

**THE  
Punjab Legislative Council  
Debates.**

**From 24th February to 21st March 1930.**

---

**Vol. XV.**

---

**OFFICIAL REPORT.**



**Lahore :**

**Printed by the Superintendent, Government Printing, Punjab,**

**1930.**

**PRINCIPAL OFFICERS OF THE PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE  
COUNCIL.**

*President :*

**The Honourable Chaudhri Sir Shahab-ud-Din, Kt., K. B.**

*Deputy President :*

**Khan Bahadur Sardar Habib Ullah.**

*Secretary :*

**Hakim Ahmad Shuja, B.A.**

*Assistant Secretary :*

**Pandit Tej Kishen Kaul, B.A., LL.B., P.C.S.**

# **PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL**

## **LIST OF MEMBERS.**

### **EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS AND MINISTERS.**

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain, K.C.I.E., Revenue Member to Government, Punjab.

The Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow, K.C.I.E., O.B.E., I.C.S., Finance Member to Government, Punjab.

The Hon'ble Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh, Kt., Minister for Agriculture (Sikh), Landholders.

The Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal, M.A., Minister for Education (Punjab University).

The Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon, Minister for Local Self-Government, Shahpur East (Muhammadan), Rural.

### **I.—OFFICIALS NOMINATED.**

Ashton, Mr. H. F., Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch.

Calvert, Mr. H., C.I.E., I.C.S., Financial Commissioner.

Dorman, Mr. W. S., B.A., C.E., Offg. Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government, Punjab, Public Works Department (Buildings and Roads Branch).

Emerson, Mr. H. W., C.I.E., O.B.E., I.C.S., Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab.

Gill, Colonel C.A., D.P.H., I.M.S., Director of Public Health, Punjab.

Mitchell, Mr. Alan, I.C.S., Offg. Secretary to Government, Punjab, Transferred Departments.

Muzaffar Khan, Khan Bahadur, Nawab, Director of Information Bureau, Punjab.

Ogilvie, Mr. C. M. G., O.B.E., I.C.S., Home Secretary to Government, Punjab.

Penny, Mr. J. D., I.C.S., Secretary to Government, Punjab, Finance Department.

Sale, Mr. S. L., I.C.S., Legal Remembrancer and Secretary to Government, Punjab, Legislative Department.

Sanderson, Mr. R., Director of Public Instruction, Punjab.

Townsend, Mr. C. A. H., C.I.E., I.C.S., Financial Commissioner, Punjab.

Wilson, Mr. W. R., I.C.S., Revenue Secretary to Government, Punjab.

## II.—NON-OFFICIALS NOMINATED.

Abdul Ghani, Khan Bahadur, Maulvi, Representative, General Interests.

Dalpat Singh, Honorary Captain, Sardar Bahadur, I.O.M., M.V.O., Representative of the Punjabi Officers and Soldiers of His Majesty's Indian Forces.

Ghani, Mr. M.A., Representative of Labouring Classes.

Maya Das, Mr. Ernest, B.A., Representative of Indian Christians.

Rattan Chand, Rai Bahadur, Lala, O.B.E., Representative, General Interests.

Roberts, Mr. Owen, Representative of the European and Anglo-Indian Communities.

Shave, Dr. (Mrs.) M. C., Representative of the European and Anglo-Indian Communities.

Sheo Narayan Singh, Sardar Bahadur Sardar, C.I.E., Representative, General Interests.

## III.—ELECTED.

Abdul Ghani, Shaikh, West Punjab Towns (Muhammadan), Urban.

Afzal Haq, Chaudhri, Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana (Muhammadan), Rural.

Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana, Mian, Multan East (Muhammadan), Rural.

Akbar Ali, Pir, B.A., LL.B., Ferozepore (Muhammadan), Rural.

Ali Ahmad, Chaudhri, Gujranwala (Muhammadan), Rural.

Balbir Singh, Rao Bahadur, Captain, Rao, O.B.E., Gurgaon (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Baldev Singh, Chaudhri, B.A., B.T., North-West Rohtak (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Bishan Singh, Sardar, Sialkot-cum-Gurdaspur (Sikh), Rural.

Buta Singh, Sardar, B.A., LL.B., Multan Division and Sheikhupura (Sikh), Rural.

Chetan Anand, Lala, B.A., LL.B., West Punjab Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Urban.

Chhajju Ram, Chaudhri, C.I.E., Hissar (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Chhotu Ram, Rai Sahib, Chaudhri, B.A., LL.B., South-East, Rohtak (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Daulat Ram, Kalia, Rai Bahadur, Pandit, M.B.E., East and West Central Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Urban.

Dhanpat Rai, Rai Bahadur, Lala, Punjab Industries.

Din Muhammad, Mr., M.A., LL.B., East and West Central Towns (Muhammadan), Urban.

Duli Chand, Chaudhri, Karnal (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Faiz Muhammad, Shaikh, B.A., LL.B., Dera Ghazi Khan (Muhammadan), Rural.



## III.—ELECTED—CONTINUED.

Fateh Singh, Sardar Sahib Sardar, Ferozepore (Sikh), Rural.

Fazl Ali, Khan Bahadur, Chandhri, M.B.E., O.B.E., Gujrat East (Muhammadan), Urban.

Firoz-ud-Din Khan, Rana, B.A., LL.B., South-East Towns (Muhammadan), Urban.

Ganga Ram, Rai Bahadur, Lala, Ambala-cum-Simla (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Gokul Chand, Narang, Dr. M.A., Ph. D., North-West Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Urban.

Gopal Das, Lala, Lahore and Ferozepore-cum-Sheikhupura (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Gray, Mr. V.F., Punjab Chamber of Commerce and Trades Association, Commerce.

Habib Ullah, Khan Bahadur, Sardar, Lahore (Muhammadan), Rural.

Harbakhsh Singh, Sardar, B.A., Hoshiarpur and Kangra (Sikh), Rural.

Hari Singh, Sardar, Ambala Division (Sikh), Rural.

Hira Singh, Narli, Sardar, Lahore (Sikh), Rural.

Joti Parshad, Lala, South-East Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Urban.

Kartar Singh, Bedi, Baba, Lyallpur (Sikh), Rural.

Kesar Singh, Chandhri, Amritsar-cum-Gurdaspur (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Kesho Ram, Sekhri, Lala, B.A., LL.B., Amritsar City (Non-Muhammadan), Urban.

Khan Muhammad Khan, Wagha, Malik, Sheikhupura (Muhammadan), Rural.

Labh Singh, Mr., M.A., LL.B. (Cantab.), Rawalpindi Division and Lahore Division North (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Maqbool Mahmood, Mir, B.A., B. Lit., Amritsar (Muhammadan), Rural.

Mebar Chand, Pandit, B.A., Jullundur-cum-Ludhiana (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Mohan Lal, Rai Bahadur Lala, B.A., LL.B., North-East Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Urban.

Mohindar Singh, Sardar, Ludhiana (Sikh), Rural.

Mubarik Ali Shah, Sayad, Jhang (Muhammadan), Rural.

Muhammad Abdullah Khan, Khan, Muzaffargarh (Muhammadan), Rural.

Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan, Chaudhri, Jullundur (Muhammadan), Rural.

### III.—ELECTED.—CONCLUDED.

Muhammad Amin Khan, Khan Bahadur, Malik, G.B.E., Attock (Muhammadan), Rural.

Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi, Khan Bahadur, Mian, G.I.E., Shahpur West (Muhammadan), Rural.

Muhammad Husain, Sayad, Montgomery (Muhammadan), Rural.

Muhammad Iqbal, Dr., Sir, M.A., Ph.D., Lahore City (Muhammadan), Urban.

Muhammad Jamal Khan, Leghari, Khan Bahadur, Nawab, Baloch Tomandars (Landholders).

Muhammad Raza Shah, Gilani, Makhdomzada Sayad, Multan West (Muhammadan), Rural.

Muhammad Sadiq, Shaikh, Amritsar City (Muhammadan), Urban.

Muhammad Saif Ullah Khan, Khan Bahadur Khan, Mianwali (Muhammadan), Rural.

Mukand Lal, Puri, Lala, Lahore City (Non-Muhammadan), Urban.

Nanak Chand, Pandit, M.A., Hoshiarpur (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Narain Singh, Sardar, B.A., LL.B., Rawalpindi Division and Gujranwala (Sikh), Rural.

Narendra Nath, Diwan Bahadur, Raja, M.A., Punjab Landholders (General).

Nur Khan, Khan Sahib, Risaldar, Bahadur, Rawalpindi (Muhammadan), Rural.

Nurullah, Mian, Lyallpur South (Muhammadan), Rural.

Partap Singh, Sardar, Jullundur (Sikh), Rural.

Raghubir Singh, Honorary Lieut., Sardar, O.B.E., Amritsar (Sikh), Rural.

Rahim Bakhsh, Maulvi, Sir, K.C.I.E., Ambala Division, North-East (Muhammadan), Rural.

Ram Singh, Chaudhri, Kangra (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Sewak Ram, Rai Bahadur, Lala, Multan Division (Non-Muhammadan), Rural.

Shahadat Khan, Rai, Lyallpur North (Muhammadan), Rural.

Sikandar Hayat Khan, Captain, Sardar, K.B., M.B.E. (Muhammadan), Landholders.

Talib Mehdi Khan, Malik Nawab, Major, Jhelum (Muhammadan), Rural.

Ujjal Singh, Sardar Sahib Sardar, M.A. (Sikh), Urban.

Umar Hayat, Chaudhri, Gujrat West (Muhammadan), Rural.

Yasin Khan, Chaudhri, B.A., LL.B., Gurgaon-cum-Hissar (Muhammadan), Rural.

Zafrulla Khan, Chaudhri, B.A., LL.B., Sialkot (Muhammadan), Rural.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS.

## FIFTH SESSION OF THE THIRD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

	PAGES.
<i>Monday, the 24th February 1930.</i>	
Oath of office	1
Starred questions and answers	1-19
Unstarred questions and answers	19-64
Resolutions—	
<i>Re committee to enquire into the grievances of the colonists of Nili Bar (carried)</i>	65-88
<i>Re stadium at Lahore (withdrawn)</i>	89-95
<i>Re school fee concessions (not concluded)</i>	95-101
Panel of chairmen	101
<i>Tuesday, the 25th February 1930.</i>	
Oath of office	103
Starred questions and answers	103-117
Unstarred questions and answers	117-135
Resolutions—	
<i>Re school fee concessions (partially carried)</i>	135-140
<i>Re committee to enquire into grievances of Government servants (lost)</i>	141-165
<i>Re income from resin in shamilat forests (lost)</i>	165-175
<i>Thursday, the 27th February 1930.</i>	
Oath of office	177
Starred questions and answers	177-191
Unstarred questions and answers	192-204
Resolution—	
<i>Re total prohibition (lost)</i>	205-238
<i>Friday, the 28th February 1930.</i>	
Starred questions and answers	239-254
Unstarred questions and answers	254-280
Inaccuracies in press reports	280-281
Oath of office	281
Presentation of the budget for 1930-31	281-290
<i>Thursday, the 6th March 1930.</i>	
Oath of office	291
General discussion of the budget	291-328

*Friday, the 7th March 1930.*

	PAGES.
General discussion of the budget ... ..	329—375

*Saturday, the 8th March 1930.*

Oath of office ... ..	377
Starred questions and answers ... ..	377—386
Unstarred questions and answers ... ..	386—400
Government's demands for supplementary and additional grants, 1929-30 ... ..	400—423
The Punjab Registration Validating Bill ( <i>introduced and passed</i> ) ... ..	424

*Monday, the 10th March 1930.*

Oath of office ... ..	425
Government's demands for grants—	
Land Revenue ( <i>not concluded</i> ) ... ..	425—467

*Tuesday, the 11th March 1930.*

Government's demands for grants—	
Land Revenue ... ..	469—494
Excise ... ..	494—495
Stamps ... ..	496
Forests ... ..	496
Forest (Capital Expenditure) ... ..	496
Registration ... ..	496
Irrigation ( <i>not concluded</i> ) ... ..	496—498

*Wednesday, the 12th March 1930.*

Elections to Standing Committees ... ..	499, 539
Government's demands for grants—	
Irrigation ... ..	499—524
Irrigation Establishment, Open Canals ... ..	525
Irrigation Establishment, Sutlej Valley Project ... ..	525
Irrigation (Capital Expenditure) ... ..	525
Debt Services ... ..	525
General Administration (Reserved) ( <i>not concluded</i> ) ... ..	525—539

*Thursday, the 13th March 1930.*

	PAGES.
Government's demands for grants—	
General Administration (Reserved) ( <i>not concluded</i> )	... 541—581.

*Monday, the 17th March 1930.*

Oath of office	... 583
Starred questions and answers	... 588—597
Unstarred questions and answers	... 597—609
Government's demands for grants—	
General Administration (Reserved)	... 609—630
General Administration (Transferred) ( <i>not concluded</i> )	... 630—639

*Tuesday, the 18th March 1930.*

Oath of office	... 641
Unstarred questions and answers	... 641—655
Government's demands for grants—	
General Administration (Transferred) ( <i>not concluded</i> )	... 655—702

*Thursday, the 20th March 1930.*

Starred questions and answers	... 703—708
Unstarred questions and answers	... 708—725
Government's demands for grants—	
General Administration (Transferred)	... 725—761
Administration of Justice	... 761—770
Jails and Convict Settlements	... 770
Police ( <i>not concluded</i> )	... 771—774

*Friday, the 21st March 1930.*

Starred questions and answers	... 775—777
Unstarred questions and answers	... 778—792
Appreciation of the services of the Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Hussain	... 792—800
Government's demands for grants—	
Police	... 800—822
Education (Reserved)	... 822
Education (Transferred)	... 822

Government's demands for grants—*concd.*

Medical (Reserved and Transferred) and Public Health (Transferred) ... ..	822
Agriculture (Transferred) ... ..	822
Industries ... ..	822
Capital Outlay on Industrial Development ... ..	823
Miscellaneous (Reserved) ... ..	823
Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments (Transferred) ... ..	823
Civil Works (Reserved) ... ..	823
Civil Works (Transferred) ... ..	823
Buildings and Roads Branch Establishment Charges ... ..	823
Hydro-Electric Scheme Working Expenses ... ..	824
Civil Works (Capital Expenditure) ... ..	824
Hydro-Electric Scheme (Capital Expenditure) ... ..	824
Famine ... ..	824
Superannuation Allowances and Pensions ... ..	824
Commuted Value of Pensions (Capital Expenditure) ... ..	824
Stationery and Printing (Reserved) ... ..	825
Stationery and Printing (Transferred) ... ..	825
Loans by Provincial Governments (Reserved) ... ..	825
Loans by Provincial Governments (Transferred) ... ..	825
Refunds (Reserved) ... ..	825
Refunds (Transferred) ... ..	825
Expenditure in England (other than Stores) under the Control of the High Commissioner for India ... ..	826
Expenditure in England under the Control of the Secretary of State ... ..	826
Nominations to the Railway Advisory Committee ... ..	826
Appendix I.	
Appendix II.	
Index.	

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Monday, the 24th February 1930.*

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following members were sworn in :—

Mr. H. W. Emerson. C.I.E., C.B.E. (Official nominated).

Colonel C. A. Gill, (Official nominated).

Mr. J. D. Penny (Official nominated).

Mr. W. S. Dorman (Official nominated).

Mr. H. F. Ashton (Official nominated).

Mr. R. Sanderson (Official nominated).

Khan Bahadur Maulvi Abdul Ghani (non-official nominated).

Mian Nurullah (Lyallpur South (Muhammadan), Rural).

### STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

#### DEPRESSED CLASSES.

**\*1827. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state whether the answer to starred question No. 1627<sup>1</sup> asked by me on 3rd December 1928, is ready? If so, it may kindly be read over.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** An answer to starred question No. \*1627 has already been given and is printed at pages iv and v of the Punjab Legislative Council debates, Volume XIII, Appendix.

#### \* SCALE OF SCHOOL AND BOARDING HOUSE CONTINGENCIES.

**\*1858. Chaudhri Duli Chand :** With reference to my question No. 617,<sup>2</sup> asked on the 18th March 1928, will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

(a) whether the rules regarding the scale of school and boarding house contingencies have been followed in the Ambala division ;

(b) if so, the year from which they have been followed ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** It has not been possible yet to resolve the uncertainty that attaches to these scales, but the matter is being scrutinised by the Director of Public Instruction.

<sup>1</sup>Volume XII, page 241.

<sup>2</sup>Volume XI, pages 551-551.

## MUSSALMAN WAKF ACT.

**\*2029. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state how many Mutwallis of Mussalman Auqafs in the Punjab have submitted their statements of accounts under section 8 of the Mussalman Waqf Act, 1928, in each year ever since it has been enforced in this province ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :**

1926	..	..	..	..	14
1927	..	..	..	..	20
1928	..	..	..	..	54
1929	..	..	..	..	16
Total					104

## MUSSALMAN WAKF ACT.

**\*2030. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state the number of Mutwallis of Mussalman Auqafs in the Punjab who have been (i) prosecuted, (ii) convicted, (iii) acquitted under section 10 of the Mussalman Waqf Act, 1928, in each year ever since it has been enforced in this province ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :**

- (i) Nil.
- (ii) Nil.
- (iii) Nil.

## NAZUL LANDS IN AMRITSAR.

**\*2075. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Nazul lands outside Hathi Gate, Amritsar, have been taken possession of by the Durgiana (Temple) authorities.
- (b) whether it is a fact that even public roads near Durgiana outside Hathi Gate have also been encroached upon ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the municipal committee and local Government have been requested to remedy the state of affairs ;
- (d) if so, with what effect ?



**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Hussain:** The matter is important and is still under investigation. It is reported that the Municipal Committee of Amritsar, who had it under its consideration for a long time, has not been able to give a satisfactory report of the facts. The Deputy Commissioner is now making enquiries. The necessary information when ready will be communicated to the Honourable Member, but in the meantime I might state for his information:—

- (a) and (b) It has been reported that several pieces of nazul land outside Hathi Gate, Amritsar, are in the possession of the Durgiana (Temple) authorities. The matter is under investigation and no final conclusion has been arrived at.
- (c) Yes. A few petitions have been received.
- (d) As stated above the matter is under investigation.

#### MANDI HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME.

**\*2146. Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (i) the total number of gazetted staff above the rank of overseers on the organisation of the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme in respect of its (a) construction staff, (b) electric project section, (c) hydraulic project section;
- (ii) the number of Europeans and Indians in each of the branches (a), (b) and (c) referred to above;
- (iii) how many Europeans and Indians referred to in (ii) above are apprentice engineers;
- (iv) how many Europeans and how many Indian engineers of and above the rank of assistant engineers are employed in the whole organization;
- (v) how many Europeans and Indian engineers employed in the whole scheme are permanent and how many temporary;
- (vi) the academic qualification, length of service, and pay of the officials referred to in (i) above?

**The Hon'ble Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh:** (i) (a) 21.

- (b) 6.
- (c) 6.
- (ii) (a) 10 Europeans and 11 Indians.
- (b) 2 Europeans and 4 Indians.
- (c) 3 Europeans and 3 Indians.
- (iii) 3 Apprentice engineers who are all Indians.
- (iv) 88 Europeans and 10 Indians.
- (v) The whole staff of the Hydro-Electric Branch is temporary.
- (vi) A statement showing the required information is attached.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

## (4) (a) Construction Staff.

Serial No.	Name.	Designation.	Scale of pay.	Rate of pay on 30-6-29.	LENGTH OF SERVICE.				Qualifications.
					In Hydro-Electric Branch up to 30-6-29.	Prior to joining Hydro-Electric Branch.	Under Government.	Elsewhere.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
1	Mr. E. S. Crump, I.S.E.	Superintending Engineer.	Rs. 1,750-100-2,150	Rs. 2,050 plus £ 13-6-8 S. O. P.	Y. M. 3 4	Y. M. 19 5	Y. M. ..	Associate of the Royal College of Science, both in Physics and Mechanics.	
2	Mr. G. H. Hunt, M.C., I.S.E.	Executive Engineer.	625-50-1,375	1,925 plus £ 20 S. O. P.	3 9	6 0	..	B.Sc. (Honours) Engineering, Manchester University.	
3	Mr. R. N. Aylward, D.S.O., M.C.	Ditto	725-50-1,975	1,975 plus £ 20 S. O. P.	3 6	5 8	Not known; was in war service	Associate Member of Institution of Civil Engineers.	
4	Major Alex. Sanderson, D.S.O., M.C.	Ditto	Ditto	Ditto	1 10	2 8	23 4	Holds Diploma in Civil Engineering issued by Engineer-in-Chief, Public Works Department, and Mining, Engineering and Metallurgy issued by Kalgoorlie School of Mines, Western Australia.	

5	Mr. S. J. Bruford ..	Executive Engineer.	725-50-1,375	1,175 plus £ 30 S.O.P.	2	5	..	17	0	Fellow of Royal Geographical Society, Fellow, Royal Society of Arts, Member Institute of Structural Engineers, Associate Member of the Institute of Mechanical Engineers.	
6	Mr. N. N. Iyengar..	Ditto	Ditto	1,325	2	3	..	11	0	Bachelor of Arts (Madras University). Bachelor of Electrical Engineering (Union University, New York, United States of America).	
7	Mr. D. P. O'Kelly..	Assistant Executive Engineer.	375-50-975	925 plus £ 30 S.O.P.	3	4	4	0	12	0	Has 16 years experience as Mechanical Engineer.
8	Major A. G. Wheeler	Ditto	Ditto	875 plus £ 30 S.O.P.	3	0	9	0	..	..	Associate Member of the Society of Engineers.
9	Captain A. Guthrie, R. E.	Ditto	Ditto	725 plus £ 25 S.O.P.	2	10	9	6	..	..	Bachelor in Science (Hone., London University). Associate Member of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers, Associate Member of the Institution of Electrical Engineers.
10	Lt. N. Boddington, R. E.	Ditto	Ditto	575 plus £ 15 S.O.P.	1	5	7	7	..	..	Associate Member of the Institution of Electrical Engineers.
11	Mr. N. V. Darroffete	Tunnel Engineer	..	1,100 (Fixed).	1	3	..	..	16	0	Associate Member of the Institution of Engineers (India).

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

Serial No.	Name.	Designation.	Scale of pay.	Rate of pay on 30-6-29.	LENGTH OF SERVICE.				Qualifications.
					In Hydro-Electric Branch up to 30-6-29.	Prior to joining Hydro-Electric Branch.		Elsewhere.	
						Under Government.			
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
12	Mr. R. L. Narayanan	Assistant Executive Engineer.	Rs. 375-50-075	Rs. 775	Y. M. 3 2	Y. M. ..	Y. M. 3 0		Bachelor of Engineering (Madras University). Bachelor of Science of the University of London (1st Class). Graduate of the Institution of Electrical Engineers.
13	Mr. B. K. Sibou	Assistant Executive Engineer.	Ditto	825	3 3	5 0	10 0		Associate Member of the Institution of Engineers (India). Graduate Member of the Institution of Electrical Engineers (London).
14	Mr. Sam. K. Bawa...	Assistant Engineer.	250-20-750	750	1 6	9 7	1 5		Technical training for 3 years under the Bombay Electric Supply and Tramways Company, Limited.
15	Mirza Muhammad Latif.	Ditto	Ditto	450	3 3	6 5	..		Practical experience of over 8 years in the Engineering line.

16	Devan Chandu Lal, Oswal.	Ditto	Ditto	390	0 8	..	10 0	Practical experience of over 10 years in Electrical Engineering.
17	Mr. K. C. Gandhi ..	Apprentice Engin- eer.	150-7-255	248	3 3	..	2 0	Holder of Paraday House Diploma. Graduate of Institution of Electrical Engineers. Bachelor of Science in Electrical En- gineering (Chicago). Asso- ciate of the American Institute of Electrical Engineers.
18	Mr. H. S. Badi ..	Ditto	Ditto	150	0 8	..	..	Bachelor of Science in Elec- trical Engineering (Chi- cago). Associate of the American Institute of Elec- trical Engineers.
19	Mr. B. N. Channa ..	Ditto	Ditto	150	0 9	..	0 8	Graduated from the Central Technological Institute, Bombay. Obtained Dip- loma in Mechanical Engi- neering, Bombay.
20	Mr. M. A. Ghafoor ..	Ditto	Ditto	157	1 8	..	..	Has studied for 3 years in Nottingham College, Eng- land.
21	Mr. P. C. Gulati ..	Ditto	Ditto	157	1 1	..	..	Completed 4 years' course in Electrical Engineering, lead- ing to the degree of I. E. E. Honours at O. I. Mechanical Institute, Bombay. Stud- ent of the Institution of Electrical Engineers.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

## (c) (b) Electric Project Section Staff.

Serial No.	Name.	Designation.	Scale of pay.	Rate of pay on 30-6-29.	LENGTH OF SERVICE.				Qualifications.
					In Hydro-Electric Branch up to 30-6-29.	Prior to joining Hydro-Electric Branch.	Under Government.	Elsewhere.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
1	Mr. H. P. Thomas..	Superintending Engineer.	Ra. 1,625-100-2,150	Ra. 2,050 plus 2 13-6-8, S.O.P.	Y. M. 2 8	Y. M. ..	Y. M. 19 0	Y. M. ..	Bachelor of Science in Electrical Engineering (McGill University), Montreal. Member of the Institution of Electrical Engineers of America. Member of the New Zealand Society of Civil Engineers.
2	Mr. A. T. Arnall ..	Executive Engineer.	725-50-1,375	1,375 plus 2 30, S.O.P.	3 4	..	Over 15 years.	..	Bachelor of Science (London). Member of the Institution of Civil Engineers. Associate Member of the Institution of Electrical Engineers. Member of the Institution of Engineers (India).

3	Mr. F. N. Howdalla.	Assistant Executive Engineer.	375-50-975	975	2 8	..	8 0	Master of Arts. Bachelor of Science. Associate Member of the Institution of Electrical Engineers. Associate of the American Institute of Electrical Engineers. Associate of the Indian Institute of Science.
4	Mr. B. Paul	Transmission Line Engineer.	..	1,075 (fixed).	2 4	..	14 0	Bachelor of Science in Engineering (Glasgow). Degree of certificate of Proficiency in Engineering (Glasgow). Associate Member of the Institution of Electrical Engineers. Associate of the American Institute of Electrical Engineers. Member of the Institution of Engineers (India).
5	Mr. N. C. Gupta	Apprentice Engineer.	150-7-255	248	2 0	..	..	Bachelor of Science in Mechanical Engineering (Birmingham).
6	Mr. T. M. Idnani	Ditto	Ditto	199	2 0	..	..	Bachelor of Science (Bombay). Bachelor in Science (Technology), Manchester University. Associate Manchester College of Technology.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

## (b) (c) Hydraulic Project Section Staff.

Serial No.	Name.	Designation.	Scale of pay.	Rate of pay on 30-6-29.	LENGTH OF SERVICE.					Qualifications.
					In Hydro-Electric Branch up to 30-6-29.	Prior to joining Hydro-Electric Branch.				
						Y. M.	Y. M.	Under Govern-ment.	Else-where.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9		
1	Mr. D. S. McPhail..	Resident Engineer.	Rs. 725-50-1,375	Rs. 1,025 plus £ 30 S. O. P.	Y. M. 3 5	Y. M. ..	Y. M. 8 11 including war service.	Associate Member of the American Society of Civil Engineers. Associate Member of the Engineering Institute of Canada. Bachelor of Arts, Cambridge University.		
2	Captain R. D. Keane, R. E.	Assistant Executive Engineer.	375-50-975	775 plus £ 25 S. O. P. (fixed).	2 5	11 3	..	R. M. A., Woolwich, S.M.E., Chatham. Trinity Hall, Cambridge.		
3	Captain R. A. Kenyon, M.C., R. E.	Ditto	..	1,050 (fixed).	3 6	10 8	..	Associate Member of the Institution of Civil Engineers. Associate of the City Guilds of London Institute. Associate Member of the American Society of Civil Engineers. Member of the Imperial College of Science and Technology, London. Associate Member of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers.		
4	S. Kirpal Singh ..	Ditto	375-50-975	975	3 3	15 0	..	Many years practical experience.		
5	S. Sundar Singh ..	Survey Officer ..	250-20-750	250	2 1	..	..	Holder of Diploma of the Madhagan Engineering College, Moghalpura.		
6	Mr. Fazal Illahie ..	Apprentice Engineer.	150-7-255	157	1 8	..	..			

E. M. A., Woolwich, S.M.E., Chatham. Trinity Hall, Cambridge. Associate Member of the Institution of Civil Engineers. Associate of the City Guilds of London Institute. Associate Member of the American Society of Civil Engineers. Member of the Imperial College of Science and Technology, London. Associate Member of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers. Many years practical experience. Holder of Diploma of the Madras Engineering College, Moghalpura.



## HIGH SCHOOLS IN ROHTAK.

**\*2243. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) the names of high schools in the district of Rohtak maintained by (i) Government, and (ii) local bodies ;
- (b) the number of teachers in the schools referred to in (a) in the Anglo-Vernacular section of the educational service (provincial or subordinate), the number of those among these teachers who come from outside the Ambala division, and the names and tribes of those who belong to statutory agricultural tribes ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that teachers in the high schools maintained by local bodies were appointed by the Inspector of Schools ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :**

## GOVERNMENT SCHOOLS.

- (a) 1. High classes attached to Government Intermediate College, Rohtak.
- 2. Government High School, Bahadurgarh.
- 3. Government High School, Jhajjar.
- 4. Government High School, Gohana.

## LOCAL BODY SCHOOLS.

- 1. M. B. High School, Sonipat.
- 2. M. B. High School, Beri.
- 3. D. B. High School, Kosli.

- (b) and (c) The information is being collected and will be supplied to the honourable member when ready.

## VERNAACULAR MIDDLE SCHOOLS.

**\*2244. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) the number of vernacular middle schools with provision for teaching English as an optional subject in each of the districts of the Ambala division, the number of teachers who teach English in these schools and the names and tribes of those among them who belong to statutory agricultural tribes ;
- (b) the number of schools referred to in (a) from which English as an optional subject has been abolished and the names and tribes of the teachers who have been thrown out of employment as a consequence of this abolition ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The major portion of the information desired by the honourable member is not easy to put together as it relates to schools under the control of local bodies, but efforts are being made to collect such information as is conveniently available and will be communicated to the honourable member as early as possible.

## RECOGNITION OF SCHOOLS.

**\*2332. Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) the names of schools that applied for recognition in the year 1928 together with the year when each of them applied for recognition for the first time ;
- (b) which of these schools were (i) recognised and (ii) refused recognition ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I regret very much that the answer to this question is not yet ready. Instructions are being given for providing the honourable member with the necessary information at the earliest possible date.

## SUB-JUDGES' COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION.

**\*2608. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- (a) how many second division LL.B.'s were allowed to sit for the sub-judges' competitive examination last year and how many of them were members of notified agricultural tribes ;
- (b) how many second division LL.B.'s are being allowed to sit for the examination this year and how many of them are members of notified agricultural tribes ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) 78, of whom 33 were members of notified agricultural tribes. The latter figure excludes 5 candidates of the Delhi Province about whom no information is available.

(b) 65, of whom 28 are members of notified agricultural tribes. The latter figure excludes 5 candidates for the reason given in (a).

**NOTE.**—51 out of these 65 candidates are those who were allowed to sit in 1928 but who did not qualify. The balance of 14 represents new candidates who were allowed to appear for the first time this year, and of whom 2 are members of notified agricultural tribes.

## SUB-JUDGE CANDIDATES.

**\*2609. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- (a) how many names were specially requisitioned by the High Court for being included among sub-judge candidates last year, and how many have been requisitioned this year ;
- (b) whether there are any, and, if so, how many, candidates belonging to notified agricultural tribes among those referred to in (a) ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) 30 in 1928 and 14 in 1929.

(b) Two in each year. This excludes the Delhi candidates.

DISTRICT INSPECTOR OF SCHOOLS, ROHTAK.

**\*2610. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) whether the Vernacular Middle School at Kanhaur in the Rohtak district was never visited by the permanent District Inspector of Schools for about three years.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The vernacular middle school at Kanhaur was inspected by the permanent District Inspector of Schools in December, 1926.

HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME.

**\*2612. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture kindly state the pace of progress of work and expenditure on the Hydro-Electric Scheme?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** It is regretted the answer to the above question is not yet ready, and will be supplied to the honourable member when ready.

WATER FAILURE ON THE MAILSI CANALS.

**\*2622. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Islam weir in the Sutlej Valley Project was damaged in the month of September and consequently the Mailsi Canal ceased to run ;  
 (b) if so, whether Government is aware that the *kharif* crop on these canals was almost destroyed on account of want of water to mature them ;  
 (c) if so, will Government kindly state the remission which it has been pleased to give to the areas concerned ;  
 (d) whether Government is aware that the people on the Mailsi Canal are deprived of the *rabi* 1929-30 ;  
 (e) if so, what steps Government has taken or proposes to take to save the people of the 3rd British circle, Sutlej Valley Project, from the great loss that they will have to undergo in the absence of the *rabi* crops ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The Islam Weir was damaged on the 19th September 1929 so that the Mailsi Canal which is non-perennial was closed about a fortnight sooner than it would have ceased to run in the usual course.

(b) Certain *kharif* crops were damaged to some extent.

(c) Special remission was given to these crops on the following scale which was in addition to ordinary *kharaba* remissions :—

Til 100 per cent.

Rice, Cotton, *Mash* 50 per cent.

[Hon'ble Sir Fazl-i-Hussain.]

(d) The Mailsi Canal is a *kharif* Channel and is not entitled to water during the *rabi* season.

(e) Enquiries on the *rabi* irrigation from Mailsi Canal are not yet complete.

MONEY COLLECTIONS BY MR. BRAYNE, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER.

**\*2665. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Chief Secretary please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that an approximate sum of Rs. 25,000 was collected by Mr. Brayne, late Deputy Commissioner, Gurgaon, soon before his departure on long leave;
- (b) if so, will the Government please state (i) the name of the fund (ii) the name of the trustees, (iii) the object of the fund, (iv) the sum already spent under each head;
- (c) whether an account of the sum already spent has been kept or not and whether it has been duly audited by an authorised or unauthorised auditing or other agency;
- (d) if the answer to the latter part of (c) be in the negative, what steps does Government propose to take to have the expenditure and accounts properly audited?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** Government regret that they have not yet obtained the information required. A reply will be given to the honourable member in due course.

BAR ROOM, HISSAR.

**\*2671. Lala Joti Parshad :** With reference to answer given to starred question No. 2282<sup>1</sup> asked by me on 29th July 1929, will the Honourable Finance Member please state when the construction of building is expected to be taken in hand?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The information asked for is still not available. It will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

HINDU JATS IN POLICE DEPARTMENT.

**\*2681. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance kindly state whether there is any Hindu Jat in the Police department who holds the post of a Deputy Superintendent or Inspector of Police in the province who has retired in either of these capacities during the last ten or fifteen years or any period of living memory for which records exist in the Inspector-General's office?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The list of retirements from the ranks of Deputy Superintendents of Police and Inspectors of Police for the past 15 years does not contain the name of any Hindu Jat.

## GOVERNMENT OWNED WELLS AND DEPRESSED CLASSES.

\*2583. **Pandit Mehar Chand** : Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether Government owned wells, i.e., those situated in the Government buildings such as Police stations, Government treasuries, courts, etc., are actually open to the use of the depressed classes such as Chamars, Dhanaks and Meghs ;
- (b) if not, whether Government intend them to be declared open to members of such depressed classes ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson** : (a) The practice is not uniform but generally speaking those Government wells which are open to the public are open to the use of the depressed classes, although in practice, the custom observed in regard to private wells is followed and water is drawn by these classes through the medium of other persons.

(b) Does not arise.

## HIGH SCHOOLS OF BACKWARD COMMUNITIES.

\*2691. **Chaudhri Duli Chand** : Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) whether Government is aware that the Jat High schools of Rohtak and Hissar, the Ahir High School of Rewari, the Meo High School of Nuh, the Gaur High School of Rohtak and the Muslim Rajput High School of Kalanaur in the Ambala division belong to the backward communities of the Jats, Ahirs, Meos, Gaur and Rajputs, respectively ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the grant-in-aid of these schools have been reduced ;
- (c) if so, to what extent and why ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** : (a) The schools in question belong to the tribes named by the honourable member.

(b) and (c) The following four schools have earned lower grants for the year 1929-30 as compared with the year 1928-29 :—

	1928-29.	1929-30.
	Rs.	Rs.
1. Jat High School, Rohtak ..	11,804	9,291
2. Jat High School, Hissar ..	4,920	4,020
3. Gaur Brahmin School, Rohtak ..	8,984	2,886
4. Muslim Rajput High School, Kalanaur	4,968	3,989

The Brayne Meo High School at Nuh has earned a higher grant in the year 1929-30 than in the previous year, and the Ahir High School, Rewari is not on the list of grants-in-aid.

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

As the honourable member is aware grants-in-aid to private secondary schools are assessed every year on the basis of a certain percentage of the difference between approved expenditure and income of the school from fees and other sources. These assessments are made by the inspecting authorities in accordance with the rules laid down in the Punjab Education Code under which they exercise a certain amount of discretion in admitting certain items as approved expenditure and making deduction for certain defects. Variations in grants from year to year are not uncommon. The fact that a school belongs to a particular tribe or community is not as such taken into account in assessing the grants.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister please say if these reductions have been made in consultation with the Minister?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** No.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Is the Honourable Minister aware that grants are calculated according to the sweet will of the Inspector?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I have already said that the Inspector has a certain amount of discretion under the principles laid down in the Education Code in arriving at his calculations. I do not think it is correct to say that these grants are made at his sweet will.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Is he aware that these grants are not made in accordance with the rules?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** If my attention is called to any specific instance in which the rules have not been observed, the matter will be looked into.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Is he ready to appoint a committee to make an enquiry?

**Mr. President :** I am afraid I cannot allow that question.

#### HAILSTORMS IN KANGRA DISTRICT.

**\*2733. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member kindly state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in the months of September and October 1929 the Kangra district was subject to the fury of a number of hailstorms which has resulted in the destruction of crops over a large area of the district and in the impoverishment of the zamindars who are unable to pay land revenue;
- (b) if so, will the honourable member kindly lay on the table a statement showing the amount of damage done by the hailstorm in each tahsil of the Kangra district;
- (c) the measure of relief proposed to be given to the zamindars so affected?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Kangra district was visited by hailstorms in September and October, 1929. They did some damage in various areas, but it is incorrect to say that as a result of them "crops over a large area were destroyed and that zamindars were so impoverished as to be unable to pay land revenue."

(b) In the Kangra tehsil 2,796 acres were affected in varying degrees—

	Acres.
In Dehra tehsil .. .. .	127
In Palampur tehsil .. .. .	480
In Nurpur tehsil .. .. .	1,894
In Kula tehsil .. .. .	81

(c) Proposals for remissions of land revenue on crops damaged are under consideration. Final orders have not yet been passed on them.

#### ACCIDENTS NEAR VERKA RAILWAY PHATAK.

**\*2735. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it has been brought to his notice that on the 9th of October 1929, Shaikh Muhammad Husain, Hide Merchant, Amritsar, met with a motor accident near Verka Railway *phatak*, resulting in the death of his two daughters and one son and serious injuries to himself, wife and to another son ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that there is a dangerous road curve where the said Shaikh Sahib met with that fatal accident ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that several accidents took place at the very same place in 1928-29, and, if so, what is their number and whether any compensation was allowed to the sufferers ;
- (d) whether it is a fact that Public Works Department in spite of several accidents did not erect caution signal at that dangerous spot ;
- (e) whether it is a fact that near the same spot there is also a dangerous pit ;
- (f) if so, why no steps have been taken to guard against such accidents and whether the Government will be pleased to state the steps they propose to take to prevent the recurrence of such accidents in future near Verka Railway *phatak* ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) It is understood that a collision occurred in 1928 at this crossing between a train and a lorry. The accident occurred on the Railway line and no compensation was claimed from or paid by Local Government.

(d) There were caution signs at each end of the double curve.

(e) No.

(f) Does not arise.

## GRANTS-IN-AID IN AMBALA DIVISION.

**\*2766. Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) the reasons for curtailing grants-in-aid in the Ambala division ;
- (b) the names of schools belonging to the educationally backward tribes in the division ;
- (c) whether greater or lesser reductions have proportionally been made in the aforesaid schools than in the other schools of the division ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) The honourable member is referred to the reply just given to his question No. \*2691.<sup>1</sup>

(b) It is not possible to reply to part (b) with any exactness as it is very difficult to define precisely the "educationally backward tribes" but the grants of all schools on the grant-in-aid list are assessed by the inspecting authorities under the general principles laid down in the Punjab Education Code.

(c) Does not arise.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister please state whether similar reductions in the grants for other divisions also have been made ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I suppose the honourable member means to ask whether any other division as a whole has suffered a reduction in the matter of grant. I cannot answer this question precisely from memory, but I think it is fairly correct to say that in other divisions any reductions like those in Ambala have not taken place.

## HIGH SCHOOLS IN AMBALA DIVISION.

**\*2767. Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state whether it is a fact that the total number of students in high schools in the Ambala division is on the decrease now, and, if so, what are the reasons ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** No; the figures of actual enrolment on the 15th May 1928 and 15th May 1929 are 17,604 and 17,621, respectively.

## LOCAL RATES.

**\*2771. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that local rate is not charged on the permanent well revenue before the expiry of the protective lease in the Pakpattan tahsil of Montgomery district and other districts of the province ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that in Multan district local rate is charged on such wells ;
- (c) if so, what are the reasons for this difference ?



**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes, at present.

(c) The law on the subject of the liability of land to local rate is uniform throughout the province. The question of whether the correct interpretation of the law is that generally followed throughout the province or that adopted by a former Collector of Multan has been referred by the present Collector of Multan to the Commissioner and a decision will be reached in due course.

#### MUHARRAM PROCESSION, KAITHAL.

**\*2775. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that Hindus of Kaithal observed a complete hartal on the occasion of last Muharram as a protest against the action of the local authorities in insisting upon allowing the procession to pass by certain route in spite of the objection of Hindus ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the local authorities refused to grant license for Rambila procession except on certain conditions which were put forward by the Muhammadans ;

(c) if so, what were the conditions imposed by the local authorities ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Hindus of Kaithal observed hartal on the occasion of the last Muharram as a protest against permission being granted to the passage of a *tazia* in front of a temple. The permission to follow the route past the temple was given by the District authorities in conformity with an appellate decision by the Commissioner, Ambala Division, on the issue of established custom.

(b) and (c) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to his Council Question No. 1587 asked in November, 1928.

#### UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

##### NON-OFFICIAL PRESIDENTS OF LOCAL BODIES.

**742. Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali :** Will the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to say if any official presidents of local bodies have been substituted by non-official presidents in any of the local bodies of the Punjab since the 1st January 1927 ? If so, in what places ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** The required information is contained in the attached statement.

[ Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan, Noon. ]

LIST OF THE LOCAL BODIES IN THE PUNJAB WHICH HAVE ELECTED  
NON-OFFICIAL PRESIDENTS SINCE THE 1ST JANUARY 1927.

*Municipal Committees.—*

1. Gohana.
2. Shahabad.
3. Sadhaura.
4. Jhelum.
5. Pind Dadan Khan.
6. Khushab.
7. Mianwali.

*Town Committee.—*

1. Jajjon.
2. Shorkot.
3. Ahmadpur.
4. Garhmaharaja.

MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE, KASUR.

**750. Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram, Kalia :** (i) Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) the average monthly income of the municipal committee, Kasur during the last seven months ;
- (b) the average monthly expenditure in all departments of the committee ;
- (c) the amount due to contractors for supplies and works completed ;
- (d) the amount due to traders for octroi refunds ;
- (e) whether it is a fact that the committee has been withholding payments due to contractors and traders for want of funds ?

(ii) If the replies to the above be in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state what measures the committee has adopted to put its finances on a sound footing ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon—**

- (i) (a) Rs. 10,467.
- (b) Rs. 9,085 for the same period as that referred to in clause (a) above.
- (c) Rs. 4,704.
- (d) Rs. 6,117-5-0 of which a sum of Rs. 5,193 -7-9 was reported to be under dispute.
- (e) No.
- (ii) Does not arise.

## RECEIPT OF PANCHOTRA BY DISTRICT BOARD MEMBERS.

**777. Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government kindly state—

- (a) if it is a fact that under the present District Board Rules no one can stand for election or remain a member who has drawn or did draw any remunerations for services rendered to the Board ;
- (b) if there are any members who received Panchotra as a remuneration from the District Board, Ludhiana, for collection of Haisiat tax ;
- (c) if so, what action does Government intend to take with regard to them under the rules ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** (a) The District Board Election Rules 1927 render ineligible for election any person who receives any remuneration out of the district fund for services rendered to the district board concerned. This cannot be construed to mean that any person who has in the past received such remuneration is ineligible provided that he is not receiving such remuneration at the time that the question of the eligibility arises.

(b) No, but it is understood that two members assisted in the recovery of Haisiat tax. The full amount of panchotra was however paid to the lambardars.

(c) Does not arise.

## DISTRICT INSPECTORS OF SCHOOLS, ETC.

**960. Shaikh Faiz Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state for each district in the Province—

- (a) the percentage of Muslims in the total population ;
- (b) whether the district inspector of schools is a Muslim or non-Muslim ;
- (c) the number of Muslim and non-Muslim assistant district inspectors of schools ;
- (d) the number of Muslim and non-Muslim headmasters of district board vernacular middle schools at present ;
- (e) the number of Muslim and non-Muslim candidates who passed the Vernacular final examination from district board vernacular middle schools in 1928 ;
- (f) the number of Muslim and non-Muslim scholars enrolled in the secondary department of all district board vernacular middle schools on 31st March 1928 ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** A statement giving the requisite information as it stood on 19th December 1929 is attached herewith.

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

## STATEMENT.

1 Serial No.	2 Name of the district.	3 Percent- age of Muslims in the total population.	4 Whether the District Ins- pector of Schools is a Muslim or non-Muslim.	5 NUMBER OF ASSISTANT DIS- TRICT INSPECTOR OF SCHOOLS.		6 NUMBER OF HEAD- MASTERS OF DISTRICT BOARD VERNACULAR MIDDLE SCHOOLS.		7 NUMBER OF CANDIDATES WHO PASSED THE VER- NACULAR FINAL EX- AMINATION FROM DISTRICT BOARD VER- NACULAR MIDDLE SCHOOLS IN 1928.		8 NUMBER OF STUDENTS ENROLLED IN THE SECONDARY DEPARTMENT OF ALL DISTRICT BOARD VERNACULAR MIDDLE SCHOOLS ON 31ST MARCH 1928.	
				Muslims.	Non- Muslims.	Muslims.	Non- Muslims.	Muslims.	Non- Muslims.	Muslims.	Non- Muslims.
1	Hissar ..	26.4	Non-Muslim ..	1	4	9	23	20	118	262	983
2	Rohtak ..	16.2	Do. ..	2	4	8	25	24	286	203	1,584
3	Gurgaon ..	31.8	Muslim ..	1	4	6	17	29	86	240	612
4	Karnal ..	28.4	Do. ..	2	2	12	18	17	70	200	503
5	Ambala ..	30.2	Non-Muslim ..	2	3	6	16	27	108	218	887
6	Simla ..	15.3	Do. ..	..	..	..	3	2	22	6	101
7	Kangra ..	4.9	Do. ..	..	..	..	19	2	123	29	1,229
8	Hoshiarpur ..	31.2	Do. ..	1	4	5	18	102	264	995	2,045
9	Jullundur ..	44.6	Do. ..	2	3	8	14	96	66	1,222	902
10	Ludhiana ..	33.9	Muslim ..	1	8	7	15	52	151	426	1,685

11	Ferozepore ..	43.9	Non-Muslim ..	2	4	12	10	72	81	683	541
12	Lahore ..	57.2	Do. ..	4	2	9	9	61	84	448	633
13	Sialkot ..	61.9	Muslim ..	3	3	7	8	94	67	914	622
14	Gurdaspur ..	49.6	Do. ..	3	3	8	12	107	118	783	882
15	Amritsar ..	45.6	Non-Muslim ..	3	2	4	11	75	137	575	1,024
16	Sheikhpura ..	63.2	Do. ..	3	1	6	7	75	51	618	397
17	Gujranwala ..	71.2	Do. ..	3	1	5	5	63	62	360	252
18	Gujrat ..	86.1	Do. ..	3	2	8	5	111	26	709	180
19	Shahpur ..	82.8	Muslim ..	4	2	18	7	84	46	846	418
20	Jhelum ..	88.7	Do. ..	3	1	15	4	108	23	987	194
21	Rawalpindi ..	82.6	Non-Muslim ..	3	2	21	7	105	18	1,253	207
22	Attock ..	90.9	Muslim ..	5	..	13	4	86	16	599	192
23	Mianwali ..	86.2	Do. ..	4	..	13	4	54	70	510	424
24	Montgomery ..	71.9	Do. ..	5	1	9	8	43	40	997	972
25	Lyalpur ..	60.7	Do. ..	4	2	16	14	171	79	1,417	572
26	Jhang ..	83.3	Do. ..	4	..	13	9	59	77	646	771
27	Multan ..	82.2	Non-Muslim ..	5	1	7	6	77	85	835	544
28	Muzaffargarh ..	86.8	Muslim ..	3	1	13	5	87	104	596	516
29	Dera Ghazi Khan ..	87.7	Do. ..	3	1	17	7	98	84	762	564

## HARGO LAL GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOL.

**1197. Pandit Mehar Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Hargo Lal Girls' High School, otherwise known as the Hargo Lal Kanya Mahavidyalaya, Ambala Cantonment, applied to the Inspectress of Schools, concerned, for recognition in March 1928;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Inspectress concerned has neither visited the school nor replied to any of the letters received on the subject from the Honorary Secretary of the School;
- (c) whether the Government will be pleased to lay on the table the correspondence, if any, on the subject;
- (d) whether it is a fact that in September 1928 a representation on the subject was made by the management of the school to the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab;
- (e) if so, will the Government be pleased to place on the table a copy of the said representation;
- (f) what reply has been given to the management of the school by the Director of Public Instruction;
- (g) whether the Government is aware that the said school contains more than 200 girls on its rolls and is housed in a suitable building?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The information as a whole is not yet available and further enquiries are being made in the matter.

## INDIAN CHRISTIANS IN GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENTS.

**1312. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing the names of departments—

- (a) in which there is at present no Indian-Christian employed in the higher or the lower grades;
- (b) the qualifications required for entering the higher and the lower grades of such departments?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** The information desired by the honourable member is not available and Government consider that its calculation would involve an amount of time and labour incommensurate with its value.

## MODEL TOWN AT PALAMPUR.

**1315. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is proposed to build a model town at Palampur; if so, what stage has the project reached;
- (b) whether a site has been selected, if so, how far it is from the railway station and Palampur town;
- (c) whether good drinking water is available near the site; if not, what action is proposed to be taken to remedy this defect?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** (a) Yes, the project is yet in its early stages as the plans and estimates are still under examination.

(b) Yes. It is at a distance of 3 to 4 miles from the railway station and less than a mile from the town of Palampur.

(c) Yes. The proposals under consideration include the provision of a piped water supply.

#### INSPECTION OF RURAL DISPENSARIES BY CIVIL SURGEONS.

**1323. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state, whether it is a fact that during 1928-29 certain rural dispensaries were not inspected by civil surgeons in some districts? If so, what is the number of such dispensaries?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** (1) Yes.

(2) Fifteen out of 300.

#### CART TRAFFIC ON THE KALKA-SIMLA ROAD.

**1327. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that bullock cart traffic is not permitted on the Simla-Kalka road during day time;

(b) if so, what is the penalty for infringement of these orders;

(c) what officer is responsible for the control of this traffic;

(d) what steps were taken by him during July 1929 to exercise this control?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The Honourable Member is right in thinking that there is a well-understood practice that bullock-cart traffic should not take place during day time. The Kalka-Simla road passes through Patiala and Baghat State territories; and the said States support the view that finds favour with the Honourable Member.

(b) No definite orders on the subject have been traced and therefore the penalty for infringement of these orders cannot be stated.

(c) Responsibility for the road lies on the administrations through whose territory the road passes.

(d) Does not arise.

#### BOAT BRIDGE MATERIAL STORED AT GHAZI GHAT.

**1344. Shaikh Faiz Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member kindly state—

(a) the exact extent of loss sustained by the Public Works Department with details of boat-bridge material stored at Ghazi Ghat and stated to have been washed away or otherwise destroyed during the recent floods in the Indus;

(b) names of the sub-divisional officer and sub-oversees or overseer in charge of the above material;

(c) number of khalsis appointed to look after the material during the last summer;

[ Sh. Faiz Muhammad.]

(d) number of khalasis appointed for the same purpose during each of the three summers previous to the last ; and, if there was a decrease in the number of khalasis, will Government kindly state who advised it and its reasons ;

(e) whether the Public Works Department authorities are prepared to admit that the loss of destruction of boat-bridge material was due to decrease in the number of khalasis and absence from duty of some of them ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The exact extent of loss cannot be given as materials are being still recovered ;

(b) I am sure it is not in public interest to communicate the names ;

(c) Forty ;

(d) The average number was 65, and the number was decreased in the interest of economy ;

(e) No.

#### AVERAGE PRICE OF UNGINNED COTTON AND WHEAT.

**1349. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member kindly state the average price per maund of—

(a) unginced cotton ; and

(b) wheat in 1920, 1924, 1926, 1927, 1928 and 1929 ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** A statement giving the required information is laid on the table.

#### STATEMENT SHOWING THE AVERAGE PRICE OF UNGINNED COTTON AND WHEAT.

Year.	AVERAGE PRICE IN RUPEES PER MAUND.		REMARKS.
	Unginned cotton	Wheat.	
	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	
1920 .. ..	10 10 8	5 6 6	The average price in the case of unginced cotton has been worked out from the retail prices in seers per rupee and the average has been converted into rupees per maund as its wholesale price is not available. In the case of wheat wholesale prices have been taken into account.
1924 .. ..	16 6 7	4 6 4	
1926 .. ..	9 8 10	5 4 9	
1927 .. ..	10 0 0	4 12 8	
1928 .. ..	11 10 2	5 0 8	
1929* .. ..	9 8 10	5 4 3	

\*Average of 10 months.



## PROHIBITION OF LORRIES ON CERTAIN ROADS.

**1352. Sardar Mohindar Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that lorries are not allowed to run on certain roads at night ;
- (b) if so, what are the names of these roads and what is the reason for this prohibition ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) (1) All roads in the following districts—

1. Multan.
2. Kangra.
3. Shahpur.
4. Hissar.
5. Jhelum.
6. Ferozepore.
7. Gujrat.

(2) The following roads only in the districts mentioned against them—

- |   |                     |
|---|---------------------|
| 1. Rawalpindi-Murree  | .. Rawalpindi.      |
| 2. Simla-Taradevi   | .. Simla.           |
| 3. Sakhisarwar-F. Munro   | .. Dera Ghazi Khan. |
| 4. Pathankot-Dalhousie and all unmetalled District Board Roads. | Gurdaspur.          |
| 5. Hoshiarpur-Una, Hoshiarpur-Barwain                           | Hoshiarpur.         |

The reason for this prohibition is, in the case of hill roads, their essentially dangerous nature, and in the case of other roads that District Magistrates consider night lorry traffic inadvisable in the interests of public safety.

Government are however of opinion that the restriction in the case of roads other than hill roads may not be necessary and the question of limiting it to hill roads is under consideration.

LISTS OF VOTERS FOR PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL AND  
DISTRICT BOARDS.

**1356. Mr. E. Maya Das :** (a) Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement by districts showing—

- (i) the number of voters for the Punjab Legislative Council ;
- (ii) the number of voters for the district boards ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that these lists are prepared by patwaris ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the patwaris are paid some extra allowance for preparing lists of voters for the Legislative Council, but are not paid anything for preparing lists of district boards ;

[ Mr. E. Maya Das.]

(d) if so, will Government be pleased to state the reasons for making some payment in one case and not in the other ?

**The Honourable Malik Feroz Khan Noon :** (a) (i) and (ii) Two statements giving the required figures are attached.

(b) The Voters Lists for the district boards are prepared by patwaris, and for the Punjab Legislative Council by patwaris in rural areas, and by muharrirs in urban areas.

(c) Yes.

(d) Under paragraph 14 of the Financial Commissioner's Standing Order No. 15 the patwaris are required to give such assistance as may be required of them in elections under the District Board Act. Hence no question of payment for preparation of such lists arises.

STATEMENT REGARDING "VOTERS LISTS" FOR DISTRICT BOARDS.

Serial No.	Name of District Board.	Number of voters as per the latest figures available.
1	Ludhiana .. .. .	35,135
2	Gujrat .. .. .	66,330
3	Gurdaspur .. .. .	60,706
4	Amritsar .. .. .	57,110
5	Lahore .. .. .	53,691
6	Hissar .. .. .	50,494
7	Gurgaon .. .. .	30,984
8	Muzaffargarh .. .. .	10,928
9	Lyallpur .. .. .	45,985
10	Ambala .. .. .	51,393
11	Jhelum .. .. .	7,728
12	Mianwali .. .. .	5,540
13	Rohtak .. .. .	76,419
14	Shahpur .. .. .	21,971
15	Jhang .. .. .	15,339
16	Sialkot .. .. .	26,652
17	Sheikhpura .. .. .	31,458
18	Gujranwala .. .. .	20,692

## STATEMENT REGARDING "VOTERS LIST" FOR DISTRICT BOARDS—CONCLUDED.

Serial No.	Name of District Board.	Number of voters as per the latest figures available.
19	Ferozepore .. .. .	80,893
20	Hoshiarpur .. .. .	93,474
21	Attock .. .. .	39,264
22	Montgomery .. .. .	36,578
23	Jullundur .. .. .	75,484
24	Multan .. .. .	17,115
25	Dera Ghazi Khan .. .. .	4,933
26	Rawalpindi .. .. .	41,288
27	Karnal .. .. .	45,318
28	Kangra .. .. .	7,299

## MANKA CANAL.

**1366. Khan Bahadur Nawab Muhammad Jamal Khan:** Will the Honourable Revenue Member kindly state—

- whether it is a fact that the Irrigation Department is expected to provide water for irrigating 45 per cent. of the commanded area of the Manka Canal in Dera Ghazi Khan district;
- whether it is a fact that, while average irrigation at the Upper Manka is 55 per cent. of the commanded area, the zamindars of the Lower Manka receive less than 29 per cent. and those of the big village Darkhast Jamal Khan at the tail only 19 per cent.;
- what steps Government proposes to take to ensure a fair distribution of water so far as this particular area is concerned?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** (a) Yes.

(b) The average percentages have been 53 per cent. on Upper Manka, 30 per cent. on Lower Manka and 20 per cent. in village Darkhast Jamal Khan.

(c) The Superintending Engineer is being directed to equalize canal supplies in the two tracts as soon as practicable.

## GRANT-IN-AID TO AIDED HIGH SCHOOLS, AMBALA DIVISION.

**1368. Chaudhri Dali Chand:** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- the grant-in-aid given separately to each of the aided high schools in the Ambala division for the year 1928-29;

[Ch. Duli Chand.]

- (b) the grant-in-aid given separately to each of the aided high schools in the Ambala division from April 1929 to September 1929 ;
- (c) the grant-in-aid sanctioned separately for each of the aided high schools in the Ambala division from October 1929 to March 1930 ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) The Honourable Member is referred to my answer to question No. 1198.<sup>1</sup>

(b) and (c) The information is not yet available, but will be given later in the usual consolidated statement of such grants.

#### COMPULSORY EDUCATION IN AMBALA DISTRICT.

**1371. Rai Sahib Lala Ganga Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) in what committees small towns and district areas of the Ambala district is free and compulsory education prevalent ;
- (b) the names of committees and small towns that have adopted wholly or partly the *Punjab Compulsory Primary Education Act*, with population of such area, number of school-going boys and those really under education on 31st March 1929, and similar information with regard to the different groups of villages of the district board areas ;
- (c) the names of the municipal committees and small towns where free and compulsory education is not at all adopted, whether any efforts have been made in the direction ; and, if so, with what results and after how long will free and compulsory education be possible in such areas ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) and (b) A statement giving the necessary information is enclosed.

(c) There is no municipal or town committee in the Ambala district which has not agreed to the introduction of compulsion in its area though it has not yet been actually introduced in some cases.

#### STATEMENT REGARDING COMPULSION IN RURAL AREAS IN THE AMBALA DISTRICT ON 31st MARCH 1929.

Serial No.	Name of Rural area where compulsion has actually been introduced.	Population of each area.	Number of boys of school-going age in the area.	Number of boys of school-going age reading in school on 31st March 1929.	REMARKS.
1	Bharaib (Kharar) ..	995	55	30	
2	Rasan Hiri ..	388	22	14	

<sup>1</sup>Vol. X, pages 70—81.

**STATEMENT REGARDING COMPUSSION IN RURAL AREAS IN THE AMBALA DISTRICT ON 31st MARCH 1929—CONTINUED.**

Serial No.	Name of Rural area where compulsion has actually been introduced.	Population of each area.	Number of boys of school-going age in the area.	Number of boys of school-going age reading in school on 31st March 1929.	REMARKS.
3	Tirab	862	203	57	
4	Shakrullahpur	757	64	48	
5	Akalgarh	195	73	39	
6	Kujhri	571	60	29	
7	Baqarpur	445	82	35	
8	Simbol Magra	136	34	25	
9	Giga Magra	424	53	33	
10	Siwan	760	53	25	
11	Dusarna	408	41	19	
12	Bhaukarpur	1,072	60	44	
13	Halla Magra	394	63	32	
14	Bajbiri	584	42	13	
15	Naya Shehar	711	38	83	
16	Bahlalpur	691	46	29	
17	Kausal	633	48	21	
18	Manauli	1,398	149	83	
19	Kurahi	2,669	163	121	
20	Kalewal	573	110	65	
21	Allahpur	365	30	11	
22	Mubarakpur	1,008	110	80	
23	Majra	494	50	17	
24	Timar	1,376	100	72	
25	Sundrai	636	54	50	
26	Barmala	1,800	220	92	
27	Mullanpur	1,732	166	121	
28	Garangaon	724	31	27	
29	Berail	1,909	174	72	

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

## STATEMENT REGARDING COMPULSION IN RURAL AREAS IN THE AMBALA DISTRICT ON 31st MARCH 1929—CONTINUED.

Serial No.	Name of Rural area where compulsion has actually been introduced.	Population of each area.	Number of boys of school-going age in the area.	Number of boys of school-going age reading in school on 31st March 1929.	REMARKS.
30	Mani Magra ..	3,253	118 ..	44	
31	Nakaia ..	877	92 ..	32	
32	Manakpur Sharif ..	1,223	105 ..	49	
33	Raipur Kalan ..	398	26 ..	17	
34	Samara ..	553	58 ..	40	
35	Rurki Paoa ..	393	55 ..	44	
36	Kali Bar ..	691	84 ..	30	
37	Doan ..	518	85 ..	53	
38	Rupal Hiri ..	420	26 ..	12	
39	Mustafabad (Jagodhiri) ..	2,355	89 ..	48	
40	Bilaspur ..	2,103	84 ..	8	
41	Khadri ..	777	76 ..	54	
42	Chhauli ..	776	30 ..	12	
43	Damla ..	801	85 ..	65	
44	Kharman ..	2,377	167 ..	62	
45	Abdullahpur Mandi ..	613	35 ..	79	
46	Tale Kaur ..	1,056	137 ..	49	
47	Sasauli ..	277	20 ..	..	
48	Nabarpur ..	1,091	70 ..	20	
49	Shahpur ..	440	30 ..	17	
50	Anrangabad ..	376	53 ..	30	
51	Deadhar ..	877	100 ..	53	
52	Tighri ..	449	50 ..	21	
53	Chagnauli ..	560	252 ..	87	
54	Mahlanwali ..	721	50 ..	33	
55	Baragoan (No. garb) ..	753	40 ..	29	

## STATEMENT REGARDING COMPULSION IN RURAL AREAS IN THE AMBALA DISTRICT ON 31st MARCH 1929—CONTINUED.

Serial No.	Name of Rural area where compulsion has actually been introduced.	Population of each area.	Number of boys of school-going age in the area.	Number of boys of school-going age reading in school on 31st March 1929.	REMARKS
56	Billa ..	1,065	63	50	
57	Naraingarh ..	2,490	157	136	
58	Mankpur Khurki ..	366	108	31	
59	Amli ..	467	92	48	
60	Jioh ..	569	88	58	
61	Rataur ..	950	96	50	
62	Sarewan ..	784	71	25	
63	Bharaug ..	750	58	40	
64	Kath Magra ..	441	26	12	
65	Shahzadpur ..	2,218	109	21	
66	Raipur Rani ..	2,698	165	16	
67	Kurali ..	943	49	20	
68	Badhanli ..	1,203	80	16	
69	Kot ..	941	80	65	
70	Khatauli ..	906	125	45	
71	Bhareri Kalan ..	693	91	66	
72	Ramgarh ..	1,507	121	106	
73	Handi ..	890	197	75	
74	Baghwala ..	375	34	25	
75	Karma Khurd ..	1,090	128	74	
76	Nanaula Ambala ..	1,275	226	60	
77	Raju Kheri ..	329	57	32	
78	Jansui ..	978	69	31	
79	Tandwal ..	628	65	39	
80	Ramgarh ..	303	47	21	
81	Hali ..	250	38	38	
82	Pilkhani ..	1,475	84	40	

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

## STATEMENT REGARDING COMPELSION IN RURAL AREAS IN THE AMBALA DISTRICT ON 31st MARCH 1929—CONTINUED.

Serial No.	Name of Rural area where compulsion has actually been introduced.	Population of each area.	Number of boys of school-going age in the area.	Number of boys of school-going age reading in school on 31st March 1929.	REMARKS.
83	Kanula ..	901	194	52	
84	Gala ..	551	47	34	
85	Rajnali ..	620	104	56	
86	Sohana ..	662	47	39	
87	Manbra ..	1,103	84	44	
88	Saha ..	2,234	200	140	
89	Sahga ..	911	57	24	
90	Dukheri ..	1,301	66	46	
91	Tharma ..	505	15	2	
92	Samalheri ..	907	114	49	
93	Boh ..	1,866	83	93	
94	Behta ..	2,060	85	55	
95	Nabauni ..	1,019	65	40	
96	Thakarpura ..	551	131	77	
97	Bahial ..	4,075	219	169	
98	Duliani ..	453	12	12	
99	Dhin ..	1,334	142	85	
100	Barara ..	1,660	71	51	
101	Thambar ..	1,759	275	109	
102	Ugala ..	1,483	108	54	
103	Binghalpur ..	909	93	63	
104	Sehum Magra (Tupar) ..	398	46	39	
105	Behrampur Zamindari ..	667	87	57	
106	Sadhupur Kalan ..	397	100	45	
107	Kandhaura ..	308	38	23	
108	Bharigarb ..	980	53	33	



## STATEMENT REGARDING COMPULSION IN RURAL AREAS IN THE AMBALA DISTRICT ON 31st MARCH 1929—CONCLUDED.

Serial No.	Name of Rural area where compulsion has actually been introduced.	Population of each area.	Number of boys of school-going age in the area.	Number of boys of school-going age reading in school on 31st March 1929.	REMARKS.
109	Dhangerli ..	969	56	28	
110	Panjkuha ..	813	50	17	
111	Rangilpur ..	222	57	42	
112	Kishanpura ..	234	27	24	
113	Dum Chheri ..	473	48	21	
114	Shimpur ..	418	35	18	
115	Gauhanli ..	1,189	72	60	
116	Lutheri ..	648	45	35	
117	Singh Bhagwantpur ..	342	68	49	
118	Morinda ..	3,693	295	147	

## STATEMENT RELATING TO URBAN AREAS WHERE COMPULSION HAS BEEN INTRODUCED IN THE AMBALA DISTRICT UPTO 31st MARCH 1929.

Serial No.	Name of Urban area where compulsion has actually been introduced (wholly or partly).	Population of Urban area.	Number of boys of school-going age (6-11 years).	Number of boys reading in the Urban area on 31st March 1929.	REMARKS.
1	Rupar Municipal Committee.	7,844	495	484	
2	Kalka Small Town ..	7,635	425	293	

## PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION IN AMBALA DISTRICT.

**1373. Rai Sahib Lala Ganga Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to supply a statement regarding the annual cost on primary and secondary education by all different resources for each year according to each tahsil of the Ambala district.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## PURCHASE OF STAMPS.

**1379. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) if it is a fact that there is a branch of the Imperial Bank situated in the Amritsar City at a distance of three miles from the courts ;
- (b) if it is a fact that the public who have to purchase stamps have first to go to the treasury situated in the court compound and get a challan duly signed by the official at the treasury and then go to the Imperial Bank for the deposit of the money, then again go back and get a stamp from the treasury ;
- (c) if the answer to (a) and (b) be in the affirmative, what action Government proposes to take to simplify the procedure ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) The branch of the Imperial Bank at Amritsar City is  $1\frac{1}{2}$  miles from the courts.

(b) The procedure mentioned is followed only for purchasers of stamps of the value of over Rs. 75. Stamps of lower value are obtainable from stamp vendors in the Kacheri compound.

(c) The question is under consideration.

## MOTOR ACCIDENTS.

**1382. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) what is the number of motor accidents that took place during the year 1928-29 which resulted in serious injury or death of one or more persons ;
- (b) in how many instances were cases instituted against those to blame and what punishment was generally inflicted ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## STATIONING OF POLICE AT FERRIES.

**1391. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that formerly police constables used to be stationed at ferries ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that they were removed some time ago ; if so, when ;
- (c) what was the reason for the withdrawal of the police ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes, police constables formerly were and still are stationed at certain ferries in the Punjab.

(b) They were withdrawn from certain ferries in the districts of Ambala, Ferozepore and Gurdaspur in the year 1916. They were also.

withdrawn from certain ferries in Jhang district, but there are still police stationed at certain ferries in Jhang, Dera Ghazi Khan, Ferozepore and Hoshiarpur districts.

(c) The withdrawals in 1916 were made when the distribution of the Police force was revised as it did not appear that the constables concerned were doing useful work.

#### EDUCATION IN RUPAR AND KHARAR TAHSILS.

**1394. Rai Sahib Lala Ganga Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

(a) the number of students classwise of all lower middle and middle schools, aided or unaided, in the Rupar and Kharar tahsils on 30th June 1929 and the names of such English and vernacular schools with optional English ;

(b) the number of students with English, optional English, as their subjects on 30th June 1929 in different lower middle schools in the Rupar and Kharar tahsils separately ;

(c) the number of students in each class in the following schools separately on the 30th June 1929—

- (i) Government High School, Rupar ;
- (ii) Khalsa High School, Rupar ;
- (iii) Islamia High School, Rupar ;
- (iv) Public High School, Rupar ;
- (v) Khalsa High School, Chamkaur (Rupar) ;
- (vi) Mission High School, Kharar ;
- (vii) Khalsa High School ; Kharar ;
- (viii) Khalsa High School, Kurali (Kharar) ;
- (ix) State High School, Nalagarh ;
- (x) State High School, Bilaspur ;
- (xi) Arya High School, Kathgarh ;
- (xii) Khalsa High School, Anandpur.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** A statement giving the requisite information is appended.

[Hon'ble Manohar Lal.]

## STATEMENT.

(a) Name of School.	Number of boys class wise on 30th June 1929.							
	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII
(a) The number of students classwise of all Lower Middle and Middle Schools, aided or unaided, in Rupar and Kharar tahsils on 30th June 1929, and the names of such English and Vernacular Schools with Optional English.								
(1) Aided Islamic Anglo-Vernacular Middle School, Rupar.	..	..	..	..	50	24	20	17
(2) Unaided Khalsa Anglo-Vernacular Lower Middle School, Kainaur (Tahsil Rupar).	..	..	..	..	6	8	..	..
(3) Aided Indian Boys Anglo-Vernacular Lower Middle School, Sanawar (Tahsil Kharar).	15	12	9	10	10	9	..	1
(b) The number of students with English, Optional English as their subjects on 30th June 1929, in different Lower Middle Schools in Rupar and Kharar Tahsils separately.								
(1) Unaided Khalsa Anglo-Vernacular Lower Middle School, Kainaur (Tahsil Rupar).	..	..	..	14	..	..	..	..
(2) Aided Indian Boys Anglo-Vernacular Lower Middle School, Sanawar, (Tahsil Kharar).	..	..	..	19	..	..	..	..

	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	S. S. I	VII	VIII	S. S. II	IX	X
(c) The number of students in each class in the following schools separately on 30th June 1929:—												
(1) Government High School, Rupar.	..	..	..	..	28	23	..	31	18	..	30	27
(2) Khalsa High School, Rupar	..	..	..	..	6	7	..	18	25	..	18	15
(3) Islamic High School, Rupar	..	..	..	..	50	24	..	20	17	..	17	13
(4) Public High School, Rupar	..	..	..	..	38	36	..	46	36	..	41	37
(5) Khalsa High School, Chamm-kaur (Rupar).	..	..	..	..	60	39	16	53	34	..	56	44
(6) Mission High School, Kharar.	25	15	28	19	25	38	9	26	21	2	36	32
(7) Khalsa High School, Kharar	..	..	..	..	32	21	18	38	37	16	36	32
(8) Khalsa High School, Kurali (Kharar).	28	14	9	13	23	35	7	31	27	2	36	36
(9) State High School, Nalagarh	..	..	..	..	43	44	..	26	19	..	31	17
(10) State High School, Bilaspur.	15	21	17	23	22	46	..	22	10	..	10	6
(11) Arya High School, Kathgarh.	..	..	..	..	25	21	..	19	18	..	16	14
(12) Khalsa High School, Anandpur.	47	39	34	21	29	20	..	13	17	..	17	32

## ENGLISH CLASSES IN MIDDLE SCHOOLS.

**1396. Rao Bahadur Captain Rao Balbir Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that optional English classes in middle schools in the Gurgaon district have been abolished from this year ;
- (b) if so, what are the reasons for this action ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes ; in six out of twelve vernacular upper middle schools teaching optional English.

(b) The expenditure on their maintenance was in excess of the income from fees and other contributions. In this connection attention of the honourable member is invited to paragraphs 19 and 20 of the proceedings of the Punjab Government (Ministry of Education) in the Education Department, No. 1468-M., dated the 29th January, 1923. The classes will, however, be continued if the deficit is made up by the local inhabitants.

## RECRUITMENT OF ASSISTANT SUB-INSPECTORS.

**1420. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance kindly state—

- (a) the total number of Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police selected since this new post was created ;
- (b) the total number of these posts which went to (i) Hindus and (ii) Muslims, showing them separately as statutory agriculturists and others ;
- (c) the total number of posts which fell to the share of each of the three ranges ;
- (d) the total number of posts which went to the four districts of Rohtak, Hissar, Gurgaon and Karnal out of the share of the Eastern Range ;
- (e) the distribution of the posts which fell to the share of the four districts mentioned in (d) among (i) Hindus and (ii) Muslims further sub-divided as statutory agriculturists and others ;
- (f) the number of Head Constables, recruited by direct appointment, with the details specified in (b), (c), (d) and (e) for the years 1926, 1927, 1928 and 1929 ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a), (b), (c), (d), (e) and (f) A statement is laid on the table.

(a) Eastern Range ..	23
Central Range ..	135
Western Range ..	57

	HINDUS.			MUSLIMS.		
	Agri.	Others.	Total.	Agri.	Others.	Total.
(b) Eastern Range ..	11	6	17	5	1	6
Central Range ..	38	8	46	63	26	89
Western Range ..	3	19	22	26	9	35

(c) Eastern Range ..	73
Central Range ..	135
Western Range ..	59

(d)	21	HINDUS.			MUSLIMS.		
		Agri.	Others.	Total.	Agri.	Others.	Total.
(e)		3	6	9	7	5	12

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

	HINDUS.			MUSLIMS.			HINDUS.			MUSLIMS.		
	Agri. Others.		Total.	Agri. Others.		Total.	Agri. Others.		Total.	Agri. Others.		Total.
	(c)	(d)	(e)	(c)	(d)	(e)	(c)	(d)	(e)	(c)	(d)	(e)
(f) Eastern Range—												
1926	22	8(b)	30	16	1	17	8	2	10	3	1	4
1927	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..
1928	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..
1929	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..
Central Range—												
1926	1	2	3	7	2	9	Nil.					
1927	4	3	7	5	4	9						
1928	4	3	7	5	..	5						
1929	..	..	..	..	..	..						
Western Range—												
1926	2	..	2	5	..	5	Nil.					
1927	2	2	4	10	..	10						
1928	3	4	7	16	1	17						
1929	..	3	3	2	..	2						
Railway Police—												
1926	2	..	2	..	..	..	7					
1927	2	1	3	..	..	..						
1928	..	2	2	..	..	..						
1929	..	..	..	..	..	..						
Criminal Investigation Department.												
1926	..	..	..	..	..	..						
1927	..	..	..	..	..	..						
1928	..	..	..	..	..	..						
1929	..	..	..	..	..	..						

\*One Muslim ex-Head Constable of the North-West Frontier Province Police was re-appointed.



## WATER STAND POST, PATHANKOT RAILWAY STATION.

**1427. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state whether it is a fact that no water stand post has been supplied on the Kangra Valley Railway platform at Pathankot? If so, will he kindly bring this shortcoming to the notice of the railway authorities?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The Agent, North-Western Railway, has intimated that the reply is in the affirmative and that it is proposed to provide a water stand post on the Kangra Valley Railway platform at Pathankot very shortly.

## AERATED WATER-SELLERS, KANGRA VALLEY RAILWAY.

**1428. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state whether it is a fact that in summer time aerated water-sellers do not accompany the trains on the Kangra Valley Railway? If so, will he kindly bring this shortcoming to the notice of the railway authorities?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The Agent, North-Western Railway, has intimated that the reply is in the negative and that ice-men have been regularly accompanying passenger trains on the Kangra Valley Railway during the hot weather months from 15th March to 31st October.

## GOVERNMENT HIGH SCHOOLS AND DEPRESSED CLASS STUDENTS.

**1429. Pandit Mehar Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of Government High Schools in the Punjab attended by students from the depressed classes, especially Chamars, Dhanaks and Meghas;
- (b) the number of such schools in which wells are actually open to the students of the above communities?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** So far as I am aware, the figures required are :—

- (a) 22.
- (b) 15.

## COMMITTEES AND COMMISSIONS.

**1438. Chaudhri Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan :** Will the Chief Secretary please state the number of committees and commissions appointed by the Government of India, the Secretary of State for India and His Majesty's Government during the period the reforms have been in force in the Punjab and the expenses incurred by the Punjab Government in connection with the same?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** A statement showing the committees or commissions in respect of which expenditure was incurred by the Punjab Government together with the approximate expenditure in each case is appended. The statement is not exhaustive, as there have been several other commissions and committees, e.g. the Royal Commission on Agriculture, in regard to which the local Government incurred incidental expenditure, for instance, on printing charges ; but information is not readily available in regard to the exact amount of expenditure incurred.

<i>Name of Committee or Commission.</i>	<i>Expenditure incurred.</i>
	Rs.
1. Civil Justice Committee ..	300
2. Indian Road Development Committee ..	60
3. Banking Enquiry Committee ..	One-fourth of the cost of the Provincial Committee which is estimated at Rs. 6,800 in 1929-30 and Rs. 5,800 in 1930-31.
4. Indian Statutory Commission..	} Rs. 70,978 (approximate).
5. Indian Central Committee	
6. Provincial Reforms Committee	
7. Auxiliary Committee of the Indian Statutory Commission..	
	100

PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN THE BEIT AREA OF THE JULLUNDUR DISTRICT.

**1439. Chaudhri Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) the number of primary schools started during the last two years in the Beit area of the Jullundur district ;
- (b) if the answer to the above be in the negative, how many schools the Government propose to open in the said area in the near future ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Nine.

(b) Does not arise.

PROVINCIAL AND IMPERIAL SERVICES.

**1453. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Chief Secretary to Government please lay on the table a statement showing—

- (a) the names of the various provincial services in the province, the members of which can rise to imperial services in their own line ;
- (b) the percentage of such imperial service appointments which are open to members of each of these provincial services ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** The information is as follows :—

Name of Provincial Service in the Punjab the members of which are eligible for promotion to the corresponding All India Service.	Percentage of appointments in the cadre of the corresponding All India Service reserved for promotion of Provincial Service Officers.	REMARKS.
(1) Provincial Police Service	20 per cent. of the Superior posts only.	
(2) Punjab Service of Engineers (Irrigation Branch).	20 per cent.	
(3) Provincial Forest Service	12½ per cent.	
(4) Punjab Civil Service	20 per cent. of the superior posts only to be attained by 1939.	Members of the Provincial Service on promotion do not become full members of the Indian Civil Service.

NOTE.—(a) Officers of the Provincial Civil Medical Service are not eligible for promotion to the Indian Medical Service, but 17 out of 28 Civil Surgeoncies are reserved for them.

(b) Recruitment to the Indian Veterinary Service, Indian Agricultural Service, Indian Service of Engineers (Buildings and Roads Branch), and Indian Education Service has ceased and these services are being provincialized. The question, therefore, does not arise in the case of these services.

#### DEPUTY REGISTRARS, ETC., OF THE CO-OPERATIVE DEPARTMENT.

**1459. Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- the number of permanent Deputy Registrars, Assistant Registrars and Inspectors of Co-operative Department community wise ;
- the names of persons appointed to these posts during the years 1927, 1928 and 1929 ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The number of permanent Deputy Registrars, Assistant Registrars and Inspectors in the Co-operative Department communitywise is as under :—

#### *Deputy Registrars.*

Europeans..	..	..	..	..	1
Muslims ..	..	..	..	..	2
Hindus ..	..	..	..	..	..
Sikhs ..	..	..	..	..	..

#### *Assistant Registrars.*

Muslims ..	..	..	..	..	11
Hindus ..	..	..	..	..	4
Sikhs ..	..	..	..	..	5

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

*Inspectors.*

Muslims .. .. .	52
Hindus .. .. .	22
Sikhs .. .. .	17
Christians .. .. .	1

(b) The following have held the post of Deputy Registrars during 1927, 1928 and 1929 :—

1927.

*As permanent Deputy Registrars.*

*As officiating Deputy Registrars, at various times.*

- |                               |                           |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------|
| 1. Khan Abdul Majid Khan.     | 1. Khan Sahib Barkat Ali. |
| 2. Khan Bahadur M. Fateh Khan | 2. S. Beant Singh.        |

1928.

- |                               |                           |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Mr. R. J. S. Dodd, I.C.S.     | Khan Sahib M. Barkat Ali. |
| Khan Bahadur Malik Fateh Khan | S. Beant Singh.           |
| Khan Abdul Majid Khan.        | Agha Ata Ullah Khan       |

1929.

- |                               |                            |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------|
| Mr. R. J. S. Dodd, I.C.S.     | S. Beant Singh.            |
| Khan Abdul Majid Khan.        | Chaudhri Abdul Hamid Khan. |
| Khan Bahadur Malik Fateh Khan | Agha Ata Ullah Khan.       |

2. The following have held the post of Assistant Registrar, during the 3 years :—

1927.

1927.

*As permanent Assistant Registrars.*

*As Officiating Assistant Registrars.*

- |                              |                               |
|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. Khan Sahib M. Barkat Ali. | 1. Khan Ghulam Muhammad Khan. |
| 2. S. Beant Singh.           | 2. S. Balwant Singh.          |
| 3. Chaudhri Abdul Hamid Khan | 3. Chaudhri Banta Singh.      |
| 4. Agha Ata Ullah Khan.      | 4. Chaudhri Ram Saroop.*      |
| 5. Lala Balkishan.           | 5. M. Fateh Singh. *          |
| 6. S. Lachhman Singh.        |                               |
| 7. S. Iqbal Singh.           |                               |
| 8. S. Gopal Singh.           |                               |
| 9. M. Mahan Singh.           |                               |
| 10. S. Kartar Singh.         |                               |
| 11. Chaudhri Nawab Ali.      |                               |

\*Probationer Assistant Registrar.

1927—*conold.*

*As permanent Assistant Registrars. As officiating Assistant Registrars*

12. Chaudhri Ghulam Muhammad.
13. Chaudhri Ali Muhammad.
14. Chaudhri Shah Muhammad.
15. Chaudhri Izzat Ali.
16. Chaudhri Ghulam Haider.
17. S. Zahur Hussain.
18. Shaikh Manzur Ali.

1928.

Same as in 1927.

1928.

Same as in 1927 and also

1. Chaudhri Ghulam Mustafa.
2. Chaudhri Iqbal Muhammad.
3. M. Kartar Singh.

1929.

Same as in 1927.

Excluding Khan Sahib M. Barkat Ali.

1929.

Same as in 1928 also.

1. Khan Ghulam Jilani Khan.
2. S. Indar Singh.

3. The following have held the post of Inspectors during the 3 years :—

Separate lists attached for each year.

INSPECTORS OF 1927.

1st grade Inspectors Rs. 250.

1. Rai Bahadur Jai Gopal.
2. K. Ahmad Hasan.
3. Lala Hargopal Das.
4. Chaudhri Milkhi Ram.
5. K. Ghulam Jilani Khan.
6. Shaikh Bashir Ahmad.
7. Chaudhri Ali Muhammad, Bajwa.
8. Chaudhri Faiz Ali.
9. S. Balwant Singh.
10. Chaudhri Badar Din.
11. M. Sultan Mahmud.
12. Chaudhri Banta Singh.
13. Chaudhri Ghulam Ali.
14. Chaudhri Ram Rakha Mall.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

*2nd grade Inspectors Rs. 200.*

15. Chaudhri Muhammad Akbar.
16. Chaudhri Iqbal Muhammad.
17. Miss Ahmad Shah.
18. Mian Kartar Singh.
19. Chaudhri Ghulam Mustafa.
20. Chaudhri Sardar Ali.
21. Chaudhri Muhammad Akram.
22. Chaudhri Tulsi Ram.
23. Dr. Baldev Singh.
24. Abdur Raoof Khan.
25. Chaudhri Muhammad Musa.
26. B. Indar Singh.
27. Abdur Rahman.
28. S. Kartar Singh.
29. Shaikh Munir Hussain.
30. Chaudhri Baldev Singh.
31. Chaudhri Muhammad Hussain.
32. S. Baldev Singh.
33. Chaudhri Ram Saroop.
34. M. Bir Singh.
35. Khawaja Ghulam Siddiq.
36. Chaudhri Sardar Khan.
37. P. Syed Haider.
38. Chaudhri Muhammad Ashraf Chima.
39. M. Rahmat Ali.
40. Chaudhri Jowala Parshad.
41. S. Balwant Singh.
42. Din Muhammad Akram.

*3rd Grade Inspectors Rs. 150.*

43. M. Dalip Singh.
44. S. Amar Singh.
45. Chaudhri Khuda Bakhsh.
46. Chaudhri Jaimal Singh.
47. M. Muhammad Ali Shah.
48. Chaudhri Bhagwan Singh.
49. S. Bhagat Singh.
50. Chaudhri Muhammad Ashan.

51. Chaudhri Bashi Ram.
  52. S. Bakhtawar Singh.
  53. Chaudhri Muhammad Panah.
  54. Qazi Ilahi Bakhsh.
  55. S. Ujagar Singh.
  56. Chaudhri Abdul Hamid Khan.
  57. Chaudhri Abdur Rahman.
  58. Chaudhri Shivdhan Singh.
  59. S. Thakar Singh.
  60. Chaudhri Sultan Ali.
  61. Nazir Ahmad.
  62. Gustasap Khan.
  63. Chaudhri Mehar Hussain.
  64. Chaudhri Muhammad Khan.
  65. Chaudhri Ahmad Khan.
- 

*4th Grade Inspectors in 1927 (Unconfirmed).*

1. Chaudhri Ahmad Din.
2. M. Ajit Singh.
3. Chaudhri Kesar Chand.
4. Sardar Lachhman Singh.
5. Chaudhri Fazal Ahmad.
6. M. Abdul Haq.
7. Chaudhri Muhammad Ashraf.
8. Chaudhri Hukam Singh.
9. Chaudhri Sant Singh.
10. Chaudhri Sultan Muhammad.
11. M. Hari Singh.
12. Chaudhri Ghulam Rasul.
13. Chaudhri Walayat Khan.
14. S. Charan Singh.
15. S. Gurcharan Singh.
16. Chaudhri Sahib Khan.
17. Chaudhri Muhammad Hussain.
18. D. Jagan Nath.
19. Chaudhri Ghulam Nabi.
20. Abdur Rashid.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

21. M. Raghunath Singh.
22. Chaudhri Abdullah Khan.
23. S. Asad Ali Shah.
24. Chaudhri Muhammad Ashlam.
25. S. Ihsan Ali Shah.
26. Chaudhri Mehr Singh.
27. Chaudhri Ghulam Sarwar.
28. Lala Bishamber Das.
29. Chaudhri Muhammad Azim.
30. Chaudhri Ahmad Khan.
31. S. Shamsheer Singh.
32. Chaudhri Sher Muhammad.
33. Chaudhri Dhirt Ram.
34. Chaudhri Rizq Ram.
35. Chaudhri Muhammad Hayat.
36. M. Sundar Singh.
37. Pandit Bhagwan Sahai.
38. Pandit Khushi Ram.
39. Chaudhri Mushtaq Ahmad.
40. Chaudhri Ghulam Qadir.
41. Chaudhri Muhammad Nawaz.
42. Chaudhri Bhagwan Singh.
43. Chaudhri Rahmat Ullah.
44. Chaudhri Milkha Singh.
45. Chaudhri Ali Muhammad Lati.
46. S. Jowand Singh.
47. Chaudhri Sohrab Khan.
48. M. Dhanbir Singh.
49. S. Shah Sower.
50. M. Abdul Majid Rana.

---

1928.

CLASSIFIED GRADATION LIST OF INSPECTORS, CO-OPERATIVE  
SOCIETIES IN THE PUNJAB AS IT STOOD ON 1ST NOVEMBER 1928.

1st Grade Inspectors, Rs. 250.

Rai Bahadur Jai Gopal	.. On deputation in Bikaner State.
1. K. Ahmad Hasan	.. Kasur.
2. Lala Har Gopal Das	.. Hissar.



3. Chaudhri Milkhi Ram .. Garh Shankar.
4. K. Ghulam Jilani Khan .. Tanda.
5. Sheikh Bashir Ahmad .. Educational Inspector, Lahore.
6. Chaudhri Ali Muhammad Bajwa .. Mianwali.
7. Chaudhri Faiz Ali.. .. Wazirabad.  
S. Balwant Singh .. Officiating Assistant Registrar.
8. Chaudhri Badar Din .. Nikodar.  
M. Sultan Mahmud .. On deputation in North-West Frontier Province.
9. Chaudhri Banta Singh .. Ferozepore from 1st October 1928. Officiating vice Sultan Mahmud on deputation to North-West Frontier Province.
10. Chaudhri Ghulam Ali .. Educational Inspector, Sargodha. Officiating vice Rai Bahadur Jai Gopal.
11. Chaudhri Ram Rakha Mal .. Palwal. Officiating vice S. Balwant Singh.

*2nd Grade Inspectors.*

- Chaudhri Banta Singh .. Officiating in 1st grade from 1st October 1928 vice M. Sultan Mahmud.
- Chaudhri Ghulam Ali .. Officiating in 1st grade vice Lala Jai Gopal.
- Chaudhri Ram Rakha Mall .. Officiating in 1st grade vice S. Balwant Singh.
1. Chaudhri Mohammad Akbar .. Shujabad.  
Chaudhri Iqbal Mohammad .. Officiating as Assistant Registrar.
  2. Miss Ahmad Shah ... Inspectress, Lahore.
  3. Mian Kartar Singh ... Ambala.
  4. Chaudhri Ghulam Mustafa .. Ludhiana.
  5. Chaudhri Sardar Ali .. Fazilka (on leave Chaudhri Dhanna Singh, officiating).
  6. Chaudhri Muhammad Akbar .. Batala.  
Chaudhri Tulsi Ram .. On deputation to Kashmir.  
Dr. Baldev Singh .. On deputation in Agriculture Department.
  7. K. Abdur Raouf Khan .. Mailsi.
  8. Chaudhri Muhammad Musa .. Phillaur.
  9. B. Indar Singh .. Zira.  
Abdur Rahman .. Ajnala (dismissed).

## [Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

- |                                     |    |   |
|-------------------------------------|----|---|
| 10. S. Kartar Singh ..              | .. | Educational Inspector, Jullundur.                                       |
| 11. Sheikh Munir Hussain ..         | .. | Campbellpur.  |
| 12. Chaudhri Baldev Singh ..        | .. | Rohtak.   |
| 13. Chaudhri Mohammad Hussain       | .. | Lyallpur.   |
| 14. Sardar Baldev Singh ..          | .. | Amritsar.   |
| 15. Chaudhri Ram Saroop ..          | .. | Rupar.  |
| M. Bir Singh ..                     | .. | On deputation in Delhi.   |
| 16. Kh. Ghulam Siddiq ..            | .. | Alipur. Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Ram Rakha Mal.                 |
| 17. Chaudhri Sardar Khan ..         | .. | Rawalpindi. Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Talsi Ram.                 |
| 18. P. Syed Haider ..               | .. | Sargodha. Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Iqbal Mohammad.              |
| 19. Chaudhri Mohammad Ashraf Chima. | .. | Hafizabad. Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Banta Singh.                |
| 20. M. Rahmat Ali ..                | .. | Jullundur Cond. Inspector, officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Ghulam Ali. |
| 21. Chaudhri Jowala Parshad ..      | .. | Lahore. Officiating <i>vice</i> Dr. Baldev Singh.                       |
| 22. Sardar Balwant Singh ..         | .. | Baha-ud-Din. Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Abdur Rahman, dismissed.  |
| 23. Din Mohammad Akram ..           | .. | Shahdra. Officiating <i>vice</i> S. Bir Singh on deputation.            |

## 3rd Grade Inspectors, Rs. 150.

- |                             |    |   |
|-----------------------------|----|---|
| Chaudhri Fateh Mohammad ..  | .. | } Promoted into this grade— <i>vide</i> Registrar, Ajmer's letter No. 2103, dated 20th July 1923. |
| S. Sohan Singh ..           | .. |   |
| Lala Banwari Lal ..         | .. |   |
| Kh. Ghulam Siddiq Khan ..   | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Ram Rakha Mal.   |
| Chaudhri Sardar Khan ..     | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> Lala Talsi Ram.   |
| Chaudhri Pitamber Singh ..  | .. | Serving in Delhi.   |
| P. Syed Haider ..           | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> Iqbal Mohammad.   |
| Chaudhri Mohammad Ashraf .. | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Banta Singh.   |
| M. Rahmat Ali ..            | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Ghulam Ali.  |
| Chaudhri Jowala Parshad ..  | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> Dr. Baldev Singh.   |
| S. Balwant Singh ..         | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Abdur Rahman (dismissed).  |
| Chaudhri Din Mohammad Akram | .. | Officiating <i>vice</i> S. Bir Singh on deputation in Delhi.                                      |

- |     |                              |  |
|-----|------------------------------|--|
| 1.  | M. Dalip Singh ..            | Dharmasala.  |
| 2.  | S. Amar Singh ..             | Chunian.   |
| 3.  | Chaudhri Khuda Bakhsh ..     | Gojra.   |
| 4.  | Chaudhri Jaimal Singh ..     | Noorpur (Kangra).  |
| 5.  | Dr. Niaz Ali (C. V. D.) ..   | Rawalpindi C. B. Inspector (on probation).               |
| 6.  | Chaudhri Bhagwan Singh ..    | Sonipat.   |
| 7.  | S. Bhagat Singh ..           | Jagraon.   |
| 8.  | Chaudhri Muhammad Ahsan ..   | Montgomery.  |
| 9.  | Chaudhri Bashi Ram ..        | Jagadhri.  |
| 10. | Sardar Bakhtawar Singh ..    | Gurgaon.   |
| 11. | Chaudhri Mohammad Panah ..   | Sadhaura.  |
| 12. | Qazi Ilahi Bakhsh ..         | Shorkot.   |
| 13. | S. Ujagar Singh ..           | Nankana Sahib.   |
| 14. | Chaudhri Abdul Hamid Khan .. | Sheikhupura.   |
| 15. | Chaudhri Abdur Rahman. ..    | Multan.  |
| 16. | Chaudhri Shivdhan Singh ..   | Thanesar.  |
| 17. | S. Thakar Singh ..           | Samundri.  |
| 18. | Chaudhri Sultan Ali ..       | Gujar Khan, on probation till he passes the examination. |
|     | Nazir Ahmad ..               | On deputation as Panchayat Officer.                      |
|     | Gustasap Khan ..             | Long leave (sick).                                       |
| 19. | Chaudhri Mehar Husain ..     | Jhang.   |
| 20. | Chaudhri Mohammad Khan ..    | Jaranwala.   |
| 21. | Chaudhri Ahmad Khan ..       | Pasrur.  |
| 22. | S. Sant Singh ..             | Gurgaon C. B. Inspector on probation.                    |
| 23. | Chaudhri Ahmad Din, M. A. .. | Gujranwala.  |
| 24. | S. Ajeet Singh ..            | Palampur. Officiating vice Ghulam Saddiq.                |
| 25. | Chaudhri Kesar Chand ..      | Pathankot. Officiating vice Sardar Khan.                 |
| 26. | Chaudhri Fazal Ahmad ..      | Sirsa. Officiating vice Pitamber Singh.                  |
| 27. | Chaudhri Muhammad Ashraf ..  | Khanna. Officiating vice P. Syed Haider.                 |
| 28. | S. Hukam Singh ..            | Jhajjar. Officiating vice Mohammad Ashraf Chima.         |
| 29. | S. Sant Singh ..             | Hoshiarpur. Officiating vice Chaudhri Rahmat Ali.        |

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

- |                               |   |
|-------------------------------|---|
| 30. Chaudhri Sultan Mahmud .. | Shahpur. Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Jowala Pershad.           |
| 31. Chaudhri Hari Singh ..    | Nawashahr. Officiating <i>vice</i> S. Balwant Singh.                |
| 32. Chaudhri Ghulam Rasool .. | Muzaffargarh. Officiating <i>vice</i> Din Mohammad Akram.           |
| 33. Sardar Charan Singh ..    | Panipat. Officiating <i>vice</i> R. Gustasp Khan on leave.          |
| 34. M. Sahib Khan ..          | Jampur. Officiating <i>vice</i> Chaudhri Nazir Ahmad on deputation. |

*4th Grade Inspectors, Rs. 100.*

- |                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Ajeet Singh ..                  | Officiating in higher grade (for details see 3rd grade list.)     |
| Chaudhri Kesar Chand ..         | Ditto.  |
| 1. S. Lachman Singh ..          | Daska.  |
| Chaudhri Fazal Ahmad ..         | Officiating in higher grade.                                      |
| Chaudhri Muhammad Ashraf Chima. | Ditto.  |
| S. Hukam Singh ..               | Ditto.  |
| S. Sant Singh ..                | Ditto.  |
| Chaudhri Sultan Muhammad        | Ditto.  |
| Chaudhri Hari Singh ..          | Ditto.  |
| M. Ghulam Rasool. ..            | Ditto.  |
| 2. Chaudhri Wilayat Khan ..     | Sialkot. Cond. Inspector.   |
| S. Charan Singh ..              | Officiating in higher grade.                                      |
| 3. S. Gurcharan Singh ..        | Moga.   |
| 4. Chaudhri Mohammad Husain     | Dipalpur.   |
| 5. D. Jagan Nath ..             | Tarn Taran.   |
| 6. M. Ghulam Nabi. ..           | Muktsar.  |
| 7. Baghunath Singh ..           | Hamirpur.   |
| 8. Chaudhri Abdullah Khan ..    | Leiah.  |
| 9. M. Mohammad Aslam ..         | Lahore.   |
| 10. Chaudhri Mehar Singh ..     | Karnal. (on one year's leave Chaudhri Partap Singh, officiating). |
| 11. Chaudhri Ghulam Sarwar ..   | Dera Ghazi Khan.  |
| 12. Lala Bishamber Das ..       | Jullundur—Industrial Inspector.                                   |
| 13. Chaudhri Mohammad Azeem     | Bhakkar.  |
| 14. Chaudhri Ahmad Khan, B. A.  | Kalebagh.   |

15. Chaudhri Sher Muhammad .. Khanewal (on 4 months' leave for Gurdaspur class, Chaudhri Kartar Singh officiating).
16. Chaudhri Dhirt Ram .. Shakargarh.  
Chaudhri Rizq Ram .. Serving in Ajmer-Marwara.
17. M. Sundar Singh.. .. Una.
18. Pandit Bhagwan Sahai .. Ambala—Industrial Inspector.
19. Pandit Khushi Ram .. Bhawani.
20. Chaudhri Mushtaq Ahmad .. Jhelum (on 4 months' leave for Gurdaspur class, Abdul Karim, Sub-Inspector, officiating).
21. Abdur Rashid Khan .. Jullundur.
22. Chaudhri Ahmad Khan .. Kahuta.
23. M. Muhammad Husain Shah .. Chakwal.
24. Nafis-ud-Din, M. A. .. Lahore—Industrial Inspector.
25. S. Karam Husain .. Multan—Industrial Inspector.
26. Chaudhri Muhammad Ali .. Nuh.
27. S. Sukhdev Singh .. Sialkot.
28. Ghulam Haider Shah .. Khushabad
29. Rana Sher Jang .. .. Gurdaspur.
30. M. Sohrab Khan .. Murree.
31. Chaudhri Feroz Din Ahmad .. Pakpattan.
32. S. Durr-i-Husain.. .. Kharian (on leave, S. Ata Ullah Shah, Sub-Inspector, officiating).
33. Khawaja Said Husain .. Ferozepore Jhirka (on a year's probation).
34. S. M. Abbas Zaidi .. Rewari (on a year's probation).
35. Chaudhri Rahmat Ullah .. Fatehabad—Officiating *vice* Ajeet Singh.
36. M. Ahmad Din .. .. Talagang—Officiating *vice* Kesar Chand.
37. R. Sardar Ali .. .. Narowal—Officiating *vice* Fazl Ahmad.
38. Sardar Kundan Singh .. Okara—Officiating *vice* Muhammad Ashraf.
39. Chaudhri Rahmat Ullah (Gujrat). .. Pind Dadan Khan, *vice* Hukam Singh.
40. Chaudhri Umrao Singh .. Ballabgarh, *vice* Rizq Ram.
41. R. Abdul Hameed .. Pindi Gheb, *vice* Sahib Khan.
42. M. Jalal Din .. .. Fateh Jang (S. Adalat Husain will replace Jalal Din when he is ready for Inspectorship), officiating *vice* Sardar Sant Singh.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

43. M. Miraj Din .. .. Ajnala, *vice* Sultan Mahmud.  
 44. M. Inait Ullah, S. I. .. Gujrat, *vice* Hari Singh.  
 45. S. Adalat Husain Shah .. Bhalwal, *vice* Ghulam Rasul.  
 46. Chaudhri Sultani Ram, S. I. .. Gohana, *vice* Charan Singh.

## GRADUATION LIST OF INSPECTORS, CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETIES, PUNJAB.

Serial No.	At work.	Perma- nent.	Name of Inspector.	Posted at
<i>1st Grade—12 Inspectors at Rs. 250.</i>				
1	1	1	Khan Ahmad Hasan Khan ..	Kasur.
2	2	2	L. Hargopal .. ..	Hissar.
3	3	3	Chaudhri Milkhi Ram ..	Garhsankar.
4	4	4	Khan Ghulam Jilani Khan ..	Tanda.
5	5	5	Shaikh Bashir Ahmad, B. A. ..	Educational Inspector, Lahore.
6	6	6	Chaudhri AH Mohammad Bajwa ..	Mianwali.
7	7	7	Chaudhri Feiz AH .. ..	Hafizabad.
		8	Sardar Balwant Singh .. ..	Officiating as Assistant Registrar.
8	8	8	Chaudhri Badar Din .. ..	Nakodar.
		10	Malik Sultan Mahmud .. ..	On deputation to North-West Frontier Province.
		11	Chaudhri Banta Singh, B. A., ..	Officiating as Assistant Registrar.
9	9	12	Chaudhri Ghulam Ali, B. A. ..	Educational Inspector, Ser- godha.
10	10	..	Chaudhri Ram Rakhs Mal ..	Palwal, Officiating, <i>vice</i> S. Balwant Singh (8).
11	11	..	Chaudhri Mohammad Akbar, B. A. ..	Mailai—Officiating <i>vice</i> Chau- dhri Banta Singh (11).
12	12	..	Miss Ahmad, Shah, B. A. ..	Inspectress, Lahore—Officiat- ing, <i>vice</i> Malik Sultan Mahmud (10).
<i>2nd Grade—25 Inspectors at Rs. 200.</i>				
		1	Chaudhri Ram Rakhs Mal ..	Officiating in 1st grade.
		2	Chaudhri Mohammad Akbar, B.A. ..	Ditto.
		3	Chaudhri Iqbal Mohammad, M.A. ..	Officiating as Assistant Regis- trar.
		4	Miss Ahmad Shah, B.A. ..	Officiating in 1st grade.
13	1	5	Mian Kartar Singh .. ..	Ambala.
		6	Chaudhri Ghulam Mustafa, B.A. ..	Officiating as Assistant Regis- trar since 10th April 1929.

Serial No.	At work.	Perma- nent.	Name of Inspector.	Posted at
14	2	7	Chaudhri Sardar Ali .. ..	Fazilka.
15	3	8	Chaudhri Mohammad Akram ..	Muktsar.
		9	Chaudhri Tuli Ram .. ..	On deputation to Kashmir.
		10	Dr. Baldev Singh .. ..	On deputation to C. V. D.
		11	A. K. Abdur Rafof Khan ..	On deputation to North-West Frontier Province.
16	4	12	Chaudhri Mohammad Musa Khan, B.A.	Batala.
17	5	13	Sardar Indar Singh .. ..	Amritsar.
18	6	14	Sardar Kartar Singh, B.A. ..	Educational Inspector, Jullundur.
		15	Sheikh Munir Husain, B.A. ..	On deputation to North West Frontier Province from 19th September 1929, forenoon.
19	7	16	Chaudhri Baldev Singh .. ..	Ludhiana.
20	8	17	Chaudhri Mohammad Husain, B.A. ..	Tallagang.
21	9	18	Sardar Baldev Singh, B.A. ..	Moga.
22	10	19	Chaudhri Ram Sarup .. ..	Rupar.
		20	Sardar Bir Singh .. ..	On deputation to Delhi.
23	11	21	M. Ghulam Siddiq, B.A. ..	Alipur. Confirmed from 1st April 1929.
24	12	22	Chaudhri Sardar Khan, B.A. ..	Shahpur. Confirmed from 1st April 1929.
		23	Sardar Pitambar Singh .. ..	Confirmed from 1st April 1929, on deputation to Delhi.
25	13	24	P. Syed Haidar .. ..	Sargodha. Confirmed from 1st April 1929.
26	14	25	Master Rahmat Ali .. ..	Consolidation Inspector, Jullundur. Confirmed from 4th May 1929.
27	15	..	Chaudhri Mohammad Ashraf, Chima, B. A.	Sadhausa. Officiating vice Miss Ahmad Shah, (10).
28	16	..	Chaudhri Jawala Parshad, B.A. ..	Lahore City. Officiating vice Dr. Baldev Singh (10).
29	17	..	Sardar Balwant Singh, B.A. ..	Montgomery. Officiating vice Chaudhri Iqbal Mohammad (3).
30	18	..	Chaudhri Din Mohammad Akram, B.A. ..	Shahdara. Officiating vice Sardar Bir Singh (20).
31	19	..	Sardar Dalip Singh, B.A. ..	Dharamsala. Officiating vice Chaudhri Mohammad Akbar (2).
32	20	..	Sardar Amar Singh, B.A. ..	Chunian. Officiating vice Chaudhri Ram Rakha Mal (1).
33	21	..	Sardar Jaimal Singh, B.A. ..	Nurpur. Officiating vice Chaudhri Tuli Ram (9).

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

Serial No.	At work.	Perma- nent.	Name of Inspectors.	Posted at
------------	----------	-----------------	---------------------	-----------

## 2nd Grade—25 Inspectors at Rs. 200—concluded.

34	22		S. Bhagwan Singh, B.A.	.. Tarn Taran. Officiating vice Chaudhri Pitambar Singh (23).
35	23		S. Bhagat Singh	.. Jagraon. Officiating vice Khan Abdur Baqof (11).
36	24		Chaudhri Mohammad Ahsan, M.A.	.. Daska. Officiating vice Chaudhri Ghulam Mustafa (8) from 19th April 1929.
37	25		S. Bakhtawar Singh, B.A.	.. Gurgaon. Officiating vice Sh. Munir Hussain (15), from 18th September 1929.

## 3rd Grade—38 Inspectors at Rs. 150.

38	1	1	Chaudhri Khuda Bakhsh	.. Gojra.
		2	Chaudhri Muhammad Ashraf Chima	.. Officiating in 2nd grade.
		3	Chaudhri Jowala Parshad	.. Ditto ditto.
		4	Sardar Balwant Singh	.. Ditto ditto.
		5	Chaudhri Din Mohammad Akram	.. Ditto ditto.
		6	S. Dalip Singh	.. Ditto ditto.
		7	S. Amar Singh	.. Ditto ditto.
		8	S. Jaimal Singh	.. Ditto ditto.
		9	S. Bhagwan Singh	.. Ditto ditto.
		10	S. Bhagat Singh	.. Ditto ditto.
		11	Chaudhri Mohammad Ahsan	.. Ditto ditto from 19th April, 1929.
		12	S. Bakhtawar Singh	.. Officiating in 2nd grade from 19th September 1929.
39	2	13	Chaudhri Mohammad Panah, B.A.	.. Gujranwala.
40	3	14	Mian Ilaahi Bakhsh	.. Shorkot.
41	4	15	Sardar Ujagar Singh	.. Nankana Sahib.
42	5	16	Mian Abdul Hamid, B.A.	.. Sheikhpura.
43	6	17	Mian Abdur Rahman, B.A.	.. Multan.
44	7	18	Chaudhri Shiv Dhan Singh	.. Thanesar. On probation.
45	8	19	Chaudhri Bashi Ram	.. Jagadhri.
46	9	20	Sardar Thakar Singh, B.A.	.. Sirsa. On probation.
47	10	21	M. Sultan Ali	.. Gujar Khan. On probation.
		22	M. Nazir Ahmad	.. (On probation—on deputation as Panchayat Officer).



Serial No.	At work.	Per. ma-nent.	Name of Inspectors.	Posted at
3rd Grade—38 Inspectors at Rs. 150—concluded.				
48	11	23	M. Mehr Husain ..	Jhang.
49	12	24	Chaudhri Mohammad Khan ..	Campbellpore.
		25	Chaudhri Ahmad Khan ..	(On deputation to North-West Frontier Province).
50	13	26	S. Sant Singh ..	C. B. Inspector (on probation) Gurgaon.
51	14	27	Chaudhri Ahmad Din, M.A. ..	Lahore Tahsil.
52	15	28	Dr. Niaz Ali ..	C. B. Inspector (on probation) Rawalpindi. (Lien in C.V.D.)
53	16	29	Mian Ghulam Rasul, B.A. ..	Muzaffargarh. Confirmed from 1st October 1929.
54	17	30	M. Ajit Singh, B.A. ..	Palampur.
55	18	31	Chaudhri Hukam Singh, B.A. ..	Pasrur. Confirmed from 2nd October 1929.
56	19	32	S. Sant Singh, B.A. ..	Hoshiarpur. Confirmed from 2nd October 1929.
57	20	33	S. Hari Singh, B.A. ..	Nawanshehr. Confirmed from 2nd October 1929.
58	21	34	M. Sultan Mohammad, B.A. ..	Lyallpur. Confirmed from 2nd October 1929.
59	22	35	Chaudhri Fazal Ahmad ..	Zira.
60	23	36	Chaudhri Mohammad Ashraf ..	Saruala.
61	24	37	Chaudhri Kesar Chand, B.A. ..	Ferozepore. On probation.
62	25	38	Chaudhri Wilayat Khan ..	Consolidation Inspector, Sialkot. (On probation).
63	26	..	M. Abdur Rashid, B.A. ..	Jullundur. Officiating vice Chaudhri Jowala Parshad.
64	27	..	S. Lachman Singh, B.A. ..	Phillaur. Officiating vice Chaudhri Mohammad Ashraf (3).
65	28	..	Chaudhri Feroz-ud-Din, Ahmad, B.A. ..	Pakpattan. Officiating vice Sardar Balwant Singh (4).
66	29	..	Mian Mohammad Azim, B.A. ..	Rawalpindi. Officiating vice Din Mohammad Akram (5).
67	30	..	Lala Bhagwan Sahai, B.A. ..	Ind. Inspector, Ambala. Officiating vice Sardar Dalip Singh (6).
68	31	..	Chaudhri Sahib Khan, B.A. ..	Jampur. Officiating vice Sardar Amar Singh (7).
69	32	..	M. Muhammad Husain ..	Dipalpur. Officiating vice Jajmal Singh (8).
70	33	..	S. Sukhdev Singh, B.A. ..	Sialkot. Officiating vice S. Bhagwan Singh (9). Officiating allowance in this grade suspended till further orders.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

Serial No.	At work.	Permanent.	Name of Inspector.	Posted at
------------	----------	------------	--------------------	-----------

## 3rd Grade—38 Inspectors at Rs. 180.—concluded.

71	34		M. Sundar Singh, B.A. ..	Una. Officiating vice Sardar Bhagat Singh (10).
72	35		Chaudhri Ahmad Khan, B.A. ..	Kalabagh. Officiating vice Chaudhri Mohammad Ahsan from 19th April 1929.
73	36		S. Mehr Singh, B.A. ..	Karnal. Officiating vice S. Bakhtawar Singh from 19th September 1929.
74	37		R. Sher Jang, B.A. ..	Gurdaspur. Officiating vice Chaudhri Ahmad Khan (25).
75	38		S. Charan Singh ..	Panipat. Officiating vice Chaudhri Nazir Ahmad (22) upto 30th September 1929. (Reverted from 1st October 1929).
	39		Chaudhri Dhirt Ram ..	Shakargrah. Officiating vice Chaudhri Nazir Ahmad after 30th September 1929. S. Charan Singh being reverted to 4th grade.

## 4th Grade—50 Inspectors at Rs. 100.

1	M. Abdur Rashid ..	Officiating in 3rd grade.
2	S. Lachman Singh ..	Ditto ditto.
3	Chaudhri Feroz-ud-din Ahmad ..	Ditto ditto.
4	M. Muhammad Azeem ..	Ditto ditto.
5	Lala Bhagwan Sahai ..	Ditto ditto.
6	Chaudhri Sahib Khan ..	Ditto ditto.
7	M. Muhammad Hussain ..	Ditto ditto.
8	Sardar Sukhdev Singh ..	Ditto ditto (Will not draw officiating allowance in 3rd grade till further orders.)
9	M. Sundar Singh ..	Officiating in 3rd grade.
10	Chaudhri Ahmad Khan, Ajmalvi ..	Ditto ditto.
11	S. Mehr Singh ..	Officiating in 3rd grade from 19th September 1929.
12	Rana Sher Jang ..	Officiating in 3rd grade from the date M. Ahmad Khan left charge at Pasrur.

Serial No.	At work.	Permanent.	Name of Inspectors.	Posted at
------------	----------	------------	---------------------	-----------

*4th Grade—50 Inspectors at Rs. 100—continued.*

		13	Chaudhri Dhirt Ram .. ..	Officiating in 3rd grade from 1st October 1929.
76	1	14	S. Adalat Husain, B.A. .. ..	Gujrat.
77	2	15	S. Ghulam Sarwar, B.A. .. ..	Dera Ghazi Khan.
78	3	16	Chaudhri Ahmad Khan, B.A. ..	Kahuta.
79	4	17	S. Durr-i-Husain, B.A. ....	Lalamusa.
80	5	18	Khan Saeed Husain, B.A. ....	Fatehabad.

*Unconfirmed on probation.*

81	6	19	S. Charan Singh, B.A. ....	Panipat.
82	7	20	M. Raghunath Singh .. ..	Hamirpur.
		21	Chaudhri Biaz Ram .. ..	On deputation to Ajmer.
83	8	22	M. Ghulam Nabi .. ..	Wazirabad.
84	9	23	Chaudhri Abdullah Khan .. ..	Leiah.
85	10	24	Lala Bishambar Das, B.A. ....	Industrial Inspector, Jullandhar.
86	11	25	Chaudhri Sher Muhammad .. ..	Khanewal.
87	12	26	Pandit Khushi Ram .. ..	Bhiwani.
88	13	27	M. Muhammad Hussain Shah, B.A. ..	Chanot.
89	14	28	Chaudhri Mushtaq Ahmad .. ..	Jhalum.
90	15	29	M. Nafis-ud-Din, M.A. ....	Industrial Inspector, Lahore.
91	16	30	M. Muhammad Yaqub, B.A. ....	Industrial Inspector, Gujrat.
92	17	31	M. Muhammad Ali, B.A. ....	Nuh.
93	18	32	M. Karam Husain Shah .. ..	Industrial Inspector, Multan.
94	19	33	Chaudhri Ghulam Haider .. ..	Khusab.
95	20	34	S. M. Abbas Zaidi, B.A. ....	Rewari.
96	21	35	M. Sohrah Khan .. ..	Murree.
97	22	36	Chaudhri Ghulam Qadir .. ..	Ferozepur Jhirka.
98	23	37	R. Sardar Ali .. ..	Narowal.
99	24	38	S. Hari Singh, Gill, B.A. ....	Okara.
100	25	39	R. Abdul Hamid .. ..	Pindi Gheb.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

Serial No.	At work.	Perma- nent.	Name of Inspectors.	Posted at
<i>4th Grade—59 Inspectors at Rs. 150—continued.</i>				
101	26	40	Mr. C. K. Bannerji, B.A.	.. Ajnala.
103	27	41	M. Kartar Singh	.. Jullundur (additional) from April 1929.
103	28	42	Chaudhri Amin Chand, B.A.	.. Kharar. From April 1929.
104	29	43	M. Azam Beg, B.A.	.. Mukerian. Ditto.
105	30	44	Q. Muhammad Asad, B.A.	.. Bariana. Ditto.
106	31	45	M. Imam Baksh, B.A.	.. Shujabad. Ditto.
107	32	46	Mr. Yog Datta, B.A.	.. Hansi. Ditto.
108	33	47	Chaudhri Anchal Das, B.A.	.. Rohtak. Ditto.
109	34	48	S. Amar Singh, B.A.	.. Dehra (Kangra). From May 1929.
110	35	49	Lala Gian Chand, B.A.	.. Sonapat. From April 1929.
111	36	50	M. Muhammad Nawaz	.. Chakwal.
112	37	..	Chaudhri Fateh Muhammad	.. Bhalwal. Officiating vice M. Abdul Rashid (1).
113	38	..	Lala Devi Dial	.. Pathankot. Officiating vice S. Lachman Singh.
114	39	..	Chaudhri Ali Ahmad	.. Sambrial. Officiating vice Chaudhri Feroz Din (3).
115	40	..	M. Abdul Karim	.. Gujranwala. Officiating vice Mohammad Azim (4).
116	41	..	M. Jalal Din	.. Fatehjang. Officiating vice Lala Bhagwan Sahai (5).
117	42	..	Chaudhri Rahmat Ullah	.. Pind Dadan Khan. Officiating vice Muhammad Hussain (7).
118	43	..	Chaudhri Jowand Singh	.. Ballabgarh. Officiating vice Sahib Khan (6).
119	44	..	Chaudhri Bhagwan Dingh	.. Gohana. Officiating vice M. Sundar Singh (9).
120	45	..	Chaudhri Inayat Ullah	.. Samundri. Officiating vice Sukhdev Singh (8).
121	46	..	Chaudhri Kartar Singh	.. Dhariwal. Officiating vice Ahmad Khan (10).
122	47	..	S. Gurbachan Singh	.. Jaranwala. Officiating vice S. Mehr Singh (11).

Serial No.	At work.	Perma- nent.	Name of Inspectors.	Posted at
<i>4th Grade—50 Inspectors at Rs. 150.—concluded.</i>				
123	48	..	Sardar Kehri Singh	Jhajjar. Officiating vice R. Sher Jang (12).
124	49	..	Chandhri Shams-ud-Din	Bhakkar. Officiating vice Chaudhri Rizq Ram (21).
125	50	..	S. Atta Ullah Shah	Pindi Baha-ud-Din. Officiating vice Chaudhri Dhirt Ram (13).
			S. Dhanbir Singh.	
			Lala Ram Gopal.	

**COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION AMONG ASSISTANT DISTRICT INSPECTORS OF SCHOOLS, AMBALA DIVISION.**

**1462. Chaudhri Yasin Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- the proportion of Muslim Assistant District Inspectors of Schools in each district of the Ambala division as compared with non-Muslims giving the total in each case ;
- the number of Muslim Assistant District Inspectors of Schools in the Ambala division at the time the present Inspector of Schools, Ambala division, took charge of the division and their number on 31st October, 1929 ;
- whether there has been any decrease, and, if so, what steps are being taken to restore the position ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) and (b) Statements giving the necessary information are enclosed.

(c) A decrease of one ; no action is contemplated, religion is not the only factor considered in making appointments to the inspectorate.

Names of Districts.	Total number of Assistant District Inspectors of Schools on 31st October 1929.	Number of Muslim Assistant District Inspectors of Schools.	Number of non-Muslim Assistant District Inspectors of Schools.	Proportion of Muslim Assistant District Inspectors of Schools as compared with non-Muslims.
Karnal ..	4	2	2	50%
Hissar ..	5	1	4	20%
Gurgaon ..	5	1	4	20%
Ambala ..	5	2	3	40%
Rohtak ..	6	2	4	33.3%.

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

<p>Number of Muslim Assistant District Inspectors of Schools in the Ambala Division on 10th October 1928, the date on which the present Inspector of Schools, Ambala Division, took charge of the Division.</p>	<p>Number of Muslim Assistant District Inspectors of Schools in the Ambala Division on 31st October 1929.</p>
<p>9</p>	<p>8</p>

#### FILLING UP OF VACANCIES IN THE PROVINCIAL EDUCATION SERVICE.

**1466. Chaudhri Yasin Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) the number of permanent Provincial Educational Service posts or special posts carrying a pay of Rs. 250 per mensem or more which have fallen vacant or have been newly created in the province from 1st January, 1927, up to 31st October, 1929 ?
- (b) how many of them have been filled up by Muslims and non-Muslims ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The number of permanent Provincial Educational Service posts which have fallen vacant in the period specified by the honourable member is 13, and these posts have been filled by two Muslims and eleven non-Muslims.

These posts were rendered vacant by the retirement of two Muslims and eleven non-Muslims.

The number of posts created in the Provincial Educational Service, in the period specified by the honourable member, is 24. These have been filled by seven Muslims and by seventeen non-Muslims.

## RESOLUTIONS.

RESOLUTION RE COMMITTEE TO ENQUIRE INTO THE GRIEVANCES OF  
COLONISTS OF NILI BAR.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore, Sikh, Rural], (Urdu) : Sir, I beg to move that—

"This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee consisting of one official and two non-official members of this Council to enquire into the grievances of the landholders, temporary lease-holders and abadkars of the Nili Bar Colony and to suggest ways and means for the removal of these grievances."

Sir, the lands in the Nili Bar Colony are now being brought under cultivation and for that purpose they are being distributed among three kinds of colonists, namely, the landholders, temporary lease-holders and the military and other grantees. But the conditions obtaining in the colony are such that none of these three groups of colonists can be expected to be satisfied with their lot. All of them have a good many real and genuine complaints to make; and as I propose to discuss their grievances at some length I will take them one by one.

First of all I will draw your attention to the procedure followed in auctioning these lands to landholders. The notices about these auctions do not contain any details with regard to the quality and locality of the lands. The Colonisation Officer simply announces that some first class lands are to be sold by auction and it is left to the zamindars to ascertain the locality and the real quality of these lands. I submit, Sir, that it is not possible for the zamindars coming from various parts of the province to find out the exact locality of the lands they intend to purchase in those jungles. Even the patwaris cannot help them in this respect. On the contrary, being ignorant themselves they often mislead the zamindars. Then, Sir, it is laid down that the bids for each square are to be offered with respect to an acre and also that no bid is to be less than Rs. 5 per acre. Thus the zamindars go on increasing their bids without realising to what amount the price of the whole square has reached, until when at last the sale is concluded the highest bidder finds out to his dismay that he will have to pay ten or twelve thousand rupees for a square for which, under ordinary circumstances, he would not have offered even half the amount. Again, the rate of interest charged by the Government is as much as 8 per cent., and if some one fails to pay the instalment when it is due this rate at once rises to 12 per cent. This means, Sir, that for each square an ordinary landholder has to pay Rs. 960, and the defaulter something like Rs. 1,400 to the Government by way of interest every year. I challenge the Government to prove that the net income of the zamindars in that colony is really Rs. 1,000 or Rs. 1,400 per square. This is why the zamindars have begun to call Mr. Wace, the present Colonisation Officer, *Barbadi wala Sahib* instead of *Abadi wala Sahib*.

Now as regards the water for irrigation purposes, it is promised as a matter of course that sufficient amount of water will be available. But at the same time a note is appended to the effect that the Government will not be held responsible in case of any shortage in water supply. Previously this note was meant simply to absolve the Government from any liability in case of unavoidable circumstances, but the present Colonisation Officer

[S. Hira Singh, Narli.]

takes undue advantage of it. Sir, the whole system is new and, therefore, the water-supply is naturally irregular and defective. But if any defaulter pleads that he could not pay the instalment at the proper time because his crops were ruined on account of the shortage of water, the Colonisation Officer instead of showing any sympathy or trying to ascertain the genuineness or otherwise of the plea, at once refers him to this note.

Then, Sir, previously the trees were sold along with the land, but now the land and trees are sold separately and the price of the trees is fixed by the Forest Department. The landholders, having already accepted the terms of the auction, are bound to accept the quotations of the Forest Department, whether they like them or not. The Colonisation Officer does not show any sympathy even to the temporary cultivators who have to cut down the trees in order to prepare the land for cultivation. If they want to burn those trees so that they may be able to send the charcoal to some big city with less cost the said officer raises the most unsympathetic and absurd objection that the Government lands will be spoiled if the wood is charred there. Now let us compare this treatment with that meted out by the Bahawalpur and Bikaner states to their colonists. These states are not at all richer than the Punjab Government, but the rate of interest charged by the Bikaner state is 6 per cent. while here we have to pay 8 per cent. per annum. Then if some one fails to pay the instalment at the proper time in the Nili Bar Colony his crops are confiscated, and his co-sharers and partners are made to suffer for no fault of theirs. But in the Bahawalpur state no such confiscation ever takes place. If such a situation arises there, the state official after determining the price of the crop at the spot takes away only half of it and the other half is left to the landholder. The worst aspect of the matter is that those who are absolutely unable to carry on under the present conditions cannot even get rid of their lands, because if any one quits his land, the Government does not let him go, but, on the other hand, he is compelled to pay the land revenue, and failing that, warrants are issued against him for the realisation of that land revenue. This reminds me of the case of a man who mistaking a bear for a blanket, jumped into the river after it. While he was struggling with the bear his friends at the river bank called him back to the bank and advised to let the blanket go if it was not possible to bring it with him. To this the wretched man replied: "Yes, I shall be only too glad to leave the blanket, but now the blanket would not leave me." Thus, Sir, the attitude of the officials is very unsympathetic so much so that they are not prepared to give a few *marlas* of land even for a graveyard or a burning ghat. This is the treatment for which the Government wants us to feel proud of being His Majesty's subjects.

Now, I come to the temporary cultivators. The distribution of lands for temporary cultivation takes place by means of tenders, and every tenderer has to make a deposit of one rupee per acre along with the tender. Now while inviting these tenders nothing is said with regard to the price of the land and the intending tenderers are left to surmises and speculation. I think it would be much better if the Colonisation Officer fixes the lowest quotation and then the lease is awarded to the tenderer whose bid is the highest above that quotation.



Then, again, most of these lands are on the tributary 4-L., and it is well known that some of them do not yield any crop worth the name even after the greatest exertions on the part of the cultivators. Now as the duration of the leases is very short some of the cultivators want to direct their energy to the better parts of their possessions. But the Colonisation Officer would not realise the desirability of such a course being adopted. He compels them to pay the land revenue for every inch of land that may be in their possession, no matter whether it is under cultivation or lying fallow. Sir, the usual procedure followed in other colonies is that the Government takes only half the produce of the lands that may be under cultivation, but the authorities in this colony do not realise the soundness and propriety of this procedure and prefer to stick to this novel system of their own. The Honourable the Revenue Member was pleased to pay a visit to this colony and in view of the sad plight of these cultivators, he left instructions with the Colonisation Officer to show some concession to these poor people. Then in reply to a question in this Council he again assured me that the Government would not withhold its sympathy from the deserving cultivators. But may I ask what sympathy the Government has shown to them after that assurance? I submit, that not the least improvement has taken place in the attitude of the authorities. On the contrary, they are taking undue advantage of a question I put in this Council with regard to the grievances of some cultivators. When any one of these cultivators goes to the authorities with a complaint they at once reply that his case has been discussed in the Council, and therefore, no further enquiries can be made in connection with his grievances. Sir, the answers given to our questions in the Council are based on the reports of the officials on the spot, and, therefore, I must submit that this reply, is, to say the least, very absurd on the face of it. Moreover, no attention is paid to the grievances of those who pay comparatively smaller amounts of land revenue and they are completely ignored at the time of granting any concessions.

Again, there is no rule to the effect that the temporary cultivators should bring the whole land under cultivation, but the Colonisation Officer insists that not a single inch should be left uncultivated. In this connection I may inform the House that some lands on the tributary 4-L., are absolutely worthless and, therefore, it is neither wise nor proper to compel these cultivators, some of whom have mortgaged their properties and gone there in the hope of better prospects, to submit to unproductive labour.

Then, Sir, some zamindars had joined together and purchased squares in lots. But after the sale was concluded they divided the lands amongst themselves and each one got his share entered in his own name. Thus their joint responsibility having ceased, every one should be held responsible for the proper payment of the dues in connection with his own share. But the Colonisation Officer would not care for the propriety and desirability of such a procedure. He makes all of them suffer for the failure of a single person to pay his instalment at the proper time.

In the end, I would draw the attention of the Government to a well known couplet of Shaikh Saadi, namely:

رعیت جو بیخ است و سلطان درخت  
درخت (ے) پسر باشد از بیخ سست

[S. Hira Singh, Narli.]

The plight of these people is very sad at present and it is the duty of the Government to remove their grievances. The Government should not care only for filling its treasury. Even the Bahawalpur state is more sympathetic than our Government towards its colonists. No doubt the higher authorities are really anxious to offer facilities to the poor zamindars but the Colonisation Officer is very unsympathetic. His predecessor was a very kind and reasonable gentleman, and it was his sympathetic attitude that attracted the zamindars from their hearth and home to the Nili Bar Colony. Therefore, the Government should see its way to send a more sympathetic officer there.

Now I have practically finished my speech but before resuming my seat I wish to make it clear that I do not insist on any particular procedure being followed. What I want is that the genuine grievances of these poor people may be removed. I leave it to the Honourable Revenue Member to decide as to what procedure should be adopted for the purpose. With these remarks I commend my resolution to the House.

**Mr. President :** The resolution moved is—

“This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee consisting of one official and two non-official members of this Council to enquire into the grievances of the landholders, temporary lease-holders and abadkars of the Nili Bar Colony and to suggest ways and means for the removal of these grievances.”

**Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath** [Punjab Land-holders, General] (Urdu) : Sir, I strongly support the resolution which is now before the House. I have not so far been able to visit the Nili Bar Colony because it is situate at a very long distance from Lahore. But in spite of that I have been receiving reports as to how the zamindars are faring over there. The real position is this. The value of land and land produce is constantly changing and even the wisest person among us is unable to form an estimate of the prices of land in the near future. I wish that sales at the Nili Bar had been put off for a time. In the last Budget session during my speech I pointed out to the Honourable Member for Revenue that the proposed method of the sale of land by auction should be modified. Generally speaking, at open auctions there is a keen competition amongst the bidders and sometimes they go on bidding without the least regard to the real value of the article put up for sale. The difficulties just now pointed out by the honourable mover were not then taken into consideration.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** But, how should the proposed method of selling land by auction have been modified?

**Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath :** Sir, a question has been put to me as to how.....

**Mr. President :** No question should be answered unless it is asked through the Chair.

**Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath :** Very well, Sir, I will disregard the question. (*Continued in Urdu*). So far as I can recollect I suggested that the authorities concerned should have an upset price and when the

bidders exceed the limit fixed the bid should be disregarded. Besides the bidders, at that time, did not anticipate the shortage of water supply. They are not supplied even that amount of water which is supplied to the zamindars on the Upper and Lower Chenab Canals and the Lower Bari Doab Canal. The instalments of repayment and the rates of interest to be charged thereon are very high. It was thought then that the purchasers would be able to pay off the remaining instalments of prices out of the produce of their lands. But, Sir, in view of the fall in prices, it appears that it would be quite impossible for them to pay their instalments within the period fixed. Though I am not in a position to go into the details of this question, yet I would submit that the general conditions prevailing are unsatisfactory and a general enquiry is needed. The present economic depression in the country is considered to be due to the prevalent rates of exchange. This very question was raised in the Legislative Assembly. No doubt it is a very difficult question and for the present I am not prepared to say anything about it. The Government, however, stated that it was not India alone, but the whole world was face to face with a depression. But the question arises how long will this state of affairs continue? I hope the Government is fully alive to the importance of the revolutionary cries that are being raised every now and then and would see its way to solve the economic problem confronting this country. Government should, therefore, appoint a committee as suggested by the honourable mover to go into the grievances of the zamindars of the Nili Bar. With these words I resume my seat.

**Mian Ahmad Yar Khan Daultana** [Multan East, Muhammadan (Rural)] (Urdu): Sir, I rise to support the resolution under consideration. The honourable mover of the resolution and my friend Raja Sahib have fully described the state of affairs now prevailing in the Nili Bar Colony. No doubt the zamindars of that place have got some real and legitimate grievances. And for that the main reason is that sufficient amount of water is not available in the project. Besides this the Government have incurred comparatively greater expenditure on the construction of this project than on any other similar construction and hence their policy is to realise the money thus wastefully spent from the colonists. Consequently the latter have to pay large sums of money to the Government. Sir, if water supply is sufficient the zamindars usually do not mind other hardships. And here it is the question of water supply which is mostly engaging the attention of the zamindars. In my opinion, the remark that the local officers are miserly people, is to a very large extent, uncalled for. They have to carry out the orders of the local Government. They have to follow the line of action suggested by the higher authorities. The local officers do not seem to be free agents of themselves; otherwise, there would have been no complaint. The colony is most successful as far as the executive side is concerned. There was no colony in which there existed greater honesty and justice. I do not like to repeat what the honourable mover has said on the subject but I would submit that so far as forest growth is concerned, the forest officers arbitrarily fix certain prices of lands which the purchasers or lessees have to pay without fail. The forest department has been very unfair, the least I can say, in assessing the value of the forest growth. In addition to that the latter have also to incur the expenses of clearing off the jungles and no income is derived from the forest growth—not a pie I can

[Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana.]

assure you. The rate of interest is also exorbitant. I understand that Bahawalpur and Bikaner authorities have granted certain concessions to their abadkars and grantees, the rate of interest is 2 per cent. less. I think the Government should also grant similar concessions to the abadkars and grantees of the colony area. It has been said that the method of selling land by auction is defective. No doubt at open auctions there is always keen competition among the purchasers and even the most sober-minded persons are carried away by the excitement of the moment. I for one cannot suggest any modification in this method. It is suggested that Government should fix the maximum price of land and a bid that exceeds that limit should be disregarded. The same remarks apply to the method of calling for tenders. Anyhow I would ask the Government to adopt some measures for affording help to the zamindars of the Nili Bar. The condition of the old proprietary areas is very sad. The owners of these areas had much better supply and paid much less to Government, while now their supply is much worse and the water rates, etc., are several times more. For them this project is a curse. With these words I once again whole-heartedly support the resolution.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member) (Urdu), Sir, I will not say that the present debate has proceeded beyond the matter under consideration, but it will be readily admitted that the arguments that have been advanced in favour of or against the present motion appear to be disconnected with it and one begins to feel that the honourable speakers have allowed their zeal to carry them beyond the point at issue. The first complaint that has been made by the honourable Sardar Sahib is with regard to the present system of selling land by auction, and I know that he never makes baseless complaints. In this he was supported by the honourable member Raja Narendra Nath who never lends his support to unreasonable proposals, but there are some grave difficulties in the way of giving a practical shape to this proposal. First of all because it is a novel scheme. (*Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath*: No, it is not a new scheme). All right I admit it is an old one but still novel. Well, Sir, the honourable Raja Sahib suggested a certain course for adoption to remove the present complaint. He said that he had used it successfully when in service with regard to contracts for selling liquor. But may I ask the honourable Raja Sahib whether he did it in accordance with the rules laid down in this behalf or whether he introduced this system departing from the provisions of the rules in force? Supposing there are ten persons who are offering the same sum for an article; out of these ten whom will you select and how? On what principles would you base your selection? Would you prefer him who is known to you and is your acquaintance? Would you decide in favour of a teetotaler as against a drunkard? On whom your choice will fall; will it be a zamindar as against a non-zamindar or a townsman as against a villager? What will be the principle on which your judgment is to be based? Do you mean to say that the Government should fix the price of land per acre before hand, for example Rs. 300 per acre, and then when more than one person have bidden for it, it should be left to the whim of the auctioneer to decide as to whom the land should go to? Sometime back you raised a great hue and cry against lotteries and insisted that the system

of lot drawings should be discouraged and discontinued, but now you yourself show your predilections for it. Well, Sir, this is a great defect which is inherent in this proposal. The auctioneer shouts "Rs. 50 in 10 places" which means ten persons have each offered Rs. 50. How would you decide amongst these ten persons who have offered to pay the same price? Each one of them will claim that the land should be given to him for his was the first bid. Here again the same difficulty will present itself and you will have to face the problem afresh as to how to make the choice amongst the various claimants. Surely this suggestion if put into practice will involve us in grave difficulties? (*Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath*: No such difficulties will arise). The habit of ruling as a bureaucrat once acquired seems to stick to one for the whole of one's life and so Raja Sahib gives no reasons but insists that there will be no difficulties. This is however quite apparent and I think the honourable members have appreciated the force of this argument. To be brief, Sir, it is very difficult for the Government to make the people understand that they should not offer very high prices for the land unless the transaction is to be profitable to them. If the zamindars and others join hands to carry on a propaganda that land should not be purchased beyond a certain price I don't see why they should not succeed in putting a stop to this bad practice.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** : In this way the Government will suffer a great loss and the Colonization Officer will not tolerate it.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** : Well, Sir, Government does not want to make money like that. Of all the Government officers whom I have met, the present Colonization Officer of the Nili Bar is more in favour of people not offering too high prices for the land. He is of opinion that people offer very high prices in tenders and at auctions. He wishes that people should not do so but as an officer in charge of the auction he cannot stop them from doing so. Neither could you if you were to be placed in his position. Therefore we can safely say that the colonization officers never wish that the people should offer unreasonably high prices to their own great loss. Reports to Government also state that people make high bids; what is Government to do? Should Government attempt to introduce some legislation to place limitations on the free exercise of the will of the people in such matters? If such a legislation is prepared it will certainly and rightly be criticised.

You say that people do not understand the conditions governing the sale of land. But in my opinion to know these conditions is not an insurmountable difficulty. Before bidding at the auction or before submitting a tender one is supposed to read and understand the conditions on which land is offered for sale and if he does not care to read them surely the Government is not to blame. It requires no great effort or intelligence to understand these terms and there is no dearth of educated men who can be consulted with regard to these terms.

Then, again it was said that interest is charged at the high rate of 8 per cent. I quite agree with the contention that the interest is high, but Government cannot help it. Two different rates, i.e., of 5 per cent. and 8 per cent. were fixed by the Government. The one was to be charged from those who paid higher prices and the other was to be charged from those

[Hon'ble Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

who paid lower prices. But Government found by actual experience that neither the price of land went down because of high interest nor did the people go up for higher bids because interest was low. Government therefore had to abandon this idea. Besides you cannot get money in any money market at a lower rate of interest in such transactions. 8 per cent. or 9 per cent. is the minimum rate of interest that obtains here and I believe elsewhere too. Hence it is incorrect to say that the rate of interest that Government charges is excessive.

Then, Sir, the mover of the resolution took up the question of graveyards, etc. I may state that in every abadkari chak an area of five squares or so is presented to every abadkari chak for ways, burial places, grazing grounds, etc. Times out of number the Council has persistently asked the Government to take more care to help the poor people. The peasant grantees are poor and deserve all help, therefore to them the Government gives land for such purposes as mentioned above free of all charge. The land sold by auction is intended for the rich people, and there is no reason why they should not be made to pay for land to be used by them as burial grounds and roads, etc. When they can very well afford to pay for all their necessities when alive, they can as well pay for a burial ground which they require when no longer alive.

Then, Sir, it was complained that the conditions of selling land are very harsh. These conditions are not harsh or unfair but the fact is that after the Great War the price of agricultural produce abnormally increased and the zamindars made large profits. They came to regard lands as no less than gold mines and invested large moneys in them, without ever dreaming that they might suffer losses at a later date. The same conditions do not obtain for ever. During the last 3 or 4 years the prices of agricultural produce have fallen and consequently large profits have dwindled down to small profits and threaten to disappear and the great expectations of the zamindars have not been realised. It is therefore natural that they should clamour and complain. If the prices of grains rise, no doubt, it would be beneficial for the zamindars but from the standpoint of the country as a whole it may be very harmful and no sincere well-wisher of his country can entertain such a desire. What help the state can render to them who purchase land at a price which they cannot afford to pay.

The honourable Sardar Sahib has proposed that a committee consisting of one official and two non-official members be appointed to enquire into the grievances of lease-holders, abadkars, etc. (*Interruption*). But the question is whether Government can afford relief to such people in any manner? Would the honourable mover like the Government to reduce the rate of interest or would he like that Government should reduce the prices that the purchasers offer to pay? I hope the honourable mover himself would see in his saner moments that Government could not adopt any of these proposals when the sale of these lands was completed long ago. And if these proposals are impracticable what else Government is expected to do in the matter? The grievances of the pottadars and auction purchasers may be genuine but the question is how can they be removed? If there is no way out of this difficulty there is no sense in appointing the proposed committee.

Instead of appointing a committee it will be better if all these three classes lay their grievances separately in the form of representations or memorials to the Government through the Financial Commissioner, Development, who would gladly make enquiries and then submit his report to the Government. Government will then see what can be done to remove these grievances. The zamindars, I think, should be able to do this. It is a simple thing and more convenient both for the people and the Government.

Next, Sir, I want to invite the special attention of the House to another matter. It has been asked why the Government undertakes the construction of such expensive schemes that later on necessitate enhancement in land revenue and water-rates to make up the deficiency in the budget. The reasons that prompt Government to undertake such constructions are not far to seek. Those gentlemen who at present, insist on the instantaneous construction of the Bakhra Dam Scheme are well acquainted with these reasons. The people send memorials, make representations and all that they can do to urge the Government to formulate a scheme and execute it. And if the Government expresses its inability to undertake such schemes on account of financial stringency they say "Never mind, we will pay the wherewithal," and when the scheme is completed they change sides and begin to clamour and say "Why was it undertaken when it was so expensive" and so on. Anyway, Sir, to make up the deficiency in the budget the Government is forced to enhance the water-rates. Surely the money cannot come from England, (*Voices*: But it is sent to England.) to make up the deficiency in your budget. It must come from the province, whether by the enhancement of the water-rates or by increasing the land revenue, court fees or stamps or from enhanced excise revenue. If you want that relief should be afforded to a few people by collecting funds from all over the province then you will have to be frank and say so. You urge that people purchased lands by paying high prices and therefore they should be supplied with water. But surely it is obvious that the Government has no control over water supply in the river. It cannot make the rain and snow to fall on the mountains to keep rivers always running with a full supply of water. If the rain falls naturally the supply of water in the canals will decrease, and no one can be held responsible for it. The Canal Department takes care that not a single drop of water is wasted. By the Triple Canal system if water is spared from the first it is made to flow in the second or the third canal as the case may be in order to be carried and supplied to the place where it is needed. Therefore, you cannot hold the Government or the Canal Department responsible for the occasional failures of the rainfall and consequently of the water supply. Moreover, is it fair after only three years experience to rush to make sweeping assertions that the supply of this canal is small? Such an inference is in no way justified. If the Chief Engineer will be permitted to speak he will tell you how abundantly water was supplied this *rabi* and what large areas are under crops at present.

I again lay stress on the fact that simply appointing a committee would not meet the necessities of the present case, especially when the financial conditions of the people and the province are not favourable. The best and the most reasonable course to be followed would be that which I have already suggested and that is, that these three classes should represent their cases



[Hon'ble Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

separately to the Financial Commissioner, Development, the who will hold enquiries into the matter and will forward them to the Government. Please note that I do not mean to give an undertaking to the effect that the Government will be bound to decide the matter in some particular manner, but that Government will consider those representations, and will see what it can do in the matter.

**Mr. H. F. Ashton** (Chief Engineer): Sir, the Honourable Revenue Member suggested that I should give the House some information about the water supplies on the Sutlej Valley Project. In making out a project one can only work on past records. It is from past records that one gets an idea of what the water supplies are likely to be available in the various months of the year. As regards Sutlej Valley Project, the average daily supply in the month of April over a period of 20 years ending 1919 was 9,700 cusecs. In April 1928, the average daily supply was actually 9,900 cusecs, in April 1929, i.e., last year, which was an exceptionally poor year, it was only 5,250 cusecs. Now taking the month of May, which is a most important month for *kharif* sowings, the average daily supply in the month of May over a period of 28 years has been 13,000 cusecs. The actual average (daily) in May 1928 was 22,800 cusecs. The actual average (daily) supply in May 1929 was only 7,000 cusecs, that is, half the supply actually measured over a period of 28 years. In spite of this, the area actually irrigated for the year 1928-29 was 10,19,000 acres and the area proposed to be irrigated by the project in that year was 10,97,000 acres, so that actual irrigation was very nearly up to the proposed. In 1929-30 the actual area irrigated up to the 15th February 1930 is 11,65,000 acres.

The debate has mainly been confined to the Nili Bar colony. In this colony the proposed irrigation is 5,86,000 acres, in 1929-30 up to the 15th February 1930, a year in which I pointed out that the water supply was exceptionally short, the actual irrigation done was 5,86,000 acres. So that we have, in this year of exceptionally short water supply, very nearly reached up to the proposed irrigation. If we take the allotted areas only, the allotted areas in 1928-29 were 2,91,500 acres. The actual area irrigated was 2,14,000 acres so that, we have irrigated well over 70 per cent. of the area allotted. Considering these figures it seems to me that if water supplies remain normal as are noted in our records of the last 28 years there is every hope that the Sutlej Project will turn out the success that it is hoped it will be.

**Rana Feroz-ud-Din Khan** (South-East Towns, Muhammadan, Urban) (Urdu): Sir, after the speech, and a very sympathetic speech, by the Honourable Revenue Member, it is hardly necessary to prolong the debate on the question before the House. He has been very kind to admit that some of the grievances to which the honourable mover has drawn the attention of the House are genuine and that it is necessary that adequate measures should be adopted to remove them. But in the course of his speech he has raised one or two points with regard to which there can be a difference of opinion and it is to discuss these points that I have risen to speak.

It is admitted on all hands that those who bought lands in the Nili Bar in open auction bid higher than the quality of these lands justified. There-



is no dispute about it that the prices that they paid were uneconomic. It may be that their zeal to buy lands overran their discretion at that time or that they were prompted to offer such high prices in view of the high prices of agricultural produce then prevailing. However it cannot be denied that very high and uneconomic prices were paid for these lands and it was certainly a mistake, and a serious mistake, on the part of the purchasers to do so. But it does not lie in the mouth of a Government Member to say that because Government had published the terms on which the lands were to be sold long before the auction took place or because the purchasers or the intending purchasers were supposed to study the terms before bidding at the auction, it is not now prepared to show any concession to the abadkars of the Nili Bar or even that it is not bound to show any concession to these people. No doubt, it was a sort of contract entered into by these people with Government without any coercion and with the full knowledge of the terms of the contract and from the legal point of view Government cannot be compelled to relax the severity of the terms. But it does not behove Government to feel and consider itself as a party to that contract when the other contracting party is no other than its loyal subjects. It does not seem proper on its part to take up that position and to insist on the fulfilment of the terms of the so-called contract. I do not mean to suggest thereby that the prices offered and settled upon should be reduced. I realise that if these prices are reduced, it will have a very bad effect on the sale of lands by auction in future. I may assure the Government that I shall not make such a proposal. But I think and feel that there will be no harm if the present rate of interest charged by the Government is reduced. The honourable member is aware of the fact that at the time of the auction of these lands, two different rates of interest were fixed by the Government. One was the rate of 5 per cent. and other was the rate of 8 per cent. per annum and the one was to be charged in the case of those who were prepared to pay higher prices and the other in the case of those who could not pay higher prices. It is true that these different rates of interest were fixed to enable all sorts of people to bid at the auction, which object could not be gained, but it is clear that Government could accept a lower rate of interest as well. The fixing of a lower rate of interest, though with a different object, shows that there is nothing to prevent Government to reduce the present rate of interest if it were so minded. This also shows that Government did at one time express its willingness and, I should say, readiness to accept 5 per cent. as the rate of interest and I think the present case is one in which it should not hesitate to accept the same rate of interest.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Urdu): Government did not fix these different rates of interest so as to distinguish between a purchaser and a purchaser or with a view to show concession to any of the purchasers of these lands. The rate of 5 per cent. per annum was to be charged in the case of those who were prepared to pay higher prices.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** (continued in Urdu): I admit that it was with a different object that a lower rate of interest was also fixed, but my point is that such a rate could be charged and that Government expressed its readiness to charge such a rate and it is why I say that Government should reduce the rate of interest to 5 per cent. per annum. Equity

[**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.**]

demands it and the miserable plight of the abadkars in the Nili Bar justifies it.

Besides I am of opinion that the period of 5 years in which the prices of these lands are intended to be recovered is too short. This period should be extended to at least ten years. It is a fact known to all that during the last three years there has come a rapid, and an unexpectedly rapid, change in the prices of agricultural produce.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Urdu): May I know what exactly the honourable member wants the Government to do? What is his definite proposal?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** (continued in Urdu): I want that the prices of these lands should be recovered in instalments extending over a period of at least ten years. In a period of 5 years even the most industrious of the farmers cannot make so much profit out of any land as to be able to pay its price in that period. I should think that even the period of ten years is not sufficient for the purpose. Supposing on an average a square of land costs Rs. 10,000. Now as the tenth part of this price is to be paid as soon as the hammer strikes, let us suppose that Rs. 1,000 are paid there and then, and the remaining Rs. 9,000 are to be paid in instalments ranging over a period of 9 years, at the rate of 8 per cent. per annum as interest. Now, at this rate the purchaser of one square of land will have to pay Rs. 1,000 as principal and Rs. 720 as interest. Now, one square of land has never yielded Rs. 1,720 a year as income and no effort or labour can make one square of land yield so much. And mind, these purchasers belong to a class which has few other sources to make up the deficiency. It is, therefore, evident that even if the period is extended to ten years, it will not afford much relief to these people. However it is possible that this concession might do them some good.

The Honourable Revenue Member was further pleased to remark that the Council has always been pressing the Government that it should help, above all, that section of the population which is poor and which, therefore, deserves its first and foremost attention. It is true that the Council has been doing so and it was its duty to do so. No one will blame the Council for that attitude, but I do not understand in what way and why it was necessary to remind the Council of this attitude? Perhaps the Honourable Revenue Member is under the impression that all those who purchased lands in the Nili Bar in open auction, are very rich. To disabuse his mind of that prejudice I may say for his information that most of these purchasers had to form themselves into various groups of ten or twenty men and to pool their savings so as to be able to pay the first instalments. They are not at all rich and it is why they are now thinking of leaving their lands because their expectations to pay the remaining instalments out of the income of these lands have been falsified. These people, therefore, deserve every sympathy and it is really sad that the concessions which are available to grantees and other landlords in the Nili Bar have been denied to them. They also require land for burial ground and for roads. They richly deserve other concessions also, for example, the allotment of 5 squares of land free of cost in every chak. Theirs is a tale of woe and misery. They have many grievances

to be redressed. The Chief Engineer has tried to show that the supply of water in the Nili Bar is normal, but I have just now been told that it is not so. The honourable mover of the resolution tells me that while irrigation percentage in Amritsar is 85 per cent. and in Lyallpur 75 per cent., nay 65 per cent., because it has now been reduced, in Nili Bar it is only 55 per cent. Now, if these figures are correct and I have no reason to doubt the correctness of these figures, then the case of these abadkars becomes all the more deserving of the help of the Government. In this connection I may be permitted to say that if the Government is really anxious to colonise this part of the province, it is necessary that immediate steps should be taken to redress the grievances of these abadkars and other colonists of the Nili Bar. I do not think Government wants to see these colonists under a heavy burden of debt for all their lives because it is only by borrowing that they can pay the instalments in case no concessions are shown to them. The speech made by the Honourable Revenue Member shows that Government has the good of these people at heart. To redress the grievances of these people the honourable mover of the resolution has suggested that a committee should be appointed which should go into this question and the Honourable Revenue Member not agreeing with that suggestion has been pleased to suggest that the representatives of all the three classes of colonists should wait upon the Financial Commissioner and place before him their grievances. I think we should welcome this suggestion. The men of the calibre of my honourable friend the mover of the resolution should go about the whole of this *ilaga* and try to organise all the three classes of colonists into one body. If they could organise themselves into one body, I am sure the Financial Commissioner and, for the matter of that, Government must submit to their demands. There is no reason why they should fail to have their grievances redressed if they present a united front. If this occasion is made use of to bring all the three classes together I think we shall have gained much. It will be considered a blessing if all these abadkars form themselves into a union on this occasion, never mind if their grievances are redressed or not redressed, although I am sure that before a united front Government cannot but yield. I hope, therefore, that the honourable mover will welcome this proposal.

**Khan Sahib Risaldar Bahadur Nur Khan** (Rawalpindi, Muhammadan, Rural) (Urdu): Sir, I strongly support the resolution moved by my honourable friend Sardar Hira Singh. I do not think I need say anything with regard to the merits of this resolution because much has already been said to ventilate the grievances of the zamindars of the Nili Bar. I shall, therefore, content myself with relating my own experience in the matter. I may say straightway that like many other abadkars in the Nili Bar I am also a victim to the many troubles from which they are suffering. I had purchased a lot consisting of 5½ squares of land in the Nili Bar hoping that I shall be able to make my living out of the income of this land.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain**: How many thousands of rupees had you before you purchased that lot of land?

**Khan Sahib Risaldar Bahadur Nur Khan** (continued in Urdu): What I had I have spent and now I am left with no money. When I went to visit that plot of land I found it to be in a very bad condition. I spent

[K. S. Risaldar Nur Khan.]

about one and a half thousands of rupees more to make that plot fit for cultivation, but I soon found that all the money that I had spent was wasted. For the first few months I waited for the supply of water and when the water was supplied, it went on to other lands and my land remained unirrigated. It was proposed that a bund may be constructed to stop the flow of water on to other lands, but the proposal was abandoned as the time and money, that would to be spent on the construction of that bund, were considered to be incommensurate with the results that would be achieved. Under the circumstances I was unable to pay the next instalments and from the fear of the authorities who do not hesitate to use force for collection of the dues, I gave up that plot of land. What I had earned and made during the Great War in the capacity of a combatant, I have spent, rather wasted, on that land and now all the zeal in me for buying or possessing land has vanished. Now, I do not think of taking such a suicidal step again. In my opinion period of ten years which Rana Sahib has proposed, is also insufficient to pay the prices of the lands and I would suggest that at least 15 years should be allowed within which the prices should be paid. Before I resume my seat I very strongly support the resolution before the House.

**Mr. H. Calvert** (Financial Commissioner): Sir, I was much struck by the moderation with which the mover of this resolution put forward his case and I congratulate him on the temperate language he used about the colony which undoubtedly has been very unfortunate in several directions. It is admitted, and freely admitted, that there have been difficulties in the Nili Bar. It is quite freely admitted that there have been grievances amongst those who have moved down to that colony. But perhaps it is not quite so widely known that all these grievances have received the most continuous and careful attention at the hands of all concerned and have met with the utmost sympathy at the hands of the Leader of the House.

The points taken by the various speakers have been rather numerous and I might begin with the objection taken by the last speaker but one to the interest rate. It seemed to me rather curious that Government should be prepared to take either 8 per cent. or 5 per cent., and he took that as evidence that Government would be satisfied with the 5 per cent. The actual facts are these. Up to the current year the estimated expenditure on this project was 10 crores and 10 lakhs. On that sum interest has had to be paid and the interest on that sum paid up to date is round about 229 lakhs, making the total out-of-pocket expenditure to 1,229 lakhs of rupees. Now, that expenditure has to be recouped and it really does not matter to the Punjab Government what proportion of that expenditure comes back by way of interest or by way of capital. Government is quite prepared to take 5 per cent. if that would attract higher prices for the land; that is to say, Government would make a calculation, and if it found that the 5 per cent. interest does not fetch a higher price than the one at 8 per cent., then Government cannot afford to take this 5 per cent. interest. The honourable member in mentioning the interest seemed to slide over the difficulty felt all over India and more especially last summer in the matter of getting money. Even the bank rate of the Imperial Bank rose to, I think, 8 per cent.; and in England the bank rate rose up to 7 per cent. Therefore, the Government in fixing the rate of interest has to take into consideration the

possibilities of the money market for a long period of years, and that it did not go too high was amply shown last year when the Imperial Bank put the discount rate at 8 per cent.

Then, the honourable member put forward the argument which has very frequently been placed before us, and which was repeated last year also, that is, that the poor purchaser should be encouraged by allowing long instalments. He wished the present period of 5 years to be extended to 10 years. The plain fact about that point is very simple. It does not pay anyone to buy land at the present prices if he has to pay 8 per cent. interest; and in my opinion Government would be doing a very serious injury to the small zamindars of this province if it encouraged him to bid at auctions by the promise of long instalments with 8 per cent. on unpaid balances. That will not be an economic proposition. We have seen in the last year or two that our capitalist friends have almost deserted the auction. Although they grumble about not being allowed to buy land, yet when the chance is given to them in open auction, they do not come and bid. The reason is very simple. They, being mostly astute business men, find that it is not really a business proposition to buy land at these higher rates. So they have withdrawn. The result has been that a very large number of the peasant class have been induced to buy at these auctions and they have paid rather higher than could be justified by the value of the land. That is really the secret of this trouble.

The honourable member paid most attention to the terms of the lease. He himself has asked that the same land should be given back to the same lessees on different terms. Then, it is clear that there is no disinclination to take the land on lease. There is no shortage of men willing to take land on temporary cultivation. The whole argument depends on the terms, and the most important terms are decided by the lessees themselves when they bid. What has happened is that many people have made rather larger bids than were justified by the agricultural conditions and have therefore suffered thereby. The real fault lay with the over-optimistic bidder.

Then again, it has been argued by my friend opposite that the water-supply was not quite so good as had been made out by my honourable friend Mr. Ashton. What he has overlooked is this, that when the Lower Chenab Canal was built there was plenty of water in the Punjab and the Government of the day was concerned only with the Lower Chenab Canal. A similar argument applies to the Lower Jhelum Canal. At that time the Government had in mind only the water requirements of the Lower Jhelum Canal Colony. In the Nili Bar the Punjab Government has not got absolute right in the water; and this Council cannot argue the case of all the water of the Sutlej River which is shared by the Bikaner and the Bahawalpur States. The Governments of Bikaner and Bahawalpur have no more rights to discuss the amount of water which the Punjab receives than we have to discuss the amount of water which they receive. Our share is sufficient to irrigate about 51 per cent. of the land. My honourable friend, Mr. Ashton, has shown that while the Government has more or less undertaken to irrigate 51 per cent., it is actually irrigating 70 per cent., so that, although water is not so great as in the case of the earlier canals, that is not the fault of the Punjab Government. The Punjab Government takes that amount of water which by agreement it is allowed to take, and is trying to make the best

[Mr. H. Calvert.]

possible use of it, and the fact that the irrigation department is actually irrigating 40 per cent. greater area than it undertook to is, I think, a great credit to that department.

Now, as I have already mentioned, a great deal of the grievances arises from the optimistic bid and the optimistic tender. Suggestions have been made in this House to-day that Government should try to reduce this to a kind of limited liability tender. The Honourable Leader of the House has spoken on the possible results of that system. I would urge that if we are to have fair dealing, the only possible method is either by the open public auction or by open tender. I think all members will agree that any other system will only lead to accusations of favouritism and jobbery.

It is argued, Sir, that the people did not know what they were bidding for. Every arrangement was made to show them the land which was going to be auctioned. Maps and plans were provided and the *patwaris* were told to show land to the people who wanted to bid for it. It is not the fault of the Colonization Officer or his staff if any one at the time of the auction says that he does not know what he is buying. Again, the case was taken by the honourable the mover where a number of people bid jointly for a large area and then are held responsible for the sums they have to pay, and he seems to object to this, although it is a very clear case of a legal contract. A body of persons jointly makes a bid and Government accepts that bid; that makes a binding contract. So what actually happens in practice is this. A certain number of members of that partnership get rather frightened of the responsibility they have undertaken and they withdraw. The remaining members select the best plots of land which they have got and relinquish the poorer bits and say the poor plots of land belongs to those friends who ran away. Cases like that make it quite clear that we cannot allow people to bid jointly and then to abandon their joint responsibility.

Then, Sir, it has been urged that Mr. Wace is rather overburdened with the financial aspects of this project. Sir, I think all of us on this side, are overburdened with the financial progress of the Sutlej Valley Project. It must be remembered that when the earlier canals were constructed, labour was cheap and the canals were constructed at comparatively low cost. Since then labour and the cost of material have advanced enormously and it is no longer possible to construct the canals at the same low rate per acre irrigated as was the cost last century. Now, Sir, it is a question for the people of this province whether they do or do not want an extension of irrigation, because if they want extension of irrigation, they must be prepared to pay for it. Actually this project has been constructed and a liability of over ten crores has been incurred and some one or other has got to accept the responsibility for those ten crores. Another argument of the honourable mover was that the colonists should be relieved of their share of the burden and I presume he was further arguing that the rest of the burden should fall on the people of other districts, because, Sir, the State is the people and a burden on the State is a burden on the people, and if one section of the population who share that burden say we do not want to assume that burden, it means that they ask other people to assume that burden.

There is one other aspect which I should like my honourable friend to consider. It is the question of the position of the Punjab and its credit in the outer world. We borrow crores of rupees on our credit for a definite purpose. We cannot borrow ten crores of rupees from a bank or the public without explaining how we are going to use it. Every single item of those ten crores has to be justified by estimates. It is ten crores for a project and that project includes a detailed proposal for the repayment of the loan or for meeting the responsibility thereby incurred; and, therefore, as we have taken a loan on some particular project costing ten crores of rupees, we cannot retract from the responsibility we have undertaken. When we have borrowed crores of rupees on our project and we hope to raise so many crores of rupees by selling land, we cannot in honour say that we do not like this high price and we will sell the land at a lower price, and let the people who lent to us go abegging. We must, Sir, as a province, honour the undertaking, and the undertaking was that we should try to raise so much by temporary cultivation and so much by peasant grants and so much by sale and so on, and we must try to find that money according to our undertaking, otherwise our credit in the world will sink low.

Sir, there are other projects under consideration for the development of this very progressive province. There are the Haveli and Bhakra projects and so on, and for these projects loans will have to be taken, and if we wish to raise these loans at a reasonable rate of interest, we must take care of our credit. We must honour the undertaking we have at present incurred, otherwise, when the time will come to raise a further loan we will have the market closed against us. So it is extremely important that having once embarked on this project, having accepted the responsibility, and having put our signatures to a certain definite proposal, we do not go back and say that our people do not like it. We cannot throw up this proposal; we cannot do this because we have spent a large sum of money on it.

Now, Sir, there is one very peculiar argument put forward. It appears in the suggestion of the honourable the mover and it appears in most of the cases which come to us to be dealt with. In auction and in the system of tenders there are always a series of offers. A bids for so much, B for a little bit higher and so on, and it is customary to accept the highest tender. The person whose bid is highest or whose tender is highest expects that his tender will be accepted. Now, Sir, if we are going to take a lower tender, why should we take it from A and not B or C. It may be that those who have not bid so high have more sense of value of the land or they may have available capital. They may be better cultivators. Why should we bind ourselves to accept the bid of the higher bidder? The honourable the Leader of the House has dealt with extraordinary care and sympathy with a very large number of grievances which have been placed before him. I, at least, am in a position to know that he receives every form of grievance. He is constantly discussing the grievances, constantly making enquiries and when the case is proved it is placed before him and he sanctions concessions to the people who in the heat of the moment have bid rather higher than they should. Distributary 4-L has been mentioned to-day as a case in point, and the lease-



[Mr. H. Calvert.]

holders on that distributary have undoubtedly had misfortune, and I think their case has been dealt with and they were given separate concessions. When it was first found that the water supply was inadequate, the lease was further extended so that their first period of possession was free. When it was further found that the water supply was still inadequate, the period was for the second time extended, and when they got a crop which was a disappointing one, the Honourable the Revenue Member reduced the *malkana* from so much acre on allotted to so much acre on matured land, and he has dealt similarly with all the complaints which have been put before him.

Now, Sir, in this world of ours, great value has been put upon confidence. In a progressive province like the Punjab, confidence is supremely necessary; and for colonization work confidence is perhaps the most essential point of all. I am aware, Sir, that in this Nili Bar colony there have been misfortunes. There have been grievances; but I would like the honourable members to understand that these misfortunes and these grievances have been found in every single colony work that Government has undertaken. When the Lower Chenab Canal, Lyallpur colony, was first started, there were harrowing tales. People who settled down were beset by *jungalies* who used to attack them vigorously and with considerable force, and they also found that the canal was not as perfectly constructed on the lines marked out. They had to dig long water courses. Having dug their water courses they found a shortage of water as was almost unavoidable in the early days. Having finally got the water they were attacked by an outbreak of cholera; and when they got bumper crops they found no adequate means to transport them. Sir, all these misfortunes and many others befell the Lyallpur colony. It was very disheartening in those earlier days. Pioneers must all expect misfortunes and difficulties. I have myself known a time in the Lower Jhelum colony, Sargodha, when there was a very magnificent harvest on the ground and a very severe outbreak of plague occurred in the colony. The people fled and could find no one to harvest their crops. No one came to harvest them. Yet now the Lower Jhelum colony is prosperous. So, I think, in the Nili Bar, if we face all these difficulties with courage, if we bring to bear all the skill which the Punjab now possesses from long experience in such matters, and if, Sir, we can bring all our patience, bring all our financial understanding and colony understanding—and such matters are not easily acquired—if we bring to this colony all the great powers which the Punjab possesses, I for one, see no reason to despair, and I believe the Nili Bar will become as prosperous a colony as other colonies in the Punjab.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan** (Sialkot, Muhammadan, Rural): Sir, at this stage of the discussion on this resolution I find that there is really very little difference with regard to the objects that the mover and the supporters of this resolution have in view and the objects which the Government have in view, and that the speeches that have been so far made have really run in parallel channels instead of being opposed to each other. A certain amount of misapprehension has perhaps been imported into the discussion owing to a reference having been made to the high prices realised at the auc-



tions of lands in the Sutlej Valley, and these high prices having been due to a very large measure to two factors, (1) the comparatively high prices of foodstuffs prevailing at the time when these lands were bid for and (2) to the spirit of rivalry which is almost always engendered at auctions. But so far as I could follow the reference to the high prices, it was not so much a grievance that Government was in any manner to blame for these high prices having been fetched. It was mentioned more as a factor which has subsequently led to a position in which the purchasers of land in the Sutlej Valley Project find themselves in a genuine difficulty. Certain other grievances were alluded to, and I am very glad to find that it has been frankly admitted on behalf of the Government that there have been grievances, that there are grievances. Only Government has sought to put forward two pleas, the first of which I think every member of this House would unhesitatingly accept, that is to say, that the majority of these grievances are due to misfortune rather than to any lack of sympathy or effort on the part of Government to do the best that it could for the purchasers, abadkars and leaseholders in this colony. I think all of us agree that that is so. The second plea put forward is that Government has done its best and is doing its best to meet those grievances. That also may be conceded because nobody charges the Government, as I have said, with any lack of effort. But then the question always arises that whenever there are grievances and those grievances have continued, it may be that there is no lack of sympathy, there is no lack of effort, but it may also be that Government is either committed to certain points of view or having adopted certain points of view would be helped rather than handicapped in its efforts to meet those grievances by admitting non-official advice with regard to the manner in which these grievances are to be met. I find myself in entire agreement word for word as to what has fallen from the Honourable the Financial Commissioner as to his anxiety to keep up the credit of this province and to keep up confidence. But I want to ask him whether he thinks that in the long run the credit of this province is likely to be maintained by the spreading of the feeling which at present exists among the colonists and the purchasers in the Sutlej Valley and abadkars that Government ought to do something for them and has failed to do it. If this resolution fails that feeling is likely to be intensified. Does the Honourable the Financial Commissioner think that the credit of this province is likely in the long run to be promoted by that feeling spreading among the agriculturists of this province, or is likely, on the other hand, to be promoted by an assurance that a committee will be appointed who will examine the question in all its aspects and in many of its aspects they may find that they are in agreement with what Government has done in the past and proposes to do in the future, and with regard to other matters which had not been examined by Government, the Committee might make suggestions which the Government could accept? I am absolutely certain, and I have not the slightest hesitation in saying, that if people in that tract and people all over the Punjab who are potential purchasers of land in other areas which might be irrigated at subsequent stages are assured that the moment the existence of these grievances is admitted, Government are willing not only to remedy those grievances but to take the non-official element into their confidence for the purpose of making suggestions as to how they could be remedied, that would encourage colonists in

[Ch. Zafrullah Khan.]

the future. And the attitude which Government has at present taken up that because in their own view they have done the best they could and that, therefore, nobody should try to have the non-official element associated with them in trying to remove those grievances, is likely to discourage rather than to encourage colonists. I think that just for the object which the Honourable the Financial Commissioner has in view, to keep the credit of this province, to attract colonists and to raise enough money in order to enable this province to meet its commitments, it is necessary that confidence should be engendered among the colonists, both existing ones and potential colonists in other parts of the province, that if there be grievances at any time, may be due to misfortune, may be entirely due to the intervention of nature and not at all due to anything the Government has done or failed to do, the Government would at all times be ready to meet the demand for making a sympathetic enquiry into those grievances and to remedy such of them as could possibly be remedied. Similarly, just as it is necessary to maintain confidence with regard to the carrying through of these projects and with regard to the financial liability which the Government or the province has undertaken, it is also necessary to maintain confidence in the sympathetic attitude of the Government towards the people. And this House has been assured by the Honourable the Revenue Member that if the three different categories of people who are interested in this colony as abadkars, as purchasers of land and as pattadars would separately put down their grievances in moderate language and submit them to the Financial Commissioner, those memorials would be very sympathetically investigated and enquired into and considered, and any genuine grievances which arise out of them which are possible of being remedied by the Government would be remedied. I have no doubt that that would be done, but that is a line of argument which might on every occasion be adopted by Government whenever there is a demand for a committee to make an investigation into any matter that might arise. After all, Government can on all occasions say: Surely, you must have confidence enough in us that our officials will honestly do what they promise to do, and if you will submit your grievances to us in moderate language, all the genuine grievances which we consider are capable of being remedied we shall remedy. Did the Honourable the Revenue Member mean that on some occasions Government is not willing to adopt that attitude with regard to the grievances urged and that on this particular occasion they would be willing so to do and that, therefore, a committee is not necessary? If, on the other hand, the attitude of the Honourable Member is that on all occasions, whenever grievances arise, Government does adopt that procedure that would be a complete answer to all resolutions whenever brought forward into this House asking for the appointment of a committee. The object of this resolution is not in any sense either to scrap this project or to get rid of the commitments of the province with regard to it or to relieve purchasers of land in this colony and other settlers of the financial obligations which they have undertaken towards the Government, nor is it even to condemn what Government have done or have failed to do. The object is to request the Government, grievances having been admitted, to associate two members of this House with, let us say, the Honourable the Financial Commissioner, in the

enquiry which Government itself proposes to make into the grievances of these three classes of settlers in this colony.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I have not heard anything about abadkars. So we had better drop them.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** I included them because the Honourable the Revenue Member mentioned them among the classes of people who might send up their grievances to the honourable member and they are certainly mentioned in the resolution. The object is that the grievances of those people should be enquired into. And let us say that that enquiry would be conducted by an officer subordinate to the Honourable the Revenue Member. Then, it is the wish of honourable members on this side of the House that in such an enquiry two non-official members of this House shall be associated. There is no reason for Government to anticipate that these two non-official members will adopt an unreasonable attitude any more than that Government would adopt an unreasonable attitude with regard to the consideration of those grievances. If the attitude of the Government is reasonable I am certain that the attitude of the two non-official members would be equally reasonable and the conclusions jointly arrived at being arrived at in the light of that confidence which the Government would be prepared to place in the non-official element would command a great deal more confidence than conclusions which may be arrived at, although they are exactly the same as would be arrived at by a committee with the non-official element, by, say, the Financial Commissioner sitting by himself and making an investigation into these matters. For these reasons briefly stated, I think that the object to be attained being the same, that is to say, that Government is prepared to make a thorough and sympathetic investigation into the grievances of those people and the same being the object of the honourable mover, only the means for the attainment of that object being different, the means suggested by the honourable mover being such as are likely to command a great deal more confidence among the public of this province than the one suggested by the Honourable the Revenue Member, I am sure that the House would be disposed to give its support to this resolution.

**Mr. J. D. Penny (Finance Secretary) :** I understood from the speech of the honourable member who spoke last that he advocated the appointment of a committee such as was suggested by the mover of this resolution on the ground that its effect upon our credit would be greater than any ordinary departmental enquiry by officers of Government, however sympathetic they might be. He thought, I understand, that the result of the association of non-officials with an enquiry of this nature would be that the conclusions would command a greater confidence in the public mind. There is a great deal to be said for this point of view, but in the present case it would be difficult to see what good purpose the appointment of this particular committee is likely to serve. A great deal of attention has been concentrated this afternoon upon the grievances of persons who have bought land at auctions in the Nili Bar. And the reason for this is that the proportion

[Mr. J. D. Penny]

of land that has been disposed of or will be disposed of in this way is a great deal larger than in previous canal colonies in which the process of colonisation is now over.

There are several reasons for this of which the chief one perhaps is the fact that in the earlier colonies the agricultural prospects of the settlers were doubtful, and it was impossible for them to foresee at all accurately what profits they were likely to derive from the land which they were taking up. The state of things is now very different, and everybody knows that very large profits have been made from perennially irrigated lands in the past, and that there is every prospect of similar profits being derived in future. It is not necessary, therefore, to attract colonists to the land by giving them very attractive terms and on conditions which, experience has shown in the past, and will show in the future, will be unduly lenient. There is a further reason in the abnormal rise in prices, which have made the construction of the Sutlej Valley project a more costly proposition than the construction of similar irrigation schemes in the older colonies; and it is necessary therefore to expect a larger return from the disposals of the land in order to make sure that the province will derive a proper benefit from its capital expenditure. Now, when it was not known what the profits of lands that were sold in the Lower Chenab Colony were likely to be, it was quite natural and, indeed inevitable, that gentlemen who made bids at the auction should have been rather cautious. But in the Nili Bar Colony persons who are bidding for the land will know the conditions that are likely to obtain in it, and it is this as much as anything else which has led to the very keen competition to get the land.

There is the further fact, on which emphasis has already been laid, that the persons who are now bidding at a public auction are not so much capitalists for whom this form of disposal of land was originally designed, but the zamindar who has himself gained profits from canal irrigation in other districts or has seen his more fortunate neighbours deriving this profit, and has hopes that he will be equally lucky in the Nili Bar Colony. For this reason, there is a great deal keener competition in the Nili Bar than there has been ever before. I think I am right in saying that when the auctions were first started in the older colonies the practice was to receive the sum that was bid at the auction on the spot or, at any rate, within a month or two, and this actually is the ordinary procedure in anything that could be called auction. By degrees, certain concessions have been given in the way of allowing certain period of time within which the money could be paid. On the Lower Bari Doab I think this was first introduced as a regular system and payment was allowed to be spread over three years in six monthly instalments. That was hailed with satisfaction by the zamindar community, and it is for that reason, I think, that an extension of the practice has been made in the Nili Bar where the conditions obtaining in auctions that have been held so far have been 10 per cent. down and the rest in five annual instalments. This concession is one which has been made for the benefit and to meet the demand of the zamindar; and it is somewhat anomalous that this very class should turn round and say that those conditions are hard.

I think that when we regard the matter quietly we must find ourselves unable to accept this argument. After all, what is in question here is not so much the investigation of some grievances, or even the question of amending one's general policy, but simply the question whether certain individuals have made bad bargains. Now, making due allowance for the fact that any committee on which honourable members of this House are represented must carry great weight with the public outside the walls of this House, it will surely be a very serious thing if any impression were given that Government is going to go back upon its contractual obligations. (*Hear, hear*). What these people want when they have made that bad bargain is that they should in some way be let off and get at the public expense some sort of concession to which under the law they are not entitled. Now, there is one of the canons of financial propriety the importance of which the Auditor-General is constantly impressing on the Financial Department and that is that the public revenues must not be used for the benefit of a particular person or class. Here we appear to have something which savours of an attempt to divert the revenues, or divert certain concessions affecting the revenues, of the province, to the benefit of a particular class. That is to say, the proposal is to interfere with the ordinary law of contracts and to relax it for the benefit of persons who find that they have overreached themselves. I cannot help thinking that it will be a very unwise step to appoint any committee which would be likely to give the impression that Government is prepared to entertain measures of this nature. Everybody will sympathise with a zamindar who has promised to pay a price which he subsequently finds himself unable to pay. But after all, we must surely treat him in the same way as he would be treated in private dealings. I can hardly imagine the honourable gentleman who moved this motion, if he sold a bullock of his own, being prepared to take payment for it in instalments spread over a period of 10 years, or to revise the price if the bullock died in the meanwhile. I think too that he would expect the gentleman who bought the bullock to have a very good look at it beforehand; he would expect him, for instance, to look at its teeth, and see what its prospective age is, and he would not subsequently accept any argument when he said that he was very sorry that he did not see the bullock before he bought it. The same argument will hold good with reference to auction even of Government land. It is the duty of the person who intends to bid at the auction to go and look at the land beforehand and see for himself what it is worth. I think when we think over the motion we must come to the conclusion that though certain bids which people have promised to pay may bear hard upon them, nevertheless it is better that we should enforce the terms of the contract than that we should give rise to a general feeling of insecurity by tampering with it wholesale in the way any relaxation of the conditions generally would involve. Therefore, I ask the House to reject this motion.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee, consisting of one official and two non-official members of this Council to enquire into the grievances of the landholders, temporary lease-holders and abadkars of the Nili Bar Colony, and to suggest ways and means for the removal of these grievances."

The Council divided : Ayes : 33, Noes 27.

### AYES.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi Abdul Ghani.  
 Diwan Bhadur Raja Narendra Nath.  
 Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram.  
 Chaudhri Kesar Singh.  
 Pandit Nanak Chand.  
 Mian Ahmed Yar Khan, Daultana.  
 Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah.  
 Mr. Din Muhammad.  
 Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram.  
 Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan.  
 Maulvi Sir Rahim Bakhsh.  
 Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal.  
 Shaikh Faiz Muhammad.  
 Chaudhri Duli Chand.  
 Pir Akbar Ali.  
 Chaudhri Ali Ahmad.  
 Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan.

Khan Sahib Risaldar Bahadur Nur Khan.  
 Malik Khan Muhammad Khan, Wagha.  
 Mian Nurullah.  
 Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi.  
 Chaudhri Umar Hayat.  
 Khan Muhammad Abdullah Khan.  
 Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.  
 Shaikh Abdul Ghani.  
 Chaudhri Afzal Haq.  
 Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq.  
 Sardar Hira Singh, Narli.  
 Sardar Hari Singh.  
 Sardar Partap Singh.  
 Khan Bahadur Sardar Habib Ullah.  
 Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh.  
 Sardar Bishan Singh.

### NOES.

Colonel C. A. Gill.  
 Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.  
 The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon.  
 Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar Khan.  
 Mr. W. R. Wilson.  
 Mr. R. Sanderson.  
 Mr. W. S. Dorman.  
 Mr. M. A. Ghani.  
 Mr. H. F. Ashton.  
 The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal.  
 The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh.  
 The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow.  
 The Honourable Mian Sir Fazli-Husain.

Mr. Alan Mitchell.  
 Mr. J. D. Penny.  
 Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie.  
 Mr. H. W. Emerson.  
 Dr. (Mrs.) M. C. Shave.  
 Mr. S. L. Sale.  
 Lala Mukand Lal Puri.  
 Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram, Kalia.  
 Rai Bahadur Lala Rattan Chand.  
 Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri.  
 Pandit Mehar Chand.  
 Sardar Bahadur Capt. Dalpat Singh.  
 Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sheo Narain Singh.  
 Mr. E. Maya Das.

The motion was carried.

## RESOLUTION RE STADIUM AT LAHORE.

**Sardar Mohinder Singh** [Ludhiana, Sikh, Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I beg to move—

"This Council recommends to the Government to provide a stadium and suitable grounds for public athletics and sports at the Minto Park, Lahore, or any other proper place."

Sir, before I proceed with my resolution, I would like to explain the term 'stadium'. It means an enclosure with a racing track, grounds for such games as football and hockey and suitable accommodation for spectators. There is also a pavilion and generally under the pavilion there are dressing rooms, refreshment rooms, committee rooms, etc. Sir, you will find that in almost all civilised countries stadiums are constructed for the use of the public. Of course there is one sort of stadium provided by the University at Lahore, but it is not open to the public. Sir, even in small villages a certain portion of shamlat land is reserved to be used as a ground for public sports. If Government undertook to construct a stadium it would create interest in athletics and sports. The attention of the people would be diverted from gambling houses, liquor shops and other places of immorality. Reputation will be another factor which will goad the people on to take interest in games and sports. Thus we will be able to produce all round best athletes and sportsmen. As the Persian couplet goes

کسب کمال کن نہ عزیز جہان شرمی

one cannot be a loser if one devotes one's entire attention to any one sphere of human activities. You know, Sir, that our countryman Gama the wrestler is a world champion. The Indian Hockey Team has earned world-wide fame. If athletics and sports are encouraged in the way I have suggested our people will be able to compete with the athletes and sportsmen of other countries. With these words I would commend my resolution for the acceptance of the House.

**Mr. President :** The resolution moved is—

"This Council recommends to the Government to provide a stadium and suitable grounds for public athletics and sports at the Minto Park, Lahore, or any other proper place."

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq** [Amritsar City, Muhammadan, Urban] : Sir, the resolution proposed by my honourable friend is of course very important, and he recommends to the Government to accept it. I might have asked the Government to accept it if my honourable friend had given some facts and figures. He wants a stadium to be built, but he has not taken the trouble of describing what size and what dimensions that stadium should have. He has not stated whether he wants to spend Rs. 1,50,000 or Rs. 500 or 5 lakhs on it. I understand that the stadium in Wembley can hold 80,000 people. There are some in Chicago and New York which can hold hundreds of thousands of people. He, however, has not stated what size of a stadium he would have in Lahore. Does he want the Government to embark on a scheme which might cost as much as the Shannon scheme in Kangra valley is costing us. Has he considered the income that is likely to accrue from that? Does he

[ Sh. Muhammad Sadiq.]

want the Government to spend one crore at a time when the whole country is suffering from the havoc of floods and at a time when there is so much economic trouble in the Punjab? Is this the time to bring forward this resolution? Is there enough money in the province? He has not given us facts and figures showing that the people who visit the matches do not find place to stand and cannot see the matches. I know that in Lahore the grounds are not fully occupied during matches by visitors. Stadiums are only built on one ground that the crowds visiting the matches are so huge that they cannot be accommodated. Government in England has not built any stadium so far. Probably in the United States where they have money to burn they can do so. Why does not my friend try to float a company? He should induce people, there are so many financiers in Lahore, he should induce them to start a company. He should show them that it is a good proposition. He should not have come to the Council when the Government is turning down useful schemes for want of money and when the people have suffered great loss of crops. Is this the time to bring such things? I think the honourable member should have considered more over this ill-made and ill-digested scheme. He is simply wasting the time of the Council. If he had brought the resolution supported by some facts and figures I would have been the first man to support him.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** The honourable member is repeating his arguments.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I am very glad my old friend remembers my repetitions. But I will not repeat, though sometime repetition is necessary to impress things on certain people who would not ordinarily understand a thing once. It all depends on the nature of the man. Some people can take the cue on the first mention, but there are others who would not take the hint even when it is repeated ten times.

**Mr. President :** But only a tedious repetition is prohibited.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I challenge my friends to show that my repetition was tedious.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, it is very tedious repetition (*Laughter*).

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I strongly oppose this resolution not that I have no sympathy with sports. If my honourable friend had said that the existing fields are congested and that we should have more fields I should have supported him. If he had asked some money to be given for producing more Games I should have said, yes. If he had wanted money for encouraging school and college students of Lahore in sports I would have agreed to the proposal. He has tried to describe what a stadium is, but unfortunately his description does not show what he meant. Are we really so ignorant of what a stadium means? This is treating the Council in a very funny way. Does the honourable member mean to say that we do not know the meaning of the word stadium? Is this the way that he wanted to treat us? We know what a stadium is.

**Sardar Mohindar Singh :** You may be knowing, but there may be others who do not know it.



**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I would not insult the intelligence of the honourable members with supposing that they do not understand what a stadium is. And look at the beautiful way he has described the stadium. We thought it might be something like *Kiri-Kara*. Stadium means a thing of very enormous size. Do you want a stadium of any size? Under these circumstances though I have every sympathy with sports and I would like more money to be given to the Honourable Minister for Education for sports to encourage youngmen to take their proper place in the world of sports, I cannot support this ill-thought out scheme which has been brought forward. It is absolutely ill-considered. He has not given the proper attention to the resolution. He does not even want a committee to be appointed. In these circumstances I oppose the present resolution without saying that I have no sympathy with sports.

**Sardar Bahadur Captain Dalpat Singh** [Non-official (Nominated)] (Urdu) : Sir, I rise to support the resolution moved by my honourable friend Sardar Mohindar Singh. I am also of opinion that the honourable member representing Amritsar has made a very tedious repetition of his arguments. The definite dimensions and details of the scheme were laid before the House in quite clear and unambiguous terms. The length of the course for foot-races was also stated; the things like foot-ball and hockey were also enumerated; the description of the building to be erected for the convenience of the players and the athletes was also given, and I don't understand what more was expected from the honourable mover of the resolution. I vehemently urge the necessity of

5 P. M.  
providing a stadium and a suitable ground for sports and athletics here in the city of Lahore. When arrangements for such a ground and such a stadium are made here, naturally the public will have an incitement to take interest in sports and athletics. This would help them to make their health good and their physique strong. When individuals become strong naturally the race they form becomes strong, and this goes a long way to make a country climb up the path of progress with an energetic, quick and confident pace.

