37. "Is it a fact that in some districts the Lambardars, Sufedposhes and Zaildars and Zamindars are forced to pay subscriptions with a minimum rate fixed by the collecting officers ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"Government has no knowledge, and has received no complaints. The Hon'ble Member is, it is understood, himself a member of the Provincial Committee, and if he has any definite information pointing to abuses, it is suggested that he might bring it to the notice of the Committee or of local authorities."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

38. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

"(*a*) Punishments by confiscation of pachhotra of lambardars, inams of Sufedposhes and Zaildars for not giving help in recruitment for the army during the last war in all the districts of the Punjab and in raising war loan ?

"(*b*) Punishments by suspension of the above officers and of Honorary Magistrates ?

"(*c*) Punishment by degradation or otherwise of Patwaris, Girdawars, Kanungos and other officials ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"So far as the Government is aware, no one was punished for not helping in raising the war loan, nor was any Honorary Magistrate, Girdawar, Patwari or other official punished in connection with recruitment.

"Some lambardars, sufedposhes and zaildars were punished for neglect of duty in regard to recruitment, as under the revised rules undes the Land Revenue Act it was their duty to render assistance in this respect. Information as to the number of such persons is not available but enquiry will be made."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

39. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table circulars and orders issued to Commissioners, Deputy Commissioners for guidance in recruitment for the army during the last 5 years and to state whether a certain number of recruits was fixed which each district of the province was to provide for the Army ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson, replied :—

"A copy of the general circulars is placed on the table. There were other circulars* relating the quota required from the province and from individual districts which owing to war conditions were necessarily confidential, and which this Government is not at liberty to publish. The district quotas were, however, communicated to the Provincial Recruiting Board."

*Not printed.

[*Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram ; Mr. Thompson ; Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Mr. Maynard ; Mr. Joseph.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

40. "Did Government receive any complaints from officials and non-officials that recruitment for the army during the war was carried on in a way which practically amounted to conscription ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"Government received certain complaints regarding recruiting methods. Considering the scale of the operations, they were not numerous and a number of them were undoubtedly without foundation. Undesirable methods were employed in certain cases in a few districts towards the end of the war but His Honour believes that in most of the best recruiting districts, recruitment was throughout carried on without undue pressure.

"As the Hon'ble Member is aware, there was a Provincial Recruiting Board on which there were several non-officials of the classes mainly concerned. This body met at fairly frequent intervals and it was always open to any member to report any cases of undesirable pressure, which came to his notice."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Raizada Bhagat Ram asked :—

Official confidential remarks against public servants.

41. "Will Government be pleased to circulate for the general information of the Heads of Departments to bear in mind, before passing final orders on a case of a public servant, the valuable remarks of the Governor in Council of Bombay Presidency (Resolution No. 7170, Bombay, dated the 16th October 1883) 'what oftener happens is that some censure is passed on a public servant 'in a side remark from the Bench, which he has no opportunity of answering 'and which the Presiding Officer may not have thought of sufficient import-'ance to require verification. It would be extremely hazardous and unfair to 'accept such a remark as a deliberate judgment, and there seems no safe 'general rule except that a public servant, unless himself convicted at a 'judicial trial, has a right to defend himself departmentally against any im-'putations that he may have thereof incurred ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"The Resolution quoted by the Hon'ble Member is reproduced in Mr. Roy's well-known collection of Rules and Orders relating to public servants and their dismissal, and the Government is not aware of any reason which makes it necessary to draw the special attention of officers to the instructions in question ?"

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

Sikh District Inspector of schools.

42. "Will Government be pleased to state if any increase has been made in the number of Sikh District Inspectors of Schools since 6th February 1918 when the Hon'ble Mr. Richey in reply to question No. 73 (*b*) put by the Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Gajjan Singh, gave figures showing only 8 Sikhs of the total of 81 ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The answer is in the affirmative. The number given in the question has been doubled since that time."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

More posts of public prosecutors to Sikhs.

43. "Will Government be pleased to give Sikhs more posts of Public Prosecutors as the latest figures are deplorable as they show only 1 Sikh Public Prosecutor out of the total of 27 ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"I would refer the Hon'ble Member to the reply given on 6th February 1918 by Mr. Craik to Sardar Gajjan Singh which ran as follows :—

"In making appointments to this, as to other branches of the public service due regard is paid to the claims of the different communities. But in a service in which a high standard of professional skill is required, efficiency must be the first consideration."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

Sikhs as S. V. Os.

44. "(*a*) Has Government taken any steps for having some Sikh Superintendents, Vernacular Offices of Deputy Commissioners' offices, since I had drawn the attention of Government towards this question, in my question No. 49 put on 6th February 1919 ?

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to open this branch to my community also ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"It is understood that the Hon'ble Member's question refers to the post of Head Vernacular Clerk, formerly known as Superintendent, Vernacular Office.

"Clause (*b*) of his question indicates a very grave misunderstanding. The post of Head Vernacular Clerk is open alike to suitable candidates of all religious communities, without distinction : and Sikhs are equally eligible, along with those of other communities if they have the required qualifications.

"Government has not taken, and does not propose to take, any steps to secure posts of Head Vernacular Clerk for Sikh candidates, merely by reason of their being Sikhs."

The Hon'ble Captain Gopal Singh asked :—

Sikhs as Clerks in District Judges Offices and as Forest guards.

45. "is Government aware—(*a*) that out of 227 parmanent clerical establishment in the offices of the District and Sessions Judges there are only 14 Sikhs, and (*b*) in Forest Department out of the total number of Forest guards of 767 there are only 44 Sikhs ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"(*a*) As regards the clerical establishment of the District and Sessions Judges enquiry has been made from the High Court and the information asked for will be furnished to the Hon'ble Member on receipt of a reply.

"(*b*) As regards Forest guards the Government has not the information at headquarters but the number of Sikhs is doubtless small owing to the fact that the chief Sikh districts of the province contain few or no forests."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked permission to withdraw the following question :—

Inspectors of Schools, Jullundur and Rawalpindi.

46. "(*a*) Is Government aware that a Sikh Inspector of Schools, Jullundur Circle, is far senior to a Muhammadan Inspector of Schools, Rawalpindi Circle.

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to state reasons why a senior Sikh Circle Inspector of Schools was made 2nd Inspector while his junior of Rawalpindi Circle is permitted to continue as 1st Inspector ? "

"On permission being granted the question was withdrawn."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

Same.

47. "Will Government be pleased to state for the further satisfaction of the Sikh public, whether the above-mentioned posts are given according to the proportion allotted for each community or on merits alone ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"Both these considerations are borne in mind."

[*Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Mr. Gibson ; Mr. Thompson.*]

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

48. "(*a*) Is Government aware that during the month of August last when the hackney carriage inspection at Lahore was going on there could be had no gharri, tonga or bamboocart at the railway station, Lahore, and the other hackney carriage stands in the city for over a week? Inspection of hackney carriages in Lahore.

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to take steps that these carriages should be inspected by batches and not at one time?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"(*a*) The inspection of hackney carriages at Lahore took place during September and October.

"There was a shortage of conveyances during part of August. Reasons for this were, first, preparation for inspection; and second, lack of ponies, some 200 tonga ponies having died during the abnormal heat of last summer.

"In order to deal with the first of these causes of shortage, the Municipal Committee of Lahore have agreed to a bye-law that owners of carriages should not discontinue plying their carriages for more than a week without the written permission of the Secretary.

"Throughout the period of inspection conveyances were available at the railway station and at other hackney carriage stands.

"(*b*) The practice has always been and still is that hackney carriages are inspected by batches and not all at one time."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

49. "Will the Punjab Government be pleased to recommend to Government of India, Home Department, to reconsider the question of Sikhs having a fair share of seats in Councils on the same basis of their military and political importance and minority in the Punjab as the claims of Muhammadans are considered in United Provinces, Madras and Central Provinces and Behar?" Fair share of Sikhs in Councils.

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"The considerations referred to by the Hon'ble Member as having been applied to the case of Muhammadans in certain provinces are not altogether applicable to the case of Sikhs in the Punjab. The representation recommended for Muhammadans in those provinces in excess of the populational proportion is due in part to the surrender of a majority elsewhere.

"It is difficult to say at present exactly how the electorates will work out, but on the proposals of the Franchise Committee, the Muhammadans with 55 per cent. of the population will apparently have about 52 per cent. of the election seats, while the Sikhs with 10·6 per cent. of the population will have 15·5 per cent. of those seats. From this point of view the Muhammadans in the Punjab will be under-represented to the extent of about 5 per cent. and the Sikhs will be over-represented to the extent of 46 per cent.

"In view however of the fact that the proportion of Sikhs among voters will probably be in excess of their proportion among the population, this Government has already made recommendations which in certain contingencies will have the effect of placing Sikh representation on the Council on a better footing."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

50. "Will Government be pleased to give figures showing the total strength of the Punjab Police and the number of Superintendents of Police, Deputy Superintendents of Police, Inspectors, Sub-Inspectors and Head Con- Punjab Police according to religions.

stablees by religion and also give the percentage by religion as the question put by me last time on the subject was not fully answered."

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"The whole of the information asked for by the Hon'ble Member will be found in the statement laid on the table on February 6th last except so far as constables are concerned. It is regretted that the 6th clause of the Hon'ble Member's question was not understood to include constables who were not specifically mentioned. Enquiry is being made as to the number of constables who are Zamindars and who are respectively Hindus, Muhammadans, Sikhs or Christians."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

Sikh interned immigrants.

51. "Will Government be pleased to state what steps have been taken regarding the Sikh interned immigrants as was done in the cases of the Multan Division Muhammadan immigrants ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"It is not quite understood what particular action in regard to the Muhammadan returned immigrants in the Multan Division is referred to. In the more important Sikh districts there have ever since the early spring of 1915 been Sikh Advisory Committees which have in some instances, notably Ludhiana and Jullundur, given valuable help to Government both in the original restrictions and in the subsequent relaxations. For the last 4½ years Government has been systematically revising the cases of all persons dealt with under the Defence of India Rules or the Ingress into India ordinances. A complete revision of every case in the province was carried out between November and February, and another revision which, had it not been for the disturbances, would have taken place in May and June, is now being carried out. As a result of these periodical revisions the number of interned persons has been cut down to 6 and of restricted persons to 126. Of these the majority are likely to be shortly set at liberty."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

52. "(*a*) Is Government aware that on account of the publication in a Government Communique in the month of April last or thereabout to the effect that a gang of Sikh Emissaries was seen passing through Gurdaspur District towards Kangra District, the Sikhs consider an unmerited slur was cast on their loyalty ?