**Lala Mukand Lal, Puri** [Lahore City (Non-Muhammadian) Urban] : Sir, I rise to support the resolution which has been moved by Sardar Mohindar Singh. I am surprised that my friend from Amritsar who professes to be in sympathy with the resolution should have opposed it simply because he thinks it is not well drafted. I can assure him that the building of a stadium and the reservation of Minto Park for public sports would considerably add not only to the amusement and recreation of the inhabitants of Lahore, but would lend a great impetus to the improving of the physical health of the inhabitants of Lahore who on account of their living in crowded surroundings are very badly affected by the conditions of city life. This would not only improve the amenities of the city of Lahore but would also benefit the whole of the Punjab inasmuch as Lahore is the centre of education, and students from all over the province come to this place. We are really thankful to Sardar Mohindar Singh that he has moved this resolution in this Council. If it is accepted by Government or if it is passed by this Council and the Government gives effect to it, it will not only improve the health of the citizens of Lahore but also provide a very good model for other towns to follow. In all countries it is recognised that there should be open grounds

[ L. Mukand Lal, Puri. ]

for recreation and sports, and in some countries it is stated by high authorities that for every 5,000 population there should be two acres of ground for recreation. In a town like Lahore the allotment of Minto Park would greatly meet the necessities of the case, and therefore the resolution of Sardar Mohindar Singh that Minto Park should be reserved for sports is quite in the fitness of things, and I strongly support it. Even the honourable member from Amritsar had no objection to the reservation of Minto Park for sports, but he objected to the resolution because Sardar Mohindar Singh had not given definite dimensions of the stadium which he proposes to be built. We can leave the details of the scheme to Government, and I hope that Government will see that the stadium which is built will be quite in keeping with the dignity of the capital of the province and will be such as would be a kind of a model for other cities to follow.

**Mr. E Maya Das** [Non-official Nominated ] Urdu): Sir, I am shocked to see such a proposal being opposed in a province like the Punjab which is the home of sports and athletics here in India. It was objected by the honourable member from Amritsar on the ground that the dimensions of the stadium were not mentioned by the honourable mover of the resolution. I may say that the honourable Sardar Sahib not only gave the dimensions of the stadium, but also went so far as to describe what a stadium is. Then Sir, the plea of financial stringency was brought forward. No doubt this is a very cogent excuse, but do you mean to say that beneficent works which are undertaken for the development of a country are stopped on account of lack of funds? Such works are carried even by taking loans. Look at France, although it suffered very heavy losses on account the great war, still it did not even for a moment desist or draw back from taking large loans for undertaking and carrying out all those schemes that were necessary for its progress. Although I am not in a position to extend my remarks to all the provinces of India, still I can safely say about the Punjab that many of its towns and villages have got their own play-grounds. Those towns of our province which have not got such open grounds where people could assemble and hold athletic matches feel the necessity very acutely. For a long time Ferozepore city felt the absence of a play-ground, but now a play-ground with a nice pavilion has been provided. This playground I don't say is very spacious, but still it is sufficient for the requirements of the inhabitants of that city.

It would be in the interest of the people as well as that of the country if we start popularising games and sports among the public. To achieve this end we can start district and divisional tournaments and finally provincial and inter-provincial tournaments. In the districts as well as in the divisions there are open play-grounds where sports tournaments can be held, but here in Lahore, which is the capital and where there ought to have been very large and spacious play-grounds, there is none for the public of the province. On account of this also, Sir, there is a real and a pressing necessity for providing Lahore with a stadium and suitable grounds. Since it is the capital of the province its stadium should be decent and well furnished with all the necessities that are essential for games and sports. For practising foot-races a track should be prepared, a pavilion for spectators should be built; and a building consisting of a room for the managing committee, a refreshment room and a store room are also needed. Some honourable member enquired

as to how much expenditure the building of a stadium would involve. I think Rs. 2,500 would suffice in the beginning. Sir, it would not be out of place to mention here that if our athletes are given systematic training they would make a name for themselves and for their country. In the last Olympic meet a peasant came over to compete for the 100 yards race. He took 10 seconds to finish it. In view of the fact that the world record of the 100 yards race is  $9\frac{3}{4}$  seconds and that this fellow had never had proper training this was a marvellous achievement. He would have shown better results if he had been given scientific and regular training. India won laurels through its hockey team which in their European tour defeated all the hockey teams of the world and won the World Championship. It would perhaps be of some interest to the honourable members to know a little about the Olympic games and their origin. These games and sports were started by the Greeks sometime before Christ, and were named after the mountain Olympia (the abode of gods) as Olympic tournaments. With the fall of Greek glory, their popularity also decreased until they were stopped altogether. Some 86 years ago they were revived by some persons who were keenly interested in sports, and now they are held every 4 years in certain countries by turn where stadiums exist. All the big cities of the world athletes are trained to compete in these trials.

Now, reverting to my original point, Sir, I would submit that we must try to keep pace with the rest of the world. When other countries and other nations are taking such a keen interest in sports there is no reason why we should lag behind and not make our young men interested in sports by providing them with all the facilities that can help to make them good athletes. We have seen in India that every good movement first starts from the Punjab, and this time let Punjab again be the first to take the initiative in popularising games and sports. Let the Punjab first set an example and the rest of the provinces will then follow in its wake. The Olympic Association has started its branches in 18 different districts, and the people are fast becoming interested in games, and this is another reason why the Government should provide a stadium here in Lahore which is the centre and the capital of the province. In Delhi a stadium has been provided, but we are not expected to go there daily for practising. His Excellency the Governor-General is the President of the Indian Olympic Association, and His Excellency the Governor of the Punjab is the patron of our local Olympic Association. There are three hundred responsible persons who have become members of this association, and they all are doing their utmost to promote the cause of sports. Consequently interest in sports is increasing with giant strides, and people are feeling the necessity of stadiums and play-grounds acutely. Therefore, we must do all that we can to meet their requirements.

In the end, Sir, I request the Government to help this movement by funds. In 1930 it granted Rs. 1,000 to this Association which has taken in hand this work of popularising games in the province, and for the year 1931 it is proposed to give it a sum of Rs. 1,500, but I think the Government ought to be a little more generous and make a grant of Rs. 2,000 annually to this Association. With the request that this grant may kindly be made I support the resolution.

**Pandit Mehar Chand** [Jullundur-cum-Ludhiana (Non-Muhammadan) Rural] (Urdu): Sir, dark and dungy narrow lanes, congested areas, foul air,

[ Pandit Mehar Chand. ]

and unsanitary conditions of the cities and towns have adversely affected the health and physique of our youths, both boys and girls. In view of this it is of outstanding importance that the Government should promptly adopt all such measures that can rebuild the health of the young men. I do not ask the Government to spend enormous sums of money on this beneficent work, but at least it is incumbent upon the Government to provide open grounds and open lawns for the people to take exercise therein. Branches of the Olympic Association have been established in various districts, and all over the Punjab people have begun taking keen interest in sports. If the Government takes an initiative by providing a stadium and a ground here in Lahore which is the central place, I hope it will be an incentive to the mufasil towns to build such stadiums with grounds and start taking exercise. The people will become interested and then will collaborate with the Government in making this good and useful work a success. With these remarks I support the resolution and ask the Government to provide such simple grounds at once. Slowly and slowly we can improve upon these simple grounds.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, I have very great pleasure in congratulating the honourable mover of this resolution inasmuch as this is the first resolution that he has moved in this Council, and is of such an important nature that it has received support from all parts of the House. I have no doubt that the honourable members are aware that in Lahore facilities for the display of sports competitions already exist to a certain extent. I have no doubt that all of us would like the sports grounds to be brought to a much better state of efficiency than they are in at present. Besides the University ground, with which I have no doubt most of the members of this Council are already familiar, there is the Minto Park which was intended to supply ground for sports and recreation for the people of the city. As early as 1909 a committee existed in order to render this ground suitable for purposes of sports. I myself served on the committee for several years before the war, and it was that committee which laid out the Minto Park, made an enclosure at a cost of, I think, fifteen or sixteen thousand rupees, and I have no doubt if the honourable mover of this resolution pays a visit to the Minto Park he will see that that enclosure is still serving the purpose it was intended to serve. I have no doubt that many of the members here who have lived in Lahore for some time and have paid visits to the Minto Park will feel that this place during the last 20 years has been really changed out of recognition. Formerly when we used to go and see *Dusserah* there, the place was really more or less like a jungle, a desert. Now you see nice grounds laid out; now one does not get even one-tenth of the dust one used to be sure of getting when going to see the *Dusserah*.

This particular case of the Minto Park has been under the consideration of the Revenue Department for quite a long time, and we have been taking great pains to organise a committee which would look after it and also improve it and make it serve, not the purpose of being used as an amusement or play-ground for little children, but as a ground for exercise and for games for the grown-ups, and not only as a ground for the use of the city people, but also to serve as a suitable ground for provincial sports competitions. I can assure the honourable mover of this resolution that the object he has in view

is exactly the object that the Government have also in view, and to that extent Government is prepared to welcome this resolution.

As to the construction of a stadium and so on, I have no doubt, the honourable member has realised, after the slashing and vigorous criticism of the member from Amritsar (Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq), that no scheme is ready to be adopted. The honourable mover of the resolution, however, I am sure never intended the resolution to serve as a direction to the Government that it must be done, that a stadium should be put up and so forth. His only desire, as I understand it, is that Government should express its sympathy with the object of the resolution, further, that Government should be ready to place the Minto Park grounds and other grounds as may be needed from time to time for promoting the cause of games and sports in the Punjab. That I am certainly prepared to do. As a matter of fact, the enclosed portion of the Minto Park is as much as 24 acres and the unenclosed portion is 45 acres, while there is a block of ground in the railway sidings which is as much as 30 acres or so. This has not been made available for sports. But if there is no other pressing need for that land, it is quite possible that Government may be able to make that also available for sports.

The second question is, who should do all this work. It may be said, very reasonably, that Government cannot run this sports-ground. It is the work of a non-official agency, if necessary, assisted by official agency. That is a matter, again, on which for the present no decision has been arrived at. If a suitable non-official agency assisted by official agency is forthcoming, and Government is satisfied that it will have the command of some non-official fund with some Government assistance to run this scheme, I have no doubt that Government will be prepared to support that institution. I trust the honourable mover of the resolution will find the assurances that I have given him quite satisfactory.

**Sardar Mohinder Singh** (Urdu): Sir, I thank the Honourable Revenue Member for the assurance he has given, and I beg leave to withdraw the resolution.

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

#### RESOLUTION RE SCHOOL FEE CONCESSIONS.

**Pir Akbar Ali** [Ferozepore Muhammadan, Rural] (Urdu): Sir, I beg to move the resolution which stands in my name and which is as follows:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that Memorandum No. 16977-R., dated the 22nd October 1929, issued by the Ministry of Education should be modified as follows:—

- (a) The proviso to the Memorandum should be restricted only to those agriculturists who own or cultivate land assessed to a minimum annual land revenue of Rs. 50 or who are assessed to income-tax.
- (b) The classes and status of village *Kamins* to whom the benefit of the concession is to extend should be specified.
- (c) The concession should extend to private recognised schools, the Government reimbursing them for the loss caused thereby to their income."

Sir, this memorandum to which reference has been made in the first part of the resolution was issued by the Ministry of Education a few months ago. It needs no comment to say that this memorandum will go to deprive

[ Pir Akbar Ali. ]

the sons of the agriculturists of fee concessions who happen to be voters of the Council or who pay land revenue to the amount of Rs. 25 per annum. The issue of such a memorandum goes to show that there is no device that is not being adopted to ruin the zamindars. Every weapon that there is in the armoury of the Government is being used to crush the interests of the zamindars. This and other concessions are given out of the money that the zamindars contribute, and I fail to understand why zamindars themselves are deprived of these concessions. It is their money and it should go to them in the first instance. It will, therefore, be in the fitness of things if that memorandum is modified as I have suggested in the first part of my resolution.

The second part of the resolution is very simple, and it says that the classes and the status of the *Kamins* should be specified so that only those persons of this class should avail of these concessions who are really *Kamins*. The third part of my resolution is equally simple, and it needs no comment on my part. With these few words I commend the resolution for the acceptance of the House.

**Mr. President :** The resolution moved is that—

"This Council recommends to the Government that Memorandum No. 16977-R., dated the 2nd October 1929, issued by the Ministry of Education should be modified as follows :—

- (a) The proviso to the Memorandum should be restricted only to those agriculturists who own or cultivate land assessed to a minimum annual land revenue of Rs. 50 or who are assessed to income-tax.
- (b) The classes and status of village *Kamins* to whom the benefit of the concession is to extend should be specified.
- (c) The concession should extend to private recognised schools, the Government reimbursing them for the loss caused thereby to their income."

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** With your permission, Sir, may I request the Honourable the Minister for Education to place a copy of the memorandum on the table? Without reading that memorandum, I am afraid, we will not be able to follow the debate in a satisfactory manner.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** I suggest that it may be read.

**Mr. President :** Will the Secretary of the Council, please read the memorandum?

*(The memorandum was read out by the Secretary of the Council.)*

**Chaudhri Duli Chand** [Karnal (Non-Muhammadan) Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I rise to support the resolution. I have very carefully studied the memorandum in question, and it needs no effort to see that it will deprive the sons of many agriculturists of the concessions in fee. It is apparent on the face of it that all the sons of the ex-soldiers, lambardars, sufedposhes and of the zaildars will have to go without this concession simply because on account of their war and other services they happen to be the voters of the Council. Similarly all such persons who own or cultivate land assessed to annual land revenue of Rs. 25 will not be able to claim this concession in fee for their children. This memorandum is, therefore, very harsh, and no time should be lost in amending it. Many of these ex-soldiers and sufedposhes and even zaildars and lambardars are very poor, and they cannot afford to educate their children

if they were required to pay tuition fees for them. And if they would like to educate their children, they will have to see that their names are struck off the electoral rolls. For my part I am inclined to think that there is some ulterior and a political motive in the issue of this memorandum. This memorandum has perhaps been issued to reduce the voting strength of the zamindars so that whenever we may claim more rights and more representation in any future constitution, our claim might be easily put off on the ground that although our population is very large, our voting strength is very small. This memorandum has created much disaffection amongst the zamindars, and they are now in a fix whether they should cease to be voters or should cease to send their boys to schools. I am in charge of a school which is meant mainly to educate the sons of agriculturists, and in that capacity I have recently received many applications by the parents of many of our students that Government may be moved to strike off their names from the electoral rolls. It is, therefore, necessary that the memorandum in question should be amended in the light of the first part of the resolution.

It is equally necessary that the classes and the status of *Kamins* should be defined as has been asked in the second part of the resolution. This memorandum supersedes all the previous orders on the subject, and the Education Code does not help to judge who are in reality *Kamins* and who have styled themselves as *Kamins* to claim fee concessions for their boys. I do not know much of the northern districts, but in the districts in our part of the province, all the non-proprietors are included in the class *Kamins* except Brahmans and such other castes. If the classes and the status of the *Kamins* are not clearly defined, this concession in fee will go to persons who do not really deserve this concession. There will be no bar for even the *banias* in the villages to claim this concession. It is, therefore, essential that not only the classes of the *Kamins* should be defined, but their status should also be specified.

The third part of the resolution is not less important. If this concession is not made available for the boys reading in private schools, it is natural that the students, who are entitled to this concession, will try to seek admission to Government schools. This will have a very bad effect on the private schools in rural areas, and particularly on those which exist for the benefit of agriculturists. The schools in the cities and in towns may not be affected by this memorandum, because there are very few such private schools in urban areas in which more than a few agriculturists are reading, but most of the schools in the rural areas will be deserted. In my school there are about 850 students reading at present and nearly all of them are Jats and hence belong to agricultural tribes which are entitled to this concession. Now if all of these students are given fee concession and Government does not reimburse the school for the loss caused thereby, it will be very difficult for the management to run the school. It is, therefore, necessary that the third part of the resolution should also be accepted.

**Mr. Din Muhammad** (East and West Central Towns, (Muhammadan) Urban): Sir, I beg to support this resolution. I believe the Honourable the Minister for Education did not seriously consider the situation when he agreed to the insertion of this proviso in the memorandum. At the request of the honourable member from Lahore City (Lala Mukand Lal, Puri) names of the districts were read, and these are those very districts which readily



[ Mr. Din Muhammad. ]

responded to the call of the Empire, when the Empire was in dire need of their help. From amongst the Muslim districts, Attock, Jhelum, Mianwali and Shahpur stood most prominent. From amongst those districts which are populated by Hindu zamindars Hissar, Rohtak, Karnal, Gurgaon and Kangra were the most prominent. So in this way if a provision was made excluding those persons whose names are borne on electoral rolls, in these districts when the Honourable the Education Minister knew full well that every discharged soldier, every demobilized soldier was entitled to a vote, this would evidently mean that Government wanted to penalize their loyal services which they rendered when the Government was sorely in need of them. When they were given this privilege of a franchise, it was repeatedly said that Government was doing a favour to those people by conferring a higher status on them than what they actually deserved. Now, on the one hand, while they were consoled and flattered in this manner, on the other hand they are being penalized in that manner inasmuch as the privilege that they enjoyed in the matter of education is at one stroke of the pen being withdrawn from them. I would not go to the length of saying that it was intentional on the part of the Honourable the Minister for Education to do so nor shall I attribute any sinister motive to him. I would submit that perhaps he unwittingly placed his signature on this document, which is actually working havoc so far as the martial races are concerned. Sir, there is another aspect of this question. Everybody to-day is asking for the extension of franchise, that is, for the lowering of the franchise, and on all hands it is being insisted upon that the wider the franchise becomes, the better it would be for the country. Now, if this circular is enforced, you may well imagine that it would spell ruin for the rural population. All those members of the rural classes who would seek to enjoy the fruit of this extended franchise, would see this sword of Damocles always hanging over their heads, and would fear that their heads would be cut off if they would get their names entered in the electoral rolls.

Similarly, Sir, the vagueness that attaches to the word 'Kamin' would also work to the detriment of the members of the cultivating classes who reside in villages. On the one hand, as has been represented, it is quite possible that a *Kamin* might be interpreted, as it is generally being interpreted in law, to mean a mere non-proprietor non-cultivating resident of a village, and, on the other hand, a real *Kamin* of a village who is generally known as a *Kamin* may not enjoy this privilege on account of being a cultivating member of the community. It is absolutely reasonable, therefore, on the part of the honourable mover to ask the Honourable Minister for Education to make the meaning of this word clearer by defining it in the clearest possible terms.

The third part of the resolution also draws attention to another drawback or defect under which this memorandum labours. If this privilege is to be confined to the Government institutions only, it is obvious, nay, absolutely certain that all the private institutions that are at present run in different places will suffer. Everybody would run to a Government institution and would at once abandon all the private institutions although they are recognised by the authorities, for those institutions would be debarred from granting them the privilege which they would enjoy in a Government



institution. Under all these circumstances I believe, the Honourable Minister for Education would be pleased to reconsider this memorandum, and in the light of these remarks would choose some better words for the purpose of placing restrictions on fee concessions which he intends to introduce. His idea may be perfectly reasonable, his object may be perfectly noble. He might have been actuated by mere considerations of economy, but the words he has chosen are unfortunately such as would work to an enormous disadvantage of the rural community, to the disadvantage of those martial races on whose support the Government generally depends.

With these remarks, I beg to lend my support to the resolution proposed.

**Risaldar Bahadur Nur Khan** (Rawalpindi, Muhammadan, Rural) (Urdu): Sir, I strongly support this resolution. This memorandum, since it has been received by the Headmasters of schools, has created disaffection amongst the zamindars in general and ex-soldiers in particular. This memorandum has come as a surprise to them. They do not know whether they should cease to be voters of the Council or they should cease to send their boys to schools. This class of ex-soldiers should not have been deprived of the concession like that. They had shed their blood in France, in Egypt in Africa, and in fact at every theatre of war. If they were given the right of voting in recognition of those military services, they deserved other concessions too. This memorandum will affect not only the ex-soldiers, but it will also affect the zamindars who pay Rs. 25 and more as land revenue. It is not necessary for me to say that petty zamindars and these ex-soldiers belong to those classes of men who make both ends meet with great difficulty, and as such it will be very difficult for them to pay tuition fees for their boys. If, therefore, the fee concession is withdrawn and is not made available to their children, they will have to give up the idea of educating their sons against their will. This memorandum has been issued at a time when the rural population has come to take some interest in education. During the last decade or so Government has been making every effort to spread education everywhere. It has spent lakhs of rupees to construct buildings for schools at many places and to provide other materials for these schools. All this has been done to create interest in education amongst the zamindars. And now when the zamindars have shown their inclination and desire to receive education, the Ministry of Education has withdrawn a concession which was necessary to keep alive their desire to receive education. It is no exaggeration to say that if this resolution is not accepted and the memorandum referred to above remains in force, many of the boys that are at present reading in the schools located in rural areas will desert these schools, and these palatial buildings will come to be considered as monuments of old times. The zamindars possess as much brain, and I should say as much desire, to receive education as any other class of people claims to possess. But the difficulty is that they are not very rich to afford to pay even tuition fee. If the Government is really anxious to help the zamindars and particularly the ex-soldiers, it should accept this resolution without demur.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** (Minister for Education): Sir, the resolution stands in three parts. The first part relates to the limit of revenue which is to be placed in order to secure fee concessions. The second relates to certain classes to whom this concession will be available,

[Hon. Mr. Manohar Lal.]

and the third would carry us further as regards the schools in which the concession is available than has existed hitherto. Let us deal in the first instance with the first part which, I take it, is the most important. Every speaker who has spoken so far in support of this resolution has thought that it was ever the intention of the Government to place a soldier who happens to be a voter on the strength of the fact that he has been a member of the army under any disability in the matter of fee concession. Let me say straightaway that this result of the proviso was never in our contemplation, and came in owing to a misunderstanding. Long before this resolution came before you, Sir, Government had taken steps. My attention was drawn to it in the first instance by a Council question which was put by Khan Bahadur Nur Khan about three months ago. And Government has already taken steps that the soldier because he happens to be a voter of the Council shall not merely by that fact lose the right of fee concession. Let us put that therefore out of consideration.

Now, reference was made to this other limitation that if you happen to be a voter for the Legislative Council, the fee concession will not be available. That was based on the consideration not to impose any disability on the voter as such, but was the result of the effort of the department with the help of the Finance Department to evolve some formula by which we could extend this concession to certain classes of people and exclude certain others from it. You will remember, Sir, that these concessions have obtained for some period of time, but they were on a temporary basis, and they were being extended from year to year. During the last two years we examined the question at great length in order to find out what principle we can follow in placing this matter on a comparatively firm basis, not subject to annual revision or extension, but something that could be accepted as a matter of principle. In working this out, one had to consider a variety of matters. First, where should these concessions obtain? Obviously in educationally backward areas, obviously where those people are found in particular abundance to whom these concessions might well be extended by the State, obviously where people continued to be poor because of the great hardship which nature imposes in particular tracts on the effort of man to acquire sufficient competence. The interest also, as has been remarked by one of the speakers, of the general tax-payer had to be taken into consideration. All this took some time, and it was then found that it would be desirable to extend these concessions in particular areas, mostly those where these concessions had so far existed on comparatively temporary basis. But now that we had definitely adopted a principle, they were to be extended to certain other poor places, certain tahsils in other districts also; for example, if I may mention one or two, the Una Tahsil of the Hoshiarpur district or the Hamirpur tahsil of the Kangra district. As regards the land revenue-paying capacity, the honorable member has referred in the course of his resolution to the present limit of Rs. 25. That arises from the fact that that constitutes the qualification for a person being a voter to the Council. In order to cut short the debate on this matter, may I say that Government wholeheartedly accepts part (a) of the resolution as it stands. The limit will be raised at once from Rs. 25 to Rs. 50 as the honourable member has proposed in this resolution. And I take it that that will be found satisfactory.

It was never the desire, let me say once again, of the Government, it could not be the desire of the present Government, that by this means any disability should be cast on the agriculturist voter or that some insidious method should be devised by which to affect his voting strength. And I say, without the least hesitation, that we accept this particular part of the resolution.

Coming to part (b), I think the honourable members who have spoken on it are given to fears which are absolutely unfounded. If they will turn to the Punjab Education Code at page 28, in paragraph 15, they will find an agriculturist defined, also the method prescribed by which the class of *Kamins* has to be definitely ascertained, and with your permission, Sir, I will read this paragraph :

'The term 'agriculturist' shall be held to denote—

(a) any owner or tenant of land who in person and not merely through tenants, agents or servants engages in the work of cultivation ;

(b) agricultural labourers ;

(c) soldiers and other similar employees of Government who actually belong to the cultivating classes, and who, if living at their houses, would engage in person in the work of cultivation ;

With this definition we are not directly concerned now because we have accepted part (a) of the resolution raising the land revenue limit to Rs. 50. According to the Code the classes of persons in a district to be treated as agriculturists, village artisans or *Kamins* for the purpose of concession of fees will be determined by the Deputy Commissioner of that district in consultation with the Inspector.

**Mr. President :** Has the Honourable Minister to say a good deal yet ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I shall have to speak for some time longer, Sir.

#### PANEL OF CHAIRMEN.

**Mr. President :** Before the House adjourns to-day, I have to announce that under Rule 8 of the Punjab Legislative Council Rules, I have nominated the following gentlemen to the panel of Chairmen for the current session :—

Mr. Din Muhammad,

Lala Mukand Lal Puri,

Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq, and

Mr. E. Maya Das.

The Council then adjourned till 2 p.m. on Tuesday, the 25th February 1930.

PRINTED BY  
THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.  
3-4 PFC-600-22-3-30-SG-PF Lahore.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Tuesday, the 25th February 1930.*

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following member was sworn in :—

Blascheck, Mr. A. D. (official, nominated).

### STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

#### PROVINCIAL CIVIL SERVICE (EXECUTIVE).

**\*2807. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab, please state—

- (a) what proportion, if any, is fixed by Government for the representation of each community in the Provincial Civil Service (Executive) and on what basis is it fixed ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that some orders have been passed that such representation should be on population basis as regards Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs and that special representation beyond all proportion to their population be given to Christians ;
- (c) if so, will the Government lay a copy of these orders on the table ;
- (d) if no such orders have been passed, will the Government please state what is the general practice followed in the matter ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) No proportion is fixed.

(b) No.

(c) Does not arise.

(d) The general practice is to arrange for recruitment so that as far as possible the various communities and classes are fairly represented, and that no particular class or community obtains undue preponderance.

#### STENOGRAPHERS IN THE FINANCIAL COMMISSIONER'S OFFICE.

**\*2808. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in 1927 and before that year there was one Hindu, one Muslim and one Sikh Stenographer in the Financial Commissioner's office ;

[S. Partap Singh.]

- (b) whether it is a fact that at present all the four stenographers are Muslims ;  
 (c) what are the reasons for the absence of non-Muslim element in that office ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) In 1927 : yes.

Before 1927 : no. From 1918 to 1922 there was only one post of stenographer. This was held in succession by three Hindus, one Christian and one Mohamman. From 1922 to 1927 there were three posts. These were held at various times by four Hindus, one Sikh and three Mohamman.

(b) Four Muslims are actually working as stenographers. All of them are officiating in the place of two Hindus, one Sikh and one Mohamman—all on deputation in the Civil Secretariat.

(c) The question assumes the absence of non-Muslim element in the office. Of the 77 appointments in the office of the Financial Commissioners only four are stenographers ; and a glance at page 10 of the Consolidated Statement showing the proportionate representation of the various communities serving in the different departments of the Punjab Government as it stood on the 1st January 1929 shows that in that office the percentage of Muslims stands at 42.9 ; of Hindus at 85.1 ; of Sikhs at 14.2. This, it is hoped, will reassure the Hon'ble Member that the non-Muslim element in the office is no less than 57.1 per cent.

PERCENTAGE OF SIKHS ADMITTED TO THE PUNJAB AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE.

**\*2809. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to say—

- (a) whether it is a fact that since last year proportions on communal basis have been fixed for admission to the Punjab Agriculture College, and that Sikhs have been given only 20 per cent. share ;  
 (b) If the answer to the above be in the affirmative, will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state whether this percentage was fixed by the local Government or by the Principal of the College ;  
 (c) whether Government is aware of the fact that the Sikhs pay about 40 per cent. of the total land and canal revenue of the province ;  
 (d) whether it is also a fact that there is a general feeling among the Sikh community that the proportion fixed for them for admission to the above college is not commensurate with the percentage of their contribution to provincial revenues ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The Honourable Member is referred to the answer given by me to part (b) of Council Question No. 1888\* of 4th March 1929.

- (b) By the Local Government.  
 (c) I do not know the figure.  
 (d) I cannot say.

## OVERLOADING OF MOTOR VEHICLES.

**\*2810. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state the procedure by which overloading of motor vehicles is checked in the province?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** It is understood that the honourable member refers to motor vehicles plying for hire. The maximum weight and number of passengers that may be carried by a motor vehicle are determined by the licensing authority when the vehicle is licensed. The particulars are given in the "Road Certificate" and are usually also painted on the side of the vehicle. This enables the police to check the weight actually carried with the weight permissible.

QUALIFICATIONS OF SUPERINTENDENTS OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONERS' OFFICES.

**\*2811. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) the qualifications of the newly appointed superintendents of the Deputy Commissioners' offices at Sheikhpura, Amritsar and Gurdaspur, and the rate of pay which they were getting in their previous offices;
- (b) will the Chief Secretary also kindly state whether no other applicants possessed the same qualifications as those that the newly appointed men possess, and whether some of the other applicants were in receipt of more pay than the newly appointed men;
- (c) if the answer to the latter part of the question be in the affirmative, will Chief Secretary kindly state reasons as to why no body was selected from amongst the candidates who were drawing more pay than the newly appointed persons and with the same or higher qualifications and experience?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## RESTRICTIONS ON PLYING MOTOR VEHICLES IN KANGRA DISTRICT.

**\*2812. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** (i) Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the plying of motor cars on kutcha roads is not allowed in the Kangra district;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the district of Kangra commands a large area, and that the means of communication in this district are few and far between;
- (c) whether it is a fact that in Una, district Hoshiarpur, which is also a hilly tract, motor cars are allowed to ply on kutcha roads;

(ii) If the answer to (a) above be in the affirmative, what action Government intend to take in the matter?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) Yes.

(d) The question is still under consideration.

#### INCREASE IN REMUNERATION OF ZAILDARS OF SARAJ.

**\*2813. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** With reference to the answer to part (ii) of Question No. 1449,<sup>1</sup> put by me on the 28th November, 1928, will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state the action taken by Government on the representation received by him from the zaildars of Saraj requesting an increase in their remuneration?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The Deputy Commissioner has submitted his recommendations which are now being examined by the Commissioner, "and no doubt will be considered by Government in due course."

#### MACHINERY FOR THE MANDI HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME.

**\*2814. Rai Bahadur Lala Dhanpat Rai :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that since the appointment of the Mandi Hydro-Electric Committee orders worth two crores (more or less) have been placed with the machinery manufacturers in connection with the said scheme;

(b) if so, why such large orders were placed before the report of the Committee was issued;

(c) whether the amount of the orders was within the budget estimates for this scheme sanctioned for the current financial year?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** Correctly speaking, the reply to this question is in the negative, with the consequence that parts (b) and (c) to the question would not arise, but as it is presumed that the honourable member would like to have the actual figures they are as follows :—

(a) The sanction of Government to place certain large contracts for the permanent plant, stores and machinery required for the Uhl River Hydro-Electric Scheme was communicated to the Chief Engineer on the following dates :—

	Approximate value of contract.
	Rs.
On 3rd July 1929 for tunnel pipes, pen-stock pipes and valves .. ..	28½ lakhs.
On 5th October 1929 for the transmission system .. ..	87½ lakhs.
On 30th October 1929 for the turbines and generators .. ..	20 lakhs.



The dates when the contracts were actually placed are somewhat uncertain as this part of the business is done through the Director-General of Stores in London, but complete information can be obtained if desired.

The resolution of the Council recommending the appointment of an enquiry committee was passed on 30th July, and the committee was appointed on 18th November 1929.

(b) the sanction of Government to the placing of the orders was given in response to the requests of the Chief Engineer for this authority made from time to time to enable him to execute the scheme in accordance with his programme of work. The execution of the scheme having been decided upon and funds having been voted for its execution at the successive budget sessions of the Legislative Council from 1924-25 onwards, in the absence of any resolution suspending the programme of work until the issue of the Enquiry Committee's report and accepting the financial consequences of a delay of indeterminable duration, it would have been contrary to approved and accepted policy to do otherwise than follow the normal course of the work.

If the honourable member will refer to the official record of the Council debate for 30th July, page 246, he will find that the Member for the Punjab Chamber of Commerce brought out in his speech that any slowing down of the programme was to be deprecated, and no member voiced a contrary opinion.

(c) the budget estimates of the current financial year cover the liabilities expected to mature during the year.

#### MONGI MINOR AND MONGI RAJBABA.

\*2815. **Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the area of land on the Mongi minor and Mongi rajbaha below Sunayi head of the Lower Gogera Branch of the Lower Chenab Canal is equal; if not, what is the respective area;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the commanded cultivated area on the minor is even larger than that on the rajbaha;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the quantity of water allotted to the Mongi rajbaha is larger than that allotted to the Mongi minor;
- (d) the time when this unequal distribution of water was effected and the reasons which led to disturbing the old arrangement of equal distribution in equal areas which had continued for a number of years?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The areas are—

	Acres.
Mongi minor .. .. .	5,918
Mongi rajbaha .. .. .	5,589

[Hon'ble Sir Fazl-i-Hussain.]

- (b) No.
- (c) Yes.
- (d) The distribution is in accordance with the areas served.

---

MONGI MINOR AND MONGI RAJBABA.

**\*2816. Rana Firez-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the size of outlets on the Mongi minor of the Lower Gugera Branch of the Lower Chenab Canal was lately reduced by cementing their bottoms, while the size of outlets on the Mongi rajbaha has not been so reduced ; if so, what are the reasons ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the level of outlets in the Mongi Rajbaha between Larkhani and Sonari has not been raised to increased supply of water at the tails ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that this alteration was made in December last after the *rabi* sowings ;
- (d) whether it is a fact that there is a rule which requires that no alteration be effected after the sowings of any crop, and, if so, why was this rule violated in the above case ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No, in fact outlets on both Mongi Minor and Mongi Distributary below the head of Mongi Minor were adjusted to reduce their discharge permissible.

- (b) Yes.
- (c) Yes.
- (d) Yes, the trouble from excessive silting rendered action necessary.

---

LAHORE CONSPIRACY CASE—APPOINTMENT OF INTERPRETERS.

**\*2817. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of those prisoners in the Lahore Conspiracy Case who know neither English nor the vernacular of the province ;
- (b) whether all or any of such prisoners requested for the appointment of any interpreter ;
- (c) whether the request has been granted, and, if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) None.

(b) One accused did request the Special Magistrate to appoint an interpreter knowing Marhati.

(c) The request was not granted as the Special Magistrate, after enquiry, was satisfied that he understood both Urdu and English.

## LAHORE CONSPIRACY CASE—INTERVIEWS WITH ACCUSED.

**\*2818. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether any complaint has been made to Government or Government is aware of the complaint that the accused in the Lahore Conspiracy Case are not allowed interviews with their attorneys ;
- (b) whether Government has found any truth in that complaint ;
- (c) if so, what steps the Government has taken or proposes to take for the removal of this complaint ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Government is aware that the accused in the Lahore Conspiracy case have made such a complaint.

(b) Government has found that there is no substance in it.

(c) None.

## LAHORE CONSPIRACY CASE—MALTREATMENT BY JAIL AND POLICE OFFICIALS.

**\*2819. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Government have received an application from the accused in the Lahore Conspiracy Case complaining against the maltreatment of jail officials and police officers ;
- (b) whether that application will be laid on the table ;
- (c) what action the Government have so far taken or proposes to take in this respect ;
- (d) what is the designation of the officer who enquired into the complaint ;
- (e) whether the report of that officer will also be laid on the table ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) The alleged incident is connected with the trial of these accused for an offence under the Prisons Act, which is now proceeding.

(d) The case is pending in the Court of the Additional District Magistrate, Lahore.

(e) Does not arise.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will Government assign reasons for giving no answer to part (b) of the question ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** This case, as I have already mentioned in my reply, is pending in the Court of the Additional District Magistrate, Lahore. That is one of the reasons why this application will not be laid on the table—as it relates to incidents connected with the trial of the accused.

## INDEPENDENCE DAY CELEBRATION IN BATALA—BEHAVIOUR OF POLICE.

**\*2820. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it has come to the notice of the Government that the police used *lathis* freely on the citizens of Batala on Independence celebration day ;
- (b) what was the cause of using force by the police ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No. Government has satisfied itself by enquiry that *lathis* were not used by the police in Batala on January 26th, 1930.

(b) Does not arise.

## EXEMPTION OF SWORD FROM THE ARMS ACT IN RAWALPINDI.

**\*2821. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Government have received the resolution of the Rawalpindi Municipal Committee to exempt sword in that district from the operation of the Arms Act ;
- (b) what action the Government has taken or proposes to take on that resolution ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Are the Government aware that the Deputy Commissioner, Rawalpindi, did not forward this resolution to Government ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** How can I know a thing which is not forwarded to Government ?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will Government make an enquiry ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** If the honourable member assures me that it is so, I will be glad to do it.

## SUPPLY OF NEWSPAPERS TO PRISONERS.

**\*2822. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the names of those political prisoners in the province who are getting daily newspapers ;
- (b) whether in all European prisons newspapers are provided even to ordinary convicts ;
- (c) whether the Government intend to provide newspapers to all the political and ordinary prisoners in the province ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) If the honourable member means prisoners who have been convicted under section 124-A, the answer is—

Master Mota Singh ;  
Prem Parkash ;  
Deoki Nandan.

(b) not so far as this Government is at present aware.

(c) the question of the provision of newspapers in Jails is now under consideration, in accordance with the orders contained in the Government of India *communiqué* of February 19, 1930.

HANDCUFFING SPECIAL CLASS PRISONERS.

**\*2823. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the Government have laid down instructions for not handcuffing the special class prisoners ;

(b) if so, will it be laid on the table ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) & (b) The honourable member is referred to rule 14 in Appendix XX of the Punjab Jail Manual.

DIET MONEY FOR CIVIL PRISONERS.

**\*2824. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that there is no fixed scale of diet money for the civil prisoners, and that they get from 4 annas to 8 annas a day as diet allowance at the discretion of the Sub-Judge ;

(b) if the reply to (a) is in the affirmative, what steps, if any, does Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes. There is no fixed scale of diet money, which is assessed according to the discretion of the Court. Inquiries made from certain districts show that the diet money varies from 5 to 12 annas per day.

(b) The matter is still the subject of correspondence between the Local Government and the High Court.

ARRESTS IN CONNECTION WITH DELHI BOMB OUTRAGE.

**\*2825. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

(a) the names of those persons who have been arrested in the province under section 151, Criminal Procedure Code, in connection with the Delhi Bomb outrage of 28rd December, 1929 ;

(b) the names of those who have been released unconditionally or on bail ;

(c) whether it is a fact that after the death of Mr. Saunders similar indiscriminate arrests of young men were made and after some time all of them were released ;

(d) whether any compensation has been given to the persons who were released without any charge being brought against them ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## LAHORE CONSPIRACY PRISONERS.

**\*2826. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) the nature of punishments that have been given to the Lahore Conspiracy prisoners by the jail or judicial authorities ;
- (b) the nature of punishments that have been given to all the political prisoners in the province in connection with hunger strike and for other political agitation inside the jail in the last six months ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Warning.

Separate confinement.

Withdrawal of all privileges, except special diet.

Forfeiture of remissions.

Bar-fetters in the case of one who is already a convict.

All of these punishments were inflicted by the Prison authorities.

No punishments have been inflicted for prison offences by any judicial authorities, but certain prisoners have been sent up for trial by a magistrate under section 52, Prisons Act.

(b) If the member will state exactly what prisoners he means, giving, if possible, the sections under which they were convicted, the information will be collected and supplied to him.

## NEWSPAPERS AND GOVERNMENT ADVERTISEMENTS.

**\*2827. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) the names of those daily papers, whether English or vernacular, that are being given Government advertisements ;
- (b) whether Government is aware that there is a general public feeling that those papers which get Government advertisements ordinarily incite communal hatred ;
- (c) If the reply to the above be in the affirmative, whether Government intend to make any alteration in their policy of giving advertisements to such papers ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) Government is not prepared to give the information desired by the honourable member.

(b) No.

(c) Does not arise.

## RECOMMENDATIONS OF JAILS ENQUIRY COMMITTEE.

**\*2828. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Sardar Bhagat Singh and others, who are being tried by a Special Magistrate, have very recently moved the Government to treat them according to the recommendations of the Jails Enquiry Committee ;

(b) whether the Government have considered that report ;

(c) what action Government proposes to take in connection with those recommendations ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

(b) Yes.

(c) The orders of the Government of India were received on February 1921, and steps are now being taken to carry them into effect as quickly as possible.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Government kindly lay these recommendations on the table ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** May I ask what recommendations the honourable member is referring to ?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I mean the new rules proposed by the Government of India.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The rules have not yet been framed. The orders of the Government of India have been received ; after this, of course, the rules will be framed and as I have already said, steps are being taken to carry out the orders of the Government of India as quickly as possible.

#### SUPPLY OF VERNACULAR NEWSPAPERS TO LAHORE CONSPIRACY PRISONERS.

\*2829. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the Lahore Conspiracy prisoners have submitted an application to the Inspector-General of Prisons to supply them with vernacular newspapers ;

(b) whether vernacular newspapers have now been supplied ;

(c) if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) They are supplied with a copy of the *Paisa Akhbar*.

(c) It is considered that one vernacular newspaper should suffice.

#### REPORT OF THE BIHAR POLICE ENQUIRY COMMITTEE.

\*2830. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

(a) whether the Government have received and considered the report of the Bihar Police Enquiry Committee ;

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

- (b) if so, whether Government intend to issue any instructions to their police officers in the light of the observations made by that Committee?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

- (b) Does not arise.

**STATUTORY AGRICULTURIST CANDIDATES AT SUB-JUDGES' EXAMINATIONS.**

**\*2831. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- (a) whether any, and, if so, how many, statutory Hindu agriculturists who had passed their LL.B. examination in the first division sat at (i) the sub-judges' examination held in 1928 and (ii) the same examination held in 1929 ;
- (b) whether among the candidates selected for appointment as sub-judges as a result of the last two examinations there were any statutory Hindu agriculturists, and, if so, how many ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) (i) Four.

(ii) Four.

(b) None.

**SUB-JUDGES' EXAMINATIONS.**

**\*2832. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- (a) whether the sub-judges' examination is a purely competitive examination or a merely qualifying test ;
- (b) if the sub-judges' examination is a merely qualifying test then why, in view of the very meagre representation of statutory Hindu agriculturists in the civil judicial branch of the P.C.S., the Government failed this year to select a single candidate belonging to this class ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) The recruitment of sub-Judges is so arranged as to give representation in certain proportions (1) to the various communities, and (2) to zamindars. Subject to the satisfaction of these conditions selection is made in accordance with the order in which candidates stand in the qualifying examination ; that is to say, a non-zamindar member of a community is not selected in preference to a non-zamindar candidate of the same community if the latter is higher on the list of candidates who have qualified at the examination.

(b) Because the rules do not provide for the further sub-division of communities into zamindars and non-zamindars ; that is to say, they do not provide that half of the Hindus shall be zamindars and half shall be non-zamindars. On the last occasion the share of Hindus according to communities was satisfied by taking the first four candidates in order of merit and all



of these happened to be non-zamindars. The zamindar candidates were, therefore, selected from other communities. It may be stated that the selection was made in strict accordance with the principles laid down by Government.

LIST RE COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION IN SERVICES.

**\*2833. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- (a) whether the consolidated list showing the measure of class and communal representation in the various branches of public service due to be published on the 1st January 1930 is yet ready ;
- (b) whether it will be possible to supply copies of the consolidated list referred to in (a) to the members of the Council before the general discussion on the budget commences ;
- (c) if the consolidated list referred to in (a) is not yet ready for distribution, what are the causes for delay and what steps it is proposed to take to avert this delay in future ;
- (d) which department was the last to send in its figures ;
- (e) whether there is any department from which figures are awaited even now, and, if so, which ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a), (b) and (c) : The consolidated list to which the Honourable Member refers will show the communal representation as on the 1st of January 1930. Since the materials for this list has to be obtained from a large number of departments, it is clear that it cannot be published on the same day as that to which it relates. In previous years the various departments were required to report the result of the census to Government before the end of March. This year the date has been changed to the 15th of February. Efforts are being made to expedite the publication of the list, but it cannot be said at present whether it will be possible to supply copies of the list to members of the Council before the general discussion on the Budget commences. The various departments concerned are required to submit the necessary information with as little delay as possible ; but it is doubtful whether it will be possible to provide members of the Legislative Council with copies of the statement during the Budget session, if that statement is to refer to the state of affairs on the 1st of January each year. For this reason the question is under consideration whether the date of reference should not be changed to 1st December.

(d) and (e) Returns are still awaited from several departments.

STATUTORY HINDU AGRICULTURISTS AMONG ZILLADARS.

**\*2834. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state—

- (a) whether it is not a fact that in the consolidated list of 1st January, 1928, the number of Hindu zilladars is 49 and the same number in the consolidated list of 1st January 1929 is 54 ;

[R. S. Ch. Chhotu Ram.]

- (b) whether it is not also a fact that the whole increase in the number of Hindu zilladars which took place between the 1st January 1928 and the 1st January 1929 went to 'other' Hindus ;
- (c) whether the Government proposes to take any, and, if so, what steps to secure the due representation of statutory Hindu agriculturists in the recruitment of zilladars ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No. In the consolidated list the figures for Hindu zilladars in 1928 are 14 agriculturists and 49 non-agriculturists and in 1929 are 14 agriculturists and 54 non-agriculturists.

(b) No. The figures in the consolidated list show under Hindus for 1928, nett increase of 5, and increase is under non-agriculturists. The figures in the consolidated list are incorrect. They should be for 1928, 14 agriculturists and 49 non-agriculturists and for 1929, 18 agriculturists and 50 non-agriculturists. Actually there were casualties of 8 non-agriculturists and recruitment of 4 non-agriculturists and 4 agriculturists.

(c) Under the rules now laid down in Article 1·3 (Revised) of the Irrigation Manual of Orders, provision is made for due representation of agriculturists in the selection of candidates.

#### EXEMPTION OF SWORD FROM THE OPERATION OF THE ARMS ACT.

**\*2835. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Punjab Legislative Council passed a resolution for the exemption of sword from the operation of the Arms Act ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that subsequently objection was taken to the policy of Government in refusing to act according to the resolution of the Council ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that sword is not exempted from the operations of the Arms Act in several districts of the Punjab ;
- (d) if so, why ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes, but as a matter of fact Government has taken steps to implement the resolution of this Council as rapidly as possible. In 18 districts the sword is already totally exempted from the operation of the Arms Act, and proposals to exempt it in five more are now under consideration.

(c) Yes.

(d) Because it is not felt that it is in the public interest to do so.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** May I know whether by public is meant public peace ? Is there any fear of any outbreak of public peace ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Is not that a supplementary question that can be thrashed out in the debate on the resolution number 3 on the list of business to-day ?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** That resolution may not come for discussion at all.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** In that case the honourable member will some day put another question.

#### ENCOURAGEMENT OF GLASS INDUSTRY IN THE PUNJAB.

**\*2836. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state what financial and other help is the Government giving to the existing glass factories at present ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** Government has not been approached by any glass factory for any definite assistance, but as is being pointed out in answer to a later question by the Honourable Member, so far as the Upper India Glass Works, Ambala City, which is the only glass factory of any considerable magnitude, is concerned, the Industries Department has taken the following steps to help the factory.

The Industries Department has recommended (i) the registration of the name of the Upper India Glass Works, Ambala City, as approved contractors to the Chief Controller of Stores, Indian Stores Department and the Director of Contracts, Army Head-quarters ; and

(ii) the works to the following Departments with a view to popularising its goods :—

- (1) The Controller of Stores, North-Western Railway. Moghalpura.
- (2) The Inspector-General of Prisons, Punjab.
- (3) The Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Punjab.
- (4) Secretaries of all municipalities and notified areas in the Punjab.

#### UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

##### EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS.

**1468. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab, please state—

- (a) the total number of candidates accepted during the year 1928 on A-II, B and C registers of Extra Assistant Commissioners ;
- (b) how many of them were Hindus, Muslims, Sikhs and Christians, respectively ;
- (c) is it a fact that no Sikh was accepted by Government either on register A.-II, or C. and, if so, why ?
- (d) what steps, if any, the Government proposes to take to give due representation to the Sikhs this year as well as to make up the deficiency for the last year ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) and (b). A statement containing the information required is laid on the table.

(c) No.

(d) Does not arise.

[Mr. H. W. Emerson.]

STATEMENT SHOWING COMMUNITYWISE THE NUMBER OF CANDIDATES  
ACCEPTED FOR THE POST OF EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER,  
DURING THE YEAR 1928 ON REGISTERS A-II, B AND C.

	A-II.	B.	C.	Total.
Hindus .. ..	2	2	7	11
Muslims .. ..	2	2	8	12
Sikhs .. ..	1	..	3	4
Christians .. ..	2	..	1	3
Total .. ..	7	4	19	30

CLERICAL STAFF IN THE BUILDINGS AND ROADS BRANCH OF  
THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

**1469. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- the total number of clerical staff communitywise recruited annually during the last four years in the Buildings and Roads Branch of the Public Works Department?
- whether it is a fact that the percentage of Sikh clerks in the said office was only 7 per cent. on the 1st January 1929?
- if the answers to (a) and (b) above are in the affirmative, will Government please state what steps it proposes to take to ensure a proper representation of the Sikh community in this department?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Figures are available for the last three years only. The number of recruitments was as follows :—

Year.	Europeans and Anglo-Indians.	Muham-madans.	Hindus.	Sikhs.	Others.	Total.
1927 .. ..	3	16	15	5	..	39
1928 .. ..	—1	23	31	4	2	59
1929 .. ..	..	..	2	1	—1	2

(b) No.

(c) Does not arise.

SUPERINTENDENT, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER'S OFFICE, AMRITSAR.

**1470. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Member, Revenue, please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the post of Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Amritsar district, fell vacant last summer ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the then Commissioner, Lahore division, asked the Deputy Commissioner to appoint an Anglo-Indian to the vacancy or failing that a Muslim clerk whom he recommended ;
- (c) whether it is also a fact that after keeping the vacancy open for more than three months by granting short period extensions to the retiring man, the Deputy Commissioner has appointed that very Muslim clerk ;
- (d) what was his permanent and temporary pay before his present promotion and what is he getting now ? What are his educational qualifications and total length of service at the time of this appointment ?
- (e) whether the post was advertised, and, if not, why not ?
- (f) whether there were any local candidates superior to the man selected in educational qualifications and office experience and, if so, why have their claims been ignored ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) No. The Deputy Commissioner discussed with the Commissioner from time to time the merits of the various aspirants.

(c) The vacancy was kept open while a search was being made for a suitable man.

(d) The permanent pay of the man appointed was Rs. 100 and he is now getting Rs. 250. He is a First Division Matriculate and studied up to F. Sc. His service at the time of appointment was about 9 years.

(e) No. It was not considered necessary as the existence of the vacancy was widely known.

(f) There were some local candidates with longer service and one of them had slightly better educational qualifications but they were not considered so suitable as the man selected.

#### QUARTERS FOR INDIAN CLERKS.

**1471. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) what designs and numbers of quarters have been built for Indian clerks on the Multan road during the last two years ;
- (b) how many more are being built and what total number of each design is to be built ;
- (c) why have the completed quarters not been allotted to the clerks so far and when it is proposed to allot them ;

[S. Partap Singh.]

(d) whether it is a fact that owing to non-habitation or the occupation of them by menials, quite a large number of them have become repairable;

(e) what rent has been fixed for each class of quarter and on what basis will the allotment be made;

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :**

(a) Type I 151. Type II, 64.

Type III, 10.

A copy of each of the Type designs I, II and III is laid on the table.

(b) Type I, 99.

Type II, 86.

Type III, 10.

quarters are under construction. The building programme is :—

Type I ..	..	..	..	250
Type II..	..	..	..	100
Type III	..	..	..	20
Total ..				370

A market will be provided; possibly a dispensary with two family wards.

(c) Owing to the Sewerage Scheme having been held up for want of land, the owners of which had appealed against the award, the quarters could not be allotted. A new Sewerage Scheme has now been prepared which does away with the necessity of acquiring this land. As soon as this new scheme is completed, it will be possible to allot the quarters.

(d) No. Petty repairs such as are given annually to all Government buildings will be necessary immediately before each quarter is occupied.

(e) The standard rents will approximately be :—

				Rs.	A.	P.
Type I	..	..	..	12	1	0
Type II	..	..	..	20	14	0
Type III	..	..	..	62	10	0

Allotment Rules have been prepared and are under consideration of Government.

**VACANCIES IN THE CLERICAL STAFF OF THE DIRECTOR OF INDUSTRIES' OFFICE.**

**1472. Sardar Partap Singh :** (a) With reference to unstarred question No. 681,<sup>1</sup> asked on 5th May 1928, by Sardar Ujjal Singh, will the Honourable Minister for Education please state how many vacancies in the various grades of the clerical staff of the Director of Industries' office have since occurred and by which community they have been filled?

(b) What steps do Government proposes or have taken to secure an adequate representation of Sikhs in that office?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Four—two of which have been given to Muhammadans and two to Hindus.

(b) There were no suitable Sikh applicants. The claims of Sikhs will receive due consideration.

COMPLAINT AGAINST THE MUNICIPAL OFFICER OF HEALTH, FEROZEPUR CITY.

**1473. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that for some time past the Municipal Officer of Health, Ferozepur city municipal committee, has been seizing in great quantity the milk brought by the villagers for sale in the town and causing it to be sent to the Gowshala ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that recently the said officer admitted this fact before the members of the said municipal committee assembled in the Town Hall ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that when the above fact was brought by some members to the notice of the chairman, the latter took no notice of their requests for the discontinuance of the above-mentioned practice ;
- (d) if the answers to the above facts be in the affirmative, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** (a) The Medical Officer of Health, Ferozepur, in the exercise of his duties is required to examine milk imported into the municipality and to seize such quantity thereof as on examination is found unfit for human consumption. Instead of destroying such milk he has been in the habit of permitting the owners at their own request to take it to a local Gowshala for feeding the cattle under proper supervision.

(b) and (c) No.

(d) The action of the Medical Officer of Health has the approval of the municipal committee and is in direct accordance with the authority delegated to the said officer by the committee under the provisions of section 206 of the Punjab Municipal Act. The Municipal Health Officer has no power to seize milk which is fit for human consumption. It is not clear from the honourable member's question whether he has referred to milk fit for human consumption or not. If the allegation is that milk fit for human consumption was wrongfully seized, Government can take no action in the absence of specific cases of wrongful seizure.

AGHA YUSAF ALI OF THE PUNJAB AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.

**1474. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Agha Yusuf Ali of the Punjab Agricultural Service, first served in the botanical section for full 19 years and was not considered competent to be promoted to the superior service although there were several vacancies in that section during the last three years ;

[S. Partap Singh.]

- (b) whether it is a fact that that official was transferred to the general agricultural section and was promoted to the superior service, although there were several other officials who were already in the general agricultural section and had better qualifications ;
- (c) if the answer to the above be in the affirmative, will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state the reasons for this action ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The officer in question served in the botanical section from 1907 to 1926, first in the subordinate service and from 1919 in a gazetted post as a member of the Punjab Agricultural Service. Vacancies in the superior service have not been filled except on a temporary basis, pending the formation of the Superior Provincial Service.

(b) He was transferred to the general agricultural section from the botanical section in 1926 as Extra Assistant Director of Agriculture, and from 1st March 1928 he has been holding charge of the duties of Deputy Director of Agriculture in the Punjab Agricultural Service with a duty allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem.

(c) Does not arise.

**RAJA MUHAMMAD HASAN OF THE PUNJAB AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.**

**1475. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Raja Muhammad Hasan of the Punjab Agricultural Service in the cotton department had been found guilty of the charge of misappropriation of Government money in the purchase of gram ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that that officer has been asked to refund the money in question to the Government ?
- (c) whether it is a fact that a similar case was decided some years back and the official concerned was reduced from the Punjab Agricultural Service to subordinate service ;
- (d) if answers to (a), (b) and (c) be in the affirmative, will the honourable minister be pleased to state the reasons for this difference in the treatment in these two cases ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The reply is not yet ready. The answer will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

**RAJA MUHAMMAD HASAN OF THE PUNJAB AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.**

**1476. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether there were any allegations of misappropriation of Government money against Raja Muhammad Hasan, an officer of the Agricultural Department at Lyallpur, in December 1928 ?



- (b) was an enquiry held into these allegations and, if so, by whom and on what date; whether the enquiry was held by a panel officer or by an officer of the department;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the officer in question was held guilty of excess payment made by him deliberately and asked to refund the excess Government money;
- (d) whether the Government is prepared to lay the papers relating to the enquiry on the table;
- (e) whether the law officers of the Crown were consulted in this respect and, if so, a copy of their opinion may please be laid on the table;
- (f) what were the reasons which led the honourable minister to take departmental action only and not hand over the papers to the police;
- (g) what punishment has been given to that officer and by whom;
- (h) was that officer a permanent member of the P.A.S. or on probation only; If the latter, has he been reverted to his permanent post and, if not, why not, after this serious incident?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) No allegation of misappropriation was made. A recommendation for payment at a higher rate than that prevailing in the market was forwarded for sanction by the officer in question on account of the cost of a certain quantity of gram purchased by him for Government.

(b) An enquiry was held by the Director of Agriculture, Punjab, between December 1928 and April 1929.

(c) The officer in question was not held guilty of excess payment, but guilty of passing on the claim for payment without proper scrutiny. The officer in question was ordered with the approval of the then Financial Commissioner to refund the difference in price, Rs. 80.

(d) The detailed report of the Director of Agriculture is laid on the table.

(e) No.

(f) The facts of the case did not warrant a prosecution.

(g) The additional cost of Rs. 80 was recovered from him.

(h) The officer was a member of the Provincial Agricultural Service on probation. His probationary period was extended up to December 31st, 1929.

In view of the fact that he had previously suffered from Encephalitis, and was still the worse for his illness, when his carelessness caused this loss to Government, he was not reverted to his permanent post.

Copy of a letter No. 15390, dated the 24th September 1929, from the Director of Agriculture, Punjab, to the Deputy Secretary to Government, Punjab, Development Department on the subject of Council question No. 1330 about misappropriation of Government money in the Agricultural Department, Lyallpur.

With reference to your endorsement No. 3152-D. (S.) dated the 17th September, 1929, on the subject cited above, I have the honour to forward herewith the papers relating to the enquiry held into an allegation that

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

M. Muhammad Hasan Khan, Assistant to the Cotton Research Botanist, Lyallpur, had paid a higher rate than that prevailing in the market on account of the cost of a certain quantity of gram purchased by him for Government.

2. The facts of the case as brought to light by the enquiry held by me, along with Mr. Trought, Cotton Research Botanist, and Pandit Karta Kishan, Extra Assistant Commissioner (late Personal Assistant to Director of Agriculture, Punjab), are that M. Muhammad Hasan Khan, Assistant to the Cotton Research Botanist, purchased 160 maunds of gram, in two separate lots of 100 and 60 maunds, respectively, from Hazari Lal, shopkeeper at the Risalewala Farm. Both the consignments were obtained by the shopkeeper from the Lyallpur market on 21st September, 1928. He began to cart the first consignment of 100 maunds to the Risalewala Farm (for which place the stock was purchased) on 21st September, 1928, and the second one of 60 maunds was carted to the farm between that date and 26th September, 1928. The Lyallpur market rate for gram on 21st September, 1928, was Rs. 4-12-0 per maund, but Hazari Lal put in a claim of Rs. 5-4-0 per maund. The fault of M. Muhammad Hasan Khan lay in the fact that he passed on the claim to the Cotton Research Botanist for payment without proper scrutiny.

3. M. Muhammad Hasan Khan had a severe attack of Encephalitis shortly before this incident occurred, and I am convinced that he was then, and even at the time of the enquiry, viz., from December, 1928 to April, 1929, suffering from its after-effects. It appears that it was due to this that he failed to examine the bill of cost with reference to the date of purchase and the market rate prevailing on that date.

4. Taking all the circumstances of the case into account, I ordered, with the approval of the Financial Commissioner, Development, that, as a penalty for his carelessness, M. Muhammad Hasan Khan should refund to Government a sum of Rs. 80, which represented the difference in price of 100 maunds of gram charged at Rs. 5-4-0 per maund, instead of at Rs. 4-12-0 per maund, the actual price prevailing in the market on the dates of purchase. I also directed that the Cotton Research Botanist should have no further transactions with Hazari Lal, shopkeeper who was not considered any longer to be a suitable person for employment as an agent for the purchase of articles for Government.

5. As M. Muhammad Hasan Khan was still on probation his probationary period was extended up to 31st December, 1929, and he was transferred as Extra Assistant Director of Agriculture to Karnal.

6. In view of what has been stated above, no necessity was felt to consult the law officers of the Crown in this connection.

7. This office file on the subject sent herewith may kindly be returned when no longer required.

SUPERINTENDENT, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER'S OFFICE, AMTITSAR.

1477. **Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (1) whether it is a fact that the present Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Amritsar, was recently transferred from the office of the Commissioner, Lahore division ;

- (2) whether it is a fact that he is getting Rs. 250 a month as Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Amritsar, while he was getting only Rs. 75 a month as a clerk in the Commissioner's office, Lahore;
- (3) whether it is a fact that there are several persons in the Commissioner's office, Lahore, and Deputy Commissioner's office, Amritsar, who are senior to him; if so, what are the special reasons for appointing the present incumbent in supersession of their claims?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (1) Yes.

(2) First part—Yes.

Second part—Rs. 100.

(3) There were several persons both in the Deputy Commissioner's and Commissioner's offices senior to him, but he was considered the most suitable of all the applicants.

#### ZUL KERNAIN, SUB-INSPECTOR OF POLICE.

**1478. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to the answer to starred question No. 2233<sup>1</sup> asked on 26th July, 1929, will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state whether the express approval of the Deputy Inspector-General of Police was obtained for extending the period of stay of Zul Kernain, Sub-Inspector of Police, then posted at Narowal in the Sialkot district, and, if so, to please lay a copy of that approval on the table;

(b) If the answer is in the negative, will the Honourable Member for Finance kindly state reasons for not obtaining the express approval of the Deputy Inspector-General of Police?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes. The answer to the second request contained in this part of the question is in the negative.

(b) Does not arise.

#### REVISION OF ELECTORAL WARDS.

**1479. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to the answer to starred question No. 2231<sup>2</sup> asked on 26th July, 1929, will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state as to whether the revision of the electoral wards has been finished and when the fresh election will take place?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** The electoral ward<sup>8</sup> of the municipality of Narowal have been revised, but their publication is pending the receipt from local officers of a correct description of the boundaries of the wards. Fresh elections will take place on dates to be fixed by the Deputy Commissioner after the revision has been notified.

#### BAND ATTACHED TO HIGH SCHOOLS.

**1480. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to the interim reply given to starred question No. 2232<sup>3</sup> asked on 26th July, 1929, will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state whether the information has yet been collected, and, if so, to please lay it on the table?

<sup>1</sup>Volume XIII, pages 4-5.

<sup>2</sup>Volume XIII, page 4.

<sup>3</sup>Volume XIII, page 4.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The final reply to starred question No. 2232 is printed at page (i) of the Appendix to Punjab Debates, Volume XIV.

SUB-ASSISTANT SURGEONS AND ASSISTANT SURGEONS IN SIMLA.

**1481. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state the names of Sub-Assistant Surgeons and Assistant Surgeons in charge of all the dispensaries and hospitals in Simla, together with the dates when they were posted there and the dates when they were due to be transferred from Simla, showing reasons in cases of those whose transfer is due, but who have not been transferred?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** A statement giving the required information is laid on the table.

Name.	Appointment.	Date of appointment.	REMARKS.
<i>Assistant Surgeon.</i>			
1. Dr. Abdul Aziz, Faruqi, P.C.M.S.	Ripon Hospital, Simla	24-12-29	
<i>Sub-Assistant Surgeons.</i>			
1. Dr. Sharif Husain ..	Sub-charge, Ripon and Police Hospitals, Simla.	15-12-24	Completed 5 years' service on 14th December, 1929. Has been granted an extension of service in his present appointment for one year for which he was strongly recommended by the Civil Surgeon. Is an excellent and popular worker.
2. Dr. Janki Das, Talwar	Dhar Dispensary, Phagli	8-12-26	
3. Dr. Nand Kishore, Khanna.	Chhota Simla Dispensary.	18-4-25	Will complete 5 years' service on 17th April, 1930. Will be transferred in November or December, 1930, as no changes are made in hill appointments during the summer months. Is a keen and popular worker.
4. Dr. Som Datt, Vaid..	Municipal Isolation Hospital, Simla.	9-1-30	
5. Dr. Muhammad Qamar-ul-Haq.	Medical Inspector of Schools, Simla.	26-12-29	
6. Dr. Piara Singh ..	Mashobra Dispensary ..	1-11-29	For winter months only. From 1st April to 31st October the charge of the dispensary is held by an officer of the Indian Medical Department.

MOTOR LORRIES PLYING FOR HIRE IN THE SHEIKHUPURA AND GUJRANWALA DISTRICTS.

**1482. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the motor lorries plying for hire in the Sheikhupura and Gujranwala districts have been and are passed for more passengers than there is real seating capacity available in them?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** No, but if the honourable member knows of any such case I will be glade if he gives the number of the lorry to Home Secretary.

MOTOR LORRIES PLYING FOR HIRE IN THE SHEIKHUPURA DISTRICT.

**1483. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state the minimum dimensions of a seat required by one passenger in the motor lorry and as to whether this fact and dimension is taken into consideration by the authorities of all the districts especially in the Sheikhupura district while passing lorries for plying on hire?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Licensing authorities have been instructed to insist on the following dimensions for a seat in a passenger lorry—width 15 inches; depth 14 inches. These instructions are being observed in the Sheikhupura district, and as far as Government is aware, in other districts also.

HINDU CREMATION GROUNDS, SHEIKHUPURA.

**1484. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to the answer to unstarred question No. 939<sup>1</sup> asked on 27th February 1929, will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state as to what action has so far been taken by Government to remove the Hindu cremation grounds from its present place?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** The notified area committee of Sheikhupura is taking the necessary steps to acquire the land required for the new cremation ground, and as soon as the land has been acquired the new ground will be taken into use and the use of the present ground discontinued.

MUNICIPAL FILTH DEPÔT, SHEIKHUPURA.

**1485. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state if it is a fact that the municipal filth depôt is situated quite close or rather within the new town of Sheikhupura? If so, whether Government intends to get it removed to a distance from the town in the interest of public health?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** The municipal filth depôt is situated close to the new town of Sheikhupura. The question of its removal to a reasonable distance is under the consideration of the notified area committee of Sheikhupura.

## SAFETY OF LADIES TRAVELLING ALONE IN TRAINS.

**1486. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to the answer to unstarred question<sup>1</sup> No. 944 asked on 27th February 1929, will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state if enquiries have been made from the Government of India on the subject, and lay a copy of the result of enquiries on the table?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** As the honourable member expressed no desire, no enquiries were made, but the attention of the local Government has since been drawn to the opinion of the Government of India on the method of dealing with interpellations in Provincial Councils relating to railway subjects, indicating that the Central Legislature is the proper place when the subject is of more than purely local interest.

As the promise to enquire, if desired, was made overlooking this opinion, it is withdrawn.

## LICENSEES ISSUED FOR PLYING OF MOTOR VEHICLES FOR HIRE.

**1487. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state whether it is a fact that in the licenses issued for plying motor vehicles for hire in the various districts of the province the number of passengers allowed to be seated in the motor vehicle is also stated? If so, will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state whether only the police or revenue officials are authorised to check any irregularities committed by the drivers against the terms of the license or all Government officials are authorised to check these?

(b) If the answer to the latter part be in the negative, is Government prepared to extend this privilege in this case to all the Government servants?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) First part, yes.

(a) Second part, the meaning of the honourable member is not quite clear. If by "checking" is meant "reporting" irregularities, the power vests in the Police but information can be given by anybody. If on the other hand, by checking is meant dealing with the culprit on the spot no such power exists.

(b) No.

## METALLING OF KUTCHA ROAD BETWEEN NAROWAL AND ZAFARWAL.

**1488. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state as to whether and when it is proposed to metal the kutcha road between Narowal and Zafarwal in the Sialkot district?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz, Khan Noon :** It is understood that the district board of Sialkot has no intention of metalling the road between Narowal and Zafarwal as the cost would be prohibitive.

A sum of Rs. 12,000, half of which was received as a grant-in-aid from the Communications Board, has recently been spent by the board on raising the road above flood-level.

## ROLLS FOR THE POST OF EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER.

**1489. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will Chief Secretary be pleased to state whether it is a fact that when the Deputy Commissioners of various districts are asked to send rolls for the post of Extra Assistant Commissioners they sometimes send rolls of the candidates and persons who are not residents of their districts and are quite outside their jurisdictions? If so, will Chief Secretary kindly state reasons for the same and say what check is proposed to be exercised to stop this practice in future?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** The practice to which the honourable member refers occurs only in the case of sons of officials who are still in service. It was brought to the notice of Government that such candidates are frequently unable to obtain reasonable consideration of their claims, as on the one hand their fathers owing to absence in Government service are often unknown to the Deputy Commissioners of their home districts, and on the other hand, the Deputy Commissioners of such districts in which their fathers are serving are more inclined to recommend residents of their own than of other district. Accordingly, while the sons of officials are not debarred from consideration in their home districts, each Commissioner of a division has been allowed to submit, in addition to the number of nominations prescribed for residents of the division one additional recommendation on behalf of the sons of officers serving in the division.

## POLICE INSPECTORS AND SUB-INSPECTORS.

**1490. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member kindly lay on the table a statement showing the names community-wise of the Police Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors who are serving in thanas of one and the same district for more than five years and to state when it is proposed to transfer them to other districts?

(b) If it is not proposed to send them now to other districts will the Honourable Finance Member kindly state reasons therefor?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) There is no Inspector of Police who has been serving in a district for more than five years. A statement is laid on the table giving the names community-wise of Sub-Inspectors of Police who have been serving for more than five years in different police stations of one and the same district. It cannot be stated definitely when any of these Sub-Inspectors may be transferred to other districts.

(b) As local knowledge is an important weapon in the combating of crime, frequent transfers of Police Officers from district to district are not in the public interest, though they are frequently transferred from one thana to another within the same district.

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NAMES COMMUNITYWISE OF SUB-INSPECTORS  
WHO ARE SERVING IN THANAS OF ONE AND THE SAME  
DISTRICT FOR MORE THAN 5 YEARS.

Hindus.	Muslims.	Sikhs.	Christians.
---------	----------	--------	-------------

## EASTERN RANGE.

1. Ram Sarup	1. Sultan Ali.	1. Sunder Singh.	1. Mr. V. P. Shariff.
2. Hirde Ram.	2. Sabih-ud-Din.	2. Natha Singh.	
3. Sarup Singh.	3. Amir Ahmed.	3. Udhams Singh.	
4. P. C. Ghose.	4. Rahmat Ali.	4. Kartar Singh.	
5. Nain Singh.	5. Muhammad Fazal Haq.	5. Lashman Singh.	
6. Kirpal Singh.	6. Abdul Haq.	6. Baldeo Singh.	
7. Khem Singh.	7. Muhammad Ali.	7. Harcharan Singh.	
8. Bhagwant Singh.	8. Muhammad Bashir Khan.		
9. Bachitter Singh.	9. Subah Sadiq.		
10. Hans Raj.	10. Inayat Ali Shah.		
	11. Muhammad Zameer.		
	12. Muhammad Hussain.		
	13. Abdullah Khan.		

## CENTRAL RANGE.

1. Dina Nath.	1. Mehar Ali Khan.	1. Balbir Singh.
2. Mela Ram.	2. Khuda Bakhsh.	2. Davindar Singh.
3. Amar Nath.	3. Asaf Ali Khan.	3. Labh Singh.
4. Sawan Mall.	4. Nasir Shah.	4. Amrik Singh.
5. Harbans Lall.	5. Yar Muhammad.	5. Tota Singh.
6. Mehta Amar Singh.	6. Shahab-ud-Din.	6. Charan Singh.
7. Kishan Gopal.	7. Muhammad Sharif.	7. Gurbachan Singh.
8. Durga Dass.	8. Shujaat Ali Khan.	8. Balwant Singh.
9. Multani Mal.	9. Usaf Ali.	9. Sewa Singh.
10. Labhu Ram.	10. Rahmat Ullah.	10. Gopal Singh.
11. Feroz Chand.	11. Zulfikar Khan.	11. Balwant Singh.
12. Nathan Lal.	12. Ahmad Niwaz Khan.	12. Dula Singh.
13. Harbans Lal.	13. Hussain Din.	13. Nau Nihal Singh.



**STATEMENT SHOWING THE NAMES COMMUNITY-WISE OF SUB-INSPECTORS  
WHO ARE SERVING IN THANAS OF ONE AND THE SAME  
DISTRICT FOR MORE THAN 5 YEARS—CONTINUED.**

Hindus.	Muslims.	Sikhs.	Christians.
CENTRAL RANGE.			
14. Lekh Ram.	14. Muhammad Shafi.	14. Bishan Singh.	
15. Daya Shankar.	15. Abdul Ghani.	15. Dayal Singh.	
16. Indar Sain.	16. Wali Ullah.		
17. Ram Lal.	17. Saadat Ali.		
18. Munshi Lal.	18. Din Muhammad.		
19. Kalyan Dass.	19. Nawab Din.		
20. Nand Lal.	20. Aziz-ud-Din.		
21. Gouri Shankar.	21. Muhammad Musa.		
22. Devi Dass.	22. Abdul Majid.		
23. Kesari Chand.	23. Akbar Shah.		
24. Harnam Dass.	24. Asghar Ali.		
25. Daulat Ram.	25. Habib Ali.		
	26. Muhammad Akbar Khan.		
	27. Muhammad Latif.		
	28. Yusuf Ali.		
	29. Muhammad Zehid.		
	30. Muhammad Ali Khan.		
	31. Muhammad Akram Beg.		
	32. Muhammad Hossain.		
WESTERN RANGE.			
1. Bal Mohand.	1. Ghulam Ali.	1. Lakhmir Singh.	
2. Kipra Ram.	2. Fazal Elahi.	2. Hari Singh.	
3. Was Dev.	3. Abdul Hamid.	3. Bhai Budh Singh.	
4. Nanak Chand.	4. Qutub Khan.	4. Hanne Singh.	
5. Bahadur Chand.	5. Ghulam Muhammad.		
6. Amolak Ram.	6. Muhammad Afzal Khan.		
7. Durga Ram.	7. Muhammad Hayat.		

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NAMES COMMUNITY-WISE OF SUB-INSPECTORS  
WHO ARE SERVING IN THANAS OF ONE AND THE SAME  
DISTRICT FOR MORE THAN 5 YEARS—CONCLUDED.

Hindus.	Muslims.	Sikhs.	Christians.
---------	----------	--------	-------------

## WESTERN RANGE—CONCLUDED.

8. Kanshi Ram.	8. Jalal-ud-Din.		
9. Diwan Chand.	9. Nasir Ahmad.		
10. Bir Chand.	10. Abbas Khan.		
11. Sant Ram.	11. Muhammad Sar- fraz Khan.		
12. Waishno Dass.	12. Sher Ahmad Khan.		
13. Sita Ram.	13. Ali Muhammad.		
14. Daswandhi Ram (Prosecuting Sub- Inspector).	14. Ghulam Muham- mad.		
	15. Muhammad Hayat.		
	16. Rahmat Khan.		
	17. Muhammad Afzal Khan.		
	18. Khuda Bakhsh.		
	19. Sultan Haider.		
	20. Fateh Shah.		
	21. Dost Muhammad.		
	22. Fezal Qadir.		
	23. Abbas Ali Shah.		
	24. Muhammad Ashraf.		
	25. Muhammad Roshan.		
	26. Sardar Khan.		
	27. Anar Khan (Officiat- ing Inspector).		
	28. Hayat Muhammad.		
	29. Ghulam Sarwar.		

## DUST NUISANCE IN LAHORE.

1491. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq** : Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state what action does the Lahore Municipality propose to take to avoid the nuisance of mud in the rainy season and dust in the dry season in the streets of the Lahore city ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** It is understood that the Lahore Municipality is adopting such measures as it finds possible within its existing resources to deal with the dust problem by the provision of motor watering lorries. The reduction of the amount of dust in dry weather will be followed by a corresponding reduction in the amount of mud in wet weather. The attention of the Municipal Committee is being drawn to the benefits to be derived from the coal tarring of cent per cent. of the road surface.

#### SCOUTS RALLY IN LAHORE.

**1492. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the boys of several schools in the Lahore division were called to Lahore in the first week of January 1930 for parade and Scouts rally? If so, will he kindly state who met the expenses of their food and conveyance to Lahore and back?

(b) If the expenses were met from the private pockets of the boys themselves, will the Honourable Minister please state reasons and justification for recovering the expenses of the move from the private pocket of the boys?

(c) Will the Honourable Minister also kindly state the necessity of calling boys like this to Lahore?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes. The expenses were met from the Boys' Funds.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) The great educational and social advantages of such gatherings.

#### PETITIONS FOR MERCY.

**1493. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance kindly state whether it is a fact that in 90 per cent. of petitions for mercy the negative orders are passed by the Home Secretary without the petitions having been shown to the Honourable Member for Finance or His Excellency the Governor, and 9 per cent. of such cases hardly reach the Honourable Member for Finance for his orders and only 1 per cent. cases are hardly sent up to His Excellency for his orders? If the answer to the above be in the affirmative, will the Honourable Finance Member kindly state reasons as to why each and every petition for mercy, intended for His Excellency the Governor for his personal orders, are not even shown to him?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** No. The second part of the question does not arise.

#### COMPOSITION OF THE LAHORE IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE.

**1494. Mr. Owen Roberts :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) the composition of the Lahore Improvement Committee;

(b) the nature of the prescribed relations between the Lahore Improvement Committee and the Lahore Municipal Committee as regards procedure and responsibility?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is regretted that a reply to the question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

PROCEDURE re. SUBMISSION OF BUILDING PLANS ON THE MALL.

**1495. Mr. Owen Roberts :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please lay on the table a copy of any rules describing the procedure to be followed in connection with the submission of a plan when it is desired to erect a building on the Lahore Mall?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

CASE AGAINST B. ILAM DIN, SUB-INSPECTOR OF POLICE.

**1496. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the judgment of the Additional District Magistrate, Gujranwala, in the case instituted by Ralla Singh, Lambardar, and others of village Nowshehra Virkan against B. Ilam Din, Sub-Inspector of Police station of the same village, under section 342/504, I. P. C., dated 2nd September 1929, has been published in various English and Vernacular papers?
- (b) If so, whether the Government has noticed the following passages in the said judgment :—
 

“ A public servant who misuses his authority and treats men of a more respectable position than perhaps of his own is just a sort of man who brings the Government a bad name.”

“ If the case had not been compounded then I would have felt my duty to sentence the accused to a pretty serious term of rigorous imprisonment.”
- (c) If the answer to the above be in the affirmative, whether Government intend to take any departmental action against the Sub-Inspector in question, and if so, what?
- (d) whether it is a fact that the said B. Ilam Din is still a Sub-Inspector of the same police station?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) The explanation of Sub-Inspector Ilam Din has been taken and it is at present under consideration whether departmental action should be taken against him.

(d) Yes.

ACQUISITION OF THE LANDED PROPERTY OF SHAHZADA ABDUL KHALIQ AND CERTAIN OTHER GENTLEMEN IN LUDHIANA CITY.

**1497. Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Will Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Government intended to acquire Shahzada Abdul Khaliq and certain other gentlemen's landed property adjacent to the women's hospital in Ludhiana City?
- (b) if so, what action has so far been taken in the matter?
- (c) whether it is a fact that the authorities of the missionary women's medical school, college and hospital at Ludhiana, under Dr. Brown, have applied for the acquisition of the land in question, and, if so, what progress has been made in this direction?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** (a) In the year 1920, Government proposed to acquire land, including land belonging to Shahzada Abdul Khaliq, for the extension of the Punjab Medical School for Women, Ludhiana, and the necessary notification was issued under the Land Acquisition Act.

(b) In 1922, in consequence of objections having been raised that the land belonging to Shazada Abdul Khaliq was in the vicinity of a mosque and hence could not be sold, the notification above referred to, in so far as it related to his land, was cancelled.

(c) Since the decision of 1922 no fresh application for the acquisition of the land in question has been received from the Principal of the institution in question.

### RESOLUTIONS.

RESOLUTION RE: SCHOOL FEE CONCESSIONS (*concluded*).

**Mr. President :** The Council will now resume discussion on the resolution regarding school fee concessions.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** (Minister for Education) : When the House rose for the day yesterday, I was dealing with part 2 of the resolution of Pir Akbar Ali which is under discussion. On referring to page 28, paragraph 15 of the Punjab Education Code, I was pointing out the provisions there made as regards these classes of *kamins* and artisans to whom the privilege of fee concession is to be extended. It is laid down in the Code :

"The classes of persons in a district to be treated as agriculturists, village artisans and *kamins* for the purposes of concession of fees will be determined by the Deputy Commissioner of that district in consultation with the Inspectors."

The honourable mover of this resolution and those that followed him were anxious that the classes of artisans and *kamins* should be defined. They were probably unaware of the fact that a very proper definition already exists in the Code. For each particular district where this concession is to obtain the Deputy Commissioner of the district in consultation with the inspecting authority will lay down to what classes the privilege is to be extended. It will be seen on reflection that no better specification or definition can possibly obtain. Any effort at headquarters on the part of the Director of Public Instruction to lay down for the whole of the province

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

who these classes are to be to what particular sections of them the privilege is to extend would be difficult if not ineffective. Therefore, the honourable member would see that all possible provision so far as this particular part of his claim is concerned has already been made. One speaker in the course of his speech made certain other reflections on the artisans and the *kamins*. It is not necessary for me to traverse these, and it will be enough to say that so far as these artisans and *kamins* are concerned, properly defined by locally authorities, the privilege of fee concession has already existed and I take it that it will not be questioned that they constitute a very necessary part of our rural economy and it could not be said that a privilege which has hitherto existed in their case should in any manner be curtailed or withdrawn. I think that that was not the idea of the honourable mover of this resolution. So far as the second part is concerned this should suffice.

Now, Sir, I come to the third part where it is urged upon Government that the concession should extend to private recognised schools, the Government reimbursing them for the loss caused thereby to their income. This part of the resolution, I must say at once, it is not possible for us to accept. These concessions in the matter of fees have hitherto existed only where scholars have gone to a Government school or to a local body school; when they go to a Government school, Government does not, where the particular conditions are satisfied, charge them more than half the fee. Similar practice obtains in the case of local body schools, because these schools are largely subsidised by Government in conducting their educational activities. To carry it any further to private recognised schools would not merely be an extension of this privilege in the case of institutions where they have not hitherto existed but would raise more serious difficulties. We would then be face to face with a financial obligation actually to pay private schools because certain scholars have gone there and pay only half fees, the Government paying the other half. This is a financial liability of an indefinite character which the honourable members would see would be very difficult for Government to assume. Not only this, but the honourable members cannot be unaware that there is a considerable difference in the rate of fees charged in Government schools and in private recognised schools. The private aided schools have to follow a particular grade which is lower than the Government grade. If these fee concessions also obtained in these private recognised schools, the result might be the very reverse of what an honourable member was pointing in the course of his speech. The result might be actually that a serious blow might be given to Government institutions. That will not be matter for gratification, particularly so when it will be remembered that now Government and local bodies have a vast network of these schools spread all over the province. There will be no advantage gained and there will be indirect harm done to our Government schools and other local body schools, besides this matter of an indefinite financial liability. As I have said already during the past many years these concessions have not existed in the case of private recognised schools. The utmost that could be done with regard to this matter is that we can try to form some estimate of the possible cost that a step like this might involve and also of the likely injury and harm that will thereby ensue to our Government and local body institutions if this step were taken. This could be done

with the assistance of our Standing Committee on Education in consultation with the Finance Department. So far as the third part of the resolution is concerned, that is the utmost extent that could possibly be done if desired.

You will see, Sir, therefore, in one word, so far as part (a) of the resolution is concerned the fears of the honourable member that the soldiers would be affected are unfounded. So far as the substance of part (a) of the resolution is concerned it is already accepted by us. In part (b) there is no point of substance, and we need consider it no further. As to part (c) Government cannot accept it. I take it the honourable member would not wish particularly to press it, because it would bring in its train a series of difficulties which it is not possible at this stage for us to surmount. I wish only to add that so far as the question of the soldiers is concerned and so far as the general exemption from the payment of full fee is concerned, orders will be issued to set the position right at the very earliest moment.

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi** [Shahpur West (Muhammadan), (Rural)] (Urdu) : Sir, I beg to move the amendment that stands in my name :

"That in line 3 of part (a) of the resolution the words 'Rs. 100' be substituted for the words 'Rs. 50.'"

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** : Sir, I have received no notice of the amendment.

**Mr. President** : Notice of the amendment was received yesterday immediately before the business of the Council commenced.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** : It is for you to disallow it.

**Mr. President** : That is not in my power. If objection is taken by any member that the amendment is too late, then I come in, but not till then.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** : Sir, I submit that the amendment of which I have received a copy only now after coming to the Council Chamber, is too late.

**Mr. President** : Will the honourable member please state why he tabled his amendment so late, and why I should exercise my special powers in his favour ?

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi** : I will show it in the course of my speech that it is very important. . . . .

**Mr. President** : I want only to know the reason why the honourable member did not give two clear days' notice of his amendment. If he is not able to satisfy me, I shall have to disallow the amendment.

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi** : The very first reason is that we knew nothing about the memorandum. It was only yesterday that it was read before the House and its implications became known to us. I tabled my amendment the same day.

**Mr. President** : It is regrettable that the circular in question was not circulated along with the printed resolutions. It was the duty of

[Mr. President.]

the Secretary to have a copy of the circular printed and circulated among the members of the Council.

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** May I ask the honourable member whether he tried to get a copy of the circular after he received a notice of the resolution?

**Mr. President :** When did the honourable member receive the resolution, and what steps, if any, did he take to get a copy of the circular?

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi :** As you know, Sir, I live in a village and it is not possible to get such documents in so far off parts of the province.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** Sir, you heard several speeches yesterday. It was pointed out in the course of those speeches that a circular had issued which caused a considerable amount of dissatisfaction in a particular area, and, therefore, I may take it that the substance of the circular was fairly known, and now that I have already spoken accepting the substantial part of the resolution, an amendment comes in of which notice is received at 2 o'clock to-day.

**Mr. President :** Was not the amendment placed in the hands of the Honourable Minister at 2 o'clock to-day?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I found it on my table when I came.

**Mr. President :** Did the Hon'ble Minister notice it?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I may say, Sir, that when I came to my seat I did notice the paper and I thought a copy of the circular had been published. I did not notice the amendment before the questions and answers began, and now I find that this amendment has been tabled of which I had received no previous notice.

**Mr. President :** If the amendment is moved and proposed from the Chair every member including the Honourable Minister will have a right to speak to it. After it is moved and proposed from the Chair, it will be before the House.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I thought that that was the very question before us, whether this amendment be allowed and you asked me definitely what objection I had. My one objection is that I received the amendment only 35 minutes ago and I have not had time even to read it.

**Mr. R. Sanderson :** Sir, we must have time to consider what attitude we should take towards the amendment. It means a reconsideration of our budget, and it would be extremely difficult to give a satisfactory answer without our previous consideration of the case.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Certain circulars are issued by heads of departments and no copies are supplied to the members of the Council even though they are important. Will you kindly direct the Government to issue instructions to heads of departments to supply such circulars to the members of the Council?

**Mr. President :** I am afraid the executive will be seriously handicapped if they are asked to distribute every circular to the members of the



Council. Strictly speaking departmental circulars are not supposed to be circulated among the members of the Council.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** In that case I may be allowed to suggest that some more days halting allowance must be allowed to members of the Council so that they may come here a few days before the commencement of the session and look into the circulars which are made available in the office. That is the practice in the Legislative Assembly.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Did not this circular appear in the *Punjab Government Gazette* ? I believe the honourable members get copies of the gazette.

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** I understand from the debate yesterday that a question was actually asked in this House in the course of the last session regarding this circular and it was owing to that question that the attention of the Honourable Minister for Education was drawn to the fact that the circular did affect the interests of certain classes. So it appears that, through the question the honourable members of this House had intimation of the circular as late as the last session.

I may mention another point. The amendment as framed would appear to affect more departments than one and it is only reasonable that Government should have sufficient notice of an important amendment of this kind in order to allow some consultation between the departments concerned as to the attitude which the Government should adopt towards the amendment. As it is, no time whatsoever has been allowed for consultation and no time has been allowed for thought.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** Sir, with regard to the last part of the point made by the Chief Secretary, I have nothing to say. It is for you to decide whether a notice in a particular case is or is not sufficient. But the Chief Secretary has put forward one point, that is, that inasmuch as in the last session a question was asked by one honourable member with reference to this circular, therefore it must be presumed that honourable members were aware as to what was the subject matter of the circular or at least should have made themselves acquainted with the subject matter of this circular. If the Chief Secretary had been appearing as counsel in a case where the question was whether the other party had or had not notice of the matter in dispute, no doubt his contention would have been valid. But to ask you to give your sanction to the doctrine that if any question is put with regard to any matter in this House, then for all time subsequent honourable members are supposed to know the whole subject matter of the question and the references in the question and that they are subsequently not entitled to notice of particular matters referred to therein, that is a doctrine which, I hope, nobody in this House will agree to. I am extremely sorry that the Chief Secretary has taken the point that we should be presumed to be aware of the contents of this circular which was never made public.

**Mr. President :** I would like to know whether the honourable members, who come to Lahore a few days before the commencement of the Council, are entitled to any travelling and halting allowance for those days. Chaudhri Afzal Haq says that they are not.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husam :** Is that with reference to those members of the Council who do not reside in Lahore?

**Mr. President :** Yes.

**Mr. J. D. Penny :** Halting allowances are admissible only from the day the Council begins to sit.

**Mr. President :** As regards the amendment itself I find that the printed copies of the resolution were despatched by the Council office to the members of the Council on the 18th and as the Council met yesterday for the first time, there were practically ten or eleven days available to the members. Thus there was ample time for them to ask the Secretary of the Legislative Council to secure a copy of the circular for their use. Therefore, I rule the amendment to be out of time.

As regards the question of travelling and halting allowance, I am not concerned with it directly, but I may suggest to Government that if possible they should follow in this respect the practice of the Legislative Assembly. If halting allowance is allowed to members of the Assembly to enable them to come a few days before and prepare themselves for the business of the Assembly, there is no reason why similar facilities should not be extended to the members of this Council. It seems rather hard that the members of the Council should come here, like witnesses in a civil or criminal case, on the very day on which the Council begins its sittings and go away on the day its business is finished. It is desirable that in this respect the rules of the Council of State, and the Legislative Assembly and of the other provincial Councils, may be consulted and adopted so far as may be possible.

Now, I propose to divide and put the resolution in three parts. The question is—

“This Council recommends to the Government that Memorandum No. 16977-R., dated the 2nd October 1929, issued by the Ministry of Education should be modified as follows :—

- (a) the proviso to the Memorandum should be restricted only to those agriculturists who own or cultivate land assessed to a minimum annual land revenue of Rs. 50 or who are assessed to income-tax.”

The motion was carried.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“The classes and status of village *kamins* to whom the benefit of the concession is to extend should be specified.”

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** That has already been specified. I do not know whether the honourable member wishes to press that part of the resolution.

**Pir Akbar Ali :** Sir, I beg to withdraw this part of the resolution. This part was by leave withdrawn.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“The concession should extend to private recognised schools, the Government reimbursing them for the loss caused thereby to their income.”

The motion was lost.

RESOLUTION RE COMMITTEE TO ENQUIRE INTO GRIEVANCES OF 141  
GOVERNMENT SERVANTS.

Mr. M. A. Ghani (Non-official, nominated) Sir, I beg to move—

3 P. M.

“This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee of official and non-official members of this Council (with a majority of the latter) to enquire into and report on the grievances of Government and quasi-Government servants drawing less than Rs. 60 a month as regards their pay, pension, quarters, allowances, hours of work and other conditions of service.

Sir, the subject matter of my resolution inasmuch as it concerns the amelioration and betterment of by far a great majority of public servants of this province, is a very important one indeed, and, therefore, requires a very serious and sympathetic consideration at the hands of the honourable members of this Council. In view of the great awakening amongst the labouring classes and in view of their organizing themselves into Unions and Associations, it seems to me that at this juncture the Government should take them into confidence and at least give them an opportunity to state their case before the committee of enquiry. Again, in view of the threatened strike on the North-Western Railway in sympathy with that on the Great Indian Peninsula Railway, and in view of the coming non-co-operation movement of Mahatama Gandhi it behoves the Government to set their house in order at this juncture and thus save the country from the calamity that would follow if the low-paid employees were to fall into the hands of the agitators of those movements. Sir, during the last decade, a wonderful progress has been made in organizing the labouring classes. Associations and unions of public servants have sprung up like mushrooms. So far as their status and rights and privileges as members of the public service are concerned, a spirit of collective bargaining has been infused into them and to-day they are in a position to shake off their old lethargy, and exert themselves for their rights and privileges. It is in response to their demands made manifest by them in their different conferences and in their different meetings that I have ventured to bring forward this resolution in this House. I would, therefore, appeal to the honourable members of this Council, through you, Sir, to give their best consideration to it. I would, therefore, request that in the fitness of things this Council should do justice to these toiling and labouring servants of the public whose sweat of the brow is responsible for the peace and order of this province and for the good government of this country. My resolution deals with only those Government and quasi-Government servants or employees whose monthly salary is less than Rs. 60 a month. I have purposely limited the scope of this resolution. In limiting my resolution to the employees drawing less than Rs. 60 it must not be taken that I have no sympathy with those drawing a little more than Rs. 60 a month, but because I wanted to be as moderate as possible, and secondly because the case of the employees drawing less than Rs. 60 really deserves to be thrashed out by such a committee of enquiry as I have proposed in the resolution.

Now, Sir, some of the Government servants and quasi-Government servants who will be benefited by this resolution are as follows:—

Peons, Chowkidars, Daftries and clerks of all departments. Darogas, Forest Guards, Muharrars, Foresters and Khalasis of the

[Mr. M. A. Ghani.]

Forest Department, Patwaris, Qanungoes, Ahlmads, Wrappers, Naib Nazirs of the Revenue Department, Patwaris, Munshis, Gauge Readers, Tracers, Jamadars, Signallers, Barkandazes, Ferro-Printers Draftsmen, Trolly-men, Sub-plate-layers, cashiers, operators, Naib-Zilladars of the Irrigation Department, Ahlmads, Bailiffs, Naib-Nazirs, etc., of the Judicial Department, Warders, Matrons, etc., of the Jail Department, Constables, C. I. D. Informers, etc., of the Police Department, Dispensers, Compounders, Nurses, Laboratory Assistants, etc., of the Medical Department, Vaccinators and Sanitary Inspectors of the Public Health Department, Muqaddams, Malis and Fieldmen of the Agriculture Department, Carpenting masters, Blacksmiths, Weaving masters, Sising Assistants, Artisan masters, Drawing masters and Tailors, etc., of the Industries Department, Vernacular teachers, J. A.-V. teachers of the Education Department, Compositors, Lino Operators and so forth of the Government Printing Press and Stationery Department and so on and so forth.

Now, Sir, from this list it will appear that the lowest paid employees that is, the chowkidars are paid Rs. 12 a month, and that chaprasis and peons of the various departemnts are paid Rs. 14-8 a month. Assistant patwaris are paid Rs. 15 a month. Police constables are paid Rs. 18 a month and the Revenue patwaris are paid Rs. 20 a month and so on and so forth. Now, Sir, I want to put to the honourable members of this House, through you, if they really consider that a monthly salary of Rs. 12, 15 or even of Rs. 20 or even 30 is an adequate salary. Do they really consider that chowkidars, peons, patwaris and clerks drawing Rs. 12, Rs. 15, Rs. 30 or Rs. 40 are really paid a living wage. I don't think that it is a living wage for human beings. It is hopelessly inadequate. I, therefore, most respectfully submit that it is, very wrong to pay one's servant an inadequate salary. I would challenge the Government or any members of this House if they could prove that Rs. 20 or even Rs. 30 or even Rs. 40 a month is a living wage. I say it is morally very wrong to starve these poor people who do so much for the benefit of the province. I beg to point out that in the memorandum submitted to the Royal Commission on Labour in India by the Punjab Government in October last, they have admitted that Rs. 18 a month as the wage of an unskilled labourer in this province was very low. When they consider Rs. 18 a month, to be very low, I do not know why they are paying Rs. 12 and Rs. 14 to their Chowkidars and peons. On page 45 of the memorandum where they have dealt with the wages of the labourers they have said that unskilled labourers earn from annas fourteen to annas sixteen a day in Lahore. Now, Sir, if annas sixteen a day is the daily wage of an unskilled labourer in Lahore which the Government considers to be very low, I don't know how Government in justification can pay Rs. 12 or Rs. 15, or even Rs. 20 to their servants. I would therefore urge that so far as the question of salary of the low paid employees is concerned, there is a fit case to go to a committee of enquiry.

Again, Sir, so far as housing is concerned, I cannot do better than quote the opinion, of Mr. Purcell, of Member of Parliament, who toured throughout

India two years ago, enquiring into the Labour conditions in this country on behalf of the British Trade Union Congress. On page 11 of the Memorandum submitted by the North-Western Railway Union to the Royal Commission on Labour in India Mr. Purcell is quoted as follows :—

- “ The housing of the people in our own country is a serious problem, but in India it is far more serious, for disgustingly bad housing conditions prevail generally so far as the working classes are concerned.
- “ Whatever may be the design or layout of the houses, they are all unutterably bad, and cannot in any decent sense be regarded as homes. We visited the workers' quarters wherever we stayed, and had we not seen them we could not have believed that such evil places existed.
- “ Outside all the houses on the edge of each side of the strip of land between the ‘ lines ’ are the exposed gulleys, at some places stopped up with garbage, refuse and other waste matter, giving forth horrible smells repellant in the extreme.
- “ The overcrowding and insanitary conditions, almost everywhere prevailing, demonstrate the callousness and wanton neglect of their obvious duties by the authorities concerned. As we see the situation, it is the job of the appropriate authorities at all costs to put an end to defective housing, to institute up-to-date methods of sewage disposal, to provide for adequate and suitable sanitary arrangements and water supplies, as well as to see that the people are educated in the right use of all these services intended to make for the public health.
- “ Until there have been radical changes in these matters the population of India will continue to be ravished by millions of deaths from cholera, dysentery, diarrhoea, plague, fevers, malaria, smallpox, influenza and respiratory diseases, as well as by an appalling mortality among mothers and infants.”

Sir, such is the picture drawn by Mr. Purcell about the housing of labourers in India. The Punjab Government in their memorandum have admitted that the conditions of the houses of labourers in the Punjab is not very different from those conditions obtaining in their neighbourhood. From this, I conclude, Sir, that the houses of the low paid employees are not better than the houses of which the picture is drawn by Mr. Purcell. I hope the members of the Government and the whole House will realize that the low-paid employees should not be paid so low wages and should not be housed in such houses as have been described by Mr. Purcell.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Is that the description of city houses of Lahore or only of Government quarters ?

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** This is the description of most of the quarters in which low-paid Government servants live all over India.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I wish Mr. Purcell had been taken into Lahore city where Government servants live.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** When Mr. Purcell was here in Lahore, I did take him to certain parts of the city.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The housing conditions in Lahore are certainly not worse than those in Bombay and other parts of India.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Sir, I have been to Bombay and almost all over India. I think the workers' quarters in Bombay are far better than the quarters in which the peons and chowkidars of the Punjab Government live.

Again so far as clerks are concerned, if any reference is required I would refer the Honourable the Revenue Member to a book written by Mrs. Caleb on the family budget of the low paid clerks of the Punjab in which she describes the conditions of housing of clerks in Lahore and other cities of the

[Mr. M. A. Ghani.]

Punjab. With these conditions and with these low wages paid to the employees of the Punjab Government, if they were to assert themselves and were to go on strike, whose fault will it be? The spirit of socialism and the spirit of Bolshevism if you like to call it so, is permeating the whole of the world. The socialistic ideas are spreading among the low-paid employees of the Government. They have also begun to think why on earth they should be paid so low wages while the high officials of Government are being paid large salaries by the Government. On a previous occasion, I alluded to the exorbitant salaries paid to the high officials of this Government and to the very, very low wages paid to the men at the lower rungs. I then showed by comparison with facts and figures relating to the salaries paid to the different employees that the Government of India has been aptly described to be a top-heavy government. Here we see thousands and thousands of rupees are paid to officers and even a minimum wage is being refused to a low paid employee. I think that in the present circumstances, the question ought to be thoroughly thrashed out before a committee of enquiry which should go into the question whether the wages now paid are really low and inadequate. If the committee records its finding that the wages are not inadequate, I will have no say in the matter. If, on the other hand, the committee comes to the conclusion that the people are paid starvation salaries, then I think it becomes the duty, not only of the Government but of the members of this House also, to see whether or not it is possible to make their wages adequate. I have on various occasions previously drawn the attention of this House to the spirit of the working classes with which they have been surcharged during the last ten years. I think that no harm would be done by appointing a committee of enquiry and allowing the low paid employees an opportunity to state their case before such a committee. After all, these low paid clerks are, so to say, the legs and arms of Government while the officers at the top could be said to be its brains. When the arms and the legs are injured I do not think the brain alone can do much. If the Government think that only the officers can run the Government, then, of course, the grievances of these men may not be remedied. But I might with due respect point out that to have discontented servants is not well for the Government. On account of the economic distress in the country and on account of the revolutionary ideas in the country, I think the time has come when these low paid employees will assert themselves and will show to the Government that they are not prepared to accept so low wages. A crash is bound to come and this Government will be responsible if it comes. In all civilised countries greater attention is paid to the amenities of life afforded to the low paid employees and in no country in the world at the present day a starving wage as it is given in this province is given to the public servants. Salaries like Rs. 12, and Rs. 15, Rs. 20 and Rs. 30 are indeed no better than starvation wages and I say with all due deference to the Government that it has got no right to pay such low sums to its employees.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** What percentage of the population according to you is starving in India?

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** All that I know is that a majority of the population in India, if not actually starving, are on the verge of starvation. Moreover, it is no reason if the population of India is starving why the Government

**RESOLUTION RE COMMITTEE TO ENQUIRE INTO GRIEVANCES OF 145  
GOVERNMENT SERVANTS.**

servants should also be starved. In these circumstances, I most respectfully submit to the House that at least a committee of enquiry be constituted so that the conditions of service and the grievances of the low paid services are enquired into. No harm will be done if such a committee is appointed and I think the Government will be well advised if they will accept the resolution, appoint a committee of enquiry and earn the gratitude of its employees.

With these words, Sir, I beg to move my resolution. (*Cheers*).

**Mr. President :** The resolution moved is—

"That this Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee of official and non-official members of this Council (with a majority of the latter) to enquire into and report on the grievances of Government and quasi-Government servants drawing less than Rs. 60 a month as regards their pay, pension, quarters, allowances, hours of work and other conditions of service."

**Chaudhri Duli Chand** [Karnal, Non-Muhammadian, Rural], (Urdu) : Sir, so far as the object and the principle underlying this resolution are concerned I have got every sympathy with it. One thing which still perplexes my mind is this, that in the face of some insurmountable difficulties how and in what way would you give this resolution a practical shape? If the honourable member shows me a way out of this confusing perplexity no doubt he will have my support. To explain his position and to throw some light on this incomprehensible matter I invite the honourable mover to answer a few questions that I propose to put to him, and perhaps this catechism may help us in coming to an agreement. My first question is this that supposing that a committee as described in the resolution is appointed and it submits its report to the effect that the Government servants are really low paid, then how would you arrange and to what source of your income would you apply in order to get the money that will be required for increasing the pay of these Government employees? The second question is whether this burden will fall on those classes of the public that pay income tax and other duties or whether it will fall on the already aching shoulders of the zamindars. Here I may explain to the House and to the honourable the mover of the resolution that the Government can enhance the land revenue and the water rates by itself, but it cannot do so in the case of other taxes without the permission of the Council. Since in the latter case its choice is not free therefore, it is feared that it might be tempted to have recourse to the easier method of increasing the extra burden of the poor zamindars with whom it has become a habit to receive all misfortune with resignation. Now the third and the last question is that out of the two, a Government servant and a zamindar, whose condition is better? Sir, is it not a fact that a prisoner is well fed and even better kept as compared with an ordinary zamindar? The zamindars, if not starving, are at the verge of starving. A zamindar's annual income is far less than the sum that is actually spent on an ordinary prisoner in one year in our jails. Keeping in view the pitiable state of the zamindars let the honourable mover answer these questions.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend** (Financial Commissioner) : I only wish to say a few words. I have every sympathy with these Government servants whose lot the honourable mover of the resolution has described in such touching terms. But before the House accepts this resolution, I invite its attention to one or two points. It is well known that prices of many commodities



[Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.]

in common use, particularly food grains such as wheat, have been dropping considerably for some years; and whether, in view of that consideration, it is desirable to appoint now the committee the honourable mover asks for is, I think, very questionable. He referred to a work by one Mr. Purcell who, I understand is a prominent member of the Labour Party in England. I do not think that Mr. Purcell made a very long stay in this country and I fear that, as has happened in many matters recently, not only in housing, the east has been confused with the west, and it has been thought that all the conditions of housing which are appropriate and necessary in the West are also necessary in the East. To refer to another matter, not extremely pleasant but still not unimportant, Mr. Purcell apparently thought that the sanitary arrangements of the West should be imported into every labourer's house in the East. I will only mention it, to show that we need not attach very much weight to Mr. Purcell's views.

One last word. The honourable mover has depicted in touching terms the case of all Government servants including patwaris, and said they did not get a living wage. Well, all I can say is that I heartily compliment him on the great saving capacity which must have been shown by his father, an esteemed patwari of the Hoshiarpur district, who was able in the course of his career on his less than a living wage to save enough money to give his son a liberal education, and who thereby enabled him to join in our debates, in which he is so heartily welcome.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** [South-East Rohtak, (Non-Muham-madan), Rural]: Sir, I wish we were in a position to pay very high salaries to every one who accepts a job under Government. But the real question before the House is where this money is to come from. After all, the object of the resolution is that a committee of officials and non-officials be appointed to make enquiries into the grievances and report on the ways in which those grievances could be redressed. It is quite plain from the speech that has been made by the honourable mover of this resolution that he has no doubt about the existence of a fairly large number of serious grievances. I think his object was not to ascertain whether grievances existed. He has taken it for granted that they did exist and the only object which he has really at heart so far as the moving of this resolution is concerned is that that committee should make a report upon the ways in which those grievances are to be redressed. And we all know that the only way in which those grievances could be redressed is to make substantial increase to the salaries which they are now getting.

The question, I think, has been very pertinently asked by Chaudhri Duli Chand where this money is to come from. If increase is allowed in the scale of salaries which we are now giving to the low-paid servants of Government, the burden will naturally fall on the zamindars. Ninety per cent. of the burden of taxation of this province falls on the zamindars. After all, the main sources of Government revenue are irrigation, land revenue and excise where also the zamindars have to pay a large share. I believe if a calculation were to be made, it would be found that roughly speaking 90 per cent. of the total receipts are contributed by zamindars. These salaries are to be paid out of Government treasury and, in the present state of things, 90 per cent. of the burden of increase will inevitably fall on the zamindars.



**RESOLUTION RE COMMITTEE TO ENQUIRE INTO GRIEVANCES OF 147  
GOVERNMENT SERVANTS.**

If my friend is in a position to suggest ways and means which will bring in money but the burden of which will not fall on the zamindars, then many members on this side of the House will be in a position to support the resolution. But we know that other sources of revenue are not open to provincial governments. Therefore, any increase that is made in the existing scale of salary will entail a further burden on a section of the population which is already overburdened with taxes. In these circumstances, it is very difficult for members who represent the zamindar section of the population to lend their support to this resolution. If my honourable friend had been in a position to point out fresh sources of taxation the burden of which would not fall on the zamindars, or if he had been in a position to make a cut in the salaries of the officers at the top, then we would have been in a position to lend our support to this resolution. Unfortunately, under the present state of the law, we are not in a position to touch the salaries of the highly paid officers, and any new taxes would fall on nobody but the zamindars. Therefore, it is a matter of great regret that most members on this side of the House would not be able to support this resolution, in spite of the fact that they may have sympathy with the object which the honourable mover has in view.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** So far as this question is concerned, I think it should be left to the committee of enquiry to find out the ways and means. If the committee comes to the conclusion that no money could be found to pay adequate salaries to the Government servants, then of course the matter can be settled accordingly. But if the committee could find out certain means and certain ways to find the money, then a case could be made out for the poorly paid employees.

**Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali** [Gujrat, East, (Muhammadian), Urban] (Urdu) : Sir, "where this money is to come from" is a very pertinent objection and as there is no visible source from which we can get this money I think the House would do better if it also assigns the duty of collecting funds to the same committee which is proposed to be appointed to enquire into the grievances of the low-paid Government servants. Sir, it would not be politic to appoint this committee unless some arrangements are made beforehand for the money that would be required for this purpose. Supposing, Sir, this committee is appointed and after duly making these enquiries it decides that the Government servants are really low paid and that their rates of pay should be revised, then if there are no funds in hand and the Government fails to abide by its decision, it would surely give rise to an agitation amongst the Government servants and they will say "Look here, the committee has most justly decided in our favour but the miserly Government cannot be persuaded to do justice in our case."

Moreover, Sir, the prices of wheat, barley and nearly all the other grains have very much fallen, and this has involved the already suffering zamindars in further difficulties. Their position has become very critical and under the present depressing circumstances they cannot understand how they would be able to pay off their heavy debts. The Government servants should have no occasion for clamouring especially when they know that it was those very people who managed to live even under such distressing conditions that were brought about by the Great War and on account of which everything

[K. B. Ch. Fazl Ali.]

and every necessity of life had become unthinkable dear. Considering the fact that the prices of grains and other articles of use have decreased to one-half of what they were during the Great War days we can justly say that the value of the money that these Government servants get as their monthly emoluments has increased two times, for their rates of pay are the same as they were during the War time. In other words they now get twice as much as was given to them during those hard times. Moreover, Sir, if we compare the income of a zamindar with that of a so-called low-paid Government employee we find that the latter is in a far more affluent condition than the former. A farm servant who tills the land all day long usually gets Rs. 8 per mensem, plus a very coarse food. He has also got a family which manages to live in his Rs. 8 per mensem. On the other hand a Government servant who gets Rs. 30 or 35 a month and has got too little to do moans and clamours that he is being starved. Furthermore Sir, although people starve in Government service, still they prefer it to private service. God knows what charm there is in Government service that people are more attracted to than to any other service. We tell people to work in the private agricultural farms where they can enjoy all facilities and can also keep a milch cow and a horse but still they refuse to join such a service. It would be within the recollection of the Honourable Minister for Agriculture that I have been discussing with him to get trained men for the private farms, but could not get any at all. Anyhow whatever be the reasons, the Government low paid servants are not at all in a bad state, and the Council must not bother about them. The question to be considered is what the zamindars will do and how they will provide their necessities and how they will pay the Government revenues when the prices of grains have gone so low. In consideration of all these facts, Sir, I hope the House will agree with me that this is not the proper time for moving such a resolution. With these remarks I oppose the motion.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Sir, the honourable member representing the interests of labour has, I have no doubt, introduced this resolution into this Council more as a matter of duty than anything else. I believe all of us, more or less, are a victim to this wretched slave mentality, to this slavish imitation of the West. I have often been told that it is the result of our defective education. I trust in course of time this defect will be removed. It has become the fashion now in India for rising young men to take up labour propaganda as a good start in public life, and it has also become fashionable to talk on the shibboleths of labour, such as housing, feeding, inadequate pay for work done and things like that. But I assure you I would not have begun this speech in this injured tone were it not for the fact that I feel and feel very much indeed, that this slavish imitation of the West in the matter of labour is a very serious menace, not to the Government, but to the best interests of this country. What we want is that the industries of the country should develop and make progress. How are we going to develop and make progress if at the very start we have this trouble about labour, and have strikes and things of that kind? When the house is not set right, when profits are not forthcoming, how can possibly a man who invests his capital in industrial enterprise go on with that industry? We should desist from the role of a foolish friend. This is really doing more disservice to the best interests of the country than real

service to that class which can only come into being if industries are flourishing in the country. I think I am justified in taking up the line that I have done in view of what I cannot but style as the threatening speech of the honourable mover of this resolution. He started by inviting our attention to the wide scale of strikes on the railway lines; he supplemented that threat by telling us that the independence movement is abroad. He further supplemented his second threat by saying "Mahatama Gandhi is going to start civil disobedience, so you had better hurry up and make your servants contented; otherwise you would get into trouble." Well, Sir, it is for this province and for this Council as representing the province to say as to whether they should advise the Government to begin to pay to their employees who get less than Rs. 60 a month, a wage which is in excess of Rs. 30, which the honourable member considers as less than a living wage. I should like to ask the honourable member and the members of this Council this question, what do they think should be the lowest wage of a man employed by Government as compared with the wage earned for the same work under a private person? Should the Government pay very much in excess for the same work than is paid by a private person? I am quite prepared to say that it should be a little more than the wage he would get from a private person, but should it be very much in excess? Well, the honourable member says that Rs. 30 is a starving wage. Considering that we live in a country where the average income is not more than Rs. 7 a month per head, to say that Rs. 30, is a starvation wage shows how unreal the discussion is. To talk of quarters of Government servants being filthy and so on, and not in the same breath talk of the quarters in which we ourselves live in the city, as at all events no better than the quarters of Government servants, is really concealing the truth. It is all very well to say that Government servants ought to have good quarters, but should not their quarters be about the same quality as the quarters that their brothers in private service occupy, or should they be entirely different? As a matter of fact, there is a serious danger in placing the standard of living and of housing and of working of Government servants on a much higher level than what obtains at present. And what is that danger. The very people of whom the honourable mover wants us to make us frightened, the proletariat, will they not say, we cannot get even Rs. 7 a month for living while Government minimum wage is Rs. 40 a month? It will never do really to put a fictitious value on the services of the people. By fictitious value I mean that remuneration which a man will not get for the work he is doing for any other agency. It has been said that there is but one way to make up the balance of pay a chaukidar gets that is Rs. 18 and Rs. 35, which is just a living wage that he should get. Well, I assure you that if the honourable members hold the view that the pay of the members of Government if reduced could meet the bill, they are entirely mistaken. Because even if the pay of the members of Government were halved that would not meet the bill of any one of these numerous services that have been mentioned. Again it is becoming a fashion to say that Government pays its officers too much. They are being paid in excess of their deserts. There again it is only fair to apply the same test. What would a member of Government be getting if he were not a member of Government but doing some other work. If it is urged that a particular person is really not worth

[Hon. Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

the salary that he is getting, then it is a case of unfair appointment, of an unsuitable appointment, in that the pay he is getting is excessive for him, but not for the post. Surely at the head of any profession, medical, engineering, or legal, people in private practice make fairly decent incomes these days and in no way less than the salaries of Members of Government. Therefore, I do not think it is fair to bring in this matter as a side issue.

Coming to the question of hours of work I really beg to sound a note of warning to all those who are interested in political work. We should not instil in the minds of our generation, be they manual workers or other workers, that they should stick to a particular number of hours of work, 6, 7 or 8. Our great effort should be to put forth all the energy that the nation possesses to make a mark in the struggle of life in this world. Only in that way can a rising country really rise and stand on its own legs. These new-fangled ideas of hours of labour, remuneration for labour and so on are the things which rich, well-established countries with strong economic, comfortable life of long standing extending over generations can afford to have. They only can afford to make the capitalists pay to the labourer and so readjust these hours and wages. But here we want the population as a whole to put forth its best energy, and it will be for the Government and the Legislature to see that the adjustment between the various parts of the population is fair and reasonable. Again to take up a case of a certain number of Government servants, is not really a matter which would make or mar the province. We all know that Government service is extremely popular. I hope and trust that it is popular for the work that it offers to the people and that it is remunerative even under legitimate terms and not for the reasons which some members have hinted at.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram :** The reason is the same as has been hinted at.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I trust all the members will exert their influence to deprive the services of that interest, as it is equally objectionable from Government point of view as well as from public point of view. I know perfectly well the terms on which Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram engages his personal servants and other servants. It is not right for us to try to set for Government a different standard from that which prevails in our own affairs. That was what I was trying to impress on the minds of the honourable members. Do you wish Government servants doing a particular form of work to be paid at a higher rate than they would be paid if they were doing the work in a private firm?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Just a little more.

**The Honourable Mian Sir-Fazl-i-Husain :** That is exactly what I said. I said there must be a difference, a slight difference, but it should not be so great that these people may become a class by themselves which invites more or less not only the criticism but also the cupidity of the proletariat. The honourable mover was trying to frighten Government by saying that Bolshevism is abroad. I said why put these people within the orbit where they would become the object of other people's cupidity. For more reasons than one the resolution is ill-timed.

RESOLUTION RE COMMITTEE TO ENQUIRE INTO GRIEVANCES OF 151  
GOVERNMENT SERVANTS.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** The standard must be kept in the salaries of the Ministers as well.

*(The Honourable Revenue Member rose to reply.)*

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** Sir, you were pleased to rule that no question should be answered unless it is put through the Chair. Why is the Honourable Revenue Member taking notice of these questions?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Is the honourable member quite sure that these questions were not put through the Chair? I think they were, otherwise I would not venture to answer them. This particular resolution is ill-timed. For, the prices are falling, everything is cheaper than before, except money and the financial position of the Government is on the decline. Is that the time for us to take stock of the position and say whether we should not give a living wage which is said to be above Rs. 80, Rs. 80 being the starving wage?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Reduce the higher salaries to half.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** That I have discussed before and I regret I cannot re-discuss that matter for the late arrivals, although I will be very glad to explain to the learned Doctor outside the Council, otherwise I would be repeating myself which you, Sir, would not like. I think the object of the honourable mover in giving expression to this has been achieved. He has realised that though the spirit of socialism is abroad, the spirit of socialism can spread not only amongst the Government servants but also among other people who are not Government servants and their number is extremely large and if equal distribution were to become the order of the day there is not a single Government servant, however low paid who will not have to share his little with a large number of people who do not possess even that much.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram** [Multan Division, (Non-Muhammadan), Rural], (Urdu) : Sir, whenever it is proposed to appoint a committee of enquiry, Government as a rule opposes such a proposal. I really wonder at this attitude of the Government. I do not see what harm it will do if the proposed committee is appointed. The findings at which this committee will arrive will not be binding upon the Government. It will be for the Government to act according to them or not. My friends, the zamindar members, are feeling nervous over this resolution and they wonder whence the money will come to meet the additional expenditure in case this resolution is given effect to. But let me assure them that it is not yet time to entertain such fears. This resolution does not ask for an increase in the salaries of the low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants at once. It only says that a committee may be appointed which should make an enquiry into the conditions of these servants and should make recommendations as to how their lot could be improved. Of course, if that committee recommends that the present scales of salaries of these Government servants need revision, Government should revise them. This committee will also suggest means and sources from which it will be possible to meet the additional expenditure. Therefore, my friends, the zamindars, need not worry about it at this stage. The honourable mover of the resolution has read a long list of Government and quasi-Government servants, who, in his opinion,

[R. B. Lala Sewak Ram.]

deserve better treatment at the hands of their masters. But here I do not wholly agree with him. I think that all these classes of servants do not deserve the same treatment. There are some classes amongst them which should be satisfied with the salaries which they are at present getting. The other classes certainly deserve our sympathy and best consideration. If their salaries are increased, it will go a long way, in my opinion, to eradicate corruption. At present the petty officials of Irrigation, Police, Jails and such other departments resort to dishonest means to make a living because their present salaries are too inadequate for the purpose. The pay of the chaprasis is particularly very low. They work from morning till evening, and they get only Rs. 14 or Rs. 15, after a month. A coolie on the other hand earns 14 annas a day. This Council has recommended twice or thrice that the salaries of these chaprasis should be increased, but Government has paid little attention to this matter. Under the circumstances these chaprasis have to adopt dishonest means. They are usually attached to officers and when a visitor goes to have an interview with their masters they refuse to take the visiting card in on the ground that the sahib is very busy. And as soon as the visitor offers to pay some gratification to them, they become very polite and very submissive and lose no time to take the card to their masters. It may be said that these visitors help to encourage corruption. But that charge will be found to have no force on deeper consideration. Supposing I go to Simla to have an interview with the Chief Secretary. I can stay there only for a day and cannot postpone interviewing the Chief Secretary to another day. I go to his office and the chaprasi as is usual with this class of servants, refuses to take my card to the officer. What am I to do in that case? I must offer to pay something to the chaprasi because I know that that is the only way to prevail upon him to get me an interview. My friends, the zamindar members, are prepared to pay Rs. 5, and even Rs. 10 to these chaprasis when they go to seek an urgent interview with any officer, but they are not prepared to lend their support to any proposal which will stop these peons from asking for a *bakhshish*. My honourable friend, Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali, went so far as to say that it was not necessary to increase the salaries of these low-paid servants because, he said, they were earning more than many Government servants drawing decent salaries. He in a way recognises these dishonest practices as justifiable. I might make it clear that my object in supporting this resolution is not that all Government and quasi-Government servants should be started on at least Rs. 50 or Rs. 60. It will be for the proposed committee to decide what should be the living wage which would enable all classes of these servants to live honestly and without resorting to unauthorised practices. Therefore, the appointment of that committee is, in my opinion, very necessary. It is a wonder of wonders that while Government has never hesitated to increase the salaries of its servants who are already highly paid, it has always opposed tooth and nail all proposals intended to ameliorate the condition of the low-paid servants. After the enquiry by the Police Enquiry Committee the salaries of the Inspector-General of Police and of the Deputy Inspector-General of Police were increased by Rs. 500, and Rs. 300 respectively, but the salaries of the constables were increased only by 3 or 4 rupees. These constables now get,

Rs. 17 per mensem to begin with, although the powers that they possess are very great. They do not get even a living wage and perhaps that is the main reason why they misuse their powers. For example, when the train of His Excellency passes through an ilaqa it is necessary to requisition the services of some zamindars to be posted as guards on the road on which the train has to pass. Some ten or twenty police constables are sent ahead of the train to ask some zamindars to do that duty. Now where only 15 or 20 men are wanted, these constables would collect some 50 men, many of them gratify these constables to be relieved of that duty and the constables would spare some of them as they know that they do not want the services of all. This is only an instance to show how the low-paid servants act. I think no other proof is wanted to show how far this resolution is important and how it is necessary to appoint the proposed committee. To meet the additional cost, if no other source is available, the salaries of the Extra Assistant Commissioners and the Sub-Judges can be reduced. I would have recommended reduction in the salaries of the Imperial Service men as well, but they are non-voted and we cannot touch them. Only 15 or 20 years ago a sub-judge known as a munsiff used to start with only Rs. 100, and he could not rise beyond Rs. 250 per month. Now the sub-judges and the extra assistant commissioners start with Rs. 300 and with one efficiency bar, which they cross in due course, they go up to Rs. 800 and more as a matter of course.

At one time there used to be only two posts of extra assistant commissioners carrying a salary of Rs. 800, but now thirty or forty such posts have been created. Besides the staff of the Secretariat and other Government offices has increased very much during these years.

The Secretaries of the Government and other high officers have been given the services of stenographers so that they may have easy time. Where these officers used to write notes and orders with their own hands previously, now they make the stenographers write everything for them. They have grown very lazy. But my zamindar friends have quietly borne all this additional expenditure and have never raised their voice against it. It is only now that they have thought of opposition when the question of raising the salaries of very deserving low paid classes of Government servants has been brought forward.

It was a mistake on the part of the honourable mover of the resolution when he threatened the Government and said that the spirit of socialism would spread amongst the low-paid servants if nothing was done to satisfy them. I think he does not know that these threats have no effect on an autocratic Government. It is only by cajolery and flattery that we can make such a Government comply with our wishes and requests. I think that if the honourable mover had refrained from giving this threat, the Honourable Revenue Member might have seen his way to accept the resolution. May I hope that the Honourable Revenue Member will disregard that threat and will consider the resolution on its merits? I hope that he will very kindly agree to the appointment of the proposed committee.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan** [Sialkot (Muhammadan), Rural]: Sir, I regret very much that at any rate my own personal feeling is that one has had to listen to a great deal of very conflicting and contradictory reasoning



[Ch. Zafrullah Khan.]

during the discussion of this resolution, and I am afraid not only on one side but on both sides. I agree with that part of the criticism levelled against this resolution on behalf of the Government and other honourable members who have described it as ill-timed in the sense that the time at which this resolution has been put forward for discussion before the House is not an opportune time for the discussion of a resolution of this nature. I need not recapitulate the reasoning and arguments that go to support that part of the criticism. It would suffice to say that the financial stringency which the province has got to face would alone be a sufficient reason, without going into the merits of this resolution for opposing this resolution. But I feel that the matter has not been allowed to rest there. Reasoning more or less of a sentimental character has been put forward both in support of this resolution and also in opposition to it. I hope I have made it perfectly clear that I am not going to lend my support to this resolution at this stage. On the other hand, I do not wholly accept the criticism that has been levelled against this resolution even from these honourable members who occupy these benches with me. This resolution if it was to be discussed on its merits deserved a more serious consideration than it has received, with less sentiment imported into the discussion. To give only one or two instances to show that the resolution has not and the honourable mover has not received fair treatment during the discussion, I might refer to some of the reasoning advanced both in support of the resolution and against the resolution. To take the latest instance put forward in support of the resolution of such kind of reasoning, I might refer to what my honourable friend across (Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram) has referred to as the laziness of the better paid officials whose salaries have continuously risen during the past few years and whose work, according to him, has steadily decreased, and the reasoning that he has put forward is that these better paid officials are now supplied with stenographers. They used previously to write all their orders with their own hands and now they have the use of stenographers and he jumps to the conclusion, that consequently they have become lazy and turn out less work. That is his reason for reducing their salaries and out of the money thus saved, supplementing the salaries of these low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants referred to in the resolution. One moment's reflection, however, will show that the supply of stenographers instead of making the work and the life of these gentlemen easier has certainly made them more strenuous. Those officers whether on the judicial side or on the executive side or in the Secretariat who have been given the services of stenographers have no doubt been saved a considerable amount of physical labour which otherwise used to go towards transcribing their orders with their own hands on the files, but the time thus saved is not being utilised by these gentlemen for purposes of amusement. A senior Sub-Judge or a District Judge or a Sessions Judge or a Secretary to Government has still got to work as many hours as he used to work before, and the result of the supply of stenographers is that whereas in the old days a Sessions Judge, for instance, used to get through a sessions trial where he had to take down every word of the evidence with his own hand in six days, he can now get through three trials in six days with the help of a stenographer. So that, for the pay of one Sessions Judge, and the pay of one stenographer, you are getting three



times the amount of work that used to be turned out by a Sessions Judge and the mental strain involved therefore is considerably heavier than it used to be, though it has no doubt considerably reduced the physical labour of the Sessions Judge. Instead of enabling an officer to enjoy comparative mental rest while he was performing physical labour, you make him dispose of a great deal more work by supplying him with a stenographer. I need not dilate any further on the sort of defective reasoning on the part of those gentlemen who are trying to support this resolution.

On the other hand, an equally glaring and much less fair argument used on behalf of the opponents of the resolution was used by the Honourable the Financial Commissioner during the concluding part of his speech. That was a reference to the education which the honourable mover has himself received at the hands of his father whom the Honourable the Financial Commissioner described as "a most esteemed patwari in the Hoshiarpur district." I would have felt very much happier if while discussing this resolution the Financial Commissioner had not used such an argument. I may be wrong, but I cannot help feeling that in sporting circles this argument of the Financial Commissioner would be described as hitting below the belt. It was of such a personal nature that it should not have been made, and I was surprised to hear it from the lips of an officer whom I hold in the highest esteem and respect. The argument for whatever it was worth was this. The argument was, here is a complaint that these clerks and these patwaris are not being paid well. Very good. The honourable mover himself is the son of an esteemed patwari. His father was able to give him the education that he possesses, that is to say, he was able to send him to England to qualify for the bar and to pay the very heavy fees which are necessary to be paid to qualify for the bar.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Sir, there seems to be a misunderstanding in this respect. It will smoothen matters if I were to explain the position. The Financial Commissioner has referred during the course of his speech that I was supplied funds by my father, who was an esteemed patwari in the Hoshiarpur district, and highly respected by the people. I really feel honoured that I am the son of a patwari who used to draw a salary of Rs. 14 a month. But it is certainly wrong to say that funds for my studies were provided by my father. From the time I went to school my father did not support me. It was my brother who has been supporting me all through. By his wonderful genius, he worked his way up, made himself and then made me and my two younger brothers.

**Mr. President :** That is not an explanation. The honourable member will do well to refer to these matters when he replies to the debate at the end.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** I was referring to the argument used by the Financial Commissioner.

**Mr. President :** May I request the Leader of the House to send for the Financial Commissioner so that he might hear what other members say in reply to his speech. If possible a speaker should remain in the House to hear what other members may say by way of reply to his speech.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Certainly, Sir.

**Mr. President :** Then will the Honourable Leader please send for him immediately ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Surely, Sir, it is for me to decide when and how I should send for him.

**Mr. President :** I thought, that in the absence of the Financial Commissioner it was the Leader of the House to whom I could make the request I have made. Perhaps I have made the request in wrong quarters. I take this opportunity to inform all members of the House that after making speeches they should, if possible, remain in the House to hear what other members have got to say in reply. It is not fair that they should make speeches and then slip away without hearing how the other members meet their arguments. Perhaps I made a mistake in appealing to the Leader of the House. So, I withdraw my request.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** It is not a question of making an appeal and withdrawing it. You said that the Financial Commissioner was not here just now when he ought to be here and you asked me to send for him. I said 'certainly, Sir.' It is for me then to take steps to get him back here. It is for me to see how I get him here and when. I should not be expected to rush out at once and get him here. That is not fair.

**Mr. President :** I did not say or mean that. Apparently I was misunderstood.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** About the second point, you have ruled, if I understood you rightly, that no member who has made a speech has a right to go out at all, but should hear what others have got to say in reply. That amounts to this that no member who has made a speech should leave the House that day or even the following day till that matter on which the speech was made has been concluded. I am here in the House all day long and so the ruling does not affect me, but I have no doubt that on reconsideration you will find that that ruling of yours will be broken to a large extent by the non-official members of the House more than by the Government members.

**Mr. President :** The ruling which I have given is not a new one. I gave it, if I remember aright, when Mir Maqbool Mahmood, the mover of the Money Lenders Bill at Simla, absented himself after making a speech. I think it is only fair that after a member has spoken on an important motion and it is likely that his arguments will be severely criticised by other members, he should be present to listen to them. There are speeches and speeches, and this is one of those speeches after making which the Financial Commissioner would have been well-advised to stay in the House and listen to what others had to say. It is not every speech the reply to which a member should stay to listen. (*Hear, hear*).

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** From what the Leader of the House has said, it would appear as if you said that no member who makes a speech had any right to be absent after his speech is made.

**Mr. President :** All I said and meant was that courtesy required that he should be present, if possible.

**Mr. J. D. Penny :** Your point was that the Financial Commissioner ought to have been here. But you now say that there are speeches and speeches, and that you do not expect the honourable members to be in the House all the time. That is to say, he has got to be in the House if he has reason to expect his speech to be answered. The Honourable Financial Commissioner had no reason to expect his remarks now in question to be replied to until at any rate the honourable mover replied at the end of the debate.

**Mr. President :** I do not think there is any possibility of my ruling being misunderstood. If you make an important speech in the House, you should expect others to reply to it. Such a speech is bound to be answered and courtesy requires that you should stay and hear what may be said by others. I gave that ruling five years ago.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I did not misunderstand you, Sir. I simply said that I would send for the Financial Commissioner. But you did not give me time to send for him, but began to say unpleasant things.

**Mr. President :** I said nothing, still less anything unpleasant. If I said anything unpleasant, I shall be the first to withdraw it. (Voices : No, no).

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** I am extremely sorry that my reference to a certain part of the argument of the Honourable Financial Commissioner should have evoked a certain amount of discussion which has lasted for ten or fifteen minutes. All that I wanted to say was that the argument that a Government servant of the category included in the resolution is able to give high education to his children and therefore he must be prosperous and happy, that argument is not a sound one. Because, if the inference is that they are able to save very large sums of money which amount to many hundred times the salaries which they have received during the course of their employment, that is obviously a wrong conclusion, because one cannot save from one's salary many times the total amount of the salary one might have received. If the argument can be explained away by saying that large sums of money are earned by legitimate means, then they are legitimate additional means which a Government servant may possess, for instance he may happen to be the owner of a large area of land or he may happen to have inherited property of other kinds from his predecessors in interest from which he may be able to make savings. Thus the argument of the Financial Commissioner falls to the ground. To say that because a certain Government servant falling within the category referred to in the resolution has been able to save large sums of money is no argument that his pay is really adequate. The saving might be due to income from other legitimate resources or it might be due to illegitimate resources. In the latter case the argument used by the Financial Commissioner is in favour of a committee being appointed to go into this question so that the temptation for these Government servants adding to their salary by illegal means may be removed and they may be given a salary on which they can live and bring up their children. Therefore, by using this argument the Honourable Financial Commissioner unconsciously used the

[Ch. Zafarullah Khan.]

strongest argument which anybody could have put forward for bettering the condition of this class of Government servants.

Let me also clear the position with regard to another objection which has been raised to this resolution. It has been urged that apart from the present financial stringency, so far as the mere question of raising the pay or otherwise ameliorating the condition of these Government servants is concerned, supposing the recommendation of the committee results in a larger burden being imposed upon the tax-payer, the fact that this additional burden will fall upon the rural classes constitutes an objection to this resolution. I do not at all agree that that is an argument against the resolution. No doubt, if we were going to provide for some luxury or for some fancy comforts or for some facilities which are not absolute necessities of life, it might be said that it is unfair to add to the burden of the rural tax-payer for the purpose of providing these luxuries or facilities for these Government servants. But if a certain class of Government servants is not getting an economic wage, I for my part will not be a supporter of that state of affairs merely because the giving of an economic wage to them would result in additional taxation which will have to be borne to a large extent by my own class or any other class.

Again, some other criticisms which have been urged were not fair. For instance, the Honourable the Leader of the House indulged in an economic discussion with regard to the average income of an inhabitant of this province and a comparison with what would be a starvation or a minimum economic wage. For instance, it was said the average income of an inhabitant of this province was only Rs. 7 a month. I believe it is very much less and being much less it would strengthen the Honourable Revenue Member's argument. I am willing to concede that. Supposing it is much less—I am told it is Rs. 2-18-0 or roughly Rs. 3 per mensem—it was said that it is an astounding proposition to say that the minimum economic wage should be Rs. 30 a month. I cannot see the disparity. The average income—when we speak of the average income of every inhabitant of this province being Rs. 3 a month—means the income of every man, woman and child, whether too young or too old to earn anything, whether he is able to work, or whether she is secluded behind the purdah. That is one thing. And when we speak of Rs. 30 as the minimum economic wage, all that we mean is that that is the wage upon which an average person with an average family in this province which would include his wife and three or four children, can make two ends meet. And I cannot see the disparity between the two, that if the average income per head is only Rs. 3 a month, why should the average minimum wage be Rs. 30 or less. So far as I know and I believe I am correct in stating that the cost only of food of a prisoner of the lowest class in our jails is about Rs. 8 per mensem. That is the cost of food alone, and if you take a family of, say a man and his wife with three, four or five children, or a family of four adults, the cost of food alone according to the calculations in the jail regulations would be Rs. 32 a month. And, therefore, I cannot see the efficacy or the applicability of this economic reasoning that because the average income per head is only Rs. 3, the minimum wage should also be Rs. 3. I need not pursue this reasoning any further. My submission is that neither the threats nor the alleged threats

which are said to have been employed by the honourable mover of this resolution should stampede either Government or this House into granting something which is not just, and I hope that in no case will this House be disposed to lend its support to a resolution merely because that resolution is supported by such threats or alleged threats. On the other hand, if the financial condition of the province justified it and a case were made out for ameliorating the condition of these low-paid servants of Government, I hope that arrangements will be made, as a measure of bare justice, not as a concession made under threats, to meet those grievances and those demands. Even on the merits nothing has been urged to convince me that at this stage there is such a crying need for an overhauling of the pay, allowances and other perquisites of this class of Government servants. Therefore, on this one ground that this resolution is ill timed, if not for the other objections which Government have urged, I oppose it.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend** (Financial Commissioner): Sir, It was never my intention to show any discourtesy to the House, in leaving it, when I did. And I desire to express my regret to you and to the House for doing so.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani**: Sir, just a word by way of personal explanation. I did not take ill what has been said by the Financial Commissioner. I think that it is an honour to me that I am the son of a patwari and I feel proud of this. Some other big personalities are also sons of patwaris.

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (Nominated, non-official): Sir, I have often heard it said that the average income of a man in India is about Rs. 3 a month. It seems as though the total sum of the happiness of each person in India is based on that sum of Rs. 3; and it is argued that because he is getting such a small amount of money, therefore, his happiness is also proportionately small. It is argued that because others are getting hundreds or thousands of rupees, therefore, proportionately they are more happy. I have, Sir, several times tried to compare myself with some of my tenants in my village and I have felt that with their income of Rs. 3 a month perhaps they were happier than I was, because after all money is not the only thing which goes to make one's joy and happiness. I think, Sir, that one's digestion is more important. One's sleep, rest and refreshment give one more joy than mere money. We believe, Sir, because we have got so many dishes on our table, we are happy. But we eat far too much than is good for us, for our needs. But out of this small amount which a poor man eats he receives all the nourishment which he needs for his body and which may give him a good sleep, rest and strength. How is it that these people are stronger physically? They sleep better and they are happy. I say that when we think of their Rs. 3 a month, we should not forget this side of it that they are not unhappy because they are not able to eat as much as we do. They generally are much more happy than we are.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang** [North-West Towns (Non-Muhammadan), (Urban)]: Sir, I think I would be failing in my duty if I did not say a few words on this resolution. I whole-heartedly appreciate the spirit which has prompted the honourable mover of this resolution to send up this resolution. There is not the slightest doubt that most of the Government employees in the lower ranks are under paid. When I say they are under

[Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang.]

paid I do not mean they are under paid in the sense that people would demand higher salary, and, that therefore, there should be no such comparison of salaries. That is not what I mean at all. On the other hand, I know that the supply is much greater than the demand and for one small post that falls vacant scores of applications are received. Even for jobs which carry very little salary with them a large number of applications are received, so that the position of the Government I fully appreciate is one of very great difficulty. If there is a job which carries with it a pay of Rs. 30 or Rs. 40, there are hundreds of people under-graduates or matriculates, thousands in number, even graduates, applying for it. So Government cannot say to the matriculates, well as Rs. 30 is a very small pay, therefore, we shall pay you Rs. 40. I fully realize the difficulty of the Government and I think the criticism which has been indulged in by some of the honourable speakers in this House is fallacious. They have not taken into consideration this aspect of the question.

Nevertheless the objections that have also been raised seem to possess much force in them. The heads of departments, who have to deal with large number of clerks, would have observed that many of their employees are neither properly clothed, nor are they properly fed. They are poorly clad in the extreme cold of the Punjab—we must confine ourselves to the Punjab—shivering from head to foot sitting on stools and benches and some on ground in their thin pyjamas and thin shirts. They have no warm clothings. They have no warm socks, and if they have got any, they are all torn out. Their shoes are torn and are hardly a protection against cold. These things cannot go unobserved.

They cannot also ignore the fact that in this country unfortunately, the rule is to marry and the exception is to remain unmarried. And everybody whether he has the means to maintain a wife and children or not is expected to marry and is sometimes forced into matrimony before he knows where he is and before he is in a position to exercise his own discretion. And again, the rule in this country is that every married couple unless some disease intervenes must have children and the attempt at limitation of families really has not even begun to be made in this country. The result therefore is that people here get married at an early age without any discretion on their part, then they have also children perhaps because they cannot help it, the result being that misery is piled upon misery. Whereas there is only one who is to earn, there are so many to share the poor earnings. The misery is something awful. There is not the slightest doubt that people who earn their living by manual labour, say as coolies or masons or as carpenters or as blacksmiths, are in many cases much better off than our clerical staff in the various departments of Government. Carpenters and masons and blacksmiths certainly get much better wages than the vast majority of the clerks in Government offices. There is no doubt about that. And then they have another advantage, and that is this, that they are not required to live up to a certain standard of life. They are not required to dress so as to meet the standard of decency observed by the superintendent of the office or the head of the department. If a cooly goes in a *langota*, nobody questions him. He is probably looked upon as quite decently dressed or at least not quite indecently undressed. If a mason goes about only in a

*dhoti* or a *takband* nobody takes it that he is violating any rules of decency and so is the case with other manual workers. But if a *babu* goes to his office say in a *dhoti*, he would not be permitted to enter the office. If he does not wear a coat, he would not be allowed entrance into the office. If he comes bare-footed, he would be kicked out. He must observe a definite standard in his clothes and in decency. The result is that a good deal of his poor earnings has of necessity to be spent upon himself and the rest has to be shared by his dependents. There is another disadvantage also from which the poor clerks suffer and that is this. Whereas the blacksmith's wife could be of some help to him at home, probably she can fire the furnace and clean it and look after certain other things apart from actual manual smith's work, the poor *babu's* wife cannot share the work of the *babu* although she may be able to cook his food and look after the children. Whereas a mason's children or a carpenter's children—the boys in any case—would be able to assist the carpenter or the mason in adding to his wages, a *babu's* son cannot add a penny to his income but has to be sent to school and money has to be spent on the other hand on his education in addition to his maintenance. I am sure honourable members of this House know that a carpenter's son if he is 10 years old, can earn his livelihood, a mason's son can also earn his by doing a subsidiary job. (*The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain*: He will not be able to do it in future in view of the compulsory primary education scheme.) Probably on account of the compulsory primary education scheme, there would be a difficulty in the way of the manual labourers and I am sure that would be one of the arguments urged by them against the introduction of compulsory primary education, and that would be a ground on which many exemptions would be claimed. Then again, agriculturists also derive some assistance from their little boys in various ways. A boy of ten, even a boy of eight can tend cattle, may sit on the *gadi* of a persian wheel and drive the team while the father is doing some hard work. But the poor *babu* has absolutely no source from which he could add to his income. Some people have the view that the *babus* loot the zamindar or loot the *sahukars* when they come to their offices. But that I submit is confined only to a certain class of *babus*. What can the poor *babu* for instance in the Secretariat or in the office of the Accountant-General do? What again can the poor *babus* of the Post Office do? And so is it with the various other offices where there is absolutely no chance of making any extra income, though we certainly know that in certain departments, particularly in courts, and so far as the *patwaris* are concerned, in the Revenue Department and in certain other Departments, even the subordinate staff are in a position if they are not honest to add a little to their income or much to their income depending upon the sphere of life in which they are placed. But there are thousands of clerks still who cannot add a single penny to their income by foul means or fair means. Surely the case of such people must be looked into. I know there are difficulties in the way. I know and I heard the Honourable Revenue Member saying that revenues of the Government are falling. There are other difficulties. But surely the object of the appointment of a committee is to look into those very difficulties. The committee is not going to recommend that so and so may be dismissed and his salary may be distributed among the clerks. That cannot be expected of the committee.



[Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang.]

It will certainly have to look at both sides of the question, the revenues and also the expenditure and the excess in it on account of any increase of salaries.

Particularly hard I would submit is the case of the menial staff under the Government. I am not quite sure but probably, these chaprasis do not get more than Rs. 14 a month. Rs. 14 a month comes to about 7 annas a day or seven and-a-half. And I am sure one chaprasi if he wanted to have a full meal for himself would consume victuals worth seven and-a-half annas and he would not be over-fed if he consumed as much as that. My honourable friend, Mr. Maya Das, if I understood him rightly was pleased to say that though the average income in India was Rs. 8 per month, the people in the country seemed to be very strong and well-fed and very healthy. And probably he seemed to prescribe a course of starvation for our improvement. Certainly occasional starvation may be very useful and may do a lot of good to some of my honourable friends both on the right and on the left. I do not mean any disrespect. I am quite prepared to concede it, but people who live on the verge of starvation would die if the starvation course were prescribed for them. There is no doubt that people who live in the country are as a rule healthier and people in the city by the indiscretion that they themselves commit are not very often in good health. That is perfectly true. But that is not because those people in the country who look healthy live on an anna and a-half a day only. They live on turnips for which they pay nothing. They will go to the field of some honourable member here and while he is not looking, they would pluck one or two turnips, wipe them with their *tahband* and eat them. They would be paying nothing. In the same way they would get a radish and such other things. And we know, all these contain a lot of vitamins. No doubt they manage thus to keep themselves on, but I am am sure that if my honourable friend, Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram caught one in plucking his turnips or carrots or his radishes, certainly he would not allow him to repeat that process. So that simply from the fact that he is able in spite of the abject poverty in the countryside, to live on and sometimes possess good health, we cannot argue that Rs. 8 is quite sufficient to maintain a man even in this poor country of ours. Three rupees a *day* would not suffice to keep a man in decent comfort in England or in America. And three rupees a *month* would certainly not keep an Indian of whatsoever poor position in good health or in comfort. Surely this evil which we see before our very eyes does cry for a remedy. And it is to find out some remedy that this resolution has been brought forward by my learned friend.

Before closing, I just want to reply to one objection which is sometimes raised and in which I find there is a great deal of force. People are apt to make too much of the labour movement, and I want to say a word to the honourable mover of this resolution who claims to be a labour leader and have the interests of labour at heart. There is a limit to which even sympathy for labour could go. Beyond that it would not be real sympathy for labour but it might be doing a great harm to labour and also to the capitalist. We cannot forget that industries in our country are in an absolute state of infancy. Labour problems or problems which arise from industrialism have not yet come to such a stage in this country as to call for



radical remedies. If we apply those theories which are sought to be, but which have not yet been, brought into practice fully even in Europe and America, to the affairs in our country, we are bound to strangle our infant industries and our foreign competitors would be very glad that our leaders should engage themselves in labour problems, try to reduce the working hours, to raise the wages, to provide better accommodation and do the like. All these are good but within certain limits. Now supposing eight hours day is reduced to six and wages are raised from 8 to 10 annas and more money has to be spent on housing and so on, what would be the result? It means, even if one item like the six hour day instead of eight hours, or shifts as they are called, is introduced, our production falls to three-fourths of what it is, and if wages are raised from 8 to 10 annas, it means our cost is raised by 25 per cent. It would be impossible for infant industries in this country to stand the competition with countries where industries are very well established. There are limits even to our love for labour, our sympathy for the labourers and our anxiety to improve their lot. But surely it does not apply to the clerical staff

5 P. M.

in Government Departments, because here we have no competition. Of course we shall be glad if we can get Englishmen for 8 annas or one rupee a day. But they want hundred rupees, two hundred rupees and sometimes five hundred rupees a day, and we really cannot afford to pay such large amounts. I believe in the principle *kam lo, dam do*, not in the sense in which some people in the courts and some departments say to the litigant public or those who want some business to be done. But we must pay every one commensurately with the work that he puts in and nobody should be underpaid.

I have already said that we realise fully the difficulties of Government also, but surely there is no disease which has no cure. As some Sanskrit poet has said, there is not a man who does not possess some virtue, there is not a word that does not possess some poetry in itself, and there is not a herb which does not possess some medicinal virtue in it. All that is required is that some one should put them together. The same English words used by Shakespeare are used by me. The permutations and combinations being different, he is Shakespeare and I am one who talks Indian English. I do not think that Government should oppose this innocent motion asking the Government to appoint a committee. If the committee can point out ways and means, the Government should accept them. Surely the Government should not refuse if a proper remedy is pointed out. If the committee cannot point out any remedy, there is an end of the thing. But I cannot agree with my friend Zafarullah Khan when he said that it will be utterly useless to appoint a committee, as I cannot see that the problem is absolutely insoluble and the disease is so bad that absolutely no remedy can be found for it. There is every possibility of some remedy being suggested only if this committee is appointed. With these words, I heartily support the resolution.

**Mr. E. Maya Das :** The honourable member attributed a statement to me which I did not make. He said that I had prescribed a starvation diet. I said nothing of the kind. What I wished to explain was this ; that

[Mr. E. Maya Das.]

actually a man requires a very small quantity of food, which is generally available in our neighbourhood, but we generally eat far too much, with the result that there is considerable wastage and therefore we take it for granted that other people are being starved.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** When the honourable member says 'we' does he mean himself or the whole Council? If he means the whole Council, I disagree with him [*Laughter.*]

**Mr. President :** The question is that the question be now put.

The motion was carried.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** I want to make a reply.

**Mr. President :** Can the honourable members make a reply as of right?

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** After the Government member has spoken I think I have a right.

**Mr. President :** Will he refer me to the rule or standing order on which he relies?

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** I cannot refer off-hand to any rule. Under the circumstances, I bow to your ruling.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member has no right of reply, but it is in the discretion of the Chair to allow him to make a reply.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** That is what I want.

**Mr. President :** I do not think I should exercise my discretion and allow the honourable member to make a reply. There is some doubt in the minds of honourable members which I think I should try to remove. When a debate closes otherwise than on a closure motion it is the right of the mover of the principal motion, if he cares to make any reply, to rise and make that reply. But when a closure motion is moved and carried, it is not by right that the mover of the motion or resolution can make a reply. Then it is in the discretion of the Chair to allow him or not. In this case, I think, the resolution has been sufficiently discussed. Therefore, I do not wish to exercise my discretion in favour of permitting the honourable member to give a reply.

**Mr. M. A. Ghani :** I stood up before you asked the House whether the debate should be closed or not.

**Mr. President :** That makes no difference. The closure motion was moved sometime ago by the honourable representative of the Lahore District; and as some members desired to speak, I allowed Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang, to have his say. After he finished it I put the closure motion which was carried. Now the question is whether the honourable member has a right of reply. I think he has not. I may invite his attention to the proviso to Article 66 of the Manual of Business. After the closure motion is carried it is the duty of the Chair to put the main question straightaway. But our Standing Orders provide that it is in the discretion of the Chair to allow a member, who otherwise has the right of reply, to make a reply. I do not wish to exercise my discretion in the present case.

RESOLUTION RE COMMITTEE TO ENQUIRE INTO GRIEVANCES OF 165.  
GOVERNMENT SERVANTS.

The question is—

“This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee of official and non-official members of this Council (with a majority of the latter) to enquire into and report on the grievances of Government and quasi-Government servants drawing less than Rs. 60 a month as regards their pay, pension, quarters, allowances, hours of work and other conditions of service.”

The motion was lost.

RESOLUTION RE INCOME FROM RESIN IN SHAMILAT FORESTS.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh** [Kangra (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu) :—  
Sir, the resolution which stands in my name runs as follows :—

“This Council recommends to the Government that the zamindars of the Kangra district be given a share of the income derived from resin produced in the *shamilat* forests.”

It is exactly the same resolution which was passed by this Council by a majority of votes in its session held at Simla in 1927. But it seems that Government has not thought it worth while to accept the recommendation embodied in the said resolution. The zamindars are very much aggrieved at the die-hard attitude adopted by Government in this matter. As was already stated in the Simla session referred to above, in the Kangra District the area of forests is about 7 lakhs of acres, of which 32 or 34 thousand acres of forests are the property of Government and the remaining are owned by the zamindar proprietors. So far as the trees on *shamilat* lands are concerned, no doubt, the zamindar proprietors are given certain rights. They are entitled to one-fourth share of the income derived from the sale of these trees. Now the question arises when Government recognises the right of the zamindar proprietors to a share of the income derived from the sale of trees why does it not recognise their right to share the income derived from resin extracted from these trees? On the previous occasion it was stated on behalf of Government that the grant of a share of the income derived from the sale of trees to the zamindars was a device adopted by the authorities in order to induce the people to take an interest in the conservancy of their forests and that otherwise they have no right even over the income derived from the sale of the trees. Sir, if that is the case, it sounds all the more reasonable to grant the people a share of the income derived from resin. If that is done I am sure they will not cease taking interest, but on the other hand they would begin taking more interest than before in the preservation of forests. Sir, is it not surprising that while in Hoshiarpur the people are entitled to a share of the income derived from resin, the zamindar proprietors in the Kangra district are deprived of that right. It has been urged on behalf of Government that in Hoshiarpur there were in ancient times no Rajas such as the Rajas of Kangra and the Government found the people in possession of their lands.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** : Are there no Rajas now in Kangra?

**Chaudhri Ram Singh** : There are, but they are nominal Rajas. Thus it has been said that because there were no Rajas in the Hoshiarpur district the people are entitled to a share of the income derived from resin. I do not see any force in this argument. Does it mean that the Kangra

[Ch. Ram Singh.]

people ought to have turned out their Rajas from their district? Was it in their power to do so? If not, then how are the people of the Kangra district to be blamed? Besides when the presence of Rajas is considered to be so material in this matter why do these two districts not differ so far as their administrative control is concerned? I find that in both the districts one and the same penal and administrative laws are in force. How then is this invidious distinction justified in the case of the Kangra district? Personally I believe that *shamilat* forests were owned by the people even in the times of the Rajas. But supposing as the Government says that the people were not the owners of forests even in those days, I would submit that that might be attributed to the highhandedness of the Rajas. And now, Sir, when a civilised Government is there, is it too much to expect from them that they would do justice to the people of the Kangra district? At the time of first regular settlement the Government consulted the people in the matter of assessment of land revenue. The latter agreed to pay land revenue for the *shamilat* lands as well as other lands. Land revenue was assessed on both the forests and lands under cultivation, but the burden of land revenue was thrown on the cultivated lands alone. The people did not then anticipate the fraud perpetrated on them. That is the way in which Government acquired this right by the system known as *Dakhal Bachh* and *Kharaj Bachh*. The *shamilat* forests are considered to be *Kharaj Bachh* lands. Sir, so far as the question of property in the trees is concerned the Government has itself decided in its own favour though in my opinion the trees exclusively belong to the people. Is it not strange that while lands belong to the people, the trees or wood on them are considered to be State property? The zamindars are entitled to graze their cattle and get wood for the construction of agricultural implements for other purposes. In addition to that, as I have already submitted they are also entitled to a share of the income derived from the sale of trees. I admit that these useful rights are given to the people. Why not also give them the right of sharing the income derived from resin extracted from these trees? Again it has been contended on behalf of Government that the net profits accruing to them are very small. Perhaps the Government gains only three annas and six pies per maund. The net profits accruing to Government probably amount to about Rs. 1,500 annually. Thus the income derived from resin is very small and it is very difficult to distribute this little sum among the people of the Kangra district. That may be true. But when Government is already distributing one-fourth of the income derived from the sale of trees (that also is a little sum) among the people why should it not also distribute the income derived from resin? If that is undesirable then I would submit that the income derived from resin may be deposited in a bank for a year or two and it may be distributed among the people. This will remove the difficulty likely to be felt by Government in the matter of distribution.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** What is written in the *Wajib-ul-Arz*?

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** At the time when *Wajib-ul-Arz* was introduced, resin was not extracted from the trees. (*Laughter*). It has also been said that if zamindars are allowed unrestricted use of the forest growth, the forests would be destroyed in no time. We do not mind if Government would take measures against the wanton destruction of forests, but it does not

mean that they should deprive the people of their legitimate right of getting a share of the income derived from resin. Sir, the people of the Kangra district have a good many grievances against Government so far as the *shamilat* forests are concerned. As I have already said, they are not given a share of the income derived from resin though a resolution was passed by this Council to this effect in 1927. I need not dilate at length on this subject because it was already fully debated upon in this Council in 1927. However I would submit one thing and that is this, that Government is according as tepmotherly treatment to the people of the Kangra district, while in the Hoshiarpur district they are.....

**Mr. President :** How long will the honourable member continue to repeat his arguments ?

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Sir, I was going to show that the Government is not favourably inclined towards the people of the Kangra district. Nowhere else in the Punjab except in the Kangra district a tax on goats and sheep is levied.

**Mr. President :** Order, order, that is not before the House.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Sir, my object in moving this resolution is to draw once more the attention of Government to this matter. With these words, I request the Government to do justice to the claims of the zamindars of the Kangra district and I entreat my zamindar colleagues to extend their heartiest support to my resolution.

**Mr. President :** The resolution moved is—

“This Council recommends to the Government that the zamindars of the Kangra district be given a share of the income derived from resin produced in the *shamilat* forests.”

**Mr. H. Calvert (Financial Commissioner) :** The honourable mover of this resolution has very carefully abstained from making the slightest effort to explain what he means. The resolution asks for a share of the income derived from the resin produced in the *shamilat* forests and he has not explained how the income is derived.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** He has explained.

**Mr. H. Calvert :** He has not mentioned what income he wishes to share. The resin obtained from all these trees is sold on the actual cost-price and Government makes no profit here. Now, Sir, this resolution like so many resolutions of this Council asks that a source of revenue of the State should be taken away and given to a few favoured people. That is to say, the honourable mover proposes that the constituents of all members of this Council should be robbed of their share of a state asset in order that his constituents may gain a small sum. And whenever a proposal is made to rob the people as a whole in order to benefit a very small minority I think that proposal requires very careful and very great scrutiny. Now, Sir, the honourable member repeated to-day what he said two and-a-half years ago that the zamindars of the Kangra district had rights in the trees in *shamilat* forests. That is absolutely incorrect. The debate on the previous occasion turned on the question of the right of the people to the trees. The Council was told by my distinguished predecessor that the zamindars of Kangra had no rights in the trees on *shamilat* forests. The members who on that occasion supported the

[ Mr. H. Calvert. ]

honourable mover harped on the question of rights. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal stated it was a question of right and Raja Narendra Nath said if zamindars had a right in the trees they had a right to the resin, and, in general, the discussion was based on the assumption that the zamindars of these forests had proprietary rights in the trees. But they have not any right and they never had any either now or at any time under the British Government or the Rajas.....

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Did the zamindars of Kangra ever get a share in the price of the trees that were sold from the *shamilats* ?

**Mr. H. Calvert :** That is perfectly irrelevant to the point at issue. The question is whether they have rights in these trees. They have no right. It is as a pure act of grace that any agreement has been made whereby these zamindars of the Kangra district receive a share of the sale of these trees on the consideration that they render assistance to the Forest Department, and they do not get that share if they by their conduct show that they are not helping the Forest Department. They have no right to that share which they can bring to the court of law. It is an act of grace.

**Lala Mukand Lal, Puri :** Is the entire sale price distributed or only a portion of the sale price ?

**Mr. H. Calvert :** They get only a portion of the sale proceeds.

The trees on the forests belong to the State, and by the State I mean the public at large. They are a State asset and the resin in those trees is, therefore, a State asset ; it belongs to the public at large. Now, Sir, let us assume for a moment that the whole foundation of the honourable member's argument was right and that the zamindars did own the trees or held proprietary rights in the *shamilat* forests. Let us assume for the time being that that is correct and see how it affects the question of resin. What is given to the zamindars in Kangra is a share in the sale proceeds of the trees. There are no net sale proceeds of resin. The very fact that there are sale proceeds of the trees shows that the trees have a value.....

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** What do you do with the resin which you take out ?

**Mr. H. Calvert :** That the honourable mover has not mentioned.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** I want the honourable member to explain that. It is said that there are no sale proceeds of the resin. The question is, what is done with the resin that is obtained from these trees ?

**Mr. H. Calvert :** The resin is sold to a co-partnership at Jallo. The price is paid by the co-partnership, which is under agreement to pay a certain sum which is sufficient to pay the whole cost of collection and transport. By a further agreement that co-partnership in Jallo gives to Government a portion of their profits which you might call a royalty on the resin. It must be clearly understood that resin in the trees has no value at all. The whole cost of resin delivered at Jallo is the cost of extraction, collection and transport.

Now, Sir, up to a few years ago resin had no value at all in the Punjab. There was very small demand for it. Resin has in the past had no value at all. There was no market in the Punjab for resin. In that agreement, which

I have mentioned, between the Jallo co-partnership and Government the zamindars have no part. The agreement is between Government on the one hand and the co-partnership on the other. This Jallo concern is a semi-private concern. So long as Government retains an interest in the Jallo factory that Jallo factory is more or less bound to buy its resin from Government. A very similar parallel is fishing in the sea or in the rivers. Fish has no value in the sea or rivers at all. If then the zamindars of any particular district claim one-fourth or a share of the fish caught by the fishermen, I do not think anyone in this Council will support it. There is in Kangra a very considerable amount of ore. It is at present of no market value at all, none whatever. If an enterprising firm starts extracting that metal, are we to expect that the company will be asked to give a share of its proceeds to zamindars?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Why not?

**Mr. H. Calvert :** Because the ore belongs to the State, to the public at large and not to any particular district. At present the income, whatever Government makes from this resin, goes to the public at large and not to any section of the public.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** If copper is extracted from a piece of land which belongs to a zamindar and a factory is established to extract that copper and to make it marketable, does the Honourable Financial Commissioner mean to say that the zamindar will have no right to claim so much of the profit?

**Mr. H. Calvert :** But resin is not on the same basis as a treasure trove or a mine. The main line of my argument is this, that various products are of no value at all unless some enterprising firm or the State proceeds to put up machinery and utilise them. It is only then that they become of value. Resin has no value unless it is bought by the Jallo factory. There is no other market for resin in the province at all. Whatever value resin has is due to State enterprise. It is not due to any action on the part of the zamindars of the Kangra district. The State on behalf of the public at large has secured a market for resin and so has created on behalf of the public at large a value for resin. If to-morrow the Jallo factory is closed down for lack of profit, resin again ceases to have any market value at all.

Now, Sir, there are in Kangra and elsewhere trees on proprietary lands, trees on zamindars' own lands. Do these zamindars extract resin from their own trees in Kangra? No, Sir. Why do they not extract resin from their own trees? There is no prohibition. There is resin in trees on zamindars' own lands in the Pathankot tahsil of Gurdaspur district. Do the zamindars of Pathankot extract resin from the trees on their own lands? No, Sir. Why not? When the zamindars have trees on their own lands, why do they not extract resin from them? There is resin available in the trees of the forests in Murree owned by zamindars. Do they extract that resin from those trees? No, Sir. Why not? The zamindars do not extract it for the simple reason that it does not pay to extract it.

It is assumed by the honourable member, and probably also assumed by his supporters that Government have promised to give a share of what-



[ Mr. H. Calvert. ]

ever income they derive indirectly from this Kangra resin. That is not correct. There is at present more resin available than the market would absorb. I believe Mr. Blascheck will tell you that it is a question whether Government should not confine its resin operations to its own reserved and protected forests in which case of course the Kangra zamindars would lose not only whatever the honourable mover claims for them but the income that they derive from the tapping of trees.

I have tried to make it as clear as I could that there is no question whatever of the zamindars of the Kangra district having any proprietary rights in these trees. The honourable mover got over the point by using the word *jangalat* when he said the zamindars owned the *jangalat*. Well, Sir, that is a comprehensive word. The zamindars certainly own the land. They have a right to certain produce, but no one has ever asserted nor has it been decreed that they have any proprietary rights in these trees. The zamindars of Kangra have never to my knowledge even asserted their right in these trees. There is no case as far as I know that has ever been brought into court or decided for or against them. They have not brought any case for the right in these trees. The whole value of resin depends solely on State enterprise and whatever value it has is due entirely and wholly to the factory at Jallo, and therefore the State on behalf of the public at large has complete claim to whatever that Jallo factory can yield to-day by way of profit.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** It has been argued by the Financial Commissioner that the zamindars have no proprietary rights. May I ask the honourable member what the entries in the record-of-rights are relating to these forests ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The entries are that Government is the owner of the forests.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal [North-East Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Urban] :** I am disappointed at the speech made by the Financial Commissioner. I was under the impression that the matter is so trivial that Government would readily agree to the demands of the zamindars of the Kangra district. When we discussed the resolution last time in 1927, if I remember rightly, the amount involved was about Rs. 1,800, and the only difficulty which the Government pointed out was how to distribute it. The trees in these lands may not belong to zamindars as the Financial Commissioner submits, but he admits that whenever the trees are sold one-fourth share of the sale proceeds of those trees is paid by Government to the zamindars. When the zamindars of the Kangra district can get one-fourth share of the sale proceeds of the trees, I fail to understand why they should not get a share of the resin sold which is a product of these trees. Can Government justly deny the demand of the Kangra district ? I respectfully submit that it cannot.

One argument that has been advanced by the Financial Commissioner is that this is a public asset and if the money is paid to the zamindars of the Kangra district, then of course the public at large will suffer. At the same time the honourable Financial Commissioner tells us that there is no profit out of it. He has told us that the sale proceeds cover the cost of extraction and transport to the Jallo factory. If that is the case, where is the harm for



Government to admit that when there is a profit that profit will be shared by the zamindars as in the case of trees? If there are no profits from the sale proceeds, the zamindars cannot claim any. They are not asking Government that it should pay them whether there are any profits or not. What they say is that just as Government pays them one-fourth of the sale proceeds of trees, they should be able to share the profits from resin. May I know if it is not a fact that Government purchases resin not only from Kashmir but from other States also? Why is Government buying resin from them? From what I know of the Jallo factory, it has made profits of about 200 per cent. during the war. Now it is not a losing concern. The co-partner is getting a share of the profit out of the Jallo concern. I have not seen the arrangement, but it is my information that the firm or individual shall have capital supplied for carrying on the show and the agreement between the Government and that firm is that they should share the profits after meeting the expenses, and according to my information, large profits are being made. In those circumstances I fail to see how Government can say that there is no profit at all. What the Kangra zamindars want is, and they do not lay claim to anything more than this, that if the Government has acknowledged the right of the zamindars to the sale proceeds of trees that stand on the land, then they should also have a share in the same proportion to the profits out of resin which is a product of those trees. This is only a reasonable demand on their part. I need not repeat that the position of Government in this matter is very weak. It is a pity that the Council should have carried through this resolution and yet the Government should not have given effect to it. This present resolution as pointed out by the honourable mover is only a request to Government to give effect to the resolution that was passed by the Council by a majority.

The Honourable Financial Commissioner has put forward an argument, supposing to-morrow iron or copper ore or any other mineral is found in the land, would the zamindars be entitled to that also? That analogy, I submit, is not quite correct. So far as I remember, the minerals under the ground belong to the State. In this particular case as I already submitted, the Government has acknowledged the right of the zamindars, not now, but several years ago, to a share in the proceeds of the trees and it is only fair that Government should give the zamindars a proportionate share in the profits of resin which is a product of those trees. I may point out that the zamindars of the Kangra district are the poorest in the province. They have given the best of their sons for the army and that is another consideration why the Government should concede the claims of the zamindars. I, therefore, strongly appeal to the Government to give the matter their very serious consideration and accede to the wishes of the poor zamindars of the Kangra district. I strongly support the resolution that has been moved by the honourable member for Kangra.

**Mr. Din Muhammad** [East and West Central Towns (Muhammadan), Urban]: Sir, I am sorry I am constrained to oppose this resolution. It is not at all necessary to heat about the bush in this matter nor to advance any arguments which are altogether irrelevant for the disposal of this question. It has been emphatically urged that the zamindars of the Kangra district have absolutely no proprietary right in the forests or in the trees that grow in those forests. This being a question of disputed ownership, I fail

[ Mr. Din Muhammad. ]

to understand how it is possible that this House can arrogate to itself the functions of a court of law and decide one way or the other as to which party is entitled to the proprietorship of these forests. If the record of rights clearly mentions the Government as the sole proprietor of those forests, naturally the trees would belong to the Government; and unless it is established in a court of law that Government has absolutely no right and unless those zamindars seek protection in a regular manner and have their rights declared over those forests or over the trees in those forests, it is clearly unimaginable that this House would be in a position to declare one way or another. It is no argument to say that this resolution was accepted by the Council in its Simla session. The honourable members who supported the resolution then did not properly understand the question. That would not therefore establish any precedent and that would not help us in the disposal of this question. It is no doubt true that some of the arguments employed by the Honourable Financial Commissioner are not cogent and are not sound; it is no argument to say that because a certain article has no innate value therefore the real owners should be deprived of the ownership of that article, however, valueless it may be. Nor is it an argument to say that because some zamindars in Pathankot or Murree do not extract resin from their forests and it is Government enterprise alone that makes it possible in Kangra, therefore, the Government alone is entitled to it. With all respect to the Financial Commissioner, I would submit that these are not the arguments to employ while refusing a case which has been put forward by the honourable member for Kangra. If the trees belong to the zamindars of the forests they are justified in asking for the price of the resin. The whole question therefore is one of ownership to be decided by a court of law and if a court of law declares the rights of the zamindars and the honourable member comes afterwards to this House with this resolution, then this House will bring pressure upon the Government so that justice might be done to them. With these remarks I oppose the resolution moved by the honourable member for Kangra.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang** [North-West Towns (Non-Muhammadian), (Urban)] (Urdu) : Sir, this resolution before the House does not really affect a matter of very great importance. I was just trying to go through the speeches made on the last occasion and I find from the speech of Mr. Barron, one of the distinguished predecessors of the present Financial Commissioner, that the total income derived from the sale of resin came to Rs. 1,547 at the rate of three annas and six pies per maund which the Government secured from the Jallo factory and if, on the same basis as applied to the distribution of income from the sale of trees, one-fourth of the income should go to the zamindars it would come to less than Rs. 400 and the reasons given by the then Financial Commissioner were that the amount was so small that it would be very difficult to distribute it among the zamindars who probably numbered some thousands. But a solution to this difficulty has been suggested. It may not be necessary to distribute one anna per zamindar per annum. This income of the share of the zamindars may be kept in deposit by the Government, free of interest if necessary, and when the amount becomes distributable easily, then it may be divided among the zamindars. If even this cannot be done, I would make a suggestion, though I do not know whether it would appeal to the honourable mover of this resolution. My suggestion is that the

share of the zamindars may be kept apart and may be spent solely for the benefit of the zamindars of the Kangra district, say some special facilities may be provided for the zamindars in the form of hospitals or poor houses or a widows and orphans home and so on. If this suggestion would appeal to the Government and the honourable member for Kangra, I think some assurance to this effect may be given by the authorities concerned. I should not be surprised if the honourable mover withdraws the resolution on that assurance. With these remarks I support the resolution.

**Mr. A. D. Blascheck** (Chief Conservator of Forests): Sir, I should like to preface what I have got to say by giving to the Council information about the area of the forests in the Kangra district. I myself have had some difficulty in understanding exactly what is meant by *shamilat* forests, that is to say the classes of forests included in this term '*shamilat*.' In the Kangra district there are reserve forests of a total area of about 16,000 acres. There are demarcated protected forests with an area of about 175,000 acres. There are undemarcated protected forests with an area of 480,000 acres. There are so-called unclassified forests making a total of 114,000 acres. These forests are entirely the property of the Government, though in some cases the ownership of the villagers in the soil is recognised. There are also certain rights admitted and freely exercised by the villagers. These rights have in no way been interfered with, perhaps I should say with one exception. In about the year 1872 or 1875 reserve forests were created in some villages of two tahsils of the Kangra district. In taking up these reserve forests which were free of all rights Government granted certain additional rights in the forests in those same villages which remained as unclassified forests. Among those new rights was the right to a third or a quarter of the sale proceeds of timber. In the majority of the villages of the Kangra district, there are no reserved forests and so no unclassified forests. There are protected forests, that is to say, they come under Chapter IV of the Forest Act. These protected forests may be either demarcated or undemarcated. From the figures I have given, you will understand that the bulk are undemarcated, and I might say, to a large extent worthless, certainly they can produce no resin, because there are no trees or only very few trees that can produce resin. It would certainly not be worth while to tap those few trees. Now in the villages where there are protected forests as opposed to reserves, a voluntary grant was made by Government, not in recognition of any right in the soil, but with a view to securing the interest and co-operation of the people in the protection and general conservancy of the forests. That was a voluntary grant and it has definitely been stated many years ago that it was in no sense a right. Since some mention has been made of the Hoshiarpur district forests, I would at once like to say that the position is entirely different there. In the Una tahsil of the Hoshiarpur district forest reserves were created and when that was done, Government relinquished all right in the remaining forests. Some years ago, perhaps six years ago, tapping was started in some of these unclassified forests. It was brought to my notice that really Government had no right to tap for resin in those unclassified forests. Since then no tapping has been done in those areas either by Government or the villagers. Certainly the villagers could not afford to tap in these areas. It seems then, that these payments of a quarter share in the protected forests is definitely a payment for services rendered.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** May I draw your attention, Sir, to the fact that it is now six o'clock ?

**Mr. President :** The Council will go on till the honourable member finishes his speech.

**Mr. A. D. Blascheck :** In the Hoshiarpur forest outside the reserved areas all rights were abandoned. I would also like to say that apart from this grant of a share in the profits from timbers from the protected forest it has been definitely laid down that the share may be withheld. This is what is actually done. It is not merely in theory but in practice that the quarter share of sales from protected forest is withheld ; for instance in cases where villagers have failed to protect their forests from fire. About 20 thousand maunds of resin are collected in the demarcated and undemarcated, protected and unclassified forests of the Kangra district and it seems to me that it is a greater consideration for the local people who are mostly poor and dependent on very poor class of agriculture that they should get employment and the wages that go with this resin tapping than that they should get a share in a very small problematic profit on the distillation of resin. I would like to give some figures. The cost of collecting, packing and transport of resin from the Kangra forest to Jallo is on an average Rs. 4-8-0, and out of this sum, Rs. 1-8-0 is spent on wages to local people. Annas four is spent on supervision and packing mostly done by local people. Re. 1 is spent on local transport, annas four is the cost of Forest Department supervision, and annas four is the Railway freight. You will see from these figures that about Rs. 2-12-0 to Rs. 3 per maund is spent in the Kangra district. Taking the outturn 20 to 25 thousand maunds annually it means that 50 thousand to 75 thousand rupees is spent locally and employment is found for people who are very poor and glad to pick up any wages they can. Now, Sir, if any share were granted, a share in any profit made by the Jallo concern, which is not a Government concern but a co-partnership concern, it will at once follow that in certain areas it would not be profitable to tap trees for resin, that is to say, the people who really work in those forests would lose their employment and lose their wages. I have calculated what might possibly be the share to be granted to the villagers and I find that it would be from five to six thousand rupees.

**Mr. President :** Question is—

“ This Council recommends to the Government that the zamindars of the Kangra district be given a share of the income derived from resin produced in the *shamilat* forests.”

The Council divided : Ayes 14 ; Noes 93.

AYES.

Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal.  
Chaudhri Ram Singh.  
Pandit Nanak Chand.  
Lala Mukand Lal, Puri.  
Lala Jyoti Prasad.

Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.  
Sardar Buta Singh.  
Chaudhri Afzal Haq.  
Sardar Hira Singh, Narli.  
Sardar Partap Singh.  
Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh.  
Sardar Bishan Singh.

## NOES.

Mr. A. D. Blascheck.	Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie.
Mr. H. Calvert.	Mr. H. W. Emerson.
Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.	Dr. (Mrs.) M. C. Shave.
The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon.	Mr. S. L. Sale.
Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar Khan.	Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah.
Mr. W. R. Wilson.	Mr. Din Muhammad.
Mr. R. Sanderson.	Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram.
Mr. W. S. Dorman.	Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan.
Mr. M. A. Ghani.	Chaudhri Duli Chand.
Mr. H. F. Ashton.	Chaudhri Ali Ahmad.
The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal.	Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali.
The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh.	Mian Nurullah.
The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow.	Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi.
The Honourable Mian Sir Fazi-i- Husain.	Chaudhri Umar Hayat.
Mr. Alan Mitchell.	Khan Bahadur Sardar Habib Ullah.
Mr. J. D. Penny.	Sardar Bahadur Captain Dalpat Singh.
	Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sheo Narain Singh.

The motion was lost.

The Council then adjourned till 2 p.m. on Thursday, the 27th February, 1930.

SECRET

4492

[illegible]

PRINTED BY

THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.

878 PLC-600-22-3-30-SGPP Lahore.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Thursday, the 27th February 1930.*

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following member was sworn in :—

Colonel Gill, C.A. (Official Nominated).

### STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

#### ENCOURAGEMENT OF GLASS INDUSTRY IN THE PUNJAB.

**\*2837. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Upper India Glass Works, Ambala City, is the largest, if not the only, glass factory at present running in the province ;
- (b) whether the Government Officers concerned have inspected the above factory and its products ;
- (c) whether Government have taken any measures to render any help to this concern ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) The Industries Department has recommended—

- (a) the registration of the name of the Upper India Glass Works, Ambala City, as approved contractors to the Chief Controller of Stores, Indian Stores Department, and the Director of Contracts, Army Headquarters ; and
- (ii) the works to the following Departments with a view to popularising its goods :—
  - (1) The Controller of Stores, North-Western Railway, Mughalpura.
  - (2) The Inspector-General of Prisons, Punjab.
  - (3) The Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Punjab.
  - (4) Secretaries of all Municipalities and Notified Areas in the Punjab.

## ENCOURAGEMENT OF GLASS INDUSTRY IN THE PUNJAB.

**\*2838. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state if it is a fact that the employment of boys is necessary in glass factories ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Yes, but to the same extent as in other factories.

## TRAINING IN GLASS MANUFACTURE IN THE PUNJAB.

**\*2839. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) whether there are any arrangements in existence to provide training in glass manufacture in the Punjab ;
- (b) if the answer to (a) is in the negative, how does Government intend to provide for the need ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) No.

(b) There has been no demand in the past, but Government will be prepared to consider the question of providing facilities for training in glass manufacture, in case of a genuine demand.

## CONSTITUTION OF INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT BOARD IN THE PUNJAB.

**\*2840. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether there is any standing board to consider measures for development of industries in the Punjab ;
- (b) if so, what is the constitution of this board ;
- (c) whether the present constitution ensures representation of all the principal industries of the province and if so, how is the glass industry represented in this board.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) and (b) It is not clear what the honourable member intends to convey by a "standing board to consider measures for development of industries in the Punjab." But in this connection his attention is invited to Punjab Government notification No. 994-D, dated 22nd February 1927, as subsequently amended, a copy of which is laid on the table, constituting the Joint Development Board for the purpose of studying and from time to time advising Government as regards the development of industries.

(c) The industrial representatives are selected with due regard to the interests of all the principal industries of the Province. There is no direct representative of the glass industry on the Board, but it is not possible to select a separate representative for each industry.

## PRESIDENT :

- (1) The Honourable Minister for Agriculture.

## VICE-PRESIDENTS :

- (2) The Honourable Minister for Education.
- (3) The Financial Commissioner and Secretary to Government, Punjab, Development Department.



## MEMBERS :

*Officials.*

- (1) The Director of Agriculture, Punjab.
- (2) The Agricultural Engineer.
- (3) The Principal, Mayo School of Arts, Lahore.
- (4) The Principal, MacLagan Engineering College, Moghalpura.

## NON-OFFICIALS :

*Representatives of Industrial Interests.*

- (1) Lala HARKISHAN LAL, Bar.-at-Law of Lahore.
- (2) The Honourable Rai Bahadur Lala RAM SARAN DAS of Lahore.
- (3) Sir DAYA KISHAN KAUL of Lahore.
- (4) Mr. L. LEWIS of Dhariwal.
- (5) Lieutenant Sardar SIKANDAR HAYAT KHAN, M.B.E., of Wah.
- (6) Rai Bahadur Lala DHANPAT RAI of Lahore.

*Representatives of Agricultural Interests.*

- (1) Mr. W. ROBERTS, British Cotton Growing Association, Khanewal.
- (2) Colonel COLE, Coleyana Estate, District Montgomery.
- (3) Diwan Bahadur Raja NARENDRA NATH, of Lahore.
- (4) Chaudhri ZAFRULLAH KHAN, Bar.-at-Law, M.L.C., Lahore.
- (5) Sardar GURBACHAN SINGH, Rais of Alawalpur (district Jullundur).
- (6) Khan Bahadur Chaudhri FAZL ALI, M.L.C., M.B.E., of Gujrat.
- (7) S. BISHEN SINGH, M.L.C., Singhpura, Tahsil Batala (district Gurdaspur).

The Director of Industries, Punjab (*Secretary*).

## JAGADHRI TOWN HALL.

**\*2841. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the local Congress Committee wanted to have the use of the Jagadhri Town Hall for Independence day meeting on the 26th January 1930 ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the President of the Committee called police to Jagadhri on the 26th ; if so, why and what was the cost ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) The local Congress Committee notified the Municipal Committee of their intention to hoist the national flag on the platform in front of the Town Hall of Jagadhri on the 26th January 1930.

(b) The Municipal Committee replied in writing<sup>r</sup> objecting to the proposal, and at the same time asked the district authorities to make the necessary arrangements to prevent a breach of the peace. It is understood that the Police force at Jagadhri was strengthened for the occasion by deputing

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan, Noon.]

additional men from headquarters and any expenditure incurred on the travelling allowance of these men will have been met from the ordinary police budget.

LAHORE CONSPIRACY CASE. CONDUCT OF THE SPECIAL MAGISTRATE  
TOWARDS LALA DUNI CHAND.

\*2842. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq** : Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Lala Duni Chand, Bar.-at-law, was not allowed to sit in the Court Room as legal adviser of S. Bhagat Singh and other Conspiracy Case prisoners ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Lahore Bar Association condemned the action of the Special Magistrate who refused to allow Lala Duni Chand to sit in his Court ;
- (c) what action, if any, the Government is taking in the matter ;
- (d) whether the Government has been informed of any action taken by the High Court against the Special Magistrate on the censure motion of Lahore Bar Association ;
- (e) whether the High Court moved the executive Government to take action against the Magistrate ;
- (f) whether the Government moved the High Court to take some action against the Magistrate ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** : (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) The matter is still under the consideration of Government.

(d) No.

(e) No.

(f) No.

CONSPIRACY CASE PRISONERS—HUNGER STRIKE THREATENED.

\*2843. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq** : Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that S. Bhagat Singh and other Conspiracy Case prisoners sent a long letter to the Home Member of the Government of India threatening to resort to hunger strike if no action is taken on the Jails Enquiry Committee reports within a week ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that all the reports of the Provincial Committees are now published ;
- (c) whether the Punjab Government has enquired into the causes of so much delay on the part of the Government of India in coming to any decision on the Jails Committees Reports ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) The report of the Punjab Committee has been published but Government is unable to state whether all the reports of other Provinces have yet been published.

(c) No.

CASES UNDER SECTIONS 107 AND 109, CRIMINAL PROCEDURE CODE IN  
HOSHIARPUR AND JULLUNDUR.

**\*2844. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

(a) the number of ex-soldiers arrested under sections 107 and 109, Criminal Procedure Code, in the months of November and December 1929 in Hoshiarpur and Jullundur districts ;

(b) whether it is a fact that cases under sections 109 and 107, Criminal Procedure Code were started in both districts to check the ex-soldiers from joining *jathas* that were being organised by S. Anup Singh ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Fourteen ex-soldiers were arrested under section 107, Criminal Procedure Code, in the Hoshiarpur and Jullundur districts. No arrests of ex-soldiers were made under section 109, Criminal Procedure Code, during this period in either district.

(b) These arrests were made to prevent the disturbance of public tranquillity.

SARDAR RANDHIR SINGH,—PROSECUTION UNDER SECTION 380, INDIAN PENAL  
CODE.

**\*2845. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that Sardar Randhir Singh of Ralwa, district Jullundur, has been prosecuted under section 380, Indian Penal Code, along with another accused ;

(b) whether it is a fact that they have been awaiting their trial for more than seven months in the Jullundur jail ;

(c) whether it is a fact that even after 80 *peskis* the case was neither decided nor accused were let on bail ;

(d) what is the cause of so much delay in disposing of this case ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** Full details are not yet to hand. They will be communicated to the honourable member as soon as received.

PRISONERS IN JULLUNDUR JAIL.

**\*2846. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

(a) the number of prisoners in the Jullundur jail that are awaiting trial for more than three months ;

(b) whether it is a fact that in the Jullundur district criminal cases are not disposed of as speedily as in other districts ;

(c) if so, what is the cause ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) On 20th February 1930, there were 28 prisoners in 12 cases whose trial had been pending over three months.

(b) No. The transfer of three magistrates in September and October last caused some dislocation of work, but it is now in hand.

(c) Does not arise.

#### BEGGARY COMMITTEE.

**\*2847. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) for how long the report of the Beggary Committee has been under the consideration of the Government ;

(b) what action, if any, the Government have decided to take on the report of the Committee?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) The report of the Beggary Committee was considered by Government in June 1929.

(b) Government issued a letter to all Commissioners in the Punjab inviting through them the opinion of the various local bodies on the problem of begging. A copy of this letter is placed on the table.

Copy of a letter No. 28522 (L. S.-G.—Comts.), dated 13th September 1929, from Alan Mitchell, Esq., I.C.S., Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab, Transferred Departments, to all Commissioners of Divisions in the Punjab, on the subject of the Problem of beggary.

I am directed to inform you that the Punjab Government (Ministry of Local-Self Government) have for some time had under consideration the question of whether any measures were possible to deal with the problem of beggary as it exists in the towns and villages of the Punjab, and a committee was accordingly convened to discuss the matter in all its bearings and to submit a report to Government. The committee's report has now reached Government, and I am to enclose a copy thereof for your information.

2. Government have taken the report into consideration and have decided that all Commissioners should be asked to call the attention of the local bodies in their divisions to the existence of the problem and to the facts elicited during the discussions held by the committee, and should invite the considered opinions of the various local bodies on the problem as a whole.

3. It will be seen that during the course of the discussions the committee invited the presidents of certain of the larger municipalities to be present, and the information given by these gentlemen as to the conditions in the larger towns proved to be of great interest. There was a consensus of opinion that the matter was of urgent importance in Lahore and other large towns as all streets, bazzars, and public gardens were frequented by beggars and such municipal committees as had been giving their attention

to the matter, considered that they were practically powerless to act owing to having insufficient powers. In this connection, however, I am to observe that the Punjab Municipal Act, 1911, contains certain provisions for dealing with the difficulty, and the attention of municipal committees should be drawn to section 151 of that Act, and they should be asked to consider the advisability of taking action under that section against able-bodied beggars in the more important thoroughfares.

4. I am further to request that the attention of municipal committees should be drawn to the fact that poor houses are included among the institutions, to the establishment and maintenance of which the municipal fund may be applied under the provisions of section 52 (2) (c) of the Municipal Act, and that enquiries should be made to ascertain the extent to which such poor houses are already in existence and whether further steps should be taken to extend their scope and render them more efficient. Government are in particular desirous of obtaining the views of municipal committees as to the utility of poor houses in connection with the problem of infirm and deceased mendicants who have no other means of subsistence except the alms of the charitable.

5. Another important aspect of the case, on which Government desire to learn the views of the local bodies, is the question of begging by children. This naturally falls into two divisions. There is the case of children who are sent out by their parents or other persons having control of them to beg for the benefit of their parents or controllers, and there is the case of children who appear to be waifs begging on their own account and without parents or guardians. Opinions are invited as to the action possible in the former case, and as to whether in the latter case local bodies should be given powers to place such children in orphanages or poor houses.

6. It is realized, however, that the real crux of the problem lies in the question of religious mendicants and in the immense difficulty that would be experienced in attempting to discriminate between genuine religious mendicants and their fraudulent imitators, should any legislation be introduced with exceptions in favour of medicancy sanctioned by religious usage. It will be seen that the committee were of opinion that the control of begging inside shrines and other religious institutions and in their immediate neighbourhood could be left to the trustees of such institutions, but that in the streets and public places religious mendicants could not be treated differently from other beggars. One member of the committee, however, dissented from this view, and held that special provisions must be made in any legislation in connection with this class of beggars. I am to ask, therefore, that in submitting their recommendations for dealing with the problem local bodies may be asked to concentrate special attention upon this very difficult aspect of the question.

7. In conclusion, I am to ask that the opinion of all local bodies should be invited as to the necessity of conferring on local bodies the power to impose special taxation in the nature of a poor cess to finance any measures, which it may ultimately be found desirable to take in connection with this problem.

## POLITICAL PRISONERS IN MAINWALI JAIL.

**\*2848. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of political prisoners confined in Mianwali jail and the names of those among them who are still treated as special class prisoners ;
- (b) whether any daily newspaper is provided to them ;
- (c) what special diet is given to the special class prisoners, if any, in Mianwali jail ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) If the honourable member is referring to persons convicted under section 124-A, Indian Penal Code, the number is five, out of whom Deoki Nandan is still being treated as a special class prisoner.

(b) Yes, to Deoki Nandan.

(c) Deoki Nandan is supplementing the jail diet with *ghee*, sugar and milk.

## POLITICAL CONVICTS.

**\*2849. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of those political convicts in 1929 who have not committed any overt act of violence and had merely been sentenced for expression of opinion ;
- (b) whether Government intends to release all such political prisoners who have been sentenced for mere expression of opinion ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) If the honourable member means the number of persons convicted under section 124-A of the Indian Penal Code, the answer is 28.

(b) If the honourable member's enquiry relates to persons convicted under section 124-A of the Indian Penal Code the answer is in the negative.

## INDISCREET USE OF LATHIS BY POLICE.

**\*2850. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state whether the Government have issued any orders to the Police for not using lathi indiscreetly when dispersing any unlawful assembly or mob ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The instructions issued by Government concerning the use of force by the Police against crowds lay down the principle that the degree of force used shall be the minimum which the responsible officer, with the exercise of due care and attention, decides to be necessary for the effective dispersal of the crowd and the making of such arrests as may be desired.

## ILLEGAL GRATIFICATION.

**\*2851. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state whether the Government has issued any fresh order to Government servants to stop taking illegal gratification?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** No.

## PAY OF DISTRICT TREASURERS.

**\*2852. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state whether any representations have been made by the District Treasurers that their pay be increased and more staff be given to them? If so, what action has been taken on their request?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The attention of the honourable member is invited to the answer given to starred question No. 2860<sup>1</sup> put by Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal in July 1929. The position is the same as it was in July last.

## BHAKRA DAM SCHEME.

**\*2853. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) the steps taken by Government in expediting Bhakra Dam scheme since March 1929—a detailed statement may kindly be laid on the table;
- (b) whether it is a fact that district boards of Hissar and Rohtak have passed resolutions requesting the Government to expedite the scheme and to allot sufficient funds for the purpose in the present budget;
- (d) what is the programme of the Government for the years 1930-31 with regard to the above scheme?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Provision of Rs. 1,89,000 was made in the Supplementary Budget of 1929-30 for the commencement of rectangulation surveys by No. 22 Party of the Survey of India and work has been undertaken accordingly. A further provision of Rs. 5,10,200 has been made in the Budget of 1930-31.

(b) Yes.

(c) Surveys by No. 22 Party of the Survey of India will continue throughout the year. Preliminaries in connection with the project have been taken in hand and every effort will be made to proceed with the project as early as practicable.

## INCOME FROM IMPOUNDING CATTLE.

**\*2854. Lala Joti Parshad :** With reference to answer to starred question No. 1822<sup>2</sup> asked on 28th February 1929, will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state the reasons for realising more than double the amount in 1928 as compared with 1927, specially when there was severe famine of fodder in the district?

<sup>1</sup>Vol. XIII, pages 265-46.

<sup>2</sup>Vol. XII, page 525.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The charges are levied upon a fixed scale sanctioned by the Government. The increase in the amount realised was due to the increase in the number of animals impounded.

REPORT OF THE PUNJAB JAILS ENQUIRY COMMITTEE.

**\*2855. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance please state—

(a) whether any action has been taken by the Government on the report of the Punjab Jails Enquiry Committee. If not, why not ;

(b) if the answer to (a) be in the affirmative, whether a statement will be laid on the table with reference to the action taken ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) None, as the orders of the Government of India on the subject were not received until February 21st.

(b) Does not arise.

HAI SIYAT TAX IN HISSAR DISTRICT.

**\*2856. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that this year the District Board, Hissar, sent up a proposal to Government for sanctioning Haisiyat tax in the Hissar district up to the grade of Rs. 50 only ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the papers have been returned by the Government with the order that highest grade should not be less than Rs. 500 ;

(c) if the answer to (b) be in the affirmative, what were the reasons for the Government for compelling the district board to raise the highest grade up to Rs. 500 ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) The District Board was informed that Government were not prepared to recommend to the Government of India for sanction a form of *haisiyat-tax* differing in any particular from the standard tax which the Government of India had agreed to sanction.

(c) It was not considered desirable to sanction a variation which appeared to benefit the rich at the expense of the poor.

KANGRA VALLEY RAILWAY LINE.

**\*2857. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the level-crossing between miles 44/7 and 44/8 of the Kangra Valley Railway is a source of danger to traffic of all kinds and especially to loaded animals like horses and mules ;

(b) whether it is a fact that at mile 44/8 the foundations of a bridge were dug some time ago ;



- (ii) If the answer to the above be in the affirmative, whether Government intend to construct a bridge at mile 44/8 in the near future?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Government have been advised by the Agent, North-Western Railway, as follows —

- (a) (a) It is not considered that the level crossing between miles 44/7 and 44/8 is a source of danger to loaded animals such as horses and mules, provided ordinary precautions are taken when crossing the line and that animals are properly under control ;  
 (b) No foundations for any such bridge have ever been dug or even started ;  
 (ii) The proposed site for the bridge has been carefully examined and it was considered to be a waste of money to build an overbridge for this footpath (wheeled traffic along this path is impossible). A diversion of the footpath was made and a level crossing provided about 200 yards from the original crossing site.

There are some 50 to 60 similar level crossings on the Kangra Valley Railway.

COMPENSATION FOR LAND ERODED BY THE CHAKRI.

**\*2858. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** With reference to the answer to question No. 2559<sup>1</sup> put by me on the 26th November 1929, will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the proprietors of lands have refused to accept the proposed compensation ;  
 (b) if so, why ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) They have made several allegations which have been gone into by local officers and it appears that really they hoped to make Government give them land in Nili Bar if they continued to refuse to take the cash compensation offered to them. I am sure the honourable member knew this long before now.

GOVERNMENT HELP TO THE CONGRESS EXHIBITION COMMITTEE.

**\*2859. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) what help was given by the Government to the Congress Exhibition Committee which organised the Exhibition during the Congress week in Lahore last year ;  
 (b) if no help was given will the Honourable Minister kindly state the reasons for the same ;  
 (c) whether Government will lay on the table the correspondence, if any, that it had with the Congress Exhibition Committee on this subject ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manphar Lal :** (a) Instructions were issued to the Director of Industries to furnish the Provincial Secretary, Exhibition Committee, any reasonable information which might be required regarding the indigenous products and industries of the Province, and where they are produced, but the Director of Industries was not approached by the Secretary Exhibition Committee with a view to furnish any such assistance.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) Copies of the letters received from the Provincial Secretary, Exhibition Committee, and of the Government reply are placed on the table.

---

Copy of a letter, dated Simla, the 20th July 1928, from Dr. Gopi CHAND, Bhargava, Provincial Secretary Exhibition Committee to the Hon ble Minister for Education, Punjab Government, Simla.

The Congress is arranging an Exhibition this year in December. I am authorised to request you to let us know the help the Government is prepared to give us.

We want help in supplying us information regarding articles produced in India, their collection, &c., as well as help from Mayo School of Arts people and the Museum, Lahore.

An early reply shall highly oblige.

Thanking you.

---

Copy of a letter No. 90, dated the 23rd September 1929, from the General Secretary, Reception Committee, 44th Indian National Congress, Lahore, to W. R. WILSON, Esquire, Secretary (Industries), Simla.

Sometime back, in the meeting of Standing Committee of Industries. I gave you a letter, requesting you to co-operate with us in the Industrial Exhibition work. I wanted you to order the Director to help us, as well as place the use of Museum and the Mayo School of Arts at our disposal. Please let me know as to what you have decided in the matter. An early reply shall highly oblige.

Thanking you.

---

Copy of a letter No. 66-71-3, dated the 8th October 1929, from the Punjab Government to Dr. Gopi CHAND, Bhargava, General Secretary, Reception Committee, Indian National Congress (Provincial) Secretary, Exhibition Committee).

With reference to the correspondence ending with your letter No. 90, dated the 23rd September 1929, I am directed by the Punjab Government (Ministry of Education) to intimate that instructions have been issued to the Director of Industries to supply you with any reasonable information which

may be required regarding the indigenous products and industries of the Province, and where they are produced. It is regretted that it is not possible to place the Museum and the Mayo School of Arts at your disposal in connection with the proposed Industrial Exhibition.

#### CORRUPTION IN GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENTS.

**\*2360. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that non-official members of the Council and other official organisations have time and again brought to the notice of the Government the fact that corruption is rampant in the Government departments;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Police Enquiry Committee even hinted that in other Government departments illegal gratification was on the increase;
- (c) whether Government will state the steps taken by them or intended to be taken in the future which may effectively combat this evil?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes, as far as certain non-official members of the Council are concerned.

(b) No.

(c) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to question No. 378<sup>1</sup> asked by Mr. M. A. Ghani in the November session of 1927. Government is still ready to consider any further practical methods which may be suggested.

#### LAHORE CONSPIRACY CASE PRISONERS.

**\*2361. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that two of the Lahore Conspiracy prisoners have been given cellular confinement by the Superintendent of Jail for raising revolutionary cries;
- (b) what is the period for which the prisoners can be given cellular confinement by the Superintendent of jail;
- (c) whether it is a fact that Mr. Lewis, the trying Magistrate in whose Court the cries were raised, accepted the apology of the prisoners when tendered in writing;
- (d) what is the justification for punishing the under-trial prisoners after their written apology?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) None of the prisoners in the Lahore Conspiracy Case has been given "cellular confinement." All but one of the prisoners, however, have been given "separate confinement" under the orders of the Jail Superintendent for disorderly conduct in jail.

(b) Cellular confinement can be given by the Jail Superintendent for periods of 14 days at a time.

(c) No apology, oral or written, was tendered.

(d) Does not arise.

## COLLECTION OF LOCAL RATES BY LAMBARDARS.

**\*2862. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that lambardars have to collect in addition to land revenue, local rates and cesses, mutation fees and chaukidara tax;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the treasury officials decline to receive the land revenue collections unless and until the other cesses are also paid in;
- (c) whether it is a fact that with the exception of land revenue, *pachotra* is not allowed on any of the cesses mentioned in (a) above and if so, why?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) Yes. The *pachotra* covers the carrying out of all the duties attached to the post.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Is the collection of cattle-tax and *Hasiyat*-tax also included in "all the duties"? If so, is *pachotra* allowed on these? If so, why is it not allowed on the other taxes mentioned in part (b) of the question?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** This will give rise to a long and a tedious debate.

## NOMINATION TO THE PUNJAB COUNCIL OF AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH.

**\*2863. Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that among the members nominated by the Government on the Punjab Council of Agricultural Research there is not a single member with practical knowledge of agriculture;
- (b) if so, what are the reasons?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please name the gentlemen coming under the category?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** If the honourable member will see the list he will find there are members representing agriculture.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** There is no such member on the list.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** Will the honourable member please read out the names please?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** The list is not with me. Have any other new members been added to the list?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** No other members than those appearing in the notification.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister please name the members who possess this qualification?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** If the honourable member means agriculturists by profession and birth, I am sure I myself can claim to be one.

#### BHAKRA DAM SCHEME.

**\*2864. Rana Feroz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state what progress has been made in the Bhakra Dam scheme in the course of the current year since the passing of the resolution in this connection in the last Budget session ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Provision of Rs. 1,89,000 was made in the Supplementary Budget of 1929-30 for the commencement of rectangulation surveys by No. 22 Party of the Survey of India and work has been undertaken accordingly. A further provision of Rs. 5,10,200 has been made in the Budget for 1930-31.

#### HALF REMISSIONS IN LOWER BARI DOAB CANAL COLONY.

**\*2865. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Government has decided to discontinue half remissions of water rate in the Lower Bari Doab Canal Colony after the current *kharif* 1929 ; if so, why ;
- (b) whether this decision applies to all irrigation divisions irrespective of the quality of land ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that a great portion of the area in this colony, specially in Montgomery and Khanewal tahsils, comprises of inferior land which was allotted on half resumable or *hara* conditions or sold in auction on long instalments from 1922 to 1928 ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes. The rules under which half remissions were granted were intended to cover the period of development of the canal when water supply was precarious. This condition no longer holds.

(b) Yes.

(c) No. Only a little more than ten per cent.

#### HALF REMISSIONS ON LOWER JHELUM AND CHENAB CANALS.

**\*2866. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) the period for which the practice of half remissions was allowed on Lower Jhelum and Lower Chenab Canals ;
- (b) whether half remissions are still allowed on these canals in any particular area ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) From *kharif* 1906 to *rabi* 1928-29, but since 1918 only in particular areas where the water supply was deemed to be precarious.

(b) Yes, but only in the case of a widespread calamity affecting large areas.

## UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

## DISTRICT BOARD SCHOOL, NAKODAR.

**1498. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether any proposals have been received to provincialise the district board school at Nakodar ;  
 (b) if so, what action is being taken on them ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) No provision is made in the Budget of 1930-31 for the provincialisation of schools owing to the financial stringency.

## WARABANDI FOR CHAK NO. 638.

**1499. Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that application for fixing an authorised distribution of water (warabandi) for Chak No. 638, situated on Rajbaha Dangali, Upper Gugera Branch, in the Jaranwala tahsil, Lyallpur District, are pending since 1921 ;  
 (b) if so, why they have not been disposed of for such a long time ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

## PUNITIVE POLICE IN VILLAGES.

**1500. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state the names of those villages where the punitive police posts have been sanctioned in the years 1927 and 1929 ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** A statement is laid on the table.

## STATEMENT SHOWING THE NAMES OF VILLAGES WHERE PUNITIVE POLICE POSTS HAVE BEEN SANCTIONED IN THE YEAR 1927.

Serial No.	Name of district.	Name of village.
1	Karnal .. ..	Urlana Khurd, Urlana Kalan and Sink.
2	Jullundur .. ..	Nal and Sindhar.
3	Lahore .. ..	Narwar.
4	Lahore .. ..	Bhura Kuhna.
5	Lahore .. ..	Nathoke and Bohr.
6	Multan .. ..	Multan City.
7	Sialkot .. ..	Dhoda.
8	Shahpur .. ..	51-A-S. B.

Serial No.	Name of district.	Name of villages.
9	Shahpur .. ..	Choha.
10	Rawalpindi .. ..	Athal.
11	Rawalpindi .. ..	Dhok Mohri and Kallish (Dakhli Chitrah).
12	Rawalpindi .. ..	Mohra Shahwali Shah, Chila Khurd and Dheri Shahan.
13	Attock .. ..	Boliawal.
14	Sheikhupura .. ..	Malooni, Maddo, Kalkera, Thatta, Kharian, Chak No. 20 and Malka Manj.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NAMES OF VILLAGES WHERE PUNITIVE  
POLICE POSTS WERE SANCTIONED IN THE YEAR 1929.

Serial No.	Name of District.	Name of village.
1	Hissar .. ..	Kanoh.
2	Ambala .. ..	Adhoya.
3	Ambala .. ..	Rupar.
4	Ambala .. ..	Malikpur, Tapalmajra, Khawaspur, Logar Phidda, Lodhi Mojra, Ghanauli, Ghanaula, Ladol, Dakola, Dogri and Daburji.
5	Ferozepore .. ..	Hari ke Kalan.
6	Lahore .. ..	Sur Singh.
7	Amritsar .. ..	Harso Chinna.
8	Gurdaspur .. ..	Kanjur, Manjitour and Mianwali.
9	Gurdaspur .. ..	Khan Malek, Dhariwal Kalan, Dhaciwala, Chima Ratwala, Kalla Sohal, Thakar Sindhu, Kohar Tatle, Sekhwan, Mallian, Waraich, Thikriwala, Butar Kalan, Rajada, Kot Todarwal, Khara, Bhangwan, Salahpur, Balmi Bangar, Pindori, Tugnalwal, Chima, Khuddi, and Aulakh.
10	Gujranwala .. ..	Zaffarabad, Phama Sarai, Manjwali, Jagowala Kohna, Jagowala Nau, Nitbarki Dhodinwala Babbar Bokhe, Thatta Manak.
11	Jhang .. ..	Chaks Nos. 126, 127 and 128.
12	Shahpur .. ..	Chaks Nos. 162/164-N.B.
13	Shahpur .. ..	Kot Moman and Kot Raja.
14	Jhelum .. ..	Khewara.
15	Jhelum .. ..	Mangwal.
16	Mianwali .. ..	Bori Khel.

## SATTA CASES.

**1501. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state the number of satta cases challaned in each of the districts of the Punjab ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Assuming that the honourable member means the number of cases challaned under the Public Gambling (Punjab Amendment) Act, I of 1929, statistics of those cases are being collected and will be communicated to him.

## AGRICULTURISTS IN REFORMATORIES.

**1502. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of persons confined in the reformatories of the Punjab in spite of their being notified agriculturists ;
- (b) the period for which each of such persons is confined ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) and (b) Thirty-four persons belonging to notified agricultural tribes are confined in the Reformatory School, Delhi, their periods of confinement ranging from three to five years. One hundred and seventy-six belonging to notified agricultural tribes, who have been notified as members of criminal gangs, are confined variously in the Amritsar Reformatory, the Agricultural Reformatory and the other settlements under the Criminal Tribes Department. Their term of detention is fixed under the rules at five years.

## PRODUCE IN GOVERNMENT FARM.

**1503. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state what is the total value of the produce of each Government farm in the several districts of the Punjab and what is the cost excluding the cost of establishment for getting that produce ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The exact figures of the total value of the produce and of the cost of production are not available. It is difficult to separate them in experimental farms, but I am glad to give income and expenditure on Seed Farms.

Serial No.	Seed Farms.	Income.	Expenditure.
1	Sargodha .. .. .	2,282 0 0	5,176 15 6
2	Chillianwala .. .. .	10,000 0 0	4,954 9 9
3	Risala wala .. .. .	30,857 0 0	2,085 3 6
4	Shergarh .. .. .	10,924 0 0	5,867 10 9
5	Fatna .. .. .	3,056 0 0	2,682 10 9

The income shows only cash received and does not include the value of stocks in godowns.

Hissar Farm Expenditure .. Rs. 1,91,708.

Total value of produce .. Rs. 2,71,857.



## EXECUTIONS IN JAILS.

**1504. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of persons executed in the jails of the province in the years 1927, 1928 and 1929, and  
(b) the number of those that have been executed in their own district ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :—**

Year.	No.
(a) 1927	153
1928	256
1929	150
(b) 1927	94
1928	163
1929	74

## WATER SCARCITY IN HOSHIARPUR AND JULLUNDUR DISTRICTS.

**1505. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the attention of Government has been drawn to the scarcity of water in the wells of the Hoshiarpur and Jullundur districts ;  
(b) if so, what steps Government intends to take to remedy this evil ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The honourable member's attention is invited to the reply given to Question 2755<sup>1</sup> (Starred).

(b) The report of the Officers of the Irrigation Department has just been received and is under consideration.

## CORRUPTION.

**1506. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state the names of those districts from which the Government have received reports of corruption being stopped in the police and district administration ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** No such report has yet been received.

## SELECTION FOR SUB-JUDGES.

**1507. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly lay on the table of the House a statement in the following form in respect of the candidates selected recently for appointment as Sub-Judges ;

Name.	Tribes.	Place and district of residence.	Year and Division in which candidate passed L.L.B. examination.
-------	---------	----------------------------------	---

<sup>1</sup> Volume XIV, page 717.

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** A statement containing the required information is laid on the table.

**LIST OF CANDIDATES ACCEPTED FOR THE POST OF SUBORDINATE JUDGE  
IN NOVEMBER 1929.**

Serial No.	Name.	Tribes.	Place and district of residence.	Year and Division in which candidate passed LL.B.
1	Durga Pershad ..	Sodhi ..	Kunjah, District Gujrat	1924, 1st Division.
2	Shanti Lal, Ahuja..	Arora ..	Sargodha, District Shahpur.	1929, 1st Division.
3	Jowala Dass ..	Arora ..	Shmadpur Sial, District Jhang.	1926, 1st Division.
4	Tara Chand, Gupta	Jain .. Aggarwal.	Patiala State ..	1927, 2nd Division.
5	Chaudhri Muham- mad Din.	Jat ..	Village Kotla Faqiru, District Jhelum.	1927- 2nd Division.
6	Harnam Singh, Cheddah.	Sikh ..	Takht Pari, District Rawalpindi.	1925, 1st Division.
7	Ata Ullah Qureshi	Qureshi ..	Gandhra, District Gujrat	1926, 2nd Division.
8	Abdul Rashid ..	Kashmiri Sheikh.	Nurpur, District Kangra	1929, 1st Division.
9	Abdus Samad Khan	Pathan ..	Basti Danishmand, Dis- trict Jullundur.	1925- 2nd Division.
10	Mehr Singh Chaddah	Sikh ..	Takht Pari, District Rawalpindi.	1925, 1st Division.

**STATUTORY AGRICULTURIST CANDIDATES FOR SUB-JUDGES' EXAMINATION.**

**1508. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- the total number of candidates who sat for the last Sub-Judges' examination ;
- the total number of statutory agriculturists among the candidates referred to in (a) ;
- the total number of second division men who were allowed to sit for the Sub-Judges' examination ;
- the total number of (i) Statutory Agriculturists and (ii) other Hindus among the candidates referred to in (c) ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) One hundred and twenty-three (excluding 7 men from the Delhi Province).

(b) Twenty-nine.

(c) Sixty-five.

(d) (i) Twenty-three, (ii) Nine.

## COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION AMONG SUB-JUDGES.

**1509. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- (a) the total strength of Sub-Judges in the province at present ;  
 (b) the total number of Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs, respectively, among the Sub-Judges of the province and the number of statutory agriculturists under each of the three groups ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) and (b) the composition of the Punjab Civil Service (Judicial Branch) cadre as it stood on the 1st January 1930, was as follows :—

Europeans and Anglo- Indians.	MUSLIMS.		HINDUS.		SIKHS.		OTHERS.		TOTAL.
	Members of notified agricultural tribes.	Others.	Members of notified agricultural tribes.	Others.	Members of notified agricultural tribes.	Others.	Members of notified agricultural tribes.	Others.	
3	41	20	6	77	4	21	..	5	177

## COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION IN CLERICAL BRANCH OF JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

**1510. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Chief Secretary kindly state—

- (a) the total strength of the clerical establishment in the High Court ;  
 (b) the total strength of the clerical establishment in the courts subordinate to the High Court ;  
 (c) the proportion which statutory Hindu agriculturists bear to other Hindus in each of the branches referred to in (a) and (b) ;  
 (d) the causes which account for the negligible representation of statutory Hindu agriculturists in the branches referred to in (a) and (b) ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) 184.

(b) 1228.

(c) 1.1 per cent. for (a) and 18 per cent. for (b).

(d) Comparatively few statutory Hindu agriculturists possessing the requisite educational qualifications have offered themselves for these posts.

**STATUTORY HINDU AGRICULTURISTS IN POLICE SERVICE.**

**1511. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance kindly state—

- (a) the total number of Assistant Sub-Inspectors recruited so far ;
- (b) the exact number of Assistant Sub-Inspectors appointed by (i) promotion and (ii) direct recruitment ;
- (c) the number of Muslims, Hindus and Sikhs, respectively, among Assistant Sub-Inspectors appointed by (i) promotion and (ii) direct recruitment ;
- (d) the number of statutory Hindu agriculturists among Assistant Sub-Inspectors of either class, i.e., those appointed by promotion or by direct appointment, separately ;
- (e) the proportion which statutory Hindu agriculturists bear to other Hindus in the cadres of Head Constables ;
- (f) the number of matriculates of the statutory agricultural classes among Hindu head constables ;
- (g) the causes which account for the inadequate representation of statutory Hindu agriculturists in all the grades of Police service ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Two hundred and seventy.

(b) and (c) Number of Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police appointed :—

	<i>Muslims.</i>	<i>Hindu.</i>	<i>Sikhs.</i>	<i>Total.</i>
By promotion	.. 144	29	18	191
By direct recruitment	.. 31	21	27	79

(d) Number of Statutory Hindu Agriculturists among Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police, appointed :—

By promotion	..	.. 2
By direct recruitment	..	.. 5

(e) There are altogether 684 Hindus in the cadre of Head Constable, of whom 276 are statutory Hindu Agriculturists.

(f) Thirty-eight.

(g) The paucity of Hindu Agriculturists in all ranks of the Police is due to the fact that few candidates from this class present themselves for enlistment.

**COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION AMONG ZILLADARS.**

**1512. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state—

- (a) the number of zilladars recruited in 1928 and 1929 respectively by (i) promotion and (ii) direct appointment ;

- (b) the number of appointments of zilladars which went to Hindus in 1928 and 1929, respectively, and the share which statutory Hindu agriculturists received in each of these years by (i) promotion and (ii) direct appointment?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :—**

	1928.	1929.
(a) Number of zilladars recruited—		
(i) By promotion .. ..	12	2
(ii) By direct recruitment .. ..	20	15
(b) Number of appointments given to Hindus—		
(i) By promotion .. ..	4	..
(ii) By direct recruitment .. ..	4	6
Share of Hindu Statutory Agriculturists—		
(i) By promotion .. ..	1	..
(ii) By direct recruitment .. ..	3	3

COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION AMONG ZILLADARS OF WESTERN JUMNA CANAL  
CIRCLE.

**1513. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state—

- whether there are any instructions to Superintending Engineers that they should nominate candidates from various communities in certain proportions for the post of zilladars ;
- what was the number of Hindu, Muslim and Sikh candidates nominated by the Superintending Engineer of the Western Jumna Canal, Delhi, in 1928 and 1929, respectively ;
- how many candidates of each community referred to in (b) were appointed as zilladars in 1928 and 1929 and what is the proportion of Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs in the population residing in the Western Jumna Canal circle ;
- how many of the successful candidates referred to in (c) were statutory Hindu agriculturists ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The honourable Member is presumably referring to the direct recruitment of zilladars. Superintending Engineers recommend candidates and selection is made by Chief Engineers who have to bear in mind certain proportions for different communities.

(b), (c) and (d) The numbers as recommended by Superintending Engineer, Western Jumna Canal, in 1928, were :—

<i>Hindu.</i>	<i>Muslim.</i>	<i>Sikh.</i>
1	1	1

only one was selected and he was a Sikh agriculturist, the Hindu candidate was below the age required under the rules.

**RAILWAY LINE BETWEEN KOT KAPURA AND JALALABAD *via* MUKTSAR.**

**1514. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member kindly state—

- (a) whether he is aware that there is a proposal under consideration for the construction of a North-Western Railway Branch Line between Kot Kapura and Jalalabad, *via* Muktsar ;
- (b) if so, whether he has official information as to when the work is likely to be taken in hand ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Government has been advised by the Agent, North-Western Railway, as follows :—

- (a) There is no proposal under consideration by the North-Western Railway administration for the construction of a branch line between Kot Kapura and Jalalabad *via* Muktsar.
- (b) Does not arise.

---

**TAHSILDAR, MUKTSAR.**

**1515. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that for the last 12 years the post of Tahsildar at Muktsar has always been occupied by non-Muslim incumbents ;
- (b) if so, will the Government kindly state the reasons for not appointing a Muslim Tahsildar at Muktsar ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) There is no special reason.

---

**KOT KAPURA-FAZILKA BRANCH RAILWAY LINE.**

**1516. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Government is aware that in 1922-23 a project for converting the Kot Kapura-Fazilka section of the B. B. & C. I. Railway Line from metre gauge to North-Western Railway broad gauge was prepared ;
- (b) if so, whether he is in a position to state at what stage the proposal stands at present ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Government has been advised by the Agent, North-Western Railway, as follows :—

- (a) and (b) The estimate for converting the Kot Kapura-Fazilka section was made out in 1923, and revised in 1927. This work has not been included in the programme for 1930-31 and it is not possible at present to say when it is likely to be taken in hand.

## ENCOURAGEMENT OF GLASS INDUSTRY IN THE PUNJAB.

**1517. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state the number of factories in the Punjab at present, with their names and approximate figures of glassware manufactures therein ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** There is only one factory for the manufacture of glasswares in the Punjab at present, *viz.*, the Upper India Glass Works, Ambala City with an average monthly output of Rs. 12000.

## ENCOURAGEMENT OF GLASS INDUSTRY IN THE PUNJAB.

**1518. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) how many factories have been closed during the last twenty years in the province ;
- (b) what has been the cause or causes of their being closed down ;
- (c) and what steps did the Government take to keep those factories running ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Ten.

(b) So far as it is possible to see, the causes of failure were—

- (i) wrong localisation.
- (ii) lack of technical assistance in manufacture and organization.
- (iii) scarcity of trained labour, and
- (iv) lack of adequate working capital.

(c) This part of the question is not easy to answer. Governments is not even aware whether some at least of these factories were not started without proper capital and management ; and it does not appear that Government was asked to render any particular assistance for factories that might have been kept in existence, nor that Government knew that deserving factories were being closed down by their managements.

## CHET CHAUDASH CATTLE FAIR.

**1519. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Government has received a memorial from the residents of Ludhiana requesting that the cattle fair of *Chet Chaudash* day be abolished ;
- (b) if the reply be in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state what action has been taken on it ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

**INSOLVENCY OF MAULVI ALLA DIN.**

**1520. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that one Maulvi Alla Din, member of the Hoshiarpur Municipal Committee, was declared insolvent about ten months ago ;
- (b) if the reply to the above be in the affirmative, will Government be pleased to state whether he has been removed from the Committee or not ? If not, why ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) In accordance with the requirements of the proviso to sub-section (1) of section 16 of the Municipal Act the gentleman has been informed that Government propose to remove him from membership of the Committee under the provisions of clause (a) of the said sub-section, and an opportunity of explanation is being given to him. Final orders will be passed after the explanation has been received and considered.

**EXEMPTION OF SWORD FROM ARMS ACT.**

**1521. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the reasons why in spite of Council's repeated demands the Government have not exempted even sword from the operation of the Arms Act in all the districts of the province ;
- (b) the ratio the license-holders of arms bear with that of unarmed population of the province ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to his starred question No. 2885<sup>1</sup>.

(b) No doubt a small one, but collecting statistics will not advance the argument any further.

**GAZI ABDUR RAHMAN, KHAWAJA, PRISONER IN RAWALPINDI JAIL.**

**1522. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the weight on admission and in the month of January 1930 of Ghazi Abdur Rahman, Khawaja, who has been sentenced to two years' rigorous imprisonment under section 124, Indian Penal Code, and is now confined in the Rawalpindi Jail ;
- (b) whether any daily newspaper is being supplied to him ;
- (c) whether he is getting writing material for writing his memoirs ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) One hundred and fifty-four pounds on admission, 146 pounds on January 20th 1930. He was sick from 12th November 1929 to 15th February 1930 and was an in-patient under treatment for rheumatism. He weighed 150 pounds on his release.



- (b) no daily paper was supplied to him.
- (c) he was given all the writing material for which he asked.

#### PUNJABI EXILES.

**1523. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) how many Punjabis, who are living abroad, are not allowed to return to their home ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that Mian Abdul Hafiz, younger brother of Mian Abdul Aziz, President, Lahore Municipality, has not been allowed to come to this country in spite of his requests ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Government have no information.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer given in 1925 to his question no. 1468<sup>1</sup>.

#### SUPERINTENDENT, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER'S OFFICE GURDASPUR.

**1524. Rana Firoz-ud-Din, Khan :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the newly appointed Superintendent of the Deputy Commissioner's office at Gurdaspur is a Hindu and he does not belong to the Lahore division ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the predecessor of the present Superintendent was also a Hindu ;
- (c) if the answers to the above be in the affirmative, will Government kindly state whether the claims of the Muhammadan candidates who had applied for the post and who belonged to the Lahore division were considered ;
- (d) what action does the Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No, he is Sikh and a resident of the Lahore division.

- (b) No.
- (c) No Mohammadan candidate had applied.
- (d) Does not arise.

#### POLICE MUHARRIRS.

**1525. Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** With reference to the answer to Starred Question No. 2288<sup>2</sup>, asked on 26th July 1929, will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state the reasons why no period has been prescribed for the stay of police muharrirs at one thana ?

<sup>1</sup>Volume VIII, Part A, page 281.

<sup>2</sup>Volume XII, pages 4 and 5.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** It has not been found necessary to fix any limit to the stay at one police station of police officers below the rank of sub-inspector. In all but exceptional cases, however, the rotation of duties as laid down in Police Rule 14-12 has the result that police officers do not stay longer than three years in one police station.

#### CONVERSION OF LAHORE INTO A PRESIDENCY TOWN.

**1526. Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state whether there is any proposal before the Punjab Government to make Lahore a presidency town?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** No.

#### GRANTS-IN-AID TO PRIVATE SCHOOLS.

**1527. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the D. A. V. High School, Shahabad (District Karnal), the A. S. V. High School, Ambala, A. S. V. High School, Pundri, the C. A. V. High School, Hissar, and the Jat High School, Hissar, have their annual grants reduced.
- (b) if so, what were the yearly grants which the above schools were receiving previous to reduction and what are the reduced grants yearly in each case;
- (c) whether in the above cases there were directions to the Inspector of Schools, Ambala division, from the higher authorities for the reduction of the grants;
- (d) whether it is a fact that schools in matter of assessment of grants have no right of appeal;
- (e) whether it is a fact that the copy of calculations for the grants-in-aid is not supplied to the school authorities.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) The annual grant to each of the schools mentioned is less this year than those of last year.

(b) The figures are :—

	1928-29.	1929-30.
	Rs.	Rs.
D. A. V. High School, Shahabad ..	5,940	4,449
C. A. V. High School, Hissar ..	7,082	5,227
A. S. High School, Pundri ..	3,492	1,894
A. S. High School, Ambala ..	8,556	6,629
Jat High School, Hissar ..	4,920	4,020

(c) No.

(d) No. There is no formal right of appeal, but representations from schools in the matter of grants always receive due consideration.

(e) No directions have been issued by the Department.

## RESOLUTIONS.

## RESOLUTION RE TOTAL PROHIBITION.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal** (North-East Towns, non-Muhammadan, Urban) : Sir, I beg to move—

"This Council recommends to Government (i) to declare a policy of total prohibition in the Punjab, (ii) to take steps to give effect to it within the next 15 years; and also (iii) to provide in the budget Rs. 50,000 a year for temperance propaganda."

Some provinces have taken the lead in this matter of prohibition and the Punjab should not lag behind. America took the first step to adopt the policy of prohibition, total prohibition, and forty-five of the American states have adopted that policy. The Senate and the House of Representatives of America have agreed to this policy. The result, so far as I am able to gather from the literature I have in my possession on the subject, is the increased material and moral progress of the American subjects. Many of the prisons that existed before have been closed, and many of the mental hospitals that existed before have ceased to exist.

There has been a good deal of saving under these heads to the State. Not only that, as I have been able to read from the literature on the subject I find that it has added very materially to the wealth and prosperity not only of the nation but also of the individuals. The money that is saved by those who at present are addicted to this habit would be spent on their children and in looking after their families and they would feel very happy. There have been many cases in which it has been found that those who were addicted to these habits had very unhappy family life. Their wives, their children and their homes were neglected. But under this prohibition law those who used to spend their money on this evil habit now save their money and put it in banks for the benefit of their children and for the benefit of their families and also for the education of their children, and are now living a better life. I am sure it would not be denied by the Government benches and by other friends of mine in the House. Any saving that can be made out of the money that is at present either being realised by Government on account of duty or being spent by the people in consuming liquor can be put in banks and utilized for the benefit of their children and for the material and moral welfare of the state as well as the individual. Nobody can deny that there is a good deal of crime, serious crimes like murders accompanied by dacoities which are due to the habit of drink. Persons under the influence of liquor adopt these methods and kill families and loot the people. If the habit of non-drink is created in the mind of the people and they are told by propaganda work the advantages of living a temperate life, I am sure these murders and crimes that at present exist in the Punjab would decrease. The figures that Americans have got on the subject of decrease of crime are so much that when one reads them one finds a total justification for the adoption of the policy. I have already submitted this in the beginning and I do not want to repeat that Americans by adopting this policy have been able to save a good deal of money which at present is being utilized for the benefit of the State and the individual. So far as the Punjab is concerned we have to see to two things. One is whether the Punjab alone can adopt this policy or

[Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal.]

not, because there are other provinces in India that are to be taken into consideration. Then there is the central government, that is the Government of India. Then there is the question that Government will be faced with a deficit in their revenue and how is that to be met. So far as the adoption of the policy of total prohibition is concerned I have submitted in the beginning that I wish that the Punjab were to adopt the principle underlying this resolution and say that we are adopting the policy of total prohibition. When the question of finance comes in I would submit that I have been reading the Excise Report and I find in that that under the head liquor the amount of income is 78 lakhs. Against that revenue the Government has to meet certain charges for maintenance of the staff. A sum of over Rs. 4,000 is realized by the Government from liquor that is supplied to the troops. The question to my mind that the Government will have to face is how to meet the revenue. I submit that the revenue can be met by putting up death duties in the Punjab, by taxing the large incomes and at the same time there is a suggestion that the lands that are lying near about the cities should also be taxed. I for one who owns a little land near the cities am prepared to share it. Those who are strong advocates of this propaganda work should not grudge their incomes being taxed for this purpose. If any sum that we save is taxed for the purpose of welfare of the public, I will be the first man to say that we should take this step and be prepared to contribute towards that. I am sure that if the Government adopts the policy and sets itself to consider the question of ameliorating the condition of the masses who are now being ruined under the influence of liquor and to find out the ways how to save them from this evil habit, and how to meet the deficit, I am sure the Punjab revenues can be raised by new taxation and by reducing the expenditure. The Government therefore should not be afraid on that score. There is only one question which has been puzzling my mind and that is whether the Government would be bold enough to say to the people at large that we are prepared in the Punjab to adopt a policy of total prohibition. Once the Government makes up its mind then the question becomes easy and there will be co-operation by the people. Under my scheme Government will be providing a certain amount of money every year for carrying on propaganda work for some years. When this is done for a number of years, I am sure that the people also would realize the value of this propaganda work and they would be prepared to give up in some cases their habit of drinking themselves. In the Punjab the position is becoming rather somewhat serious and alarming as crime is increasing. I submitted before that I was reading the Excise Report. In it I find that the consumption of Indian liquor has gone up in the year 1927-28 by several lakhs of gallons.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** Not several lakhs of gallons.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** I draw the attention of the Honourable Minister for Agriculture to the exact words used in his report. The expression used is that the increase is alarming. The Honourable Minister would agree with me that debit to be charged to the Punjab out of the total number of increase of gallons is 1.7 lakhs.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** What is the total consumption of liquor ? The honourable mover said that there is an increase of several lakhs of gallons. What is the exact number ?

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** I am giving him the exact figures. Punjab revenue in 1926-27 under the Excise head was 128.84, in 1927-28 it was 132.92. That is, the increase in revenue to the Government has been 4.56 lakhs.

**Mr. V. F. Gray :** Are you talking of rupees or gallons ?

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** I am talking of the income. Expenditure on excise in 1927-28 was Rs. 30,07,000 as against Rs. 19,91,000 in 1926-27, the increase in expenditure according to the report is Rs. 10,10,000.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** What paragraph are you reading from ?

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Paragraph 1—Revenue and Expenditure. The total amount of gallons that were consumed in the Punjab was 570,000 in 1927-28 and 387,000 in 1926-27. The increase in consumption of Indian liquor during 1927-28 has been 283,000 gallons. Out of this, 59,000 gallons were indented by the other provinces against 45,000 in 1926-27. The Indian States indented 52,000 gallons, out of which Patiala was responsible for about 50,000 gallons. This is a very substantial increase, these are the words used in the Report. There is another factor to which I want to draw the attention of the Council. This is the number of licences that have been issued from time to time by the Government. The number of licences in 1923-24 were 517; in 1924-25, 518; in 1925-26, 519; in 1926-27, 661; this is a sudden rise of about 100 licences, in 1927-28 the number was 655, that is a considerable increase of about 177 licences over the 1923-24, 1925 and 1926 figures. So far as I know and remember we have been told from time to time by the Government that its policy has been and is that the number of licenses is to be restricted. In this report, if the statement that I have read before you is correct, it appears that the Government has allowed the increase of the number of licences during the year 1926-27. Perhaps Government will be able to inform the House the reason why this step was taken. From the report also I find that the increase of revenue is perhaps due to the lowering of the duty by the Government on Indian liquor. The question is whether this policy is to be followed by Government or the policy of putting up such a prohibitive duty that the people may not be able to get this liquor. It requires very careful consideration by the Government as well as the people. From a perusal of the report it appears to me that there is a good deal of illicit traffic going on in the Punjab, and that this is due to the fact that the Punjab is a sugar-growing province and I have been told that it is not practicable in the Punjab to adopt a policy of total prohibition if sugar cane is to be allowed to be grown in fields, because people take advantage of this fact and extract liquor. My submission is this that if Government were to take an effective step to do their duty, it is possible to my mind that this evil could also be checked. I fail to understand that there is anything which cannot be managed in this world. It is only energy, resource and push that is required to look after a thing that is needed, and if Government is keen, I can

[Rai Bahadur Lal Mohan Lal.]

assure it that it can be done. My reply to the policy of Government is that some years back we were informed that it was impossible not to provide opium to China. But Government has in conjunction with other countries adopted a policy under which they have to limit the supply of opium to the other countries, including China especially. The question of total prohibition also is a question of international importance. All the countries in the world are now trying to adopt this principle. There are several states, including that of Russia in the times of Czar, which have adopted this policy of total prohibition and there are restrictions on it in many states. If Government has any doubt about the statements that I have made let the next elections be fought on this issue and I am sure that the advocates of prohibition will come out victorious. With these words I move my resolution in the hope that it will be carried unanimously.

**Mr. President :** The resolution moved is—

"This Council recommends to Government (i) to declare a policy of total prohibition in the Punjab; (ii) to take steps to give effect to it within the next 15 years; and also (iii) to provide in the budget Rs. 50,000 a year for temperance propaganda."

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (Non-official, nominated): Sir, I beg to move the amendment, which stands in my name—

"That in line 3, the words 'try and' be inserted between the word 'to' and the word 'give.'"

Sir, I am in sympathy with the resolution that has been moved, but it seems to me that to say a certain thing must be done in so many years is to lay down a programme which it is almost impossible to say that we will be able to accomplish. It will be very much better to say that we will try and do such and such a thing than to say that we shall certainly do such and such a thing. Even when the railway authorities make out a programme they say that their trains will start at such and such a time and will reach at such and such a time, but they do not guarantee that the trains will run to time. And we very often find that trains are running late because unforeseen difficulties arise. Nobody can foresee what will happen in the course of a few years and therefore to lay down a programme and to say that it must be done would not be the height of wisdom.

Sir, people sometimes talk against prohibition because they say that it cuts down their personal freedom. But absolute freedom is not to be found in any civilised country. Law and order are made possible only by the majority, the strong who impose their will upon the minority, that is the weak. I am of opinion that the majority of the people are in favour of a policy of prohibition, although they may not yet be able to enforce it. We know that many people live by theft and by fraud, but we are compelled to deprive them of their liberty and know that they feel annoyed about it when their liberty is taken away some times for a few weeks and sometimes running into years. There was a time when there was slavery in the British Empire and in America and it was abolished by a law which was set up by the majority against the will of the minority. Those who were in the minority were extremely annoyed at their liberty being curtailed. And in America we know that this also led to bloodshed. But

finally the majority were able to enforce their will on the minority. It would not be at all strange if the law regarding slavery were to be done away with that many people would again begin to have slaves.

Then, there is such a thing as public opinion, and it may take long for public opinion to be formed on a certain point, but a time does come when a few people ahead of others make suggestions and these are regarded as rank injustice in one generation, but the next generation comes and blesses them for the action that has been taken. For instance, there was a time in certain countries when all kinds of cruelties were practised on animals for mere sport. I have heard of cases when people were trying to train their dogs to catch wild animals. They would catch hold of a hare, break one of its legs and let it loose. Then the dogs would be let loose who would then overtake it and kill it. In this way dogs were trained to hunt wild animals.

Again, Sir, there was a time when child labour was common, but it has been given up. For a time there was great indignation when such proposals were made. This was regarded as curtailing personal liberty, but now we are glad that child labour has been abolished. Then again there are very many people who like to enjoy liquor at the proper time and place, but when they think of the misery which is caused to children and their weaker fellows, they are prepared to give up their pleasure. Imagine the torture which a man has to undergo who having signed the pledge has on his way home to pass day after day the places where wine is sold. It is a very great temptation to him and a great torture to him and there are similarly thousands of young men who are trying to put up a fight against this drink habit and yet some times there are some of us who get up and say, I am not my brother's keeper. Experts tell us that many a man may have grown in years, but his mind is that of a child, his mentality is that of a child, and many are predisposed to alcohol from the cradle because it is a legacy to them from the parents, and they should not be allowed to fend for themselves. Those people who work amongst children tell us that they can easily tell children that have abstainer parents and those that have not. Free will has certainly been given to us by God, but not to gratify ourselves at the expense of the weak and the ignorant.

Again, if we go to a life insurance company—they are hard-headed people, they know whether drink does good or harm—they will tell us that they are always more ready to insure the lives of those who are abstainers, and that they are less willing to ensure the lives of non-abstainers at the same rates.

Then again, we find in the regime of sports and where nerves are needed that it is those who abstain that take the lead amongst those who hold records in sports; by far the larger majority will be found amongst those who are abstainers. Lindberg, the famous airman who flew from America to Europe, says that he would never have been able to do this if he had not been an abstainer all his life, and all those who go in for boxing and sports of that description have steadily to deny themselves, and do without liquor for long periods before the time of contest. With these words, I beg to move my amendment.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member may move his second amendment too.

**Mr. E. Maya Das :** Sir, my other amendment is—

"That in line 4, for the words 'Rs. 50,000 a year,' the words 'Rs. 5,000 a year or such larger sum as can be set apart' be substituted."

My object in moving this amendment is to make it as easy for Government as possible to give effect to the resolution.

3 P.M.

A sum of Rs. 5,000 for a big province like ours is a very small one and with this amount it must be possible for the Government to make a beginning in the direction of prohibition. If a larger amount can be made available for the purpose, it should be made available. In connection with propaganda, I would say that books of a scientific nature explaining in simple language how excessive drink is harmful should be provided in schools. I am very sorry to say that I was extremely disappointed at the last session when for two questions I was given the answer that the Minister did not know whether such books existed in the school libraries or not.

So far as children are concerned, if their mind is trained even from now against drink, when they grow up they will have a tendency to avoid drink. By this process in the course of another thirty years we will have produced a large volume of public opinion against drink and it will then be possible to have prohibition in the country. By prohibition I do not mean that it will ever be possible to remove drink altogether or that distilleries will entirely go out of existence. If the mind of the children is trained from now, then in the course of thirty years there will be less demand for liquor or there may be no demand for it. Therefore what we have got to do is to work in such a way that the demand for liquor may decrease. In that case illicit distillation and the sale of liquor will cease automatically. With these words I move the amendment.

**Mr. President :** Resolution under consideration, amendment moved is—

"(a) That in line 3, the words "try and" be inserted between the word "to" and the word "give."

(b) That in line 4, for the words "Rs. 50,000 a year" the words "Rs. 5,000 a year or such larger sum as can be set apart" be substituted.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan:** Sir, before we proceed any further, I should like to point out one matter. The resolution as it is set down in the list of to-day's business consists of three parts. The first requests the Government to declare a policy of total prohibition. The second part asks Government to take steps to give effect to it within the next 15 years; and the third part asks Government to provide a certain sum of money each year in the budget for temperance propaganda. The amendments moved are with reference to the second and third parts. Now, honourable members may feel differently with regard to the different parts of this resolution. Some of them may wish to support the last part and may not wish to support the first two parts. Others may wish to support the first part and not the other parts. It would be rather awkward if the House is called upon to discuss and vote upon these amendments before the first part of the resolution, which is really the most important part as I conceive it so far as Government is concerned, is discussed and voted upon. I therefore request that that point may be considered.



**Mr. President :** The three different points involved in the resolution may be discussed together, but they will be put to the vote of the House separately. As regards the amendments, I would refer the honourable member to Article 119 of the Business Manual.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** I do not object to those parts being discussed together. All that I wanted was that when the time came you should be able to exercise your discretion in the manner I have submitted.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** [Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana (Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I am really gratified to see a welcome change in the attitude of this Council. It is a very agreeable surprise to see a resolution recommending total prohibition being moved by an honourable gentleman from those benches which have always stood against the policy of total prohibition. Then, Sir, there is another welcome change in the attitude of those who previously used to oppose the different forms of this recommendation on the ground that such a policy would be a direct blow to individual freedom and was likely to place the minorities at the mercy of the majority. Now I think that under these circumstances the Government also will find it necessary to declare that it is quite prepared to follow the policy of total prohibition. But at the same time it will try to avert the situation by taking shelter behind the so-called practical difficulties. Therefore, I propose to discuss these practical difficulties at some length.

No doubt the present excise policy of the Government yields an annual income of a crore of rupees.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** No, it is 78 lakhs.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Thank you. Well then let it be 78 lakhs. What I want to submit is that to forego such an income for the sake of a policy is a responsibility which, perhaps, no Council would be prepared to take upon its shoulders. Therefore, I do not ask you to ignore the financial aspect of the matter. But I must submit that this loss sinks to nothingness when compared with the national gain which is sure to accrue from the policy of total prohibition. From amongst the civilized countries the most successful experiment of this policy has been made in the United States of America. I had some misgivings when I heard some local officials say that the experiment has proved a total failure, and that, therefore, the Government of the United States was going to give a wide berth to this policy. But here I have a book in my hand which tells quite another story. It is entitled "Prohibition in America." I do not wish to encroach upon the time of the Council by reading any passage out of it. I will simply refer to some pages so that the sceptics may be able to verify my remarks in this connection. On page 98 you will find a summary of the happy results of this policy. There you will find how this policy has brought untold happiness to hundreds and thousands of families and what a wonderful change has taken place in the life of careless fathers and brutal husbands. It will tell you how a good many jails with accommodation for hundreds of prisoners have now been found quite unnecessary and, therefore, turned into restaurants and libraries. Then there is a message from the President of the Temperance Association, which tells its own delightful story. He has drawn the attention of the public to the nefarious propaganda carried on by drunkards and their sympathisers to the effect that the experiment of prohibition has been a total failure in the United

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

States of America. To give the lie back to these propagandists he has pointed out the cases of the workers who before this policy of total prohibition were groaning under the burden of indebtedness and now drive to their workshops in motor cars. Thus Sir, the immense gain by way of increase in national income and efficiency has more than compensated for the loss of some revenue (*A voice* : that was before prohibition). I beg your pardon, but this book, to which I am referring, relates to what took place as the result of prohibition.

Now I come to the conditions obtaining in our own province. If you go through the reports of the Police and the Excise departments, you will find that the number of crimes increases in proportion to the consumption of liquor. The Honourable the Finance Member will be able to tell you from the Police reports that in 75 per cent. cases the criminals took liquor before committing the crime. It is not only my personal experience but the Government will also admit that the most heinous crimes, especially dacoities, are committed after having recourse to liquor. The same is the case with riots and murders.

Then, Sir, the lady member of this Council once raised a very important point in the course of a discussion. While discussing the comparative value of spending money on education and health, she most emphatically remarked that the health of the nation is far more important than anything else. I quite agree with her and, therefore, submit that the health of the nation deserves much more attention than its wealth.

It may be argued that if the Government were to forego the huge income that accrues from the Excise Department it will have to effect curtailments in other departments, and that such a course would seriously tell upon the efficiency of administration. But I submit, Sir, that if the number of crimes falls down, as it surely will as the result of the policy of total prohibition it will not be difficult to save an appreciable part of the money that is now being spent on the Police force; and then such a decrease in the expenditure on the Police force is sure to result in a proportionate decrease in the expenditure on other administrative departments.

This report to which I have referred you shows very clearly how the national health and efficiency has improved as the result of total prohibition. Then take the case of the Great War. At that time every living soul was anxious to fight for the cause which his or her country had espoused and each country was trying to increase its national efficiency. It was then that the real worth of prohibition was realized and it was felt that so long as the policy of total prohibition was not adopted no improvement was possible in the health and efficiency of the nation.

But there may be some people who would not like to be led by America and who always prefer to follow England. Therefore, I wish to refer you to what Mr. Lloyd George, who held the reins of the Empire at a very critical time, had to say with regard to this subject. He said :—

"I must say that I have a growing conviction, based on accumulating evidence, that nothing but root and branch method will be of the slightest avail in dealing with the vice. I believe that to be the general feeling. The feeling is that if we are to settle German militarism, we must first of all settle the drink. We are fighting Germany, Australia and Drink; and so far as I can see the greatest of these three deadly foes is drink."

Not only this. The Ship Building Employers Federation also realized the importance of this subject. When they found that under the existing circumstances they could not compete favourably with other nations and tried to find out the cause of such a state of the inefficiency of their workers, drink was found to be the root cause. The result was that they at once formed themselves into a deputation and approached Mr. Lloyd George with the request to declare a policy of total prohibition throughout the War. This shows that although their efforts did not prove quite successful, yet total prohibition was considered absolutely necessary to attain and maintain national efficiency. These efforts on the part of the most civilised countries show that if India wants any improvement in her present condition, she must needs be much more active and enthusiastic about total prohibition. Under these circumstances, I must request the Government to accept this resolution and thus remove the obstacles from our way to efficiency and prosperity. You are trying to increase our prosperity by means of education and industries. Even the British nation realizing the decrease in our purchasing capacity has found it necessary to appoint commissions like the Agriculture Commission to enquire into its causes. I admit that it is not out of any philanthropic spirit that they are anxious about our financial condition. It is quite true that they feed the sheep simply for the sake of its wool. Still it shows that our wealth, prosperity and efficiency are on the decrease. The Honourable the Finance Member, or perhaps it was the Honourable the Revenue Member, was pleased to remark the other day that the average income of an average person here is 2 or 3 annas only. He was quite right and this is exactly the reason why we, while fully realizing the necessity and importance of education and hospitals, etc., cannot contribute a single pice for such institutions. I know, Sir, that the Government does require money for carrying on other developments and I do not question their importance and necessity. But there must be a limit to everything. We must not sacrifice our national efficiency and morality for the mere pleasure of having some roads and other such facilities. Moreover, if you help us in getting rid of these vices our efficiency, and consequently our wealth, will increase by leaps and bounds and thus all our troubles about national wealth and income as well as the complaints of the British people about our purchasing capacity will disappear in no time. Your present excise policy yields you an income of 78 lakhs a year and you are beaming with happiness over such a huge income. But my heart sinks when I find that my fellow countrymen are spending so much on drink. To me it is an index of the moral condition of our province and I shudder to think of the consequences of such a state of affairs. This shows that the other vices attendant upon the habit of drink must be abounding in the province. You must have heard the story of an old woman which shows that drink is really the mother of vices. A Brahman gentleman was in search of a suitable match for his daughter and coming to know of an eligible young man he asked the opinion of an old woman about him. The old woman was not on good terms with the family of the young man, but at the same time she did not think it politic to make an open display of her hostility. So she replied that he was the best boy in the neighbourhood and there was nothing against him, except that he occasionally took meat. But that, she added, did not matter much. This pricked the ears of the man and he asked whether the young man was really a meat-eater. "Oh no," replied the old woman,

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

"he eats it only when he is drunk." That was another blow to the gentleman and he enquired if the old woman meant what she said. To this she replied that as she had already said the young man was the most eligible son-in-law in the whole neighbourhood and he was not at all a confirmed drunkard but took a glass or two when he had won some money in the gambling den, and he had recourse to gambling only when he was successful in stealing money from some house. (Laughter). Thus, Sir, if the Government does not accept and follow the policy of total prohibition all its efforts for development and all the reforms granted to India by the British Government are sure to fail to attain their aim. Therefore, if the Government is really anxious to do some good to India and Indians it should not hesitate to accept and act upon this resolution.

Now Mahatma Gandhi has spoken of his 11 points as being childish. But the fact is that he is quite sure that the Government will never adopt the policy of total prohibition of its own accord, otherwise he would not have included it in the list. In the presence of communal ministries I hesitate to say anything with regard to the policy of our Sikh Minister. However, I must point out that although Mahatma Gandhi says that at present he sees no bright ray with regard to the campaign of civil disobedience, yet when such a campaign is launched the Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh will, as the Minister concerned, be responsible for throwing in prisons thousands of young men who will be placed on picketing duty before the liquor shops. The fault of those young men will be nothing else than that they want to rid their motherland from the curse of liquor. It is just possible that you may induce some members to vote with you, but you must remember that in his heart of hearts every one feels very strongly against your present excise policy. India is a religious country and all the religions in this country condemn the use of liquor in the strongest and most emphatic terms. Now it is already getting late, otherwise I would have shown by facts and figures that if the policy of total prohibition is adopted, you will find an immense change for the better in the efficiency, health and wealth of the nation even in the course of one or two years. With these remarks I strongly support the resolution.

**Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali** [Gujrat, East (Muhammadan), Urban], (Urdu): Sir, the subject under consideration can be approached from two different points of view, firstly, whether liquor is in itself a good thing or bad and, secondly, how its use can be stopped. My honourable friend from Hoshiarpur during his speech has been talking of liquor alone. He perhaps used the term liquor as meaning any intoxicating drug. I do not think that liquor is as harmful as hemp, *charas* or *chandru*. I have seen a good many physical and moral wrecks who were formerly addicted to the use of *charas* and *chandru*. Such people are absolutely good for nothing. I do not know whether the use of liquor also produces similar effects on one who is addicted to it. In my opinion all intoxicating drugs are equally bad. No sensible person can deny that. But Sir, the point which requires our careful consideration is that when *Alquran* and other religious books particularly forbid the use of intoxicating drugs and when people do resort to their use in disregard of the religious injunctions, how can compulsion possibly bring about better results? I am sure even the severest legal

sanction will not succeed against the confirmed drunkards. There are serious difficulties in our way. We should try to overcome them. If one tries to point out these difficulties, he is taken to be a person who advocates the cause of liquor. But, Sir, before we decide either for or against the policy of total prohibition, we should thoroughly consider the relevant facts. Unless we do that we should not compel the Government to declare a policy of total prohibition in the province. I am of opinion that for the present Government is not in a position to declare in favour of total prohibition, and that you are asking for an impracticable thing. The present policy of the Government clearly shows that they are also anxious to put a stop to the use of liquor. If you look at the facts and figures, you will find that the number of liquor shops has considerably decreased. If formerly there were fifty liquor shops in a district there are now only ten or twelve liquor shops. Besides the heavy duty imposed on liquor its price has, of late, immensely increased. The cultivation of poppy plants is also forbidden and only a few people are permitted to sow poppy plants, although the zamindars of my district consider its cultivation a profitable business. It also shows that Government is trying to achieve the same end which the honourable mover of the resolution has in view, although steadily and slowly. I do not know how Government feels with regard to the first part of the resolution. But the second part of it, I am sure, will be admitted to be impracticable. How can you specify a period within which Government should give effect to the policy of total prohibition? When you fix a period, you seem to ignore the acts of God, that is, you do not take into consideration such natural calamities as locusts-pest, famines and floods, which frequently befall this unhappy country. Sir, why do you not allow the Government to act according to the policy which appears to them best for the time being? When the proper time comes, they will never hesitate to declare a policy of total prohibition. It has been said that it is not a bad bargain to sacrifice the excise revenue for attaining the greater good of the country. Sir, to me the question of foregoing excise revenue is not as important as the question of the expenditure involved in successfully putting an end to the use of liquor (*hear, hear*). For that Government will have to incur a huge expenditure which cannot be justified in these days of financial stringency. My village is situate on the border of an Indian State and I know for certain that from there a very large quantity of *charas*, *chandu* and country-made liquor is smuggled into the British territory. During the judicial investigation of certain cases I came to know that hundreds of maunds of *charas* was brought from tribal territory on the North-West Frontier and sold in Lala Musa. In one case it was brought to light that a very clever smuggler smuggled *charas* under the cover of sweetmeats. He was carrying this *charas* in a basket and to avoid detection he had given it the form of *laddus*, a kind of sweetmeat. Three-fourths of these *laddus* were, in fact, *charas* and the remaining one-fourth was actually sweetmeat. Sir, as you know fully well *charas* worth crores of rupees is smuggled in places like Lahore, Calcutta and Delhi by Pathan smugglers from the tribal territory. When smuggling of *charas* and hemp on such a large scale is going on in the country and when you try to put a stop to it, you are sure to incur a heavy expenditure. It is difficult to say how much extra burden will be thrown on the provincial revenues if the policy of total prohibition is adopted. As a matter of fact, it may be said that it is a good thing to stop the use of liquor, and that we

[K. B. Ch. Fazl Ali.]

should not mind spending as much as we can for the purpose. But, Sir, we should not be carried away by sentiment. If the policy of total prohibition is adopted, I am sure that the expenditure involved will not be commensurate with the results that will be achieved.

Now I come to the question of propaganda. It has been said that fifty thousand or five thousand, as the amendment proposes, should be set apart for temperance propaganda. Sir, when drinking is expressly forbidden by Islam, when Hinduism and Christianity equally condemn the use of liquor, why should we not create private funds for the purpose of carrying out temperance propaganda? We should tell the Government that they may keep liquor shops open. We will not mind. We are not going to buy liquor from these shops. If we do that, we are sure to meet with a certain amount of success. I think that there is no use of landing Government in further financial difficulties. It seems to me that the object both of the Government and the people is one and the same. Both desire to put an end to the use of liquor. The Honourable Minister for Agriculture has, on many previous occasions, declared in favour of gradual prohibition. On some previous occasion I was surprised to find that an honourable member of this House, who, I was told, was himself addicted to the use of liquor, was earnestly advocating the cause of total prohibition. He did so perhaps he was convinced that it was good to do so. In short, I request the House that before deciding one way or the other it should see how far the policy of total prohibition is likely to increase the financial liabilities of the Government. We should not set apart any amount whatsoever for temperance propaganda because goodness knows what calamities will befall this country and how much land revenue will have to be remitted by Government in years to come. In my opinion it is also as absurd as impracticable to ask the Government to give effect to the policy of total prohibition within a specified period. With these words I resume my seat.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan** [Sialkot (Muhammadian), Rural]: I would have preferred to have heard the views of the author of "Kamla" (The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh) on the question of prohibition before I submitted my own for the consideration of the House; but inasmuch as I found that if I did not rise on this occasion when there was no other member anxious to speak, I might lose the opportunity of submitting my views on this question altogether, I have stood up to put forward these views without having had the benefit of the views of the Minister for Agriculture on this question.

Sir, the question is no doubt, as other honourable members have observed, an extremely serious one and must be considered from various points of view, as it has many implications which must be seriously considered before the House expresses its opinion one way or the other on it. With regard to one aspect of the question, there can be no serious dispute at all between any two sections of the House, that is to say, that in itself drink very often degenerates into a vice and every civilized Government ought to make every possible effort that it is open to the Government to make, consistent with its other responsibilities, to put down this vice of drunkenness. With regard to the discussion of this question whatever differences there may be from the moral

4 P.M.

point of view between merely taking liquor and being drunk I shall make my submission on the ground that so far as the general view is concerned the permission to take drink in some cases, if not in a majority of cases, degenerates into a vice, and that, therefore, it would be admissible to adopt the point of view that total prohibition, if it were practicable and possible, is the only effective remedy for checking that evil. I will not enter into the question of excessive drinking and temperate drinking. I may have to make reference to this aspect of the question when I am dealing with the last part of this resolution which requests the Government to devote Rs. 50,000 annually towards the promotion of temperance propaganda. So far as the main part of the resolution is concerned I must take it that subject to the two limitations which I have submitted—the practicability and the possibility of carrying total prohibition into effect, there really is not much difference with regard to it, and to stress that point of view one or two considerations may be placed before the House in addition to those that have already been submitted by honourable members who have spoken in support of this resolution. All over the world this problem of drink degenerating into a vice is being tackled in various ways and the honourable mover of this resolution and other members who have spoken in support of this resolution have given the history of this movement against drink in various other countries and also the results that have been so far obtained supported by the opinions of observers and figures obtained from those countries. I will not attempt to cover the same ground over again, but I shall, so far as this country is concerned, draw your attention to a certain division that exists between those classes that use intoxicating liquors in this country. There are some classes that use it—so far as the Indian element in this country is concerned—more as a fashion or perhaps as a social necessity than anything to which they are by habit accustomed, and there are some classes who have resort to intoxicating liquors because they have become addicted to it. There is a very sharp division among these two classes in this country. Whenever we find members of the poorer classes in this country having recourse to liquor, there is no question of temperate drinking or excessive drinking. A member of these classes when he purchases intoxicating liquor for his own consumption or the consumption of his friends purchases it for the purpose of getting drunk and making other people drunk. There is no question with him either of social necessity or of temperate drinking or merely flavouring his food as it were with something which has more bite in it than the ordinary provisions that are available to him. So far as that class is concerned it is a pure vice. Every one of that class starts with the hope that he will not go to the limit to which other people go in the use of these intoxicating liquors, but very rapidly everyone who takes to drinking goes on to drink for the purpose of getting drunk and there can be no question that it is an absolute vice without any redeeming feature whatever and all those consequences that have been detailed by other honourable members who have spoken in support of this resolution flow from it, loss of health, loss of efficiency, loss of working hours and far greater than any of these, loss of character, and that loss is not always confined to the actual consumers of intoxicating liquor, but it spreads to the members of their families and sometimes affects the efficiency and the health and the character of the family unto the second and third generations even when these succeeding generations do not themselves use intoxicating liquors to excess. The



[Ch. Zafrullah Khan.]

other class which uses intoxicating liquors, as I have said, at any rate the Indian portion of it, uses it more, as I have said, as a question of either social necessity or as an imitation of something which is regarded or has come to be regarded as a fashionable necessity. With regard to this class at any rate, it may be said that whereas this class has benefitted a great deal from the institutions which the West has sought to import into this country and has benefitted in many directions, in this direction certainly the imitation of Western ways is doing a great deal of harm. A majority of the members of that class who either use intoxicating liquors themselves or supply intoxicating liquors to their friends on occasions when they entertain them do so not because they have a hankering after liquor or consider that there is no harm in the use of it, but because they think that no entertainment would be complete without the supply of these liquors, if among the guests are included gentlemen who ordinarily use such liquors. So far as this class is concerned we might at once dispose of it by saying that once you introduce prohibition in this province or in this country the use by that class of intoxicating liquors will disappear altogether. It cannot be supposed that members of that class will be out to violate the law in some manner in order that they might satisfy a hankering after liquor. The importance of the question from both these aspects, that is to say the desirability of prohibiting the use of liquor and the difficulties in the way of enforcing prohibition, keeping the financial aspect apart, really arises with regard to the lower classes in this country. As to these classes it has been amply demonstrated that the habit of liquor is growing. Even if one did not have the figure with regard to the actual quantity consumed from year to year more particularly of country liquor, because that is the kind of liquor which is more largely used by these classes, the very fact that revenue derived from excise in this province is almost steadily growing.....

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** It is declining.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** I am very glad that it is so and I shall not use that as a part of my argument. Then I must fall upon.....

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Consumption of liquor is increasing.

**Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** Then I must fall back upon the figures that actual consumption of country liquor as has been demonstrated by the honourable mover has increased in this province, and that certainly shows that the evil is increasing, if any argument were necessary upon that point. The revenue, whether it is growing or not apart, as I said, from the financial aspect of the question, forms a pretty considerable portion of the revenues of this province. We have been told that our total excise revenue is one crore and several lakhs, and out of that the revenue derived from the tax upon liquors alone is something near three-quarters of a crore. But as I have quoted these figures to show that if there is a greater difficulty in trying to enforce a policy of prohibition they can also be quoted to show that the greater the revenue derived from the consumption of liquor the greater the course which lies upon this province. It has been demonstrated that there is a direct connection between crime and drink all over the world and here in this country so that as a direct consequence of the consumption of larger quantities of drink every year you have an increase of crime every year and



unless you put an end to it you will go on having an increase of crime every year. I have so far merely stated the question with regard to its general aspects and with regard to its financial aspects, the objection which has in the past been raised and which is bound to be raised today and which is a very valid objection so far as it goes against the enforcement of a policy of total prohibition is that a very considerable portion as I have said, of the revenues of this province is derived from this duty on excisable articles and if you are going to enforce a policy of total prohibition, then certainly the province is going to be deprived of this source of revenue and this is bound to result in confusion and chaos in the financial field and any effort made in the direction of prohibition would not be worth the trouble and inconvenience and possibly financial stringency and distress that might result from this unbalancing of provincial revenues. That would be an argument put forth on behalf of Government with regard to its financial difficulties. On the other hand, the answer given to-day has been that certain economies would also be effected, that for the purpose of this discussion it is not valid to take the figures of the gross excise revenue, from this you must deduct the expenditure of maintaining the present excise establishment and then there would be, as it is hoped, reduction of crime and there would be other savings and perhaps the loss will not be as great as is apprehended. It is only, if valid, a very partial answer to the argument put forward on the other side. There is no doubt that the excise establishment, even if the object to be achieved were only the collection of excise revenue, would not be altogether abolished if there is total prohibition. On the other hand, as has been pointed out by my honourable friend Chaudhri Fazl Ali perhaps for many years Government would have to maintain an establishment for enforcing a policy of prohibition and for checking and putting an end to illicit distillation of liquor in this province, and if the expenses of that extra establishment will not be very much larger than the expenses of the present excise establishment they certainly will not be to any considerable extent less than the present estimate, and, therefore, for this part of the argument one might take it that no economy is likely to be effected for some years in this direction and even if these economies were to be effected, there is no doubt that the province would be faced with a very serious problem as to the adjustment of its revenues and expenditure. So far as that argument goes I freely admit the validity of that argument. But it does not necessarily result that this province should not make any serious effort in order to achieve a state of affairs which is universally desired. If that argument were at all times effective to dispose of all arguments in favour of the desirability of enforcing prohibition, then I am afraid it merely exposes the utter helplessness of all of us who have to tackle this problem to deal with a very serious evil and I hope we shall refuse to be reduced to that condition of utter helplessness. There is no doubt that if the object of this resolution were to compel the Government to adopt a policy of prohibition forthwith and immediately to put an end to all importation of liquor and to distillation of liquor in this province, the Government would be utterly powerless to carry out any such request if such a resolution were to be passed unanimously.

The position, therefore, is this, that there is a serious problem which everybody admits and I do not think that even on behalf of the Government it would be urged that this is a problem which does not require serious

[Ch. Zafarullah Khan.]

consideration, and on the other hand there is another problem which is likely to arise, and that also requires very serious consideration. The obvious course, therefore, is for Government first to consider whether the evils to which the present state of affairs leads are so serious as to induce Government to hold that the ideal state of affairs—not merely in fancy or in imagination but the ideal state of affairs in practice—to be achieved is a state of total prohibition, provided some reasonable and practicable solution of the other problem can be discovered. Once that position has been arrived at, it would be for Government to examine how far and within what practicable period they shall readjust their revenues and their finances in such a manner that after eliminating this particular source of revenue, their revenues would still be sufficient, and that it would be practicable after eliminating this source for Government to make both ends meet. I realise that the problem is not so easy as to be disposed of by saying that it is for Government to do so. I realise that they cannot do this single-handed. It is not possible to constitute a committee and for them to sit down and after half an hour or an hour's deliberation to reconstitute the entire financial system of this province. They alone are not concerned. The central government would be very seriously interested in the problem. It would also be interested in the prohibition problem, apart from the financial point of view. This is a matter which will involve the reconsideration of the allocation of the different sources of revenue to the provinces. This is a matter in which the provincial contribution to central revenues will have to be reconsidered. But even from that point of view it is absolutely necessary, and more necessary at this stage than at any other, that the province should make up its mind emphatically to press upon the Government that they will be required as time goes on with greater and greater urgency to deal with this problem and eventually they will have to be deprived of this item of revenue which they derive from the sale to the poorer classes of this province of a substance which is nothing less than an insidious poison. Once this urgency has been impressed upon Government and brought home to them they will then be in a position to approach the Government of India and to tell them that their province to a man insists that they should get rid of drink. If they have to get rid of drink, Government would be compelled as a result to readjust its finances and then within a practicable period of time, say a quarter of a century, the province will be deprived of this source of revenue, and I think it is necessary that we should warn the provincial Government that this source of revenue is likely to cease to exist in this province so that in any readjustment of finances which is likely to take place before the introduction of the next instalment of reforms the province should not be treated as if all the revenues that it at present enjoys were permanent sources of revenue and it should be realised by the central government that this source of revenue is likely to be lost. I would urge upon the Government that even from the financial point of view it is absolutely necessary that this House, rather this province through this House, should make it clear to Government that so far as the non-official members are concerned they have arrived at the conclusion that it is necessary to adopt total prohibition as the policy of this province, so that within a practicable number of years, having full regard to the other responsibilities of the Government that state of affairs should be achieved. That is my point of view with re-

gard to the first part of this resolution, that, realising all the difficulties that Government would have to face, that should be the state of affairs in this province.

Then, Sir, certain objections have been raised with regard to this part of the resolution that, if religion cannot stop people from drinking, prohibition cannot do so. That is no sort of an argument really. The sanction of religion is purely voluntary. It is a sanction which it is open to an individual himself who identifies himself with any particular religion is to violate with apparent immunity. But what we are really worried about is not so much the voluntary habit or rather the wish occasionally to take a glass of wine, but what we are aiming at is to stop those people from drinking who have lost the will power of controlling themselves with regard to this habit. No doubt the religious sanction has been set at naught, but that does not mean that no attempt should be made to put an end to this habit. For instance, take theft, which is prohibited by all religions, and yet people go on stealing. Nevertheless it has been found necessary to shut up people who have been convicted of theft for a certain number of years because it is necessary to reform them and also because it is necessary to prevent them from going on with their nefarious designs against the property of other persons. That is also total prohibition. A man is found guilty of having committed a theft. He is sent to jail for a long term of imprisonment and he is thereby totally prohibited from committing theft. You put him in jail and keep him away from the mischief of stealing anybody's property. His character may have been weakened to such an extent that he cannot resist the temptation of stealing, so by putting him in jail you completely prohibit him from stealing. That is total prohibition. Only the process in that case is reversed. If total prohibition is enforced to its strictest limits, nobody will be able to drink as no drink will be available. But it is said that, the moment you enforce total prohibition as a matter of law, you will find that illicit distillation will increase to a very large extent. That again is only a partial argument and not a very valid argument against the desirability of enforcing total prohibition. In the first place, as I have said, with regard to one class, that argument has no force at all. I cannot conceive of any member of the educated classes, once total prohibition has been enforced voluntarily going and trying to get liquor by illicit means. It must be an extreme case of an entirely depraved person who would voluntarily go and try to get liquor by illicit means. It is only the poorer classes who try to obtain drink always for the purpose of getting drunk who would resort to this means. There is no doubt that, when prohibition is introduced, there will be an attempt to increase illicit distillation, and that is why I concede that, during the first few years at any rate, Government will require additional staff in order to cope with that practice. At the same time, that class must steadily decrease rather than increase. Once the upper classes give up the use of liquor altogether, and society has set its face against it and the law prohibits the use of it, the detection of such offences would become easier, and this class is bound steadily to grow smaller and smaller, and the expenses which Government may have to incur on this additional staff will decrease gradually. Therefore, although the situation is no doubt fraught with difficulties, it is a situation which must be shouldered with a great deal of sense of responsibility. Government should summon courage to adopt the

[Ch. Zafrullah Khan.]

policy of total prohibition and should begin seriously to tackle this question of finance because that is the only real difficulty that is being put forward. There is no reason why the desired result should not be achieved within the space of fifteen years. That is my view with regard to the first part of the resolution. For all these reasons I whole-heartedly hope that Government will declare that it is their object consistently, as I have said, with their other responsibilities, to introduce total prohibition, and that they want to see in this province the day when it will not be possible, apart from medicinal purposes, to obtain liquor for the use of any person whatever, however low or however high his station in life might be.

As a matter of fact the feeling in favour of prohibition is so strong that unconsciously one of the honourable members who was speaking with regard to the subsequent part of this resolution supplied an instance in regard to it and perhaps also supplied the reason why prohibition is necessary. Chaudhri Fazal Ali, while speaking, referred to a previous occasion when this matter was under discussion in this House. He said that one of the honourable members who spoke on that occasion in support of the resolution was himself addicted to the use of liquor. He cited that as an instance to show the anomalous position of some of those who are supporters of total prohibition, but the instance does not rest there. It is a very psychological instance. Here is a gentleman, presumably well educated and therefore knowing full well the evil effects of the habit to which he was addicted and fully realising his position, getting up before the members of the House at that time, knowing all the time that the members of the House know his weakness and courting ridicule on that point and putting forward the plea that he had become addicted to the habit and requesting that Government should take such steps that he should not be able to get this poison, which was sapping his health, strength and character. What better plea is required in favour of total prohibition?

As to the second part of this resolution, I have partly dealt with it while dealing with the first part of the resolution; that is to say, the request that Government should give effect to the policy of total prohibition within the next fifteen years. I am sure I will not, after having spoken as I have done, be misunderstood when I say that it is rather unfair to expect that Government will at this stage be able to guarantee that it will be able to carry out this policy in this province during the next fifteen years, which, as I have submitted, involves a very great deal of responsibility on Government, and might for some time upset the financial system of this province. Without going into the question at any length, my own view certainly is that, provided Government take up a sympathetic attitude with regard to the first part of the resolution and are able to assure this House that they will do the utmost they can, subject, as I have said, to all those practical considerations and difficulties in their way, to achieve that desired state of affairs, it would perhaps not be wise to insist upon any special period within which they must complete the adoption of that policy.

As to the third part of the resolution that Government should set apart Rs. 50,000 every year for the promotion of temperance propaganda in this province, my own feeling is that, to begin with, certainly this is not the time

when Government could possibly spare any sum whether large or small for propaganda purposes of this nature while voluntary propaganda is being carried on to a large extent. But, apart from that, I have a rather doubtful feeling with regard to temperance propaganda. One of the honourable members of this House who spoke on this resolution was extremely careful when dealing with this part of the resolution and urging upon Government to set apart Rs. 5,000 for this purpose to employ the expression "excessive drink." He said that students in this province and little boys should be taught the evils of excessive drink and it was not merely that that expression slipped out, but it was advisedly used on each occasion when attention was being drawn to that part of the resolution. That is where I feel doubtful with regard to this temperance business as distinguished from total prohibition altogether. If it is said that by temperance the honourable mover of the resolution means total prohibition, that is, if Rs. 50,000 are to be spent in promoting propaganda for total prohibition, my submission would be that if the first part of the resolution is accepted, then Government would be spending large sums of money in order to achieve that desired state of affairs when nobody in this province should be able to drink. It would then be entirely unnecessary to spend any money on temperance propaganda. If, on the other hand, temperance means what it ordinarily does mean, that people should not drink to excess, although of course that also includes total abstinence, inasmuch as a man does not drink to excess if he does not drink at all, my submission is that, with regard to that class of people of this province who are the chief object of our anxiety in this matter, temperance is not likely to have any effect at all; and with regard to any class, after all, no man starts drinking from the first day with the object and the desire that he should become a drunkard. Everybody who starts drinking does so with a secret pledge to his own better conscience that he will drink only in moderation and will not drink to excess. Therefore, as I have submitted, without going further into a question which is likely to arouse controversy, because it is not really my object to discuss or review that aspect of temperance, I would say that, even if some money could be spared for this propaganda, this propaganda is really only of doubtful value. Combining with the fact that propaganda will be of doubtful value in the present financial situation, I feel I am unable to give my support to that part of the resolution. I hope, Sir, that Government would be able to give some sort of declaration or assurance which would be satisfactory to this House with regard to the first part of the resolution, and if that is done, perhaps the other two parts will become unnecessary.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** (Minister for Agriculture): Sir, I must begin by acknowledging the fairness and moderation with which every member of the House spoke on the resolution. I am quite sure every member of the House realises the gravity of this problem and the difficulties that are in the way of achievement of total prohibition and also that this is not a problem which is of recent origin, but has been before the world, as it were, from the very beginning. Religious teachers, as my friends have pointed out, have been preaching prohibition, and the drink habit has continued. I will not detain the House by going into historical details, but, I should like to say one word: no one who has the good of his

[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

country or his people or his family at heart can support a habit which is not conducive to health or well-being. The honourable member further expressed that, if Government were to declare prohibition as the goal of their policy, he will be satisfied. I wish it were in my power to give a pledge which Government could redeem. The honourable member will agree that any pledge that cannot be redeemed it is no use giving. I suppose that the honourable member realises that such a pledge that he desires is not likely to be redeemed in our lifetime.

The honourable mover of the resolution cited the case of the United States, where he said total prohibition has been enforced. I may tell him that from the days of Babylonian Kings 4000 years ago the question of prohibition has engaged the minds of men, and as to-day we are still faced with this problem it shows that all the attempts at total prohibition have ended in failure. Referring to the United States of America, Chaudhri Afzal Haq read out from a book, but I have a summary of a very careful survey before me giving altogether a different verdict, the New York correspondent of the "Sunday Express" saying "Prohibition enforcement in the United States has failed after an experiment which has lasted nearly ten years." Interest is added to this review of the situation by the announcement that the Drink Commission appointed by the new Labour Government will probably visit America during its tour of investigation into the problem of drink and prohibition.

I now come to the results. May I mention now the expenditure which the United States had to bear to enforce total prohibition and the results of this action? Says the correspondent—

"The prisons are overcrowded to a disgraceful state, and cannot properly accommodate the new rush of inmates. New York State authorities estimate that they will require between £ 5,000,000 and £6,000,000 to reconstruct prisons capable of coping with the increase in crime."

A marked feature of prohibition has been the manufacture of illicit liquor and its import in all places. There is certainly an enactment prohibiting drink, but, so far as the evil itself is concerned, it is widespread, perhaps more widespread than when prohibition legislation was introduced.

Coming nearer home, the state of Bhopal tried an experiment. I am sure this Council will be interested in the statement issued by the Bhopal Finance Department, which runs—

["Prohibition was introduced in 1921, an annual revenue of three lakhs was sacrificed, and the experiment, which lasted up to June of this year, cost the Bhopal Government nearly seventeen lakhs and then had to be given up as hopeless; prohibition only resulted in the transfer of revenue from the Bhopal Government to outside territory and in the people continuing the drink habit by illicit means."]

Then again, the Bombay Government tried what they called the rationing system, and the Commissioner of Excise says:—

"The fact cannot be denied that, since the first steps were made towards the prohibition goal in 1921-22 the revenue from excise has dropped by about 92½ lakhs; besides the additional cost of establishment of 40 officers and 316 menials.

"The continued rise in the abkari offences and the growing demoralisation of the people are the most alarming results of the present policy. On the lowest estimate.....the total cases of illicit distillation during the last year were 31,460, which, at an average of 2½ gallons per still, gives 78,650 gallons of liquor made and consumed locally."

With these instances before us, is it possible for us calmly to say that prohibition could be easily enforced and introduced in the Punjab? I ask the honourable mover, would it be wise for us to launch on an undertaking which has practically failed in countries like America, rich in all the resources of modern civilisation? Are we to learn nothing from the failure of Bombay and Bhopal? How can we try this experiment in the Punjab where the chances of its success seem to be altogether impossible?

Perhaps it may interest the honourable member to know the results of our own attempts in the Punjab to promote true temperance. I can with some pride say that what the Punjab has achieved no neighbouring province has achieved. We are trying to carry out a policy of definite control, aiming slowly and steadily to achieve all that the members who have spoken in favour of this resolution have in view. We are reducing shops, we are raising duties, and doing all that is possible to gradually bring about that state which in some future time may enable this House to realise the dream of total prohibition.

Let us take some of the figures. Consumption in 1910 was 4.41 lakhs gallons. Consumption in 1928-29 was 3.62 lakhs gallons. In 1906-07 there were 1,292 shops, which have since been reduced to 674. Now, Sir, let us look at the same problem from another point of view and compare our position with other provinces. The Punjab has 1 shop to 166 square miles, the United Provinces has 1 shop to 50 square miles and the Central Provinces has 1 shop to 50 square miles. Then again we find that, to every lakh of inhabitants, the Punjab has 3 shops, the United Provinces 5 shops and the Central Provinces 15 shops. Then again, if we take consumption per head of population, we find that the Punjab consumes 1.85, the United Provinces 0.89 and the Central Provinces 3.45. Now, no one can deny after the figures which I have placed before them that our policy has been altogether unsuccessful.

I have hopes that, if our present policy is maintained, and we receive that support to which we are entitled and people of our province are really prepared to control this habit, it may be possible to gradually reduce the habit of drink and eradicate it from the villages in the first place and then from the towns.

Then again you know that this Legislative Council passed the Punjab Local Option Act; and, if the extent to which that Act has been availed of is an indication of the desire of the people—and some members said that every man in the Punjab stood for the policy of total prohibition—then I am afraid we shall have to wait long for this happy result. I should have liked to have read a statement which I have before me showing what little demand there has been for the application of this Act. I think it is too long a statement to read, but, if honourable members would care to study it—and I think it is worth studying—I shall be glad to lay it on the table.

The honourable Mr. Mohan Lal, with his usual fairness, took into account all the difficulties that Government may have to face. He realised that a large loss of revenue will be the inevitable result. He was



[Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh.]

aware that large additional expenditure would have to be incurred. He went further—and that is an indication of the honesty of his purpose—when he expressed his readiness to impose new taxes, such as death duties, super-taxes, tax on improvement of town land and private contributions. I do not know how far he carries the wishes of the people with him, but, so far as I am aware, none is prepared to shoulder additional burdens and I doubt if the sources mentioned by him would find a sum of 2 crores which would be required to cover the loss in revenue and to meet the new expenditure. The financial aspect, as Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan pointed out, is the most important part of the problem and will have to be very carefully considered. It is not only a provincial problem, but an imperial problem of great complexity. The excise problem is more than a provincial problem not only from the financial point of view, but also from the prohibition point of view, that liquor poured in from the neighbouring States and Bhopal lost money in the bargain. The prohibition policy, unless it is supported by all the provinces and all the neighbouring States, cannot be effective. It will have to be an imperial policy and will have to be decided by the Imperial Legislative Council, so that the whole of India may jointly enforce it. Without that united and imperial consent it would be impossible to prevent the flow of liquor from one province or neighbouring State into another. Therefore, as far as I can see, three things will have to be definitely accepted even by members who have spoken in favour of the resolution. One is the financial aspect and the other is the imperial aspect, and the third, as Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan pointed out, is the time aspect. I do not know what good it would be to express the pious hope that the policy of Government is to secure total prohibition if we cannot do it within a reasonable time. As far as I can see, and as far as I can gather from the speeches of the honourable members who have spoken, there is no possibility of its realisation. I do not know how Government could bind itself to a policy which it cannot carry out. If I may, I should like to draw the attention of the House to the policy which is at present guiding the Government of the Punjab. It is to steadily decrease the number of shops in the villages, to control licences in the towns, and, if there is any tendency indicating a rise in consumption, to increase the duty and to use every other means in its power to control the habit of drink. I think my honourable friend, Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan, will agree with me that we are in a way carrying out what he has in view.

Lastly, Sir, prohibition must come from within, and, as experience of centuries has shown, it cannot be forced from outside. We would court failure if we try to prohibit it. Human hungers are not easy to control, and drink is one of the hungers. I have often asked myself why it is that people like to drink, and the only answer I could find is in the words of Ghalib;

مے سے غرض نشاط ہے کس روستا کو  
اک گرتہ بخوردی مجمع دن رات چاہئے

Saints and sages seek self-forgetfulness in their love of God; lesser men in drugs and drink.



**Mr. V. F. Gray** (Punjab Chamber of Commerce and Trades Association, Commerce): Sir, what is rather surprising

5 P.M.

to me in the debate to-day is the fact that we have a resolution in three parts of which the third part, which suggests propaganda, is the one which does not seem to be popular with any part of the House, whereas the earlier parts of the resolutions in no way appeal to me. It seems to me that restrictions of drink should be by persuasion rather than by legislation. It is a very, very easy form of indirect taxation, and, provided people drink in a temperate manner, it is a very nice way of paying one's tax; it is a good tax so long as the taxation is not sufficiently high to drive people to the temptation of illicit distillation. Legislation will not stop drink as has been proved in the United States. It will only add to law-breaking, and will of course cause extra taxation to be imposed to make up the deficit. The worst feature, in my opinion, of prohibition, especially in a country like the Punjab, is the opportunity you are giving, for the eternal cry that we always have here, of police persecution. You cannot have prohibition without a very strong preventive force who must interfere with family life to find out if illicit distillation is going on. You are going to have endless trouble for a rather doubtful gain. Do you consider that any group of people elected by a popular vote has any right to legislate against the habits of the people, and to make such a definite and drastic change in the lives of people without a definite mandate from the electorate? I quite agree if the majority of people in the province want total prohibition; you have then got a fairly sound ground for examining the best avenues to get it. But I do not think the majority of the masses are clamouring for it at all. I think that time should be spent in propaganda work, trying to create public opinion against drink or against excessive drink. As I said at the beginning, it should be by persuasion, and not legislation. ]

To reply in more detail to one or two remarks made by the honourable mover. He told us that prisons in America were empty since prohibition has come into being. But what about prisons in England? They are being emptied to such an extent that they are now closing many. Yet there is no prohibition in England. The honourable mover has also an idea that all the money saved in drink will go into the savings bank, which again seems to me rather an unlikely place for them to go. For, from the recent debates we had in this Council, it seemed to me evident that all the money belonged to the money-lenders who alone will be the people to benefit by money saved. The honourable mover then pointed out by figures that there was an increase in the Punjab in regard to consumption, as well as under revenue. I have not got the exact figures before me, but the preventive measures against illicit distilling are probably beginning to have some effect. A reduction in the price of duty so as to make illicit distilling less tempting is probably the explanation why the number of gallons of licit drink has increased. (*The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh*: Those are figures of last year. They have decreased this year.) I consider a drop in the tariff excise means that there will be more consumption shown in Government revenues—because it is not so tempting now to do illicit distillation as it used to be—without really more drinking. Therefore, as the consumption figures are really dropping, the consumption must be much less, for, even if they did rise in the excise revenue, it does not necessarily mean that there is

[Mr. V. F. Gray.]

more spirit being drunk. It only means that there is less illicit spirit, and more licit spirit, being drunk. We were also told, in connection with the various classes of people, if total prohibition came into the province, that nobody would attempt to drink if he was forbidden by law, except the very poor classes. That is the direct opposite from the experience of America. For, the largest amount of drink in America is done by the wealthy people because it is difficult for the poor to buy it in America. It is procurable by any one who could pay for it. It is expensive and the masses could not afford it, while the middle and upper classes could continue to drink. The honourable mover then raised the question of the opium evil and showed how we eventually put a stop to opium going into China. We did undoubtedly, but is China getting less opium now? (*Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal*: You were not willing to do it, but you were forced to adopt that policy.) Whether it was so or not, we prevented opium from going into China. The result is that China is growing its own opium. Similarly, if you stop people being able to procure spirits in the Punjab, there is the great danger that you will drive them to the use of drugs.

Lastly, the question of cost. The honourable mover talks of adding extra taxation to recompense for one or two crores loss in revenue from excise. Do not honourable members think that pressing for temperance propaganda as against drinking to excess a better proposition and spending such revenue in other needs, beneficial needs so frightfully wanted in the province, such as compulsory education, advancement of industries, and various activities that would add to the prosperity of the country, than sacrificing that income for a very doubtful advantage? What I submit is that you want as much public opinion, as much propaganda, in the country towards temperance as possible, but do not attempt total prohibition.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** [South-East Towns (Muhammadan), (Urban)] (Urdu): Sir, the honourable member for Gujrat had expressed the hope that the Government will readily accept the first part of this resolution. Not only that; he went even so far as to remark that there could be no two opinions as far as that part was concerned. Then the honourable member for Sialkot appealed to the Government saying that the declaration of such a policy would be in the best interest of the Government itself. Now after that we were looking forward to the Honourable Minister for Agriculture to fulfil these very reasonable expectations. But when he did rise and made his speech all these fine hopes were rudely disappointed and we were compelled to say—

انے نے سوال کا یہ مختصر جواب

He flatly refused to give any undertaking whatsoever on the ground that total prohibition was impracticable, and therefore it was not possible to offer any promise in this connection. As an Indian, he was very profuse in expressions of sympathy with the resolution and the aspirations of the people; but, as the Minister in charge, he was not prepared to give any material shape to his sympathy.

Then, Sir, the arguments advanced by the Honourable Minister are as unconvincing as they are strange and novel. First, he quoted the figures for the years 1907 and 1910, and then with a sudden leap began to compare

them with those for the year 1927-28. Had he begun with the year 1921 or 1922 and tried to prove by comparing the figures for the most recent years with each other that the Government was really following a policy which was sure to effect reduction in the consumption of liquor, then of course it could have been possible to come to some conclusion. But the method which he has been pleased to employ reveals nothing.

A similar resolution was moved in this Council in 1925. At that time I discussed the reasons for the increase in the consumption of liquor and the number of liquor shops, and, though the Government benches tried to offer a reply to my arguments, their logic was far from convincing. No doubt there was a considerable decrease in the excise revenue during the year 1921-22, but it was due to some special reasons and circumstances. But after that there has been a steady increase in the number of liquor shops, as well as in the consumption of liquor, both licit and illicit. Now let us see what this report for the year 1927-28 has to say.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** It is not the latest report.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** This is the latest report I could get from the library.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** That has not been published yet.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** It ought to have been available by this time, especially when it was known that this resolution was coming before the Council in the budget session. Now the very first sentence of this reports reads thus :—

“The Excise Report under review reveals a rise in the consumption of country liquor.”

I need not repeat the figures which have already been quoted by the honourable mover of the resolution. Then the second paragraph begins with the following sentence :—

“Nevertheless, though the increase in licit consumption was probably accompanied by a considerable decrease in illicit output, the manufacture of the latter still continues.”

As it was not possible to deny the steady and enormous increase in the consumption of licit liquor in the presence of stern figures, the Government has tried to find some consolation by saying that this increase was probably accompanied by a considerable decrease in illicit output. But let us see what this considerable decrease is. The report says that during the year 1927-28 “Two hundred and twenty-four working stills were captured as against one hundred and ninety in the previous year.” And then—

“The number of persons arrested for illicit distillation rose from 1,229 to 1,310 and of convictions from 577 to 692. One zaildar and 13 lambardars in the single district of Ferozepore were dismissed for dereliction of duty.”

Now may I ask, Sir, whether this is what they mean by “considerable decrease?” On the contrary, these figures clearly show that there has been a considerable increase in the consumption of not only licit, but illicit liquor as well. In the presence of these facts and figures the Government cannot claim with any amount of decency that it is following a successful policy of reduction in the consumption of liquor.

[Rana Firoz-ud-din Khan.]

Then, Sir, they have compared this province with the United and Central Provinces. In this connection I am free to admit that in one or two respects our province appears to compare favourably with the United and Central Provinces, but in other respects it is no better than the latter. But then they have not told us as to what was the comparative position of these three provinces in the previous years. If previously the Punjab was much better than the other two provinces, and now it is only a little better, then of course our province has made no progress. On the other hand, it has fallen from its high pedestal.

Then it was said that this evil has accompanied mankind from the very day this world came into existence. The Honourable Minister was pleased to remark that all the religious leaders have tried to eradicate this evil, but their efforts were not crowned with success. In this connection he referred to the ancient kingdom of Babylonia. But I will draw his attention to a living example. It is well known that, as far as the use of liquor is concerned, the condition of Arabia was much worse than that of any other country. But its use was stopped by one word. The Prophet of Islam, an illiterate orphan, rises one day and as a messenger of God enjoins his followers not to touch it, saying: "It is unclean from to-day," with the result that not only is liquor thrown away, but even those vessels which had come into contact with those containing liquor are broken and thrown away. Even now, after the lapse of more than 13 centuries, it is looked upon as the most unclean thing in every Muslim country. Take the case of Turkey, Persia, Afghanistan, Arabia.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** Yes, what about Persia?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** The *araq-i-angur* used in Persia is not liquor,

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** What about Umar Khayyam and Hafiz?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Oh, those were only the usual revellings of Eastern poets. They were not drunkards as you think them to be. Take the case of those Islamic countries and you will find they are absolutely dry. Even in the Punjab consumption of liquor is much less in those parts which are populated mostly by Muslims, such as the western districts.

It must be remembered that the number of Muslims is very small in the Central Provinces, and therefore it cannot compete favourably with the Punjab. The greater the number of Muslims in a country, the less is the consumption of liquor. Therefore it is not correct to say that the religious teachers and leaders have not been able to achieve any success. They were immensely successful.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Yes, they have met with some success here and there.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Then we were referred to the Local Option Act. But I beg to submit, Sir, that that Act has not met with any success anywhere because its provisions are so inherently defective that it is impossible to give effect to it. It is no wonder that only the Hissar district has attempted to make some use of it.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I have not read that list yet.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Well then I may let it alone. But I must say that it is really surprising to find even that single district trying to make use of that worthless Act.

Now this resolution is very reasonable and absolutely harmless. The Government may attain this object in 15, or even in 20, years. It only asks the Government to accept the principle and make a declaration to that effect. The honourable minister has not told us whether he wants to decrease the consumption of liquor or to increase it.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** To decrease it.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** That is good. But no effective step has so far been taken to attain that object. You say you have increased the excise duty, but I submit that you cannot reduce the consumption of liquor by any amount of increase in the duty. To make the licit liquor more costly will simply increase the illicit output.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** That is right.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** And, if you make it cheaper, the consumption will again increase. Therefore you cannot decrease the consumption of liquor unless you declare its use punishable under the law.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The use of illicit liquor is already punishable.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** That amounts to nothing else than that it is illegal, immoral and irreligious even to touch a single drop of liquor prepared by the consumer himself or any other person; but, if the liquor is purchased from you, then the consumer would not offend against any religious or moral code even if he were to drink tons of it every day. This means that it is illegal from the revenue point of view only. The verse quoted by the Honourable Minister, namely :—

مے سے غرض نشاط ہے کس رو سیاہ کو اک گودہ ہے خودی مجھ دن رات چاہئے

does not fit into the present excise policy of the Government. Instead of that, he ought to have quoted the following couplet :—

تاک را سو سبز کن اے ابر نیسان بہار قطره کو مے توازد شد چرا گوهر شود

Therefore, if the Government is only after the excise revenue, it would cease to talk of its earnest desire to decrease the consumption of liquor; but, if it is really anxious to effect such a reduction, then I must submit that no increase in the excise duty can help to attain that object. In that case all distillation, as well as consumption, must be declared illegal. It is a pity that although, as has been pointed out by my honourable friend Chaudhri Afzal Haq, there has been a welcome change in the mentality of the non-official element of this Council during the last five years, the attitude of the official block is still the same.

**Pir Akbar Ali :** It has become more unsympathetic.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Quite so. And now, as there is no difference of opinion with regard to the second part of the resolution, I need not say anything about it. But, as regards the third part, I am surprised to see that, although the first two parts relate to total prohibition, money is asked for only temperance propaganda in the third part.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** By temperance propaganda I mean propaganda for total prohibition.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Then I quite agree with you. I do not deny the value of propaganda, but it must be abstinence propaganda, and not temperance propaganda. A particular class of people carried on vigorous propaganda against liquor in the year 1921, and, although the Government opposed those people with its usual zeal and strength, there was a very considerable decrease in the consumption of liquor.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** What kind of liquor ?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Both licit as well as illicit. I speak from my personal knowledge ; as an instance, the inhabitants of 20 villages in the Hoshiarpur district met in a diwan and swore not to touch liquor of any kind.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** And are they total abstainers even now ?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** I do not know; they may not be, now that propaganda has ceased, and therefore its effects have naturally disappeared. It is quite true, Sir, that the financial condition of the Government is not very encouraging and it is just possible that, owing to certain circumstances, its expenditure may still increase. But, if some money is set aside to help this kind of propaganda, it will do immense good to the province.

In the end, Sir, I must say that the speech made by the Honourable Minister for Agriculture has in no way strengthened his position, nor has he been able to refute the arguments advanced in favour of this resolution. Had he come forward with some cogent and convincing arguments, it might have been possible for one to revise his opinion. But he has totally failed to do so, and therefore I strongly support the resolution under discussion.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend (Financial Commissioner) :** I associate myself with the remark that fell from the Minister for Agriculture that the gentlemen who have spoken in support of this resolution did so with great moderation. I have listened with great interest to this debate, which is not the first on the subject I have heard.

This Council, Sir, has acquired a well-deserved reputation, since it came into existence, for sanity and common sense, and I am confident that it will maintain that reputation by declining to pass this resolution.

We all, even we on the Government benches, are in sympathy with temperance. There is no doubt that excessive drinking does cause crime, and, speaking for myself, I should welcome this resolution if I thought that, as a result of its adoption, the consumption of liquor of all sorts would cease. In that contingency I should be prepared to do all I could to find the necessary money. I have just said the words " liquor of all sorts " because I have

seen in the speeches of some members a distinct tendency to disregard the fact that there is such a thing as illicit liquor as well as licit liquor. I was for some years Commissioner of the Jullundur division, where a good deal of liquor is drunk. I can assure the House that the problem offered in some districts of that division by illicit distillation is serious to a degree. The ancestral habits of the people are largely the reason for this. Sugarcane is very common in the districts in question, and it is therefore easy to distil illicit liquor.

I turn now to deal with some of the specific remarks that fell from the speakers this afternoon. America has figured largely in more than one speech, and America has been dealt with by the Honourable Minister. I get every month an American journal which is not devoted only to questions of temperance and prohibition, but deals with subjects of every variety. I have been much struck with the amount of discussion that this question of prohibition is at present causing in America. In nearly every issue there are long papers on the subject from one side or the other. Some maintain that prohibition is good and has been a success, and others say that it is entirely bad and has failed in its object. Mr. Afzal Haq, the member from Hoshiarpur, quoted extracts from a book written by an American gentleman saying that it is entirely good. The Honourable minister quoted extracts from newspapers saying that it is entirely bad. I will tell you two things which came to my own notice. Three years ago I was the guest of an Indian gentleman at Jullundur who had some American gentlemen staying with him. I asked one of them about prohibition. He replied that I was the 79th person who had questioned him on the subject. He said that before prohibition came he got his liquor from London and that he still got it, only he had to pay more for it. Again a soldier friend of mine went to New York. On his return I asked him about prohibition. He replied that an American met him in New York, took him round the city, and in the evening said: "I must get some more whisky." They went to a place where whisky was sold. My friend remained outside in the car and a little later saw a car coming with the head of the police; he naturally feared that his friend would be arrested. But his fears disappeared when he saw the head of the police himself come out of the house with four bottles of whisky. (Laughter.)

I venture to bore the House with a repetition of some facts about an instance of prohibition which I gave to this House two years ago. It happened in the year 1810 when the Emperor Ala-ud-Din Khilji reigned in Delhi. He, from the best of motives, imposed a policy of prohibition on the city of Delhi, which was then a walled city, and in it therefore the enforcement of prohibition was easier than now. General prohibition was proclaimed. Distillation, however, continued and a considerable amount of liquor was imported into the city. The guards were doubled and smugglers were very severely handled by the law, but the evil still continued; people resorted to villages at a safe distance to drink, or distilled in their own homes. Eventually the Emperor was driven to permit distillation to be conducted privately, and alcohol so distilled to be consumed in private.

The evening is getting on and I have only one or two other remarks to make. My friend Chaudhri Fazl Ali from Gujrat said that much liquor and *charas* is smuggled into the Punjab Indian States. I speak with the greatest respect for Indian States, but it is no use ignoring facts. We have, in the

[Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.]

heart of this province, many important Sikh States, and I, as a Financial Commissioner, have much to do with them on questions of liquor and excise administration. Suppose, Sir, that this House adopts the resolution, and that in 15 years total prohibition becomes the law in this province. Do the members of this House, as reasonable men, really think that these States will follow our example? Do they not perceive that by adopting this policy they will be only throwing lakhs of rupees into their pockets? The smuggling from them into the Punjab would be immense and the opportunities of which we hear so much from Mr. Afzal Haq would increase enormously. I ask the House to consider these points of view. I do not wish to stress the many difficulties that lie in the way of the achievement of prohibition. We have been told that Bombay has taken the lead in adopting this policy. True, but Bombay is making very slow progress. The honourable mover said that he is confident that, if a general election was fought on the issue of prohibition, then the supporters of the policy would be returned in a majority. Whatever the defects of the Local Option Act, on which my honourable friend Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan has laid so much stress,.....

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** It is a very imbecile measure.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend :** The honourable member himself was a member of the Council when this imbecile measure was passed. Well, Sir, we have the Local Option Act under which a referendum can be called. But the number of people in any town who have ever taken the trouble of voting on such a referendum can generally be counted on the fingers of both hands.

My friend Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan criticised the Honourable Minister. He is capable of looking after himself, but I wish to say that the Honourable Minister has, since he has come into office, realised his responsibilities and has appreciated the fact that there is a vast difference between passing destructive criticisms in opposition and the actual administration of a department.

The particular remedy that we have been offered for illicit distillation is propaganda. Propaganda is a word of which we now hear a great deal. It is like the blessed word "Mesopotamia." There is, however, a limit to the effectiveness of propaganda. When people are accustomed to liquor from childhood, it is extremely difficult, nay, it is entirely impossible, to stop them from drinking purely by propaganda. With these words, I ask the House to reject this resolution.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** I will only take 5 minutes because I feel that the time is slipping and we might like to go home. The Honourable Minister, while replying to our arguments, congratulated the House and the Government on the fact that the number of shops has decreased, and that the number of gallons of liquor consumed has also decreased. He took the figures for 1910-14. But I have got a statement on page 6 of the report for 1927-28, which the honourable members would perhaps like to listen to. It says that the total number of shops in the Punjab in 1923-24 was 517 and in 1927-28 655, which means an increase of 138. The number of gallons consumed in the Punjab in 1923-24 was 122,000 gallons and in 1927-28 the number of gallons



consumed was 540,000, which means an increase, excluding States and other provinces, of more than four times. If the Government can be congratulated on these figures, then certainly we must congratulate them.

**Mr. J. D. Penny :** May I suggest that it is unfair to take the figures of 1923-24? The decrease was due to the fact that there was non-co-operation in those days.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** I have taken the figures since the Reforms came into existence. The consumption of country liquor in the Punjab has increased by four times (*hear, hear*) and the number of shops has increased since 1923 by 188.

If the Ministry can be congratulated on this achievement, then I join in the congratulation.

One word more, about Mr. Gray's remarks. It is due to the civilisation of the West and of the community to which my friend Mr. Gray belongs that we are suffering from this evil—an evil which is eating into the very vitals of our life—and the sooner we get rid of it the better. There is another reason why Mr. Gray is opposed to my resolution. His country is getting crores of rupees from the liquor traffic, and we cannot possibly expect any sympathy from him or from the nation to which he belongs. I am sorry that I am rather harsh in my words, but that is how I feel.

**Mr. V. F. Gray :** Sir, I was not in my speech referring to any of the foreign liquors; I was referring to country liquor consumed in this country.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** As I was saying, we cannot expect any sympathy from Mr. Gray, and he cannot have any sympathy in our aspirations. So far as I remember, more than two crores are going from India to foreign countries on account of the sale of wines in India. We send our children to England and they imbibe this bad habit of drinking. In fact, I would recommend my friend Mr. Gray to stir up his own community in England to take steps that their children may be saved and our children may also be saved.

Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan has clearly put the case before the House and I need not repeat it. There are two classes, the upper classes and the lower classes, for which total prohibition is necessary. There will no doubt be loss of revenue involved in the eradication of the evil, but Government should not grudge it. During the first few years it will no doubt be an expensive affair, to put up the staff to see that there is no illicit distillation. My humble submission is that, if Government declares the policy of total prohibition and follows that policy, I for one would be satisfied. There would be no question of time-limit. Let Government come forward and make a declaration of its policy, and I can assure you that the money that will be spent on propaganda work will be money very well spent.

With these remarks I submit the resolution to the House in the hope that my honourable friends will lend their support to it. If our Government declares its policy, it will give a good lead to other provinces. If the Punjab Government were to do so, I am sure other provinces would also take similar steps and follow us. I can say with regard to the Jail Enquiry Committee report that we took the lead and the other provinces followed.

[R. B. L. Mohan Lal.]

and the Government of India accepted the principle of our report. If the Government of India knows that the Punjab is going to follow the policy of prohibition, and other provinces will also follow our lead, the Government of India will have to yield and will have to find a solution of this problem. With these remarks I commend this resolution of mine to the House.

**Mr. President :** As the resolution involves three distinct points, I propose to put each point or part of the resolution separately. The question is—

"This Council recommends to Government to declare a policy of total prohibition in the Punjab."

The Council divided : Ayes 22, Noes 28.

### AYES.

Mr. M. A. Ghani.  
Mr. Labh Singh.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal.  
Chaudhri Ram Singh.  
Lala Mukand Lal Puri.  
Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana.  
Lala Gopal Das.  
Lala Jyoti Prasad.  
Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri.  
Pandit Mehar Chand.  
Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah.

Mr. Din Muhammad.  
Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan.  
Pir Akbar Ali.  
Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammadi  
Amin Khan.  
Malik Khan Muhammad Khan,  
Wagha.  
Mian Nurullah.  
Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad  
Hayat, Qureshi.  
Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.  
Chaudhri Afzal Haq.

Mr. E. Maya Das.

### NOES.

Mr. H. Calvert.  
Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.  
The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan,  
Noon.  
Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar  
Khan.  
Mr. W. R. Wilson.  
Mr. R. Sanderson.  
Mr. W. S. Dorman.  
Mr. H. P. Ashton.  
The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal.  
The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogen-  
dra Singh.  
The Honourable Sir Alexander  
Stow.  
The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-  
Husain.  
Mr. A. Mitchell.

Mr. J. D. Penny.  
Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie.  
Mr. H. W. Emerson.  
Mr. S. L. Sale.  
Mr. Owen Roberts.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Rattan Chand.  
Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram.  
Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali.  
Sardar Hari Singh.  
Mr. V. F. Gray.  
Lt. Sardar Raghubir Singh.  
Sardar Bahadur Captain Dalpat  
Singh.  
Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sheo Narain  
Singh.  
Sardar Bishan Singh.  
Sardar Mohindar Singh.

The motion was lost.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That this Council recommends to the Government to take steps to give effect to the policy of total prohibition in the Punjab within the next 15 years."

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** If the answer to the first part of the question is in the negative, the steps to enforce that non-existing policy surely cannot be put to the Council.

**Mr. President :** The first part of the resolution, which has been negatived by the House, says that Government should declare the policy of total prohibition in the Punjab. Now the Government may not declare its policy, and yet it may carry it out. Therefore it is open to the Council to request Government to give effect to that policy in a certain number of years.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I think, Sir, your logic is absolutely faultless. It is perfectly true that a man may have a policy of prohibition, and yet refuse to declare that policy. But I think you will agree with me that no Government in the Punjab, or for the matter of that anywhere else, would have a policy of prohibition, and yet conceal it from the public of the Punjab as if it were ashamed of it, and yet go on enforcing it.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** Sir, I beg to differ from the interpretation of the Honourable Revenue Member. It is quite possible that the Government may not like to declare a thing, and still do it, as is generally done. (*Laughter.*) It would be perfectly justifiable if you put the second part of the resolution also to the House so that the House may declare itself one way or the other as to whether it agrees with the second part or not.

**Mr. President :** There might be some inconsistency between these two parts as pointed out by the Leader of the House, but I do not consider it to be so clear that the first part entirely negatives the second. Therefore, I will put the second part to the House.

The original resolution was—

"This Council recommends to the Government to take steps to give effect to the policy of total prohibition within the next 15 years."

since which an amendment has been moved—

"That the words 'try and' be inserted between the words 'to' and 'give.'"

The question is that the amendment be made.

The motion was lost.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"This Council recommends to the Government to take steps to give effect to the policy of total prohibition within the next 15 years."

The motion was lost.

**Mr. President :** The third part of the resolution moved was—

"This Council recommends to the Government to provide in the budget Rs. 50,000 a year for temperance propaganda."

since which an amendment has been moved—

"That for the words 'Rs. 50,000 a year' the words 'Rs. 5,000 (five thousand) a year or such larger sum as can be set apart' be substituted."

The question is that that amendment be made.

The motion was lost.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"This Council recommends to the Government to provide in the budget Rs. 50,000 a year for temperance propaganda."

The motion was lost.

The Council then adjourned till 11 A.M. on Friday, the 28th February 1930.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 8RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Friday, the 28th February 1930.*

THE Council met at the Council Chamber at 11 A.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the chair.

### STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

#### GRANT-IN-AID TO AIDED SCHOOLS.

**\*2867. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) whether the details of grant-in-aid earned by aided schools are supplied to the schools concerned ;
- (b) whether such a practice existed in the past ;
- (c) if this practice is not observed now, the reasons for the same ;
- (d) whether such details can be supplied to the management of an aided school on request ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) No definite rules have been framed nor have any orders been issued in this regard, but the details of the assessment of grant are largely confidential; though the inspector often discusses certain matters concerning the grant with the school concerned.

- (b) Not so far as I am aware.
- (c) Does not arise.
- (d) No.

#### GRANT-IN-AID RULES.

**\*2868. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) whether the rules regarding the method of calculating grant-in-aid have been framed by the department, and, if so, whether they are uniformly observed by the inspecting officers ;
- (b) will he please lay a copy of the rules on the table.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** Yes. The rules are contained in Chapter III of the Punjab Education Code. Efforts are always made to secure all practicable uniformity in the observance of these rules by the

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

inspecting officers; and the recommendations of the Inspectors in regard to grants are also examined in the office of the Director of Public Instruction.

#### PROSECUTION OF CERTAIN CONSTABLES AND HEAD CONSTABLE.

**\*2869. Lala Joti Parshad :** (a) With reference to answer to part (c) to my question No. 2747, asked on 6th December 1929, will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state whether the question of prosecuting the head constable and constables has received further consideration of the Government.

(b) If so, with what result?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) It has been decided that the further prosecution of the head constable and constables concerned is not necessary. Their sentences in the second case under section 350, Indian Penal Code, were upheld by the High Court and both officers have been dismissed from the Force.

#### FAMINE RELIEF IN HISSAR.

**\*2870. Lala Joti Parshad :** With reference to answer to (d) of my question No. 2664\* starred put by me on 2nd December 1929, will the Honourable Revenue Member please state in detail what other measures, to afford relief which were under the consideration of the Government then, have been taken in hand up till now?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Test works have been started at Jagmalera and Rania in the Sirsa Sub-Division, Jhallanian in the Fatehabad tahsil, and Jui, Tosham and Siwani in the Bhiwani tahsil. Over rupees six lakhs have been advanced as taccavi loans during the current financial year. Of land revenue due in Kharif 1929, over rupees four and half lakhs have been suspended and over five thousand rupees remitted. Liberal concessions have been sanctioned for the importation of fodder from a large number of Railway Stations. Municipal Committee of Bhiwani has been granted a loan of Rs. 5,000 free of interest for expenditure on relief works. The Municipal Committee of Hissar has also spent a sum of Rs. 1,694 to afford relief to the people who are in distress.

#### WAR SCHOLARSHIPS.

**\*2871. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

(a) the amount of Budget provision under the head "War Scholarship" in 1928-29 and in 1929-30 and the amount actually spent out of the funds budgetted;

(b) the restrictions which have been placed on the award of War Scholarships since the institution of these scholarships?

\*Vol. XIV, pages 710-11.

\*Vol. XIV, page 561.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :**

	<i>Provision in the budget for the education of the children of Indian soldiers.</i>	<i>Amount actually spent.</i>
	Rs.	Rs.
(a) 1928-29	4,00,000	2,98,840
1929-30	4,00,000	2,68,157

There are still some districts which have not yet claimed the amount of the second instalment.

(b) Copies of the circulars issued on the subject from time to time will be supplied to the honourable member.

**EMPLOYMENT OF STATUTORY AGRICULTURISTS.**

**\*2872. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- the measures of progress, which statutory agriculturists have made in securing employment in his department from year to year since he assumed office ;
- whether it is a fact that the consolidated list shows the general effect of promotions, retirements and new appointments combined, and not of new appointments alone ;
- if the proposition stated in (b) is correct the number of appointments in the Provincial Educational service and in the first two highest grades of the Subordinate Educational Service (Anglo-Vernacular Section) which went to Hindus, Moslems and Sikhs and to statutory agriculturists under each head in each year since the 1st January 1927 ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) It is not understood what the Honourable Member means by "measures of progress."

(b) Yes.

(c) In view of the information made available in the consolidated statement it is not proposed to compile this further information.

**RURAL REPRESENTATION ON THE PUNJAB UNIVERSITY.**

**\*2873. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state the exact measure of rural representation on each of the governing bodies of the Punjab University ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The Universities Act does not provide for representation on the governing bodies of the University by reason of residence in any particular locality.

\* Not printed, but kept in the library.

## BHAKRA DAM PROJECT.

**\*2874. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state—

- (a) whether the revised estimates for Bhakra Dam Project have been completed; if not, when are they expected to be completed;
- (b) whether the contemplated aerial survey has been made;
- (c) whether the committee of Engineers proposed to be appointed to examine the effect of the Bhakra Dam schemes on the water level of the Indus has been appointed, and, if appointed, whether the committee has submitted its report;
- (d) if the committee referred to in (c) has not been appointed, what are the reasons for the delay, when it is proposed to appoint the committee and within what maximum period its report is expected to be submitted?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No, but preliminaries are in hand, and every effort will be made to proceed with the Project as early as practicable.

(b) No aerial surveys were contemplated in connection with this Project; work on the rectangular surveys has, however, been taken in hand by No. 22 Party of the Survey of India which is solely employed on this work.

(c) The committee has been appointed and should meet on April 1st.

(d) The delay is due to the fact that suitable officers have not been available. It is hoped that the report will be submitted within 5 months of the committee starting work.

## STATUTORY AGRICULTURISTS AS NAIB-TAHSILDARS.

**\*2875. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state—

- (a) the number of Hindu statutory agriculturists serving as Naib-Tahsildars according to the consolidated list published on the 1st January 1927, 1928 and 1929;
- (b) if there has been a fall in the number of Hindu statutory agriculturists serving as Naib-Tahsildars, what are the reasons of this reduction?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a)—

1927	..	..	..	..	..	15
1928	..	..	..	..	..	19
1929	..	..	..	..	..	17

(b) The figure for 1929 should read 19 as in 1928. The particulars of one Hindu statutory agriculturist Naib-Tahsildar of the Rawalpindi Division were omitted in the list for 1929, as he was only officiating; but he has now been confirmed with retrospective effect from the 31st March, 1928. Another Hindu statutory agriculturist Naib-Tahsildar of the Jullundur division was incorrectly shown as a Sikh, the word "Singh" in his name having caused the misunderstanding.



**MUNICIPAL COMMISSIONERS AND INDEPENDENCE DAY CELEBRATION.**

**\*2876. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that a Hindu Municipal Commissioner of Sonapat has been called upon by the Sub-Divisional Officer of the place to explain why action should not be taken against him for being the member of the Congress Committee which passed the resolution of Independence ;
- (b) whether the Government issued any instruction to the Deputy Commissioner of the province to take action against those Municipal Commissioners who took part in the celebration of the Independence day ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) He was called upon for an explanation but not merely for being a member of the Congress Committee which passed the resolution of Independence.

(b) Government has issued certain instructions relating to the participation in the Independence movement of the Committees of Local Bodies or of individual members of the committees of Local Bodies in their capacity as members.

**POLICE INTERFERENCE WITH JUDICIAL OFFICERS.**

**\*2877. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the attention of the Government has been drawn to the recent remarks of Mr. Justice Fforde which he made in the judgment of transfer application of Kiran Chandra Dass who was tried by Mirza Mehdi Hussain under section 107, Criminal Procedure Code ;
- (b) whether the Government have issued any instruction to the magistracy to independently uphold justice and not to abide by the instructions of the Criminal Investigation Department or other executive officers ;
- (c) whether the Government have also issued any instructions recently to the police officers not to offer suggestions to judicial officers and thereby interfere in the discharge of their judicial work ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) No.

**RESIGNATION OF MUSLIM MEMBERS OF MONTGOMERY MUNICIPALITY.**

**\*2878. Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Government is aware that the Muslim members of Montgomery municipality sent in their resignations some two months back as a protest against the high handedness of the President ;
- (b) If so, what action has been taken to redress their grievances ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Five Muslim members of the municipal committee of Montgomery tendered their resignations sometime ago.

(b) Before the resignations were accepted by the Commissioner, the members withdrew their resignations and have been informed by the Commissioner that any representation made by them will be duly considered and enquired into.

#### AZAN CONTROVERSY IN ZAFARWAL.

**\*2879. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Azan controversy is going on in the village of Zafarwal, district Gurdaspur;
- (b) whether it is a fact that Commissioner of the division visited the place;
- (c) what are the facts with regard to the Commissioner's visit and what did he say there?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Government understand that there is now no controversy regarding the *Azan*, which is being called regularly.

(b) Yes, on January the 17th 1980.

(c) The Honourable Member is referred to the letter of the Commissioner which appeared in the issue of the *Muslim Outlook*, dated the 23rd January 1980, a copy of which is laid on the table.

Copy of letter from Sir H. D. CRAIK, Commissioner, Lahore Division, as published in the *Muslim Outlook*, dated the 23rd January 1980.

Sheikh Sadiq Hassan's statement published in your issue of January 22nd regarding my visit to Zafarwal village on January 17, so gravely misrepresents what I said on that occasion that I feel impelled to write to you to correct the impression which the statement may produce.

After hearing what the Imam of the mosque and the headmen of the village had to say regarding the facts of the dispute, I explained that I was not a court of law and that it was not my function or my intention to pass any orders in the matter, but I proposed to offer both parties my friendly advice as to the best means of terminating this unfortunate dispute. I informed the Muslims that the proclamation of *Azan* was not an unlawful act but I advised them, in view of the fact that the calling of the *Azan* caused annoyance to their neighbours, to refrain from calling it until an amicable arrangement was reached. My advice was certainly not "tantamount to an order." I reminded them that the Sikhs were the sole owners of the village. I then told the Sikhs that any annoyance that might be caused to them by the proclamation of *Azan* seemed to be a small matter compared with the trouble and expense that had already been caused by this dispute. Both parties have been involved in expensive litigation, and I reminded them that they had to spend their lives together in the same village and advised them to come to a friendly settlement as soon as possible.

I then informed the five or six gentleman from Amritsar, who had arrived at the village before myself and the Deputy Commissioner, that my experience was that such disputes in villages were usually settled in a friendly fashion, if they were not kept alive by interference from outside, and I advised the visitors to leave this village alone to settle its dispute by itself. I informed Sheikh Sadiq Hasan that I would undertake that the Muslims would not be forcibly molested by the Sikhs if he and his friends would abstain from interference (the Sikh Zamindars having repeated before me a promise they had already given to this effect) and that I was convinced that the matter would in that event be settled amicably. No doubt my advice to the Amritsar gentlemen was not palatable, but it was not conveyed with any discourtesy.

As regards the allegation of damage to the mosque, one of the gentlemen from Amritsar pointed out to me a "*parnala*" that was slightly out of the straight. As there had been very heavy rain during the three days preceding my visit, I was convinced that this trifling damage was due to natural causes and not to the action of any individual.

In conclusion I would call attention to the advice given by Sheikh Chiragh Din, Advocate of Gurdaspur, *viz.*, who is appearing for the local Muslims in the proceedings now in progress in the Courts, conveyed in his letter published in your issue of the 19th of January. In that letter Shaikh Chiragh Din referred to the fact that the local authorities had given a sympathetic hearing to representations put before them by himself and other local Muslims, and advised the Muslims of Amritsar and other places against visiting Zafarwal with the object of encouraging the Muslims of Zafarwal to call out *Azan*. His advice on this point coincides with my own.

#### EXEMPTION OF SWORD FROM THE OPERATION OF THE ARMS ACT.

**\*2880. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in spite of the recommendations of the Punjab Legislative Council Government have not so far been able to exempt sword from the operation of the Arms Act in all the districts of the Province;

(b) if so, why?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) and (b) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to Council question<sup>1</sup> No. 2835. (Starred)

#### COMPULSORY PRIMARY EDUCATION.

**\*2881. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the committee to devise means of making the primary education free and compulsory in the province has been appointed;
- (b) if not, when it will be appointed;
- (c) what will be the terms of its reference?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) The terms of reference are as under :—

The Committee will—

- (a) inquire into and frame estimates for the application of compulsion to boys at the primary stage of their education so that all boys of school going age are at school ; these estimates will have reference in particular to (i) maintenance ; (ii) inspection, (iii) the training of teachers, and (iv) capital expenditure on buildings and equipment ;
- (b) report on the appropriate stages by which in a given number of years the object of introducing compulsion can be best attained ; in particular how the principle of compulsion is to be extended to areas where at present under the operation of the Punjab Primary Education Act compulsion has not made adequate progress ;
- (c) to suggest ways and means whereby the additional funds required for the purpose can be raised ;
- (d) to devise a suitable machinery for the purpose of disposal of cases arising from a failure on the part of parents and guardians to comply with the conditions of the present Act.

#### COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION IN HYDRO-ELECTRIC BRANCH.

**\*2882. Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture kindly state—

- (i) the number of Hindus, Sikhs and Muslims who have so far been appointed to the following gazetted posts in the Punjab, Public Works Department, Hydro-Electric Branch :—
  - (a) Executive Engineers,
  - (b) Assistant Executive Engineers,
  - (c) Transmission Line Engineers,
  - (d) Assistant Engineers ;
- (ii) the number of posts of the following categories sanctioned for Transmission circle formed on 1st September 1929 :—
  - (a) Executive Engineers,
  - (b) Assistant Executive Engineers,
  - (c) Transmission Line Engineers,
  - (d) Assistant Engineers,
  - (e) Apprentice Engineers,
- (iii) the number of posts referred to in part (ii) above filled by (a) Hindus, and (b) Muslims.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :**

(a) None.

(b) Hindus	..	..	..	..	2
Sikhs	..	..	..	..	None.
Muslims	..	..	..	..	None.

(c) None.

(d) Hindus	..	..	..	1
Sikhs	..	..	..	1
Muslims	..	..	..	1

(ii) No new posts of the categories referred to in the question have been sanctioned for the 'T' Circle but the posts shown below have been transferred from 'E' Circle to 'T' Circle :—

(a) 2.

(b) 1.

(c) None.

(d) None.

(e) 7.

(iii) (a) Executive Engineers—

Hindus	..	..	..	None.
Muslims	..	..	..	None.

(b) Assistant Executive Engineers—

(a) Hindus	..	..	..	1
(b) Muslims	..	..	..	None.

(c) Transmission Line Engineers—

Hindus	..	..	..	None.
Muslims	..	..	..	None.

(d) Assistant Engineers—

Hindus	..	..	..	None.
Muslims	..	..	..	None.

(e) Apprentice Engineers—

Hindus	..	..	..	5
Muslims	..	..	..	None.

## HYDRO-ELECTRIC ESTABLISHMENT CHARGES.

\*2883. Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal : Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture kindly state—

(a) the average monthly cost of the following classes of establishment in the Hydro-Electric Branch.

(i) Gazetted officers ;

(ii) Subordinate staff ;

(b) the percentage of the cost with reference to the Hindu, Sikh and Muslims communities ?

The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh : I cannot say till I hear from the authorities concerned, who have been requested to supply the necessary information.

## 'AZAN' DISABILITY IN VILLAGES.

**\*2884. Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal :** Will the Honourable Finance-Member kindly state—

- (a) whether there are any villages in the Punjab in which the Muslims do not enjoy the freedom of "Azan" ;
- (b) if the answer to (a) is in the affirmative, the number of such villages ;
- (c) what steps, if any, does Government propose to take to remove the disability wherever it exists ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) and (b). With the exception of the village of Zafarwal in the Gurdaspur district (where it is understood that the matter has been settled) Government have received no complaints that Muslims do not enjoy the freedom of *Azan*.

(c) Does not arise.

## IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICES.

**\*2885. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of vacancies in the Provincial Forests Service and the time for which they have been lying unfilled ;
- (b) the number of vacancies in the Imperial Forest Service and the time for which they have been lying unfilled ;
- (c) if so, why ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :—**

(a) *Provincial Forest Service.*

1 vacancy since December, 1928.

1 vacancy since February, 1929.

Total 2 vacancies.

(b) *Indian Forest Service.*

3 vacancies since March, 1921.

1 vacancy since April, 1926.

1 vacancy since July, 1927.

1 vacancy since November, 1927.

1 vacancy since January, 1928.

1 vacancy since March, 1928.

Total 8 vacancies.

(c) As the anticipated development of the Department has not fully materialized it has been necessary to keep these appointments vacant. With the exception of one vacancy in the Indian Forest Service all the vacancies mentioned above have been proposed for abolition.

## WORKING PLANS CIRCLE IN THE FOREST DEPARTMENT.

**\*2886. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that a third circle known as the ' Working Plans Circle ' was formed in 1927 in the Forest Department ;
- (b) whether it has now been abolished ;
- (c) if so, the reasons for the same ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, as the Working Plans and Utilization Circle.

(b) No.

(c) Does not arise.

## FOREST DEPARTMENT.

**\*2887. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that there is a strong complaint of officers being in excess of requirements in the Forest Department ;
- (b) if so, why one more Imperial Forest Service Officer was recruited last year and why another was obtained from Bengal ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Government is not aware to what complaints the Honourable Member refers. It might, however, be mentioned for his information that the question of the strength of the Forest Services is already under the consideration of Government. Proposals have been submitted for the sanction of the Secretary of State to the abolition of 7 posts from the cadre of the I. F. S., and it is proposed to abolish 2 P. F. S. posts. Suitable reductions in other directions will also be made as opportunity occurs.

(b) The recruitment of the two officers mentioned was necessary to meet the requirements of the Department owing to retirements, etc.

## HEAD QUARTERS OF UPPER BUSHAHR DIVISION FOREST DEPARTMENT.

**\*2888. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the headquarters for the Upper Bushahr division (Forest Department) were built at Gopalpur but were never actually occupied.
- (b) how much money was spent on those buildings and why the quarters were condemned ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) Rs. 14,600 were spent on the construction of buildings at Gopalpur, but owing to the abolition of the Bushahr, Timber division and the constitution of an Upper Bushahr division, the headquarters of which were fixed at Nichar, and not at Gopalpur, which is outside the limits of the Upper Bushahr division, the clerks' quarters at Gopalpur are now used as Range-quarters and the headquarters house as a rest house.

## EXCISE STAFF, HISSAR DISTRICT.

**\*2889. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Excise staff in the Hissar district is inadequate to cope with the work of preventing extensive smuggling of opium into the Hissar district from Bikaner State ;
- (b) whether Government is considering the question of increasing the staff ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The matter is being examined.

(b) Yes.

LOCAL BODIES—SEPARATE ELECTORATES FOR MUSLIMS—DATE OF INSTITUTION.

**\*2890. Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government kindly state :—

- (a) the year and the municipal committee or district board where separate electorates were introduced for the first time for Muslims ;
- (b) whether the policy was adopted on the representation of an organised body of Muslims and, if so, the representation of that body may be placed on the table ;
- (c) whether before the introduction of the separate electorates the matter was ever placed for discussion before the Punjab Council of pre-reform days ;
- (d) whether any organised Hindu Association was consulted in the matter ;
- (e) whether the plan of reserved seats for Hindus and Muhammadans with a joint electorate was ever discussed by Local Government in the Council or with an organised body of Hindus and Muhammadans.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The required information is being collected. It will be communicated to the Honourable Member when ready.

UPPER CHENAB CANAL—LEVY OF TAX.

**\*2891. Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (1) whether an impost of annas 8 per acre of matured crop was levied on the Upper Chenab Canal between 1923 and 1926, and, if so, from which harvest did the levy of the impost begin and in which harvest did it end ;
- (2) under what law was the impost levied and whether Government will lay on the table of the House any notification issued authorizing the levy ;



- (3) the purpose for which the tax was levied and the reason for which it was discontinued ;
- (4) the total amount of the tax recovered from the zamindars during the period in which the tax continued ;
- (5) if the tax was imposed for a special object of a temporary nature what is the total amount spent on that object by the department ;
- (6) whether Government will place on the table of the House letter No. 368-R.-I., dated 12th March 1928, from the Chief Engineer to the Superintending and Executive Engineers of his Circle ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (1) Yes.

(2) Under Act XIII of 1873.

Copies of the notifications Nos. 1101 R. I., dated 21st November 1917, and 868 R. I., dated 12th March 1928, are attached.

(3) It was levied to recoup Government for expenditure on *killabandi* and the construction of culverts and water-courses on the canal, and discontinued when it appeared that the recoveries would be sufficient for the expenditure contemplated.

(4) Rs. 17,58,811. This figure is subject to audit.

(5) Rs. 11,48,800. This figure is subject to audit. From the balance in hand, it is proposed to reserve an amount sufficient to cover the cost of construction of such water-courses and culverts as are considered necessary in the immediate future, and to refund the remainder in the form of a deduction in two successive harvests, from the total *abiana* due on the actual area matured of those crops on which it was originally levied.

(6) Copy attached.

Punjab Government, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch, Gazette Notifications.

*The 21st November 1917.*

No. 1101 R. I.—*Notification.*—In exercise of the powers conferred by section 75 of the Northern Indian Canal and Drainage Act, 1873 (Act VIII of 1873), as amended by Acts XVI of 1889 and IV of 1914, the Lieutenant-Governor is pleased to direct the substitution of the following rule for rule 21 of the Rules under Act VIII of 1873, applicable to the Upper Chenab Canal, Lower Bari Doab Canal and the Upper Jhelum Canal within British territory and published under Punjab Government, Irrigation Branch, notifications Nos. 9-R. I., dated 3rd January 1913; 06-R. I., dated 20th May 1913, and 275-R. I., dated 13th March 1915, respectively.

#### 21. *Charges for the use of water.*

The charge for the use of water shall be made on the area irrigated at the rates specified in the schedules for the time being in force, and subject to the following rules : provided that in the case of lands irrigated from water-courses which have been constructed at the expense of the Government, an additional charge of eight annas per acre may be levied on crops irrigated from the said water-courses till such time as the cost incurred by Government has been recovered.

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

*Dated Lahore, the 12th March 1928.*

No. 868-R. I.—*Notification.*—In exercise of the powers conferred by section 75 of the Northern India Canal and Drainage Act, 1873 (Act VIII of 1873) as amended by Acts XVI of 1889 and IV of 1914, and in supersession of Punjab Government Irrigation Branch notification No. 1101-R. I., dated 21st November 1917, the Governor in Council is pleased to direct the substitution of the following rule for rule 21 of the Rules under Act VIII of 1873, applicable to the Upper Chenab Canal, Lower Bari Doab Canal, and the Upper Jhelum Canal within British territory and published under Punjab Government, Irrigation Branch, notifications Nos. 9-R. I., dated 3rd January 1918; 06-R. I., dated 20th May 1913, and 275 R. I., dated 13th March 1917 respectively:—

21. *Charges for the use of water.*

The charge for the use of water shall be made on the area irrigated at the rates specified in the schedule for the time being in force and subject to the following rules: Provided that in the case of lands for the irrigation of which watercourses have been constructed at the expense of the Government an additional charge of eight annas per acre may be levied on crops irrigated within such lands, till such time as the cost incurred by Government has been recovered.

RATTAN SINGH BOMB CASE.

\*2892. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of persons prosecuted under section 307-109, Indian Penal Code, in connection with Rattan Singh Bomb case in Jullundur district;
- (d) whether it is a fact that two accused who have been prosecuted under section 307-109, Indian Penal Code, are detained in Jullundur jail pending receipt of sanction from Government for more than four months;
- (c) what is the cause of delay in disposing of this case?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow:** Full details are not yet to hand. They will be communicated to the honourable member as soon as received.

'AZAN' CONTROVERSY IN ZAFARWAL.

\*2893. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) whether Government have received information that a compromise has been reached between Sikhs and Muslims over the *Azan* controversy in the village Zafarwal, district Gurdaspur;
- (b) whether Government are aware of the fact that according to public opinion a high Government official instead of improving the situation in Zafarwal has aggravated it;

- (c) whether the Government have issued instructions to the local district authorities that before giving orders in communal matters an attempt should always be made to effect a compromise.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** It is regretted that the material for this reply is not ready. A reply will be given to the honourable member in due course.

#### STUDENTS' STRIKE IN ENGINEERING COLLEGE, MUGHALPURA.

**\*2894. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Government received information that the students of Moghulpura Maclagan Engineering College went on strike ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that Anglo-Indian students first put the Union Jack on their coats on the Independence day and Indian students put national flag on their coats afterwards ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that Indian students were punished for wearing national flag ;
- (d) whether the Government had issued any instructions to the Principal to punish the students for putting on the national flag ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret that the answer to the question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### HOUSE AND WATER RATES IN MULTAN CITY.

**\*2895. Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government kindly state—

- (a) whether the Government is aware of the situation that has arisen over the non-payment of house and water taxes in Multan city ;
- (b) whether any representations were made to the Government against the proposed rates ;
- (c) if so, what action was taken ;
- (d) whether the Honourable Minister has been able to find time to go to the spot and see things for himself ;
- (e) what safeguards does the Government contemplate adopting to avoid similar situations arising in other places in future ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) These representations were duly considered by Government before sanctioning the imposition of the taxes in question.

(d) Yes.

(e) The only safeguard possible would be to require a town desiring a proper water-supply to collect its share of the capital cost by taxation imposed prior to the construction of the work. No committee is likely to

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan, Noon.]

propose action of this sort as such taxation would naturally be even more unpopular than taxation imposed after a water supply has been constructed and is functioning.

NATIONAL FLAG HOISTING OVER MUNICIPAL BUILDINGS AT RAWALPINDI.

**\*2896. Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government kindly state—

- (a) whether Government is aware of the scenes of rowdyism created in a meeting of the Rawalpindi municipality over the controversy of hoisting the national flag on the municipal buildings ;
- (b) if so, what steps have been taken by the Government to put a stop to such open incitement to violence and challenge to authority by law established ;
- (c) if no steps have been taken so far, what action Government proposes to take to deal with this open defiance of authority ;
- (d) whether the Government proposes to declare its policy in connection with the declaration of independence in Lahore last December ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Government are aware that members of the public admitted as spectators to a meeting of the Rawalpindi Municipal Committee on January 25th created a disturbance in the municipal hall.

(b) The ring-leader of the disturbance was prosecuted, but on his tendering a full apology to the President of the Committee and to a member he had particularly insulted, the case was withdrawn.

(c) Does not arise.

(d) The policy of Government is to prevent the subversion of constituted government and to maintain law and order.

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

MATRICULATION RESULTS AND REDUCTION OF GRANTS.

**1528. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) how many boys were sent for Matriculation in the years 1928 and 1929 from the D. A.-V. High School, Shahabad (District Karnal), A. S. V. High School, Ambala, A.-S. V. High School, Pundri, C. A. V. High School, Hissar, and Jat High School, Hissar, and how many were successful, giving the percentage in each case ;
- (b) was the percentage of successful students less in the above schools in the year when grants were reduced ;
- (c) if not, what are the reasons in detail for the reduction of grants in each case ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** Information is being collected and will be supplied to the honourable member when ready.

**KANKAR USED ON THE DELHI-MONTGOMERY ROAD.**

**1529. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) the kind of *kankar* used at the time of the last construction of the Hissar-Hansi section of the Delhi-Montgomery road ;  
 (b) the kind of *kankar* used on the Hissar-Fatehabad section ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :—**

(a) *Hansi-Hissar Section.*

Miles 88 to 97 were renewed with "*bhata*" *kankar* from the Bawani Khara quarries and 98 to 102 with "*bichhwa*" from the Kurli quarries.

(b) *Hissar-Fatehabad Section.*

Miles 103 to 106 were renewed with "*bichhwa*" *kankar* from the Kurli quarries and miles 107, 108, 110, 112, 117 and 122 with "*bichhwa*" *kankar* from the Durjanpur quarries. Miles 109, 111, 113 to 116, 118 to 120 and 123 are proposed to be renewed next year with Durjanpur "*bichhwa*" *kankar*. Miles 109 and 111 were originally consolidated with "*bichhwa*" *kankar* from the Durjanpur quarries, miles 113 to 116 and 118 with "*bichhwa*" *kankar* from the Agroha quarries and 119 to 121 and 123 with "*bichhwa*" *kankar* from Chindar.

The Agroha and Chindar quarries have since been abandoned owing to the *kankar* being very soft.

**METALLED ROADS.**

**1530. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) how many miles of metalled roads there are in each district of the Punjab ;  
 (b) whether it is a fact that Hissar district has got comparatively a very small number of mileage of metalled roads ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The statement is placed below.

(b) No.

**LENGTH OF METALLED ROADS IN EACH DISTRICT OF THE PUNJAB.**

District.	ROADS MAINTAINED BY			Approximate total.
	Public Works Department.	Municipalities including Cantonments, town committees and notified area committees.	District Boards.	
	Up to 31st December 1929.	Up to 31st March 1928.	Up to 31st March 1928.	
Hissar .. ..	89.90	33.97	32.30	156.17
Rohtak .. ..	133.934	33.58	97.0	264.514

[ Hon'ble Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh. ]

District.	ROADS MAINTAINED BY			Approximate Total.
	Public Works Department.	Municipalities including Cantonments, town committees and notified area committees.	District Boards.	
	Up to 31st December 1929.	Up to 31st March 1928.	Up to 31st March 1928.	
Gurgaon .. ..	127.11	15.98	54.00	197.09
Karnal .. ..	136.23	15.82	87.14	239.23
Ambala .. ..	42.85	47.538	100	190.388
Simla .. ..	2.68	21.25	..	23.93
Kangra .. ..	97.41	..	..	97.41
Hoshiarpur .. ..	12.00	9.53	74.87	96.40
Jullundur .. ..	47.16	20.8	138.94	206.90
Ludhiana .. ..	58.32	33.18	117.65	209.15
Ferozepore .. ..	112.53	39.035	93.0	244.565
Lahore .. ..	159.04	82.30	39.0	280.34
Amritsar .. ..	88.75	71.28	56.29	216.30
Gurdaspur .. ..	105.98	10.91	49.81	166.48
Sialkot .. ..	68.97	13.00	14.31	94.37
Gujranwala .. ..	113.57	19.14	14.00	146.71
Sheikhpura .. ..	119.25	7.78	12.00	139.03
Gujrat .. ..	37.88	6.58	49.50	93.96
Shahpur .. ..	61.25	23.89	86.50	171.64
Jhelum .. ..	34.96	15.91	12.0	62.87
Rawalpindi .. ..	128.59	48.24	41.25	218.08
Attock .. ..	123.64	10.33	10.75	144.72
Mianwali .. ..	16.00	4.07	6.5	26.62
Montgomery .. ..	216.32	29.52	55.0	300.84
Lyallpur .. ..	38.89	35.23	116.25	190.37
Jhang .. ..	14.60	10.73	34.81	60.14
Multan .. ..	165.11	67.71	68.50	301.32
Muzaffargarh .. ..	52.88	3.14	4.92	60.94
Dera Ghazi Khan .. ..	33.15	12.31	2.25	47.71

## ROAD FROM HANSI TO BHIWANI.

**1531. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that there is no *pucca* road from Hansi to Bhiwani in the Hissar district ;  
 (b) if so, whether Government intend to take any steps to provide such a *pucca* road ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) Attention of the honourable member is invited to the reply given to part (b) of question No. 2397 (starred).

## MOTOR ACCIDENTS.

**1532. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) whether there were any motor accidents in the districts of Hissar, Gurgaon, Karnal and Rohtak in the years 1928 and 1929 ;  
 (b) if so, what was the number of such accidents yearly in each district ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b)				1928.	1929.
Hissar .. .. .	..	..	..	5	12
Gurgaon .. .. .	..	..	..	4	8
Karnal .. .. .	..	..	..	10	18
Rohtak .. .. .	..	..	..	20	31

## CRIMINAL APPEALS IN SOME SESSIONS COURTS.

**1533. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member please state—

- (a) the number of sessions cases and criminal appeals in the Sessions Courts conducted in each of the following districts in the years 1927, 1928 and 1929 :—

Hissar, Hoshiarpur, Ambala, Karnal, Ludhiana, Gujrat, Gujranwala, Sheikhupura and Montgomery ;

- (b) the pay of the Public Prosecutor in each of the above districts ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## ARMS LICENSES IN AMBALA DISTRICT.

**1534. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state the number of arms licenses districtwise in the Ambala division for the years 1928, 1929 and 1930 ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** 1. The number of licenses for arms in force in the Ambala Division for 1928 is :—

				Rs.
Ambala	..	..	..	1,714
Karnal	..	..	..	1,674
Gurgaon	..	..	..	1,140
Rohtak	..	..	..	1,087
Hissar	..	..	..	855
Simla	..	..	..	646
Total				7,116

2. The statistics for 1929 are not yet available.

3. The statistics for 1930 have yet to mature.

## GRANT-IN-AID TO THE MUSLIM ORPHANAGE AT MIANWALI.

**1535. Khan Bahadur Khan Muhammad Saifullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- whether it is a fact that the Education Department prepared necessary papers for the grant of a grant-in-aid to the Muslim Orphanage and Hostel at Mianwali some two or three years ago ;
- whether it is a fact that the Secretary of the said institution also made repeated requests for the same ;
- if so, what action Government intends to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** An application for grant-in-aid from the management of the Muslim Orphanage and Hostel has been received and is under consideration.

## FERRY TOLLS ON MOTOR VEHICLES.

**1536. Khan Bahadur Khan Muhammad Saifullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- whether it is a fact that the ferry tolls at present levied at the bridges on the Jhelum (near Khushab) and the Chenab rivers for motor vehicles is heavy, being Rs. 3 per vehicle at the former bridge and Rs. 6 at the latter for a single crossing ;
- whether Government have any proposals under consideration to reduce the rates ?



**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) The ferry tolls at present levied at the bridges on the Jhelum (near Khushab) and the Chenab rivers on motor vehicles for a single crossing are as follows :—

Description.	RATE OF TOLLS LEVIED AT PUBLIC FERRIES.			
	On the Chenab in the Lahore Division.		On the Jhelum in the Rawalpindi Division.	
	Laden.	Unladen.	Laden.	Unladen.
	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.
Four wheeled motor vehicle ..	6 0 0	6 0 0	2 8 0	2 8 0
Motor bicycle with side-car ..	1 8 0	1 8 0	..	..
Motor bicycle without side-car ..	1 0 0	1 0 0	1 0 0	1 0 0

(b) A bridge-of-boats is included in the definition of a ferry in section 8 of the Northern India Ferries Act, 1878. The maximum rates of tolls prescribed by Government for ferries in the Lahore division undoubtedly appear high when considered as tolls for the use of a bridge-of-boats. Government are, therefore, proposing to take immediate steps to reduce with effect from the 1st April 1930, the maximum rates admissible in the Lahore Division when the ferry takes the form of a bridge-of-boats.

#### MUSLIM OFFICIALS IN MIANWALI.

**1537. Khan Bahadur Khan Muhammad Saifullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- whether it is a fact that Mianwali is a semi-frontier district and agricultural tribes are wholly Muslims and form about 90 per cent. of its total population ;
- the number of Government servants responsible for the administration of the district communitywise ;
- whether the Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, is a non-Muslim and has been there for a period of more than four years ;
- what steps Government intend to take to redress the grievance of the Muslim inhabitants of that district in so far as the appointment of Muslim officials in that district are concerned ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, and Muslims form 86·22 per cent. of the total population.

(b) A statement showing communitywise the number of Government servants, including and under the Deputy Commissioner, is placed on the table.

(c) Yes.

[Hon'ble Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

(d) As Muslims already hold 69 per cent. of the total appointments and their claims are receiving due consideration on the occurrence of vacancies, Government considers that no action is called for.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF APPOINTMENTS COMMUNITY-  
WISE INCLUDING AND UNDER THE DEPUTY COMMIS-  
SIONER, MIANWALI.

Designation of posts.	NUMBER.				Percentage of Muslims to the total population.
	Muslims.	Hindus.	Sikhs.	Others.	
Deputy Commissioner, Sub-Divisional Officer, Bhakkar and Extra Assistant Commissioners.	4	3	1	..	Per cent. 50
Tahsildars .. ..	2	1	..	..	67
Naib-Tahsildars .. ..	3	3	..	..	50
Excise Inspector .. ..	1	..	..	..	100
Superintendent, Head Clerk and Clerks.	44	24	..	..	65
Namal Canal Establishment ..	1	..	..	..	100
Kanungo Establishment ..	15	10	..	..	60
Patwaris .. ..	137	78	..	6	62

#### WASTE LAND IN JHANG.

**1538. Sayad Muhammad Husain :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- whether it is a fact that Government waste land was auctioned in the district of Jhang in 1925 at a high price ;
- whether it is also a fact that the three last crops were complete failures in the Jhang district ;
- whether it is a fact that the zamindars of the district represented to His Excellency the Governor on the 29th January 1925 to extend the instalments of unpaid price of auctioned area ;
- if the answers to the above are in the affirmative, what action has been taken in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, a fairly good price, i.e., Rs. 290 per acre was the average.

(b) Surely the honourable member is indulging in exaggeration. Kharif 1928 was the only one which can be called a failure ; and land revenue and water-rate to the extent of one-half were remitted.

(c) and (d) The honourable member appears to have missed the date of representation. The number of outstanding half-yearly instalments were doubled in June 1928.

## COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION IN THE LAHORE CO-OPERATIVE UNION.

**1539. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of elected members of the Lahore Co-operative Union and the number of Hindus, Musalmans and Sikhs amongst them ;
- (b) the principle on which representation has been granted to various communities ;
- (c) the number of Hindu and Sikh members who have resigned during the last one year and-a-half as a protest against the existing system of representation of various communities in the Lahore Co-operative Union ;
- (d) the existing strength of Hindu, Musalman and Sikh members, respectively ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The question has necessitated certain enquiries to which a reply is awaited. The answer will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

## COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION IN CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETIES.

**1540. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) the total number of Hindu, Sikh and Mussalman members respectively of the Co-operative Societies in the Punjab ;
- (b) the total amount of loans given and deposits received by these Co-operative Societies ;
- (c) the total number of Hindu, Sikh and Musalman debtors and depositors, respectively ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The trouble and labour involved in furnishing the requisite information for the honourable member is out of all proportion to the importance of this question.

## GRANT-IN-AID TO SCHOOLS—MUSLIM'S SHARE.

**1541. Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that various Islamic bodies in the province (e. g., Anjuman-i-Islamia, Rawalpindi) recently represented to His Excellency the Governor that the mode of distribution of grants-in-aid to schools should be revised so as to enable the Muslim community to receive a fair share from the money spent by the Government in this behalf ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that His Excellency the Governor was pleased to say that the point having been stressed by the Central Anjuman Himayat-i-Islam, Lahore, also, His Excellency

was considering the same in consultation with the Honourable Minister for Education ;

(c) if so, what action has so far been taken in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### JHELUM RIVER.—RISE OF BED LEVEL OF—

**1542. Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

(a) whether the Government have taken any steps to find out the changes that have taken place in the bed level of the Jhelum River since the construction of the Canal Headworks at Rasul and the Railway bridge at Jhelum ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the wholesale ruin of the Jhelum town and the villages below caused by the floods of 1928 and 1929 was due to the rise of the river bed by deposits of silt on account of Canal Headworks ;

(c) if so, what measures the Government have taken or propose to take to prevent the recurrence of a similar disaster ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) The Canal Headworks at Rasul have no effect whatever on the water-levels at Jhelum, 20 miles upstream. The damage done to the town in August 1929 was due to the flood in the river being nearly 50 per cent. greater than anything previously known, and at Mangla, 20 miles above Jhelum, the water rose more than 12 feet above the highest level of which there is any record in the past.

(c) Does not arise.

#### THE ATTOCK OIL COMPANY.

**1543. Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the land for the Attock Oil Company in the Campbellpur district was compulsorily acquired from the local zamindars in 1921 and again in 1925 ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the said company has alienated several plots of land to various bodies and individuals ;

(c) if so, whether the company has been authorised to do so ;

(d) whether it is a fact that the Government is again acquiring more land from the zamindars for the said company ;

(e) if so, whether Government intend to impose any restrictions on the power of alienation enjoyed by the company ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## THE ATTOCK OIL COMPANY.

**1544. Shaikh Abdul Ghani:** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government kindly state—

- (a) whether there is a proposal under consideration to place the Attock Oil Company area under a notified area;
- (b) if so, will it comprise only the area required by the company or is it proposed to place the Khaur village wholly or in part within the jurisdiction of the notified area;
- (c) if the answer to (b) be in the affirmative what would be the total amount of the respective areas thus proposed;
- (d) whether it is a fact that the zamindars of the Khaur village have submitted a representation on the subject; if so, what steps have been taken to redress their grievances?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:** (a) Yes.

(b) A small part of the Khaur village is included in the proposal which, although owned by the village owners, is either under the use of the Attock Oil Company or within the limits of the oil field.

(c) The total area is 7,089 kanals 11 marlas as detailed below:—

	<i>Kanals. Marlas.</i>	
Owned by Government .. ..	84	7
Owned by the Company .. ..	4,888	8
Owned by village owners .. ..	2,567	1

(d) Yes. This is now under consideration.

## NEWSPAPERS AND GOVERNMENT ADVERTISEMENTS.

**1545. Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) the names of those dailies, whether vernacular or English, that have been started in the province in the years 1926, 1927, 1928 and 1929;
- (b) the names of those weeklies, bi-weeklies, fortnightlies and monthlies that have been started in the province in the years 1926, 1927, 1928 and 1929;
- (c) which of those papers and magazines as stated above get Government advertisements;
- (d) what is the total number of dailies, monthlies, fortnightlies, weeklies and bi-weeklies up to 31st December 1929 and how many of them get Government advertisements?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow:** (a) and (b). A statement giving the required information is laid on the table.

(c) and (d). Government is not prepared to give the information desired.

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

NAMES OF DAILIES (VERNACULAR AND ENGLISH) WHICH STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927, 1928 AND 1929.

1926.

1. Dipak.
2. Haqiqat.
3. Hindu Herald.
4. Nation.
5. Peshwa.
6. Swarajya.
7. Hindustan Times.

1927.

1. Daily Market Report.
2. Election Bulletin (Lahore).
3. Election Bulletin (Lahore Cantonment).
4. Nirakhnama.
5. Raison ka Akhbar.
6. Election (Gujranwala).

1928

1. Punjab Mail.
2. Sewak.
3. Shakti.

1929.

1. Aftab-i-Sadaqat.
2. Bijli.
3. Himayat-i-Islam.
4. Matri Bhumi.
5. Naujawan Bharat.
6. Rafiq-i-Hind.
7. Suragh Rasan.
8. Vir Bharat.

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927, 1928 AND 1929.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
		1926.	
Aina Bhatnagar-Conference.	Kirpan Bahadur.	Ahmadiya Gazette	Afzal.
Al-Shams.	Rind Bahadur.	Benoh and the Bar.	Amad.
		Hamdard.	Aftab.
Badr-i-Munir.		Kashatriya.	Aftab-i-Ismael.
Beopar Samachar.		Koh-i-Nur.	Al-Shafa.
Bhiwani Samachor		Nau Rattan.	Al-Jamal.
Bir Akali.		Punjab Mail.	Ambala Division.
Bir.		Shia.	School Journal.
Himayat-i-Islam.		Sunrise.	Baharistan.
Hindustani.			Brij Basi.
Hindu Rakshak.			Brahma Darshan.
Insaf.			Shakti.
Kukroon Koon.			Chand.
Lahani.			Chander Odal.
Manji.			Chhota Siphai (Hindi and Urdu.)
Mahajan Patter.			Chakr Dhar.
Nidharak (G).			Dunya-i-Islam.
Naresh.			Daulat Bhandar.
Nishtar.			Dehati Ustadonka Akhbar.
Nusrat.			
Paigham-i-Watan.			Dayanad Mathra Das College Magazine.
Punjabi Bhra.			Education Gazette.
Paras.			Gulshan.
Railway.			Guru Nanak Khalsa College Magazine.
Sacha Dhandora.			
Sangat.			Haziq.
Sadaqat.			Ibn-ul-Waqt.
Shahpur Gazette.			Indar.

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927,  
1928 AND 1929—CONTINUED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
1926—continued.			
Syed.			Istri Jiwan.
Tarjuman-i-Sarhad.			Kashrti Vir.
Tarjuman.			Kutbi Satara.
			Kashkar-i-Hind.
			Khawar.
			Kirti.
			Lahore Law Times.
			Leading Law Cases.
			Mansarovar.
			Markaz-ul-Islam.
			Mufn-ul-Islam.
			Mehra Rajput Patrika.
			Muraqqa-i-Adab.
			Northern Star.
			Nur Jahan.
			Oriental Gazette.
			Panj Batten.
			Path Pardashakt.
			Pism-i-Muhabbat.
			Prem Sewak Sabha.
			Monthly Report.
			Philatelic Journal of India.
			Punjab Review.
			Prem.
			Paimana.
			Road.
			Scout (Simla).



**NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927,  
1928 AND 1929.—CONTINUED.**

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
	1926—concluded.		Scout (Lahore). Sanatan Dharm College Magazine. Sartaj. Satjug. Inqilab. Intikhab-i-Alam. Sun Beam. Student. Temperance Society Magazine. Trilokpal. Uswah-i-Husna. Vaid Bhushan. Vidhya Bandhu. Vishwa Mittar. Widows Cause. Zindgi.
		1927.	
Afsana. Aggarwal Hitechi. Al-Qisas. Basharat. Bedharak. Bharat. Bhunchal. Bombay Mail. Chandhri. Gau Rakshak. Hamdard-i-Police.	Shehab.	Ahir Gazette. Guria. Miabeh. Motor Bulletin. Nau Arya. Suk-i-Marwarid.	Abla. Afghan-i-Hind. Aftab. Aftab-i-Jain. Al-Ashrat. Al-Shahid. Al-Shafa. Ar-Rawal. Aruj. Ayur Vedio Vigian. Bahar-i-Kashmir.

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927,  
1928 AND 1929—CONTINUED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
	1927—concluded.		
Hissar-i-Islam.			Basant.
Ijrad.			Bhagsu.
Inkishaf.			Bharat Zindgi Sudhar.
Insaf-di-Goonj.			Bhatia Sewak.
Ittihad.			Brahman Sudharak.
Izzat.			Buti Darpan.
Jat.			Chhaohhundar.
Jat Sudhar.			Chand.
Kamboj Rajput.			Chandrodaya.
Lahore Life.			Chenab.
Mahajan Samachar.			Dam-i-Isa.
Malang.			D. A.-V. College Magazine.
Mehnat Kash.			Dehati.
Muslim Gazette.			Dikash.
New Age.			Dilpazir.
Nihang.			Firdaus.
Nusrat.			Ghalib.
Observer.			Hardil Aziz.
Paigham-i-Amal.			Hnr.
Prahlad.			Iksir-i-Hayat.
Pindi Samachar.			Indian Good Templar.
Public.			Industry Review.
Punjabi Danda.			Insurance Review.
Purity Servant.			Irbad.
Paras.			Ishwar Bhagti.
Qaumi Daler.			Islah.
Reformer (Jullundur).			Jotish Samachar.

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927,  
1928 AND 1929—CONTINUED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
	1927—concluded.		
Reformer (Ambala).			Kangra Magazine.
Republic.			Kashatri Vir.
Sanatan Dharam Pat- rika.			Khalsa Bradri Gazette.
Shardha Nand.			Krishan Sandesh.
Tijarat.			Lady Doctor Risala.
Tawaf.			Lahore Diocesan Mag- azine.
Tauhid.			Light for the fighting forces of India.
Vir Kesari.			Mahabharat.
Zamindar Gazette.			Makhzan.
Zila Gazette.			Mashal.
			Mastana.
			Mehr Parbhakar.
			Mashir-i-Sihat.
			Rafiq.
			Rahnuna.
			Rozgar.
			Sadaqat.
			Satjung.
			Shilpkar Brahman.
			Sud Samachar.
			Upnishad Magazine.
			Vaid Raj.
			Vidant Kesari.
			Vartman.
			Vedant Magazine.
			Yad-i-Baiza.
			Zamindar Gazette.
			Zaraat.
			Zat Pat Torak.

[Hon'ble Sir Alevander Stow.]

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927,  
1928 AND 1929—CONTINUED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
		1923.	
Adi Danka ..	Samelan ..	Beopar ..	Aftab-i-Islam.
Afkar-o-Havadis ..	Upkari ..	Nirol Khalsa ..	Akhuvvat.
Aftab.		Pind Sudhar.	Al-Riaz.
Al-Adal		Rahbar.	Anwar-us-Sufia.
Atmak Patan aur Jiwan.		Lajput Hitkari.	Attock Gazette.
Azad		Sainapat.	Attock Magazine.
Bhiwani Samachar.		Surraya.	Awaz.
Conference Bulletin.		Sutantar.	Ayurved Martand.
Daur-i-Jadid.		Tabligh.	Azad Rozagar.
Desh Sudhar.			Badr.
Desh Upkarak			Balagh.
Dusht Daman.			Beopar Jiwan.
Faruq.			Bharat.
Fateh.			Brahman Patrika.
Ghan Chakkar.			Brahm Tej.
Gwala Gazette.			Cantonment Advocate.
Haqiqat (Multan).			Chaman.
Haqiqat (Gujran- wala).			Cinema.
Haqqaniat.			D. A.-V. College, Jull- undur, Magazine.
Hila.			Daulat-i-Kaunain.
Hindu (Karam Chand).			Dil Bahar.
Hindu (Bhai Parmo Nand).			Doctor Janhar.
Hindu Samachar.			Engineering.
Hira.			Engineering Herald.
Indian Cases and Statutes.			Govardhan.

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926, 1927,  
1928 AND 1929—CONTINUED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
	1928—continued.		
Inkishaf.			Guldasta-i-Girami.
Kaba.			Gurdawara Gazette.
Krishan.			Hafiz-i-Sehat.
Krishan Sandesh.			Hakim-i-Haziq.
Krishan Sewak.			Humeopath.
Lahaul.			Hunaymand.
Mahbub-i-Am.			Iksir-i-Hayat.
Meher Samachar.			Imdad-i-Bahami.
Mastana.			Islah-i-Dehat.
Matwala.			Islam.
Mujahid.			Janhar.
Munis.			Karah Parshad.
Munsiff.			Kavi Darbar.
Naujawan.			Khalsa Panchayan.
Nayyar-i-Islam.			Khalsa Parchar Sewak.
Panth Premi.			Khalsa Swami.
Patwar Gazette.			Kirti (Urdu).
Pushwa.			Kiranti.
Public.			Lahore King Edward College Magazine. Mehfil.
Punjab Sewak.			Makhmur.
Qaumi Babbar Sher.			Malwa Gazette.
Qaumi Hira.			Mandi.
Qaumi Tarjuman.			Medical Gazette.
Quraish.			Mian Mithu.
Railway Herald.			Misbah.
Rajput Samachar.			Mizan-ul-Haq.
Republic.			Mubahila.
Sada-i-Hind.			

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926,  
1927, 1928 AND 1929—CONTINUED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
	1928—concluded.		
Sant Sewak.			Model Town Gazette.
Sargodha Gazette.			Muslim.
Sawarajya.			Muslim High School. Magazine.
Shaitan.			Paigham-i-Ittehad.
Shikayat.			Punian da Chand.
Shola.			Punja Sahib Magazine.
Subah-i-Umid.			Punjabi Darbar.
Suthra.			Qasid.
Taziana.			Railway Panch.
Vardhman.			Risala-i-Anjuman-i-Taid-i-Islam.
Vartman.			Rozgar.
Yugantar.			Saini Samachar.
Ziafat.			Sankh Chakkar.
		1929.	
Adalat.	Nil.	Afghanistan.	Adbi Dunya.
Aka Baka.		Aror Gazette.	Ahir Gazette.
Al-Ansar.		Comrade.	Bahar-i-Zindgi.
Al-Azam.		Mister Gazette.	Bal Sudhar.
All India Advertiser.		Pind Sudhar (Urdu).	Bhag's Chemistry.
Arus-i-Nan.		Saini Kashatri.	Bhatia Sewak.
Azad (Sargodha).		Tat Khalsa.	Bhatia Gazette.
Azad (Rawalpindi).		Yadav Hiteshi.	Bhupindra.
Bedar.			Darzi.
Congress Gazette.			Debat Sudhar.
Coronation.			Dilchasp.
Daily Commerce.			Doctor.
Dast Kar.			Darbar.
Dharam Vir.			Excelsior.

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926,  
1927, 1928 AND 1929—CONTINUED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
	1929—continued.		
Dost.			Ghar Ka Vaid.
Ghadr.			Gulshan.
Hindu.			Gyan Amrit.
Hindu Bir.			Hakim.
Hunter.			Happy Living.
Intikhab.			Hans.
Iqdam.			Hikmat.
Islah.			Jainindar Patrika.
Jhang Sial.			Journal of the Aero Club of India and Burma.
Karkhana.			Kamla Kant.
Khatra.			Kanwal.
Khabardar.			Khair.
Khalsa.			Labour Leader.
Khas.			Lehore Diocesan Ma- gazine.
Krishan Sandesh.			Lasting Youth.
Lejpat Rai.			M. A. O. High School Magazine.
Machhandar.			Malerkotla College Magazine.
Mazdur (Amritsar).			Mast Qalandar.
Mazdur (Rawalpindi).			Movie Show.
Mazlum.			Mohsan.
Mujahid.			Nandev.
Musawat.			Nara-i-Jang (Hindi).
Nishtar.			Natural Health.
Paroharak.			Pam-i-Islam.
Professors.			Patials Law Reporter.
Public.			Postman.
Punjab.			Qadr-i-Ilaj.

[ Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow. ]

NAMES OF WEEKLIES, BI-WEEKLIES, FORTNIGHTLIES AND MONTHLIES THAT  
HAVE BEEN STARTED IN THE PROVINCE IN THE YEARS 1926,  
1927, 1928 AND 1929—CONCLUDED.

Weeklies.	Bi-weeklies.	Fortnightlies.	Monthlies.
	1929—concluded.		
Punjab Gazette.			Radiant Health.
Punjabi Darbar.			Raja Gazette.
Punjab Kesari.			Ranjit Nagara.
Punjab Labour Gazette.			Rationalist.
Ragra.			Rawal Gazette.
Ramgarhia.			Saini Sandesh.
Rais.			Sanjhiwal.
Rangila.			Sarin Samachar.
Sacha Dhandora.			Saroh.
Sadaqat.			Sartaj.
Sadiq.			Scholar.
Search Light.			Shabistan.
Shamsher Khalsa.			Shahpur Samachar.
Shivaji.			Student Union Maga- zine.
Shiv Sandesh.			Suraj Parkash.
Sikh Sangat.			Udyog.
Simla News.			Vaid Raj.
Sudarsan Chakkar.			Vedant Kesri.
Sudhar.			Vidhwa Bandhu.
Sudharak.			Vidyarthi.
Suraj.			
Tamancha.			
Toadi.			
Tufan.			
Vakalat.			
Waqf.			
Yamdoot.			
Zamindar Gazette.			



**DRINKING WATER SUPPLY IN BEIT, GARSHANKAR.**

**1546. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in *ilaga* Beit of tahsil Una and Tahsil Garshankar, district Hoshiarpur, there is dearth of drinking water ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that owing to the absence of wells the people of this *ilaga* are obliged to drink water from tanks and ponds and thereby contract *Narcoa* and other diseases ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the Government have under consideration a scheme for supplying wholesome water to this *ilaga* by means of water-pumps ;
- (d) whether any water-tax will be charged from the consumers, and if so, whether in fixing its amount the poor condition of the people will be taken into consideration ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is regretted that a reply to the question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

**CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT SOCIETY OF CHAK No. 118 G. B.**

**1547. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that an enquiry was ordered and made some time ago into the constitution, working, and financial condition of Co-operative Credit Society of Chak No. 118-G. B., district Lyallpur ;
- (b) if so, a copy of the report of the officer deputed to make enquiry may kindly be laid on the table ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that Circle Registrar, Co-operative Societies, Lyallpur, ordered immediate removal of a number of defects ; if so, a copy of the orders passed by him may also be laid on the table ;
- (d) whether any action has been taken so far by the President of the Society concerned to remove these defects ;
- (e) if the answer to (d) be in the negative, what is the reason for this delay and what steps, if any, Government proposes to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The question has necessitated certain enquiries to which a reply is awaited. The answer will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

**CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT SOCIETY OF CHAK No. 118 G. B.**

**1548. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that area of operation of Co-operative Credit Society of Chak No. 118 G. B., district Lyallpur, extends to nine or ten villages ;

[L. Joti Parshad.]

- (b) whether it is a fact that each of these nine or ten villages has got a separate society of its own ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that a person cannot become a member of two societies at one and the same time ;
- (d) whether it is a fact that certain persons who previously were the members of the Credit Society of Chak No. 118 G. B., cannot now become members of societies in their own villages without parting with their shares at a low value for no fault of their own ;
- (e) if the answer to (d) be in the affirmative, whether Government intend to take any action to remove those difficulties ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The question has necessitated certain enquiries to which a reply is awaited. The answer will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

#### AREA OF LAND RESERVED FOR GRAZING IN HISSAR.

**1549. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether any area of land is reserved by the Government for the grazing of the cattle in Hissar town ; if so, what is the area in acreage ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that this area is leased out annually through the Tahsildar, Hissar ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the lessee reserves a portion of it for his own use and allows the cattle of the town to graze on a small portion only ;
- (d) whether it is a fact that residents of the town represented their grievances in writing to the Deputy Commissioner last summer with no result ;
- (e) if the reply to the above be in the affirmative whether and, if so, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The area [of 'bir' land reserved for grazing of cattle in Hissar town is 1,818 acres.

(b) Yes.

(c) Yes.

(d) A representation was received and orders are being issued that in future no land should be set apart by the contractor for his private use.

(e) Does not arise.

#### FAMINE RELIEF IN HISSAR DISTRICT.

**1550. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) the places together with dates where famine relief test works were started in the Hissar district ;

- (b) whether test works are still in operation at all or any of these places ;  
 (c) the number of labourers (male, female or child) who have been working at these works ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :—**

(a) *Test work.* *Date on which opened.*

- |                                      |                             |
|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| (1) Bawan in tahsil Fatehabad ..     | 24th November 1929.         |
| (2) Ellenabad in tahsil Sirsa ..     | Ditto.                      |
| (3) Bawani Khara in tahsil Hansi ..  | Ditto.                      |
| (4) Ranya in tahsil Sirsa ..         | First week of January 1930. |
| (5) Tosham in Bhiwani tahsil ..      | Ditto.                      |
| (6) Jhalanian in tahsil Fatehabad .. | Third week of January 1930. |

The first three works have since been closed as no labourers appeared on them.

(b) Yes.

(c) The daily average of attendance on these works is men 607·1, women 411·6 and children 240·4.

#### FAMINE RELIEF IN HISSAR DISTRICT.

**1551. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) in what year was the Punjab Famine Code of 1906 enforced ;  
 (b) what was the average daily wage of an unskilled labourer in that year and in the year 1929 ;  
 (c) how is this difference in wages to be made up ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) 1907.

(b) Information on the subject is not available till 1909, in which year the first provincial survey of wages was held. In that year the rate of daily wages to unskilled labourers varied from 1 anna to 11 annas, while that returned in the wages survey for the quinquennium ending December 1927, varied from 1 anna six pies to 23 annas and 6 pies.

(c) The attention of the honourable member is invited to the answer given to part (a) of Council Question<sup>1</sup> No. 2601 (starred).

#### HALF TUITION FEES IN GOVERNMENT SECONDARY SCHOOLS.

**1552. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that under a recent order of the Ministry of Education a concession of half tuition fees in all Government secondary schools in certain selected tehsils of the Province has been extended to agriculturists and village *hamins* reading in those schools ;

<sup>1</sup> Vol. XIV, pages 407—409.

[R. S. Ch. Chhotu Ram.]

- (b) whether it is a fact that the concession referred to in (a) does not extend to the sons of those whose names are borne on the list of voters for the Punjab Legislative Council; if so, why?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes, because it was felt desirable to impose a financial limit, but the limit is now being revised.

#### ZILLADARS.

**1553. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state—

- (a) the number of Zilladars belonging to statutory Hindu agricultural tribes according to the consolidated list published on the 1st January 1928 and that published on the January 1929;
- (b) the number of Zilladars belonging to 'other' Hindu tribes according to the consolidated lists referred to in (a);
- (c) the reasons which account for the increased appointment in the number of Hindus having gone to the share of 'other' Hindus;
- (d) the reasons for the disproportionately low increase in the share of Hindus between the 1st January 1928 and 1st January 1929?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The figures given in the consolidated lists are as below and incorrect :—

(a) 1928	..	..	..	14
1929	..	..	..	14
(b) 1928	..	..	..	49
1929	..	..	..	54

The correct figures are :—

(a) 1928	..	..	..	14
1929	..	..	..	18
(b) 1928	..	..	..	49
1929	..	..	..	50
(c) Does not arise.				
(d) Ditto.				

#### INSPECTORS OF CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETIES.

**1554. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture kindly state—

- (a) the total number of Inspectors of Co-operative Societies recruited in 1926, 1927, 1928 and 1929, respectively;
- (b) the number of Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs and of those belonging to statutory agricultural tribes under each of the three groups out of the total referred to in (a)?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The numbers of Inspector candidates and selected Sub-Inspectors (not Government Servants) finally confirmed as Inspectors are as follows :—

1926	..	..	..	6
1927	..	..	..	1
1928	..	..	..	..
1929	..	..	..	27

(b) All belong to statutory agricultural tribes. According to religions, the numbers are :—

Hindus	..	..	..	9
Sikhs	..	..	..	6
Mussalmans	..	..	..	19

#### NEWSPAPERS SUPPLIED TO POLITICAL PRISONERS.

**1555. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- the names of the papers which are being supplied to political prisoners in Lahore jails ;
- the names of those political prisoners who are being supplied with daily newspapers in other jails of the province ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) and (b). If the honourable member will state which prisoners he is referring to, giving if possible the section of the Indian Penal Code under which they have been convicted, the information will be obtained for him.

#### PROSCRIPTION OF BOOKS FOR EXCITING COMMUNAL HATRED.

**1556. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- the number of those books that have been proscribed for exciting communal hatred ;
- the date of publication and proscription in the case of each such book ;
- whether the books have been proscribed on the Government's own initiative or after the agitation of the public ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) and (b). A list is placed on the table.

(c) In some cases the books came to the notice of Government in the ordinary course ; in others the attention of Government was drawn to them by the expression of public opinion.

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

The following eight books have been proscribed since Act XXXVI of 1926 and Criminal Law Amendment Act of 1927 came into force :—

No.	Name of publication.	Date of publication.	Date of proscription.
	1926.		
1	Din-i-Islam aur us ki Ishaft ..	Not known.	6-11-26.
2	Vichatter Jiwan by Kali Charan ..	1924	22-11-26.
	1927.		
3	Khaun-i-Darvesh Urf Shahid Sanyasi by Kishan Chand Zeba.	Not known	2-5-27.
4	Durra-i-Islam (whip of Islam) by Sh. Mehr Ilahi Betab.	Not known	12-5-27.
5	Balidan Chitravali by Pandit Ram Gopal Vidyakar.	1926	5-10-27.
6	Rad-i-Hindu by Maulvi Muhammad Ismail.	January 1913	10-12-27.
	1929.		
7	Chandvin ka Chand by Champati, M.A.	Not known	2-5-29.
8	Shahidon ka Potha by Asa Nand ..	Not known	18-5-29.

#### FOREST GUARDS.

**1557. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- the number of Forest Guards appointed in the department since April 1929 up to 31st December 1929 ;
- the number of Forest Guards who resigned and the reasons for their resignation so far as known to the Department ;
- the pay of a Forest Guard and the travelling allowance allowed to him on transfer ;
- whether there is any proposal to raise the pay of Forest Guards under the consideration of Government ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The information required by the honourable member has been called for from the local officers and a reply will be sent to him as soon as it is ready.

#### INACCURACIES IN PRESS REPORTS.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member) : Sir, my attention has been invited to page 12 of the 'Hindu Herald,' dated the 1st March 1930 wherein it is reported that I stated yesterday in Council

"Sir, your logic is faulty"

which is absolutely untrue. I trust it is a case of *bona fide* misreporting.

**Mr. President :** I hope the newspaper concerned will correct its report and avoid misreporting in future.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Sir, the ' Civil and Military Gazette ' of the 28th February reports something which is supposed to have occurred in this Council with regard to your ruling that honourable members if they have delivered a speech to which they attach importance and which they expect to be replied to should arrange to remain in their seats when replies are being given, and in the middle of that controversy, I am reported to have stated that I requested you to send for the Honourable the Financial Commissioner. I am perfectly certain that throughout the time when that point was under discussion, I kept to my seat and did not say a single word. And I hope that the reporting of these papers will improve. I never said a word on the subject at all.

**Mr. President :** I presume that the reporters of the Press have heard the complaint of the honourable member representing Sialkot. Instances of misreporting have been brought to my notice more than once but I do not think that it is done deliberately. I hope in future the reporters will take greater care to avoid misreporting.

#### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following member was sworn in :

Lala Chetan Anand (West Punjab Towns, Non-Muhammadan, Urban).

#### PRESENTATION OF THE BUDGET FOR 1930-31.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member) : When the budget was introduced last year, it may be remembered that I laid no stress on any expectations which might be formed of prosperous harvests, and confined myself to the hope that the return of more favourable conditions might not be long delayed. I regret to say that even this modest, and not unreasonable aspiration has remained unrealized. It is true that in parts of the province harvests have been more favourable than in the two preceding years. But the tests applied by nature to the handiwork of man and to the financial arrangements of this province during 1929-30 have been more than usually severe. We have discovered a hidden meaning in the old proverb, "it never rains but it pours." Of the usual interpretation of this adage, that is to say, "misfortunes never come singly," we had full experience. But for us the saying contained a literal truth; it certainly never rained in the south-east districts, but it poured in the north and west. Drought and floods, to say nothing of locusts, have combined to prolong the series of lean years which the province has had to endure since the close of 1927.

Before reviewing the financial history of 1928-29, the final adjustments for the current year and the proposals for 1930-31, I would draw attention to the heavy and intricate labour involved in the constant revision of financial arrangements necessitated by the vicissitudes of the season which I shall presently describe. Last year a member of the House, who is no longer with us, in the general discussion on the budget appeared to think that the main work of those concerned with the preparation of the budget lay in

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

arithmetical calculation and in seeing that there was no flaw in the application of the rules of addition and subtraction. Other members, more especially those who have worked in the Public Accounts Committee of this Council and in the Standing Finance Committee, know what constant care and forethought is required on the part of the Finance Department in order that the resources of the treasury may be made available in the most profitable way and at the most propitious moment. They will, I am sure, join with me in full appreciation of the courage and resource displayed by Mr. Penny, the Finance Secretary, and the staff of the Finance Department in fighting their rearguard action against the slings and arrows of outrageous fortune. Any success in this encounter (and, looked at from many points of view, the success has been considerable), is due to them, and to the loyal co-operation of all—Members, Ministers, Heads of Departments and those working under them—in effecting economies without which it was impossible to meet the ever-varying situation.

From the final accounts for 1928-29 we may learn how the exercise of economy can help us in the difficulties caused by dwindling receipts and the rise of inevitable expenditure. The year was exceptionally trying, but, when the accounts were finally closed, the balance was 2 lakhs better than in the revised estimate laid before the Council in the budget session.

The disappointments of a profitless wheat crop in *rabi* 1928, and disastrous floods and partial cotton failure in the following *kharif*, are reflected in the successive diminution of the expected receipts from a budget figure of 1122 lakhs to a revised estimate of 1065 lakhs and a final account of 1048 lakhs. In addition to the losses under Land Revenue and abiana due to the seasons, Excise receipts were unexpectedly disappointing, owing mainly to the deduction of large credits to other administrations, while Stamps—a head from which an unforeseen surplus has often been obtained—showed an unwelcome decrease of 2 lakhs on the revised estimate. The heads Forests, Interest, Jails and Education all showed decreases of a lakh or more, while Extraordinary Receipts were nearly 14 lakhs below the revised estimate, a disappointment which reflects the failure to recover instalments of the purchase price of land.

To meet this decrease in revenue, disbursements were cut down from 1169 lakhs, the budget figure, to 1130 lakhs in the revised estimate and diminished again in the final account to 1101 lakhs. But the last figure was only obtained by omitting from the expenditure side the 15 lakhs which the framers of the budget in 1928-29 intended to transfer to the Revenue Reserve Fund and by rigid economy in all departments. Practically every expenditure head of account shows an actual expenditure below the revised estimate. Land Revenue, Forests, Agriculture, Public Health, Police, Education (Reserved) and Stationery and Printing show diminished disbursements to the extent of 1 to 2 lakhs apiece; under each of the heads Excise, General Administration, Jails and Medical the decrease in expenditure amounted to more than 2 lakhs, under Pensions to over 3 lakhs and under Education (Transferred) to more than 4 lakhs. These figures represent, for the most part, the abandonment of what is considered desirable in departmental working as opposed to bare essentials which must perforce be retained.



As I cannot too often emphasize, this Council has reason to be grateful to the indefatigable and successful efforts of Members, Ministers and Heads of Departments to reduce expenditure to a minimum consistent with efficiency.

Let us now turn to the revenue account for the current year. It might well have been hoped that the province had, for the time at all events, completed the tale of disasters by flood and field. The *rabi* harvest of 1929 except in the south-eastern districts, was on the whole satisfactory, and in the tracts inundated by the floods of the previous year exceptionally good. The greater part of the province—again with the painful exception of the south-eastern districts—received rainfall during July and August which was not markedly below the average. But the caprice of the elements was not to be denied. On the 25th July unprecedented rainfall in the Baluchistan hills reduced the plains of Dera Ghazi Khan to a swamp, and practically obliterated the system of inundation canals. The bursting of the Shyok dam on the 17th August caused an exceedingly high flood level in the Indus, but direct damage from this incident was small. Worse was to follow. At the end of August three or four days of torrential rain in the mountain ranges from Gilgit to Peshawar and from Ladakh to Jammu, combined with heavy rainfall on the plains, caused the waters of the Indus, Jhelum and Chenab rivers to rise to levels over-topping all previous records. The damage caused by these floods of the 28th to 31st August and by the heavy rainfall was colossal. The districts bordering on the Indus, Jhelum and Chenab rivers, especially Muzaffargarh, Shahpur, Jhang, Mianwali, Multan, Gujrat and Dera Ghazi Khan, suffered extraordinary losses in cattle, houses and in grain. The grain of the *rabi* harvest of 1929, an exceptionally good one in these tracts, had been stored in the hope of a rise in prices. Not only were these stores in many cases swept away or rendered unfit for consumption, but the *kharif* crop, of which much was expected, was entirely destroyed. The toil of laborious months, the profits of one harvest and the promise of another disappeared in a few hours. In Muzaffargarh over 100 hamlets are reported to have been entirely destroyed, in Shahpur 70 and in Jhelum more than 20. Muzaffargarh is stated to have lost over 7,000 head of cattle and Dera Ghazi Khan nearly 4,000. In Muzaffargarh, Shahpur and Jhelum the loss in grain is estimated as between 40 to 50 thousand maunds for each district, with a corresponding destruction of *bhusa*.

The effect of these floods on Government property was calamitous to a degree. Not only have the actual damage and cost of repairs to headworks, weirs, regulators and other canal works to be reckoned with, but the loss by crop failure due to the breakdown of irrigation on important branches has also to be taken into account. In addition to the loss to irrigation works the cost of replacing and repairing roads, bridges, schools, hospitals, police stations and other Government buildings is a most serious item of expenditure.

The culmination of this disastrous chronicle came in September, when extensive damage was caused to the Islam weir, necessitating further expenditure on that weir and also on the Panjnad Works.

In contrast to the deluge with which the north-western districts were afflicted, the Ambala division remained, as for months previously, a victim to severe drought, the effects of which, though somewhat mitigated by recent

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

showers, have not yet been dispelled. Continuous famine relief measures have been necessitated in two districts of this division for many months past.

The financial effect of these cumulative disasters has made itself felt in every direction. The revenue account receipts are sadly reduced. The suspension, remission and short collection of fixed and fluctuating land revenue owing to the floods at one end of the province and the drought at the other, combined with the reduction of water-rate collections in consequence of the failure of certain damaged irrigation channels to work at their fullest capacity, could not fail to have an adverse effect on receipts. At the same time, we have to face a shortage of 12½ lakhs under Excise, chiefly due to diminished fees for licenses and still-head duty, and a reduction in the amount accruing to this province from the income-tax collections of the Central Government. It is hardly surprising that the revenue account receipts should have dropped from 1140 lakhs in the original budget to 1064 lakhs in the present revised estimate. Even this figure is only arrived at by including in receipts a sum of 15 lakhs which it is proposed to transfer from the Revenue Reserve Fund in order that the loss of revenue may be to some extent counterbalanced.