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to state the source of this information, on which the above mentioned communique was based ?

"(*c*) Is Government in a position to disclose the number and names and full addresses of the said Emissaries ?

"(*d*) Would Government be pleased to state why the said Emissaries were not arrested ?

"(*e*) Will Government be pleased to state the date of such report being made to Government and that by whom it was made ?

"(*f*) Will Government be also pleased to state the date of wire cutting in Kangra District beyond the Chakki river ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"The Lieutenant-Governor regrets that the source of the information cannot be disclosed. The Hon'ble Member however has not quoted the communique quite correctly. It did not speak of a "gang of Sikh Emissaries" but of "Sikh Emissaries". The information was not very definite, and no action was taken. The report was dated 18th April. The cutting of the wires near the Chakki bridge took place on the 20th. It is not known who cut them.

[*Captain Sardar Gopal Singh ; Mr. Thompson ; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Fagan.*]

"The fact that the men in question were Sikhs, even if duly verified, is of course no kind of reflection on the community generally."

The Hon'ble Captain Sardar Gopal Singh asked :—

53. "May I again respectfully draw the attention of Government towards my question put in the Council last year regarding the Gurpurb of the birthday of Guru Nanak and Guru Gobind Singh and request that both birthdays be observed as general holidays throughout the Punjab, as the Sikh public were not satisfied by the answers given by the Government ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"The views of Government are contained in the answer given to him by the Hon'ble Mr. French at the meeting of this Council held on February last, but the matter will be again further considered."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Loss by floods in 1917, in Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts.

54. "With reference to question No. 122 asked by me in a meeting of this Council held on 6th November 1917 and the reply given, will Government be pleased to state—

(*i*) What was the estimated loss suffered by the people of Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts respectively and what was the nature and amount of help rendered by the Government ?

(*ii*) How long after the occurrence was the relief given and what was the cause of the delay ?

(*iii*) Whether any part of the relief given was gratis ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Fagan replied :—

"(*i*) An accurate valuation of the loss incurred by the people of the Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts as a result of the floods of the autumn of 1917 is not practicable. In the case of the Rohtak District however the loss, inclusive of damage to houses, cattle and kharif crops, was roughly appraised shortly after it occurred at Rs. 1,15,000. The loss in the Gurgaon District was much more extensive than in Rohtak. The damage to houses was put at something less than one lakh of rupees, while it was estimated that 1,800 head of cattle had been lost. No estimate of the cash value of the crops destroyed in this district was framed.

"Officials were placed on special duty in December 1917 in both the districts to enquire into and report on the extent of the damage done and the nature and extent of the relief required, while the Financial Commissioner toured through portions of the Palwal, Nuh and Gurgaon Tahsils of the Gurgaon District in February 1918. The nature and extent of the assistance afforded by Government was as follows :—

"(*a*) In the Gurgaon District nearly Rs. 2½ lakhs or about one-third of the land revenue demand for kharif 1917 was suspended, while the similar suspension in the Rohtak District amounted to Rs. 26,500, chiefly in the Jhajjar Tahsil to which portion of the district damage from floods and excessive rainfall was mainly confined.

"(*b*) In addition to the above suspensions, taqqavi loans to the extent of Rs. 60,000 were distributed in the Gurgaon District between October 1917 and April 1918 ; while a further grant of Rs. 57,000 for similar loans free of interest for both districts was sanctioned in August 1918, it being understood that the question of the ultimate remission of loans made from the grant would be considered in due course. The recommendations of the local officers in this matter are awaited.

"(*c*) Government placed a grant of Rs. 20,000 at the disposal of the Deputy Commissioner of Gurgaon for the repair of irrigation lands which had been damaged by the floods.

"(*d*) It is believed that one of the chief contributing causes of the floods which caused such widespread and regrettable damage was the bursting of certain bands in the Alwar State. In July 1918 the Punjab Government drew the attention of the Hon'ble the Agent to the Governor-General in Rajputana to this matter with a view to necessary preventive and remedial measures being adopted by the Alwar Darbar. It is understood that the reply of the Darbar is still awaited by the Agent to the Governor-General. The whole question of the control of drainages in the Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts will, it is hoped, be taken up in the near future by the recently constituted Drainage Board.

"(*ii*) The first portion of this part of the question has already been answered. Government does not consider that any avoidable delay took place in affording such assistance and giving such relief as was within its power either immediately after the occurrence of the calamity or later when its full nature and extent had been adequately investigated by the local officers.

"(*iii*) No gratuitous relief was given beyond interest free loans. A proposal for a free grant of Rs. 25,000 for the relief of distress was carefully considered by Government but had to be negatived as, under the circumstances not justifiable on the financial and administrative principles by which its action must be regulated. The Committee of the Punjab Branch of the Indian Imperial Relief Fund was also approached but it regretted its inability to grant assistance."

Loss by floods in 1917 in Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts.

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

55. "(*i*) With reference to my question No. 123 asked in the same meeting, will Government be pleased to state the result of the enquiry by the Public Works Department and what were the financial orders of the Government ?"

"(*ii*) What is the area that was under water on account of the flood in the Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"(*i*) The Hon'ble Member is referred to the answer of the Hon'ble Mr. D. W. Aikman, C.I.E, laid on the table at the meeting of the Legislative Council held on the 24th April 1918. The Local Government has not yet been approached by the Local Bodies for any assistance in the matter.

"(*ii*) The area that was under water in the Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts has not been reported to Government. If desired enquiries can be made."

Transibility of an inundation canal.

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

56. "In view of the huge mass of water collecting nearly every year in *Dhari Chak* of Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts on account of floods in *Sahibi Nadi*, will Government take steps to enquire whether an inundation canal in the above two districts is feasible ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"Enquiries as to whether an Inundation Canal from the *Dhari Chak* in the Rohtak and Gurgaon Districts is feasible will be set on foot as soon as possible."

[*Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Gibson.*]

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

District Board road of Rohtak District.

57. "(*a*) Is Government aware that the inhabitants of Sonepat Tahsil which has formed part of the Rohtak District since 1912 are labouring under a great difficulty on account of the absence of a direct *pacca* road to the headquarters of the district ? If so, will Government be pleased to help the people out of his difficulty ?

"(*b*) Does any District Board in the Province maintain an equal or larger number of miles of *pacca* road than the Rohtak District Board ? Did Government take this fact into consideration while fixing the 5 years consolidated grant ?

"(*c*) In view of the inability of the Rohtak District Board for reasons given in (*b*) above will Government be pleased to consider the proposal of making a direct metalled road from Rohtak to Sonepat from provincial funds ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"(*a*) Government is not aware that the inhabitants of the Sonepat Tahsil of the Rohtak District are labouring under the difficulty referred to in the first part of the Hon'ble Member's question.

"(*b*) Government has no information later than the year 1917, but in that year the Rohtak District Board was maintaining a greater mileage of metalled road than any other District Board in the Province. This fact was certainly taken into account in fixing the consolidated grant which is calculated by applying the estimated sum per mile required for maintenance to the number of miles of road.

"(*c*) Government gives annually to District Boards (*a*) a development grant, (*b*) a grant for metalled roads. These grants are distributed by Commissioners in accordance with the needs of the respective District Boards. Besides these grants special assistance is occasionally given towards the construction of metalled roads, but no application for such special assistance, has, as far as Government is aware, been received from the Rohtak District Board respecting the Sonepat-Rohtak road. It these circumstances Government sees no necessity for completing a metalled road from Sonepat to Rohtak from Provincial funds. As stated in the reply to a question asked by the Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh in Council in 1915 the part of the road from Sonepat to Kharkhauda is already metalled."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

District Board roads of Hissar.

58. "(*a*) What part of its income has the District Board of Hissar spent on roads during the last ten years ?

"(*b*) In view of the small amounts spent on roads, will Government be pleased to draw the attention of the District Board to connect the big villages in Hansi Tahsil by means of *pacca* roads to the headquarters of the Tahsil ?

"(*c*) Will Government advise the said Board to consider the possibility of having a *pacca* road from Jhind to Hansi in order to make the Agricultural Farm easily accessible to other districts of the Division ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :

"Government is informed that the District Board of Hissar has spent an average of 12 per cent. of its gross income on roads during the past ten years.

"As regards (*b*) and (*c*) the suggestions made therein will be brought to the notice of the District Board of Hissar."

[*Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Maynard.*]

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Milk supply in towns.

59. "Has Government collected any information on the question of milk supply in towns? What is the ordinary rate per seer prevailing in the large towns of the Province?

"(*a*) Does Government propose to take some steps to create facilities for dairy farms in the suburbs of towns, and

"(*b*) Will Government be pleased to consider the suggestion of making a survey of milk and ghee supplies in the Province so that it may be known how much milk and ghee per head is available in the Province?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"A Board of Economic enquiry has recently been established, which includes representatives of the University officials and non-officials. It will be provided with funds to conduct investigations and to publish the results. One of the subjects which is likely to be undertaken is the supply of milk and ghee. In the meanwhile the University has established an Economic research scholarship and selected the ghee supply of large towns as the subject of research. In the city of Lahore an Agricultural research scholar conducted a survey of the milk supply in 1916.

"(*a*) A Dairy Farm created at Montgomery was not successful in consequence of the lessee's bad management and breach of conditions. The grant was resumed and transferred to a different licensee who will qualify in practical dairy farming at an Institute in the United Kingdom.

"The Government will view with favour any specific proposals which may be put forward by private persons or companies for the establishment, under proper management and supervision, of dairy farms near large towns: and the officers of Government in the Agricultural, Veterinary, and Sanitary Departments will always be ready to advise the promoters of any such scheme. The essential preliminary appears to be the development of a good milking breed of cattle. It is for this purpose that the Government have created on Crown lands in the Lower Bari Doab Canal five large cattle breeding farms, two of which are devoted to the Montgomery breed.

"(*b*) The new Board of Economic Enquiry will be requested to consider the suggestion put forward in this clause of the Hon'ble Member's question."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Milk sellers' societies.

60. "Has the Co-operative Department opened any societies for the milk sellers? If not will Government be pleased to consider the suggestion of reserving one Inspector for milk supply societies in the Province?

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"One Co-operative Society of milk sellers in the Gurdaspur District is in existence and has met with moderate success. Others have been projected near Lahore and elsewhere, but have not hitherto been registered on account of the difficulty in selling pure milk in competition with impure. The difficulty can be removed by the strict enforcement of Municipal regulations against adulteration. The local co-operative staff will then be more effective than a special Inspector."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Grade pay of Inspectors of Co-operative Societies.

61. "What are the grades of pay of Inspectors of Co-operative Societies in our Province and in the United Provinces?

"Do Inspectors of the lowest grades here draw the same travelling allowance as their clerks and, if so, will Government be pleased to remove this anomaly?"

[*Mr. Maynard ; Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Joseph.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"The Punjab grades are :—

(1) Rs. 200, (2) Rs. 150, (3) Rs. 120, (4) Rs. 90.

Government have no information as to the grades in the United Provinces.

Pay of Veterinary Inspectors.

"Inspectors on Rs. 90 are entitled under the Civil Service Regulations to the same travelling allowance as their clerks ; their daily allowance is Re. 1 as against annas 4."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

62. "(*a*) What is the pay of a Veterinary Inspector of the lowest grade ?"

"(*b*) Are there special rules for the travelling allowance of this grade of officers, and, if so, in what way do they differ from those regulating the travelling allowance of the Inspectors of Banks ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"(*a*) There is one grade only of Veterinary Inspectors. Beginning on Rs. 75 they rise by two septennial increments of Rs. 25 to Rs. 125. The Local Government has, however, recently sanctioned a revision of this scale, and in future they will begin on Rs. 100 and rise to Rs. 150 by ten annual increments of Rs. 5.

"(*b*) There are no special rules for the travelling allowance of Veterinary Inspectors."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

63. "(*a*) Are Inspectors of Co-operative Societies eligible for the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner in the Provincial Service ?

"(*b*) If so, how many Inspectors have been accepted for the Provincial Civil Service, during last four years ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"Yes : under paragraph 4 of Standing Order No. 17.

"One."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

64. "How much American cotton has been sown in the Punjab during the present Kharif ? Has Government any information about exhibitions held by certain officers of the Canal Departments on the Sirhind Canal ? Will Government be pleased to lay the reports of such exhibitions on the table ? What has been their cost to the State ?"

Produce of American cotton.

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"Available estimated figures of American cotton are :—

	Rs.
Lower Chenab Canal	4,75,081
Lower Bari Doab Canal	2,35,015
Chunian Colony	6,843
Lower Jhelum Colony	1,20,000
Upper Jhelum Colony	12,000
Sirhind Canal (Ferozepore District)	30,000
Total ...	8,78,939

"The cultivation of American cotton has not yet been extended to other tracts as the Department has not yet been able to conduct the necessary

[*Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Joseph ; Mr. Maynard ; Mr. Gibson.*]

Research and Experiment that must precede the introduction of any new type. Steps are being taken to obtain the information for which the Hon'ble member asks regarding exhibitions held by officers of the Canal Department."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Number of Criminal cases from certain villages.

65. "Will Government be pleased to state for the information of this Council :—

(*a*) The number of criminal cases from the villages of Chandi, Bainsi, Sanghi, Khirwali and Kharainti of Rohtak District during the last 5 years, classifying them under each year as—

(I) Cognizable, and

(II) Non-cognizable.

(*b*) The number of reports of crimes received by the Police and duly recorded in respect of inhabitants of these 5 villages during the last 5 years classifying them as above and stating against each how many of these cases resulted in convictions ?

(*c*) How many of the reports and convictions mentioned in (*b*) related to offences against the property and how many to offences against person ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"The information asked for is being collected and will be supplied to the Hon'ble Member when ready."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Agricultural exhibitions.

66. "(*a*) How many exhibitions of this sort have been held by the Department of Agriculture during the present year and what has been the cost of the same ?

(*b*) In view of the large influence possessed by the Canal and Co-operative Departments, will Government allot funds for such exhibitions to the said departments ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

The suggestion here put forward will be considered by Government."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Income from Arboriculture Department.

67. "(*a*) What is the total income to the District Board from the Arboriculture Department and what is the expenditure on the same ?

"(*b*) Are there any uniform directions on this important function of the Boards ?

"(*c*) In view of the high prices of timber, will Government be pleased to make a survey of the different methods of tree plantations and issue uniform instructions for all District Boards ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"(*a*) I give for the information of the Hon'ble Member the average income and expenditure on Arboriculture for the past 3 years of all District Boards in the Punjab—

Income.	*Expenditure.*
Rs.	Rs.
3,42,079	2,58,102

"As regards (*b*) and (c) technical notes upon methods of tree plantation are already in the possession of all Deputy Commissioners. Government

believes that Boards are alive to the importance of arboriculture and that fresh instructions would serve no useful purpose; nor in view of the diversity of conditions between districts could any instructions be uniform."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Post of Under-Secretary to Government, Punjab.

68. "Will Government be pleased to state how far is it correct that the post of an Under-Secretary to Government, Punjab, is open to the Provincial Civil Service and that no such appointment has yet been made?

69. "If so, how long since such appointment is due, and whether it is under the consideration of Government to make the selection at an early date?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Thompson replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to the answer given to a similar question by the Hon'ble Lala Kashi Ram in March 1916. This answer covers questions Nos. 68 and 69."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Promotion of Sub-Overseers.

70. "Will Government be pleased to state how far it is correct that some of the 1st grade Sub-Overseers drawing Rs. 50 to Rs. 70 per mensem under the old scheme, including those who have passed the Overseers' examination, have been placed in or degraded to the 2nd grade under the new scheme and that they have been superseded in promotion to the post of Overseer by Sub-Overseers, 1st and 2nd grade, who have not passed the Overseers' examination?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"Prior to 1917 Sub-Overseers were classified in 3 grades at 7 different rates of salary, as follows :—

	Rs.
3rd grade on ...	30
2nd grade on ...	35
2nd grade on ...	40
2nd grade on ...	45
1st grade on ...	50
1st grade on ...	60
1st grade on ...	70

The scheme of 1917 re-arranged the classification and rates of pay as follows, with an efficiency bar between 2nd and 1st grades :—

	Rs.
2nd grade on ...	35 per mensem.
2nd grade on ...	40 per mensem in 3rd year.
2nd grade on ...	45 per mensem in 7th year.
2nd grade on ...	50 per mensem in 11th year.
2nd grade on ...	55 per mensem in 15th year.
1st grade on ...	60 per mensem in 18th year.
1st grade on ...	70 per mensem in 22nd year.
1st grade on ...	80 per mensem in 25th year.
1st grade on ...	90 per mensem in 28th year.

[*Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand ; Mr. Woods ; Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; Mr. Joseph.*]

"Under the old system the Sub-Overseer had no assurance as to when he would be likely to attain to a particular grade or rate of salary, as the rate of promotion depended upon the rate of occurrence of vacancies, which was fortuitous. Under the scheme of 1917 both the lowest and the highest rates of salary were substantially increased, and the Sub-Overseer was given an assurance that, assuming approved service, he would receive promotion to stated increments of salary at stated intervals of time. In consequence of the introduction of the time scale of promotion 167 Sub-Overseers in both Branches of the Public Works Department who had previously been designated 1st grade Sub-Overseers (including 8 who had passed the Overseers' examination were placed in the new 2nd grade, because their length of service did not qualify them, under the time scale, for the designation 1st grade. This did not however involve any reduction of their salaries."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand asked :—

Promotion of Sub-Overseers.

71. "If so, will Government be pleased to state whether this is in accordance with the spirit and letter of paragraphs 47, 198 and 199, Public Works Department Code, volume I, and to lay before the Council a statement showing the number of Sub-Overseers who have not passed the Overseers' examination but have been promoted to that post during the last 8 years by superseding Sub-Overseers who had passed Overseers' examination."

The Hon'ble Mr. Woods replied :—

"During the past 8 years 8 Sub-Overseers, who have not passed the Overseers' educational test, have been promoted permanently to the Overseer class on account of their proved ability and merit. Ten others have been similarly promoted sub *pro tem.* in place of others who have been deputed to service overseas. The promotions thus made have been in accordance with the Public Works Department Code rulings quoted by the Hon'ble Member, when read in connection with paragraph 204 of the same Code, Volume I (Ninth Edition). The rulings on the subject have been made clearer in paragraphs 20-25 of the latest (10th) Edition of the Public Works Department Code."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Salaries of Imperial and Provincial Forest Services.

72. "Will Government be pleased to state—

(*a*) Whether it is correct or not that the salaries of the Imperial and Provincial Services in the Forest Department were recently re-organized and annual increments introduced.

(*b*) If so, when was this scheme sanctioned and what salaries and annual increments were prescribed in each case.

(*c*) What amounts have actually been granted every year for increment of the salaries in Imperial and what amounts in the Provincial Service since the scheme came into force."

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

"I will answer the three parts of this question together. Government has received no official intimation of the re-organization of the Imperial or Provincial Forest Service. The *Pioneer* of August 9th published a statement, which the Hon'ble Member may have seen, that the Secretary of State had sanctioned a revised scale of pay for Imperial officers of Rs. 450—50—850 in ninth year. Thereafter subject to passing the efficiency bar the scale would be Rs. 1,000—50—1,500 in the 21st and 22nd years and Rs. 1,600 in the 23rd year. No announcement has yet appeared in the press regarding the revision of the pay of the Provincial Service, nor have the Imperial officers yet drawn the pay which is said to have been sanctioned for them."

[*Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal ; Mr. Joseph ; Mr. Maynard.*]

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Posts of Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests.

73. " Will Government be pleased to state—

(*a*) How many posts of Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests are sanctioned for the Punjab Forest list.

(*b*) How many of such posts, if any, are still vacant ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

" (*a*) Three posts of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests are sanctioned.

" (*b*) All 3 are vacant, the senior Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on the cadre not yet having reached the maximum pay of his rank.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Salaries of Forest Rangers.

74. " Will Government be pleased to state —

" (*a*) Whether any scheme for re-organization of the salaries of Forest Rangers has lately been sanctioned ?

(*b*) What were the various grades of Rangers pay in 1890, 1900, 1910 and 1915, and what are they at present ?

" (*c*) How many and what increases, if any, have been made in the various grades of Forest Rangers under the scheme ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph replied :—

" (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) & (*c*) a statement* showing the increases is laid on the table. It will be observed that there are now 4 Rangers in the first grade on Rs. 200 against 1 on Rs. 150 in 1890 ; 6 on Rs. 150 against 1 on Rs. 120 in the second grade ; 8 on Rs. 125 against 1 on Rs. 100 in the third grade ; 12 on Rs. 100 against 5 on Rs. 80 in the 4th grade ; 16 on Rs. 80 against 11 on Rs. 60 in the 5th grade ; 19 on Rs. 60 against 5 on Rs. 50 in the 6th grade.

" The average pay drawn in 1890 by 24 Rangers was Rs. 70. The average pay now drawn by 65 Rangers is over Rs. 97."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

75. " Will Government be pleased to state how far it is correct—

Licensed liquor shops at Kangra.