On the expenditure side in the revenue account, leaving out unexpected additional charges to capital heads, repairs to irrigation works damaged by floods and heavy rainfall are estimated to have cost 28 lakhs in the current year and to cost a further sum of 24 lakhs in the year 1930-31. The corresponding estimates for repairs to buildings and roads in charge of the Public Works Department amount to 8 lakhs in the current year and for 1930-31 to 4 lakhs. These heavy charges have been partly met during the current year by the postponement of work in progress to the extent of 6 lakhs in the Irrigation Department and 6 lakhs in the Buildings and Roads Branch, while minor savings have been possible in other departments. These economies were effected with a thoroughness and promptitude worthy of all praise. It should be noted, however, that curtailment of expenditure has not been allowed to affect materially the programme laid down for the prevention of water-logging and the reclamation of water-logged lands. By these economies and by refraining from the transfer of 5 lakhs to the Revenue Reserve Fund it has been possible to keep the expenditure in the revenue account at 1130 lakhs, or only 11 lakhs in excess of the original budget.

The revised estimate for capital disbursements shows 154 lakhs of expenditure, that is to say, the same as the budget figures, a saving under the Hydro-Electric Project being set off against an increase under Irrigation and Commutation of Pensions.

At the same time, the realizations of Extraordinary Receipts have been not less disappointing than last year, and are now expected to reach only 73 lakhs as against 105 lakhs budgetted for in March 1929.

The population of the flooded areas, in addition to the assistance they have received from the Red Cross Fund and the Indian People's Famine Trust, have had to be supplied with free grants from the famine fund and liberal takkavi advances for the purchase of bullocks, and seed, while similar aid has been necessary in the drought-afflicted districts of the Ambala

division. The expenditure from the Provincial Loan and Advance Account has now grown from the 45 lakhs anticipated when the budget was framed to 80 lakhs in the present revised estimate.

In order to avoid closing the year with a minus balance, it has been necessary to increase our borrowing from 140 lakhs to 200 lakhs. With this assistance we should end the current year with a balance on all accounts of 20 lakhs, of which 18 lakhs will be in the Famine Relief Fund. I would draw attention to this attenuated margin of safety, and enter a warning that any excess expenditure or further depletion of revenue may result in an overdraft which the Government of India are not likely to regard with equanimity.

After hearing the description I have just given of the calamities which this province has been called upon to endure in the course of the past few months, to say nothing of the preceding series of unsatisfactory harvests, he would be an optimist indeed who could anticipate in the coming year any extensive programme of development or an uninterrupted continuance of progress on lines laid down in more prosperous conditions. Our task at present is, by economy in every direction, to prevent the complete depletion of our resources and to avoid an accumulation of debt which may hamper the province in future year. Unfortunately an examination of our probable revenue receipts in the coming year has shown that they are not likely to exceed 1095 lakhs, a figure 55 lakhs less than the original estimate for the current year. One reason for the falling off is the necessity of flood repairs which reduces the net figure of Irrigation receipts by some 24 lakhs; another, the reduction of Land Revenue by some 10 lakhs in consequence of the application of the principles of the new Act to settlements started since 1922; another, the diminution of Excise receipts to which I have already alluded. It has, therefore, been necessary again to make all possible economies on the expenditure side in the hope of balancing the budget. All departments have been affected by this painful process, all the more painful from the large increases in establishment and other charges that have been sanctioned in the last few years and grow imperceptibly as the years pass, but the chief sufferer has been head "41—Civil Works" in which it has been necessary to effect a saving of 19 lakhs by omitting projects already approved by Council, but not yet actually started. In this way it has been possible to provide for new expenditure, which, though it amounts to as much as 47 lakhs in the revenue section of the account, includes only a very small amount which can be called "new" in the true sense of the word. The bulk of this sum represents the continuance of certain temporary establishments and provision for minor works and tools and plant under the head Irrigation; and the only head under which any substantial advance is being made is Education which will receive an additional 5½ lakhs for grants for Primary Education besides a few smaller sums for other purposes. The curtailment of new programmes in the sphere of the departments classed as "beneficent" may evoke the criticism previously heard in some quarters, namely, that the beneficent departments starve, while other departments of Government maintain, if not increase, their expenditure. But a comparison of the budget figures for expenditure in statement B prefixed to the budget with those of last year shows that the reverse is the case. The expenditure on beneficent departments, that is to say, Education, Medical, Public Health,

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

Agriculture and Industries, is this year only 3 lakhs less than that on Civil Administration, Administration of Justice, Jails and Police. The expenditure budgetted for Civil Administration is actually 5 lakhs less than the corresponding estimate of last year, while, on the other hand, next year's expenditure on beneficent departments is estimated as 12 lakhs more than that for 1929-30, and the bulk of this increase goes to Education. Under the heads Medical, Public Health and Agriculture there is no such marked advance. But, although the pace is retarded, some advance has nevertheless been possible. To the regret of all those interested in the development of communications it has been found impossible to continue during the coming year the programme of road construction in which so much progress has been made. It is true that the motor vehicle has always outrun road construction, and makes its own way to its destination, road or no road. Such achievements, however, though interesting as tests of motor machinery and the driver's courage, carry us little further towards the ultimate solution of those transport problems with which an agricultural province is so intimately concerned. But, after mature consideration, it was considered advisable, especially in a year of limited resources, to confine the activities of the Buildings and Roads Branch to the maintenance of existing roads, rather than to the construction of new mileage. The proposed expenditure for 1930-31 under the head "41—Civil Works" is 20 lakhs less than was provided in the original budget for 1929-30, and the provision for Communications has suffered severely.

A reference to the budget figures will show that expenditure in the revenue account is expected to amount to 1122 lakhs, or 27 lakhs more than revenue receipts. But, when we remember that special flood repairs in the budget year will cost 28 lakhs, we may claim that to all intents and purposes we have just balanced our budget. But the difficulty with which this result has been attained shows that the years of affluence produced by the remission of provincial contributions are past, and suggests that further difficulties await us in the future.

It is usual to give some account of our main capital undertakings, the Sutlej Valley Project and the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme.

In regard to the first, orders of the Government of India, to the effect that pensionary charges were to be treated as direct charges after the 31st of March 1926, necessitated a formal revision of the project estimate. The revised estimate as sanctioned by the Secretary of State in April 1929 now stands at approximately 2382 lakhs for total direct charges, of which this Council is concerned with 987 lakhs and Indian States with the remainder. The estimated expenditure met from Punjab revenues up to end of 1929-30 is approximately 865 lakhs.

The outstanding event of the year 1929-30 was the accident to the weir at Islam. The causes of this failure have been investigated by a committee of expert engineers from outside this province. They have recorded their definite opinion, which has been published, that the damage was due to a retrogression of river-levels far in excess of anything which might reasonably have been expected when the designs were prepared.

The capital expenditure in 1929-30 provided by the Punjab Government amounted to 75½ lakhs. Of this 11 lakhs was spent on the Panjnad Weir and the remainder on the construction of distributaries, water-courses and works connected with the main canals and branches, such as bridges, residential and other buildings and plantations.

The budget provision of 27½ lakhs' expenditure during 1930-31 provides for the construction of distributaries and water-courses. But the main item of expenditure concerns the alteration in the design of the Panjnad Weir to meet the feature of retrogression of levels to which I have previously referred. This weir should have been completed in 1929-30, but, owing to certain apprehensions caused by the recent abnormal floods it has become necessary to enlarge the waterway, with the result that completion is postponed for another year.

The final administrative approval to the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme stood at 438 lakhs, inclusive of interest accruing during construction. As assessed by the Financial Adviser in February 1929, the project, including interest, was estimated to cost between 540 and 550 lakhs. Since the original administrative approval was given, several of the sub heads of the project have been revised, and the figure, which has up to date received administrative approval, stands at 468 lakhs. From recent information received in the administrative department, however, it is expected that the latter figure, and even the Financial Adviser's assessment, will be exceeded.

The estimated expenditure up to the end of 1929-30 is 147 lakhs and for 1930-31 a figure of 101 lakhs has been entered in the budget. These figures do not include expenditure on the Lyallpur Electrification and Amritsar Electric Supply Schemes, as these are regarded as separate undertakings. In the main work the tunnel, which is an outstanding item of expenditure, is being driven from four faces. The two pipe tunnels will be completed, so far as excavation goes, before the end of the current financial year. In addition to these tunnel headings, the sinking of the surge shaft has been in progress throughout the year and is now complete. Following excavation, the lining of the tunnel has already been begun on the north heading. In the Uhl Valley excavation of the diurnal storage reservoir is making good progress, and this work should be completed during the coming financial year. In addition to this excavation and other preliminary work, the construction of the decantation chambers and stilling ponds has been begun. On the Jogindernagar side of the hill the excavation of the track to accommodate the main penstock pipes is nearly completed, and the foundations of the power-house have also been excavated. During 1930-31 the principal work will be the excavation and lining of the tunnel. The construction of headworks in the Uhl Valley will also be taken in hand, and it is hoped that most of this work will be completed before the end of the coming financial year. On the south side the construction of pipe anchors and supports will be pushed forward with a view to the erection of the penstock pipes. The contract for the transmission system has now been placed, and there will be considerable expenditure on the purchase of towers and conductors, and probably also on a portion of the sub-station equipment. It is also proposed to commence work on the building of the sub-station.

The necessity for borrowing to meet productive capital expenditure in the last two years gives more than usual importance to this subject.

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

For a detailed account I would refer you to Mr. Penny's memorandum. For present purposes the position may be thus summarized. In 1928-29 the original intention was to borrow 40 lakhs from the Provincial Loans Fund, the remaining sum necessary to meet capital expenditure being provided by Extraordinary Receipts. While there is no doubt as to the ultimate realization of the bulk of the amount due under the head Extraordinary Receipts, the estimate of realizations year by year is extremely difficult. The budget estimate of 105 lakhs for Extraordinary Receipts in 1929-30 dwindled to 73 lakhs when the revised estimate was prepared. At the same time, capital expenditure, owing to the unusually rapid progress of construction, expanded unexpectedly, and large sums were required for takkavi loans, with the result that borrowings from the Provincial Loans Fund had to be increased to 140 lakhs. Taught by the experience of 1928-29, we budgetted this year for another loan of 140 lakhs, and expected that this, combined with Extraordinary Receipts, would enable us to meet capital expenditure and provincial loan requirements. But, though the revised estimate of capital expenditure in the present year shows no increase over the original estimate, there has been an exceptionally keen demand for

12 noon.

takkavi loans to assist the cultivators to repair the havoc wrought by floods at one end of the province and by drought at the other. At the same time, the realization of Extraordinary Receipts, has again proved disappointing. It has, therefore, been necessary to ask the Government of India for a supplementary loans of 60 lakhs, and even this will leave 12 lakhs of expenditure to be met temporarily from revenue. In this way we should be able to avoid a minus balance on all accounts (excluding the Famine Relief Fund and the Depreciation Reserve Fund) at the close of this financial year. We are constrained to extract what consolation we may from the fact that we are only asking for a supplementary loan of 60 lakhs this year as against a crore in 1928-29.

For the year 1930-31 it is proposed to ask the Government of India for a loan of 150 lakhs to provide for capital expenditure and takkavi loans. The balance will be met from Extraordinary Receipts which will be sufficient to meet some additional capital expenditure and increased demands for takkavi loans.

It is well to call attention to the rapid growth of expenditure under the head "Reduction of Debt," and to bear in mind that loans once taken have to be repaid. In 1927-28 the expenditure under this head was only 2 lakhs, in 1928-29 it had risen to 3½ lakhs and has again increased to 6½ lakhs in the present revised estimate. For 1930-31 the figure is 9½ lakhs, which will of course be increased again in 1931-32 by the loans which it is proposed to take in the coming year. In view of the growing burden, it is fortunate that capital expenditure can be met to a large extent from Extraordinary Receipts and is taken for projects which in the main are clearly remunerative and revenue earning assets to the province.

The Provincial Loans Account, hampered as it is by the suddenness of demands in aid of agricultural distress, and by the extreme improbability of complete recoveries, is difficult to forecast with any degree of accuracy.

Demands for takkavi loans in 1930-31 are estimated at 40 lakhs, and recoveries, if favoured by climatic conditions, should go far to meet these advances. The budget figure in this account provides 8 lakhs for loans to co-operative societies, and 4½ lakhs for loans to local bodies.

The balance in the Famine Relief Fund at the end of 1930-31 is estimated at 19 lakhs, while the Revenue Reserve Fund will have some 10 lakhs.

The budget for 1930-31 is expected to close with a balance on all accounts of 62 lakhs. The Revenue Reserve Fund, the Depreciation Fund and the Famine Relief Fund will provide 30 lakhs. Extraordinary Receipts not yet used to meet capital expenditure will account for another 55 lakhs, while the revenue account will show a deficit of 23 lakhs. Partly by unfavourable seasons, partly by heavy and inevitable recurring expenditure and an inelastic revenue we are thrust back to the position of 1924 when balances were only maintained by Extraordinary Receipts.

The budget for 1930-31 taken as a whole has thus been balanced, but only by omitting from it a number of works already approved by the Council, and by drawing on Extraordinary Receipts to assist the Revenue Account. There is doubtless this year a very sufficient reason for this unsatisfactory result. It is to be hoped that it will be long before the province is called upon again to endure the double stroke of flood and famine. But a province dependant on agriculture is also dependant on the climate, and must be prepared for cycles of misfortune as well as cycles of prosperity. Is the Punjab so prepared? To the regret of all it is impossible to give a ready answer in the affirmative. Yet on this preparedness depend all the schemes for improvement in the future, and even the full realization of some of those on which the province has already embarked. For three successive years the revenue account has shown an excess of expenditure over receipts. Unless schemes for progress and development already approved by this Council are to be held in abeyance, there is no prospect of arresting the growth of expenditure. At the same time, an examination of revenue receipts, even after making allowance for any increase which may accrue from more prosperous seasons, reveals no certain indication of expansion. Land revenue assessments have been permanently reduced by at least 10 lakhs, while Excise income has shown for the last two years a downward tendency, which may or may not be permanent, but at all events introduces an element of uncertainty fatal to confidence.

I would commend to the consideration of all the old maxim "no advance without security," a saying capable of more than one interpretation. The first which I would emphasize is the necessity for security, for the building up of reserve against the evil day of violent fluctuation. With these reserves disappointments in revenue receipts can be faced, and assistance obtained in shape of loans. In the second place, advance in the direction of education, health, agriculture, industries or communications must rest on a sure foundation of the power to finance it in future. Expanding expenditure cannot be met by stationary or receding revenues. This is the bare truth with which this province is faced. For such a difficulty retrenchment is at best a temporary palliative, and I trust that I have made it clear that during

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

the last two years the most strenuous efforts have been made in this direction. I can give the assurance that these efforts will continue, but that is not sufficient. This Council has never shown itself backward in doing battle with the forces of ignorance and disease and in promoting the development of the province, and we all wish the latter to continue. But if further progress is to be made, indeed if ground gained is not to be lost, it must be consolidated on the sure basis of visible resources, or more resources must be made available. I have every confidence that the courage and determination to make such provision for the welfare of the Punjab will not be found wanting either now or in the future.

I beg to introduce to the Council the budget for 1980-81.

The Council then adjourned till at 2 P. M. on Thursday, the 6th March 1980.



## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Thursday, the 6th March 1930.*

THE Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P. M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following member was sworn in :—

Cowan, Mr. H. M. (Official, nominated).

### GENERAL DISCUSSION OF THE BUDGET.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** [Hoshiarpur *cum*-Ludhiana (Muhammadan), Rural] : Sir, the Budget generally is described as a juggler's trick and that it stands at the will of the Finance Member. In this Budget I admit that I find no trick. It is a statement of expenditure, a very clear and lucid statement, and where there is weakness the Honourable the Finance Member and the Finance Secretary have admitted that there is a weakness. In this Budget, there is a deficit of Rs. 55 lakhs, as compared with the estimate of 1929-30. No doubt this figure is a very big sum. But I am very glad, Sir, that no new taxation is proposed. Already, since 1923-24 up to 1929-30, the Government have spent from the revenue receipts a sum of Rs. 4.56 lakhs. I think such a big sum ought not to be spent and it is against the principles of a good budget. But this time I am glad that extraordinary receipts have been spent on current expenditure, and justice has been done. I am subject to correction. My calculation is that Rs. 4.56 lakhs of revenue receipts have been spent in capital expenditure and that ought not to be done.

Now, Sir, the expenditure on Civil Administration is more or less Rs. 50 lakhs, since 1921-22 up to 1930-31. On the other hand, on Industries, a department which can bring prosperity to the province, only Rs. 6 lakhs have been spent in this decade.

Then, Sir, if you take the expenditure on Agriculture, from 1921-22 to 1930-31, the amount spent does not exceed Rs. 29.6 lakhs. Compared with the sum that has been spent on Civil Administration this is very inadequate for purposes of development. I quite admit that on Education, the Government have spent nearly one crore since 1921-22, since the advent of reforms in this province.

Now, when I look to the revenue receipts, as compared with that of 1929-30, I find that the position of the province is very bad. So far as the purchasing ability of this province is concerned, it shows that our purchasing abilities are becoming lesser and lesser every year. I compare the current year's figures with the figures under review. The deficit of 55 lakhs is made up of 22 lakhs under Land Revenue and Irrigation, 8 lakhs under Income tax, 18½ lakhs under Excise, 3 lakhs under Forests, and so on. It shows, Sir, that the wealth of the province has decreased very much.

[ Ch. Afzal Haq.]

If you look at the extraordinary receipts you will find that in spite of the zamindars having a great love for land and willing to purchase it at any cost the extraordinary receipts have dwindled down from the figure of Rs. 1.28 lakhs in the year 1927-28 to Rs. 87 lakhs in the year under review. This goes to show that the economic position of the province is very bad, and unless Government does something to finance industries and agriculture our position will grow worse and worse. I am very glad that the Honourable Finance Secretary, Mr. Penny, has very kindly, and very boldly admitted this fact, namely, that this deficit is not a passing phase but is likely to recur.

If you look into the budgets since 1921-22, up to the year under review, you will find that with the exception of 4 years, in six years there were deficit budgets. Not only that. Even in those prosperous years we had to finance ourselves by large additional resources. I refer to the contribution that has been remitted by the Government of India. Had not the remission been given we could not expend money on different branches in different departments these years.

I have already said that very little has been expended on those departments which go to bring prosperity to the province. Now I refer to co-operative societies. The expenditure under this head has increased by Rs. 8 lakhs since 1924-25 but mortgage debt has risen from 7 crores to 20 crores since 1891 in the province. This goes to show that our attention towards co-operative societies ought to be doubled and trebled, and the Government should finance this department all the more if they really want to give any relief to the zamindars of this province. Now, Sir, I think that if in the next few years nature does not favour us, our people will be absolutely ruined.

Coming to the exchange policy of the Government, the cost of raw materials has automatically decreased by 12½ per cent. No doubt we are getting land revenue and water rates from the zamindars. Although the cost of raw materials has greatly diminished the charges of land revenue and water rates are the same as has been in the prosperity years. The natural consequence of that is that the zamindars who are already poor as compared with the zamindars of other countries have found it difficult to meet their daily expenses. There is absolutely no industry in the province. Those zamindars who cannot find work in the whole year cannot find work in any industry of the province. You see, Sir, that we are faced with a very grave situation in the province. Last year, the Honourable the Leader of the House will bear me out, there was an ex-military men's jatha who claimed that they were penniless; they were without land, they marched towards the Mall road and they wanted to go to the Government House. So far as I know, their number does not exceed 30 or 40 thousands up to this time. It is just possible that they may organise themselves and bring in greater number but at present so far as my information goes, their number does not exceed 30 or 40 thousands. But I can say from what I see in the province that there are millions who are ill-clad and half fed. Unless the Government does anything for them and unless the Government finance the industries of the province and give some protection to the goods that are being made in this province. ....

**Mr. President :** In view of the fact that a very large number of gentlemen wish to take part in the general discussion of the budget, I propose to fix a time limit on speeches. Will 15 minutes be sufficient for every speaker? Up till now 18 gentlemen have communicated to me their desire to speak to-day and 21 gentlemen wish to speak to-morrow. Besides, 5 members of Government might also speak tomorrow. In view of this it will be impossible to accommodate so many speakers tomorrow. I would request, therefore that some of the members, who have given their names for to-morrow, may speak to day, if possible. What should be the time limit?

(Voices : 15 minutes).

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** There are 4 lakhs of beggars in this province and 18 lakhs more that depend upon these beggars and if millions of half-starved people are taken into consideration there are really two or three millions of people in this province who can at any time within ten years march towards the Government House bare-headed and bare-footed and they will tell the Government to either give them bread or take away their lives. That will surely come about if you will not hear me and my remarks and will not act upon my advice and give relief to the zamindars and finance and protect the industries of the province. The time will come when the people will go before the Government House in jathas not in thousands but in millions. . . . .

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Why not to the Legislature?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** What for? You have got the purse in your hands. You have increased the expenditure by Rs. 58 lakhs on Civil administration within this decade. The time will surely come if those who are spending money against the wishes of this House keep doing so when the whole administration will crumble down like a house of cards. I hope that Government will act upon my advice and give more money for the industrial development and agricultural development and not spend money on police and other departments which are not giving relief to the poor but are a burden on the poor tax-payers.

**Lala Chetan Anand** [West Punjab Towns, (Non-Muhammadan), Urban]: Sir, I cannot fully congratulate the Finance Member on the Budget he has presented to the House. The expenditure on Civil Administration is increasing day by day while on the other hand we are becoming poorer and poorer. The unrest is increasing, and if the Government were to remove the root cause of the unrest, then the expenditure on law and order can be reduced. A sum of Rs. 3.40 lakhs only have been set apart for the beneficent departments which is too small an amount in comparison with the emergent needs and gravity of their need. Expenditure on industries is only Rs. 11 lakhs. That is only 1 per cent. of the total expenditure. No steps are being taken to solve the question of unemployment and raise the earning capacity of the masses. The policy of the Government ought to be that money should be spent as liberally on transferred departments as on the police department. We do not want palatial buildings, all we want is bread for the half starving people who are unable to get even one meal a day.

**Mian Nurullah** [Lyallpur South, (Muhammadan), Rural] : Sir, I would just like to touch the revenue head and the condition of the poor zamindars

[ Mian Nurullah.]

in the province at this time. The Government knows very well that the zamindars are the backbone of the Government and the country. On the zamindars also, depends, the prosperity of the urban classes. Everything goes according as the condition of agriculturists of the province goes. The Government off and on has been doing something for the zamindars by way of suspension and remission in the revenue, but that only is a temporary measure to appease the zamindars of the province. I know that in the hard, hit days of 1928 when the *rabi* crop had nearly failed altogether, the zamindars had feelings which most of us would not welcome. They were getting Red ideas. I came personally in touch with all shades of opinion amongst zamindars and I did hear from many of them that they could not manage to pay (and it was really the state of affairs) the revenues. One zamindar whom I met in the *zail ghar* appeared as if he was living in the 16th century. He was quite illiterate and he said if a few more zamindars were prepared to join him he would stop paying revenue. I told him that that would be a bad thing for him but he said he could not make his two ends meet. These ideas gaining ground in the minds of the people are really injurious and would always be injurious for the prosperity of this country and no doubt would be troublesome indeed. The Government cannot afford to lose the sympathy of the zamindars at this juncture. Although the Government has been helping the people it has done nothing as regards the greatest difficulty of the zamindars and that lies in the fall of the general level of prices. Prices have been falling since 1920-21.. After effects of the war brought home to the zamindars their difficulties. The assessments, I think, in most of the districts were carried out in those days of maximum prices *i.e.*, in 1920-21. In these assessments revenues were raised to a very high figure. But since then the prices have been falling day by day. But the Government has been getting that high rate of revenue all the same. This was the maximum revenue that Government could impose according to those conditions. Now the zamindars are running their zamindara altogether at a loss. If you look at the accounts published by Government as a result of the enquiry held by Mr. Stuart, you will find that the average income of a present-day zamindar or a farmer varies from one anna to five annas a day. How on earth can he live within that sum? That is the greatest problem of the zamindars. In addition to the aforesaid he has also to face the troubles due to the modelling and remodelling done by the Irrigation department. Engineers think that they are passing through a scientific and experimental stage and the time will come when they will settle down to a certain sort of method which will settle the problem of water distribution permanently. But the zamindars think it is ruinous and a huge waste. Moreover, they also complain that the water supply is being reduced day by day, so they do not know what to do. That is the greatest problem and I want to put before the House with all the emphasis at my command that the land revenue should be reduced as soon as possible. How this is to be done is really a difficult matter because, after all, the Government is to be run on the revenues of the province. I see that Government in the last few years has been spending a lot of money and capital expenditure has been drawn from the revenue of the current years. That I think is not a sound policy and I do not think that in any other civilised country that is

being done. All the capital expenditure should be met, I should say, by raising loans from other Governments or from any other source and each individual enterprise should be treated as a different business concern, because it seems to me very unfair that we, living in this generation, should pay for all that should be spent in the coming generations and that all the benefit should go to the people of the province in the years to come. That seems very unreasonable too. If Government were to give up this policy then we will be satisfied. Sir, I cannot understand how Government puts the expenditure on the side of receipts under the heading of revenue derived from irrigation. It is written on page 10 of the Budget of the year 1930-31: "*Deduct Rs. 2,40,00,000*". This, I think, should come on the side of expenditure. It is a big item and all items on this side should be of income alone and all items under expenditure should be of expenditure alone. I do not see why this departure is made from the usual course.

Further, I think that there is no necessity of giving this budget in such huge form; look at its size and shape. It is too difficult to carry and is, besides, not quite clear. It could be made more clear by putting it in a more concise and precise way. I am holding in my hand now, as you can see, the "Finance Accounts" of the United Kingdom. It is so brief that it is not even one-twentieth of the volume of our Budget, though the sum dealt with is more than five hundred times ours.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh** (Sikh, Urban): Sir, I believe all members of this House fully realise that uncertainty in the financial conditions of the province due to vagaries of nature made the task of the Honourable the Finance Member and the Financial Secretary extremely difficult. Both of them, therefore, deserve the gratitude of the House for the way in which they have by their labour and resourcefulness overcome those difficulties. This budget, Sir, has three characteristics. Firstly, it reveals deficits all through. In the revenue accounts of 1928-29 there is a deficit of Rs. 58 lakhs and a deficit of Rs. 66 lakhs in 1929-30 in the revised estimate and Rs. 27 lakhs in the budget estimate of 1930-31. In fact, the deficit is much higher than is revealed by the figures. As is made clear by Financial Secretary a sum of Rs. 15 lakhs from the revenue reserve fund has been omitted in the accounts of 1928-29, and as a matter of fact, Rs. 15 lakhs have been taken from the revenue reserve fund towards the revised estimates of 1929-30. So that the deficit which would have amounted to Rs. 81 lakhs has been in this way reduced to Rs. 66 lakhs. Similarly in the budget estimates, 1930-31, no sum has been provided for the revenue reserve fund. Sir, on the other hand some capital expenditure has been charged to revenue account in the budget of 1930-31, for example, a sum of Rs. 10.16 lakhs on account of interest on capital outlay on Mandi Hydro-Electric Project and Rs. 15.19 lakhs under 41—Civil Works on account of communications, Nili Bar and other productive works have been charged to revenue accounts. As a matter of fact, all capital expenditure of this nature on productive works ought to have been charged towards capital account and not to revenue. The third aspect of the budget as revealed by the figures is that although the expenditure on account of beneficent departments is growing, at the same time there has been a remarkable growth in the expenditure under civil administration. In 1926-27 the expenditure under civil administration stood at Rs. 3.03 lakhs. In three

[ S. S. S. Ujjal Singh. ]

years it has jumped to Rs. 3,41 lakhs and in the budget of 1930-31 it is put at Rs. 3,43 lakhs. It will be seen therefore that the major portion of the remission of provincial contribution has been absorbed by civil administration. Besides, under 41—Civil Works on account of repairs alone the expenditure is Rs. 67 lakhs which in 1924-25 stood at Rs. 37 lakhs. We are now face to face with a serious situation. While the total expenditure charged to revenue has increased at the rate of Rs. 50 lakhs a year since 1925-26 the revenue receipts since 1925-26 have actually gone down. The Financial Secretary has made it perfectly clear that this budget is not a passing phase and as a matter of fact, this state of affairs is likely to continue. This requires serious consideration. Unless we reduce expenditure in other directions, cut our coat according to our cloth, there is a great apprehension that beneficent departments will considerably suffer.

Coming to details it is gratifying to learn that education has been allotted some money as new expenditure in this budget. But the policy of opening new high schools and arts colleges ought to be put a stop to. It is swelling the ranks of the unemployed. Instead of spending more money in that direction the money could be well utilised towards female and technical education and towards solving the problem of mass illiteracy.

With regard to the Agricultural Department, I would only say a word that more work need be done on the field than in office. No one can determine the huge amount of loss that the agriculturists have suffered on account of crop diseases, and serious attempts should be made to combat crop diseases.

Coming to Industries, it is really a pity that nothing substantial has been done in this direction. The only solution of the unemployment problem is to create work, and you cannot create work unless there is industrial expansion in the country. More weaving schools like the one at Shahdara will not solve the problem. What is required is a bold policy. Government ought to help the textile industry by advancing loans at a low rate of interest and with easy instalment system of payment.

In regard to the Co-operative department, I desire to bring to the notice of the authorities, the Honourable Minister and the Registrar, a very serious grievance of the Sikh community. That department is now the hot bed of communalism. Everywhere in central banks and in the Punjab Co-operative Union the Sikhs have been ousted. I think the Honourable Minister will set right this grievance that has already been brought to his notice and to the notice of the Registrar by various Sikh societies and which grievance has been given prominence in the Sikh press too. Here, Sir, I desire to bring to the notice of the Government a general grievance of the Sikh community in regard to their legitimate share in the public services. The Sikhs would not mind if the recruitment is made on merit alone, but if communal considerations prevail, Sikhs have a right to watch their interests with the same keenness as others are doing.

On the High Court bench there is not a single Sikh. Since the creation of the High Court or the old Chief Court no Sikh has ever served on its bench. I refuse to believe that no Sikh either from the bar or from the services could

be found who could fill this high office with equal ability and with equal distinction with the members of other communities who are now adorning the place in the High Court.

So far as other services are concerned, I would only give figures with regard to a few of them just to show what place the Sikhs occupy. In the executive branch of the Punjab Civil Service out of 266 posts they have got only 98; in the judicial branch they have got 24 out of 180; there are only 11 Tahsildars out of 180; in the Irrigation Branch they have 12 Sikh members of the Punjab Service of Engineers out of 108; out of 44 Temporary Engineers there are only 3 Sikhs; similarly in the Medical Service out of 144 Assistant Surgeons there are 21 Sikhs; in the Punjab Civil Secretariat out of 12 superintendents there is not a single Sikh and out of 88 senior clerks there is not a single Sikh. I hope Government will remove this grievance of the Sikh community at an early date.

Sir, we are passing through anxious times. Prices of all commodities have fallen and there is no likelihood of a rise in the near future. On the other hand, the tendency of prices is to stabilise near about the pre-war level. The agriculturists are very hard hit. At the same time there is a heavy trade depression in the country with little or no purchasing power. The ranks of the unemployed are swelling every day. This serious economic situation is causing discontent and a desire for a change.

Whatever the causes may be, Government cannot absolve itself from the responsibility of having contributed a great share in bringing about this state of affairs. The agricultural population have no occupation for the greater part of the year. In spite of the fact that this Province is the producer of raw material and consumer of finished products, it cannot claim a single industry worth the name. This serious situation coupled with impending constitutional changes has produced a dynamic state in the country. It will be nothing short of blunder of great magnitude not to realise the forces—far less to under-rate them—that are working to bring about the salvation of the country and to bring about an equality of political status with the dominions of the British Commonwealth. While, on the one hand, it is the duty of the Government to utilise all its powers for maintaining peace, law and order—a task in which it can expect support from every reasonable section of the Province—it is no less its duty to remove the root causes that are in the way of peace. The Government will not be well advised if in hot haste it resorts to repression. Such a policy invariably defeats the object it seeks to achieve.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani** [West Punjab Towns, Muhammadan), Urban] : Sir, I would not have taken the time of the House, but on going through the statement of the Honourable Finance Member and the memorandum I find, as a casual observer would do, that there is something wrong somewhere. It is clear that the province mainly depends upon the irrigation it receives from the canals, and this province has been spending quite ungrudgingly crores of rupees on the construction of canals, headworks and their maintenance, but I find this year—I admit that the floods this year were record ones—but I find that this year almost all the headworks of any importance in this province have given way, and to my mind, that is very

[ Sh. Abdul Ghani.]

threatening. That shows that whenever there are huge floods, there is every possibility of a similar state of affairs recurring again. The result would be that a province whose mainstay is agriculture and which has to depend upon the canal irrigation would be ruined if a similar state of affairs is to repeat itself again. The question naturally arises whether the sum of Rs. 65 lakhs that has been spent on these works and on their repairs, in order to put them in order, whether these are only makeshift arrangements or whether we will have to provide similar sums every year for these works. As a matter of fact, there is every danger of the calamity being repeated in the years that have yet to come. There is absolutely nothing in the lengthy statement of the Honourable Finance Member to assure us on the point. That is why I rise to ask the Government to explain to the House whether the money that has been spent this year, that is, sixty-five lakhs, is enough to make the headworks immune for ever or whether they still stand in danger of being yearly swept away and we will have to make provision yearly for huge sums to put these headworks in repairs and to maintain them in proper working order. I learn from the statement that a committee of certain expert engineers was appointed and that that committee examined the circumstances with respect to the Islam weir and that their recommendations were carried into effect. But there is nothing to show that as a matter of fact the committee came to the conclusion that in future no such damage to the headworks at Islam would be possible and that they would be safe for ever. That is the assurance which anybody who goes through the statement of the Honourable Finance Member would like to have on the point.

Again, in the case of the Rasul headworks, I presume that the dam that was raised was swept away or damaged by the floods this year. Several lakhs were spent to put that in order. Now, it is working; but the question is, has the money that has been spent this year been enough to avoid any future danger to the headworks at Rasul or whether the money spent was only to make up for the damage that had been done to the headworks this year? If there is a possibility of the headworks being damaged by the recurrence of floods, if the headworks cannot stand the strain of another flood, where would the province be? That is a very serious problem and I would request the Honourable Finance Member or whoever is in charge of the subject to give an assurance to the House, not only to give an assurance, but to explain the whole situation. All along we have been told that we can very well pride ourselves on the excellent canal system that had been introduced into this province and we really thought that it was one of the greatest boons of British administration in India that very vast tracts of waste lands have been brought under cultivation through the efforts of their engineers and we thought that their skill in this department had, to a very large extent, contributed to the prosperity of the province. But we now find that all the money that has been spent in this direction may be taken to have been wasted because, if there is a recurrence of floods every year and these headworks are swept away or damaged, there would be no security and no immunity and the result would be that the province which depends so largely on agriculture and irrigation from canals would be easily faced with a calamity and as a matter of fact, all this money would have, to a great extent, been wasted. So, the question is whether all that has been spent



for repairs of these headworks this year is such that they will withstand the onslaughts of huge floods that may come down the streams next year or on any other future occasion. I would really want an assurance on that point.

Moreover, in the case of the Rasul headworks, if one takes the trouble to examine carefully, he will find that the silt that has been deposited from year to year by the stream has been raising the bed level of the river. Though I am not an expert, I may safely presume that the extraordinary damage done to the villages near about Jhelum was due to the rising of this bed level of the river. Is it not then a source of great danger? Can we, under the circumstances, think that the money that has been ungrudgingly given to this department is not being wasted and that it is being very well spent? I would specially request the Chief Engineer to overhaul the whole situation and to assure the House on these very serious problems and tell us that, as a matter of fact, in future there is no very great danger of these headworks being swept away in the way they were done this year.

Then, I should like to dissociate myself with certain remarks made by the honourable member who just preceded me, namely, that there is no use opening intermediate colleges and that the money spent on them is almost being wasted. I beg to differ from him on the point. The point is that everybody cannot afford to send his sons to big towns such as Lahore and other places. In the first place, all these places are very expensive. In the next place, people are very chary and do not want that their sons should be spoiled by the bad influences that are very common in the metropolis.

With these remarks I resume my seat.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal** [North-East Towns (Non-Muhammadan), (Urban)]: Sir, I associate myself with Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh in congratulating the Honourable Finance Member and the Finance Secretary in being able to adjust the budget at a time when there has been a failure of harvest and a decrease in the provincial revenues. But I want to draw the attention of Government to two or three points. One of them was touched upon by the previous speaker, that is, that no capital expenditure should be incurred out of revenue receipts. This is wrong in principle. It has been pointed out that several crores of rupees have been spent by Government from revenue receipts on capital works in previous years. The result has been that a large amount of surplus which could have been given back to the tax-payers has not been so returned.

Again there are several works on which the revenue receipts should have been spent but have not been spent. I, as a member of the Jail Enquiry Committee, have visited several jails; and I found that some of the jails, such as those in Jullundur, Ludhiana and other places, are such that they require immediate consideration. After all, the jail population requires humane consideration from the Government as much as any other section of the public. The Jullundur jail, according to my information, was condemned several years ago, but the Government has not been able to rebuild it. That requires the special attention of the Government and I am of opinion that if the Government had not undertaken financing big schemes out of revenue receipts which should have been financed from capital receipts, these jails would have received the attention of Government.

[ R. B. L. Mohan Lal. ]

Another building which requires the serious attention of Government is the Mental Hospital. I saw the population there. Really it is the Kingdom of God. The officer who is in charge of the institution is loved by the inmates, and I was myself struck by the fact that even the most violent and insane people there loved that officer and they were prepared to lie at his feet. The sisters of charity who are working there are also doing good and useful work. But the barracks in which the mentally defective people are kept are not in good sanitary condition and require the immediate attention of Government.

Another subject to which the attention of the Government has been drawn by my honourable friend is the question of female education. I entirely agree with my friend 3 P. M. Sardar Ujjal Singh that the Government perhaps would be very wise in taking steps to open new high schools for girls. As regards the education of boys, the Government, the Honourable the Minister for Education, the Director of Public Instruction and the Deputy Director deserve our congratulations for having given us so many schools. But I am sorry to observe that they have not provided the same funds towards female education as they have done towards the boys education. In this budget I do not find any provision for the opening of girls high schools as used to be before. I hope, Sir, that in such a big budget the Education Department would be provided with funds for the opening of girls high schools in the province even at the sacrifice of boys schools.

I am sorry, Sir, that in my remarks regarding the Mental Hospital I forgot to touch one very important point with respect to the diet which is given to the prisoner. The Government agreed to stop the mixed flour bread and white bread of wheat is being supplied. I hope ghi would be substituted for oil. But, Sir, the oil is still in use there, therefore, I strongly recommend that ghi be supplied to the prisoners.

Another point to which I want to draw the attention of the Government is the Forest department in the Punjab. Sir, this department is very much over-manned. I understand that Government propounded a scheme some years back to reorganize the Forest Department under which 36 provincial and 36 Indian Forest Service officers were to be recruited. When the recruitment was made I am informed that the Government found itself unable to see where to put the officers that were recruited. Now, Sir, the places of rangers, deputy rangers are being held by the Indian Forest Service and Provincial Officers and minor divisions, which were held in charge before by the Provincial Service men, are being held by Indian Forest Service Officers. I put to the consideration of the Government that in future there should be no recruitment in the Punjab for the Forest department and that the Punjab Government should address the Government of India that when the other provinces require Forest Officers they can take from the Punjab. In this way the Punjab Government would be able to save a large sum of money in forest expenditure which can be spent in other directions.

One grievance of the Hindus which I want to bring to the notice of the Government is in connection with the recruitment in the police department.

There is a budget provision now for 60 sub-assistant inspectors. In this department the claims of the Hindus do not appear to have received the same consideration as they should have received. The Hindus have been much less recruited in this department than their due share.

Another subject to which my honourable friend Sardar Ujjal Singh has drawn the attention of the Government is the present political condition in the country. There is going to be a very severe struggle between the people and the Government and all of us who are anxious to help in the maintenance of law and order assure the Government our support, but at the same time my suggestion for the consideration of the Government is that when this critical moment comes, the Government should not lose its head and take any hasty steps which may make the position more complicated in India or in the provinces. The handling of the present situation in the provinces requires the very careful and calm consideration of the Government and I hope that Government would do all that it can to see that no false steps are taken. With these words, Sir, I resume my seat.

**Mr. E. Maya Das** [ Non-official, Nominated ] (Urdu) : Sir, I also congratulate the Honourable Finance Member, his Secretary and other assistants on the success which their efforts to prepare the budget in this satisfactory manner have met. This is one of those lean years when the revenue has diminished but there has been no corresponding decrease in liabilities and, therefore, it required great intelligence as well as diligence to balance the budget. The Honourable Finance Member and his assistants have spared no pains to meet the situation in a satisfactory manner and they deserve not only our congratulations, but also our thanks because it is on account of their efforts that imposition of further taxes has not been found necessary. Sir, it is very difficult for any member to agree to every item of the Budget as prepared by any Finance Member. It is, therefore, very natural that some of us may like to see a larger provision made for a particular department and others may be anxious to have some reduction made in another department. For example, I am of opinion that if the grants proposed to be made to the local bodies for buildings, for schools and such other purposes were to be reduced somewhat no harm would be done, and the money thus saved could be utilised for more urgent needs under other heads. I think that if more money had been provided for the Punjab Health School, it would have been a very good thing.

In this connection, I beg to ask one question from the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government. Will he kindly let me know whether it is a fact that the number of deaths in confinement cases and of new born babies is much larger when such cases are attended by untrained *daïs*? If the answer to this question is in the affirmative, will he kindly let me know as to how he has arrived at the conclusion that the running of the Punjab Health School at the present scale and strength is not very necessary?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** : It is quite wrong. Where did you get the statement that this school is not very necessary?

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (Urdu) : I have no particular statement in view except the figures as are given in the budget. It will not be denied, however, that a reduction has been made in the provision for this school and, in my humble opinion, it points towards the intention of slowing

[ Mr. E. Maya Das. ]

down rather than accelerating the activities of the school. Besides the fact that trained *dais* are a great necessity of the day, it is essential that the work of the trained *dais* should be constantly supervised, otherwise, there is the natural tendency to relapse to primitive and crude methods. This is all the more necessary in the case of indigenous *dais* that have been given training. It is no secret that the local bodies are not taking sufficient interest in this matter and if Government, by its action or inaction, betrays the least indifference towards this very important matter of public welfare, it will be but natural that the Local Bodies will do the same. Even in England where there is so much light and learning, 50 per cent. of grants are made to local bodies for similar purposes, and if it is intended to create interest in this matter in this Province, it will be necessary to give cent per cent. grants to local bodies for some years to come. In the absence of such grants, the local bodies must needs dispense with the services of their Lady Health Visitors, for lack of funds and the result will be that so many Lady Health Visitors will be thrown out of work and after that, it will become absolutely necessary to close the Health School. I sincerely wish that this should not happen and that is why I ask the Government to pay more attention to this very important matter. The children yet unborn have a claim upon us and upon Government that they be given the best attention possible at the time when they come into this world, and allowing them to be attended to by untrained *dais* is certainly not giving them that attention. It will be readily admitted that the children, who, at the time of their birth, are attended by trained *dais*, grow to be healthier than those not so cared for, and, therefore, it is essential that such *dais* should be made available in large numbers.

Sir, we were under the impression that Government would, as far as possible, avoid taking a step which would tend to curtail the activities of any beneficent department. But in the case of the Punjab Health School, which is apparently in the front rank of the beneficent departments, this matter appears to have been overlooked. We were also told that this school would be made permanent, but from the budget it appears that its life has been extended only for one year. If such is the case, it will not be a matter for surprise if the school is closed shortly on the expiry of this year.

There is another point to which I like to draw the attention of the Government. As Government is aware, the financial position of district boards is very precarious. If some suitable means could be devised to supplement their income, Government would be saved a good deal of trouble. It will then not have to make as large grants as at present. To improve the financial position of district boards I make one suggestion for what it is worth. At present, the number of cattle fairs that take place at various places in the British territory is 95. The income that accrues from these fairs amounts to about 4½ lakhs of rupees per annum or in other words Rs. 4½ per square mile, and if the actual area that comes under the range of these fairs were taken into account, the income per square mile comes to about Rs. 6½ per annum. But the income that the neighbouring States make out of these fairs is much larger. The area of those States is about 24,000

square miles and the income that accrues to them from these cattle fairs amounts to Rs. 4,48,000, i.e., about Rs. 10 per square mile. And if the actual area in which these fairs take place were taken into consideration, the income per square mile comes to about Rs. 18½ a year. Nabha and Pataudi are making the largest income from these fairs. Nabha State extends over an area of 960 square miles, and the income that it derives from these fairs amounts to Rs. 1,16,000 a year, or in other words, Rs. 119 per square mile, whereas our income on account of these fairs does not exceed Rs. 6½ per square mile. Pataudi State is more fortunate than even Nabha in this respect. By quoting these figures I do not mean to say that the Punjab Government should unduly interfere in the administration of these States, my object in placing these figures before the House is to show we could also increase our income on account of these fairs by making efforts in this direction. Because the number of cattle fairs that take place in the British territory is very small, people from the British territory take their cattle to the States on the occasion of such fairs and thus the income that we could have derived goes to fill the coffers of these States. To avoid this loss in our income we should increase the number of fairs and select suitable places for holding these fairs that men from the British territory may not have to take their cattle to the States. I hope that Government will take this suggestion into consideration.

Now, I want to say a few words with regard to the Education department. Sir, during the last few years Government has been giving unusually large grants to the district boards for purposes of education, perhaps because there was surplus money available. These grants, I may be permitted to say, have upset the budget of district boards. Nobody objects to these grants, but the difficulty is that while making these grants, Government requires the district boards to spend 60 or a larger percentage of these grants from their own budgets. But very often they are not in a position to bear the burden and it would, therefore, be much better that under these circumstances such large grants are not made. Added to it, there is another difficulty, and that is, that method of calculating those grants is so very complicated and difficult that hardly any one can understand it.....

*(At this stage the bell rang indicating that the time was up and the honourable member resumed his seat.)*

**[Mr. H. F. Ashton (Chief Engineer, Irrigation):** Sir, an honourable member of this House asked for certain information to be given to the House in regard to certain canal headworks. The statement was made by him that "almost all the important headworks have given way this year and that this might occur again at high floods in the future." It is a statement which is open to question. The only headworks damaged this year are Rasul, Mangla, Islam and to a comparatively slight extent, Marala. Those are only four out of the many canal headworks in the province. Taking this one factor, the honourable member has put the question whether the sixty-six lakhs to be spent on headworks this year is enough to make them immune for ever or must the expenditure be repeated. That is a question to which I doubt any human being will give a definite reply. Everything depends on circumstances. I will take the Mangla headworks as an example. When these headworks were being designed, and the whole question of their construction

[ Mr. H. F. Ashton. ]

was under consideration, all past records of gauges and floods in the river Jhelum at or near that site were very carefully scrutinised and flood levels calculated. In the actual design, it was decided to allow the flood level 7 feet higher than that found by calculation of all previous records. The flood last year was actually 15 feet higher than the calculated highest flood prior to construction and 8 feet higher than was allowed for in construction. The water passed 8 feet over the top parapets and 5 feet over the top of the roadway over the regulator. These headworks stood! The hill on each side was scoured away, on one side to a width of about 50 feet and on the other about 100 feet, but the actual constructed headworks stood. Now, one might say that these headworks have been proved to be immune. I myself would not like to say that, because at any time we might get a very much higher flood or some other disaster might occur and the headworks be wrecked. The Rasul headworks were built about 1899-1900 and though they have suffered damage two or three times before this, that of last year is the worst damage that they have suffered. Again these are on the Jhelum river on which as I shall just show we had an extraordinary flood. At the Kohala bridge, the river rose to 96 feet, a height which has never been known before. On the Chenab we have two headworks. Of these, one was entirely undamaged and the other comparatively slightly. On the Sutlej, we have four; Rupar was practically undamaged, Ferozepore and Sulemanke were undamaged, Islam suffered disaster. That disaster was enquired into by a committee consisting of the Chief Engineer of the Sarda Canal in the United Provinces, the Chief Engineer of Sukkur Barrage, or rather he is now the Chief Engineer in Sind, and the Consulting Engineer to the Government of India. They went very carefully into all the calculations and the designs and, as a result of their recommendations, it has been decided to do further work on the Panjnad headworks and also supply further protection at Sulemanke and Ferozepore. So that, I can say, as far as we can foresee, as far as we can calculate, we are endeavouring to make our headworks immune from further trouble. But at the same time we must take into consideration the expenditure point of view. It is perfectly easy for us to make headworks and spend any figure you like—say a hundred crores, if you will; it is only a matter of making it stronger. But the interest on that money would cost Government annually more than a few lakhs spent once in 20, 30 or even 50 years. So no one can say—at least I cannot say—that our headworks are immune from disaster in the future. All I can say is that we are doing our best to make them immune, keeping in view the fact that the expenditure must not be out of all bounds as compared to the work under construction.

Another statement which the honourable member made was that he thought, seeing the silt upstream at the Rasul weir, that that silt had caused a rise of the river levels right up the Jhelum. I can assure the honourable member that that is not really the case. The actual rise of the level of the river Jhelum at Rasul has been comparatively small. The weir there is a very long one and it was originally built at the average river bed level and has been raised since its first construction by a comparatively few feet; I cannot give the exact figure but it is in the neighbourhood of about 6 feet or a little more.

That six feet raising of the weir itself—and not of the sluices—would not cause any appreciable rise in the level of the river at Jhelum, and the cause of that rise at Jhelum was the extraordinary river flood that we had this year. No one can say when such floods will occur again, and, as the honourable member said, it may occur even next year. But why should we anticipate it? The flood in the Indus this year was the highest since 1882; it was some feet higher than the 1882 flood. If we went in for making our headworks absolutely immune from any conceivable flood, the expenditure would be so great that no Government could view it with equanimity and place it before the House for its sanction. (*Hear, hear*).

**Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath** [Punjab Landholders (General)]: Sir, I am in full agreement with those speakers who have appreciated the hard work done by the Finance Department, the Honourable the Finance Member and the Secretary, in carrying on the financial administration of the province in a year which has been by no means prosperous, and in preparing a programme for the next year which also does not promise to be prosperous. In the past year we had had to contend with two opposite forces, dry weather and wet weather—wet weather in certain parts causing floods and dry weather in other parts causing drought. In the year to come, the damage done to canals by floods will have its effect on the water supply, and the income from abiana and land revenue is not expected to be as good as it would be in other parts. Besides, the standard of assessment of land revenue has been lowered since the last year and that also must have its effect on the income from land revenue. The income from Stamps and Excise is also expected to suffer. I think there will be a greater falling off under these two heads than the framers of the Budget have anticipated and this, for reasons on which some of the speakers have dwelt, and to which I shall also make a brief reference.

With regard to the internal arrangement of the Budget figures, it has been pointed out that the savings from the revenue account have been utilised for capital expenditure. The matter certainly needs explanation. I drew the attention of the Finance Secretary to it on reading a criticism in the press. But it seems to me that the whole question will resolve itself into one point, whether utilisation of a part of the revenue account on capital expenditure was the result of re-appropriation or whether it was anticipated at the time of the framing of the budget. If it was anticipated at the time of the framing of the budget, certainly the surplus should have been utilised either on beneficent departments or towards reduction of taxation. If it was not anticipated, and if the diversion of the sum is due to re-appropriation, I do not think that the objection has much force, for any change in taxation involves a certain amount of re-arrangement of finances which it is not possible to do within the year. The expenditure on beneficent departments having been once fixed cannot be suddenly increased.

With regard to the next year, Sir, the spring harvest in the ground promises very well, and if it is saved from locusts I believe we shall have a bumper crop. But bumper harvest alone is not a thing on which we can congratulate ourselves. There are other considerations to which reference has been made by several speakers and to which I also wish to advert. The price of agricultural produce is going down. Now, this may be a source of gratification for consumers of a certain class—of a very limited class,—not



[ D. B. Raja Narendra Nath. ]

for all consumers, those whose incomes are fixed, those who get salaries from Government will be pleased to get more corn for less money spent, but traders will suffer very largely. As for the zamindar himself, he has to meet several demands on his purse in cash, and it is not right to suppose that the inflation of prices will benefit only the big landlords and not the peasant proprietors. Both have to pay cash in the way of land revenue, in the way of abiana. Kindly calculate for a moment the 'price of the produce on an acre of wheat and then deduct from it the amount which the peasant proprietor has to pay for land revenue and abiana. Besides, those times are gone and past when the requirements of the peasant proprietor were met by village products. The peasant proprietor has to spend money on articles which are not produced in the village. Apart from that, there is one other great demand on his purse besides land revenue and abiana, that is, the price of cattle. If unfortunately some epidemic appears and his cattle die, it will affect him very seriously. So, he must have a surplus. If this fall in prices becomes permanent, there will be a sort of economic misfit with the surroundings. It is very difficult to go into the economic causes which have brought about this result. I am primarily concerned with the price which agricultural produce yields. I follow very carefully all the discussions that take place higher up on this question. I am not yet able to locate the causes. The Honourable the Finance Member recently said that world causes are operating; perhaps he is right. There are others who say that the fixation of the rate of exchange at 1s. 6d. is the cause of our misfortune, or at any rate has deprived the agriculturists of a large amount of money. I myself feel incompetent to give any final opinion on the subject. But I do find one thing to which I would draw the attention of economists and the Finance Member, and that is, the price of gram is very high, much higher than that of wheat. Wheat is produced all over the world. But gram is mainly produced in India, and it sells at the rate of Rs. 5 per maund, while wheat sells at Rs. 4 or Rs. 3-12-0 a maund. Now, Sir, this fall in price of agricultural produce will have its effect on provincial liabilities in other ways. We have many projects on hand, at least two important projects; one of them is nearly completed and the other is going on—the Nili Bar project, which is nearly finished and the Mandi Hydro-electric scheme, which is going on. It is mainly out of the proceeds of the sale of crown lands that we look forward to meet the liabilities which we incur on the Sutlej Valley scheme. As to the Mandi Hydro-Electric scheme a committee has been sitting to enquire as to the prospects of its success and as to the hopes we can entertain about the economic prosperity which it promises. That report is not in our hands yet, but from what I have heard I think I am justified in saying that the economic prosperity of the province on account of the Mandi Hydro-Electric scheme is not assured for some time to come, till at least 4 or 5 years.

Then, Sir, the question of the depression of trade and depression of agricultural produce brings me on to an allied topic to which reference has been made by some members, especially by my friend sitting opposite, Sardar Ujjal Singh, viz., the question of unemployment. This morning I read a paper in which some figures were given about the number of unemployed in Europe and America, and the figure given was something like 3 crores.



Of course, no account is taken of the unemployed here : the number of unemployed in India is not known, perhaps it is not ascertainable. This Council by a resolution appointed a committee which went thoroughly into the question and submitted a report. The report has been in our hands for some time now, but nothing has been done. The conclusion arrived at by the Committee was that unemployment was to be met with on a large scale amongst the educated classes, that people are taking to literary education in large numbers without any specific aim beyond that of obtaining clerical appointments and Government jobs. The whole matter requires further probing into. In this connection I would certainly express my full agreement with the suggestion which has been thrown by my friend opposite, that the number of intermediate colleges should not be multiplied without making some arrangement for vocational instruction. (*Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal* : That has been considered by the Punjab University.) But we do not see the result yet. The Education Committee of which I was a member submitted a report, and the report emphasised the bad need for vocational instruction, and deplored that at present people have recourse to university education without any specific aim, and the multiplication of colleges is creating a sort of political unrest. It is impossible to provide all the products of colleges with Government service and they run amock and invent all sorts of social and economic theories. It is a very serious question which ought to be tackled by Government, and in fact, not only by the provincial Government but by the Government of India, and I think that one important solution of the difficulty is to introduce vocational education. We as members of the Committee were unable to make any specific recommendations because none of us had technical qualifications necessary to enable us to grapple with the question. The report has been now in the hands of the Education Department for some time and in the hands of the Education Minister and the Minister for Industries, but no specific action, no particular action, has been taken either in this province or in any other. The department of Industries has been in existence for the last ten years, and I find on reference to the Memorandum which was presented to the House with the Budget that the expenditure on it has become nearly double of what it was in the days when the department was started. There are several industrial schools, there are technical schools, but whether the department has been able to make any impression on the increasing unemployment is a question to which I am not prepared to give an answer in the affirmative. Well, Sir, I do not wish to go into the various figures which are to be found in the budget, suffice it to say that our resources are limited and our demands are many ; we have got many important matters to attend to which require immediate attention. Well, about two years ago, I do not think I made any speech last year, about two years ago I drew the attention of the Council to the importance of hospitals for men and for cattle. I find that some improvement has been made in this respect and further improvements are promised. But I think that a great deal remains to be done and more money is wanted. Education is a very important matter and we are not yet far from having free and compulsory education all over the province. Money is not forthcoming. It is not easily available. With our resources decreasing, with the amount of money in the country becoming less and less, with the depression in trade, with the depression in agriculture

[ D. B. Raja Narendranath. ]

with unemployment on the increase and with all these demands of various beneficent departments pressing on us, we are confronted with problems which are very difficult to solve. I think, for any Government, but I would particularly draw to them the attention of the treasury benches in front of me.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore, Sikh, Rural], (Urdu): Sir, I associate myself with those of my honourable friends who have congratulated the Honourable the Finance Member and the Finance department for presenting the Budget in such a lucid form. They have had to work very hard in their efforts to make both ends meet because the year is a particularly lean one and the expenditure of the Government is rising by leaps and bounds. It is a pity that in spite of their best efforts they have had to come forward with a deficit of 27 lakhs of rupees, but at the same time I cannot but express a sort of satisfaction on finding them face to face with such a situation. The reason is that whenever we have tried to ventilate the grievances of the poor people in various parts of the province, the official benches have been always pleased to turn a deaf ear to all our requests in that behalf, but now they must have realized what it means to live on a poor income. The trouble with our Government is that it never has paid any attention to the desirability of cutting its coat according to the cloth in hand or saving a penny for the rainy day. The province has enjoyed some prosperous years too, and had the Government saved something for the lean years at those times, the situation would not have been so bad. Even now there are many sources of income which can be tapped with great advantage if the Government be so inclined. For instance, there are a good many tracts of very excellent land lying uncultivated in various colonies with ample provision for irrigation. If the Government gives those lands to the zamindars on free contract they are sure to yield a very considerable income. But the officials stick to their own novel method and thus those lands are lying uncultivated.

But in spite of this and other such sources of income, it must be said that no improvement in the present state of affairs can have any permanent or enduring effect unless the Government makes serious efforts to reduce its ever-increasing expenditure. There is no civilized country in the world where public servants are paid so high salaries as in this country. The Government has often said that on account of the financial stringency it is not possible to increase the salaries of the subordinate servants. True. But where is the fun in giving the higher officials extraordinarily high salaries in days of such financial stringency? The Government can very easily reduce the salaries of those who are drawing Rs. 500, or more a month by 25 per cent. at least. This reduction will save you a huge sum, and it may end your troubles for ever.

Now I draw your attention to the Irrigation department. Quite recently a good many persons have been employed to remove fallen trees and other such things from the canal roads. I submit, Sir, that the officers do not visit these roads very often and, therefore, this extra expenditure is absolutely unnecessary. Then, these roads are not open to the public. None but the pedestrians are allowed the use of these roads. Even cyclists are denied that facility.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Motorists are allowed with permits. They are using these canal roads.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** You are a member of the Council and, therefore, you might have been allowed their use.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** I have become a member of this Council quite recently, but I have been using the road for the last 6 years.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu):** Then Sir, there are so many bungalows of which there seems to be no need at all. The touring officers can and do return to their headquarters within 3 or 4 hours, and these bungalows are used, if at all, only once a year. In fact, Sir, the Irrigation department has created a world of its own. For instance, take the case of its post and telegraph Offices. Even the Railway telegraph offices are open to the public, but the Irrigation department would not care to provide any such facility to us, and at the same time to increase its own income. We are ready to pay for those facilities, but a strange notion of prestige would not allow these celestial beings to descend a little from their heavenly pedestal and share them with us. The Honourable the Revenue Member declared some of these telegraph offices open to the public, but I submit that the whole system should be open to public use.

Then I come to the heavy expenditure on police force. This expenditure is incurred to check and investigate crime, but in addition to that our Government maintains a special police force to deal with the political activities of the people. This system may be necessary so long as the attitude of the Government remains what it is, but I must say that it is an absolutely wrong and faulty method of allaying political unrest. This unrest cannot subside unless the Government tries to win the co-operation of the people and realizes the truth of the following couplet of Shaikh Saadi :

با رعیت ملج کی وز جنگ خصم این نشین  
[زانکہ شاہنشاہ عادل را رعیت لشکر است]

Thus the Government should leave no stone unturned to secure the good will of the people. I must say, Sir, that a Government which cannot secure the co-operation of an angel of peace like Mahatma Gandhi is, to say the least, not fit to govern. Our Government does not realize the desirability of such a step and allows itself to be misguided by those people whose motto is :—

اگر شہر و زر را گوید شب است این  
بیاید گفت ایک ماہ پر رہی

Now it has started a baseless and futile propaganda against the Indian National Congress through these very people. For instance, I draw your attention to a poster which has been issued under the signatures of the Honorary Magistrates and Zaildars of the Lahore district warning the zamindars against the activities of the Congress and drawing their attention to an imaginary resolution of that body. I was really wonder-struck to find our own learned Deputy President among the signatories, and when I drew his attention to the matter he replied that.....

**Mr. President :** The honourable member should not refer to a private conversation.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu) :** May I ask the Chair to address me in Urdu as I do not understand English very well ?

**Mr. President :** Did the honourable member understand what I said just now in English ?

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu) :** No, Sir. I should like you to explain it in Urdu.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Is it really not permitted to a member to ask the Chair to speak to him in Urdu or is the Chair forbidden to speak to a member in Urdu ?

**Mr. President :** The convention of this House is that in the Council the President addresses the House or its members in English.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Do you approve of that convention ?

**Mr. President :** It is for the House to decide.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** I think that convention ought to be broken and a new convention set up.

**Mr. President :** Does not the honourable member (Sardar Hira Singh Narli) know English ?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** He wants the Chair to address him in Urdu. English cannot be forced on him when he does not understand it.

**Mr. President :** But it appears that he does understand English. However, some members do not understand English at all. I think all such members and others who are not well conversant with English are entitled to be addressed in the vernacular. Is that the sense of the House ?

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I would submit that there should be a translation of the orders of the Chair. That was the practice followed by Mr. Casson.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** No, that would be too cumbersome a procedure.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** You have got the Secretary and the Assistant Secretary, and you have got other staff, who could communicate your orders to the members in Urdu.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** With your permission, I would submit that translation is a most cumbersome process, and should not be resorted to when the Chair can express itself very well in Hindustani.

**Mr. President :** I am inclined to agree with Dr. Gokul Chand Narang. Why should the time of the House be wasted by translation ?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** In fact the convention should be that the Chair should also speak in Hindustani or Punjabi when not addressing any of the European members.

**Mr. President :** These conventions have to be established gradually. They are not, like a piece of legislation, established in a day.

**Lala Mukand Lal, Puri :** Sir, why do you not stick to English? Your rulings can be translated in Punjabi or Urdu.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram :** Sir, when you speak in English you speak with greater force (*laughter*). Therefore, you should speak in English and not in any of the vernaculars.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** May I ask, Sir, whether any of the honourable members on the official benches have any suggestions to make on the point? There might be certain members among them who would not be able to follow the vernacular.

**Mr. President :** In the absence of the Leader of the House, may I ask Sir Alexander Stow or the Chief Secretary to state the official point of view, if any?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** So far as these benches are concerned, I understand there would be no objection on this side to any course which you think fit yourself to pursue.

**Mr. President :** I am entirely in the hands of the honourable members of the House. The Secretary says that there will be some difficulty in reporting. The reporting of vernacular speeches of the members is not so faithful and so complete as the reporting of English speeches.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** I see there is force in that, but I think you will have very few occasions where you will have to use Hindustani, and on these few occasions you can be bi-lingual. You can give your ruling in English and at the same time you can translate it.

**Mr. President :** In other words, I should perform two duties—one as President, the other as translator.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** I do not think it will be necessary to adopt this procedure that on occasions when you are addressing honourable members who cannot follow English very well or who do not know English at all, you should first give your direction in English and then translate yourself. I agree with Dr. Sahib that such occasions will be very few when you will have to say anything in Hindustani for the sole benefit of an honourable member who does not understand English, and on those occasions it will perhaps not be giving a ruling so much as giving brief directions, and I think if you speak in Hindustani that can be taken down and correctly reported.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** When you are giving directions of the nature that the honourable member must speak to the motion you can say سب سے زور کے ساتھ کہیں گے متعلق تقریر کریں or when you want to say : you must not repeat yourself : you can say آپ دلائل کا اعادہ نہ کریں There will be no difficulty in reporting that in Urdu.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Sir, are there no signs for these few general remarks that you can adopt? Is it not possible to fix certain signs for the purpose? The President should make those signs instead of speaking when he wants to rule a member out of order or when he wants him to stop (*laughter*).

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu) :** I was saying, Sir, in connection with the expenditure on the police force that the zaildars and honorary magistrates are carrying on a vigorous propaganda on the basis of a resolution which was never passed by the Congress, and when I drew the attention of our learned Deputy President to the poster in question,

[ S. Hira Singh. ]

he emphatically denied any knowledge of such a poster and was surprised to find his signature therein. Then Sir, every one knows that the country is passing through a very critical period at present. Conspiracy cases and bomb outrages have become the order of the day. It is not possible to say anything with certainty, but there is an impression growing in the mind of the public at large that even the Government employees play their part in this connection, and this impression has been strengthened by what has come to light in Lyallpur. The Government must remember that it can never suppress this unrest by repression. Whenever in the history of the world a Government has resorted to repression in order to suppress the legitimate activities of the governed, there has been a serious clash between the two resulting in a disaster to the former. I admit that no one has so far expressed any sympathy with those who do not mind resorting to violence for the attainment of their object, but the very fact that the resolution about non-violence was passed with the barest majority in the Lahore Congress should serve as an eye-opener to us. It shows very clearly that as the object of those people is the same as that of Mahatma Gandhi, the country has every sympathy with their aim and, consequently, with the means they adopt to attain it. Therefore, Sir, unless the Government sincerely tries to reconcile the people, no amount of expenditure on the police force can prove of the slightest avail in this connection.

As regards the Education department, the Government is no doubt spending a lot on it, but the fact remains that that expenditure has not proved as beneficial to the country as it ought to have done. In other countries this department is doing highly useful work, but here it is only a machine for increasing the number of unemployed. Our graduates are only fit for clerical work, and as it is not possible for the Government to provide employment to all of them they are tossed from pillar to post. It is just possible that most of the youngmen participating in conspiracies and bomb outrages are these very graduates. Therefore, the Government should impart some useful education to our young men. It is really a pity that no serious attention is paid to agricultural and industrial education in this country. No doubt our country is an agricultural one, but that is no reason why it should be the poorest country in the world while other agricultural countries are enjoying affluence and prosperity. For instance, wheat is selling at Rs. 8-8-0 per maund here and contracts are taking place at Rs. 8 only for the next crop, but the English biscuits made of the same wheat are selling in the country at Rs. 2 a pound. This is due to nothing else than their industrial development.

Then, Sir, the Government has never thought it fit to pay the same attention to the needs of the rural areas as it pays to those of the big cities and towns. I do not mean to suggest for a moment that the latter should be neglected or forsaken altogether. What I want to say is that the Government should at once direct its efforts towards bringing the former on the same level with the latter. The sanitary condition of our villages is anything but satisfactory. The Government must remember that it is not only the cleanliness and grandeur of the secretariat that.....

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is up.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri** [Amritsar, City (Non-Muhammadian), Urban]: Sir, I congratulate the Honourable Finance Member and the Finance Secretary in placing before us the real situation. The explanatory memorandum shows that in the year 1921-22 we started with an income of Rs. 8,64,00,000 but when we came to 1923-24 the income had gone to Rs. 10,22,00,000 and disbursements to Rs. 9,71,00,000. That is to say we had a surplus budget in the year 1923-24. But we find—that is my experience as a member of the Public Accounts Committee—that whenever there is a surplus the Government gets into the idea of diverting it to capital expenditure. They want to spend the surplus somehow or other and it so happens that schemes which have never been thoroughly gone into are always taken up. That is what happened in the case of the Hydro-Electric scheme. After spending at least 2 crores on that scheme, thanks to my friend who moved a resolution to the effect that the scheme should be examined with a view to see whether we should cry halt or not, the Government appointed a committee to look into the scheme. The same happened with regard to the Shahdara tannery. The Government started the tannery without examining the scheme very carefully and now, there is nobody to purchase it. That is another dead loss. So, whenever there is a surplus there is some sort of liking on the part of the officers concerned that somehow or other they must get as much as possible of the surplus, and there is a scramble for money for schemes which have never been properly examined. When we go back to our constituents we have to render an account of what we have been doing all these years. In 1921-22 when we came to this Council for the first time, we found that we were faced with a deficit budget and the Government said, 'Well, you are the persons responsible for the government of this province and therefore you must find money in order to run the machinery of government.' We found that money by taxing the people. We raised the stamp duty and the court fees and also the water rate. We brought more money. It was, however, expected later on that when there was a surplus budget that the taxpayers would get a remission. Unfortunately, when there was a surplus it was diverted to some channel or other and the taxpayer naturally came forward and asked 'here is a surplus budget, why do you not give us the remission?' The Government said, we have to govern the country, we have to maintain law and order and, therefore, we have to increase the police force as if by increasing the police force they can govern the country. No Government can continue to govern a province as long as it has not got the good will of the people governed. Unless and until you bring about that atmosphere, all the police force will not help to govern a province.

There was also another windfall in the year 1925 or 1926 when there was a remission by the Government of India of the provincial contribution. When there was that remission, other schemes came in. The Agricultural Minister was very keen on starting agricultural farms. Money was allotted for him, but it was never spent and later on it was appropriated for some other purpose. My submission is that whenever there is a surplus we are entitled to expect a certain remission of taxation.

This year we are faced with a deficit budget. It is proposed to meet the deficit not by fresh taxation, but by borrowing. Last year also the Finance Member borrowed and this year also he proposes to borrow. If



[ Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri. ]

we continue to borrow like this we will have to repay later to those persons who lend now. Naturally we shall be met again with fresh proposals for taxation. The question is, when are we going in for retrenchment, and are we going to stop this borrowing or not? We are giving for the police one lakh a month or twelve lakhs per annum while we do not pay even our Ministers as much. With the advent of this Council we are having greater burdens on the province, we are having more police, we are having inefficient judiciary and we are having even inefficient police. There are certain members of the judiciary who are personally responsible for bringing the Government into hatred and contempt. What is the result of all this? The peasant is not satisfied. In spite of the great canal systems, in spite of the most fertile soils, we are not able to produce our own wheat and cheap Australian wheat is being imported into this province, the thanks for which, I think, should go to Government. The time has come when the peasant proprietors of this province must make the Government clearly understand that this province cannot continue merely as a producer of raw material but must become the manufacturer of articles from the raw products.

Vicissitudes of nature will come in every time, as the Finance Secretary has remarked. He says—

“ But the hard fact remains that if the series since 1921 is taken as a whole, good years and bad years balance, and that the financial system must be adapted to fluctuations which nature herself prescribes.”

This Government has been governing the province for such a long time and yet has not understood this principle. I suppose it is time for the Government to understand that nature has its ways of doing things, and that it does not deal with people as they wish.

Then, there is the Revenue Reserve Fund. Strictly speaking the surplus should at least have been credited to that fund to meet the losses. But somehow or other, for reasons better known to persons who are responsible for the administration of the province, they have diverted the surplus to some pet schemes of theirs and I do not know whether they will ever come into existence or not. Whether we are going to make the province richer or poorer, this much I know that the electricity from Lahore to Amritsar actually caused the life of one person yesterday. The connection has been so nicely done that there was a leakage and one passerby fell a victim to the shock caused by the leakage. This, is, however by the way. I was submitting that this surplus amount which should have been kept as a reserve fund has been utilised for certain purposes, for certain schemes, of whose utility I am very doubtful. I refer to the Hydro-Electric scheme which has been the subject of enquiry by a committee who have not yet reported and so I am not in a position to discuss it.

Suppose for argument's sake that we had plenty of money and we took upon ourselves capital expenditure of a nature, the interest on which is bound to be met year after year from current revenues. That is the point which I wish to place for the consideration of the House. (*Interruption.*) I never asked any one not to pay interest, in fact, I believe in paying interest for money borrowed. But the question is whether that interest could be borne upon our current revenues. The so-called productive schemes, we



were given to understand, will start giving us money from 1929. The limit has now gone on to 1933 and it might even go to 1936. And it may not be found to pay at all, in the end! It shall not pay interest at all till the whole output is consumed. I put it to the agriculturists whether they are going to take the situation as it is.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is over.

**Mr. Owen Roberts** (European and Anglo-Indian Communities) : Sir, one may read the very lucid speech of the Honourable the Finance Member in introducing the budget with a certain degree of appreciation without arrogating to oneself the claim to be regarded as a financial expert. Indeed, if I may say so, one of the merits of that presentation was the simple and direct manner in which a very involved and difficult subject was approached. A vivid picture of the struggle with adverse conditions was presented to us. The hope was expressed that it would not be long before the province would be called upon again to endure 'the double stroke of flood and famine.' We are warned that the outlook is not good. In fact, such light as may appear on the horizon is but a false dawn reflecting inelastic revenues and growing expenditure. The honourable member goes on to say :

"But a province dependent on agriculture is also dependent on climate, and must be prepared for cycles of misfortune as well as cycles of prosperity."

And he asks the question—

"Is the Punjab so prepared?"

The answer to this question, as he gives it, is not promising. But surely, Sir, another question arises: Is the Punjab prepared to meet its cycles of prosperity? And this is the question that I have been asking myself since I heard the speech.

It will be admitted that even an agricultural province requires for its development to attract financial assistance and all the co-operation that it can get from business. In recent years this province has attracted both banks and business houses to come and develop it. As a result of this attraction a demand has sprung up for proper accommodation in which to house these new institutions. And to meet this demand, investors have come forward in order to provide accommodation on the principal business thoroughfares that we have in this city. I submit, Sir, and hope to show this Council, that in this respect, business does not get a square deal. There have been complaints by those who came forward to supply the lack of accommodation of enormous losses arising out of interest on capital which has been laid aside for building purposes. And, in addition to that, there has been the uncertainty of entering into leases with firms who were anxious to move from insufficient premises into more suitable accommodation. The subject took such important shape it became necessary for the Chamber of Commerce to appoint a committee to go specially into the matter. As a member of that committee I endeavoured to obtain some information on the subject but without any success. I must confess now that the matter which I now propose to place before the House has two sides to it. One is the personal one and the other is a public one. I propose to keep off the personal side because I may yet have to approach you, Sir on the subject of the privileges of a member of this House. But turning to the other side, I will begin by quoting a letter from the Secretary

[Mr. Owen Roberts.]

to Government, Punjab, Public Works Department (Buildings and Roads) to the Northern India Chamber of Commerce. The delay on building was traced to the plans having to go before the Lahore Improvement Committee. And this is the reply that was received by the Chamber from the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department. Omitting the first few lines :

"I am to suggest that you should refer to the Municipal Committee, Lahore, to ascertain the authority for the orders you mention.

"The Lahore Improvement Committee is an informal body without any authority and its functions are purely advisory. It was initiated by Sir Edward MacLagan on 23rd May 1919 in an un-official note a copy of which is enclosed for your information. This note describes its objects and its limitations and it will be understood that no question of the 'passing of building plans' by this Committee can arise. The sanctioning of building applications is a statutory function of the Municipal Committee and it is entirely at the option of the Municipal Committee whether the Lahore Improvement Committee is consulted or not in regard to the suitability of applications."

Sir, I ask you and honourable members to note the wording carefully. The next document which I do not propose to read out but which I shall give an indication of is the copy of a Resolution No. 287 (18) passed at an emergent ordinary meeting of the General Committee of the Lahore Municipality held on 14th December 1928 :

"The following proposal with the recommendation of the Civil Station Sub-Committee :

"The following letter No. 1054-C. A., dated the 19th June 1928, from the Secretary, Lahore Improvement Committee, to the Secretary, Municipal Committee, Lahore....."

Then follow three paragraphs which lay down rules which are to be observed before plans are submitted to this Committee. The second paragraph contains no less than eight sub-heads. This is put forward to the Lahore Municipal Committee by a body which admits that it has no authority. I then took the matter up with the President, Municipal Committee and I propose to read a few extracts from a letter given in reply to mine. I received the letter yesterday—

"With the exception of one building plan which was passed in a few hours all other plans have been delayed considerably requiring the Committee to adopt rather hard procedure of having the plans refused on several occasions by the President before they could finally be disposed of....."

"The Lahore Municipal Committee who had—vide their letter No. 44, dated 6th April 1929, to restrict its activities to the Mall frontage alone appears to have taken the functions of the committee..... So far the builders on the Mall have been put to serious inconvenience but in future if the Lahore Improvement Committee is to be obeyed, all the builders will have to face the same fate as the Lahore Improvement Committee has instructed the committee to submit to it the plans of all buildings proposed to be built on all important roads in the Civil Station."

Here, Sir, is a statement by the President, Municipal Committee, that this un-official committee proposes not only to carry on its work but to extend the scope of its activities. Then, I have with me the draft of a letter which has been sent to me for approval and which is to come on to Government. I understand, from the Municipal Office that the letter is to be addressed to the Deputy Commissioner. It deals with the delay on plans and one instance of such delay is followed in some detail in the letter :

"The plans in this case were first filed on the 16th April 1929 and were forwarded to the Secretary, Lahore Improvement Committee, on the 23rd April 1929."

After explaining several returns of the plans, he goes on to say :

"The Secretary, Lahore Improvement Committee wrote back in his letter No. 40 dated the 28th June 1929, that the builder should supply clear drawings in plans and sections and specifications with regard to drain clarifying his proposals when the plans were resubmitted by the builder."

Now, Sir, here is an un-official Committee which had, at the most, concern in regard to frontages, interfering in the matter of drains—

"The builder resubmitted his plans on the 6th August 1929 complying with the above instructions..... The Superintending Sanitary Engineer, Municipal Engineer and Medical Officer of Health had inspected the site jointly."

All the ramps had to be removed on account of this non-official committee—

"The view of the Municipal Engineer and Medical Officer of Health along with the opinion of the Legal Adviser was duly forwarded to the Secretary, Improvement Committee on the 13th September 1929. He again raised certain objections which were communicated to the builder."

As a result of these objections I may say that the builder had to enter into a legal agreement which was approved by the Municipal Legal Adviser in respect of this drain.—

"Thereupon the Secretary, Lahore Improvement Committee informed the Municipal Committee on the 23rd October 1929 that his objection regarding the drain would be met if the drain was made as recommended and a satisfactory agreement was made."

Sir, I would ask you to observe that in this city there is a man who has set aside money to build an important building and submits his plans on the 16th of April and it is not until the 23rd October that this un-official committee has made up its mind and in the meantime various important officers have been called in to assist it. That is taking one case at length. But other cases are reported; e. g. the case of Messrs. Pearay Lal and Sons which has not been disposed of although a period of some months has elapsed. In another case—

"The plans filed by Messrs. Durga Dass-Devi Dass were sent for advice to Lahore Improvement Committee on the 11th September 1928, but in spite of the Committee's urgent reminders the plans were not finally disposed of by the Lahore Improvement Committee till the 21st December 1928."

Next,

"The plans submitted by Rai Bahadur Lala Narsingh Dass and prepared by Messrs. Anderson Asorpota were sent for advice to Lahore Improvement Committee on 31st May 1928, but were not disposed of till the 18th August. The committee of the Chamber of the Northern India Commerce made a protest against the delay caused in this case."

Here is another case which shows what can be done :

"The plans submitted by Mr. Harcharan Dass Bhalla were sent to the Lahore Improvement Committee on the 5th April 1929 and were disposed of by the Lahore Improvement Committee on the 6th April 1929, i.e., only in one day."

I have no intention of quoting from this any further, but when we ask ourselves: Is this province prepared to take advantage of its existing prosperity, I think the answer will definitely be in the negative so far as any assistance goes in the way of providing accommodation.

I now turn, Sir, for a moment to a matter which I ventilated in this Council before, and that is the question of the need for proper statistics in regard to trade. This year illustrates rather well what can happen. I

[Mr. Owen Roberts.]

understand from my honourable friend who is not here at the moment Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendranath, that he touched on this matter also. The price of wheat opened in the middle of June at Rs. 8-15-6 and it stands to-day at about Rs. 8-9-0 having risen in the meanwhile as high as Rs. 4-8-6 in November. These are very heavy fluctuations in price, and I might draw the attention of honourable members to an extract from the speech which we heard referring to certain districts bordering on the Indus.

"The grain of the *rabi* harvest of 1929, an exceptionally good one in these tracts, had been stored in the hope of a rise in prices. Not only were these stores in many cases swept away or rendered unfit for consumption, but the *kharif* crop of which much was expected, was entirely destroyed. The toil of laborious months, the profits of one harvest and the promise of another disappeared in a few hours."

Sir, one's sympathy goes out to these people. But if the honourable member who wrote these lines could see the matter from my point of view, he would regard this misfortune as tempering the wind to the shorn lamb. This province to-day is stiff with wheat that it cannot sell and I attribute this very largely indeed to the fact that there are no statistics available on which to base an opinion as to what is in the province.

**Sardar Partap Singh** [Jullundur (Sikh) Rural] (Urdu): Sir, the honourable member representing Hoshiarpur-*cum*-Ludhiana has rightly said that the zamindars have in no way gained any benefit by the existence of co-operative societies in the Punjab. It is a glaring fact that these societies have lagged far behind the object with which they were started. They have utterly failed in affording any help to the zamindars. Notwithstanding the fact that these credit societies are at work for the last few years the zamindars still continue to labour under their heavy debts as they did before. Then, the honourable member representing Sikh Urban constituency complained that the Co-operative department had become the hot bed of communalism. The painful fact is that the members of these societies have also been affected by the communal bias and the interests of the people as well as the interests of the department itself demand that these complaints should be removed. Besides these defects as stated by these honourable members there are many others from which this department suffers. The first defect of these societies is this, that if you borrow some money from them and then after some time go to pay back a portion of it then first of all the sum of interest will be added to the original principal and then from this total sum that amount will be deducted that you would like to pay back.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh:** I fail to follow the honourable member.

**Sardar Partap Singh:** To make it more clear, supposing you borrow say a sum of Rs. 100 from a co-operative society at 12 per cent. rate of interest and then after a month you want to pay back Rs. 10 out of the sum standing against your name. What I mean to say is this that the clerk concerned first adds the interest for one month, i.e., rupee one to Rs. 100 and then out of the total of these two he deducts the sum you want to pay back, i.e., Rs. 10. In this way you will have to pay interest on the remaining sum that you would owe which will be Rs. 91, and not Rs. 90,

as it ought to be the case. This is done every time you go to pay back a portion of your debt. This is a great defect and one has not to suffer from it even by dealing with the money-lenders for they add interest to the loan only after the expiry of the term for which the loan was originally taken. This is a system of compound interest in which the interest is added to the principal after very short periods.

The second defect from which our present system of co-operative societies suffers is this that if one member wants a loan two more are required to stand sureties for him. In this way the sureties are also made to share with the debtor his liabilities and under the rules of the co-operative societies they are also treated equally with him and are not granted any loan. This amounts to saying that at a time only one-third of the number of members of a co-operative society is eligible to take loans and the rest two-thirds if they stand in need are sent to knock at the door of a money lender.

The third defect in the system is with regard to the fees of the audit staff. A sub-Inspector ordinarily gets Rs. 60 a month. It is only for a few days, say six or seven at the most in a year that he is required to audit the accounts of a society; the society is charged at the rate of 10 per cent. of the yearly income and thus the total amount for these few days of work often comes to Rs. 150, or Rs. 200 which is a very large sum as compared with the work done. If the society is charged according to the rate of the sub-Inspectors pay it will have to pay at the most Rs. 20 or 25 and in no case more than this. No such audit fees are charged in the Bombay Presidency. On this point I would suggest that for the audit work the fee charged from a society may be reduced, for this sum which at present is taken away from the societies for no heavy work can be used in some other way for the development of the societies, and for the betterment of the village.

Then Sir, the Union Banks have got no current accounts to enable the the smaller societies to deposit or withdraw money according to their timely needs. If the department is unwilling to allow the Union Banks to open current accounts the credit societies may be allowed to keep deposits with the post offices which are present in almost all the small towns and villages of the province. This would be very helpful for the managing committees of the societies in the performance of their duty. At present whenever there is some money with the society it is required to be deposited for a fixed period in the Union Bank in the headquarters of the circle, and whenever some loan is to be given again it becomes necessary to run to the union bank a distance of five or seven miles in order to get the sum required for the purpose. This is an unnecessary botheration and should be removed by having recourse to the scheme proposed by me.

Then another grave defect is that a loan borrowed from a credit society is required to be paid back within two years. The crops have failed, the prices of the commodities have fallen and on account of these the zamindars are hard pinched by poverty and it has become impossible for them to pay back their debts in such short periods as two years. They cannot afford it and therefore it is of utmost importance that the period for the

[ S. Partap Singh. ]

repayment of these loans should not only be extended but also that in future they should be granted long term loans.

Now, Sir, I turn to the question of land revenue. The honourable member representing Lyallpur requested that as the land revenue was very excessive it should be reduced. In view of the straitened circumstances of the zamindars his request was very reasonable, very pertinent and should be given effect to. There has been no session of this exalted Council in which attention of the Government has not been drawn to the depressing circumstances obtainable in the Jullundur Doab. Sir, in that division the water level has been going down for the last few years and on account of this, people are tremendously suffering from the scarcity of water. Time out of number attention of the Government has been drawn to this deplorable situation and not only this but often such schemes as may help the people in supplying water are also submitted for its consideration but it is with regret that I am constrained to say that the Government has always treated our requests with undue indifference and neglect. These tracts in which at present the calamity of scarcity of water prevails can be rendered help by resorting to the tube-well system of irrigation and for it the Government is welcome to realise *abiana* according to the rates of irrigation by canals. Then Sir, there is another scheme which if given a practical shape will render a good deal of help to these people. This scheme is that dams may be constructed across the river Sutlej and the two streams named Bein Safed and Bein Kali that pass through these tracts. By the construction of these dams the water level of the division will generally rise. It is but reasonable that the Government should give effect to these schemes of relief. The circumstances are such that we would not be able to call it inappropriate or unjustifiable on the part of the zamindars if they are compelled to stop the payment of higher rates that they pay at present for the well irrigated lands, on account of the indifferent attitude of the Government.

Not only is the land revenue excessive but the assessment of the land revenue is not made according to any reasonable principles. I submit a proposal which if acted upon will go a long distance in setting things right and rendering justice to the poor zamindars who have suffered long and awfully under the present system of revenue assessment, Sir. In my humble opinion if land revenue is also assessed on the same principles according to which the assessment of income tax is made then the condition of the zamindars can be bettered and made less intolerable. Sir, no income is assessed on a person whose annual income is less than Rs. 2,000, but on the other hand no such concession is shown to a small proprietor, whose income is no more than a few rupees a year. A man who owns two marlas of land and a man who owns a hundred squares of land are assessed land revenue according to the same rates. In utter disregard of the fact that one's holding is too small and the other's too big, both are made to pay land revenue at the same rate. This is inequitable and if the Government's sense of justice has not become blunt the present defective method of assessment should be changed. Sir, in order to make my point more clear I would like to lay before the House certain facts and figures in connection with the land and the land owners. Sir, those zamindars who own less than 5 acres of land constitute 58.3 per cent. of the total number of land owners in the province and the land thus owned

is 8,815,000, acres. My proposal is that these small proprietors who own this land may be exempted from the payment of the land revenue, for they are too poor and cannot afford to pay it. Then the proportion of those who own more than 5 acres and less than fifty acres constitute 88 per cent. and the total area of their land is 17,325,000 acres. These may be allowed

5 P. M.

to pay land revenue according to the present rates of assessment. Further 3·7 per cent. of the proprietors are such whose holdings consist of more than fifty acres of land. The land thus owned is 7,860,000 acres. In their case I would suggest that they may be charged varying rates of land revenue which may increase in amount according as their holdings increase in area. For example, those who own land between 50 and 100 acres may be made to pay Re. 1-2-0 instead of one rupee which they may be paying at present or their land revenue may be increased by one-eighth and those who own land between 100 and 150 acres may be assessed at the rate of one rupee and four annas instead of a rupee. In brief, my proposal is that the small holders may be exempted from the payment of land revenue altogether and the deficiency that would occur on that account in the total receipts of the land revenue may be made up by charging enhanced rates of assessment from the big landlords. I hope the big land holders would not mind this increase in their rates of assessment, for the small proprietors who usually take land on *batai* from the big owners have to pay land revenue on their own holdings as well as half of the revenue on those that they take on lease. Thus, this small holder pays land revenue on the whole of his holdings whereas the big zamindar pays only on one half, the other half being indirectly paid by his tenant. Thus the sacrifice demanded from the big holder is not great and he should be ready to agree to this new system of assessment in view of the rapid changes in the ideals of his tenants. This is a grave defect in the present method of assessment and it should be removed. If the Government consents, and my proposal is given a practical shape, I think, it would not only help a great deal in ameliorating the conditions of the poor zamindars, but will also place the big holder in a position in which it would be difficult for the critic to accuse the Government of differential treatment.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq** [Amritsar City (Muhammadan)] (Urban): Sir, it is no use criticising the budget when I see that this budget or perhaps the next budget will be the swan's song of the government benches. We are on the threshold of a new constitution, and now to criticise Government for their past misdeeds or future hopes will be futile. I think there is not much time for them to profit by criticism or to make many improvements. So, I will not indulge in hopes which are not going to be realised, because those gentlemen will not be here to carry on the work, and new set of men, perhaps more interested, perhaps less, will come into being. But, certain things we must discuss in this House, and one of them is the economic condition of the province to-day. It is not only a question for the future government, but it is question which must engage the attention even of the present government. There have been floods unprecedented in the history of the Punjab which have spelt disaster to the people living on the river areas. People have suffered great losses; so also the Government because money must come to it from the people. So far we cannot

[Sh. Muhammad Sadiq.]

blame Government as they have done what best they could under the circumstances. But one thing I wish to say. I have been a member of this House for the last 4 or 5 years, and I have been watching whether Government are taking any steps to increase the prosperity of the province, either by starting new industries or by reviving old ones. No scheme has yet come from the fertile brain of Government to relieve the economic depression of this country. The fact is the Government benches are not in touch with the people of this country. (*A voice*: Question). They may question, but I have been watching all their efforts in this direction. I say that the economic position of this province now is worse than ever it was in the history of the Punjab. Indeed, I think it has not been so bad since the beginning of British rule in the Punjab. Hundreds of thousands are without work and many families are without food just now. I am not exaggerating, and I am not in the habit of exaggerating. (*Voices*: No, no.) I am very glad that those benches who should have been scolding me are supporting me now. Whether it is in joke or earnest, whether they believe it or not, I do not care, the fact is that the economic position of the Punjab is very bad, hundreds and thousands are workless and cannot find work even if they want it. In olden days, when such conditions prevailed, they started some scheme of construction such as the construction of Imambara in Lucknow in order to give work to the people, and thousands were supported in that way. Here nothing of the kind has been done. The Government do not bother about it. (*A voice*: Repairing damages.) Yes; but how many people are employed there? They do not take the trouble to see things for themselves. They have not done anything to alleviate the sufferings of the people. I am appealing through you, Sir, to the Government benches and I hope they will hear what I am going to say. I appeal to them to do something just like what is done in England and Australia and to see that workless people are fed somehow or other. (*Interruption*.) This year is a momentous year for our country. Very often we hear people in Parliament speaking about India. I think there will be no harm if with your permission, we speak about England once in a way (*Voices*: No harm) and draw the attention of the higher authorities to the position of this country. People in England must realise our position. For years and years, we have been treated just like scullions in this country, and India, our country, as the kitchen of the Empire. Everything here is made to order from England for England not for the people of the country but for the benefit of the people living outside our country. They may give us reforms and all that, but what is the use? They must realise that India is starving. I think that the "good old days" when India was ruled from England are gone. We are treated like slaves, in our own country just like people in the old times of Pharaohs. People in England, whether of the type of Lord Rothermere or Mr. Lloyd George, or of this party or that party, must realise that India will submit no longer to such treatment. They will not allow interference from England just as England does not want to have interference from India. There must be reciprocity. For hundreds of years we have been their best customers, we have been buying their goods and are their best customers and we have been fighting for them. What is our recompense? We are being exploited still more.



**Mr. President :** This would have been a very appropriate speech on the budget discussion in the Legislative Assembly. But I am doubtful if it equally appropriate in a discussion on the provincial budget.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** It might have been more appropriate in the Legislative Assembly, but I am sure it will not be less appropriate here. (*Laughter.*) What I want, Sir, is that those gentlemen sitting on the treasury benches representing the Crown and the Parliament should convey this message to their masters in England.

**Mr. President :** The honourable members of this House are discussing the budget of the province of the Punjab and the principles involved therein. There are other ways in which that message can be sent through the local Government to the Parliament or His Majesty. But I do not think that this is the proper occasion for to convey such a message.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I withdraw the message. I do not want to send any message; they may not care to read it even. What I say is that the Honourable the Revenue Member, the Finance Member and other officers are here on the authority of Parliament, and we are going to pass, if not their pay, at least their travelling allowances and the pay of their establishment which is a transferred subject. So we can say that we refuse to pass this budget for these reasons. If you will allow me, Sir, probably in this roundabout way I may be within my limits in discussing this suggestion.

Now, Sir, there are millions of people who are willing to co-operate with England if England co-operates with us. We have no quarrel either with England or with Englishmen. We only want our dues, we want to be treated not as slaves but as civilised people. If England is ready to extend her hand of fellowship, I do not think there will be any in India who will not equally do so; India will be equally ready. The responsibility for the present discontent lies on England and the English people alone.

(*After Sh. Muhammad Sadiq had resumed his seat, nobody stood up.*)

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** I did not finish my speech, may I have now a chance of doing so?

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is a learned member of the Bar. Will he please refer me to the rule under which I can permit him to speak a second time.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** I thought in the absence of any other speaker I should offer myself.

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi** (Shahpur West, (Muhammadan), Rural) (Urdu) : Sir, first of all I offer my congratulations to the Honourable Finance Member and his assistants not so much because it has become a practice with the members during the general discussion of the budgets, but because they really deserve our congratulation this year when there was so much deficit in the budget and when; consequently, it was very difficult to prepare the budget in the form in which it has been presented to us. It is very satisfactory to note that the deficit in the budget will be met by raising loans in the market and that no new taxes will be imposed. And if my opinion were asked I will say that there is no scope left for imposing further taxes. Nearly all the sources of income have al-

[K. B. Mian Muhammad Hayat Qureshi.]

ready been taxed to the fullest extent and, therefore, if further taxes were imposed it will be beyond the capacity of the people to bear that additional burden. Under the circumstances we should have expected that a substantial reduction in expenditure would be made, but we are sorry to find that no effort has been made to cut down the expenditure. On the other hand it appears that Government is increasing its liabilities and if the expenditure went on increasing in this way, I fear that it would be very difficult to meet it from the revenues of the province. When Government and its officers rack their brains to find out additional sources of income, they should also try to see how the expenditure can be reduced. But it seems that no serious effort is made to bring down the expenditure and if ever economy is proposed to be effected, attention is concentrated on very small and minor items. For example, instructions have been issued that envelopes that are used in correspondence should not be wasted after once using them, but that the same envelopes should be used again and again. Economy in these small items cannot help to reduce the expenditure substantially. If Government is really anxious to effect economy, it should do so in more important items of expenditure. At present a very large portion of the provincial revenues is being spent on buildings and roads and on other public works. If I may say so, money on these works is spent like water and without any consideration of the fact that this money has been collected from the people who are most of them practically starving. I do not mean to say thereby that these works should not be undertaken or that they are of no utility to the public. What I mean to impress upon the Government is that much more money is spent on these works than it is necessary to spend. For example, in the Sargodha or in the Shahpur district, different departments have sanctioned different rates for the contractors who undertake to complete these works for the Government. In the same place if Public Works (Roads Branch) Department will sanction one rate, the Engineering Department or the Public Works Department or the Railway Department will sanction different rates for works of the same nature. The District Board in that district will allow quite different rates from those sanctioned by other departments. To take a definite example, if Engineering Department will sanction Rs. 5½ or Rs. 6 as rate for earth work, the Public Works Department will sanction Rs. 8 for the same work and in the same place. If the different departments were to consult each other before allowing or sanctioning these rates and sanction uniform rates—and I should say minimum rates—I hope that thousands, nay, lakhs of rupees can be saved. Sir, you will be surprised to learn that the Sanitary Board estimated the Pindi Wahir Water Supply Scheme, which was to benefit the people of my district, to cost Rs. 75,000 and when this question came before the District Board of that district, the District Board estimated that the scheme could be undertaken at a cost of Rs. 24,000. The Sanitary Board did not approve of that estimate and returned the same to the District Board for revision. Thereon, the District Board expressed its readiness to undertake the scheme at a cost of Rs. 39,000.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** On a point of order, Sir. I might point out to the House that it was not a difference in the estimate in the two departments, but the difference was due to the fact that the

Sanitary Department suggested a more expensive kind of pipes which would last much longer than the pipes which were suggested by the District Engineer and later on we brought the two officers together in the Sanitary Board and a compromise was arrived at.

**Mr. President :** Order, order. This is not a point of order, but a speech.

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi (Urdu) :** Quite so. A compromise was arrived at and it was settled that Rs. 39,000 should be sanctioned for the scheme. It means that when the two departments consulted each other a saving of Rs. 18,000 was brought about. Similarly if the other departments are instructed to consult each other when sanctioning an estimate for any public work and ascertain beforehand whether the rates proposed are reasonable or not, I think Government could save lakhs of rupees from the expenditure that it incurs on the Public Works Department alone. I think that is an important matter and deserves the careful attention of the Government and the House. In my opinion it would be much better if a committee were appointed to sift the truth in this matter.

Now I proceed to say a few words with regard to other departments of the Government. I take the Education department first. At present the largest part of the revenues is being spent on this department and it is a department on which largest amount of money should be spent. Whenever any demand for grant relating to this department has been made, the Council has readily agreed to it. But that does not mean that money so sanctioned should be wasted. From the figures in the budget it appears that the grant for Education department has not been spent in the best possible manner. Referring to pages 20-21 of the Explanatory Memorandum, it will appear that expenditure under Education (Transferred) has risen from Rs. 1,02,84,000 in 1924-25 to Rs. 1,66,99,000 in the revised estimates for the current year. The present grant to University is nearly 3½ lakhs or double of what it was in 1924-25. The expenditure on Government Anglo-Vernacular Secondary Schools has risen from 15 to nearly 28 lakhs of rupees while the maintenance grants to local bodies for vernacular education have risen from 39 to about 72 lakhs of rupees. But there has been no corresponding increase in the number of students. From the figures it appears that while the expenditure on the Education department has doubled, the number of students has risen only to one-third of the previous figures. This shows that the provision for the Education department is not being rightly spent. I think that expenditure under this head can be reduced if instead of palatial buildings for schools, ordinary and simple though spacious and clean buildings should be erected for these schools. This will not only bring about saving in the expenditure, but it will have also a very salutary effect on the students. They will learn simple habits and will prove more useful to themselves and to their country. In these days of growing unemployment it is particularly desirable that the students should not form expensive habits.

As regards Medical and Public Health departments I have only this much to say that a large amount of money should be spent to combat the breeding of mosquitoes. They bring havoc particularly in flooded areas. I can quote facts and figures to show that in flooded areas 40 or 50 per cent. of

[ K. B. Mian Muhammad Hayat Qureshi. ]

the children succumb to the attack of malaria. I understand that Government intends to provincialise the dispensaries in charge of district boards and local committees. That is very good because these local bodies will be relieved of a heavy burden of expenditure. But there is one great defect in acting this policy. At present the doctors who are employed in the dispensaries very sympathetically treat the rural people, but when these dispensaries are provincialised and these doctors become Government servants, they will not have to look forward to the representative of the rural population for their promotion and consequently will, in all probability, cease to have any sympathy with the villagers. I hope Government will try to see that this defect is avoided before these dispensaries are provincialised.

I now come to the Agricultural department. Sir, it is one of those departments the very name of which stirs a feeling of happiness in the minds of the zamindars. It was expected to do much for the zamindars, but I am sorry to point out that inspite of heavy expenditure that we have been sanctioning for this department, it has so far only succeeded to supply better seeds to the zamindars. Every year the crops of the zamindars suffer from one disease or other resulting in the loss to the zamindars as well as Government, but the Agriculture department has not been able to find out any remedy to save the crops from the insect-pests. There have been appointed Fruit Specialists and other specialists but no effort has been made to solve the problem to which I have referred above. If the Agriculture department could suggest remedies to save the crops from insect-pests, both the zamindars and Government would stand to over.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is up.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram** [Multan Division (Non-Muhammadan), Rural]. (Urdu) : Sir, I must admit at the very outset that it is not possible for a layman like myself to criticise the various items of this intricate budget one by one. However I cannot but say that the whole system of our administration appears to be the most extravagant in the world. In the first two Councils we tried to reduce the expenditure on some items but our efforts did not meet with any success. The trouble is that when we are face to face with a deficit budget the Government would not accept any reduction in the proposed expenditure on the plea that the estimates presented to the Council were already the lowest possible and, therefore, any further reduction would seriously tell upon the efficiency of the administration, while on the other hand, if it is a surplus budget the members of this Council would not care to check any extravagance on the part of the administration. Last year only one-rupee cuts were moved and the whole time was wasted in futile communal warfare with regard to the representation in the various departments under the Government. This year we are again face to face with a deficit budget and it is necessary to make serious efforts to at least remove the deficit and thus make our income balance with the intended expenditure. But that is not an easy job. If we try to apply the axe to the beneficent departments like agriculture and education we are sure to incur the displeasure of the public while if, on the other hand, it is sought to reduce the ever-increasing expenditure on the police force the Government will at once jump upon us with the independence resolution of the Indian National Congress and declare that it is

absolutely impossible to effect the slightest reduction in the police expenditure at such a critical time. Of course we will try to effect some reduction here and there but surely it is the duty of the Government to see that its expenditure does not exceed the income. It comes to the Council with a deficit budget and then wants us to offer our congratulations on presenting such a budget. That is really asking too much.

As I have already pointed out our administration is run on the most extravagant lines. I do not wish to go into details but I may be allowed to draw the attention of the House to some of the glaring instances in this connection. First of all our Irrigation department is decidedly the most wasteful department in the province. (*Hear, hear.*). For instance, there are lands on either side of the various canals extending over hundreds and thousands of miles which are left uncultivated simply for using their earth for the canal banks, etc. Why not give these lands on temporary cultivation and thus increase your income to a great extent? Even the trees in those lands are not utilized properly and are used by the officers and their staff as fuel. Those of my honourable friends who own lands in the canal colonies must be fully aware of the wastefulness of this department. The timber grown by canal department can also be a source of much income to the Government with very little effort on its part. Some time ago it was decided to hand it over to the Forest Department, but then perhaps the two departments could not agree with each other and thus the proposal was dropped.

Again, take the case of giving lands on temporary cultivation. There are thousands of people willing to cultivate those lands and if they are given to these people, there can be an income of ten to fifteen rupees per acre to the Government. But the Government would not realize the desirability of such a procedure. Thus the real trouble with the Government is that it does not care to tap the various sources of income.

Then there is the Forest department which stands for all expenditure and no income from end to end. Can the Government point out any income that it has ever derived from that department? Then if it is really a case of no income and all expenditure, why not abolish this department? In that case you will save at least the salaries of the officers and the ever-increasing staff. Year after year we have been drawing the attention of the Government to this wasteful department but nothing has so far been done to improve matters.

Now it is said that there has been a great decrease in the proceeds in the Registration department and in the sale of stamps. Sir, the reason for that decrease is nothing else than the recent increase in the registration and stamp fees. At present, the stamp duty for purposes of conveyance is as much as 8 per cent. This means that if some one purchased a house for one lakh of rupees he would have to pay Rs. 8,000 as stamp duty besides the registration fee. That is really monstrous, and that is the reason why people have begun to achieve their purpose by getting a receipt with one anna stamp registered. For instance, a very eminent lawyer of Lahore, Dr. Moti Sagar, purchased a bungalow for Rs. 1,50,000 and got it registered with no more cost than a one-anna stamp. I submit Sir, that if the Government reduces this fee to the original amount, that will surely result in a very appreciable

[ R. B. Lala Sewak Ram. ]

and steady increase in the proceeds in that department. Sir John Maynard had definitely promised to abolish this additional taxation as soon as there was a surplus. I can quote no less than three speeches of his to that effect. But I am sorry to say that although we have had some surplus years too, that promise has not been redeemed yet.

In short the Government never has made any serious efforts to effect economy and to make both ends meet. The expenditure has increased enormously and the present financial condition cannot improve without drastic retrenchment. Ever since I became a member of this Council the expenditure on the Secretariat has been increasing by leaps and bounds and the Government has never tried to reduce it. A committee was once set up by Mr. Abbot and it was hoped that some economy would be effected. But all those hopes were rudely disappointed. We never so much as even saw the report of that committee. The Government always tries to explain away the deficit by pointing out that it had to remit some ten lakhs of rupees by way of land revenue and water-rate owing to the failure of crops caused by floods or droughts. But may I ask whether a sum of mere ten or fifteen lakhs can really affect the budget to such an extent? Moreover, if the officers were really anxious to do some good by the people there could be a voluntary reduction in their salaries. For instance, when there was a serious decrease in the revenue the Financial Commissioner could come to our help and accept reasonable reduction in his salary for the year. The same spirit could be shown by other high officials.

But let us leave that alone and direct our attention to the astounding extent to which the expenditure on the Provincial Services has increased. It is a pity that no step is taken by the Government to check the extravagance prevailing in the various departments by enormous increase of salaries. I do not want to repeat what I have been saying over and over again on the floor of this House, but the enormous increase in the salaries of Extra Assistant Commissioners, Sub-Judges and other members of the Provincial Services of the Punjab deserves a very serious reflection on our part. Once it was suggested—perhaps by our Honourable President when he was an ordinary member of the Council—that the salaries in the Provincial Services should be reduced by 25 per cent. at least. I wish the Government had accorded to this very sound and reasonable suggestion the attention which it deserved. But, unfortunately, we cannot expect our Government to take a wise step of this kind.

Then, where is the Roads and Buildings Branch? I admit that the means of communication are very necessary and highly useful to the zamindars for sending the produce of their lands to the central markets, but there is no need of erecting more and more buildings. The existing buildings are quite sufficient for the present needs, and if some of them are not in proper condition they may be repaired. But there is absolutely no necessity of erecting new buildings. The huge sum of money wasted on them may be utilized to meet other necessary and profitable expenses.

Then I come to the MacLagan College of Engineering which costs the Government so much money.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is over.

At this stage the Council adjourned till 2 P.M. on Friday, the 7th March 1980.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Friday, the 7th March 1930.*

THE Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the chair.

### GENERAL DISCUSSION OF THE BUDGET.

**Lala Gopal Das** (Lahore and Ferozepore-cum-Sheikhupura, (non-Muhammadan), (Rural)): Sir, the Honourable Finance Member has asked us to believe that the financial position of the province at the present moment is very bad and that he could not balance the budget until he had taken two crores of rupees from the Government of India as a loan. He has also told us that we have practically finished our resources and that in case we want to find more money for the beneficent departments we should be prepared for fresh taxation. The picture he has depicted is really very discouraging and if the position is really so, it should give us serious alarm. But the budget figures show that the deficit has been caused by spending money on capital works from the revenue receipts which policy has been in practice in this province for some few years. About two years back I suggested that the capital expenditure should be met from borrowed capital and the money derived from revenues, which will be released if expenditure on capital works is met from borrowed money, can well be spent on medical relief, education and encouragement of industries. In this year's budget I find that the road construction programme has been practically stopped. I think it is in the interest of this province that the construction of arterial roads should continue. I made a suggestion two years ago to the Honourable Finance Member that the programme of road construction should be carried on from borrowed capital (*hear, hear*) which I repeat once again. At that time the Finance Member gave a very sympathetic hearing to my suggestion. But in practice I find that nothing has been done in this direction since then.

I next wish to draw the attention of the Council to the very small sum allotted for industries this year. It is admitted that we have five industrial surveyors in the province so far, and that we are going to add one more this year. In a province like Delhi which is hardly equal to an average district of the Punjab, there is one industrial surveyor employed whole time for that work; whereas here for 29 districts we have only five. These five surveyors cannot possibly do their work properly, and I am sorry to say that they have not yet been in a position even to make an economic survey of a single district in the province. With reference to Delhi the contrast, I must say, is very significant. This is all due to money not being given for the department of industries for the simple reason that the money that is derived from revenue is being spent on capital works which, in my opinion, is absolutely a wrong policy.

[L. Gopal Das.]

I should like to say another thing in connection with industries. We find that the income from jails is Rs. 5,24,000 while the expenditure is Rs. 43,22,000. We are told that the proceeds of articles manufactured in jails bring to Government as much as Rs. 3,63,000. I submit that all these jails should be run on the lines of reformatories. We should try to reclaim the convicts and reform them and not condemn them to a life of crime. If we change our system of jail administration and employ these convicts in productive labour, surely we will earn a little bit more in the jails department and by that means we may make the jail administration a little less expensive.

I should, then, turn to the subject of trade and commerce in the province. The Honourable the Finance Member said that our stamp revenue, court fees and excise revenues are, if not going down, stationary. I may say that the figures under these heads are an index of the prosperity or otherwise of the province, the drop in revenue under these heads clearly shows that we are passing through a period of depression in trade and commerce. This depression is mainly due to the maintenance of the 18 pence ratio of exchange and also to the maintenance of high court fees and stamp duties. We were given a promise, when these stamp duties were enhanced, that they would be reduced whenever we had a surplus in the budget. There have been surplus budgets during some of these years consecutively, but no remission has ever been given to the tax-payer. Not only has the Government committed a breach of faith in not remitting that extra revenue when they had surplus budgets, but they are responsible for the present trade depression. I hope that in the interest of trade and in the interest of the prosperity of the province Government will see its way to relieve the tax-payers of the province of the extra tax at the earliest opportunity. (Cheers).

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** [South-East, Rohtak, non-Muhammadan], (Rural): Sir, I leave the technical aspect of the budget alone and would not indulge in a discussion of figures. I would confine my remarks to some of the topics that have already been touched by certain speakers and introduce one or two others which have not so far been discussed by anybody. Two or three speakers who spoke yesterday suggested that the programme of starting fresh intermediate colleges should be stopped. I am afraid I must express my dissent from that view. The starting of intermediate colleges at the headquarters of districts was a part of the programme of the rural party and the reason why it was adopted as a part of the rural party's programme was that, as far as possible, facilities for education should be provided for rural areas more or less in the same measure as for urban areas, and if the starting of fresh intermediate colleges were to be stopped that part of the programme would *ipso facto* come to an end. These speakers, it seems, have taken an entirely narrow view of the intermediate colleges. They look upon an intermediate college solely as an institution for literary education for which they think there is no more scope. I take another view of it. If any changes or improvements were urged in the scheme of study or in the subjects which are taught in intermediate colleges I have absolutely nothing to say, but if it is suggested that the programme of starting intermediate colleges should



be altogether stopped, I begin to feel alarmed and one reason for my feeling alarmed is that there are certain professional colleges admission to which depends upon certain standards of education. For instance, admission to the Veterinary College is confined mostly to those who have passed the intermediate examination. Similarly, admission to the Lyallpur Agricultural College and the Medical College at Lahore is confined to those who have passed the intermediate examination. If intermediate colleges ceased to be started at the headquarters of districts, it would mean the curtailment of facilities for literary education in rural areas, which it was the object of the zamindar party to provide, so that among other things students from rural areas would pass their intermediate examination, with greater ease, at smaller expense, and enter into colleges where standard for admission has been fixed at an intermediate 'pass'. If for no other reason, then on this ground alone any change in the policy relating to intermediate colleges ought to be denounced.

Then, my friend, Sardar Ujjal Singh, also made certain remarks with regard to the inadequate representation of Sikhs in the Medical department. I do not remember the figures exactly, but I think the representation of zamindars in that department is certainly very low and if any of the vacancies which it is proposed to fill fall to the share of Sikhs, the claim of zamindar Sikhs should not be ignored. I think it would be well to remember that even amongst Sikhs it is the agriculturist who has fared badly in the matter of appointment in this department, and if there are any qualified Sikh candidates of the agricultural stock preference should be given to them. With regard to the Hindu share I would draw the attention of the Honourable Minister to the most miserable position the Hindu zamindars occupy in the Medical Department. Now in the cadre of Civil Assistant Surgeons, the Hindu share is 88 posts. Out of these 88 posts only 9 are held by Hindu agriculturists, roughly speaking 11 per cent. So if there are any appointments going to be made and if there are qualified Hindu agriculturists among the candidates, I should press their claims on the Honourable Minister for sympathetic consideration.

Sardar Ujjal Singh also suggested that some Sikh gentleman should be appointed to the bench of the High Court. Everybody knows that there is no Sikh on the bench of the High Court, and if there is a vacancy, there is no reason why a Sikh should not be appointed. But here again, if a Sikh is to be appointed the appointment should go to a zamindar Sikh. If you just try to analyse the composition of the High Court, you would find that there is not a single zamindar on the Bench and if there is any element which is most conspicuous by its absence of representation, it is the zamindar element. I need not analyse the actual composition in detail. It is a well known fact that the High Court is entirely lacking in the zamindar element. Even out of the European judges, probably not one has spent any part of his life in close association with zamindars. There was a time when officers who had had settlement training which brought them into close touch with zamindars were appointed to the High Court. But now it so happens that even among European judges there is not one who has had any close contact with the zamindars in any part of his career, and, therefore, I submit very strongly that if there is any vacancy which is to be given to a Sikh it should be given to a zamindar Sikh.

**Lala Mukand Lal Puri :** A member of the statutory agricultural tribe?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Certainly.

One speaker also suggested the advisability of having a Retrenchment Committee. I think retrenchment has been long overdue and it would do a lot of good if a strong committee were to be appointed to go into the question of extravagance which does occur, in a smaller or larger measure, in every department. My honourable friend Muhammad Hayat Qureshi gave instances of lack of uniformity in rates and standards which have been adopted by engineers of various sections in one and the same place. I also find that there is unnecessary duplication, triplication and multiplication of engineering agency almost everywhere. In Rohtak district alone, one will find half a dozen engineers, representing Drainage, Public Works, Irrigation, and so on. Is there really any necessity or valid ground for such multiplication of posts which require qualifications of more or less the same nature. Similarly, you will find in other departments that the work which formerly was, and could now be, done by one officer is being done by three different officers and with no better results than when the work was done by one officer.

I would also like to draw the attention of the Home Department to the fact that this Council passed a resolution in favour of certain modifications in the Village Patrol Act. It seems that the Government has done something in the matter and issued certain instructions to their Commissioners to see that the Village Patrol Act is worked in a manner which will not cause any unnecessary hardship to the people. But this is very vague. I think it would have been fairer if a copy of the instructions that have been issued by the Home department to their Commissioners had been laid on the table of the House and made available to the members. After all, this is a subject on which a fair proportion of the members of this House have felt keenly, not once, not twice, but as many as three times. Resolutions have been tabled condemning the operation of the Village Patrol Act. In a matter like this I think a greater degree of confidence ought to have been shown to the members of this House and any secret instructions that may have been issued to the Commissioners may, with advantage, be placed before the members of this Council.

Lastly, I will draw the attention of the Honourable the Finance Member to the question of recruitment in one of the departments under him, that is the Police department. A reference to this department was made by the honourable member, who represents Simla (Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal). His complaint was that so far as recruitment to the police department was concerned, the share of the Hindus was very inadequate. I endorse that part of his complaint. But there is another point which deserves consideration in this connection. The Hindu share goes almost entirely to non-zamindars, and while the share of the Hindus requires to be enlarged I would also like to bring to the notice of the Honourable the Finance Member the fact that here zamindars fare very badly indeed.

**Lala Mukand Lal Puri :** Do you claim your share for Hindu zamindars or for Muslim zamindars?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** I don't like to be interrupted, Sir. When the time of the honourable member comes he may say whatever he likes. Here the share of the Hindu zamindars is very low. Take the case of Assistant Sub-Inspectors, their total strength is 175. Out of this total, 88 posts have gone to Muhammadan agriculturists, 36 to Muhammadan non-agriculturists, 1 to Hindu agriculturists, 23 to Hindu non-agriculturists, 20 to Sikh agriculturists and 7 to Sikh non-agriculturists.

These figures clearly indicate that a very much larger share has gone to the Muhammadans than could be warranted either by their population or by the proportion of their existing representation in the force. A much larger number of posts under this head ought to have gone to Hindus than has actually fallen to their share, and, surprising as it may seem, whatever has fallen to their share has gone almost entirely to non-zamindars. There are 24 Hindu Assistant Sub-Inspectors of whom only one is a zamindar. This is unconscionable injustice. Nobody can pretend that a Hindu zamindar is less fitted for police service than a Hindu non-zamindar.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is over.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Dhanpat Rai (Punjab Industries) :** Sir, the budget which is under discussion is no doubt a disappointing one, and we all deplore with the Honourable the Finance Member the ravages of floods and the havoc of bad weather. But we have to bear in mind that these are things which are not new to us. We have no means at our disposal to escape the ravages of the weather, and the question arises what we should do in order to tide over our difficulties brought about by these catastrophes. I would submit that we should in prosperous years lay by something for these lean years and this can only be done if the Government and the Council co-operate to make retrenchment in their expenses. Although we find it in the speech of the Honourable the Finance Member that so far as possible retrenchments have been made and economies effected, they are not worth the name because our expenditure stands as high or as low as it was last year. The only retrenchment which is possible and which I think neither the Government nor the Council will take in hand is the reduction of the pay of officers from top to bottom. Unless and until that is done there will be no saving and the expenses must rise high and new taxation will have to be proposed. The next thing which we have to consider is this, that our province is pre-eminently an agricultural province and we depend upon agricultural prosperity to a very large extent. So long as we allow this province to remain agricultural, we have to put up with the catastrophes due to the weather. In order to find occupation for the unemployed and to make out other sources of taxation we should encourage industries. So far, we have not taken seriously to the development of industries at all. Nothing in this province up to this time has been done for the encouragement of industries. If we look to our present budget, we will see that a sum of Rs. 55,000 has been set apart for the development of industries in the province both out of revenue receipts and capital expenditure. With this niggardly sum, can you ever expect that anything could be done for encouraging the industries? Unless we take a bold step and unless the Government is convinced that we can encourage industries and start new ones in the province nothing can be done to improve the situation. As I have said, unless and until the Government takes up the

[R. B. L. Dhanpat Rai.]

question seriously nothing can be done for the development of industries. If Government can raise crores and crores of rupees for irrigation and railways, can it not raise a crore of rupees for this province to start industries and lay the foundation for industrial progress? On the other hand, in this budget as well as in the previous one, only Rs. 55,000 has been set apart for this purpose. It is a matter of great shame for the province that we cannot even turn out the framework of a bicycle or of an umbrella. But if we raise a loan of a crore of rupees, with the co-operation of the people we could start a foundry workshop which will turn out several marketable commodities of daily use and which could be sold at a profit in the bazar. It will be a source of income not only to the Government but it will be a source of employment for the people who are now out of employment. So far as the question of co-operation of the Government with the people is concerned, last year the result of the deliberations of the Joint Development Board was that a sugar factory should be started in Sonapur in the district of Karnal and the Government came forward to its help saying that they would subscribe one-fifth of the capital which was required for the mill—the mill itself costs Rs. 10 lakhs—but their offer of one-fifth was hedged with restrictions which were very onerous to be complied with. The Government wanted not only that they should be treated equally with the other shareholders of the company, but they wanted preference. They wanted that 6 per cent. of profits should be paid to them first and if the other shareholders should get more than 6 per cent., then they should also be allowed more than 6 per cent. In the case of other companies I have seen that if there are preference shareholders they are content with a certain amount of percentage of dividends, say 5, 6 or 7, whatever is fixed to begin with. But in this instance, the Government would not rest content with the preference dividend. They required that they should not only get this percentage but that if the other shareholders were lucky enough to get more than 6 per cent., the Government should also get that over and above this percentage. What has been the result of that? Far from helping the company it has retarded its progress, because when you go to the shareholders, they ask why Government should be getting a preference share out of the dividends and say that they would not be able to get anything after the Government is paid. That is the attitude which Government has taken in the matter. As I have said, if you develop the industries, you will be solving the question of unemployment as well because that will give employment not only to the thousands of illiterate persons but to a good many literate persons as well. From the reports of the Honourable Education Minister we find that there has been a decrease in the number of scholars and particularly in the number of scholars belonging to a community against whom practically the doors of employment are being shut every day. This is but a necessary consequence. If you cannot find employment for the people why should they go on being educated? If the University is turning out thousands of matriculates and hundreds of graduates every year and they do not find employment, that will lead to discontent and much of the political discontent is due to this unemployment question. If that is solved by starting industries and encouraging them, you will not only be benefiting Government with additional sources of taxation but give employment and decrease the unrest that exists in the country.

at present. Along with this question we have to consider the question of financing of the industries, trade and commerce of this province. There are three agencies in this province for the purpose. One is the co-operative societies which are said to be helping agriculture, the second is joint stock banks and the third, the indigenous bankers. So far as co-operative societies are concerned we are giving them liberal assistance in every shape and form. We are giving them not only monetary help but also the advice of our officers and they have got the sympathies of the Government also. So far as the joint stock banks are concerned, the attitude of the Government, if not apathetic to them, is one of indifference. They enjoy neither the confidence nor the patronage of the Government and Government does not help them in any way. The heart of the Government never goes out to them; not only of Government but even of self-governing corporations like municipalities and district boards. Although these corporations are allowed to deposit their money with the co-operative banks and co-operative societies and with the Imperial Bank, they are not allowed to deposit with the joint stock banks. That is a question which has seriously to be considered. If you want to advance banking and if you want to help them, then you should encourage sound Indian banks. But, as I have said, the attitude of the Government is apathetic towards them. As an example I may cite one instance. When this Government floated loans, two Indian joint stock banks, subscribed as much as 80 lakhs of rupees and the loan was closed in one day and it was a great success. The interest on these bonds was made payable only in Punjab. Why? In order to make the Punjab Government loans very popular. The interest should have been made payable at port towns like Bombay or Calcutta also. On behalf of the Punjab National Bank I wrote a letter to the Financial Secretary requesting him to make the interest on these bonds payable at the branches of the Imperial Bank at Calcutta or Bombay. The Imperial Bank is the agent of the Government and it does not cost anything to the Government if that were done, but the reply which I got was that that could not be done as it was one of the terms laid down by the Government of India that the interest should not be so payable. I am unable to understand the reason. If our Government had asked the Government of India to comply with our request and they had refused it, that was quite a different thing, but no such thing was done. When the United Provinces Government floated a loan the interest on their bonds was made payable at Calcutta and Bombay also, but so far as the Punjab is concerned, the interest on their loans can only be made payable at Lahore. These are small matters but they go to show that Government does not at all want to help the joint stock banks in the province. As regards the third agency, the indigenous bankers, obstacles always are thrown in their way and no help is given to them, by and by they are being thrown out of the profession. Under these circumstances I would ask the Government to co-operate with the people and start new industries and encourage the existing ones. Practically speaking there is no industry in the Punjab now except ginning, but if the Government helps we can have dozens of new industries which can prosper in this province. (Cheers).

**Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal** (Lahore City, Muhammadan, Urban): I should like to offer a few general observations on the financial position of

[Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal.]

the province as revealed in this budget. In his very clear and lucid explanatory memorandum Mr. Penny has given the present position in a nutshell. On page 13 he says :—

“Even after these special efforts at economy revenue receipts stand at 10·95 lakhs and expenditure at 11·22 lakhs with no provision for a transfer to the Revenue Reserve Fund, and there will thus be a deficit on the year of 27 lakhs. The only consolation is that provision has been made for expenditure of 28 lakhs on special flood repairs, and if this is excluded from consideration as abnormal and non-recurring, the budget just balances.”

Now, I am afraid the consolation given by Mr. Penny does not prove of much consequence in view of what he himself says at page 16 :—

“A glance at the first graph prefixed to this memorandum will show that the year 1930-31 will be the third in succession to show an excess of expenditure over receipts in the revenue account. It is true that fortune has been singularly unkind in the last two years and that the deficits in both are capable of convincing explanation. But the hard fact remains that if the series since 1921 is taken as a whole, good years and bad years balance, and that the financial system must be adapted to fluctuations which nature herself prescribes. If the decade has been marked by unprecedented floods in the Jumna in 1924 and in the Indus and Jhelum in 1929, by failure of the rabi harvest in 1921, by a strange disaster to the wheat crop in 1928, and by cotton disease in 1926, there have been compensating gains in the reassessments of land revenue that fortunately fell due in the first five years, in the good harvests from 1921 to 1926 and above all in the complete remission of provincial contributions to the Central Government. The continued extension of canal irrigation has made the prosperity of the province and its revenues more and more secure, and added to the resources from which progress in future must be financed. Regarded in the light of the experience of the past nine years, the budget of the year 1930-31 has a special significance.”

This is the part of the paragraph to which I will draw your special attention.

“The deficit in the revenue account may be attributed to the completion of flood repairs, but what is of far greater importance is the fact that even if the cost of flood repairs is excluded, the budget has been balanced only with difficulty and by jettisoning a number of works that had already received the approval of the Legislature and, but for unforeseen delays or the need for economy, would already have been under construction.”

Mr. Penny then discusses the causes of the present financial position and is driven to what he calls a somewhat melancholy conclusion that the present state of things is not a passing phase but has come to stay. He says : “The inevitable but somewhat melancholy conclusion to be drawn from an examination of the budget for 1930-31 is that it represents not a passing phase which can be attributed to seasonal misfortunes or flood calamities but a state of things that is likely to continue”. Now, Sir, we know that the province is already in debt. The problem of unemployment is becoming more and more acute every day. Trade is at a low ebb. You can easily imagine what the financial future of the province is likely to be. I am inclined to think that the present position is not so much due to stationary revenues as to the present system of administration which necessitates high salaries in the matter of which the people of this province have no say. There are to my mind only three alternatives open to the people of this province—either have the present system with all its ugly daughters, such as deficit budgets, communal bickerings, starving millions, debt and unemployment, or do away with the present system root and branch, or retain the form of the present system and secure the power to pay less for it. There is no other alternative. This system must come to an end if you want to

live a comfortable life. We spend more than any other country in the world on the present system of administration. There is no other country which spends so much on the administration. (*Mr. H. Calvert: Question.*) The honourable member may reply me when his turn comes. My belief is that we pay much more than our revenues justify. So far as expenditure in regard to which we have some say is concerned, I support the proposition that a retrenchment committee ought to be appointed so that we may be able to see whether any further reductions are possible.

I now proceed to offer a few remarks on industry and education. We spend practically nothing on industry. As I have said before and as many other speakers have pointed out, industrial development alone can save us from the curse of unemployment. (*Hear, hear.*) There is a good future for weaving industry, and for shoe-making industry in this province, and if we encourage these industries, I think we shall be able to save the province from unemployment, provided we protect those industries against Cawnpore and Ahmedabad.

Again we have spent a good deal of money on education and with what result? The report on the progress of education in this province shows that there has been a fall of 27,000 students and about 1,000 schools. The cause of this fall as mentioned in the report is lack of propaganda work on the part of school inspectors. I do not agree that is the real cause. The real cause for this phenomenon ought to be sought elsewhere. I have a copy before me of the facts and figures relating to the work of the Education Minister during the last three years. Unfortunately, I cannot go through all these figures within the fixed time limit, I would draw your attention only to the special grants to unaided schools during 1928-29. You will see that the total number of schools to which grants have been made is 21. Out of this there are 18 Hindu institutions, 6 Sikh institutions and 2 Muslim institutions. The grant that goes to the Hindu institutions is Rs. 16,973, to Sikh institutions, Rs. 8,908 and to Muslim institutions Rs. 2,200. The cause therefore of this remarkable phenomenon must be sought in the way in which money on education is spent.

**Mr. J. D. Penny** (Finance Secretary): Sir, the diversity of opinions that were expressed in the general discussion on the budget puts a representative of the Finance Department in a rather awkward position. First he has to acknowledge the nice things many honourable members have said about the labours of the department in preparing the budget which is now being discussed; then he has to protect himself against the various missiles that have been thrown at him. The words of appreciation that honourable members have been kind enough to give to the Finance Department are particularly gratifying because this year's budget has been an especially difficult one to prepare, partly owing to the loss in revenue in the current year and partly owing to changes which have constantly had to be made in the figures and which had a very great effect upon estimates of next year. I will merely say that all working under the Finance Member and myself had worked hard and have also had to ask for and have received more than the usual help and assistance from other departments.

In dealing with the criticisms that have been levelled at the budget, I fear I am in the position of the incompetent performer at a concert who



[Mr. J. D. Penny.]

has to be protected from the fury of the audience by a notice saying 'Don't throw things at the pianist: he is doing his best'. We have done our best in compiling this budget and putting it in an intelligible form, and nobody regrets more than we do ourselves that the result is one which cannot command universal approval. A large number of the criticisms related to points of detail in which it is hardly worth while to enter. I can only say that I hope that the time limit imposed on speeches is a sufficient excuse for my asking you to assume that if I do not deal with any point it is not because I cannot answer it but because I haven't time. In dealing with the revenue section of the accounts, I notice that honourable members have generally accepted what I have given in my memorandum and taken it to represent the position as it is to-day. I do not propose therefore to deal with it at any great length. I should like, however, in passing, to answer one question that was put by one honourable member who noticed that expenditure under 'Irrigation—Working Expenses' is shown as a deduct entry on the receipt side of the account and he asked why this should be done. Well, in a matter of this sort, the local Government have not got an entirely free choice, because the form of our account is prescribed by the Auditor-General and the Secretary of State and we have to conform to the rules laid down by them. In this particular matter, the local Government did recently ask the Auditor-General to reconsider the rule which obliges us to show working expenses as a deduct entry on the receipt side. We pointed out various drawbacks to

3 P. M.

this procedure and suggested that it might be more consonant with the line that was taken under other heads if this expenditure were shown on the expenditure side and then the gross income would appear on the receipt side. The matter is still under consideration. I must however draw the attention of the House to the fact that there is one advantage in the present procedure and that is, that it emphasises the fact that the improvement is not under the gross income from Irrigation but from the net income after deducting your working expenses. That is the thing which really matters. If we look only at the gross income we might be lulled into a sense of security by noticing that it shows a steady increase, whereas it might be counterbalanced by a still greater increase in the cost of running our canals. For instance, the measures recently taken to combat water-logging are a case in point. They have got a considerable effect upon the net yield that will accrue, and if we find that the net yield is going down, it will be a reasonable ground for considering the question of raising the water rates. If you have to spend more on running your canals it naturally affects the question of the price at which water can be sold. Now, I am glad that this question has been raised in this debate because it is responsible for the form in which our present difficulties, in so far as they are due to the damage caused by the floods, appear in the budget. Several members have noticed that emphasis has been laid in my memorandum on the fact that receipts next year show a fall of Rs. 55 lakhs. This is very largely due to the fact that the rise in working expenses of canals appears as a deduct entry on this side of the account. You may say that Rs. 25 lakhs may be attributed to this cause so that if it were to appear on the expenditure side the loss of revenue would be reduced to Rs. 30 lakhs. I have also mentioned that another 8 lakhs



is really a matter of accounts procedure in that it represents the way in which certain adjustments are made in the jail accounts, so the actual loss of revenue is something between 20 and 25 lakhs. Now, the moral to be drawn, I think, from the figures of the budget as presented is this—that a comparatively small loss of revenue can cause us very great inconvenience. In fact it emphasises what we knew before that our revenues are extremely inelastic. I am sorry therefore that honourable members in this discussion have laid less emphasis on the matter of safeguarding our revenue than on the question of reducing the expenditure. It is quite true that reduction in expenditure is an extremely important thing and the Finance Department is only too glad to receive any suggestion to this end. But the improvement that can be effected in this way is comparatively small. The honourable members who suggested retrenchment are apt, when a particular question comes up in which they are interested, to adopt a very different tone. When they demand retrenchment generally they “roar like lions”. When an attractive item of expenditure comes up they “coo like any sucking dove”. For instance, we hear suggestions that the whole of the Forest department be swept away. We have one honourable member who suggested that the Buildings and Roads branch can go, at any rate as far as Buildings are concerned, and yet, I think I remember the same honourable member suggesting an increase in the pay of tahsildars and another honourable member suggesting raising the pay of everybody under Rs. 50 a month. The honourable member who suggests doing away with the Forest department, I think, himself suggested that it is most important to build a new jail or two and to substitute ghee for oil in the diet of prisoners. Now, all these reforms may be desirable but they are inconsistent with any very urgent need for retrenchment.

As time is short I will now pass on to the capital account where I notice a number of honourable members have been under a misapprehension as regards the policy of Government. I should like to tell them that there has been no change in the policy of Government and the line that is being followed in the present budget is exactly the same as has been followed in several years past. The criticism with which I am mainly concerned is that capital expenditure has been met from revenue. Now I listened and tried to find out what has given rise to this misconception but none of the honourable members has quoted the actual figures. The real fact of course is that capital expenditure is not being met from revenue in the true sense of the term at all, but in so far as it is not met from loans it is being met from Extraordinary Receipts which represent the value of land sold. The whole point of this *pro forma* account, which occupies a considerable space in the memorandum on the budget, is to show in what way these extraordinary receipts are being spent, and there you will find that I have struck a balance in each year to show whether extraordinary receipts exceed or fall short of capital expenditure not covered by loans, and the object from year to year is to try and make these extraordinary receipts just fill the gap between loans and capital expenditure over and above the loans. If honourable members have been misled by any entries in the budget I should be only too glad if they will draw my attention to them. I think I shall have no difficulty in explaining to them that capital expenditure, the figures of which have misguided them, has been met entirely from extraordinary receipts.

[Mr. J. D. Penny.]

There is one more point relating to the capital account which needs a passing mention and that is, the question of the interest paid on Punjab bonds. When Punjab bonds were issued sometime ago, the original idea was to try and raise the loan at Lahore, but no facilities for this existed. There is no money market in Lahore and for practical purposes it was necessary to go to Calcutta and utilize the services of the Government of India in floating our loan there. It is necessary, before a provincial Government floats a loan, to procure the assent of the Government of India for the purpose, for it is necessary that some control should be exercised by the central Government before a provincial Government can be allowed to go into the money market and compete against each other for loans. The assent of the Government of India was obtained on the condition that the terms of the provincial loan should not be such as would compete with other demands being made on the money market, and one of these conditions was that interest on the loan should be payable in the Punjab only. Now, however much we may sympathise with the joint stock banks who have large holdings of the Punjab bonds and who would like to draw the interest at Calcutta or Bombay, it is much more important that the local Government should stand by, and not attempt to alter, the terms on which the loans were originally floated. I hope the honourable members will see that this is so, and if some small inconvenience has been caused in having to receive interest in Punjab instead of Calcutta or Bombay I think he will agree that it is not unreasonable.

One honourable member mentioned the revenue reserve fund and was disappointed to find that certain withdrawals have been made from it. He was not quite able to explain what happened but he suspected that the money so withdrawn must have been diverted to some nefarious object. This honourable member rather reminds me of a friend who recently asked me if I could answer a budget riddle. I said there are many budget riddles and asked to which he referred. He said "Where is the Penny Stowed?" The honourable member apparently is still groping for an answer to that question. He thinks because money is no longer in the revenue reserve fund, therefore it must have been devoted to some purpose other than that to which the Council would have liked to devote it. Now, money that is withdrawn from the revenue reserve fund is taken across to revenue account and is only expended on purposes for which the Council voted it. It is simply intended to make good a gap caused by shortage in current revenue and therefore, it is simply devoted to the programme of expenditure of which the Council has already approved. I hope the honourable member who himself is a member of the Public Accounts Committee will realise that with the help of audit we do see that the money which is voted by the Council is devoted for the purpose for which the Council votes it. (Cheers).

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is up.

**Lala Mukand Lal Puri** [Lahore City (Non-Muhammadan), (Urban)]: Sir, the Honourable Finance Secretary has pointed out that the complaint of certain honourable members of this House that in the budget of this province expenditure on capital is being charged to revenue is incorrect. I want to draw the attention of the House to page 15 of the budget where the total amount of capital which has been charged to current revenue for the

past several years is given, and I find that during the last 4 or 5 years about 5 crores of capital outlay has been charged to current expenditure. I should be glad to know if the Honourable Finance Secretary can give an assurance that this entire capital outlay has been the proceeds of the extraordinary receipts which he finds are a source of revenue. As far as the present year is concerned, no doubt the amount of capital expenditure which has been charged to revenue is about Rs. 28,72,000. But to this loss should be added the amount which the Government has spent on the reconstruction of capital undertakings which have been destroyed by floods. No businessman charges the amount spent on the destruction of his capital to current expenditure. Therefore, this amount should also be added to the capital outlay which is shown in the budget. With respect to the commercial departments we find that the practice of the Punjab Government is to give the net profits, i.e., profits after deducting the working expenses. Now it rests with the Finance Department to show the working expenses as much as they like and the practice seems to have been that they debit not only the repairs but also the amount spent on reconstruction of productive capital outlay. The Honourable Finance Member pointed out in his opening speech that the revenues are stationary, but they will continue to be stationary if with respect to your commercial departments you go on increasing the working expenses by debiting your capital outlay to your current revenue. This has been done also this year. I am glad to find that it is regarded now as an accepted canon of Punjab Finance that capital outlay, at any rate so I understood the Financial Secretary to say, that capital outlay should be met from the extraordinary receipts and public loans. If this is so, I have no complaint to make (*A voice*: Yes, it is so.) Then I would suggest that in order to find more money for the increasing capital expenditure in this province the item of income in the extraordinary receipts should be increased. I remember very well the argument which was advanced in a speech on one of the resolutions by the Financial Commissioner, Mr. Calvert, that what belongs to the State should not be given out in doles to individuals but should be conserved for the benefit of the State, and I remember reading also in one of the budget speeches of the Honourable Sir John Maynard in which he said that the Crown lands should not be given out to individuals. He said that they are a very good source of revenue for the State and should be sold and the money derived from the sale of Crown lands should be devoted to capital expenditure. I hope, Sir, that this Government will for ever give up the policy of giving grants of land to individuals and thus deprive the whole body of taxpayers and the whole body of inhabitants of this province of what belongs to them. This is a very important source of revenue and I shall be very glad if the Government definitely accepts the principle that they will not in future give to the favoured few what belongs to the State. I submit, Sir, that this is one of the methods by which our revenue can be increased and I hope that the Honourable the Finance Member whenever there is a proposal of giving a grant of land, will reject that proposal and will realise the best market value by selling it by public auction.

Another point to which I wish to draw attention of the Government and which has been mentioned by almost every speaker in this House is the lamentable lack of interest shown by the Industries Department in the

[L. Mukand Lal, Puri.]

development of industries. From every corner of this House, from the rural benches, from the Nationalist Party, from the Sikh benches and from the members on this side of the House, a complaint has been made that Government is not doing its duty towards developing the industries of this province. This complaint is repeated from year to year and yet nothing seems to have been done. What is the use of opening new intermediate colleges in rural areas? Why not establish industrial schools and colleges instead, and why not spend money on spreading industrial education in the province if not in any other way at least by establishing a technological institute like the one the United Provinces Government have opened at Cawnpore? My submission is this, that if the Punjab Government were to spend a fraction of what it does spend on capital undertaking on industries in this province, it will not result in less beneficial results than the good irrigation schemes of which the Punjab is justly proud. After all, there is no difficulty about finding the money. Money for big undertakings is always to be found by borrowed capital and if one looks at the budget one will find large sums that have been borrowed for such undertakings, and a little more addition will not make any very serious difference. Therefore, I hope that Government, if it really wants to provide means of revenue for the agricultural population of this country or to find means of employment for the educated middle class, the only possible solution is to devote a little more attention to the industrial development of this province.

The only other point to which I want to refer is the increased taxation on stamps and court fees. It was pointed out by Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram yesterday that this increased taxation is defeating the very object which the legislators had in view. The stamp duty is so prohibitive that people instead of having the luxury of having a title deed are content with getting possession of the property with only a receipt on which is affixed an anna stamp. Therefore, this increased taxation on the transfer of urban property is defeating the very object which Government had in view, and I would not be at all surprised if enquiry on this point proved that the decrease in the income under this head was due to some extent to that cause. But very particularly, I want to draw the attention of this House to the increase in court fees. In the United Provinces they charge  $7\frac{1}{2}$  per cent., but in this province the court fee is  $11\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. If a man brings a suit for Rs. 600 and the suit goes to the High Court, then by the time it has been through the three stages, the Sub-Judge's court, the District Judge's court and the High Court, by the time the litigation is finished, the successful litigant has spent the entire amount, while the unsuccessful litigant has in addition to the amount decreed against him, made himself responsible also for an equal amount in costs,  $11\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. in court fee, 5 per cent. lawyers' fee, a certain amount of process fee, a certain amount on stamps on every application which has to be put in, and a payment for price of every paper that has been put in, diet money and travelling expenses of witnesses, etc., etc. This is the official expense which the litigant has to bear, so that a person has to pay all that and then take the possible chance of recovering his money by execution. There will be some justification in charging such prohibitive rate of court fee if justice were an expensive thing, but if you look at the income from the administration (or sale) of justice you will see

that Government makes a profit of 23 lakhs. Every taxpayer is supposed to pay a certain amount of taxes whether he is a land-holder or whether he is an income-tax payer. In order to enable Government to perform its primary duties of maintaining law and order in this country one would expect that Government would not ask these people to pay further for administration of justice. But if Government after charging other taxes still wants to tax justice pure and simple, is there any justification for taxing justice at such a high rate as 11½ per cent? Should it not revert to 7½ per cent., the rate which existed before the new taxation came into force and the rate which prevails in the neighbouring province across the Jumna? I draw the attention of the House to this great injustice which exists in this province.

In conclusion, I will just mention one or two things. I will draw the attention of the Honourable Ministers to the Lahore Medical College and the Lahore Veterinary College. Sometimes, things which are before our very eyes do not attract our attention, and I find there is no system of proper inspection, and the money which is being spent on these institutions is not properly spent. With respect to the Medical College, every dispensary in this province, I take it, is visited and inspected by the Civil Surgeon who sends to the headquarters a complete inspection report. Similarly, I take it that district dispensaries are inspected by the Inspector-General. I do not know if any committee of inspection ever inspects the Medical College. The facilities for medical relief in the great hospital attached to the Medical College are not available to the public in certain parts of the year. I understand in the vacation certain wards are closed because professors go on leave. I do not grudge the professors their leave, but there is no reason why those wards should be closed down, and if the professors have to go on leave why an additional staff is not provided. If that cannot be provided why are not honorary physicians and honorary surgeons appointed? There is Sir Ganga Ram Hospital run by honorary physicians and surgeons, and in all countries Government maintain hospitals where physicians and surgeons are allowed to assist in the administration of hospital on honorary basis. I understand there was a time when Rai Bahadur Dr. Beli Ram and Dr. Hira Lal were appointed honorary physician and surgeon, but for some reason that practice has been given up.

Similarly with respect to the Veterinary College. It appears questions were put by Lala Bodh Raj to which an answer was given, and it was expected that the Honourable Minister will look into the working of the Veterinary College and into the manner in which things were being administered in an institution which is not far from here.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** [South-East Towns, Muhammadan, Urban] (Urdu): Sir, I do not think I need go into figures in detail. They are indeed a very complicated thing. I will, however, draw the attention of the House and the Government to a very simple and easily intelligible matter. It is more than clear from the budget that during the last five years beginning from 1925-26 and ending with 1929-30, the revenues of the province have remained stationary. There has been no marked increase in them. Further, it can be safely and very reasonably said that our revenues will remain stationary for many years to come. Nearly all the schemes for extension have been completed. The Nili Bar, which was considered to

[Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.]

be the biggest source of income, has since been colonised. Of the Hydro-Electric scheme, which is compared to a white elephant and which has cost us huge sums of money, we are not sure whether it will ever come to fruition, and, if it is at all completed, we are not sure whether it will bring any prosperity to the budget or, for the matter of that, to the province. The Bhakra Dam scheme and the Haveli project cannot be undertaken for at least another ten years. The extraordinary receipts from the sale of lands have been and are being utilised for capital expenditure. These receipts cannot be made use of to relieve the financial stringency and to meet the ordinary and current expenditure. In short, there is no source of income left which we can tax to increase the revenues at once. So much about the receipts of the province.

Now as regards expenditure, it has increased by about one crore of rupees during these five years in which there has been no increase in the revenues. Not only that. This expenditure is rapidly increasing with the increase in pensions and pay of the Government servants. Under the circumstances one is justified in asking as to how this increasing expenditure is going to be met. From the Memorandum which places before us the financial position of the province in a very clear and lucid manner, it appears that during the last few years the expenditure on the nation-building departments such as Education, Medical, Agriculture and Co-operative Societies, has very much increased as it ought to have increased. Some part of the revenues has also been spent on the department of Industries, but I have not mentioned it because I think that it has not so far received that attention of the Government which it deserved. Now, this expenditure on the beneficent departments will go on increasing if our province is to keep pace with the advanced countries of the world. For example, more money will be required and will have to be spent to meet the demands of the rural population not only as regard primary education, but facilities for secondary education will also have to be provided. At present the students from the villages waste two precious years of their lives to go through the junior and senior special courses simply because there are few Anglo-vernacular middle or high schools in rural areas. If the Council and the Government are really anxious and if it is their sincere desire that the rural population should not lag behind the urban population, it is essential that at least Anglo-vernacular middle schools should be opened in large numbers in rural areas. Now this and such other expenditure will have to be incurred irrespective of the fact that the province is faced with financial stringency or not, and the Council and the Government should be prepared for it. But again, the same question—and perhaps in a more serious form—arises, and that is, whence this expenditure is to be met. I have already shown that we have long ago exhausted all the sources of income. For the present we see no means by which we can supplement our income. Under the circumstances there is no other course left open to us except to reduce the expenditure. Now, it may be asked how it is possible to reduce the expenditure without affecting the efficiency of the administration and which items of expenditure can be safely reduced or cut down. To my mind, if we were to direct our attention to the head "General administration" we will find that there is great scope for reducing the expenditure under this head. Out of 30·6 per cent. of the total expenditure spent on General Administration one-third is spent on Police and Jails. About 11 per cent. of the revenues

are being spent on the Police department alone. The reasons why such a large portion of the revenues is being spent, nay, wasted, on the maintenance of police force and jails is that Government is very insistent on sticking to a policy to which a large majority of the public is opposed. At this time a sort of war is going on between the rulers and the ruled. To suppress the agitation against their policy Government has to maintain a large police force, jails and a Criminal Investigation Department. This undoubtedly involves a huge expenditure. If the Government could be prevailed upon to revise that policy, I am sure not very large police force will be required to maintain law and order, not many jails will have to be maintained and the Criminal Investigation Department can be abolished, resulting in a large saving in the expenditure. Times are fast changing, and it is high time that Government should change its policy. That is one way in which economy can be effected.

The other method which can be usefully adopted to effect economy in expenditure is to revise the pay of the Government servants getting more than Rs. 60 per mensem with a view to reducing them. (*A voice*: Not Rs. 60, but Rs. 200). It will be recalled that the pay of Government servants was revised soon after the Great War when the prices of foodstuffs had abnormally gone up and when, in consequence, the Government employees were clamouring that they could not make their both ends meet with the salaries that they were then getting. The scales of their salaries were consequently revised. I do not exactly remember the figure by which the liabilities of the Government increased on account of that revision, but it was Sir John Maynard who, in one of his speeches, said that Government had to incur an added expenditure to the amount exceeding one crore of rupees on that account. Now, the same high prices do not obtain in the market. They have practically come down to the pre-war level. It is now in the fitness of things that these salaries should be revised again with a view to reducing them. As is clear from the explanatory Memorandum a sum of Rs. 55.21 lakhs is being provided for pensions alone which means that expenditure under this item has increased by 21 lakhs of rupees. The increments in salaries which are due to Government employees after every year will go to increase still more the expenditure on salaries. It is, therefore, necessary that the salaries of the Government servants should be revised as suggested. After the Reforms the income of the Government has increased by about seventy five lakhs, which accrued to it on account of increased taxation. Besides the Government of India remitted 1,76 lakhs of rupees which that the Punjab Government used to pay as provincial contribution. This means the income of the Government has increased by about Rs. 2½ crores after 1923-24. But the wonder of all wonders is that all this income has been absorbed. The budget of the last year was practically a deficit budget, and of the year 1930-31 is admittedly a deficit budget. The financial position of the province is going from bad to worse, and is causing great anxiety to all well-wishers of the province and its people. The Finance Department should carefully look into the matter to remove that anxiety from the minds of the public. There is, of course, one way in which the income of the province can be increased, and that is to encourage industries in the province. Government should advance loans to the people to enable them to start new industries, and if possible, it should initiate some industries on its own account. We should



[Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.]

not now depend mainly on the income from lands. On account of the intensive cultivation of the lands, their productivity has very much decreased, and zamindars now get little profit from their lands. Most of these zamindars are now in debt, and one of the reasons of their indebtedness is that their lands have ceased to be profitable. I, therefore, hope that industries will in future receive greater attention on the part of the Government. While impressing upon the Government the necessity of opening secondary schools in rural areas I forgot to mention one thing. In these days of growing struggle for existence it is necessary that every section of the population should be equipped with equal qualifications to be able to compete with others, and for this reason the policy of opening intermediate colleges should not be abandoned. On the other hand, as many intermediate colleges should be opened in the mufassal as possible. Some honourable members are of the view that we are wasting money over these intermediate colleges. I differ from them in this respect. The well-being and the welfare of the country as a whole depends upon the welfare of the rural population, and to remove dissatisfaction from amongst the rural population it is necessary that at least the same facilities for higher education should be made available to them as are available to the urban population.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is up.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** (Minister for Education) : Sir, I rise to address a few words on the two departments of Industries and Education that are my particular concern. Firstly, with regard to Industries I appreciate the desire expressed in every part of this House as regards the desirability of expanding our industries and establishing in this province that full measure of balanced economy resting on agriculture and industry without which no great economic prosperity can be achieved by any people. I realise in full, I have been taught to realise this, that a province or a people that depends solely or very largely on agriculture can enjoy only a very limited prosperity. But the question is as to the method which it is possible to adopt and the scope that we have for the advancement of our industries. It has been said that Government has been lamentably neglectful of what it ought to be doing in the matter of industries. It has also been said that Government ought to assist developing old industries and starting new ones. On a former occasion I had an opportunity of pointing out what exactly the Government has been able to do in the matter of helping the industries of this province, and I shall refer to that again. But before I do so, I should like the House to remember in full the serious limitations under which Governments can properly and with any effect work in making any effort to help industries as such. The possibility of state help in this regard is apt to be much exaggerated. We have, thanks to the energy of the Honourable Minister for Agriculture, established in this province what is called the Joint Development Board. He has collected round the table of this Board all the leading industrialists of this province. We have frequent meetings of this Board, and every effort is made to ask these persons, individually and in concert, to place before Government practical suggestions as to what possibly Government itself could undertake. And I am here in a position to say that so far as anything has ever been definitely suggested, Government has not been slow to act on it. Now, in



so far as industries themselves are concerned during the last two or three years Government has assisted in the Punjab in the establishment of a paper mill, probably one of the largest that exists in India. Government has given assistance in the establishment of a sugar factory in the south-east of this province. We have helped recently the establishment of an oil mill in Lyallpur. Now these three, Sir, named above, do not represent small assistance on the part of Government.

In addition, reference was also made that in order to solve the problem of unemployment the Industry department has another approach and that is, by the method of establishing industrial schools and institutions and colleges. Here again, Sir, in spite of the financial stringency of recent years, the programme of development of industrial schools, though it may have slackened occasionally, has never been abandoned for a single moment. From year to year we are establishing more schools, and improving their equipment. In addition to these during recent years a weaving factory to serve as a model and also to train our weavers in the method of power looms has been established at Shahdara. We have also a hosiery institute at Ludhiana. Further, we have a dyeing school at Shahdara; not to speak of the the MacLagan Engineering College where young men are trained in the work of handling machines and become efficient mechanics. But, Sir, I wish to state to the House that if any definite suggestions are made which are feasible there would be no hesitation on the part of the Government to examine them, and give all possible and legitimate help in their furtherance. Government is as willing now, as it has abundantly shown itself to be in the past, to help in the industrial advancement of this province; and certainly I do not yield to any member of this House in my desire to see industries advanced and improved here. That, Sir, so far as the industries are concerned.

So far as Education is concerned, Sir, in the course of this debate reference has been made particularly to two or three matters. One is with reference to our intermediate colleges. I may say at once that with regard to these intermediate colleges the policy of Government has not undergone any change, i.e., the establishment, as funds permit, of intermediate colleges in as many suitable places in the district towns as we can. It is undoubtedly recognized that these intermediate colleges might in some measure lead to intensify the difficulty of unemployment, but that is inevitable with all higher schemes of education, where employment of only one kind is in view. Government feels the full force of the observations made by the honourable member on that side of the House that these intermediate colleges now constitute a means of admission to certain professional colleges. Without large and extended facilities in this direction the way of advance to several professional institutions may be seriously barred for many deserving and bright boys.

Further, Sir, important stress was laid by honourable members on the desirability of pushing forward girls' education. Now, those who have studied the schedule of new expenditure this year, a year of extreme financial stringency, could not have failed to notice that even this year we have provided for three Anglo-vernacular middle schools for girls, and in the year that is just about to close, we established two high schools and three Anglo-vernacular middle schools for girls. And that is not all. It is a pleasing fact

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

to recognize that our existing girls' schools are rapidly developing institutions. You can go to Sialkot, you can go to a small town like Moga, you can go to Jullundur, you can go to Gujranwala and several other places, you will see schools of the large size of 400, 500, 600 and even more girls' Sir, a reference was made to the fact that our total enrolment has fallen. I shall come to it presently. Here I would say that if you will refer to the figures of enrolment and the number of scholars in our girls' schools you will see that there has been an improvement all along the line. And that is not all, not only have we established and continue to establish Anglo-vernacular high schools, and Anglo-vernacular middle schools for girls, but recently we have taken steps to add to the strength of lady teachers by establishing a class for training young matriculate girls, and young intermediate girls for junior Anglo-vernacular at the Lady MacLagan Normal School at Lahore, so that in course of time we will not be embarrassed by the same difficulty of the paucity of lady teachers as we experience at the present moment, in our efforts in establishing more schools. And may I go further, Sir, and say that we have also examined with great care the possibility of placing proper buildings at the disposal of these girls' schools. As I have stated on previous occasions the education of girls has been a subject of special concern and of particular interest to the Director of Public Instruction. And I must at this moment say that the energy and enthusiasm of our present Director, Mr. Sanderson, has brought improvement and progress all along the line. That is, Sir, so far as girls' education is concerned.

Now, Sir, references were made by two or three members during the course of this debate that the report of progress of education in this province for the year 1928-29 that has been placed in their hands recently, has disclosed a certain fall in the number of scholars. It is not necessary for me to scan figures in any detail, but two facts stand out, and I will first dispose of what fell from the lips of Sir Muhammad Iqbal, who ended his speech with language of unwarranted denunciation. He said in reference to this fall that he is not surprised at it. And why? Because the Minister had pursued a particular policy in the matter of grants-in-aid as a result of which certain number of schools belonging to the Hindus during recent years, have been placed on the grants-in-aid list, so many of the Sikhs and only 3 schools of the Muslim community. Sir, to these allegations I gave a very complete reply in the course of the budget discussion last year. The number of Muslim schools was three because three was the number that actually applied for being placed on the grants-in-aid list. But be that as it may, this fact even if it had any validity can furnish no manner of explanation for the fall in the total enrolment of scholars, because enrolment of scholars of the Muslim community, as a matter of fact, has gone up. And further, the grant-in-aid to secondary schools does not touch enrolment in primary schools. Coming to the fall itself, as I said before, I do not propose to scan the figures for any length, but any one who examines these with any degree of care will find this, and I am sure he will be pleased to find it, that while there is a fall in the total number of scholars during the year 1928-29 as compared with 1927-28, there is a substantial increase in the average attendance of scholars at school, and when these facts are placed side by side, the explanation which suggests itself at once, is, that what has happened is that the

schools that had a roll of fictitious and unreal scholars on their list are now showing a more genuine position. Now, the honourable members of this House will remember that time and again my attention was called, and the attention of the Director of Public Instruction was called, that a large number of schools were not having a true state of affairs as regards the number of scholars. Really serious efforts were made to see that there should be a genuine list of scholars who actually came to the schools, because we were clearly of opinion that when a child's name was put on the school register he could not be properly regarded a scholar without attending the school regularly, and this is what has happened. Now, we are in a position to say that practically a very large percentage of those who are on the registers are actually students who go to schools. Therefore, we are really getting our money's worth. That Sir, is, with regard to the number of our total scholars.

Sir, reference was made by the honourable member who has just preceded me to the system of our secondary schools.

4 P. M.

There, progress has undoubtedly not been as great as most of us would desire—it can seldom be. But he will find a continued tale of progress so far as our secondary schools are concerned, better attendance, schools better filled and more economically worked. I am in full sympathy with the desire of those who see that Anglo-vernacular education may be established widely in our rural schools. But Anglo-vernacular education, as honourable members are aware, is extremely expensive. And while Government has not found it possible to convert our rural vernacular middle schools, all of them, into Anglo-vernacular middle schools the number of Anglo-vernacular middle schools is on the increase; also when we consider the question of unemployment, and so on, it cannot be a matter of unconcern to us to remember that while our vernacular middle schools do not add to the list of unemployed, Anglo-vernacular schools undoubtedly will do so.

Sir, reference was made again by the honourable member who preceded me to the curricula that obtain in these schools. And as a matter of fact, earlier in the debate other members also spoke of the desirability of adding a vocational side to the educational work as it prevails in our secondary schools. I should like to say this much in this connection that an effort was made to dissociate high school education entirely from the matriculation examination some years ago, and that effort completely failed. But we are once again examining the possibility of introducing further vocational work in our secondary and higher education.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is over.

**Mr. Din Muhammad** [East and West Central Towns (Muhammadan), Urban] : Sir, it is a difficult job to criticise or to appreciate the budget profitably. On the one hand, we see that experts spend about a year in scrutinising, preparing and collecting figures and laying them before this honourable House. On the other, we find that a layman like myself is expected to unravel its mysteries and to comment upon them. The time allowed is very short, and under these circumstances to expect an intelligent or a well-informed criticism of the details of the budget is unreasonable.

[Mr. Din Muhammad.]

But this circumstance should not be used by the administration to flatter itself that no glaring defects exist in the budget, that the budget is a perfection in which no flaw could be pointed out.

Sir, this Council unfortunately succeeded a former Council that had passed its full term in affluence and prosperity. During full three years the surplus income went up to Rs. 3,00,00,000, as the figures given in this budget show. The first year of this Council saw a prosperity budget, but to our ill-luck, all the three succeeding years have brought adversity budgets. A prosperous Council no doubt would launch new schemes, would involve itself in expensive commitments and would naturally leave a legacy of large commitments to its successor. We were placed in this difficult position. We have now to see whether during the last two years we have been able to meet the situation properly, like good business men, whether we have realised that the mere adjustment of figures is not the only thing which is aimed at in a budget, but that it is absolutely necessary that real relief should be afforded to the taxpayer in one form or another. That is the only criterion which can be applied to any financial statement which is issued by any constitutional Government. It was really very disappointing to see that even in spite of the fact that the provincial contribution had been remitted by the Government of India, we could not make both ends meet. We have to see, after all why this is so.

From several quarters several criticisms have been levelled at the budget as it is presented to us. It has been suggested that there is some sort of jugglery in the financial figures. Some say that as capital expenditure is being charged to the revenues, the expenditure side is not a genuine but a bogus expenditure side. It has also been urged that in some respects the income is not properly shown, and it has been further urged that it is in the interests of the administration always to terrify this Council so that it could be coerced into withdrawing some of the reforms which it wants to be introduced or agreeing to the imposition of some additional taxes. Under these circumstances it is for us to see where the fault lies and how we can remedy the defect. This budget shows that in spite of our spending more money on education, our illiteracy has increased. I have with me a copy of the report of the Government issued a few days ago which shows that in the matter of vernacular education, in spite of our spending large sums of money the proportion of literacy has gone down. It is remarked there that the Minister of Education as well as the Director of Public Instruction consider that this is a very regrettable state of affairs. It is further said that they are disturbed by this drop in enrolment.

**Mr. R. Sanderson :** May I explain, Sir? The Honourable Minister has already explained that the drop in enrolment is purely.....

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the honourable member please wait and hear what I want to say?

We further see in the budget that in spite of our incurring extra expenditure in the department of Excise to control illicit distillation, illicit distillation is gradually and annually on the increase. We further see that in spite of our engaging extra and additional police every year the crime is on the increase. We also find that in spite of our giving extra

help to our judicial officers to dispose of their work in the shape of stenographers and additional Sessions Judges, the demand for extra staff is daily increasing. Everywhere that we see, we are sorely disappointed to find that every remedy that has been proposed so far has failed to achieve its object. That must, naturally, lead us to think that there is something fundamentally wrong in the administration itself, and that it is on account of the wrong policy that is being followed that we are landed in this trouble. Personally I think that the administration is being run on aristocratic lines. (*An honourable member*: Bureaucratic). I would say aristocratic. Everywhere is visible the aristocratic extravagance, the aristocratic aloofness, the aristocratic aversion to criticism, the aristocratic disregard of future commitments and the aristocratic arrogance, to boot. And this is the reason, Sir, why with ears shut and eyes closed this administration runs headlong to ruination through the old grooves that had been formed long ago. This inflexibility and inelasticity of their notions is mainly responsible for all the deficit budgets that are being presented to the Council every year. If they are prepared to listen to reason, and if they care to afford sufficient attention to all the points that are brought to their notice, I am sure that some such remedies would be found as would make our path smooth.

Take the case of the Honourable Minister for Agriculture. He is a man of great parts, a very talented gentleman. The other day when he went to Jhang he gave a very nice sermon. He is full of pithy sayings and aphorisms, and whenever he finds an opportunity he is out with at least half a dozen of them. He was pleased to remark there that the State is the people. He was further pleased to remark that this legislature is a partially sovereign body, and that it is the people who are virtually ruling the country. These were the very words that he spoke, and which I read to-day in the *Tribune*. I am subject to correction if the Honourable Minister says that he did not utter those words. And what do we see? Who actually does rule? The other day when the resolution for total prohibition was tabled, was brought before this House, he saw with his own eyes that this sovereign body, the major portion of it at least, was opposed to his policy, but he invoked the help of the real sovereigns and defeated this nominal sovereign whom he himself proclaimed the other day as the real sovereign of this country. This is the policy that he is adopting. Leave this policy of excise aside. Take the department that he has the honour to govern, the department of Agriculture. He is fond of opening new farms, starting new departments, introducing new appointments. But what purpose do they serve? Has he ever considered whether the fellow that toils at the plough has ever felt that there is his own brother in charge of this department of Agriculture, that such and such relief has been provided for him which he did not have before? Have any methods been taught to him which would bring him more food, more grain, less pain and less trouble? In spite of all that, when the Honourable Minister will stand on his legs, he would boast that such and such improvements have been made, such and such reforms have been introduced in the department and that the department has taken giant strides on the road of progress. These are all matters to be said, but when we see his actual practice, we are sorely disappointed.

[ Mr. Din Muhammad. ]

Take again the case of the Honourable Minister for Education. For full three years we have been crying hoarse against his policy. But he has proved adamant, absolutely paying no heed to what has been said. It was brought to his notice last year by honourable members on this side of the House that the department of Education has failed to realise what sort of inspecting staff should be engaged to popularise vernacular education. It was brought to his notice that there is absolutely no sympathy whatsoever in the existing inspecting staff for those people or for those *slagas* which they are expected to control and to inspect. It was brought to his notice that propaganda work is lacking but then everybody on the official benches ridiculed that statement. Everybody on my left side ridiculed us too. But what do we see now? There is a drop in the enrolment, and the Honourable Minister for Education has himself been forced to admit that that is the reason for the drop in the enrolment on which we laid stress then. This is what his own report says :—

“The decrease to which reference is made in the report is more serious in that there has been some slackening on the part of the inspecting staff in carrying out propaganda work among the people.”

What more cogent proof is required ? The Director of Public Instruction is getting up to object to the truth of the statement, but he should patiently hear and see for himself what has been said by his own predecessor and by his own boss.

**Mr. R. Sanderson :** Is the word ‘boss’ as applied to the Honourable Minister, parliamentary, Sir ?

**Mr. President :** Is there any serious impropriety in the use of the word ?

**Mr. R. Sanderson :** It is not English. It is a form of slang, and I think it is an improper term to apply.

**Mr. President :** Did the honourable member mean any insult by the use of the word objected to ?

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** If it is an abusive term, I withdraw it and would substitute ‘chief’ for ‘boss’, if that would satisfy him.

It has been pointed out by the Honourable the Finance Member that floods and famine are chiefly responsible for this deficit budget. He has also been pleased to remark that retrenchment is no palliative. He has also realised the necessity of stabilising the revenue. I would most respectfully submit, and repeat what I said last year, that it is time now that a committee of financial experts be constituted to go through the financial conditions of this province. Otherwise the time is not very far when we will become actual bankrupts. We are now on the verge of bankruptcy ; we have to borrow two hundred lakhs this year to make both ends meet. We want financial experts to go into the matter, reveal all the mysteries of the budget and inform us as to what our financial condition is at present, what the condition of our future commitments would be, and how best we can provide for future developments, lest we might be found virtual paupers and unable to afford adequate relief to the tax-payer when provincial autonomy is granted to this province.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** (Minister for Agriculture): I rise to make a few general observations—(*An honourable member: Aphorism?*)—yes, if the honourable member so desires. It is with genuine pleasure that I have heard members speaking on this budget in the way they have spoken. Four years ago, when I came to this House, I found the House engaged more or less on speculative problems, to-day the House has been discussing things that really matter. From Sardar Hari Singh, who voiced the village problems, Sardar Partap Singh who raised questions regarding co-operation, every member who spoke, including Mr. Din Muhammad, have spoken.....

**Mr. President:** I have more than once pointed out that, if possible, members should not be referred to by their names but by their constituencies or in some other way.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh:** I shall try to remember it, Sir. If I may resume, it is a hopeful sign that the members of this House are realising their responsibility and desire to make a better life for the people of the Punjab. It is in the tackling of economic problems—agricultural, industrial and educational—that we can make this province prosperous. The member for Gujranwala asked me as to what the Agricultural department was doing for the benefit of the zamindar. I am glad, Sir, to be in a position to answer his question that the village people are recognising the benefits of the Agricultural department and the correspondence and enquiries which this department receives from all parts of the province show that the department of Agriculture is winning a place for itself. My object in opening these farms is to occupy strategic positions from where to examine what can be done by modern methods of agriculture, and to create demonstration centres, so that the new knowledge may be available to the villagers. Now, we all know agriculture is our primary industry, but agriculture, to realise its full value, depends on the existence of other industries, which simply implies that the raw produce from agriculture should be manufactured in the villages and in the towns. I entirely agree with this view. But here again, I repeat, what I have said before, that this House to some extent, and Government as a whole, can help. But, development of our resource depends more on the leadership of men outside, who can organise industry and give the lead which the province needs. If that lead were forthcoming, I have absolutely no hesitation in saying that work of production will begin. (*Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal: who is to supply the money?*) The member for Lahore who is more known as the world-famed poet, has asked me where the money is to come from. Who can know more than he, that money is created by man, that it is men we need, not money, which comes with men.

**Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal:** Does the honourable member create the Rs. 5,000 that he gets?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh:** Certainly.

**Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal:** I do not think he does.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh:** I have always created more than Rs. 5,000; otherwise I would not be worthy to occupy my present position. One thing more. A great deal of emphasis has been laid that our finances are not as prosperous as they ought to be, a general

[ Hon'ble Sir Jogendra Singh. ]

desire has been expressed—and I entirely share that desire—that the popular services should be multiplied. Government depends on the prosperity of the people, and the prosperity of the people depends on all those beneficent activities—education better living and development of industries. It is with the prosperity of the people that the resources of Government can multiply, and with greater resources at the command of the Government, the services which the people need can also be greatly increased. Without this deep, continuous and abiding co-operation there can never be any progress.

Sir, Sardar Partap Singh (I forget his constituency) made some suggestions about the working of the Co-operative department, and I can assure him that all the matters that he has mentioned will receive careful attention. Then, again, the member for Shahpur brought out that the rates for earthwork in the Public Works Department, Roads and Buildings and Irrigation Branch were not uniform. I made enquiries and I found that the rates on Shahpur bridge for earthwork and dressing were Rs. 8 for 1,000 cubic feet. I am going to make further enquiries, I agree with him that the rates for the same kind of work in all the departments ought to be almost the same unless there are any variations in the work.

Then, Sir, I am very glad to hear from one of the members a plea for road development, but there is one thing which I have not been able to follow. Some members have held that the only right method for capital expenditure is to finance it from borrowing. I do not know how these canons of financial propriety have been discovered, ordinarily we all desire to meet ordinary expenditure from our ordinary revenues, and the Punjab Finance Department in any case can claim that it has endeavoured to meet some of our capital expenditure out of extraordinary revenue. Then, again, members have drawn attention to falling prices. I can assure honourable members that, an agriculturist myself, I too am affected by the fall of prices and I have been studying the problem with deep interest. I can quote from one of the leading economists that this falling of prices is not only confined to India; but it is at present a world-wide phenomenon. Mr. Keynes, writing on the subject says: "Between 1909—1921 and 1924, the reaction from the great post-war inflation was practically completed. But since 1924 our wholesale index number has fallen by further 25 per cent. This rate of fall lasting for a period of 4 or 5 years is unparalleled in modern economic history. The consequences have already reached the dimensions of a first class disaster. Nor is it by any means certain that the further movement in the same direction is going to be avoided?" The cheapness of things that a man requires is not an evil in itself, indeed cheapness if it means abundance of everything, is to be much desired. The difficulty arises when there is a disparity between the price of raw produce and manufactured article.

Mr. Owen Roberts complained that some of his projects were not promptly complied with by an officer of the Public Works department. The officer in question was a member of a committee. I must confess that the committee does not belong to my portfolio, and I cannot enlighten him about the matters he mentioned.



A great deal has been said, Sir, on the cost of administration, which has been held by every member of the House to be too expensive, and one of the members—I think the Member for Lahore City—said that this was, as compared with other countries, the most expensive administration in the world. I do not know where he got his figures, but if he would compare the cost of the administration in the Punjab per head of the population with any other administration in India, Hyderabad or any of the neighbouring States, I can assure him, that he will find the administration of the Punjab cheaper. If he wishes to go outside, he should compare the cost in the same way. Take any district of the Punjab, see the number of officers in charge of administration and he will find that our expenditure is not more than that of other civilised countries.

One of the members pointed out the existence of communal feeling in the Co-operative department. I confess with regret that there is a certain amount of communal feeling in the Co-operative department. It has been my hope that people who are co-operating together will find reconciliation and recognise the benefit of associated effort and disadvantages of disassociation, I still hope that reconciliation of all interests will inspire the co-operative movement. All I can say is, that the doors of co-operation will be open to all, irrespective of caste and creed and Government has no other object but to promote co-operation and to lead the people to a better life and to afford those financial facilities about which the honourable member for Lahore pleaded. In the Co-operative department we are able to place liquid capital to something like 14 crores at the disposal of the village population and we hope that in the near future we will be able to finance long term loans also. (*Cheers.*)

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan** [Sialkot (Muhammadan), Rural]: Sir, I shall not take up very much of the time of the House in submitting the few remarks that I have to submit during this discussion on the Budget presented to this Council for the year 1930-31. As honourable members fully appreciate we are faced with a rather serious situation, and it must be the desire of all of us to enforce the strictest and the most rigid economy with regard to expenditure for as long a time as the present conditions continue. On this subject I shall perhaps only sound this warning that the sincerity of the attitude of Government with regard to this matter will be tested by their voting on reduction motions that might be proposed with regard to expenditure on various departments on the ground of economy. I can well realise that when the object of a particular reduction is the criticism of a certain department it is not open to Government members to adopt any attitude except that of opposition to the reduction proposed. With regard to the reductions the object of which is economy in administration to the extent to which it is open to the House to propose such reductions I can also realise that Government could, not of their own accord, propose reductions of a certain kind, but when they are proposed by members of this House, as I have said, the attitude of Government will be the test of the sincerity of Government to reduce the expenditure on the administration. There are several small matters with regard to which economies might well be effected and I hope that the Government will view with sympathy the efforts which might be made by different sections of the House to introduce economy with regard to these matters. It might be that the total amount of reductions

[ Ch. Zafrullah Khan. ]

which honourable members are able to propose, having due regard to the efficient working of the system of Government, may not amount to very much, yet the time is such that every penny saved will be a penny gained. I need not dilate upon this aspect of the question.

One or two matters with regard to which I might urge the reduction of expenditure upon the Government might perhaps be mentioned here rather than by way of a cut asking for reduction when demands are under consideration. Two years ago various sections of this House urged upon the Government the desirability of holding the summer session of the Council at Lahore rather than at Simla on various grounds and one of the principal grounds put forward was the ground of economy. Various honourable members detailed the inconvenience which non-official members have to suffer when they have to go up to Simla for a short time in the middle of summer. We are all aware that there is no proper accommodation for the holding of a session at Simla and were it not for the courtesy of His Excellency Sir Malcolm Hailey and our present Governor in lending, for the use of this Council, the ball room at Barnes Court, there would be no proper place where the session of the Council could be held at Simla. Again, there are no quarters provided for the accommodation and comfort of honourable members and in any case, I am certain that a great deal of extra expense is involved in holding a session at Simla than would be involved in holding the session at Lahore. That is one very minor economy but certainly, it is worth the consideration of the Government and Government should respect the wishes of the House on this question expressed two years ago. I was rather surprised to find last year that the previous practice was resorted to and the session was held at Simla. But this year when Government is faced with the question of enforcing very rigid economy with regard to expenditure I hope that this will be taken into consideration, as it is not desirable that this matter should be pressed upon the attention of Government by means of a cut for reduction.

Again, Sir, the budget shows that there are two or three matters with regard to which Government have reduced expenditure and the limit to which they have now brought it with regard to certain branches is such that no useful purpose can be served by continuing the small amount that Government asks this House to grant for the purpose. These items will be more particularly specified at the time when Government is being requested to cut down expenditure with regard to these branches. I was rather surprised to find that honourable members of this House, at least some of them, instead of concentrating upon this aspect of the budget which is really the only aspect to which attention was required particularly during this session could not refrain from ventilating grievances of a kind which on a discussion of this year's budget were really not of very great help to the House. One honourable member who always poses as a nationalist and a very great enemy of communalism stood up and devoted the greater part of his speech towards discussing the paucity of representation in the services of his own community, that is to say, the Sikh community.

**Mr. President :** Will the honourable member please withdraw the word "poses".

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** I beg your pardon, Sir. If I have used that expression, I certainly withdraw it. At any rate, he always assures the

House that he is a nationalist member and is opposed to all sorts of communal considerations. If I used that expression I withdraw that and substitute what I have just said. And as I have said, the chief grievance that he was able to put forward during the general discussion of the budget was the low representation which, according to him, his community had received in the services. I could not understand the position he took up. He prefaced even this grievance with the declaration that if appointments went on merit then he would have no grievance, but as it is, he had some sort of grievance that his community was not well represented in the services. He did not specify what particular representation he wanted in these services and the mischief of putting forward such a grievance is that unless members representing other communities start putting forward a similar grievance with greater vehemence, it might be assumed that a grievance which has been put forward in that fashion and has been allowed to pass unchallenged had really some valid ground behind it. I do not wish to enter into a discussion of this kind, but as some sections of the House and the communities which these sections represent, seem to have adopted the doctrine that the louder you put forward a grievance, whether real or assumed, the better the bearing that you will secure for it, I consider it my duty to examine the figures which the honourable member has put forward in support of that grievance. He put forward various figures to show as to what was the representation of his own community in the services, and I was rather surprised to find that, although the figures put forward were the total figures, not on the basis of percentage, if the percentages were to be worked out, the conclusion at which honourable members would arrive after examining these figures would be that that community certainly in some departments was rather over-represented in others over-represented to a great extent, and that in no department was it being under-represented. For instance, he referred to the executive and judicial branches of the administration. I find from the figures that among Extra Assistant Commissioners his community has 14·8 per cent. representation and when one remembers that the percentage in the population of that community is about 11 per cent., that is rather a case of favourable representation certainly, if not of over-representation than otherwise. It would be interesting to know that a community which is five times the number of the Sikh community in this province has only three times their representation among the Extra Assistant Commissioners, that is to say 14·8 per cent. Sikh representation and exactly thrice as much, 42·9 per cent. Muhammadan representation. Surely, there was no ground here for a grievance on behalf of the Sikhs. Among sub-judges there are 13·8 per cent. Sikh sub-judges as against 35 per cent. Muslim sub-judges. If there can be any grievance here, it cannot be on behalf of the community which my honourable friend represents, but it would be on behalf of the community which has only 35 per cent. in this branch of the service, that is 20 per cent. below its population basis. In the police which is always described as a sort of Muslim preserve, the Sikh community have 13·2 per cent., that is, 2·2 per cent. above their population basis; among the Deputy Superintendents, 14·5 among inspectors and 15·4 per cent. among sub-inspectors. Coming to the Irrigation department there are 15·4 per cent. Sikhs among the Deputy Collectors and 15·5 per cent. Sikhs among the Upper Subordinates, 19·4 per cent. Sikhs among the Assistant Engineers and 26·8 per cent. Sikhs among the zilladars, and yet, my learned friend has the grievance that in this particular

[ Ch. Zafrullah Khan. ]

department, the Sikhs are not give employment in accordance with their due share. There is no doubt that among temporary Engineers recently employed the percentage is rather low, that is, 6.1 per cent., but that is for the reason that among the Engineers in the Irrigation department, the Muhammadan representation among the upper ranks is very small, that is, only 11.1 per cent. It is because of that poor representation that they have been given 30 per cent. in these new recruitments as against 6 per cent. to the Sikhs which is exactly 5 times the percentage given to the Sikh community which also corresponds with the population basis. In the Forest Department, among Extra Assistant Commissioners the Sikhs have 25 per cent., certainly a case of over representation; among forest rangers 21 per cent., among deputy forest rangers 14 per cent. and as a matter of fact, there is a very serious grievance that in the Forest Department at one time there was such a large recruitment from among the Sikh community that both the other communities were deprived of their due share. The Muhammadans have a crying grievance that they have been shouldered out of this department and it will be many years before their representation can be brought up to its proper level. Coming to the Revenue department, no doubt my learned friend pointed to a grievance that there were only 10.6 per cent. Sikh tahsildars but he did not inform the House that there were 15.6 per cent. Sikh naib-tahsildars and if he took the two percentages together, he would have found that they work out to a far better percentage than the community is entitled to. I strongly deprecate the attempt made in this guise to show that from the nationalist point of view there is something very wrong in the distribution of these posts. The chief cause for Sikh or Hindu objection is the allegation that Muhammadans are getting a great deal more than the Hindus or the Sikhs, whereas the fact is exactly the reverse. As I submitted in the opening part of my speech it should be the duty of every member of the House when dealing with the present budget to see that the strictest economy is being observed.

I was rather surprised to find that where a department had made an effort towards economy it was rather unjustly criticised by one honourable member. I refer to the criticism levelled against the Public Health department in its attempt to restrict its expenditure with regard to the Public Health School. Now, I understand that one of the functions of the doctors in charge of this Public Health School is to train nurses and *daïs*.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is over.

**Dr. Gokul Chand. Narang** [North-West Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Urban]: Sir, I have not much to say, but I must say that the budget that has been presented to us is really a most disappointing one. That does not mean that it has not been given the care that it deserved or that the Finance department have not done all that was possible to make the Budget as pleasant a reading as possible. The circumstances, however, are such that we feel that we are rapidly drifting towards bankruptcy, unless something unforeseen happens to put our finances on a better basis. To quote from the speech of the Honourable the Finance Member on page 7 :

"After hearing the description I have just given of the calamities which this province has been called upon to endure in the course of the past few months, to say nothing of the preceding series of unsatisfactory harvests, he would be an optimist indeed who would anticipate in the coming year any extensive programme

of development or an uninterrupted continuance of progress on lines laid down in more prosperous conditions. Our task at present is, by economy in every direction, to prevent the complete depletion of our resources and to avoid an accumulation of debt which may hamper the province in future years."

When I looked at the figures something like that was passing in my mind. I was not here when he made this excellent speech and when I went through the whole of it, I found rather as an unpleasant surprise that my forebodings had been the same as those of the author of this statement.

It is really a very unhappy outlook and that necessitates a far greater effort at economy than has been put forward up to this time. Various honourable members of this House have complained against one Minister or another or one department or another. I think all that criticism is really misplaced and uncalled for. There is a combination of circumstances here which makes perhaps everybody helpless. I feel that the reserved departments feel that perhaps some change is coming in this country and they find themselves unable really fully to anticipate what is going to happen and although they are doing their best and showing as much interest in the betterment or at least the welfare of the country as they used to do before, still I think there is something in the air which gives the whole thing an appearance of uncertainty. There are others who are in charge of transferred departments who may represent, so to say, the swadeshi wing of Government. There again I find that they are helpless. Much is expected of them while very little is given to them. They have absolutely no power to initiate any expenditure or on their own responsibility to do anything which the needs of the nation require. They have to depend upon the reserved half of the Government. This combination, therefore, is working in such a way as to produce the result which we have got in the present budget and in the present condition of our province, not only of our province but of other parts of the country as well. We deplore the defects we find in the present administration and think of what we would do if we had the power but, in the present circumstances we cannot achieve what we really wish to do. I have already submitted that in the present circumstances we cannot expect any more than what we have got. Unless there is a change in the administration altogether, unless there are constitutional changes in the country and the centre of power is shifted, this state of affairs will continue, however bitterly we may complain and howsoever anxious we may be for the betterment of our province or of our country. Still, however, there are certain things which could probably be done even in the existing state of affairs and it is only to those few things that I would draw the attention of the Government.

We find that so far as the revenue receipts are concerned, they are about Rs. 27 lakhs or so, less than the expenditure and what we are doing is this, that in order to balance our budget and to meet the cost on the exchequer of the province, we are really giving away what is properly speaking a reserve fund of our province, namely as we find from page 57 of the Budget Estimates, those extraordinary receipts, to the extent of Rs. 87 lakhs which really represent our capital, our reserve, and, in order to meet our current expenses we are selling, like a person who expects bankruptcy, a part of our house, a part of our land, a part of our household effects.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** To meet current expenses ?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Yes, to the extent at least of Rs. 27 lakhs or so. That is what it comes to. The receipts are Rs. 10.95 lakhs and the expenditure is Rs. 11.22 lakhs. That is a difference of Rs. 27 lakhs. Extraordinary receipts to the extent of Rs. 86 lakhs are added to the income and there is some other expenditure which is to be met on account of certain capital works and it is by taking this sum of Rs. 86 or 87 lakhs into account that the current expenses are sought to be met. But it is really perhaps owing to the various extraordinary circumstances which we have to face that we have been put to our last resources.

I shall just say one or two words with respect to a few things and then I will sit down. So far as the Police is concerned, I repeat my complaint that a certain section of His Majesty's subjects are entirely excluded from the police. I will not go into the complaint and say that so many Hindus are recruited or so many Muhammadans are recruited, but there is a certain class in this province which is not at all recruited and I think I would not be talking unnationally if I bring forward their grievances. I mean the depressed classes as such, the untouchables as such. I put this question when I was sitting as a member of the Joint Free Conference to the Inspector-General who appeared as a witness and he admitted that these untouchables were not recruited. I sent a question to the Honourable the Finance Member. I do not know who was in charge of the portfolio at that time, and the answer was that there was nothing against the Government of India Act in excluding these people and the policy of Government did not permit of a recruitment of these people. I want to bring the grievances of this large community to the notice of Government. I want any responsible gentlemen on the Government benches to deny it and if it cannot be denied, then I want an assurance that the case of the so-called untouchables who number many lakhs in this province would be taken into consideration and that they would not be excluded from an important department of His Majesty's services, simply because they happen to belong to a certain community and have the curse of untouchability branded, as it were, on their faces.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Who has done that ?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Whoever has done it, we are removing it, and we want that those who pose that they do not believe in caste, that those who believe that they are the torch-bearers of light and civilisation and those who claim to be the leaders and rightly claim to be leaders of mankind at the present time, that they should remove the curse. If more ignorant people or less enlightened people or more selfish people have placed this curse on their foreheads, it is no reply to ask who has placed this curse or branded this curse on their foreheads. Whoever has done it, economic circumstances may have done it, certain other considerations may have done it, but whosoever has been the author of it, it is for us to remove that curse and it is a matter of great shame that a member of an enlightened Government should stand up in the twentieth century and say that the policy of Government does not permit the recruitment of such people in the Police department.

With respect to education, I again repeat what I have ventured to submit from time to time that too much is being wasted on so-called higher education. We should concentrate ourselves on primary education. We

have already too much of so-called higher education in this province and I know that thousands of people who have received that so-called higher education are wandering about without any hope of getting a livelihood and Members of Government must know that their doors are being knocked at by people who have received higher education.

I would also say that so far as industries are concerned, it is really useless to take the time of this Council. I know that so long as the reins of the Government of this province are in the hands of a nation which depends upon industries and commerce they will not improve. I do not mean any disrespect, but that is a fact. It is no use really our bemoaning our lot. We get a little dole in sugar, we get a little dole in oil, we get a little dole in paper, but really nothing is being done to improve the lot of people so far as industries are concerned. If we were independent, in ten years we could show much better results. But things are as they are and it is hoping against hope to expect that industries in this country will ever make any headway until things radically change.

With respect to the co-operative movement, I have repeatedly asked the Honourable Minister in charge who is not present in the Chamber at this time, to see that some element of co-operation is introduced among the trading classes as well, but so far nothing has been done. I asked him again yesterday but he said nothing has been done in spite of his promises in one of the reports that he issued a year or two ago. I need not repeat what has been said by so many people as to the lines on which this department is run. It is run on communal lines and not only on communal lines but on most offensive lines.

One word with respect to local self-government. I would not have touched this subject but for something which happened in Gujranwala. I must say that if instances were to multiply like the instance which we had at Gujranwala, local self-government institutions may as well be abolished in this province. What happened at Gujranwala? The vice-president of the municipality had the audacity to lend the use of the municipal hall for a certain purpose and the result was that he was not merely removed from his office of vice-presidency—which perhaps the Honourable Minister or the Government could not do because that was an elected office—but he was removed from the list of members of the municipal committee. His case was sought to be brought under section 16 of the Municipal Act, that is, that he abused his position as a member of the committee. I will not go into the question whether a change in the ideal of the Congress about Swaraj means independence or dominion status or whether the fixing of independence as the immediate goal means declaring independence, though my personal opinion is that making a change in the ideal of the Congress does not mean a declaration of independence. But to remove a member from the list of members of a municipal committee because he allowed a thing to be done which has been allowed to be done in hundreds of places, is really an act of unwisdom, not to use a stronger word. It is reducing local self-government to a farce.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** (Minister for Local Self-Government): Sir, I am rather fortunate in having waited for so long and listened to the very important point raised by the learned Doctor which,



[Hon'ble Malik Feroz Khan Noon.]

if unfortunately I had spoken earlier, I would not have had an opportunity to reply to. As a matter of fact, this matter, I understand, has already been tabled for discussion in the form of a cut in my salary by Chaudhri Afzal Haq, and my honourable friend Dr. Narang will have an opportunity to give full vent to his feelings and oratory on the subject on that occasion, and I hope I shall be able to deal with the subject more fully. But, now, I shall only say two things on that matter. The other things I shall reserve for the fuller debate later.

The first thing I want to refer to is the fact that in the year 1928 this learned House passed an Act by means of which they introduced a provision in the Municipal Act whereby they made it incumbent on every elected and nominated member of a local body to take an oath of allegiance before he became a member of the local body. Now, if, in the opinion of the Minister who is responsible to this very House for seeing that certain provisions of law enacted by this House are being carried out, he does an act under the provisions of that Act, he is only doing an act in pursuance of the wishes of this House. It is another matter whether his interpretation is right or wrong. If his interpretation is right, then he is carrying out the wishes of the House; if his interpretation is wrong, then it is the business of the House to put the law in such unambiguous a manner that it is not possible for any minister to make a mistake of that nature in the future.

The only other point I wish to discuss is this. The learned Doctor said, 'Here is a Minister who has brought about the very negation of local self-government in local bodies.' May I ask, if it is not a fact that it was advertised in the papers that the day of independence was to be celebrated on the 26th of January? Is it not a fact that a draft resolution had been circulated to be read on that occasion when the independence flag was to be hoisted on the independence day? Is it not a fact that the late vice-president of the municipal committee knew that such and such a day was going to be celebrated and he could have laid a resolution before the municipal committee in advance and invited their verdict on the subject. Without doing this, on his own responsibility and against the provisions of the Municipal Act he passed an order ordering the hoisting of the independence flag on the municipal building. (*Hear, hear*). May I ask, if it is not a fact that the only provision under which a president or vice-president can pass an order is section 85? Is it not a fact that the president of the municipality happened to be absent from Gujranwala only for a few hours? Is it not a fact that the vice-president took full benefit of the absence of the president and under that section passed an order though illegal? What does section 85 say? It says that in case of emergency when it is in the interest of the public or for the safety of the services of the public a vice-president in the absence of the president can pass an order. My point is that the Municipal Act authorises a president or, in his absence, the vice-president to pass an order if the safety of the public required it. That is one point.

Secondly, here is a gentleman who has passed the order. There are six others who are of the same view as himself. That is to say, seven gentlemen out of 21 members of the municipal committee are of one view. Among



others, one is absent in Calcutta and so he could not have taken part in the work of the committee. If you leave him out of consideration, there are 13 more members remaining. Of these, I have received a protest from 12 members saying that they are against the vice-president's action. (*Hear, hear.*) If the vice-president had brought a resolution in the committee, these twelve members say they would have opposed it and the resolution would have been lost. Now, may I ask, if a minister's action is in accord with the wishes of 12 members of the Municipal committee as against a minority of seven, whether he is running rough over local self-government or whether it is this vice-president, whose cause our learned Doctor is espousing, that is bringing about absolute negation of local self-government?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** The Honourable Minister has put more than half a dozen questions during the course of his speech. Are these questions intended to be answered or are they merely a flourish of rhetoric on his part?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** My honourable friend knows that all these questions are absolute facts and he cannot deny them.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Did these twelve members ask the Honourable Minister to dismiss the vice-president?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The twelve members sent a protest against the action of the vice-president, which protest is in my possession.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** When did the protest come, was it before the occurrence or after?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I am not prepared to satisfy my honourable friend on that point till the debate arises.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member has put a question. If the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government is able to answer it he may do so. I cannot compel him to give an answer, but courtesy requires that he should, if he can.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** I have a right to ask the Honourable Minister when that protest was received. That makes a great difference. I understand that the protest came when the motion had been tabled or rather, when it was announced that the honourable member from Hoshiarpur, (Chaudhri Afzal Haq) intended to table a motion.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The protest came after the vice-president had been removed. That, however, does not make the slightest difference, because the view of the majority was against the act of the vice-president. This is, however, only in passing. The full debate on the subject is coming later on when it can be discussed at great length.

Now, I will turn to a few arguments brought forward by certain members in the course of their speeches. First, I shall refer to the bed level of the river Jhelum, which was referred to by the honourable member from Sargodha. That question has been investigated and we are advised by our technical advisers that his complaint is not a fact. The flood in the Jhelum river was not due to the rise of the bed level, but to the synchronisation of floods in the Jhelum and heavy local rain.

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

The second question was that the grant for public health had been cut down. I regret to say that that is a fact, but it is entirely due to the deficit budget. When our finances improve I have no doubt that the Finance Department will be able to help us to increase the grant for public health.

As regards cattle fairs, that is a matter which entirely rests with the local boards and the honourable member from Ferozepore who is the Secretary of the local board is quite welcome to move in the matter in his own local board. I understand that a lot of money can be made out of these fairs and I also understand that Gojra is making Rs. 4,000 per month from these fairs.

Another honourable member suggested that something should be done to put down malaria. All that is possible is being done in this direction. We have already completed our public health staff; we have got a district medical officer of health for each district and the Rural Sanitary Board is gradually drying up all the possible wheels in order to kill mosquitoes. During the last malaria epidemic, the public health department distributed no less than 1,158 lbs. of quinine worth about Rs. 17,000 free of cost amongst the public in addition to the quinine distributed by local dispensaries of the medical department. Whatever demand for quinine was made was duly met. I do sincerely hope that the district medical officers of health will justify their existence in a few years by bringing malaria under control. Other diseases, I am glad to say, are gradually coming under control.

One honourable member complained that we do not allow the money of local bodies being deposited in joint stock companies. The difficulty there is that it is impossible for Government to choose between one company and another. If we choose one company then another will have a real grievance against us. Again, it is very difficult to find out how far the joint stock companies are reliable. In order to avoid all these difficulties and unpleasantness we recommend that the money should be deposited with the Imperial Bank. In some cases the local bodies deposit the money with some local *Mahajans*.

Then, there was the question of closing certain wards in the Mayo Hospital. It was only last year that we did so. I hope that will not be the case in future. The needs of the hospital are quite met by the officers who are always on duty there, one physician and one surgeon. The question of appointing honorary surgeons or physicians is a difficult one. The difficulty arises in the matter of choosing A or B. Again if the honorary physicians or surgeons are appointed, then there is likely to be conflict between them and the college staff, and friction over accommodation available in the wards. For these reasons it was felt that the scheme was not acceptable to Government.

There was a suggestion that we should recruit more zamindars in the medical department. I must say that this is a department in which efficiency is the foremost criterion as far as recruitment is concerned. But, where the qualifications are equal, zamindars can be given preference under the general circular of the Government of 1919.

Now, I come to the very important question of the Lahore Improvement Committee which Mr. Owen Roberts raised yesterday. He said that

there was a case in which a great delay occurred on account of this committee. I may say that such delays will not occur if there were properly drawn up plans prepared by qualified technical advisers. He cited one case where a man applied for permission to build in April and yet the scheme had not been sanctioned. I am very glad that he has given me an opportunity to explain the case. That is a case in which a firm called Messrs. Naraindas put in a building plan. What happened was that there was huge municipal drainage under the building which they proposed to erect. The municipal committee sent the plans to the Improvement Committee. At first, the Improvement Committee discovered that the distance between the shop and the Mall road and the distance between it and the adjoining shops were not given. To avoid possibility of encroachment the Improvement Committee asked that those distances should be given. When the file came back the Improvement Committee, while examining the plan, noticed that there was a municipal drain over which the building was proposed to be erected. The Improvement Committee protested and said, here is property of the municipality which is being built over, if to-morrow the municipality takes up the scheme of sewage, this building over the drainage will stand in the way. Why should the firm take possession of the property which does not belong to it?

**Mr. President :** If I understood the honourable Mr. Owen Roberts rightly, the gist of his objection was that the Lahore Improvement Committee had no recognised status or *locus standi*. He asked under what law it was formed and under what authority it was functioning, and whether it was not a clog upon the working of the municipal committee. His objection was that the committee was illegal, and that it had no authority to interfere in the working of the municipal committee under the Municipal Act.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I shall satisfy him on both the points. The honourable member presumed first that the Committee was delaying plans to such an extent that the firms who wanted to put up buildings, and had set aside their money for the purpose had been losing interest on that money.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's time is up. If the House is prepared to allow him to go on, I shall give him five minutes more.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I shall then come to my last point. It is this. In the year 1919 Sir Edward Maclagan wrote and said that the Mall was the most important street in our capital city, and that buildings on that road should be of such a nature which add to the dignity and beauty of the town, and that they should be properly planned and put at proper distance from the centre of the road. In pursuance of that suggestion of His Excellency the Governor, the municipal committee has since then been forwarding plans of buildings only on the Mall to this Lahore Improvement Committee which consists of the Chief Engineer (Buildings and Road), the Government Architect, the Deputy Commissioner and the Secretary of the Municipal Committee. These four officers are concerned only with the plans of buildings on the Mall, and in this particular instance, the plan went before the Lahore Municipal Committee, and it was this general committee which after receiving the objections of the Improvement Committee said that they agreed with the latter and rejected the plan. It is

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

on account of the resolution of the general committee of the Municipal Committee that the delay complained of has occurred mainly on account of faulty plans and other mistakes in the application itself.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member has to satisfy the Council as to the law under which this committee was formed.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The law is the Municipal Act under which the Municipal Committee has to sanction plans, and if the Municipal Committee chooses to take advice from certain persons before its sanction, it is quite welcome to do it.

**Mr. R. Sanderson** (Director of Public Instruction) : I thank you for this opportunity to speak. I had no intention to ask for leave to speak on this occasion and would not have risen now but for some unfortunate statements made in the course of the debate. I regret that the honourable member for Lahore and the honourable member for Gujranwala are not present. The former honourable member was not present either when the Honourable Minister was answering his statements on the working of our department. I wish very much that the honourable member from Gujranwala were here now, because he made what was a definite attack on the Ministry of Education. He imputed to the Honourable Minister a subtle policy whereby he was attempting to deprive rural children of their education. It was remarkable to hear in this House his statement accusing my distinguished predecessor, for whom I am officiating, of slackness in carrying out his own policy. He also accused me of a slackness, which is responsible for the fall in attendance at the schools in 1928-29, the year in which I was officiating. I do not know whether the honourable member fully understands our figures; he made great capital out of the fact that our total enrolment showed a fall; the fall is I admit 40,000. I have no time to explain at length, and I think honourable members would not wish me to analyse those figures in their entirety. But I shall take one set of figures which will demonstrate my point. I was officiating as Director in 1928, when, I think, I am right in saying, one of our earlier financial blows came, the wheat harvest in that year being affected very adversely by the hot winds. I was warned then that money would not be so easily obtained for further expansion of education. After thinking over the situation and actually consulting my distinguished colleague by letter, it was decided that we should attempt a policy of consolidation in the department for this lean year. And as I thought over the right line of consolidation and how we could firmly establish our educational system when marking time in the matter of expansion, I was reminded of the analogy of a tankard of beer on the top of which there was a mass froth which was undesirable; you can make more room in such a tankard by blowing the froth away. Honourable members opposite have often complained of what I may call the evanescent school boy in our schools who sits there for a day, a week or a month but does not become literate. In my opinion we may liken him to the froth to be blown off to make room for less evanescent school boys. A letter was sent to all inspectors stating that expansion would be difficult as there was probably insufficient money, that they must concentrate their attention that year on increasing the average attendance in schools, and that it should be remembered that the increase of average attendance in schools was much

more important than any increase in paper enrolment. Thus, by getting rid of the boys who came and sat in our school seats for short and irregular periods, we managed to find room and fill that room with boys who stayed a much longer time. As I said, I shall confine myself to one set of figures: the figures of attendance in all recognised high, middle and primary schools in this province. These show a fall in paper enrolment in the year under report of 5,000, but they show a rise in actual attendance of boys, of over 30,000. Can it be claimed, Sir, that this is evidence of malevolence in the Ministry, apathy in the directorate, slackness in the inspectorate or that the district inspectorate was unsympathetic to a class of people who deserve the sympathy of all?

**Sardar Buta Singh** [Multan Division and Sheikhpura, (Sikh) Rural] (Urdu): Sir, since the time granted to me for laying my views before the House is very short, I will make only two or three submissions. First of all through you, Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the Honourable the Leader of the House to the great inconsistency between the words and the actions of the Government. Sir, on the one hand they with great force press forward the excuse of financial stringency and on the other, undertake such expensive works which are unnecessary, unessential and altogether uncalled for. To quote an instance, much expenditure is uselessly wasted for the maintenance of the Criminal Tribes department. This department is utterly useless, and on its account even respectable zamindars who own big areas and are in very affluent conditions, have to undergo a lot of trouble. Under the Criminal Tribes Act they have been included in the category of criminal tribes, and this has caused a great deal of unnecessary botheration to them. It will be within the recollection of the Honourable the Revenue Member that on the occasion of the durbar at Sheikhpura a deputation headed by me had the honour to wait upon him with the purpose of bringing this very matter to his kind notice. At that time he was pleased to give us an undertaking to the effect that something should be done in this behalf. Since then much time has elapsed and still nothing has been done to undo this grave injustice. I again draw his special attention to this matter and request him to take some early steps for the removal of this stigma of infamy from the foreheads of these peace-loving, loyal zamindars. They have been brought under the provisions of this Act from the last two years, and in these two years, they have not committed even a single such act which may be called criminal. Therefore the staff that is kept to keep an eye over the movements of these zamindars is quite unnecessary and useless. In this very connection, my second complaint is with regard to the occasional shortages of water supply. I take the instance of my own district. There the Upper Chenab Canal was not supplied water for two months successively and the zamindars did not irrigate their lands even once this season. A tenant of mine came to me and complained that there was no water in the canal for irrigation. He told me that in order to escape the payment of land revenue it would be better for him to cut down the standing crops. Such are the conditions that obtain in our district, and I wonder why Government so readily undertake the construction of new schemes when it cannot even work the old ones efficiently. I think Government would do better if it abandons the policy of undertaking everything and succeeding with none. Crop failures, floods and all such other calamities have visited the

[S. Buta Singh.]

zamindars in such quick succession that at present their distress knows no bounds. Therefore, it is very important that in some shape or other, the Government should grant them some relief. The troubles of the zamindars are already numerous, and this is not the proper time for adding to them by bringing them under the provisions of the Criminal Tribes Act. I request the Government to extend a helping hand to these poverty-stricken zamindars.

Then Sir, there is the question of the co-operative societies. In a way, this department has become the bone of contention between the various communities. With the establishment of this department the roots of dissection and disunion have been made more firm and more permanent. Last year very few Sikhs and Hindus were taken in the management of P. C. U., but this year their claims have been fully ignored and very few Sikhs and Hindus have been taken. It appears that the Muslim community has monopolised this department to the exclusion of all the other communities. Even at present when swaraj is still a dream the majority community is not dealing fairly with the minorities; God knows what will happen in this province after it is attained. Hence I appeal to the Government and my Muslim brothers to solve this problem satisfactorily.

Then comes education; and much has been said on this subject by honourable members who preceded me. I would say that much attention should be paid to games and sports, and the district and divisional tournaments should also be revived. Exercises like mass drill and scouting are in no way good, but sports and games are far better inasmuch as they inculcate the the spirit of emulation in young men.

Then an honourable member said that there was need for repression, but I think we would do better if, instead, we try to create good feelings and good will between the Government officers and the people. It would not be out of place here to mention that some time back I, with a few other very respectable gentlemen, called upon a very high Government officer in connection with a work of public welfare. I do not want to reveal the name of this officer. He is an Englishman and is the Head of a Department. He refused to see us, and when we sent in the object of our visit in writing he again refused and we had to come back without seeing him. It was my first chance to call upon an English Government officer. A Muslim officer of his department received us cordially and also heard our submissions very sympathetically. Late Mr. Berry, who was Deputy Commissioner of Sheikhpura District, had very good relations with the people. He mixed with them and even paid visits to their houses without any formality. This, in no way, lowered his prestige as an officer. On the other hand, his intimacy with the people drew them towards him and they began to regard him as their sincere well-wisher and friend. If the other Government officials also follow his good example and mix with the people without wearing that official rigid expression on their faces I think the relations between the Government and the people can become more cordial and more affable. In this way a mutual understanding can develop and the people can become more attached to the Government.

Now, Sir, my next point is this, that while ordering the arrest of respectable people, Government should take every care to enquire into their past conduct. If their past conduct reveals them to be dangerous and unprincipled characters then and then only, their arrests should be ordered and not otherwise. For example, sometime back Sardar Charat Singh was arrested under section 124 (A) of the Indian Penal Code. I know this gentleman personally, he is very good and of high moral character and deeply religious. Before making the arrest his past record ought to have been looked into. His past conduct is such that he did not deserve this treatment at the hands of the Government.

Then, Sir, in the end I will repeat my request made last year. It is that at present no such means of communications exist by which one may reach Nankana Sahib from Sheikhpura. A road is necessary, and it should be constructed at any cost. I know that there stands the excuse of financial stringency in the way of my request, but I say beg, borrow or steal but money must be produced for the construction of this road.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, this is the tenth budget of this province being discussed in this Chamber after the Reforms Council, and it affords me very great pleasure indeed to see that after these ten years the Council in discussing the budget has now reached a particular level—if I may be permitted to say without really trying to flatter—of excellence. In the beginning the discussion used to be about details, not quite to the point, perhaps not quite so relevant as it has become now. This year I have noticed that honourable members have made their points with great lucidity and with great force. They have, most of them, come to understand what a province's budget is, and even when they do not agree with particular policies or with particular items of expenditure, still they understand the reasons which prompt Government to adopt that policy or incur that expenditure. That, I venture to submit, is an extremely hopeful sign that in future when this Council has full control of the budget and there are no reserved subjects and no so-called alien elements, there will be that sense of responsibility inspiring the criticism of members of this Council which will work for the best of the province.

In trying to wind up the debate, the general discussion of the budget, one can hardly attempt to meet the various objections that have been raised by honourable members during the general discussion. Such of the objections as are taken if they are really seriously taken by them, undoubtedly during the next eight days of the debate on the budget will come up for discussion in the usual constitutional way, i.e., of cuts or demands. Therefore, what few observations I have to offer will necessarily be of a very general and perhaps of a vague nature.

About Forests, an honourable member pointed out that there were too many posts in the department. He was perfectly justified in his remarks. I think in answer to a question during the course of this or the previous session it has been stated by Government that six of the Imperial Service posts which were created some years ago were, as a matter of fact, not filled, and that the Punjab Government had requested the Secretary of State to scrap them. Coming to the provincial service posts, there again the criticism that they are overstaffed was perfectly just. Two of the provincial



[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

service posts which fell vacant during the last year or two have not been filled, and the case has been taken up with a view to abolishing them. Thus in these two services where the complaint was justly made, Government has already taken steps to move in the direction. Another member went so far as to say, forests are an utter nuisance, and they should be got rid of. I am afraid I cannot but disagree with him. He has not had time to study the whole problem in all its aspects. Forests are not only an industry or a business undertaking calculated to bring a certain amount of income to the province, though one should attempt to attain that object to the best of one's ability, but there are other purposes that forests serve. Experts tell me that the meanest of them serves to attract the wayward clouds that may be roaming about. In that case, if the experts are to be believed, it would be a great pity if the forests were allowed to fall into decay. Again, so far as land revenue is concerned, floods come with great rapidity and devastate the low-lying lands, ruin the headworks and cause such havoc as to seriously affect the revenues of the province. So you see that in Nature things are so arranged that they inter-act or are inter-dependent on one another to an extent that you dare not neglect one or the other and if you do, you pay for it, and pay heavily too. I do not think the honourable member was really earnest or quite serious when he made that suggestion. If what he really wanted was that the department should be better administered, that it ought to be made a paying concern more than it is at present, I am at one with him and assure him that no efforts will be spared to carry out that wish.

Then about the department of irrigation. As I said, I shall not attempt to touch all the points raised. But I notice one honourable member to my right wanted that large areas, thousands of acres, should be added to the lands which are already being irrigated, while another honourable member opposite me says that the lands which are receiving irrigation now are not receiving enough of it. So that if more acres were added to those already irrigated, his complaint will grow more serious. I have set myself the task of adding as little as possible to the area irrigated unless there is additional water available, and in view of the bad crop we have been having in the recent past, I have no doubt that is the policy which this House would approve of.

I pass on at once to the economic situation in the province. It has been in some speeches rightly analysed, while in some others in general terms it has been stated that everything is going to dogs, everybody is in agonies of hunger and every one is starving. General denunciations as a rule seldom contain the whole truth. It would be absolutely wrong to say that the Punjab in 1929 is much worse off than it was fifty years ago. It would be wrong because we could prove definitely from figures that the output in the year 1929 is probably double the output of fifty years ago. Again, it would be wrong to say that public health is worse in 1929 than it was in 1879, similarly medical relief, similarly education, and so on. Then, what is the trouble? It is a matter—when I say this, I say it with some hesitation—which is beyond the control of any Government. If you wish me to express this view it is not as a member of Government or as Leader of the House that I will do it. It is the problem of controlling our numbers—the same



advice which the Mahatma gave—Do not multiply “slaves”. As a matter of fact, if fertility of the soil, productivity and wealth increase we have improved public health, with the result that neither babies nor old men die, surely with all these reforms our numbers will grow at a greater speed. I assure you that there are very few parts of the Punjab left which could be colonised in future. Perhaps Thal could be, but not for the next forty or fifty years. Therefore, when you are talking of economics, do not put on the Government the task of carrying the standard of life and of comfort higher, and also providing means to feed the people well, if you go on producing too many mouths to be fed. That will, never do. I am not saying anything very revolutionary. It is a very simple proposition. You can reasonably expect your public servants to do their best to provide the means of keeping the population that they are trying to serve at a particular standard of comfort, and that is their duty, but what about yours ?

As to floods, I assure you that those members who represent the areas that have been flooded this year will agree with me that if there is one thing which affords some satisfaction to Punjab it is that during these periods of calamities, the administration as well as the people have shown a remarkably good spirit and promptitude in reaching the areas of these calamities with the utmost speed, sparing neither time nor trouble in ministering to their needs and doing all that was humanly possible to make good the great loss inflicted on the sufferers. Then I on pass to the question of unemployment. Here I may point out to the honourable members that although in some parts of this province there is unemployment on account of famine conditions appearing there, is it not a fact that labour from across the border comes into the Punjab to be employed ? If it is so, you cannot say that for the Punjab people—I am talking now of manual labour—there is dearth of labour.

We come, Sir, next to the general denunciation of the administration. One member said that rise in expenditure is unreasonably high. Another member said that too much money is being spent, and too many officers are employed. He asks : Is it because the Secretariat people and others have become too lazy ? As a matter of fact, if the honourable members were to reflect for a moment and try to compute the number of questions they have been pleased to put involving extensive enquiries and collection of statistics of which honourable Members seem to be so very hungry, they will find that they themselves are at the bottom of the increase in numbers. When a question case comes before a Member or a Minister he has to make up his mind either to satisfy the curiosity of the honourable member or not. If he does not, he runs the risk of being told “You are concealing, you don’t recognise the privileges of the members of this House ; we ask questions and we are met by prevaricating answers.” What is the result ? The result is that work is enormously increased.

**Mr. President :** The Hon. Member’s time is over.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member) : Sir, time is very short now and I will confine myself to removing, if possible, some

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

of the misapprehensions which have arisen in the course of this discussion. Some members have made the discovery that for several years past the Punjab Government have been meeting capital expenditure from revenue. The Finance Secretary has dealt with the subject, and I trust that his explanation has given those honourable members satisfaction. The honourable member for Lahore was evidently reassured on this ground. In point of fact, many of the statements made by honourable members seem to owe their origin to some articles which are at present appearing in the Press. The misconception is due to the fact that under our system of accounts extraordinary receipts have to be shown in the revenue section of the accounts, and therefore, capital expenditure that is met from these extraordinary receipts has also to be shown in the revenue section. The principle that the proceeds of sales of land should be utilised to meet capital expenditure has long been accepted by this Council and has not been abandoned. One honourable member went further and suggested that the cost of flood repairs should be classed as capital expenditure. Now, the ordinary principle is that repairs that have the effect of restoring a work to its former position as a revenue-earning work should be debited to revenue. Damage by floods is unfortunately not uncommon, and it would ordinarily be quite wrong to borrow to meet such expenditure. The question whether the floods of last year were so extraordinary as to warrant a departure from this principle is under consideration and discussion with the Accountant-General. I cannot forecast what the decision is likely to be. Most of the criticisms seem to follow certain main lines of thought. Some members drew attention to the excessive and growing expenditure under Civil Administration and the neglect to spend money on beneficent departments. I claim no gift of prophesy, but I think the remarks that I made last week in the budget statement were not far from being accurate. I said "The curtailment of new programmes in the sphere of the departments classed as 'beneficent' may evoke the criticism previously heard in some quarters, namely, that the beneficent departments starve, while other departments of Government maintain, if not increase, their expenditure." Now I would draw the attention of honourable members to paragraph 8 of the Memorandum on the Budget and the figures appended thereto. It will be observed that the anticipated expenditure under the beneficent departments in 1930-31 is Rs. 340 lakhs while that on the Civil Administration is Rs. 343 lakhs. In other words, the expenditure under beneficent departments is now practically the same as that under civil administration. From the same figures it will appear that the expenditure on beneficent departments in 1921-22 was Rs. 170 lakhs and that it is now Rs. 340 lakhs. In other words, the expenditure on beneficent departments has increased a hundredfold. Similar figures for civil administration show that the expenditure which was Rs. 290 lakhs in 1921-22 has risen to Rs. 343 lakhs in the budget estimates for 1930-31, an increase of nearly 18 per cent.

One honourable member went actually so far as to say, as I understand from the '*Tribune*' report, that practically the whole of the provincial contribution remitted by the Central Government has been absorbed by the Civil Administration. I need hardly say that it is a statement which is not

borne out by facts. If we turn again to the figures in the statement attached to graph No. 3, it will be seen that the contribution from the Central Government amounted to Rs. 175 lakhs, and as I have already pointed out, the increase in the expenditure under Civil administration since 1921 is only about Rs. 53 lakhs. I need say no more. (*A voice*: It has been absorbed somewhere). As usual much stress has been laid on the excessive and growing expenditure under Police. May I remind honourable members that the expenditure on police in 1921-22 was Rs. 111 lakhs and in 1922-23, Rs. 122 lakhs, in the following years it was never less than Rs. 107 lakhs, and the figure now is Rs. 128 lakhs, an increase of just over 10 per cent. A few more words on the subject of police. Two honourable members deeply interested in the recruitment of Hindus in the police force, especially Hindu agriculturists, have urged their views on the subject this afternoon. I have had many conversations with them, and I can assure them that the subject will receive the attention it requires and that it has already been receiving attention. I am constantly in communication with the Inspector-General of Police on this subject. I shall also refer to the answer given by me to a question asked by an honourable member who is interested in the subject. I said that the paucity of Hindu agriculturists in the ranks of the police is due to the fact that few candidates from this class present themselves for enlistment. That is a statement which I think the honourable member will not disagree with. At the same time, I know he has other points of view to urge, and he has already urged them. I am taking them into account. The same honourable member mentioned the question of the Village Patrol Act. There again, in reply to his question in the July session I was able to tell him.—“In accordance with the statement made by the Honourable the Leader of the House, the reports of Commissioners, Deputy Commissioners and the Inspector-General of Police regarding the working of the Act were examined by the Standing Police Committee of this Council. The Standing Police Committee recommended that certain instructions should be issued to Commissioners with a view to ensuring the better working of the Act. Government have issued these instructions.” I may add that I have not the slightest objection to placing those instructions on the table.

One honourable member mentioned the question of the enrolment of the depressed classes. I think, if I have not misunderstood him, the answers to the question which he quoted were not quite those that are given in the local Hansard. He asked ‘whether it is a fact that members of the depressed classes are not recruited in the police department.’ The answer I gave him was, “Subject to any difference of opinion as to what classes may correctly be described as depressed classes, the policy of Government has already been explained in answer to question No. 466.” That answer was as follows :

“Members of the depressed classes are not enrolled in the police. When there is evidence that the depressed classes are treated on an equal footing by all sections of the community, or when Government is satisfied that enrolment of members of these classes will satisfy the requirements of efficiency and be in the best interests of the composition of the service, Government will be quite prepared to throw open recruitment to them, provided they come up to the physical and other standards required of all recruits.”

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

Another line of criticism was in the direction of retrenchment. In the view of many honourable members the best course was to cut down the salaries of high officials and the expenditure on the civil secretariat. I presume that this is the meaning of top heavy expenditure. In spite of the fascinating suggestion made by Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram that salaries should fluctuate with the seasons or with the provincial balances, I fear that there is not so much to be hoped from these suggestions, as from certain remarks put forward by Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hyat, Qureshi, who advocated close attention to the rates paid in the Public Works department. These suggestions have already been dealt with by the Honourable

6 P.M.

Minister for Agriculture. Other suggestions regarding expenditure and retrenchment have also been dealt with by Honourable Members and Ministers. I need only say that the Finance Department have already done their best to reduce the demands to the bare requirements of the departments and left no room for extravagance. Large cuts for probable savings will be found under all heads. Several members dealt with the subject of taxation. They appear to be chiefly interested in the reduction of taxation. One honourable member gave an instance of the best way to avoid paying a tax which he considered justified or excessive. It was not, however, expected that honourable members would be in a hurry to put forward suggestions for new taxation at a time like the present. There is one point, with regard to Stamps, which I should like to make clear. One honourable member spoke of this Government as the only Government which had the stamp duty at the present rates. But, generally speaking, the Punjab rates are much the same as in Madras and Bengal and are higher than in the United Provinces, that is to say, the Punjab does not stand out as the only province which takes a high rate of stamp duty. One suggestion which one might have heard, I myself do not think that I heard it, is that the collection of the existing taxation should be more rigidly enforced. I am sure that it must have been in the minds of all present.

The Finance Department are glad to hear that certain members found the statements and figures in the present budget clear and easy to follow. I sympathise deeply with the honourable member who complained of the size of the budget volume. He wished it to be reduced to the size of the excellent pamphlet which he assures us contains the Financial Accounts of the United Kingdom. He must be interested to hear that the matter is receiving our attention, and we have reduced the budget volume by over 60 pages. But still it is far from being the slim and graceful volume which he would like us to adopt. We should be glad to hear of any suggestion of this kind, and we will endeavour to do what we can to present to the House something more manageable than the formidable volume which is before me.

In conclusion, I must again express appreciation of the trouble which honourable members have taken in studying the budget figures and furnishing their suggestions. It must be admitted that the budget with a deficit in the revenue account calling for economy and retrenchment is not an inspiring subject for those interested in the development and the welfare of the province. It is only too clear that new resources must be found before

any step is taken on the road of progress, but I do not despair of these resources being forthcoming in one way or the other, to enable the province to continue its advance. After all we have, I think rightly, laid no stress on the possibilities of a good harvest in 1930-31. It may be that prosperous times may be in store for us, and the gloomy whispers of bankruptcy may be silenced. (*Cheers*).

The Council then adjourned till 2 P.M. on Saturday, the 8th March 1930.

---

PRINTED BY  
THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.

424 P.L.C.—600—2-1-30—SGPP Lahore.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Saturday, the 8th March 1930.*

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 p.m. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following member was sworn in—

MACNABB, Mr. A. C. (official nominated).

### STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

#### SHIKAR LICENSES.

\*2897. **Chaudhri Ram Singh :** (a) Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that in the shikar licenses renewed for the year 1930, a condition has been inserted to the effect that the license-holder is not entitled to purchase bullets and Groves cartridges ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the dealers in arms and ammunition have also been cautioned not to deal in those commodities ;

(c) if the answer to (a) above be in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state the reasons for imposing this restriction and the period during which the restriction shall remain in force ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) To prevent supplies of this type of ammunition from falling easily and without any form of check into the hands of persons who might pass them on to dacoits and other criminals who, as experience has recently clearly demonstrated, prefer for obvious reasons to arm themselves with the most deadly type of ammunition procurable. The restriction will be in force for three years in the first instance.

#### AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE, LYALLPUR.—DEATH OF A STUDENT.

\*2898. **Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that a student of the Agricultural College, Lyallpur, died a short time ago under suspicious circumstances ;

(b) whether any enquiry was held into the circumstances under which the said death took place ; and, if so, what is the result of that enquiry ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes. The results of the police investigation have not yet been communicated to the Principal of the College.

PRINCIPAL, AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE.

**\*2899. Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Principal of the Agricultural College, Lyallpur, occupies a bungalow within the boundaries of the College estate ;
- (b) on how many occasions during the last year the Principal has been pleased to pay a visit to the College itself ;
- (c) what is the number of lectures delivered by him to the various classes during the last year and on what subjects ;
- (d) what is the total number of hours spent by the Principal during the last year in the class rooms of the college and in actual supervision and superintendence of the work and other pursuits of the students ;
- (e) what is the manner in which the Principal of the Agricultural College carries out his duties of supervision over the staff and the students of the college ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be supplied to the honourable member when ready.

CHAUKIDARS AND SHAMILAT LANDS.

**\*2900. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the pay of chaukidars is realised from the residents of villages ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the cost of supplying uniforms to chaukidars is realised by *bachh* ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the *shamilat* lands are assessed to land revenue the amount of which is determined and realized from proprietors in proportion to the areas of their principal holdings in the village, or in proportion to the land revenue payable on such holdings ;
- (d) whether it is a fact that in certain villages the cost of the chaukidars' uniform is being realised from the income of the *shamilat* lands alone ; if so, why ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) The cost of supplying uniforms to chaukidars is provided by the village community out of the village *malba*, which is a cess imposed by land owners on themselves to meet common village expenses. The Deputy Commissioners of Hoshiarpur and Kangra districts have, however, been



authorised to meet, when they consider necessary, the cost of uniform of village chaukidars by the levy from occupants of houses in the village of a tax assessed on the annual value of such houses.

(c) Yes.

(d) Government has no information on the matter, but is making enquiries.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand :** With reference to part (b) of the question will the Honourable Member for Revenue please say under what law the cost of supplying the uniforms to chaukidars is realised from zamindars?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The people paying for services rendered are also believed to be responsible for clothing.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand :** Under what law?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Faz-i-Husain :** Surely there are conventions as well as laws.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Member kindly state whether it is a fact that in some districts Government supplies uniforms to the chaukidars?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Enquiries will have to be made to answer this question.

#### CORRUPTION IN GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENTS.

**\*2901. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state the steps taken or proposed to be taken to check corruption in the Government departments?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The honourable member is referred to the answer given to part (c) of his starred question<sup>1</sup> No. 2860 asked in the Council on the 27th February 1930.

#### GHORIPAL ZAMINDARS.

**\*2902. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Government is aware of the Ghoripal agitation;
- (b) what were the grievances of the Ghoripal zamindars;
- (c) whether the Government has appointed a committee to go into their grievances?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

- (b) (i) the continuance of horse-breeding conditions;
- (ii) the continuance of the rule of primogeniture;
- (iii) the administration of horse-breeding tenancies, more especially with regard to the penalty of resumption;
- (iv) Subsidiary matters connected with the Horse-breeding Society, and the various areas of land managed by the Army Remount Department.

(c) Yes, with regard to the third class of grievances.

## BOMB ACCIDENTS.

\*2903. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of bomb accidents and outrages in the provinces during the last six months;
- (b) the number of bombs recovered during the last six months;
- (c) the number of arrests made in connection with them?

**The Honourable Mr. A. M. Stow**: (a), (b) and (c) A statement is laid on the table.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF BOMB ACCIDENTS AND OUTRAGES, THE NUMBER OF BOMBS RECOVERED AND THE NUMBER OF ARRESTS MADE IN CONNECTION WITH THEM IN THE PUNJAB FROM 1ST AUGUST 1929 TO 17TH FEBRUARY 1930.

Serial No.	Place of occurrence.	Bombs recovered.	Bomb accidents.	Persons arrested.	REMARKS.
1	Village Jhugian, Police Station Garh Shankar, District Hoshiarpur.	1	1	3	One accused is common in these cases.
2	Police Station Garhshankar, District Hoshiarpur.	1	1	7	
3	Village Kutehla, Bilaspur State.	12	..	1	
4	Village Rauwal, Police Station Sidhwanbet, District Ludhiana.	4	1	3	
5	Ram Gali, Police Station Naulakha, Lahore.	..	1	2	
6	*Isa Khel, Police Station Isa Khel, District Mianwall.	1	—	..	
7	*Village Chasania, Police Station Kamar Mashani, District Mianwall.	1	..	..	
8	Hakiman Gate, Amritsar	1	—	5	
9	Atari Saraka, District Lahore.	..	1	1	
10	Near Ootroi Post, Multan..	..	1	3	
	Total ..	21	6	23	

\*These bombs were voluntarily surrendered and no action was taken against their possessors.

NOTE.—Since notice of question was received there has been a further bomb outrage at the Khalsa College, Amritsar, on 22nd February 1930. No arrests have been made up to date in this case.

## PRICES OF AGRICULTURAL PRODUCE.

**\*2904. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the prices of agricultural produce have fallen to a very large extent ;
- (b) if so, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The prices of some commodities have fallen in the last year.

- (b) No action is called for at this stage.

## IRRIGATION OF CROWN WASTE LANDS.

**\*2905. Sirdar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) the total area of Crown waste lands capable of being irrigated by means of wells ;
- (b) whether Government intend to make this available for distribution among people whose lands have become uneconomical as the result of fragmentation ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Figures are not available. If the honourable member will specify his meaning more precisely, efforts will be made to supply him with such information as may be available.

- (b) Does not arise.

## ZAILDARS AND SUFEDPOSHEES.

**\*2906. Sirdar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that it is the earnest desire of the village people that Zaildars and Sufedposhes should either be declared Government servants or that they should be appointed to their posts by election ;
- (b) if so, what action do the Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

- (b) Does not arise.

## CYCLING ON INSPECTION ROADS.

**\*2907. Sirdar Hira Singh, Narli :** (a) Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Irrigation Department has constructed reserved or inspection roads along the banks of all the canals ;

[S. Hira Singh, Narli.]

(b) whether it is a fact that for some time past the public has been forbidden to use these roads for cycling ;

(ii) if the answer to (i) be in the affirmative, will the Honourable Member kindly state whether the Government have framed any new rules in the matter of cycling on inspection roads ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) No, not bicycles.

(c) Does not arise.

#### CENSORSHIP OF CONGRESSITE PAPERS.

**\*2908. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the Government have under their consideration a proposal for censoring all Congressite papers ;

(b) if so, will the Honourable Member kindly state the reasons which have led Government to consider this proposal ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

#### RELEASE OF POLITICAL PRISONERS.

**\*2909. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state whether the Government of India have consulted the Punjab Government regarding the release of political prisoners ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The Government of India have not consulted the Punjab Government about the release of any class of prisoners.

#### ROUND TABLE CONFERENCE.

**\*2910. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

(a) whether it has been decided to invite representatives from the Punjab to attend the proposed Round Table Conference ;

(b) if so, what form of representation would be adopted for this purpose ;

(c) whether the representation will be on communal lines or whether it will take some other form ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a), (b) and (c) As the honourable member is no doubt aware, this is a matter which concerns the Government of India, to whom the views of the Legislative Council have been conveyed, as expressed in the Resolution moved in last session by the honourable member for Sialkot and passed by the House.

## HAILSTORMS.

**\*2911. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether he is aware of the fact that hail-storms have done a lot of damage in certain parts of the Province ;
- (b) if so, what measures have been adopted by the Government to give relief to the zamindars affected by this calamity ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No, though a few districts report some damage by hail.

- (b) It will be dealt with under the ordinary rules governing such cases.

## SUB-JUDGES' COURT AT HAMIRPUR.

**\*2912. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the nearest court of Sub-Judge to which the people of Hamirpur town can go is situated in Kangra, which is at a distance of between 60 and 70 miles from the place ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that there are two courts of Sub-Judges in Kangra ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the means of communication in the Kangra district are few and far between ;
- (d) if the answer to the above be in the affirmative, whether Government have under consideration any proposal to establish a court of Sub-Judge at Hamirpur ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Not for all cases. The Tahsildar, Hamirpur, tries money suits up to the value of Rs. 100. The Raja of Nadaun, sitting as an Honorary Sub-Judge, 15 miles from Hamirpur, tries money suits arising in his jagir villages up to the value of Rs. 750. Other suits, however, cannot be tried in any court nearer than that of a stipendiary Sub-Judge at Kangra. The distance between Hamirpur and Kangra is 44 miles only.

(b) Yes.

(c) Yes.

(d) No.

## SHANAN GENERATING STATION.

**\*2913. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the estimated output from generating station at Shanan as 36,000 K. W. is for 50 per cent. of the time and is only capable of giving 18,000 K. W. for 24 hours ;
- (b) how much of this will be available at consumer's terminal for sale ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I cannot say till I hear from the authority concerned who has been requested to supply the necessary information.

**APPOINTMENT OF INDIAN ASSISTANT ENGINEERS IN MANDI  
HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME.**

**\*2914. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that with only two exceptions no Indian has been taken as an Assistant Executive Engineer in Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme;

(b) if so, what action the Government proposes to take to increase the recruitment of Indians for these posts ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The services of five Indians were secured as Assistant Executive Engineers or in a post of equivalent rank in the Hydro-Electric Branch; three of these have left, of whom two left on the expiry of their periods of engagement and one to take up another appointment.

(b) All steps possible are already being taken to recruit suitable Indians to posts in the Hydro-Electric Branch.

**MANDI HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME AND KANGRA VALLEY RAILWAY.**

**\*2915. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture kindly state what would be the cost per unit in the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme if the cost of Kangra Valley Railway chiefly constructed for Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme is taken into account ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** Projects for constructing a railway through the Kangra Valley have been under consideration since 1900, and it was the additional transport demands arising out of the construction of a hydro-electric scheme in the valley which turned the scale in favour of construction in 1925 of a railway to serve the interests of both the public and of the hydro-electric scheme.

It is not correct therefore to suggest that the Kangra Valley Railway was chiefly constructed for the Mandi scheme.

This railway, which runs from Pathankot to Jogindernagar, should not, however, be confused with the tramway for part of the capital cost of which provision was made in the Mandi project of 1924. This tramway was designed on a different alignment and on different principles and was to have run from Mukerian to Shanan. The tramway was, however, excluded from the Mandi project as sanctioned, as prior to sanction being given, the Government of India had undertaken to build the Kangra Valley Railway.

The cost of the Kangra Valley Railway therefore has no direct bearing on the cost per unit of electricity generated by the Mandi scheme, and I am not prepared to calculate what is a hypothetical sum.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister kindly say what would be the cost per unit of generating electricity under the Mandi Hydro-Electric scheme,

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** It is calculated at present to be a little over 8 pies per unit, at 11,000 volt Busbars.

**HOLIDAYS FOR SUB-REGISTRARS.**

**\*2916. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that sub-registrars used to observe the same holidays which were allowed to the civil courts ;
- (b) whether recently these holidays have been curtailed by the Inspector-General of Registration ;
- (c) if so, what are the reasons for depriving the sub-registrars of this concession ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is regretted that a reply to the question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

**Mr. President :** May I just make a request to the Government Benches. At times it is difficult, no doubt, to collect, within the prescribed period of 15 days, the whole information required for answering a question ; but if full information were collected and the question answered within that period, that would, I think, enable the honourable members of the House to ask supplementary questions. A statement to the effect that the answer to a question is not ready and that it will be supplied to the honourable member concerned when ready, deprives the honourable members of the House of their right of asking supplementary questions. There may, no doubt, be cases in which Government Members may not be able to collect the whole information in time, but such cases cannot be very many. I would, therefore, request them to take, if possible, special steps to collect the requisite information in time, so that the honourable members of the House may be able to exercise their right of asking supplementary questions.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** With regard to this question and all questions that come to us for answer we do our best to collect the information within time.

**Mr. President :** I have no doubt that the Government Members do their best to collect the information in time. What I mean is that, if possible, they would please make greater efforts in future.

**MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE, MULTAN.**

**\*2917. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Multan Municipal Committee is seriously involved in debt ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the municipality have imposed heavy water-tax ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that a section of the public have started no-tax campaign and have refused to pay water-tax ;
- (d) if so, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) The municipal committee of Multan has taken two loans to finance the Electric and Water

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

Supply Schemes amounting in the former case to Rs. 5,00,000 and in the latter to Rs. 4,00,000.

(b) The municipal committee has imposed a water tax within the city walls and a house tax outside the walls at the rate of 4 per cent. per annum on the annual rental value of property, which is by no means heavy.

(c) A certain section of the public did start a no-tax campaign, but as explained below the campaign has been given up.

(d) I visited Multan myself on the 14th February and discussed the case, first with the municipal committee and, secondly, with the supporters of the no-tax campaign, and later at a joint meeting of the two bodies. It was unanimously resolved that the tax for two years should be paid up before the 31st March 1930, and on this understanding the committee have agreed to suspend the recovery of arrears through warrants of attachment until this date. The committee have further undertaken to examine, after the end of March 1930, their financial position with a view to arriving at a decision as to whether expenditure can be reduced and to what extent, if any, the taxes above-mentioned could be reduced or be replaced by other forms of taxation. Government hope that the above understanding will afford a solution of the question, but it must be pointed out that the solution depends primarily on the prompt payment of arrears. I regret to say that the latest information shows that this resolve to pay up the tax stands unfulfilled and no effort seems to have been made to pay up the arrears. Up to the end of February only Rs. 225 have been paid up. This consists of Rs. 220 paid by three municipal commissioners and Rs. 5 by a Government pensioner.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** Sir, I want to know whether certain questions which were starred by me have since been unstarred. May I know whether the Chair has done that of its own accord or whether some mistake has been made in the office ?

**Mr. President :** If the honourable member comes to my room with his complaint, I shall be very glad to satisfy him. I do sometimes change starred questions into unstarred ones.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** Thereby we are deprived of asking supplementary questions.

**Mr. President :** I do not want to enter into any discussion.

#### UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

##### IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICES.

**1558. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state the number of Forest Divisions now being held by Imperial Forest Service and Provincial Forest Service officers, respectively ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The number of Forest divisions held by officers of the Indian Forest Service is 15 and of the Provincial Forest Service 7.



## FOREST DEPARTMENT.

**1559. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) the forest area under the control of the department in 1908 and 1929, respectively ;
- (b) net surplus of the department in 1908 and 1929, respectively ;
- (c) number of gazetted officers in 1908 and 1929, respectively ;
- (d) net surplus per head of gazetted staff in 1908 and 1929 ;
- (e) forest area per head of gazetted staff in 1908 and 1929, respectively ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :**

	1908.	1929.
(a) Forest area .. .. .	9,138 square miles.	5,341 square miles.
(b) Net surplus .. .. .	3.58 lakhs	5.66 akhs.
(c) Number of gazetted officers ..	*20	*50
(d) Net surplus per head of gazetted officers ..	17 800	11,320
(e) Forest area per head of gazetted officers ..	457	107

\*Excludes officers serving in the North-West Frontier Province and on deputation.

## COST OF FIREWOOD AT CHHANGA MANGA RAILWAY STATION.

**1560. Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state the cost per hundred maunds of firewood delivered at Chhanga-Manga railway station by bullock tramway before 1915 and the present cost for delivery at the station by locomotive tramway ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## IRRIGATION UNDER UPPER BARI DOAB CANAL.

**1561. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing separately for the years 1890, 1910 and 1929—

- (a) the discharge of water (in cusecs) from the Upper Bari Doab Canal ;
- (b) the area (in acres) irrigated by this canal ;
- (c) the average rate of *abiana* levied ;
- (d) the total amount of *abiana* collected ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The statement appended below gives the information asked for :—

	1889-90.	1909-10.	1928-29.
Discharge (in aunes) .. ..	990,800	1,275,812	1,705,103
Area irrigated (in acres) ..	523,409	982,773	1,340,688
Average rate of <i>abiana</i> levied ..	2.50	3.40	4.33
Total <i>abiana</i> collected ..	1,278,199	3,226,310	5,327,745

#### AUCTION OF LANDS IN THE NILI BAR.

**1562. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- the extent of auctioned lands in the Nili Bar confiscated as the result of non-payment of instalments at the proper time ;
- the total amount of money so confiscated by Government ;
- whether it is a fact that in the case of the old colonies, Government granted lands to the defaulters elsewhere equivalent in value to the moneys confiscated ;
- if so, what action Government intend to take in the case of defaulters of the Nili Bar ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The total area confiscated up to the 30th September, 1929, on account of non-payment of instalments, was 6,075 acres.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to part (a) of his question<sup>1</sup> No. 1258 (unstarred) asked on the 30th July 1929.

(c) No.

(d) Does not arise.

#### SCHOOLS AND COLLEGES FOR GIRLS.

**1563. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- what is the number of middle and high schools and intermediate colleges in the Punjab for girls ;
- how many of these schools and colleges are situated in Lahore and how many of them are situated outside Lahore ;
- if it is a fact that none of the colleges is situated outside Lahore ; what steps, if any, does Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (i) There are 109 recognised middle and high schools for girls in the Punjab. Information for unrecognised schools for girls is not readily available and is not included in these

figures. There are no intermediate colleges for girls in the province, but there are two degree colleges for women at Lahore.

(ii) There are 13 middle schools, 8 high schools and 2 colleges for girls in Lahore; and 93 middle and high schools for girls are situated outside Lahore.

(iii) The answer to the first part of the question as stated above is in the affirmative; Government has no proposal before it to take any action in the matter at present.

#### HEAD MISTRESSES OF GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOLS.

**1564. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) how many of the Head Mistresses of girls' high schools in the Punjab are in provincial service, and what are their qualifications;
- (b) how many of them are in subordinate service and what are their qualifications;
- (c) whether it is a fact that all the European and Anglo-Indian Head Mistresses are provided with free quarters while none of the other Head Mistresses are provided with free quarters or allowances in lieu of the same; if so, what is the reason for this differentiation?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :—**

- (a) 2. (1) High School Certificate for Europeans.  
(2) B.A., B.T.

- (b) 11. (1) Matric, S.A.V.  
(2) F.A., S.A.V.  
(3) B.A., B.T.  
(4) M.A.  
(5) F.A., S.A.V.  
(6) B.A.  
(7) Matric.  
(8) F.A., S.A.V.  
(9) Matric, J.A.V.  
(10) Vacant.  
(11) M.A., B.T.

(c) No.

#### GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOLS, AMRITSAR.

**1565. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (i) whether it is a fact that the Girls' High School at Amritsar has been provincialised; if so, when;
- (ii) whether it is a fact that the inspecting authorities consider the present hired building as unfit for school purposes;

[L. Kesho Ram, Sekhri.]

- (iii) if the answer to part (ii) be in the affirmative whether Government intend to house the school in a permanent building, and, if so, when?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (i) Yes, in May, 1929.

(ii) Yes.

(iii) Steps are being taken to rent more suitable building from an early date.

#### GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOL, AMRITSAR.

**1566. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (i) whether the sanctioned staff has been employed in the Government High School for girls at Amritsar; if not, why not;  
(ii) whether it is a fact that no conveyance has been provided by the school authorities for conveying girls to and from the school;  
(iii) if so, whether the Government propose to take any steps to provide a conveyance?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) No; because the number of girls in attendance is less than was anticipated.

(b) Tongas are being used.

(c) Does not arise.

#### HYDRO-ELECTRIC BRANCH APPRENTICE ENGINEERS.

**1567. Dr. Sir Muhammad Iqbal :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture kindly state, with reference to Hydro-Electric Branch, Public Works Department—

- (a) the number of posts of Apprentice Engineers created for Transmission Line work;  
(b) the number of posts out of these held (1) by Hindus and (2) by Muslims?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The attention of the honourable member is invited to the answer given to part (ii) of Council Question<sup>1</sup> No. 2882.

#### GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOL, AMRITSAR.

**1568. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that there was a whole-time clerk in the Government High School for Girls at Amritsar when the school was under the management of the municipality;  
(b) whether it is a fact that the whole-time clerk has now been replaced by a part-time clerk; if so, for what reasons?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes; it is the normal practice in girls' schools to employ the services of a part-time clerk who attends in out of school hours.

**FLOOD AFFECTED LANDS IN KHAHRAN AND ANDAURA TALUQA.**

**1569. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to lay on the table a statement giving the following information with regard to the villages lying on either bank of the river Beas in the Khairan and Andaura taluqas of tahsil Nurpur, district Kangra—

(a) the total area under cultivation as shown in the Settlement Reports of 1891-92 and 1917-18, respectively, and the total area under cultivation now;

(b) the total cultivated area of these villages swept away during the last six years with details of the area so lost by each village?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The question has necessitated a reference to local authorities. The reply will be communicated to the honourable member on receipt of their reports.

**CONSTRUCTION OF A BUND AT DHOLBAHA.**

**1570. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that Government had under consideration a proposal for the construction of a bund at Dholbaha in the Hoshiarpur district;

(b) if so, what action has so far been taken to give effect to this proposal?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) There is a proposal to train the Dholbaha Cho by means of guide banks, with the object of protecting the adjacent culturable land from the action of floods in the Cho which spread sand and thus render the soil unculturable.

(b) The proposal is being examined from all points of view and no final decision has so far been reached.

**CONSTRUCTION OF A BUND OVER THE BEAS AT PADSI.**

**1571. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the Government propose to construct a bund on the banks of the Beas at Padsī near Shitabkot in the Hoshiarpur district;

(b) if so, what action has so far been taken in the matter, and what is the amount proposed to be spent in this connexion?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) A marginal bund already exists along the left bank of the Beas river for protection of the country behind the bund from floods. The river is cutting through the left bank into the western Bein nallah, and there is a danger of the river changing its

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

course near Shitabkot. Proposals to check erosion are in hand and detailed estimates are being prepared.

(b) The expenditure on this work will be shared by the Punjab Government, the North-Western Railway and the Kapurthala State, as all these three parties are concerned. The probable cost of the work will be over two lakhs of rupees.

#### COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION AMONG TAHSILDARS.

**1572. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state the number of Tahsildars directly recruited during the last three years and the number of Hindus, Mussalmans and Sikhs amongst them and out of Hindus the number of Rajputs ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The number of Tahsildars directly recruited during the last three years is as follows :—

Mussalmans	..	..	..	16
Hindus	..	..	..	8
Sikhs	..	..	..	5
Indian Christian	..	..	..	1

Of Hindus one is a Rajput.

#### AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE, LYALLPUR—EXPULSIONS.

**1573. Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state the number and names of the students who have either been expelled from the Agricultural College, Lyallpur, or have discontinued their studies in the College during the last six years ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### WATER-LIFTING BRANCH AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT.

**1574. Chaudhri Zafrullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether there is a Water Lifting Branch of the Department of Agriculture ;
- (b) if so, how many engineers are employed in this branch and what are their respective salaries ;
- (c) on how many occasions during the last six years did these engineers travel together, and on each of these occasions for how many miles did they travel by train and motor, respectively, and what amount was allowed for their total travelling allowances and what was the object of the journey on each of those occasions ;
- (d) whether these engineers have ever visited the Kangra district and the hilly parts of the Gurdaspur district ;

- (f) if so, whether they have ever prepared a water-lifting scheme to be put in operation by private agency or through Government, and whether such scheme has been put in operation or not, and, if not, why not?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### JATHAS OF EX-MILITARY MEN.

**1575. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of women that have been arrested in the different districts for taking part in *jathas* of the ex-military men in October, November and December 1929;
- (b) how long each woman was kept in police and judicial custody;
- (c) the number of ex-military men who have been arrested under section 107, Criminal Procedure Code, in each district;
- (d) the number among those who are referred to in (c) who are still in jail?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### POLITICAL PRISONERS.

**1576. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of political prisoners undergoing imprisonment in the Punjab jails;
- (b) the number of prisoners who have not been classed as special class prisoners and the reasons for denying them this concession?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** If the honourable member will define more closely what he means by "political" prisoners in part (a) of the question and by "prisoners" in part (b), the information will be obtained.

#### NON-OFFICIAL PRESIDENTS OF DISTRICT BOARDS.

**1577. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of district boards whose presidents are non-official gentlemen;
- (b) whether there is any proposal under the consideration of Government to introduce the system of elected Presidents in all such bodies?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Two : Gujranwala and Gurjat.

(b) The decision of Government is contained in Resolution No. 4774 dated the 20th February, 1925. This is to the effect that if 60 per cent. of the non-official members of a board of which three quarters of the members are elected decide at a meeting specially called for the purpose to request Government to allow the board to elect a non-official chairman, such request will ordinarily be accepted. In the beginning of 1928 the attention of district boards was again drawn to this circular, but no request for a non-official chairman was received.

#### INDIAN ENGINEERS IN HYDRO-ELECTRIC BRANCH.

**1578. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state with reference to Council Question<sup>1</sup> No. 1246 asked on 30th July 1929—

(a) how the percentage of 27.77 of Indian officers has been arrived at ;

(b) how the figures of the total amount paid in salaries to European officers have been made up ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I cannot say till I hear from the authority concerned who has been requested to supply the necessary information.

#### DISCHARGE IN THE UHL RIVER.

**1579. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

(a) the minimum discharge of Uhl river in cusecs ;

(b) the minimum discharge assumed on which the generation of 36,000 K. W. is based at 50 per cent. time ;

(c) what would be the total capacity in K. W. for 24 hours hundred per cent. of the time ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I cannot say till I hear from the authority concerned who has been requested to supply the necessary information.

#### MR. McLEOD, SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER.

**1580. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that after the sanction of the Mandi scheme by the Punjab Legislative Council, the Under-Secretary Mr. Macleod was elevated to the post of a Superintending Engineer to supervise the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme by superseding 32 senior men ;

(b) whether Colonel Battye himself selected Mr. Macleod for Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme or whether he was recommended by Mr. Sangster, Chief Engineer, Punjab Irrigation, who opposed the Madhopur Scheme or whether Mr. Macleod himself applied for the post ;



- (c) on what grounds or merits Mr. Macleod was selected for the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I cannot say till I hear from the authority concerned who has been requested to supply the necessary information.

MR. McLEOD, SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER.

**1581. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Mr. Macleod is not holding charge as Superintending Engineer of Construction nor of the Hydro-Electric Circle, but of an administrative circle ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that no administrative circle has ever been created in India before ;
- (c) whether the Government is aware that such work as is entrusted to Mr. Macleod is being done by the officers of the Executive Engineer's rank in all provinces under all Chief Engineers throughout India ;
- (d) if the answer to the above parts be in the affirmative what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) and (c) As these parts of the question relate to the whole of India I am not in a position to answer them.

(d) Does not arise.

MANDI HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME.

**1582. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to furnish in the following form information with respect to the working of the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme :—

<i>Particulars.</i>	<i>Cost of power per unit in pies.</i>	
(1) Administration .. ..	..	..
(2) Generation .. ..	..	..
(3) Transmission .. ..	..	..
(4) Distribution .. ..	..	..
(5) Depreciation .. ..	..	..
(6) Provident Fund .. ..	..	..
(7) Interest .. ..	..	..

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** As the Mandi Hydro-Electric scheme is not yet working it is not possible to say what the cost of power is.

COMMISSION ALLOWED TO SUB-REGISTRARS.

**1583. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Sub-Registrars are allowed certain commission only on registration fee while they are not allowed any

[Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri.]

commission on copying fee, especially when they have to compare and certify copies ;

(b) if so, why ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is regretted that a reply to the question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### POSTING OF CLERKS IN SUB-REGISTRAR'S OFFICE.

**1584. Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether the attention of Government has been drawn to Circular No. 2822, dated 22nd November 1924, from Inspector-General of Registration, Punjab, regarding the posting of clerks in Sub-Registrar's office ;

(b) whether that circular has been followed ; if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is regretted that a reply to the question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### KHAN BAHADUR SHEIKH NUR ELAHI'S LITERARY WORKS.

**1585. Lala Gopal Das :** Will the Honourable the Minister for Education be pleased to state—

(a) which of the books written, compiled or revised by Khan Bahadur Sheikh Nur Elahi, Inspector of Schools, Lahore Division, either by himself or jointly with others, have been approved or not approved by the Department of Public Instruction, Punjab, as text-books, prize or library books ;

(b) which of the approved books are in use in schools in the Punjab, especially in the division in which the Sheikh Sahib is the Inspector ;

(c) to what extent his official position is responsible for the use and sale of his books ;

(d) what action, if any, Government proposes to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) The list of books by Khan Bahadur Sheikh Nur Elahi both approved and not approved is laid on the table.

(b) Information is not available in the office of the Director of Public Instruction and is being collected. It will be communicated to the honourable member when it is ready.

(c) and (d) It is not possible to measure, to any degree of precision, the extent to which an officer's position may be held responsible for the use and sale of his books. However, with a view to guard against an inspector using his official position for extending the use and sale of his books, Government has provided certain safeguards in their C. M. No. 18511-B, dated the 16th August, 1929, a copy of which is put on the table.

**LIST OF APPROVED BOOKS WRITTEN, COMPILED OR REVISED BY KHAN  
BAHADUR SHEIKH NUR ELAHI, M.A., I.E.S., INSPECTOR OF SCHOOLS,  
LAHORE DIVISION.**

1-4	Urdu-ki-Pahli, Dusra, Tisri, aur Chauthi Kitab by Bakhshi Ram Das and revised by Shaikh Nur Elahi.	Alternative books.	text-
5-8	Murraq-i-Adab, Parts I, II, III and IV .. ..	Ditto.	
9	Ahmad Najumi .. ..	Supplementary Readers.	
10	Miao Miao .. ..	Ditto.	
11	Rafiq-i-Urdu, Part I .. ..	Ditto.	
12	Shahzada Gwala .. ..	Library books.	
13	Mian Budhu .. ..	Ditto.	
14	Mai Beeha .. ..	Ditto.	
15	Shamas aur uski Gaye .. ..	Ditto.	
16	Sair-i-Dunya, Part I .. ..	Ditto.	
17	Lakshami .. ..	Ditto.	
18	Shamshi .. ..	Ditto.	
19	Gohar Bano .. ..	Ditto.	
20	Australia ki Kahani .. ..	Ditto.	
21	Maghrur Malik .. ..	Ditto.	
22	Nawab Sherli Khan aur unki Billi .. ..	Ditto.	
23	Kukrun kun .. ..	Ditto.	
24	Gutter Gun .. ..	Ditto.	
25	Mian Koshish .. ..	Ditto.	
26	Raja Mor .. ..	Ditto.	
27	Takht-i-Sulemani .. ..	Ditto.	
28	Jangli Shahzadi .. ..	Ditto.	
29	Hai meri nak .. ..	Ditto.	
30	Chin Chin .. ..	Ditto.	
31	Ap Biti, Parts I and II .. ..	Ditto.	
32	Chanda Mann, No. I .. ..	Ditto.	
33	Shahzada Gadariya .. ..	Ditto.	
34	Rafiq-i-Zamindar, Parts I and II .. ..	For use in Adult Schools.	

**BOOKS NOT APPROVED.**

- 1 Hindi Biti, by Lala Dev Ditta Mall and revised by Khan Sahib Sheikh Nur Elahi.
- 2 Andher Nagri, Parts I and II.

Copy of letter No. 13511-B., dated Lahore the 16th August 1929, from Sir George Anderson, Kt., C. I. E., M.A., Under-Secretary to Government Punjab (Ministry of Education, to all Divisional and District Inspectors of Schools, Members of Director of Public Instruction's Headquarters staff, Deputy Directress of Public Instruction, Inspectresses of Schools, Heads of Government Colleges and Schools, Secretary, Text Book Committee Punjab, Superintendent of Education, Delhi Province, and Superintendent, Reformatory School, Delhi.

In supersession of Mr. Godley's circular No. 10, serial No. 988, dated the 16th February, 1917, and of Mr. Sanderson's C. M. No. 17985-B., dated the 15th November, 1927, on the subject of the production of text-books for use in schools and colleges in this province, I am directed to communicate the following orders of Government for the guidance of all officers of the Education Department.

2. Under rule 15 of the 'Government Servants' Conduct Rules, a Government servant may undertake occasional work of a literary or artistic character, provided that his public duties do not suffer thereby, but Government reserves to itself the right to forbid him to undertake or to require him to abandon any employment which in its opinion is undesirable. The rate

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

of fees which can be accepted in the case of work undertaken on behalf of a private person or private body is subject to the provisions of rule 46 of the Fundamental Rules and the subsidiary rules thereunder.

3. The circulars referred to in paragraph 1 of this letter laid down certain rules for the guidance of all educational officers in regard to the production by them of books specially designed for use in educational institutions. These rules make no distinction between the members of the teaching and the inspecting staffs, nor do they differentiate between text-books for use in schools, text-books prescribed by the University for its examinations, and books which can be regarded as works of scholarship first and text-books afterwards. It seems desirable to make a distinction between these two classes of officers and between the several categories of books.

4. The following revised orders on the subject are therefore issued :—

(a) In the case of literary work undertaken for a private person or body, the officer whose services have been commissioned shall before undertaking the work obtain the permission of the Head of the Department.

(b) The acceptance of fees for such work will be subject to rule 46 of the Fundamental Rules.

(c) In cases in which the book so commissioned is intended for use as a text-book in the primary and middle departments of schools and is approved by competent authority as such, the permission, if granted, will be subject to the condition that the writer if he is a member of the inspecting branch, or on the staff of the Central Training College, shall not retain a pecuniary interest in the sale of the book in the Punjab; in other words, he will be permitted to receive payment of a royalty for all copies sold outside the Punjab. In the case of books commissioned by the Punjab University or prescribed for use in one of its examinations, the writer or editor shall be permitted to receive payment of a royalty for copies sold whether inside or outside the Punjab.

(d) In the case of books written by an inspecting officer or by a member of the staff of the Central Training College on his own initiative, specially for use as text-books in the primary and middle departments of schools, and approved by competent authority for the purpose, the same conditions as given in (c) above shall apply. The orders contained in sections (c) above and (d) shall not apply to educational officers employed in the teaching branch. If, however, any such officer be transferred to an inspecting post, or to the staff of the Central Training College, he shall forthwith comply with the orders detailed above. The conditions mentioned in sections (c) and (d) shall not apply to books which are works of scholarship first and text-books afterwards, i.e., for example, books of general academic interest, literary works and books of reference designed for teachers and for higher education. For such works any officer in the Education Department may receive a royalty.

(e) In every case officers of the Education Department shall, before writing any text-book, obtain the permission of the Head of the Department to undertake such work and shall submit to him a copy of the agreement entered into between himself and the person or persons who publish his work, or who have commissioned him to do the work.

(f) All officers of the Education Department shall submit to the Head of the Department annually a statement on the attached prescribed form showing the amount of money received as remuneration for the writing of text-books and other books and for royalties received on account of the sale of such books.

(g) No officer of the Education Department shall be permitted to publish his own works, except with the permission of Government.

(h) These orders shall take effect from the date of issue of this circular and shall not be retrospective, though in the accounts submitted under section (f) all sums received in royalties during 1928-29 for books written before the date of this circular must be included.

*Statement showing income derived by \_\_\_\_\_ from books during the financial year \_\_\_\_\_.*

(To reach Office of Director of Public Instruction by 1st October 1929, in respect of income during 1928-29 and by 1st July in future years.)

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Name of the book.	Name of the author or joint author with his official designation.	Publishers	Lump sum received on account of sale of copy right and No. and date of Director of Public Instruction's letter sanctioning its acceptance.	Amount of royalty received and No. and date of Director of Public Instruction's letter sanctioning the acceptance of royalty on the book.	Total amount received. (Total of columns 4 and 5).	REMARKS.
			Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	

N. B.—

- (Column 1). In case of an approved text-book, add (T.B.) to its name.
- (Column 1). All the text-books written by the same author should be named first.
- (Column 2). In case of a joint-author add the names of the other joint-authors.

*Signature.*

*Designation.*

*Date.*

## CORRUPTION AMONG POLICE OFFICERS.

**1588. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of gazetted Police officers in the Punjab who have been charged with corruption during the last five years ;
- (b) whether the charge was established against them ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR SUPPLEMENTARY AND ADDITIONAL GRANTS, 1929-30.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow (Finance Member) :** Sir, I beg to present the additional and supplementary grants specified in the continuous list of Government business. These have all been recommended by His Excellency the Governor.

## LAND REVENUE.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain (Revenue Member) :** Sir, I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 8,260 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Land Revenue.”

The motion was carried.

## FOREST CAPITAL EXPENDITURE.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Sir, I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 6,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Forest Capital Expenditure.”

The motion was carried.

## IRRIGATION EXPENDITURE.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Sir, I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 9,90,360 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Irrigation Expenditure.”

The motion was carried.

## IRRIGATION (CAPITAL) EXPENDITURE.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Sir, I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 7,67,255 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Irrigation (Capital).”

The motion was carried.

GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (RESERVED).

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Sir, I beg to move—

"That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,69,020 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of General Administration (Reserved)."

The motion was carried.

ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member) : Sir, I beg to move—

"That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 4,05,470 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Administration of Justice."

The motion was carried.

POLICE.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** Sir, I beg to move—

"That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,00,150 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Police."

**Mr. President :** The supplementary demand moved is—

"That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,00,150 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Police."

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** (Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana, Muhammadan, Rural) : Sir, I beg to move—

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 24,680 with respect to the item of Rs.24,680, District Executive Force."

I have carefully gone through the note that has been supplied to us by the Government with respect to this demand and I find that the Government takes its stand on the Lumsden Committee's recommendation. It is stated that that committee have recommended an increase of 696 foot constables and 400 assistant sub-inspectors partially compensated for by the decrease of 10 sub-inspectors and 187 head constables. Thus it is claimed that the Government have only demanded a small sum for only 450 foot constables, 85 head constables, one inspector and one superintendent. Now, if we look at the memorandum of Mr. Penny, it will be observed that already sanction for 1,106 foot constables has been given. Not only that. The note says that according to the Lumsden Committee's report the cost of this additional force will be Rs. 5,69,000. The expenditure in this department in the last five years, has, however, been Rs. 12 lakhs. If you have spent Rs. 12 lakhs in the last five years, what is the good of demanding for this additional police force? The Government has not only increased the force by 696 foot constables, but sanction has already been accorded for 1,106 foot constables. I do not know, Sir, what is the use of putting forward this note and the suggestion of the Lumsden Committee. When the Lumsden Committee suggested and recommended the increase of this force, why is it considered advisable that this honourable House should give its sanction to this increase?

[Chaudhri Afzal Haq.]

But, Sir, it is claimed in this note that because the Congress has passed the independence resolution and that other bodies are going to support the programme of non-violence civil disobedience, therefore, we want this extra force. Well, Sir, if really you want extra constables for the civil disobedience programme what was your position in the years 1921 and 1922? You had little force at your disposal at that time and you controlled the position well. You have spent about 20 lakhs of rupees more than you spent in 1921-22 on the Police department, but in spite of that increase you say that you are unable at present to control the coming civil disobedience. What is the position of the Government to-day? With 18 thousand foot constables, sub-inspectors and inspectors you were able ten years ago to control the position of the province while civil disobedience was going on. But now after ten years you. . . .

**Mr. President :** Is the honourable member addressing the Honourable the Finance Member, or the Chair?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, I am addressing the Chair. Now, Sir, I was submitting that it has always been my painful duty to criticise this department. But, Sir, whatever unpleasantness there may be, duty is duty which ought to be performed. I must say, Sir, to my mind there are two reasons for the unrest in the country. One is the economic distress of the province, and the other, the high-handedness of the police. Without removing the one, the economic distress, you are aggravating the situation by increasing the other, your police force all the more. There is a man who is dying by a full doze of arsenic, but you are giving him another doze for his recovery. People in this province abhor the police organization and their methods and it has been brought to your notice and to the notice of this honourable House time and again by censuring the Police department, that the present force is no good. But in spite of the unanimous verdict of this honourable House, Government is going to increase this force and they want to commit this honourable House for that increase. I ask, Sir, what for are you going to increase this force? It has been brought to your notice, Sir, that with the increase of the police force, crimes in this province have also increased. No one can challenge the truth of this. When you have already seen that the crimes with the increase of the police force show no sign of decrease, why, Sir, then you are going to increase the spread of crimes? Since 1919, Sir, take any number of years and compare with any year with any other, you will find that there is an appreciable increase in crimes in this province. And in spite of that, Sir, we are made to believe that if this increase is not sanctioned, we will not be able to control and defeat the non-co-operation propaganda. I believe, Sir, that by these methods the Government cannot improve the situation in this province. I say co-operate with the people, respect the people, look to their miseries and you will find the followers of Mahatma Gandhi coming to your help. If you are going to increase the force, and if by brutal force you want to crush all the people, you will yourself increase the trouble. Sir, before the advent of the Reforms, the police force could manage a crowd of 20 thousand people but with a staff, but after the Reforms set in, the police force have been provided with *lathies*. Now, Sir, for ten years, full ten years, you have allowed the police officers to break



the heads of innocent people. They freely use *lathies* on innocent persons and harmless crowds. But in spite of that, Sir, you have seen bombs everywhere, in every city, not only in every city, but in every village. If you are going to increase the force for putting down the crimes, what will you do with civil disobedience? Those who are breaking the law by criminal methods you could not effectively control them even, I am sure, you will not be able to put down this non-violent non-co-operation. You say, Sir, that the saner people will come to your help and succour. Have you really one honest co-operator, a single honest man with you, except a few toadies? With the help and co-operation of honest people you can really do without the aid of an increased police force. If you really want to crush any movement you can easily crush it without any increase in the force, provided you rally round the straightforward citizens and get their co-operation. I invite your attention, Sir, to the words of the Secretary of State for India. He said that without the co-operation of the people the Government cannot control the situation in India. One constable cannot control 20 thousand people without their co-operation. Are you, Sir, really going to co-operate with the honest people? I think, Sir, it is your duty not to increase the police force but try to co-operate with the people and have their responsive co-operation. But, Sir, where is the change of heart? Is there any sign of the change of heart? Repression is going on in full swing and Government take pride and hurl threat after threat. What is the use of these threat. I tell you frankly, if the Government wants the co-operation of the people it will not be forthcoming with threats. Where there is love, threat is of no avail. If you really begin to love the people, there will be no occasion for threat. You say, the saner element of the country will come to help you. I say, who is saner than Mahatma Gandhi, who claims to be saner than his disciple Rajagopalachari, who is saner than Vallabhai Patel?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Those who are in the Councils.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I say, Sir, there is not a single member, not even those who are at the helm of affairs in this country, I mean even Lord Irwin.

**Mr. President :** Order, order. The honourable member need not discuss His Excellency the Governor-General.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I was not going to criticise His Excellency the Governor-General.

**Mr. President :** I did not say that the honourable member was criticising. All I said was that, if possible, he need not discuss His Excellency the Governor-General.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Well, Sir, there is no one in this country, even in this honourable House to whatsoever party or school of thought he may belong who can deny the fact that Mahatama Gandhi and his disciples are the sanest section of the people in this country. If the Government cannot

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

get the co-operation of those gentlemen where is the good, and what is the necessity of an appeal to the saner element in this province to come to the help of the Government? If you think that this non-co-operation movement could be suppressed by police force without the good-will of the people you are mistaken. If really Government is afraid of bomb throwers and believe that they do not need the co-operation of the people, I do not think that four hundred or five hundred constables can control the situation. It is the co-operation of the people that will make the situation calm, but without the co-operation of the people, this additional force will do nothing. It is said in this note: 'Government believes that the loyalty and sanity of the overwhelming majority of the people of the province will reject any programme of civil disobedience,' and 'they consider it to be their duty to take such measures as will protect all classes from the pernicious consequences of this campaign and to take reasonable precautions against the attempt (which it is the declared policy of the Congress to make) to subvert ordered Government and threaten right.'

Why are these words there? Those are very significant words. They are there because Government are afraid that without this fear being held out before them, honourable members of this House will not support the present demand. Unless that bogey of subversion of law and order is created, Government feel certain that their demand will not be supported. If they really want law and order, it is their duty to do justice to the demands of the people, to hear advice from all quarters and remedy the state of affairs. I find the appeal made in the name of loyalty. For my part I am loyal and can be loyal only to the Crown. I say so and I proclaim it that I am loyal only to the Crown; I am not loyal to every law. I may be considered a breaker of the law and dealt with as such, but it does not mean that I have swerved from the oath of allegiance to the Crown. If you concede that responsibility is introduced in this Council, then, what do you mean by loyalty? Loyalty in the real sense of the term can only be in relation to the Crown and applying it in that sense, we are all loyal. But if you make bad laws, if you impose heavy taxes on the people without looking to the ability and capacity of the tax-payer, it is my bounden duty, if I think fit, to disobey those laws and not to pay taxes. These words are intended to frighten the people, to frighten even those who want to work in the constitution from within. They could well have been used 20 years ago for they carry no weight now, after the reforms. One Minister may come into the seat of power and say: I am part and parcel of Government; you ought to be loyal to me. The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal will say: Yes, I am a Minister, part and parcel of the Government; you are to respect me and be loyal to me. To whom should I be loyal? Loyal first to my conscience, to God and to my country, and to the King Emperor and not loyal to the Executive Councillors and Ministers. I think that the system of Government and its present policy do not warrant that we should be loyal to them. In my opinion, therefore, these words have been used as a threat to the House.

Finally, I would make this appeal to the Honourable the Finance Member. For God's sake, do not increase the police force which has been already

increased to its utmost capacity judged by the ability of the tax-payer to meet the burden. It will be kind of the honourable member if he is bold enough to disband the police force altogether, for then, we will find more peace and prosperity, more law-abiding people in the land than at present. (Mr. F. Maya Das: Any country in the world like that?) The honourable member is looking at this slave country with the bureaucratic mentality, with the vision of honourable members on the benches opposite. There is law no doubt, but you cannot expect order from the people. There is bound to be disorder and it will be worse if you are going to increase the expenditure on the police department.

With these words, I move my motion and hope that the honourable House will accept it without division.

**Mr. President:** Demand under consideration. Amendment moved is—

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 24,630 with respect to the item of Rs. 24,630 District Executive Force."

**Mr. Din Muhammad** [East and West Central Towns, Non-Muhammadan, Urban]: Sir, I beg to oppose this motion, and in doing so, I realise my full responsibility. I have taken up this attitude not because that I feel I am not patriotic, or lack in my love of my country or have no desire to see the country advance, but because I feel convinced that it would be highly detrimental to the interests of the law-abiding citizens of the province if this demand is refused. It is a matter of common knowledge that the condition of the country to-day is not the same as it was this day last year, when Pandit Moti Lal Nehru was the prophet of the day and his revelation was the Nehru Report. Even the most advanced politician of the extremist wing believed in Dominion Status under the aegis of the British Crown. All efforts were devoted to spread this propaganda and to popularise this political creed that Indians should be satisfied with Dominion Status under the protection of the British Crown. The close of that year however saw a great metamorphosis wrought in the political creed of the country. A week before the year ended, the whole country was shocked by the diabolical outrage that was perpetrated at Delhi on the Viceregal train. Six days later Congress sat here and the dawn of 1930 saw the Independence flag unfurled and heard the declaration of independence announced. I would not for one moment attack the *bona fides* or the intentions of those gentlemen who sincerely believe that independence is their goal. That is not, however, the point to be discussed. Nor are we here concerned with a discussion of the merits of the police force in general. We are here faced only with one problem, i.e., whether we should sanction the demand that has now been made to retain the services of the additional police, which was engaged in September 1929, which was sanctioned by this House in November 1929 and for which a longer lease of life for another six months is requested by the executive government. That is the only question now before the House.

Conditions, as I have submitted to the House, have changed with the dawn of 1930 and since then, we have been living in a constant din of revolutionary shouts. Every day we find a bomb-thrower arrested; every day we find a manufacturer of bomb chased by the police. A few days ago a conspiracy to manufacture bombs was detected in Lahore and it is still

[ Mr. Din Muhammad, ]

pending investigation. It was only ten or fifteen days ago that an innocent life was lost at Amritsar where innocent students were assembled just for their own academic purposes. Every day the papers bring some news of the discovery of a bomb in this nook or that corner of the country. If that is the state of affairs and if the executive that is responsible for the maintenance of law and order, for preserving the dignity of law and for affording safety and security to the law-abiding citizen, if that executive feels that the present force is insufficient and that to cope with the new situation, additional force is necessary, who are we to say, No? Remember, Sir, that if once you refuse this demand and if an untoward incident happens, you shift the whole responsibility on to your own shoulders. So long as their demand is met the responsibility is theirs. As soon as their demand is refused you give them a loop-hole of escape. Anyhow, you give them this argument to be used against you: "We warned you; we were honest enough to confess our weakness; we demanded additional force; you refused; and if an untoward incident has happened, if sufficient protection and security has not been given to the law-abiding citizen, it is not our fault; it is your fault who as representatives of those very people refused the demand that was put forward before you." This would be the argument that would be employed if this demand is refused. I would be the last person to support any policy that can spell repression. But we must see what repression is. To bring an offender to justice is not repression. If I break the law I am bound to be hauled up and that would not be repression. (*An honourable member*: What about 1918?) The years 1918 and 1919 were extraordinary years. The ordinary law of the land was superseded. Innocent people were molested. Complaint was made that in the Jallianwala Bagh an unjustifiable slaughter took place. We are not, however, concerned with those questions now. It is in order to avert such unfortunate happenings that this additional force is being demanded. I do not believe in the innocence of the cult of non-violence. It is such a subtle philosophy that an ordinary man like myself with ordinary intelligence cannot believe in it, and cannot act upon it. But I wish to assure my honourable friend that this additional force is not meant for the non-violent resisters, the sane elements as my honourable friend has been pleased to call them, but it is to check, to safeguard, against the insanity which will be engendered and generated by their sanity. And nobody in India can claim that he has got any hold on the multitude. That apostle of non-violence, Mahatama Gandhi himself admitted his defeat when after giving it a trial for two years he retired to his ashram. He realised that it was not possible for him to keep an effective check and control on the multitude. Nobody will be able to control a multitude once it is let loose upon society. The multitude always waits

for an opportunity to feed fat its own grudges.

3 P.M.

This thing has taken place on several occasions before. It took place when the Jhang people rioted, it took place when the Multan people rioted. It took place when the strength of the Government was imagined to have been shaken or impaired. Quite independent of this non-violent movement, quite independent of any other political movement, these people are waiting for an opportunity to be let loose on society. So if Government want additional force to control them why should we stand

in their way? I would ask the honourable mover to keep in mind that if we withheld the 450 foot constables from the executive we cannot weaken the strength of the British Empire; and if we add 450 foot constables it cannot strengthen the weakness of the British Empire. And if the strength or weakness of the British Empire is to be determined by this contingent of police that they demand, I believe that the Government will be well advised to leave this country bag and baggage; 450 foot constables are nothing. The stability and security of the Government depend on other considerations than this. They do not demand this force for the first time. This very force has been in existence for the last six months. When the Congress held its sittings here, nobody interfered with them; when political meetings were held here nobody stopped them; when seditious speeches were delivered, nobody objected. It is the law of the land that punishes; additional police has nothing to do with that. The law of the land must be respected. If I break the law, whatever I may be—a member of the Legislative Council or an advocate—I am bound to be hauled up before the tribunal of justice. In these circumstances, Sir, I would submit that we should not be carried away by any lofty sentiment of independence or non-violent creed, but we should, like practical men, give our serious consideration to the practical question that is before us.

So far as these non-violent resisters are concerned I am tempted to quote what Samuel Butler wrote of the Liberals in 1893. He remarked: "I am really afraid of these liberals, because they flirt with the radicals, who flirt with the socialists, who flirt with anarchists, who do something a deal more than flirt with the dynamite." This is exactly what this non-violent resister will do. A non-violent resister is not an innocent being. Self-restraint and self-control are the only two difficult things in the world. If everybody is able to restrain himself, if everybody is able to control himself, I perfectly agree with the honourable mover that no police would be required, no military would be required, nothing of the sort would be required. But these two virtues are very rare in the world. And when we see with our own eyes that this self-restraint has never been kept, my respectful submission is that we cannot build on fancies and phantasies. Hard facts are to be faced and hard facts must be faced in a proper way.

It was urged before the House that Mahatma Gandhi and his disciples are the only sane people here, that they are saner than any other persons in the world and therefore everybody should follow their lead. I may be excused if I say that I am not such a toady of Mahatma Gandhi as to believe in what he says. He may be perfectly sane in his own way, he may be a very wise man, he may deserve my respect for his other qualities, but it does not follow that because he holds a certain political creed, therefore every citizen of this country is bound to hold the same. He may be sane in his own way, there may be others saner in their own way; every man has to follow his own lights or the lights of those in whom he believes. I say therefore that any reference to the sanity of Mahatma Gandhi is altogether out of place here.

It was further urged, Sir, that economic distress was present in the country, that the tax-payer cannot bear this extra expenditure and that therefore this additional force should not be given. That also is an argument which

[ Mr. Din Muhammad. ]

could not be utilised in this case. Let us see whether a similar demand has been made before. We remember, Sir, that when communal riots took place in Lahore, additional police was engaged. We remember that when riots took place in Rawalpindi, additional police was engaged, not over our heads, but with our full approval. We know that whenever such extraordinary conditions had existed additional police has been engaged with our approval. Extraordinary conditions prevail now and extraordinary conditions must lead to extraordinary demands. If the condition of the country is such that the existing force is unable to cope with the situation, additional force must be given so that law and order might be preserved and respected.

An argument was advanced, Sir, that the reference to the Lumsden Committee in the note of the Financial Secretary was misleading. The Lumsden committee had recommended that the police force was not sufficient even for normal times and that it would be necessary that 696 foot constables with an adequate staff of officers should be further engaged. This argument seems to have been employed to justify the demand. It is urged that even in normal conditions, if the finances had permitted, the police force would have been increased by this time by 696 foot constables. The present demand falls far short of that figure and therefore it is not an extraordinary demand that is being now put forward. It is clearly within the limits which have been prescribed by the Lumsden Committee. No responsible person, should therefore oppose this demand.

With these few words I beg to oppose the motion moved by the honourable member from Hoshiarpur.

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (Representative of Indian Christians) (Urdu): Sir, no doubt, the strength of the police should not be increased beyond the limit that is absolutely necessary for the maintenance of law and order in the country. But at times special circumstances arise which necessitate an increase in the strength of the police, but we should see that such increase does not exceed the requirements of the case. Now, let us see what special circumstances have of late arisen which do or do not justify the proposed increase in the police force. Sir, I am aware of only a few of such circumstances, for instance, an agitation regarding the non-payment of taxes is going on in Multan as well as in Bilgah. Even in Lahore, from the chemical laboratories of some local schools and colleges such acids have been stolen as are required for the preparation of bombs.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: That matter is *sub-judice*.

**Mr. E. Maya Das**: Similarly a few days ago a bomb was thrown in a gathering of the students of the Khalsa College, Amritsar. I am referring only to such matters as have been published in the newspapers. In Campbellpur, just a few days back, a congress procession was taken out in defiance of the orders of the local authorities. In Una serious rioting has taken place. Bombs have been discovered in Raawal in the Ludhiana district. In Amritsar pistols and cartridges have been found in possession of persons without license. Probably there are many other acts of lawlessness of which I am not aware. When such is the state of affairs, is it not advisable for Government to taken steps to nip the evil in the bud? Perhaps some people would say that the situation is not very serious and the present phase of things will soon be over. But others, who feel their responsibility, would

certainly urge upon Government the necessity of bringing the offenders to book. Sir, if the preachers of the cult of bomb and pistol are left off scott free, the time may come when no police force, however large it may be, would be able to keep law and order in the country. I, therefore, see no reason why Government should let the matters pass beyond control.

Sometimes I am inclined to compare the police in this country with the police in other countries. For instance, take the case of the police in England. There the police constable is not only better paid but also bears a greater proportion to the population than the proportion of police constables bear to the population in this country. But England is a very advanced country. Now let us take the case of a backward country. A few days back I was much surprised to hear something very interesting about the police administration of a semi-civilised country like Abyssinia. In that territory there is a town known as Adisabbaba which has a population of 60,000 persons. Sir, just imagine that in a country where there is no rioting and offences against the State are not common and where people are passing peaceful days, a police constable is employed for every twenty persons, while in our Province, where explosive material is not lacking and hardly a single day passes without bringing reports of explosions of bombs or the discovery of fire arms in the possession of the members of the revolutionist party, a police constable is employed for every one thousand persons or even more. I am sure that the present police force will not be able to cope with the serious situation that has arisen and therefore the Government would be well-advised to take immediate steps to avert the danger that is threatening the peace of the country.

Previously there was also an occasion when Government should have increased the police force. I am referring to the time when communal riot had not yet taken place at Rawalpindi. If at that time precautionary measures had been adopted and additional police employed, the city of Rawalpindi would have been saved the serious damages it sustained. A fine was imposed on the citizens but that proved useless because it was later on decided by this very House to remit the said fine. Sir, from the public point of view would it not have been much better for Government to have taken precautionary measures before the riot actually took place than to have imposed a punitive tax on the people afterwards when the latter had already suffered serious losses? I think that the present police should be strengthened only to the extent that is absolutely indispensable for public security. With these words I resume my seat.

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan (Muhammadan Landholders):** Sir, a reference has been made to the Lumsden Committee Report both in the explanatory note and also by the honourable mover of the amendment. I would just like to explain that the recommendations made by the Lumsden Committee for the increase of the police force were made with due regard to the financial stringency prevailing during the years previous to the time when this Committee was appointed, and although we considered that our recommendations were not likely to meet the requirements in full, yet we felt that they would to some extent alleviate the situation, and help in making the police more efficient and adequate for the purposes of keeping law and order in this province. The honourable mover has mentioned, I think, that an increase of 5 lakhs was recommended



[ K. B. Capt. Sikandar Hyat Khan. ]

by the Lumsden Committee. I want to correct this statement. As a matter of fact the total sum involved even by these conservative recommendations of the Committee amounted to Rs. 21,74,000. This increase was meant to deal with the strength of the police force under normal conditions. In addition to this we also recommended an additional expenditure of Rs. 2,16,000 for replacing town watchmen by regular police in the smaller towns. The total extra expenditure recommended by us amounted to no less than Rs. 23 lakhs. Unfortunately the Government did not agree to accept our recommendations in full and cut down this figure to somewhere about 16 lakhs and even so, the Government could not see their way to give effect to these recommendations immediately, but decided to spread the amount of 16 lakhs over a period of 5 or 6 years. If the Government had accepted the recommendations of the Lumsden Committee at the time, I think it would not have been necessary for them to come for this additional grant for police at the present juncture. So I think that the Government also are to blame for ignoring the recommendations of the Committee which were made as long ago as 1926. I might also point out and remind the House that the report of this Committee was approved of by this honourable House.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** Never. It was never placed before the House.

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** The demand for the increase of establishment was placed before this House and was approved of by it.

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** How could the expenditure of Rs. 5 lakhs have been included without the vote of this House?

**Mr. President :** Was not the Report discussed?

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** No, the Government never gave us the chance of discussing the Report.

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** The extra expenditure on the Police was discussed in this House and was incurred after this House had approved of it. The increase was made after the approval of the House. The honourable member from Sialkot, I remember, made one of his best speeches on the occasion.

**Mr. President :** I do not know that, but as far as my recollection goes, copies of that Report were not circulated among the members of this House and that consequently its discussion had to be given up.

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** As a matter of fact extracts from the Report were circulated and an objection was taken that the full report had not been circulated, but I pointed out that the extracts practically contained the whole of the Report except two paragraphs the publication of which was not considered conducive to the interests of the public. But even if the report was not fully discussed, the increase in police expenditure was sanctioned by this House in the Budget session.....

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** Not in that way.



**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** In any case it had to go in the budget and without your approval it could not be included. Sir, perhaps the House would be interested to know that the expenditure on police in this province is—except for the Central Provinces which as you know is a much smaller province, and Assam—lower than any other province in India. The figures, which, with your permission, I will read out, are these. The percentage of police expenditure to revenue in Bengal is 17·47, Madras 12·14, Bombay 11·4, Punjab 10·67, Burma 15·29, United Provinces 12·51 and Central Provinces 10·4.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** That was in 1926. What is it now ?

**Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** I will give the figures just now. We could not get figures beyond 1924-25. The budget for 1925-26 was under preparation at the time and these figures were found to be even more favourable when our report was presented. The figure for the Punjab instead of 10·67 in 1924, came down to 9·54 in 1925-26, the year when our report was published which is even less than Assam and the Central Provinces. You will see that the Punjab at the present moment, although it consists of very explosive elements is spending the least of all the provinces so far as expenditure on police is concerned.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** And you want to make up the deficiency ?

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** As a matter of fact I think that if the propaganda which some people—fortunately a very small portion of the public of this province—are now trying to spread takes root or grows, it will be necessary for the Government not only to continue this additional force but engage a much larger force to try to nip the evil in the bud, if they wish to prevent chaos and disturbances in this province. My friend referred to the economic poverty of the people, but I am at a loss to understand how the economic condition would be bettered if the cult of the bomb and the pistol is preached in the province instead of working for the orderly progress, which is the aim of all of us. I, Sir, like to warn my friends on my right and my friends on my left.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** Do you include me also ?

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** Yes, you included and everybody else included. Should like to give the warning that you should take stock of the situation now and not merely rely on the Government to preserve law and order in this province. If you want to see the Punjab progressing on healthy and orderly lines then you must organise yourselves and try to see that the cult of the bomb and the pistol, now being preached by people who have no stake in the province should be checked at all costs if it is desired to avoid bloodshed, rapine and murder. I would also appeal to the Government that it is their duty to see that the saner elements which as they say.....

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** Saner in what sense ?

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** Not in the sense mentioned by the honourable mover, but I am referring to those who desire to see the Punjab progressing in a constitutional and orderly manner, and

[ K. B. Capt. Sikandar Hyat Khan. ]

wish that it should not lose the ground gained during the period of Reforms. Government should try and encourage and support those people who want to see that the edifice of law and order is not shaken in this province (*Hear, hear*). Sir, I would not take any more time of this House except that in conclusion I would like to warn the honourable mover that not only this additional police, but perhaps a much larger additional force may be required, unless he and his friends are prepared to work and win from their activities those unfortunate people and youths who are being led astray. Such activities will not only involve larger expenditure, but may lead to bloodshed and misery to the people. To my friend at the moment I can only say—

اے ہندو صبا میں ہمہ آوردہ تست

(*Cheers*).

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq** [Amritsar city, (Muhammadian), (Urban)]: Sir, one does not mind spending for law and order but at least one expects some honesty in dealing with this House. I do not say that the Government is deliberately lacking in honesty but when we objected in November that this police force is going to be a permanent force they told us that it was only for Congress purposes. If the Government had frankly stated, they knew that civil disobedience and independence was in the air, and if they had told us frankly that it was going to be a permanent force, I would have said, 'yes; take it, it is a necessity.' We now know that the police force is going to be a permanent thing. Why did they not come forward and say that it was a permanent force. My friend stated that we passed additional five lakhs for the police and we accepted the Lumsden Committee's report. That is absolutely wrong. That report was never put before us and we had never the honour or the pleasure of discussing that report. What actually happened was this that a lot of time was taken up in discussing other items and when the time of the police report came, the President of this House asked us to pass or to reject the whole of it. But that was not possible. We may be opposing the Government for an additional grant but we would not irresponsibly reject the whole of the Police grant. My friends who say that the matter was discussed then are absolutely wrong. Such a big and important question should have been discussed. Government should have even gone to the extent of fixing a special day for the discussion of the Lumsden Committee's report. They then shirked their duty, and now they come and ask us to pass this police grant and say that if we do not do so it will bring about chaos. Now they accuse us that we are opposing it. What is the police wanted for? These gentlemen are not going to be spread all over the province, but they are going to be kept as a ready force. Government say that they want more men. If more police is wanted why not distribute it all over the districts? There are people who think that non-violent non-co-operation is the only remedy in this country by which success can be attained; I am not a non-co-operator nor am I ever going to resort to civil disobedience, yet to refer to the thing in such a way as to rouse the House into hatred against it is not the proper thing to do. If Government come forward with clean methods and say that they find that the number of police constables in the districts is not enough to maintain law and order and that they want this additional

police, that would be all right. But on the one hand Government says that the Lumsden Committee's report recommended so much police and according to that report the number of constables in the districts is less than it ought to be, and on the other hand, Government says in the same breath that they have done nothing to increase the number. If the number was less, then Government should have come forward long ago with this demand and asked this House to increase the number and I am sure there are members here in this House who would not mind our borrowing money even from America or England for the purpose of enabling us to engage more police if our own budget could not supply the money. We have members here who would support Government for anything. Why has Government not come forward up to this time for more money for executive force in the province? Let us consider this point seriously. If Government really thinks that there are not enough constables in the district, why has it not asked for more police all this time? Surely the reason is that Government was not convinced of the necessity of increasing the police in the district. What Government really wants is a striking force, probably my friends will say, of agents *procurateurs*. If Government were to say that they were going to have these policemen spread over the province, where they are needed to maintain law and order, if they were to say that they were wanted in the districts where there is a lot of theft and robbery going on and that the present police employed there is not sufficient to cope with the crime, then I would understand it. But what Government wants is an army of men ready for oppression, and if that is so, then I am afraid I cannot support Government in their demand. If Government had said that they wanted five or ten or twenty additional men in each district, if they had said they wanted 500 or 700 extra constables to keep law and order in the district, then I would have gladly approved of Government's demand, but if they want a striking force then I cannot agree to it. They say that the Congress has declared civil disobedience. But the Punjab has not started it yet, nor is there much likelihood of it being started in the Punjab where there are 99 per cent. of loyal and law-abiding people. They are not going to indulge in this costly affair. Government says that in the Punjab 99 per cent. of the inhabitants are loyal that they are not law-breakers and that there is only a small band of people in the province who are going to take part in the movement. If that is so, then what is the necessity of employing this extra police? My friend from Ferozepore says that there is one policeman for every twenty persons in Adis Ababa in Abyssinia. I wish them good luck: I do not think my friend understood the statistics correctly. It is just possible that he read a lot of statistics and mixed them up. It might be it was a misprint, for to say that there is a policeman for every twenty persons is absolutely ridiculous. That might be the army of the whole country, which he has mistaken for police. I feel sure he is mistaken in his statement.

My friend from Gujranwala in supporting Government said that the year 1919 was an extraordinary year. He said that poor innocent people were arrested. When you talk about those days of disorder you always think of the victims of imagination also. Who could have imagined that our ex-Deputy President (Sardar Mohindar Singh) was a leader of revolutionaries? Who could have imagined that our Minister opposite or the

[ Sh. Muhammad Sadiq. ]

Minister of the first Council could have committed murder and arson? I wish you had heard my friend from Gujranwala who has just spoken speak about the police in those days. I know what his feelings were in those days. He is a very magnanimous man and has forgotten those old days, but we have not yet forgotten them. We know that giving too much impetus to the police means more repression. Government loses its head. There is a danger of disorder in a locality. Government sends police to the spot to stop the disorder, but it probably goes and creates disorder. I do not attack Government of any dishonest motives, but I know it is very difficult to rule. Even when there are experienced people at the helm of affairs, they are liable in heated moments to take counsel which is not always wise. If Government comes and tells us that it does not want this money for a striking force but that it wants it really for the benefit of the public, for protecting the property and lives of the people, then it is different, but if it wants it for political purposes or, in other words, for oppression, then we cannot agree to it. There is not the slightest doubt that the demand will be carried by a huge majority. Even members who are ordinarily cursing the police and are opposed to increasing the police will at this time become anti-nationalist enough and vote for Government. Last time Government said that they wanted 500 or 700 men for the purposes of the Congress. What happened during the Congress days? Did any disorder take place? The whole force was practically useless. Even last time when I spoke against the demand I said that Government was training a force which the people said was for the purposes of oppression. But Government did not have the courage at that time to say that they wanted the additional police because the Lumsden Committee's report had recommended that more policemen should be recruited. Three months ago nobody even mentioned the Lumsden Committee's report. They had forgotten all the items of the report. And now they say that the Lumsden Committee recommended the appointment of additional police. I do not want to say hard words at all against Government because I have no grudge against it, but it is my painful duty to say what I feel. I would be the last man to encourage disorder or the breach of the peace. I would be the last man to encourage it, but it is my honest conviction that we must reject the demand.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Sir, I beg to move—

"The question be now put."

The motion was carried.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, I am very sorry that the honourable members who opposed the amendment made unedifying criticism. I expected that they would be kind enough to take to task the Government which was responsible for the state of affairs in the province, which necessitated such an increase of the police force. The honourable member from Gujranwala said that the might of the British Empire was so great that this addition of 500 or 600 constables will not add materially to their strength. I quite admit that. If really the Empire is at stake, certainly these 500 constables will not be able to do anything, will not add to the might of the Government which is already mighty. As the honourable member put it,

the might of the Government is so great that it cannot be challenged. While I agree with this view of his, I submit that that is an argument in my favour, that is, in support of my motion. If the might of the Empire is so great that it cannot be challenged, where is the need for this extra police force?

Again, the honourable members who opposed my motion said that I will be held responsible if anything untoward happens in this province.

”اے باد صبا این ہمہ آورد؟ تست“

I may inform my friend who is now absent, the ex-Revenue Member and perhaps a candidate for the next vacancy of Revenue Member, that I never indulge in private affairs and I never attack my honourable friends.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** You are attacking him now.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** That is because that honourable member indulged in that art and no one was good enough to stop him.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** You may be more generous.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I say, that we people who oppose the Government always give advice to Government at the proper time and so we cannot be held responsible for the state of affairs if anything untoward happens in the province. The Government ignored our advice when the Simon Commission came. If the Government had listened to the advice of the saner elements of the country, the whole country would have been with the Government. But the Government against the advice of our party co-operated with the Simon Commission which brought about the results well known to all of us and we are not, therefore, responsible for them. Is it not a fact that time and again we advised the Government to co-operate with the people and try to satisfy the demands of the people? What is the net result of the seven years of our toil? There is not a man in the street who does not say that these councils are toys. Whenever a resolution is put forward, they are almost always opposed. Therefore, if the Government will not listen to our advice, who is responsible for the results? We try our level best at any cost, even at the risk of incurring the displeasure of some of our friends and relatives, we try our best to advise Government with what we think as right and proper, but it is the honourable members opposite who say

”اے باد صبا این ہمہ آورد؟ تست“

These honourable gentlemen do not advise the Government at the proper time to mend their matters. Had they done so at that time, the Congress would never have passed the independent resolution. I am very sorry that one of my friends says that the Congress declared independence. No, nothing of the sort. Mahatma Gandhi, that great leader of this country (A Voice: Question). The questioner's position can be questioned, but not that of Mahatma Gandhi. I say that virtual leader of this country made it plain time and again that by complete independence he did not mean severance of connection with the British provided the Government were prepared to make amends. I have been a member of that body called the

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

All India Congress Committee and I have been taking part in the proceedings of that committee and I may assure the Government that if the Government cares to consider sympathetically the eleven points of Mahatma Gandhi, he will no doubt come to a compromise and will accept Dominion Status, because he is one of those who try to avoid rather than create opportunity for fight. Who differs from his eleven points? Can any of my honourable friends in this House tell me whether there is any one point in those eleven points with which they disagree?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Prohibition.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** That is only opposed by the Government.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** No, it was opposed by this House.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** No, the prohibition resolution was lost owing to Government's crushing majority.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Only a few non-official members disagreed.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Now, Sir, I was disappointed to hear the speeches from these benches and.....

4 P. M.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** You were also disappointed not to hear some speeches from these benches. (*Laughter*).

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I was really disappointed, Sir, to hear that everything, every insinuation and all sorts of criticisms have been hurled against me and not a word has been said by way of advice to the Government. All moderates at this time, Sir, will say, and no honest Indian can differ, that the position taken up by Mahatma Gandhi is very.....

**Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath :** Speak to the amendment. Sir, why discuss the policy of Mahatma Gandhi?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** The resolution of independence has been discussed in greater detail and I have reason to say that I must touch those points the Government say that they are afraid that law and order may suffer. I say that the situation that has been created is created by the irresponsibility of the responsible officers of the Government. If really there had been a change of heart Government would have very gladly accepted these eleven points of Mahatma Gandhi and would have given an opportunity to the saner element of this country to prevail upon Mahatma Gandhi not to resort to non-violent civil disobedience. Now, Sir, instead of inviting the attention of Government, instead of advising the Government to take up those points and sympathetically consider those points, they have indulged in criticisms against Mahatma Gandhi. Sir, whatever my political belief may be, I think, Mahatma Gandhi and his followers are able people and are doing lot of good to my country and to my countrymen. They may be extremists, but when Government refuses to hear the advice of reasonable people why they might not go to the extreme limit. There is no one in the country, Sir,

who says that there may be an iota of misunderstanding between the people of India and of England. It will be and it ought to be the sacred duty of the Government and the opposition Benches and every bench to bring about that state of affairs and settle all disputes that exist at present. Sir, instead of doing something, advising Government and pressing upon the Government to do something, towards these down-trodden people, my friends will advise the Government to suppress them by force and will continue to support the Government even going out of their way. I think, Sir, however mighty an empire may be, however strong the Government may be, it cannot retain its hold upon the people without their co-operation. With all its deadly weapons the Government cannot govern 38 crores of people without their good will and co-operation. It may not be palatable to Government to hear that without co-operation which is necessary to carry on the Government, it is difficult to govern India and yet, the blame for that is thrown on the people. The people have been doing their level best to help the Government, they have shed blood for Government outside their Motherland, they have given their lives for the glory of the British Empire, and, Sir, with what results?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** That you are in this Council.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, for the last 7 years I have been pressing upon the Government to adopt the policy of prohibition and with what result?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Failure.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Yes, failure all round and who is responsible for that failure, you can well imagine. This is my position. Unless you do something to satisfy the people, no force, I say, even your air craft will do nothing. I make my request through you, Sir, to the Honourable the Leader of the House, and the Honourable the Finance Member that instead of replying to these criticisms adversely and meeting arguments with arguments, they will advise their Chief, I mean the Imperial Government, the Parliament, the Secretary of State for India, to take such steps as will conciliate the extreme section of this province, and rally round the saner element and improve the situation of the country. You can postpone for the time being the day of Judgment, but surely, Sir, the time will come and it is bound to come, when this police force, this air force, these machine guns and bombs will not be of any avail if really the masses are against the Government as they seem to be at present.

Well, Sir, one point more and I have done. The figures quoted by my friend the ex-Revenue Member show that since 1924-25 you have increased the expenditure on police by Rs. 12 lakhs and you have increased the police force of foot constables by 11,000. But what is the necessity for the present increase when so much increase has been made already? Well, Sir, I assure you that the report of the Lumsden Committee was never discussed in this House. I tried my level best to give cuts to discuss that Committee's report, but, Sir, the Honourable the President advised the Government to circulate that report to the Members and thereby give an opportunity to discuss that report. I am sorry, Sir, that that advice was not taken by the Government Benches.



[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

But, Sir, if you are really anxious on the basis of the Lumsden Committee's report to put forward your claim for the increase in the police force, I will ask, what about their other recommendations? My friend the ex-Revenue Member has made very useful and reasonable suggestions and if these suggestions are adopted I am fully certain that corruption in the police department will decrease to a great extent, but instead of doing so, you only demand an increase in the police force. You are increasing your liabilities by this increase of police force, but you have not taken any responsibility. Are you sure, Sir, that if the Lumsden Committee's report is adopted so far as the increase in the force is concerned, that the corruption in the Police Department will stop, or will decrease. No, nothing of the sort. Has any member of this House who supports the increase in the police force on the basis of Lumsden Committee's report got any assurance from the Government Benches that by adopting this recommendation the efficiency of the police department will increase and that the corruption, inefficiency and high-handedness of the police will decrease. Sir, in the Lumsden Committee's report all the members are agreed that the police is inefficient and there is no doubt complaints are increasing against this department of maltreatment and corruption.

Liability without responsibility is such a thing which every member of this House will not agree to. I hope that the Government will not evade the issue and will give us the assurance that this force will not be utilised for repression, will not be employed to break the heads and bones of innocent crowds, but that it will only be employed for the purpose of investigation, for purposes which strictly belong to the police department. We have, however, very bitter experience of Government and their police officers and I hope those bitter experiences will not be repeated. I look forward for an assurance to this effect from whoever replies to this debate on behalf of Government.

With these words, I commend my motion for the favourable consideration of the House.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, it was with some pleasure that we found the honourable member who moved this amendment speaking in English. But I must say that the speeches of his in Urdu to which we had the pleasure of listening several times in this House were not so lacking in what one might call argument or relevancy as the one to which we have listened to-day. Perhaps it is because he is yet new to the language, but perhaps it was also due to the fact that from no part of the House did he receive any support with the result that he decided to make up for those speeches by speaking himself. He has made a speech which is exceedingly difficult to reply to, firstly, because one has not been able to grasp the relevancy of the various passages so far as the matter before the House is concerned. Again, one is at a loss to know whether to discuss the honourable member's politics or to discuss the politics of the members of this House or still further to go afield and discuss non-violence, civil disobedience and such like thing. I will touch upon these points very briefly indeed.



First, as regards the honourable member's own politics. I unhesitatingly congratulate him on having had the moral courage to refuse to follow Mahatma Gandhi when he found the Mahatma was wrong in preaching boycott of Councils. I further congratulate him on possessing all his colleagues except one. None of them except one honourable member who used to sit next to him followed Mahatma Gandhi's lead, while others followed the honourable member. Not only he himself is giving such co-operation as he feels ought to be given to the Government but the province as a whole is ready to give the co-operation which Government deserves.

Passing on from his politics to the politics of the House, when the honourable member says that Government does not do this and Government does not do that, what he really means is that he is not able to persuade his colleagues to hold the same views as he himself holds. When he trots forth a theory of his own and says that the country does not want this, that or the other, he scarcely realises that he has no more right to speak on the part of the country than the 73 and odd non-official members of this House. When he says the sword should be exempted from the operation of the Arms Act, and the members of the House agree with him and the Government yields to that demand and makes sword free in most of the districts, he does not say that that has been done in response to the wish of the country. That does not matter. When he wants prohibition to be introduced and he finds that the House does not agree with him under the existing circumstances,—and as a matter of fact the province as a whole does not consider it practical politics—he goes on repeating, Government does not want it. Surely, he must realise that when he is trying to condemn Government he is really courting his own condemnation, inasmuch as he makes out thereby that he stands by himself unsupported by his colleagues. As a matter of fact, this debate in which it has not been necessary for any Government official to take part is an eloquent tribute to the efforts that Government continuously is making to maintain the peace in the province. This demand for additional police has absolutely no bearing whatsoever on the question of the reforms which the Punjab, or India, for the matter of that, is to get or is not to get. It has got absolutely nothing to do with the question whether the Viceroy gives an interview to Mahatma Gandhi or not. It has got absolutely nothing to do with the march on the 12th, or perhaps to-day, of any people who wish to disobey certain laws. This demand stands by itself as a necessary measure for the administration of the province. We all realise—no one does better than the honourable member himself—that what he calls the public has a strange way of getting at the people who try to lead them. Does he not realise that the public for the time being may, if he were to make the sort of speech he makes here, in some countryside, go at him and it would be absolutely necessary for the Government to protect him and protect him through the agency of the police? Does he not know that, as a matter of fact, no mean part of the duties of the police engaged last November or October was, not to prevent the Congress deliberations being held, but to no small extent, to see that those who lead the Congress were allowed to hold their meetings peacefully even if the Government did not agree with the resolutions they carried out. When honourable members of the House have been more than once assured and convinced that this measure has got nothing to do with the political

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

programme whatsoever, there is no justification left for any one to adopt a threatening attitude. Threatening does not pay in this life. Those who threaten without having the strength to make good their threats only weaken their own position by resorting to those threats. Does not the honourable member realise that if there is one thing that has been consistently adopted by Government benches, for the last nine or ten years that I have had the honour of being associated with them, it has been *never to threaten*. We all know that if we want to take a measure against the honourable member himself it is ever so much easier to take it without threatening him in any way before hand. Therefore, is it not wise on his part also to see that he does no good by indulging in threats time after time, minute after minute, as a matter of fact I might go on to say, quarter of an hour after quarter of an hour. It does no good by saying Government does not want co-operation. Surely, the mere fact of our sitting in this Council for hours and days together, what is it but co-operation? Is not the honourable member himself, even when he is threatening Government, in this Council, offering co-operation? While others criticise some measures, appreciate others, recognise the existence of obstacles in some other cases, the honourable member tends to see nothing but evil in Government measures. He stands by himself. I admire it. The mere fact that he stands by himself is no argument, I concede, to establish that he is wrong. On the contrary he may be right. But at all events he will have to educate the whole of the Punjab for some time to come before he can reasonably expect them to agree with him. They may agree in the end or they may not, that depends upon the amount of truth in his possession, the amount of knowledge he possesses and the amount of ability he can bring to bear upon his view of the problem. Let him, Sir, grasp once for all, that Government is most appreciative of all the co-operation it receives and there is hardly any section of the people in the Punjab who are withholding that co-operation and for this, credit is due to Government in no small measure. Government is co-operating every minute and every moment of time. I do not think any useful purpose will be served by repeating a lot of platitudes on which there is general agreement. We are told Government should not have recourse to repressive policy. Is there a Government which says that Government ought to have recourse to a repressive policy? Has he ever come across a Member of Government saying—I have advised Government to have recourse to a repressive policy? Certainly not.

The honourable member then says, he will press this amendment to the demand, unless he is given an assurance that we would make the Secretary of State do this or do that. What has that got to do with this demand? What I am going to do in my capacity as a Member of Government to persuade the Secretary of State in the matter of reforms can have no bearing whatsoever on the question whether this additional police, 400 or so, ought to be engaged. They are being engaged in the interests of peace and it is considered prudent to do so. If it is, whether I am going to use my good offices with the Secretary of State or not is entirely irrelevant. As a matter of fact, in the face of the speeches made by His Excellency the Viceroy, His Excellency the Governor and all responsible members of

Government it is really unnecessary to say that this assurance should be given. They give assurances by the yard. We do our best, we are ready to co-operate, ready to be friends. What more is wanted? If the honourable member could draft an assurance which would be fairly reasonable and sensible I have no doubt all of us would be glad to sign it. We may be called upon to give an assurance, for instance, that the police shall be honest, but the honourable member himself should come forward to give an assurance that the residents of his constituency will cease to try to corrupt the police. I can, for my part, give him the assurance that I will try not to corrupt the police. He should give me the same assurance in return. I can give it to him, I am sure, on our behalf, but it is certain that he cannot give it on behalf of his constituents because his constituents go and try to corrupt the police. Therefore all these platitudes do not help us to come to a correct decision on the point which is before the House, namely, is Government acting wisely in engaging the additional police knowing what the condition of the country is, that there are people who perhaps wantonly make statements which they ought not to make, and which a cautious Government is bound to take note of?

What it amounts to is this. The honourable member says: Our threats are empty threats, don't take them seriously, and don't engage any additional police. Well, Sir, I have really great sympathy with that argument. As a matter of fact, for a long time I myself had strongly held the view that these things should not be taken notice of and no additional precautions should be taken in consequence of such threats, but I am afraid irresponsible talks have a dangerous way of spreading about, young people who are not yet of mature experience, and well equipped for the struggle for life, may take these matters seriously, and from lack of experience, from lack of self-restraint and on account of plenty of enthusiasm, may indulge in things that are dangerous for the society, and for themselves. It is that aspect of the case which has converted me to the belief that Government cannot afford to overlook these things, that Government cannot disregard these things if it is to discharge its duties towards the country in doing its best to maintain law and order. No one knows better than Government that it is not with the help of the police that peace and good will can prevail in the country. No one knows better than Government that not only is the police inadequate but even the army is inadequate, to cope with the situation which may arise if the good will of this country is not in support of it. We all know that, and yet that is not enough to make us give up taking such precautions as we think necessary. I trust, Sir, that the House will reject this amendment with a very great majority, in fact all excepting the honourable mover, not only to convince the honourable mover of the amendment that he was not right in opposing the grant, but also to give the country a very good lead. *(Hear, hear).*

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration. Amendment moved—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 24,680 with respect to the item of Rs. 24,680, District Executive Force.”

The question is, that the amendment be made.

The motion was lost.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,00,150 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Police.”

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I will oppose the total demand.

**Mr. President :** Very well.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** We are asked to give Rs. 64,000 to this department. This note which is provided to us is so short that we cannot make out what really it means. We do not know whether the staff is a temporary staff or permanent. We do not know if Government wants to make any part of this staff as permanent. I must say, Sir, that the Lumsden Report clearly says on page 54, part 2, under heading Criminal Investigation Department that the principle that should be adopted to meet the emergency in the way of waves of crime or political ferment should be by temporary additions to the staff of the department drawn from the districts and not swelling the number of the normal permanent staff. If, Sir, Government is going to appoint a permanent staff I think that Lumsden Committee's report expressly lays down that it ought not to be done. If, therefore, really this is a temporary staff then there is no objection to that, and I hope the Honourable Finance Member or the Financial Secretary will kindly throw light on the question whether it is a temporary staff or whether after some months, it is going to be placed on permanent basis.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,00,150 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Police.”

The motion was carried.

#### INDUSTRIES.

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal** (Minister for Education) : Sir, I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 3,87,200 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Education) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Industries.”

The motion was carried.

#### MISCELLANEOUS (TRANSFERRED).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** (Minister for Agriculture) : I beg to move—

“That an additional sum not exceeding Rs. 45,300 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930 in respect of Miscellaneous (Transferred).”

The motion was carried.

#### CIVIL WORKS (RESERVED).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 11,500 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Civil Works (Reserved).”

The motion was carried.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member) : I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,40,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Famine.”

The motion was carried.

---

SUPERANNUATION ALLOWANCES AND PENSIONS.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member) : I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,07,100 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Superannuation Allowances and Pensions.”

The motion was carried.

---

PAYMENTS OF COMMUTED VALUE OF PENSIONS.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** : I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 3,05,900 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Payments of Commuted Value of Pensions.”

The motion was carried.

---

REFUNDS (RESERVED).

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** : Sir, I beg to move—

5 P. M.

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 94,140 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Refunds (Reserved).”

The motion was carried.

---

REFUNDS (TRANSFERRED).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** : Sir, I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 69,880 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Refunds (Transferred).”

The motion was carried.

---

EXPENDITURE IN ENGLAND UNDER THE CONTROL OF SECRETARY OF STATE.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** : Sir, I beg to move—

“That a supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 18,400 be granted to the Governor in Council and the Ministry of Local Self-Government to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1930, in respect of Expenditure in England under the control of Secretary of State.”

The motion was carried.

## THE PUNJAB REGISTRATION VALIDATING BILL.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** (Minister for Local Self-Government): Sir, I beg to introduce the Punjab Registration Validating Bill.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon**: Sir, I beg to move—

“That the Punjab Registration Validating Bill be taken into consideration.”

The motion was carried.

**Mr. President**: The Council will now proceed to take the Bill into consideration clause by clause.

The question is—

“That sub-clauses (2) and (3) of clause 1 stand part of the Bill.”

The motion was carried.

**Mr. President**: The question is—

“That clauses 2, 3 and 4 stand part of the Bill.”

The motion was carried.

**Mr. President**: The question is—

“That the schedule stand part of the Bill.”

The motion was carried.

**Mr. President**: The question is—

“That the preamble stand part of the Bill.”

The motion was carried.

**Mr. President**: The question is—

“That sub-clause (1) of clause 1 stand part of the Bill.”

The motion was carried.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon**: Sir, I beg to move—

“That the Punjab Registration Validating Bill be passed.”

The motion was carried.

The Council then adjourned till 2 P.M., on Monday, the 10th March 1930.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Monday the 10th March 1930.*

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 p.m. of the clock. Mr. President in the chair.

### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following members were sworn in :—

Wilson, Mr. W. R. (Official, nominated).

Ogilvie, Mr. C. M. G., C.B.E. (Official, nominated).

### GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS, 1930-31.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member): Sir, the various demands placed on the agenda are put forward on the recommendation of His Excellency the Governor.

### LAND REVENUE.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 39,59,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Land Revenue.”

**Mr. President:** Demand moved is—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 39,59,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Land Revenue.”

**Pandit Nanak Chand** [Hoshiarpur (non-Muhammadan), Rural]: Sir, I beg to move—

“That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 36,800—Re-afforestation (including *chos* areas).”

Honourable members of this Council are not particularly interested in the Hoshiarpur district and, therefore, some honourable members have asked me not to make any lengthy speech on this matter. I have been trying to bring forward this matter before the Council almost every year and this year also I wish to draw the attention of Government to this fact that so far as the destruction of agricultural lands and houses in the Hoshiarpur District is concerned, the efforts so far taken by the Government have proved absolutely ineffective.

**Mr. President:** May I take it that the object of the honourable member in moving this amendment is to criticise the policy of the Government?

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Yes, Sir. The steps taken by the Government so far have not proved effective at all. The destruction of the agricultural land and houses goes on from year's end to year's end. During the rainy season if an outsider visits the Hoshiarpur district he will find how the agricultural lands are run over by hill torrents and turned into sandy waste, how the houses which border on these hill torrents are swept away by the force of the currents that come down. I particularly wish to mention here the village of Jaijon in the Garhshankar tahsil where hill torrents have made great inroads and houses of very great value have been swept away by the hill torrents. Various Government officials, such as the Commissioner, the Deputy Commissioner and others have visited this town or village—it is not clear which is the right word, because up to this time the Rural Sanitary Board has not decided whether it is a town or a village—and have found that the condition of this town is very dangerous. If these hill torrents are allowed to go on like this, in a few years the whole town will be swept away. This matter was discussed by the Rural Sanitary Board and it said that this was a matter for the Urban Sanitary Board. When the matter went before the Urban Sanitary Board, that body said that it was a matter for the Rural Sanitary Board. Both these boards, however, realise the importance of effective steps to check the inroad of the hill torrents towards this particular locality, but neither of these boards up to this time has come to a definite decision whether it is a matter for the Rural Sanitary Board or for the Urban Sanitary Board. I submit whether it is a matter for the Rural Sanitary Board or the Urban Sanitary Board, it is really a matter which affects the life and property of persons who live in that particular locality. It is in a very dangerous condition indeed, and the opinion of the Government officials who have seen this particular area is unanimous that the town or village is in a dangerous condition. It is, therefore, the duty of Government to adopt effective measures immediately for the protection of these unfortunate people. That is one very important matter which I wish to place before the Financial Commissioner who, I trust will throw some light as to what steps the Government has taken in this matter which has been brought before the Council for the last three or four years. So far nothing has been done to prevent the onrush of the hill torrents towards this locality. Government has wasted about Rs. 30,000 in building up dams which were afterwards found to have been wrongly planned. The Government has been carrying on experiments on things without taking proper advice and this matter which is really one of life and death to a large number of people has not up to this time drawn the serious attention of Government. Of course, the Government will reply that this officer visited the spot and that officer visited the spot and so on, but the question is, what has been done so far in order to remedy the evil which is there and which is persistent and which is eating into the vitals of this town destroying houses and very valuable property of the people of Jaijon?

Then, with regard to agricultural lands, Government has so far declared that certain parts of Shiwalik mountains are under certain legal restrictions and people are not allowed to graze their cattle there and so on. But nothing has been done so far to prevent the onrush of the waters from the Shiwaliks. In Garhshankar tahsil I find after constantly visiting that place that *chos* have extended a great deal in that *ilaza* and that agricultural lands are being



swept away and turned into sandy deserts. It is a matter for regret that the Government which is now trying to help the zamindars by opening up canals in other districts is not doing anything with regard to the Hoshiarpur district. I shall be very much obliged if the Financial Commissioner would throw some light as to in what manner the Government has so far succeeded in preventing the onrush of these hill torrents or saving the lives and property of these people. The cattle of these unfortunate agriculturists are carried away by the hill torrents and are destroyed. Something ought to be done and I submit that nothing serious has so far been done. Some experiment has been going on with regard to one, but with regard to the remaining parts of the district nothing is being done.

**Mr. President:** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 36,800—Reafforestation (including *chos* areas)."

**Mr. W. R. Wilson** (Revenue Secretary): Sir, the complaint of the Honourable Member for Hoshiarpur is that something effective should be done to prevent the destruction of agricultural lands and houses by hill torrents. It is not so very easy to do anything effective straightaway: the matter has been engaging the attention of Government for a very long period. But I wish to bring to the notice of the honourable member for Hoshiarpur that it was only a year ago that Government appointed a special officer to make local enquiries and to report upon the denudation and erosion in such *ilagas* as Gurgaon, Ambala, Hoshiarpur, Kangra, Attock and Rawalpindi, where the inrush of torrents from the hills in the monsoon have been damaging, the extent of the damage being proportional to the intensity of the summer rains. The report of Mr. Holland was published a year ago and a copy of it was sent to all members of this Council who represent those particular districts. It was also sent to all members of the Forest Board and also the Deputy Commissioners of the districts concerned.

I would like very briefly to put before this Council the main conclusions of Mr. Holland in order to show that there is no royal road to the solution of this problem of control. Mr. Holland found that denudation and erosion in the lower hills and also in the nearer hills was on the increase and that the problem generally was becoming more acute. The reason given as being responsible for the deterioration that has taken place in recent decades is that the incidence of cattle grazing is everywhere excessive, and the forests which are of course the mainstay against the damages to which Pandit Nanak Chand refers are so generously thrown open to grazing and browsing that the matter now for serious consideration is whether some steps should not be taken to limit the extent to which cattle should be allowed to graze in unclassified and protected forests, not to speak of reserves. Even in the reserved forests, 41 per cent. are open to grazing and 26 per cent. are open to browsing, and in protected and unclassified forests not less than 93 per cent. of that class of forests is open to grazing and browsing. That percentage, I think, is very much higher than obtains anywhere else in India. One of the reasons why the demand on the forests is so great is that village wastes have so greatly deteriorated that the next step is the inevitable demand upon the areas classified a

[Mr. W. R. Wilson.]

forests, and the result is that we had painful reminders not only last year, but also in the year before when summer floods came down with increased violence and we have also had warnings that in winter, canal supplies are threatened to be affected. This is a difficult problem, and its solution is not very easy. On the one hand you have a demand, a very legitimate demand, in a way for the village cattle, goats and sheep, and a plea that some provision should be made for their proper pasture. Whenever it is pointed out that efforts should be made to put a limit on the increase of cattle, particularly the increased number of goats, by means of, as for instance in Kangra, a light cattle tax, the honourable members from Kangra and Hoshiarpur and other honourable members protest, and say that such an arrangement is *zulum*. I admit that the pasture problem is a serious one and deserves sympathetic consideration. There is also another problem, the problem of the food supply of the country at large and that is to be considered in connection with forests and their maintenance, and there is also, I think, the fact that concurrent with the increase of population the standard of living is rising and the demands on forests and upon the village waste increase. These demands are becoming greater every year. The request that has been put to Government by the honourable member from Hoshiarpur that effective steps should be taken to stop the results of these conditions which I have briefly attempted to sketch is not a very easy one to satisfy. But I will explain what action has been taken upon Mr. Holland's report. The conclusions that I have put before this House were also placed before a meeting of the Forest Board in June last and the Forest Board accepted these conclusions and it was resolved that first of all information should be collected comparing the present incidence of grazing with that at the time of the forest settlement. It has been noted and if honourable members will look at the figures of Mr. Holland's report, it will be apparent that it is in districts in which forests whether reserved, protected or unclassed exist, that the number of goats has risen excessively out of all proportion to the increase of the number of sheep or other cattle. And it was decided that some investigation should be made to try and see how the incidence of grazing on the forests compares now with the incidence at the time when the forest settlements were made and to see, if it can be ascertained, the measure of the increase in the number of animals, particularly goats, that graze in village wastes and forests bringing about the deterioration which is the main cause of these floods. The investigation has been limited first of all to the districts of Kangra and Rawalpindi. There is another recommendation in the report that as far as possible and practicable the practice of grazing should be replaced by grass cutting combined with stall feeding. It is not very easy to see how effect is to be given to that, but last year there have been set up Forest Advisory Committees consisting of certain officials and certain non-officials to be nominated by the district boards to consider problems such as those I have mentioned and it has been put to the Local Advisory Committees that they should consider this and also the possibilities of rotational closure in selected forests or in village wastes. After the Deputy Commissioners of Rawalpindi and Kangra have reported about the possibilities in their districts it will be considered whether it is possible to take effective action in Kangra and Rawalpindi to begin with, and subsequently, if possible, in all other districts. Not only this problem has been put to the

members of the Forest Board, but also to the Deputy Commissioners concerned who were asked to report what steps were feasible or workable in the way of diminishing excessive grazing in their districts and pushing forward reafforestation. The Deputy Commissioner of Jhelum has recently sent in a report in which he suggests the creation of stop dams in the various ravines that fissure the Salt Range. With regard to the *chos* in Hoshiarpur I think one of the suggestions that has been made is that across the *chos* should be put stop dams, not any elaborate structures, but adequate enough to hold up the spates to enable the water to percolate into the soil and not to pour violently into the plains. To come to a district with which I am more familiar with than Hoshiarpur, there has recently been appointed a special officer, an expert officer to endeavour to devise more effective means for controlling the course of hill torrents in Dera Ghazi Khan. It is not only in the Hoshiarpur district that villages are threatened. I have mentioned Dera Ghazi Khan because it is due to this very fact of denudation and erosion that during the torrents of last year there was one village which was not only threatened but was blotted out. I remember seeing the Jaijon case to which the honourable member refers and can testify that the problem there is not an easy one. If I remember right, certain proposals that were put forward for the protection of this village involved an expenditure of 20 to 25 thousand rupees and it was not at all evident that the expenditure would achieve the object in view. It was thought that by taking such action as was possible, further up stream, the *cho* in question might be diverted without the expenditure of what after all was a considerable sum of money with only a problematical result.

Without taking the time of the House any longer, I would urge the House to reject this motion.

**Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath** [Punjab Landholders-General]: I have not had the benefit of hearing the speech of my honourable friend from Hoshiarpur, but I know the circumstances of the district and I am in full sympathy with all that he intended to say or is likely to have said. In 1916 when I knew the district well, measures for the afforestation of those areas had been in operation for about 12 years past and since 1916 up to now, twelve years more have elapsed, but no substantial result is forthcoming. Certainly, the measures which have been in operation for such a long time must have been of a very ineffectual nature. I am not an expert in afforestation or in hydraulics and I cannot suggest any plan of my own. But in the meantime while nothing really effectual can be done, I would invite the attention of Government to the necessity of providing for these men in the areas about to be colonised. The amount of capital required for afforestation and for the erection of dams is so large that it is quite impossible for a body of peasant proprietors to find the money. If Government with all the expert advice at its disposal is unable to devise a remedy which is effectual, these poor persons by themselves can do nothing at all. Whilst unable to suggest any plan of my own I would draw the attention of the Honourable the Revenue Member to the desirability, in fact, the necessity, of providing for these peasant proprietors who have lost their lands by destruction from *chos* in the new areas which are about to be colonised. I know that the misfortune is not confined to Hoshiarpur alone, but it extends to other districts as well. For instance in the Pubbi hills in Gujrat,

[D. B. Raja Narendra Nath.]

in Ambala and in other places certain measures have been adopted which have proved more successful than those adopted in Hoshiarpur. It seems to me that the special circumstances of Hoshiarpur district are such that a speedy remedy cannot be found and the peasant proprietors of that district which is a highly congested district as well deserve special consideration for lands in the new areas.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** [Minister for Local Self-Government]: The honourable member from Hoshiarpur was doubtful as to whether the question of erection of bunds at Jaijon was a matter for the Urban or the Rural Sanitary Board to take up. The matter is quite simple, for if Jaijon has a small town committee or a municipal committee of the first or the second class or a notified area committee, then it is a matter for the Urban Sanitary Board. If it is none of these, it is a matter for the Rural Sanitary Board. But the difficulty has not risen on this account as to whether the rural or the urban board has to take up the matter. I might as well say that the honourable member from Hoshiarpur is a member of the Rural Sanitary Board himself and has the fullest opportunity of advising the board on this very important matter. The difficulty as I said is not because these two boards cannot decide as to which of them is to deal with the question, but the difficulty is the impossibility of the problem itself. At various times various suggestions have been made for the protection of villages and towns. Whenever one village or town proposes to put up a bund in order to protect itself there are a dozen other villages on the same or another side of the torrent or the river who cry hoarse that if that bund was put up they would be ruined. Thus it is practically impossible for Government to decide whether that one village is to be protected as against three or four other towns or not, with the result that after a great deal of consideration, Government feel that in the matter of these *chos* the best thing is not to put up bunds which may protect one village but destroy villages or towns on the other bank which may have been safe so far, but to try and tackle the problem at its very root. What usually happens with these *chos* is this, that when water comes down in great volume from the hills, it brings a great deal of sand along with it and when that sand comes along with the water on to the *chos*, in certain places, it gets deposited, with the result that the course of the *chos* is naturally diverted to another channel and some more and fresh land is cut up. Thus the *chos* go over from one area into another and destroy more and more land. The only way of dealing with this problem is to try and prevent this rush of water into the plains from the hills and that can be done in only one of two ways. One of them is to have small catchment bunds up in the hills before the water actually reaches the plains, and the other is to have trees, plants bushes and grass up in the hills so that the water may trickle down gradually and get absorbed into the soil in the hills and not come down in a great rush. As far as our advice goes these are the only two ways of dealing with the problem. One suggestion was made that a bund might be put up at the foot of the hills in order to stop the rush of water and let it come down gradually. What will happen if you put up a bund like that at a cost of a lakh or two lakhs is that when the water comes down with all its force, the area behind the bund will be filled up with sand and water will flow over the bund and cut

its way through it. Government is as sympathetic towards solving this problem as any honourable member of this House can be, and I can assure the honourable member from Hoshiarpur that he and the people living in Hoshiarpur have as much sympathy as could be given to them by the Rural Sanitary Board or by the Government. If there is any method by which help could be given to them without injuring people in other villages, I assure the honourable member that the board and the Government will give it every possible consideration. As he is himself a member of the board it is open to him to press forward suggestions and try to convince the board. But if there is no suggestion of that kind which would convince the board, convince his other colleagues who are also members of this House, he cannot very well blame Government for not taking any action. I give him this assurance that the moment the honourable member brings forward a practical suggestion, the Government will be only too pleased to carry it out.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend** (Financial Commissioner) : I only wish to say one or two words. The honourable member from Hoshiarpur has asked me for a little information. The Revenue Secretary gave the House a lot of information on the problem of denudation in the province generally. But naturally the honourable mover would like to have a little information in particular, as to what is being done in Hoshiarpur. The honourable mover and I are in complete agreement that no more sympathetic officer can be found than Mr. Jenkins, the present Deputy Commissioner of that district. Here I have before me his considered opinion written since the last debate on this subject in this House two years ago. I will only read one or two sentences :

"It follows that the *Ches* Act was and is a very necessary piece of legislation. I believe that the Act has done some good. Its critics are often residents of more favoured parts of the district than the Katardhar, and the more thoughtful residents of the villages affected admit that there is some improvement. Indeed I was recently asked by the owners of certain large villages in the Una tahsil who are alarmed by the denudation taking place in their lands to take them over and place them under the Act. I do not expect to work miracles, but I thoroughly believe that the present arrangements are in the best interests of the district as a whole."

I have one other passage to read to the house. Last June was held at Simla a meeting of the Siwaliks Afforestation Committee of this Council of which the honourable mover was a member. He of course is fully aware of all the decisions arrived at at that meeting. Upon the point whether the Act has done any good at all, I wish to read to the House what was decided in paragraph 7 of the minutes of that meeting—

"It was urged in favour of a change of policy by the non-official members that, although since the Act came into force there had been improvement in the Hoshiarpur tahsil, there has been no improvement in the Garshankar tahsil."

I admit that there was no improvement in Garshankar but here you have the non-official members of the committee of which the honourable mover was a member agreeing that the Act had done good in the Hoshiarpur tahsil. The meeting was held last June and various decisions and recommendations were arrived at. They were sent for opinion to the Deputy Commissioners of Ambala and Hoshiarpur, the two districts concerned. The Deputy Commissioner, Ambala, has given us his opinion but the Deputy Commissioner, Hoshiarpur, has not yet replied. When he does so, I shall be delighted to discuss the matter with the honourable mover. We have

[Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.]

nothing whatever between us on this matter, and if he will come and see me, as I said, a few days hence I shall be delighted to hear everything he says sympathetically and put the plans of Government before him.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** [Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana (Muhammadan) Rural]: Sir, I have no wish to speak on this motion but I think the problem before the House is not very simple. Really the Act referred to by the Financial Commissioner has done some good to the area which is very near the hill. But I think now the complaint is, though no doubt the torrents are not doing so much damage as they did in past years, still the water in the wells is becoming less and less year by year. I think the honourable mover has noted the state of affairs in that district where the great complaint now is that the water in the wells, for instance in tahsil Garshanker, is failing.

**Mr. President**: That matter is not now before the House.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: The question of the damage done by hill torrents is under discussion. I wish to point out that the hill torrents do no damage. In fact they have done something good. The complaint raised in regard to them is in another connection and I wish to bring it to the notice of the Government so that they may not look at only one side of the question.

**Mr. President**: Is the honourable member opposing the motion?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: No, Sir, I am supporting it, but I may bring to the notice of the House that there is the other complaint.

**Mr. President**: That complaint is not now under discussion.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: These complaints have reference to the hill torrents. If the Government tries to check these torrents, the natural result will be that there will be no water in the wells.

**Mr. President**: Then, is the honourable member against any action of Government?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: Not against any of Government. I want that action should be taken, but care should also be taken of the water in the wells.

**Mr. President**: That is a separate matter altogether, and it is open to the honourable member to table an amendment to that effect.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: If you so rule I have no objection.

**Pandit Nanak Chand**: The reply to my amendment from the Government benches has been most disappointing. It shows really that the Government Members have admitted that they have so far failed to tackle with the problem. (Mr. C. A. H. Townsend: Question.) The honourable member will not question if I state certain facts. Now, the first gentleman who spoke on behalf of the Government said that he cannot adopt any measure straightaway, and that a certain gentleman namely, Mr. Holland, was appointed to make an enquiry into the matter and he came to certain conclusions. What are those conclusions? The House would be pleased to bear in mind, and I would request the Honourable Financial Commissioner too to bear in mind, what was stated by Mr. Holland in his report. He

said that this destruction by the hill torrents was on the increase and that the problem was becoming more and more acute. This was said by Mr. Holland last year in his report. The Government has failed to tackle this problem and it has bungled. Whatever remedies have been proposed by Mr. Holland in 1929 were already proposed by the Government officials in 1879. On various occasions, the Government appointed special officers to go into this matter, and they came to certain conclusions. The problem instead of being successfully tackled has become worse. I would ask the Financial Commissioner, through you, Sir, what reply the Government has got to make against this finding of Mr. Holland himself. There is nothing new that Mr. Holland has stated with regard to the steps that are to be taken for the stoppage or decrease of damage by hill torrents. These findings were often referred to. What were they? In 1879 these enquiries started. They are still going on. An enquiry is to commence now once more. This efficient Government comes to the conclusion now once more that certain investigations would be made with regard to the incidence of grazing, as to how far grazing is injurious and how far it can be stopped.

**Mr. W. R. Wilson :** May I explain, Sir, that the object of the investigation is to see how far the incidence of grazing at the present time exceeds the rights acknowledged at the forest settlements? There are good reasons to suspect that the present incidence of grazing is considerably more than the measure of the rights as then acknowledged. Hence the necessity for the enquiry.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I do not think the Revenue Secretary has thrown much light on the point. My point is simply this: that Government is still on the threshold of an enquiry. In 1879 it enquired into these matters, and in 1929, it also made an enquiry. It is still on the threshold of that very enquiry or part of that very enquiry. The Government thinks that it is a matter on which it can take credit for what it has done, but the plain folk living in that area are saying that these enquiries have been going on with no result and with no benefit to anybody.

Then it was stated that it has started making enquiries into the district of Kangra. Here I am talking of the district of the Hoshiarpur people, and this efficient Government speaks of starting an enquiry into the problem at Kangra and Rawalpindi. I do not know anything about Rawalpindi, but I know that the problem in Kangra is entirely different. It is entirely a separate problem there. Here in Hoshiarpur are the Shiwalik hills from which water runs with great rapidity and fields are turned into wastes, while the problem in Kangra is entirely different and enquiry there is not going to help those living in the Hoshiarpur district.

Then another thing was suggested, that Government should ask the people to resort to grass cutting instead of grazing their cattle. What a wonderful conclusion the Government has arrived at after 40 years, as though that would solve the problem in which property worth nine lakhs is involved!

Then the honourable member drew the attention of the House to the fact that at Jhelum the Deputy Commissioner has recommended the building up of a dam. This may have been the first time that the question of building dams comes within the knowledge of the honourable member, but

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

the question of dams has been coming up before the Council for the last six or seven years. They are still talking of dams while people are losing their property and the lives of their numerous cattle.

Then, Sir, came the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government with his reply. He thought that he crushed me when he said that I was a member of the Rural Sanitary Board. If the Rural Sanitary Board does not listen to my advice it is not my fault. Suggestions were placed before that board, but in the matter of this village, the Rural Board ruled that it had no jurisdiction to deal with this problem, because it was a small town. Then I was informed that the matter was referred to the Urban Board, and there it was ruled that it was a matter for the Rural Sanitary Board. The Government have not up to this time come to the conclusion whether this matter is to be dealt with by the one board or the other. I say this is not a matter for these boards when people are losing their lives and property. The Honourable Minister made a suggestion that we must tackle the problem at the very source. A very wonderful suggestion the Honourable Minister is making! He delivered a lecture that such and such a thing is needed here and such and such a thing is needed there. We have been accustomed to these lectures; we read them in the reports. Nothing tangible is being done.

Then the Honourable Minister assured me that the Government are dealing with the problem with great sympathy. Sympathy must be expressed in action, and people will not be satisfied by these vocal expressions of sympathy. We know that the problem is very acute, the destruction of life and property is on the increase and we want effective steps to be taken.

Then the Financial Commissioner went into the question of reservation of forests and said that a certain amount of area has been enclosed and people are not allowed to graze their cattle there. I say the enclosing of these areas will not be in the least effective. Why? There would be grazing going on somehow or other. The forest guards take money from the people and allow grazing and this sort of thing will go on. In my humble judgment there is only one solution, namely Government should take up these lands and compensate the people whose lands they have taken by giving them land in other places. This suggestion has been made by me not once, but many times. At the time of the enquiry the villagers also made a similar suggestion. If the difficulty of the problem is a reason for not tackling it, then I submit the Government must abdicate its functions and leave it to the people of the Hoshiarpur district to settle this question as best they might. Government makes 16 lakhs of rupees every year from the Hoshiarpur district, and it is but just that the people there should have something in return in the shape of Government help in order that their property might be safe.

There was one other argument brought forward by the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government. He said wherever they started building these dams, silting comes in. He said that villages all over the Punjab are subject to this.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I never said all over the Punjab, but I said villages on the banks of the *chos*.



**Pandit Nanak Chand:** Well, that is how I understood him. But taking that very example, he stated that other villages thought that something should be done with regard to their villages.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:** No, that is not what I said. Let me explain. I said that if you try to protect one village on a *cho* by means of an embankment of a bund then that diverts the water to other villages and the people of those villages raise a hue and cry for they are flooded.

**Pandit Nanak Chand:** That is wrong. As a matter of fact, I know with regard to a big *cho* in my part of the *ilaga* that in the villages right from the hills where Nigi village is situated to the Sutlej river, people are anxious and are prepared to co-operate with the Government to some how or other dig a small canal so that it may become fruitful for cultivation and fruitful for giving water to the wells which are being dried up. Water is now running waste; the lands are not used. In this manner this problem can be tackled. On more than one occasion I have stated that this problem has been tackled in Mysore and certain other parts of India, but the Government has not taken the trouble of sending any expert. It is a matter for an expert engineer and an expert forest officer, but the Government has not taken the trouble of appointing an expert engineer and an expert forest officer to act together to tackle this problem. The Government is bungling, it bungled in 1879 and it is bungling now. I submit from the very conclusions arrived at by Mr. Holland that the problem is more serious and acute now and that the destruction is greater. Let the Government take proper steps to stop the destruction of people's houses and lands.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): I did not intend to speak on this particular matter to-day but the heat which the honourable mover of this cut has imported into the discussion has compelled me to say a few words. He knows it perfectly well that the subject matter of this debate is not new to this Council. If Government has done nothing up till now in improving the *chos* of the Hoshiarpur district, it has certainly improved the honourable member's knowledge of the history of this trouble a great deal. (*Laughter*). He knows it perfectly well that he has been requested by Government to attend meetings of sub-committees convened with the object of studying the problem to help its solution. He knows perfectly well that engineers have sat on this particular matter, that the Financial Commissioners have toured in the *chos* areas, that there are no facts which have not been elicited and that the Deputy Commissioner has more than once reported on this important matter. His complaint is, 'what is the good of doing all these things? You have not cured the evil'. There is a great deal of force in what he says, but is he not confusing the effort made by Government in this behalf with the amount of success achieved by Government through these efforts? I will state frankly that the disease from which, necessarily, the plains lying at the foot of the hills, and lands in which rights are possessed by owners other than those who hold the lands in the plains, is a disease which no Government can cure. (*A voice: Question.*) The honourable member says "Question". He, of course, with his very natural ignorance, like my own, of engineering matters may expect miracles from engineers, but, after all, they are human beings and cannot perform miracles even in

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

these days of science and progress. Sir, the honourable member is perhaps unaware that there are *chos* or hill torrents in places other than Hoshiarpur but within the Punjab. He cannot, however, be ignorant of the great damage done in the Dera Ghazi Khan district, the extent of which damage would be many times more than the damage done in the Hoshiarpur district in a number of years. Does he think engineers can build little bunds all along the *chos* areas and train the *chos* in order to take them safely to the Sutlej? Does he imagine that by any chance there is a lot of money to be made by Government out of utilizing these waters for the purpose of irrigation and Government is so foolish that it will not avail itself of these waters? Surely he must understand that the Government which is conserving every ounce of water with the object of irrigating land and is making money for the benefit of the province is not likely to have lost that chance. When he understands the history of the problem and has the nice little pamphlets brought out by Mr. Holland on this very question, how can he come before the Council and assume that here is a curable disease and complain that we have shown no results. He has been told quite frankly in the report the extent of the cure which can be expected, and what cannot be reasonably expected to be cured. As a matter of fact, even by sinking very large funds you cannot make this scheme a success even as a protective scheme. I assure the House that Mr. Holland and his colleagues had a great opportunity which capable officers seldom fail to snatch of making a successful venture of it, but when they found that they could not do so, they frankly stated the difficulties and said this much and no more can be expected in this matter. Therefore, let me make it absolutely clear, Sir, that all that any Government could have attempted with the amount of money available for this purpose has been attempted. In fact, I think more time has been spent both by officials and non-officials on this problem, during the last four or five years than on any other question of a similar nature. In the face of these facts, to say not in ignorance of these facts, but with full knowledge of them, that nothing has been done is not being fair to various officers who devoted themselves, heart and soul, to this matter. In fact, if I am not mistaken, the year before the last we organised a special division in the Forest department to do afforestation in these hills. There have been careful and detailed reports from the Deputy Commissioner who has taken a personal interest in the matter and has gone into the thing thoroughly. On the one hand to say, do not touch the people in the Siwalik hills, let them go on grazing their sheep and goat and on the other to say, do not let water come into the plains is really blowing hot and cold in the same breath. (*Cheers*).

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

"That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 36,800—Re-afforestation (including *chos* areas)."

The question is that that amendment be made.

The motion was lost.

**Sayad Muhammad Husain** (Montgomery, Muhammadan, Rural):  
Sir, I beg to move—

"That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 2,67,800—Colonisation Operations."

Sir, the colonization operations in the Lower Bari Doab Canal Colony are coming to a close. In another six months or a year all the culturable land of the Lower Bari Doab Canal Colony will have been distributed to the people. I think I will be failing in my duty as a representative if I did not bring to the notice of the Government the claim of the people living in the vicinity of Kamalia, locals of Kamalia I call them. Kamalia constitutes a part of the Montgomery district. Geographically it is situated on the other side of the river Ravi. Being situated close to the district of Lyallpur it was very often thought, and it is still being considered, that this part of the country should be taken away from the district of Montgomery and attached to the Lyallpur district. These unfortunate locals whom I have the honour to represent, from the very beginning have been deprived from getting any share of the land in the colonization schemes both in the Lyallpur colony and the Lower Bari Doab Canal Colony. When irrigation was started in the Lyallpur district by the Lower Chenab Canal it was thought proper that these people, as they form part and parcel of the Montgomery district, should be accommodated in the district to which they belonged, especially when Government was contemplating the extension of irrigation to that district. With the result that these people remained without getting their proper share in the Lyallpur district in the hope that when the Lower Bari Doab Canal starts irrigation they will be accommodated in the district of Montgomery. Now, Sir, these unfortunate people could not get their share even in the Montgomery district. War broke out and a huge area was earmarked in the very beginning for those people who were serving in France and other places and of course rightly so, for they were shedding their blood for the Empire. When they came up and after they had been accommodated—and I hear their accommodation is not complete even up till now—only inferior land was left in the district for these sons of the soil. In the past the precedent of Government has been, and rightly, in the other colonies that these sons of the soil who were born and bred there, who were, before the introduction of the canal, the masters of the soil and who had vast herds of cattle grazing in that part of the country, should be first accommodated and then the other people of the congested parts of the country. Unfortunately that practice was not followed here. I tried my best, being their representative, for the last ten years to put forward their claim, year after year and I am thankful to the Government that my voice and clamour did not fall on deaf ears, for, these people were accommodated, though on inferior soil. With the large quantity of manure at their disposal they have converted that land into smiling pastures. There you will find good crops growing mainly due to their efforts. These lands which were given up as inferior as *bagaya* have been gladly accepted by these wandering tribes. But Kamalia people have got no land at all. I have been trying for these people ever since the time when Mr. Barron was Financial Commissioner. I took a representation from them to him. These people have been living here even prior to the invasion of Alexander the Great for so many thousands of years and they are supposed to be loyal, though the term loyalty in these days is a thing which is not valued by Government nor the people. They were living there from those ancient days and it would be a pity if these people were now excluded from there. I thought it desirable to take this last opportunity to push forward their claim. There is still one chance left and that is, that in the

[Sayad Muhammad Husain.]

northern district, in the vicinity of Pir Mahal I think, irrigation is going to be started. That irrigation will be round about Kamalia and if those people who have been living there for thousands of years are deprived of land even in that part of the country, it will mean that a strong and loyal population will be excluded, and I do not know what population will be put in their place. In the circumstances I most respectfully ask the House and through you, Sir, the Honourable Member and the Financial Commissioner to give their full and careful consideration to this request of mine and to try to accommodate these people Hindus, Muhammadans and Sikhs, living in that part of the country for, being the sons of the soil they have a prior claim.

I may also add here that still in the district of Montgomery there is a vast population of these locals whose names have been recorded and Mr. Bourne is making every effort to find out whether they are really deserving or not. Those people should also be accommodated in the same way as the others. In the district of Lyallpur you find still a population whose list was made two years ago and they are still on the waiting list. Before surrendering his magnificent charge, I ask the Honourable Member for Revenue, in the name of humanity, to take into consideration the case of these unfortunate and inarticulate people and accommodate them as far as possible, and in doing that, he will be doing an act of justice to them and to the country at large.

With these few words, I beg to move this amendment.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 2,87,800—Colonization Operations.”

**Mr. H. Calvert** (Financial Commissioner): Sir, I am glad to think that this should be the last occasion on which the honourable member for Montgomery will bring forth this hardy annual which has been produced year in and year out for the last four years regarding the provision of land for the locals in the Lower Bari Doab Canal Colony. The tale is rather an old one and there has undoubtedly been a large amount of delay in disposing of the question. The reasons for that delay are fairly clear, being mainly questions of finding sufficient land to meet the competing claims. He admitted, Sir,—and I am very glad that he did admit—that in so far as the older residents of the Lower Bari Doab Colony area are concerned, most of them have now been given land. The attempts to deal with the locals in that area began in 1918 when Mr. Joseph prepared his first lists. Of these, the majority received land in the succeeding years and by 1922 the first selection had been almost completely disposed of and settled on land. In 1922 Mr. Joseph's lists were again reviewed and the concession of land was extended to others not included in that list as well as to those who had been omitted. In 1925 a further enquiry was made for people who had been omitted from previous lists and it was then decided that some 21,000 acres should be allotted to the remainder of the locals who up to date had not got land. Then came the question of the complaints from the *Fauji* grantees who wished exchanges from poor land to better land, and Government had to postpone the placing of the locals on the land till the more pressing claims

of the *Fauji* grantees had been dealt with. As the area required was supposed to be between 20,000 and 30,000 acres, there was some difficulty in finding so large an area and we had to wait for further extensions of the canal, when land became available. In 1927 the difficulty arising from the *Fauji* grantees desiring exchanges from poor land to better land was disposed of, and a further estimate was made and it was then estimated that some 30,000 acres would be required. This received the approval of Government. In 1928 work was commenced by disposing first of all the cases of local peasants who had lost land by river erosions or whose land had suffered from the shrinkage of water in the river owing to the weirs and all these were placed on fresh grants. In June last the final orders of Government were given and Mr. Bourne received orders to give land to all the deserving remaining *tirni guzars* of the Ganj Bar who had not received land, and, in so far as any of the 21,000 acres of land promised remained over, to give them to old occupancy tenants of the proprietary land. That completely disposed of all the cases of deserving local peasants in the Lower Bari Colony area proper.

My friend laid rather more stress on the people in the *Kamalia ilaqas* across the river. The orders of Government now are that lists shall be prepared, and in fact are being prepared, of the locals in that tract who for one cause or another deserve consideration. When the Lower Chenab Colony was being started practically all the really authentic cases of *rahtas* were dealt with and there is probably no real case of another *rahtas* being left unprovided for.

So it comes to this, that people whose lands have suffered from erosion or whose lands have suffered from shrinkage of water and a certain number of *tirni guzars* in the area of the three extensions—Pir Mahal, Khika and Burala—are being placed on the list, and it is proposed to give them land in the Burala extension of the Lower Chenab Canal Colony. The irrigation arrangements have been completed but *qilabandi* is not yet finished. We hope to finish it this year and as soon as the land is ready, these people will be allotted land.

**Sayad Muhammad Husain :** Sir, as I am satisfied with the reply of the Honourable Financial Commissioner, I beg for leave to withdraw my amendment.

The amendment was, by leave, withdrawn.

**Pandit Nanak Chand** [Hoshiarpur (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] : Sir, I beg to move—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 30,03,170, —Total Pay of Establishment.”

As the honourable members will realise, this cut is moved with the intention of discussing the very serious problem with regard to the pay, prospects and other essentials which the patwaris require for carrying out their duties. Sir, some people are under the impression that no enhancement in the pay of the patwari is needed because some of them prey on the people (zamindars), take illegal gratifications and in other words, harass the zamindars. If that were the position of Government I would have nothing

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

further to say but, fortunately, the then Honourable Financial Commissioner, I mean Mr. King, when I moved a cut to this effect previously, stated that the charges of bribery and corruption could not be made out against the patwaris as a class. It is true that there are dishonest people amongst various ranks of services, similarly you could find dishonest officials in these ranks and therefore, the argument that is generally levelled against the enhancement of their pay will not hold good. Now, Sir, I am one of those persons who realise that the pay of the patwaris is hardly sufficient for their maintenance in decent comfort. The ordinary pay of the patwari is Rs. 20 a month and the second grade is Rs. 23 and the pay of the third grade patwari is Rs. 26. Rupees 26 is the highest pay which a patwari gets. Before discussing whether this pay is adequate or inadequate, I wish to draw the attention of the House to the various duties which these patwaris perform, and I ask whether in view of these various duties the wages that are given to them are adequate or not. You will permit me, Sir, to read out from this address which Pandit Beli Ram, Patwari, as Chairman of the Reception Committee of Patwaris' Conference, delivered on the 26th of January 1929, and I hope that Government will very kindly point out whether these matters have been exaggerated. These are the various duties. I wish to read them in Urdu first, and then, here and there, I will translate them into English.

”گوداوری فصل خریف اور فصل ربیع اور زائد ربیع“ کامل ازھائی ماہ تک کہیت بہ کہیت پھر کر فصلوں کی حالت دیکھنا۔ اندراج اجناس استادہ و انتقالات۔ تغیرات۔ کاشت۔ لگان و انتقالات بیع و ہبہ۔ تبادلہ اور تقسیم۔ رہن اور پٹہ وغیرہ دریافت کرنا۔“

The patwari has to inspect the two crops and make a report and enter in a register the result of his inspection and he has to go field by field, he has to make entries with regard to the crops, with regard to the sale, the mortgage and other matters connected with the transfer of these crops.

”تیاری نرد باچہ۔ معاملہ مال و لہر ہو دو فصل اور ان کی وصولی میں مناسب آمدن۔ متعان فہمید حساب و تحریر رسیدات وغیرہ۔“

He has to prepare *Fard Bachh* and to render assistance in the realization of land revenue. He has also to prepare the distribution of the land revenue on the various members of the community under his charge.

”تیاری تلمہ شجرہ یعنی موقع پر پیمائش۔ ان نمبروں کی جو زیر اثرات انتقالات۔ ہر قسم شکستہ ہو جائیں۔“

He has to prepare the field map and he has to show how a part of a certain field has been sold and to give it a separate number.

”تیاری جمعہندی ہائے چار سالہ معہ ۲۵۵ جات چار سالہ و نقشہ جات سالانہ۔“

He has to prepare the *jamabandi* together with the maps of wells yearly and also after four years.

”انتقالات بیع و رہن وغیرہ ہر قسم کا۔ دو پڑتوں کا درج رجسٹر۔ انتقالات کرنا اور ریونیو انسران جب وہ وقتاً فوقتاً دورہ پر جائیں۔ بغرض فیصلہ پیش کرنا۔“ جس کی نسبت اپنے حلقہ کے سوائے دیگر مقامات پر بھی بستہ آتھا کر جانا پڑتا ہے جہاں ریونیو انسور کا مقام ہو۔

He has to prepare the mutation of various sales, leases, mortgages of agricultural landed property. He has to carry all these matters to the revenue officials wherever they may be holding enquiries with regard to the mutation.

”دفاتر تحصیل میں داخلہ کاغذات جمعہندی۔ تیاری کاغذات۔ مردم شماری مال شماری۔ الیکشن ہر قسم اور درستی بدلات کے لئے حاضر ہونا۔“۔ جہاں بیٹھنے اور کاغذات رکھنے کے لئے سرکاری کوٹی انتظام نہیں ہوتا۔ بارش کی حالت میں بستہ بغل میں دبا کر پٹواریاں مارے مارے پہوتے ہیں۔

روز نامچہ معمولی روز مرہ واقعات کا اندراج کرنا اور تیاری امثلہ تقسیم۔

Then, he has to report the daily occurrences in the village and has to prepare files of partition of property.

”تیاری امثلہ بُرد برآمد۔ تیاری امثلہ زیر اور اراضیات سرکار تیاری امثلہ پڑتہ نہری۔ تیاری امثلہ التوا یا مجرائے معاملہ۔“

He has to write about the destruction of survey marks, etc.,

”تیاری امثلہ التوا یا مجرائے معاملہ بصورت آفات ارضی و سماوی۔ رپورٹ نزول آفات ارضی و سماوی۔ رپورٹ فوتیدگی۔ مکزی فصلوں کو کیزالگ جانا۔“

”رپورٹ فوتیدگی معافی داران و جاگیر داران۔ رپورٹ بیماری انسانی و حیوانی۔ رپورٹ شادی پنشن خوار لڑکیوں کی جن کے نام تا شادی پنشن ہو۔ مردم شماری۔ مال شماری۔ شتر و خچر شماری۔ خدا جانے اور کیا کیا شماری۔ بصورت سنگین واردات موقع کا نقشہ مطابق ہدایت پولیس تیار کرنا۔ تیاری کاغذات۔ فہرست و وٹران سیاسی جلسوں اور تحریکات کی نسبت باضابطہ دائریاں روانہ کرنا۔“

I do not know whether this is correct or not, but I think it is an important affair.

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

”مذمتہ اعلیٰ تحریک میں اس قسم کی دائریوں کے باعث مہمات میں شہادت دینی پڑتی رہی جس میں ملزمان قید و جرمانہ کے سزا بپ ہوتے رہے اس نوحہ کی بجائے آؤری میں ہمارے علاقہ جات کے زمینداروں نے ناں مل و رتن۔ (فان کراپویشن) کے ریڈ ویلوشن ہمارے برخلاف پاس کر کے عملی طور پر ہمارا سہل بائیکاٹ کر دیا۔“

This shows that they have to act as Criminal Investigation Department of the Government in the villages which are in their charge. This is a matter on which I should like the Government to give a definite reply, whether what is stated here is correct.

These are the functions which patwaris have to perform and nobody in this House will deny that these are functions which are extremely important. A person in order to perform these functions faithfully has to devote a large amount of his time. The duties of preparing electoral rolls with regard to elections of Legislative Council and Assembly were recently added to his duties when the new councils and the Assembly came into existence. No increase in pay is allowed to these patwaris for these various duties which they have to perform. I submit that these are functions, which an educated man with great intelligence has to perform and for all these duties a patwari is paid Rs. 20 a month which an ordinary civilian or a barrister would spend for a pair of shoes or for the purchase of a hat. I may say that there are people who spend more than Rs. 20 a month on the maintenance and upkeep of a single dog. The maintenance of a horse even in a village costs more than Rs. 20 a month. This is the state of affairs to which a very respectable section of officials of the Government have been reduced by the kindness and benevolence of this Government. If the Government is really sincere to tackle this problem which is making a very large number of its officials dissatisfied with the mode of their living, I ask, is it not high time that the Government take up this question more seriously? Twenty rupees a month means about ten annas a day. If a patwari is a married man, and normally every patwari is married, and has a wife and children, then you can just see what will fall to the share of each individual family member. It will come to one pice or half an anna each for food. And we do not live by bread alone. There are other things which a man needs, such as houses, clothing and so on. Is it possible to expect that a man of a patwari's position would be able to live on Rs. 20 a month or even on Rs. 25 or even for that matter on Rs. 26, and carry on his duties efficiently? Not only this. The patwaris are not given any allowance for the purchase of stationery. This they have to purchase out of their own pocket. We take it that the patwaris who have to carry on so much of writing work do require money for purchasing ink, pencils, pen, paper and they want boxes for keeping their papers. Is any allowance given to patwaris for furniture? Are they provided with office accommodation? Are they given any house rent? My information on these points is that they are not given office accommodation, nor furniture nor stationery. They have to purchase everything out of their own pocket. Under these circumstances you cannot expect that this important functionary of the



village will be satisfied with the conditions which exist at present. Everywhere there is a clamour for a decent wage, for a living wage. People have to educate their children, have to call in doctors, and purchase medicines when in need. You cannot expect that this small pittance will suffice for a decent, comfortable life. I, therefore, submit that the honourable members should concentrate their attention to this very important problem. There are, I understand, about 18,000 patwaris in this province and each patwari has to do not only these functions which I have enumerated with regard to one particular village, but sometimes four or five villages are in their jurisdiction.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** These are, I suppose revenue patwaris.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Yes. I am talking of revenue patwaris only. I am sure the Government's reply to my contention would be, 'Look at the condition of the budget. The budget is a deficit budget. How can we give an increase in the face of this budget?' But I may submit that this matter of patwaris' pay was brought forward in this Council by me more than once even when the budget was not a deficit budget but was a prosperity budget. Even then this question was brought before the Council and the reply of the Government was a very indifferent one. The Financial Commissioner who spoke at that time stated that the patwaris make a certain amount of money from mutation fees and by giving copies of documents and so on. The reply of the Financial Commissioner was discussed and considered by the patwaris at their conference and the general consensus of opinion was that they did not make more than Rs. 2 or 3 a month by those means. These are facts which the Honourable Revenue Member ought to take into consideration. An addition of Rs. 2 or 3 will not be a material gain. It will not alleviate the distress of this very important section of Government servants.

It is stated sometimes that these are village officials and that Government have nothing to do with these village officials and that it is a matter which concerns the village people themselves. No doubt in olden times these patwaris were considered to be village officials. They were not paid out of the Government treasury. The villagers paid them at the time of the various crops and these people were satisfied. They got a living wage. In addition to that, the patwari belonged to that particular village and he carried on his ancestral profession, sometimes the profession of money lending, sometimes the profession of agriculture or some other profession which his parents carried on in the village. The patwari was not transferred from one place to another, nor was he asked to keep all these various registers, nor was he called upon to perform those functions which he is called upon to do at the present time.

There is a very serious acute distress amongst these people. The position of the Government ought not to be that, as these people are allowed to prey upon the zamindars, therefore we need not look into their grievances. That cannot be the position of Government. It ought not to be the position of any decent government. The question is this, whether a person of this importance, of this education, a person who is a part of the machinery of Government, whether he is to be treated in this shabby manner. It is

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

a matter on which the Government should concentrate its attention. It is not for us to state how much money is needed, but if it is a function which the Honourable Revenue Member wishes to throw on our shoulders, we are prepared to meet this objection on the part of the Government. Two crores and a half in the shape of release of provincial contributions and 76 lakhs or thereabouts in the form of additional taxation have all been spent by Government on its various branches of administration but the patwaris have had no share in them. I therefore respectfully submit to honourable members that they should tackle this problem before them very seriously.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

"That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 30,06,170—  
Total Pay of Establishment."

**Mr. Din Muhammad** [East and West Central Towns (Muhammadan) Urban] : Sir, I have every sympathy for the poor officials who complain that they cannot make the two ends meet with the small pittance that is allowed to them, but that is not the only consideration which should prevail with us. The question is, why should patwaris be singled out for any preferential treatment in an adversity budget. The other day when the honourable member for labour (Mr. M. A. Ghani) brought forward a resolution asking for a committee of enquiry into the case of those persons who were getting less than Rs. 60 per mensem, the House strenuously opposed it and the motion was lost. To-day, one class of such persons has been brought again before the House and it is urged on their behalf that it is impossible for them to meet all those expenses which their mode of life demands and that therefore their case should be considered at once. Personally I think that out of all those persons who receive small salaries, he is the only person who is most fortunately placed. He lives in a village, gets his house free, his office furniture free, his office in the shape of *patwarikhana* free, (*Interruption*) and his monthly allowances as well. The zamindars who fed him 50 years ago feed him still and in addition to the salary that is allowed to him he receives something extra in the shape of allowances for the copies of mutation entries that he makes and other small services that he renders. When a few years ago, the patwaris' case was brought before the Council, the Council then also with one voice decided against him. It is therefore reasonable to expect from the honourable member who has moved this motion that he should make out a case which would appeal to reason and to common sense. Out of the patwaris themselves he has singled out the revenue patwaris. Why should the canal patwaris be made an exception? Why should the chaprasis, orderlies and clerks getting hardly Rs. 20 or Rs. 25 per mensem, living in towns, working day and night and having no facilities that are available to the patwaris, why should they be ignored especially when we know that they have to incur a very heavy expenditure on account of their living in towns? It does not stand to reason that we should devote our attention to his case alone at the present stage. The honourable mover was pleased to remark that there was something wrong with the Government in ignoring this case every time it was brought before this House, that even in spite of the prosperity budgets the case has never been considered. I should say in reply that we had a prosperity budget only once when the Council met for the first time in the first year and that

all the subsequent budgets had been adversity budgets, deficit budgets. (*An honourable member*: No.) That is at least what the figures show, the figures which are supplied to us. It was the budget for 1927-28 that was a prosperity budget. All the subsequent budgets showed a deficit. Under these circumstances I do not think it would be reasonable for us to make an invidious distinction in favour of the revenue patwaris and ignore the chaprasis, clerks and others getting below Rs. 60. They will then have a real grievance.

With these remarks, I beg to oppose the motion.

**Mr. President**: My attention has been invited to Standing Order 7<sup>I</sup> which runs as follows:—

"When a resolution has been moved and has not been withdrawn with the leave of the Council no resolution or amendment raising substantially the same question shall be moved within one year."

One of the honourable members of this House, Mr. M. A. Ghani, moved a resolution that the salaries of certain servants, including the patwaris should be raised. That resolution was discussed and lost. As patwaris were included in it, the question is whether the present amendment is in order.

**Pandit Nanak Chand**: Sir, you will be pleased to note that I have referred in my amendment to three things, the pay and the provision of a grade, the provision of office furniture and the provision of a pension. On the last occasion, if I remember right, the honourable member asked for a committee to go into the question of pay. His was a substantive motion while mine is a budget cut in order to discuss the matters I have specified. The appointment of a committee is something entirely different from asking Government to take immediate steps to enhance the pay of the patwaris and to give them certain other benefits which I have mentioned. Thus it is an entirely different motion from the one which was discussed recently. Mr. Ghani's motion was a dilatory motion, it asked for the appointment of a committee for the collection of information on the matter. Mine proceeds on the positive basis without the need for any enquiry. I positively assert that they are low paid and that fact cannot be denied.

As to the point that the patwaris were included in the previous resolution, I beg to submit that that should not bar me from raising this discussion. In that way almost every department would be out of order from being discussed. While the honourable member in the previous case asked for a committee, for which the House gave a negative reply, I ask that the matter be discussed here and now and the Council will give its vote according as I have made out a case for immediate action or not. On these various grounds I submit that this is an entirely different motion and you will be pleased to allow it to be discussed.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain**: Sir, in both the motions of which notice has been given by the honourable member, Pandit Nanak Chand, he raises the same question in regard to the patwaris and wants the Government to adopt measures to increase their pay, etc. I do not object to that, that while he is moving a cut of Rs. 1 out of my budget he is doing so with the object of enhancing the expenditure, because previously it has been ruled that if a mover keeps within certain limits

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

he might be permitted to do so, But there is a second objection, the one relating to the matter having been discussed already. This, I venture to submit, is fatal to the motion. Firstly, because the resolution which this Council rejected had asked for a committee in order to raise the pay of those who were receiving less than Rs. 60, as the pay they were receiving was a starvation wage. And the word 'substantially' in the Standing Order if it could have any meaning in a Standing Order or a rule, surely cannot but mean that substantially it is the same question that is now raised, not identically the same. The point then discussed was the raising of the pay and this is exactly what the mover says he wants the Government to do now at once. Not that he could possibly do it knowing that his cut is for reduction of the budget and that the Council is not in order in demanding enhancement unless it be by way of a resolution, strictly speaking.

As for other matters, that is to say, giving them furniture—I think that is the only thing that is left over—the honourable mover has evidently forgotten that he himself never went beyond a desire that the patwaris should be given a bonus or a provident fund when we had prosperous budgets. But now that we have a deficit budget, it is not for him to go beyond what he wanted then.

**Mr. President:** Here is the resolution which the honourable member, Mr. Ghani, had moved. It reads:

"This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee of official and non-official members of this Council (with a majority of the latter) to enquire into and report on the grievances of Government and quasi-Government servants drawing less than Rs. 60 a month as regards their pay, pension, quarters, allowances, hours of work and other conditions of service."

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang:** I would submit, Sir, that from the language of the resolution which you have been pleased to read out, the present motion cannot be excluded. The Honourable the Revenue Member has been pleased to say that the question before the House then was about the same, though not exactly the same. Obviously, he has ignored the possibility of two things having been present in the minds of some members at the time when that motion was under consideration. That motion was lost. The very fact that that motion was lost would let this motion in for two reasons, and those are the reasons which, I submitted, are embodied in these two possibilities.

**Mr. President:** Standing Order 71 (Article 122) applies to resolutions only. But assuming that it applies by analogy to the motion before the House I allow the discussion to proceed, as the resolution of Mr. Ghani was different from the amendment now before the Council. The resolution was for the appointment of a committee for submitting their report after going into certain matters. The definite question now before the House is that the pay of patwaris which is said to be insufficient be raised and Government is being criticised for the alleged insufficiency of pay. So I allow the discussion to proceed.

**Mr. Labh Singh** [Rawalpindi Division and Lahore Division North, (Non-Muhammadan) Rural]: Sir, I heartily associate myself with the remarks that have been made by the honourable mover of this amendment, and am in a very peculiar

position to speak on behalf of patwaris as I have come in contact with a very large number of them. My constituency extends over eight rural districts, practically from the Ravi to the Indus and beyond. I should like to make a few observations with respect to this class, a very important class I would say of Government servants. In the first place this class has been unnecessarily maligned. It is a much maligned class and for no adequate or good reasons. This class has been indiscriminately described as corrupt in a general way, but such general descriptions could not possibly be applicable to the class as a whole. And, indeed, whenever general denunciations are made they should be taken not with the proverbial grain of salt but with a big spoonful of salt. The real fact of the matter is that there is no other class of ministerial officials who may be more properly described as the very foundation of the administration than this class. This class is a highly over-worked class and mostly underpaid. The patwaris, in order to be able to cope with their work successfully, have to work practically for full 24 hours and even then, they are not, able to finish what they are called upon to do from time to time. In view of the fact therefore that these people have got to work so hard and that they are educated people and are paid so low, their case is a very special one and calls for special treatment. My friend from Muhammadan Gujranwala has told us that there is no reason why their case should be singled out for special treatment as there are other underpaid servants like orderlies, peons, etc. But, Sir, my submission is that the case of the orderlies is quite different and it is not to be compared with the case of these poor patwaris because the patwaris are after all educated and have to educate their children and have to live up to a certain minimum standard of life. The orderlies are able to get pensions and they can supplement their income in many other ways, not unknown to honourable members, whereas these poor patwaris have to a large extent to live upon the pittance which is allowed to them in the shape of small salaries. Sir, not only a case has been made out for an increase in their pay, but I would submit that a stronger case exists for their post being made pensionable. When these people have been working day and night and working hard on a small salary for their entire working life, there is no reason why they should not be allowed pensions. The only reason why these people who are at the lowest rung of the ladder are not allowed either enhancement of their pay or pension seems to me to be that they are not organized. If the patwaris were properly organized they could have their demands considered with respect, nay, the demands would then become irresistible. My advice to the patwaris would be that they should organise themselves and then alone could their demands be made irresistible. Whenever a demand is made for the enhancement of the pay of the poor people we are met with the plea that no funds are available and that we are face to face with a deficit budget. Such pleas come with ill grace from quarters responsible for the Lee loot. Sir, my submission is that if one were to scan the copy of budget from cover to cover a large number of items of expenditure can be laid hands on and pointed out which are not, in my opinion and in the opinion of this House expressed over and over again, at all necessary. Take for instance, the posts of the five Divisional Commissioners. This House expressed itself more than once that these posts were absolutely unnecessary and should be abolished. After the Reforms we have three Ministers to do the

[Mr. Labh Singh.]

duty which formerly was done by these Divisional Commissioners, and thus these posts have become absolutely redundant. These Commissioners perform no functions except that of a post office. Why not abolish these Divisional Commissioners? The funds which are now being used to pay their big salaries and their establishments and other incidental charges would be rendered available for making the desired increase in the pay of the underpaid patwaris. After all, Sir, we have got to see that these people should get a living wage. There was a time when these patwaris were able to supplement their income by taking certain customary dues from the local zamindars, but those times have changed and these people have now to live absolutely on their small salaries. Sir, this is not a plea for a corrupt people but for people who are anxious to live an honest life. A case, therefore, has been made out for giving them at least a living wage and we should not hesitate to act upon this case and in any event, if their pay is not increased then, pensions should be allowed to them as is allowed to all Government servants.

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (Nominated, Non-Official) : Sir, if we should happen to be standing on a battle field and if there had been a heavy fire and many persons wounded, whom would you attend to first, the man who is slightly wounded or the man who has been so badly wounded that he is about to die? I maintain, that amongst the employees of Government there are several that may be classed as much worse off than the patwaris. And to take up the case of a man who is not so badly off is not fair, not fair to those who are much worse off and it would result in their making a great deal of noise and raising the objection why they have been passed over.

The cheapest commodity in the market, I think, is the clerk because his number is in excess of the demand. For this reason alone I think this is not the proper time to take up this question.

Then there are other reasons which we should not forget. What are the conditions prevalent in villages? Those who are acquainted with village life—I myself live in a village—those who are acquainted with village life, know that people are much more hospitable there than the people in towns—it is their way of thinking—and it is the custom among them that presents of fodder, presents of grain and presents of milk, etc., etc., are given to them, but giving willingly is quite a different thing from extortion. These are our village ways and the patwari certainly does come in for presents which I maintain are not extorted. So, therefore, his condition there cannot be said to so bad as it has been made out to be.

Further, let us see if really this is the proper time for proposing any increase in the wages of those who are paid small salaries. I would say, do not single out the case of the patwaris, but take up the whole case; but again the question is, whether this is the proper time. If we take into consideration the fact that prices are falling and therefore conditions are easier than before for those getting small salaries, and coupled with it, the fact that we have got a deficit budget, how are these proposals to be viewed? I quite agree, that there are certain people amongst the employees whose e-

salaries should be increased, but I request you to consider that the present is not the best time for raising this question and for this reason, I am opposed to the proposal.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh** (Sikh, Urban): Sir, although I am in sympathy not only with the spirit of the motion but with the motion itself, yet I am not prepared to support it because I consider it inopportune. Sir, there is no country in the world in which subordinate officers are paid so low salaries and the high officers so high salaries as in this country. And amongst the subordinates, I admit, the patwari is the most lowly paid officer as compared with the amount and the responsible nature of his work. Sir, it is not in our power to reduce high salaries. (*An honourable member*: Why not?). We may not do it and some of us dare not do it. In view of the deficit budget as has been pointed out by previous speakers, it is not possible now to incur more expenditure. If we agree upon more expenditure we will have to provide more money by taxation. But I doubt very much whether the House is prepared to agree to any kind of taxation. The country is too poor to bear any fresh burden of taxation. There was a very strong case, at least a stronger case, a year or two before than it is now for such an increase in pay. The prices of wheat, cotton, and nearly of every necessary of life have fallen in recent times and on account of that reason alone this is not an opportune time to bring forward a motion of this nature.

My another reason for not supporting this motion is this. If we were to give this concession to the patwaris, it will induce others who are lowly paid to demand this concession for themselves also. How then, with any reasonableness would you be able to refuse that demand? I admit, Sir, that the patwaris have a strong case. Whenever there is an opportunity and the budget allows it, Government ought to consider their case first and consider it very sympathetically. But at present, I believe this motion is inopportune, and I would request my honourable friend to withdraw it. (*Hear, hear*).

**Sayad Muhammad Husain** [Montgomery (Muhammadan), Rural]: It is written in the Holy Bible that it is easier for a camel to pass through the eye of a needle than for a rich man to enter the Kingdom of God. And why? Because they have no sympathy with the poor. This line of demarcation will go on so long as the rich man has no sympathy for the poor. What is a patwari? He is the pivot of the administration from time immemorial, and has been paid Rs. 20 and sometimes even less. A dog cannot live on Rs. 20, a horse cannot live on Rs. 20 and yet, you expect patwari to live on that and to be decently dressed too. You also expect that he should not be corrupt. Everybody knows that a patwari cannot do without corruption, without beggary, without litigation. It is an open secret that the patwari has been fed by the zamindars. On the one side, the zamindar is heavily taxed, he has to pay land revenue and he has to pay the patwari as well. If not, the patwari will bring him trouble. On the other hand, if the zamindar is too strong for the patwari, the patwari will starve. Is it proper for a civilized Government for a strong and rich Government like the present one, to allow a patwari, who is the pivot of the administration, to be starved? It is very difficult for any man to live on Rs. 20, and everybody knows—and there are examples.

[Sayad Muhammad Husain.]

of patwaris sending their sons to Roorki and other places for higher education. Where do they get the money from? Do they meet these expenses from their pay, or have they any special jagirs? How do they manage it? They manage it from the pockets of other people. And when we ask the Government to take their case into consideration, with what courage can they say, "they are corrupt"? A patwari has to eat, he has to make both ends meet, and as he cannot do it out of his pay he has to be corrupt. Everybody asks; "This is a deficit budget, how can you meet the extra expenditure?" I can tell them, they can meet this and many other things. In some patriotic countries, members drawing Rs. 5,000 and such large salaries have given away voluntarily a good portion of their pay for the benefit of these people. I am not asking those here to do that. The zamindars give money to these people. (*Interruption*). There are Hindu patwaris also. I always finance some of the poor patwaris. How can a man get on with Rs. 20 a month? He has to make money somehow to meet his wants. Whenever we bring this question before Government, they say, "We are in full sympathy with the lot of the patwaris, but the budget is a deficit one and whenever we get a surplus budget we will give effect to it." But they never translate their sympathy into action. When there is a surplus budget and when we bring this matter to the notice of Government they give some other reply. This was, I think, the line of argument of Pandit Nanak Chand and we do not oppose it. Even if something good comes out of Pandit Nanak Chand why should we oppose it? On the contrary, I congratulate him, he being a rich man, for coming to the help of the poor.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Do you give away everything?

**Sayad Muhammad Husain :** I am very glad to notice that the honourable member takes such a keen interest in the case of the poor people. A patwari is a poor man, he is corrupt, he does all sorts of mischievous things, because he is unable to live on the pay he gets. If Government will enhance his pay they will be helping the zamindar class also—(*The Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :* Quite sure?) for there will be less opportunities for corruption (*The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :* Are you quite sure?). Government may say that if any such case of corruption is brought to their notice he will be dismissed. If we are to believe in the argument of my learned friend it means that because they are incorrigible therefore let them remain as they are. That is not the way to cure the evil. They must be paid just as much, if not more, as will enable them to live above want. Otherwise they will make good from the pockets of the zamindars. Under the circumstances, I support my friend and request Government to bestow its early and sympathetic consideration to this important question.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang** [North-West Towns, (Non-Muhammadan), Urban]: I have only to say a few words in support of this motion. I have gone through certain proceedings of a conference of the patwaris. Two resolutions are embodied in a pamphlet which has been handed over to me, as I believe it has been handed over to some other members of this House. The chief complaint of the patwaris appears to be two-fold. One is that they are not treated as Government servants at all. Formerly, before 1885,



if I am not mistaken, they were treated as village servants and they looked to the village zamindars for their pay, promotion and allowances and all sorts of privileges, and they did not require much in the shape of cash. They had a house to live in in the village usually, and they used to be one of the villagers themselves. They either had a shop or some land which was one of the sources of their income. Then they had fodder for their cattle, milk and other perquisites free, because those things in those days did not cost much. They had also a share in the grain at the harvest time just as the other village functionaries, both ecclesiastical and temporal, had. The potter had his share, the barber had his share, the dhoby had his share and other functionaries had their share of grain at the harvest time. It was considered that the patwaris should be brought under proper control, and after 1885, I am speaking subject to correction, they were made, so to say, quasi-Government servants. But although they were brought under Government control in the matter of discipline and in the matter of the sources from which their orders emanated and were subject like other Government servants to be transferred from one place to another, they were not given the privileges which other Government servants enjoyed. Up to this time, I understand, they are only given a sort of gratuity after a service extending over thirty to forty years. They are able to put in such long service, because they begin service early. After such long service, they got no pensions at all. Again, they are not placed on the same level with any kind of Government clerks. The clerks begin with a certain amount of pay, and they get their promotion as time passes. But these gentlemen do not. There are only three classes of pay for patwaris, viz., Rs. 20, 28 and 26, and no patwari gets more than Rs. 26. I am again speaking subject to correction. They have no other privileges which the Government servants, say, of the clerical line, enjoy. For instance, if a clerk is sent on Government duty from one place to another, he gets his travelling allowance. I am not sure if the patwari gets any travelling allowance if he goes on duty from one village to another, but I know that if they move within their own circle, they do not get any travelling allowance; even if they are made to go under the orders of their officers, say, to tahsil headquarters, on official duty, they do not get any.