" (*a*) That the licensed shops for the retail vend of country spirit in the towns of Kangra and Bhawan are situated outside the bazar but inside the Mohallas of residential quarters of respectable families consisting of ladies and young boys and girls ?

" (*b*) That the customers are allowed to drink the liquor on the premises of the shops in view of the neighbouring residents.

" (*c*) That the sale of country spirit in these shops has been continuously increasing by leaps and bounds."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

" (*a*) A reference will be made to the Deputy Commissioner of Kangra to ascertain whether the situation of the country spirit shops in the towns of Kangra and Bhawan is such as to justify the suggestion conveyed in the Hon'ble Member's question.

" (*b*) At present drinking is allowed on the premises of these shops. As mentioned in paragraph 35 of the last Excise Administration Report, the introduction of the sealed bottle system, with off consumption only, is under consideration for the whole of the Kangra District.

*See Appendix B.

"(*c*) In the Kangra District as a whole there was a diminution of consumption in the year ending 31st March 1919 of 835 gallons. As asked in question 10, the figures of consumption in the two particular shops referred to for the last five years will be obtained for the Hon'ble Member's information from the Deputy Commissioner."

Licensed liquor shops at Kangra.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

76. "Will Government be pleased to lay on the table—

"(*a*) A plan of the situation of these shops showing the distances of all the nearest houses round about the shops.

"(*b*) A statement showing the following particulars about each of the shops :—

"(1) Quantity of spirit sold in each shop during the last 5 years.

"(2) The population of the town to which each of the shop ordinarily supplies liquor.

"(3) The distance from the towns limits of the nearest shops outside the town."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"(*a*) The Government does not think it necessary or desirable to call upon the local authorities for the preparation of plans of the kind suggested. The local Municipality is, as stated below, the adviser of the Deputy Commissioner in regard to the location of shops, and has more complete information regarding the local situation than the suggested plans would convey.

"(*b*) The particulars asked for by the Hon'ble Member under heads 1, 2, 3, will be obtained from the Deputy Commissioner and laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal asked :—

Licensed liquor shops at Kangra.

77. "Will Government be pleased to consider the advisability of (*a*) omitting these shops from the list of the shops for retail vend to be licensed for the next year, (*b*) ordering the removal of these shops from the vicinity of the residential quarters in the Mohalla to a place outside the town, and (*c*) prohibiting the location of any shop for retail vend of country spirit in the Kucha or Mohalla of residential quarters of any town in the Punjab."

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"(*a*) The question of reducing existing shops wherever possible is receiving attention in Kangra as in other districts of the Province.

"As regards the location of shops the Hon'ble Member's attention is invited to Financial Commissioner's circular printed on page 335 of the Excise Manual, Volume I. A copy of that circular will be laid on the table, if desired. The Government has no doubt that if the Collector receives any representations regarding the situation of shops or the reduction of licenses from the local authorities to which the advisory function belongs he will duly consider the same.

"It is not clear what suggestion is intended to be conveyed by clause (*c*) of question 11, but the matter is one essentially dependent upon local conditions, and local bodies are the only qualified advisers upon it."

The Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah asked :—

Selection of Excise Inspectors for Extra Assistant Commissionerships.

78. "Has the attention of Government been drawn to paragraph 4 of Standing Order No. 11, that the Commissioner is required to send an Excise Inspector's name for selection as an Extra Assistant Commissioner candidate, and that there are 32 candidates for this post on the Financial Commissioners' Register A, and that the number of Tahsildars is 128 in the Punjab and the number of Excise Inspectors is 38?"

[*Mr. Maynard ; Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied:—

"The Government is aware of the contents of paragraphs 4 to 6 of Financial Commissioners' Standing Order No. 11. The Standing Order lays down that each Commissioner should keep the Financial Commissioners supplied with two nomination rolls of Register A candidates, provided that really fit candidates to these numbers are forthcoming, as well as of one or two Settlement Tahsildars or Naib-Tahsildars employed in settlements in progress in his division. The Commissioner may in addition submit a nomination roll of an Excise official employed in his division.

"It is correct that the number of candidates on the Financial Commissioners' Register A has for the present been limited to 32. This number includes the names of other officials as well as of Tahsildars and Excise officials as is stated in paragraph 4 of the Standing Order. The number of Tahsildars varies in accordance with Settlement requirements and is approximately as given in the question. The number of Excise Inspectors is only 35, and not 38 as supposed by the Hon'ble Member."

The Hon'ble Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah asked:—

79. "Will Government be pleased to state how many Excise Inspectors stand on the Financial Commissioners' Registers out of his 32 accepted candidates?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied:—

"Three."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Rajan Shah asked:—

80. "Is it true that only four Excise Inspectors have so far been accepted as Extra Assistant Commissioner candidates since April 1910 when the Department was re-organized?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied:—

"Four Excise Inspectors and one Distillery Superintendent have so far been brought on to the Financial Commissioners' Register A."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Rajan Shah asked:—

81. "Will Government be pleased to ask the Financial Commissioners to reserve 8 vacancies on their register A for Excise Inspectors as their proportion with the Tahsildars is something like 1 to 3?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied:—

"The Hon'ble Member is labouring under a misapprehension. As already stated in the answer to Question 1 the Financial Commissioners' Register A is meant for the inclusion of names not only of Tahsildars and Excise Inspectors but also of Superintendents of Divisional and District offices and persons recommended by the Directors of Agriculture, Industries, Land Records and also of persons recommended by the Registrar of Co-operative Societies. Other deserving officials employed in offices subordinate to the Financial Commissioners can also be accepted on this register, and the Financial Commissioners therefore cannot bind themselves to reserve $\frac{1}{4}$th of the total number for the Excise Department alone."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Rajan Shah asked:—

82. "Will Government be pleased to make a concession to Excise Inspectors of 5 years' standing for appearance in the Extra Assistant Commissioner examination without being accepted as candidates in the same manner as Financial Commissioners has given the concession to Sadr Kanungos of 2 years' standing and other Revenue officials for appearance in Tahsildars' examination under Standing Order 12, Appendix B, rule (4), clause III?"

[*Mr. Maynard ; Sayad Makhdum Rajan Shah ; Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava ; Mr. J. P. Thompson ; Colonel MacWatt.*]

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"Government do not regard the course suggested as desirable."

The Hon'ble Makhdum Rajan Shah asked :—

83. "Is it true that the starting pay of the Excise Inspectors is still Rs. 125 below that of the Tahsildars and that some of the Inspectors could not earn promotion notwithstanding good work since 1910 ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Maynard replied :—

"It is not certain what this question means. The Excise Inspectors are now paid according to a time scale recently introduced and starting at Rs. 125 (as contrasted with Rs. 100 which was originally the lowest pay of an Inspector). The suggested comparison with the pay of a Tahsildar is misleading. When the new time scale for Sub-Inspectors and Inspectors of Excise was arranged, the object in view was to put the prospects of an officer entering the Excise service as a Sub-Inspector approximately on the same footing as that of an officer starting as a Naib Tahsildar with the prospect of promotion in due course to the rank of Tahsildar. It is believed that that object has been approximately attained. The time scale pay of Inspectors rises from Rs. 125 to Rs. 225, and there is a small grade on Rs. 250 which is to be filled by selection of the most meritorious. The suggestion that there has been no promotion since 1910 is apparently based on conditions existent prior to the introduction of the time scale."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Punjab Disturbances.

84. "Will the Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement (so far as it can be ascertained) showing name, parentage, residence and profession as well as the period of custody along with the reasons for arrest, detention and release of all the persons arrested, detained in custody and released without trial during the period of the recent disturbances in the Province ?

85. "Will the Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing (*a*) the name, residence, and age, (*b*) the period of custody, (*c*) the result whether released without trial, tried, discharged, acquitted or sentenced or dealt otherwise, of all the legal practitioners in the Province arrested during the recent disturbances."

Action under Legal Practitioner's Act.

86. "Will the Government be pleased to state the names of the legal practitioners against whom proceedings for disciplinary action may have been taken under the provisions of the Legal Practitioners' Act, and the result of the same ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. J. P. Thompson replied :—

"The information asked for in questions 84, 85 and 86 is being collected and will be supplied to the Hon'ble Member when complete."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Admission in Medical College.

87. "(*a*) Is Government aware that the students who were among the first 5 in order of merit in their University Examinations have been refused admission in the Medical College during the last 2 years ?

"(*b*) Will the Government be pleased to state if there are any rules regulating admission into the College, and, if so, will the Government be pleased to lay them on the table ?"

The Hon'ble Col. MacWatt replied :—

"(*a*) Government is aware that some of the first five students of each class of F. Sc. candidates in each of the last two years have failed to secure admission into the Medical College in consequence of the orders

issued in 1917 that candidates who, themselves, or their near relatives had assisted Government during the Great War should be given preference. All B. Sc. candidates, however, have been admitted each year.

"(*b*) The rules regarding admission to the King Edward Medical College are contained in paragraphs 1 and 2 of the Prospectus* a copy of which is laid on the table."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Rustication of Medical students during the disturbances.

88. "(*a*) Will Government be pleased to state the names and the year of study of the students of the King Edward Memorial Medical College, Lahore, rusticated by the Principal of that institution after consultation with the local martial law authority as well as the names and the year of study of students detained and otherwise punished by him ?

"(*b*) Is it a fact that in the local Government College and other institutions offending students are rusticated only after the whole College Council has carefully considered their cases ?

"(*c*) Does any such Council exist in the Medical College ?

"(*d*) If not, will the Government be pleased to direct that a College Council be brought into existence in the Medical College in order that the whole College staff may carefully consider cases of offending students and the question may not be left to the discretion of one individual ?"

The Hon'ble Col. MacWatt replied :—

"(*a*) The list asked for is laid on the table :† but I may state, for the information of the Hon'ble Member, that the punishments have been revised in accordance with the suggestions of the Committee recently appointed by Government to consider the case of students punished in May last.

"(*b*) The answer is in the affirmative as regards the Government College. In the case of other Government institutions such as the Central Training and Veterinary Colleges no College Councils exist.

"(*c*) The answer is in the affirmative.

"(*d*) The necessity does not arise as a College Council already exists : this Council is purely consultative for the Principal in matters affecting College life : questions of discipline are dealt with by the Principal, Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals and Government, and not by the College Council."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Chair of Physiology in Medical College.

89. "In view of the resolution of this Council regarding the filling of one of the chairs either of Physiology or Anatomy by an Indian, will the Government be pleased to consider the advisability of appointing an Indian (non-I. M. S.), to the chair of Physiology on the retirement of Dr. Caleb."

The Hon'ble Col. MacWatt replied :—

"The resolution of this Council to which the Hon'ble Member refers made no mention of the chairs of either Anatomy or of Physiology being filled by an Indian : the resolution as accepted by the Council ran as follows :—

'This Council recommends to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor that recruitment for the Professorship of Anatomy or of Physiology in the Medical College, Lahore, be not restricted to the I.M.S., and that suitable qualified men outside the I.M.S. be eligible for the post.'

*Not printed.
†See appendix C.

[*Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava ; Mr. Gibson ; Mr. Townsend.*]

"The Hon'ble Mover of the resolution and the Hon'ble Members who supported the resolution emphasised the fact that the object in view was not to secure anything particular for any particular class or section of a class or to benefit Indians, but to secure the best available graduate whether British or Indian. The question of a successor to Dr. Caleb on his retirement shortly has recently been considered by the Government of India, and an I.M.S. officer has been selected to succeed Dr. Caleb."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Pay of clerical establishment.

90. "Will Government be pleased to state—

"(*a*) the approximate time when the proposal regarding the increase of pay for the subordinate clerical services is likely to be given effect to ;

"(*b*) the percentage of pay to be given as increment."

The Hon'ble Mr. Gibson replied :—

"(*a*) The Hon'ble Member is referred to the answer given to question 6 asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Dass.

"(*b*) No information other than that contained in the reply to question 5 asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Ram Saran Dass can at present be given.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Technical Education in the Punjab.

91. "(*a*) Will the Government be pleased to state what has been done during the last twelve months in the matter of diffusion and improvement of technical education in the Province ?

"(*b*) Will the Government be pleased to state if any conference referred to in column (2) last four lines, column (3) first nine lines, on page 5 of the issue of the *Civil and Military Gazette*, dated the 14th August 1919, were held to consider industrial problems, and if there was any suggestion for the establishment of an institution on the lines of an English polytechnic to impart technical knowledge required by the various trades ?

"(*c*) If so, did the Government accept the suggestion and, in the event of the reply being in the affirmative, when does the Government intend to establish the polytechnic ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"(*a*) A series of meetings of the Standing Committee on Industrial and Technical Education have been held during the year, and the recommendations of the Committee for the improvement of the training given in Industrial schools conducted by local bodies, by the introduction of sound courses in craft work, by a more liberal system of grants-in-aid, and by the provision of an Assistant Inspector of Industrial schools have been accepted by the Local Government.

"The system of Industrial Education adopted provides a progressive course of training through the Primary and Middle Industrial schools up to special craft schools in wood and metal work. The new courses of instruction have already been prepared and are now in the press, while a craft school for carpentry is being established at Jullundur with a grant of 1½ lakhs from Imperial Funds : the ground has been selected and the plans prepared.

"The Standing Committee have also considered and made proposals for the training of Mechanical Engineers, probably in Moghalpura in connection with the North-Western Railway Workshops, and with the help of a new Technical Institution adjacent. These proposals are now before the Government of India.

"(*b*) A very recent meeting of the Standing Committee and other gentlemen was held to consider the establishment of a polytechnic in Lahore, as the Committee was strongly of opinion that many industries, essential to progress in the province, which could not be taught in separate institutions, could be combined in one building with efficiency and economy. Industries such as motor-car mechanism, house painting, plumbing and pipe laying, lead and sink working, plastering and glazing and others were suggested. The Committee have under considerations proposals for the purchase of a suitable site for a polytechnic in Lahore. Some difficulties are however being encountered. No proposals to this end have yet been put before Government. They are still under the consideration of the Committee."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Pandit Jawahar Lal, Bhargava, asked :—

Pay of Clerical Establishment.

91. "In view of the fact that ghi forms such an essential part of the every-day diet of almost all the subjects of the Crown and that the prices have abnormally increased and have become almost prohibitive, is the Government prepared to take any steps to lower the price of ghi and consider in this connection the advisibility of stopping the export of ghi from this province ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Townsend replied :—

"Government greatly regrets the rise in the price of ghi which has shown itself in the past year. In the opinion of the Government this rise is very largely due to the marked scarcity of fodder of all kinds, including cotton seed which occurred during the past year, owing to the failure of the monsoon of 1918. The fodder position has however considerably improved of late, thanks to the recent monsoon, and it may be expected that this factor will, in time, have its effect in lowering the price of ghi.

"No practicable steps which would lower the price of ghi, without driving that article into markets outside the province, present themselves to Government. An examination of the trade figures shows that the Punjab annually imports over 2,200 tons more ghi than it exports. The import in the financial year that concluded last March was greater than in any of its four predecessors. Prohibition of the export of ghi from the province is impracticable even if the Government of India were to agree to it. As the figures just given show, this province would suffer more than it would gain from such a policy, as the provinces now exporting ghi to the Punjab might forbid such exports if export were prohibited from the Punjab."

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE.

Answer by the Hon'ble Mr. Gibson to question No. 8 asked by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal on the 7th April 1919.

"At the meeting on the 7th April the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal was informed in reply to question No. 4 put by him on that day that the information on the subject was being collected and that an answer would be furnished at the next meeting of the Council.

"It has now been ascertained that during the years 1909-10 and 1914-15 Rs. 75 and Rs. 44, respectively, have been spent by the Kangra District Board in connection with the agricultural development of the district. Rs. 176 have been spent from the same source during the year 1918 on industrial development. No Government grant has been given for any of the objects mentioned in the Hon'ble Member's question."

[*Mr. Joseph ; Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan ; Mr. Fazl-i-Hussain ; His Honour the President.*]

PUNJAB CUSTOM (POWER TO CONTEST) BILL.

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph :—"Your Honour, In the meeting of Council held on the 6th of February Mr. Craik when introducing the Punjab Custom (Power to Contest) Bill gave some account of its genesis and its provisions. In doing so he said that his regret at leaving the Council was tampered with satisfaction at resigning charge of so difficult, if not so contentious a measure, a task which he modestly felt to be beyond his powers. These, I venture to think, he underrated, but no one regrets his departure so sincerely as the member who is now in charge of the Bill. It is unnecessary at the present stage for me to repeat the account Mr. Craik gave of the purpose of the Bill or to recapitulate on this occasion the arguments then employed for or against it. It will be remembered that the discussion centred on two alternative proposals either of referring the Bill at once to a Select Committee or of circulating it again for opinion. The latter was the course desired by the Government of India and after full discussion finally adopted in this Council. The opinions which we have now received (copies of which I have with me, if any one wishes to see them) are largely criticisms of matter of detail and add little to the body of opinion which was already before Government. They are on the whole in favour of the general principle of the Bill which some would see even further tightened up so as to limit the power to contest alienation or appointment of an heir even more strictly than the Bill itself proposes to do. On the other hand, there are at least two Deputy Commissioners, who report that the conservative instincts of the people of their districts are on principle averse to the introduction of any legislation of this kind. These results were reported to the Government of India and they have agreed to the Bill being proceeded with.

"I now accordingly formally move to refer it to a Select Committee consisting of—

The Hon'ble Mr. Fagan.

The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh,

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazal-i-Hussain.

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai, and

myself."

The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Mirza Ikram Ullah Khan :—"Your Honour, I move an amendment that one more member be added to the Select Committee, and, if permitted by Your Honour, I would propose Rao Bahadur Chaudhari Lal Chand to be elected to this Committee."

The Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-i-Hussain :—"Your Honour, I support the amendment that has been moved by my Hon'ble colleague, chiefly on the ground that the Bill deals entirely with the question of custom—a custom generally affecting the agricultural classes ; and it seems to me desirable that on the Select Committee a member who is governed by the custom which we seek to modify be added."

His Honour the President :—"I fancy the Council will agree with the two members who have just spoken, and if they have no objection I would add Chaudhari Lal Chand."

The motion that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee consisting of the Hon'ble Mr. Fagan, the Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh, the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazl-i-Hussian, the Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai, the Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Chaudhari Lal Chand and the Hon'ble Mr. Joseph was put and agreed to.

PUNJAB LIMITATION (CUSTOM) BILL.

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph :—"Your Honour,—The Bill which I shall shortly ask leave to introduce is one to amend and consolidate the law governing the limitation of suits relating to alienation of ancestral immoveable property and appointments of heirs by persons who follow agricultural custom in the Punjab.

"When Mr. Craik introduced the Bill which has just been referred to a Select Committee he explained how the two questions which are part and parcel of the same policy, and were originally dealt with in one draft were at the suggestion of the Codification Committee separated into two Bills. The present Bill deals solely with questions of limitation.

"The law of limitation as it at present exists is to be found partly in the Indian Limitation Act, 1908, and partly in the Punjab Limitation (Ancestral Land Alienation) Act of 1900. The former governs the case of suits for a declaration that an alleged adoption is valid or that it is invalid or never took place: for a suit for a declaratory decree brought in her life time that an alienation effected by a female is void at her death or re-marriage or for suits to recover possession of land on the death of a female who has alienated it during her life time. The Punjab Limitation Act of 1900 governs the case of suits by the sons or reversioners of a male proprietor for a declaration that an alienation of ancestral land made by him is void or to recover possession of land so alienated by him. So far as the present measure seeks to consolidate these provisions in one statute it will be generally conceded that it is a useful Bill. It does not however stop short at consolidation but alterations of the law as well as consolidation are contemplated. The recommendations of the Simla Conference on the question of alteration were as follows:—

(1) That the period of limitation for a declaratory suit in regard to an alienation, whether by a male or a female, be reduced to 6 years.

(2) That limitation for a suit for possession (where no declaratory decree has been obtained) by contesting an alienation by a male or female be reduced to 6 years' time to run as laid down in the Punjab Limitation Act, 1900.

(3) That this Conference recommend a rule applying *mutatis mutandis* the principles of the above suggested rules to suits—

(*a*) for the possession of land where the setting aside of an adoption is a question involved,

(*b*) for a declaration that an adoption is invalid.