A great deal of confusion prevails among many people as to the duties of these patwaris. To give a definite example, I am told they are now required to submit confidential reports of the meetings held in their villages and of political movements that may be carried on in their circles. They are expected to submit this report immediately. Even a day's delay in some cases may not be excused, and yet I am told they are not provided even with postage so that they may be able to send their reports by post. I asked them whether they could send them post bearing. They said nobody would receive them, they would be returned and they might incur the displeasure of their officer. I asked how they managed and I was told that they had to go personally either to the district headquarters or tahsil headquarters to hand over that report and that they were not paid. It might be said that they would perhaps get hold of the village *chaukidar* or some *kamin* in the village, but it is not always possible for them to get hold of even a *chaukidar* and no other *kamin* in the village would do any service. The Government can realise that there is a spirit

[Dr. G. C. Narang.]

abroad that all unpaid work is most unpleasant and is refused. Nobody would like to do anything without payment and the times of impressed labour are fast disappearing, if they have not already disappeared. The result is that very often it is they personally who have to go to deliver these reports to the tahsildar or to some other officer and they get no payment for that. If it is so, I would submit that it is a genuine grievance and the authorities ought to look into the matter. But if it is false, then certainly, I should not like to have any sympathy with them so far as this matter is concerned. Then I am told that they are made to do certain other duties which fall outside the range of their legitimate work as village accountants. The work of preparing electoral rolls for instance has increased so much during the last ten years that it certainly makes a very heavy encroachment upon their time and labour. There are various kinds of electoral rolls to be prepared in which the patwari's assistance is taken and I am told that no extra allowances are made to them for this extra work. If it is so, certainly some extra allowances ought to be given to them. Then I am told that they are not supposed to have any office. They are supposed perhaps to have an office but the Government is not supposed to provide them with any office. If it is so, I would be excused if I say that it is really, to say the least, curious, if not really scandalous. Here is a class of quasi-Government servants or officials who are expected to keep correct accounts with respect to the holdings in their circles, accounts which after they have been verified by revenue officers carry a presumption of correctness under the law. Such an important duty is assigned to them and yet Government does not think it necessary to provide them with any office. When I was young, I found, living in the village, that they had a *patwarkhana* at least in our village, but I am now told that *patwarkhanas* were originally expected to be provided by zamindars and the zamindars now have shaken themselves free of this duty. They say: well, it is the Government's business to keep accounts and correct measurements of the land and to keep their books somewhere and lodge their patwaris somewhere, why should we provide them with houses and offices? If it is so, again I submit subject to correction, if they have no offices and the duty of providing an office for themselves is imposed upon them, it is really a matter which ought to be looked into and it is a genuine grievance. With respect to their lodging, again, either the Government expects them to live in rented houses and pay rent from their own pockets or perhaps the Government expects that the villagers in order to oblige or to keep their patwari *khush* will give them some sort of hut or *kur* or some sort of building to live in, but no zamindar is bound to provide them with such shelter or a house. And a patwari does require a decent lodging because sometimes girdawars or kanungos or other officials come there and would lodge for a night or so or at least rest for a short time with the patwari. If this grievance again is genuine it must be redressed. Two arguments have been urged against this motion. One is that this is a deficit budget. Certainly it is a deficit budget and we have great sympathy with the Government. We appreciate its difficulties. But, on the other hand, if what I have said is really correct and these grievances are just, no time should be lost in redressing these grievances even if some cuts have to be made in other departments. How can a man have his office in the air, or in a village

street or under a banyan or peepul tree in the village? How can he be expected to carry on his work? He must be in his field most of his time doing girdawari work or measurement work or some other work so that this argument that this is a deficit budget—no doubt, it does possess some force—is not a conclusive argument. Their needs must be recognised and savings must be made somewhere else and their grievances must be redressed at once. My learned friend from Gujranwala asked: Why has the honourable mover of this motion ignored the canal patwaris, why has he ignored the chaprasis? Well, probably the honourable member from Gujranwala was here when the question of the chaprasis came up and a motion was before the House to have a committee appointed to go into their case. I am not sure if my honourable friend voted for that. Every member who is opposed to this motion for one reason or another thinks as if the whole duty of making the two ends of the budget meet lies on his shoulders. If it is a genuine grievance it must be brought to the notice of those people who have the running of Government in their hands.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram:** What about those who have to pay?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang:** I am sure that those whose duty it is, if they are so minded can make the two ends meet and yet do something to redress the grievances. Now, the second argument is that of corruption. Some people say that these patwaris are corrupt, they can make the two ends meet, they rob this man and that and therefore it is not a paramount and urgent necessity that those grievances of theirs should be removed or that their pay should be increased, or that they should be brought on the list of Government servants and pensions be given to them. Those honourable members who used this as an argument forgot one very important thing. Let us assume for the sake of argument that these patwaris are corrupt, that they supplement their slender pay by robbing the zamindars. Should not zamindars themselves come up and cry against this corruption and approach the Government to somehow keep these robbers under check and not allow them to prey upon the poor zamindars? This argument is a strong argument in favour of the motion and not against the motion. How can the Government, for a moment, allow a section of its employees, whether regular government servants or irregular government servants, to prey upon the people, at least. If for nothing else, for the sake of protecting the society from their ravages their pay and emoluments should be increased and the concessions asked for should be given to them. That argument, so far from supporting those who are opposing the motion is a strong argument in favour of the motion. Now, there is an indirect way of the zamindars being burdened and probably it was that that my honourable friend from Rohtak had in view. If their salaries are increased, the provision will have to be made in the budget, taxation will have to be increased and he is afraid that ultimately that taxation will fall upon the zamindars. If that taxation is to fall upon the zamindars, it is the zamindars even now who are paying them and perhaps paying them more than they would have to pay if a provision were to be made in the budget. [Interruption.] That certainly applies to the case of a zamindar. An ignorant zamindar would refuse to give one angareane but would give a whole *pheli* or a lump of *ya*. So that I think

[Dr. G. C. Narang.]

that this is a more economic way of meeting the demands of the patwaris. One word more and I would sit down. The patwaris are not like unskilled labourers. I know some of these people. They are very well educated, they are trained people, some of them are very good draftsmen, very good mathematicians, they know a great deal of arithmetic, of geometry, of mensuration, of drawing and have a very good working knowledge of Urdu and Persian, and some of them know a little English as well. A man with these qualifications it is impossible to get outside the circle of patwaris and there is no reason why their case even under a deficit budget should not stand distinguished from the case of unskilled labourers. The mason sits on the scaffold and gives orders to the cooly "bring gura, cement and lime": they are both of them human beings and probably both are illiterate, but the one is trained and the other is untrained and the wages of the former are therefore twice as much as those of the latter. For a similar reason also patwaris should be the first whose case should be looked into. Again, patwaris are really sleeping lions. They are carrying on a very important part of the administration. If they are evil-minded and discontented, well, I feel that if they fall into the hands of a competent agitator who wants to paralyse the Government, he need not go anywhere else but straight to the patwaris and get hold of the 18,000 of them and paralyse the whole administration. I do not want that such a state of affairs should come about but the Government should at the same time keep in view that hope deferred maketh the heart sick and if their grievances are not redressed, naturally they will be liable, I submit, to be influenced by people who want to do harm to the present administration and to be used as a weapon in their hands. (*An honourable member*: Is it a threat?). It is not for me to give threats. I do not believe in empty threats. As my honourable friend pointed out they are a sign of weakness. But it is perfectly correct that if a threat comes from patwaris it will not be an idle threat.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, the debate has assumed the form of a special pleading for one of the numerous departments of Government and I wish to sound a note of warning so that the Council may not gradually slip into the practice of taking up by turns the case of particular groups of Government servants with the object of enhancing their pay or improving their prospects. I wish the Council to deliberate over such momentous affairs in the way that such momentous affairs should be considered. If some honourable members were to take up a case of a particular set of Government servants and place it before the Council, given a particular amount of interest which is to be found in every part of the House, is there a case of any set of Government servants which cannot catch the eyes of the honourable members saying how badly they are paid and what an amount of work they are doing and whether it is right for any one individual or Government to pay them so badly?

Take the case of the village school master who is the moulder of the character of the next generation, who has to teach them not only to read and write but to teach them honesty, patriotism, hygiene and a hundred and one virtues that various societies try to promulgate. What is his pay? Not quite as munificent as the pay of the patwari. Where is his house?

As a matter of fact, Sir, it seems to me that the honourable members when they say what is Rs. 20 or what is Rs. 80 are really showing a certain lack of information as to the economic conditions prevailing in the province. Do they know that there is a part of this province which has been in the grip of economic distress for the last year or more, where test works in connection with the famine attract poor and unfortunate human being from a distance of say five or even six miles for nine pice (2½ annas) a day? Sir, true, they do not know these things, but Government has taken pains to put in the public press a number of times various statements showing how badly the condition of these people is, how there are amongst the members of this Council some, one at least, if not more, who have devoted their money which Providence has given them in order to ameliorate the condition of these unfortunate people, I mean the honourable member who represents rural Hissar (Chaudhri Chhajju Ram) who has spent lakhs. (*Hear, hear*). There are official members of this Council who generally devote themselves days after days and weeks after weeks in considering these unfortunate cases and helping these people in saving no end of valuable cattle from starvation and death, and recently helping to save human life. When these honourable members realise what the condition of the country is, when they realise that nine pice represents the wages of a man and seven pice of a woman, then I trust they will appreciate that Rs. 80 means something. And after all, who is to pay for the additional expenditure that I should like to incur with the object of helping the patwaris, the schoolmasters, the chaprasis and no end of other highly deserving people? For, your budget in that case will go up not by four or five lakhs as has been suggested. Why, in the case of revenue patwaris alone, if the concessions asked for were granted, it would amount to an additional expenditure of no less than 25 lakhs a year. If we include the other patwaris, chaprasis, school masters, etc., the figure would work up to between 2 and 8 crores a year. It has been asked what about the Commissioners, what about the civil servants and so forth? Need I mention, Sir, that so far as the Engineering department is concerned, can any one seriously contend that the pay given to these men is not the pay that they command in the open market? Can any one contend that the pay that the schoolmaster gets is higher than the pay he will get in the local market? Then much has been made of the civil service and of the police service. Those of you who know the Police force will agree with me that many men who are no better qualified than those in the police and who have adopted an independent profession are making twice or three times the amount of money the police officers get. Then take the civil service. After all the pay that they get does not amount to more than one-fourth or one-fifth of the amount that is required for the revenue patwaris alone. Much is made of the salaries of Members and Ministers. Supposing there is a saving of Rs. 1,000 per month from the salary of each of the Ministers and Members. It will not amount to more than Rs. 50,000 for the whole year. To whom are you going to pay that, To the patwaris, or chaprasis or the schoolmasters? You will see that even if you do away with the top officials, even then you will not have one-tenth of the money wanted for the purpose of increasing the pay of these men.

What then is the result of such motions? The honourable member hinted at the possibility of patwaris being used as agents for spreading

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i Husain.]

political propaganda against Government which I must say means the same thing as the disturbance of peace and good order. I trust the patwaris will lose no time in repudiating the possibility of any one attempting to mislead them. I have not the slightest doubt that the large rural classes amongst whom the patwaris live will not tolerate for one moment any attempt to mislead the patwaris. As a matter of fact, Government has not got another set of Government officials which it values more than it values the patwaris. We have tried to foster the spirit that a patwari, a Government Member, the Financial Commissioner and the Deputy Commissioner are all but pieces of one organism the sole object of which is to serve the province, and a man, be he a patwari or a Financial Commissioner or a Revenue Member, as a public servant he is just the same. There is only the difference in the walks of life to which we have been called; otherwise the Punjab Government makes no distinction whatsoever of classes and sections, high or low. It was only recently that this Council was anxious that the status of tahsildars should be raised. Government made every effort to do so. It should be fully realised that Government is not an outside agency, but is there to carry out your wishes. If you are prepared to introduce higher rates of pay and provide the wherewithals, why, Government is bound to carry out your wishes, but you must realise the effect of what you wish to do. No one is going to find money from his own pocket to improve the prospects of any service. Are you prepared to give directions to your Government that it should improve the prospects of the lowest paid services in the province so that one who gets less than Rs. 30 should have his pay and prospects raised? If so, be prepared to foot the bill to the extent of 2 to 3 crores a year. If you are, your wishes should be carried out. If not, it is no use, by expressions of such sympathies or appreciation to sow the seeds of discontent. It will do them no good, it will do the country no good. Therefore, Sir, I wish honourable members to approach the consideration of this question not in a spirit of having promised to help a particular class, deserving or otherwise. That is not the right spirit. The spirit in which I wish this honourable House to tackle this matter and similar matters is to consider that they are the sole custodians of the funds of the province. If they make up their mind that there is good reason for revising the scales of pay, then they should be prepared to pay for it as well. I would very much like on behalf of the Financial Commissioner to express the view that general denunciations of patwaris are not justified. It is a pleasure during this debate to hear from a certain part of the House that most of those denunciations are altogether ill-founded. I have not the slightest doubt that for this I am prepared to convey the thanks of my Financial Commissioners to the House.

As regards houses and writing material, I have very great pleasure in stating to the House that so far as writing materials are concerned, Government have definitely decided to make an allowance to each patwari for writing materials. (Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang: Four annas a month, but that too is not being paid). It was only owing to the deficit budget that that item had to be cut out, though it was included in the schedule of new expenditure. As regards houses, I was very pleased to hear the members growing eloquent as to the need of houses. I trust the same members

will not, at all events during the course of this session, begin to say that Government is wasting money in putting up buildings callously. When a member is becoming eloquent a small dispensary worth Rs. 500 or a small school worth Rs. 600 at once becomes a palace in his oratorical efforts. The position, therefore, is that Government has decided to build patwaris' quarters gradually. Why gradually? I think it is about 50 quarters for each division.

5 P.M.

You may say, that is too small a figure. Again, I will reply that I am prepared to put 500 a year for each division provided there are funds available. When honourable members of this House are keen about primary education, they want every other item to be cut down and only schools to be put up. When they are anxious for compulsory primary education being introduced, nothing else matters to them. Government should spend every available pice on that purpose. You give so many orders to be carried out with the available pice that one does not know where to make a beginning. But of this much I am sure, Government has recognised the principle of providing houses for patwaris as soon as funds are available. But here again, when the claims of primary education and *patwarkhanas* came in conflict, Government decided in favour of primary education and for the time being, put off building *patwarkhanas*. That is the position. I trust I have made it absolutely clear to the Council that Government has the greatest possible consideration for the patwaris. It recognises how valuable their work is. It also knows that although patwaris are up to their mark, there are, as the honourable members are aware, at least three times the number waiting outside to take their places if by any chance any one of the patwaris happens to fall ill or happens to be unable to carry on his duties. Am I not then placed in an awkward position if I am asked, 'Oh, you can get men three times over for the work you want done and that for the pay you are at present offering; why should you pay them higher rates of pay?' I am the first to recognise that Government should not take mean advantage of the need of the people. But you should not expect me really under the circumstances to take the responsibility of paying a much higher rate than they would get outside Government service; nor would you like me to commit the province to a course of action which when some of you take your place on these benches will be the first to try to get out of.

I wish this subject had not been debated at the length at which it has been debated. But I felt when the discussion took this turn that I had better place the Government point of view before the House. I trust the House will deal with the question in the way it deserves, in the spirit of statesmen, of responsible persons, and not simply as advocates throwing the burden of carrying it out on Government. (*Cheers*).

**Mr. M. A. Ghani** (Nominated, non-official): Sir, as it has been pointed out by the Honourable Revenue Member that this subject has been discussed at great length, I do not propose to make a long speech. I think very many points have been thoroughly thrashed out during the discussion by the members who have preceded me. There is one point, however, to which I would like to make a reference. The Honourable Revenue Member said that whenever there is a vacancy of the post of patwari there are many candidates for it. He was, I think, referring to the question of



[Mr. M. A. Ghani.]

supply and demand. My humble submission is that so far as the question of supply and demand of human beings is concerned, this principle of economics, of supply and demand cannot be applied. The principle of supply and demand can be applied to things that are sold in the market. A human being is not to be treated as a chattel, and therefore this principle cannot be applied to him. If you want to engage a servant, it becomes your duty to pay him at least a living wage. The pay that a patwari gets now is not a living wage. I have often pointed out in this House that no one has been able to prove that one can live on Rs. 20 or Rs. 23 or even Rs. 26 a month.

There is one other point to which I would like to make a reference, that is, as regards the question of provident fund for patwaris. This fund was sanctioned in 1921, and it is a great surprise to me that the fund has not been enforced even up to now. In 1926 the rules about the provident fund were framed, but they have not yet been brought into force.

Then, there is the question of quarters. I know it from my personal experience that patwaris cannot get decent houses in the villages. I think that it is time for the Government to redress the grievances of patwaris in all these respects. As I am not feeling well, with these few words, I whole-heartedly support the amendment.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** (South-East Rohtak, non-Muhammadan, Rural): Sir, I am not a little surprised that the honourable mover of the amendment has deemed it fit to make this motion in this particular year when he knows full well that the House had rejected this very motion when the times were certainly far better. I have every sympathy with the class of public servants who have to do arduous work and yet are not being paid on a very liberal scale. If I were in a position to do so, I would give all these classes of public servants a very liberal pay. But the real difficulty is to find money. I have every sympathy with these patwaris. I also wish the Government were in a position to pay them Rs. 40 a month each. I wish that the Council could lay its hands on funds which would enable it to vote a minimum salary of Rs. 60 a month for every public servant. But the real trouble is, where the money is to come from. Let us all take a responsible view of the thing. Let us not be carried away by sentiment. I have no desire to oppose the motion which benefits the patwaris. Patwaris form a very powerful class in the land. I think every member of this House who stands for election has to take account of them. (*Hear, hear*). They can make themselves disagreeable. They can do you an ill turn and they can also do you a lot of good. But in spite of all these considerations, in spite of our desire to help the patwari, in spite of all the odium that we may incur on account of our opposition to this motion, we cannot take a view which has not an element of full responsibility about it. (*Hear, hear*). Suppose we lend our support to this motion and it is carried, and suppose the Government feels that in view of the definite expression of opinion by the Council they give a substantial increase to these patwaris; where is the money to come from? Who is going to pay this money? It will be a very heavy bill. Let us just count the cost. My learned friend says that the number of revenue patwaris alone is about 18,000. If it is once conceded that these revenue patwaris are deserving of an increase on any ground whatsoever, can you refuse a similar increase to canal patwaris? On what logical ground



can you refuse to give an increase—a similar increase—to canal patwaris? Now, let us put the number of patwaris of both classes at 20,000. My friend says that an addition of Rs. 5 a month would be no solution of their difficulties. So, according to him it should be something more than five. Let us put the figure at 10, that is, an increase of Rs. 10 a month. This would mean a total extra expenditure to Government of Rs. 24,00,000 per annum. My friend says that the patwaris are a very hard worked class. I admit that they have to do very arduous work. But what about the village teacher? Is he not equally ill-paid in spite of the fact that he is certainly much better educated than the patwari? Besides, a patwari has some legitimate means of augmenting his income, but the village teacher has absolutely none.

Again, we must observe the ordinary laws of economics. After all, though it would not be proper to take undue advantage of the position of public servants and refuse them proper salary on the ground that any number of others will be forthcoming, yet, you cannot altogether ignore the fact that there is no lack of candidates. If there is one post vacant and you call for applications, you will get as many as 100 applications for that one post. You may be justified in overlooking this economic consideration to some extent, but you cannot overlook it entirely.

After all, there ought to be some relation between the salary that Government decides to give and the salary which would attract a class of people efficient enough to discharge the duties attached to a particular post. The present emoluments have proved sufficiently attractive. So, on the ground of ordinary laws of economics I beg to submit that no case has been made out for any increase in the patwaris' pay and allowances.

Now, the honourable member, who represents labour in this House (Mr. M. A. Ghani) said that nobody so far had been able to prove that Rs. 30 was a living wage in this country. The proposition is certainly too broad in the way in which he put it. It all depends upon what you call a living wage. The Honourable the Revenue Member stated just now in the House that there would be no lack of people willing to work from 8 to 10 hours a day for nine pice daily. Is that or is that not a living wage? Of course, for a man who would spend upon himself thousands of rupees a month, it would be very difficult to conceive how a man could live on Rs. 30 a month. Those who are members of this House are in the habit of spending many times more than the money which falls to the share of a patwari and naturally they think that a living wage should certainly be much higher than is represented by the pay which is given to a patwari. Now, I beg to submit that it is a very hard life no doubt, but if an ordinary zamindar, and if an ordinary labourer, is expected to live on nine pice a day, there is no reason why a patwari cannot when he can augment his income in a perfectly legitimate manner (A voice. How?) by giving copies of mutation entries, by giving copies of jamabandis, per khata for which he is allowed annas two, he is allowed to charge fees on the copies of these documents. That is perfectly legitimate income. To his pay he can add in this way some five or six rupees a month. If a labourer or an ordinary zamindar can live on nine pice a day, there is no reason why a patwari cannot live on Rs. 25 or Rs. 30 a month. He may not be able to maintain a standard of comfort and decency which we observe for ourselves but that is not the point.

[R. S. Ch. Chhotu Ram.]

Now, I come to the question of finding money. It has been urged : after all, even as things are, the patwari has to be paid by the zamindars ; he preys upon the zamindars, he robs the zamindars ; and that where would be the real harm if the patwari gets in the shape of increased pay what he now exacts in an illegal manner ? But there is a very real difference between the two positions. A zamindar is under no legal obligation to pay a patwari any bribe, but if you by your own vote, or the Government by a valid order, allows an increase in the pay of the patwaris, it becomes a legal charge upon your revenues. Now if you add anything like 20 lakhs or 30 lakhs on account of patwaris alone to your budget, the money must come from somewhere. We all know that the only persons on whom a local Government can throw their burden are practically the zamindars. If the zamindar members of this House are prepared to find 20 lakhs or 30 lakhs of rupees a year for patwaris alone, well, let them say so. If the zamindars do not want to add to their burdens, then they must say, we are not prepared to lend our support to this motion. The honourable mover of this amendment has not indicated any source whatsoever from which income can be derived, the burden of which will not fall upon the shoulders of the zamindars. If my honourable friend had been in a position to suggest fresh taxation, the burden of which would not have fallen on the zamindars, if he had proposed some remedy which would bring money from amongst the commercial classes, *sahukars*, money-lenders and shop-keepers, I would have given my whole-hearted support to the motion. But I know that if an increase is sanctioned in respect of the pay of the patwaris, the burden is bound to fall upon the zamindars, and, therefore, I should earnestly suggest to the zamindar members of this House that they should ponder and consider well before they make up their mind to cast their votes, one way or the other. It is all very well to think in generous terms, but after all, you have to take into consideration the interests of those who have sent you to this House. If you think you can, consistently with your duty in this respect, give your vote in favour of this motion, you may. But it seems to me that we cannot effectively safeguard the interests of our constituents and yet vote in favour of this motion.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore, (Sikh) Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I wish just to say a few words with regard to this amendment. First of all, it can be said without any fear of contradiction that if this province were enjoying responsible Government, such a motion would never have come before the House. (*Hear, hear*). It is needless to point out that the party which is responsible for this motion will not be affected in the least by the extra expenditure which this amendment involves. It is also clear that the income of those who will have to bear this extra burden is not more than two annas a day, while the patwari is getting much more than that. Then in addition to his regular pay, he earns a goodly amount by way of remunerations for providing copies of *jamabandis*, etc., to the zamindars. It is also well-known that the patwari gets many of his necessities free of any charge e.g. he never has to spend a single pice on fuel and fodder. Under these circumstances, it is not correct to say that the patwaris are not getting a living wage, and that it is not possible for them to make both ends meet with their present salaries.

However, Sir, even if we accept the view that the patwari is really the most ill-paid public servant, it is not proper to ask the zamindar, whose income is much less than that of a patwari, to share his burden. Had the honourable the mover of this amendment suggested in the course of his speech that in order to meet the extra expenditure involved in his amendment the salaries of the higher officials may be reduced, we would have been only too ready to lend him our support. I will support him even now, but I must point out that if the proposal to reduce the salaries of the higher officials were brought forward, the mover and his party would be the first to oppose it. I would, therefore, request my honourable friends to bear in mind the income of the zamindars when they bring forward resolutions and amendments of this kind. With these few remarks, I resume my seat.

**Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali** [Gujrat East (Muhammadan) Urban] (Urdu): Sir, this amendment has already been discussed at a very great length and, therefore, I will confine myself to a very brief survey of the situation under consideration. I would rather this amendment were of a general character and did not concern only a particular class of public servants; because in the latter case any person with a sense of honesty and responsibility is bound to discuss everything with regard to that class. However, being in for it now, I will first draw your attention to the list of the duties performed by the patwaris which my honourable friend the mover of this amendment has been pleased to lay before the House. He certainly did the thing very cleverly, showing every detail of a certain function as a duty by itself. That funny procedure reminds me of an equally funny analogy. Suppose I write a letter. Then if I were to follow the example of my honourable friend, I would not be content with saying that much only. On the other hand, I would magnify this very simple thing by saying: I took a paper, I took a pen, I took an ink-pot, I wrote the letter and then I took an envelope and wrote the address, then I stamped it and then I called my servant and asked him to post it (*Laughter*). The honourable member told us that the patwari has to go to the headquarters to submit his reports. With due deference to him I would say that this is far from being the fact. The patwari has so many lambardars and chaukidars to execute his orders and do the work for him. In fact, the whole village is at the beck and call of this powerful being because he has the power and means to do a good deal of harm to them. It is a matter of common knowledge that the greater part of the litigation going on in connection with land in the villages is due to him.

As regards their income and expenditure, I am free to admit that there are some patwaris who do live on their regular pay and legitimate remunerations. But this is not the case with the majority of them. More often than not they are accustomed not only to accept but also to snatch bribes of various kinds. Whenever an alienation of land takes place the patwari must be paid before all. I am not speaking of the revenue patwaris, it is generally about the patwaris of the Irrigation department. The patwari has been called a poor thing, but let me draw your attention to what this poor thing is doing in the village. Once a patwari asked a washerman to bring some fodder for his cow. The washerman said that he was going for a business, he will do it afterwards. But just imagine his amazement when he found after some time that he was required to pay land revenue for four *kilas* of land, about

[K. B. Ch. Fazal Ali.]

Rs. 40. In vain did he try to convince the patwari that he never so much as even thought of cultivating a single inch of land. The patwari would not listen to any such plea. He had written what he had written. All that was due to the fact that the man refused once to bring some fodder for his cow. The poor fellow appealed to the Irrigation department, but the order was that the matter had become time-barred. Thus, Sir, even if we take into consideration only that income of the patwari which is considered legal now-a-days, we find that he is by no means the poor thing as described by my honourable friend. All the necessities of life like ghee, grain, milk, etc., for his family and fodder for his horse he gets free. And, then, his earnings by illegitimate means are by no means inconsiderable. The position which a patwari enjoys in our villages will be clear from the following well-known incident:—Once a Deputy Commissioner paid a visit to a certain village. Being a perfect gentleman and a kind-hearted officer he gave a very patient hearing to what the villagers had to say and treated the zamindars very kindly. Now, in return, the villagers wanted to express their gratitude, and an old man said, "O Sahib, you are such a kindly officer. I pray to God that you may become a patwari very soon." (*Laughter*).

Now leaving aside the canal irrigation lands we turn our attention to girdawari. It is a matter of common knowledge that it is not always done at the spot. It has been said that the poor patwari is always on the go, and the pressure of work does not allow him any rest whatever. But I must submit that more often than not the patwari is to be found enjoying himself to the full under some shady tree near a well or *dera*. If he is often on the go it is for the sake of fodder for his cow or horse. (*Laughter*).

As I have said already the patwari can live quite comfortably on his regular pay and legitimate remuneration without having recourse to illegitimate means of augmenting his income. It has been asked why the zamindars do not drag the corrupt patwaris into courts of law. I submit, Sir, that that is surely a very round-about way of asking a very simple question, why the zamindars pay any gratifications at all. It cannot be denied that it is much easier not to pay anything than to approach the higher authorities with a complaint against the patwari or to drag him into a court of law. Therefore, if the zamindars had the courage or they could afford to make any representation against the patwari, they would not pay anything to him by way of illegal gratifications. But they cannot afford to incur the displeasure of such a powerful being by taking a step of this kind. Let it be remembered that the zamindars pay illegal gratifications not because they like to pay, but simply because they have to pay. (*Hear-hear*).

Then it was said that the present salary of the patwaris is too small and that if it is not increased, they will start a vigorous agitation and then the Government will be face to face with a very serious situation. With regard to that I would say that the Government can never succumb to such threats of agitation. Because if it did, then every department will try to take advantage of this weakness on the part of the Government. The honourable member has laid so much stress on the matter because, as has been pointed out by an honourable member, his own purse will not be touched by the extra expenditure that his amendment involves. The whole burden will fall on the

poor zamindars, and he wants to get credit for mere lip sympathy. This is just like the old saying :

دانا جي کا فائدہ حلوائی کی دوکان

As regards the agitation or boycott of services, I can supply you with ten thousand candidates within twenty-four hours.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Oh, you have undertaken to supply candidates to every department under the Government ?

**Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali :** The honourable member simply wants to create difficulties and enjoy fun at the expense of poor zamindars.

Some time ago, a resolution was brought forward in this House with regard to the grievances of lambardars and safaidposhes and zaildars. I know that there are some lambardars whose income by way of *pachotra* is not more than Rs. 5 only, while their extra expenditure as lambardars is as much as Rs. 20 on one occasion. Lambardars, safaidposhes and zaildars are the people who have very many duties to perform. They have to serve and work for every department day and night. They were the persons who not only supplied recruits for the army during the great war, but also presented their sons for the purpose. On that and other similar grounds the Government was asked to raise the remuneration of lambardars, safaidposhes and zaildars, and a resolution was passed by the Council twice. But Government could not raise their remuneration, because the money was not forthcoming, and because it involved an extra burden on zamindars. The same is the case with the present amendment, and there is no reason why it should not be rejected on the same ground.

I do not wish to repeat the arguments that have been advanced already, but I must say that, as it was pointed out by my honourable friend Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram, there is a special reason for this extraordinary sympathy for the patwari. Why do they not extend the same helping hand to the poor chankidar ? For the very simple reason that he can do nothing for or against them, while the patwari can make himself very useful as well as extremely disagreeable, if he chose. A resolution was also brought forward with regard to the condition of the low paid public servants, and I am free to admit that that was more reasonable than the present move as it included the patwaris also. But so far as the patwari is concerned, we may have certain reasons of our own to help or please him, but he surely is not so poor a thing that the honourable members would have us believe.

Then there is the question of demand and supply. With regard to that I need only point out that applications were last year invited for admission to a certain training school at our district for patwaris, and there was such a rush of candidates that the selection authorities found their task extremely difficult. This shows that the supply is much greater than the demand. Moreover, the office of the patwari requires no exceptional ability or high education like that of an Executive Councillor or a Minister whose pay is rightly high. Any person with quite an ordinary education can perform these duties satisfactorily.

Again, Sir, at one time it is said that the patwaris are very poorly paid and that they cannot meet their necessary expenses out of their present income, while at another the Government is asked to increase the pay of the

[ K. B. Ch. Fazl Ali. ]

patwaris on the ground that they are being crushed under the pressure of work. Now, which of these are we to take as the real ground for the proposed increase in the pay of the patwaris? However, Sir, if my honourable friends are really anxious to help the patwaris, let them take this extra burden on their shoulders and the zamindars will be quite willing to bear the rest. (*Hear, hear.*) It is my experience that not a single proposal of this kind has ever come before the House which was likely to touch the mover's own purse.

Now a proposal of this kind involves consideration of two things. Firstly, the financial condition of the Government, and, secondly, the price of the produce of the zamindars upon whom this burden will fall. The financial condition of the Government is well known to all of us, and similarly, there is no gainsaying the fact that the price of the produce of our lands has fallen very considerably. Under these circumstances, it is neither proper nor wise to increase the burden of the zamindars. I beg to submit that the pay of the patwaris was not increased even when we had a surplus budget. And that was very wise on the part of the Government, because you never can foresee what the next year has in store for you. Had the Government increased this pay in the years of surplus budgets the present financial stringency would have become even more acute, now when locusts have appeared to destroy our crops. They have laid eggs in our fields, and within a week or two the new generation will be ready to make matters still worse for us. Under these circumstances, it is not fair to ask the Government to add to the burden which is already crushing us. My honourable friend the Shah Sahib, who is not present in the Chamber now, was pleased to remark that we pay the patwaris by way of *zakat* only. I beg to submit, Sir, and I wish the *Pir Sahib* were here, that it is only customary with our *Pirs* that whenever they get or snatch anything they call it *niyaz* and when they have to part with something, it is termed *zakat*. (*Laughter.*)

As regards the question of houses for the patwaris, the Honourable the Revenue Member has already dealt with it. He has told us that Government has agreed to build a certain number of houses for them annually. But I submit, Sir, that at present there is no chance of a patwari feeling any difficulty in finding a good house for himself. A time may come when the village people will become so educated and enlightened as to refuse to meet this demand of the patwari, but at present it is only a question of pick and choose for him. Every single house in the village is at his disposal. Under these circumstances this proposal can mean only one of these two things, namely, that either the honourable member wants to show a special favour to the patwaris or that he is not aware of the real situation. The probability, I should say, is that he is not aware of the facts.

I need not detain the House much longer now, but I might be allowed to say a few words with regard to corruption. If the honourable mover expects to eradicate corruption by increasing the pay of the patwaris, as he says, I must say that he cannot achieve that object by any amount of increase in their pay. The corruption will go only when zamindars are bold enough not to pay and the patwaris are honest enough not to accept any illegal gratifications, as a number of patwaris are at present. Sometimes increase in pay, serves only to increase the amount

of illegal gratifications. I will draw your attention to the case of a certain clerk to make this point clear. When he was drawing only fifteen rupees a month he gladly accepted Re. 1 as a gratification, but when his salary was raised to Rs. 40 he would simply jump upon any one who happened to offer him Re. 1 saying: "Don't you realize the change in my position now? It is now certainly below my dignity to accept such a small amount." (Laughter). Thus, Sir, corruption cannot cease unless there is a sense of honesty in one's mind. Not to speak of the patwari, even some higher officials, getting much more pay than the patwari, are not above it. Therefore, I would request the honourable mover to wait till we become sufficiently enlightened and shake off this bad habit of offering gratifications, thereafter we will be quite willing to deposit Rs. 2 extra for each square with the Government to meet this demand of his.

Now I come to the threat about agitation. I have already pointed out that no Government can afford to succumb to such threats. Moreover, there is no paucity of candidates. Let all the patwaris tender their resignation and I will get you thousands of candidates. Therefore, if the patwaris resort to agitation, none but themselves stand to lose. You cannot deceive the people now. Your propaganda will only serve to make the real position clearer to us. Therefore, you must be cautious lest your propaganda should prove harmful to your own cause. Sometimes the man who wants to give fire to another burns himself with that fire. I was of the opinion that no propaganda of such kind must be made in the villages, but now I say, begin this and you will find the result against your own interests. The villagers will give such persons who made such propaganda a severe lesson. We know that the patwaris cannot afford to part with their extremely lucrative job, because they cannot enjoy the same comforts at home or anywhere else. Their position is just like the mare of a *Pir Sahib*. The mare had become accustomed to enjoy seers of gram at the houses of the *Pir Sahib's* followers and, therefore, when the *Pir Sahib* returned home after his spiritual tours she began to tap her foot on the ground at the time of getting her usual dainty. But the *Pir Sahib* at once rebuked her for that, saying: "Now, you must keep quiet here. This is our own house." (Laughter). Sir, allow me to say that the gentleman has moved this out for the benefit of the patwaris but has done it only to make fool of them and to try to put the Government in difficulties. He may remain assured, however, that he will not succeed at all in that.

In the end, Sir, I most earnestly request the House not to add more and more to the burdens which are already crushing the poor zamindars. With these remarks, I strongly oppose the amendment. (Cheers).

**Pandit Nanak Chand** [Hoshiarpur, (Non-Muhammadian), Rural], (Urdu): Sir, it is to-day after a very long silence that my honourable friend from Gujrat has made a speech in this House. His silence had been conspicuous. But after all he has delivered himself of a speech to-day. I am at a loss to decide whether one should laugh or weep at his speech as the arguments advanced by him against my amendment can hardly appeal to a reasonable man. While some honourable members were laughing at the funny arguments, I was seriously thinking how those arguments were relevant to the subject under consideration. For instance, he stated as an argument that once the



[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

Deputy Commissioner of his district visited a certain village where people greeted him with a wish that he should soon become a patwari. Perhaps by this he meant to say that so far as the village circle was concerned the patwari was all in all and made more money than an Indian Civil Service officer gets. Oh! how strong and powerful is the patwari to whom even the big landlords and title-holders are compelled to pay homage and have to pay bribes! This argument, if it is an argument, equally applies to the case of honorary magistrates. To become an honorary magistrate is considered by many people to be a great privilege because that opens the door for making money by illegal means. For many people this post though it carries no salary, is a great boon. They utilise it as a means for making money. They get what they want, and we do know with some, these considerations weigh a great deal.

Then, the same may also be said of the patwaris. Of course there are some dishonest patwaris just as there are some dishonest honorary magistrates. But, Sir, to me, the wholesale condemnation of an institution by a member of this House looks very objectionable. Another argument advanced by my friend was that I had moved my amendment only because it did not affect me at all while it affected the honourable member and his community. When he said that, he was perhaps thinking that I had no lands. Of course, I do not own so much land as my honourable friend owns, and I do not enjoy the same privileges which my friend has under the Punjab Alienation of Land Act. But in spite of that I am a zamindar, and I own a considerable amount of land. When, Sir, my friend is in possession of special rights and special privileges, he should not mind paying a little more than what I have to pay for the benefit of a most deserving class of public servants. God has given him ample and he should not grudge helping the poor. Sir, if my honourable friend has any sympathy, and I think he has got sympathy with the poor, and if he knows that the patwari has to provide his superiors with grain and fodder, let my friend give his lands to the patwari. I am also prepared to give my lands to the patwari. If I give away my lands, I will not starve. I am a labourer, and I can still use my brain to earn my livelihood. Those who wish to grow fat at the cost of the poor are the people who betray the nation and deceive the Government. My honourable friend has also made an insinuation against Dr. Narang. He perhaps meant to say that the honourable members on this side of the House were here only to carry on constitutional agitation. If that is true I see no harm in that. I ask my friend, what else is the use of this Council? I strongly repudiate the insinuation. No doubt, my honourable friend can boast that he is the *thekadar* of the Government, but he cannot forget that he has made much out of the Government and can make still more. We look to no favours. We do our duty; when it is necessary to criticise the policy, we must do so unfettered by any consideration and point out the defects that exist in the administration of the country. Our desire to better the administration cannot but be described as actuated by the highest motives. He thinks that the members of his community are loyal and the members of the community to which I belong are disloyal.

**Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali:** No, I never said that you were disloyal people.



**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Very well Sir, I am glad that you never said that or at least you never intended to mean that. Anyhow, there was an insinuation of that kind against which I strongly protest. Now, Sir, coming to the question before the House, I would submit that the real point has been ignored and the arguments advanced against my amendment having proceeded on irrelevant grounds cannot hold good for a moment. As I have already stated in my previous speech, the patwari has to perform various important duties. His duties are obviously far more important than those of a chaukidar. Then the question arises whether a person, to whom such important duties are entrusted, can maintain himself and his family with a salary of rupees twenty a month. It is a very paltry sum, and, as has been admitted by various honourable members of the House, for instance, by my honourable friends, Sardar Ujjal Singh and Sardar Hira Singh, Narli, this amount is quite insufficient for the maintenance of the patwari and his family.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** I never said that.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Of course, the honourable member never said those words, but he meant to say that now-a-days the sum of rupees twenty is quite insufficient for the maintenance of an educated person. So far as this point is concerned, I would like that some Government member may kindly provide us the necessary statistics and tell us how an educated person while remaining strictly honest can possibly maintain himself and his family with twenty or twenty-three rupees a month. If that is impossible, is it not then advisable for Government to devise some means to ameliorate the condition of such a deserving class of public servants as Patwaris?

At this stage the Council adjourned till 2 P.M. on Tuesday the 11th March 1930.

PRINTED BY  
THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.  
433 FLC-600-5-4-30-SGPP Lahore.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Tuesday, the 11th March 1930.*

THE Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—CONTD.

#### LAND REVENUE—*contd.*

**Mr. President:** The Council will now resume debate on the amendment of Pandit Nanak Chand.

**Pandit Nanak Chand** [Hoshiarpur (Non-Muhammadian) Rural] (Urdu): Sir, as I was submitting yesterday the real question before the House is whether an educated person to whom various important duties have been entrusted, can possibly maintain himself and his family within the salary of Rs. 20, 23 or 26 (the three grades of patwaris) per mensem. The speeches made in favour of or against my amendment clearly show that this sum is quite insufficient for the maintenance of an educated person and his family. The honourable members who opposed my amendment have based their opposition on the ground that because the patwari is corrupt and obtains illegal gratifications from the zamindars, his pay should not be revised and that even if his pay is increased he will remain as corrupt as ever. But, Government cannot take their stand on this ground. Their position is quite different. They cannot say that because there are some dishonest patwaris the legitimate claims of the patwaris as a whole should be disregarded. Sir, it would have been much better if the honourable members who opposed my amendment, had placed before the House some constructive proposals as to how corruption could be stopped among the patwaris. Moreover, corruption is not confined to patwaris alone. As you know, and as has been stated by some honourable members, the patwari has to provide his superior officers with fodder, grain, ghee and other things. When this is the state of affairs, is it not advisable for Government to take immediate steps to stop corruption among the patwaris which is mainly due to the fact that their pay is very small. The arguments advanced against my amendment also indirectly support my view. When I emphasised the point that the duties of a patwari are very important it was not without reason. I meant to say that in the matter of pay a person to whom important duties have been entrusted should not be treated like a chaukidar. I am sorry that my friend Khan Bahadur Sahib is not present now in the Council. By the illustration he gave about the writing and posting of a letter he probably meant to convey that the importance of the duties of a patwari was very much exaggerated. I would ask my honourable friend whether previously the work in connection with the preparation of the

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

electoral rolls of Legislative Council, of the district board and of the Gurdwara-Boards was included in the duties of a patwari? He has now to attend to this work also. I would ask him again, if formerly, the patwari was also required to send confidential reports regarding persons taking interest in political movements in villages. He has now to perform the duties of the Criminal Investigation department as well. Was it also previously the duty of a patwari to hold census of camels, mules, &c.? If all this is included in the duties of a patwari now, is not one justified in saying that his duties are heavy and of various and different kinds? Naturally his pay should correspond to the importance of the duties entrusted to him.

I do not suggest, as an honourable member tauntingly said, that the patwari should be given the salary of a Minister. I do not think for a moment that Ministers and other high officials of Government are super human. In fact most of the work of Ministers is done by the Secretaries of Government. The Ministers have in most cases to sign certain papers and orders. That can be done by any person having a little common sense. But, Sir, that is not the question before the House. My honourable friends, Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain, Sardar Hira Singh, Narli, and Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali have also objected on the ground that the amendment proposed by me would mostly affect the zamindars. I know that the poor zamindars are already groaning under heavy taxation. Any further taxation would reduce them to great misery. I realise that not a single pie should be taken out of the pockets of the poor zamindars. I would submit that in order to ameliorate the condition of such a deserving class of public servants as the patwaris we should reduce the salaries of high officials of Government, tax the big landlords, vakils and traders. (*A voice: Impose a patwar tax?*) Yes, do impose a patwar tax. I accept the principle that those who have much must be made to pay more for the sake of the poor.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh:** To which class does the honourable member belong?

**Pandit Nanak Chand** (*continuing in Urdu*): Put me in any class you like. I do not mind if you start a fund for this purpose. I would readily subscribe to it. The people have become very poor. One cannot live on Rs. 20 a month. While my friend Sardar Ujjal Singh stated that the prices of wheat and cotton goods have considerably gone down, the Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain remarked that there was famine all over the country. Both of them contradict each other. I say that in the Punjab labour is not cheap. An unskilled labourer can earn one rupee a day. Therefore, the consideration put forward by my friends Sardar Sahib and the Honourable Member for Revenue does not apply to the case of the patwari.

One more word and I shall have done. It has been said that the condition of the zamindar is just the same as it was before. That is not the fact. Sir, now he is labouring under various disabilities. He has to satisfy the illegal demands of various officials. The Honourable Revenue Member has also said that it is not proper for us to single out one class of Government servants for the favours of Government and that there are other classes of public servants who equally deserve encouragement at the hands of Government. Sir, I remember that the case of the tahsildars was put before the

House and subsequently their pay was increased. A similar question regarding the pay and prospects of members of the subordinate education service was raised in this House and consequently some relief was also granted to them. I do not think that we can take up the case of all classes of Government servants at one and the same time. That is not possible for us. Besides, if we put the case of all classes of Government servants together, do you think that Government would accept our recommendations. This argument is advanced only with a view to reject the amendment under consideration. There is no reason that because four persons are starving, the fifth who can get relief should also be made to starve.

Now, Sir, take the case of stationery. No stationery was ever provided for the patwaris. It was, however, later on proposed to sanction four annas for each patwari for the purchase of stationery. But when the time came to give effect to this proposal, we see that even this little sum is not provided in the budget. Again, Sir, the Government was asked to construct *patwarkhanas* for the use of patwaris. The Government realised the necessity of such *patwarkhana* and have agreed to construct fifty *patwarkhanas* only in the whole division, while there are about over 8 thousand patwaris in each division. That is how Government is dealing with the legitimate grievances of the patwaris. I hope that my amendment will receive favourable consideration at the hands of the House. The condition of the patwari is most pitiable. But if the House desires that in view of the deficit budget I should withdraw my amendment, I am prepared to do so and ask the House to deal with the matter next year.

**Mr. President :** Is it the wish of the House that the amendment be withdrawn? [*A voice : No.*] As there is one dissentient voice against the leave being given to withdraw the amendment, I propose to put it to the House.

Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

"That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 20,06,170—Total Pay of Establishment."

The question is that that amendment be made.

The motion was lost.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore (Sikh), Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I beg to move—

"That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 100."

Sir, my object in moving this amendment is to urge upon the Government the necessity of applying to the assessment of land revenue the principles governing the assessment of income-tax. I would like to state in the very beginning that I have not moved this amendment in view of any personal interest but merely for the benefit of the poor zamindars. I ask, is it fair that while a non-zamindar whose yearly income is Rs. 1,999 is exempted from the payment of income-tax, a zamindar who owns even three or four kanals of land, should be made to pay something in the form of land revenue?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Sir, you will remember that last year this Council passed the Land Revenue (Amendment) Act. Now the cut proposed by the honourable Sardar Sahib means that the Land Revenue Act as it stands at present is contrary to the principle involving this cut and the object of this cut cannot be attained unless it be through legislation. If I am not mistaken, Sir, it has been ruled by the Chair that such measures are not the proper subject for a cut.

**Mr. President :** According to parliamentary practice matters involving legislation cannot be criticised in discussing grants and two years ago I ruled accordingly. But it was represented to me that as during the past eight years the Council had been discussing legislation in budget debates, a sort of convention had been established in favour of such discussions. In deference to the wish of the honourable members I informed the House the very next day that though my ruling was sound, I would not enforce it. It is there that the matter stands.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** That is perfectly true. I did not say that this ought to be ruled out, but in 1927 the Chair ruled that although in deference to a convention the matter could not be ruled out of order it is suggested that this is a better subject for a resolution than a cut, and the honourable member who was discussing the subject asked permission to withdraw the amendment. I want to remind you of the fact, but leave the matter at that.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, as it is a matter which touches the privileges of honourable members of this Council, I would request you to adopt the convention which has already been established in this House, namely, that members are permitted to criticise and discuss the actions of Government without following the parliamentary practice. This practice was followed by your eminent predecessors. I have been a witness to that and we have been debating these questions on more occasions than one. If I remember aright you corrected yourself or the ruling was rectified by yourself in the light of the previous convention as you have just now said, and I think, Sir, that when our House does not possess the same privileges as the members of the House of Commons possess, as we have not got the same full responsible government as the Parliament in England possesses, an application of those practices would not be quite in the fitness of things here and, therefore, I would submit that those rights and privileges which are ours under the convention which has been established should not be taken away from us.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, if I remember aright the Chair has already ruled that in the case of supplies when there is an amendment, we can give an amendment for the repeal of the law. That is a recent ruling of the Chair, and I know, Sir, that for total prohibition though at first objection was raised that the Act cannot be repealed, the very next day you gave permission to move the cut for the repeal of that Act. I think, Sir, that the chair has already ruled and the honourable member ought to be allowed to proceed with this cut.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I am afraid the honourable members are thinking that an attempt is being made to trespass upon the privileges of any member. That is certainly not the case.

The question, as I put it, was one of advisability, whether a motion involving change of the law would be better discussed by way of a resolution or by way of a cut and I simply suggested to the member whether he would not be better advised in having an important matter like that discussed by way of a resolution. It rests with the member to make up his mind. Therefore, I do not see how it can possibly mean trespassing on the rights of the House.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** What I feel, (Sir, is that although this convention has gradually grown up in our House, if you look into the case you will find that the convention of the House of Commons has some very strong and cogent reasons behind it, and we shall not be making a mistake if we were to change our practice if such a practice has been established. The reason for that is this, that as far as an Act of legislature is concerned, if a law is passed by a House then that House has had the fullest opportunity of discussing the various provisions of that Act, with the result that the House having once expressed its considered opinion on the subject in the form of an enactment, it does not look right that that considered opinion of the House should be attempted to be altered by means of a snap vote in the form of a rupee cut because whatever discussion may be on a rupee cut, people have not come prepared with all the arguments on the subject and they cannot in the case of a rupee cut have a full debate on a legislative measure as they can when a Bill is discussed. Therefore, I submit that as far as the laws are concerned once they have been enacted after full consideration they should not be altered unless the House has had an opportunity of considering them in a similarly full and thorough debate. For this reason I feel that the practice of the House of Commons is really better than our practice if we have such a practice at all.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** The reasons which have been advanced by the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government do not hold good at all. What he means to say is this, that once the House has expressed its opinion against a particular measure, it should not be open to the members to re-agitate the matter in this manner. (*The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :* I said nothing of that sort.) This is exactly what the Honourable Minister said. He said—I shall quote his words—that if a Bill is passed into an Act and the House approves of that Act, then by a snap discussion the House should not be allowed to give a contrary opinion. Am I right?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Yes.

**Mr. President :** The ruling I gave in 1928 was—

"Last year during the budget session and this year only the other day I gave a ruling to the effect that while demands for grants were under discussion, necessity for legislation or matters involving legislation could not be discussed. I have found, however, on going through the debates of this Council for the past seven years, that, without the question being ever raised or decided, the Council, while discussing demands for grants, has discussed matters involving legislation in a number of cases. Therefore, although my ruling is constitutionally sound and although it is completely in accord with Parliamentary practice, yet in view of the fact that a kind of convention or practice has already been established on the point, I propose not to follow it in future."

[Mr. President.]

If the majority of honourable members are inclined to prefer the parliamentary practice, which is very sound indeed, I shall gladly follow my ruling.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** No case would appear to have been made out for adopting the parliamentary practice in this case.

**Mr. President :** All I said and still say is that if the majority of the House is inclined to follow the parliamentary practice in future I shall be very glad.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I am in favour of the convention which has already been established in this Council.

**Mr. President :** I am entirely in the hands of the honourable members of the House.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Nobody wants to follow parliamentary practice. We shall have our own practice.

**Mr. President :** But parliamentary practice is based upon the experience of several centuries.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** We shall follow the parliamentary practice when we have the power to make our own laws. Here, the fundamental thing is that we are not in a position to make our own laws, in any full sense of the term.

**Mr. President :** May I take it that not a single member of the House is in favour of the parliamentary practice ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I am in favour of it.

**Mr. President :** May I collect the sense of the House informally ?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Nobody has spoken in favour of parliamentary practice. The members who rise to speak advocate our own practice.

**Mr. President :** What has the Honourable Minister for Education to say on the point ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I expressed my opinion on a previous occasion. This was a rule of parliamentary practice which has grown up in the course of ages, and no higher sanctity attaches to it. Besides, it is a technical rule of the House of Commons where extremely technical rules, as a matter of fact, prevail, and it cannot be invoked to operate as a bar to discussions on supply to consider broad questions of state policy underlying legislation. If we import the technical rules prevailing in the House of Commons we shall be going against a number of our precedents. It is perfectly open to us, as possibly it is open in this matter to other similar Houses in India, to establish such practice as is convenient to us. Unless we are impelled by strong circumstances to import the practice from England with all its technical aspects, I think it is better for us to continue our own practice. (*Hear, hear*).

**Mr. President :** To me it does not appear to be sound that legislation should be discussed in a budget discussion, but if the House is determined to follow its own practice, I shall not give effect to my ruling to the contrary.



**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The term of this motion is 'to urge upon Government' and not 'to attack the Government.'

**Mr. President :** Is it fair that an honourable member of this House should stand up and ask Government to do a certain thing which Government cannot do under the law in force? Should not the House first change the law and then ask Government to follow it? That appears to be the right procedure. The House cannot fairly expect Government to do a thing which is against the law in force.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** A motion of this kind should not be interpreted too literally. The honourable mover of this motion is supposed to know that there is a law and that as long as that law is in force Government cannot comply with the wishes expressed in this motion.

**Mr. President :** The object of the motion is that Government should change the law.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Yes, Sir.

**Mr. President :** But instead of making an effort to achieve that object indirectly, why should not the honourable member move a resolution recommending the desired change in the law or introduce a Bill for that purpose?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Besides, I understand from my honourable friend on my right that the practice of the House of Commons is as it is because every member of that House has got power to initiate legislation. But here, a private member is absolutely unable to put the law in motion. He has first to obtain the sanction of the Government of India and the application to the Government of India has to be sent through the local Government and if the local Government does not want the law it would certainly not forward the application to the Government of India. Thus, there are obstacles in the way of private members initiating legislation in the Council. The power of the members of this Council are not the same as those of the members of the House of Commons. Therefore, the practice of the House of Commons cannot be applied to our legislature which is led by the apron strings of certain authorities over whom it has no control whatsoever. There is therefore no harm in our having our own conventions. Though there may be better methods of getting the law changed, there is no harm in adopting our present method also.

Then again, there is another difficulty. When we send our resolutions, they may or may not be balloted. But the present method is a surer method of making one's ideas plain to the House, because these cuts are sure to be brought forward before the House. As I submitted already, the present motion should not be interpreted too literally. By this motion the honourable member wants that Government should take necessary steps to change the law. Whether the motion is a good one or not, I have no concern with it for the purpose of the present question.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** With due deference to you I submit that I agree with the interpretation put upon the motion by the honourable member for Rawalpindi (Dr. Gokul Chand Narang). If a suggestion is made that a change is necessary in certain direction and effective avenues should be sought in order to bring home to the Government the necessity to pursue the change of rules or law, I don't think a member is debarred

[Mr. Din Muhammad.]

from urging and putting this question before the House or to bring this matter before the House in order to insist upon the Government to change their law in the light of remarks which are made in the House. Personally I think the honourable member in bringing forward this motion is perfectly within his rights to move a cut for discussion and to urge upon the Government the possibility and advisability of a change which Government should adopt.

**Mr. President :** If that is the sense of the House I have nothing further to say.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** (*continuing in Urdu*) Sir, I was saying that while a person having an income of Rs. 1,999 was exempted from the payment of income-tax, a person owning three or four kanals of land had to pay land-revenue. The zamindars have become very poor and they cannot afford to meet the Government's demands. How can you expect them to pay land revenue when they have not got even sufficient to meet the bare necessities of every day life? They cannot educate their children and even in some cases they cannot maintain them properly. Their houses are little better than hovels, unhygienic and unfit for human dwellings. They cannot even afford to clothe themselves and they generally go about in rags. Such is the intensity of the want to which they are subjected and it is on their behalf that I exhort the Government to relent a little and grant them this little concession which is so reasonable and so necessary. These people in the first place have not got land, and if ever forced by necessity, they take it from the big landlords on lease or on *batai*; in the former case they have to pay the full amount of the land revenue to the benefit of the land-owner and in the latter case one half. Neither in the former nor in the latter case is it possible for them to earn sufficient to make a decent living. In these distressing circumstances it is advisable that the Government should grant some concession as regards land revenue assessments. On various occasions Government's attention has been specially drawn to the pressing necessity of introducing some such system of land revenue assessment by which some relief can be afforded to these indigent people. It is high time for the Government to abandon its policy of filling its own coffers and turning a deaf ear to the cries and groans of the suffering zamindars. Times have changed and Government stands in great need of them. It is politic that the Government should win them over to its side by obliging them. At present, the Indian atmosphere is pervaded by revolutionary ideas and every where you find anarchists, revolutionaries, terrorists and nihilists at work trying to undermine the very foundations of ordered Government. In times when such conditions prevail in the country it is of vital importance that Government should have the support of the zamindars who have always stood by it in moments of emergency. In times of need Government has always turned for help to the zamindars and they have also without fail fully responded to the call made on them. Now when we can smell the trouble here, there, and everywhere the Government cannot afford to lose the sympathies of such loyal and faithful subjects. Perhaps the Government is under the impression that the zamindars are poor, credulous and simple and no harm can come from them. If really it is so, then let it know once for all that when hard pressed they are sure to turn against it.

For the benefit of the zamindars the Honourable the Revenue Member has done some very, very useful work and from his magnanimity we can very well expect that he will very kindly make it clear to the Government that there is an actual necessity of assessing land revenue according to the same principles on which income-tax is assessed. Sir, supposing that two persons have got Rs. 40,000 each, one with his money buys a house and the other two squares of land. The former lets his house on hire and receives Rs. 1,800 annually as its rent. This man is not required to pay any income-tax, but the latter whose income from the land is scarce has to pay at least Rs. 100 a year as land revenue. Both own property equal in value but one is made to pay a huge sum annually on account of it while the other is allowed to escape scot free from making any such payment. This is injustice and should be remedied. In the end I once more lay stress on the necessity of introducing a graduated taxation of land. With these words I commend my motion to the House.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration. Amendment moved is—

“That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 100.”

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend** (Financial Commissioner): This is the third debate on the subject in the last two years which I have attended. The previous debates were very interesting, and in each of them a resolution to the same effect as that now moved was rejected. I am confident that the strong common-sense of the honourable members of this Council, including the agriculturist members will, as before, reject this resolution.

I listened with some interest to the speech of the honourable mover. So far as I can make out he desires to take for his purpose those principles of income-tax assessment which suit him, and have nothing to do with those principles which do not suit him. In what I am going to say there is very little original: most of it was said in the previous debates on the matter.

The position has materially changed since this motion was last before the House in the debates on the Land Revenue Amendment Bill nearly two years ago. It was then fully discussed, and was turned down. Since then, the Land Revenue Amendment Bill has become law, much to the satisfaction, I hope, of the cultivators of this province. And I may say that we on the official benches are most willing and ready to do all we can to give effect to it, not only in its words but in its underlying principles. The Act, as I say, has become law. Does the House wish to give effect to this resolution in effect, pass the equivalent of a vote of censure on those who have passed the Land Revenue Amendment Bill into law? Do not honourable members realise that by bringing up this very far-reaching proposal they are attacking some of the most important and fundamental ideas of our land revenue administration? In the old Land Revenue Act of 1887 we had a very fine Act. Under it, to adopt a metaphor, the Punjab Government lived in comfort for many years. Then times changed. I say the Act was originally a good house. But as time went on it became necessary, in accordance with changed conditions, to make some changes in its structure. Let us imagine that the building was lying within the Lahore Municipality. Sanction

[Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.]

had therefore to be obtained from superior authority before the changes could be made. There was also a difference of opinion as to details of the changes to be made between the architect and the actual builders. The superior authority, the Lahore Municipal Committee, according to my metaphor, but in reality the Government of India, objected to some of our proposals. After a great deal of trouble some alterations were made in the house. I call the reconstructed building, the Land Revenue Amendment Act. We have now got a building in which the Punjab Government and the agriculturists of this province can live, I hope, comfortably together for many years. Now we get this resolution. Does not this House realise that it practically means the destruction of the new house we built with such trouble and delay and the substitution for it of a temporary structure, which will not only be extremely difficult to build, but which will not guarantee you against bad weather in future?

One new feature of our Land Revenue Act is that you have now got forty year settlements in most districts in the province. But in future, if effect is given to this resolution, as the Khan Sahib from Gujrat said when this motion was last before the House, you will have yearly settlements, because every year the income-tax authorities will come round and make the most detailed enquiries, as was pointed out in the debates on this subject two years ago by His Excellency the present Governor, as to the income of the agriculturists in every possible detail during the preceding year. Most of the members of the House, not perhaps the agriculturists, as they are fortunately exempted from the tax, but most of us who are worried more or less with income-tax, know what an inquisition it is. As His Excellency, the present Governor, said if you pass this resolution you will subject the peasants of this province to an annual inquisition which will cause them an immensity of trouble.

One or two other small matters. I remember speaking on this matter two years ago to an honourable member of this House who was advocating very strongly the present proposition. I said: "Do you not think that it will encourage fragmentation of holdings?" He said, "I cannot deny that; it will undoubtedly encourage fragmentation. I have given this matter much thought and I can see no way out of it at all." When this was last before the House one honourable member scoffed at the very term consolidation of holdings. Consolidation of holdings is a matter with which my colleague the Financial Commissioner for Development is very much better fitted to deal than I am. But when I was Commissioner of Jullundur I took much interest in visiting villages in which that most beneficent operation had been carried on, and I was impressed by the gratitude the people showed. One of them said to me: "We do not want squares in any colony; you have given us squares in our own land by consolidating it." That, Sir, is the benefit of consolidation. If effect is given to this resolution all consolidation would cease, and you will get infinitely more fragmentation of holdings with its many disadvantages than you have at present. So anxious was Government two years ago to explore every possibility of meeting the wishes of some members, though not all, of the House in this matter, that an experienced officer of my service was put on special duty for some weeks. He went into the matter in great detail

and examined it from every possible point of view, and he came to the considered opinion that it was entirely impossible to give effect to this resolution. We will take, say an average holding of 30 acres. I understood the honourable mover to say that he did not wish to exempt any holding entirely. Small holdings though they pay very little will pay something. We will take whatever the limit suggested is, five acres or ten acres. Suppose there are three brothers owning a joint holding of 30 acres and you give no exemption to holdings of that size. At once these three brothers will apply for partition and each will get 10 acres. Suppose, however, that that does not give them any relief. Calling these three agriculturists as A, B and C, there will be one holding in complete ownership of A and mortgaged to B, another holding in complete ownership of A but mortgaged to C, another holding in complete ownership of B but mortgaged to A and so on. I will not pursue the matter for it is obvious to any thinking member of this House that the difficulties in adopting a proposal like this are immense.

I confess that I was cut to the quick by one remark that fell from the honourable mover that the British Government pays no regard to poor people. I have been associated with land revenue work for many years. I was Settlement Officer in the poor district of Hissar, and I had great pleasure in getting the land revenue reduced in three assessment circles of that poor district. In other circles if I did not reduce it, I kept the previous assessment unchanged. And now the honourable member comes and makes the definite charge that the British Government is unmindful of poor people. Putting however that individual case on one side, it is a commonplace of our revenue administration, as has been frequently said before, that we have always assessed districts of small holdings much lighter than those with large holdings. The matter is always kept before us when we are considering assessment proposals: namely, is the district one of large holdings consisting of landlords, many of whom are rent receiving absentees, or is it a district with comparatively small self-cultivating proprietors? The size of the average holding is always taken into the most careful consideration and it has been so for the last fifty years, and it is now the policy of the Punjab Government to assess districts with small holdings very much lighter than those with large holdings.

Another matter. As was said in the previous debates, there is nothing whatever in the present land revenue administration to prevent the people of any village when they divide the land revenue that has been assessed over their village as a whole over its individual holdings to assess the small holdings at any rate they liked. They have full power in the matter. As is well-known the minute calculations which Settlement Officers make, assessing *chahi* lands at so much, *barani* lands at so much, and the like, are very often entirely disregarded by the people when they distribute the land revenue over the holding. There is nothing whatever to prevent them in future in new settlements from treating the small holdings as leniently as they wish.

One last word. Our land revenue administration has for the last two or three years become even more sympathetic, if that is possible, than it was before. I personally am struck, and so I think would have been my predecessors, as Financial Commissioner, at the very large amounts of land revenue

[Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.]

that were remitted on account of locusts and floods last year. Everywhere we have treated the people who were suffering from these calamities of locusts and floods with the greatest possible consideration. I mention another point. In the old days we used to remit fixed land revenue when it had been under suspension for three years. The rule has been changed, and in future land revenue that has been under suspension for three harvests will be brought specially under consideration, and, if there is no strong reason to the contrary, it will be remitted without waiting for three years. Calculations show that this concession will cost the Government about eight lakhs of rupees a year.

I wish to repeat my confidence that the House will, as on the last occasion, show their sense by rejecting this resolution.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** [Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana (Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu): Sir, I am very glad to find such a motion before the House which is intended to ameliorate the pitiable lot of the small land-holders. It is another matter for great satisfaction that an honourable member of the House, who was heretofore considered to be opposed to the interests of the zamindars, has to-day expressed his readiness to support their case. Perhaps he and his party occupying the Hindu benches have come to realise that the country can make no progress worth the name unless and until some steps are taken to improve the deplorable condition of the petty zamindars. It is no doubt a pleasant change in their attitude and I should welcome it. This change is perhaps due to the organisations and their influences that are working outside this Chamber.

Sir, at one time it was thought that land-revenue was a sort of rent and not a tax. Those who had no interest in lands used to contend that Government was the sole proprietor of lands and that the zamindars were no better than tenants and Government was, therefore, justified in charging as much revenue as the value of the lands warranted. But the committee which was appointed by the Government to go into this question did not support this extreme view of the problem and dispelled all doubts on the subject by definitely laying down that land-revenue was not what is understood by rent. The committee opined that it was a tax on lands and thus established the principle followed in the past beyond all doubts. Zamindars have always been considered to be the proprietors of lands and it would have amounted to an encroachment on their rights if Government had declared itself to be the sole proprietor of these lands. Having admitted this principle Government ought to have changed its policy with regard to the assessment of land revenue. The present system of assessing land revenue seems apparently to be based on the old and extreme theory according to which zamindars were considered to be no better than tenants. While assessing land revenue Government has never taken into account the requirements, I should say the most ordinary requirements, of those who depend for their maintenance on lands. It has never cared to bother itself with that question. It must charge land revenue even if the zamindar who has to pay it has only one or two acres of land to claim as his own and even if he and his family may starve after paying Government dues in the form of land revenue and other cesses. While charging tax on income the capacity of those, who

are to pay taxes, for meeting the demand of the Government is ordinarily taken into account and only such persons are to pay taxes whose income exceeds a certain amount of money. But in assessing land revenue that principle is not followed. And if, under these circumstances, my honourable friend, the mover of this motion, said, and he was right in saying so, that Government has done nothing to improve the condition of the petty zamindars, there was no reason for the honourable Financial Commissioner to get angry over that statement. This statement appears to have enraged him very much and, in fact, upset him. It was not very commendable for a member occupying the position of the Financial Commissioner to adopt that attitude. He ought to have known that many members of the Council share the view expressed by the mover of this motion. Even the public outside this Chamber think with him. There are solid facts to show that Government has all along been indifferent so far as the small land-holders are concerned. Of course, it has been doing all that it could to pamper those who are already in affluent circumstances. It does not behove the honourable members occupying Government benches to get angry like that and thereby to strangle honest criticism that non-official members may like to offer. This is not the first time that an official member has tried to take an undue advantage of his position. Many members of the Council have been intimidated before into silence by some of the official members. It is a fact patent on the face of it that the petty zamindars have been reduced to abject poverty and that in spite of our efforts to move the Government in their favour, very little attention has been paid to improve their condition.

It is very often trotted out that the zamindars have, of late, prospered very much and that they are yet prospering. But no one who has ever moved amongst the zamindars will ever support that statement. It is a distortion of facts. Far from it, their indebtedness is increasing every day and I can say without any fear of contradiction that this increasing indebtedness is mainly due to the scanty produce of their lands combined with the excessive demands of the Government. There are other reasons too which are responsible for this state of affairs, but as I have said the main reason is the defective principle of assessment of land revenue. In this connection I would like to refer to a few lines on page 237 of the important book named 'Punjab Peasant in Prosperity and Debt' which read as follows :—

"In 1891, the mortgage debt of the province (including the North-West Frontier) was estimated at 7·83 crores. Assuming again that it was only 45 per cent. of the whole, total debt in that year would be about 17 crores. The corresponding figure for 1922 (excluding the Frontier Province) is 32 crores, or 65 crores more than in 1891."

Now, this figure, as far as my information goes, has gone up to 90 crores. This clearly shows that the statement that the zamindars are on the way to prosperity has no basis of truth. This heavy indebtedness of the zamindars is a matter of serious concern and requires the immediate attention of the Government. Only yesterday the Honourable the Leader of the House was pleased to admit that the average income of a zamindar does not exceed 9 pice per day. If that is so, Government is not justified in exacting so much from the small land-holders in the form of land revenue and other cesses. Of course, Government is in power. It is established and has many forces at its command and with the help of those forces, it



[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

can do whatever may please its fancy. But it must know that justice is not on its side and it should also know that justice is more powerful than all the other forces combined together. If the condition of the zamindars is such as was described by the Honourable the Leader of the House yesterday....

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** On a point of personal explanation, Sir, I never said that the daily remuneration on which a zamindar is prepared to work does not exceed 9 pice. I never said anything about the zamindars. What I said was that many labourers from the frontier, who could not find employment, had offered themselves to work in the test works recently started for 9 pice as daily wages. The word zamindar has been added by the honourable member himself out of his imagination.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Even admitting that the Honourable the Leader of the House did not make mention of the zamindars and that he said that labourers were available in the market at 9 pice per day, is there any reason to suggest that the income of an ordinary zamindar is much more than a labourer? It might be within the recollection of the members that, in 1927, while making his speech in the Assembly, the Honourable the Home Member of the Government of India was pleased to say that lakhs of labourers were ready to take the place of those working in the factories and workshops at Rs. 9 per mensem, thereby showing the acute economic distress of the people of this country. The petty zamindars are no exception to this general rule and if, under these circumstances, an honourable member of the House has thought fit to draw the attention of the Government to the miserable condition of the petty zamindars, the Honourable the Financial Commissioner was not justified in getting angry with him. On the other hand, he and, for the matter of that, the Government ought to have calmly considered his proposal. Last time when opposing a similar proposal, the Honourable Revenue Member stated to the House that the administration of the province cost something like 13 crores of rupees and he asked, if, in the assessment of land revenue, the principle of assessing income-tax was introduced, where would the money to meet the huge expenditure of Government come from. He was of opinion that by the introduction of this principle, the zamindars in general will not gain much while the Government will lose a large amount of money from its revenues. There is, no doubt, some force in this argument. We realise that Government must have money and sufficient money to run the administration. But our request is that this burden should not be thrown on those who are not able to bear it. The petty zamindars should be exempted from the payment of the land revenue if possible and the big zamindars should be made to pay more to make up that deficiency. I think no thinking member of the House will object to that proposal. In any case the small landholders, who are unable to pay anything to the Government and are day and night worried over the question of their maintenance, should be relieved of the burden which they cannot bear.

The Honourable Financial Commissioner, while opposing this motion, said that if the principle of assessing income-tax was introduced in the case of assessment of land revenue, the work of the consolidation of holdings would receive a set back. I do not understand the logic of this argument.



To my mind it has no connection with the motion before the House. If the small holdings of the zamindars when they are scattered are not sufficient to maintain them and their families, I do not think that, if consolidated, they will bring such a large amount of income that these zamindars will not only be able to maintain themselves and their families, but they will also be in a position to pay very easily all Government dues. This is a fallacious argument on the face of it and I need not dilate upon it. Such arguments are in fact advanced to evade the real issue. This tactics will no longer pay. I can assure the Government that the zamindars are not the same dumb and mute people. They can also agitate and clamour like clever people. If Government thinks that the zamindars are still as ignorant as they were before, it is mistaken. It should know that there are other forces at work which are shaking them from their lethargy and which are incessantly reminding them of their hopeless condition. If the Government go on treating them as before for any length of time, the time will come and very soon come when they will gird up their loins against those who insist on keeping them in bondage. It is not a threat. It is an advice and a warning by the opposition benches who represent the zamindars and who have a right to give this warning in time. The economic distress of the people is growing very acute and if nothing is done to tackle the problem in time, it is feared that these zamindars will throw in their lot with those who have set on foot the present agitation against the Government. I may repeat it again that I am not giving any threat as I am not accustomed to giving threats. It is a simple advice and a suggestion which I thought necessary to give under the circumstances. I hope the Honourable the Revenue Member will not get up and say that I was threatening the Government and doing this and that. If in spite of this assurance my advice is taken to be a threat I can not help it. In any case Government should bear in mind that the zamindars will not bear the same treatment for a long time to come. They have to maintain themselves and their families and they must have the wherewithal to do so. If Government will insist on snatching everything from them, they will have to do what the peasants have done in Russia. They will devour those who are now devouring them. With these words, I support the motion before the House.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

"That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 100".

The question is that that amendment be made.

The motion was lost.

**Mian Nur Ullah** [Lyallpur South (Muhammadan) Rural]: Sir I rise to move—

"That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1"

The balancing of the budget or avoiding minus balances, though an admirable and difficult task in itself, does not show and is not a true indication of our real state of affairs. We have to face the real situation as it would come before us in the coming years. None of the honourable members concerned, on the official benches made any reference to, or touched on the point of, the greatest difficulty that faces the zamindars of to-day; and that difficulty, I may say, lies in the abnormal fall of prices. To make it clear, I may mention that the price of cotton has gone down from about Rs. 24 some years ago to Rs. 6, and the price of wheat has fallen by half. (*An honourable member:* What of the

[Mian Nur Ullah.]

normal price of cotton?) There is no normal price. It is always fluctuating. (Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang: Of rui?) There is difference between *kapas* and *rui*. *Rui* is ginned cotton. It is sometimes Rs. 80 and sometimes Rs. 20, as it is now.

But, Sir, I beg to submit that the prices, on the whole, seem to have fallen by over 50 per cent. and the classes that are hit most by this abnormal fall in prices are the agricultural classes on whom the prosperity of the urban classes and the Government depends. Sir, at present the sympathy of the zamindars is with the Government but I am inclined to think that the other forces that are acting on them might induce them and they may be snatched away from the Government. Some of the honourable members here have just depicted the difficult position they are in and I speak from my personal experience of 1928 when I was the Secretary of the Zamindara League of my district. I shall be failing in my duty if I do not bring facts to the notice of the Government and this House. From what I learned from the illiterate people and from other shades of opinion many undesirable ideas were percolating and filtering into them. It is a fact that one of them objected to my riding a car and another asked why should the Deputy Commissioner get Rs. 2,000 and the Minister Rs. 5,000 per mensem and why should others enjoy all the luxuries of life while they can hardly manage to exist. I was astonished how these ideas got into them. Probably that was by the force of circumstances, on account of the failure of crops in those years. But I am sure that in those days there was not this agitation that is being carried on in the country. I think that this agitation would be more harmful than we can at present imagine. The other day I read in the *Tribune* of March 1st, an article under the heading "United Provinces Peasants and Zamindars" asking them to get ready for Satyagraha. Some of the principles preached therein are most undesirable for some of us and mischievous too. I might also refer, if you allow me, to some of the declarations made by the so-called leaders and some of the patriots. I refer to the *Forward* of Calcutta of 24th July 1928 and of 29th April 1928, the *Tribune* of Lahore, dated 30th October 1928, in which it is said "The abolition of landlordism would occupy a prominent place in their programme." Further, Sir, in the *Tribune* of Lahore of 12th February 1929 the principal leader of the party says "He could not bear the sight of hundreds of big landlords enjoying comfortable life without any work or labour and was eagerly looking forward to the day when these fat bellies and idlers should cease to enjoy the positions they are now enjoying." Further, *Forward* of 29th July 1928 says "the big zamindars are exploiters, they cannot be tolerated and they must go." These are some of the principles preached which are quite unacceptable to us (Hear, hear). Such principles were promulgated in Russia in 1917 and we all know with what results. If ever the zamindars break away, the tenants get against the landlords and the peasants against the Government—that would cause havoc and it would be ruinous to the whole country. No amount of expenditure, not even the budgets of the whole world put together would help us. Sir, before things come to such a pass I shall request the Government to reduce the land revenue and meet the reasonable demands of the zamindars. Such movements and propaganda should be nipped

in the bud, at the very start. Budget figures will show that from 1921-20 the land revenue and water rate which contribute more than half of the total revenue of the province have increased considerably. The prices about the year 1921-22 had touched the maximum limit. The zamindars could well afford to pay the high rates then imposed, but they have now come down practically to the pre-war level and the zamindars are unable to pay such high rates. I wish the Government would base its land revenue policy on some index number to rise and fall with the rise and fall of prices. I can work out a very practicable and easy scheme which would not mean so much botheration to the Government and so much uncertainty to the zamindars, as they might at first apprehend. The feeling that any novel method of assessment is bound to create or arouse in the minds of the people in the beginning would be a most imperfect test of its real merits. This House was kind enough to pass, last year, the Land Revenue Amendment Act. I request that it should be enforced at the earliest opportunity and it is high time that the land revenue be reduced accordingly, though, we will much prefer, that the rate of percentage applied in all the districts be the same.

Just as I pointed out the other day all zamindara business is at a loss. A zamindar barely manages to exist. His standard of living is the lowest. His earnings per day, if properly worked out, will come to, as I pointed out, between 1 anna and 5 annas. That is much less than what a labourer or a soldier gets. Even a prisoner in the jail who enjoys, I am told about 6 annas for his daily meals, is much better off. It is rather pitiable and worth consideration. Most of the zamindars are running heavily into debt. The fragmentation and uneconomic holdings have reduced him to a state of indebtedness never known before. Many have seen the jail because they could not pay the instalments of the mortgage banks. Thousands of the zamindars own less than 5 acres and have a big family to support. Even in a rich district like Lyallpur the figures of indebtedness run to a few thousands per square while the price of a square has come down considerably. I have not made any systematic statistical study of these things yet, I have not had the time, but I might mention that my statements are borne out by the enquiry held by Government about the economic conditions of zamindars of the Khikha rajbaha on the tail of the lower Gogera, in Lyallpur district. I think the enquiry took place last year and the papers are before the Government and I hope they will receive a very sympathetic and favourable treatment.

I do blame the zamindars for bringing about such a state of affairs. But what has the Government done so far, for him? The water supply is being reduced day by day. I welcomed the assurance given by the Honourable Revenue Member the other day, that no more colonisation would be allowed by him until and unless more water-supply is forthcoming. I am sure all the zamindars would be very glad to hear that. I hope the Government would stick to that policy. The zamindars of Toba Tek Singh and Samundari tahsils are afraid that the new *rakh* of Pir Mahal adjoining to them is going to be colonized at their cost. Now they will have this assurance and I hope they will be satisfied. But about this Pir Mahal *rakh* which is going to be colonised I may be allowed to say a few words. Zamindars of these places have rendered meritorious war services. They have tilled the sandy soils of these tahsils and they are expecting that

[Mian Nur Ullah.]

they will get their due share of land when this *rakh* is colonised. I have said something about their economic condition. Fragmentation has increased so much that a family runs into tens of persons. One square was given to one man and his sons and grandsons have now come to number about 20. Some of the bigger people there had put in some special effort in the war and their claims for that *rakh* I hope would be favourably treated and land in that *rakh* would be given to these.

Sir, finally, I may say that the abnormal fall in the prices and the fall in the price of land itself and the fears and disappointments that I have mentioned, do need a very sympathetic treatment and if the Government wants to save the zamindars from ruin and the country from the ill-advised propaganda it should take time by the forelock and meet the reasonable demands of the zamindars. With these few words, Sir, I beg to move the cut of Re. 1 standing in my name.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration. Amendment moved is—

“That the demand be reduced by Re. 1.”

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): I do not want to speak on the amendment. I only want to point out that the honourable member has not moved the cut in the usual way but simply, as you will be pleased to see, raised a discussion of the land revenue policy and if I am not mistaken that form of cut is not the one which is put to vote.

**Mr. President :** Following the parliamentary procedure I propose to put all such cuts to the vote of the House. (*Hear, hear.*)

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** That was the ruling which you were pleased to give some time ago. I am glad you told me.

**Mr. President :** Some gentlemen wanted such cuts to be put to the House, while the rest were satisfied with a general discussion, but we must follow one uniform practice with regard to all such reductions.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I must obey the ruling that you are pleased to give eventually, but may I point out that a member of the House on a general discussion raised on land revenue policy, will find some difficulty in voting for or against it. What is a member to vote on in a general discussion that has taken place?

**Mr. President :** I rule that all cuts shall be put to vote.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang** [North-West Towns (Non-Muhammadan), Rural]: Sir, I congratulate my very learned and honourable friend from Lyallpur on his most eloquent and thoughtful speech which is practically his maiden speech in this House.

**Mian Nurullah :** Sir, I did make another speech. This is my second speech in this House.

**Mr. President :** He participated in the general discussion.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** It is very creditable. I said, practically maiden speech, and it was an excellent speech and the point that he has raised is of very great importance. It is generally assumed that members sitting on this side of the House do not have much sympathy

for the zamindars, sometimes or rather very often, described as poor zamindars. If it is stated that the members occupying these benches have not got much sympathy for the zamindars, meaning thereby big zamindars, there may be some force in it, but if it is stated that we people have not got much sympathy for the poor zamindars, that is certainly untrue (*Hear, hear*), because not only for myself but on behalf of every member sitting on this side of the House, may say that we have got genuine, sincere and deep sympathy for the poor cultivator. The application of the name zamindar to them is rather a mis-application. Take the poor cultivator who has to work in the rain and in the sun, in winter and in summer, and has to work very hard for a pittance. No one can have any feelings except of deepest sympathy for him and the question that is now before the House is whether anything can be done to alleviate the hard lot of such zamindars. I can assure you, Sir, that we are all in sympathy with such zamindars and if Government can find its way to reduce the revenue realised from them without imposing any burden on people who may not be able themselves to bear it but on those who can bear it, the Government will have our full support and sympathy (*Hear, hear*). But if it is intended that one class of people should be relieved at the expense of another class equally hard up that would be a different question. I myself would do all that is possible for any member of this House in reducing the burden on the tillers of the soil because we owe our very existence to them. If they did not work so hard we would neither get anything to eat nor would we get anything to wear, and I think the capitalist that grinds them down is not to be found so much on this side of the House as in some other parts of the House, I mean the one occupied by big zamindars. My honourable friend from Lyallpur referred to certain newspaper articles but he did not read them out.....

**Mian Nurullah :** I did read the important portions of them.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Just the heading. He did not read out any lengthy quotations. He referred to the *Tribune* of such and such a date and to the *Forward* of such and such a date. But we know what those papers contain because we also keep reading them. The lot of the poor peasant in Bengal and in the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh is much worse than the lot of the agriculturist, fortunately, in our province. Our province is a province where the peasant proprietor is to be found in the largest number. If I am not mistaken, and as some gentleman remarked yesterday, the Punjab possesses the finest peasantry in the world on this side of Italy (*Mr. H. Calvert*: That is so.) Their case therefore is not so hard as the case of their brethren in other provinces. Still, however, it does not mean that they are very happy or that they are prosperous and that nothing should be done for them. We shall be very glad if the Government can find its way to do something for them provided it has got the means.

There is one word more which I want to say about people situated like myself. We who live in the cities have also to pay land revenue although we do not possess any agricultural lands at all. Even on the lands which are under our residential houses we have to pay land revenue.

**Mr. H. Calvert :** No.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Then I will refuse to pay next time. The Financial Commissioner is shaking his head, but the fact remains that we do pay. He is under the impression that we are not paying anything. If that is so, then probably we shall try to recover what we have already paid and refuse to pay in the future. The land revenue which is payable on sites of bungalows in Lahore has probably been assigned by Government to the Municipal Committee of Lahore and it is being recovered through the Municipal Committee. It is the municipal employees who come to recover it.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend :** It is not so.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** In any case we are paying. We seldom take care to see who it is who comes, but he comes with a *parwana* and we are not very recalcitrant people, we are very mild people, we pay. We have not yet entered upon a course of civil disobedience and non-payment of taxes, and we do pay land revenue on the sites of our houses.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend :** In Lahore there are far more arrears than anywhere else.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** I do not know. There must be something wrong with your realisation agency or there may be some people who are thinking of civil disobedience and have refused to pay their tax up to this time. But the fact remains that this tax continues. I think the principle underlying land revenue is that this tax is levied on agricultural land, and for a very good reason. It is supposed that the land belonged to Government or to the nation, why say Government. The land belonged to the nation, and people who started cultivating took possession of it because it belonged to the nation. Some people having no other means of livelihood wanted to earn their livelihood by cultivating the soil and that soil they took without paying any compensation to the nation. Therefore the nation says, "All right you have begun cultivating this land, we have provided this means of livelihood, you should provide us with the means of national existence". The case is, however, different so far as towns are concerned. Here again, I would speak subject to correction, there were lands lying waste. There were *nazul* lands and when one Government succeeded another, when the British succeeded the Sikhs, the British Government sold those lands to various people or transferred them for some consideration or another. If they have realised the value of the land and the land is no longer used for agriculture but has been built upon and has become part of the *abadi* no land revenue should be imposed upon such land.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** It applies to all waste land which has been sold by Government.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Then do not have any land revenue even on that provided you do not want any further privileges or further facilities from the Government. If they are waste lands and you buy them as waste lands, let them lie as waste lands. Government would not help you in cultivating them, Government would not provide water, Government would not give any facilities. (*A voice:* There is a separate charge.)

Government will not provide roads for the conveyance of products and so on, but when a man builds a little hut to hide his head in, that is to say buys it for residential purposes, there does not seem to be any good reason why he should pay any land revenue on that land, particularly as he pays other rates and taxes to the municipal committee and is liable to other burdens as well. That is a matter which is felt by people who own property in towns and properties which are subject to land revenue. Unfortunately this point did not occur to any of us at the time this Act was under amendment, otherwise perhaps at least some discussion might have taken place although the fate of such an amendment would be a foregone conclusion.

**Mr. President :** If I remember aright an amendment was moved but I cannot say with what result.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The amendment was accepted to a certain extent by me.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Unfortunately I was absent at the time owing to some reason or other. If there is another amendment of this Act, I hope that Government will keep this matter in view. That is the only thing that can be said on a cut like the present one before the House.

**Chaudhri Baldev Singh** [North West Rohtak (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] : Sir, I have risen to place before Government and this House some facts about the zamindars in the south east of the Punjab. That portion of the Punjab is much distressed for several reasons. One of them is that there are no facilities for irrigation. From this budget we find that only a sum of Rs. 5 lakhs has been allotted to the Bhakra Dam. The Land Revenue Amendment Act will not come into force in those districts until after 18 years or so. This means that whatever relief would be afforded to the zamindars of these districts by this Act will not come to their share for a long time, I think, for a generation. The famine and the lack of facilities for irrigation have rendered their condition almost unbearable and at this time when Government has already a deficit budget I do not think any relief will be afforded to them in a measure that is fit to be given to them. But their condition has been so for the last five or six years. Once there was plague and many people were carried away by it. Then there was cattle disease and the cattle died in large numbers. Then came the floods and now during the last two or three years we have had successive famines. Under these circumstances, Government might not remit land revenue for ever, but they might only postpone payment. I do not, however, think that the people will be able to pay the land revenue even in two or three years. The only thing, therefore, that can give relief to the people is not to demand any land revenue from those tracts until the Bhakra Dam is taken in hand. If land revenue is demanded from people who have nothing to eat, I wonder how Government will be able to collect it. I only want to draw the attention of the Government to the chronic state of trouble that is prevailing in those districts. I have nothing more to say.

4 P.M.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, the question is—

“That the demand be reduced by Rs. 1.”

The Council divided : Ayes 27 ; Noes 30.

# AYES.

Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang.  
Mr. Labh Singh.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram.  
Chaudhri Ram Singh.  
Chaudhri Baldev Singh.  
Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana.  
Pandit Mehar Chand.  
Sayad Mubarak Ali Shah.  
Khan Bahadur Khan Muhammad Saifullah Khan.  
Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram  
Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan.  
Maulvi Sir Rahim Bakhsh.  
Malik Nawab Major Talib Mehdi Khan.  
Pir Akbar Ali.

Khan Bahadur Malik Muhammad Amin Khan.  
Khan Sahib Risaldar Bahadur Nur Khan.  
Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali.  
Mian Nurullah.  
Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi.  
Lala Chetan Anand.  
Chaudhri Afzal Haq.  
Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq.  
Sardar Hira Singh, Narli.  
Sardar Hari Singh.  
Sardar Partap Singh.  
Sardar Harbakhsh Singh.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Dhanpat Rai.

# NOES.

Col. C. A. Gill.  
Mr. H. Calvert.  
Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.  
The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon.  
Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar Khan.  
Mr. W. R. Wilson.  
Mr. R. Sanderson.  
Mr. H. F. Ashton.  
Mr. W. S. Dorman.  
The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal.  
The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogen-dra Singh.  
The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow.  
The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.  
Mr. Alan Mitchell.

Mr. J. D. Penny.  
Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie.  
Mr. H. W. Emerson.  
Dr. (Mrs.) M. C. Shave.  
Khan Bahadur Maulvi Abdul Ghani.  
Mr. S. L. Sale.  
Lala Mukand Lal Puri.  
Mr. Owen Roberts.  
Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram, Kalia.  
Lala Gopal Das.  
Lala Jyoti Prasad.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Rattan Chand.  
Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri.  
Sardar Bahadur Capt. Dalpat Singh.  
Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sheo Narain Singh.

Mr. E. Maya Das.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh** [Kangra, (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu) ; Sir, I beg to move—

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** May I point out that the land revenue policy was just now discussed. The motion of Chaudhri Ram Singh is to discuss the general policy of Government. I should like to know whether by general policy is meant the revenue policy.



**Mr. President :** Which general policy does the honourable member propose to discuss ?

**Chaudhri Ram Singh (Urdu) :** Sir, I would like to move this amendment with a view to discuss the distribution of land in the Nili Bar, to point out the defects of the *beggar* taken at the time when patwaris are required to carry their papers to tahsil headquarters and to urge that Dogra Rajputs should be given proper representation in the services.

**Mr. President :** Not revenue policy ?

**Chaudhri Ram Singh (Urdu) :** No, Sir. I beg to move—

“ That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1.”

Sir, I have got a good many grievances against the revenue department. I would like to make it clear at the very outset that my intention is neither to move a censure motion against the department nor to get the Government involved in difficulties. My object in moving this is simply to draw the attention of Government to the grievances that I have got against the administration. First of all, I have a serious grievance against Government in connection with the distribution of land in the Nili Bar. As has been stated here many times before, Kangra is a district of small holders. The poor zamindars of this district have been granted no lands in the Nili Bar. The Rajputs of this district have rendered valuable service to Government during the Great War and even their claims have been ignored and they are given but a few squares of land. A few of the zaildars and some big zamindars were fortunate enough to obtain land in the Nili Bar. But the claims of those zaildars and other people who rendered during the Great War and are still rendering conspicuous services to Government, and who, therefore, richly deserve encouragement at the hands of Government, have been totally ignored. Sir, a few days back I was very much surprised to learn that the Honourable Member for Revenue did not know to what extent the Kangra district suffered by the action of the river Beas. I would like to state for his information that the Kangra district has suffered considerable losses by floods in the river Beas. Many villages have been washed away. I am sorry to observe that no squares of land have been granted to the flood sufferers in the Kangra district as well as the flood sufferers of the Hoshiarpur district. Is it not sad that while the people of the Hoshiarpur district have been granted lands for service rendered in connection with the construction of the railway line running from Jullundur to Mukerian, the Kangra people have got no squares of land in recognition of the services rendered by them in connection with the construction of the Kangra Valley Railway ? Sir, I ask, is it fair for the Government to help the people of one district and ignore the similar claims of the people of another district ? I, however, leave this point because it is after all a matter of concession. I now turn to a matter of right. During the 18th century (the exact year I do not know), the Government, after cutting the Dhangoo hill, diverted the direction of the river Chakki towards Nurpur tahsil which resulted in the total ruin of many villages, such as Damtal, Sirt, Notli and so on. It was done by Government in order to protect their Canal department. Sir, the case of the people who suffered by the diversion of the direction of the river Chakki was represented to Government more than once, but with no satisfactory result. Various proposals were considered

[Ch. Ram Singh.]

by Government, till at last it was decided to grant Rs. 50,000 to the sufferers as compensation. That was not a matter of concession. The people were entitled to compensation as a matter of right. They should have been given sufficient land on that score. Similarly very few people of Rohtak also got squares of land. Besides, the cattle tax to which I have drawn the attention of Government on various occasions, has been treated as land revenue in the Kangra district.

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend** That; is given to the district board, is it not?

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** (Urdu) Yes, that is correct. But the fact that the income derived from this tax is given to the district board does not mean that it is a lawful tax. On the other hand, it clearly shows that even Government treats it as an unlawful and unjust tax, and therefore, the income derived from this source is handed over to the district board. In my opinion this imposition has no justification whatsoever. Sir, there are about 2,200 villages in the Kangra district regarding which it was decided by means of *Dakhil Kharaj* in the settlement of 1917-18 that there were no Government forests over there, and that every inch of land belonged to the village proprietors and was assessed to land revenue. In spite of that a cattle tax is imposed on the people in those villages and every zamindar who keeps a goat has to pay a fine of annas two.

Now, Sir, I turn to the question of increasing the remuneration of the zaildars and the lambardars. It has been urged before the House that because the duties of the patwaris have increased, their pay should also be increased. I hold the same view. But, Sir, I am very sorry to observe that no one has cared to consider the case of the zaildars and lambardars. There has also been a considerable increase in their work. They have to help the police and revenue authorities in the discharge of their duties. Even in a petty case of theft they have to help the police in their investigations. It may be said that because the zaildars and lambardars do not take any interest in national movements and are playing the part of a second fiddle to the police and revenue authorities, their case should not be considered. I submit that no Government servant dare take part in national movements and thus incur the displeasure of Government. Sir, we should not be carried away by this consideration, but should ask the Government to increase the remuneration of the zaildars and lambardars because they have to do a lot of work.

Sir, I would also draw the attention of the Honourable Member for Revenue and the Honourable the Financial Commissioner to another serious grievance of the people of my district. I do not know whether the people of other districts have or have not got the same grievance against the administration. But, as a matter of fact, there is a strong general feeling among the people of my district against the practice of taking *begar* from the poor people at the time when patwaris have to carry their papers to the tahsil headquarters. The zaildars and lambardars, in order to win the favour of officers force poor people through their influence to do the work of *begar*. It is the duty of the Government to arrange for the despatch of these papers to the headquarters. It is their own outlook, either to pay remuneration.

to the coolies or pay some allowance to the patwaris so that the latter may themselves arrange for the despatch of the necessary papers to tahsils. The Government admits that to exact forced labour is contrary to the spirit of the law of the land, but in spite of that, the practice of taking *begar* is in vogue. Sir, the zamindars of my district are very seriously feeling this trouble. I think that in these days of popular unrest it would be in the best interest of Government to issue a *communiqué* forbidding the practice of exacting forced labour or permitting it in a restricted manner, that is, if forced labour is taken, some remuneration should be paid for it. Sir, another difficulty which is being experienced in this matter, is that contrary to previous practice, the patwaris are not provided now with service stamps with the result that if they have to send any paper to the kanungos they have to requisition the services of the chankidar, a village servant, who has to attend to many other duties as well. After all a chankidar is also a human being. He has to comply with the orders of the police and revenue officials. He has to report deaths and births to the authorities concerned. Under these circumstances I would ask the Government to supply service stamps to the patwaris.

In the end, I would like to draw the attention of Government to the fact that in the recent selection of the tahsildar and naib-tahsildar candidates, no Dogra Rajput was accepted. I take this opportunity to say that the Rajputs in general are the most loyal subjects of His Majesty the King Emperor. In times of need they have always readily responded to the call of Government. I hope that the Honourable Financial Commissioners will bear me out when I say that Rajputs are straightforward and honest people. When they provide a very large number of recruits for the army, it is but just and equitable that they should also be given proper representation in other branches of Government service. Sir, these were the matters to which I wanted to draw the attention of Government. And now that I have done my duty, I hope the Government would see their way to remove these grievances of ours.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

“ That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 1.”

**Mr. H. Calvert** (Financial Commissioner) : I may be permitted to reply to a few of the points raised by the honourable member in his speech. He had not given any notice of the points which he proposed to raise. Therefore, I am somewhat unprepared in dealing with such a large number of rather vague points. He mentioned that in the Nili Bar no land had been given to Kangra on account of the congestion of people there. That is not quite correct. Grants have been given in the Nili Bar on account of the congestion to Kangra district, I think, of more than 185 acres. The difficulty really is that the Rajput of Kangra district is very loath to leave that beautiful and salubrious district and he finds the climate of Montgomery excessively dry. For this reason in the past the Rajput of Kangra has not proved an altogether satisfactory colonist. But in the new areas now about to be opened up in Pir Mahal and Kheeker the case of trying more Rajputs is under consideration.

Then the complaint was made that no grant had been given to those whose land had been acquired for the Kangra Valley Railway. The fact is that land had been given to some of those whose land had been acquired in large areas, but the honourable member is quite right in saying that the

[ Mr. H. Calvert. ]

small petty owners who lost small areas have received no land. That is very simple to explain in that the average holding in a large part of Kangra is only about 2½ acres and the small bits taken from these people for the railway was so very small that it was hardly a practicable proposition to compensate them with land in the Nili Bar. That was the only reason. I may assure the honourable member that my honourable colleague and myself are most anxious to secure candidates from the Hindu Rajputs, and we are scrutinising the lists of candidates very carefully, but he must understand that posts are few and the competition so great that we must require from the Hindu Rajput of Kangra the same high qualifications which we demand in the case of other people. But when qualified candidates are forthcoming, we are already doing our best to give them a fair share of posts.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** After this assurance, I beg leave to withdraw my motion.

The motion was by leave withdrawn.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 39,59,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Land Revenue.”

The motion was carried.

#### EXCISE.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** (Minister for Agriculture) : Sir, I beg to move—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 13,77,500 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Excise.”

**Mr. President :** The demand moved is—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 13,77,500 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Excise.”

**Sardar Partap Singh** [Lahore, (Sikh) Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, the Government has increased the strength of the excise sub-inspectors with a view to stop the illicit distillation of liquor, but contrary to our expectations the number of cases of illicit distillation has largely increased. Before excise sub-inspectors were appointed police had power to deal with cases of illicit distillation. At that time informers used to inform the police secretly of the situation of the distillery and the police used to raid the place on their own initiative and without reference to higher authorities; thus, no time was allowed to the culprits to make good their escape. At present the informers are required to inform the excise sub-inspectors who in their turn call the police to their aid in order to raid the place. Before the place is actually raided some four or five hours elapse.

*(At this stage Mr. President left the Chair and the Deputy President occupied it.)*

**Mr. C. A. H. Townsend :** I can assure the Honourable Member that when I see his speech to which I have listened with great interest, in print, I will examine his suggestions with care. The honourable member's contribution to our excise administration has been most valuable. I wish to

emphasize only one point, that Excise sub-inspectors have many other duties to do in addition to the detection of illicit distillation. They have to examine liquor shops, verify stocks, and the like. I mention this point incidentally. I again assure the honourable member that his suggestions will receive my careful attention.

**Sardar Partap Singh** (*continuing in Urdu*): Sir, I was saying that before the place is actually raided five or six hours elapse and in this interval the culprits remove everything incriminating. When the police was responsible to trace the cases of illicit distillation the excise inspectors have only to investigate whether the liquor was or was not illicit. That was a successful and a better method of dealing with crimes of this nature.

There is another defect in the present system. The promotion of the excise sub-inspectors depends on the number of cases they successfully trace out and in order to win distinction these excise sub-inspectors themselves manufacture false cases. For example, they would first get some wine placed in a house and then raid it and then start a case against the so-called offender. I may mention an instance. In my own district an informer himself used to brew contraband wine. He came to terms with the excise sub-inspector on the condition that he would help the latter in manufacturing false cases of illicit distillation. Consequently this informer, with the help of a rope through a skylight, placed a tin containing about three bottles of wine in the house of a neighbour with whom he was not on good terms, and informed the excise sub-inspector. The excise sub-inspector called the police to his help and raided the house in which wine was stored. From the position of the tin and the spot at which it was lying the police suspected foul play and made further enquiries which revealed the real state of affairs. The excise sub-inspector was asked to file a suit against the informer, but he would not do it. Consequently, the police itself challaned the informer and brought him to book. Sir, in brief I mean to say that these excise inspectors, in order to get promotion, often resort to such vile practices. In the villages after the harvest nearly each and every plot of land shows signs of having been used for *bhattis*. So long as some better arrangements are not made for putting a stop to the illicit distillation of wine the evil is sure to increase. I would finish my speech with the request that if Government is not prepared to act on the policy of total prohibition, it should at least check this evil with an iron hand.

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** (Minister for Agriculture) (Urdu): Sir, for the information of the honourable member, I would like to say a few words. A committee has already been appointed to go into the matter. It will probably hold its meeting in May 1930 and consider the question as to how illicit distillation can be put a stop to. We have anticipated Sardar Sahib's object and have appointed a committee to consider the question of improving our organisation.

**Deputy President:** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 13,77,500 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Excise."

The motion was carried.

## STAMPS.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member): Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 57,200 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Stamps.”

The motion was carried.

## FORESTS.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 19,82,800 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Forests.”

The motion was carried.

## FOREST (CAPITAL EXPENDITURE).

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): I move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 5,65,500 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Forest (Capital Expenditure).”

The motion was carried.

## REGISTRATION.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** (Minister for Local Self-Government): I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,11,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Registration.”

The motion was carried.

## IRRIGATION.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member). I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,35,56,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Irrigation.”

**Deputy President:** The demand moved is—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,35,56,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March, 1931 in respect of Irrigation.”

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore (Sikh) Rural], (Urdu): Sir, I had given notice on the 7th March of a cut in connection with the demand before the House and my object was to draw the attention of the Government to the advisability of the canal post offices being opened for the use of general public.

5 P.M.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** May I draw your attention to the fact that no amendment on this demand has been circulated to the members?

**Mr. E. Maya Das :** I, too, have given notice of an amendment.

**Deputy President :** I suppose the honourable member is opposing the whole demand.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** No, he is moving an amendment and he says that he gave notice of an amendment on the 7th March.

**Deputy President :** Is the honourable member moving his amendment? His amendment is in time and he can move it. The difficulty about the same not having been supplied to the members is due to the fact that the office did not anticipate that all those honourable members who had given notice of different cuts would be absent from the House and the whole of these items would be gone through in so short a time; so the office has not been able to get these cuts printed and distributed to the honourable members in time.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** In that case I propose the adjournment of the House. Because no amendment has been circulated to the members of the House no discussion ought to be allowed to proceed.

**Deputy President :** Government got notice of these cuts in time and they would be ready to answer the criticism of the honourable members. Would it still be necessary to adjourn the House?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** But what about the other members of the House?

**Deputy President :** They will know the subject matter from the honourable member who has given notice of the cut.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** They should know it beforehand to be able to take part in the discussion.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, if the cut relates to a matter of policy, it does not require any notice, because a member can always discuss the question of policy. If it is a substantive motion with regard to a particular department and reduction is to be made with regard to a particular amount of money, then it does require notice because in opposing the demand you can always discuss the question of policy.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** The principle of providing members with cuts is based on the consideration that members may consider over the matter and may form an opinion. But we have got no agenda and we cannot form our opinion and cannot express our ideas on that. This is a very legitimate demand.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** It is a very troublesome matter which cannot be proceeded with. It appears that some members have given notice of some cuts which have not been put on the agenda and though I am not in a position to say how many members have put in such cuts, I understand at all events the honourable member, Sardar Hira Singh has sent one. The one mentioned by Mr. Maya Das is under a different demand altogether. If Sardar Hira Singh is the only member who has sent in a cut and if it has any reference to a general question, I think there is no harm in his discussing it by way of opposing the grant.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** I sent in a cut on the 8th March, 1980 during office hours.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Was it in reference to demand No. 7 or 8?

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh :** Probably it was in reference to demand No. 7.

**Deputy President :** I would like to make the position a bit clear in connection with demand No. 7 on Irrigation. Sardar Hira Singh sent in a cut of Re. 1 to urge upon the Government the necessity of reducing the *abiana* on cotton crops.

*(At this stage Mr. President resumed the chair.)*

**Mr. President :** Will the honourable members please repeat their objections to proceeding further with the business before the House?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** The objection taken was that the amendment, of which notice was sent by Sardar Hira Singh, has not been printed and supplied to members of this House. There may be some other cuts on the same demand, but unless these are supplied in time to the members, discussion should not be allowed to go on because it will not be fair to take the members by surprise without giving them an opportunity to prepare themselves and express their opinions on the subject.

**Mr. President :** I can only express regret on behalf of my office and as the agenda is not before the House, I have no option but to adjourn the Council till 2 P.M., to-morrow.

The House accordingly adjourned till 2 P.M. on Wednesday the 12th March, 1980.



## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Wednesday, the 12th March 1930.*

THE Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### ELECTIONS TO STANDING COMMITTEES.

**Lala Mukand Lal, Puri :** I rise to record my protest against the postponing of the elections to the Standing Committees which were fixed at 1-30 to-day and the postponement without notice. Almost all the members of my party were here at 1-30 and none of them had notice that the elections had been postponed.

**Mr. President :** Order, order. Was the honourable member present last evening when was the Council adjourned till 2 P.M. to-day?

**Lala Mukand Lal, Puri :** Yes, I was.

**Mr. President :** When was the Council adjourned till 2 P.M. to-day any notice to the contrary issued by the Secretary should have been taken as cancelled. Such matters may be discussed with the Secretary or with me in my room.

**Lala Mukand Lal, Puri :** Notice was issued by the President.

**Mr. President :** Notices are not issued by the President.. It is the Secretary who issues notices.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram :** If we were informed yesterday that the elections will not take place to-day we would not have wasted so much of our time.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member should have, if he felt any doubt about the matter, cleared it last evening when the Council was adjourned till 2 P.M. to-day. Had my attention been invited to the notice under discussion, I should not have adjourned the Council till 2 P.M. In any case I should have been glad to announce to the Council that the non-official members will elect Standing Committees at 1-30 P.M. I am sorry that the honourable members were inconvenienced.

### GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—*cont.*

#### IRRIGATION—*cont.*

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli [Lahore, Sikh, Rural] (Urdu) :** Sir, I beg to move—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 15,000 with respect to the item of Rs. 15,000, New Major Works—A-1 (3) Upper Bari Doab Canal.”

[S. Hira Singh, Narli.]

Sir, this money is to be spent on the remodelling of rajbahas Kohali and Jama Rai on the Upper Bari Doab Canal, and I wish to draw the attention of the House to the most defective and objectionable method that has been adopted for the purpose. It must be clear to every one of us that the proper course was to distribute water equally amongst the various outlets, but the officials concerned are taking undue advantage of this opportunity and supplying water to some other rajbahas from the canal head. The people who have been irrigating their lands from these rajbahas for 60 years have, quite naturally, come to consider it their right to enjoy the full benefit of their water. Of course, there can be no objection to an equal distribution of water amongst the various outlets of these rajbahas, but it is highly improper and unwise to encroach upon our rights for the benefit of other people. The Government should not give undue preference to the big people owning thousands of acres. On the other hand, it should help the small holders on these rajbahas so that they may be able to get better crops from their petty holdings.

I wish to make it absolutely clear that we have no objection to Government supplying water to those people. There is sufficient water in the river and the Government can make much better arrangements for them. Why not adopt that course? The Government knows it fully well that there is no surplus water in those rajbahas. Therefore, any reduction in their supply from the canal head is sure to affect our crops very seriously. I may also add that this is not the case with the Upper Bari Doab only. Everywhere the zamindars are getting only as much water as is just sufficient for their present needs. Now I need not detain the House any longer. The matter is quite clear and the demand absolutely legitimate. Therefore, I commend this amendment to the House with these few remarks.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 15,000 with respect to the item of Rs. 15,000, New Major Works.—A-1 (3) Upper Bari Doab Canal."

**Mr. H. F. Ashton** (Chief Engineer, Irrigation) : Sir, there appears to be a general impression among the public that re-modelling of the channels of necessity involves a reduction of supply in the distributaries. In most cases this is not so. Re-modelling of the channels and re-modelling, so-called, of the outlets means a readjustment of outlets in order to effect a more equitable distribution of supply. There are many causes why re-modelling is necessary. There is a shortage of supply in certain outlets while the bed of the channel becomes raised in a certain length and the outlets in this length get a greater supply than they should. The result is a shortage of water at the tail of the channel. This motion refers specially to two distributaries on the Upper Bari Doab Canal. On the Upper Bari Doab Canal we have definite rules for re-modelling. The question was thrashed out in 1917 by a committee of senior civil and canal officers, and the conclusion they came to was that re-modelling and re-adjustment of outlets from time to time was necessary. They put up certain proposals and those proposals were accepted and brought into force by the Government. That was done in 1918. One rule was that adjustment of outlets should be done at regular

periods of five years. Another rule was that outlets drawing excessive supplies should not be reduced more than 20 per cent. as a rule and 25 per cent. as a limit. These rules have been strictly complied with on that canal so far as reduction of outlets is concerned. As regards the time limits I must confess that they have not been strictly complied with and adjustments have not been done once in five years; six and seven years have occasionally passed before action was taken in hand. Taking the two distributaries mentioned, Kohali and Jamrai; on the Kohali, the re-adjustment of outlets involves 36 outlets which are taking supplies in excess of what they should do. These 36 outlets will necessarily have to be reduced. Thirty-one outlets are drawing normal supplies and they will not be touched, while 34 outlets are drawing short supplies. On the Jamrai 11 out of 46 are drawing excessive supplies, 19 are drawing normal supplies and 16 have short supplies. The proposals on account of these two distributaries were agreed to by the civil department. The proposals in respect of the Kohali were put before the local Canal Advisory Committee, which while agreeing to them, urged that they should be carried out at an early date. These two distributaries are being provided for this year because they are, in our opinion, the most urgent cases. I may mention that originally the proposal was to adjust the outlets of no less than eight distributaries of this canal this year. But on account of shortage of funds we have had to cut down the number to two.

What is the alternative to re-modelling? One alternative the honourable member has mentioned. The other alternative is to leave things as they are and do our best to get supplies to the tails of these channels by "tatil." "Tatilling" outlets is a method of dealing with this problem which is highly unpopular with everybody. The supervision of "tatilling" of outlets must remain in the hands of the subordinate staff, and this House is not unfamiliar with complaints about the doings of the subordinate staff. The cultivators at the tail of the channels complain, and complain bitterly, that the orders given for "tatilling" of outlets are, due to bribery and corruption, not carried out. The men whose outlets are "tatilled" and closed complain that their crops are ruined. Surely it is not the object of the honourable member that the men at the tails of channels who may be getting short supplies and not getting their due share of water should be condemned to continued shortage while cultivators higher up the channels who are drawing supplies in excess of what they should get continue to enjoy it. Surely in the matter of supplies in channels distribution should be improved.

As regards the suggestion put forward by the honourable member that supplies at heads of channels should not be reduced, in many cases they are not. In some cases they have to be reduced. Take the Upper Bari Doab Canal. We have here a canal on which water supply is not sufficient to run all branches and distributaries continually during six months in the year. The branches and distributaries have to be worked by rotation. Obviously if you give more water under such conditions to one distributary in excess of what it should get, you are taking away that water from some one else. You have got a limited supply of water; every one ought to have the same share of water according to the area owned or irrigated by him. If you give more to one outlet or one village or one distributary undoubtedly you are taking water away from some of the others. Even from that point of view,

[Mr. H. F. Ashton.]

I think the House will agree that in such cases it is only right that the distribution of water should be made more satisfactory and more equitable than it is at present.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration. The question is—

“That the item of Rs. 15,000 with respect to New Major Works—Upper Bari Doab Canal be omitted.”

The motion was lost.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore, Sikh, Rural] (Urdu): Sir, I beg to move—

“That the demand be reduced by Rs. 1.”

My object in moving this amendment is to urge upon the Government the necessity of opening canal telegraph offices for the use of the public. I think, Sir, that no lengthy speech is required for this purpose because the matter has been already discussed at great length on the floor of this House. Some time ago, a resolution was adopted by the Council to this effect. At that time the Honourable the Revenue Member was pleased to assure the House that the telegraph offices on the Upper Bari Doab would be opened for the use of the public immediately, and that if the experiment proved successful, the Government would be quite willing to provide these facilities on other canals as well. Now I can say from my own experience that the experiment has been most successful. It has yielded a goodly income to the Government.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Income?

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Yes, there has been an income of one thousand rupees at least.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** After deducting the expenditure?

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** The Government has had to incur no extra expenditure by opening these telegraph offices to the public.

Now, Sir, we zamindars usually send telegrams to our relatives, and most of our relatives are living in other canal colonies like the Lower Chenab. Therefore, the telegraph offices on the Upper Bari Doab could not be as useful to us as they might have been if the offices in other colonies were open for public use too. I beg to submit, Sir, that it is the duty of the Government to provide such facilities to the tax-payers.

Again, there is no rush of work in the canal telegraph offices. No office ever receives or sends more than four or five telegrams on any day. Look at the railway telegraph offices. They are open for the use of the public in spite of the fact that there is always a great rush of work there. I am of opinion that even the people working in the canal telegraph offices would rather welcome any number of telegrams from the public, because they may be a source of some income to them. Therefore, the real cause of this attitude on the part of the Government seems to be nothing else than that the higher officials of the Irrigation department do not consider themselves public servants. They really consider it below their dignity to come to the same level with the public. Otherwise, why should they refuse to share these facilities with us when we are ready to pay for them? With these remarks,

I commend my amendment to the House and hope that the Honourable the Revenue Member will have no hesitation in complying with this very reasonable request.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

"That the demand be reduced by Re. 1."

**Mr. H. F. Ashton** (Chief Engineer, Irrigation) : Sir, I would like to give to the House a very brief history of this case. During the year 1927, the mover of this cut drew the attention of Government to the advisability of opening canal telegraph offices for the use of the public and Government agreed to try this experiment for a short period. The Upper Bari Doab Canal was chosen and 12 telegraph offices were opened for public for 50 days. Now it has been stated that telegrams despatched from and received at canal telegraph offices are exceedingly few in number and the signallers have no work. The record of these twelve offices show that during this period of fifty days no less than 6,254 telegrams were issued and out of these 6,254 telegrams only 120 were sent by the public. Of these 84 were sent from Amritsar, 18 from Dhariwal and 12 from Gurdaspur—places which have general telegraph offices. In May 1928, Sardar Hira Singh moved a resolution in the Council and that resolution was carried. Action was taken in accordance with it to open to the public all telegraph offices on the Upper Bari Doab Canal.

Now, telegraphs are under the Government of India and the Local Government cannot open telegraph offices to the public without the sanction of the Government of India. The Government of India were addressed in June 1928. The Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs replied that licence would be granted on receipt of a complete list of offices which may be opened to the public and that "during the period of experiment of one year the Irrigation Department will be permitted to take the revenue derived from the opening of the telegraph offices to the public on the understanding that this arrangement will be subject to modification if during the period of the experiment the Government of India revised the present arrangement whereby the licences for telegraph offices are permitted to give telegraph connection." In accordance with this we got a licence and in accordance with the licence all offices were opened. In March 1929 the honourable member asked an unstarred question No. 974 to which reply was given by the Honourable Member for Revenue to the following effect :—

"(a) Yes. (b) yes, if the experiment is a success."

The telegraph offices were opened to the public on the 1st July 1928. At the end of June 1929 the extra expenditure to Government by the opening of these telegraph offices to the public was Rs. 1,175, while the revenue realised was Rs. 828-6-0 and the loss to Government was Rs. 351-10-0. This loss was incurred even though the Government of India took nothing from us by way of receipts. When dealing with this case I expressed the opinion that the experiment has not lasted long enough for full use to be made of the facilities provided. That opinion was accepted by the Government and the experiment still continues. The latest information I have got is that during the last six months since the 1st July there has been some profit. We still have to see what would be the result of the working at the end of the year.

[Mr. H. F. Ashton.]

Now assuming that the Government of India wanted to have the one-half out of the revenue of Rs. 828 our revenue would be Rs. 400 and our loss would go up to Rs. 750. Is the House prepared to have similar losses on each of the canals in the province? Considering the present financial situation of the province, surely it is better to go slowly and to see exactly what we are likely to gain or lose by this measure. It is not an easy thing to throw open these offices to the public. We have to arrange for various forms, various checks, various methods of keeping accounts and remitting the money realised to the treasury. We have to get supervisors to go round and see that the canal signallers are keeping their records properly. This accounts for the expenditure. If you are going to eventually open all canal telegraph offices throughout the province to the public we will undoubtedly have to open a special telegraph branch in the department. Personally, I see no objection to that provided we can show that Government is not a very heavy loser by this measure. The subject is still under consideration. If it can be shown that the opening of the canal telegraph offices has resulted in no loss to Government and that the Government of India will continue to allow the Punjab Government to keep the revenue realised, there will not be the very least objection to the opening of the telegraph offices on other canals also.

**Sayad Muhammad Husain** [Montgomery Muhammadan, (Rural)]: Sir, one difficulty which we see in connection with this canal department is that the Government always treats this as a commercial department, as if the department is here for earning money. Whenever any question is raised in connection with the canals, they raise the question of return that the canals will give on the amount spent. The same question is raised when my honourable friend raises the point of opening the canal telegraph offices to the public. I want to lay stress upon this with all the force at my command that we should not deal with the canal department simply as a commercial business. This is a department for the good of the people. This is a department upon which depends our life. This is a department which we regard as our own. The time is not far off when this department will be transferred to popular control. Under these circumstances I cannot understand the attitude of the department when they say that it does not pay. The canal department should provide to the public all the amenities that a zamindar requires in that department. If some responsible Minister were in charge of the department, the first thing he will have to do will be to throw open all the canal telegraph offices to the public, just as all canal roads will be kept open for motor traffic and other purposes. At present, a zamindar, if he wants to send a telegram, has to go twenty miles to the nearest telegraph office whereas if the canal telegraph offices are opened for the public, he can send his telegram to the office next door to him. If so much money has been spent on these canals and if the canal department earns a good deal of profit such as 12 per cent., is there any harm if the department were to incur a certain amount of expenditure by the maintenance of the telegraph offices for the benefit of the public? That is no excuse at all. The first and foremost thing for the department is to safeguard the interests of the zamindars, to take into consideration the amenities and facilities and comforts of the people. These canals have been constructed not to earn money but to assist the zamindars. These canals are ours, the money with which they are

constructed is ours. These canals are for our benefit. If we find that these telegraph offices, if opened for the use of the public, will be to our benefit, I do not see why they should not be so opened. I think the Honourable Revenue Member will do well to try to treat the subject as if it were a transferred subject from the very beginning and satisfy the needs of the people so that our co-operation with this department may continue as it has been so long. He has said that though he is in charge of the reserved subjects he has been dealing with them as if they were transferred subjects. I request him to give a concrete proof of that in this matter. With these words, I strongly support the suggestion made by my honourable friend. If the Government cannot accept the suggestion this year on account of the deficit budget in respect of two or three canals, that is no reason why they should drop the matter altogether.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** [Revenue Member] (Urdu): Sir, in reply to the speech made by the honourable mover of the amendment my friend the Chief Engineer has just now stated the relevant facts and figures as well as the results produced from the experiment made on one of the canals. He has told us how much the Government has spent and how much it has gained through that experiment. Besides, Sir, a serious difficulty stands in our way, that is, if this Government were to give effect to the proposal put forward by the honourable mover, I am afraid that the Government of India would come forward and claim all the income that will be derived from this source. It is therefore obvious that the Punjab Government will stand to lose in this matter. Anyhow, we shall try to meet the wishes of the honourable mover. I thought that the speech of the honourable the Chief Engineer would be sufficient to dispose of this amendment, but the honourable member for Montgomery has mentioned some general principles. Sir, it is very difficult for the House to endorse or for me to accept those principles because I do not like to create difficulties for my successor. No doubt, the Canal department is meant primarily for the benefit of the public. But this does not create any obligation on the part of the Government to provide water to the people free of cost. We hope that, by the grace of God, this department will soon become a transferred subject. But even in that case, we would have to pay for the water we make use of.

It has also been said that the roads should be metalled and made available for the use of the public. Very well, Government has absolutely no objection provided you are prepared to incur an expenditure of 15 or 20 thousand rupees for the construction of *pucca* road per mile and of Rs. 3,000 for its maintenance.

**Sayed Muhammad Husain**: I do not want that they should make big roads; I only want that they should be kept properly and open to the general motoring public.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain**: Yes, you are asking for difficult things. In other words, it means that you ask one to take a dip in the sea without drenching himself. You want that these roads should be made available for public traffic but you ignore the point that if these roads are made available for the use of the public, how difficult it would be for us to maintain them. Sir, the question of roads is a different question. With

[Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

regard to the boundary roads, Government has already issued orders which have raised a dispute between this Government and the Railway department. So far as the inspection roads are concerned, orders were issued last year.

I am sure that the honourable member did not mean to say that the Canal department should be turned into a charity department. Of course, it is a public department but it does not mean that the people should not pay towards its expenditure. Government as at present advised is diffident but it would, as far as possible, try to meet the wishes of the honourable mover.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu):** Sir, I am surprised to note that an innocent amendment like the one under consideration has met with opposition on the part of the Government. Of course, the Honourable Member for Revenue has been kind enough to say that Government would try to meet my wishes. But, Sir, I do not know what really stands in their way to give effect to the proposal put forward by me. It has been said that if that proposal is given effect to, the Government of India will come forward to claim the income that will be derived from this source. The Local Government has got relations with the Government of India.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** It is a question of money.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli:** Oh! you can settle that matter with the Government of India. Anyhow, I would ask the Government to accept my request. With these words, I beg leave to withdraw my amendment.

The amendment was, by leave, withdrawn.

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi [Shahpur, West (Muhammadan) (Rural) (Urdu)]:** Sir, I beg to move—

“That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 1.”

Sir, my object in moving this amendment, as will appear from the note appended to it, is to discuss the desirability of increasing the amount of water provided to the zamindars for the irrigation of the Ara tract on the Lower Jhelum Canal. A part of this tract is situate in the Shahpur district and a part of it in the Jhang district. It is so called because the soil is *kallar* and is very hard. This tract was owned by the proprietors and the remaining area was treated as Government forests. Originally the tract was provided 40 per cent. irrigation and the remaining *ilaqa* 75 per cent. irrigation. In previous years this tract got its due share, but of late years, the people have begun to feel the scarcity of water. Besides, in places where sufficient water was provided, water-logging had begun. Previously, scarcity for water was felt in winter but now even in summer the zamindars are not provided sufficient water. For *kharif* crops the tract is entitled to one third, that is, 13 per cent. irrigation. Sir, just imagine what crops can possibly grow and be matured with the help of this 13 per cent. irrigation. Besides, the canal is sometimes closed. In fact the people hesitate to sow any crops. But if they sow any crops, they do not mature for want of water. It may be said that water supply of the zamindars should not be increased because there is the danger of water-logging ahead. In reply to this I



would submit that there are three drainages in that *ilaga* and I do not think that water-logging will begin if the water supply of these people is increased. I do realise that it would be difficult for us to reduce the water supply of the zamindars in the upper part of the canal in order to provide sufficient water to the zamindars on the lower part of it. But, it is the duty of Government to devise some means for helping the needy zamindars of the tract. The water supply of these people should be increased to some extent. The Advisory Committee had also strongly recommended their case. I had also on a previous occasion moved a resolution asking the Government to increase the water supply of the zamindars of this tract. I hope that my request will receive favourable consideration at the hands of the Government.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

“ That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1.”

**Mr. H. F. Ashton** (Chief Engineer, Irrigation) : This concerns a part of the Punjab which I do not personally deal with. I can only point out that this question was thoroughly thrashed out in this House on the 29th November 1928 on a resolution proposed by the honourable member for Gurgaon-cum-Hissar (Muhammadan, Rural). The arguments for and against giving more water to the Ara tract were mentioned fully and in detail, and I do not think it is necessary to traverse the ground over again. The reasons for the 40 per cent. irrigation were fully given on the same occasion by the Honourable Member for Revenue. The reasons for not increasing the supply to 75 per cent. in the Doab area were fully dealt with by my predecessor, Mr. Smith, and the resolution was not accepted by the House. The honourable member says that there is no danger of water-logging in that tract. My information is that the sub-soil water is only 5 to 15 feet below ; it is already, therefore, near the danger zone. Again, to get water to this tract, it has to be taken through water-logged tracts and this means that whatever improvement we are trying to make in these tracts will be greatly diminished. Thirdly, the Ara tract has 40 per cent. irrigation, and if the Government gives more water to it from the canal, how can we refuse such water to the other tracts also ? Besides, to do so will require considerable increase in the discharge from that canal which will have to pass through water-logged tracts. Undoubtedly, the conditions in the Ara tract are very unfavourable compared to the colony area which is on a higher level and which does not suffer so much from *kullur*. But we have to think of other things also. The Government is spending a very large sum of money annually in improving water-logged areas, and it is desirable in every way that the expenditure here should be as low as reasonably possible. I think this is a proposition which will be accepted by the House as reasonable. These were the reasons which were put forward on the last occasion when this matter was debated and which led the House not to accept this resolution.

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi** (Urdu) : Sir, the resolution referred to was moved with a view to urge upon the Government the necessity of increasing the irrigation percentage of this tract to 75 per cent. But the object of this cut is not the same, i.e., it is not moved

[K. B. Mian Muhammad Hayat Qureshi.]

with the purpose of urging on the Government that they should raise the irrigation percentage actually to the figure of 75 per cent. As already mentioned, the soil in this part of the province is very hard and crops cannot be matured with the help of this inadequate water supply. The main purpose of my cut was to bring the difficulties of the inhabitants of this *ilaga* to the notice of the Government and I hope Government would take some early steps to help these people. A proposal on this very subject has also been sent to the Government from the inhabitants of Shahpur district and we leave it to the magnanimity of the Government to consider it sympathetically.

With every belief in Government's sense of justice and magnanimity I withdraw my motion.

The motion was, by leave, with drawn.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore, Sikh, (Rural)] (Urdu): Sir, I beg to move—

“That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1.”

Sir, my purpose in moving this cut is to urge upon the Government the necessity of reducing the *abiana* on cotton crop by 4 annas in the rupee. In connection with it I would like to say that in the December session of the Council I had moved a resolution with the same purpose. At that time the Honourable the Revenue Member was pleased to say that if cotton would visit a still further fall in its price he would then consider the matter sympathetically. Now, the price of cotton has fallen down considerably and it is high time for the Government to redeem their promise. In view of the deficit budget, if not annas 6 in the rupee, let them at least reduce the *abiana* by annas 4 in the rupee. In the speech that I made on that resolution I had fully dealt with this question and now I will try to bring to the notice of the Government only those aspects of the matter which are of later development. Sir, so far as my information goes, these fluctuations in the price of cotton are due to the rate of exchange fixed by the Government of India. This was brought to the notice of the Government, but they did not consider it worth while to adopt any measures in this behalf. It is true that the Government do not wish to bother themselves about any evil to which the country becomes subjected for the time being, so long as that evil does not begin to affect their own interests. It is very important for the Government to appoint a committee to enquire into the reasons why the prices of all the commodities and specially of cotton have gone down. To my mind, the first cause of the failure of the cotton crop is the fact that if cotton is sown in the same field successively three or four times, the productivity of the soil decreases and with it, the yield also becomes small. After the War the price of cotton tremendously increased and people in order to make large sums of money year after year sowed cotton which reduced the fertility of the soil generally. On account of this, the other crops have also failed. On this account also the zamindars deserve that the Government should grant them this reduction in the *abiana* rates.

Then, Sir, cotton is a *kharif* crop and in this season water is so abundant that even much of it uselessly flows out into the sea. Moreover, cotton

crop does not require much water. This is another reason why Government should see their way to show this generosity to the indigent zamindars. It would be within the recollection of the Government and the honourable members that these rates were fixed when cotton fetched high prices, but now circumstances have changed and its price has gone down and, therefore, it is necessary that the rates of *abiana* assessed on this crop should also be revised. Sir, in answer to a question put by me in the Council I was very kindly furnished by the Government with the following facts and figures. In the year 1889-90 the amount of water supply was 99·63 cusecs. In the year 1909-10 it was 1,176,822 cusecs and in the year 1928-29, 1,751,108 cusecs. It means that in comparison with the year 1889-90 now the amount of water supply has increased twice as much. Similarly the area under cultivation has also increased. In the year 1889-90 it was 528,409 acres, in 1909-10, 932,773 acres and in 1928-29, 1,346,088 acres. The percentage of water rates for the year 1889-90 was 2·50, for the year 1909-10, 8·40 and for the year 1928-29, 4·33. Similarly, the amount of *abiana* collected for the years 1889-90, 1909-10 and 1928-29, was Rs. 13,76,189, Rs. 92,22,810 and Rs. 53,87,745, respectively. These facts and figures amply prove that the present water supply as well as the percentage of *abiana* rates have increased twice as much as they were in the year 1889-90. But, on the other hand, the income from *abiana* assessments has increased four times. This great difference between the increase of *abiana* receipts on the one hand and the percentage of *abiana* and amount of water supply on the other is due to the care and economy that the zamindars observe in using water for irrigation purposes. Now they irrigate 20 or 25 acres with as much water as they used previously for watering 10 acres. This statement does not only hold good in the case of the Upper Bari Doab Canal but it is also true in the case of Jhelum and Lyallpur districts. In these districts also the water supply for irrigation has decreased but the irrigation by itself has increased. Sir, as the zamindars have decreased their demands for water supply it is but reasonable for the Government that they should also reduce their rates of *abiana*.

Moreover, Sir, the expenditure that the Government incurs on account of canals is reserved capital, but on it—I speak of the Upper Bari Doab Canal—they charge interest at the rate of 24 per cent. This is a very high rate of interest and Government should reduce it. Sir, I admit that there is shortage of funds and Government would find it difficult for themselves to effect this reduction. But if the policy of economy is followed they can curtail their expenditure. If you give to a person a large amount of wealth he will, at once increase his expenses, but if, afterwards, he in some way or other, loses his wealth he would automatically manage to live moderately. Same is the case with Government. They can also increase or decrease their expenditure according to the receipts of their revenues.

In the end, Sir, on behalf of the half-starving zamindars I request the Government that they should reduce *abiana* on the cotton crop by four annas in the rupee.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

“That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 1.”

**Mr. H. F. Ashton** (Chief Engineer, Irrigation): The amendment moved is in order to urge upon the Government the necessity of reducing the *abiana* on the cotton crop by 4 annas in the rupee. A resolution to very much the same effect was put before the House in December 1929, some three months ago. It was fully debated at the time and the resolution was by leave withdrawn. Reference has been made to that resolution which was moved by the honourable member who has moved this present cut. In that reference he stated that the Honourable Member for Revenue had promised that Government would give help if prices fell any more. May I quote from the official report of the debate exactly what the Honourable Member for Revenue stated? He said "if the price falls to 4 rupees or 5 rupees the Government will surely help the zamindars." Well, Sir, the information I have is that the average prices of *desi* cotton during the fortnight ending 15th February are Rs. 6-18-0 a maund and for American, the prices are Rs. 9-10-0 a maund. So, obviously, the time has not come for the Honourable Member for Revenue to fulfil what he said in December last. It is difficult to quote or state the main points which were mentioned during the course of the debate on the resolution in 1929, but it seems to me that the most forceful point made at that time was that if we introduced the system of lowering and raising water rates with the rise and fall of market prices, we will be introducing something which will be exceedingly hard to work. During the debate on the Land Revenue Bill the whole sense of the House was that there should be security, that is, that land revenue should not be revised except after long periods. Surely it is better to stand by that principle also in the matter of water rates. Market values, after all, are constantly fluctuating. The market value of cotton does not depend on the area of cotton in this country or any one particular country. A good cotton crop in one country will cause a fall in prices and a poor cotton crop will, on the other hand, cause a rise. So that, I think the House will see that the principle of increasing or lowering the water rate merely on a fluctuating market value is not a sound policy. The cotton crop has undoubtedly been a poor one for the last two or three years, but my information is that the cotton crop this year is a considerable improvement on that of the last two years, and no one can say when market rates will again rise. I would put it to the House that it is not a good principle to introduce fluctuations based on market values into water rates or any other rates.

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (Nominated, non-official): Sir, I have great sympathy with the mover of this cut, but, while the profits of the people of canal irrigated areas are not as well off as before, my friends of canal irrigated areas forget one thing and that is, what about their poorer brethren who are dependent on wells? I wish to ask, if they will tell us, how much they pay for the cost of getting one acre under cultivation of any crop and how much does it cost us poorer people who work wells to raise water to irrigate a corresponding area. These figures have been worked out with great care and it is found that it costs much more to irrigate by wells than to irrigate by canal. Therefore, Sir, while it is true that the profits are much less than before, I would urge my friend that he should not only ask for a remission for himself, he should, at the same time, ask for a

larger remission of or those irrigating with wells as well, for we are all raising crops of the same kind and we are all selling our produce in the same market. If the man from the canal irrigated area is not only able to make some profit, but he makes a larger profit than the man from the well irrigated area, on that account it does not look nice for my friends from canal irrigated areas to always press for decreasing the *abiana* since there are others also in this world who are working under more difficult conditions.

Then, Sir, his argument about the returns on capital outlay is not a very good argument, because after all, you cannot take into consideration the return on each canal separately. You have to fix a rate more or less for the province, and if one canal brings you a larger return it makes up for a smaller return on another canal. After all, where does all this return go? It goes to the common fund from which we meet the expenses of the province. When suggestions are made that rates should be decreased, naturally at once the question arises, how are you going to make up the shortage? There are two ways. Either the new expenditure must be cut down or fresh taxation must be resorted to. I feel very strongly that new expenditure should not be allowed to increase at so great a pace, at the same time I feel very strongly that fresh taxation should be resorted to because there are so many needs that have to be met. In some cases the burden is heavy while in others it is light, and where it is light it should be increased. On which shoulders the burden is light it is for Government to find out. For these reasons I oppose this cut.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal** [North-East Towns [(Non-Muhammadan), (Urban)]: Sir, the question of a decrease or an increase in the *abiana* has several times been discussed in the Council, and I have expressed my views on the subject before. Water is a commodity which belongs to the State and those who want to take advantage of this commodity should be prepared to pay for it. The complaint of my honourable friends on the other side is that the *abiana* rate is heavy. I was a member of the Hydro-Electric Scheme Enquiry Committee and there we discussed the question whether tube wells should be sunk by Government for the purpose of irrigating those areas which are not at present served by canals. Mr. Brownlie who appeared before us as a witness told us that zamindars were prepared to pay at the rate of Rs. 18 per acre if they were provided with water under the tube well system. (*Sayad Muhammad Husain*: Question). The honourable member may question it, but the fact remains that applications to that effect were brought before the Committee. You will find this in the statement in the evidence given before the Hydro-Electric Committee by Mr. Brownlie. We were also informed by those who represented rural interests on our Committee that a zamindar is prepared to pay Rs. 12 per acre per crop if he is supplied with water in places where the lands are not at present being irrigated by canals. If Government undertakes any scheme for the benefit of the zamindars under the tube well system, I am informed—we had evidence placed before that Committee—that zamindars have offered to pay Rs. 12 per acre. In these circumstances, it is for the Council and for Government to decide whether to reduce the *abiana* or not. On the one hand, there are our friends opposite who are always saying that the *abiana* is very heavy and that it should be reduced. On the other hand, when the question is investigated, we find that the

[R. B. Lala Mohan Lal.]

zamindars are prepared to pay a much higher rate, if they are given water under the tube well system. How far the demand for reduction is consistent I leave it to the Council to judge.

**Sayad Muhammad Husain** [Montgomery (Muhammadian), (Rural)]: Sir, the vexed question of *abiana* is again before the House, and it will remain before the House so long as the grievances of the zamindars are not redressed. It was most unconstitutional on the part of Government that, with one stroke of the pen they raised the tax by one crore of rupees without discussing it in the Council. Nobody at that time asked the Government Member why Government was going to raise the tax by one crore of rupees without consulting the representatives of the people, without even consulting those people on whom this burden was going to fall. Of course, it was in the power of Government to raise the tax just as they liked. We were helpless then, as we are helpless now. Still, out of formality, if for nothing else, they ought to have brought the matter before the Council. They did not do so. They added to their taxation by a crore of rupees and the incidence of that taxation fell upon the poorest of the poor. It did not fall upon my millionaire friend who is urging that the tax is not heavy, but it fell on those who can hardly make the two ends meet. I admit that there are certain rich people who have profited by it, but the real hardship fell on the poorest of the poor. Government did not discuss the question with the representatives of the people, and once the tax was levied there was no going back. What was the justification for the increase? Government increased the tax simply because in those days the prices of cotton had risen abnormally. For two or three years the prices of cotton went higher and higher. They were at one time as high as Rs. 25. But then they began to fall gradually, so much so that my honourable friend the Revenue Member thought it proper to say that he would consider this claim of the zamindars if the cotton prices were to come down to say Rs. 5 or Rs. 4. The area under cotton is increasing not only in this country but it is increasing all over the world, not only in the Punjab but throughout India. As soon as the Sukkur Barrage scheme comes into existence, I think the area will be doubled. Take the condition of other countries. It has quadrupled in Egypt and it has doubled in America. Everywhere they are increasing the area under cotton. The result is that the supply is greater than the demand, and the quality of cotton is also growing inferior. Do you think there is any likelihood whatever of the prices again going up? The Honourable Revenue Member will soon be leaving us and our cries for help will be reaching him at Simla. It will now be for his successor to remember the promise which was made by his honourable and learned predecessor. Let us assume the present rate is not likely to go down to Rs. 5. What justification is there for the Government to let the *abiana* remain at a rate which was fixed when the price was Rs. 20 per acre? When an increase in *abiana* was effected on all crops, the greatest increase was made on cotton.

Now, the zamindars have been asked to grow less cotton. I ask, what substitutes are we to have in the place of cotton? Unfortunately, the Director of Agriculture is not here. I asked the Deputy Director of Agriculture to suggest to the zamindars as to what they should substitute for

cotton. He was unable to give any suggestion. He says that the zamindars have to grow cotton and there is no help for it. If the *abiana* is to go up, or even if it is to remain where it is, how can the zamindars grow cotton? My friend, the Chief Engineer, rightly said that the land revenue policy is not to be challenged. I admit that there must be security of land revenue demand, that we should not ask the Government to have a lower assessment at one time and a higher assessment at another time. I would say that the period of assessment should be fixed as long as fifty years or even more. But in the case of *abiana* I find that the incidence is on the sown area and not upon the matured area and the *khara* system is practically dead. Therefore, the only thing that the Government can do is to reduce the *abiana*. After all, what does my honourable friend ask? He asks for a reduction of only eight annas per acre. If the Government is unable to accept that proposal at this stage, let it reduce it by at least four annas. Government must do something for the poor zamindars. If the Government fails to do that, the result will be disastrous for us and I do not know what the result will be for the Government. It is time that the Government looks forward to the interest of the people lest they should get into the hands of agitators. The zamindars are poor and resourceless. They are prepared to keep law and order and it is the duty of the Government to help them in distress. It is the duty of the Government to see that they do not go into the camp of agitators. I appeal to the Honourable Revenue Member who is very great and whose greatness lies in his helping the zamindars in times of need. Let him come forward to our succour. My honourable friend from Ferozepore said that if we touch *abiana* the people on the other side would suffer. I may say that we are prepared for the enhanced *abiana* if that enhanced revenue is ear-marked for the uplift of the zamindars. We have over and over again asked for succour to the people of Muzaffargarh and Dera Ghazi Khan, and yet no help has come to them and they are where they were. We are heavily taxed and they are also taxed and so, in the course of 4 or 5 years if the *abiana* remains the same, all will be reduced to the same level with the exception of a few magnates like my friend from Simla. This will be the effect and it is now for the Honourable Revenue Member to review the position. I hope the honourable members who know the condition of the zamindars, especially my honourable friend, Raja Narendranath, who has been Deputy Commissioner and who has, therefore, been in touch with the poor zamindars, will consider the proposal favourably and not reject the demand simply because it comes from poor zamindars.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** [South-East Towns (Muhammadan), (Urban)] (Urdu): Sir, the income that accrues to Government from *abiana* amounts to 50 per cent. of the total revenues of the province. Even if the expenditure that is incurred on the collection of *abiana* be deducted, the net income amounts to not less than 40 per cent. of the total revenues. This *abiana*, therefore, is obviously not an ordinary tax. Such taxes must be imposed with the full consent of the House. But in the words of my friend the honourable member from Montgomery, the *abiana* was increased by the executive Government with one stroke of the pen. Under the circumstances, my friend was perfectly right when he said that this imposition of *abiana* was unconstitutional. To impose or to increase such a heavy tax without the consent of the Council clearly constitutes an illegality. I, therefore,



[Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.]

draw the attention of the Government and particularly of the members of this House to this matter and request them to take steps to rectify the mistake.

It has been alleged that the *abiana* was increased by one crore of rupees in 1928. That is not quite correct. As far as I remember, it was increased by Rs. 75 lakhs. Later on, on the representation of the zamindars, the *abiana* was reduced by 25 lakhs leaving an increase of Rs. 50 lakhs under this head. But I am sorry to point out that according to the Persian proverb, "از ما است و بر ما است" the honourable members of the House, who now cry hoarse on this increase, were, I should say, mainly responsible for allowing this state of affairs to continue. Their protests at this stage will be of no avail. In the first session of the Council which was held immediately after this increase was announced, these honourable members remained altogether silent. In the second session these members did not move the resolutions relating to this subject which they had tabled and which were ballotted in their names. In the third session of the Council following this increase, a member of another party in whose name a similar resolution was ballotted, moved his resolution. When the discussion on this subject began, each one of these members was very profuse in expressing his gratefulness to the Government for reducing the increased *abiana* by Rs. 25 lakhs. These members had waited in deputation on the Honourable the Revenue Member at Simla and had succeeded in having that reduction made in the *abiana* and, therefore, each one of them considered his duty to express his gratitude to the Government. I wonder why they were so profuse in giving thanks to Government. If it had reduced *abiana* by Rs. 25 lakhs, it had done no favour to them. They ought to have insisted on the revival of old rates. Government had arbitrarily enhanced *abiana* rates and if it had, later on, reduced these enhanced rates to some extent, there was no occasion for the zamindar members of the Council to be thankful to the Government. The members of the Council have since been protesting and very vehemently protesting against this increase, but what is use of these protests now? The proper time when such protests ought to have been entered was, for reasons known to everybody not availed of.

The present cut is the result of the same feelings which have been expressed many times before over the vexed question of *abiana*. The honourable mover of this cut has requested the Government to reduce *abiana* on cotton crop by 4 annas in the rupee. It will be readily admitted that the price of cotton has gone down very much during the last two or three years. Where cotton used to sell at Rs. 13 or Rs. 14 per maund a few years ago, it is now selling at Rs. 6 or Rs. 7 per maund (*A voice*: It was then selling at Rs. 18 per maund). That may be true in respect of American cotton, but I am talking of *desi* cotton. In a previous session of the Council the Honourable Revenue Member had promised in one of his speeches that if the prices fell down abnormally, Government would certainly consider the question of reducing *abiana* rates. The honourable Chief Engineer, while referring to that speech, has tried to give a different colouring to that speech and has tried to lay stress on the particular words used. Undoubtedly it was said that if the prices of cotton fell down to Rs. 4 or Rs. 5 per maund, the question of reducing water rates would be favourably considered. But



I do not think that by using these particular figures, the Honourable Revenue Member meant that the water rates would be reduced only if the prices fell down to Rs. 4 or Rs. 5, not less and not more. That is not what was intended to be conveyed by these figures. That was not the spirit of the speech as the Chief Engineer would have us believe. In reality, the speaker meant that if the prices of cotton fell down substantially, the water rates would be reduced. The present prices of cotton warrant a reduction in these rates. Now, the time has come when that promise should be fulfilled. While opposing this cut, the honourable member from Ferozepore (Mr. Maya Das) was pleased to say that people of canal irrigated areas had no reason to grumble and complain of these water rates, when the zamindars of the well-irrigated areas had to pay much more towards the cost of irrigation of their lands. He is of opinion that irrigation by wells costs more than irrigation by canals. But he has stated no figures in support of his statement. If he had supported his statement with figures, I would have given due weight to his argument. I know for certain that well-irrigation does not cost more than irrigation by canals. He appears to have opposed this cut for the sake of mere opposition.

Another point that Government should take into consideration in this connection is that the produce per acre of cotton crop has very much decreased during the last few years. We find that every year this crop is attacked by one insect-pest or another. The Agricultural Department with all the resources and so much staff at its disposal has not been able to suggest any remedy to save these crops from these pests. I understand that last year in one part of Montgomery district and in some parts of the Lyallpur district the cotton crop had failed. I have come to know that whereas one acre of land used to yield 15 or in some cases 20 maunds of cotton now this yield does not exceed 4 maunds per acre of land. It appears that some elements are at work which are not now favourable to the growth of cotton crop. But the Agricultural department has done nothing to improve the situation. It is, in my opinion, guilty of criminal negligence in as much as it has failed to do its duty towards the zamindars. It has not been able to suggest the right course to the cultivators. The honourable member for Montgomery stated to the House that the area under the cotton crop had, of late, increased all over the world, and consequently the supply of cotton had increased much more than there was demand for it. I do not know how far it is true, because there are no figures available in this respect. In America and in other civilised countries of the world Government prepares forecast and statistics showing thereby the area under a particular crop in other countries of the world. With the help of these statistics each country regulates the cultivation of different crops according as there is demand for it in the world market. But our Government has not so far thought of preparing such statistics and our zamindars grow cotton and other crops without knowing beforehand what prices their crops are likely to fetch. In this connection I may inform the Government, if it does not know already, that cotton crop is the only crop which brings some money to the zamindars. The wheat and such other crops are mostly consumed by the zamindars themselves. Therefore the zamindars must grow this crop, particularly when the department of Agriculture has not been able to suggest a counterpart of this crop. Under the circumstances, the supply of

[Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.]

cotton has very much increased and there is no likelihood of the prices of cotton crop going up now. All these circumstances combined together justify a reduction in *abiana* as has been proposed by the honourable mover. I do not insist that Government must needs reduce it by any fixed amount in the rupee. I realise that at this time when the province is face to face with a financial stringency, we cannot, with fairness, insist on any substantial reduction in the *abiana*.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Does the honourable member think that it can be reduced by 4 annas in the rupee ?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan (Urdu) :** I do not insist on any particular figure. But all the same, it is very important that some relief should be afforded to the zamindars. It is a matter which should not be shelved. Something must be done to satisfy the zamindars. In the present circumstances Government will not be justified to trot out the same old reply that the present budget is a deficit budget and that it would not be possible for it to do as proposed. This demand of the zamindar is very reasonable and justified. It must be met anyhow. We will not object to reduction in other items of the expenditure if the saving will be utilised to reduce *abiana* on cotton crop. I would suggest that a committee of some financiers be called and some zamindar members of the Council also be co-opted in that committee. It should find some *via media* so that financial equilibrium of the province might be maintained and the reasonable demand of the zamindars satisfied. With these words I support the cut moved by my honourable friend.

**Mr. E. Maya Das :** On a personal explanation, Sir. The last speaker said that I made out that a man who cultivated land with well irrigation had to spend more and that I had no basis for that statement. Sir, the basis for it will be found in the Council debates. I think it was in the year 1925.

**Mr. President :** That is not a personal explanation, but another speech.

**Mr. E. Maya Das :** Sir, I was going to make no speech. The information is available. He was wrong in saying that my statement had no basis. I have made my statement on the basis of what the Honourable the Financial Commissioner laid before the House during the budget debate in 1925 or 1926.

**Mr. H. Calvert (Financial Commissioner) :** Sir, I was reading a short time ago a book dealing with the agrarian system in India under Muslim rule. The chief authority concerning the conditions of about 700 years ago a gentleman named Zia-ud-Din, Barni, wrote an interesting book, *Tarikh-i-Humayun*. There he warned the Emperor of the day not to put a light assessment on the peasants. He said that light assessment made the peasantry idle and insubordinate. (Laughter). Now, Sir, that was written about 700 years ago, and in those days the assessment was 50 per cent.

of the gross as compared with less than 5 per cent. to-day. I have, Sir, spent most of my service in districts which do not enjoy canal irrigation and I sympathise very deeply and very sincerely with the hardships and sufferings of those poor people who are striving to live on two, three or four acres without canal irrigation, and for them, Sir, I have every respect and admiration. But, when I hear our more prosperous friends, with better aid to agriculture, grumbling, I am, Sir, in somewhat less sympathy with them. The proposal would, at a rough guess, represent a loss of round about Rs. 20 lakhs. The last speaker has pointed out that of the original increase of Rs. 50 lakhs only about Rs. 25 lakhs remain, and if the present cut is made, there will be little left at all. Now, Sir, one would have thought from the speeches of those honourable members who supported this cut that they were in sympathy with the poor cultivators, but we do not hear of any example of that sympathy taking a practical form. If my honourable friend from Montgomery would address his neighbour, the honourable friend from Shahpur, and ask whether the owners of the private canals, who take one-fourth of the produce as their water rate, are prepared to reduce that proportion in consideration of this fall in price of cotton, I feel very certain that the answer would be "certainly not." The honourable member denied, or rather refused, to accept the statement from the honourable member from Simla that the zamindars were prepared to pay a far higher water rate. The Punjab water rate may be taken round about 5 to 7 per cent. of the gross produce. The private canal owners of Shahpur take one-fourth of the gross produce. The cost of well irrigation is variously estimated from 22 to 50 rupees an acre as against an all round average water rate of about Rs. 4-8-0.

Another broad consideration, Sir, is this, and I hope the Council will always bear this in mind as it is most supremely important for this province, this province has invested round about 36 crores of rupees on irrigation works, I have not got the exact figures, but I think it is round about that sum. They will understand that that investment involves a tremendous

4 P.M.

liability and any haphazard, casual interference with the working of these canals merely on account of a temporary change in prices may have the most serious effect on our province. It may be cotton to-day, sugar to-morrow, and wheat the day after. Any attempt to bring political pressure on to the working of an investment of 36 crores is, I think you will all admit, highly dangerous. We have pressure brought to bear from honourable members from the south-east of the province asking Government to push on the work on the Bhakra Dam Scheme. Those gentlemen know perfectly well that they will not get water at the average low rate which the rest of the Punjab pays. And yet, Sir, in the south-east of the province they are prepared to pay twice and three times the water rates which are charged in our present irrigated tracts. If the principle be adopted, that whenever there is a temporary drop in prices, water rates must be reduced, then this Council must also accept the principle that where there is a rise in the price of produce, the water rates must go up. We have at present a proposal in another House to enhance the duty on sugar. The effect of that duty will be probably to put up the price of *gur*. Is that a sound reason for our Finance Member to increase the *abiana* on sugarcane? If so, if we admit casual rises, casual

[Mr. H. Calvert.]

changes in prices be a sound reason for reduction or alteration of water rates, I think it would be fairly clear that it will only lead to greater confusion and very great divisions between the people of this province. When this motion was before us on the last occasion, I tried to explain to the House that this province is able to charge a water rate actually less than what it costs to put the water on to the land. I happen to have figures before me for the Lower Bari Doab Canal. The capital cost per acre newly irrigated on the Lower Bari Doab is about Rs. 70. Taking interest on it at 6 per cent., the interest charge per acre irrigated is round about Rs. 4-3-0. Administration charges are round about Rs. 1-8-0 per acre. Therefore the cost of putting water on to the Lower Bari Doab Canal is Rs. 5-11-0 per acre as compared with the average water rate of Rs. 4-8-0. The same argument applies to most of the canals except those which were built last century, the Lower Jhelum and the Lower Chenab. The so-called profit from our canals is of course due to the credit of indirect receipts, sales of land and land revenue. But the actual water rate is less than what it costs Government to put the water on the land.

There is one further view of this case which I should like members to take. I illustrate this by the case of the Nili Bar. When the project for a canal is worked out, this Government has to see how it proposes to make that canal a financial success and how it proposes to meet the heavy interest on capital charges thereon. Therefore, the whole question of receipts and expenditure has to be gone into most carefully. On the Nili Bar we have taken an all-round estimated receipt from water-rate alone of, I think, Rs. 4-8-0 an acre over perennial and Rs. 2-4-0 over non-perennial canals. I estimate that they were the average and if we always got that average water-rate we should be able to make the Nili Bar project a financial success. If we do not get that average water-rate, the project will not be a financial success but will be a burden on the province. If you are going to reduce the water-rate on cotton by Rs. 1-8-0 an acre you are very seriously interfering with the average water rate, and unless honourable members are prepared to make the rates higher on other crops so as to compensate Government for this loss, the proposal ceases to be practicable. I do hope honourable members would realise that under the terms under which we raise loans we are to raise so much income and that income must be raised or we lose our credit. If members are prepared to have increased water rates from wheat or sugar so as to compensate for this loss of 20 lakhs, then the position is worth discussing. If members merely put forward a proposal for reduction without suggesting any compensation, then they must see that they are inflicting a very great injury indeed, not only on the financial prospects of this province, but on its credit when the time next comes to borrow for further irrigation projects.

**Mr. J. D. Penny** (Finance Secretary): Sir, I do not wish to detain the House long, but I should like to emphasise the practical results of the reduction which the honourable member wishes to make in the *abiana* rate on cotton. Taking the average area under cotton for the last three years and working out the reduction thereon, I find that it will amount to approximately 24 lakhs of rupees. The effect of this can be very easily imagined when we remember that much of the difficulty in balancing or trying to

balance the budget for next year has been due to a loss of revenue which amounts to very much the same figure. We have reduced our land revenue by a sum amounting to about 10 lakhs in pursuance of an undertaking given some years ago that the principles of the new land revenue Bill should be applied to settlements that were started after 1922. We have also to face an expected loss under the head of Excise amounting to 13 or 14 lakhs. It is therefore a curious coincidence that the loss which the honourable member wishes to inflict upon the province amounts to just about the same amount as we have already experienced in our coming budget. The province is faced with the question whether it wishes to proceed with the development of those schemes on which it has embarked in the last three or four years since the remission of the provincial contributions, and an examination of our commitments under the various departmental heads and a comparison of those commitments with any probable growth of receipts leads us to the conclusion that without some definite addition to our revenues, it will be quite impossible to finance these further developments which I think all sections of the House are anxious to see translated into practice. Any reduction therefore of our existing sources of revenue will not merely make further progress impossible but necessitate an actual cutting down of the present beneficent activities of Government. The honourable member has laid much stress upon the fact, that when the existing rate for cotton was fixed, prices were very high. It is true prices have fallen since, but it is not true that the rate was fixed on the assumption that the prices then prevalent would continue. I remember myself that in the autumn of 1920 when I was starting a settlement and had to give very serious consideration to this particular subject, the rate for cotton was Rs. 9, and it was known when the rates were raised in 1923 or 1924, that a drop of this kind was a thing which was only too likely to happen. Several honourable members have recognised the impossibility of rapidly changing the charges for the supply of water with the changes in the market rates of produce. It must, I think, be accepted that it is only when the price of the crop falls for a considerable period and shows no signs of raising again that that can be made a reasonable ground for reducing the charge that has been fixed for it. The present charge is Rs. 5-8-0, I think, in the Upper Bari Doab and Rs. 6-4-0 upon the canals of the triple project, and if we assume that the outturn of a canal irrigated land is only about 5 maunds per acre . . . . . (*An Honourable Member*: The rate is Rs. 6-8-0.) Well, I assume that it is Rs. 6-8-0. Assuming that the outturn is 5 maunds per acre and the return Rs. 7 or 8 a maund, the value of the profits will be about Rs. 40. Can it seriously be urged that it is not worth the zamindars' while to pay Rs. 6-8-0 per acre? Several honourable members who hail from *barani* districts have told the House that they would be willing to pay a great deal more than this. Now, the increase in revenue which was secured by a revision of the water-rates in 1924 amounted approximately to 55 lakhs. This was reduced in the following year by 17 lakhs and subsequently by further reduction in water rates by another 8 lakhs, so that, the net enhancement of revenue by water rates has been Rs. 30 lakhs only. The honourable member now proposes to reduce that by Rs. 24 lakhs leaving a miserable residue of only 6 lakhs. I leave it to the House to decide whether he has made out a case for so drastic a reduction.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** (Minister for Local Self-Government) (Urdu): It is quite true, Sir, that if you are making a bargain with another person, it usually pays you to keep back the truth and show only that side of your picture which may be likely to serve your purpose better. I am a zamindar myself and, therefore, I stand to gain by any reduction that may be made in the *abiana*. But after all, Sir, truth is truth, and it must be told when you are dealing with such a matter of public importance. My honourable friend representing the Lahore, Sikh, Rural constituency (Sardar Hira Singh Narli) may say

میر کا بہدشی لگا ڈھانچ

but there is no gainsaying the fact that the lands in the canal irrigated areas usually yield 10 to 15 maunds of cotton per acre.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli**: That is not a fact, Sir.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon**: I say that they do yield that much in the beginning.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan**: Yes, in the beginning.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon**: And the produce from the old lands is nearly the same, too.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli**: It used to be that much but it is not the same now.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon**: I get that much from my lands which are not even permanently irrigated.

**Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi**: But those lands are highly fertile and exceptionally rich.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon**: Thank you, but it is a fact that these are the usual expectations from the lands in the canal irrigated areas.

However, Sir, even if we take the produce at 9 maunds per acre and the price of the American cotton at Rs. 8 a maund, the income comes to Rs. 72 per acre. Now, half of this goes to the cultivator and, similarly, half of the *abiana* falls upon him. Then, even if the zamindar gets no more than Rs. 20, it surely is not too much for him to contribute a mere Rs. 8 towards the public treasury. The zamindars themselves get no less than Rs. 18 as their *haq-i-abpashi* and, therefore, it is but fair that they should not grudge paying Rs. 8 to the Government.

Now, let us look at the situation in the light of these circumstances and our present financial condition. You know it fully well that we are face to face with a deficit budget this year, and you cannot be unaware of what a deficit budget implies. If any honourable member would like to come to me I will show him how this financial stringency has affected the schemes

designed for the welfare of the province. There are so many hospitals which we intended to provincialize and there are a good many other beneficent schemes which we wanted to carry out this year. We feel that some of these schemes are of the most urgent importance so far as the poor people living in the far off rural areas are concerned, but we are simply compelled to withhold them for want of money. Under these circumstances, Sir, I sincerely hope that my honourable friends will realize the desirability of not pressing their demand any further.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu):** Sir, I was hoping that the Government will accord to my amendment a sympathetic consideration which it richly deserves. But I am sorry to find even the zamindar member of the Government (the Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon) raising his voice against it. However, that is not a matter for surprise, because so long as he is a member of the Government it is his duty to work in the interests of the Government. Then the Financial Secretary was pleased to quote what he thought to be the price at which cotton is selling at present. But I submit, Sir, that those are the highest rates for the best American cotton. The price of the *desi* cotton has fallen considerably and is still on the decrease. I know that we have a deficit budget this year, but that is the only reason why I have asked for such a small reduction. The Government cannot deny that if it is face to face with financial stringency, the condition of the zamindars is even worse.

Now, if you compare the rates charged in the Punjab with those prevalent in other parts of the country you will find that in the United Provinces and Sindh they are much lower than in our province. I own some lands in Sindh, and there we have to pay less than Rs. 5 by way of *abiana*. Then Sir, cotton sells at a much higher price in Sindh on account of the nearness of the port of Karachi and, moreover, an acre in that province consists of 10 *kanals* while here it is equal to 8 *kanals* only.

The honourable the Financial Commissioner was pleased to remark that if you reduce the burden on the zamindars and make them too comfortable they usually take to mischief-making. This, Sir, is a question about which the less said the better. But I may be allowed to point out that if there is really any danger of that kind it is in the case of those drawing too fat salaries and not from the poor starving zamindars.

My honourable friend, Mr. Maya Das, has asked why the zamindars do not use wells for irrigation purposes. That is really a very good suggestion. But those who know anything about our lands will bear me out when I say that we can get only salt water there. The zamindars would be only too ready to take up that suggestion if they would get good, sweet water from wells.

Under these circumstances, I would request the Government to see its way to revise its position with regard to this amendment. I am very glad to find that the communal warfare which was too conspicuous a feature of our deliberations last year has subsided to a great extent and, therefore, I hope that this as well as other motions will be considered dispassionately and purely on their merits.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain (Revenue Member), (Urdu):** Sir, I think I had better speak on this amendment in Urdu. My



[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

honourable friend, the Sardar Sahib, has said that we should consider every motion dispassionately and then vote upon it according to its merits. I quite agree with him, because we cannot adopt a better course of action than this golden rule. I have always urged upon the Council the desirability of adopting this course and tried to induce my honourable friends invariably to keep it in view. Now, Sir, this amendment calls our attention to three things, and I hope the House will accord the most careful and dispassionate consideration to them. First of all, there are four main sources of income in this province. Out of these, the first place is occupied by *abiana* (water rate) and the second by land revenue. Then come the proceeds in the Excise department and stamp fee, etc., and lastly, some miscellaneous items. This, I hope, must be clear to every honourable member of the Council.

Next, we have to take into consideration the expenditure which the province was incurring before the introduction of the Reforms, and see how it has increased. First of all, we had to maintain the various colleges, schools, hospitals, etc., that had come into existence before the advent of the Reforms, and they were, almost all of them, situated at the headquarters of the districts or in other central places, with the result that people living in the far off rural areas could not enjoy the benefits of schools, hospitals and good roads. It was, therefore, necessary to provide the same facilities to the rural areas. But that required money, and there is no gainseying the fact that Government cannot get money without an increase in taxation. Now, the land revenue was a source from which the income was really on the increase. But it is well-known to the honourable members that the Land Revenue Act, which they were pleased to pass last year, has reduced the chances of a large increase in land revenue. This year, it has caused a loss of ten lakhs of rupees, and this sum of ten lakhs has gone to the zamindars owning lands mainly in the canal irrigated areas. (A voice: In which districts?). In Gujranwala, Gujrat, Jhang, Shahpur, Sheikhupura, Attock, and one other district. Now, as a result of this decrease of ten lakhs the Government has not been able to do what it wanted to do for the uplift of the backward people. Not only that. We have been also compelled to withhold some beneficent schemes intended for ameliorating the condition of the people in some of the more backward and poorer districts like Gurgaon, Pindi and Kangra, etc. May I ask, Sir, whether it is possible to build and maintain schools, hospitals, roads and canals without money?

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli:** But can you not reduce your expenditure by a proportionate reduction in the salaries of those who are drawing Rs. 500 or more a month?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** I am coming to that presently. I was saying, Sir, that these facilities are absolutely necessary, and none needs them more than the poor people of the rural areas. But nothing can be done without money. And what do we find here? Instead of suggesting ways and means for augmenting its income, the Government is asked to part with another 25 lakhs. I submit, Sir, that that is absolutely impossible unless we do away with the rural dispensaries and stop a good many



grants to district boards. It is you, who stand to lose by adopting such a course of action. You have urged upon the House to consider every problem on its merits, and I would request you to accord the same treatment to what I am going to say with regard to our present financial condition. We have been discussing the various items of the budget for the last two days. Every honourable member knows that we are face to face with a deficit budget this year. Not only that. It is also obvious that the present state of affairs cannot improve unless there is an improvement in the sources of our income. But may I ask whether any motion has been brought forward by any member which is likely to reduce our expenditure or to increase our income? Do you mean to say that we can reduce our expenditure by increasing the pay of the patwaris? I was under the impression that the honourable members had realized the importance of the present situation and, therefore, I was hoping that they would rise to the occasion.

Now, it has been said that land revenue is contributed and shared by the whole province while the burden of *abiana* falls upon the canal irrigated areas only. But may I ask, Sir, whether the condition of the zamindars in any part of the province is better than that of the people owning lands in the canal irrigated areas? Both Sardar Sahib and Fir Sahib have urged that the poor zamindars must be afforded some relief by reducing the *abiana*, but have they even given a thought to the fact that there are poorer people in districts like Jhelum and Gurgaon who will consider themselves only too fortunate if they could get water even at these rates? I will request them to reflect whether they would be prepared to meet such a demand if they were in my position. The Government has been repeatedly urged to help the poor zamindars. But can any one say that the condition of the zamindars who own lands in the canal colonies is really worse as compared with all other classes of people living in the province?

Now, let us consider this amendment in the light of these circumstances and the golden rule suggested by the honourable mover. He says that the price of cotton has fallen considerably and, therefore, this commodity cannot bear the present burden of *abiana*. But, would he like the idea of throwing this burden on any other crop in order to relieve cotton? Will he please name any other crop which would be able to bear this burden? Hardly three months ago, i.e., in December 1929, this matter was discussed in this House at great length. At that time also I put the same proposition before the honourable members, because the Government simply cannot reduce a single pice unless it can find some other source of income to counter-balance the loss in income.

Therefore, Sir, if I were to say that the Government would accord a sympathetic consideration to this proposal it would surely create a wrong impression that the Government will make some reduction in the *abiana* and make up the loss from some other source. I must make it clear that that is absolutely impossible unless the Government were to abandon all beneficent schemes or modify the existing rates of *abiana* on other crops. Hardly a year back, the honourable members definitely promised that the Council would be quite willing to help the Government to make up any loss that might result from the passage of the Land Revenue Act. But what do we find now? The province has already suffered a loss of ten lakhs under the head land revenue, and now Government is being asked to

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

reduce the *abiana* also. May I ask, Sir, whether this is what the Honourable Members meant by their willingness to help the Government?

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

“That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 1.”

The question is that the proposed reduction be made.

The Council divided : Ayes 22, Noes 81.

#### AYES.

Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath.	Malik Nawab Major Talib Khan.	Mehdi
Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram.	Sayad Muhammad Husain.	
Chaudhri Ram Singh.	Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.	
Chaudhri Kesar Singh.	Lala Chetan Anand.	
Pandit Nanak Chand.	Chaudhri Muhammad Rahman Khan.	Abdul
Chaudhri Baldev Singh.	Chaudhri Afzal Haq.	
Lala Mukand Lal, Puri.	Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq.	
Lala Gopal Das.	Sardar Hira Singh, Narli.	
Lala Jyoti Prasad.	Sardar Hari Singh.	
Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri.	Sardar Partap Singh.	
Pandit Mehar Chand.	Sardar Harbakhsh Singh.	

#### NOES.

Col. C. A. Gill.	Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie.
Mr. H. Calvert.	Mr. H. W. Emerson.
Mr. C. A. H. Townsend.	Dr. (Mrs.) M. C. Shave.
The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon.	Khan Bahadur Maulvi Abdul Ghani.
Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffer Khan.	Mr. S. L. Sale.
Mr. W. R. Wilson.	Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikander Hyat Khan.
Mr. R. Sanderson.	Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal.
Mr. M. A. Ghani.	Mr. Owen Roberts.
Mr. H. F. Ashton.	Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram, Kalia.
Mr. W. S. Dorman.	Rai Bahadur Lala Rattan Chand.
The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal.	Khan Bahadur Nawab Muhammad Jamal Khan.
The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh.	Chaudhri Ali Ahmad.
The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow.	Sardar Bahadur Captain Dalpat Singh.
The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.	Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sheo Narain Singh.
Mr. Alan Mitchell.	Mr. E. Maya Das.
Mr. J. D. Penny.	

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,35,56,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st March 1931 in respect of Irrigation.”

The motion was carried.

## IRRIGATION ESTABLISHMENT—OPEN CANALS.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 87,58,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Irrigation Establishment—Open Canals.”

The motion was carried.

## IRRIGATION ESTABLISHMENT, SUTLEJ VALLEY PROJECT.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain**: Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 17,54,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st March 1931 in respect of Irrigation Establishment, Sutlej Valley Project.”

The motion was carried.

## IRRIGATION (CAPITAL EXPENDITURE).

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain**: Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 32,54,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st March 1931 in respect of Irrigation (Capital Expenditure).”

The motion was carried.

## DEBT SERVICES.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member): Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 5,600 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Debt Services.”

The motion was carried.

## GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (RESERVED).

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow**: Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 93,60,200 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of General Administration (Reserved).”

**Mr. President**: Demand moved is—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 93,60,200 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of General Administration (Reserved).”

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan** [Sialkot, (Muhammadan), Rural]: Sir, I beg to move—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1,000 with respect to the item of Rs. 1,30,400. Total—Provincial Legislative Council.”

My object in moving this demand is to urge upon Government the necessity of providing an adequate staff of messengers and orderlies for the Council and a clerk for preparing members' travelling allowance bills. I conceive that it is not necessary for me to make a lengthy speech in support of this motion, as I do not apprehend that any section of the House will be

[**Ch. Zafarulla Khan.**]

disposed to quarrel with the necessity for a better staff of messengers and orderlies for the Council Chamber and also the necessity for a clerk to prepare members' bills and other similar documents. I have put the motion in that form out of regard to the financial stringency with which the province is faced. No doubt, a great deal more staff is necessary both for the office and for the Council Chamber, but I have confined my motion to that amount of staff without which the work of the Council and the members is really being seriously hampered. Very often, when one is sitting in the Chamber and a debate is proceeding, one wants to communicate with other honourable members or to send for papers or books from the office or from the Library, and there is nobody who can attend to one's requirements. Ordinarily, there are only two orderlies who attend during the sittings in the Chamber and their services are very seldom available to non-official members for the purpose of sending them on errands. If one or both of them are sent away, there will be no one left to attend to other demands that might arise.

Similarly, with regard to the demand that a clerk should be provided for preparing members' travelling allowance bills and other similar documents, I can assure the Government benches that honourable members have a genuine grievance that their travelling allowance bills are delayed for considerable periods of time and are not passed sometimes for months, and very often, the reason is either that they have not been properly prepared which is due to the fact that a very large number of members—including myself, for instance—are not familiar with the details and rules with regard to these matters and are not able to fill up these travelling allowance bills without help from the office, with regard to distances and rates and other matters on which technical advice is necessary and we are also assured that the delays are due to the fact that the office is undermanned. If these two demands are agreed to, honourable members will feel that their grievances with regard to orderlies and messengers in the Chamber and with regard to the matter of the preparation of travelling allowance bills have been removed. This is not a matter over which I apprehend that any controversy will arise, and I hope Government will be prepared to accept the motion in the spirit in which it has been put before the House. With these words, I move the amendment.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1,000 with respect to the item of Rs. 1,30,400—  
Total—Provincial Legislative Council."

**Mr. H. W. Emerson** (Chief Secretary) : Sir, I think a happy convention has been established between Government and the House in regard to the financial provision necessary to maintain the dignity and efficiency of the House and the comfort of the members. On the one hand, the House has never asked anything that has not been reasonable, on the other hand Government has therefore never refused anything that the House has asked for. Government has every reason to suppose that that convention will be maintained and will only be too glad to give sympathetic consideration to any proposals that may be put forward for the further comfort and convenience of the members in the directions indicated by the honourable mover

of the amendment. I hope that in view of this assurance, the honourable-mover will not desire to press his amendment.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Sir, in view of the assurance given by the Chief Secretary, I beg for leave to withdraw my amendment.

The amendment was, by leave, withdrawn.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan** [Sialkot (Muhammadan) Rural] : Sir, I beg to move—

“ That the grant be reduced by Rs. 100 with respect to the item of Rs. 49,100—Elections of members of Indian and Provincial Legislatures.”

My object in moving this amendment is to draw the attention of Government to the inadequacy of polling arrangements in rural areas. On a previous occasion also, I drew the attention of Government to the grievances which arise on the occasions of elections to the provincial and Indian legislatures that in the rural areas arrangements for polling are extremely inadequate. Honourable members are aware that candidates are not permitted either to supply hired conveyances to the electors in order to carry them from their homes to the polling stations and to take them back, or to pay them their travelling expenses, and in the rural areas even in the central districts where the police stations, which are generally chosen as places for establishing polling stations, are more numerous than they are in the more sparsely populated tracts of the province, great inconvenience is felt as sometimes the polling station is, as many, as ten or fifteen miles from the home of the elector, and it is rather difficult to expect that a man will give up one whole day's work and undertake a journey fifteen miles in each direction, that is to say, a distance of thirty miles, at his own expense, for the purpose of recording his vote. In those tracts in which police stations are not so numerous, I understand that occasionally the distance between a polling station and another is forty or fifty miles. It will, therefore, be easily imagined what amount of inconvenience the electors have to undergo when they are asked to go and record their votes at the polling stations on the occasions of these elections. On the other hand no doubt as popular franchise has been established in this province and as time passes, one hopes that the basis of the franchise will be still more widened and a larger number of persons will be expected to go to the polling stations, the inconvenience that is at present being felt will be largely multiplied. In this respect the rural elector is at a great disadvantage as compared with the urban elector and so is a candidate contesting a rural constituency as compared with a candidate who is contesting an urban constituency. This is a matter to which Government's attention was drawn also on a previous occasion during the discussion of the budget.

The principal objection that might be taken to this suggestion that polling stations in rural areas for these elections should be very largely multiplied, is the objection of expense. No doubt whenever conveniences of this kind have to be provided for expenditure has got to be incurred. The objection of expense may be taken against the whole system of reforms that has been introduced since 1919. Every item of these reforms involves more expense. The pay of the Ministers, the pay of additional staff, the travelling allowances of honourable members of provincial legislatures and members of the Indian legislature, all these things involve extra expense.

[Ch. Zafrull Khan,]

The question is whether the extra expense which is directed towards securing the results which is the object of these reforms is or is not justified and no one will deny that the small amount of extra expenditure for the purpose suggested would be fully justified. There are some devices which no doubt the officers concerned with these matters will fully explore by adopting which it may be found that the increased expenditure is not as great as is apprehended. For instance, even in the present system it sometimes happens that when there is a large number of electors, the electors even of one community have to be divided into two or more batches, and one batch of electors would come and record their votes on one day, and the other batch on the second day. In the case of those police stations at any rate where two days have to be fixed to enable the electors of one particular community to record their votes on the occasions of these elections if the police stations were to be divided into two groups and polling stations were established in the middle of each of these two groups, the average distance which the elector may have to walk would be halved and the days on which the votes have to be recorded would not be multiplied. In this case there would be no extra expense. In other cases where polling would take place in one polling station on two days as a result of the widening of the franchise, if not at the next elections but certainly for the elections thereafter, there will be a very large number of voters. There too it will be necessary for Government to allot more days to allow voters to go and record their votes at the time of the elections. All that Government would have to do in the case of such police stations in order to meet this demand would be to divide them up into circles and to put up polling stations in the middle of these circles. With regard to other police stations it may be that a slight multiplication of the number of polling booths would involve a slight amount of extra expense, but that would be fully justified having regard to the object which has to be achieved.

I have also one other suggestion to offer, as it affects the recording of votes in rural areas. At present the hours fixed for polling are from 9 A.M. to 4 P.M. allowing for a short interval for lunch in the middle for the officers engaged in the arrangement for polling. My own experience in a rural constituency is that generally it is difficult for people in early winter—that being the ordinary time when the elections are held in this province—to travel to the polling booth from their homes which may be two or three or five or even ten miles from the polling stations to be in time to record their votes at the very beginning of the polling. Therefore there is a very sparse attendance at the polling stations at 9 A.M. As a matter of fact things do not begin to hum, as it were, till about 10 or 11; whereas towards the close of the polling hours at 4 o'clock in the afternoon there are still a large number of people who are anxious to record their votes, but are shut out because the ballot boxes have to be closed. My suggestion in this respect is that the hours of polling should be changed, at any rate certainly with regard to rural areas. The hours should be from 10 A.M. to 5 P.M. instead of from 9 A.M. to 4 P.M. This change would meet the grievance in this respect. With these few words I put the reduction motion before the House.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

"That the demand be reduced by Rs. 100 with respect to the item of Rs. 49,100, elections of members of Indian and Provincial Legislatures."

**Sardar Buta Singh** [Multan Division and Sheikhpura, Sikh, Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I quite agree with what Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan has said and I strongly support him. The trouble and inconvenience that the members as well as the voters undergo at the time of the elections have been fully dilated upon by the honourable mover and the reasons that the honourable member adduced in support of his suggestions are also very sound and cogent. In the case of the district board elections Government have seen that these elections can be efficiently held by locating polling stations at the central places. In view of the fact that it is more convenient for the people to assemble at the central places than at the police stations I would request the Government that they should see their way to consider the proposals of the honourable mover favourably. With these few words I resume my seat.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh** [Kangra, (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I rise to support the cut that has been moved by the honourable member representing Sialkot. Three election have taken place after the inauguration of the reform. At the time of the first two elections the polling arrangements were not only different from but also better than the existing polling arrangements. Under the previous system certain areas were divided into certain circles and then in each circle according to the number of the voters, one, two, or even three polling stations were established at the police stations, and all voting took place on the same day. The voters from the circles went to their respective polling stations and recorded their votes without undergoing any inconvenience or botheration. But under the existing polling arrangements the invariable rule is that a police station is made the polling circle and the recording of votes continue for two or three successive days. Alphabetically different villages are assigned different days for recording their votes at the same polling booths and often the simple illiterate zamindar voters get confused over the alphabetical system of turns and come to the polling stations on the wrong days and have to go back again, without recording their votes, and it is quite clear that they never take the trouble of coming back again for recording their votes. In this way they are put to a good deal of unnecessary botheration. In view of this trouble it is a grave defect and should be remedied. Moreover under the existing polling arrangements the percentage of attendance instead of increasing is sure to decrease. Against the previous polling arrangements the objection of the paucity of the presiding and polling officers has been urged. No doubt it is a very reasonable excuse but this difficulty can be got over. Sir, under the existing arrangements the recording of votes takes place in all places at the same time and staffs on duty at polling booths take two or three days to finish their work specially if the circle is a big one. Since the recording is done in all places at the same time a staff at work at one place cannot be made available to go and attend to the work of recording votes at some other place. Consequently a separate and independent staff is required for each polling booth, and since we have not got a large number of officers to depute to the

[Ch. Ram Singh.]

work of elections therefore we cannot increase the number of polling booths for the convenience of the voters. This is the nature of the difficulty with which we are face to face at present, but it can be overcome if we do away with the system of recording votes on the same day. If this is done the staff at work in one circle after finishing its work there can travel to the next polling station to carry on the work of recording votes of that circle. To illustrate my point I will try to show how this can be done in the case of my own district. The first police station in the district of Kangra is at Basar. According to my proposal recording of votes may be done at this place on one day and then the next day may be made a non-working day to allow the staff to travel to the next polling station which is at Hamirpur. The recording of the votes of the Hamirpur circle may be done on the third day and the 4th day may again be made a holiday in order to let the staff reach Sujanpur. Similarly after finishing recording at Sujanpur the same staff can go to the next station of Palampur and from there to the next and so on. Introducing such an intermittent system of recording votes would prove advantageous in as much as it will save expenditure and also decrease the necessity of too many responsible officers. These arrangements, if adopted, would prove very helpful to the voters as well as the candidates. According to this very system elections were made in our district at the last two elections. The voters will get their votes recorded without undergoing or experiencing any inconvenience or discomfort and the candidates will have sufficient time to be personally present at least at 4 polling stations in order to see that the recording of votes is done efficiently. Then, Sir, the honourable member suggested that the recording of votes should be done between 10 A.M. and 5 P.M. I think this time would be more suitable and more convenient for the electors. With these few words I support the cut moved by the honourable member.

**Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar Khan** (Director, Information Bureau) (Urdu): Sir, I fully realise the trouble and inconvenience that the voters experience under the existing polling arrangements. They have my heartfelt sympathies. I know that in some cases they have to walk as much as 20 or 25 miles in order to reach a polling station to cast their votes. While the Government have got every sympathy with the voters they, at the same time, expect it from the members of the Council to keep in view the expense and difficulties that are involved in giving a practical shape to the proposals put forward by my honourable friend from Sialkot. Sir, at the time the reforms were inaugurated the number of voters was six lakhs and the average number of voters going to a polling station for recording their votes was between 500 and 1,000. The honourable members are aware that no complaint has ever been heard that any person at any place could not get his vote recorded on account of mis-management or overcrowding.

Then, Sir, an honourable member suggested that the number of polling stations may be increased. The number of voters at present is seven lakhs. Supposing that one polling booth is located for 700 voters then for seven lakhs we will have to locate 1,000 polling booths, for which there would be



required at least 4,000 polling and presiding officers. There have been complaints against polling officers and presiding officers. To remove those complaints Government as far as possible appointed gazetted officers to preside at the last elections to the local and the central legislatures. But now if we accept the suggestion of the honourable members and raise the number of the polling stations to 4,000 we will directly come face to face with the difficulty of finding responsible presiding and polling officers. At present there is a great paucity of officers. Last time we requested the High Court to lend us the services of the Sub-Judges for this work but they rightly refused to comply with our request on the ground that it was difficult to spare judicial officers. Similar is the case with other Government officers. They cannot be spared in such large numbers. So, it is a real and a genuine difficulty that stands in our path.

I hope members would be pleased to hear that in spite of all these troubles and inconveniences the percentage of the voters who come to the polling stations to cast their votes has been very large. Now the percentage of the attendance for the Legislative Council and the Assembly has at some thanas been 60 and 80 respectively. By this I don't mean to contest the statement that the voters feel a great deal of inconvenience in coming to the polling stations. What I mean to convey is this that now they are becoming so much interested in the elections that they do not attach very great importance to the inconveniences and trouble involved in going to and coming back from the polling stations.

Sir, my next submission is with regard to the expenditure that is incurred on account of 14 polling stations. On each polling station a sum of Rs. 40 to Rs. 50 is spent. Two ballot boxes, two canvas bags, table, voting papers, lists of the voters, locks, seals, sealing wax, etc. If polling stations are arranged by villages or zails this number would in all probability be doubled.

Then, Sir, the honourable member Chaudhri Ram Singh suggested that all electors of one thana should be able to finish their voting in one day. This method of polling if adopted would require a still larger number of presiding and polling officers. Where one set of officers goes on working for several days, several such sets would be required to finish the polling in one day. If suitable officers are available Government would do everything to meet the wishes of the House. But I may point out that for recording the votes of a very few electors we cannot go to their respective villages. The number of the voters in such cases is very small and the expense would be enormous. How can you have polling stations for 20 or 30 electors and in some cases for 2 or 3 voters as in the case of Kangra, Dera Ghazi Khan and other sparsely populated districts. To locate polling booths for such places would be sheer waste and extravagance. As regards the proposal that the recording of votes should commence from 10 A.M. I think there would be difficulty in adopting the suggestion.

**Sardar Mohindar Singh** [Ludhiana, (Sikh) Rural] (Urdu): Sir, there are actually some grave defects in the existing polling arrangements. The defect which lies in alphabetical system according to which villages are divided into batches in the same circle for the purposes of recording their

[ S. Mohinder Singh. ]

votes is this that under it some voters have to walk 20 or even 25 miles in order to get at the polling station while others have to undertake no journey absolutely to reach there. The polling arrangements that were made in the district of Ludhiana in the year 1920 and in the year 1923 were far better than those made subsequently. The previous arrangements differed from the existing ones in as much as under them the recording of votes took place on alternative days. I would request the Government that this time they should make polling arrangements according to the older system, for that system is more convenient for the people. With these words I support the honourable mover.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram** [Multan Division; (Non-Muham-madan), Rural] (Urdu): Sir, I can name six districts in which the polling stations are located so far from villages that the voters have to walk twelve miles or more in each direction before they get at them. In my constituency the first instance is that of a town by the name of Ahmedpur Sial in the Garh Maharaja police station where in the election days the voters assemble to record their votes after undertaking a journey of 15 to 20 and even in some cases 25 miles. At the time of the last elections it was requested that Ahmadpur, a central place, may also be made a polling station for the convenience of the electors. But the authorities concerned did not consent to our proposal. The next instance that I would like to quote is the instance of Dunyapur in Multan district which is 15 miles from its police station. In this town there are some one hundred or more voters. The voters of this village have to face the same trouble of walking such a long distance to the police station. The honourable member, the Director of Information Bureau, has himself admitted that in the district of Dera Ghazi Khan the police stations are situated at long distances from each other. No doubt in the new districts like Lyallpur and Montgomery the police stations and consequently the polling stations are situated at smaller distances from each other and voters are not put to so much trouble on account of long distances intervening between their homes and the polling stations. But this is not the case in the old districts. Under these circumstances it is necessary that the rule of making police stations the polling centres should be changed and instead of the police stations the central big towns may be made the polling stations. Supposing, Sir, there is a village which is situated at such a place which is very near to another police station but outside its area. The voters of this village according to the existing polling arrangements would not be allowed to cast their votes at the polling booth of the other police station which is nearer. They will have to go to the polling booth of their own police station, whether at the distance of twenty miles or thirty miles. This is a great defect and should be remedied by locating polling stations at the central places. No doubt to do this would require more expenditure but by increasing the number of the polling days we can curtail the expenditure that would become necessary otherwise. Some honourable members have suggested that the polling hours may be fixed between 10 A.M. and 5 P.M. To my mind the hours between 11 A.M. and 6 P.M. would be more suitable for in winter the zamindars generally leave their houses in no case before 8 or 9 in the morning after taking their morning meals, etc.

The honourable the Director of Information Bureau was pleased to inform us that percentage of attendance of rural voters who actually voted had increased. Sir, at the first election out of 10,000 voters in my constituency only 2,500 voters recorded their votes and at the third election out of 14,000 electors 6,000 to 7,000 electors attended the polling stations to cast their votes. This shows many voters did not reach the polling booths. But I say that if you make arrangements to locate polling stations near their places this percentage of attendance will still go up.

Then the honourable member dilated upon the paucity of polling and presiding officers, no doubt this is a genuine difficulty but we can get over it by utilizing the services of inspectors, sub-assistant surgeons, deputy collectors, sub-judges and others for this temporary work. If the number of election days is increased the same officers can be employed at various polling stations and this will involve no extra expenditure. Then, the Muslim members generally represent single districts and in their constituencies there would be no need of increasing the number of polling stations but most of the Hindus, especially in the Western Punjab, have large constituencies. In the end I request the Government that they should make such polling arrangements under which the voters may in no case be required to travel more than five miles on either side to record their votes. With these few words I support the motion.

**Diwan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath** (Punjab Landholders, General): Sir, I am an elected member, but from a special constituency, and I am one of those fortunate few who at every election have been returned unopposed. I have, therefore, no personal experience of the matters with which the honourable the mover of this cut has dealt. But, Sir, I have listened to every word with great care and I have every sympathy with the proposal which he has made and I am glad that my honourable friend Nawab Muzaffar Khan has given a sympathetic reply. But, Sir, the difficulties to which he has adverted ought not to be given an undue weight, but the convenience of the voters and the convenience of the candidates ought to be taken into consideration. The proposal that the hours of polling should be so changed as to enable the voters to come to the polling booth more easily and the area prescribed for each polling booth should be made smaller is a sound one. These changes will have to be adopted when the franchise is lowered with the new constitution, yet we should be prepared for that bigger change by introducing change now in conformity with those bigger changes. The number of voters who take interest in elections is increasing. At every election a larger and larger percentage is going to the polling booths and I am sure that in the next election which will be the last under the present reforms the percentage of voters going to the polling booths would be very large. Therefore, we should have no hesitation in adopting the reforms suggested by the honourable the mover of the cut. I cannot quote the special cases of any thana or area assigned to each polling booth. I have no personal experience, and therefore, with a general support to the cut I resume my seat.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** (Lahore, Sikh, Rural) (Urdu): With your permission, Sir, I would also like to make one or two suggestions with regard

[S. Hira Singh Narli.]

to the matter under consideration. Sir, under the present system of elections, those persons who are not very rich and who, in my opinion, are the real representatives of the masses, cannot compete for election to the Council. They cannot arrange for motor cars and lorries for the conveyance of the voters to the polling booths and they cannot supply liquor, which is generally supplied by the rich candidates for election, to these voters (*laughter*). I can quote hundreds of examples in which the candidates supplied liquor to the voters to persuade the latter to vote for them. At present the polling stations are so arranged that the voters of many villages have to travel between 10 and 20 miles to record their votes at the polling stations. Therefore only those persons can succeed in these elections who can afford to spend thousand of rupees on means of conveyance and on other things to tempt the voters to vote for them. In order to put a stop to these corrupt practices and in order to enable the really deserving candidates to be elected to the Council I would suggest that voters should not be required to record their votes at the polling stations but that their votes should be collected in their own houses in the villages. No candidate and no agent of the candidate should be permitted to approach the voters to canvass for the votes. They should not be permitted to influence the voters in any way. Let them give their votes in favour of the candidate who, in their opinion, is most deserving and whom they trust as their true representative. If this suggestion is adopted I can guarantee that only the true representative of the people will come to the Council and besides the present corrupt practices will stop. Another suggestion that I like to make is that elections should be held after every five years as is done in England. During elections feelings run very high and many opposing factions come into existence on these occasions. It is, therefore, better that five years should elapse before another election takes place. I hope that these suggestions of mine will receive proper consideration at the hands of the honourable member who is in charge of elections.