"I should like for a a moment, with Your Honour's permission, to take the Council back for 20 years to explain the origin of the Punjab Limitation Act, 1900. It used to be supposed that 12 years' actual possession gave a man a clear title to his land until a decree of the Punjab Chief Court in 1895 established the principle that the limitation for a suit to recover possession of land alienated by the last male owner was 12 years—not from the date of alienation or from the date of transfer of possession—but 12 years from the date of the last owner's death. It will be obvious to the Council that the result of this ruling was to enable the postponement of the suit till a period when any testimony as to the necessity of the alienation or as to the custom obtaining in the family that governed it would be exceedingly difficult to obtain and when obtained exceedingly unreliable; and it might also result in the dispossession of a transferee who had been in possession of his property for a very considerable period and who had long reasonably believed that his title was secure. This is the reason that the Act of 1900 was passed. The

Act provided that the limitation for a suit of a declaratory nature in the case of alienations made by a male proprietor was 12 years from the date on which mutation was attested by the revenue officer or if it had not been so attested the date from which physical possession of land alienated was transferred, while in the case of a mortgage without possession it was 12 years from the date of the alienation. At the same time the limitation for a suit by the heir of a male proprietor to recover possession of ancestral land alienated during his life time by a male owner was also fixed at 12 years and the date from which the period of limitation ran was if no declaratory decree had been obtained identical with the date from which limitation would have begun to run, in the case of a suit for a declaratory decree, while if a declaratory decree had been obtained the period of 12 years' limitation ran from the date of the alienor's death. The result of this provision was this, that if the person aggrieved did not exercise his right of bringing a suit for a declaratory decree but chose to wait until the alienor's death in order to exercise his ultimate right of bringing a suit for possession of the land so alienated he ran the risk of finding that the alienor lived for more than 12 years after the date of transfer by which time, inasmuch as the *terminus a quo* of the limitation in the cases of suits for possession where no declaratory decree had been obtained was the same as it was in the case of suits for a declaratory decree itself, he would never be able to bring a suit for possession at all ; for by the time that his cause of action accrued with the alienor's death the limitation had already *ex hypothesi* expired owing to the alienor living for 12 years after the transaction. It therefore became in the interests of any person aggrieved by such an alienation to avoid this risk and to bring a suit for a declaratory decree within 12 years of the alienation when testimony as to custom and as to the necessity of the alienation was still easily obtainable and reasonably reliable.

"This principle which is the governing principle of the Bill is then already in operation in the Punjab Limitation Act of 1900. The point is no doubt familiar to the legal gentlemen who are members of this Council, and I am sure my brother laymen who have not had to study the point will accept this statement of the fact. One alteration made in our present Bill and a very important alteration is to affirm this principle as a definite proposition of law instead of leaving it to be deduced from the somewhat intricate provisions of the schedule of 1900 in which it lies enshrouded or may I say enshrined.

"In the second place we propose to reduce the period of limitation allowed in the Punjab Limitation Act from 12 years to 6, or, in cases where the declaratory decree has already been obtained, to 3 years. That is a provision which will tend to expedite the decision of questions of title while still leaving all persons interested ample opportunity for institution of their suits. In the next place it is proposed to apply the same principle to certain other classes of cases to which the Punjab Limitation Act of 1900 does not apply. The schedule of the Act of 1900 specifically limited the application of the Act to suits, for a declaratory decree or to recover possession, by sons or reversioners of a male preprietor—suits by the heir of a male proprietor governed by the Customary Law of the Punjab to recover possession of ancestral land alienated by such proprietor during his lifetime. Under the law as it stands at present if a male land owner is succeeded by his widow with a life interest in the property and she alienates the land then the limitation for a suit for possession is by the Indian Limitation Act, 1908, 12 years from her death. It is perfectly true that the person aggrieved has still his option of bringing a declaratory suit within 12 years from the date of alienation, but there is nothing to compel him to do so and in the absence of any such provision as exists in the Punjab Limitation Act in the case of suits to contest alienations by a male proprietor there is nothing to induce him to do so. If he does not do so, he can still exercise his ultimate right of bringing a suit for possession. Suppose the widow lives for 40 years after the alienation, the vendee, donee or mortgagee, whatever it

may be, may find his title impugned after half a century of actual possession. This is no imaginary case, as a case is reported where such a suit was brought after 60 years and still found to be within time. It is therefore proposed to compel the person aggrieved to exercise his option of bringing a declaratory suit at the risk of ultimately being defeated by the widow's longevity as he already is compelled in the case of alienations by the male proprietor, and in the one case as in the other the period is proposed to be put at 6 years. Further, we propose to apply the same principles to the class of cases where suits arise for declaratory decrees or for possession out of adoption or appointment of heirs by a proprietor, male or female, as we do to the occasions where they arise from alienation of the property. The schedule of the Bill provides for all these cases, and in every single case the period of limitation proposed is 6 years, except where a suit for possession follows a declaratory decree when three years has been considered sufficient for such suits to recover possession.

"The Bill as originally drafted was widely circulated for opinion in the summer of 1917 under the title of the Punjab Limitation Act. The reception it received was on the whole very favourable, but there were a number of criticisms both of the title and of particular provisions of the Bill. These were considered by the same committee which, as explained by Mr. Craik in February last, revised the original draft of the sister Bill just referred to a Select Committee and it was very much simplified in the course of this process. As redrafted the Bill was again circulated for opinion. Its reception was still more favourable but the drafting was still further amended in the light of a final scrutiny to which it was subjected in a Small Committee consisting of two eminent Judges of the High Court, the late Secretary to this Council, and myself. The opportunity was taken again to change the title to the present one of the Punjab Limitation (Custom) Act as it was felt that Customary Limitation Act was an unsuitable title in view of the fact that limitation is not customary at all but statutory. Sanction of the Governor-General to the introduction of the Bill was received in June last, though some minor alterations in the drafting have been made in accordance with suggestions conveyed by the Legislative Department.

"I now formally move that leave be given for the introduction of the Bill."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. Joseph:—"I now introduce the Bill and move that it be referred to the same Select Committee which has just been appointed to deal with the sister Bill. I hope I have already made the general scope and objects of the Bill clear, but I will run briefly through the clauses.

"Clause 1 is merely a definition clause.

"Clause 2 repeals the existing Punjab Limitation Act, but

"Class 5 re-enacts the provision of section 2 thereof incidentally with a correction—so as to make the operation respectively of the local law and the Indian Limitation Act clear.

"Clause 4 protects rights which have already been effectively asserted, from the operation of the law while clause 6 gives a year's grace within which to assert—and assert promptly—all rights which have not yet been effectively asserted and would otherwise be already time-barred under the shorter period of limitation now provided. The section is perhaps not very happily worded, and the Select Committee may be able to make it more succinct but equally clear.

[*Mr. Joseph.*]

"Clause 7 is the really important clause—the clause which I have already explained and which specifically lays down that a suit for possession of ancestral immoveable property on the ground that its alienation or the appointment of an heir is not binding on the plaintiff should be considered time-barred if a suit for a declaration would be time barred unless a declaratory suit has been instituted within the period specified in the schedule. This clause contains the assertion of the principle already contained in the Act of 1900 and extended in the present Bill that the reversioner must exercise his discretionary right to bring a declaratory suit within the period allowed for that purpose unless he wishes to see his ultimate right to bring a suit for possession go by default, or accrue still-born. Sir Edward Chamier, the late distinguished Chief Judge of the High Court of Patna and now Legal Adviser to the India Office, has made a criticism of a highly technical nature which should be considered by the Select Committee in dealing with this section. 'Ordinarily,' he says, 'a suit for declaratory relief of the kind indicated in article I of the schedule can be brought during the life of a Hindu female only by the presumptive reversioners. If he fails to sue within the time prescribed and dies before the female it is not clear whether the person who takes his place will be affected by clause 7.' Now, according to rulings governing the right of the next reversioner to sue when the first is in collusion with the alienor or refuses without sufficient reason to act, it would seem that the next reversioner would be permitted to sue within the period of six years provided the nearest reversioner failed to do so when called upon. But to allow him to do so after 6 years would keep the title indefinitely in suspense. This point will however be further considered by the Select Committee.

"Clause 8 give statutory force to the rule of law that a declaratory decree in favour of one person entitled to impeach an alienation or appointment of an heir shall ensure for the benefit of all persons entitled to impeach the alienation or the appointment of an heir. The principle is already incorporated in the explanation to the schedule of the Punjab Limitation Act of 1900 and is well recognised.

"Articles 1 and 2 of the schedule reproduce or rather replace so as to cover the acts of the female proprietor as well as of the male. Articles 1 and 2 of the schedule of the Punjab Limitation Act, while the period of limitation is reduced as explained, and the *terminus aquo* is better defined. In case of a registered deed the date of registration is now taken as the starting point. Articles 3 and 5 are merely consolidating ones, that is to say, they reproduce the corresponding provision of the schedule of the Indian Limitation Act so as to bring all the cases together in one Act.

"Articles 4 and 6 are new and are necessary as there is a conflict of opinion as to what article of the Indian Limitation Law at present governs such cases and whether the limitation is 6 years or 12.

"I beg leave to move that the Bill be now referred to a Select Committee consisting of the same members who have just been appointed to deal with the sister Bill, namely :—

The Hon'ble Mr. Fagan,
The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Gajjan Singh,
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Fazal-i-Hussain,
The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Diwan Daulat Rai,
The Hon'ble Chaudhari Lal Chand and myself."

The motion was put and agreed to.

ADJOURNMENT.

The Council adjourned *sine die*.

LAHORE:—
The 10th November 1919.

M. HARRISON,
Secretary.

APPENDIX A!

(*Vide* ANSWER TO RAM SARAN DAS QUESTION 12.)

Proceedings of His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab in the Home Department, No. 4572-S., dated Simla, the 3rd October 1919.

READ—

The proceedings of a Committee appointed to consider the subject of the increased employment of zamindars in the Civil Departments under the Punjab Government.

REMARKS.—At the meeting of the Punjab Legislative Council, held on the 9th February 1918, the Hon'ble Mr. J. P. Thompson, Chief Secretary, in reply to a question by the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Chaudhri Lal Chand indicated the intention of the Local Government to appoint a committee of officials and non-officials to consider the question of the representation of "zamindars" in the public services of the Province. In pursuance of that intention a committee under the presidency of the Hon'ble Mr. H. J. Maynard, Financial Commissioner, was appointed by His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor in the following March. The Committee held several meetings, its enquiries and deliberations extending up to November 1918. Its proceedings with its recommendations were finally submitted to the Local Government under cover of a letter No. 2—766-13 of the 3rd December 1918, from the Assistant Secretary to the Financial Commissioners. They have been submitted to very careful and lengthy scrutiny and consideration by His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor who now finds himself in a position to formulate his views on the highly important subject under reference, and the general issues which it involves, for the information and guidance of the Heads of Departments and of all other officials concerned.

The recommendations of the Committee embraced the non-gazetted as well as the gazetted services of the Province, excluding, however, the employés of local bodies and such officials as patwaris, constables, other than head constables, jail warders, forest guards and menials. The scope of the present resolution will cover generally the same ground and be of similar extension.