**Chaudhri Baldev Singh** (North-West Rohtak, Non-Muhammadan, Rural) (Urdu) : Sir, various suggestions have been made in connection with the motion before the House. It has been represented that the time, as it is at present fixed for recording votes at the polling stations, is inconvenient to the voters. As it is illegal to supply food to the voters of the rural areas who must start very early from their places to reach in time at the polling stations, the honourable mover has suggested that the hours should be changed from 9 A.M. and 4 P.M. to 10 A.M. and 5 P.M. Another honourable member has suggested that the recording of votes should be from 11 till 6 in the evening. But both of these honourable gentlemen have overlooked one thing. They have not realised that the voters have also to go back to their places, and I need hardly say that the hours of 5 and 6 in the evening particularly in the winter season, when the elections generally take place, are too late to start back to the places lying at a distance of 10 to 15 miles from the polling booths (*hear, hear*). I, therefore, cannot persuade myself to agree to this suggestion. Then it was proposed that the voters of the villages lying nearest a polling station should be required to record their votes at that polling station irrespective of the fact whether these villages are under the jurisdiction of that police station or not at which the polling booth

is located. This arrangement may prove somewhat convenient, but I think that it would be more suitable and more convenient to the voters if instead of police stations, zails are taken to be units and polling booths are located in the centre of these zails. Similar arrangement exists in the case of district board elections and it has been found to be quite convenient both from the point of view of voters as well as of the candidates. It will involve no extra expenditure because it will not be necessary to appoint extra staff. I really wonder why police stations have been selected as units and why it is that polling booths are located at the thanas. The jurisdiction of the different police stations varies very much. In some of them the number of voters is very large while in others their number is very small. In my constituency there are 6 police stations. In the jurisdiction of the Sampla police station the number of voters is about three thousand. In three others it is less than two thousands and in the jurisdiction of the Kalanaur police station the number does not exceed one thousand. It is, therefore, apparent that the distribution of voters in the different circles is unequal and it is also easy to understand that in the police stations, whose jurisdiction extends over a much large area, there must be many villages lying at a very great distance from the polling booths. The present arrangement is obviously very inconvenient and if Government really wishes that the largest number of voters should come to the polling booths to record their votes, it is necessary that a more convenient arrangement should be made. If Government cannot think of any other arrangement at present, it will do well to adopt the suggestion I have made above. With these words I support this motion. But as I have said before, I cannot agree with the honourable mover so far as he suggested that the time for recording votes should also be changed.

**Chaudhri Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan** (Jullundur, Muhammadan, Rural) (Urdu): Sir, I rise to support the motion under discussion. I want to make it clear that the present system of elections to the Council and even to the local bodies is more favourable to rich and wealthy persons. My experience during the recent election to our district board confirms this view. Every candidate for election to that district board was running at least four lorries to transport the voters to the polling booths. There were some candidates who had hired 12 lorries for this purpose. Not only that. In this election almost all the candidates supplied wine and *kunka*, as the Sikhs call it to the voters. I will not mention any names, but I know that one Sikh candidate had spent Rs. 1,600 on liquor and *kunka* besides the expenses that he had to incur on lorries and motor cars for conveying his voters to the polling stations. There was a Muhammadan candidate who had likewise spent a large amount of money on this election campaign. When his voters used to approach him with the request that they should also be supplied with liquor, he used to reply, "please do not ask for wine because Islam strictly prohibits the use of it; you can have money to entertain yourself with sweets and when you have got the money you can spend it in any way you like. You should not directly ask for wine." This is how many members of the Council and of the local bodies succeed in elections. I can say without fear of contradiction that during the recent elections to our district board each candidate had to spend at least Rs. 600 or Rs. 700 and

[Ch. Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan.]

some of them had to spend Rs. 2,000. Now you can imagine how far it is possible for those persons, who are not rich, to stand as candidates for election to these representative bodies. Under the present system of elections only rich men are returned to local bodies and to the Council and if the present system continues, there will be no chance for poor men, who are the real representatives of the people and who alone can really sympathise with the masses, to come to the Council and the Assembly. It is hardly necessary for me to say that these rich men cannot be expected to represent the poor people. The men who now come to the Council are generally those who have never known poverty and they cannot naturally feel for the poor as much as a poor man will feel for them. It is said that at one time in the history of the Bikaner State the inhabitants of the State began leaving it in search of employment because they were starving there. Some of the *darbaris* went to the Raja and told him that his people were leaving the State. He wondered at this information and replied that if his people were dissatisfied even when they had *zarda* and *pulao* to eat every day, he could not help it. What else the Raja could be expected to say? He was accustomed to eating *zarda* and *pulao* every day and he thought that every one else was also as fortunate as he himself was. This is generally the mentality of the rich people. If the Government wish that the real representative of the people should come to the Council, it should change the present system of elections. The present system requires change from another point of view also. It favours corruption which the Government is very anxious to stop. So much money is wasted on these elections that one cannot imagine. The country is already poor and it is necessary that this waste should be avoided. It is no use saying that there is the law to check corruption. I know that in one case when the officers were approached with the request that such and such a candidate should be stopped from entertaining the voters with *halwa* the officers replied that there was no such law which gave them power to stop that candidate from doing so. Such and other complaints can be removed only if this system is changed. No half measures will do. If it is not possible to collect votes separately in every village as was suggested by Sardar Hira Singh, the system that is in vogue with regard to the University Constituency should be introduced. Voting papers should be sent to each voter in an envelope who should return the same marked in favour of the candidate for whom he wishes to vote. I think this is very simple and very easy method and no difficulties will be experienced by the voters or the candidates if that is adopted. If this method is not approved, zails should be adopted as units and polling stations should be located in the centre of these zails. In any case the present arrangements must be improved. I may in passing request that some steps should also be taken so that the recording of bogus votes may become impossible. With these words I support the motion with all the force at my command.

**Mr. Labh Singh** [Rawalpindi Division and Lahore Division, North (Non-Muhammdan)], (Rural) : I claim, Sir, a special and, I may say, a very extensive experience of the polling arrangements. I have seen voters coming on foot, on horse, by rail, on camels and by boats, using every possible means of conveyance or transport. As I was remarking only the other day, my constituency is perhaps the most unwieldy, the most difficult to

negotiate that can be imagined, extending as it does practically from the banks of the Ravi to right across the Indus, comprising over eight rural districts. On the basis of this experience I would, with your permission, like to make two remarks. The first one is this, that under the existing polling arrangements the invariable rule is that a polling centre is necessarily a police station. I would submit for the consideration of those who are in charge of these arrangements that this rule may in some cases be departed from with advantage. I will cite the illustration of Malakwal, which is a big village, a trading centre of some importance, a railway junction, and having a large number of voters. If these people have to go to the polls they have got to be carried or transported over a distance of some 30 miles, whereas the police station where they cast their votes is a village with perhaps half a dozen voters. Difficulties of this kind can very easily be overcome if we in some extreme cases depart from this rule, namely, of locating the polling booth necessarily at a police centre.

As regards the other suggestion that has been made, that the present time of 9 A.M. to 4 P.M. may be changed to 10 A.M. to 5 P.M., with an interval of half an hour, to this also I have a slight objection. My experience of these rural conditions is that it is easier by far to beat up the rural voters in the early hour of the morning than towards noon. When they once get scattered into the fields you would not be able to get at them. But in the early hours of the morning, it is easy to catch hold of them and request them to go to the polling booth. There is also another slight objection which should not be lost sight of. These elections,—general elections at any rate, I do not want to refer to bye-elections—generally take place in the winter months. If we allow the polling to continue up to 5 P.M., it means that it would become practically dark before these voters disperse to their homes; and as honourable members are aware, feelings at election times run very high, and it is but fair that we should allow the voters daylight enough to disperse to their various villages; otherwise, there would be just a chance of their jostling with one another in the dark, a possibility which cannot be contemplated with equanimity. I would, therefore, suggest that these things might be taken into consideration.

One observation more I would like to make with your permission. It has been suggested by the Honourable Member in charge of these arrangements that there is a paucity of competent returning officers, that they are not available in numbers sufficiently large to cope with the emergency. I would draw the attention of the honourable gentleman to the practice which prevails in England. I would like to ask him: Is it also a fact that in England all the returning officers are government officials or gazetted officers? Both officials and non-officials serve as returning officers and the latter are generally barristers of standing.

**Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar Khan:** We appointed two non-officials and our experience of their work was anything but pleasant.

**Mr. Labh Singh:** That is because the Government have a knack of making a wrong choice. (*A voice:* Always.) Even if some mistake was made at some time, there seems to be no reason why this suggestion should not be given a more extended trial. Competent persons in the legal



[Mr. Labh Singh.]

profession are available for this work, and their services can with great advantage be utilized. These are all the suggestions I have to make.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand** [Karnal (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu): Sir, I had no intention to take part in this discussion but for the suggestion made by the last speaker with regard to the appointment of non-officials as presiding officers at the polling stations. It is my personal experience that these non-officials prove very dishonest. They mark the voting paper in favour of the candidate belonging to their party quite against the wishes of the voters. What to say of barristers and vakils if the retired officers of the Government cannot be trusted to do this work independently.

**Dewan Bahadur Raja Narendra Nath**: But the honourable member is also one of the non-officials.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan**: He has expressed no desire to become a polling officer.

**Chaudhri Duli Chand** (Urdu): I know of a retired Executive Engineer who was reputed for his honesty and when he was entrusted with this work, he belied the confidence reposed in him. On retirement these retired officers become presidents or members of Hindu Sabha or this sabha or that sabha and if they were to be entrusted with the duties of polling officers, it is natural that they will favour the candidates who belong to the party with which they are connected. Likewise these barristers and vakils are invariably the members of some party and they must help the members of the party to which they belong. On the other hand, officials do not belong to any party and if they may be inclined to favour a particular candidate, they cannot do so fearing lest they should incur the displeasure of the Government and its high officers on whose recommendations their promotions depend. (A voice: But very often complaints are received against these officials.) Then these officials against whom complaints are received must be officials in name. Secretly they must have some connection with this party or that party. I hope, therefore, that non-official agency will not be employed to do the work of polling officers.

**Pandit Nanak Chand** [Hoshiarpur (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu): Sir, I had no mind to take part in the discussion of this subject, but the various suggestions that the honourable members have made with regard to it have prompted me to represent the other side of the picture. Some of these friends have suggested that the number of polling booths should be increased to avoid the inconvenience that is caused to voters in rural areas coming from very long distances to record their votes. One honourable member went so far as to suggest that every village should become a polling station so that the votes may be collected from the voters at their very door. But my experience tells me that the larger number of polling stations the greater are the difficulties that are experienced by the voters as well as by the candidates. I think that the present arrangements are quite satisfactory. Even at present when the number of polling booths is not very large, it is very difficult to obtain the services of as many honest agents as are necessary to represent the candidates at the different polling stations. During the last elections I saw with my own eyes that a so-called agent of a candidate was indirectly persuading the voters to vote for another



and a rival candidate. When I questioned him why he was doing so, he replied that he had never seen the candidate whom he was supposed to represent and it was a friend of his who had written him to help that candidate. I reminded him that if he had promised to help a particular candidate, it was his duty to help him, but he told me that it was not possible to help a person whom he did not know. My own experience in this matter is that I employed one messenger on a certain remuneration to deliver my letters. This messenger of mine went to different persons in different villages in my constituency with my letters and wherever he went he asked the people to vote for vakils. Some of the voters who were in my favour came to me and told me that my messenger was asking the people to vote for vakils and was thus injuring my cause. I sent for him and enquired why he was doing so. I told him that if he was not prepared to help me, he ought to have told me plainly. He pleaded not guilty to the charge and in his defence said that I was known in my own village as a vakil and, therefore, he had done no harm in asking the people to vote for the vakil. No doubt I am known as a vakil in my village because my father was a vakil, but in fact I was and I am a barrister and my opponent was in reality a vakil, and my messenger was in fact doing propaganda work for him. I have quoted these examples to show that it is very difficult to get hold of honest agents in great numbers and if the polling booths are increased, as has been suggested by my friends, this difficulty will become very serious. There is yet another objection to the suggestion that the number of polling stations should be increased. As has been pointed out by an honourable member, feelings run very high at the time of elections and in the interests of peace it is essential that sufficient police should be posted at every polling station.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member will continue his speech tomorrow.

#### ELECTIONS TO STANDING COMMITTEES.

**Mr. President :** I have to announce that elections to the Standing Committees will take place on the 20th instant, after the ordinary business of the day is finished.

The Council then adjourned till 2 P.M. on Thursday, the 18th March 1980.

PRINTED BY  
THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.  
444 PLC-600-8430-SGPP Lahore.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 8RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Thursday, the 13th March 1930.*

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P. M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—CONTINUED.

#### GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (RESERVED)—continued.

**Mr. President :** The Council will resume discussion on Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan's amendment.<sup>1</sup>

**Pandit Nanak Chand** [Hoshiarpur (Non-Muhamadan), Rural] (Urdu) : Before the Council adjourned yesterday I was submitting, Sir, that it is our experience that at the time of elections, feelings run very high and if riots have not actually taken before, there is always the fear of the people coming to blows when dispersing to their homes. It is, therefore, necessary to post sufficient police force at each of the polling stations to avoid chances of such riots taking place. Consequently, if as suggested, the number of polling booths were increased, extra police will have to be employed. But as far as I have been able to judge from the discussions that have been taking place in this Council on various occasions, most of the members of the Council do not favour any unnecessary increase in the strength of the police and the consequent increase in the burden of taxation. In view of this and the other difficulty which I pointed out yesterday, it will not be in the interests of the people and the Government to increase the number of polling booths.

I agree with my honourable friend, Chaudhri Duli Chand, that there are complaints regarding the impartiality of the polling officers. I say that even officials are said to be guilty of partiality when discharging this duty. At least I have heard people complaining of the partiality of the officials as well. I have not any personal experience about this matter, but I know it for a fact that many voters think so. How far this complaint of theirs is true is not known. If there is some truth in this complaint, and I do not think that it is wholly unfounded, Government should take early steps to remove it. In my opinion, the best way to remove it is to ask the voters to mark the vote papers themselves in favour of the candidate whom they like to support. We shall have to train the voters to mark the voting papers themselves sooner or later, and why not make a beginning at once ? This is, I think, the simplest and the surest way to remove the complaint. But if this suggestion is not practicable at present, in future two officers representing the two parties should be posted at each polling station. This arrangement will at least minimise the chances of dishonesty by the polling officers. As for the suggestion that the time for recording votes should be changed, I am not prepared to support it. I have seen at various polling booths

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

officers sitting idle after 3 o'clock in the evening after having collected nearly all the votes. It is, therefore, no use extending the time from 4 to 5 in the evening.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** [South-East Towns (Muhammadan), Urban] (Urdu) : Sir, need I say that the object of the system of elections is to enable the people to send their representatives to the representative bodies of their own free will ? But in the rural areas in our province the constituencies are so arranged and the polling stations are located at such great distances from many of the villages in each constituency that the object of these elections is frustrated. In many cases in the rural areas, the voters have to travel 15 and 20 miles to go to the polling booths to record their votes and, therefore, the candidate who can afford to arrange for their conveyances is preferred to others who cannot afford to do so. In civilised countries election campaigns are conducted on party lines and party funds are used for propaganda work. The candidates have little to spend themselves to ensure their success at the elections. But here in India political parties for purposes of elections have yet to come into existence. The candidates for election to the Council or Assembly have to meet the expenses from their own pockets on election campaigns. Owing to inadequate polling arrangements in the rural areas each candidate must arrange for conveyance of the voters to come out successful in elections. It will be no exaggeration to say that these expenses, which each candidate has to incur, come to 40 thousand in many cases. But they are not shown in the returns which are sent to Government showing the expenses incurred by each candidate. And no one takes objection to these expenses by means of an election petition because, each candidate is guilty of the same offence. Therefore, this illegality has never been taken noticed of. Under the circumstances, poor persons cannot even think of standing as candidates for election to any of the representative bodies. In order to compete with his rivals in these elections a candidate must have at least Rs. 15,000 to spare. The present polling arrangements are favourable to the rich and wealthy people. The Council and the Assembly are, in fact, the monopolies of the capitalists who are, in most cases, not the real representatives of the people. If it is intended that the Council and the Assembly should be representative bodies in the real sense of the word, polling stations in the rural constituencies should be so located as to cause no inconvenience to the voters. In that case candidates will not have to hire motors and lorries to transport the voters to the polling stations, and poor as well as rich have equal chances of success in these elections. As regards the hours appointed for recording of votes, it is immaterial whether recording of votes begins from 9 in the morning and finishes at 4 in the evening, or whether it begins one hour earlier and finishes one hour later. With these words, I whole-heartedly support the motion before the House.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan** (Sialkot (Muhammadan), Rural) : Sir, I am sure the Government must have realised the keenness which members from all sections of the House have exhibited with regard to the grievances relating to the inadequacy of arrangements for polling on the occasion of these elections. One or two honourable members have taken exception to the suggestions put forward on grounds which I am sure a majority of the

members of this House would not be willing to endorse. There was one misunderstanding, I think, which arose from my suggestion as to the hours between which polling should be permitted. The Honourable Government member who is in charge of elections, when dealing with the suggestion, stated that any curtailing of the time for recording votes would necessarily result in a larger number of days having to be allotted for polling. My suggestion was not at all for the curtailment of the time. All that I suggested was that the number of hours allotted to polling on each day may be retained as at present, only polling should start an hour earlier than it does at present and should close an hour later so that if that suggestion is adopted, the question of curtailing the hours will not at all arise. Another objection with regard to the time that was put forward by one honourable member, I believe, the honourable member from Gujranwala, was that whereas one must look to the convenience of those electors who have to travel long distances from their homes to the polling booths in order to record their votes, one must also look at the other point of view that one must allow enough time for them after they have recorded their votes, to travel back to their homes. No doubt, that is true, but the fallacy underlying that argument was that by extending the hours of polling up to 5 P. M. a man who had travelled a long distance would be compelled to remain at the polling booth up to 5 P. M. The difficulty that was put forward was that the experience of the candidates, particularly in rural constituencies, is that, towards the close of the time for polling, it is observed generally that there are a good many electors who are anxious to record their votes, but as the time for closing arrives, they are unable to do so. No doubt, complaints may not have been addressed to the Elections Commissioner, but this is an experience which many candidates and their agents have had. The suggestion, therefore, was that whether you extend the time for polling or whether you merely start later and go on later by adding one hour at the end of the time you would enable these electors to record their votes who are at present unable to do so, owing to the fact that they have to start late from their homes and have to travel long distances to the polling booths and sometimes they do not arrive in time to record their votes. If a particular voter is anxious to return home early and he records his vote at 1 P. M. or 2 P. M. there is nothing to detain him. Thus, by extending the time by an hour, you will not lay upon any single elector the obligation to be there at 5 P. M. so that there is no hardship, because that does not mean that the voters would be required to stay on. They can return as early as they like. I was rather surprised to hear that we are thus necessarily curtailing the time during which the voters can go back to their homes. Any particular voter can arrive early and record his vote early and leave early, only the extension of the time would enable some of the voters to record their votes even when they come late. And even if it is likely to detain some of them an hour longer, this suggestion is justified on the ground that if at present it does happen that certain people are shut out from recording their votes and if, by extension of the time for polling by an hour, they would be able to do so then, any consequent inconvenience entailed can be borne because the object of the journey will have been achieved. What happens at present is that the journey is undertaken, and nevertheless, the object is not achieved but if the desired object is achieved, and a certain amount of inconvenience is

[Chandhri Zafarullah Khan.]

caused, then that need not be regarded as unjustified. One argument used by the honourable member in charge of elections was that it was not true to say that under the present arrangements there was an appreciable amount of inconvenience caused to the rural electors for the proportion of rural votes polled was not lower than that of urban votes, that on the contrary, their proportion compares very favourably with the proportion of votes recorded in urban areas. If that is so, it is a proof of the keenness exhibited by the rural electors with regard to these elections. But that does not entirely do away with the argument that there is actually in practice a great deal of inconvenience caused. Surely, if that is any argument at all, it is in favour of making things very much easier for the rural electors who have exhibited such a keenness in these matters as against the urban electors who would not take the trouble of getting up and going to the polling booths at their very doors in order to record their votes and surely, those people should not continue to suffer from these inconveniences who in spite of these inconveniences undertake the journey and go to help to make this system a comparative success. And the honourable member must also further remember the criticism that has been put forward that, no doubt, it is a good sign that a very fair proportion of the rural electors have taken part in these elections, but that the present system places a very great temptation in the way of a candidate whose keenness to get elected at one of these elections far outruns his scruples with regard to the observance of the rules as to corrupt practices. In the heat of the contest if a candidate or his agent finds that the rival candidate has thrown his scruples to the winds and is prepared to use all sorts of means in order to bring his electors to the polling booths, then it is practically putting a premium on the corruption, to continue these conditions, for a man who is willing to spend money in an illegitimate way may secure an advantage over an honest candidate. There is that danger also, and from the speeches which have been made in support of this motion the Government members must have realised that that is not only a potential danger but an actual experience, and the honest candidate is being put at a disadvantage as against the candidate who is not willing to conform to the rules. Another argument used against the suggestions put forward was that it will not be possible to arrange for adequate police if the number of polling stations is multiplied. The answer to that has already been given by another honourable member by citing instances from the elections to the district boards. The number of electors of district boards is certainly much larger than the number of electors of the legislative councils, provincial or central, and if it is possible to make adequate polling and police arrangements for the polling that takes place on the occasion of elections to the district boards then there is no reason why the same polling and police arrangements cannot be made for the elections to the provincial legislative council and for the Assembly elections. I, therefore, cannot see the validity of the objection that if you multiply the number of polling stations you will not be able to make adequate police arrangements. They are made in district board elections and they will be as easy to make in the council elections and I cannot see that feelings run any higher during council elections than they do during district board elections. Whenever there is

(RESERVED).

an election, the feeling exhibited or the keenness aroused is just the same, whether it is an election to the local board or to the provincial council. I do not want to discuss various suggestions that have been made in addition to the suggestions submitted by me when introducing this motion yesterday for the consideration of the House. Honourable members must have realised that there are several kinds of grievances that have been put forward and several kinds of suggestions that have been put forward by adopting which the machinery of elections can be improved and I wish to submit for the consideration of Government the suggestion made by my honourable friend from Jullundur that a small committee might be appointed which might be associated with the Elections Commissioner in order to devise means by which these grievances may be removed and such suggestions may be adopted as may be conducive towards the better working of these elections and achieving the desired results. That is a suggestion which I wish to bring to the notice of Government and I am sure that if this is done and a certain amount of care is devoted to this matter, the machinery can be improved considerably. With these remarks, I submit this matter to the House. So far as I am personally concerned, I am willing to accept the assurance which was yesterday given by the honourable Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar Khan in this matter subject to this that, if Government would be prepared to consider sympathetically the suggestion as regards the appointment of a committee, I think that will be an excellent solution of the whole problem and then this motion need not be put to the vote of the House.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir, when listening to the debate yesterday, I felt that it was impossible in the course of this debate for me to express any opinion as to the various suggestions made. I feel that probably it would be very helpful to the Elections Commissioner, if the members of the House who have experience of elections were to arrive at certain definite conclusions among themselves to enable him to consider them, and then discuss them with the members concerned. Therefore, I am quite ready to fall in with the suggestion of the honourable member from Jullundur as adopted by the honourable member from Sialkot, to the effect that a few members of this House—probably it would be best not to have a very large number, but only such members as are willing to give the time and energy to it—should be brought together to discuss among themselves the various suggestions and arrive at definite conclusions. (*Hear, hear*). I think a committee of four non-official members of the House, elected non-official members of the House, will probably meet the case. When this committee has by itself, after deliberation arrived at definite conclusions, then I would expect the committee to send those conclusions to Government and then, Government will request the Election Commissioner to meet that committee. Then, the Election Commissioner and the Committee will go through all these suggestions and arrive at certain conclusions which, I have no doubt, Government would be very glad to consider. I need hardly add that it is not in the interests of Government that there should be any corruption in these elections. It does Government no good and the sooner we try to place a check on these tendencies the better for us all (*Hear, hear*).

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Sir, in view of what has been stated by the Honourable the Leader of the House, I beg to ask for the leave of the House to withdraw this motion.

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore (Sikh) Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I beg to move—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 100 with respect to the item of Rs. 4,32,000—22-E. (c)  
—Reclamation of Criminal Tribes.”

My object in moving this amendment is to urge upon the Government the necessity of desisting from its new policy of declaring zamindars as members of criminal tribes. It cannot be denied, Sir, that cases of theft and other similar crimes have been taking place ever since the advent of the British Government in this province, but there is not a single instance of the zamindars being declared members of criminal tribes. It was only two years ago that some Jats were subjected to this humiliation for the first time in the history of the province, and there arose a storm of opposition and resentment against this action of the Government. There is a suspicion that this new policy is due to some remote cause other than the one given out by the Government. I should not be surprised if it were really so, because this is often the case with many actions of our Government. For instance, punitive police was appointed in our village simply because we had participated in the Akali movement, while in the official records it was shown to be due to some other cause. The proof of that is not far to seek. Those who had taken part in the Akali movement were made to pay Rs. 5 each by way of *tawan*, while according to ordinary calculations, it could not be more than two rupees. Thus I had to pay Rs. 60 while my four brothers paid much less than that. At first, I thought I should resent to pay that *tawan* on that ground. But as the Akali movement had subsided on account of the Gurdwaras Act, I desisted from adopting that course and drew the attention of the patwari to that inexplicable disparity. But he replied that he was absolutely helpless because his duty was simply to carry out the instructions of the higher authorities. Then I approached the Tahsildar and the Deputy Commissioner, but without avail. Now, is that not a sufficient proof of the truth of my contention?

It is well-known, Sir, that whenever the Government takes an unwise step of this kind, we find more often than not that it is taken at the instance of the police. None of us can be unaware of the notoriety that the police has gained for such actions in this province. Now, I am a member of this honourable House, but you will be surprised to hear that the police still has my name in the list of *badmashes*. Finding no rhyme or reason for this absurdity, I drew the attention of my honourable friend, Lala Bodh Raj, to it, and he very kindly put some questions in this Council with regard to the matter. Then I put some questions myself. But all of them met with the kind of replies usually given by the Government to our questions.

I submit, Sir, that there is absolutely no reason why zamindars should be declared as criminal tribes. This step, as I have said, is taken at the instance of the police which is reigning supreme in our province. The very first victim of the Criminal Tribes Act from amongst the zamindars were the Virk



Jats of the Sheikhpura district who are undoubtedly very loyal and highly respectable people. Some of them are paying as much as Rs. 500 by way of land revenue and are occupying a very high position in society. The Honourable President of this Council himself belongs to a Virk family.

Next, this humiliation was heaped on the zamindars of Sughranwan in the Lahore district. I am free to admit that crimes have been committed in that village, but that is no reason why the whole village should be declared criminal. I would request the House to bear in mind that these people were very loyal and law-abiding, so long as they went on supplying maunds of milk and ghee to the police. Some police officers used to take away their buffaloes with them without any payment and returned them when they went dry. May I ask, Sir, whether they were considered loyal and peace-loving on that account only, and whether their crimes have increased in number and seriousness? I put some questions to the Honourable the Revenue Member in this connection and also drew the attention of the official concerned to the impropriety of this step. Both of them promised to accord a careful and sympathetic consideration to the matter, but nothing has come out of those promises as yet.

I wish to make it absolutely clear, Sir, that I do not claim any special privilege for the zamindars. If a zamindar commits a crime punish him by all means. But why punish the whole class for the offence of a few? The Government has the power to award the highest punishment under the ordinary law of the land, and if any one offends against any law it has the fullest right to make use of that power. Therefore, there is absolutely no necessity for having recourse to this extraordinary measure in the case of these zamindars. The Criminal Tribes Act is meant for habitual criminals, and the Government cannot deny that most of the Virk Jats are as law-abiding and peace-loving as it is possible for any human being to be. Then why this indiscriminate punishment? In the end, Sir, I wish to make it clear to the Government that these people are our brethren and we cannot bear to see them thus humiliated. With these remarks, I commend my amendment to the House.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 100 with respect to the item of Rs. 4,32,000—  
Total—Reclamation of Criminal Tribes."

**Sardar Buta Singh** [Multan Division and Sheikhpura (Sikh), Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I have to relate a very sad and pathetic tale to-day. I may inform the House, at the very outset, that I have tried all possible means to make the Government realize for itself that the punishment inflicted upon these poor people is glaringly out of proportion to their shortcomings. I approached the officials concerned and drew their attention to the undesirability of inflicting such a harsh measure on the zamindars when there are so many sections in the ordinary law to deal with their crimes quite adequately. But I regret to say that all such efforts on my part have not met with success.

Now, if we go through the Criminal Tribes Act, we will find that it was really designed for the habitual criminals in whose case the ordinary law cannot prove effective. I beg to submit, Sir, that the crimes for which this Act was meant are committed by those who have no means of earning

[S. Buta Singh.]

their livelihood. Therefore, it is highly inadvisable to apply it to the zamindars who own valuable properties and hundreds of acres of land. I quite agree with my honourable friend, Sardar Hira Singh, Narli, that it is a humiliation of the worst kind that has been heaped upon the zamindars. The Government knows it fully well that we have always paid our dues at the proper time and met all its demands willingly. Whenever there has been a call from the Government we have responded to it readily and helped the Government with men and money to the utmost of our capacity. But I am sorry to say that it is we who are chosen to be the victims of any harsh measure that comes on the Statute Book. The effect of declaring zamindars as members of criminal tribes calls for a very serious attention on the part of the Government. It is strangling their self-respect. Moreover, no body would like to marry his son or daughter in a family which has been declared member of a criminal tribe, and thus these people feel degraded in their own eyes. The Government must remember that any person who is devoid of self-respect cannot have any sense of responsibility and, therefore, if these people lose their self-respect, the Government cannot expect any kind of help from them in times of need.

Then, Sir, there is a provision in the Criminal Tribes Act to the effect that those who are declared members of criminal tribes should be provided with means of earning their livelihood. That, again, is a conclusive proof of the fact that this Act was not meant for zamindars who own five or six squares of land besides cattle and other valuable properties. You have got section 110 of the Criminal Procedure Code to deal with such people, if necessary, and you may inflict enhanced punishment in cases of repetition of a crime. But why humiliate the whole class for the crimes of a few and inflict this obnoxious measure on the otherwise law-abiding people?

This much about the zamindars in general. Now I come to the application of this Act to three villages of Virk Jats in the Sheikhpura District. Quite recently, when the Honourable the Revenue Member paid a visit to Sheikhpura a deputation waited upon him in this connection. We drew his attention to the fact that there has not been a single crime in those villages during the last two years and that, therefore, it was in the fitness of things that the application of the Act should be discontinued with regard to the Virk zamindars. We requested him to verify that statement of ours from any local officer if he so desired, and even now, its truth can be ascertained from the police without much trouble.

Sir, I do not want to enter into any controversy with regard to the grounds on which these zamindars were declared members of criminal tribes, but I may be allowed to say that these cannot be any sufficient reason to justify the step taken by the Government. I wish to draw the attention of the House and the Government to the fact that there are no less than one hundred villages inhabited by the Virk Jats, and they are to be found in equally great numbers in other districts like Gujranwala. Therefore, it is highly improper to inflict humiliation on such an important class of zamindars. If you look at the history of these people you will find that they enjoyed very eminent position under the Sikh regime. It was on account of their importance and high status that they came to be called "*Babe ke*" in the reign of Maharaja Ranjit Singh. Even now, their social as well as political

importance is beyond dispute. Our own President, as has been pointed out by my honourable friend, belongs to this class. Therefore, it is in the fitness of things that the Government should desist from meting out such treatment to these people.

Now, as an amendment to this effect stands in my name also, I wish to make it quite clear that I did not mean it as a censure motion. All that I want is to lay the various aspects of the matter before the Government, and thus to draw its attention to the very unfortunate mistake that has been committed. It is in the interests of the Government itself that the earliest opportunity should be taken to rectify this mistake. There are people who would like to adopt some other methods to get their grievances removed, but I have preferred the more constitutional and conciliatory attitude in the hope that the Government will be prepared to listen to reason and meet this very legitimate and most urgent demand. It must be remembered that in these days when some people have resorted to civil disobedience in connection with the Salt Act, others may take to a similar course for the sake of their self-respect. But I and some others who are of my way of thinking have not allowed the matter to reach such a pitch. Therefore, I most earnestly request the Government to amend the situation by rectifying the mistake before it is too late. With these remarks, Sir, I strongly support the cut moved by my honourable member from Lahore.

**Mr. C. M. C. Ogilvie** (Home Secretary): Sir, the Criminal Tribes Act is limited in scope to those tribes, gangs or classes which are systematically addicted to the commission of non-bailable offences. Any community, or tribe which comes within that scope is not and cannot be exempted, and the Act applies not only to those whom we are normally inclined to consider criminal tribes like Sansi and Pakhiwaras, but also to those who are very much higher in social scale but have unfortunately taken to living on crime instead of by lawful pursuits, whether agricultural or any other. The application of the Criminal Tribes Act to those, as well as to wandering nomads, is not a new thing. Before 1911, which is the date of the present Act, not less than 14 tribes or gangs belonging to agricultural communities had been registered as criminal tribes. We heard yesterday from the honourable member from Montgomery that the zamindars of this province were very poor, uneducated, ignorant and resourceless. I do not intend to add now to his indictment against the finest peasantry in India, if not in the whole world, (*Hear, hear*), and I will not say that are also extremely criminal. Whereas the vast majority of the Punjab agriculturists are excellent, worthy and reputable people in every way, an infinitesimal minority of them is also extremely criminal. And whereas the criminal tribes of Sansis and Pakhiwaras, etc., content themselves to sneak thieving and pick-pocketing and such forms of crimes, the zamindar when he takes to it, being brave, active and resourceful, is very much more formidable. In certain areas, in some villages and in some families people have undoubtedly become professional and hereditary criminals although they do own land, and owing to the skill or audacity and to their knowledge of how to defeat the law and also the fear which they inspire, they are normally able to avoid the consequences of their action. Occasionally, they are caught and imprisoned, but the majority of the crimes which they commit go untraced or at least unproved. The action which is being taken against some of those

[ Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie.]

families and a few villages has been proved to be most beneficial. It is true, as the honourable member from Sheikhpura said that zamindars do not like the humiliation of being registered as criminal tribesmen. They do regard it as a humiliation, but that, I may say, Sir, is a very good thing. It helps undoubtedly in the process of reformation. And here, I may say that the object of the Criminal Tribes Act is not punishment. It is in no way penal. The objects of the Act are prevention and reformation. In many cases very careful, patient and sympathetic methods of reformation coupled with the inevitable restrictions, which are necessary for bringing these methods into action, have resulted in the conversion of gangs of dacoits, marauders, thieves and robbers who were a perfect menace to the countryside, into good and hardworking agriculturists. The tribe of Wallana Jats who all come from the district of the honourable member who last spoke, have recently been wholly exempted from the provisions of this Act as they have been completely reformed. As regards the Virks, they have been a subject of much anxious consideration. It is a well-known fact that they are uncommonly fine people. When they keep to peaceful avocations within limits, they are probably as fine a body of peasants as can anywhere be found. But unfortunately some of them in the Sheikhpura district have become most formidable criminals and, for this very reason, it had become necessary to register 845, however, only 61 of them were restricted. The drastic provisions of the Act were brought into effect only against 61. Out of those 61, 20 were very shortly exempted and 15 more were put on six months' probation after which the Deputy Commissioner was able to report that he had no other complaint against them, when they also were exempted. Now, there only remain 25 Virks in the Sheikhpura district who are subject to the restrictions of the Act and it is hoped that in due course, possibly very shortly, they also may be exempted. I have gathered from the Deputy Commissioner, Sheikhpura, that complaints against them are getting much less.

The honourable member from Lahore in so far as his speech related to the administration of the Criminal Tribes Act discussed the case of the remarkably well-known village of Sobraon. He must, I think, know that that village has had a reputation for crimes of all kinds going back as far as history relates. Maharaja Ranjit Singh, I believe, was compelled to retain a force of cavalry constantly near at hand in order to keep them in some kind of order. The severities of the well-known ruler Sardar Sham Singh of Attari were powerless to reform those people. I myself have known that village and its inhabitants for more than ten years. Every possible method of coping with them was resorted to. But the natural facilities which the situation of the village gave to the pursuit of crime were such that all efforts were entirely hopeless. A punitive post existed in that village for no less than ten consecutive years, but even so, gangs of armed marauders emerged from it whenever there was an opportunity, to harass the Punjab far and wide and committed dacoities in places as far away as Amritsar, Ludhiana, Gujranwala, Sialkot and Ferozepore. If there was a just man in Sobraon he kept very quiet about it. The land of the village was good but mostly uncultivated, as dacoity and cattle-lifting appeared more profitable than the humdrum

3 P. M.

pursuit of agriculture. Several thousand acres of arable land were covered with an enormous grass jungle in which stolen cattle were hidden and into which once they arrived there was no possibility of ever finding them again. Since this village has been taken under the protection, let me say, of the Criminal Tribes department, the people for the first time are commencing what ought to be their occupation, that is, agriculture. Several thousand acres of the great grass jungles have already been cleared, a magnificent wheat crop is now on the ground and two summers ago, I think, on, another portion of it, there grew a crop of rice which brought into the village more than Rs. 12,000. The people of the village themselves, I hear, are grateful for what is being done and are beginning to realise that there is something in agriculture after all. I feel sure that the honourable member from Lahore would not wish that this beneficent process of reformation should be interfered with or checked in any way. Finally, let me say that this Act is only brought into use after the most careful consideration. The safeguards are many. It is not until the declaration of a tribe or gang as a criminal tribe has been recommended by the Deputy Commissioner, the Superintendent of Police, the Deputy Inspector-General of Police, the Inspector-General of Police, the Commissioner and Deputy Commissioner of Criminal Tribes that Government considers the matter and decides whether that is the only course to take for reformation of the gang concerned. There is no doubt that wherever the Act has been applied, so far, it has been used most sympathetically, most carefully and so far as we are able to judge, with the most beneficent results. (*Cheers.*)

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani** [West Punjab Towns (Muhammadian), Urban], (Urdu): Sir, it appears that the honourable mover of the amendment under consideration is labouring under some misunderstanding. As my honourable friend, the Home Secretary, has said, the Criminal Tribes Act is only meant for those people who are habitually inclined to the commission of crime. The words 'criminal tribes' mean those people with whom it has become a habit to commit crimes. To say that this Act should not be made applicable to the zamindars because they possess so much land or because they are so very respectable, is an argument which does not stand to reason. As the legal maxim goes, law is no respecter of persons. It should make no distinction in the case of any particular class of people on the ground that they are respectable people. If it makes any such distinction, it is not worth being enforced. Sir, if the motion before the House were that since the people of this country have become very civilised, that Mahatma Gandhi has been able to solve the problem of untouchability, that the Janglis have become reformed and that Dominion Status is going to be granted to India, therefore there should not be an Act like the Criminal Tribes Act. I would have seen my way to support it. But the motion that the Criminal Tribes Act should not be made applicable to a certain classes of people on the ground that they possess lands is one to which I cannot agree on principle. Sir, it is not the question of services where it would be proper if we should say that such and such class of people should be given so much representation. On the other hand, it is the question of dealing with confirmed criminals. I admit that the Virk Jats are respectable people. But this does not mean that if they commit crimes they should be let off scot-free. It is written nowhere in the Act that it is meant for the poor. It is general in its appli-

[ Sh. Abdul Ghani.]

cation. It applies to all persons irrespective of their profession and respectability. Sir, this cut is absolutely out of place. The honourable mover ought not to have moved it. He should try to get the Act itself amended. Sir, of course you can reject the whole grant but that will not serve your purpose. No doubt, the Virk Jats, as my honourable friend the Home Secretary has also admitted, are respectable and the honourable mover being, himself a member of the same tribe, is aggrieved at their being declared members of a criminal tribe. But, Sir, that is a different question and has nothing to do with this cut. With these words, I resume my seat.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore (Sikh) Rural], (Urdu): Sir, I am sorry I could not follow the speech of my honourable friend, the Home Secretary word by word. But so far as I could follow it, I can say that he has not been able to vindicate the position of the Government in this matter. He referred to severe punishments awarded to the people by Sardar Sham Singh of Attariwala. But I ask him whether the said Sardar used to punish the offenders only or the other people also. I am sure that the said Sardar punished only those persons who broke the law. Sir, the Criminal Tribes Act should be made applicable only to those persons whom we cannot punish otherwise. But the people who have got sufficient lands and money should be exempted from the operation of this Act because they can be punished with fine or imprisonment or with forfeiture of property. To deprive such people of their personal liberty is both insulting and objectionable. They are not allowed even to attend the marriage or death ceremonies of their relations.

**Sardar Buta Singh**: If their cattle are lifted they cannot pursue the cattle lifters.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli**: Yes, that is right, they cannot even pursue the cattle lifters. In most cases if a literate person commits some offence, he is punished with fine. Similarly, the zamindars can be punished with fine or imprisonment or with forfeiture of property if they commit crimes. With these words, I would ask the Government to desist from declaring the zamindars as members of criminal tribes.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** [Revenue Member] (Urdu): Sir, the department to which the grant under consideration relates is not the police department. If the police were to take cognizance of the matters falling within this department, there would have been absolutely no justification for its separate existence. The aim of this department is reformation and not retribution. It has to reform and look after the habitual offenders. The ideal before this department is and ought to be the complete reformation of criminal tribes, etc., so that after a certain period we may be able to say that the department is no longer needed. Sir, the department has before it the task of effecting a wholesome change in the habits of the members of criminal tribes within a generation. Sir, I do not mind admitting that during the last four or five years I have not been able to find time to effect such changes in the department as would have perceptibly accelerated our march towards the goal in view. I suppose that every honourable member of this House is fully aware of the fact that there are certain elements working in the Punjab which require careful handling on the part of the Government.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri:** Are these elements confined to the Punjab alone or do we find them in other countries as well?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain (Urdu):** Yes, we do find these elements here as well as in other countries. In other countries these elements are being dealt with according to the law of the land. I ask then, is it improper for us to deal with such elements in accordance with the law for the time being in force in this country? Sir, law is no respecter of persons. It cannot make any distinction in the case of Jats, Sayads, Rajputs, or Mughals. Whosoever offends the majesty of law must suffer. The honourable mover has said that the Virk Jats are respectable people. That is true. I know that the Honourable the President and some other honourable members of the House belong to the Virk tribe. If the Criminal Tribes Act is applied to this tribe, the blame for it should not be fastened upon me. We have to obey the law. Perhaps, you do not know that certain Rajput tribes have also been declared criminal tribes. Every case that comes up has to be decided on its own merits.

**Sardar Buta Singh:** We do not contend that.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain [continuing in Urdu]:** Sir, the Act cannot be confined in its application to non-zamindars or the poor alone. It applies only to such people as are habitually inclined to the commission of crime irrespective of their profession or their tribal respectability. We should particularly attend to one thing and that is, that we should see that the department is properly run without being in any way influenced by the police. If the police is permitted to exercise any undue influence over this department, the latter will certainly fail in its object. Previously, the procedure for declaring a tribe to be a criminal tribe was quite simple. The Deputy Commissioner, after consulting the Superintendent of Police, used to make a report to the Commissioner who after recording his opinion thereon forwarded it to the Local Government for final orders. But, Sir, now I require that this investigation should pass through another stage. The case is sent to the Deputy Commissioner, Criminal Tribes, who, before submitting his report to Government, has to serve a notice on the people whom it is proposed to declare a criminal tribe or class to show cause why they should not be so declared. Thus you see, Sir, that now every individual of any such class of people has an opportunity to show reason why he or his class or tribe should not be declared criminal, and thus subjected to the operation of the Criminal Tribes Act. If after the service of this notice any representations are made on behalf of the people proposed to be declared a criminal tribe, these should be submitted along with the report of the Deputy Commissioner. Besides, a few days back it was decided that the Deputy Commissioner should also state his points in writing upon which his opinion is based, so that the people concerned may have an opportunity to answer those points. I think that, under these circumstances, it is not easy for the authorities concerned to abuse their powers or for the department to go against its golden principle. There is another point worth mentioning and that is, that the Deputy Commissioner in charge of this department is a member of the same community to which the honourable mover himself belongs. Sir, the case of the Virk Jats came up before me some two years ago. I decided the case after fully considering its merits. Last May I went on



[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

tour to Sheikhpura, and at my request the Deputy Commissioner, Criminal Tribes, and the honourable member for Sheikhpura and some others discussed the case of the Virk Jats. I explained to them all that I have stated now before the House. I told them that I was really sorry that a respectable tribe like the Virk Jats was declared a criminal tribe and that it was up to the leading Sikhs to bring about such reforms as would enable the department to cancel the restriction on Virk Jats at a very early date.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Sir, I would ask the Honourable Revenue Member whether he himself or Sardar Hari Singh declared the Virk Jats to be a criminal tribe.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** How could that be unless I accepted the recommendation of Sardar Hari Singh. Therefore, the responsibility is mine. Sir, I was going to submit that I have every sympathy with the Virk Jats, but if they want exemption from the operation of the Act on the ground that they are zamindars, I am afraid Government cannot do that. But, however, if any case is brought to my notice where injustice has been done, I would be only too glad to look into the matter. In fact, it cannot be said of any tribe or community that it consists of only good people or bad people. Sir, after all, the character of a person can only be determined by his actions. It is his actions alone that raise a person from the depths of degradation to the pinnacle of glory or *vice versa*. Therefore, Sir, if the honourable members insist that, before applying the Criminal Tribes Act to any particular class of people, Government should thoroughly satisfy themselves that the said class of people certainly deserve to be brought under the operation of the Act, they would be justified. But if, on the other hand, they say that the Act should not be made applicable to certain people because of their profession or tribe, it is a demand which Government is not prepared to accept. I hope that honourable members will not insist on such an unreasonable demand.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** In view of the reply of the Honourable Revenue Member, I beg leave to withdraw the amendment.

The amendment was, by leave, withdrawn.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** [Lahore, Sikh, Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, I beg to move—

“ That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1.”

Sir, my object is to discuss the desirability of appointing non-official Presidents of district boards.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Urdu) : Sir, I fail to understand to what item of the budget the cut relates. At present we are discussing item No. 8 at page 163 of the budget and the cut obviously does not relate to that. The matter which the honourable member proposes to discuss is entirely the concern of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government who has absolutely no connection with the present demand.

**Mr. President :** Are not the salaries of Deputy Commissioners covered by the demand which has been moved? Are not Deputy Commissioners presidents of district boards as Deputy Commissioners and in no other capacity?



**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** The point that you have been pleased to mention is that, because the Deputy Commissioners are presidents of district boards, therefore, the question arises whether this is not the place to discuss this subject. My submission is that Deputy Commissioners are not presidents as Deputy Commissioners, or even as members of district boards. They are there by virtue of the notification issued by the Honourable Minister of Local Self-Government appointing them as such, and therefore, it is the Ministry of Local Self-Government that is responsible for it, and not the Deputy Commissioners, as such.

**Mr. President:** Why cannot the members of this House, when discussing the subject of General Administration, ask Government not to allow Deputy Commissioners to act as presidents of district boards?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** With due deference I would submit that unless the position taken is that the Deputy Commissioners should refuse to act on the notifications of the Honourable Minister...

**Mr. President:** I think the Council can ask Government not to allow Deputy Commissioners to do that work.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** I leave it in the hands of the Chair to decide whether the question of non-official presidents being given to district boards is a fit subject to be discussed with reference to the grant under discussion and whether it is not a fit subject to be considered under the grant for Local Self-Government asking the Honourable Minister to answer that point.

**Mr. President:** Which section of the District Boards Act is relevant?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:** May I draw your attention to section 18 (2)? That is the relevant section.

**Mr. President:** Sub-section (2) of section 18 reads:—

“(2) The Local Government shall determine, as regards each board or as regards any class of boards, whether the chairman shall be a person appointed by virtue of his office or by name or be elected.”

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** ‘Local Government’ in all these sections means the Minister with the Governor, and not the Government as a whole.

**Mr. President:** Certainly, the Local Government referred to in section 18 (2) means the Governor acting with the Minister of Local Self-Government. Now, the question is whether, when General Administration is under discussion, it is open to the members of this House to request Government that a Deputy Commissioner should not be allowed to be employed by another department of Government, that is to say, the department of Local Self-Government, to perform the duties of the president of the district board. I do not say that this question cannot be considered or discussed when the grant, if any, of the Local Self-Government is discussed, but I think that it can be discussed under the grant relating to General Administration as well.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** Even when the note under the amendment is as it is, the note says that it is to discuss the desirability

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

of appointing non-official presidents. He is not talking of Deputy Commissioners. He is talking of the question of bringing in non-official presidents.

**Mr. President :** A Deputy Commissioner is paid from the provincial revenues and, though his salary is non-voted, yet, I think, it is open to this House to question why an officer who is paid from the revenues of the province should be allowed to work for another department which does not contribute any part of his salary. It appears to me quite clear that this House can ask the Revenue Department not to allow Deputy Commissioners to act as presidents of district boards, and can also ask the department of Local Self-Government not to employ them as such. I rule accordingly.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Moreover, this note is not a part of the amendment.

**Mr. President :** Yes, it is not. It is only an indication, perhaps sometimes most insufficient and inadequate indication of the mover's object.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu) :** Sir, for the last two years I am hearing the demands for dominion status noisily made and urged with all enthusiasm and vehemence, but when I try to see what has been done in response to them I find that Government have not yielded even to a small extent. In the case of the district boards the Deputy Commissioners do not release them from their iron hold. If ever members pass a resolution recommending that a non-official may be appointed president of their district board, the Deputy Commissioner becomes enraged and all such members who had voted in favour of that resolution incur his displeasure. But it is seldom that members take such a bold step for, usually the members of a district board are people like honorary magistrates, zaildars, numberdars and others who are generally creatures of the Deputy Commissioner. These people cannot afford to forego the favour of the Deputy Commissioner and if ever any one of them takes courage to support such a resolution as recommending a non-official president for the board, the Deputy Commissioner at once makes of him an example in order to discourage audacity in others. If the poor fellow happens to be a numberdar or a zaildar, he is at once dismissed, and if he is an honorary magistrate, the Deputy Commissioner gets him suspended. The municipal and district boards are schools for training and preparing people for home rule. But in actual practice we find that no endeavour is made in this direction and the Deputy Commissioners who are usually the presidents of the district boards boss over the affairs of the boards like so many autocrats intolerant of all dissentient voices. So long as matters stand like this, there is no hope of people being trained for home rule or dominion status. There is one general objection against appointing non-official presidents of the boards. This objection is that non-officials are incapable and inefficient for carrying on the duties of presidents. This is a very wrong assertion. Raja Akram Ulla and Khan Bahadur Fazl Ali are presidents of Gujranwala and Gujrat district boards, respectively. They are non-officials, but their work is very good.

The Deputy Commissioners ought to be very generous in this matter. Their position is that of a teacher and it is their sacred duty that they should try to impart political education to the people in order to make them fit

for self-rule. He who never tries to practise riding can never hope to become a rider. Without learning one cannot know a thing. To tell a person "Don't ride lest you should fall" is equal to discouraging him. Therefore, it is requested that the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government may very kindly see his way to remove the official presidents of the district boards and in their place appoint non-official presidents. The Deputy Commissioner is like an incubus for fear of whom the people cannot take courage to urge upon Government the necessity of appointing a non-official president for their district board.

**Mr. President (Urdu):** Would it not have been better if the honourable member had requested the Honourable the Finance Member and the Honourable the Revenue Member to direct the Deputy Commissioners to restrict their activities to particular kinds of work and not to do any thing else which may be beyond their prescribed province? (*Laughter*).

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli** (*Continuing in Urdu*): When our Honourable President, who is a non-official, is carrying on the work of this dignified House so efficiently how can it be possible that a non-official president will show himself incapable of controlling a petty district board? There are many such instances in which non-official rank holders have proved themselves very capable and efficient. The Honourable Member, Chaudhri Chhotu Ram, before he was appointed Minister in the last Council worked as a vice-president of the district board of Rohtak. So is the Honourable Member, Sardar Harbakhsh Singh, vice-president of his district board. He is a lawyer and a very learned man; do you think he will prove himself a failure in performing the duties of a president if he is appointed to the post? So, Sir, this assertion is utterly unfounded and the real thing is this, that Government are unwilling to appoint non-official presidents of district boards. In the end, I request the Honourable the Revenue and the Honourable the Finance Members to consider this matter favourably and see what help they can render. With these few words I commend my motion to the House.

**Mr. President:** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

"That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1."

**Chaudhri Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan** [(Jullundur, Muhammadan, Rural) (Urdu): Sir, I rise to support the cut moved by the Honourable Sardar Sahib. I am a member of my district board for the last 16 years and with my vast experience I can say that the Deputy Commissioner is really for the district board what he has been described by the honourable mover, an incubus. In the meetings of a district board the Deputy Commissioner hampers the freedom of vote and freedom of speech. For the purpose of imparting political education to the people the presence of a Deputy Commissioner in a district board is no good. Once, in the meeting of our district board a resolution to the effect that there should be a non-official president was moved. With the exception of us three, that is, the Sardar Sahib, Raizada Bhagat Ram, and myself all voted against it. The vice-president in his speech said that, if Indians were to be appointed presidents of district boards, they would certainly prove themselves incapable for the post. In answer I was

[Ch. Md. Abdul Rahman Khan.]

constrained to say that the Khan Bahadur ought to have said the same also when he was appointed Deputy Commissioner. Really to say this was very ridiculous on his part. He made these remarks not because he believed Indians worthless, but because he wanted to flatter the Deputy Commissioner. Similarly, when Indians were appointed Sessions Judges, some toady at that time also made some such remark and said that they would prove inefficient. But now, contrary to this, we find that in some cases Indian judges excel their English confreres. Here I may cite an instance to show how these Deputy Commissioners misuse their powers and influence the members. Once a post of the secretary to a district board fell vacant. Applications were invited. Three applications—two of Sikhs and one of a Christian—reached late. The vice-president asked the permission of the members to entertain the application of the two Sikh candidates. The permission was granted. Then he at once sought permission to entertain the application of the Christian candidate also. Of course, it had to be given. Up to that time, none guessed the object of the vice-president. But when it was known that the Christian candidate was related to the Deputy Commissioner, the matter became clear and consequently, many who were in the dark before prepared themselves to raise their hands in favour of the Christian candidate. Consequently, the Christian was appointed secretary. This statement which I have made before the House can be verified from the records. Then, Sir, there have been many such cases in which the majority of the members have tried to dismiss a teacher, but the Deputy Commissioners have stood inexorable. What happens in such cases is this: that the flatterers who are interested in the particular teacher run beforehand to the Deputy Commissioner and poison his ears, and when he comes to the meeting of the district board he brings with him a biased mind. And when the case is put up before the board for decision he shows himself biased in favour of the teacher. The members who are generally under his influence guess it at once and vote against the dismissal. On such occasions if any member makes bold to oppose the Deputy Commissioner's will, he is regarded a fire-brand and an anti-Government element. Sometimes, these toadies and insinulators leave everything to the decision of the Deputy Commissioner, saying, "You are wiser, you know better, you are a superior intellect, do it as you like." Sir, if everything is to be left to the decision of the Deputy Commissioner, then what's the use of district boards? They are good for nothing and should be discontinued. Some Deputy Commissioners are good and the people actually begin to like them while others are haughty and treat the people harshly; such officers lose their reputation and in order to save their skin from Government, they indirectly mention it to a toady that they desire that a photo of theirs may be hung in the meeting room of the district board. The toady makes a propaganda and the other toadies support him. The photograph is taken and hung in the meeting-room and everything about it is shown as if it is done on behalf of the people. Now, this done, the position of the Deputy Commissioner is secured and he is furnished with an excuse. If ever Government calls him to question for his misbehaviour he can say, "No, he is popular, here is his photo to prove it."

Some time back the tahsildars were also ex-officio members of the district boards. They held great influence over the members and helped a great

deal in influencing their opinions. Now, after much protest, they have been removed from district boards. Their removal from district boards has in no way created any difficulty in carrying on the work of the boards. Similarly, if the practice of appointing Deputy Commissioners presidents of boards is also discontinued, I do not think that the work of district boards will in any way suffer. But if Government want to have their own way in keeping Deputy

Commissioners presidents of the boards, then let them also bring in again the tahsildars for they were helpful instruments in the hands of the Deputy Commissioners to influence the opinion of the members. Government should at least appoint non-official presidents of those district boards who desire it and pass a resolution to that effect.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Two non-official presidents have already been appointed.

**Chaudhri Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan :** If a house catches fire and two men escape and save their lives, you cannot say the whole house was saved or you helped their escape.

**Mr. President :** There appears to be some ambiguity. May I ask whether only two districts were given the option of electing a non-official president, or all district boards in the province were given that option and only two of them availed of it ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain (Revenue Member) :** Sir, I can answer that question because I was then in charge of district boards, being the Minister for Education at the time. All those districts whose constitution allowed them 75 per cent. of elected element—and there were something like 17 such districts in the Punjab—were asked to elect a non-official president if they liked, and in the case of several district boards I exercised my personal influence in support of this proposal, but did not meet with much success.

**Chaudhri Baldev Singh [North-West Rohtak (Non-Muhammadian), Rural] (Urdu) :** Sir, I am prepared to support this motion, but with two reservations. We should have non-official presidents of district boards, but these non-officials must be of the same calibre, of the same qualifications and must possess the same experience as the official presidents of district boards are known to possess.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** Who will examine and how, whether examined that they come up to that standard ?

**Chaudhri Baldev Singh (Urdu) :** In order to avoid any chances of corruption, only those men should be appointed or elected as presidents of district boards who are totally free from debt reasonable. The presidents and the vice-presidents have to sanction large amounts of money for works under the control of the district boards and to give contracts for these works. They have also to sanction huge expenditure on other items connected with the administration of district boards. It is therefore very necessary that the presidents and the vice-presidents of the district boards should be above all temptations to misappropriate the money

[Ch. Baldev Singh.]

of the boards. It will be admitted, therefore, that such men should be appointed presidents of district boards as are totally free from debt. Then I think that the non-official presidents should not have unrestricted powers to give contracts to any contractor they may like. Some such provision should be made according to which the question of giving contracts should be discussed in the open meeting of the district board concerned, if the non-official president may not like to give the contract relating to any work to the lowest bidder. If these two suggestions are agreed to, I am prepared to extend my support to the motion under consideration.

**Rai Bahadur Lala Ganga Ram** [Ambala-cum-Simla (Non-Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, this proposal on the face of it appears very reasonable. Whoever will look upon it cursorily will be inclined to support it. But if one were to look into it deeply, it will be found not altogether free from defects. In the present state of affairs, when we see people fighting over the interests of Hindus and Muhammadans, agriculturists and non-agriculturists, and over urban and rural questions, it is not quite safe to have non-official presidents of district boards having the same unrestricted powers as the official presidents possess. In our district board this resolution was twice brought up that no non-agriculturists should be employed in the service of the board. This resolution, was of course, rejected every time it was moved. But if the president of that district board had been a non-official, I do not think that that resolution would have met with the same fate. Lest I should be misunderstood, I may make it clear that I do not mean to convey by these words that I am not in favour of the appointment of non-officials as presidents of district boards. When we are claiming swaraj for our country, which is a much bigger thing, we must insist on the appointment of non-officials as presidents of district boards. But unless and until the present communal outlook of the people does not change, some provisions must be made placing checks on the powers of non-official presidents.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq** [Amritsar City (Muhammadan), Urban] : Sir, I have never been a member of a district board, so I do not know the working of district boards. I am, however, a member of a municipal committee and fortunately, I have been serving under non-official presidents. A few years ago when the demand was made that municipalities should be given non-official presidents, a hue and cry was raised that municipalities were unfit for that privilege because of their communal outlook. When free compulsory primary education was demanded, it was objected to on some ground or other. Even the Reforms were objected to. In fact, no forward movement is allowed to go unopposed by people who oppose democratic system of government. Communalism will be nipped in the bud only if a chance is given to communities to work side by side and solve their problems for themselves. We are on the threshold of further reforms, which are expected in two years' time. Every member of this House demands provincial autonomy (*Pandit Nanak Chand* : Question. Not every member.) May be the honourable member from Hoshiarpur does not, but so far as I know, every member worth the name (*Laughter*) demands self-government for the province. No, Sir, even more than that. A big majority wants complete Home Rule for India, and there is a minority that wants complete independence. When we are thinking of the Himalayas to think of a mole-hill is a kind of *sad-i-rah*. If we are to get self-

government, the sooner we get it the better, and if we are to get self-government, the sooner Indians are trained as presidents of district boards the better. These are the people who are going to rule. These are the people from amongst whom Ministers will be recruited. A few years ago the idea was that as Indians had not had the training they should not be made Ministers, and yet let Government say that the Ministers they have selected have been failures. (Pandit Nanak Chand: Votes of censure are always being moved.) But they have never succeeded. Government is now accepting the view that the Ministers are fit for the job they are holding, otherwise the learned members opposite, I mean the members of the Civil Service, would not have voted for them if they were not considered fit for the job. None of these Ministers has had any experience of a municipal committee or of a district board, yet they have all succeeded as Ministers. And it is ridiculous to say that the honourable member sitting behind me or the honourable member on my right are unfit to be appointed presidents. I do not know why Government always acts in such a funny way. It gives two appointments to Indians and then keeps quiet. It gives two more after some time and then sleeps for two years. Then there is agitation and some pressure is put upon it and it gives a few more. If Government thinks these men are fit, why does it not give more appointments? If Gujrat has a fit person, why not Hoshiarpur? If Gujranwala has a fit man, why not Dera Ghazi Khan, and why not Shahpur where my friend, the Minister comes from? Surely, there are enough men of capability in the Punjab. If they can become Revenue Members, if they can become Education Ministers and High Court Judges, and if they can become Chief Justices, I do not see any reason why there are not men fit to become presidents of district boards. If you want to learn swimming you cannot learn it unless you try to swim. If responsibility is thrown on us, it will be ridiculous to say that we will not be able to carry on the government. As soon as any burden is thrown on any man, as soon as any responsibility is given to him, his whole mental attitude changes. A man may be begging for votes to-day, but as soon as he becomes a member of the municipality, his whole outlook changes. A Hindu may say before he is appointed a Minister that he will appoint Hindus only in the Education Department, but when he does occupy that place his mentality changes, his whole mental outlook changes. A Muhammadan may say that he will appoint only Muhammadans when he is made the Minister for Local Self-Government, but his mentality undergoes a complete change as soon as he actually becomes one. Then he represents not Government but he represents the people, the members of the Council. He should not be afraid that the senior Member will give him a rebuke or the Governor will give him a rebuke. I know, Sir, I should not have brought in the name of the Governor—but when there is pressure from outside he should do, if he is fit to govern the Local Self-Government department, what he is asked to do. He must know that there are other people who are fit to govern small district boards. There are a lot of people who will prove their fitness if they are given the chance.

A Deputy Commissioner can be a blessing in the present communal atmosphere, but we have to look to the future. You say, Hindus and Muhammadans quarrel. Yes, they do. Let them quarrel like dogs, for soon they will realise that the strength of the country depends on their co-operation.



[Sh. Muhammad Sadiq.]

I know that as along as Deputy Commissioners are presidents, the work of district boards will be done with much greater promptness than if there is a non-official president. But what does he do? He takes up item No. 1 on the agenda and says "I have no objection" and passes on to the next item. "Item No. 2," he says, "is not necessary." Item No. 3 "has been discussed." As regards item No. 4 he asks: "What do you think, Rai Sahib? I think you agree with me." And so on and so forth. That is how the work is done there like lightning. He must be an extraordinary man who is to control everything from the birth to death of persons within his jurisdiction, and so is the Deputy Commissioner. It often happens a person's brother is a lambardar, another's cousin is a zaildar, yet another's grandfather or grandmother wishes to become an Extra Assistant Commissioner. (*The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:* The honourable member is not stating facts when he says that a grandmother could become an Extra Assistant Commissioner. It is not possible.) (*Laughter.*) Grandmothers will become Extra Assistant Commissioners. The day will come when they will. If they could now be members of Council and members of municipal and town committees, the day will soon come when they could be judges and magistrates and Extra Assistant Commissioners. So that, my point is, it is really unimaginable how the Deputy Commissioner could be opposed. We all know what an opposition to a constable means, what an opposition to a *thanadar* means. To oppose the will of a Deputy Commissioner is inconceivable to the highest degree. I concede that many of them are able gentlemen. I know that in many ways the Deputy Commissioner is much more efficient than an elected president will be. But so was the case with the Czar who was very efficient in certain respects. If there happened to be a rebellion anywhere, the Czar used to send all the hundreds of people alleged to be concerned in it to, say, Siberia and everything was soon quiet. So was the case with Nadir Khan nearer home. If all were put to death there will be none left to oppose and the task of government will be very easy. But, Sir, if you pause and consider, these revolts and signs of unrest are the awakening signs of democracy and, once they become manifest, we should not delay reforms. Then, Sir, the honourable the Revenue Member said that the principle of election was conceded in the case of a district board, 75 per cent. of whose members were elected members, if they met under the presidency of a non-official chairman, the Deputy Commissioner being absent, and if at such a meeting a 60 per cent. majority of the members demanded a non-official president. I do not think that that is a good solution of the problem. It may be that the Deputy Commissioner is absent. He would perhaps be seated in his bungalow. There are many people to send him news every now and then as to what is happening at the meeting. Reports of whether one member raised his handkerchief to his nose, whether another sneezed or a third yawned will all be communicated to the Deputy Commissioner. Who among the members will dare to rise and talk anything against the Deputy Commissioner or express a desire for an elected president? If my honourable friend from Gujrat was elected, I am sure it was in pursuance of a *hukkm* from above. It is impossible, whether in Gujranwala or Gujrat, Amritsar or Lahore, for any member to stand before the Deputy Commissioner unless the Deputy Commissioner has received some sort of *shariat* from above directing him to take a particular



course of action. To expect any one to thwart the wishes of the Deputy Commissioner who is bent upon being in charge of the district board is to expect the impossible. As my honourable friend said, the lambardar or the zaildar will lose his position or will probably be dealt with under section 124-A or hauled up before a magistrate. There are so many wide powers vesting in the Deputy Commissioner. I do not say that he will use them dishonestly, but the very fear that he has those powers instil the consciousness in the minds of the people that he is armed with martial law powers, so to say. People will tremble at the very sight of him, not that he is a devil or that he is a monster, but the very fact of his possessing such wide powers frightens the people. The people who compose the district board, for the most part, are those who should *sajam* the Deputy Commissioner every week, pay him their daily respects. With such temptation how can you expect him to brook the idea of their voting for an elected president? There is no Deputy Commissioner at the meeting, of course, but all the members would realise what it would come to if they decide against the wishes of the Deputy Commissioner. It is just like placing a child near the fire and, lest it should catch it, pull it by a rope. I know, of course, it will be said that the Deputy Commissioner is not meant to stand in the way and that he never does so. I request Government if they care for democratic institutions in the country to give a free hand to the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government. The honourable the Leader of the House was pleased to say that Local Government means Minister with a Governor. When we talk of a governable Minister, we know what it means. After all, a Governor is a Governor and a Minister is a Minister. I ask then where is the Cabinet system?

**Mr. President :** The expression "Local Government" in the case of a Governor's province, means the Governor in Council or the Governor acting with Ministers.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** That may be the definition of the term. As far as I know, joint responsibility with reference to a Cabinet system of government means the Government as a whole, and does not mean this Minister or that Minister. If the Government wants to overrule the Minister, it can do so. And naturally, the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government is in fear of being overruled. If the Deputy Commissioner of Amritsar, for instance, is not to work as the president of the district board, he should only be too pleased, for one worry less he would then have. The complaint is often made that the Deputy Commissioner has too much work and it is rather funny to see that on the one hand it is said that he has no time and on the other, district board work is tacked on to him. The matter should be left to the Minister for Local Self-Government and the Honourable the Revenue Member should say : Why worry our officers further, they are already overworked ; take off the district board work from the Deputy Commissioners. The Deputy Commissioner is burdened with revenue work, judicial work and police work. But the fact is, it is pressure from the executive side that is forcing the hands of the honourable Minister. He will, of course, rise to deny it, but the fact is apparent to any one. If he is left to himself, I am sure he will be too glad to hand over these offices to the people's representatives. Will not the honourable Minister be pleased to see my honourable

[Sh. Muhammad Sadiq.]

friend, Sardar Habibullah, for instance, elected president of the Lahore district board or other honourable friends on that side of the House placed in charge of other district boards? Why should he restrain himself for the reason that he knows that Government will not like that? Government will, of course, think that the prestige of the Deputy Commissioner on the executive side will then be lowered. But that is no reason to debar the honourable Minister from giving effect to the decision made several years ago to place these local self-governing bodies in non-official hands.

Sir, reforms are coming in the constitution of the government of this country. Democratic institutions are going to be established firmer than before and we all believe that provincial autonomy will surely be gained, and in the circumstances to keep in office a president after one year in the case of the district boards and to deny election to it would be wholly ridiculous.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** (Minister for Local Self-Government) : Sir, amongst many things that stand to the credit of my honourable and worthy predecessor, I mean the Leader of the House, in the way of encouraging and advancing local self-government in our local bodies stands also the fact that in February 1925 he issued a circular letter conveying the decision of Government to the effect that, wherever there were 75 per cent. elected members in a district board, if they met when the Deputy Commissioner was to be absent, and if, by a majority of 60 per cent. members present, they decided to have a non-official president, then Government will withdraw the Deputy Commissioner from his presidency of the district board. (An honourable member : If there are only three members.) There is no question of three or two or one member. Please do not interrupt. It was only in the case of Gujrat and Gujranwala that the district boards decided to have non-official presidents who are working even now.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** When was it?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** After 1925. When I took my office, Sir, I was as enthusiastic about supplanting official presidents by non-official presidents as the honourable members opposite, and I also felt that we should try and give this local self-government into the hands of non-officials as far as possible, and I took this question very seriously into my mind. At that time there were 16 district boards, including these two, Gujrat and Gujranwala, where there were 75 per cent. elected members. Now 16 out of 28 was not a large number and I felt that we ought to give other district boards also 75 per cent. elected element, so that they may also have this percentage to be able to elect their non-official president if they wish to do so. Therefore, in May 1928, we gave 75 per cent. elected element to the district boards of Gurgaon, Sheikhupura, Jhelum, Rawalpindi, Montgomery and Jhang. These six district boards will be added to those 16 who already have 75 per cent. I was not quite contented with this. We doubted that the circular order of the Ministry of Local Self-Government that the district boards mentioned therein have the power of electing their non-official chairmen will probably be laid on the shelf and be forgotten. We, there-

fore, issued another circular letter inviting the attention of those district boards to the previous circular and asked them to elect their non-official chairmen. Again on the 30th June 1928, that is, about a year after I took office, we issued a circular to the Deputy Commissioners again asking them to invite the attention of their district boards to the circular letter and to enquire if they wanted to have non-official chairmen. Not content with that again, on the 24th September 1928 we issued another circular letter inviting the district boards to decide to elect their non-official chairmen if they wished to do so. What is the result? The result is that 18 district boards who possessed 75 per cent. elected members have by a definite resolution in the absence of the Deputy Commissioner resolved to continue to have an official chairman. Three district boards one of which is the Lahore district board, from which the honourable member who moved this cut himself comes, simply received our letter and recorded it, taking no action thereon. Is it not open to the honourable member who has moved this cut to bring a resolution in his district board to the effect that they shall have a non-official chairman? The district board has 75 per cent. elected members and at any meeting convened for this purpose the Deputy Commissioner is under the orders of Government obliged to remain absent. Cannot the board meet and pass a resolution to that effect? If the elected representatives of the people in a district board by a resolution resolve that they wish to have such and such a person as their president or that they do not wish to have a non-official president, if I say 'No,' and proceed by an order of the Ministry of Local Self-Government to force a non-official chairman, I am certain, Sir, that the next morning there would be a cut motion on my salary in order to censure me for having done a thing of that nature. I try to meet the wishes of the people, and in each case the public must induce the members of the district board themselves for such a course. If those members of the board have not got the courage of their convictions to decide that they shall have a non-official chairman they have no right to sit there as representatives of the people. (*An honourable member: Why not assume that?*) If I do so to-morrow, the honourable member will be the first to bring a cut motion. This is as far as the position of Government is concerned. All these district boards if they wish to have non-official chairmen have only to pass a resolution and we shall give non-official chairmen to them.

I wish then to point out to the House certain facts from the little experience that I have gained in the working of the district boards within the last three years. I am of the opinion that the reason why district boards have worked successfully in this province as compared with other provinces is that you have official chairmen. The reason why district boards have worked better than municipalities so far as administration is concerned, is because they have official chairmen. The reason why Government here have not had the necessity to suspend or abolish any district board, as has been the case in Bombay and another province, or in the case of the Ludhiana Municipal Committee, is the fact that official chairmen are guiding the working of these boards. And my advice to this House would be that if, however, you wish to substitute the official chairman by a non-official, then two or three things are absolutely essential. One of them is that you must have in the district board a well-paid, responsible and highly educated

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan, Noon.]

officer, whether you call him secretary or by any other name, to run the administration with definite powers delegated to him by an Act of the Council or by a resolution of the district board, and the members should not be allowed to go and interfere in the internal administration of the board. Next, you should have your engineer who is to carry on your work with a status and standing, reliable and with a security of service not depending on the snatch vote of a few members or a clique of members of the board. Unless you have these securities given to the staff who are responsible for the running of the district board, I should say that the House would be wrong in demanding the abolition of the official president.

One honourable member said "If I did not ride a horse how can I learn riding?" I entirely agree with him that if we want to learn the methods of self-government we must jump into them. Maybe we shall suffer in the beginning, but in the long run we will learn how to do the business. But you can only teach riding to a person who is prepared to go on the back of a horse. You cannot force one on the back of a horse against that one's wish. So Government can only say: Here is the horse, put on your breeches and get on it. (*Sheikh Muhammad Sadiq*: If the Honourable Minister's son, for example, does not want to go to school, will he not give him a whipping and make him go?) One of the privileges which I learnt from the Council as well as the bar is that it is a courtesy that one owes while listening to the arguments of one's adversary not to interrupt and I request the same courtesy from the honourable member. If the Lahore District Board does not wish to ride a horse for fear of breaking its neck, if it desists from the attempt on account of that, it should be persuaded and not forced to embark on the undertaking.

Those are the safeguards which I should like to suggest before a district board should decide on a course of such a nature. There are further difficulties which I wish to point out. For instance, there is the question of collection of taxes. Taxes in the district board are collected through the agency of the land revenue department. The Deputy Commissioner is the head of the land revenue department, and through his help and guidance the taxes of the district board, I mean the local rates, which are collected along with land revenue, are collected easily. Wherever there are official presidents there is no difficulty about the collection of these taxes. I do not wish to go into details, but I should just cite one instance. The other day I happened to get a report covering about 40 pages of the audit department about the collection of district board taxes in Gujranwala, where we have a non-official president. It is alleged in that report that members of the board themselves are going on collecting the taxes. The board decided that they should themselves collect them. Accordingly what they do is this: They go on collecting and keep the money in their own hands. They take beforehand, as they are the sanctioning authorities, 5 to 6 per cent. of the collections as their charges, keep the money with them for some months and finally credit it to the district board funds. (*An honourable member*: What tax?) Whether it is tax A or tax B does not make the position any different. If you remove the official chairman, then I say it is incumbent on the House and on Government to safeguard the interests of the tax payers of the district and see that the funds which they

contribute are not wasted by the members of the board who are responsible to the public. And I submit that, as long as the system of sheer honorary work continues, without any safeguard, of a competent secretary or an executive officer over the district board, the finances will be ruined and the collection of taxes is an important thing about which the House ought to be careful before they decide to make a sudden change of that nature.

The next point is that at the present moment, as it has been conceded by certain honourable members themselves, there is a certain amount of communal feeling within the district boards. I have often spoken to members of district boards myself and asked them if they wanted to have non-official chairmen. The reply has often been "For God's sake prevent us from communal bickerings." The moment the chairman is to be elected, communal bickerings will arise as is the case with the municipal committees. The Hindu, the Muslim and the Sikh will be fighting with one another. At present we get a Muhammadan, a Sikh, a European or a Hindu Deputy Commissioner as our president, so that there is not this danger that, if in any board, any one community is in a permanent majority, the other communities are denied a say in the matter of administration. That danger is now avoided because, if a Hindu Deputy Commissioner is transferred, a Sikh or a Muslim comes in his place and, as there are transfers from time to time, the Deputy Commissioners try to distribute patronage and favours among the various communities and there is no permanent grievance of any one community against the president. Therefore, I submit that on account of this communal feeling at present the members themselves do not wish to have elected chairmen. The moment that communal feeling passes away, say in a year or two, members will express their desire for non-official presidents and I shall be only too delighted to grant them the privilege. I want that the decision should be made by themselves. If they do not want to have the privilege, then this House will be the last place to force the hands of Government to impose an elected chairman on a board against the wishes of its members.

Another point is the question of giving contracts. One honourable member hinted at the point. There is no doubt that in some district boards—but they are exceptions—you may have very good non-official chairmen who are scrupulously honest. But we are not thinking of personalities. We are thinking of systems. We should try and evolve a system whereby it becomes impossible for anybody, no matter who he is, if he comes into the place and is not fit for it, to be able to do any harm to the tax-payer. When you see that some district boards have as much income as 15 lakhs of rupees per annum, as the district board of Lyallpur for instance, and some others have five, four and three lakhs which figure represents quite the ordinary income of a district board and in addition to that they get large grants-in-aid from Government, and these large amounts of money have to be dealt with, it would be highly inadvisable to remove the official chairman and replace him by an honorary member who may be trying to do the work as a sort of *bigar*. After all, the person whom you elect as the president is a human being himself with a family to look after, who must engage himself in an occupation to bring in enough money for his needs such as the education of his children and so on. It cannot therefore be expected

[Hon'ble Maik Firoz Khan, Noon.]

of him that he could devote the whole of his time for district board work. Human nature being what it is, what will happen is this. There may be some people rich enough and able to devote the whole of their time for this work, but there may be others who have their private businesses to carry on. The danger will then be that the whole situation will be left to the secretary, and at the end of the day he will go to the president with a bundle of papers, and the latter, perhaps too tired of the day's work, will go on signing them without reading through them. Are we right in entrusting the administration of lakhs of rupees to such hands? There are many Indian States with incomes of 5, 6, 10 or 12 lakhs; many of them are of that income. Look at the staff that they have in order to look after the States. If any honourable member has himself an income of say, 80 lakhs of rupees a year, would he agree to leave it to be managed by an honorary worker?

Therefore, my final submission is this. I am in entire sympathy with the feeling of the honourable mover of this amendment, but before that change can be brought about, many safeguards are essential, the most essential being that we should do it with the consent of the board itself and not force it on any one. When the safeguards are there and the boards express their desire, Government will be only too pleased to act according to the wishes of the board. As the amendment now stands, it will be extremely inadvisable to pass it at this stage.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri** [Amritsar City, Non-Muhammadan, Urban], (Urdu): Sir, my honourable friend here has asked me to speak in Urdu and therefore I will express my views in that language. I must confess at the very outset that I was absolutely unprepared for the sermon which the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government has been pleased to inflict upon us. He told us that he is whole-heartedly in favour of having non-official presidents for district boards. But at the same time he hastened to advise us on the basis of his three years' experience that these non-official presidents must be well-to-do persons so that they may be able to spare sufficient time for the work of the boards. He pointed out that non-official presidents have to look after their private affairs and the comforts of their families, and therefore they cannot devote sufficient time and energy to the affairs of district boards. Then he related many other difficulties which have stood in the way of appointing non-official presidents. I wish, Sir, that instead of resorting to such unconvincing arguments, the honourable Minister had plainly confessed that he was really anxious to meet the popular wishes, but the Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners would not allow him to adopt such a course.

The principle of appointing non-official presidents was accepted in the year 1919 and it was declared that if any municipal committee wanted to have a non-official president it was at liberty to do so. I was a member of the Amritsar Municipal Committee at that time and I moved a resolution asking for a non-official president. That resolution was vehemently opposed by the late Sir Gopal Dass, Bhandari. But when the Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain, the then Minister in charge, allowed us to elect a non-official president, Sir Gopal Dass was the first to stand as a candidate. However, Sir, the desirability of appointing non-official presidents is not denied by the honourable Minister, but I must submit that the condition with regard

to a resolution being adopted by a majority of 75 per cent. is not only needless, but is also open to objection from another viewpoint.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** There is no question of 75 per cent., Sir. I never said that.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri [Urdu] :** The honourable Minister was pleased to say that if any district board had 75 per cent. elected members, and out of them 60 per cent. expressed a desire to have a non-official president, the Ministry of Local Self-Government would be prepared to accede to their wishes. But I submit, Sir, that if any board consisted of only three members, then one of them would be the chairman, and in that case, it would be practically impossible to fulfil that condition.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** There is no such board.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri [Urdu] :** But there may be one in future. Now the Honourable Minister took over charge of his present office in 1925, and I submit that, if he really wanted to appoint non-official presidents, the condition about 60 per cent. ought to have come down to 50 per cent. at least by this time. There are 22 district boards in the province, and out of them as many as 16 have not been given any chance by the honourable minister to work under a non-official president. He has been pleased to lay so many conditions before the House which must be fulfilled by a district board before asking for a non-official president. May I ask, Sir, whether he was required to fulfil any special conditions when he was appointed a Minister? He was just an ordinary member like others and took the same oath as all of us. But there can be no objection to his being appointed a Minister on that score. Then why should he lay so many conditions with regard to this very simple matter? He knows it fully well that Indians are quite competent to discharge the duties of any office, however high it may be. The honourable Leader of our own House is an Indian and none can deny the fact that he has proved as efficient and capable as his predecessors, or perhaps much better than they. But even if we leave that aside, every one knows that every single resolution passed by a district board has to pass through the hands and receive the assent of the Deputy Commissioner, Commissioner and the Honourable Minister himself before any action can be taken on it. Therefore, there is no danger of any trouble arising out of the appointment of a non-official president.

Then he advised us to have executive officers in the local bodies. That appears to be quite a sensible suggestion. But the trouble is that you require these executive officers to work in your interest, while their salaries will be paid by the district boards. If you really want to give us executive officers, their position must be exactly similar to the executive officers in Calcutta, and not to those in Bombay, who consider themselves masters, and not servants, of the local bodies.

It has also been said that the experiment of appointing non-official presidents has been tried in some district boards and it has proved a failure because the work of those boards was found to be very defective and unsatisfactory. But, Sir, that does not show that the fault lay with the non-official presidents only. Suppose there are some defects in the workings.

[L. Kesho Ram Sekhri.]

of local self-government in this province. Then, will that mean that they are wholly due to the incapability of the Honourable Minister, or that no Indian should be entrusted with the portfolio of local self-government in future? If some non-official presidents are guided by communal tendencies, you have the fullest power to take them to task, but there is no sense in condemning or abandoning the principle of appointing non-official presidents on that ground. Similarly, the suspension of the Ludhiana Municipal Committee cannot serve as an argument so far as the appointment of non-official presidents is concerned. Government often has to suspend Extra Assistant Commissioners and other members of the provincial service, but the Honourable Minister would never advise Government to abolish that service, or to close its doors to Indians on that score. I submit that it is not wise to look at the dark side of the picture only and ignore the bright side altogether. Our own deliberations are presided over by an Indian gentleman, and none can deny the fact that everything is going on all right in this Council.

Again, the Honourable Minister was pleased to remark that he had presented the horse, and now it was for the people to ride it. But I submit that you cannot claim any credit for presenting the horse with one hand while you are holding a lash in the other to beat down anyone who tries to reach its back. If you present us with a horse and want us to learn how to ride it, you must provide us with all facilities for the purpose, instead of jumping at the slightest excuse to withdraw your present. I would request the Honourable Minister not to succumb to imaginary dangers, and let us learn to manage our own affairs. When Britains were under Roman rule, they used to view with the greatest apprehension the time when they would be deprived of the protection and guidance of the Romans. Even the thought of such a calamity was sufficient to make the blood run cold in their veins. But, when the Romans did leave them, it was found that all their fears were absolutely unfounded. On the other hand, we all know what an immense boon it has proved to that country to get rid of its former masters. When responsibility fell on their shoulders, they rose to the occasion and managed their affairs admirably. Therefore we should not be afraid of making mistakes. Let us make as many mistakes as we can and thus learn to stand on our own legs. The Honourable Minister should not be afraid of any cut being moved in his salary. After all, the worst that can come out of such a motion is that he may have to change his seat from the official benches to this side. But that, I submit, is not a very serious calamity.

Then he drew the attention of the House to the corruption that prevails in connection with contracts. I am prepared to admit, that some of our non-official presidents are not above it, but at the same time Government cannot deny that this is also the case with many of its own officials. Therefore that is no reason why we should be deprived of our right to manage our own affairs. There are so many Rajas and Maharajas at the head of various States, but Government has never thrust its unsolicited services upon them on the ground that it can manage their affairs better than they can.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** What about the Court of Wards?



**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri:** The Honourable Members and the Ministers are not minors, and therefore, there is no need for a Court of Wards here. In short, Sir, to me it appears to be a case of—

ہر کہ در گان نمک رفت نمک شد

Otherwise, if the Honourable Minister were really anxious to see our district boards presided over by non-official presidents, he would not have tried to put off the matter on such flimsy grounds. Government should provide us with opportunities to shoulder our responsibilities in the district boards just as it has done in this Council. It is no use saying that non-official presidents cannot devote sufficient time and energy to the work of district boards. It was very rightly pointed out by my honourable friend Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq that this argument applies with much greater force in the case of Deputy Commissioners who are too overworked to attend to the work of district boards. For instance, take the case of Amritsar, where Khwaja Ghulam Sadiq is devoting as much time to the work of the committee as would not be possible for any Deputy Commissioner to do. However, to cut a long story short, we must learn to manage our own affairs, no matter how badly we manage them in the beginning. I submit, Sir, that, instead of standing in our way, Government should compel us to shoulder our responsibilities. I wish the honourable the Leader of the House had, by this time, refused to spare the services of Deputy Commissioners on the ground that they had too much work of their own. But it is not too late even now, and I hope that he will see his way to do some such favour to the province before he leaves us to join the Government of India. With these remarks, I strongly support the amendment.

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (Non-official Nominated): Sir, I wish to speak about one matter. One of the speakers referred

5 P. M.

to a certain action taken by the Deputy Commissioner, Jullundur, and, lest it might have left an impression that the Deputy Commissioner was unfair, and since I happen to have heard the details of the matter, I think I would make mention of it. So far as my information goes, and I believe it to be quite correct, the facts are that as soon as the Deputy Commissioner knew that one of the names proposed for the post of secretaryship was a man related to him he left his seat and told the members that he was not going to have anything to do with it and the members might decide the case as they liked and then he left the meeting. These are the facts as I came to know several months ago and I feel it my duty to mention this matter for the information of the House.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** (Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana, Muhammadan, Rural): Sir, I must say that I have been very sorry to hear the sad speech made by the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government. I thought, Sir, that the Honourable Minister had resigned his post and after resigning he had come to explain his position that, because district board administration was not working satisfactorily, so he was going to resign. But I am sorry to find the Honourable Minister sitting on an official seat and objecting to the administration of the district boards—an administration which is under his control. I must say that the Honourable the Leader of the House, when he was Minister for Local Self-Government, never made

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

such speeches, and we sitting in opposition admit that we always felt that the administration of his department had been satisfactory.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I did not say that my department was working unsatisfactorily. I said that it was more efficient than in other provinces.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** And you said that if you removed the Deputy Commissioners, then the whole administration will fall to the ground.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It may, in future.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I say that if you, as Minister, as an elected member, as an Indian, are capable of administering a department as a whole, what is the reason for thinking that if these Deputy Commissioners are removed anything bad would happen? I do not know whether you have thoroughly gone into the affair of the Gujranwala district board, and whether you have decided it as yet, in spite of the fact that you gave your opinion about that; but there are other district boards and municipalities and small towns under you, but you never said anything about them that these non-official presidents are doing anything bad. I must frankly admit that I shall be glad even if our local bodies were to do worse than they are doing, provided they were given non-official presidents. I shall gladly say: let them go on even if they are not doing as much good as they did under official presidents. After all, if you, as Minister for Local Self-Government, really demanded from Government, in your memorandum that you presented to the Simon Commission, that provincial autonomy should be given to the province, then with what face do you say in this honourable House that if non-official presidents are given to these local bodies, then local self-government would be ruined? I am sorry that this argument has been used. This was the second speech in these three years which may be said to be a sad speech. One was made in the July session of 1928 by an honourable member who is a very prominent member of this House and the second speech is by the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government, which is an indictment against his countrymen and their capacity to administer. This speech will be used as a plea and reason against those reforms that you expect and which you have demanded. Government will say: here you are, this is your speech, you say that without the official help you cannot control your local bodies satisfactorily, and what right have you to say that provincial autonomy should be granted to you? I have tried to go through the reports of the debates of the last few years and I am glad to say that the Honourable the Leader of the House had never uttered a word against local self-government administration when he was himself in charge of the administration. He was wise enough not to commit himself as the Honourable Minister has done. In fact, he tried his level best always to encourage the non-official agency rather than the official agency. He has decided cases against Deputy Commissioners, I know that. I do not say that out of any *khushamad*. I frankly admit that if such speeches were to be made, then there will be not only an end to local self-government, but to all our claims for further reforms. I will not deal at length with the administration of local self-government, but I must say that, unless you take up courage yourself and give non-official presidents to the district boards, you cannot say that people will be trained in the

art of self-government. Unless you know the ABC how can you read the big books? If really you want to do something good to this province, it is not up to you to speak in this way in this honourable House against your own administration, against your own people. I say if really official presidents can administer your local self-government in a better way than your own people, even then, there is no reason why non-official presidents should not be allowed to these local bodies, but you know self-government, whether it is bad or good, is better than government which is being administered by a foreign agency. I am sorry that I have indulged in this strain, but really I am sorry to hear this speech and I expect the Honourable Minister will kindly make amends and will kindly assure the House that he will do his level best to do away with the official presidents and give not only a chance to non officials, but circulate his orders to the Deputy Commissioners that in future they will not be permitted to control local self-government. With these words, I whole heartedly support the cut moved by my honourable friend.

**Pandit Mehar Chand** (Jullundur-cum-Ludhiana, Non-Muhammadan, Rural) (Urdu): Sir, I would respectfully make a few observations on the subject under consideration. Government has been making strenuous efforts to train the people of this country in the art of local self-government for the last nine years. The principal object of this training is, as is quite evident, to make Indians fit for shouldering greater responsibilities. Government wants to establish self-governing institutions in this country by degrees. The object is no doubt laudable. But, Sir, at the commencement of an enterprise a person is liable to commit mistakes. And if we, like other human beings, commit some mistakes, we should not be discouraged by Government. Just look at the municipal committees. They are working quite satisfactorily with non-official presidents. The case of the Ludhiana municipal committee is an exception. Sir, there are certain departments which are mostly run by Indians, for instance, the Education department. All divisional inspectors, with the exception of one, are Indians. If you read the education report for this year, you will find that the work of these Indian inspectors is most satisfactory. The only European inspector, who is now posted at Ambala, has not been able to put in as much good work as his other colleagues have done in other divisions. In fact, he does not like to mix with Indians and does not understand their views, and that is the reason why he is not so successful. I think that, if the official presidents of the district boards are replaced by non-official presidents, the innovation would not prove a failure. But so long as Deputy Commissioners are presidents of district boards, we shall never be able to receive any training in the art of local self-Government. These Deputy Commissioners are autocrats. As compared with Deputy Commissioners, Superintendents of Police and District Judges are nonentities. It would be in the fitness of things to remove official presidents from district boards just as the official element has been removed from municipalities under executive orders. If district boards pass objectionable resolutions, the Commissioner can exercise his veto. You say here is a horse, jump up. But who can dare to use the horse when his hands and feet are bound? Fear makes a person

[Pandit Mehar Chand.]

a coward. There are very few persons who are fearless. If I know that I will be appointed a Minister, I shall never incur the displeasure of Government. I shall never utter a single word against Government. Sir, these Deputy Commissioners are all in all in their districts. We people are terribly afraid of them.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** They are afraid of you !

**Pandit Mehar Chand :** You can say that. But I do not think that they are afraid of us. Sir, it is high time that official presidents of the district boards should be replaced by non-official presidents. This reform appears to be all the more important when we hear that dominion status is going to be granted to India very soon, though personally I do not think that this report has any basis of truth. Anyhow, we must have some training in local self-government. Unless we learn to work and live together like brothers, communal bickerings will never cease. Hindus and Muhammadans, when given an opportunity to co-operate with one another, are sure to improve their relations and live like good neighbours. I expect that the time is fast coming when both Hindus and Muhammadans will realise one another's importance and sink their differences. The Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government has said that Government is prepared to give wider powers to the people, but they do not like to have them. Sir, the way in which those powers are proposed to be exercised by the people is very objectionable. So far as local bodies are concerned, let the representatives of the people exercise full control over their affairs. With these words I resume my seat.

**Sardar Harbakhsh Singh** (Hoshiarpur and Kangra, Sikh, Rural) (Urdu) : Sir, I had no intention to speak on the subject under consideration. I rather wanted to keep silent like my honourable friend Khan Bahadur Sardar Habib Ullah because both of us are vice-chairman of district boards. But, Sir, some honourable members have said certain things against Deputy Commissioners generally with regard to which I feel myself called upon to make a few observations and throw light on the subject matter of the discussion. What the honourable members have so far said is both true and untrue. The wholesale condemnation of the official element cannot be justified. No one can say that all official presidents are bad. In fact, the whole thing depends upon the nature and temperament of the particular Deputy Commissioner who holds the office of president for the time being. If he is a good and well-intentioned gentleman, and is anxious to promote the cause of local self-government, he will certainly prove very useful. But if, on the other hand, he is the sort of person described by some honourable members, his presence is likely to materially check the progress of the work of local self-government. I think it would not be out of place for me to refer to my own district board, which is working quite satisfactorily with Mr. E. M. Jenkins (the Deputy Commissioner) as its chairman. Sir, he has been working with us for the last three years or more. I can say from my personal experience that he takes an honest and keen interest in the work of the district board and never puts any pressure on any one and never interferes with members, who enjoy full freedom of speech and action in district board matters. I think that the Honourable Minister for Local

Self-Government who on one occasion, himself witnessed the proceedings of our district board, will bear me out when I say that our district board is working very smoothly and successfully under the direction of the official president. Indeed, we are very much grateful to Mr. Jenkins for his valuable advice and guidance and the training that he has given us. The late Mian Beli Ram, advocate, a friend of mine, worked as vice-chairman of the district board for full five years before me. He always took a keen interest in the work of the district board. It was mostly through his efforts that the old order of things changed, and the new light dawned on our district board. There is now a delegation of power on behalf of the board to the chairman and vice-chairman, and so far as the work of the district board is concerned, the chairman and vice-chairman are on the same footing. The vice-chairman has got the same powers as the chairman has got except that the latter presides at the meetings if he is in the station. In order to effect a division of labour, the work is divided between the chairman and vice-chairman. The work of the district board falls under four heads, namely, Education, Public Works, Finance and Public Health. At present, the chairman deals with Public Health and Education, and the vice-chairman with Finance and Public Works. Neither of them interferes with the work of the other. That is how the work is being carried on. Sir, I devote about two hours daily on an average to the work of the district board, only because it is my earnest desire that we should qualify ourselves for self-government and prove our fitness. Otherwise, a person like myself, being a member of the legal profession, need not have given so much time to district board work. It was only last year that I had to tender my resignation on account of my illness which was no less due to overwork than to other reasons. I blush to say that in a letter from the Ministry of Local Self-Government my work as vice-chairman of the district board was officially recognised and appreciated by Government, presumably on the recommendation of the Deputy Commissioner.

**Sardar Narain Singh :** Sir, may I know whether the speech is relevant to the proposition under discussion? He is really lavishing praise on the Deputy Commissioner of his own district of Hoshiarpur.

**Sardar Harbakhsh Singh (Urdu):** If the honourable member has a little patience, he will see the other side of the picture as well. It is because people are prejudiced against Deputy Commissioners that it is not palatable to them to hear so much being said about one of them. As I have already stated, everything depends upon the person who holds the office. Otherwise, in my opinion, official character plays but a little part to harm the popular demand for powers to non-officials. I am at one with the honourable Minister when he says that, if official presidents are replaced by non-official presidents, it would become very difficult for us to realise the profession tax. Tahsildars have already been removed from district boards, and hence they naturally feel annoyed and would not help us unless hard pressed by Deputy Commissioners. Professional tax can only be realised through the help of the Deputy Commissioners, and it is natural that, if they do not remain presidents they will slacken the support that they give now. But, Sir, the Minister says : here is a horse, you are in your breeches, jump up; it is your fault if you do not. But, the horse is under the control of somebody else who holds

[S. Harbakhsh Singh.]

it and offers a ride. How can we make use of it safely? If we dare to use it, it might kick us on a sign from its master. Here is, the other side of the picture. For instance, our district board passed a resolution to the effect that the official president may be removed from the district board. This was in 1925 when the late Mian Beli Ram was vice-chairman of the district board. The resolution recommending the removal of the official president was passed with a majority of 60 per cent. of the members as laid down in the circular. But along with it a condition was also unfortunately attached to the effect that, so long as the then Deputy Commissioner (whom I refrain to name here) was there, he should not be removed (*laughter*). I do not want to attack anybody who was serving as Deputy Commissioner, at that time. I am simply narrating facts. But what happened after the passing of that resolution will simply amuse you and will prove the objection of several honourable members who advocate the removal of official presidents. Within a year matters so deteriorated that next year the same board overruled their former resolution under the presidentship of the same vice-chairman, who himself declared that communal or party feeling has grown so much in the meantime that we do not require a non-official president. Ever since that time nothing again has been attempted in this connection. As for myself, my modesty would not permit me to arrange a meeting of the kind, as the circular letter requires to be convened, even if I desired a change. When such is the state of affairs, how can we hope for success unless the Deputy Commissioners themselves recommend the removal of the official element, or unless Government introduce this reform under executive orders? It has been said by the honourable the minister that, besides the thirteen district boards which enjoyed 75 per cent. of non-official element in membership, but refused to have a non-official president, six other district boards were raised to the status of boards enjoying 75 per cent. of non-official membership. What is the use of that when we know that owing to an inherent defect in the procedure so many district boards had failed to avail themselves of the choice. So, that is not the proper way to deal with this problem. Government should itself find out which of the district boards can work satisfactorily with non-official presidents. There they should replace the official presidents by non-official presidents, without a regular prayer emanating from a majority of members. Do not leave this matter to the district boards. They cannot pass resolutions recommending the removal of the official element unless the Deputy Commissioners themselves agree to it and encourage the members to pass such a resolution. When I say so, I keep the case of all the district boards in the province in view, and not that of my own district board of Hoshiarpur.

**Sardar Bahadur Captain Dalpat Singh** [Non-Official, Nominated] (Urdu): Sir, for the last four years I have been vice-president of the district board, Rohtak, and on the ground of my experience I can claim to make a few submissions on the subject. Several members have urged upon Government the necessity of appointing non-official presidents of district boards. In theory the principle holds good, but in practice at least, my experience tells me that the present time is not opportune for adopting it. The sense of duty, the tolerance of opinion and allowing others freedom of speech are qualities which we still lack, and therefore the appointment of non-official

presidents of the boards would involve us in great difficulties. My honourable friend, Sardar Harbakhsh Singh, has stated that the Deputy Commissioner of his district who is also the president of the district board never interferes with the work of the board and that he always tries to lead the members on the right path. The Deputy Commissioner of our district is also moved by the same spirit. He never tries to exert undue influence or overawe the members. Some time back a meeting was held at Sonapat; the Deputy Commissioner also attended it. His behaviour as usual was very good and he sat amongst us as if he was one of us. Often, out of mere party feeling or personal grudge, members try to turn out a good and diligent teacher or some other servant from the district board's employ. On such occasions it is only the Deputy Commissioner who keeps them from turning him out, he, being a non-party man. No doubt, in itself, the principle is very good, but it will take some time before we can adopt it without any fear. Much objection has been taken to the example of the horse given by the Honourable Minister. But I say a wise man will never even go near a horse if he happened to have seen no horse before in his life. He would try to gain its acquaintance step by step and never jump on to its back at the very first chance of seeing it. Sir, I fear in this way we will spoil even that much which we have got at present.

Then, Sir, there is a difference between the work of a Deputy Commissioner and a president. The former has got authority and he takes work from his subordinates by order. The latter has to make them work by his good behaviour, honesty and kindness. Sir, as I fail to see any reason to support this motion, and I oppose it.

**Sardar Narain Singh** [Rawalpindi Division and Gujranwala, Sikh, Rural] (Urdu): Sir, masterly speeches have been delivered on the subject of the desirability of appointing non-official presidents of district boards, but unfortunately I happen to disagree with some of them. After hearing the first part of the speech made by the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government, I formed an opinion that since such circumstances are possible under which appointing an official president becomes necessary, I must vote against the cut; but later on, after hearing the second part of the Honourable Minister's speech, I had to revise my opinion. The Honourable Minister's speech reminds me of an incident which happened in a district magistrate's court. In an appeal, after hearing the arguments advanced by the counsel for the appellant, the district magistrate said "Well, you are right, your arguments are very strong and I have every sympathy with you, but I dismiss the appeal *in toto*." Similarly the Honourable Minister also made a self-contradictory speech. He said that Government had given us a horse, that it is we who were to ride it, but in the same breath he stated that Indians were not fit to take over themselves the responsibility of being chairmen. He said that the income of the district boards amounted to lakhs of rupees and their work required a good deal of honesty of which the Indians were incapable and therefore could not be entrusted with such a great responsibility. To prove his contention he referred to a report of 42 pages and gave instances in which the members had misappropriated the monies collected on behalf of the district boards. These cases are few and we can treat them as exceptions. Then, Sir, the



[S. Narain Singh.]

Honourable Minister argued that Indians were too busy in their household duties and could not spare time to work on the boards as well and for these reasons Deputy Commissioners had to be burdened with such duties also. I think that while making this statement, he did not think over it much. Deputy Commissioners have very little time to spare as compared with Indians. Sir, the duties of a Deputy Commissioner are so numerous that he cannot discharge them efficiently even if he remains busy over them for the full 24 hours of the day. Here I remember a Punjabi story. It will help us in clearing my point. Two children had a stepmother who apparently loved them very much and often, when she brought milk for the children, she was asked by them to drink it herself and in reply she always satisfied them with the expression

بیچہ ماں پٹنی چار دچ

while in reality she used to get milk and cream ready for herself at the fire place. One day one child happened to go near the fireplace. He found that milk, butter, cream and every other nice thing was there. The next time she brought milk for them they again enquired as to why she did not take it herself. Again she made the same reply. But this time the children said that they were also very anxious to fall into the same fireplace. By telling this story I mean that, whenever we ask Government to trust some work of responsibility to our care, they discourage us by dilating upon the difficult nature of the work. Some people practise lip loyalty by saying that Government is their "Ma-bap" (Mother and father). I can say this much, that I can admit Government to be our mother, but only a stepmother. As regards accepting it in the place of our father, we cannot give it that exalted position. But, as Government is said to be established by law, if desirable we can call it legal father or father-in-law, in a legal sense. A Government that is reluctant to give us a good political training cannot aspire to be our mother. We are in a dilemma. Neither can we yield to this stepmotherly treatment of the English, nor can we desire them to leave us. Leave us! How can they leave us? Perhaps in some circles it may be thought that the English would go away leaving the country, but this is—

"این خیال است و محال است جنوں"

Yes! it is difficult, impossible, and an idle hope. How can—

**Mr. President :** Will the honourable member please withdraw that rather objectionable expression?

**Sardar Narain Singh :** If you consider that objectionable, I withdraw it at once. I never meant the slightest discourtesy. Well, I was saying that India is very hospitable; every foreigner that happened to come to India was treated like a son of the soil and was never allowed to go back. This country of bliss and peace is tolerant of all creeds and castes; here you will find established churches of all religions. He who came to seek hospitality in India was never refused or turned away. We do not desire to turn the English out; what we ask from them is this much: that they should extend a friendly hand towards us and, in order to be our brothers, they should regard us also as their brothers. Let them treat us as their equals.



**Mr. President :** The honourable member is wandering away from the motion before the House.

**Sardar Narain Singh :** Sir, the question is, do they treat us like their brothers or not? The answer to this is: "Yes! in theory, in papers, but not in practice." We are not given proper training. He who never falls can never hope to become a good rider. Sikhs, Hindus, Muslims, they are all brethren, sons of the same soil. They have been living here as brothers, neighbours, fellow-countrymen from time immemorial, and through God's grace they will continue to live like that for ages to come. Their petty dissensions, insignificant communal friction, are but things of the moment. They are effects, and will vanish with their cause. We are bound to live in a way as described in the couplet—

من تو شدم تو من شدمی      من تن شدم تو جان شدمی  
تا کس نه گوید      بعد ازین من دیگرم تو دیگرمی

A time will come when we will not be troubled by communal differences. Let us have a chance and we shall not be failing in our duty. Through you, Sir, can I ask the Honourable the Revenue Member if we have ever failed him in our duty of respecting and obeying him? We have got every respect for him.

Then, Sir, in the end I would like to suggest that, in such a case where a district board passes a resolution recommending that a non-official should be appointed president by the majority of 60 per cent. or 70 per cent. votes, Government should see their way to appoint a non-official president in this particular case. The members of the district boards are usually too much cowed down by Deputy Commissioners, and Government should not expect them to first take the initiative in this direction. The Deputy Commissioner is really an incubus for them, and we cannot expect this from them. Sir, at present there is one such district board in the Punjab which is on the verge of insolvency, but it has got in its employ an engineer who draws some 800 rupees a month. This engineer was appointed by an Englishman, and he continues to hold his lucrative job. The question is not whether he is or is not capable of discharging his duties, but the question is whether he was or was not appointed by the influence of the then Deputy Commissioner.

Again, Sir, another objection is made against the desirability of appointing non-official as presidents of district boards, that is, that, if the practice of appointing Deputy Commissioners as presidents of district boards is discontinued, then there would remain no one to collect the taxes of district boards authoritatively. To this I answer that this is no insurmountable difficulty. In the case of non-officials being appointed presidents of district boards, the list of arrears due can be prepared and sent to Deputy Commissioners, who would collect them with the revenue receipt. With these words I resume my seat.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani** [West Punjab Towns (Muhammdan) (Urban)]  
(Urdu) : Sir, in the opinion of the honourable member who just preceded me, sometimes, on account of the official presidents, such people are taken in

[Sh. Abdul Ghani.]

district board service who are often incapable, and whom the majority of the members also does not like. He referred to a particular case in point I do not want to discuss the circumstances under which the gentleman concerned was appointed, but I would like to say that now, by his excellent work and good behaviour, he has won our trust and is in great favour with the people. Sir, we are moved by a keen desire and wish that all work may be entrusted to our care. This desire is very good in itself, but first we must consider whether we are or are not fit to take over ourselves such a great responsibility. Whenever any such matter comes up for consideration, we are always carried away by our headlong zeal and never consider it calmly. The Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government referred to a report of 42 pages and said that it was not an opportune moment to trust Indians with any work of great responsibility. All of us took objection to it and clamoured that it was a reflection on the Indian character as a whole. None of us cared to enquire the grounds on which the Honourable Minister had based his remarks. If a member expresses his personal opinion regarding any matter, all the House begins to oppose him. They never ask him to state the reasons in support of his case, but try to force their own opinions on him. If ever anybody opposes what they say, they at once take fire and dub him a toady and a flatterer. The Honourable Minister said that often members misappropriate the money that they receive on behalf of district boards. All objected to it, but none cared to ask the Honourable Minister to state the cases in which such an abominable thing had happened in support of his contention. I don't say these things because I am goaded on by selfishness or that I belong to the district to which the honourable minister belongs, but I say them because I feel them and regard them as shortcomings in us all, as a whole. Some honourable members objected that the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government was trying to spoil their reputation by publicly saying such undesirable things. They said that at the coming round table conference it would be urged that Indians are still unfit for home rule and the Honourable Minister's words will be quoted as the authority. All this is right, but this does not mean that we should not try to purge ourselves of all the defects and shortcomings on account of which we afford others a chance to make such unpleasant remarks regarding us. These are facts and we cannot shut our eyes to them. At the time when non-officials were appointed presidents of municipal committees, each committee had funds which amounted to lakhs of rupees. At that time the committee of my own town had some 23 lakhs with it. But, soon after full responsibility was entrusted to Indian hands, all that money vanished. Now, nearly all the municipal committees are under debt. I don't mean to discourage you, but what I want to say is this, that we should try to cultivate in ourselves the habits of diligence and honesty. We must also develop a sense of duty and then everything will go on smoothly. Moreover, in the beginning such things are bound to happen, but by experience we will learn. It is necessary that to some extent we should try to overlook these shortcomings, but this does not mean that we should make it a habit. The present question is an important one and we must consider it from all points of view. We must keep in view the spirit, the circumstances and the educational condition of the country while discussing it. We had a bitter experience in the case of municipal committees, and, if we would persist in framing such a drastic measure with regard

to district boards, then we will bring ruin over them also. The present desire of the honourable members, if accepted, would hasten ruin.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Fateh Singh** [Ferozepore (Sikh) (Rural)] (Urdu): Sir, for many years past I have been a member of the district board of Ferozepore. The board is split up into two factions—the Mulisms and the Sikhs. These two parties always remain at daggers drawn. They quarrel and abuse each other over matters most insignificant and sometimes unimportant. They cannot tolerate each other's opinions. Once, after a hot discussion and much abusing over a matter of votes, a *banya* member did not vote on the side of the Sikhs. At this one Sikh was enraged, and, instead of giving an argument, gave a *lathi* blow to the *banya* member.

Sir, so long as this is our mentality, if more power is given to us we are more likely to misuse than to use it properly. This is the one main reason for which I oppose the motion now before the House.

The Council then adjourned till 2 p.m. on Monday, the 17th March, 1980.

PRINTED BY  
THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.  
445 PLC-600-9-4-30-SGPP Lahore.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 8RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Monday, the 17th March 1930.*

THE Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the chair.

### OATH OF OFFICE.

The following member was sworn in :

Mr. D. Milne (Official, Nominated).

### STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

SANSKRIT TEXT OF VATSAYANA'S KAMA SUTRAS.

**\*2918. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Sanskrit text of Vatsayana's Kama Sutras has been published in Benares ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that there are no restrictions on the import or sale of the book in the Punjab ;
- (c) whether there are any restrictions on the publication of the book in Sanskrit in the Punjab ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) Yes ;

(b) No ; the publication of the book " Kama Sutra " is restricted in the Punjab.

(c) Yes.

### PROPAGANDA AGAINST THE CONGRESS ACTIVITIES.

**\*2919. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in each zail of the province, committees are being constituted at the instance of the Government to carry on propaganda against the Congress and to keep the Government well posted in regard to the Congress activities ;
- (b) if the answer to (a) be in the affirmative, will he kindly state whether the Zaildars and Sufedposhes have been ordered to become members of such committees ;
- (c) whether it is also a fact that the local police are persuading people to become members of these committees saying that Government would grant them *sanads*, squares of land, *inams* and *jagirs* ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) No.

(b) and (c) Do not arise.

## LAND REVENUE—IRREGULARITIES IN RECOVERY.

**\*2920. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (i) (a) the action taken against landholders who do not pay the land revenue at the appointed time ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that even if the lambardar submits a list of the defaulters, the treasury officer refuses to receive the revenue unless the full amount due is paid ;
- (ii) If the answer to (i) above be in the affirmative, whether Government intend to take any steps to alter this practice ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (i) (a) The honourable member is referred to section 97 of the Punjab Land Revenue Act, and paragraph 520 of the Land Administration Manual, copies of which are available in the library.

(i) (b) and (ii) Enquiries are being made, the result of which will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

## INDEPENDENCE DAY CELEBRATION.

**\*2921. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether any municipal commissioners in the Rohtak district took part in the Independence Day celebration ;
- (b) whether some or all of them were ordered to submit explanations for participating in such celebrations ;
- (c) whether it was unlawful for them to take part in such functions ;
- (d) whether any explanations have been called from municipal commissioners in any other districts of the province ; if so, which of them ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Government have no information as to whether members of municipal committees in the Rohtak district took part in such celebrations in their private capacity. No case has been reported to Government from the district in question of any action taken in this connection by a member of a municipal committee as such.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to Question No. 2876<sup>1</sup>, answered in this House on the 28th February last. Government have not called for the explanation of any members of municipal committees in regard to acts performed by them in their individual capacity.

(c) Members of municipal committees are, in regard to acts performed by them in their private capacity, in the same position as other members of the general public.

(d) The Ministry of Local Self-Government called for the explanation of one member of the Gujranwala municipal committee.

MR. MUHAMMAD SAID, MAGISTRATE.

**\*2922. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether Government is aware that there are some complaints against Mr. Muhammad Said, Magistrate, exercising powers under section 30, Criminal Procedure Code, in the Karnal district ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that in an appeal *Surja v. Crown, Rai Sahib Shibbu Mal*, Sessions Judge, Karnal, passed remarks in his judgment against the said Magistrate that he had violated the sanctity of his record ;
- (c) whether any complaint was made by some members of the Karnal bar to the High Court against the attitude of this magistrate ; if so, whether any action was taken on this complaint ;
- (d) whether the attention of the Government has been invited to the complaint published in the daily 'Tej' of Delhi in its issues of 25th October 1929, 17th November 1929 and 23rd December 1929 against this magistrate ;
- (e) if the answer to the above be in the affirmative, whether any enquiries have been made about the correctness of these allegations, and, if so, with what result ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** Government are not in possession of the information necessary for a reply to be given. The information is being obtained and a reply will be given to the honourable member in due course.

#### CATTLE-LIFTING AND THEFTS IN KARNAL DISTRICT.

**\*2923. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that cattle-lifting and other thefts have been on the increase in the Karnal district since last year ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that persons declared as belonging to criminal tribes in this connection are still at large and are doing their nefarious work in the villages ;
- (c) whether any villagers have deserted their villages in fear of the prevalence of this crime ;
- (d) if answers to (a), (b) and (c) are in the affirmative, what steps, if any, Government proposes to take for the protection of peace-loving and law-abiding section of the population ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

(b) No.

(c) Not so far as Government are aware.

(d) Does not arise.

## LITIGANTS IN LAW COURTS.

**\*2924. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member please state—

- (a) whether Government is aware that the litigant public in the law courts of the province are being put to great inconvenience for not being provided with any shed and benches to sit on ;
- (b) if so, what arrangement Government is going to make in this direction ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

## CORRUPTION AMONG SUBORDINATE JUDICIAL ESTABLISHMENT.

**\*2925. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether Government is aware of the fact that process-serving establishment and the subordinate clerical staff of the Punjab courts are deeply indulged in corruption and money is extorted at every step from litigant public by way of right and usage ;
- (b) if so, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Government is not aware that the subordinate clerical establishment of the courts and process-servers are more open to charges of the wholesale corruption than other bodies of subordinate Government or private employees.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to question No. 378<sup>1</sup> asked in the November Session of 1927 by Mr. M. A. Ghani.

## MEMORIAL FROM HINDU SABHA, AMBALA, re PREPONDERANCE OF MUHAMMADAN OFFICERS.

**\*2926. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether Government have received memorials, dated 16th December 1929 and 9th February 1930, from the President, Hindu Sabha, Ambala City, in connection with the serious preponderance of the Muhammadan officers in Ambala district and the gradual elimination of the Hindu official element therefrom ;
- (b) if the reply to the above be in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state what action has been taken on these memorials ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) No memorial was received in February 1930. Two memorials were received in December 1929 and related to the preponderance of Muslim officials in the district office.

(b) These memorials were forwarded to the Commissioner for disposal.



## COLLECTION OF LOCAL RATES BY LAMBARDARS.

**\*2927. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** With reference to the answer to part (c) of question No. 2862<sup>1</sup> put by me on 27th February 1929, will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the collection of cattle tax and *haisyat* tax is also included in "all the duties" mentioned therein;
- (b) whether *paahotra* is allowed for the collection of these taxes;
- (c) if the answer to (b) be in the affirmative, what are the reasons for not allowing *paahotra* to lambardars for the collection of local rates, cesses, mutation fees, etc.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) Yes.

(c) Does not arise.

## PATWARIS' SHARE OF MUTATION FEES.

**\*2928. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in addition to their pay, the patwaris are allowed a share of the mutation fees?
- (b) If so, what is the percentage of this share?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) Two-fifths of the fee charged.

## DARAKHTPAL GRANTS IN LOWER BARI DOAB CANAL.

**\*2929. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the terms on which Darakhtpal grants were made in the Lower Bari Doab Canal;
- (b) whether it is a fact that after the expiry of the terms Government took possession of the trees in some cases but not in others;
- (c) whether it is also a fact that the district boards are not prepared to take this property as its maintenance is much too expensive;
- (d) whether the Government is also aware that the grantees are spending lots of money for the upkeep of these trees which they are not required to do by the terms of the grant;
- (e) If so, what action Government intend to take in the matter?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The honourable member is referred to Punjab Government Notification No. 2359, dated the 5th of November, 1919.

(b) There appears to have been some misunderstanding about the conditions of these grants. The idea that tree planting tenants would be relieved of their duties in the way of planting and looking after trees as soon as

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

they obtained occupancy rights was erroneous. Action is now being taken correctly to interpret the condition of these tenancies.

(c) Government has no information on this point.

(d) No.

(e) Does not arise.

**DISTRICT BOARD ANGLO-VERNACULAR MIDDLE SCHOOL, DERAGOPUR.**

**\*2930. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the District Board of Kangra has passed a resolution to raise District Board Anglo-Vernacular Middle School, Deragopur to high standard ;

(b) whether the Government is aware that an Anglo-Sanskrit High School already exists at Deragopur which is on the permanent grant-in-aid list ;

(c) whether it is a fact other schools in the district such as Nadaun, Sujampur, Nagrota Baguan, Daroka, Karoa, Haripur and Palampur have got larger number of boys than D. B. Middle School Dehra and some of those schools have applied to the district board for opening high classes ;

(d) if the reply to the above be in the affirmative, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) Government has no such information.

(d) The matter will receive due consideration at the proper time.

**SELECTION OF CIVIL ASSISTANT SURGEONS.**

**\*2931. Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that in the proposed selection of candidates for the posts of Civil Assistant Surgeons in the Punjab Civil Medical Service Government proposes to restrict its choice only to such candidates who obtained the M. B. B. S. degree in the minimum number of years prescribed under the regulations of the Punjab University ;

(b) if so, the reasons for this restriction ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is not intended that the selection of candidates to fill vacancies in the Punjab Civil Medical Service should be restricted to such candidates as have qualified for the M.B.B.S. degree in the minimum number of 5 years.

Applications are being invited from all medical graduates under the age of 35 and the selection will be made on the advice of a Board of Selection on which four members of this House have agreed to serve.

TEXT BOOKS WRITTEN BY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT OFFICER.

\*2932. **Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) the names and designations of officers of the Education department who have written or compiled books for use in school and colleges of the province during the past ten years ;
- (b) which of these officers are so placed that they can influence the sale and use of their books ;
- (c) the amount of royalty received and income-tax paid thereon by each officer mentioned in (a) during the past ten years ;
- (d) what steps the Government proposes to take to prevent this misuse of their official position to push the sale of their books ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a), (b) and (c) : This information is not available and it is difficult to obtain it. Its value (even if it could be procured) would not be commensurate with the time and labour spent on its collection.

(d) Government has taken steps to prevent authors from abusing their official position to push the sale of their books. Necessary orders have been conveyed in Government letter No. 18511-B., dated the 16th August, 1929, a copy of which is placed on the table.

Copy of letter No. 13511-B., dated the 16th August 1929, from Sir G. Anderson, Kt., C.I.E., M.A., Under-Secretary to Government, Punjab, to all Divisional and District Inspectors of Schools, members of Director of Public Instruction's Headquarters Staff, Deputy Directress of Public Instruction, Inspectresses of Schools, Heads of Government Colleges and Schools, Secretary, Text-Book Committee, Punjab, Superintendent of Education, Delhi Province, and Superintendent, Reformatory School, Delhi.

In supersession of Mr. Godley's circular No. 10, serial No. 988, dated the 16th February 1917, and of Mr. Sanderson's C. M. No. 17885-B., dated the 15th November 1927, on the subject of the production of text-books for use in schools and colleges in this province, I am directed to communicate the following orders of Government for the guidance of all officers of the Education department.

2. Under rule 15 of the Government Servants' Conduct Rules, a Government servant may undertake occasional work of a literary or artistic character provided that his public duties do not suffer thereby, but Government reserves to itself the right to forbid him to undertake or to require him to abandon any employment which in its opinion is undesirable. The rate of fees which can be accepted in the case of work undertaken on behalf of a private person or private body is subject to the provisions of rule 46 of the Fundamental Rules and the subsidiary rules thereunder.

3. The circulars referred to in paragraph 1 of this letter laid down certain rules for the guidance of all educational officers in regard to the production by them of books specially designed for use in educational institutions. These rules make no distinction between the members of the teaching and the inspecting staffs; nor do they differentiate between text-books for use in schools text-books prescribed by the University for its examinations and books which can be regarded as works of scholarships first and text-books afterwards. It seems desirable to make a distinction between these two classes of officers and between the several categories of books.

[Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal.]

4. The following revised orders on the subject are therefore issued :—

(a) In the case of literary work undertaken for a private person or body, the officer whose services have been commissioned shall before undertaking the work obtain the permission of the Head of the department.

(b) The acceptance of fees for such work will be subject to rule 46 of the Fundamental Rules.

(c) In cases in which the books so commissioned is intended for use as a text-books in the primary and middle departments of schools and is approved by competent authority as such, the permission, if granted, will be subject to the condition that the writer if he is a member of the inspecting branch, or on the staff of the Central Training College, shall not retain a pecuniary interest in the sale of the book in the Punjab ; in other words, he will be permitted to receive payment of a royalty for all copies sold outside the Punjab. In the case of books commissioned by the Punjab University or prescribed for use in one of its examinations, the writer or editor shall be permitted to receive payment of a royalty for copies sold whether inside or outside the Punjab.

(d) In the case of books written by an inspecting officer or by a member of the staff of the Central Training College on his own initiative, specially for use as text-books in the primary and middle departments of schools, and approved by competent authority for the purpose, the same conditions as given in (c) above shall apply. The orders contained in sections (c) above and (d) shall not apply to educational officers employed in the teaching branch. If, however, any such officer be transferred to an inspecting post, or to the staff of the Central Training College, he shall forthwith comply with the orders detailed above. The conditions mentioned in sections (c) and (d) shall not apply to books which are works of scholarship first and text-books afterwards, i.e., for example, books of general academic interest, literary works and books of reference designed for teachers and for higher education. For such works any officer in the Education department may receive a royalty.

(e) In every case officers of the Education Department shall, before writing any text-book, obtain the permission of the Head of the department to undertake such work and shall submit to him a copy of the agreement entered into between himself and the person or persons who publish his work, or who have commissioned him to do the work.

(f) All officers of the Education department shall submit to the Head of the department annually a statement on the attached prescribed form showing the amount of money received as remuneration for the writing of text-books and other books and for royalties received on account of the sale of such books.

(g) No officer of the Education department shall be permitted to publish his own works, except with the permission of Government.

(h) These orders shall take effect from the date of issue of this circular and shall not be retrospective, though in the accounts submitted under section (f) all sums received in royalties during 1928-29 for books written before the date of this circular must be included.



**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes; orders were issued in 1927 to the effect that no books written or edited by a member of the Education department will be placed on the list of approved books unless or until the author or the editor concerned has stated that he has no personal interest in the sale of the book.

(b) The required information has been entered in a statement, which is placed on the table<sup>1</sup>. It is difficult to know on what basis the sale price of copyright was calculated in each case, though it may be presumed that the merit of the books was one of the determining factors.

(c) Yes, the orders issued in 1927 were revised in 1929. Copy of Government letter No. 13511-B,<sup>2</sup> dated the 16th August 1929, is placed on the table.

#### TEXT-BOOKS WRITTEN BY BOARDS OF STUDIES.

**\*2934. Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) what books written by the members of the School Board of Studies of the Punjab University, separately or jointly with others, were prescribed as text-books for use in high schools and colleges in the Punjab during the past ten years;
- (b) the name or names of the authors or compilers of these books;
- (c) the names of the authors and compilers mentioned in (a) who still retain an interest in the sale of the books written or compiled by them;
- (d) what steps, if any, the University has taken or proposed to take to prevent the members of the School Board and other Boards of Studies of the Punjab University from influencing the selection of their books as text-books?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) and (b) The names of books written by the members of the School Board of the Punjab University and prescribed as text-books for use in high schools and colleges in the Punjab during the past ten years are given below along with the names of authors or compilers.

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| 1. Selections from a "Book of Golden Deeds" | Edited by Bakhshi Ram Rattan.                                      |
| 2. Man Eaters of Tsavo                      | .. Mr. H. Wyatt.   |
| 3. Selected Stories from Hawthorne          | .. Mr. E. Tydeman and Bakhshi Ram Rattan.                          |
| 4. Tales from the Boyhood of Famous men     | .. Mr. H. G. Wyatt and Bakhshi Ram Rattan.                         |
| 5. The Coral Island by Ballantyne           | .. Abridged by Major Alexander Wilson and Khan Sahib Muhammad Din. |

<sup>1</sup>Vide page 640 *infra*.

<sup>2</sup>Pages 583—591 *ante*.

6. Qarun da Khazanah .. Bawa Udham Singh.
7. Assignments in Practical Elementary Science Dr. R. H. Whitehouse and Mrs. Whitehouse.

The authors in the case of all the above books were members of the School Board, except Major Alexander Wilson and Mrs. Whitehouse.

(c) Books Nos. 1 to 3 are no longer on the list of prescribed text-books, and hence the question of interest in the sale of these books does not arise. Mr. Wyatt and Dr. Whitehouse are no longer members of the School Board. Information in respect of Bakshi Ram Rattan, Khan Sahib Muhammad Din and Bawa Udham Singh has been sent for and will be supplied to the Honourable Member when received.

(d) In 1927 the Syndicate passed the following resolution :—

“ When a Board recommends a text-book written, edited or compiled by a member of the board, in which such member has any financial interest, the Board shall state this fact in its recommendation for consideration by the other University bodies concerned.”

This was communicated to all the Boards of Studies and the School Board.

The situation has been further changed by the Syndicate approving of the following decision of the School Board on 7th February 1930—

- (1) That every member of the Board shall make a declaration in writing as to whether or not he is interested directly or indirectly in any book which comes before the Board for consideration ;
- (2) that only in exceptional cases for reasons to be specified in writing the books in which a member or members of the Board are thus interested be considered.

The Boards of Studies and the School Board have been asked to follow these recommendations in connection with text-books to be prescribed in future.

#### VICE-PRESIDENTS OF LUDHIANA DISTRICT BOARD.

**\*2935. Sardar Mohindar Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) when was the last election of senior and junior vice-presidents of Ludhiana District Board held ;
- (b) on this occasion was the election held by a single vote or by double vote ;
- (c) was the procedure adopted in accordance with rules framed by Government ;
- (d) if not, what action does Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) On the 29th August 1929.

(b) By the double vote.

(c) There is some difference of opinion as to the interpretation of the rules in this connection. Steps are being taken to make the rules perfectly clear in the revised edition which will be issued before long.

(d) Does not arise.

#### GHORIPALS OF THE LOWER JHELUM CANAL COLONY.

**\*2936. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that a committee was appointed to enquire into the grievances of the 'Ghoripals' of the Lower Jhelum Canal Colony in the Shahpur district ;

(b) whether that committee has held any sittings, and reached any conclusions, and, if so, what ?

(c) Has the Government, so far, taken any steps to give effect to those recommendations, and, if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) The Committee has sat and reached certain conclusions. A detailed report embodying the conclusions of the Committee on the various points of reference will, it is hoped, shortly be received from the Commissioner of Rawalpindi Division.

(c) On receipt of this report Government will take such action as may be required.

#### ZAMINDARS OF THE JHANG DISTRICT.

**\*2937. Sayad Mubarak Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that owing to general failure of crops and the extraordinary low prices of the produce of the land in the last three years, the financial condition of the zamindars of Jhang district has been very badly affected ;

(b) whether the Government has received any representations from the zamindars of Jhang district requesting therein to extend the period and numbers of the remaining instalments due on Government lands purchased by them at the last settlement operations under the same conditions as those existing in the Lyallpur and Montgomery districts ;

(c) if so, what action Government intends to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Surely the honourable member is indulging in exaggeration. There were no general crop failures in Jhang district during *Rabi* and *Kharif* 1929, and the prices of the produce of land in the district have not been extraordinarily low during the last three years, although the prices of certain commodities have fallen recently.



(b) Yes. A representation was made to the Deputy Commissioner, Jhang, in February, 1928, and on the recommendation of the local officers the number of outstanding half-yearly instalments was doubled in June 1928.

(c) None.

NOOR-MAHARRAM AND AQALA-HAYATA BALOCHES.

**\*2938. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it has been brought to the notice of the Government by the Deputy Commissioner, Criminal Tribes, Punjab, and the local authorities of Jhang district that the Noor-Maharram and Aqala-Hayata Baloches of that district do not commit crimes as habitual offenders, but they do it owing to their adverse economic conditions ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the same officials have recommended that they (the Baloches) should be given some lands to get them out of their present financial difficulties ;
- (c) if the answers to (a) and (b) be in the affirmative, what steps the Government has taken, or proposes to take in this respect ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) No.

(c) Does not arise.

NOOR-MAHARRAM AND AQALA HAYATA BALOCHES.

**\*2939. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that some land (in the Jhang district) was placed during 1927-28 at the disposal of the Deputy Commissioner, Jhang, to distribute it among the Noor-Maharram and Aqala-Hayata Baloches and other deserving persons in that district, to ameliorate their financial conditions ;
- (b) whether that land has been distributed, so far, and to how many persons ; if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

DISTRIBUTION OF LANDS TO LANDED GENTRY.

**\*2940. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) the total area of land in acres very recently distributed amongst the landed gentry of the province ;
- (b) the area of land given to persons of this class in the Jhang district ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) 9,000 acres.

(b) 20 rectangles or 500 acres.

## CIVIL SURGEON, JHANG DISTRICT.

**\*2941. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that during the last 20 years the post of Civil Surgeon in Jhang district has been held by non-Muslim gentlemen, except for a short period of two years ;
- (b) what were the reasons for the appointment of non-Muslims to this post for such a long period ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The required information is being collected and will be communicated to the honourable member as soon as it is available. The obvious reason seems the shortage of Muslims in the Punjab Civil Medical Service.

## ASSISTANT SUB-INSPECTORS OF POLICE IN JHANG DISTRICT.

**\*2942. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Finance Member please state—

- (a) the total number of Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police recruited from the statutory agriculturist tribes of Jhang district since the creation of this post ;
- (b) If the answer to (a) be in the negative, what were the reasons for ignoring the claims of this class of the Jhang district to this line of Government service ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Two.

(b) Does not arise.

## LOCUST IN THE JHANG DISTRICT.

**\*2943. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that most of the *Waga* of Jhang district has been visited by locusts and the young *rabi* crop damaged and in some cases destroyed ;
- (b) If so, what steps does the Government propose to take to help the affected zamindars ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Locusts appeared in a number of villages and slightly damaged the crops in a few villages, but luckily crops were not destroyed by them.

(b) The slight damage caused so far does not call for any steps, other than those provided by the ordinary rules.

## ROAD BETWEEN LYALLPUR, BHAKKAR AND JHANG.

**\*2944. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether there was a proposal to metal the road between Lyallpur and Bhakkar ;

(b) what actual steps have been taken to give practical shape to this proposal ;

(c) whether there is any possibility of the Lyallpur-Jhang section being metalled in the near future ?

**The Honorable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) The first section to be taken in hand will be between Lyallpur and Jhang but until the intention of the North-Western Railway in regard to a more direct railway connection between Lyallpur and Jhang is known it is inadvisable to do anything towards remaking the road.

(c) This will depend on the consideration alluded to in the reply to part (b) and to the financial conditions prevailing.

---

AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE, LYALLPUR, AND DEATH OF A STUDENT BY POISONING.

**\*2945. Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that a student of the Agricultural College at Lyallpur died of poisoning in the year 1929 ;

(b) whether it is a fact that some letters purporting to have been written by the deceased were discovered by the police ;

(c) whether it is also a fact that in these letters serious allegations were made against certain students and the Hostel Superintendent ;

(d) whether any departmental enquiry was made in this matter ; if so, with what result ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes ;

(b) All letters found with the deceased were handed over to the police ?

(c) The contents of these letters have not been disclosed ;

(d) The Deputy Commissioner ordered a magisterial inquiry and the police held the usual inquest ; in view of the reports received of these inquiries it has not been considered necessary to hold a third departmental inquiry.

---

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

LADY HEALTH VISITORS.

**1587. Khan Sahib Risaldar Bahadur Nur Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table—

(1) number of lady health visitors trained by Miss Simon and Miss Raynor in the province ;

(2) number of such visitors prior to their appointments ;

(3) number of *Dais* trained by lady health visitors ;

(4) whether the demand of lady health visitors is on increase or decrease ;

[K. S. Risaldar Nur Khan.]

(5) number of applications requiring lady health visitors received from different districts of the province, and number of lady health visitors available ;

(6) whether it is a fact that only Rs. 1,500 have been provided as grant-in-aid to local bodies to meet the expenses of the health centres ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (1) 34.

(2) 4.

(3) 263 during the last seven years, excluding the year 1924, for which information is not available.

(4) The demand is increasing. But it is doubtful if the demand will go on increasing at the same pace as it is doing now if the local bodies knew that the Government are unable to pay a grant-in-aid to cover the salary of each health visitor entertained.

(5) 19 applications for health visitors have been received from different local bodies and voluntary committees in the province, and others have been told that no further applications can at present be registered, as it is only possible to supply 8 health visitors each year. No lady health visitor is at present available.

(6) Not 1,500 but 15,000.

**EXEMPTION OF THE HINDUS OF MIANWALI DISTRICT FROM THE OPERATION OF FRONTIER CRIMES REGULATIONS.**

**1588. Khan Bahadur Khan Muhammad Saifullah Khan :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether Government is aware that the Hindus in the Mianwali district are exempt from the operations of the Frontier Crimes Regulations which are now operative on Muslims of the district only ;

(b) if so, whether Hindus will still be made members of the Jirgas appointed to try cases of Muslims falling under these regulations ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** The honourable member referred to the answer given to his unstarred question No. 735<sup>1</sup> asked in the Council on the 28th November 1928.

**PANDIT JAGAT RAM OF HOSHIARPUR DISTRICT.**

**1589. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether the term of imprisonment of Pandit Jagat Ram of Hoshiarpur district has expired ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the Inspector-General of Prisons recommended to the Government that Pandit Jagat Ram be released ;

- (c) if the reply to the above be in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state the reasons why Pandit Jagat Ram has not been released so far?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

(b) Government is not prepared to give the information.

(c) Does not arise.

---

AREA OF LAND SOLD OR MORTGAGED BY SMALL LAND HOLDERS  
TO BIG LAND HOLDERS.

**1590. Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether Government have had statistics collected of the extent of land that has passed from the hands of small landholders into the hands of big landlords by sale and mortgage since the Land Alienation Act came into force;

- (b) if the reply to the above be in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state the area so alienated.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, by the Board of Economic Enquiry, but they are not yet complete.

(b) Does not arise.

---

APPOINTMENT OF TRAINED NURSES IN ALL THE BIG VILLAGES  
OF THE PROVINCE.

**1591. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether there is any proposal under the consideration of Government regarding the appointment of trained nurses in all the big villages of the province?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Not at present.

---

FAILURE OF CROPS AND FALL IN THE PRICES OF AGRICULTURAL  
PRODUCE.

**1592. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether Government is aware of the fact that the financial condition of the zamindars of the province has gone from bad to worse in recent years as the result of successive failure of crops and fall in the prices of agricultural produce;

- (b) whether there is any proposal under the consideration of the Honourable Minister to institute an enquiry into the causes of this fall of prices and failure of crops?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Government is aware of the unsatisfactory features of agriculture in recent years;

- (b) As the causes are well known, no inquiry seems necessary.

## INTRODUCTION OF PUNJABI WRITTEN IN THE PERSIAN SCRIPT.

**1593. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether there is any proposal under the consideration of the Honourable Minister regarding the introduction of Punjabi, written in the Persian script, as the medium of instruction in the primary schools of the province;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Amritsar District Board passed a resolution to this effect;
- (c) if so, what action has so far been taken in the matter?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) No.

(b) Yes.

(c) The Education department is considering plans for increasing the number of Junior Vernacular and Senior Vernacular teachers trained to teach Punjabi.

## LIST OF MILITARY PENSIONERS.

**1594. Sardar Hira Singh, Narli :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Government has caused a list of military pensioners to be prepared;
- (b) whether it is a fact that one of the headings in these lists contained an enquiry whether the military pensioner concerned was a member of Risaldar Anup Singh's Jatha;
- (c) if the answer to (b) be in the affirmative, what was the object of making such an enquiry?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) No.

(b) and (c) Do not arise.

## MUNICIPAL COMMISSIONERS OF SEVERAL MUNICIPAL COMMITTEES IN THE PROVINCE WHO TOOK PART IN THE INDEPENDENCE DAY.

**1595. Chaudhri Baldev Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Municipal Commissioners of several Municipal Committees in the province who took part in the Independence Day were asked to give their written explanations; if so, why;
- (b) what legal steps the Government can or intend to take against those who have admitted their participation?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) The honourable member's attention is invited to the answer given in this House on February 28th, 1930, to Starred Question<sup>1</sup> No. 2876. Government called for the explanation of one member of Gujranwala Municipal Committee.

(b) Government are unable to answer a hypothetical question. Each case will be treated according to its own facts and circumstances.

**STRUGGLE BETWEEN TENANTS AND THE LANDLORDS OF VILLAGE  
CHHUCHAKWAS IN ROHTAK DISTRICT.**

**1596. Chaudhri Baldev Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether some instructions have been sent to the district authorities concerning the struggle between tenants and the landlords of village Chhuchakwas in Rohtak district ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the efforts of Mr. H. S. Malik, the late Deputy Commissioner, to bring about a compromise failed ;
- (c) what action Government propose to take regarding this struggle between tenants and the landlords ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No.

(b) Mr. Malik suggested to both landlords and the tenants to refer their disputes to a board of arbitration, consisting of—

- (1) a prominent non-official Muslim gentleman,
- (2) a prominent non-official Hindu gentleman, and
- (3) himself.

But both parties declined the proposal.

(c) The Government will be only too glad if the matter is amicably settled, and is prepared to give any assistance to that end in its power within the law. Failing however such amicable settlement, the law will take its course. Government will take every step possible to prevent the occurrence of any breach of the peace.

**REPRESENTATION OF THE MUSLIMS IN THE FEROZEPORE DISTRICT BOARD.**

**1597. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the representation of the Muslims in the Ferozepore district board is not in proportion to their population strength in the district ;
- (b) if so, what action Government intend to take to set right the proportion ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The Honourable Member is referred to the answer given to his question No. 569<sup>1</sup> asked on the 25th February 1928. Since that day owing to the lowering of the franchise the voting strength of Muslims has risen from 20 to 30.6 per cent.

Enquiries have already been addressed to all local officers as to whether the lowering of the franchise has so altered the balance of communities as to demand the revision of the constitutions of any district board.

**REPRESENTATION OF MAMDOT ESTATE ON THE DISTRICT  
BOARD, FEROZEPORE.**

**1598. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Mamdot Estate, Ferozepore district, is the greatest local rate-payer in the district ;

[ Pir Akbar Ali. ]

- (b) whether it is a fact that the Manager of the said Mamdot Estate used to be a member of the District Board, Ferozepore ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that he was removed to make room for the Executive Engineer, Public Works Department, Ferozepore ;
- (d) if the answer be in the affirmative, will the Honourable Minister please state further—
  - (i) the percentage of the number of meetings attended by the Executive Engineer ;
  - (ii) the assistance he gave as an expert to the District Board ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) No. By Punjab Government notifications Nos. 32987 and 32988, dated the 14th December 1927, the Executive Engineer, Sirhind Canals, was replaced as a member of the board by the Executive Engineer, Provincial Division, and the Manager, Mamdot Estate, by the District Medical Officer of Health.

(d) Does not arise.

#### FEROZEPOR DISTRICT BOARD.

**1599. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the District Medical Officer of Health is a member of the Ferozepore District Board ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Civil Surgeon is also a member of the said board ;
- (c) if the answer be in the affirmative, will the Honourable Minister please state the reasons for appointing two representatives of the same department as members of the District Board ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) The two officers in question represent two different departments, the Medical and the Public Health. It is desirable that on account of the rural dispensaries the Civil Surgeon should be in touch with the District Board and its members, and the prevention of epidemic like Malaria, Cholera, Plague and Small-Pox, make it necessary that the District Medical Officer of Health should be in touch with the members and thereby create public opinion on the subject. If the honourable member has any suggestion to make, Government will, as it always does, welcome it in writing.

#### MANDI HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME.

**1600. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) the cost per unit of the electricity to be produced by the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme ;



- (b) whether it is a fact that the estimated cost per unit of the Mysore State Darbar Scheme is cheaper than the cost per unit of the Mandi Scheme;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the Mandi Scheme possesses such natural advantages as are not available to the Mysore Scheme;
- (d) if so, what are the reasons why the cost per unit of the Mysore Scheme will be cheaper as compared with the Mandi Scheme?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) It is estimated that when the Mandi plant is fully loaded the gross average cost of delivery of electricity to high tension consumers will be approximately 8 pies per unit.

(b) The corresponding cost per unit of the Mysore State Scheme is not known to the Local Government.

(c) and (d) The Local Government is unable to make a comparison of the natural advantages possessed by the Mandi and Mysore Schemes, respectively.

#### KANGRA VALLEY RAILWAY.

**1601. Mr. Labh Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Kangra Valley Railway was a necessary adjunct to the Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme;
- (b) what did that Railway cost;
- (c) was that cost borne by the Central Government at the request of the Punjab Government?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) No.

(b) The cost incurred on the construction of the Kangra Valley Railway is a subject on which questions should be asked in another place as Railways are the concern of Government of India;

(c) The proposal to construct the Kangra Valley Railway at the cost of the Central Government did not originate with the Punjab Government.

#### CO-OPERATIVE DEPARTMENT—COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION.

**1602. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of inspectors, sub-inspectors and camp clerks in the Gujranwala and Sialkot divisions of the Co-operative Department in the year 1926, and the number of Hindus, Sikhs and Mussalmans amongst them;
- (b) the number of Hindu, Sikh and Mussalman inspectors, sub-inspectors and camp clerks in the aforesaid divisions who were punished by or on the report of Chaudhri Abdul Hamid, Circle Registrar, during the period extending from April 1927 to September 1927;
- (c) the punishments given to the above-mentioned staff community-wise?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) There were seven inspectors, of whom one was a Hindu, two were Sikhs, and four were Muslims. There were eight camp clerks, of whom four were Sikhs and four were Muslims. Sub-inspectors are not Government servants, and the information is therefore not available ;

(b) No inspector or camp clerk was punished during the period ;

(c) Does not arise.

---

CO-OPERATIVE CENTRAL BANKS—NON-MUSLIM  
REPRESENTATION ON THE DIRECTORATE.

**1603. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that in the Directorate of Central Co-operative Banks in those districts of the province where the Musalmans are in a majority, the Hindu and Sikh element has been reduced ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the Hindu and Sikh co-operators of Gujranwala have started a Central Bank of their own and have applied to the Government for the recognition of the same ;

(c) if so, whether Government has accepted their application ; if not, why ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Government have no information. Central Banks are independent bodies, which receive no grants from Government, and function under their own constitution bye-laws and system of elections. Under the Act there is no provision directing them to supply details of the name and religion of Directors to the department.

(b) Yes, an application has been received.

(c) The Bank has not yet been registered but the matter is under consideration.

---

REPRESENTATION OF SIKHS IN THE STAFF OF CO-OPERATIVE  
CREDIT SOCIETIES.

**1604. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

(a) the number of clerks recruited in the offices of the Registrar, Deputy Registrar and Circle Registrars of the Co-operative Credit Societies since October 1928, and the number of Sikhs amongst them ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the number of Sikh clerks is very small ;

(c) if so, what are the reasons for the same ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The question has necessitated certain enquiries from the local officers whose reply is awaited. The answer will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## INDAURA. PROVISION OF A TELEGRAPH OFFICE.

**1605. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the town of Indaura in tahsil Nurpur, district Kangra, is surrounded by the Beas on one side and by Chakki Khud on the other side during the rainy season resulting in the suspension of all traffic for several days and making it impossible even for the mails to reach the town ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that there is no telegraph office in Indaura, and the public have no means of communication with the outside world when the passages are blocked during the rains ;
- (c) if so, whether Government intend to take any steps to provide a telegraph office in the town of Indaura ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, but the approach to the town is not entirely closed during the rainy season, and the mails are taken across daily from the Nurpur Road Railway Station by the District Board road.

- (b) There is no telegraph office, but there is a sub-office at Indaura.
- (c) Does not arise.

## TENANTS AND LANDLORDS OF CHHUCHAKWAS.

**1606. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether any instructions have been issued to the district authorities about effecting compromise between the tenants and landlords of Chhuchhakwas in the Rohtak district ;
- (b) whether tenants were willing to accept the arbitration of the late Deputy Commissioner ;
- (c) the reasons which led to the failure of compromise being effected ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) No, but attention of the honourable member is invited to Part (b) of Council question No. 1596<sup>1</sup>.

- (b) No.
- (c) Does not arise.

## SARDAR GAJJAN SINGH.

**1607. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please to state—

- (a) whether any representation was submitted last year by Sardar Gajjan Singh, ex-sufedposh, Gurah, Tahsil Sirsa, in the Hissar district, against his dismissal ;
- (b) if so, what action, if any, has been taken on the above representation ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

- (b) None.

**BHIWANI POLICE OFFICER.**

**1608. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the population of Bhiwani town in the Hissar district community-wise;
- (b) the names of sub-inspectors who have been in charge of Bhiwani city police station for the last fifteen years;
- (c) whether any complaints were made to the Deputy Commissioner against the present officer in charge of Bhiwani City police station;
- (d) whether Government intend to put a senior Police Sub-Inspector in charge of this police station?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) According to the Indian Census Report, 1921, the population of Bhiwani town in the Hissar District is as follows :—

Hindus	--	--	..	26,661
Mussalmans	--	--	--	6,110
Sikhs ..	..	--	--	3
Others	..	..	--	496

- (b) A statement is laid on the table.
- (c) No.
- (d) There is no intention of making any fresh appointment at present, the present incumbent having only been in charge for a few months.

*List showing the names of Sub-Inspectors, who have been in charge of Bhiwani city police station for the last fifteen years.*

1. Chaudhary Abdullah Sub-Inspector, No. E.-208.
2. Mirza Yar Muhammad, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-225.
3. Chaudhri Sultan Singh, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-58.
4. Mirza Yar Muhammad, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-225.
5. Lala Shankar Dass, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-100.
6. Chaudhary Abdul Jalil, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-144.
7. Lala Lakhshmi Chand, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-155.
8. Mirza Yar Muhammad, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-76.
9. Raja Jot Ali Khan, Sub-Inspector No. E.-866.
10. Lala Siri Ram, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-108.
11. Raja Joti Ali Khan, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-150.
12. Shaikh Mubarak Ali Shah, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-213.
13. Mian Syed Muhmud, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-273.
14. Mian Mir Muhammad, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-32.
15. Mian Alla-ud-din, Head Constable, No. 158 as Officiating Sub-Inspector.
16. Qazi Kabirul Haq, Head Constable No. 69, as Officiating Sub-Inspector.
17. Chaudhri Sultan Ali, Sub-Inspector, No. E.-266.
18. Qazi Kabirul Haq, Officiating Inspector, No. 70-E.

## SHRINE OF DIUT SIDDHA.

**1609. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** (i) Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that in tahsil Hamirpur of the Kangra district there is the shrine of a well-known deity, known as Diut Siddha, and that thousands of pilgrims from all parts of the country visit this shrine every year;

(b) whether it is a fact that the shrine of Diut Siddha is situated at a distance of about 6 or 7 miles from Barsar;

(c) whether it is also a fact that there is no road leading from Barsar to the shrine of the deity mentioned, and that this causes a good deal of hardship to the pilgrims.

(ii) If the answers to the above be in the affirmative, will Government be pleased to state whether they propose to construct a road from Barsar to Diut Siddha?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Government have no information on the points raised in the question but have instituted enquiries, and will communicate the result to the honourable member in due course.

## NON-GRADUATES AND OFFICE OF EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS.

**1610. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state how many non-graduates have been accepted for the post of Extra Assistant Commissioners during the past three years?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** Under the rules Tahsildars and Naib-Tahsildars and members of certain clerical staffs are eligible for promotion to the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioner even if they are not graduates. In accordance with these rules 22 such officers have been appointed during the past three years. No non-graduate has been successful in the competitive examination or has been selected for Register C which relates to non-officials.

## DISTRICT BOARDS AND PRIMARY SCHOOL, BUILDINGS.

**1611. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) which district boards possess buildings originally built for primary schools, but now not so used;

(b) how many of these originally so built have since been dismantled;

(c) how many of these were built out of Government grants?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The collection of the statistics asked for by the honourable member would involve an amount of labour in the offices of district boards and Deputy Commissioners which appears to Government quite incommensurate with the value of the information asked for. If the honourable member has in mind any cases where buildings constructed out of Government funds for use as school buildings have been diverted to other uses, Government will be glad to have the cases investigated on receiving further particulars. Or if the honourable member has any other object in view, if he will very kindly communicate it to Government, it will receive Government's best attention.

## SIRHIND CANAL.

**1612. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) when was the Sirhind Canal constructed;
- (b) what was its cost?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) It was completed in 1886-87.

(b) On the completion of the Project the total capital outlay (direct and indirect) was :—

			Rs.
British	..	..	2,41,87,125
Contribution	..	..	1,44,67,175
Total			8,86,54,800

## SIRHIND CANAL.

**1613. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) through the territories of what Native States does the Sirhind Canal pass;
- (b) what areas in Native States are irrigated by this canal;
- (c) whether there is any agreement between the Native States and Government as to distribution of water; and, if so, is it on a proportion of the water coming down the canal or on the basis of volume;
- (d) what is the machinery to supervise that the distribution of water is just and equitable?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The Sirhind Canal system passes through the Patiala, Nabha, Jind, Faridkot, Kalsia and Malerkotla States.

(b) Area irrigated, by British Branches is 689,725 acres and by State Branches is 1,629,000 acres.

(c) There is an agreement between the British Government and the Patiala, Nabha and Jind States about the State Branches. The distribution of water is based on the supply in the canal as laid down in the terms of the agreement.

In the case of areas irrigated by the British Branches the distribution is done by the British Government just as in the British territory.

(d) The Executive Engineer, Ludhiana Division, does the distribution between the British and State Branches and the Executive Engineer, Patiala, does the internal distribution between the Patiala, Nabha and Jind States. In both cases the distribution is done under the supervision of the Superintending Engineer; a regular water account under definite rules being kept.

## DIPALPUR AND EASTERN CANALS.

**1614. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Dipalpur and Eastern Canals, which take off at Ferozepore were running during February 1930 ;
- (b) Will any water rate be charged for the area irrigated during the winter ;
- (c) if so, under what rules and orders ;
- (d) what will be the approximate area irrigated ;
- (e) what will be the approximate revenue from this source ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The information is not available at head-quarters and has necessitated enquiry being made from the local officers and the result is awaited. The information when received will be communicated to the honourable member.

## EDUCATION GRANT.

**1615. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing for to year 1928-29 and 1929-30 for the following district boards, Jullundur, Hoshiarpur, Ludhiana, Kangra and Ferozepore—

- (a) the amount of Government grant (excluding that for buildings) for education ;
- (b) the amount of Government grant (excluding that for buildings) as actually received ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is regretted that the reply to this question is not ready.

## WASTE LANDS IN THE SHAHPUR COLONY.

**1616. Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue kindly state what steps have Government taken to carry out the assurances given by him on the resolution regarding waste lands in the Shahpur Colony area brought forward for discussion in the last session of the Council on 26th November 1929 ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Enquiries have been made from the local officers, whose report is awaited.

GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—*contd.*GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (RESERVED)—*contd.*

**Mr. President :** The Council will resume discussion on the amendment of Sardar Hira Singh Narhi, relating to the presidents of district boards.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** [South-East Rohtak (Non-Muhamadan) Rural] : Sir, the question which this Council was discussing on the last working day related to the appointment of non-official presidents of district boards. The present situation stands thus. Every district board

[ R. S. Ch. Chhotu Ram. ]

which has 75 per cent. of its members returned to it by the system of election has the right to elect a non-official president provided the board at a special meeting passed a resolution for having a non-official president by a majority of 60 per cent. of the members present. While discussing the present situation, the Honourable Minister made it perfectly plain that the object which the mover of this cut had in view had his full sympathy. Some of the members who spoke last on this subject seemed to have misunderstood the real significance of the latter portion of the speech of the Honourable Minister. In that portion, he wanted to draw the attention of the House to certain practical difficulties which stood in the way of giving non-official presidents to all district boards. By making that speech he did not mean to whittle down the sympathy he had already expressed, but what he wanted was that the House should not ignore some very serious difficulties which really existed in the way of the fulfilment of that object. I may remind the House that it was in the time of the present Minister for Local Self-Government that the franchise for the district board elections was very substantially lowered. Previously, only those who paid an annual revenue of Rs. 15 had the right of vote, but now this amount has been reduced to Rs. 5. Further, every person who pays professional tax has been given the right of vote. From this alone one can reasonably draw the inference that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government is in full sympathy with the extension of the principle of local self-government all round. While, however, we cannot overlook the difficulties which stand in the way of giving non-official chairman to all district boards, we cannot shut our eyes to the fact that there is an insistent demand for provincial autonomy. Now, a demand for provincial autonomy and a refusal to give non-official presidents to district boards do not go well together. However, let us remember that half the district boards of this province are not in a position to find men sufficiently competent to discharge the duties of a chairman. If, however, we insist upon provincial autonomy as we should, we should place ourselves in a position to find a sufficient number of competent men to take charge of district boards.

This argument was advanced by several members who spoke on the motion and it is not easy to meet. However, I have no doubt that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government is in full sympathy with the object which the mover of this cut has in view, and I am sure he will take an early opportunity to call a meeting of a few of the members representing various groups in this House, and place his difficulties before them. Those who are invited to that meeting will then have an opportunity of convincing him of the need, perhaps the urgent need, of giving non-official chairman to some more districts. When that meeting is held, it will be open to various members to press their views, and it will then be for the Honourable Minister to put forward the difficulties which he sees in the way of giving non-official presidents and ask for suggestions as to how those difficulties could be removed. Lastly, I think that it will not be difficult to find means of relaxing some of the conditions regulating the grant of the privilege of having non-official presidents at as early a date as possible.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** [South East Towns (Muhammdan—Urban) (Urdu)]: Sir, the honourable member who has just preceded me has in



his speech offered certain suggestions as to how we can possibly remove the difficulties confronting us at present. But in spite of that, he has ignored certain aspects of the question under consideration. The Honourable Minister has drawn the attention of the House to some difficulties that stand in the way of giving a practical shape to the wish of the honourable members. I admit there are difficulties and we cannot ignore them. No doubt, they are there, but we are not justified in calling them insurmountable. The honourable member representing Rohtak said that the franchise had been lowered. I thank the Government for lowering the franchise. They have done well because it was a right that legitimately belonged to the craftsmen and could not be kept back from them. Then the same honourable member exulted over the fact that the franchise qualifications of zamindars had also been extended. That also is a very good thing and for that the credit goes to the Honourable Minister. But notwithstanding all this, our difficulty remains the same, not solved in the least. In the first instance, the question is whether this principle is or is not adoptable? Secondly, what are the difficulties that stand in our way and how are we to overcome them? The predecessor of the Honourable Minister found a solution of these difficulties and took steps to adopt it. He began by appointing two non-official presidents. But after him no one tried to follow in his footsteps. This was done in 1925 and since then five years have passed. During this time Government ought to have extended this principle at least to five or six more district boards. Whenever Government are requested to replace the official presidents by non-official presidents, they always vehemently raise the objection that efficient persons are not forthcoming. I admit that if we try to appoint non-official presidents of the boards in the beginning we will have to confront this difficulty, but as time passes, better and better people would be coming forward to discharge these duties. Efficiency and ability are things that can be acquired by diligence and application. How can you expect us to do a thing without first giving us a chance to learn it? Sir, I may give a concrete example. The District Board, Lyallpur, decided to take the control of education into its own hands and the department tried to stand in the way of this resolve. The present Secretary, Transferred Departments, who was then the president of the board, recommended the case strongly observing that the chairman of the Education Committee who was a double graduate was quite competent to manage the administration, and that, even supposing that efficiency would slightly suffer in the beginning, it was impossible to adopt a different course in the face of the Government policy of affording every opportunity to the people to get training and experience to enable them for self-government, the ultimate goal. The Government agreed and now the work is carried on without any hitch. It is Government's duty to prepare the people for self-government by giving them training in the departments that are under the control of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government. Without regular training one cannot learn a thing efficiently. Then, Sir, an honourable member dilating upon the difficulties that stand in the way of this proposal, suggested that some limitations may be imposed on the qualifications of the candidates. For instance, we may make a rule that the candidate must not be under-debt. Sir, these are details and this is not the proper moment to discuss them. The present question before the House is whether non-officials may or may not be

[ Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan. ]

appointed presidents of the boards. To this I answer that the Government should appoint non-official presidents of the boards for there is no dearth of able and efficient men in the province.

Then, the Honourable Minister said that if the proposal was accepted and adopted, the collection of the district board taxes would become very difficult. In answer to this, I enquire in what way. The major portion of the taxes consists of local rates. Rules have been framed for the collection of these taxes and these are collected along with land revenue. For the collection of the other district board taxes, it may be provided that they will be collected through the agency of the executive department just like income tax. As regards the remark that if the district boards are taken away from the control of the Deputy Commissioners, the Deputy Commissioners would become malicious and will try to create difficulties in the way of the work of the boards, I cannot for a moment agree with that contention. Deputy Commissioners are members of the I.C.S., and we cannot expect such a thing from them. They would, on the other hand, help the boards a good deal in collecting taxes, etc. The second objection was with regard to the presence of the communal tension. The Honourable Minister has refused to accept our proposal on this ground saying that it is difficult to adopt it so long as relations between the different communities continue to remain strained. When the principle of appointing non-official presidents in district boards was laid down five years back, the communal tension was much more acute than now, but that was not allowed to stand in the way of this advance. Again, Sir, at the time the non-official presidents were appointed to the municipal committees, the communal tension was at its height, but still it did not affect the matter in the least. Moreover, communal friction, I may point out, is present in the towns only and not in the villages. When the Government have given full control to the non-officials over the committees which are in the towns, there is no reason why the same privilege should not be extended to district boards whose membership generally consists of gentlemen from the country and where there is little or no communal friction. The apprehensions of the Government are simply imaginary. I fail to understand this vast deal of self-contradiction on the part of the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government. In the report which he submitted before the Simon Commission jointly with the Honourable Revenue Member, he recommended full autonomy for the province and said that the province was quite fit for it; but when the question of the desirability of appointing non-official presidents of the boards is raised, he at once contradicts himself and says that the province has not still advanced to that stage, and efficient men are not forthcoming to take over charge of the district boards. Then, in another portion of his speech, the Honourable Minister said that the work of the district boards of the Punjab was better as compared with the work of the United Provinces district boards. The credit for this excellent work was given to the Deputy Commissioners, who are presidents of the boards of the province. In a way, this also was a self-contradiction and it would mean that the Honourable Ministers were in every way efficient for controlling all the departments under their care but that their fellow-brethren, their countrymen, were incapable and inefficient even for carrying on the work of the petty district boards. This was

a slur on the capabilities of all non-officials. Since all these statements that were made by the Honourable Ministers were self-contradictory I feel that he did not mean them, and that he would be only too glad to explain himself again. Perhaps he made these remarks under excitement. If so, let him explain them again before the House.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** [Minister for Local Self-Government] : The honourable member stated that I had said that Indians were unfit to be presidents of district boards and that the Deputy Commissioners must continue if district boards were to be run efficiently. I said nothing of the sort. All that I said was that the district boards were working efficiently under the presidency of the Deputy Commissioners, and I heartily appreciated the feelings of the honourable members that they should be replaced by the non-official presidents. But before that could be done there were certain necessary safeguards which this House must take into consideration. I never said that Indians are unfit to look after district boards. I only suggested that there should be certain precautions before you make the change.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Another reason advanced against this proposal was that Indians generally remained busy in their household duties and could not save time to attend to other works as well. This objection is as groundless as the previous ones. When compared with the work of a Deputy Commissioner, the household duties of an ordinary Indian appear absolutely nothing. The Deputy Commissioners have got so many duties that it is difficult for them to attend to them all. I think the Government would do better if they lighten the duties of the Deputy Commissioners by relieving them of the work of the boards. There is no paucity of efficient people to whom this work can be entrusted. To say that there are no capable persons in the province is a lame excuse. When one is entrusted with any work the sense of duty and the sense of responsibility at once develop in him. We have got before us the instance of the Lahore municipality. The Hindus boycotted it and for three continuous years, the Muslims alone did all the work successfully without ever affording even once a chance to the other communities to complain. With responsibility, the sense of duty awakened in them, and they carried on the work of the committee in such a way that there was no objection against their management.

Sir, the honourable member from Sargodha said that since the time non-officials have been appointed presidents to municipal committees, municipal committees have become insolvent. This may be true with regard to the Sargodha municipality, or of a few other municipalities. Previously, when the municipal committees had official presidents, their incomes hoarded up and never spent on works of public welfare. Now, the committees spend their income on works of sanitation, public health and education. These committees are small bodies with small incomes and there is nothing wonderful if they are running into debt. Even the Punjab Government who have got vast resources of income at their disposal are in debt. But this does not prove their inefficiency. On the other hand, it shows that they have undertaken many works of development and to carry them on they have had to borrow money. This is creditable. The same can be said of municipal committees. They undertake works of public welfare and as their incomes are not sufficient to cope with them, they are obliged to go in for loans.

[Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.]

Therefore, Sir, from all points of view the proposal is reasonable and the Government should see their way to accept it. Then, in the end, I once again request the Honourable Minister to explain himself, for I can never believe that he meant what he said. How could he mean a thing which so injured the feelings of his countrymen and which was adverse to the interests of the country? I think, really, he did not mean to say those things, although the words chosen, for expression, were not happy and conveyed the meaning which we have given them. Let him explain his meaning. With these words I support the motion at present before the House.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** [(Revenue Member) (Urdu)]: Sir, it will be admitted that if controversy on a subject is a blessing in some and a source of pleasure in many cases, it grows tiresome and even worse in some cases. It is a blessing when those engaged in that controversy consider the points at issue very calmly and dispassionately, and without imparting any heat into the discussion and after examining all the arguments adduced in favour of or against the issues involved, come to a decision satisfactory and useful to them all. But the debate on a subject becomes very wearisome and troublesome when the parties to that debate unnecessarily rack their brains and try to advance arguments for the mere sake of advancing arguments. Sir, I have always been an admirer of the manner in which honourable members of the House have been making their speeches. I have been listening to the speeches of the honourable member who has just sat down with particular interest and as he happens to be a man of very calm nature, he was seldom in the habit of repeating his arguments. But, to-day, he has repeated the same arguments over and over again quite contrary to his usual practice. (*Laughter*). It should be realised that this is the budget session of the Council. There are only eight days allotted for the discussion of the demands. Four days have already passed and the fifth has begun. We have so far discussed only 12 demands and there are yet about 80 demands to be discussed. It should further be realised that the discussion of the demands relating to the transferred subjects, in regard to which the members of the Council are, as a rule, more particular to offer their suggestions, is yet to begin, and when the discussion of these will be finished, there will still remain 10 or 15 demands to be discussed. He appears to have overlooked these important things to-day. Lest I should fall in the same pit and become a party to the controversy, I shall at once address myself to the subject and say briefly what I have to say with regard to it.

In the first place, I want to make it clear that the subject under discussion does not directly relate to the demand under consideration, and a clean cut decision thereon can hardly be arrived at. The Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government has been asked again and again to give expression to his views on the subject. I wonder why he is being pressed to do so when the demand under consideration has not been moved by him and he cannot address the House again, not being the Member in charge of the demand. However, he has explained to me what his policy is with regard to this matter and as I am in charge of the subject, I shall explain to the House the whole situation on behalf of the reserved as well as the transferred side of the Government. It has been argued that as the Deputy Commissioners have their hands full of work, it is better that they should be relieved of the work which

they have to do as presidents of district boards. It has been urged that their time will thus be saved and they will be able to pay more attention to other important duties. But there, the members are mistaken. They are also mistaken if they think that since the official presidents of the municipalities have been replaced by non-official presidents, much of the time of the Deputy Commissioners has been saved. Under the Municipal Act the Deputy Commissioners are required to supervise the working of the municipalities and they have, therefore, to do from outside what they did before from inside. That takes a lot of their time. In some cases, they have to spend more time than they used to spend previously. They used to look into matters as presidents from inside and even now as Deputy Commissioners, they have still to scrutinise them. Similarly, even if the Deputy Commissioners are relieved of the duties of the chairman of the district boards, they will have to spend, if not more, the same amount of time to see that the district boards are efficiently working. Therefore, this is no argument, to support the claim for the proposed reform. But it does not mean that because this argument is fallacious, Government is not prepared to have non-official presidents for district boards. Government has no wish to oppose the bringing in of non-official presidents in case the Ministry of Local Self-Government, in a constitutional manner, comes to decide that the work of district boards can be safely entrusted to non-official presidents. Government will place no impediments in its way. It will, in that case, readily and willingly withdraw the Deputy Commissioners from the presidency of the district boards. When the people are looking forward to the grant of dominion status in the near future and of provincial autonomy to the provinces, how can the Government insist on the continuance of the official presidents of the district boards without good reasons? (*Hear, hear.*) The House should know that if it had been an easy job to appoint non-officials as presidents of district boards in place of the Deputy Commissioners, it would have been done by me long ago when I was the Minister for Education. I can assure the House that if the difficulties in our way could have been surmounted easily, I would never have left this work uncompleted. There are serious and real difficulties which have delayed this reform. The first difficulty is, and it appears that the members have not realised it, that the area under the jurisdiction of a district board is very large, much larger than that under a municipal committee. There are only two or three large municipalities like that of Lahore and Amritsar. The remaining municipalities are very small and it is not very difficult to manage them. The vakils and barristers in the municipal towns can easily attend to their work in their leisure hours. But the case of a district board is quite different. It may extend to 50 miles and even much more, from the headquarters. Any one ready to discharge the duties of a president of a district board satisfactorily, as the office carries no remuneration, must have independent means and ample time to spare. Some of the honourable members have taken great pains to show that Indians are capable of shouldering any kind of responsibility. That is not denied. It was not necessary for them to take this trouble to establish that. Neither I nor Malik Sahib has questioned their capabilities. We admit that they are quite capable of performing efficiently any responsible duty. But the difficulty is that there are very few Indians who are capable, and at the same time, free from all anxieties in the matter of earning their

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazli-Husain.]

livelihood. It has been said that I, who am an Indian, have been able to discharge the duties of a Minister and of a Revenue Member. But to be frank, if I had to perform these duties honorarily, I would not have been prepared to take them up. We have no doubt that if such capable Indians are available whom God has provided with sufficient means to serve honorarily, they will prove quite efficient if they were to take up the duties of presidents of district boards. But, as I have said before, such men are not easily forthcoming.

Honourable members have failed to realise another difficulty that stands in the way of the proposed reform being carried out. The work of self-government is not an easy job. No one can carry on the duties of a president unless he has the support of the members of the district boards. Honourable members know much better than I do that some of these members themselves are not prepared to support non-official presidents. They are, in fact, opposed to the appointment of non-officials as presidents. The district boards used to contain much larger nominated and official element, and not only was the proportion of the elected members very small but the franchise was very high, and so they represented but a small class. Again there were and there are factions and parties, and each party is afraid lest a member of the other party, if appointed president, should use his powers against their interests. Similar feeling has been exhibited here too on many occasions. Is it not a fact that on many occasions when an attempt has been made at investing a non-official with the powers of an officer of the Government, opposition has been offered by many of the non-official members? (*Laughter*). It is admitted that it is a fact and, therefore it is not very difficult to understand the opposition on the part of some members of district boards to the proposed reform. All the same, it does not mean that Government is taking or it wants to take undue advantage of such feelings. I admit that it is the duty of the Government to create circumstances favourable to this reform in spite of these difficulties, and the members will be glad to know that Government is doing all it can to create favourable circumstances. I and the Malik Sahib do not claim any credit for what we have been able to do in this direction, but it should be remembered that we have been doing all that is in our power to do. The circle, which each elected member now represents has, since the reforms, been reduced in size, and the electorates widened. And, after me, the Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon, has lowered the franchise further inasmuch as the zamindars, who pay Rs. 5 as land revenue, are now entitled to vote for the district boards whereas only such zamindars could vote previously as were paying Rs. 15 or more as land revenue. I can assure the House that no effort has been spared to bring about the desired state of affairs. I can also assure the House that wherever capable men will be forthcoming to be elected as presidents of district boards and a reasonable number of members of district board concerned express their desire to have a non-official president, Government will be only too glad to withdraw the Deputy Commissioner from the presidency of that district board. The Deputy Commissioners, there is no valid reason to believe, will oppose this reform. They have not opposed it before, so far as my personal experience in several districts goes. When I was Minister I had many talks with members

of various district boards. In the case of some district boards the members expressed their desire to have non-official presidents in my presence, but after I had left them and come back to the head-quarters, they would come and say that I should postpone complying with their wishes. Sometimes, I was actually annoyed at this attitude of theirs. But, on all these occasions, the Deputy Commissioners never opposed this reform. It will, therefore, be realised that opposition has often come from the members themselves. But in spite of that, Government has been trying to introduce the reform. I have now been asked to inform the House that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government intends to convene a meeting of the Standing Committee of the Council on Local Self-Government and to place this question before that committee. This question will be thoroughly discussed in that committee and the suggestions that will be made will be thoroughly examined. I hope that this will satisfy the members of the House. I cannot say more than that at this stage on the subject and I hope that the members will also realise that nothing further can be said at present. In view of what I have said, I think that the House will not further press this matter.

**Sardar Hira Singh, Narli (Urdu):** Sir, it appears from what the

3 P. M.  
Honourable the Revenue Member has said that some changes are going to be effected in the present state of affairs, and that the number of non-official presidents is going to be increased in the near future. In view of that assurance and also of the fact that a good many amendments are still to be considered, I think I need not press my amendment any further. Therefore, I beg leave to withdraw it.

The amendment was, by leave, withdrawn.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** May I just venture for a moment to interrupt the further proceedings? We started the discussion of the demand for General Administration (Reserved) on the last day but one. I am not sure whether the two days' limit has not been exhausted. It, however, depends upon what interpretation is put upon the word 'day.'

**Mr. President:** As we sit for four hours daily, our day is of four hours, and thus the discussion of a demand should not exceed eight hours. I may add that debate on the demand under discussion shall end at 4-47 P.M. to-day.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** May I point out that your ruling is not quite correct? You may be aware that this point was discussed before and the conclusion arrived at was that the two days' limit does not come into operation unless under the express orders of His Excellency the Governor.

**Mr. President:** Has not the honourable member seen the *communiqué* issued by His Excellency the Governor under Article 118 of our Business Manual?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** I do not think any mention is made in the *communiqué* about the time limit.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain:** May I read the *communiqué* for the information of the honourable member? It reads as follows:—

In accordance with the provisions of the Punjab Legislative Council Rules, His Excellency the Governor has been pleased to allot 8 days for the discussion of the Government demands for grants under the various heads of the budget. Of the days allotted not more than 2 days shall be devoted to the discussion of any one demand.



**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** [Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana, (Muhammadan), Rural]: Sir, I beg to move—

“That the total grant be reduced by Rs. 1.”

Honourable members of the House are aware that a resolution for the exemption of the sword from the operation of the Arms Act was passed in the year 1924 and in the years 1925 and 1926, similar resolutions were passed and the Government was even censured for not adopting the suggestions made by the members of this Council. In the year 1927 I even made the remark that if the Government was not going to accept this resolution—which, after all, was not a very important one—how can we expect from this Government that we will be granted provincial autonomy or dominion status? The Honourable Leader of the House was then pleased to say that the Government was ready to exempt the sword from the operation of the Arms Act, but because there was communal tension in the province, Government could not agree to exempt the sword in all the districts from the operation of the Act. Now, there are eighteen districts in the province which are exempted from the operation of the Arms Act so far as swords are concerned. This year one case has been brought to the notice of the District Magistrate, Lahore. One Congress volunteer came to the Lahore district with a sword from the Gujranwala district where the sword is exempted from the operation of the Arms Act. That case has since been withdrawn, but there is another which is still pending; and unless the Government exempts the sword from the operation of the Arms Act throughout the province, such cases no doubt will recur. I say, Sir, that the exemption of the sword is not a demand which needs to be urged so seriously by me because the sword is not a weapon of offence or defence. But I put that because I want to make it clear to the public that here is a Government which after five years of continued agitation would not exempt swords from the operation of the Arms Act throughout the province in spite of the fact that in 1924 Government did not raise a dissentient voice against the resolution, and in spite of the fact that the Government was censured in 1926-27 by this honourable House. At that time the Government only put the plea that there was communal dissension in the province and that therefore they could not carry out the resolution in full. Now, Sir, that lame excuse has been removed and there is absolutely no communal dissension at present, but in spite of that, Sir, you know that in this very session the honourable the Leader of the House in answer to my question said that in five more districts Government was going to exempt sword from the operation of the Arms Act. Is it not, Sir, a huge joke? I characterize it as a joke and I will show that the Council is also a joke—a very expensive joke. You are giving travelling allowances, you are giving high salaries to the Ministers and you invite our criticisms, you say that our resolutions and criticisms will be accepted; when you say all that, why don't you act upon them? Mahatma Gandhi in his very memorable resolution said that here in India the nation is tyrannized by a foreign bureaucracy which has made cowards of us all by taking away arms from us. Sir, I thought that by the exemption of sword, Government will say: here is the resolution.



of this honourable House and we have acted upon it, and if another resolution of a similar kind for the exemption of other kinds of arms is brought before the House, we will act upon that resolution as well. But, when after five years the Government has not been able to exempt even the sword from the operation of the Arms Act, what other exemptions can we expect from this Government? You, see, Sir, the communities that had already been enjoying the right of keeping swords have been absolutely peaceful, and I do not know of any communal disturbance in which swords have been used. I know no communal riot in which people have used swords. I know, Sir, that the *lathi* is a more dangerous weapon than the sword now-a-days. But, Sir, in spite of that, Government say that there is communal tension, and that therefore the exemption of swords throughout the province cannot be allowed.

Now, Sir, there are 18 districts which were granted exemption for swords from the operation of the Arms Act. There is not a single district and there is not a single case, as far as I know, of any murder or any communal riot or any sectional riot in any of these districts in which swords have been used, and even if there be any case, any solitary case, that does not mean that there would be any danger to public peace if the exemption were extended. I think, Sir, that there is absolutely no ground for the Government refusing to exempt other districts. You know, Sir, that the resolution was passed in 1924 and it is now 1930, and there are many districts that are not exempted even now. Perhaps, in the next reforms when provincial autonomy is granted, it would be left to responsible Ministers to exempt the sword from the operation of the Arms Act. Does it not mean, Sir, that we should not have any confidence in the present administration? Have not the people outside enough reason to say and believe that the present administration and those gentlemen who are at its head do not listen to the reasonable arguments and to the reasonable demands of the people, though the demands have never been refuted or disagreed to by the official benches. For, this is the demand which has been agreed upon by all parties irrespective of their political creed. There was not a single member who dissented to the demand. Even the honourable the Leader of the House in the year 1927 expressed that—

“I recognize that the Indian sentiment on the question of swords or on the question of arms generally is one which I for one have always shared, appreciated and even admired.”

After expressing these lofty sentiments, appreciating and admiring the people's view, the Government has not yet been able to exempt all the districts from the operation of the Arms Act. I do not want to deal at any length with this question which has already been agreed to. But I must say, Sir, that these are the ways in which the people get disappointed with the Government. I know, Sir, had the Government been reasonable, had the Government appreciated the unanimous demand of this House, the people outside would not have had to pass the independence resolution, so that they may be masters of their own homes, and their country may prosper and people may use arms for defence or offence. It is quite natural, Sir, that if the Government will go on doing such acts, will go on refusing the united demands of the people, the fury against Government no doubt will be awakened, and you will, as I have said before, find more followers with Mahatma Gandhi than with the

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

present Government. With these words, Sir, I commend my amendment for the favourable consideration of this House.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration. Amendment moved is —

“That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1.”

**Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie** (Home Secretary) : Sir, the honourable member's speech appeared to me to be divided into two parts, one an attack on Government and the other a defence of the sword. As regards the second part, I think I heard him say that the sword was neither a weapon of offence nor of defence. I presume that he meant that the sword was a non-violent weapon. I cannot say that I agree with him there, for I have seen the effects of a well-wielded sword on more than one occasion, and I must say that they are far more serious than the majority of wounds inflicted by *lathi*, which, according to the honourable member, is a more formidable weapon than the sword. He said also that the sword had never been used by those to whom the law allows its unfettered possession for murder or for taking part in communal disturbances. In both these assertions he is unfortunately and demonstrably wrong. As regards murder a substantial proportion of those which are committed in this province are committed with this weapon. As regards communal disturbances, one does not wish to rake up old and unhappy memories, but as the honourable member has himself mentioned, it unfortunately is my duty to contradict him and say that as short a time ago as 1927, the terrible riots that took place in the city of Lahore were started by people who employed this weapon.

I now come to the attack which the honourable member made upon the Government. He stated that Government paid no attention to the unanimous demand of the House, had flouted its wishes and that its attitude towards this question could be held to be an example of its general attitude towards the wishes put forward by this honourable House. In 1924, the question first came up, and it was then made clear that Government was entirely at one with the House in desiring that the existing restrictions upon the use of the sword should be totally removed. But Government has to take account not only of the desires of the House, and of its own desires, but also of its responsibility. Therefore, Government then held that the time was not then, unfortunately, ripe. In 1926, however, it was decided that a start could be made and accordingly all jagirdars with jagirs of over Rs. 50, all income-tax payers, all persons paying land revenue of over Rs. 50, and all Government servants drawing salaries of Rs. 250 or over were totally exempted from taking out licences for swords. That was a very substantial step. In 1927 the matter again came up, and the Honourable Member for Revenue then stated that unfortunately the internal condition of the province was then such that the chances of bringing the desire of the House as regards the freedom of the sword into effect were less promising than they had been two years before. That he was only too right, too correct, in his estimate of the position was clearly shown in the terrible disturbances which shortly after broke out in Lahore and in Multan. It was nevertheless thought possible almost before the echoes of those disturbances had died away to make a start in those parts of the province which had been unaffected, and accordingly, in 1927, all restrictions on the sword were removed in Mianwali, Dera-

Ghazi Khan, Muzaffargarh, Jhang, Hissar and Ambala. In 1928 the position was again reviewed, and then it was decided that a further advance might be made. Accordingly the following districts were exempted in addition: Rohtak, Jullundur, Gurdaspur, Sialkot, Jhelum, Ludhiana, Gujranwala and Attock. Since then all restrictions were removed from the sword in all these districts. The matter was even then under the anxious consideration of Government, and it has been decided that five more districts, Lyallpur, Shahpur, Hoshiarpur, Sheikhupura and Montgomery could also be free from all restrictions. A recommendation to that effect has gone to the Government of India, and there is every reason to hope that in a short time orders will be received. The position will then be that in 29 out of 29 districts in the province, the sword is totally free from all manner of restrictions and in the remaining six, what may be roughly described as wholly of the upper and middle classes of the province, are also free from all manner of restrictions as regards the possession of the sword. I think that that shows clearly enough that Government cannot be held to have ignored the wishes of the House in this matter.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, I am very sorry to see that the honourable member who has spoken has not cited all the cases in which *kirpan* had been used. He gave just one instance, and I think that that solitary instance is not sufficient to prove his case. I can quote thousands of cases where *lathi* has been used with more dangerous effects. Does it then mean that because the *lathi* has been so used restrictions ought to be placed on it? In 99 cases out of 100, the *lathi* is used in committing murder, but yet, the Government are not afraid of that weapon, but are anxious not to exempt the province as a whole in respect of the sword. What is the cause of that? To me there seems to be no reason for the Government to be at all afraid, but the Government, as a rule, is suspicious, being a foreign Government, of the people, and feels nervous to grant those concessions which are not already enjoyed by the people of this country. It is this suspicion alone on the part of the Government that is responsible for the continuance of this restriction. Otherwise, as I have put it, many a time before this House, the sword cannot be held to be a dangerous weapon as against the Government or against one community or another, effectively. I assure you, Sir, that when I tabled this cut, it was not with the hope of any benefit that would ensue to the people by the removal of these restrictions so much as to let the people know and realise how the present bureaucratic Government is absolutely unsympathetic to the national demand and that the removal of the restrictions cannot be brought about unless the Government is brought to their knees by the constant opposition and agitation of the people so as to grant them Dominion Status. That, Sir, was my object in bringing this motion. In fact, the Government are playing into my hands by refusing to make this concession. This is not the only resolution of mine, but there are four on the list which will go to prove that Government are not going to yield to constitutional agitation of the constitutional people. It looks as if unconstitutional agitation will perhaps bring good sense to the Government. In 1929 no exemptions were made because there was no agitation, no resolution brought before the Council. Now that I have tabled this cut, Government have been pleased to state that five more districts would be exempted. I ask the House, can it be considered to be respecting the demands

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

of the House on the part of a Government to exempt five districts after being censured thrice? Really the Government are indulging in a joke when they claim to have acceded to our demand. Five districts in one year, three in another! If this progress is continued we fail to imagine what will be the fate of our other demands. The Government knew it perfectly well that the repeal of the Arms Act has been one of our immediate demands, and so far as it lies within their power to do in this direction, this Government will not even exempt the sword from the provisions of that Act in the province as a whole. The Government knows it full well that this constitution is not to last more than two years, and in spite of that, it has not chosen to exempt the sword from the Act. We are here given sermons on the wishes of the House being respected by the Government on many occasions. I remember my honourable friend representing the European class once saying that if Government indulges in such jokes and not yielding to the reasonable demands of the House, the members of the House will be irresponsible. A sense of irresponsibility will be the result, far from a feeling of responsibility. Is it not open to an honest member of this House to criticise Government on this attitude? I do not want to deal at length with the several instances in point, but suffice it to point out just one case, the separation of the judiciary from the executive. As we all know since 1921, this House has been passing resolutions demanding the separation. What has been the fate of the resolutions? What, again, has been the fate of other resolutions of a similar kind? In the face of this attitude on the part of the Government, what is the course open to us? To disobey its laws? If we do so, the Government and some honourable members here will accuse us of being unconstitutional. But when constitutional agitation is of no avail as against the Government, I ask, what is the remedy? This kind of agitation, call it unconstitutional if you like, will go on till the Government changes its attitude.

With these words, I think that this honourable House will accept my cut and censure the Government for not accepting the suggestion made by this House time and again.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** (Finance Member): Sir, the House has heard from the Home Secretary what Government has done in this matter, and I think that is really, although the honourable member would not admit it, a very considerable answer to what he has stated while moving the cut. If this note to the cut means anything at all, I think that the object of the cut has been largely attained. We have here the note—"to urge the exemption of swords from the operation of the Arms Act." As Mr. Ogilvie has shown, there are only six districts in which the Act is now in force as regards swords, and those are, Lahore, Amritsar, Rawalpindi, Multan, Karnal and Ferozepore. Whatever the honourable member may think, there is a considerable body of opinion which is inclined to doubt the entire disappearance of communal tension. As regards the district of Karnal, in Panipat there was considerable apprehension a few days ago which arose out of some communal dispute. Luckily, trouble was averted, and in the end there was nothing to regret or to feel ashamed of. But there is still considerable evidence of communal tension. As regards Lahore,

Amritsar, Rawalpindi and Multan I need not allude to the incidents which have occurred in the last three or four years.

As regards Ferozepore, as everybody knows, it is inhabited by an extremely active, energetic and occasionally, I regret to say, aggressive population. And it also borders on Indian States to whom we have certain duties to discharge. It does not seem to me, Sir, that this is the time to give further exemptions in spite of the honourable mover's assertion that it is a weapon which is fit neither for offence nor for defence. I think the honourable member may be congratulated on the constitutional methods he has adopted to remove the restriction from a large portion of the province. But far from attacking the Government, I think he might be content with showing that his own constitutional methods have to a great extent succeeded in getting for him what he wanted.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration. The question is :

"that the Demand be reduced by Re. 1."

The motion was lost.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I want a division.

**Mr. President :** After collecting the 'Ayes' and 'Noes' I said : "I think the 'Noes' have it", and waited to find whether my view was accepted or challenged. When no one disputed my opinion, I said : the "Noes have it."

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** When you decided that 'Noes' have it, I at once stood up, and it seems to me that that was the proper time, Sir.

**Mr. President :** The proper time for claiming division was *after* I had said : "I think the Noes have it," and *before* I declared : "the Noes have it." After saying : "I think the Noes have it," I paused to see if anyone challenged that view, and when no one challenged it, I declared "the Noes have it." According to his own admission the honourable member's challenge was too late.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, I move :

"that the total grant be reduced by Re. 1."

My object is to criticise the Government for the slackness of control and consequent corruption in the departments under its control.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is welcome to do so.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** [Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana, Muhammadan, Rural] (Urdu) : Sir, in 1924 by a cut it was proposed that Government should adopt some effective measure to put a check to corruption which was enormously prevalent in all departments, especially in police. Since then, full six years have passed, but still the evil is as rampant in all the departments as it was before. There is not even a single department in which corruption does not abound.

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** On a point of order, Sir, may I ask if the honourable member is going to complain about corruption in the services included in this demand or whether his discussion is going to range over all the departments of Government ?

**Mr. President :** Services not included in the demand should not be discussed under this demand.

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** Then I think he will confine himself practically to the discussion of corruption in I. C. S., and the P.C.S. of the Executive branches.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, I may be allowed to discuss all the departments that come under this demand. The Honourable Member's pay is included in this demand, and therefore, I am entitled to discuss his department as well and also all those other departments which are affected by it. In short, Sir, I have thought over this point and am confident that I can extend my remarks to all the departments of Government.

**Mr. President :** In other words, the honourable member's intention is to criticise all services and departments covered by the demand.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, on this question all the House agrees. In 1924 Sir John Maynard, the then Leader of the House, said, that the presence of corruption in the various departments was not only harmful to the public but also disgraceful for the Government that allowed it and did not try to put a check to it. These words uttered at that time in sincerity removed all my doubts regarding the *bona fides* of the Government. At that time I thought that I was not justified in suspecting the policy of the Government. Perhaps I may not be even now justified in blaming the Government for undue negligence or connivance. But at the same time, since the Government have inadvertently allowed the evil to continue, one cannot also praise them. At various times we have brought this matter to the notice of the Government and have shown how the Government officers force the petty as well as the big zamindars to give them bribes. But it appears that all our requests fall on deaf ears for Government have never tried to uproot this evil. But still as it is our duty to bring all objectionable matters to their notice, we cannot stop our clamours, and it is their outlook to think whether our requests are or are not worth hearing.