2. Before, however, the various services are dealt with in such detail as may be necessary a very important question presents itself for consideration, in connection with which His Honour does not find himself in agreement with the views of the majority of the Committee. For the purposes of its enquiries and suggestions the Committee laid down at an early stage of its proceedings that the word "zamindar" should mean a member of the agricultural tribes notified under the Alienation of Land Act. In the letter forwarding the results of the Committee's deliberations it was stated that the Hon'ble Mr. Maynard disagreed with this decision and desired to dissociate himself therefrom. After careful consideration of the question, His Honour is of opinion that the definition accepted by the Committee is unduly restrictive and is to some extent based on a misconception of the objects underlying the Alienation of Land Act. The intention of that measure is not to define exhaustively who are and who are not the persons whose real interests lie in the land and in agricultural callings, but to protect certain classes of landed proprietors and occupancy tenants by the imposition of disabilities from the consequences of their own economic weakness and of educational and other deficiencies. Much less it is the intention of the Act to place particular rural tribes in a position which can in any proper sense be treated as one of privilege. His Honour, accordingly, is pleased to hold that for the purposes in view the term "zamindar" should include all hereditary proprietors or tenure holders of agricultural land mainly dependent thereon and residing in rural areas, as well as actual cultivators of such land.

3. On the question of the propriety and desirability of paying due regard to the interests of land owners and the rural population in respect of employment in the public services of the Province, His Honour does not think it necessary to say much in view of the broad and patent facts of the situation. Of the total population of the Punjab according to the figures of the last census 90 per cent. live in areas which are classed as rural while 54 per cent. are zamindars as defined in the last paragraph or the dependents of such. Zamindars, in addition to paying other demands, contribute some 380 lakhs of land revenue and 270 lakhs in canal occupiers' rates to the fiscal receipts of the Province, or roughly 66 per cent. or two-thirds of the total Provincial and Imperial income derived from it by the State. Considerations based on such broad figures as the above are reinforced by the not less important fact that education and enlightenment are spreading with considerable rapidity among the rural and agricultural classes, not only directly through the agency of educational institutions, but indirectly by such means as the opening of railways, the improvement of communications, the development of canal colonies, the notable spread of the co-operative movement, the activities of the Publicity organization, and last but not the least by the experience of foreign countries which has been gained by many of the very large number of soldiers which the zamindars of the Province contribute to the ranks of the Indian Army. Facts such as the above indicate in the Lieutenant-Governor's opinion that time has come for definitely securing to the landed classes an adequate representation in the public services of the Province. But any standard proportions which may be laid down for this purpose must of course be taken subject to the proviso that a sufficient number of candidates of adequate educational qualifications will be forthcoming as they may be required from time to time.

4. Turning now to a consideration of particular services, and dealing first with the Provincial Civil Service of Extra Assistant Commissioners, in both its executive and judicial branches, it appears from the statistics collected by the Committee that somewhat more than 40 per cent. of the officers at present included in it are of the zamindar class, while if European and Anglo-Indian officials be excluded the proportion rises to 46 per cent. In this connection a majority of the Committee, while it recognised that efficiency must be the main test in so far as appointments to these posts are made by promotions, and was at the same time satisfied that the policy on which Government acts in making appointments is calculated to give a reasonable proportion of them to zamindars, recommended that the power of direct nomination should be exercised by Government so as to maintain the proportion of zamindar Extra Assistant Commissioners at not less than half of the total number exclusive of Europeans and Anglo-Indians. His Honour after full consideration accepts the general conclusion that after excluding European and Anglo-Indian officers one-half of the remaining strength of the Provincial Service, both in its executive and judicial branches, should consist of officers who are members of the zamindar classes. The means by which such a result is to be secured and maintained must, His Honour considers, be such as will be operative at the stage of recruitment. They cannot therefore be laid down with precision until orders have been passed on the recommendations made by the Public Services Commission in Annexure X of its report regarding the methods of recruitment to be employed in future for the Provincial Civil Service.

5. As regards the existing cadre of Tahsildars and Naib-Tahsildars, the Committee found that of the total posts included in the former 42 per cent. are occupied by zamindars, the corresponding proportion in the latter being 45 per cent. If the term "zamindar" be understood in the somewhat wider sense adopted in this resolution these proportions would probably be slightly greater. The Lieutenant-Governor is of opinion that a somewhat higher proportion is both desirable and practicable in the case of these classes of

officials than in that of Extra Assistant Commissioners; but in the process of securing this result in the case of the cadre of Tahsildars a considerable period must necessarily elapse since, with the exception of a very few direct appointments, the cadre is filled entirely by promotions from that of Naib-Tahsildars. It is only in connection with the recruitment of the latter that the necessary changes can be effected. The Committee was of opinion that of the total number of candidates selected for the posts of Naib-Tahsildars 66 per cent. should be zamindars.

This proportion is in the Lieutenant-Governor's opinion appropriate and he is pleased to accept the Committee's recommendation for its adoption. The Financial Commissioners will be requested to propose such modifications in the existing rules for recruitment of Naib-Tahsildars as may be necessary in this connection. The ultimate result will be that in due time two-thirds of the officers included in the combined cadre of Tahsildars and Naib-Tahsildars will belong to zamindar classes.

6. In the case of the subordinate judicial service of Munsifs the proportion of officers who are zamindars according to the Committee's definition of the term is only 29 per cent., but here again the true proportion is probably somewhat higher though in itself comparatively low. The Committee's recommendation in this case was that out of the total appointments to Munsifships made either by direct nomination or by selection from clerical and other services 66 per cent. should be given to zamindars, no similar restriction, however, being imposed as regards appointments filled by competition. In connection with the general subject of the present resolution the case of Munsifs is clearly one of very considerable importance, not only because the majority of this class of officials is in the execution of its duties brought into close daily contact with the agricultural classes but also because many of the posts in the judicial branch of the Provincial Civil Service are filled by officers selected from it. On both these grounds, as well as on the general grounds already noticed, the Lieutenant-Governor is of opinion that the presence of a substantial zamindar element in the Munsif service is very desirable provided always that duly qualified candidates are forthcoming in sufficient numbers. He therefore agrees with the Committee so far as to hold that a proportion of 66 per cent. of non-competitive appointments to be allotted to zamindars should be adopted as an ultimate standard to be reached as soon as may be possible consistently with the above proviso and with the maintenance of the efficiency of the subordinate judiciary. The future of the Munsif service, however, as regards status and recruitment is dependent in some degree on the decisions which may be reached on the recommendations made in paragraph 51 of annexure X of the report of the Public Services Commission, and it is therefore not possible to lay down at present the precise means by which effect can be given to the standard of 66 per cent, which His Honour considers to be desirable. The entire question will form the subject of further consultation with the Hon'ble Judges of the High Court.

7. In the Excise Department the proportion of zamindars among Inspectors is 35 per cent. The Committee recommended that one-half of all new appointments should be allotted to zamindars. This proportion His Honour considers reasonable and he is pleased to prescribe it for the future. The Financial Commissioners will be requested to make such modifications as may be necessary in the rules for recruitment to the Excise Department.

8. Turning next to the Agricultural Department, which is capable at present of indefinite expansion and the future importance of which it is difficult to over-estimate, it appears from the statistics collected by the Committee that, excluding clerical posts and posts below that of upper subordinate, out of those filled by Indians 55 per cent. are held by zamindars. The Committee's opinion was that inasmuch as special technical qualifications are required in this

Department all that is possible is to give preference to zamindars as between candidates who are equal in the above respect. His Honour has no hesitation in accepting this view pending the time when arrangements now under consideration for stimulating the entrance of zamindars to the Lyallpur College shall have been effective and have rendered it possible to prescribe a definite and suitable proportion of posts in the Department to be allotted to zamindars.

9. In the Veterinary Department, including subordinate but excluding clerical posts, 66 per cent. of the Provincial Service Indian officers are zamindars. This proportion is satisfactory and should be maintained in future appointments to the Department.

10. In the Department of Co-operative Societies 90 per cent. of the posts are held by zamindars, and in view of the fact that by far the greater part of the work of the Department is concerned with rural areas, such a proportion is by no means unreasonable. It should not, His Honour considers, be allowed to fall below 80 per cent., and at least this proportion of fresh appointments should be allotted to zamindar candidates.

11. Of the total provincial and subordinate (exclusive of clerical) posts in the Forest Department down to and inclusive of the rank of Forester 48 per cent. are according to the statistics filled by zamindars. The Committee's recommendations in this case were similar to those made by it in that of the Agricultural Department, and it appears that the present practice complies with them; that is to say, that among candidates who are equal in respect of the technical qualifications which are necessary preference is given to zamindars. In view, however, of the nature of the work of the Department and of its very intimate connection with the daily life and occupations of the rural population of the tracts affected, His Honour regards it as desirable to lay down a definite proportion as the standard to be attained as soon as possible, subject of course to the candidates who are appointed possessing the needful technical qualifications. The proportion which His Honour is pleased to prescribe in this connection is 66 per cent., that is to say, two-thirds of the candidates appointed, inclusive of those sent to the Forest schools for training, should be zamindars. He recognises that this standard cannot be immediately attained, but continuous efforts should be made to reach it within a reasonable period.

12. In the Jail Department less than 33 per cent. of the present staff of Jailors are zamindars. Considerable difficulty is experienced in securing candidates, and in view of this fact His Honour does not think it necessary to prescribe any definite standard, though the desirability of recruiting a fair proportion of properly qualified zamindars should be kept in view.

13. Out of the total number of posts of Inspector, Sub-Inspector and Head Constable existing at present in the Police Department and held by Indians somewhat more than 56 per cent. are filled by zamindars. The Committee, in agreement with the views of the Inspector-General of Police, that zamindars qualified for direct appointment as Inspectors or Sub-Inspectors are difficult to secure, abstained from making any definite recommendations. It is stated, however, that it is the traditional practice of the Department to recruit qualified zamindars so far as they are available. As regards this, the Lieutenant-Governor would observe that the figures seem to indicate with some degree of clearness that a standard of at least 50 per cent. is immediately practicable, while if sufficiently qualified zamindars are forthcoming in considerable numbers for such posts as those of Extra Assistant Commissioner and Tahsildar, there seems to be no very good reason why they should not be equally obtainable for the posts of Deputy Superintendent, Inspector and Sub-Inspector of Police. He is disposed to believe that a steady and systematic infusion of a larger zamindar element into those grades would be decidedly beneficial from several points of view. In the light of the above considerations, His Honour

desires that in future at least one-half of the direct appointments by nomination to these grades should be given to zamindars subject to the general condition already laid down that candidates of adequate educational qualifications are available.

14. In the Education Department the proportion of Indian officers holding Provincial, subordinate and special posts other than clerical who are zamindars is about 25 per cent.; a decidedly low standard. In the case of Provincial Service Officers' posts and in that of special appointments it falls to 13 and 5 per cent. respectively, while in the case of subordinate posts it is 27 per cent. The reduction of so large a preponderance of the non-zamindar element in the educational staff of the Province is, in the Lieutenant-Governor's view, a measure calculated to help largely in the removal on the one hand of existing deficiencies in our educational system and in increasing its popularity on the other. In order to secure an adequate expansion of primary education in rural areas it is very desirable that teachers of rural extraction and accessible to rural ideas and influences should be obtained. Again, inasmuch as the Provincial Service is recruited by means of promotions from the subordinate service, an increase in the proportion of officers of the zamindar classes in the former obviously demands a similar increase in the latter. On both the above grounds, therefore, a larger admixture of the zamindar element in the subordinate service is desirable. His Honour recognises that before the object in view can be attained certain preliminary difficulties may have to be faced to which allusion was made in the proceedings of the Committee. The Lieutenant-Governor proposes, therefore, before arriving at a final conclusion on the subject under treatment in relation to the Education Department, to await an expression of the fully considered views of the Director of Public Instruction which has been invited.

15. Turning to the Medical and Sanitary Departments, it appears that of the total Civil Indian Staff of the former, consisting of Assistant Surgeons, Sub-Assistant Surgeons and subordinates, exclusive of clerical officers, slightly more than 15 per cent. is contributed by the zamindar population of the Province, the separate corresponding proportions for the three grades being 8, 11 and 20, respectively. These figures are lower than that of any other of the services or departments dealt with in this resolution. It is in His Honour's view very desirable that the proportion of persons having rural and agricultural connections who are employed in the Medical Department should be substantially increased within a reasonable period. The Department is, however, clearly one in which proper technical qualifications are of the first importance; and it is, His Honour recognises, the paucity of young zamindars who enter on a course of medical education, be the cause what it may, which is the main factor in the present situation. Until they can be successfully encouraged to enter in larger numbers than at present it is of little use to prescribe any definite proportion of posts in the Department for allotment to zamindars. The main immediate desideratum is to undertake such a revision of the rules regulating entrance to the institutions for medical education and training as will be effective in removing any preventible causes of discouragement to rural candidates which may exist, and to this end action is being taken. In the meantime, His Honour is pleased to direct that in accordance with the recommendations of a majority of the Committee as between candidates with equal qualifications preference should, for the present, be given to zamindars.

In the Sanitary Department more than 60 per cent. of the vaccinators at present employed are zamindars, and His Honour desires that the proportion should not be allowed to fall below a minimum of 60 per cent.

16. Of the Indian staff of the Buildings and Roads Branch of the Public Works Department, consisting of temporary engineers and of upper and lower subordinates, 24 per cent. are at present zamindars. Here again technical and educational qualifications are of prime importance, and until

zamindars offer themselves in larger numbers than at present for the necessary training and instruction in recognised Indian engineering schools and colleges it will not be possible to secure the inclusion of any substantially larger number of them in the department. Formerly Roorkee College was practically the sole source of supply; but within the last decade it has been supplemented, so far as the training of lower subordinates is concerned, by the Provincial School at Rasul, and His Honour trusts that an increased number of zamindar candidates will resort to that institution for instruction. So far as may be necessary the rules for entrance should be revised with a view to doing all that is possible to remove any reasonable grounds of discouragement which may exist for such candidates from doing so.

17. In the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department out of the total Indian staff employed in the grades ranging from Temporary Engineer to petty establishment in superior service (both inclusive) 26 per cent. of the existing posts are filled by zamindars. In the two revenue grades, that is to say, those of Deputy Collector and Zilladar, included in the above, the proportion is 44 per cent., or somewhat higher if zamindar is understood in the more extensive sense of that term. In the three engineering grades, *viz.*, those of temporary engineer, upper subordinate and lower subordinate, the proportion is 19 per cent. The general recommendations of the Committee were that in the case of the Zilladar grade the Department should aim at securing zamindars for 66 per cent. of the posts, while for posts in the engineering grades or for posts of draftsmen zamindars should be preferred where qualifications are equal as between them and non-zamindars. As regards the latter grades the remarks made in the last paragraph in relation to the Buildings and Roads Branch are applicable, and subject to them His Honour accepts the recommendations of the Committee. The officers of the two revenue grades have, in the execution of their duties, to be in close and constant touch with the agricultural population and it is in His Honour's opinion highly expedient that they should include a substantial proportion of members of the zamindar classes. He considers that 66 per cent., the proportion prescribed for Tahsildars and Naib-Tahsildars, is in no sense excessive in the case of Zilladars, and he desires that in future that proportion of fresh appointments should be allotted to zamindars subject to the general condition already laid down. Such alterations in the rules for the recruitment of Zilladars as may be necessary in this connection should be carried out.

18. In the above paragraphs clerical establishment in all departments have been excluded from consideration. The Committee collected a considerable number of statistics showing the extent to which clerical posts are filled by zamindars in the offices of Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners and in a considerable number of the departmental headquarter offices in Lahore. From these it appears that in Commissioners' offices the proportion so held is 43 per cent. while in Deputy Commissioners' offices the corresponding figure is 36 per cent.; for the headquarter offices in Lahore the similar figures are generally substantially lower. The Committee expressed an opinion that qualified agriculturists for clerical posts frequently find difficulty under prevailing conditions in bringing their qualifications to the notice of the authorities concerned, and it recommended that in order to assist in remedying this state of things the Director of Public Instruction should maintain a register both of zamindar and non-zamindar candidates which the heads of offices should be required to consult whenever available vacancies occurred. On the general question of the employment of members of the zamindar classes in clerical appointments, His Honour's view is that it is not to be expected that the scope for it will be so large as in the case of some of the other classes of employment which have already been dealt with, so far at least as headquarter offices are concerned. It is on the whole easier for a candidate or a junior employé of the non-zamindar classes to live with friends and to keep himself in a large urban centre than it is for one who is a zamindar. His

Honour does not think that the remedy suggested by the Committee is likely to be very effective or calculated to secure any large results. He desires, however, to take this opportunity of emphasizing the necessity for giving due consideration to the claims of zamindar candidates for clerical posts, and in order to secure this he desires that in the registers of candidates which are, or should be, maintained under standing orders in all offices zamindar and non-zamindar candidates should be distinguished by suitable entries. He also considers that it is desirable that when the proportion of zamindars holding appointments in any office appears to be unduly low preference should be given to zamindar candidates who have the necessary educational qualifications, and that in this connection the establishment lists of offices should be overhauled periodically.

ORDER.—Ordered that a copy be forwarded to all Heads of Departments (including District and Sessions Judges), Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners in the Punjab.

Ordered also that the Resolution be published in the *Punjab Government Gazette*.

By order of His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab,

H. A. CASSON,

Joint Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab.

APPENDIX B.

(SEE ANSWER TO QUESTION No. 74.)

Statement showing the grades with the number in each of the Forest Rangers in the Punjab from the year 1890 to date.

Year.	1st grade.	2nd grade.	3rd grade.	4th grade.	5th grade.	6th grade.	7th grade.	Total number.
1890.	150	120	100	80	60	50	*Nil.*	...
No. in each grade ...	1	1	1	5	11	5	...	24
1897.	150	125	100	80	60	50	*Nil.*	...
No. in each grade ...	2	2	4	5	10	15	...	38
1907.	150	125	100	80	60	50	*Nil.*	...
No. in each grade ...	3	6	8	14	14	12	...	57
1910.	150	125	100	80	60	50	*Nil.*	...
No. in each grade ...	3	6	8	15	16	11	...	59
1915.	200	150	125	100	80	60	50	...
No. in each grade ...	3	5	6	10	16	11	8	59
1919.	200	150	125	100	80	60	*Nil.*	...
No. in each grade ...	4	6	8	12	16	19	...	65

APPENDIX C.

(See Answer to Question No. 88.)

List of students of the King Edward Medical College, punished in May 1919, for going on strike.

---

(1) To be forthwith expelled from and permanently removed from the roll of the College :—

1.	Qasuri Lal ...	... First year student.
2.	Nanak Chand, Kapur ...	... Second year student.
3.	Hans Raj, Madan ...	... Third year student.
4.	Jagat Ram, Bhatia ...	... Ditto.
5.	Gian Chand, Bhatia ...	... Fourth year student.
6.	Gopal Singh, Chowla ...	... Ditto.
7.	Lal Singh, Sahotra ...	... Ditto.
8.	Pran Nath ...	... Ditto.
9.	Hans Raj, Chhibber ...	... Ditto.
10.	Parma Nand ...	... Ditto.

(2) To suffer the loss of one (1) year's seniority :—

1.	Kulwant Rai ...	... First year student.
2.	Jagrinda Singh ...	... Ditto.
3.	Kanhya Lal, Bhambri...	... Second year student.
4.	Lakshmi Narain ...	... Ditto.
5.	Gurbakhsh Rai, Dhamrait	... Ditto.
6.	Shamsher Singh ...	... Third year student.
7.	Kishori Lal ...	... Fourth year student.
8.	Amolak Ram, Mehta ...	... Ditto.
9.	Hira Lal, Sachdeva ...	... Ditto.

(3) To forfeit their scholarships :—

1.	Qasuri Lal ...	... First year student.
2.	Kulwant Rai ...	... Ditto.
3.	Jagat Ram, Bhatia ...	... Third year student.
4.	Shamsher Singh ...	... Ditto.
5.	Kishori Lal ...	... Fourth year student.
6.	Amolak Ram, Mehta	... Ditto.

(4) To have their scholarships suspended for three months :—

1.	Mohan Lal ...	... First year student.
2.	Parma Nand, Bhatia...	... Ditto.
3.	Fakhur-ud-Din ...	... Ditto.
4.	Ram Lal, Ubroi ...	... Ditto.
5.	Ch. Hakim Din ...	... Second year student.
6.	Jagat Ram Sahai ...	... Ditto.
7.	Amar Nath, Chopra ...	... Ditto.
8.	Jhangi Ram ...	... Ditto.
9.	Mohkam Chand ...	... Third year student.
10.	Sh. Muhammad Yusaf	... Ditto.
11.	Hukam Chand, Gupta	... Ditto.
12.	Bhagwant Kishori, Sikand	... Ditto.
13.	Vaishnu Das, Kashyap	... Fourth year student.
14.	Jagan Nath, Chopra	... Ditto.
15.	Daulat Ram, Mehta	... Ditto.
16.	Harbhajan Singh	... Ditto.

96 LR—200—2-12-19—SGPP Lahore.