قاصد کے آتے آتے خط ایک اور لکھ رہوں

میں جانتا ہوں جو وہ لکھیں گے جواب میں

Perhaps the Government may again retort "Whose brothers are they?" If so, we can give the same ready reply that was given on the previous occasion, that is, that the Government set the dogs at the hare and when they kill it they say "Very sorry, but why did it not run hard to save its life? It is no fault of the dogs." Sir, another reply to our criticism that often is returned from the Government benches is that we should try to ask the people not to tempt Government servants by bribes. No doubt, if the people desist from offering bribes, the Government servants cannot force them to offer bribes. But the question is whether to control 98 crores from offering bribes is easy or whether to control a few officers (say at the most 1 per cent. of the population) from accepting bribes is easy? You cannot as easily reform all the people as you can a few. As I have said, I never doubted the *bona fides* of the Government before. I always thought that there were actual practical difficulties that stood in the way of the Government and did not allow them to make an effort to uproot this evil. But now after seven years' experience of the Council I regret to say that I have to change

my views. I no longer have any faith in the words of the Government. They have hopelessly disappointed me. They never took pains to reform their corrupt officers. From their negligence, from their indifference, from their inadvertence one cannot help inferring that they knowingly encourage corruption. If corruption can be effectively checked in the Jail department, it can as well be checked in all other departments only if the Government exert themselves and make a sincere effort in this direction. In 1926 they made a half-hearted attempt to stop corruption in the Jail department and they succeeded. There is no reason why this evil cannot be put a stop to in all the other departments only if the Government set themselves to it. After the Irrigation department, Police is the next department in which this evil is more rampant. If an honest superintendent is appointed to a district his mere presence there discourages the evil and no sub-inspector dares to accept bribes. But all his work is undone as soon as he is transferred from there to some other district. One year the Government issue instructions to their officers to discourage corruption. They, in response, become more cautious and actually succeed to some extent to uproot it. The next year Government forget their previous year's resolve and become inert. The officers since they receive less poking in their sides, think their duty done and become less zealous in stopping corruption. In this way one year's work is undone in the next and the suppressed evil springs up again with a double force and spreads twice as much as it did the year before. Notwithstanding all his faults we cannot help praising Sir Michael O'Dwyer in this respect that he tried to put down this evil with an iron hand. He sent the corrupt officers to jail, and did all that a strong ruler need do to effect the reform. At that time the Extra Assistant Commissioners and the other executive officers had become so cautious that they shunned even to see their near relatives fearing that they might not be suspected of accepting bribes through their agency. But now, times have changed. The present is the time of quarrels over 40 per cent. and 50 per cent. representation. The Government is sure of the support, if not of the one, of the other party, and therefore, do not regard it worth while to do things properly. Sir, I may say that this agitation which is afoot at present in the country is mainly due to the presence of corrupt officers. They trouble the people, they press them and squeeze money out of them. They suffer, and it is but natural that they should raise a great hue and cry. Through you, Sir, I would like to request the Government that in the coming years they should make their sincere efforts to eradicate corruption. They tried to put down the corruption in the Jail department and have succeeded. We congratulate them over this success and request them to do the same in the case of the other departments. Some time back in this very House I was asked by the Government to tell the names of the corrupt officers. In answer, I said that I was ready to name them provided the Government gave an assurance to the effect that they would prosecute them. At that time I had challenged the Government to falsify my statement. I again repeat what I had said at that time. Really it would be cowardly on my part not to name them for fear of them. These Government officers suck the life-blood of the people. Let the Government stop corruption before we adopt unconstitutional methods to stop it. I give one or two years to the Government to eradicate corruption and if in this period nothing is done, I will bawl out the truth from



[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

public platforms. I will denounce the Government and their policy before the people. I will make public the names of corrupt officers. Let Government prosecute me and send me to the jail for that. If my sacrifice, if a little trouble on my part, can save my countrymen from the clutches of this great evil, I will willingly offer myself to do that sacrifice and to suffer that trouble. If the sacrifice of an individual can save a race, then I will be that individual. I will accuse the Government and their policy. I will question their *bona fides*; I will bring them into contempt with the public, if they failed to eradicate corruption within the two years which I would allow them. Let them punish me, I will not tender an apology or an appeal for mercy. Let Government adopt measures to remove this evil before that happens. With these few words, I commend my motion to the House.

**Mr. E. Maya Das :** May I ask what device this honourable member has discovered which he proposes to make use of?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I thank the honourable member for inviting my attention to this. This question has always been put and always been answered. I ask, whose function is it to find out means for eradicating corruption? It is Government's duty to stop corruption, and consequently it is the duty of the highly paid Government officers to find out the means by which they can best effect it.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is making another speech. Will he please point out the ways by which, according to him, corruption can be stopped?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, I am really very sorry at this attitude of the Government. It is not long ago when the Police Enquiry Committee made proposals to check corruption in the Government departments. If Government had accepted even those suggestions much of corruption would have been stopped.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

"That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1."

**Mr. H. W. Emerson (Chief Secretary) :** Sir, the House has had opportunity on many occasions to observe and study the methods of the honourable mover of this cut. His usual methods are two: firstly, the abuse of Government, and, secondly, the threatening of Government. In regard to the threatening of Government the Honourable the Leader of this House had a few words to say not many days ago. He pointed out to the honourable member that it was really a little foolish to give a threat which he is not able in practice to carry out. I think members of this House are getting a little weary of being told time after time that unless Government does this or that then the time will come when it will be forced to do it. Time after time we are being told that, unless constitutional means are adopted for carrying out certain reforms or remedies put forward by the honourable member, unconstitutional means will be adopted. Now, in regard to the subject under discussion the constitutional remedy—and really the only effective remedy—towards the eradication of corruption is now in the process of being applied, namely, the constitutional method of forming public opinion against this evil which not only lowers the standard and efficiency of



the public services, but which is the cause of endless trouble and oppression to the people. This method has been in progress ever since this Council came into creation; and the most hopeful sign that, sooner or later, a remedy will be found for this evil is, that in this House the subject does attract attention and is openly condemned from every quarter. It is, in any discussion on corruption, I think, necessary to remember that dishonesty does not always take the form of a Government officer running after a private individual and compelling him to give a bribe, either by threatening him that if he does pay him money he (the officer) will withhold from him some service which it is the duty of the officer to perform, or will inflict on him some misfortune which the officer has within his power to inflict. There is another form of corruption. That is the form in which the public themselves go to the officer and in order to obtain some advantage to themselves offer him money. Not many days ago, the honourable member for Gujrat made mention of that form of corruption in discussing the question of *khara*. That is one instance of it. Other instances will occur to members of this House. Now although this House does condemn that form just as much as it condemns the worst form of blackmail and intimidation, yet it does seem to be a fact that the condemnation of this House has not yet succeeded in so forming public opinion as to impose a moral stigma on the acts of these private persons who seduce our officers by offering them inducements either to misuse or abuse their power. I wish to make it clear that Government itself makes no distinction between any acts of corruption. It condemns them all; and it desires to eradicate them. (*Hear, hear*). But, if I mention the different classes of corruption it is merely to illustrate the point that without the most hearty and complete co-operation of the public, Government cannot itself kill the evil. It can take steps to palliate and to mitigate it; and those steps it has taken and is taking.

There is one other general observation I would like to make. Government has from time to time made it perfectly clear that it is anxious to investigate any well-authenticated complaint against any of its officers. But the complaint must be well authenticated. If we have a duty to the public, we have also a duty to our officers. We cannot undermine the confidence of our services by the investigation of frivolous and anonymous complaints that are not properly authenticated. If any member of the public wishes Government to investigate an alleged case of corruption, then, he must give us facts on which the investigation can proceed, and he must be prepared to substantiate his statements. Anonymous and malicious petitions must be consigned to the waste-paper basket.

The honourable member has asked, what has the Government done in the way of taking measures to root out this evil. One important measure of Government is the very careful selection of its officers, and during recent years, there has been a steady improvement in the qualifications of officers admitted to the higher services. As the House is aware the educational standard of candidates has been consistently raised. And if, as one can only hope, education improves the ideal of public service and of duty, then, in that direction Government is certainly doing all it can. Another means open to Government is give the greatest publicity to the desire and will of Government to combat this evil; and for that reason, it welcomes debates in this House on the question. But one would also ask honourable members

[Mr. H. W. Emerson.]

themselves outside the House to give the greatest publicity to the wishes of Government. The third method is by requiring superior officers to exercise control and supervision over their subordinates. That is one of their most important functions ; and the Government is continually bringing to the notice of their officers the importance that Government attaches to it. The fourth method is by periodical reports on officers. We do have periodical reports of officers, and any officer whose reputation is not as high as it might be is carefully watched. Another method is to keep a check on the acquisition of landed property by officers. The rules in that respect have been tightened up during the last year or two, and an officer is required to report at once to Government any acquisition of land either by himself or by his near relatives. Another method, and one to which the honourable member drew attention, is the necessity of not allowing officers to overlook the instructions of Government. I think the honourable mover in one portion of his speech said that Government issues orders in one year and forgets about them the next year, and all the other officers of Government likewise forget them. There is naturally a tendency to overlook orders unless people are reminded about them, and for that reason, our officers are constantly reminded and are required to report each year the officers against whom action has been taken during the preceding year. In this way the importance that Government attaches to this matter is continually brought to their attention. The last method is by providing an efficient machinery for the investigation of authentic complaints when they are brought to the notice of Government. In that respect great progress has been made during recent years. We have now a panel of retired executive, judicial and police officers from whom a member is selected either to investigate a complaint or to examine it from a judicial point of view and to scrutinise the evidence that is produced. Under that system a number of cases have been more fully investigated than would have been possible had the enquiry been left to departmental officers. We have during the past few years been able to bring home to a number of corrupt officers their guilt and to discharge them from the service.

What I have said, I think, will convince the House that Government has not been idle in this matter, and that it does not deserve the censure which the honourable member would like to move against it. But, as I have said, we must have the co-operation of the public. Without that, Government can do very little.

As regards the general standard of our services, I think it is only right to say that so far as the superior services of Government are concerned—and in that term I include all the provincial services of Government—I do believe that the corrupt officer is the exception and not the rule. There is growing up in our services an *esprit de corps* which stamps the dishonest officer as a person who is not quite respectable. That is the spirit which we want to encourage, and I believe the greatest encouragement of all is by the publicity given to the matter in this House. I would ask the honourable mover, in fairness to Government and in fairness to the services, not to press this motion further. (*Cheers*).

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq (Urdu):** Sir, I am glad that my speech has pricked the side of the Government and to that extent the purpose of my speech

is served. I wanted to remind the Government of its promises to eradicate corruption, and I think I have done it. The honourable Chief Secretary appears to have been very much annoyed by what I said in my speech. Perhaps he thinks that we, the members of the House, are not entitled to arouse the Government to its sense of responsibility towards the public and that it is Government alone which may do or may not do anything for the welfare of the public. We shall not stop to criticise the Government and shall not be satisfied until and unless our grievances are removed. I am sorry that the time at my disposal is very short. But before I take my seat, I shall say that the sweet words used by the Government carry no conviction with us. The methods that are being used by the Government for rooting out the evil of corruption and which have been enumerated by the Chief Secretary, are very old and ineffective, and I shall not be far wrong if I say that Government has done practically nothing to stop this evil.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Government has done nothing to eradicate corruption ! Does the honourable member want the Government to use force to stop this evil ?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq (Urdu) :** Government may not do anything. It is at liberty to do as it likes in the present circumstances. But the time is fast approaching when it will have to submit to our wishes. Consider it a threat or advice or the weak voice of the opposition, but let the Government know that it can not remain indifferent to our requests for a long time to come.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain (Revenue Member) (Urdu) :** Sir, I think there is yet one minute more to put the whole demand to the vote of the House and with your permission, I want to say only one word. I am very sorry to hear from the member opposite that Government has done nothing to eradicate corruption from public services. It is a charge which cannot be substantiated by facts.

**Mr. President :** Time is up, so I must put the demand to the vote of the House.

Demand under consideration, Amendment moved is—

“That the total grant be reduced by Re. 1.”

The question is, that the proposed amendment be made.

The Council divided : Ayes 18 ; Noes 27.

AYES :

Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.  
Sardar Narain Singh.  
Sardar Buta Singh.  
Lala Chetan Anand  
Chaudhri Muhammad Abdul Rahman Khan.  
Chaudhri Afzal Haq.  
Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq.  
Sardar Hira Singh, Narli.  
Sardar Partap Singh.

Sardar Harbakhsh Singh.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Dhanpat Rai.  
Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang.  
Rai Bahadur Lala Sewak Ram.  
Chaudhri Ram Singh.  
Pandit Nanak Chand.  
Chaudhri Baldev Singh.  
Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri.  
Pandit Mehar Chand.

## NOSES :

Col. C. A. Gill.  
 Mr. H. Calvert.  
 Mr. D. Milne.  
 The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan,  
 Noon.  
 Khan Bahadur Nawab Muzaffar  
 Khan.  
 Mr. W. R. Wilson.  
 Mr. R. Sanderson.  
 Mr. W. S. Dorman.  
 Mr. M. A. Ghani.  
 Mr. H. F. Ashton.  
 The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal.  
 The Honourable Sardar Sir  
 Jogendra Singh.  
 The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow.

The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-  
 Husain.  
 Mr. Alam Mitchell.  
 Mr. J. D. Penny.  
 Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie.  
 Mr. H. W. Emerson.  
 Dr. (Mrs.) M. C. Shave.  
 Mr. S. L. Sale.  
 Mr. Owen Roberts.  
 Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram,  
 Kalra.  
 Rai Bahadur Lala Rattan Chand.  
 Chaudhri Ali Ahmad.  
 Khan Bahadur Chaudhri Fazl Ali.  
 Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad  
 Hayat, Qureshi.

Makhdumzada Sayad Muhammad Raza Shah, Gilani.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 93,60,200 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of General Administration (Reserved)."

The motion was carried.

## GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (TRANSFERRED).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** (Minister for Agriculture) : Sir, I beg to move—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 2,10,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of General Administration (Transferred)."

**Mr. President :** The demand moved is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 2,10,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of General Administration (Transferred)."

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir I beg to move—

"That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of 60,000, Pay of Officers—Minister for Education."

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Is the honourable member moving the first part of his amendment or the second part? Sir, the reason why I am putting that question is that for censuring a Minister there is a clear provision in the Rules and these Rules have been amended since the enquiry of 1924 and the new Rule I am referring to is Rule 10-A., Constitutional Manual, page 16, paragraph 52.

**Mr. President :** I did not quite follow the objection of the Honourable Member. Does he object to the use of the word "censure" or the expression "to criticize the policy of the Minister?"

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The objection, Sir, is this. Paragraph 52 provides a special provision under which any Member of the Legislative Council can show his lack of confidence in a Minister. Now the Rules have made it very clear for the honourable members to have recourse to these methods. The motion expressing want of confidence in a Minister or a motion disapproving the policy of the Minister in a particular respect may be made with the consent of the President and subject to the following restrictions, namely :—

(a) leave to make the motion..... etc., etc.

If the object of this motion is to express want of confidence in the Minister and involving, as a consequence thereof, his resignation, then the present motion is not moved in the way in which it ought to have been moved. If the object of the motion is to raise a discussion and nothing more than that, then, of course it rests with you, Sir, to let the discussion take place.

**Mr. President :** Has the honourable the mover of the motion used the expression that he wants to express 'no confidence' in the Minister?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Sir, the first part of his amendment says—

"To censure the policy of the Minister."

**Mr. President :** Is not the policy of a Minister distinct from the Minister himself?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** But, Sir, if you will read paragraph 52.....

**Mr. President :** I have read it. It lays down one of the several ways in which a Minister's policy can be criticised.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I have no doubt that the members of this House will be glad to hear other ways also.

**Mr. President :** On the point under discussion, Sir Alexander Muddiman's Reforms Enquiry Committee expressed the following opinion :—

"At present the local councils may definitely control the action of the Ministers by means of legislation. They may also control their administration by refusing them supplies or by moving the reduction of their salaries. The council, however, normally exercises its powers of appropriation only once a year, and we consider that some further procedure is required. The existing rules appear to us to be defective in this respect as they do not provide for motions of no confidence and other motions of a similar nature. We must not, however, place the Ministers in such a position as would compel their resignation on all occasions when criticisms of their policy are endorsed by the local council. In our opinion the rules should provide for two classes of motions :—

(a) a motion of no confidence; and

(b) a motion questioning a Minister's policy in a particular matter.

The former motion, if carried by the council, should necessarily involve the resignation of the Minister, or of the whole Ministry if it holds itself to be jointly responsible in regard to the particular question. The carrying of a motion falling within the second class should not necessarily involve the resignation of the Minister. It should depend upon the magnitude of the question in issue and the importance which the Minister attached to his policy in regard to it.." (Page 68, paragraph 80).

That is the relevant portion of Sir Alexander Muddiman's Report on the point. As the Council is not expected to discuss the budget throughout the year or at its

[Mr. President.]

every sitting provision is made in paragraph 52 of the Business Manual for occasions other than those on which the Council is discussing the budget. Rule 12-A (paragraph 52), which is based on the aforesaid Report, clearly draws a distinction between the two kinds of motions, viz., a motion expressing lack of confidence in a Minister and a motion disapproving the policy of a Minister in a particular respect.

As to the question, in how many ways a Minister can be criticised, attacked or censured, I think that, apart from the specific motion provided for in paragraph 52 (Rule 12-A), there are several other methods as well.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** May I point out, with reference to the passage in Sir Alexander Muddiman's Report which you have read out to us and which, you have been pleased to observe, has been the genesis of the present rule in our Business Manual, that there is one sentence in that paragraph which reads—

“They may also control their administration by refusing them supplies or by moving the reduction of salaries.”

In case that cut is passed, undoubtedly not having been left any salary, he cannot but go unless he wishes to work as an honorary Minister. Therefore, the question arises whether, where the motion is not for omitting the whole salary of the Minister and directly, in a straightforward manner attacking him, but is a one-rupee cut alleged to be with reference to his policy, you consider that that one-rupee cut is distinct from a cut of the whole salary or that both have the same effect; in other words, whether the one-rupee cut is also one of the five or six methods which you are about to enumerate.

**Mr. President :** If a one-rupee cut is interpreted as a censure, it is not only a one-rupee cut but a cut of the whole salary of the Minister.

On page 206 of his masterly book ‘How England is governed’ the Right Honourable Mr. Masterman says—

“Sufficient here to say that when Government is asking Parliament to provide the money for the carrying on of the work of any department, the House of Commons, first through a Committee, and second when the decision of its Committee is reported to the House, has opportunities given it to attack any suspected delinquencies in that department. The common form is to propose that the salary of the Minister responsible be reduced by, say, fifty pounds, and under such a proposal any action of any one in that department can be attacked, for the Minister is responsible for all.”

\* \* \* If the motion is carried, the unfortunate Minister does not lose fifty pounds of his salary. He loses all his salary, and his colleagues also. For, unless they attempt to reverse what they may interpret as a snap vote, unrepresentative of the real opinion of the House, they must resign. And in any case a succession of such snap votes would ensure their resignation.”

Thus, it does not appear to be very material whether the cut is only nominal or of the whole salary. But if it is of the whole salary, then it would mean that the House wants to reduce the post of the Minister. On the other hand, if it is only of a small amount and is carried, it may be interpreted to mean that the House does not want the Minister concerned. This, I think, is the only difference between the two kinds of reductions.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** You have cleared the matter and absolutely settled the fate of those amendments because knowing

their implications, I have not the slightest doubt that the House would be very careful about them.

**Mr. President :** That is for the House to consider. But as the question is one of great importance and as it arises often, I give the following ruling for future guidance :—

The members of a Provincial Legislative Council can attack or criticise a Minister in the following ways :—

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** May I request, Sir, that this ruling of yours shall be incorporated in our Business Manual ?

**Mr. President :** Rulings are incorporated in the printed proceedings of debates. I shall now enumerate the several methods—

- (1) By questions and supplementary questions ;—
- (2) By a motion of adjournment ;
- (3) By a resolution, the right to move which is determined by ballot ;
- (4) By individual members in the general discussion of the budget. This, however, is not a criticism by the House in its collective capacity, but is a criticism only by one or more individual members ;
- (5) By proposing, in discussion on demands, a reduction in the salary of the Minister concerned. Under such a proposal any action of any one in the department of the Minister can be attacked ;
- (6) By a formal motion expressing want of confidence or disapproving the policy of a Minister in a particular respect.

It would appear that a motion disapproving only the policy of a Minister in a particular respect is in effect different from a motion expressing want of confidence in him, as its object is to express some special grievance or to criticise some special act of the Minister.

- (7) By a formal address to the Governor after motion made and carried in Council.

In the House of Commons in the case of motions amounting to a distinct vote of want of confidence in the Government, proposed or sanctioned by the Leader of the Opposition, it is the practice of the Government to concede an opportunity of discussion. But no such practice existed in India, and hence the Rule 12-A (paragraph 52). The quorum of our Council is 15. So, if only 15 members are present, they can omit the salary of a Minister and abolish his post. A motion under Rule 12-A, an adjournment motion or an ordinary resolution can be moved when the Council is not discussing the annual budget. When grants are under discussion motions for reductions of salaries are most appropriate. But to say that unless there are 30 members and the conditions of Rule 12-A are satisfied, no one can criticise the policy of a Minister, amounts to make the Ministers independent of the Council. When Ministers come before the House for their grants, it is the right and privilege of the House to ask them how they had spent the moneys previously granted to them. If they fail to convince the House,

[Mr. President.]

the House may refuse to vote fresh grants. Thus it is the constitutional right of the House to question and criticise the Ministers, and I; therefore, rule that the motion is in order.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** In view of the ruling that you have given, as one is not aware which of the two motions which stand in the name of my honourable friend on my left he is likely to move, may I be permitted, through you, to submit to the Honourable Ministers that it would be rather inconvenient if honourable members have to vote, at any rate, upon the first of these two motions without fully realising the consequences which may follow from it according to the view which the Honourable Ministers may take of this motion after it is discussed and voted upon; therefore it will help us in deciding what course to adopt during the discussion and subsequent voting if honourable members could be informed as to whether Honourable Ministers deem themselves to be jointly responsible to the House or only individually responsible to the House?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** I think, and my colleagues as Ministers would support me in the statement I am now making, the position is this. The first motion which stands in the name of Chaudhri Chhotu Ram and the second also standing in his name are attempts at attacking me. I do not see how my colleagues come in here at all. That is an attempt at attacking my policy and nothing else. (*A voice:* Individual responsibility?) I think the honour is entirely intended for me.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** This is a very pertinent question and the reply given by the Honourable Minister is not satisfactory at all. He wants to know, the House wants to know, at least some of the honourable members want to know, whether it is joint responsibility of the Ministers or only individual responsibility. That question has not been replied to by the Minister who spoke last on this point.

(*A voice:* Let other Ministers clear the position.)

**Mr. President :** If the House wants my opinion on the question of ministerial responsibility in India, I shall gladly place it before the House.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I have not the slightest doubt that any study you may have been pleased to make of any important constitutional matter will give us much enlightenment, but whether the ministerial responsibility is joint or not, no doubt, Sir, you and the House are aware, that it is a matter which has been left undecided. If I may venture to point out, it is not right for any of us to, more or less, ask you from the Chair to enter into constitutional controversies, especially when they relate to matters which are in the making. I am afraid there is a tendency in some quarters to try to drag the Chair into these controversial matters which are not essential for the disposal of the business of the House.

**Mr. President :** I have no desire to enter into any controversial point. One honourable member said that the solution of the question whether the responsibility of the Ministers is joint or several will enable the members to decide which way they should vote.

**Rana Feroz-ud-Din Khan :** That is not a question to be decided by the Chair.



**Mr. President :** Yes, that is not a point on which I can give a ruling.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Can we not ask the Ministers other than the one against whom this motion is directed, whether if one of them is defeated the others also will go? This will affect the voting in the House. If they say, "No, we shall throw the one under discussion over and take shelter behind closed doors," there will be a difference in voting, and if there is a chance of others also being thrown out of the Ministry then there may be some who will not vote against it.

**Mr. President :** Leave it to them to decide if and when the motion is carried.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Let me complete my statement. On the other hand, the voting may be affected in another way. There may be some who are anxious to throw out the Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal and they may not be anxious or may not be at all desirous of throwing out any one of his colleagues. Well, there may be others who may be anxious to throw them all out. So that instead of asking you to give a ruling as to the joint responsibility or separate responsibility, the question is put to the Honourable Ministers. If they want to answer it they may.

**Mr. President :** I think that question is beyond my jurisdiction.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Yes, that is what I say, but it is for the Honourable Ministers or the Leader of the House, if he can speak for them, to answer.

**Mr. President :** That is a legal question, and I do not think that the difficulty will be solved if they say "yes."

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** We do not go into that question of constitution whether the responsibility is joint or individual. But they certainly know their own minds. They can say : if you turn one of us out, all of us go.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The question whether Ministers other than those attacked should leave or not—I have heard one of the great authorities that you have just read out—depends on the matter attacked and the nature of the debate and the voting. How can what is contingent upon the discussion and the voting be decided upon beforehand, and in any case I have to request the Honourable Ministers in this case not to enter upon this controversy.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** The extract which has just been referred to, I believe, laid down that the consequence of a vote of this description would depend upon the discussion and the voting and the magnitude of the question discussed, that is to say, whether even if the motion is carried, it would or would not amount to such censure as to compel the Ministers or the cabinet to resign. But my question wanted to clear the thing. Supposing that a motion of this kind is carried and supposing that with reference to the magnitude of the question discussed and the speeches delivered and the votes given, it is construed by the Ministry that it is amounting to a censure or want of confidence, then it will affect that particular Minister alone, or, if all the Ministers deem themselves to be jointly responsible for the policy which is being discussed, then it will affect the whole cabinet. This is as I understood one of those

[Ch. Zafrulla Khan.]

extracts which were read out by you, and it was with reference to this second part no doubt that this motion is directed against the policy of the Honourable Minister for Education. That is perfectly clear, and nobody wanted anything of that kind to be explained; surely it may have been left to our own intelligence to see that it is expressly directed to censure the policy of the Honourable Minister for Education, and it is that Honourable Minister alone against whom the motion is directed in case the motion is carried. In case the question is considered to be of great importance, I wanted you to put a question to the Honourable Ministers as to whether with regard to the policy of the Honourable Minister for Education, although this motion is directed against him, the other Ministers deem themselves responsible jointly for this policy or they do not.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** This question was answered by the Honourable Minister for Education himself.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** You know that when the Ministers are appointed the consent of the Ministers is taken that they will work together, and if any Minister thinks that he cannot co-operate with other Ministers the Ministry is not formed.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** Ministers are appointed with the consent of the House.

**Mr. President :** It is not for me to go into that question.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** What is the parliamentary procedure?

**Mr. President :** The parliamentary practice is different from the procedure followed here.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** May I submit that up to this time no Ministry has been censured and no occasion has arisen for such a question?

**Mr. President :** Who can say that the motion, even if it is carried, will be interpreted as a censure?

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** We never say so.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** But the parliamentary procedure is quite clear.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** In my humble opinion it would be quite unfair on our part if we force or compel the Honourable Ministers to give a reply to such an important question which involves their life and death. (*Laughter*).

**Mr. President :** They can defend themselves.

(*A voice :* We all know that they are not going out). (*Laughter*).

(*Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram stood up to move his amendment*).

**Mr. President :** Does the honourable member propose to move his first or second amendment?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** I propose to move only the second motion.

**Mr. President :** The second motion is time barred.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** This amendment was sent in on the 13th at 4 P.M. before the office was closed.

**Mr. President :** It was received by the office at 4 P.M. The honourable member admits that it was sent to the office at 4 P.M. on the 13th. Therefore, it will be taken to have been received to-day, and thus it is clearly out of order for insufficient notice.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Is the office supposed to close before 4 o'clock ?

**Mr. President :** May I refer the honourable member to standing order 11 ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Then, in that case, I should be allowed to move my first amendment.

**Mr. President :** I clearly asked the honourable member and he himself said that he would not move his first amendment. After having made that declaration how can he ask my permission and how can I grant it ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Then I shall oppose the whole demand when it is put.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, I beg to move—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 60,000—Pay of Officers—Minister for Local Self-Government.”

Sir, as the House is aware, the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government has unseated Malik Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman of the Gujranwala municipality because of the fact that he permitted the hoisting of the flag on 26th January 1930. Sir, you know and this honourable House knows that the Working Committee of the Congress Committee passed a resolution which has been passed on every platform in every district, in every small town and in every city of this province. In that resolution it was openly proclaimed that independence was demanded by this resolution, and the people who passed the resolution demanded severance of connection with the British Crown. If there can be any act of rebellion and if there can be any resolution which ought to be taken notice of by the Government it was that resolution.

I am sure, Sir, that many municipal members who have taken the oath of allegiance to the Crown took part in that demonstration, and not only took part in the demonstration but actually used the words “the severance of connection with the British Crown.” In spite of that, Government has been wise enough not to take any notice of those demonstrations and of the members who used those words. If the oath of allegiance to the Crown forbids any member to hoist the national flag, then I think that those who used those words are more condemnable. I do not think, Sir, that any Minister responsible to this House has any right to take any notice of the hoisting of the flag by a member who says that he is really true to the

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

oath of allegiance to the Crown and that the oath in no way hinders him from hoisting the flag on a municipal building.

Now, Sir, can any one say that the national flag is a symbol of rebellion? Is it not a fact that for many years the flag has been hoisted in this country, and even in this very city the national flag was hoisted two or three months ago, and the Government took no notice of it. You know, Sir, that those people who are hoisting the flag tell the people and the Government that they are not loyal to the British Crown, and in spite of that, not a single arrest has been made throughout the length and breadth of the country. If the hoisting of the national flag is taken to be against the oath of allegiance, why were not those people brought to book who on the 26th of January passed the resolution that demanded the severance of British connection? I have reason to think that the Government very wisely interpreted the resolution as a mere demand and a forcible demand for Dominion status. Perhaps, I will not be permitted to use the name of the head of the whole administration in this country, but in his five speeches made after the 26th February he did not tackle this resolution and evaded a discussion and interpretation of the resolution. The Governors of the provinces, no doubt, gave a threat that those who disobey the law will be dealt with under the law, but, Sir, no one said that those who voted for the resolution or who hoisted the national flag would be dealt with as rebels. But, here, Sir, a responsible Minister without consulting the honourable members of this House takes such a drastic step and raises a constitutional issue of a considerable importance. Now, we are told in one of the speeches delivered by Mr. Wedgwood Benn that dominion status is in action in India, and the Government members in the Assembly made much use of it and said: here is a responsible person giving a clear promise to this country that Government is anxious that Dominion status is in action. We were told that Government has changed their heart, and that we would be getting Dominion status in the very near future. Every nation, every Dominion within the Empire has got its own national flag which, if I am permitted, I will bring with me to-morrow. All Dominions within the Empire have their own national flags, and they are permitted to hoist them on corporations and other Government buildings. But here the elementary rights that are enjoyed by Dominions are refused in this country and still we are assured that Dominion status is in action in India.

In the Council of State that very wise gentlemen, Sir Habibullah, in his speech on the Round Table Conference resolution last month said that Dominion status is something better and something more beneficial to his countrymen and to his country than complete independence. Co-operation between the two nations and between the two people.....

**Mr. President:** The honourable member will please not deliver a speech on the present and future political constitution in India. He will please confine his speech to the unseating of a member of the municipal committee of Gujranwala.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** All that I want to say is that we want Dominion status, and in Dominion status the hoisting of the national flag is permitted.

My argument is that the hoisting of the national flag on a municipal building is not a breach of the oath of allegiance to the Crown. That is why I say that if Dominion status.....

**Mr. President :** I am not going to allow a discussion on Dominion status. I think the honourable member has already said enough about it, I do not want to curtail the right of the honourable member to speak, but at the same time, I cannot allow him to wander away from the question raised by him.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** In spite of the fact that Dominion status is promised to us, and we will have it in the very near future, the Honourable Minister has been pleased to unseat Malik Lal Khan from his membership of the municipal committee. I think that this action of the Honourable Minister strikes at the very root of local self-government. Does not local self-government mean self-government, complete government within the municipal limits under the Municipal Act? If any office bearer has done anything wrong he ought to be proceeded with under the law. But, Sir, the Act clearly lays down that if Government wishes to unseat an office bearer it can do so by the consent of the two-thirds of the members of the Committee.

**Mr. President :** Which section is the honourable member referring to?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I am referring to section 22 which runs as follows :—

“ Whenever a president or vice-president vacates his seat or tenders in writing to the Committee his resignation of the office he shall vacate his office and any president or vice-president may be removed from office by the local Government in pursuance of a resolution to that effect passed by two-thirds of the members of the Committee.”

I will not refer to section 16 because that does not suit my purpose.

**Mr. President :** It is not for me to interpret the section, but apparently it relates only to the removal of a president or a vice-president from office.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** From membership also. Under section 16 (e) if in the opinion of the Local Government he has frequently abused his position as a member of the committee, he can be unseated. I submit that he has not used his powers as a member of the committee. As a member of the committee, he has absolutely no power. He cannot order the staff of the municipal committee to hoist the flag, and no member can be such a fool as to take upon himself the powers of the vice-president or president and give such an order. So any act of wisdom or of folly that he has done he has done in his capacity as an office bearer, as a vice-president of the committee and not as a member of the committee. So, if any office bearer can be removed he can only be removed under the resolution of the committee passed by two-thirds of the members. To me that is quite clear, though this argument may not appeal to you.

The Council then adjourned till 2 P. M. on Tuesday, the 18th March 1930.

*Statement referred to in part (b) of the answer to Starred Question No. 2988, page 592 ante.*

No.	Officers.	Designation.	Lump sum received on account of sale of copyright.
			Rs.
1	{ Chaudhri Fateh-ud-Din	Inspector of Schools,	500
	{ Mr. K. L. Ralia Ram ..	Multan.	
2	Lala Brij Lal, M. A. ..	Lecturer, Government Intermediate College, Jhang.	50 (1925)
3	S. Asghar Ali, B.A., B. T.	Headmaster, Government High School, Jhajjar.	75 (1926)
4	Lala Ram Lal, Kanwar ..	Headmaster, Government High School, Karnal.	120 (1915)
5	Mr. H. L. O. Garrett ..	Principal, Government College, Lahore.	500
6	M. Ghulam Ahmad Qureshi, B.A.	..	547-8-0
7	Lala Devi Ditta Mal ..	Model School, Lahore	100
8	Lala Rang Behari Lal, B.A., B.T.	Reporter on Books ..	200 (1904 or 1905).
			600 (1911).
9	S. Maqbul Shah and Muhammad Nazir.	Inspector of Vernacular Education.	1,500
10	Man Mohan, Esquire ..	Inspector of Schools, Jullundur.	4,362 (1928-29).
11	J. L. Wilson, Esquire. M.A.	Inspector of Schools, Ambala.	1,500 (1928-29).
12	L. B. L. Bhatia ..	Principal, Government Intermediate College, Hoshiarpur.	625 (1928-29).
13	Lala Lachhman Das Varman.	Professor, Central Training College, Lahore.	950

# PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Tuesday, the 18th March 1930.*

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

## OATH OF OFFICE.

The following member was sworn in :—

Macnabb, Mr. A. C. (Official, nominated).

## UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

### EXEMPTION FROM TUITION FEE.

**1617. Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the exemption provided in memorandum No. 16977-R., dated the 2nd October 1929 (Ministry of Education) relates only to Khushab Tahsil of the Shahpur district and does not extend to other tahsils of the district ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that before the publication of the above memorandum, the agriculturists of Shahpur district were exempt from paying half the tuition fee ;
- (c) whether it is also a fact that representations by the local district board have been made to Government not to withdraw the concession from the other tahsils of the district ;
- (d) if so, with what effect ;
- (e) if nothing has been done so far, will the Government state reasons for not taking any action ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) Yes.

(d) The Shahpur district board has been told that in the present circumstances it is not desirable to extend the concession to the whole district, as the other tahsils are in a better financial position.

(e) In placing these fee concessions on a more permanent footing Government has settled for the whole province the tahsils to which this concession should extend on the basis of backwardness in education, general poverty and other relevant considerations, and placed the whole position as regards fee concessions on firm grounds of principle.

## INTERMEDIATE COLLEGE, SHAHPUR.

**1618. Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Hayat, Qureshi :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education kindly state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that there is no provision for science classes in the new Intermediate College opened at Shahpur ;
- (b) if so, whether the Government is aware that the omission would seriously affect the popularity of the college and its efficiency ;
- (c) whether there are any proposals under the consideration of Government to make provision for these subjects ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) and (c) The college was opened only as recently on 1st May 1929. Government have proposals under consideration now to make the suggested provisions, though owing to financial stringency it will not be possible to provide the college with the usual laboratories on the full scale.

(b) Other things being equal, the absence of science classes is generally considered a defect.

## KHADIR CANAL.

**1619. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan Daultana :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that water was allowed to flow in the Khadir canal of the Sutlej Valley Project in the recent past and that the zamindars irrigated their wheat crops with the canal water ;
- (b) whether the Government is also aware that on account of the failure of the Islam weir and other reasons, water in the Khadir was allowed to flow for a longer period than it was actually required for the *rabi* crops of that area ;
- (c) whether it is also a fact that the zamindars could not close their outlets for fear of breach in the canal and the minors and they used the superfluous water by spreading it on the uncultivated land over a larger area than that which could be required for the next *kharif* ;
- (d) whether it is a fact that Executive Engineer, Khadir division, has ordered that *raoni* charges be levied on the whole area on which water was spread whether it would be used for the next *kharif* or not ;
- (e) if so, will the Government please state reasons for this action ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) Yes.

(d) Orders have only been issued to book the culturable area. No orders have been issued to charge it as *raoni*. No charge shall be made for water allowed to run to waste on lands not likely to be cultivated.

(e) This is according to the usual practice and orders for charging any *ccr* areas as such would be passed after *kharif* sowings are over.



## ELECTIONS TO CENTRAL CO-OPERATIVE BANKS AND UNIONS.

**1620. Sardar Hira Singh Narli :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that under the present system of election prevalent in the central co-operative banks and co-operative unions the minority communities are deprived of their due share in the representation ;
- (b) if so, what steps Government propose to take to give the minority communities representation in those institutions in exact proportion to their numerical strength ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Central Co-operative Banks have as their members primary societies with a few individual share-holders ; each member has one vote. The person who represents any society at a general meeting is appointed by that society as its proxy. Thus the general meeting of a central bank is composed of a few individual share-holders and the representatives of the member societies. These elect the directors in accordance with their by-laws.

(b) Government cannot take such steps as member societies are organized under the Act on a co-operative and not on a communal basis and are not confined to particular communities, and generally speaking it would be as unreasonable to lay down a fixed proportion for communities on the directorates in such societies as it would be to prescribe that joint stock companies should, when electing their directors, elect a certain proportion of each community instead of leaving this selection to the share-holders. Societies or individuals, who do not find themselves satisfied with the representation resulting from election, are at liberty to withdraw from the association and have the freedom, if they can reform into really co-operative groups, to seek registration as a society or bank, but such fissiparous action is kely to weaken the unity and strength of the movement.

## FEE CONCESSIONS.

**1621. Sardar Hira Singh Narli :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Lahore district has been deprived of the concessions contained in memorandum No. 16977-R., issued by the Ministry of Education on 2nd October 1929 ;
- (b) if so, why ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) This district was not on the list of those where these fee concessions existed before the orders contained in the Memorandum referred to were issued, and therefore, it is not correct to say that the district has been deprived of these concessions. But it is correct that the district has not been included among those to which the concession is extended.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer to part (e) of Council question<sup>1</sup> (unstarred) No. 1617.

## PATROL ACT IN LAHORE DISTRICT.

**1622. Sardar Hira Singh Narli :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the villages of Lahore district have been exempted from the operation of the Village Patrol Act ;
- (b) if the answer to (a) be in the affirmative, whether it is a fact that the police still insists upon the villagers to do patrol duty ;
- (c) if so, what action Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

(b) and (c) Do not arise.

## HIGH SCHOOLS, JULLUNDUR DISTRICT.

**1623. Sardar Partap Singh :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to lay on the table—

- (a) (1) list of high schools (Government, District Board or private); in the Jullundur district ;
- (2) number of students communitywise in the high classes of each school ;
- (3) number of students communitywise who passed the matric examination from each of the schools during the last five years ;
- (b) (1) number of students communitywise in the 1st and 2nd year classes of the D. A.-V. College, Jullundur ;
- (2) number of students communitywise who after having passed the matric examination from each of the above mentioned schools entered the D. A.-V. College, Jullundur, during last five years ;
- (c) whether Government intend to open a Government Intermediate College at Jullundur for the benefit of those students who do not like to join the D. A.-V. College after passing the matric examination ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) (1) The list of high schools in the Jullundur District is laid on the table.

(a) (2) and (3) and (b) Information is being collected and will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

(c) No such proposal is at present under Government's consideration.

*List of High Schools in the Jullundur District.*

1. Government High School, Jullundur.
2. Government High School, Phillaur.
3. Government High School, Rahon.
4. D. B. High School, Banga.
5. D. B. High School, Nakodar.
6. D. B. High School, Kartarpur.

7. D. B. High School, Nurmahal.
8. Cantonment High School, Jullundur Cantonment.
9. Doaba Khalsa High School, Jullundur City.
10. Mission High School, Jullundur City.
11. Islamia High School, Jullundur City.
12. Khalsa High School, Bundala.
13. Khalsa High School, Kalra.
14. A. S. High School, Alawalpur.
15. Labhoo Ram Doaba High School, Jullundur City.
16. A. S. High School, Nawanshahr.
17. Doaba Arya High School, Nurmahal.
18. A. S. High School, Nakodar.
19. S. D. A. S. High School, Jullundur City.
20. Victor High School, Jullundur Cantonment.

KAMINS OF KHEEKA, PIR MAHAL AND BURALA.

**1624. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan Daultana :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that orders were issued that the names of the *kamins* be not registered for the local grants in the Kheeka, Pir Mahal and Burala Projects ;
- (b) whether the Government is aware that a lot of *kamins* paid *tirni* and had the same claims for the grant as non-*kamins* ;
- (c) the reasons for having deprived the *kamins* of the above areas from their legitimate claims and rights ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes, but the mere fact that a person has paid *tirni* gives him no claim for consideration in the allotment of land.

(c) The *kamins* of these areas have not been deprived of any legitimate claims or rights.

ALLOTMENT FOR THE LOCAL GRANTS IN KHEEKA, PIR MAHAL AND  
BURALA PROJECTS.

**1625. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan Daultana :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state when the allotment for the local grants in the Kheeka, Pir Mahal and Burala projects will be made ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** When the selection of grantees is completed, and the irrigation and killabandi arrangements are ready, which it is hoped will be by *kharif* 1931.

## AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE, LYALLPUR—SHORTAGE OF WATER-SUPPLY.

**1626. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that there is a shortage of water-supply in the boarding houses attached to the Government Agricultural College, Lyallpur;
- (b) if so, whether it relates to water for drinking purposes or other purposes or both;
- (c) what are the sources of water-supply in each case;
- (d) what is the number of boarders;
- (e) what is the amount of water for drinking purposes available in gallons per head per day;
- (f) what is the amount of water available for purposes other than drinking purposes in gallons per head per day?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) Both.

(c) (1) For drinking, municipal standposts.

(2) For bathing and domestic purposes, a tube well with a mechanical pump, and hand pump.

(d) 277.

(e) 1,928 gallons for a total population of 1,800 persons at 0.74 gallons per head.

(f) 8.7 gallons.

---

 AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE, LYALLPUR—WATER-SUPPLY TO BOARDING HOUSE.

**1627. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Director of Agriculture has reported to Government about the insufficiency of water-supply at the Boarding House, Government Agricultural College, Lyallpur;
- (b) if so, will Government be pleased to lay a copy of the letter or extracts from it on the table?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) Extracts from the Director of Agriculture's letter are laid on the table.

[Extracts.]

The position regarding the domestic water-supply for the College estate has become such that it is impossible to carry on any longer without the provision of an adequate supply. The present water main was laid in 1909 at the time of the opening of the College. For some years it provided a sufficient supply, but with the expansion of the College estate, bringing with it increased demand for drinking water, and the making by the Municipal Committee of a large number of water connections in the city, by which

a large quantity of water is drained off from the main, the water available has become less and less for several years, till now frequently for several consecutive days not a drop of water is received at the College, and when it does come it is little more than a trickle and that only at night or very early morning. Representations have been made frequently to the Municipality for an increased supply, but without effect. The Committee has failed entirely to meet our requirements, and in view of past experience with that body there is no prospect of getting our needs satisfactorily met from them.

\* \* \* \* \*

The scheme for which sanction is now asked amounts to Rs. 1,32,000. This sum includes Rs. 17,216 chargeable to the Jail department, so that the total cost of the College scheme amounts to Rs. 1,14,784.

\* \* \* \* \*

#### FEROZEPORE DISTRICT BOARD—MAINTENANCE OF ROADS.

**1628. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture kindly state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the district board road between the Ferozepore City Municipality Mall Road and the Ferozepore Cantonment Mall Road passing over the North-Western Railway crossing bridge is wholly maintained by the Ferozepore district board ;
- (b) whether it is really a part of the Ferozepore-Makhoo road which is a class II road ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the Ferozepore district board is not prepared to maintain this road in future ;
- (d) if so, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) Government has received no representation from the district board.

(d) If the district board will approach the Communications Board to promote the road from Class III to Class II, it will consider the proposal.

#### FEROZEPORE MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE—RETRENCHMENT IN STAFF.

**1629. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Ferozepore Municipal Committee dispensed with the services of certain of its employees recently under the plea of retrenchment ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that all the retrenched persons were Muhammadans ;
- (c) if the answer to the above be in the affirmative, will the Honourable Minister please lay on the table a copy of the resolution on

[ Pir Akbar Ali. ]

the subject passed by the Municipal Committee with the amendments moved by Pir Akbar Ali and Chaudhri Abdul Haq ;

- (d) whether it is a fact that the Municipal Committee has retrenched the services of an accountant who had good record on the ground of reduction of expenditure ;
- (e) whether it is also a fact that after dispensing with his services, the Committee re-engaged another person to work as accountant ; if so, why ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes. The step was rendered necessary owing to a deficit of about Rs. 20,000 in the current year's income.

(b) No.

(c) A copy of the resolution passed by the Committee together with the amendments moved by Pir Akbar Ali and Chaudhri Abdul Haq, is attached.

(d) On the ground of economy the committee amalgamated the posts of accountant and typist, and as the accountant was afterwards found unable to carry on the duties of the combined post he was discharged. His record of services was not good.

(e) No separate post of accountant has been created. A fresh appointment has been made to the combined post referred to above.

Copy of Resolution No. 3 of a special meeting of the Ferozepore Municipal Committee held on 8th October 1929.

#### *Proposal.*

Report of the Special Sub-Committee in response to resolution Nos. 1 and 2 of the special meeting dated 14th September 1929, regarding curtailment of expenses and enhancement of octroi to the effect that the suggestions of the representatives of the tax-payers as embodied in the proceedings of 26th and 27th September 1929 were read and considered and it was resolved unanimously that the following recommendations be made to the Committee :—

(1) That the posts of the accountant and the 2nd clerk be combined together and the pay of the post be fixed at Rs. 50 and some competent hand be engaged.

(2) That the post of the Naib Ahlmad be brought into reduction and in order to facilitate the work some of the duties of Naib Ahlmad, viz. (receiving and issuing of dāk and indexing the files, etc.), be entrusted to the Record Keeper.

(3) That the post of the births and death's clerk and that of the Road inspector be brought into reduction. The duties of the former to be carried by the clerk of the Medical Officer of Health and that of the latter by the draftsman. Resolved further that out of the 4 Muhafiz of trees two be dispensed with.

(4) That out of 81 kitson lamps as many as possible up to 16 be discontinued.

(5) That the number of Municipal schools be reduced as under :—

Boys' Schools from 4 to 3.

Urdu Girls' Schools from 4 to 2.

Hindi Girls' Schools from 2 to 1, and the remaining schools be so located that the reduction in the number of the schools be not felt by the tax-payers. Special Sub-Committee be authorized to carry out the recommendations with regard to item Nos. 4 and 5.

(6) That the schedule of enhancement of octroi as already submitted to the Committee by the Secretary and referred back to the Special Sub-Committee for consideration and report in consultation with the chosen representatives of the town, be approved and published for objections with the following amendments :—

(a) That on grain instead of Re. 0-0-3 per maund octroi be levied in the following manner :—

Re. 0-1-3 per bullock or buffalo load.

Re. 0-0-6 per pony or mule.

Re. 0-0-3 per donkey load.

Re. 0-1-0 per camel.

1½ pies per maund imported in bags or otherwise not mentioned above.

Grain means wheat, gram, barley and their admixture.

(b) That on metals and articles made of metal Re. 0-0-4½ per rupee be charged instead of Re. 0-0-3 as already charged and Re. 0-0-6 proposed.

(c) That on cloth at Re. 0-0-4½ per rupee be charged instead of Re. 0-0-3 already charged and Re. 0-0-6 proposed.

(d) That the ice which is not already taxed be charged at Re. 0-1-0 per maund instead of Re. 0-1-6 proposed.

(e) That on milk which is not already taxed, octroi be charged at Re. 0-1-0 per maund instead of Re. 0-2-0 proposed.

(f) That on chemicals at 7½ pies per rupee be charged instead of Re. 0-0-6 already charged and Re. 0-0-9 per rupee proposed.

(g) That no octroi be charged on sweets etc., imported at the time of marriages for distribution in the *Bradri*.

For the information of the Committee the Sub-Committee submits that all the suggestions about reduction of expenses and enhancement of octroi duty made unanimously by the representatives of the citizens have been adopted by the Sub-Committee with the following exceptions :—

(1) That the representatives suggested a reduction of Rs. 3,000 annually in establishment. The Sub-Committee, keeping in view the efficiency of the administration and the utility of the various departments, has been able to make a reduction of 1,800 a year.

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

- (2) In the matter of enhancement of the octroi this Sub-Committee has made only those recommendations which the representative approved except so much so that they recommended Re. 0-0-4 per rupee on cloth and no enhancement on chemicals. The Sub-Committee, taking into consideration the deficit to be met with, has recommended Re. 0-0-4½ on cloth and Re. 0-0-7½ on chemicals. If the above report and the recommendations which carry with it the entire support of the citizens, are accepted by the Committee, it is hoped that the deficit will be met with and the Committee will find itself in decent financial position.

*Resolution.*

Proposed by Khan Muhammad Nawaz Khan that report of the Sub-Committee be adopted and the special Sub-Committee be authorised to carry out proposals Nos. 1 to 5.

Proposal No. 6 be published under Section 62 for calling objections within 80 days.

Seconded by Sardar Gopal Singh. Amendment proposed by Pir Akbar Ali that item Nos. 1, 3, 4 and 5 and parts (a), (c) and (g) of item No. 6 be omitted from the report of the Special Sub-Committee. By accepting them the Committee's work will greatly suffer. These proposals are based on personal enmity and communal bigotry and the following arrangements be sanctioned instead thereof :—

- (1) Slaughter house allowances of Veterinary Assistant at Rs. 12 per mensem be discontinued and this work be given to the Sanitary Inspector. Saving will be Rs. 144 per annum.
- (2) Yunas Khan, octroi chaukidar or chaprasi of Octroi Superintendent, be discharged one man can easily perform these two duties. Saving Rs. 180 per annum.
- (3) Octroi Muharrir of Amritsari Gate who is mentally unfit be discharged as there is no income from this barrier. Saving Rs. 216.
- (4) Chirag Din, Head teacher, has applied for retirement ; therefore his services be dispensed with and some normal trained be appointed in his place at Rs. 20 per mensem. Saving Rs. 360 per annum.
- (5) Pandit Ram Lubhaya, Assistant Octroi-Superintendent, be discharged. Saving Rs. 480 per annum.
- (6) One out of 2 chaukidars of Medical Officer of Health be discharged This work can be done by one. Saving Rs. 168 per annum.
- (7) Services of Draftsman be dispensed with. Saving Rs. 52 per mensem. The report of the Sub-Committee shows that he is not needed.



(b) Employees who are of 60 years of age be made to retire and their places to be filled by giving promotions to the present staff or by appointing competent persons from outside. Saving Rs. 2,220 per annum.

(c) (1) Two new shops be opened in Sabzmandi. Income Rs. 600.

(2) Mall Road and Malwal Road Barriers be amalgamated and shifted near Serai Nagar Mall. Thereby one octroi post will be abolished and the expenditure thereon will be saved.

Buildings of the said posts be given on rent.

Seconded by M. Abdool Rahman Khan.

Point of order raised by Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram that from Pir Akbar Ali's amendment the words relating to the personal enmity, etc., and the reasons given, be omitted. The point of order was accepted by the chairman.

Amendment proposed by M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan that the following words be added to the amendment proposed by Pir Akbar Ali :—

"Allowance of the school attendance officer at Rs. 25 per mensem be discontinued in view of the Commissioner's letter."

Seconded by M. Abdool Rahman Khan.

Amendment proposed by M. Abdul Haq that portion 1 to 5 of Sub-Committee's report be omitted the saving of Rs. 1,800 which has been proposed to be made therein be made good in the following way :—

(1) Allowance of Veterinary Assistant be discontinued by giving the work to the Sanitary Inspector.

(2) Allowance of School Attendance Officer be discontinued.

(3) Yunas Khan, chaukidar, be discharged.

(4) One of the office peons be discharged.

(5) Services of the Assistant Lady Health Visitor be dispensed with.

(6) Provision for embroidery teaching be omitted.

(7) Second vaccinator and his chaprasi should not be engaged. Saving in this way will be Rs. 2,688 instead of Rs. 1,800. M. Chirag Din be made to retire as applied by him.

Seconded by M. Abdool Rahman Khan.

Amendment proposed by M. Abdool Rahman Khan that proposals of M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan as embodied in his report dated 4th June 1929, be adopted by which the Committee will save Rs. 18,000.

Seconded by M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan.

Amendment of M. Abdool Rahman Khan was rejected by a majority of 12 against 6.

#### NAMES OF THE MEMBERS IN FAVOUR OF THE AMENDMENT.

1. M. Abdool Haq ;
2. Sheikh Ghulam Haider ;
3. Khan Sahib Khawaja Gul Muhammad Khan ;
4. M. Abdool Rahman Khan ;
5. Pir Akbar Ali ;
6. M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan.

Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

*Against.*

1. Lala Nihal Chand ;
2. Lala Ram Lall ;
3. Lala Jai Kishen Dass ;
4. Lala Jawala Ram.
5. Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram ;
6. M. Mohabbat Ali ;
7. M. Murad Ali ;
8. Khan Muhammad Nawaz Khan ;
9. Dr. Dhian Singh ;
10. Lala Rikhi Ram ;
11. Lala Hans Raj ;
12. Sardar Gopal Singh.

Amendment of Chaudhri Abdool Haq was rejected by a majority of 10 against 7, one not voting.

NAMES OF THE MEMBERS IN FAVOUR OF THE AMENDMENT.

1. M. Abdool Haq ;
2. Sheikh Ghulam Haider ;
3. Khan Sahib Khawaja Gul Muhammad Khan ;
4. M. Abdool Rahman Khan ;
5. Pir Akbar Ali ;
6. M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan ;
7. Lala Jwala Ram.

*Against.*

1. Lala Nihal Chand ;
2. Lala Ram Lall ;
3. Lala Jai Kishen Dass ;
4. M. Mohabbat Ali ;
5. M. Murad Ali ;
6. Khan Muhammad Nawaz Khan ;
7. Dr. Dhian Singh ;
8. Sardar Gopal Singh ;
9. Lala Rikhi Ram ;
10. Lala Hans Raj.

Amendment of M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan was rejected by a majority of 8 against 7, others remained neutral.

NAMES OF THE MEMBERS IN FAVOUR OF THE AMENDMENT.

1. M. Abdool Haq ;
2. Sheikh Ghulam Haider ;
3. Khan Sahib Khawaja Gul Muhammad Khan ;
4. M. Abdool Rahman Khan ;
5. Lala Jwala Ram ;
6. M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan ;
7. Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram.

*Against.*

1. Lala Nihal Chand ;
2. Lala Ram Lall ;

3. Khan Muhammad Nawaz Khan ;
4. M. Mohabbat Ali ;
5. M. Murad Ali ;
6. Lala Rikhi Ram ;
7. Sardar Gopal Singh ;
8. Dr. Dhian Singh.

Amendment of Pir Akbar Ali was rejected by a majority of 11 against 3, two not voting.

NAMES OF THE MEMBERS IN FAVOUR OF THE AMENDMENT.

1. M. Abdool Haq ;
2. Sheikh Ghulam Haider ;
3. M. Abdool Rahman Khan ;
4. Pir Akbar Ali ;
5. M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan.

*Against.*

1. Lala Nihal Chand ;
2. Lala Ram Lall ;
3. Khan Muhammad Nawaz Khan ;
4. M. Mohabbat Ali ;
5. M. Murad Ali ;
6. Lala Rikhi Ram ;
7. Sardar Gopal Singh ;
8. Dr. Dhian Singh ;
9. Lala Jai Kishen Dass ;
10. Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram ;
11. Lala Hans Raj.

Original proposal of Khan Muhammad Nawaz Khan was carried by a majority of 11 against 6, one not voting.

*Against.*

1. M. Abdool Haq ;
2. Shaikh Ghulam Haider ;
3. Khan Sahib Khawaja Gul Muhammad Khan ;
4. M. Abdool Rahman Khan ;
5. Pir Akbar Ali ;
6. M. Muhammad Nawaz Khan.

*In favour.*

1. Dr. Dhian Singh ;
2. Sardar Gopal Singh ;
3. Lala Rikhi Ram ;
4. Lala Nihal Chand ;
5. Lala Ram Lall ;
6. Lala Jai Kishen Dass ;
7. M. Mohabbat Ali ;
8. M. Murad Ali ;
9. Khan Muhammad Nawaz Khan ;
10. The Chairman.
11. Rai Bahadur Pandit Daulat Ram.

**FEROZEPORE MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE—EMPLOYEES OVER  
55 YEARS OF AGE.**

**1630. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government kindly state—

- (a) how many of the Ferozepore City Municipal Committee permanent employees are over 55 years of age, with their names, age and pay ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that after the engagement of the Medical Officer of Health the Secretary is relieved of the duties of supervision of sanitation ;
- (c) if so, has there been any decrease in his allowance which he was paid for the said purpose of supervision ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Twelve—*vide* statement<sup>1</sup> attached. The Municipal Committee is satisfied that all those employees are discharging their duties satisfactorily.

(b) Yes.

(c) No extra allowance has ever been paid to the Secretary of the committee for supervising the sanitation work.

**FEROZEPORE MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE—DEFALCATIONS.**

**1631. Pir Akbar Ali :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government kindly state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Ferozepore Municipal Committee recently discovered a case of defalcation of a considerable sum by one of its employees ;
- (b) if so, whether this case was reported to the police and, if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The Ferozepore Municipal committee discovered that a sum of Rs. 758-13-0, remitted to the treasury for the credit to the Municipal Fund, was not actually credited thereto. The cashier of the committee when called upon to explain made a statement which in the opinion of the committee was not convincing. The said amount was accordingly forthwith recovered from him and the committee decided not to make further investigations into the matter but dismissed the cashier from his post and forfeited the municipal contributions towards his Provident Fund (about Rs. 335). Government are causing further enquiries to be made in the matter.

**LOCUST PEST IN LUDHIANA.**

**1632. Sardar Mohindar Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the villages of Dakha, Gahor, Baddowal, Threake, Sunet, Doogri, Khanpur, Gill and Dad in the Ludhiana district were visited by locusts in the last summer ;
- (b) were any other villages also visited ;

- (c) was any damage done by locusts ;
- (d) was this damage assessed ;
- (e) if so, by whom ;
- (f) was any kind of assistance given to any of these villages (especially to village Threke) ; if so, when and what was its nature ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) to (d) Yes.

(e) By Revenue Officers, including the Collector and Revenue Assistant.

(f) Yes. Remissions of land revenue for the harvest in question were granted in thirty-three villages including six of those specially mentioned by the honourable member, to the extent of the damage caused. Taccavi loans were also given on a large scale for various purposes in many of the affected villages, including Threke.

#### IRRIGATION IN LUDHIANA.

**1633. Sardar Mohindar Singh :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that there is a tube-well belonging to some Government department at Ludhiana not far from the villages of Jawaddi, Phulanwal, Doogri, Sunet and Threke ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that in all these villages wells have been used for irrigation of crops for generations past ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that when the tube-well is working it draws away so much water that very soon the water in wells in the neighbourhood begins to fall and goes down to such an extent that some become almost dry and in other cases water left is insufficient for irrigation purposes ;
- (d) whether this state of things has been drawn to the notice of Government ;
- (e) what action Government proposes to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—CONTD.

##### GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The Council will now resume discussion on the amendment<sup>1</sup> of Chaudhri Afzal Haq.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** [Hoshirapur-cum-Ludhiana (Muhammadan), Rural] : Sir, yesterday I was explaining that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government had selected a wrong section for taking the drastic action against Malik Lal Khan in unseating him. A doubt was expressed as to the force of my argument and I will now refer to the speech of the

[ Ch. Afzal Haq. ]

Honourable Minister himself in the course of the general discussion of the budget. He put forward the plea then that if Malik Lal Khan really wanted to hoist the flag, he could very well have done so with the consent of the members of the municipal committee.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** But I never said that if the members of the municipal committee had consented to it, that would have been a lawful action. I said that he could have consulted them, but he did not.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Exactly, that is to say, he would not have been unseated as a member if he had the majority of the members of the committee to support him in passing a resolution for hoisting the flag.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** No, I did not say so.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** The Honourable Minister said that Malik Lal Khan took advantage of two hours' absence of the President of the committee.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** A few hours' absence.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Very well. In any case it comes to this that as vice-president and as an office bearer, he took advantage of the absence of the president, and not as a member of the municipal committee. That is why I put forward the argument that if Malik Lal Khan took advantage of his office as Vice-President, then he ought to have been dealt with under section 22 of the Municipal Act and not under section 16 of that Act.

Now, that is not all. The Honourable Minister knew his weak position and he took shelter in the fact that if the Calcutta Corporation hoisted the flag it was because of a resolution passed by a majority of the members of that corporation and that was why no action was taken by the Bengal Government against the Deputy Mayor of that corporation, even though he has been administered the oath of allegiance. So the point comes to this, that if an office bearer of a municipal committee had in pursuance of a resolution passed by that committee hoisted the flag, Government would not have taken objection to it as was the case in the case of the Calcutta Corporation. But in the present case, though the vice-president took illegal advantage of his office, Government did not proceed against him under the proper section of the Municipal Act, because it feared lest the majority of the members of the municipal committee should side with him. That was not all. Realising his weak position he adduced the argument that he had received in writing a letter to the effect that the members of the committee disapproved of the action of Malik Lal Khan. I do not mean to say that the Minister invited them to give that disapproval in writing; it is probable that the members of their own accord might have expressed to him their disapproval of Malik Lal Khan's action. But it is worthy of note that this disapproval was expressed after Malik Lal Khan was unseated. The Honourable Minister made mention of the fact that there were certain members of the municipal committee who resented Malik Lal Khan's action and that was why Government took action against him. But the real fact is that the appeal or request to the Honourable Minister was made by the members of the committee only after Government had taken action against the Malik. I can, therefore, safely

say that this action of the members of the committee is not without its meaning. Now I will read out how the Malik explained his action when he was called upon by the Deputy Commissioner to offer an explanation.

چونکہ آپ نے مجھ سے دریافت فرمایا ہے کہ باوجود حلف لینے کے بحیثیت میونسپل ممبر میں نے ۲۵ جنوری سنہ ۱۹۳۰ء کو سیکریٹری میونسپل کمیٹی کے نام قومی جھنڈا عمارت کمیٹی پر نصب کرنے کے لئے تحریری حکم دیا وہ میں نے اسلئے کیا کہ میرے خیال میں ایسا کرنا اس حلف کے ذمہ خلاف تھا اور اب بھی میری یہی رائے ہے۔

No doubt this Council had incorporated in the Act in 1922 a provision for the members of the municipal committee to take the oath of allegiance. But there is no express provision in the Act or the rules which clearly show that the hoisting of the flag will be taken by the Government as an act against the oath of allegiance. It is just possible that a member or even an office bearer of the municipal committee may honestly hold the view that the hoisting of such a flag does not go against the oath of allegiance and it is possible that he may be mistaken. But when a representative of Government asks the Malik for an explanation, he does not say that he did not mean to abide by the oath. If the Malik of the municipal committee had said so in so many words, then the Malik of this Council would have been right in unseating him. The Malik of the municipal committee said—

چونکہ آپ نے مجھ سے دریافت فرمایا ہے کہ باوجود حلف لینے کے بحیثیت میونسپل ممبر میں نے مورخہ ۲۵ جنوری سنہ ۱۹۳۰ء کو سیکریٹری میونسپل کمیٹی کے نام قومی جھنڈا عمارت کمیٹی پر نصب کرنے کے لئے تحریری حکم دیا وہ میں نے اس لئے کیا کہ میرے خیال میں ایسا کرنا اس حلف کے قطعاً خلاف نہ تھا۔ اور اب بھی میری یہی رائے ہے۔

that is to say, that he still sticks to that oath of allegiance and that explanation is not accepted by the Government.

Again, if acting in pursuance of the resolution of independence is an act of rebellion or is against the oath of allegiance, I may say that the Honourable Minister also has committed a similar offence. May I invite your attention to a daily paper called *Inqilab*. Honourable members of the House are aware that in 1920 the Central Khilafat Committee passed an independence resolution and they have been since pursuing that policy and they are not co-operating with the Government. I need not refer to that resolution as honourable members are aware that the creed of the Khilafat committee is complete independence. (*Voices*: We do not know). The honourable members will then come to know presently. In spite of that our Honourable Minister has taken part in the conference.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:** That is absolutely false.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I have documentary proof in support of my statement. In the *Inqilab* of the 27th December 1929 there is in bold headline.

اگر مسلمانوں کے اتحاد کا شان دار منظر دیکھنا چاہتے ہو

تو

خلافت کانفرنس لاہور میں آؤ۔

جس میں

رئیس الاحرار مولانا محمد علی۔ ضیغم اسلام۔ مولانا شوکت علی۔ بزرگ قوم مولانا شفیق داوری اور نواب سر ذوالفقار علی خان۔ انریبل ملک فیروز خان۔ نور داکٹر سر محمد اقبال اور سر محمد شفیق شانہ بشانہ اور پہلو بہ پہلو شامل ہو کر اسلامی اتحاد کا روح پرور منظر پیدا کرینگے۔

حکومت کو اور کانگریس کو دکھا دو

کہ مسلمان مطالبہ حقوق پر بالکل متفق ہیں

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sikander Hyat Khan :** What paper is that ?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** This is *Inqilab*, a semi-official paper of your party.

Now, Sir, it runs thus :

آل انڈیا کانفرنس اور مجلس استقبالیہ

اجلاس کے لئے عظیم الشان تیاریاں

لاہور۔ ۲۴ دسمبر۔ آل انڈیا خلافت کانفرنس کے لاہور میں اٹھنے والے منعقد کوہنے کی عظیم الشان تیاریاں ہو رہی ہیں۔ ایک زبردست مجلس استقبالیہ مرتب ہو گئی ہے جس کے صدر بالاتفاق سر ذوالفقار علی خان قرار پائے ہیں۔ اس صوبے کے معزز اور سرکردہ مسلمان اکابر شامل ہیں جن میں سے مندرجہ ذیل حضرات خاص طور پر قابل ذکر ہیں۔ سر محمد شفیق۔ علامہ سر محمد اقبال۔ ملک فیروز خان۔

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Wrong. Absolutely false.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I hope so.

ڈاکٹر خلیفہ شجاع الدین۔ مرزا جلال الدین بیگ ستر ایت لا۔ چوہدری فضل الہی تھیکہ دار۔ چوہدری دین محمد رئیس۔ مولوی محبوب عالم (پیشہ اخبار)۔ مہیاں محمد عمر۔ سوداگر چوم امروتر۔ شیخ صادق حسن بیگ ستر ایت لا۔ امروتر اور مولوی غلام محی الدین قصوری وکیل۔

Now, Sir, this is another article written and signed by Maulana Ghulam Rasul Mehr, General Secretary of the Reception Committee of the Khilafat committee, and the two other gentlemen, Dr. Sultan Muhammad and Mian Firoze-ud-Din Ahmad, who are Secretary and General Secretary of that committee. It runs thus :



## آل انڈیا کانفرنس کی مجلس استقبالیہ

رہنمائے ملت کے عطیات

لاہور—۲۵ دسمبر۔ ایک مسرت افروز حقیقت ہے کہ آل انڈیا خلافت کانفرنس کی مجلس استقبالیہ کے ارکان کی تعداد میں روز افزوں اضافہ ہو رہا ہے۔ مقتدر اور سرکردہ روزندان توحید کثوت سے مجلس مذکورہ کی رکنیت قبول کر رہے ہیں۔ حسب ذیل حضرات نے مجلس استقبالیہ کی رکنیت کی نیس (د) کرنے کے علاوہ سرمایہ خلافت میں مندرجہ ذیل رقوم عطا فرمائی ہیں:—

نقد

میان مبارک دین صاحب میونسپل کمشنر	... ۷۰ روپے
میان نظام دین صاحب رئیس اعظم	... ۱۰۰ روپے
آنریبل ملک فیروز خان صاحب نوں	... ۲۵۰ روپے

(The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon : False.)

سر شیخ عبد القادر صاحب پوسٹر ایٹ لڈ	... ۱۰۰ روپے
سر میان محمد شفیع صاحب	... ۱۰۰ روپے
نواب سر ذوالفقار علی خان صاحب مزید	... ۱۵۰ روپے
مسلمانان موچی دروازہ	... ۱۵۰ روپے

(مولانا) غلام رسول مہر متعدد عمومی مجلس استقبالیہ  
(ڈاکٹر) سلطان محمد  
(میان) فیروز الدین احمد  
{ متعددان مجلس استقبالیہ خلافت کانفرنس۔

Sir, I am sure that the Honourable Minister is contributing to this paper and several honourable members might have seen this paper on his table. I know, Sir, that the Honourable Minister is so touchy that he has contradicted the statement of mine. But I am surprised to hear that the statement of fact which is signed by no less a personality than Maulana Ghulam Rasul, Mehr, is being contradicted now by the Honourable Minister. Why was it not contradicted by him before?

The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon : It was never brought to my notice before, and I contradict it now.

Chaudhri Afzal Haq : Now you contradict it. But, no gentleman has any doubt about the correctness of the statement of the Honourable Minister. Sir, a gentleman must accept the explanation of another gentleman. Malik Lal Khan did nothing wrong. He explained his position and

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

said that he did nothing against the oath of allegiance, but the Honourable Minister did not say "yes, I accept your explanation and I will not unseat you, from the membership of the Municipal Committee."

If the Honourable Minister says that he did not contribute that big sum for the propaganda of complete independence, I am sure, Sir, that Sir Zulfiqar Ali Khan, who is a very faithful ally of the Government cannot contradict it.

**Mr. President :** Please do not discuss a gentleman who is not a member of this house.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I do not say, Sir, that he did anything wrong.

**Mr. President :** Please say nothing about him.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I am not going to attack that gentleman, Sir.

**Mr. President :** I am glad to hear this.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, this is an open secret and he takes pride in it. He has been the President of the Khilafat Committee and this is not a secret, Sir.

**Mr. President :** That's all?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I think, Sir, that if really anything done to help and taking part in the propaganda or celebration of the Independence Day is objected to by the Government, it ought to be objected to in all cases. Government should not single out only one case. There are thousands of cases of this nature where Government can direct its attention. Government up to this time has not been pleased, and I will say wisely, to take any action against those who have taken part in the celebration of the Independence Day.

Now, I must invite the attention of the Honourable House that here are the national flags of other countries (*showing a book with pictures of national flags*) and, Sir, these flags do not belong to those nationalities who have got complete independence, but even to those countries which have dominion status and which are bound to the British Empire by their oath of allegiance. They have got their own national flags but that is not against any oath of allegiance. Look here. Here is the flag of the Irish Free State. It looks like our own national flag. There is also the flag of Canada.

Now, I have brought our national flag to this House—(*Hear, hear*)—the Indian National Flag, and there is absolutely nothing in it to frighten the Government. No doubt, there is red colour in it, but it need not frighten anybody. Sir, what is my position? I honestly believe that the flying of the national flag is not against any oath of allegiance. I, Afzal Haq, who has taken the oath of allegiance fly the national flag (*waving the flag in his hand*) in this House. What is my position now? The position of Malik Lal Khan was exactly the same as it is mine at this moment. I would like to know from the Government benches and other benches, what is my constitutional position. I think that in spite of the fact that I have got the national flag in my hand and that I am flying that flag in this Honourable House, still

I think that I do abide by the oath of allegiance. (*A voice: You are not a Government servant*). This is a Government building. I don't think that there is any danger to the British Empire by hoisting the national flag. Sir, what was the state of affairs in Egypt?

**Mr. President:** But Egypt is not under discussion now.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq:** Sir, really Egypt is not under consideration at this moment, but my point is that those who are under the British Crown have their national flag, and there is absolutely no objection to our having our own national flag. My point, Sir, is this, that Government should be kind enough not to take any notice of these petty things as they have already done. Sir, if there were an English gentleman in the seat of my honourable friend, he would never have given such orders. I know that they think themselves very secure in their position, and they do not go out of their way to please their masters as an Indian gentleman would do. I say that the Honourable Minister has done wrong and was not well advised in unseating Malik Lal Khan for a very trivial thing. I hope that the Honourable Minister in replying to the debate will be pleased to assure this House that he did not mean what he did, and he really accepts the explanation of Malik Lal Khan who says that he is still of the opinion that the hoisting of the national flag is not against the oath of allegiance. With these words, I move my cut for the consideration of the House.

**Mr. President:** Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 60,000—Pay of Officers—Minister for Local Self-Government.”

**Mr. E. Maya Das** (nominated, non-official): Sir, it has been to me an intellectual treat to listen to the speech of the honourable member who has just sat down. He is perfectly right in his desire to convince us that what he believes to be true is the correct position and he has tried to place things before us in moderate language. In the same way I feel it my duty to place certain facts before him and try to convince him of a different way of thinking. First of all, any flag, idea or person that is held in high esteem and honour by a very large number of persons should not be lightly spoken of. We should be extremely careful in what we say, lest we should hurt the feelings of any one. In regard to any person like Mahatama Gandhi or any flag like the Independence flag of India, I would be the last person to utter any word of disrespect. In fact, I ought to examine their course of reasoning and to such extent that I find it true and practicable I should adopt it. But when I have difficulties before me in this matter I cannot help making mention of them.

What does a flag stand for? A flag is the symbol of the nation, and a flag represents its united strength. This is the idea with which the countries of the world look upon their respective flags. I beg to ask my honourable friend whether he can honestly say that the Independence flag which certainly at the present time is held in high regard by a large number of persons can be said to be the symbol of the nation? Can it be said that it represents our united strength? I am afraid not, because the Christian community and the Native States have so far not been represented on it. It is possible that

[Mr. E. Maya Das.]

in time to come when India becomes united, this flag with some modifications may be made the National flag, but it is not so to-day. I think already criticisms have appeared about the flag, that it is more a symbol of the absence of unity, because of the different religions which that flag stands for. In the flags of other countries, the red colour stands for the blood of those heroes who have died to make the flag what it is. But in the case of this flag, the red colour has a different meaning entirely, and the same is true of the other colours.

It has been stated that if a man is convinced in his mind that he is absolutely right in hoisting the national flag, that it is not against any law or against any person, then in that case he should not be punished. But what about people who have their convictions and believe themselves to be absolutely in the right? Yet, their liberty has to be curtailed. There are people who are brought up to be Thugs, brought up to be thieves and robbers, and they regularly make their offerings and prayers at shrines, and ask the goddess to bless their work, and are quite convinced, that they are acting in the right and proper manner. There are also people who are brought up to be cannibals from their birth, who never consider it wrong to kill a human being and devour him. These may be extreme examples, but my object in making mention of them is to show that the mere conviction that the hoisting of the flag is not wrong, does not render the act harmless, nor does it make it consistent with the oath of allegiance which a municipal member has to take.

In India, from a very long time the star has been looked upon as a symbol of the nation, but the star is absent in this flag.

Mere statements made by the honourable member that the Honourable Minister has acted wrongly in taking the step he has taken against Malik Lal Khan, cannot carry conviction in the absence of proof. No argument that has been put forward by the honourable member has appealed to me. The honourable mover mentioned the case of Calcutta, that the Deputy Mayor there acted in a similar manner and yet was not punished. What does that matter to us? There are many matters in which we do not follow Bengal. Why should we copy them in this?

Finally, I would ask the honourable mover just one question. Self-preservation is the first instinct of life. Supposing, when the German cruiser *Emden* was bombarding Madras, the National flag had been flying over this land, I respectfully ask in all seriousness, would the steamer from Australia have come for our defence? I am not saying a word against the National flag, I wish to give it all the honour that I can, but from the point of self-preservation I ask whether the Australian battleship *Sydney* would have been just as ready and willing to come to our assistance and blow up the *Emden* as they did then? Just as you cannot have two kings ruling in the same country, so you cannot have two flags flying over the same country.

The honourable member stated that the flag of Canada was quite separate and had no connection with the Union Jack; I do not know where he got his information from, because it is quite wrong, because the Union Jack, along with some other symbols which are indicative of the prosperity of that Dominion, has a place on the Canadian flag.

What does the Union Jack stand for? The perpendicular red cross is that of St. George of England, the diagonal white cross is that of St. Andrews of Scotland and the diagonal red cross, that of St. Patrick of Ireland. These three crosses are all on the Union Jack. If Canada, Ireland or Scotland have other flags of local interest that may be, but they are all connected with the Union Jack in some way or another, and is the sign that those countries recognise themselves as belonging to the Empire. All those flags are merged in the Union Jack, which stands for the united strength of the Empire and gives protection to all who take shelter under it.

With these words I beg to oppose the motion.

**Mir Maqbool Mahmood** [Amritsar, Muhammadan, Rural] : Sir, We have all listened very carefully to the interesting oration from the honourable member who has proposed this cut both yesterday and to-day. And if I may, Sir, with your permission, I would compliment him on the sense of oratory which he always imports in his speeches and the subtlety with which he always succeeds, wholly or in part, in confusing the real issue with the sentimental side of the question which he presents to the House. He has to-day in presenting his case tried to confuse the real issue. The issue before us, so far as I can see, is not whether the holding of, or the carrying of, the National flag is a crime or an offence or even a misdemeanour that would entitle one to be unseated from one's seat on a local committee. The issue, to my mind, is something very much different. It so happens that on that day, the 26th of January, a particular line of policy by a section of my countrymen was launched, and the hoisting of the flag on that particular day implied the allegiance to the policy enunciated on that particular day by those who hoisted the flag. It also implied that those institutions and those places where this flag was hoisted from that day stood committed to follow the instructions of the Congress and the particular creed of political action that may be enjoined by that particular body. In fact, I have taken some pains to study the various manifestoes issued for the celebration of the 26th January, and I can say without hesitation that it also implied the association and allegiance to the particular resolution moved in the Congress at Lahore regarding independence and the programme there laid out, to which programme I am glad to find that even my honourable friend who has proposed this cut did not give full allegiance as he is here with us which we all welcome. Even in the Congress itself I was glad to find that my honourable friend pleaded and urged for the postponement of the resolution to which he has rightly and wisely not subscribed in action. Not only that. I have here with me the declaration which was to go with the hoisting of the flag on that day which makes it clear what that hoisting on that day was intended to connote. I shall not detain the House by reading the whole of this through, but I shall just invite the attention of the House to one or two salient features. It says:

'The British connection in India has not only deprived the Indian people of their freedom, but has abused itself with exploitation of the masses and has ruined India economically, politically, culturally and spiritually. We believe, therefore, that India must sever the British connection and attain *Purna Swaraj*, or complete independence.'

[Mir Maqbool Mahmood.]

That is one portion of the creed that is to go with the hoisting of the independence flag on that particular day. Later on :

'We hold it to be a crime against man and God to submit any longer to a rule that has caused this disaster to our country. We recognise, however, that the most effective way of gaining our freedom is not through violence. We will therefore prepare ourselves by withdrawing so far as we can all voluntary association from British Government and will prepare for civil disobedience including non-payment of taxes.'

The part to which my honourable friend does not himself subscribe then follows :—

'We are convinced that if we can but withdraw our voluntary help and stop payment of taxes without doing violence even under provocation, the end of this inhuman rule is assured. We, therefore, hereby solemnly resolve to carry out the Congress instructions issued from time to time for the purpose of establishing *Purna Swaraj*!'

That, Sir, was the significance of the hoisting of the flag on that day. And I would submit that so far as the majority of this Council is concerned there is unanimity on the point that we do not subscribe to that particular creed and that particular declaration of policy. That being the position, the only issue that is before us is whether the action of the Honourable the Minister in this particular respect was constitutional or whether it was such as to deserve a censure of his policy from the constitutional point of view, so far as we are concerned.

Before I refer to the question I wish to make one point clear. So far as the National flag is concerned, I entirely agree with my honourable friend who moved this that it is not a crime to hoist it, and I fully subscribe to the view that it is an emblem of India's liberty and unity and of her status as a member of the British Commonwealth. But the significance of the National flag on that particular day is relevant in discussing the issue on the policy of the Minister. What was the issue before him on the day this declaration was made? This declaration involves civil disobedience; this declaration involves a policy of which he would have been guilty if he had not put his foot down on it, because it is against the majority policy to which he stands committed. What did the Minister do? Obviously he sat on it to consider, he visualised before himself the position in which he stood. I have no ill-will against the vice-president concerned whom I know personally. He thought, was it open to a vice-president to go against the terms of his oath of allegiance? *Firstly*, it is obvious that the majority of the members of the committee concerned were not a party to the action of the vice-president on that particular day. He took the law in his own hands and his action was not endorsed by the majority of the committee. *Secondly*, apart from that, he wanted to commit a particular local self-government institution, the municipal committee of Gujranwala, on that particular date to this particular creed from which we have all dissented. What would the Minister do? If he had remained inactive, it would have meant—I will not say passive assistance—his conniving at the commitment of the municipality to the creed which we have charged him to desist from. He had to search his heart as to what action he should take. It was open to him to take any action he chose under sections 14 and 16 of the Municipal Act. Without boring the House by reading the whole sections I will just refer to the relevant portions, Section 14 (e) says that it is open to him to unseat any specified member

whether elected or appointed on a certain date. What is the criterion or issue on which he could declare that seat vacant? The preamble explains it. 'For any reason which it (the local Government) may deem to affect the public interests'. Later on, under section 16, he could have declared the seat vacant if in the opinion of the Local Government "he has flagrantly abused his position as a member of the committee." My friend tried to make a point by asking whether it was his position as a vice-president or his position as a member of the committee that he abused. I would concentrate primarily on section 14 (a). I would say if the Minister was right, I am speaking from the legal point, in unseating that member under section 14 (a), the moment he was unseated he was ineligible to be a vice-president and he could not be a vice-president if he could not be a member. Under section 14 (e) he could not be a member if in the opinion of the Local Government he has done something for which in the public interests he deserves to be unseated. The question is, was the action taken by the vice-president against the interests of the public? On that issue opinions may differ. But I and those for whom I speak are convinced that the goal of India's legitimate aspirations is dominion status, and we are convinced that the Honourable Minister would have been guilty of dereliction of his duties to this Council and the constitution he is entrusted with if he had not taken the action he did. (*Hear, hear.*)

Reference has also been made to the attitude of a Corporation elsewhere outside this province in regard to this matter. It is clear that in the Calcutta Corporation to which reference has been made, the majority of the members held a different opinion. That, to my mind, cannot be a constitutional justification for the action to be taken here. There is also this difference that in the Bengal Municipal Act, there is a proviso to the oath of allegiance under which people there have tried to commit particular actions. The proviso says 'If a person who by constitutional means endeavour to make changes in the constitution he shall not be deemed to have thereby violated the oath of allegiance.' (*Interruption.*) I am one of those who feel, though I have no authority to declare it officially, that the hoisting of the flag under the particular circumstances is not constitutional. Whether the authorities at Calcutta chose to take action or not, that is their concern. We are entitled to express our views just as the honourable mover has tried to.

Now, Sir, referring back to the action of the vice-president of the municipality concerned, if I may speak with due deference to him, he has in a way stultified even the dignity of the national flag by placing it officially on an institution that day when he knew that the majority of the committee did not subscribe to the creed which he wanted to give an impression to the world they were following. If you analyse the situation, you will agree that the vice-president concerned did not do justice even to the national flag by hoisting it on an institution where he knew that the policy indicated by that flag on that particular day was not welcomed and the flag would have been thrown over the moment it was hoisted.

Great stress has been laid by my honourable friend on the propriety of the section in the Act that should have applied to the action of the Minister. I have so far tried to explain (1) that constitutionally it was open to the



[Mir Maqbool Mahmood.]

Minister to take the action he did, (2) if he had not done so, he would have been guilty of a neglect of duty so far as this House is concerned. If any of our friends on the opposition feel that the Minister was wrong in applying the section that he did, it is open to them to take the matter to the law courts and obtain a verdict as to the legality of his action as to whether he has abused his powers under the Act. So far as we in this Council are concerned, we will in unanimous terms declare our opposition to the policy which the hoisting of the national flag connoted. I am sure that it does not need any formal declaration from any educated Indian or any Indian who is worthy of his country's traditions. However unpleasant it may be, where the issue involved is the ordered progress of the country, and where the choice lies between chaos and cosmos, it shall be our duty, and we shall not budge an inch, to take direct action in dealing with such things as tend to retard the progress of the country. I submit, to me it seems, just as, I am sure, it seems to many others, that the action of the vice-president on that particular day in acting as he did was not only unconstitutional, was not only riding roughshod over the feelings of the majority members of the Committee, but it was one to which the preponderating majority in the province and the most responsible elements in the country would not subscribe. With these words, I appeal to the House, and in this matter I am not appealing to sentiment, to concentrate on the issue before us and realise as to what they would have done in similar circumstances if they had been placed in the position of the Minister.

One word more. I would ask my friend, the mover of this cut, is it or is it not a fact that some of the highest authorities have declared in connection with the boycott of councils that those who subscribed to the Independence creed cannot take the oath of allegiance? (*Chaudhri Afzal Haq*: No, no.) I would appeal to my friend to read the articles of Mahatma Gandhi. It is a point on which there is a difference of opinion even in the Congress camp. So, was it or was it not open to the Honourable Minister and those who agree with him to declare that this action of the vice-president was against the oath of allegiance to which he has subscribed as a member of that municipal committee? (*Cheers*).

**Sardar Harbakhsh Singh** [Hoshiarpur and Kangra (Sikh,) Rural] (Urdu): Sir, the matter before the House is very important and it will have to be considered very calmly and carefully. I could never believe that dishonest motives could be attributed to a member like the honourable mover of this cut for, it is my belief, that he is one of those who in their conduct as members of the Council have never been actuated by other than honest motives of public interest. This motion, I thought, must likewise have honesty of purpose behind it and the additional fact that the mover and the honourable gentleman against whom this cut has been moved belong to the same community would apparently have convinced us *prima facie* that there was something seriously wrong with the action taken by the latter against Malik Lal Khan to justify the cut. But after very carefully listening to the speech of my friend Chaudhri Afzal Haq I have come to a different conclusion. I think that he has not been able to make out a case for condemning the policy of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government with reference to the order unseating Malik Lal Khan.



In order to arrive at a correct decision with regard to the matter, we shall have to take two things into consideration. In the first place we have to see what the position of the municipalities in the present constitution of the country is. No one will deny that they are directly under the authority of the Government. They are not independent bodies in the sense that it will not be illegal for the presidents or vice-presidents and for other office-holders of these bodies to do anything against the constituted authority under an enactment of law. In their subordinate position, as such, the presidents and vice-presidents and the members of these bodies who take an oath of allegiance to the Crown before entering on their duties, must conform to that oath. They cannot say that they are independent and owe no allegiance to the Crown. So far as they are in these bodies they must remain faithful to the Crown. But if any of them is inclined to recognise no heavenly or earthly authority, let him vacate his seat in the municipality concerned. (*Laughter*). He will then be at liberty to do anything he likes, because there will be no oath to bind him. Next, we have to see what this so-called national flag connotes and whether it is really a national flag. I shall be excused if I say that it is not a national flag. Every country and its people are free to form themselves into a nation and any efforts made in that direction must be appreciated. My countrymen have also been making efforts to create a nation in India, but so far they have failed in their attempts for various reasons. I wish that we Indians could claim to have become a nation and the flag that was to be hoisted on the premises of Gujranwala Municipal Committee was a national flag in the real sense of the word. But if I were to call a spade a spade, I cannot help saying that it is not a national flag. I have seen it to-day for the first time, but I find that there is no colour of the Sikh community in it. Members of the Council will be aware of the fact that before the night of the 31st December, 1929 when this national flag was to be hoisted in the Congress pandal here according to the announcement made by the Congress, Sardar Kharak Singh made enquiries to know whether any colour representing the Sikh community would find a place in the flag. Thereupon Mahatama Gandhi is said to have promised that the yellow colour of the Sikhs would appear at the top of the colours representing other communities. But in the flag that was actually hoisted on that memorable night, this colour did not seem to have appeared. Perhaps those who were in charge of this show had no time to arrange for a new cloth for a flag in which the yellow colour would have also appeared. (*Laughter*). I am not joking. I am talking in all seriousness. The independence day was celebrated a long time afterwards, on 26th January, but yet the Sikh colour was missing, as this miniature flag of Chaudhri Afzal Haq shows. Now I wonder how in the very city of Maharaja Ranjit Singh and under the Presidentship of a Sikh gentlemen a flag devoid of Sikh colour could be hoisted as a national flag. The honourable mover of this cut referred to countries like Ireland and Canada and said that they had their own national flags besides the Union Jack and the British Government, which is the sovereign Government, has never taken exception to the hoisting of these flags by the people of such countries anywhere in their countries. That is quite so, but their flags are not banners of rebellion or so-called complete independence outside the Empire. On the other hand, the flag that was hoisted

[8. Harbakhsh Singh.]

on the 31st of December, 1929 and the flag that was hoisted on the Gujranwala municipal building purported to denote severance of connection with the British Government in India and to give ultimatum to the Government that because dominion status was not promised, India represented by the Congress would declare independence. Under the circumstances

3 P.M.

the hoisting of this so-called national flag was not compatible with allegiance to the Crown and because the vice-president of the Gujranwala municipal committee gave permission to hoist that flag on the premises of the municipal committee, which is directly under the Government, he acted *ultra vires* and against the oath of allegiance and, therefore, the action of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government in unseating him was not unjustified. I presume Malik Lal Khan to be a good man, because he probably feels for the country in his own way of thinking, but his action was in this case quite incompatible with the terms of his oath as a member of a legally constituted corporation, and he should not grudge paying the penalty for his rather bold and disloyal action which he, no doubt, might have been inspired to take, to win the popularity of the section of people of his own way of thinking, but which was, all the same, a suicidal thing with regard to the question of retaining his membership of the committee. This censure motion is, consequently, undeserved and unjustifiable. The Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government had no personal grudge against the gentleman in question. He had rather done him a favour on a previous occasion when certain legal objections were raised against the candidature of Malik Lal Khan for election to the municipal committee the Honourable Minister, by a lenient interpretation of the law on the subject, had waived those objections in his favour. For this reason it is untenable to say that the Honourable Minister had any personal grudge against the *ex-vice-president* of the Gujranwala municipal committee.

The honourable mover of the motion has to-day gone out of his way and referred to the activities of the Honourable Minister as a member of the Khalifat Committee of bye-gone days. By reference to these activities of the Minister he perhaps wanted to show that there was no difference between him and the Minister and that both were agitators against the Government. But he has overlooked one thing. The Khilafat Committee was then a religious body and there was no harm if the Honourable Minister took part in that Committee. Similarly, the Akali movement was a religious movement and many a Sikh of all shades of opinion had taken part in it. The loyalists as well as extremists had joined in that movement and even in the opinion of the Government, they had done nothing wrong in doing so, as long as they adhered to the purely religious programme. A reference to these activities was, in fact, irrelevant and it would have been better if the honourable mover had refrained from mentioning them. The Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government has, in my opinion, acted very dispassionately and with a great sense of duty in unseating Malik Lal Khan and in order to appreciate his action a motion to enhance his salary should have been brought forward instead of the present motion. (*Laughter*). To discharge his duties the Honourable Minister could not be expected to pay

regard to opinions and he had to do what the circumstances of the case justified. Malik Lal Khan's note to which Chaudhri Afzal Haq has alluded simply says that in his own opinion he acted rightly. That is nothing and could not imply that he, as a matter of fact, did not violate his oath. The action of the Minister has also been criticised on the ground that his action has been based on a wrong provision of the Municipal Act. It has been argued that Malik Lal Khan had acted as vice-president when sanctioning the hoisting of the flag and, therefore, action should have been taken under section 22 of the Municipal Act. But it has not been realised that in giving permission for hoisting the flag, Malik Lal Khan had acted against the oath of allegiance which he had taken as a member of the committee and not as vice-president. He, therefore, could not be allowed to remain a member and when he was unseated, he had automatically to vacate the chair of the vice-president. Look at this matter from any point of view and you will find that the action of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government cannot be criticised and declared unjust. The honourable mover of this cut may be said to have moved it to win cheap notoriety and we know that he will be applauded by the ignorant public. But the fact is that the Honourable Minister does not deserve this censure and I hope that honourable members of the House will not be carried away by appeals to sentiment while voting on this motion.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan** [South-East Towns (Muhammadan), Urban] (Urdu): Sir, I was surprised to hear the speech of the honourable member for Hoshiarpur. He has misunderstood the honourable mover in so far as he said that the latter had, by reading an extract from the *Inqilab*, made an attack, and an unreasonable attack, on the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government. The honourable mover had no such intention. It was with a different object that he had brought these facts to light, i.e., that the Honourable Minister took part in the deliberations of the Khilafat Conference, which is a religious as well as a political body, subscribed a substantial amount to its funds, and in fact, was then a patron of that Reception Committee of the Conference which was the first to pass the resolution of independence. Need I mention that it was in December last, that the Khilafat Conference held its sittings at Lahore. My honourable friend's object was to show that it was no offence to subscribe to the creed of those who supported that resolution and who accordingly were in favour of the hoisting of the national flag, and that if it was an offence, the Honourable Minister was equally guilty of it. (*The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon*: I have already denied the correctness of those statements.)

I know that and I would not have referred to this point if it had not been necessary to clear the misunderstanding created in the mind of the honourable member for Hoshiarpur (Sardar Harbakhsh Singh). I wonder why so much has been made of the resolution of Independence? It was not passed at Lahore for the first time. It was rather renewed in this session of the Congress. It was, therefore, not a novel thing for which its supporters could be hanged. At least Government does not think that it is a serious offence to support the resolution of Independence. The Government, I think, has acted wisely in not launching a campaign of repression in consequence of this resolution. Then the honourable member for Hoshiarpur expressed a wish that this flag had been a national flag

[Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan.]

in the real sense of the word, and that Indians could claim to be a nation. That is a wish which every lover of the country should entertain. But the fact that the Indian nation has yet to be created and the flag has yet to become a national flag was no ground to oppose this motion. Nations are not created in a day. It takes years and years to blend the different elements in a country and shape them into one whole. My friend should have rather supported this motion and he should have realised that, if such action were permitted to be taken against the well-wishers of the country, the attempts at nation building would receive a set back. My friend has further complained that the national flag was not representative of all the communities because the yellow colour of the Sikhs did not appear in that flag. He said that it was an insult to the Sikhs to give permission for the hoisting of such a flag on the premises of the municipal committee of a town, which is the birth place of Maharaja Ranjit Singh and which is a sacred place in the eyes of the Sikhs. I think he was joking all the time and if he was serious, he should know, that the action taken by the Minister against Malik Lal Khan, who had given that permission, goes to show that the flag was something more than a national flag, which had enraged the Minister so much that the latter had no other course open but to unseat Malik Lal Khan.

But these are all side issues. The real issue before the House is whether the action taken by the Honourable Minister against Malik Lal Khan was legal, and secondly, whether his action even if authorized by law, was proper and justified under the circumstances. The resolution of Independence, the celebration of the day of Independence and the hoisting of the flag on the 26th of January last meant to convey to Government the feelings of the Indians and the goal that political India had in view. It was really a strange argument against this motion to say that if the national flag had been allowed to be hoisted on the municipal building, the municipal committee concerned would have been committed to the policy and creed of the Congress. That is an argument which is fallacious on the face of it. This national flag had actually been hoisted on the buildings of many of the municipal committees without committing them to a certain policy.

Now I proceed to examine the legal aspect of the question. Section 16 (e) of the Municipal Act under which the order against Malik Lal Khan was passed, did not at all apply to this case (*A voice* : The order was passed under section 16 (e) as well as under section 14 (e) of the Act). If that is so, it shows that the Honourable Minister himself was not sure which of the two sections applied to this case and he, therefore, thought it best to base his order on both of these sections. I shall first try to show that section 16 (e) was not applicable to the present case. It runs as follows :—

‘ If in the opinion of the Local Government he has flagrantly abused his position as a member of the committee.’

Now, nobody, as a member could pass orders that the flag should or should not be hoisted on the buildings of the committee. This could be done either by the committee as a whole or by the president or the vice-president. The president was not present at that time and Malik Lal Khan who is the senior vice-president of the committee, thought that it was in the public interest that he should allow the flag to be hoisted on the buildings

of the municipal committee. Thus, it was as the vice-president acting in the absence of the president and not in the capacity of an ordinary member, that he allowed the hoisting of the flag on the Town Hall. Therefore, if any action was to be taken against him on the basis of these orders, it should be taken in his capacity of vice-president. But as there is no provision in the Municipal Act under which this could be done, the Honourable Minister called section 16 (e) to his help and so interpreted it as to serve his purpose. Moreover, the Deputy Commissioner was fully competent to enquire into the matter, and if the committee did not approve of the action of Malik Lal Khan, they could have called an urgent meeting and recorded their disapproval. But as the committee was not against the action taken by its vice-president, the authorities did not adopt this proper course and invoked the help of section 16 (e).

Then section 14 (e) on which so much stress has been laid by the honourable member representing Amritsar, Rural, runs as follows :—

"That the seat of any specified member, whether elected or appointed shall be vacated at a given date and in such case such seat shall be vacated accordingly, notwithstanding anything in this Act or in the rules made thereunder."

This again relates to one's seat as an ordinary member and has nothing to do with the office of the president or the vice-president. Not only that. In this case you also have to serve a notice to the effect that such and such a seat is to be vacated on and from such and such a date. But nothing of the sort was done in this case. However, this section also is not in the least applicable in the case of a president and vice-president. Therefore it is absolutely wrong to say that the Honourable Minister was justified in taking the action which he did. No cogent argument has so far been advanced in its justification and it is as clear as daylight that it was wholly unwarranted.

Next, we come to the advisability or otherwise of the Honourable Minister's action in view of the attitude at present adopted by the Government towards the Independence and flag hoisting movement. The honourable member for Amritsar, Rural, has spoken of the matter as if the world would have come to a sudden end had not the Honourable Minister passed these orders. But, I submit Sir, that the Independence day was celebrated throughout the length and breadth of the country. Meetings were held in every city not excluding Lahore and national flags were hoisted in the presence of hundreds of thousands of people. But the Government very wisely abstained from taking any rash step and ignored the matter. On the other hand, our Minister who is entrusted with the great responsibility of teaching us the ways of self-government and is also responsible to the Council, at once jumps upon the Gujranwala municipal committee and removes Malik Lal Khan from that body. Now, if the Government had adopted a similar attitude itself, then, of course, it could be said with some fairness that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government had no other course open, but where Government is ignoring these activities elsewhere there was no necessity for the Honourable Minister to overdo himself in this case.

Then it was said that the majority of the members of the Gujranwala municipal committee had made a representation to the Honourable Minister disapproving and protesting against the action of Malik Lal Khan. But, when it was asked as to when that representation was received, it was found

[ Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan. ]

that it was made after Malik Sahib had been removed from the committee. Sir, we might have attached some weight to that representation had it been made by the members before the Minister had passed orders unseating Malik Lal Khan. But what do we find here? The Honourable Minister had passed his orders and some members had resigned their seats in protest against the action taken by him. It was after all this had happened that the Honourable Minister decided to avail himself of the opportunity and, somehow or other, prevailed upon the remaining members to make that representation. This shows that the Honourable Minister himself was not sure of his ground as far as the legality of his action was concerned and, therefore, tried to create circumstances in justification of his action. Thus the action of the Honourable Minister has no legal or political justification. It was illegal, unconstitutional and ill-advised. I, therefore, strongly support the amendment.

**Mr. Din Muhammad** [East and West Central Towns (Muhammadan) Urban]: Sir, I am a member of the municipal committee to which this incident relates and I owe a duty to the House to explain the whole situation, and to place all the facts before the House so that the right decision may be arrived at on the motion in question.

It was in pursuance of a resolution of independence passed on the 1st January, 1980 by the Indian National Congress at Lahore that the Congress Committee at Gujranwala decided to celebrate the Independence Day on the 26th January in obedience to the mandate issued by the president of the Congress, Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru. The Congress Committee on the 25th through its secretary approached Malik Lal Khan, who was then the senior vice-president of the municipal committee and submitted an application in writing to be permitted to hoist the independence flag on the Town Hall on the 26th. The vice-president referred that application to the secretary of the municipal committee. He enquired from the secretary whether the president was in the station and on learning that he was out of station issued an order permitting the Congress Committee to hoist the flag on the town hall as had been arranged before. Up till the 26th none of us knew what was going to happen. All these facts saw the light of day on the afternoon of the 26th. On the 26th when several people assembled outside the Town Hall it came to the notice of the authorities that some flag was going to be hoisted on the Town Hall. Malik Lal Khan, the senior vice-president, who was responsible for this order, was also there. No sooner did the authorities come to know of it, than they sent for Malik Lal Khan and he confessed that he had passed the said order on the application which was submitted to him by the secretary of the local Congress Committee. It was then that under section 232 the Deputy Commissioner exercised his power of suspension of the order of the vice-president and deputed a magistrate to go to the Town Hall to announce his orders to the public that had assembled there. After this, an enquiry was started into the affair and it was on the 2nd of February that some members of the committee drafted a resolution condemning the president for the facility which they thought he had afforded to the vice-president in the commission of this act by absenting himself on the 25th. Capital is being made of the fact that the written protest was a belated one. I

make bold to say that on the 2nd February those persons who had protested later had actually drafted a resolution against the conduct of the president in absenting himself on the 25th, for they thought that this facilitated the commission of this act, and that, therefore, he was as much guilty of this act as the vice-president. (*Hear, hear*). On the 3rd the Honourable Minister happened to go to Gujranwala to attend a durbar that was being held by His Excellency the Governor; and this protest was conveyed to him by persons who represented the majority party in the municipal committee. A representation was made to the Honourable Minister that Malik Lal Khan, as senior vice-president of the committee, had flagrantly abused his position; that he had no business whatsoever to issue such an order which affected the creed of the whole committee, especially when he knew that a large majority of the members of the committee was opposed to it. (*A voice: When was that representation made?*) It was on the 3rd February when His Excellency the Governor had gone there in connection with the opening of the health centre that this protest was made. We were informed that enquiries were being actually held into this matter. If it is necessary to see whether those members who protested later were actually thinking of putting in a protest against this conduct of the senior vice-president, I would refer the honourable mover to the issues of the *Tribune* of those days which clearly show that a resolution condemning the president had been drafted for various considerations by various members of the committee. I was the person who drafted it. Some people have even taken photographs of the draft.

Now, Sir, our protest was based on the fact that if this flag was hoisted on the Town Hall, it would carry the impression that the municipal committee subscribed to the creed of Mahatma Gandhi or to the creed of the Congress that was promulgated after the 1st January, 1930. We did not want the public to have that impression as regards the municipal committee. Honourable members are aware that in that corporate body no individual action is possible and no individual member has got any independent existence whatsoever. The business of the committee is to be conducted by the corporate body itself and the will of the majority is to prevail. If, therefore, any member arrogates to himself the powers of the majority of the committee and issues an order which is quite inconsistent with the will of the majority, the only punishment or the only penalty that can be inflicted on him is his removal from membership. And it is absolutely necessary that such stringent measures should be adopted now, as, we are expecting the grant of further instalment of reforms every day (*A voice: Every minute*). Yes, every minute. We are going to step into the shoes of our present administrators. If we play lightly with our responsibilities in this manner, if we do not realise what our rights are, if we do not realise that despotic rule will not do, if we do not submit our personal idiosyncracies to the will of the majority, then we cannot be considered entitled to any further instalment of reforms. That is the reason why the Minister for Local Self-Government took this opportunity to teach everybody that this was not the way in which municipalities were to be administered. (*A voice: Despotic?*) It was not despotic. It was a protest against the despotism of Malik Lal Khan. It was to teach him



[Mr. Din Muhammad.]

how to behave constitutionally, how to realise the responsibilities of a responsible office. It was to check the arbitrariness, the autocratic display of one's power that the Minister for Local Self-Government was compelled to pass this order. (*Dr. Gokul Chand Narang*: Did Malik Lal Khan join in the protest?) I am talking of the will of the majority. I can demonstrate that Malik Lal Khan and his associates are in a hopeless minority. (*An Honourable Member*: Was not Malik Lal Khan elected president of the committee?) This is not the occasion to divulge everything that happened at the time of his election. If I am to divulge all that happened on that occasion, it would only go to prove that we are not entitled to any sort of reforms. (*Hear, hear*). (*Inter-ruption*). Malik Lal Khan was put forward as a candidate by the Hindu members in order to defeat the rightful Muslim candidate. (*Hear, hear*). That is the reason why Malik Lal Khan got the support of the Hindu members of the committee. This, however, is not the occasion to divulge those secrets. We are here concerned with one fact alone, and that is, whether Malik Lal Khan was authorised under the provisions of the Municipal Act to issue an order on the 25th for hoisting the national flag on the Town Hall. (*A voice*: Who was the rightful candidate? The honourable speaker himself?) There were many. If I were to make a reference again to that old history, I feel ashamed to say that these very Hindu members put forward an illiterate blacksmith to defeat a Muslim candidate who was literate and who was in every way qualified to occupy the office.

**Mr. President**: That is not relevant to the matter now before the House.

**Mr. Din Muhammad**: I would submit, Sir, that you be pleased to ask the honourable members not to interrupt me with irrelevant remarks. I only reply to their queries lest my silence should be misinterpreted.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang**: The honourable member mentioned the letter protesting against the autocracy of Malik Lal Khan. The question is whether the Malik joined in the protest? That question has not been answered.

**Mr. Din Muhammad**: I was coming to that, but I was not allowed to proceed.

It was urged by the honourable member for the Ambala division urban constituency (Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan) that the national flag was hoisted on that day because a large majority of the members of the municipal committee was in its favour, and that was why no protest was made in time, and no action was taken under section 22. That was the argument advanced by the honourable member who just preceded me. I have already submitted that a protest was made and that the majority was opposed to the views of Malik Lal Khan. That is evident from the fact that when Malik Lal Khan was unseated, only six members of the committee, that is, less than one-third of the committee expressed sympathy with him, and the remaining, that is, two-thirds of the committee, not only did not express any sympathy with him, but further expressed their disapproval. The only conclusion possible from this is that at least two-thirds of the members of the committee were not in favour of the action of Malik Lal Khan.



Even the six members who had tendered their resignations in sympathy with Malik Lal Khan have scrupulously avoided—and this is the most important point—they have scrupulously avoided to mention that they had any sympathy with Malik Lal Khan or that they in any way authorised him to hoist the flag. They have clearly stated that whatever their political views may be, they considered that the act of unseating Malik Lal Khan was unconstitutional.

Now, the only question to be determined is whether the Minister acted unconstitutionally or not. The honourable member who just preceded me has been pleased to remark that there is a section in the Municipal Act (section 85), which empowers the president or, in his absence, the vice-president to issue any order he likes.

Sir, this section has always been grossly abused, and I shall show just now that section 85 has been abused in this case also. So far as its right use is concerned, I am sure that the critics have not taken the trouble to read what section 85 lays down. Section 85 reads as follows:—

"In cases of emergency the president or, in his absence or during the vacancy of his office, a vice-president may direct the execution of any work or the doing of any act which the committee is empowered to execute or do, and the immediate execution or doing of which is, in his opinion, necessary for the service or safety of the public, and may direct that the expense of executing such work or doing such act shall be paid from the municipal fund."

Now, Sir, it is for the honourable members of this House to see whether the immediate hoisting of the national flag was necessary for the safety of the public of that Municipality. If the majority of the representatives of the people there had been consulted or had agreed to it, then it could be contended that the majority of the public considered that it was a piece of good service to them to have the flag hoisted. But in this case the vice-president did not consult anybody; rather by passing this order he took them by surprise. It follows, therefore, that he had not exercised his legitimate powers and legitimate authority vested in him as senior vice-president.

Now, Sir, the question is whether this act was such as deserved such a severe penalty and this is the most pertinent question to be asked. Unfortunately, I do not agree with those honourable members who consider that the hoisting of the flag on a town hall is a very light matter. I would not agree even with the Honourable Members of Government if, for reasons of state or for reasons of expediency or for other political reasons, they tried to mince matters and treat this question very lightly. (Interruption). Sir, it is my personal opinion and I have every right to hold that personal opinion whether Government Members or other honourable members hold it or not. Sir, a flag is not an innocent piece of cloth, which it is represented to be. It is an outward manifestation of what lies embedded in one's heart. It is a symbol of the political creed that one follows. It is an indication of the power to which one owes allegiance. If it means anything at all, it means this and nothing else.

Sir, we have to see whether in this House we can play lightly with such affairs. The Government might be weak and the Government might remain inactive. But I would go to the length of saying that it is the right of every peaceful, law-abiding citizen to demand from the Government

[Mr. Din Muhammad.]

that they should tell him once for all whether they are going to be his protectors or not against the rival party that sets itself up against him. If a flag is hoisted in pursuance of an independence resolution which has actually advocated the severance from British control, however harmless it may appear to the honourable the mover of the motion, to me it does not look so innocent and so harmless. We have not to look at the act alone, we have to look at the motive too under which the act is done. (*Interruption*).

If we compare a flag with a gun or a bomb, personally, I would say that the flag is much more serious, much more dangerous than the throwing of a bomb or the firing of a gun. One is only a temporary aberration and the other a permanent delinquency. My friend knows that even the most merciful God who condones every sin, does not condone the sin of setting up a rival against Him. Sir, I have been trying to show to the honourable members of this House that we cannot play lightly with it. Anybody is welcome to throw off his allegiance, but he should not be allowed to blow hot and cold in the same breath.

This creed of independence is the creed against which the honourable the mover protested most vehemently when it was discussed in the subjects committee of the National Congress. The honourable mover himself not once, not twice, but thrice opposed Mahatma Gandhi and advised him not to launch upon this movement of lawlessness.

آپ نے یہ خرد نہ پسندی پر دیگران سے منع کیا۔ This is the very same creed which every honourable member of this House, whether he calls himself a socialist or a nationalist, whether he calls himself a Congressman or a Mahasabhibite has refused to follow. Otherwise, these gentlemen would not have been here. I fail to understand the attitude of these inconsistent gentlemen. What they do not like for themselves, they want to inflict upon others. If they would have followed the creed of Mahatma Gandhi, they would not have been here to-day. People who have followed the creed of Mahatma Gandhi have walked out of the Council Hall. Take a homely instance. Supposing on the 26th January some member of the congress committee in spite of the mandate of Pandit Jawahar Lal Nehru, had hoisted a Union Jack on the Congress buildings instead of the National flag, would he have been allowed to remain there? No. He would have been at once turned out of the Congress building. Public demonstrations would have been held against him and he would have been hooted down, he would have been denounced by the Congress people, and disowned by them. Exactly the same thing has happened here. So long as you hold a creed, stick to it; and if you do not want to hold it, then walk out. You have absolutely no business to break the law and then complain that you are penalized for breaking that law.

Sir, a point was being made out of the fact that the Minister was himself a member of the Khilafat Committee, which passed a resolution of independence later on, and it was urged that the same Honourable Minister was not in any way justified to condemn this action. In the first instance, I do not at all endorse the opinion expressed or the remarks made by the honourable members on this point. It is one thing to hold independence

as an ideal and a totally different thing to claim it immediately. Everybody, every true patriotic Indian would hold independence as an ideal. Even Government would not refuse this to us. The only difference between those who advocate immediate independence and those who hold independence as an ideal is this, that the latter say that the country is not yet prepared to undertake that heavy responsibility is not yet fit for complete independence, and that under the present circumstances, we must remain loyal to the Crown or the power that protects us against foreign aggression. (A voice: Complete independence is your final goal?)

**Mr. President :** Please do not interrupt the honourable member who is in possession of the House.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Sir, he is arguing a case. He need not get excited.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** It is you, gentlemen, who are losing your patience. I am going on smoothly. Sir, my submission is that the Honourable Minister has never subscribed to the creed which is advocated by Mahatma Gandhi or the National Congress. The Khilafat Committee does not at all subscribe to that creed. I was a member of that committee myself and I make bold to say that their resolution was couched in terms which were altogether different from the terms which were used by the National Congress. The Honourable Minister, therefore, cannot at all be condemned for being a member of the Khilafat Committee. Sir, this is also a fact that the Honourable Minister was not at all present in the meeting when the said resolution was passed. I would, however, say that if in spite of being a member of the Khilafat Committee, he considers that his office calls upon him to issue an order in the interest of law and justice which is inconsistent with the Khilafat creed, he should be given more credit for that, because this means that he sacrifices his own personal ideal at the altar of the higher ideal of Duty that he has placed before him. The Honourable Minister may hold any creed he likes, he cannot be condemned for that. But here his action should be commended that he has suppressed his personal inclinations, he has suppressed his personal whims, he has suppressed his personal idiosyncrasies and issued an order which is consistent with law, order and justice.

Another point urged by the honourable member for Ambala Urban

4 P.M.

Constituency was that any declaration that was made by the Congress was not a declaration of independence and that the resolution which was to be reiterated on the 26th January was not a resolution of independence. (Interruption). It is now admitted that it was a resolution of independence. Where lies the difference then between the passing of a resolution of independence and a declaration of independence? Complete independence was declared on the 1st of January by those very gentlemen who later issued an order to observe the independence day on the 26th January. The mandate suggested two methods of observing that day. One was the reiteration of the resolution which was prepared by Pandit Jawahar Lal Nehru and the other was the hoisting of the flag. It would be a mere hair-splitting, altogether unjustifiable, to say that that was not a declaration of independence. It is in

[Mr. Din Muhammad.]

pursuance of that same policy and of that same resolution that Mahatma Gandhi is conducting himself in the manner in which he is doing to-day. He is out to defy the law, to break the law; he does not avow any allegiance to any authority, rather openly asserts that he is determined to break the law. I fail to understand how you are justified in drawing any distinction between the declaration of independence and the passing of the resolution of independence.

It was further urged that this conduct of Malik Lal Khan was not inconsistent with the oath of allegiance that he had taken on the day when he accepted membership of the committee. If honourable members will refer to the section which lays down the oath, they will see that the words are very much similar to those prescribed in respect of the oath of allegiance administered in the Council. The form runs—

‘I, \_\_\_\_\_ swear that I will be faithful and bear true allegiance to His Majesty the King’ (the word *true* is significant) ‘and I will faithfully discharge the duty upon which I am about to enter.’

We have to see now whether it was a faithful discharge of his duty when he issued the order without consulting any member of the committee. The sole point is whether he was authorised to do so. The Municipal Act nowhere authorises him to pass any such order even under the extraordinary powers vested in the president. The Act does not even invest the president with such powers. That is a point to bear in mind. Let us not be carried away by extraneous considerations, by mere sentiment. Flag or no flag, let us see whether he possessed such a wide authority. Let us take a specific illustration. Supposing he had entered into an agreement to sell the municipal hall to the highest bidder on his sole authority, would we be justified in endorsing his action? Dismiss the question of flag altogether from your consideration. Suppose a vice-president of the committee on a day when the president is absent, in the exercise of the extraordinary powers of a president, enters into an agreement to sell the municipal hall to any purchaser that comes forward, will he not make himself liable for removal? (*Honourable Members*: No). Certainly he would. It would mean that he was abusing his position as a member, and that he did not realise his responsibility.

It is not also possible for the honourable members to distinguish between Malik Lal Khan as vice-president and Malik Lal Khan as member. If under section 409, Indian Penal Code, a public servant is run in for misbehaving in the capacity of a public servant, will he be justified in urging before a court of law: “please draw a distinction between my office and myself, send my office to jail and not my person.” If, as an office-bearer of the committee, a vice-president conducts himself in a manner which is not consistent with law, he must suffer. Two penalties are provided for him. Removal from office and removal from membership. One is that vested in the members themselves under section 22, to pass a motion of condemnation in order to move the Local Government to remove him. (*An honourable member*: That is the only section which could apply to a president or a vice-president). That is where the whole mistake lies. Even then, it is the authority of the Local Government alone that could remove him, that is what the section,

lays down. And the local Government is not bound to remove him even if a majority of two-thirds of the members passes a resolution of condemnation. The words of the section are: 'The Local Government *may* . . . .'. In this case, if you believe that a protest was entered against the Malik impliedly on the 2nd as well as expressly on the 3rd February, it is evident that Malik Lal Khan would have been unseated, and if you further believe that there are at least 14 members of the committee who have not joined with him and who remain members of the committee even after he has been unseated, you shall have to conclude that two-thirds of the members of the committee were not approving of his conduct, that inasmuch as they had verbally made a protest to the Minister against his conduct, even if no such order had been passed as has been passed by the Honourable Minister, they would have approached the local Government to remove him and the local Government backed by this protest would have removed him. Where lies the harm then in the present order. The power to remove vests in the local Government. Members alone cannot remove him. If they have to approach the local Government even after a resolution of condemnation is passed, then why could not the members approach the local Government direct? There is no illegality involved.

It has been urged that the Honourable Minister feeling his weakness, somehow or other, arranged to secure a protest on behalf of the 12 members. That also is a mistaken notion. It is one thing if you do not approve of the action of those who entered their protest, but you must be clear on facts. It was not at the initiative of the Minister himself. The Minister was assured on the day when the protest was lodged with him that the majority of members held views contrary to those of Malik Lal Khan. Later, when it was published in the papers that an honourable member of this House was going to propose a motion for adjournment to discuss this matter or to move a vote of censure, naturally the Minister tried to ascertain from those who had approached him before whether a majority of the members actually held those views or not. And it stands to reason that every Minister should try to secure material to strengthen his hands. It could not, therefore, be said that this was an after-thought. This protest had been lodged against Malik Lal Khan's conduct quite in time, and if some honourable members do not care to follow the events as they have happened, they cannot realise the situation. The verbal protest had been lodged before and it was only to ascertain the views of the members in writing that that writing was secured. Our word of mouth was as good as our writing. As it was given out that some motion for adjournment or for censure was contemplated, the Minister saw no harm in calling upon those who had made a representation to him of their being opposed to the views of Malik Lal Khan to come forward and say that they were actually opposed to his views. (Interruption). On the 3rd it was oral. There was no necessity of putting forward a written representation. A majority may make representation either verbally or in writing and it is nowhere laid down that any protest which is made against the vagaries or whims of an office-bearer must be made in writing. The Municipal Act is silent on the point. Where is the harm if, subsequently, a writing is secured so that no room might be left for objection or suspicion? Honourable members of the House should, therefore, be satisfied that the majority was against the hoisting of the flag, and that

[Mr. Din Muhammad.]

is the most crucial point in the whole situation. If the majority was against him, then Malik Lal Khan had abused his position as a member of the committee and he deserved removal, therefore.

It has been further urged why the Honourable Minister had chosen Gujranwala alone for being made an example. So far as I am aware, that is the only municipal committee in the Punjab, the office-bearer of which conducted himself in this manner. The Minister for Local Self-Government could move only against either the office-bearers of district boards or those of municipal committees, and if he moved against an office-bearer of the only municipal committee who had conducted himself in this illegal manner, the Minister can hardly be taken to task for it. A policy of inaction on the part of the Government elsewhere could not justify Lal Khan's act. The Minister realised that his duty lay in that direction and he passed these orders accordingly.

It was urged by the honourable member that the hall was a public place and that, therefore, everybody had a right to hoist the flag there. That is not true. A town hall or a municipal hall is not a public place within the meaning which is generally assigned to that term. It is under the control and in the possession of the municipal committee. It is not public in the sense that any member of the public has a right to do anything there that he likes. And then, this particular hall bears a very special feature. It has not been built from public funds. It is *nazul* property which has been made over to the committee for temporary use and occupation. Under these circumstances, to all intents and purposes, it was not a place to which the public had the right of access any time they liked and to use it in any manner they liked. Supposing the hall had been built from public subscription and it had been only in the temporary occupation of the committee, the matter might have been different. But in this case the committee was only using it at the sweet will and pleasure of the Government. (*An honourable member*: Even the hall?) Yes. That is what the actual state of affairs is. That hall was the residence of one of the relatives of Maharaja Ranjit Singh. When the British Government took possession of the Maharaja's property, the hall remained in their possession so long as a municipal committee was not notified for Gujranwala. It was only after this was done that the temporary use and occupation of the hall was made over to that committee. It is in a way not even a town hall. It is a Government building made over to the committee for legitimate occupation and legitimate use. We should also remember one thing and that is this. As soon as the public elects its own representatives and sends them to the committee, then the public can exercise its control only through those representatives. If that be not so, all our constituents can combine themselves to-day and resolves to take possession of this hall. Will they be entitled to do so? (*An honourable member*: Yes, by force, if necessary). But then force is condemnable. Force is not permissible, and that is why this order was passed.

The position is this. The constituents of the Gujranwala municipality and the members of the public could not use that hall without the express permission of the president of the committee, and even the president could

not authorize the doing of this act without ascertaining the wishes of the members of the committee that constituted it. So it could not be treated as an ordinary affair to hoist a national flag or an independence flag on a town hall, when the majority of the members of the committee held a different creed. It is but right that the president should not be permitted to give a wrong impression to the public abroad.

Then, Sir, it was urged that because our goal is dominion status and this was a national flag, therefore, it should not have been disturbed in any manner. So far as the goal of dominion status is concerned, I have already placed my views before the House. I am in entire sympathy with that creed. But the question is whether the person who wanted to hoist the flag was the person who believed in dominion status as his goal. He was, to all intents and purposes, a believer in the resolution of Mahatma Gandhi.

**Mr. President :** I think the repetitions of the honourable member are becoming quite tedious.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** I am taking the points one by one and submitting my replies. In such matters replies may overlap; that cannot be called unjustifiable repetition, especially when the points have to be hammered on the minds of members who do not see eye to eye with us. But if it is your will and pleasure that I should stop, I have no objection to resume my seat.

**Mr. Labh Singh** [Rawalpindi Division and Lahore Division, North (Non-Muhammadan), Rural]: My friend hailing from the same place as I come from has imported considerable heat into the discussion of this matter, and I do not like to follow him along those lines. I should like, if possible, only to place before you a few facts, and in as dispassionate a manner as it is possible for me under the circumstances to do. This heat, I would submit, was absolutely unnecessary, for the only result of it has been that he has inadvertently, so to speak, let the Council see that the whole game—as my honourable friend views it and so far as he is concerned—is how best to manoeuvre for the chairmanship of the municipal committee concerned and for him, no happening can have any more or other importance. Had he not imported that heat, we might well have confined our attention only to the constitutional point involved in the action that the Minister for Local Self-Government was pleased to take in the matter of the removal of Malik Lal Khan from the membership of the Gujranwala Municipal Committee. As it is, he has confined his attention only to the brief that was perhaps placed in his hands by the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government, to the complete neglect of the real point of the controversy—the constitutional issue.

**Mr. Din Muhammad :** I object to the word "brief." My friend has no right to say that any member of this House has placed any brief in my hands. I have every right to object to that expression. It is a serious aspersion to make.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** All members have to advocate the cause of the party they represent. There is nothing objectionable in that phrase.

*(At this stage Mr. Deputy President took the Chair.)*

**Mr. Labh Singh :** All that I was saying was that it would have been much better if the honourable member had stuck even to his brief and not tried to set about excusing himself at great length. By doing so he was simply in a way accusing himself, thereby only illustrating the truth of the old proverb, with which honourable members are no doubt familiar.

**Mr. Din Muhammad** (*leaving the Chamber*) : I do not attach any importance to the remarks that are being made against me.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Sir, you have heard the remarks of the honourable member. He says he does not attach any importance to the remarks that are being made by another member of this House. Is it parliamentary to say so? Members who attack other members of a party must stay here to hear what the members of that party have to say with regard to their remarks. The Honourable President has given a ruling to that effect in another case. That is the parliamentary practice and it should be followed here.

**Mr. Deputy President :** If the honourable member does not want to be present to hear the remarks made against him, I cannot force him to do so.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** But the President's ruling might be conveyed to the honourable member.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I need not, therefore, spend much time in discussing the matters which the honourable member who has run away has placed before the House, because so far as matters of fact are concerned, he himself, it would appear, does not attach any serious importance to his version of them and that is why he has not had the courage to stop here and listen to the remarks which might be made by the other side.

Carried away by the heat which was engendered by his own ebullience he called a candidate who had been put up for the chairmanship of the Gujranwala municipal committee by the Hindu members over two years ago as an illiterate blacksmith. How far a remark of that kind, even if it was true, would be justifiable I would leave it to the House to judge. But so far as facts are concerned I must submit that the candidate alluded to was neither an illiterate person nor a blacksmith in the sense that he was carrying on that profession. Are caste distinctions a feature of the separate nation of which my friend is fond of speaking? Even if he belonged to the blacksmith caste there is no reason why he should not become a chairman of a municipal committee quite as my friend who has spoken so disparagingly about the blacksmith has become an advocate in spite of what he originally was and is licensed to abuse people from a position of privilege and immunity. As regards that gentleman I have submitted already that he is very much literate, knows English, and is a merchant of considerable standing. It is really very regrettable that my honourable friend should be carried away by the heat of the moment to make remarks against people who are absent and who have no opportunity to defend themselves against aspersions that may be cast upon them.

Coming to the real matter under discussion, I will give you, Sir, a brief history of what took place at Gujranwala without importing any unnecessary heat into the narrative. It was on 25th January 1930 that the Secretary of the Local Congress Committee I learn approached Malik Lal Khan,



the senior Vice-president, for a permit for the use of the municipal hall or the platform which is just adjacent to it for the purpose of hoisting the national flag on the 26th January 1930. He approached him to grant the permit in his capacity as the senior vice-president and on a date when the president was not there. Under the circumstances it was open to the senior vice-president to exercise all the powers that have been conferred by statute on the president of the municipal committee. And what did the senior vice-president do? He recorded an order on that written application, addressing it to the municipal secretary, "Secretary, please allow the use of the Hall to the applicant for the purpose of hoisting the national flag." Now, in the events that happened, this permit was never conveyed to the Secretary and was never acted upon; nor is there any evidence to show that there was any intention on the part of those who had armed themselves with this permit to make use of the hall without making any reference to the secretary of the municipal committee.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Do I understand that this permit was not conveyed to the Secretary on the 25th?

**Mr. Labb Singh :** No; and of all persons you should have known it. There was no intention on the part of the local Congress committee to take advantage of that permit in the sense that they would use the hall or any premises connected with that hall for the purpose of hoisting the national flag, without approaching the proper authorities. The president was not at Gujranwala on the 25th, and had he been there even on the 26th, the natural thing for the Congress committee would have been to approach either the president or the secretary and if the president had interdicted the use of the hall, or if the secretary had not reported the matter to the president nothing more would have been done. What happened then was—I may also mention parenthetically that the square where the municipal hall is situate is also the place which is generally used for holding public meetings—that the flag was actually hoisted in front of the hall or the platform which adjoins the hall but not on the hall itself or any part of the municipal building. If the demonstrators or the persons who were responsible for holding the meeting on the 26th were anxious to do something which was contrary to law, or contrary to the permit or to hoist the flag without the permit, they could very easily have done it. But no such thing was attempted, and long before the advertised time for the meeting, the municipal hall was guarded by a strong posse of police. There was no intention on the part of anybody of running counter to the orders of the police or doing something without the permission of the municipal authorities, and nothing was actually done. The national flag was hoisted in the usual place where the meeting was held in front of the municipal hall. And this was on the 26th. I have already mentioned that the president of the municipal committee was absent on the 25th. He was absent also on the 26th, which was Sunday; and it was only towards the evening on that day, that he was sent for by the Deputy Commissioner from a village some four or five miles away, where he had gone presumably on private business.

So in the absence of the president both on Saturday as well as on Sunday, it was perfectly legitimate and fair and perfectly honest on the part of the

[ Mr. Labh Singh. ]

senior vice-president to exercise his powers and allow the temporary use of the municipal hall or any other municipal premises. No exception, therefore, either on the point of law or procedure can be taken against the action of the senior vice-president. Now proceeding further, let us try to gather the position of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government from what he spoke the other day regarding this matter. It appears to me that both from the position that he took up then and the position which is being taken up by his advocates now during the course of this debate, we may analyse like this. Three objections have been taken to the conduct of the vice-president. In the first place they say that this hoisting of the national flag or the granting of a permission to hoist one is contrary to the oath of allegiance which all members of municipal committees take when they assume charge of office as members of municipal committees. This is the first objection which has been taken and on the face of it, it would appear plausible and intelligible. As to how far it is correct I will examine in a few minutes. The second objection is that the conduct of the vice-president was contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee, that the vice-president in giving this permit acted contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee. Now, whether this wish was a declared wish or only an assumed wish of the majority we shall see later on. But this again is a position which one can understand and one can examine. Thirdly, it is said that his action was *ultra vires*, that the vice-president acted beyond his jurisdiction in giving this permit. Now let us examine these three positions one by one. I submit very respectfully that there would be no difficulty on a dispassionate examination of them in coming to the conclusion that neither the one nor the other nor the third, for the matter of that, of these positions to which the whole thing resolves itself can possibly stand any analysis. As regards the question of the order being *ultra vires* I have already made the remark that it is perfectly open to the president or in his absence to the senior vice-president or even to the junior vice-president to make such use of the property which is under his control as he, according to his judgment, thinks best—always consistently of course with the provisions of the Municipal Act and the Rules and By-Laws thereunder. If a president and for the purpose of the present argument we must assume that the gentleman under discussion was to all intents and purposes a president, the actual president being away, cannot allow the use of a hall of a municipality, the use of a hall say for holding a meeting, or allow the use of a platform attached to the municipal committee for hoisting the national flag, if this is the position of the municipal president, I fail to see what Local Self-Government means. You will be pleased to remember, Sir, that in the Report which is looked upon as the Magna Carta of the new Constitutional Dispensation in India—the new political arrangement of things, the Report made by Lord Chelmsford and Mr. Montagu, it was directed that the municipal committees should have the fullest freedom from outside control. Now if the Minister for Local Self-Government is going to poke his nose into every little matter and direct the president of a municipal committee whether he should or should not permit the use of the hall or the furniture belonging to a municipal committee, would it be allowing the local body what is to be called the fullest freedom from outside control? I think it would be a sheer abuse of the word to say that it is in any sense

a freedom at all, it would be downright slavery and wholly indistinguishable from that. It would reduce Local Self-Government to worse than mere farce. There is no need, Sir, of invoking the aid of section 35. Section 35 of the Municipal Act gives extraordinary powers to presidents or vice-presidents and simply lays down that a president or vice-president may exercise all such powers as the committee is empowered to exercise, but only subject to this that the president who acts under this section must certify that he looks upon the case as one of importance and urgency and his certificate to that effect is final under the law and even the civil courts cannot go into the question, let alone a superior controlling authority in the shape of a Deputy Commissioner or a Commissioner or the Minister for Local Self-Government. This section I have already submitted need not be resorted to for this purpose because if the buildings belonging to the municipality are under the control of the committee a president can make such legitimate use of it as he may and no body has the right to question his authority. If we look upon this section 35 as I have submitted, it lays down very clearly that if in the opinion of the president an order is necessary for the service or safety of the public he may pass such order and his discretion cannot possibly be questioned. Now as regards service, it is apparent and I will give only just a few illustrations that this is so, the president was really doing service to the people of the town by giving them the necessary permit or by giving to their representative committee the necessary permit for the use of the hall and in my humble judgment the Congress Committee in a more real and in a more vital sense represents the views and opinions and the wishes of the citizens of Gujranwala than perhaps even the municipal committee does. It is a more representative body, a more authoritative body, in the sense that it derives its authority wholly from public opinion, which the municipal committee, as I have submitted, does not, and therefore in granting the request of the Local Congress Committee or more correctly the City Congress Committee, the president was well within his right in entertaining the opinion that thereby he was serving the people of the town. That this is so may be gathered from the nervousness of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government in facing public opinion. The only way in which we can see whether the action of the senior vice-president was or was not in conformity with the wishes of the citizens of Gujranwala would be to make a referendum and invite the opinions of the citizens of Gujranwala and I am confident that they would, to a man, barring perhaps certain persons who have to look to ulterior ends, barring say half a dozen people or so, vote in favour of the action and not a few souls even could be discovered who would go out of their way to condemn the action of the vice-president. That this is known to the Government is apparent from the fact that although they have thrown open all the seats to election, I think 6 or 7 members resigned from the municipality as a protest against this autocratic action of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government, although all these seats are now to be filled up by election, I have just now been handed a notice saying that a by-election would take place on such and such a date and nomination papers are being invited, the ward which stands vacated by the dismissal from office and membership of Malik Lal Khan does not figure in this notice. So what will happen is this : I told you that the whole thing is dirty

[Mr. Labh Singh.]

in the extreme. I am going to say Sir, that the word dirty in this reference is perfectly parliamentary and I am going to give reasons to show that the whole thing is managed and manœuvred in a way which would do credit to nobody and least of all to a person who occupies the responsible position of a Minister for Local Self-Government. If you use your executive position to put your political opponent out of the way, or you use it in party interests, there is no other way of describing the action. The seats which I submitted were rendered vacant by the resignations of members who submitted them as a protest are going to be filled up by election, and I have not the slightest hesitation, even before the results are announced, I have not the slightest hesitation to say that even if the whole might of the Government goes to Gujranwala and impinges itself against these candidates who have resigned, the only persons who will be returned on this issue would be the persons who have resigned as protest, showing thereby that the people of Gujranwala have felt the insult as poignantly and as keenly as the members who have tendered their resignations by way of protest. And now as regards the constituency vacated by the dismissal, as I have submitted, of the senior vice-president, that remains there where it was. It is not going to be filled up by election and for what reasons? The reason is this, that the local authorities and the Minister for Local Self-Government as also the gentlemen on whose advice he acts, they are perfectly convinced that in that ward only such candidate would be returned who would be a nominee of the dismissed vice-president and there is not a chance for anyone else to be returned. It is for these reasons that they do not put this seat to election.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It is absolutely false. Why should the honourable member attribute motives?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** It is an absolute truth which goes home. If I attribute motives I shall prove them. I would hesitate to make any allegations which I am not in a position to prove to the hilt. I am going to make only such allegations as I am in a position to prove and not prove elsewhere or after I have resumed my seat, but here and now before I sit down. I was saying that that seat is not being put to election for these reasons that the persons responsible for ordering these arrangements know or ought to know at any rate that that seat would be filled if election takes place, by some person who is favoured by the outgoing member and represents his policy. And what do they do?

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Can he not seek re-election?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** No he stands barred till such time as the mighty Government thinks it, in its wisdom, fit to remove the disqualification. This is how I read the law and the announcement made by the Government. They take refuge under section 17 sub-section (2) of the Municipal Act. This is only parenthetical. Section 17, sub-section (2) says—

“Upon the death, resignation or removal of any appointed member or when a member's seat has been vacated under the provisions of Section 14 (e).”

The section which has been made applicable to this dismissal—

“The Local Government may, if it shall think fit, fill his place, either by appointment or by election.”

This gives the Local Government the choice and certainly, they have no hesitation in making the better choice, the better choice for them in this case being that this seat should not be thrown open to election, but should be filled by nomination by the local Government of a sane and safe man, or in other words, a man who would have no opinions or only such opinions as will conform to the wishes of the powers that be. Is this really slow and progressive extension of local self-government? I would say it is a slow and progressive extinction of all that local self-government connotes or ought to connote. There is only one interpretation that can possibly be put on this action which is proposed to be taken and that is, that the Minister is ready to avail of every loophole in the statute to go back. It is difficult to imagine a more reactionary or retrograde procedure. Now, Sir, let us pass on to the other objection that this action of the president is *ultra vires*. The Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government is again pleased to interrupt and say that I am imputing motives. It is not, I repeat, a question of imputing motives at all. It is a question of putting two and two together. I would ask the House very respectfully to see things dispassionately. A certain number of seats have been vacated and elections are going to take place covering as many as 8 seats, but this particular constituency vacated by the dismissal of the vice-president is left out and the Government wants to exercise its discretion in favour of nominating a member for that constituency. The only inference to be deduced is that Government have not the courage to meet the people, that it has no respect for public opinion and that it will burk every opportunity authoritatively to ascertain it. Irresponsibility could no further go. And this is a transferred subject. This dominion status in action is a cruel and insulting hoax.

If it be said that the president has acted outside his jurisdiction, then what is the remedy and what is the punishment to be awarded to him? You will be pleased to note that I have never heard of officers of law being dismissed from office for exceeding their jurisdiction. Gentlemen who are practising in the High Court generally complain in their second appeals and petitions for revision that the court below has acted without jurisdiction, has exceeded its jurisdiction or has failed to exercise jurisdiction which was vested in it by law, and things of that kind are perfectly familiar to us. But have we ever heard of an officer of a court of law or a judge having been dismissed for exceeding his jurisdiction? As a matter of fact, I remember an old saying which is a sound legal maxim which says that a good judge would so interpret the law as to extend his jurisdiction. That ought to be the rule. It may be perhaps in countries, which are not suffering from what we are suffering from, that this is a good rule of law and a good rule of interpretation and a wholesome procedure that a wise judge would so interpret law if it is equally open to two alternative interpretations as within limits to extend his jurisdiction. But here the things are utterly different. Every nerve is to be strained to further curtail the already much too limited liberties of the people.

Apart from this, Sir, the punishment that has been meted out in this case means the premanent disability on the part of the dismissed person to stand for any municipal election for an indefinite and indeterminate length of time unless he chooses to come and pray to the authorities that this stigma

[Mr. Labh Singh.]

which, judged by national standard, is an honour be removed from his brow, so that he may not premanently remain in the position of a person incapable of serving his town or his city as a member of a municipal committee. Does the punishment reveal a sense of proportion?

In addition to this, while stressing this point of jurisdiction, I would submit that this matter could have been set right and as a matter of fact, as we have been told, it was set right. No hoisting of the flag on the municipal building took place. No attempt to hoist the flag there was made, and the local Deputy Commissioner, as we have been informed by the honourable member from Gujranwala who spoke just before me, cancelled that order under the extraordinary jurisdiction vested in him under section 232 of the Municipal Act. That order of the senior vice-president was categorically cancelled. Nothing came out of it. All that therefore happened was that an innocuous order was passed, which was never acted upon but was cancelled, in time by competent superior authority and for this offence, this gentleman is being punished in the way in which he has been punished. In the British Indian Constitution the phrase 'error of judgment' is reserved for more innocent occasions. Historians, mark!

I have already submitted that police had been told off to prevent the hoisting of the flag. Even that was unnecessary because nobody was—and that is not the allegation—going out of his way to force open the municipal doors, or to break open the hall or to go upstairs and plant the flag there. That is not the allegation that is made, or could have been made, although some sort of after-thought has resulted in a certain prosecution that is just now pending in Gujranwala, relating to another incident of many days after but to which I cannot, under the rules, refer and to which I shall not refer.

Section 35 mentions, as I have submitted, the service of the people, and I have submitted also with your permission that Malik Lal Khan as president of the municipal committee was serving the wishes of the people in giving the permit that he did. He was trying to serve his masters, namely the people, and the officers who are responsible for the order that has been passed against him were trying to serve their own masters. It is a question which service is to be preferred. The one is a service which ends in the way in which it has ended, a person going out of office, a person sought to be disgraced in the way in which it has been done, while those who had expressed their dislike for and disapproval of his order were serving another master and that latter service was a paying proposition. This phenomenon is perfectly well understood and must be met with in all slave countries and I, for one, am not really surprised at this. A thing which under the olden regime could not be thought of, a thing which a white bureaucrat would have hesitated to do, that is done without the least compunction of conscience by people who think that they must out-herod Herod. They try to go out of their way to even anticipate and comply with what they consider to be the possible wishes of their masters. This is a phenomenon which is well-known in the history of slavery all over the world. The slave owner has never been known to be so heartless as the slave overseer in immediate charge of slave driving. The callous convict overseers in jails and penal settlements illustrate the same truth. This is the first gruesome aspect of the question.

The second aspect of the question was whether the vice-president acted contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee. That is a very important thing, whether in fact, the dismissed vice-president acted contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee. Which is the way of ascertaining whether the vice-president has or has not acted either in conformity with or contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee? There must be some resolution of the committee to that effect. There must be some attempt to pass a resolution to that effect. This order of the vice-president under discussion was passed on the 25th of January and up till now, two months have passed or thereabouts, the committee has passed no resolution condemning the action of the vice-president. What does that show? It shows that by private letters some of these people might have been persuaded or cajoled or threatened into writing things which publicly they cannot possibly avow and, therefore, there is no public transaction on the part of the members of the municipal committee which goes to show that those gentlemen as members, and mark you, that is the distinction, have condemned the action of the senior vice-president. No such thing has been done uptill now which is a proof positive of the fact that even the rump committee, I mean the remaining members of the committee leaving out those who have resigned in protest, even those members, I say, have not had the courage to pass any such resolution. I would not say courage for, that would imply that they were in any way willing to associate themselves with any such resolution. The only legitimate construction which may be placed upon their conduct is that those gentleman feel and feel as strongly as those who have resigned that a dire insult has been flung upon the local municipal committee, and they further feel that they are even more helpless than those who have resigned and therefore, they choose to keep quiet over the matter. But their silence is very significant, all the same. It has a meaning in it. It means that they are, at heart, at one with those who have resigned in protest, that they condemn the action of the Ministry for Local Self-Government in passing the order which it has passed.

**Mir Maqbool Mahmood :** Have they recorded their protest?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Yes, they have. My honourable friend thought that he was putting a very inconvenient question, but he will soon learn that that inconvenient question redounds against those who in this matter are trying to advocate the cause of, and hold brief for, the Ministry of Local Self-Government. I am submitting that the answer to the question is in the affirmative. This is how the melodrama unfolds itself. The committee met again subsequent to the gazette notification. Some thirteen members were present at the meeting. A motion was brought up by one of the members to the effect that the conduct of the Minister for Local Self-Government be censured. This resolution was formally brought up. The president who was in the chair objected to this resolution being taken up on the technical plea that the resolution, as such, was not on the agenda. But, according to rules which govern the conduct of business in the municipal committee, the standard rules which are in force throughout the province, it is open for fresh matter to be brought up by any member with the permission of the House, and this was done. As soon as the question was put to the House by the



[Mr. Labh Singh.]

chairman, everyone of the members, barring perhaps one, was for this resolution being taken up. The permission of the House having been granted, it was then actually taken up and it was being discussed, when the president thought that if the discussion continued and if this motion was put to the vote the result would be inevitable, namely that the conduct of the Minister would be censured by a municipal committee, and that was not a thing which would be contemplated with equanimity by people who are of the way of thinking of my friend, the present president. What does he do? Without assigning any reason he says, I adjourn the House, and himself unceremoniously runs away. These shabby and third rate tactics leave one aghast. If this incident is not within the knowledge of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government in spite of the fact that he has paid perhaps more than one visit to Gujranwala recently and that he is in constant touch by telephone, letters and otherwise with the authorities there and that he keeps also an exalted errand boy at his back and call, if in spite of these facilities the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government is not aware of this, then what is he aware of? He knows that a president of the municipal committee has grossly misbehaved in the way in which I have detailed before the House. Has he taken any notice of the matter? Has he even made an enquiry, and would he pretend that he does not know it? I have submitted that it would not be open to him to get up and say that he is not aware of the incident. If, on the other hand, he is aware of it what action has he taken in the interest of law and order, in the interest of good government and in the interest of the good name of the department which he administers. Now, this is the view of the matter so far as regards the condemnation of the conduct of the Ministry by the municipal committee is concerned, let alone the secondary question which was put to me by my friend from Amritsar (Mir Maqbool Mahmood) whether the committee has taken any action in approving of the conduct of the vice-president. To that I have made a twofold answer, *firstly*, that no such action was necessary, and *secondly*, the only course open to them, if they approved of the vice-presidents' conduct, was to take steps to pass a vote of censure against the Minister. That they attempted to do and would have passed it, but for the fact that the formal recording of the vote of censure was frustrated by the illegal action of the president. It would have been a practically unanimous vote of condemnation against the conduct of the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government. The president may be chuckling complacently over the brain wave which enabled him to make just one more addition to his record of meritorious services and the Honourable Minister may graciously nod assent that a case for reward has been made out, but the two between them leave the standard of public conduct very much impaired indeed. This is so far as regards the second point, namely, whether the vice-president acted contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee.

Now, we have been treated to something by my friend from Gujranwala (Mr. Din Muhammad), which is rather delectable but will not bear analysis. He says that he told the Minister that the majority party was of that view. When he was speaking on behalf of the majority party one has only got to touch that point to

5 P.M.



—see how hollow it is. If the honourable member was actually speaking on behalf of the majority party, he ought to be occupying the chair of the municipal committee. And all these discussions, all this wrangling and all this washing of the dirty linen in public would not have arisen. The very fact that he is not the president of the municipal committee is proof positive that he is not a representative of the majority in the municipal committee and has no title to speak in that strain.

While on this point I should like to make just a few remarks, which to my mind form the crux of the whole case. I shall simply ask certain questions of the Honourable Minister. Is it or is it not a fact that long after the expulsion of Malik Lal Khan from office and from membership, and only when it was ventilated in the press of the province that a vote of censure against the Minister was imminent, that the Minister wrote a letter to the Deputy Commissioner entreating him to secure the signatures of the remaining members of the municipal committee as an approval of what had been done by him? This is what they call *ex post facto* arrangement, as distinguished from *ex post facto* argument, a line of reasoning with which we are familiar. The Minister's contention is that he acted in the way he did because the vice-president had acted against the wishes of the majority of the municipal committee. But that is not a fact and could not be one. After the vice-president had been thrown out of office and when a censure motion in this House was about to be tabled, it was only then that the Minister bethought himself that he should arm himself with some sort of justification. The way in which he proceeded to arm himself with a justification is really interesting. I will tell the few steps that he took and leave the rest to the imagination of honourable members. I am really very sorry to have to refer to these matters, but it is an unpleasant duty which has got to be performed. It is not my habit to administer sugar-coated pills. I am in the habit of speaking out my mind rather bluntly whenever I have to speak. I do not really believe in diplomatic periphrases. If one has got to talk, he should talk straight and have done with it. As regards the history of the procedure that the Minister adopted to arm himself with justification, I would only, just in a way, put a few more questions to him. Can the Honourable Minister deny that he wrote a letter to the Deputy Commissioner asking for his help in securing signatures to certain propositions which he had sent to the Deputy Commissioner at Gujranwala? Again I ask him, can he deny that it was an urgent letter? Can he deny that he sent it through a special messenger? Can he deny that in pursuance of that letter the District Magistrate called the members of the committee to his house or office and secured their signatures. (*A voice*: Shame)—to the letter which the Minister was pleased to tell the House last week he had in his pocket. He said the other day that he was armed with authority. Now the question arises, when was this authority secured and under what circumstances and through what agency and at what time? (*The Honourable Mian Sir Faal-i-Husain*: Were all the members called?) No, only such as could be intimidated into signing the letter. (*Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang*: All are called but few are chosen.) That is so. I would ask, appealing to the experience of the honourable members of this House, whether an average member of a mofussil municipal committee would be able to resist the solicitation of the District Magistrate or even alternatively of the additional District Magistrate. Can

[Mr. Labh Singh.]

this solicitation, by any stretch of imagination, be distinguished from downright intimidation? And would the district authorities in complying with the behest of the Minister confine their activities within the limits of fair and legitimate canvass? Having secured a letter signed by the members under these circumstances, can the Minister call it his authority for the step that he took? I have put these questions to the Honourable Minister and I want a clear—out answer to them. Having secured the authority, as the Minister is pleased to call it under these circumstances, I ask him whether he wants this Council to believe that they should rely on this subsequently manufactured evidence. Now, we are all familiar with this that, when dealing with civil cases, the court asks for all documentary evidence to be put in before leading oral evidence and examining witnesses. (*Interruption.*) Quite right. In the present case following the analogy of law courts in the matter of belated documents, I submit that no importance should be attached to the evidence that has been admittedly manufactured subsequent to the order passed against Malik Lal Khan. This piece of evidence I submit, is intended only to show, I must say again if I can do so, without being guilty of unnecessary repetition, that this piece of evidence is intended only to show that the vice-president acted contrary to the wishes of the majority in the local municipal committee which according to the Minister is one of the foundations of his order. I have also submitted that this evidence will not prove anything of the kind. This document proves nothing, or it proves too much. My charge is that the Minister has been guilty of gross impropriety in securing this document in the way in which he has done. Not only that. I would even go to the extent of saying that he is guilty of a breach of constitution as we know it. He has even gone further, he has sought to defend his action by subsequently manufactured evidence. I will put the case at that and leave it to the House to decide as to whether in view of the facts that I have enumerated, this conduct of the Minister can at all be justified.

In this connection, there is another point I want to urge, and that is the question, why the Honourable Minister or the officers under him did not take the direct action of asking the municipality to adopt a resolution in favour of the action the Minister had taken. The only conclusion that can be arrived at from all these circumstances and from the omission to take the right course is, that the power of patronage enjoyed by Government is such that many cannot resist, similarly the power to do harm which is enjoyed by this Government under the present constitution is such that no man can possibly resist the temptation of getting away from unmolested, if that is at all possible for him to do, even at the cost of self-respect. That is what it really comes to. Otherwise the direct and honest way of proceeding with this case would have been under section 22 which lays down that any president or vice-president may be removed from office by the local Government in pursuance of a resolution to that effect passed by two-thirds of the members of the committee. If the members of the committee were really annoyed at the action taken by Malik Lal Khan, they were familiar with the sections of the Municipal Act and they would have proceeded to take action under that section. They would have passed a resolution requesting the Minister for Local Self-Government to remove that gentleman from his office as vice-president, as he had misbehaved.

or acted contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee. This is what they should have done. From the fact that the municipal committee did not pass such a resolution it is quite clear that the vice-president did not act contrary to the wishes of the majority of the committee.

One point remains and that is, whether the action of the vice-president was contrary to the alleged oath. This is the third point that can possibly be advanced in defence of the action of the Minister for Local Self-Government, namely, that the action of the vice-president was contrary to the oath of allegiance. With respect to this, I may, with your permission, only make just a few remarks. The first one is this.

Much has been made of the independence resolution adopted by the Congress at its last session in December. The resolution of the Congress is not a declaration of independence. Emphatically it is not so. It is not so according to the authors of that resolution and it is not so according to the views and opinions of the Government itself and its legal advisers. If it were really a resolution of declaration of independence, the authors of the resolution were brave enough, strong enough and honest enough to have said so. But they have not said so. Nor do the lawyers at the disposal of the Government, the legal adviser, who must be taken to be astute enough to interpret a plain resolution in a plain way would have hesitated to say so, if the resolution was susceptible of that interpretation. They would have even gone out of their way to put such interpretation if the wording of the resolution could have been found capable of bearing the strain. But in this case no such interpretation has been attempted and the authors of the resolution, as I have submitted, make no such claim. It is not a resolution declaring independence, it is not a resolution of independence, but a resolution for independence, if I might, with your permission so describe it. It is a resolution for independence in the sense that it lays down independence to be the goal of India's political endeavour. Just as prior to this, dominion status or self-government or Swaraj were the words employed to indicate the goal, now the word employed is independence. Independence is implicit in the status known as dominion status just as dominion status was implicit in the declaration of 1917 that the dominion or the country which enjoys that political status known as dominion status has the right also to cut itself away from the parent fabric or the imperial government or the Empire. If then, this independence is certainly implicit in every dominion constitution, the Congress resolution contains nothing novel and enunciates no new or foreign principle. That being so, I would submit that this resolution which was right and which, on the very face of it, is not a resolution declaring independence here and now should not be travestied or misconstrued, so as to mean a declaration of independence. It is quite plain that if in India anybody or any group of persons declare independence, they would be certainly going against the constituted authority and offending against the law, and if the constituted authority takes such legal action against them as it is open to it to take, then they cannot possibly complain. But here in this case, I would submit, it would be a mere travesty of things and a wanton misconstruction of the resolution to say that it declares independence. There was a flag before, no change, I would submit, has been made in this flag since the change in the

[Mr. Labh Singh.]

Congress creed and because of it. The new declaration has introduced no change in the colour or design of the national flag. The Congress flag before and after the change in the creed remains according to my reading of it and according to my instructions, the same old flag. It does not lie in the mouth of anybody to say that this is a flag of rebellion. It may turn out to be a flag of contingent rebellion, but that is a different thing. As a matter of fact, as things are, nobody says that it is a flag of rebellion, neither the contingent rebels nor those against whom this rebellion may possibly be directed. If this is so, it is really not a valid argument for anybody to say that simply because it is a flag of independence, in the sense of its being the national flag, it should not be hoisted. I would submit that it is perfectly compatible with the continuance of the present government in authority gladly to agree and help in the hoisting of the national flag. If this were not so, action would have been taken against such municipalities all over the land as had hoisted the flag on their premises or buildings, notably, for instance, against the Corporation of Calcutta. Now, it would not be open to any one to say that action has actually been taken against the Corporation of Calcutta, simply because the Mayor of that Corporation is being proceeded against in another connection which may result in his being landed into a jail. That would not be an example which can be pressed into service to supply a genuine parallel. Anyway, it would not be a very pure and honest parallel as it would compel us to assume that the Government is not proceeding in an honest and straightforward way, but is having recourse to indirect and Machiavellian methods to put its adversaries out of action. The mere fact that the resolution passed by the Corporation of Calcutta or the action taken by its officers in hoisting the national flag on the hall of the Corporation has not either been rescinded or declared *ultra vires* by the Government, nor the authorities of the Corporation of Calcutta punished therefor, suffices to show that there is nothing illegal in the hoisting of the flag. I am taking the Calcutta case only as an illustration. I know of other cases also where the national flag has been hoisted without any objection on the part of the Government. If that is so, then really it is a very invalid argument to adopt to say that the national flag is a flag of rebellion. In addition to that, you are well aware, every one of us must have seen for himself, that at the time of the last session of the Indian National Congress in Lahore in the Dane Park, I think, a flagstaff perhaps as high as 400 feet if not higher was put up. If it could have been done on a piece of property which was not only presumptively Government's, as some of my friends have tried to argue that the municipal hall at Gujranwala is, but admittedly that of the Government, and on which the Congress people were present only under a licence, then why not on a municipal building? This is the legal position and if nobody could take any objection to hoisting a national flag in Dane Park on a staff over four hundred feet high, then no objection could possibly be taken to the hoisting of a small flag in a small local town unless those in authority for reasons best known to them wanted to make much of it and turn it into a *Casus belli*. Apart from that, it is also clear, I am speaking subject to correction, I have not been to any of the colonies and dominions myself, I believe that the dominions have, for certain purposes, flags of their own in addition to the Union Jack which flies over the whole of the Empire. Every dominion has got its own distinctive national flag which is a symbol of its national identity. If the Union of South Africa, or

the dominion of Canda or Australia or any other small dominion or colony can claim to have a flag of its own, then there seems to be no earthly reason why an invidious treatment should be forced on India alone. If a few citizens want to please themselves with the notion that some day they may march under their own national flag, why should it be taken exception to by right-minded people, unless, of course, it is taken exception to by people who believe as an article of faith that there are ever so many nations living in this country which for all time should be kept apart, or whose interest it is that there should never be a single unitary nation in this country. It is only these two sets of people who can take possible exception to the hoisting of the national flag, which, after all, as things are at present, is only a most innocent aspirational exhibition. The demonstration does not mean anything which might legitimately frighten any one, much less this strong and mighty Government. The flag stands for only a possible aspiration for common nationhood and not a settled fact of rebellion, and if any diseased imagination conjures up the spectre of rebellion at the sight of the flag, then certainly, the imagination is diseased and not the innocent ceremony itself. I have some more remarks to address in order to explain what has been placed before you by my honourable friend from Gujranwala. I am sincerely sorry that he should have placed these things in the way in which he has done and, on the top of it, should have slunk away ostentatiously and not wanted to listen to the contradictions. I was just going to submit that there was no other action in the shape of a resolution or a representation made by the local municipality to the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government prior to the action taken by him. If that be so, the action was taken *in vacuo* and not on any legitimate basis. Now a refuge has been sought to be taken under the plea that one of the members of the local municipal committee, who seems to be in special touch, perhaps with the Minister, says that he made an oral representation to him. I want to nail that terminological inexactitude to the counter. Here I hold now in my hand a requisition addressed to the local municipal committee to its president, requesting him, rather requisitioning him, to appoint a day so that the following resolution may be discussed and action taken thereupon—

“Resolved that Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sundar Singh, M.B.E., be removed from the office of the President, Municipal Committee, Gujranwala.”

This requisition is dated the 2nd February, the year of grace 1930, and it is in the hand of my honourable friend from Muhammadan Gujranwala constituency he being also the first signatory thereto. You will be pleased to note that not only the honourable member from Muhammadan Gujranwala figures as the first signatory to this requisition, but that this letter bears also the honoured name, I should say, of Malik Lal Khan, senior vice-president. It means, if it means anything at all, that up to the 2nd of February and even up to a much later day, this gentleman, the author of this requisition and Malik Lal Khan were collaborating together for the expulsion of the present president. I do not want to discuss at all the motives of a combination of this description. (*An honourable member.* How many signatures are there?) Thirteen; and this inauspicious number would explain the extraordinary haste in which this order against Malik Lal Khan was passed. I shall come

[Mr. Labh Singh.]

to that later on. It is a dirty affair and I would submit to you how it works out. It is perfectly mathematical. There is nothing abstruse about it. What I am concerned to point out at this stage is this, that any explanation which might now be tendered to the effect that any majority or minority of members in the local municipal committee had made any representations, oral or otherwise, to the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government or to any other authority for the expulsion of Malik Lal Khan could not be correct and they are in the nature of a mere after-thought. For anybody to stand up in this House and to suggest that up to the 2nd, 3rd or the 4th or right up to perhaps a few days of the tabling of this motion, these people, the honourable member and Malik Lal Khan were not acting in collaboration with one another for the expulsion of the present president, would be too much for anybody to believe. This letter speaks for itself, and I do not propose to comment upon it. Evident it is that some Mr. Facing Bothways was at work and was trying to run with the hare while hunting with the hound. No words can be strong enough to condemn this policy.

To comment upon it any further would either lead me to say things which one should not say in this House or it would be only like illustrating the obvious. Neither procedure would be profitable. I have too much respect for the intelligence of this House to illustrate the obvious, and I have too much respect for myself to embark on the alternative procedure of commenting upon the incident in detail, and washing dirty linen in public. My purpose is served by just pointing out that right up to within near of the tabling of this resolution these gentlemen were working in collaboration to expel the present incumbent from his office, and no party could have made any representation to the Minister for action against Malik Lal Khan. Some how or other, it did not suit the local officers or the Honourable Minister that this inconvenient resolution should go through. I am just going to make out that this resolution was bound to go through. As I submitted early in my remarks, I shall be simply putting two and two together and I am not anxious to make any unnecessary comments. My point is that this letter shows, if it shows anything at all, that the resolution adumbrated in the letter was bound to go through because our municipal committee is composed of 21 members, and of the 14, that is the majority of two-thirds required for the passage of this resolution, 13 had already signed it and one gentleman was away at Allahabad and he, by the way, is one of the members who have resigned as a protest against the action of the Minister. So it may be safely assumed that that was a resolution which in all human probability was bound to go through and this prospect was sufficient to disturb the equanimity of the powers that be. I shall not go into the reasons therefor. What the letter means according to me is this. In the first place it means that the resolution was bound to go through as I have just submitted according to the rules governing the procedure of the local municipal committee. The Minister for Local Self-Government did not want that the present incumbent should be thrown out and what does he do? A couple of wires—I am again stating a fact—were sent to this absent person at Allahabad asking him to return at once. (A voice: By the Minister?) No, naturally by the friends of the absent members who were signatories to this precious document. It was expected momentarily that that absent



gentleman would reach Gujranwala and place his signature on the requisition. My own position, I may state here, was more or less a detached one so far as this requisition went. I am not a signatory to it. Well, that is the first proposition which is perfectly a plain one. The second may also be easily inferred. The Minister or some other officers interested do not want that the present incumbent should go, and what was the natural way for them to proceed? The natural way was for them to proceed in indecent haste. It was on the 8th that the gazette notification was made, and it took some time for the news to filter to the several quarters. Is this not an instance of indecent haste? If persons in executive authority, who have in their power to make and unmake members make or unmake them in hot haste in the interests of a particular policy or in the prosecution of their endeavour to serve a particular purpose or help particular individuals, I would characterise such haste as indecent. I do not at all object to certain honourable members on the Government benches going out one day and their successors being notified perhaps the very moment, and an extraordinary issue of the gazette appearing immediately to that effect. That is perfectly necessary and is perfectly intelligible. But a procedure of this kind, when such haste is employed to serve what, after all, is not a laudable purpose, the Honourable Minister siding with one party in a local body as against another when it is the duty of the Ministry of Local Self-Government to keep up a detached position holding the balance even, as it were, between the various conflicting parties indulging in some sort of rivalry for their own delectation or the defence of their interests, I would respectfully submit, is not fair, to say the least of it, on the part of the Honourable Minister. He cannot be permitted to load the dice in favour of one party. The worst part of the affair is not yet over. Even under the ordinary criminal law an opportunity is given to people to show cause why they should not be punished. How was this elementary necessity of procedure and natural justice complied with in this case? Malik Lal Khan is called to the house of the local Deputy Commissioner. The Deputy Commissioner tells him: The Minister wants some sort of explanation for your conduct. The Deputy Commissioner understood the seriousness of the situation too well, but the gentleman to whom the words were addressed did not. He does not feel that he is being called upon to tender an explanation on which his life as a public man in the local municipal committee turns. He does not have the chance of consulting any legal adviser or discussing the matter with his friends. Then he simply writes perhaps a word or two how he passed the order under the circumstances in which he was placed and his own opinion of the law and his authority under it. Even the letter asking him to show cause—I think it must have been properly and formally worded—was not read out to him. Even if it was, it must have been in English and he is not a person who could be expected to understand it. He is not a gentleman who knows English sufficiently well to be able to follow an official draft. I am speaking with authority from the gentleman against whom this order was passed and I have every reason to believe that what he says is correct, and I would certainly believe him in a matter like this in preference to any body else. Honourable Mian Sir Fāz-i-Husain: Is it the honourable member's suggestion that the Deputy Commissioner does not know Urdu? I was suggesting that the Deputy Commissioner in a very casual way asked

[Mr. Lahr Singh.]

him what his attitude was in regard to the matter as the Government wanted to know it. It was never held out that action was going to be taken against him under the Act and that he was to show cause why that should not be done. Well, that gentleman says to the Deputy Commissioner, this is my view. He simply writes down his view. It is sent over to the Honourable Minister and the order in question is immediately passed. This is only an illustration brick in this edifice of nefariousness which has been built. Even a fair opportunity has not been given to the gentleman to explain himself. Had he been given an opportunity to explain, he would have said: "Very well, I passed the order; I understood the law in the way in which I did. Nothing has been done in pursuance of that order and you were pleased to cancel that order before it was executed and you have taken adequate measures to see that the flag is not hoisted. If you think that I have been in the wrong or that I have misinterpreted the law, I am sorry for it." This opportunity should, in elementary fairness, have been given him. But nothing of the sort was done. It was only casually and incidentally that the Deputy Commissioner mentioned the matter to him and asked for his views. Some days after the notification appeared in the gazette I enquired of Malik Lal Khan if he would care to challenge the notification in a court of law as he had not been given the chance to show cause before the action was taken against him. He was asked to purchase the necessary stamp so that a lawyer may institute a suit on his behalf. After a good deal of cross-examination, I discovered,..... (An honourable member: Oh! you gave him instructions instead of asking for instructions!) It so happens occasionally when we come across people who are not conversant with technical law. We have to elucidate facts by cross-examining them. It is after a good deal of tussle that in some cases we come to know the actually relevant facts. I learnt that the Deputy Commissioner, a day or two before the notification appeared in the gazette, had proceeded in the way which I have just now described. I bethought myself then that he was tricked into giving some sort of explanation and that the thing had been done. The form had been complied with but the substance evaded. I asked him: Why did you not consult a lawyer; why did you not tell me that you had been asked to give an explanation? You should have submitted a detailed explanation which, though it might be rejected by the authorities, would be considered by the public as adequate and which would have set out an accurate statement of facts as they had taken place, so that when the explanation was read along with the notification and the grounds on which your dismissal was based it would be apparent on which side justice lay.

These are the facts which I wanted to narrate on my analysis of the situation. (An honourable member: Was he also dismissed from presidency?) I have been reminded of some other fact but since that relates to a question of motive, I would be chary of making a detailed reference to it. This gentleman, Malik Lal Khan was some two years back elected chairman of the Gujranwala municipal committee. I would almost say that he was unanimously elected, but to be technically very correct, the election may be described as *nem con.* His was the only name proposed and he was elected.



Substantially speaking, therefore, he was elected unanimously to the Chair. (Mr. Din Muhammad: But seven members walked out.) After the event, just as you ran out now. Running out is habitual with certain people and we need not take much notice of these antics. We have to address ourselves to business. No other name was proposed which means in ordinary parlance that the gentleman was unanimously elected. He was, I repeat, elected, to put it very technically, *nem con.* Certain gentlemen chose to walk out after the election. That is, however, no relevant part of the affair on which I am now called upon to comment. All that is necessary for the present purpose to say is, I may repeat with your permission, that he was an elected president and this Ministry of Local Self-Government presided over by our present Minister was supposed to have vetoed that election under the extraordinary powers vested in it under the present Municipal Act. With that action I have no direct concern now; and I did not want to make mention of the fact for two reasons; one was that it would give the Minister an opportunity of introducing irrelevant matter to confuse the constitutional issue to pass comments on a past action relating to this gentleman and may be, to cast one-sided aspersions on him when he is not here to defend himself and it is not in the power of any of us to defend him, as you have been pleased to give the Honourable Minister the last word in the debate. All that is relevant for our present purpose is this, that he was an elected president and this election was thought fit to be immediately vetoed by the Ministry for Local Self-Government. Now that is past history. But it has a bearing on the present. It leads one to think, and that with a great deal of justification, that the present action may not be wholly unconnected with the action taken then. (A voice: What were the reasons?) I am not concerned with the reasons, and I intentionally abstained from commenting on the reasons which were then assigned, because that would take us astray from the present debate. Suffice it to say that they were such as would not hold water. Therefore, the only thing necessary for me to mention is that people may not be far wrong when they connect this action with that and look upon this the present action, not as a constitutional one, but as one dictated by party, factional, electioneering and personal considerations. The obvious implications of such conduct must disturb the minds of the people who are anxious for the early establishment of the reign of law and constitutionalism in this land. People could not be very much wrong, or at any rate, they could not be very much blamed, if they infer that these two actions of the Honourable Minister should be connected or at any rate, that such actions are to be explained only on grounds of the kind and description I have delineated before you, namely, that the reasons cannot be wholly objective. Any reasons which actuated the conduct of people who hold the reins of Government should proceed from a wholly dispassionate and objective examination of the facts of the case before them, and not from considerations of a description which cannot bear examination.

So, Sir, I will wind up my remarks by saying that all the three grounds on which this action of the Minister for Local Self-Government has been sought to be justified are such which really, on examination, turn out to be wholly untenable. The order of

[Mr. Labh Singh.]

the vice-president was demonstrably not contrary to the wishes of the majority of the members of the local municipal committee. Secondly, it has also been made plain that this order of the president was not in excess of the powers vested in him by law. My third submission is that the order cannot be and certainly ought not to be taken to be contrary to any oath of allegiance which members are in the present state of the law called upon to take while entering upon their office as municipal commissioners. (*Loud cheers*).

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** The question may now be put.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“That the question be now put.”

The motion was carried.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I am very sorry that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government has not been pleased to answer the criticisms that have been levelled against his administration.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** You gave him no opportunity.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I must enter a protest against this remark.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** It is unfair to the House that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government has not risen to give his views, so that the honourable mover of the cut may be in a position to say something.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** He is prepared to do it now. As the closure was carried he could not do so. Otherwise, he was perfectly ready.

**Mr. President :** As the closure motion is carried, the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government cannot reply of right. Had not the matter been of exceptional importance I would not have allowed the mover of the motion to make a reply. The honourable members are referred to the proviso to paragraph 66. But for the closure motion, the honourable mover of the amendment would have been entitled to reply and had he exercised that right, the Government Member would have been entitled to have the last word. But for the exceptional importance of the matter under discussion, I would not have allowed the mover of the amendment to make a reply.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I am very glad that you have been pleased to exercise your powers in allowing this speech. It would enable the Minister to reply.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I do not want to speak because the President allows it, but I think I am entitled to the right of reply.

**Mr. President :** Under what rule or Standing Order is the honourable member entitled to reply?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Under Standing Order 33.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is referring to Article 64. But the case is governed by proviso to Article 66.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Though I am permitted I will not speak, because the Honourable Minister is deliberately insulting the House by not speaking.

**Mr. President :** Order, order.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** The Honourable President waited for the Honourable Minister but he did not get up.

**Mr. President :** He did.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** After the closure motion he has no right of reply.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is referred to paragraph 66 of the Buisness Manual. After a closure motion is carried, the question has to be put without amendment or debate. That is the ordinary rule. But if a member has the right of reply, the President may allow him to reply, and I have consequently given the honourable member an opportunity to make a reply.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** If the honourable member does not reply, can the Government member reply ?

**Mr. President :** I think not.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I just want to clear my own mind. Does the honourable mover of this cut refuse to exercise his right ? When he has been permitted by the President to speak he certainly has the right to speak. If he now refuses to speak, it can only be due to his desire that the Minister should not speak.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I must say that I cannot agree to the tactics of the official benches. I have already brought to your notice that the official benches take the opportunity of disregarding the criticisms of the non-official benches. This is not the only time. I have brought this to your notice before. So I do not think that it is worth while to give any reply to the remarks of non-official members when no official member has deigned to reply.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** May I say a word as to the undeserving condemnation that the honourable member who has just sat down has hurled at us ? There is one particular thing I want to say. Since the honourable member sat down after speaking, he was opposed by an honourable member, Mr. Maya Das ; Mr. Maya Das was supported by the honourable member from Amritsar, who again opposed the honourable mover. He had hardly sat down when Sardar Harbakhsh Singh spoke against the cut, and it was after these three speeches were made against the honourable mover, that my friend in front of me (Rana Feroz-ud-din Khan) gave him his support. After that, the honourable member from Gujranwala again opposed him. Again a second member from Gujranwala spoke for him, perhaps he was the last to speak. In the circumstances, I fail to see how the honourable mover can say that his cut has not been criticised. We are here as official members, but the Minister has his party behind him.

**Mr. President :** This discussion must come to an end.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I must reply.

**Mr. President :** Certainly, but the honourable member must obey the Chair.

*Chaudhri Afzal Haq stood up to speak.*

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Order, order.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** (*turning to the Hon'ble Revenue Member*) You are creating disorder. I am not going to be dictated to by you.

**Mr. President :** May I know if the honourable member is inclined to make a reply ?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** No, Sir.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** May I make a submission, Sir ? Very serious charges were made by Mr. Labh Singh against the Ministry of Local Self-Government, and before we are called upon to give our vote, it was but fair and legitimate that we should have heard the Honourable Minister before the closure motion was put. Therefore, I would submit that in the interests of fair play and justice, you would rule out this closure motion and once more allow the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government to meet these charges and even give Mr. Afzal Haq the right of reply.

**Mr. President :** I very much regret that I cannot relax or violate the rules of business. But if the House is anxious to hear the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government I will allow him to speak in deference to the united wish of the House. It would appear that the honourable mover of the motion has not given any reply with the object of depriving the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government of a right of reply. But if it is the wish of the honourable members of the House that he should be heard I will allow him. On the other hand, if it is not the wish of the House that he should be heard, I will not allow him.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** We pray that he should be heard.

**Mr. President :** If that is the wish of the House I have no objection. (*The President then gathered the sense of the House which was unanimous for hearing the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government.*)

The Council then adjourned till 2 p.m. on Thursday, the 20th March 1930.

**List of the Employees of the Ferozepore Municipal Committee,  
who are over 55 years of age.**

(*Vide answer to part (a) of Q. 1630, page 654 ante.*)

Name.	Designation.	Pay.	Age.	REMARKS.
		Per mensem. Rs.	Years.	
1. Lala Ucho Dass ..	Secretary ..	200	60	
	Conveyance allowance ..	40		
2. M. Shahab Din ..	Octroi Inspector ..	45	61	
3. M. Muhammad Bux ..	Octroi Moharrir ..	24	53	
4. Lala Anant Ram ..	Ditto ..	22	53	
5. Yunus Khan ..	Octroi Chowkidar ..	15	62	
6. M. Chiragh Din ..	Teacher ..	50	64	
7. M. Abdul Ghani ..	Do. ..	50	60	
8. M. Imam Din ..	Do. ..	35	52	
9. Shahab Din ..	Conservancy Jama- dar.	15	70	
10. Farid Bux ..	Ditto ..	15	65	
11. Jumma ..	Ditto ..	15	60	
12. Fatch Muhammad ..	Clerk, School Atten- dance Officer.	22	61	

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

*Thursday, the 20th March 1930.*

THE Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P.M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

### STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

#### AGITATION AGAINST WATER AND HOUSE-TAX IN MULTAN.

**\*2946. Lala Chetan Anand:** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether he is aware of the fact that there is a great agitation at Multan against the imposition of water and house-tax by the municipal committee, Multan;
- (b) what are the reasons that have led to this agitation;
- (c) whether Government is aware of the fact that the local executive authorities are giving it a political colour?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:** (a) Yes. There was some agitation.

(b) Government have held no enquiry into the reasons for this agitation. Some alleged it was due to personal frictions between various gentlemen; others said it was instigated by Congress workers. The latter allegation was, however, repudiated by Congress workers who saw me. It is very difficult to say which allegation is correct without a prolonged enquiry.

(c) The words "political colour" are not understood. If the honourable member will very kindly explain what he wishes to know, Government will be only too pleased to answer.

#### LEVY OF WATER AND HOUSE-TAX IN MULTAN.

**\*2947. Lala Chetan Anand:** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the municipal committee, Multan, passed a resolution recommending to the Government that the water-tax and house-tax shall be levied only up to the end of March 1931;
- (b) if so, what action has been taken on the said resolution;
- (c) will the Honourable Minister place the copy of the resolution on the table?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:** (a) Yes.

(b) The matter is under the consideration of Government.

(c) A copy of the resolution is placed on the table.

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

Resolution No. 1 of a special emergent meeting of the Municipal Committee, Multan, held on 10th February 1930.

(1) Laid on the table a note, dated the 7th February 1930, signed by 11 Municipal Commissioners moving that an emergent special meeting of the committee be called for consideration of the serious situation which has arisen in the city from the realization of water-tax. Both Vice-Presidents have directed to call a meeting for today for the purpose.

In this connection an informal meeting attended by 14 Municipal Commissioners and the Deputy Commissioner, Multan, was held at the bungalow of the Deputy Commissioner, Multan, on the 9th February 1930. This meeting proposes to move the following resolutions:—

"That the Local Government be moved to make the existing water-tax and house-tax (taxes announced in *Punjab Gazette* notifications Nos. 29311 and 29312, dated the 16th November 1927) operative up to the 31st March 1931 only.

"The committee will endeavour to balance the budget by other means, by the curtailment of expenditure, by the imposition of a passenger tax or some other form of tax, and by the rapid extension of house connections bringing in an income in the form of water rate; and while retaining its right to do so will not re-impose direct taxation unless all other means fail.

"That the committee should remit the water-tax and house-tax demand for the year 1928-29 on all persons assessed to pay a total demand of eight annas or less per annum; or such number of annas as is necessary to make the total amount of relief as nearly as possible (but not exceeding Rs. 5,000) provided that the assessee pays his assessment for 1929-30 on or before the 15th March 1930. Amounts already paid but due to be remitted under the terms of this resolution should be set off against the 1930-31 demand."

The committee is asked to pass orders.

*Resolved—*

1. The committee unanimously agrees with the above proposals. The local Government may be moved accordingly.

2. Senior Vice-President further proposed, and H. Wahid Bakhsh and Lala Chetan Anand seconded, that the above resolution be proclaimed to the public by beat of drum, and public be informed to pay the taxes at once and the District Magistrate be requested to postpone the execution of warrants of attachment issued for the recovery of taxes on application from this office for a period of ten (10) days. This was carried unanimously.

3. Proposed by Senior Vice-President and seconded by H. Wahid Bakhsh and Lala Chetan Anand and all other members that the Deputy Commissioner be requested to kindly arrange the withdrawal of cases under Indian Penal Code and security proceedings under section 107, Criminal Procedure Code, pending in connection with the collection. This was carried unanimously.

#### WATER AND HOUSE-TAX IN MULTAN—CONFERENCE OF LEADING CITIZENS.

\*2948. **Lala Chetan Anand:** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that at the time of his visit to Multan in connection with the water and house-tax agitation he called a

conference of the municipal commissioners and certain other leading citizens of the town to consider over the situation created by the said agitation ;

(b) if so, what was the result of that conference ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) Attention is invited to the reply given on the 8th March 1930 to part (d) of Question No. 2917.<sup>1</sup>

#### COLLECTION OF WATER AND HOUSE-TAX IN MULTAN.

**\*2949. Lala Chetan Anand :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the municipal committee, Multan, has entrusted the entire work of realisation of water and house-tax to the executive authorities ;

(b) whether it is a fact that the local authorities are making efforts to realise the tax by overawing the people with the show of police force, execution of distress warrants by breaking open the locks of shops and houses and otherwise ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) No. In certain cases where the municipal committee had failed to collect the tax by the ordinary methods through its own staff the committee applied to a Magistrate having jurisdiction to recover the arrears due under section 81 (1) of the Municipal Act.

(b) A Magistrate to whom an application is made under section 81 (1) of the Act has no option but to recover the amounts found to be due under the Act by the distress and sale of the moveable property of the defaulter.

#### MULTAN MUNICIPALITY—EXTENSION OF THE TERM OF MEMBERS.

**\*2950. Lala Chetan Anand :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

(a) if there is any proposal to extend the term of the present members of the Multan municipality ;

(b) if so, what are the reasons for the extension ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) No such proposal has yet been received by Government.

(b) Does not arise.

#### BREACHES IN SULEIMANKE CANAL.

**\*2951. Chaudhri Zafulla Khan :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state with reference to the answer given by him to Council Question No. 1858<sup>2</sup> on the 26th November, 1929—

(a) whether the Government is now in a position to give the actual figures of the proposed amount of compensation to be paid in the case of each of the villages mentioned in the question ;

<sup>1</sup>Pages 385-386 *supra*.

<sup>2</sup>Volume XIV, pages 352-353.

[Ch. Zafrulla Khan.]

(b) if so, what is the amount of such compensation in the case of each village ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) It is regretted that the case is not yet complete. The claims of the parties concerned are still under consideration, and the final report is expected shortly.

(b) Does not arise.

SALE OF NAZUL LAND IN MAUZA SHEESH MAHAL.

**\*2952. Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether a piece of nazul land bearing field No. 156 in Mauza Sheesh Mahal in Lahore tahsil has recently been sold to an adjoining landowner, and, if so, what is the name of the person to whom this plot has been sold, the actual date of the sale and the price realised from the purchaser ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that another neighbouring landowner wrote to the Deputy Commissioner and Commissioner (March-December, 1929) offering to pay a higher price for the plot, and, if so, what action did those officers take on this ;
- (c) whether the same landowner made the same offer to the Financial Secretary to the Punjab Government in his letter, dated the 12th December 1929, and, if so, what action did the Financial Secretary to the Punjab Government take on it ;
- (d) what are the reasons which induced the Government to sell this plot of land at a much lower price than the one that was being offered by another adjoining landowner ;
- (e) the names of the officers of the Nazul department who have dealt with this case at different stages, and in case this loss has been occasioned to Government by the sale of this plot at a lesser price than was being offered for it, the name or names of the officers who are responsible for this loss ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, to Ram Ditta Mal on 16th December 1929 after realising Rs. 2,215, as price.

(b) An application was received from Mr. Muhammad Nazir, Advocate, but he owns no land in his own name in the neighbourhood. Mr. Muhammad Nazir offered to pay Rs. 1,800, which was less than the price realised from Ram Ditta Mal. The honourable member appears to have been misinformed.

(c) Yes ; it was forwarded to the Commissioner for disposal.

(d) Does not arise.

(e) Mr. F. H. Puckle and Mr. A. A. Lane Roberts. There has been no loss to Government.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Did not Mr. Muhammad Nazir offer to pay a higher price for the plot than the price offered by the rival purchaser ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I have no information ; he offered only Rs. 1,800.



EXCISE SUB-INSPECTORS—PROMOTION TO SPECIAL GRADE.

**\*2953. Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) the names of the Excise Sub-Inspectors who have been promoted to the special grade in connection with the vacancies caused by the retirement of Qazi Ghulam Hussain and Pir Haider Shah, Excise Inspectors ;
- (b) whether the Sub-Inspectors so promoted had ever been previously ignored for promotion and the reasons for the same, and
- (c) whether the Sub-Inspectors so promoted have superseded any Muslim Sub-Inspectors ; and, if so, the reasons for such supersession ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Lala Prabh Dial, Lala Dina Nath, Barry.

(b) The former had on a previous occasion not been selected for promotion, because he was then considered to be less suitable for promotion than the Sub-Inspector who was actually promoted.

(c) One of them was selected in preference to three senior Muslim Sub-Inspectors, because he was considered to have stronger claims than them for the selection grade.

EXCISE INSPECTORS.

**\*2954. Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that promotions to the grade of Excise Inspectors have hitherto been made from the special grade of Sub-Inspectors only ;
- (b) if that is so, and if there is at present no Muslim Sub-Inspector in the special grade, what prospects are there for the promotion of Muslims to the grade of Inspectors during the next few years ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Excise Inspectors have of late years been appointed only from the selection grade of Sub-Inspectors.

(b) At present there are no Muslim Sub-Inspectors in the selection grade. But the claims of qualified candidates for selection to the selection grade will be considered by the Financial Commissioner who makes these appointments.

EXCISE LICENSEES IN LAHORE, ETC., DISTRICTS.

**\*2955. Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state the number and names of Excise licensees in the Lahore, Amritsar and Gurdaspur districts who are related or are connected with the Excise Assistant to the Financial Commissioner ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** Lala Pyare Lal is the Excise Assistant's cousin. He is a wholesale licensee for country liquor

[Hon'ble Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh.]

in Lahore Cantonment. A relative of Lala Pyare Lal, Lala Mulk Raj, holds a retail license for country liquor in the same place. No other excise licensees of Lahore, Amritsar and Gurdaspur districts are related to or connected with the Excise Assistant.

### UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

#### HONORARY MAGISTRATES, SHEIKHUPURA DISTRICT.

**1634. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member please state community-wise with regard to the Sheikhpura district—

- (i) (a) the population,
- (b) the number of honorary magistrates,
- (c) the number of provincial darbaries,
- (d) the number of divisional darbaries,
- (e) the number of district darbaries, and
- (f) the number of jagirdars ;
- (ii) (a) why the Muslim community is not given its due share in places of distinctions stated above ;
- (b) what action, if any, does Government propose to take to right this unequal treatment ;
- (iii) (a) whether Government is considering the appointment of some more honorary magistrates in the Sheikhpura district ;
- (b) if so, how many of the new nominees are Muslims ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** As Government do not consider that any public purpose will be served by the collection of the information which the honourable member desires, it does not propose to collect it.

#### HONORARY MAGISTRATES, ETC., AND MUSLIM REPRESENTATION.

**1635. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) in which districts of the Punjab the share of Muslims is commensurate with their population in the list of—
  - (i) honorary magistrates ;
  - (ii) jagirdars ;
  - (iii) provincial darbaris ;
  - (iv) divisional darbaris ;
  - (v) district darbaris ;
- (b) where they are not given their proportionate share ;
- (c) the reasons why such a state of affairs exists ;
- (d) what steps, if any, does Government intend to take to make up the deficiency of Muslims in the aforesaid places of distinction ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** Government regret that the collection of the information asked for would involve an amount of labour entirely incommensurate with its value when collected.

#### TIKKA TILLOO FOREST.

**1636. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the forest of Tikka Tilloo in the Kangra district has been reserved for the grazing of cattle belonging to Tikka Tilloo and 11 other Tikkas of tahsil Hamirpur, district Kangra ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that a large part of this forest area is reserved for *tirhahi* and the Government godown and only a small part is actually available for grazing purposes ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that there is a strong feeling against this inadequacy of grazing land, and that representations to this effect have been and are being sent to Government ;
- (d) if the answers to the above be in the affirmative, what action do Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) Government has no such information.

(d) Does not arise.

#### MOTOR VEHICLES ON HIRE IN TAHSIL HAMIRPUR.

**1637. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that motor vehicles are plying on hire in tahsil Hamirpur, district Kangra ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Palampur-Sujanpur road and other roads in the said tahsil are not being kept in good condition ;
- (c) whether it is also a fact that there is no pucca bridge on the river Beas in the Kangra district ;
- (d) if the answers to the above be in the affirmative, what action Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The question as to whether motor traffic can be allowed in the Hamirpur tahsil is still under consideration, but for the present it is allowed on the road between Nadaun and Hamirpur.

(b) No complaints have been received about the roads in Palampur tahsil.

(c) Yes.

(d) The matter will be considered.

## INCOME FROM SHAMILAT FORESTS, KANGRA DISTRICT.

**1638. Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) the amount of money distributed during the last two years amongst the zamindars of the Kangra district from the income derived from the produce of the *shamilat* forests giving details of the distribution tahsil-wise ;
- (b) the number of trees granted free of cost to the zamindars during the last two years for the making of agricultural implements, giving details of the same tahsil-wise ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The information required by the honourable member has been called for from the local officers. A reply will be sent to him as soon as it is ready.

## GOVERNMENT WASTE LANDS IN JHANG.

**1639. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state the total area in acres of the Government waste lands in the Lower Jhelum and Lower Chenab Canal Colonies of the Jhang district ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** If by waste the honourable member means lands available for sale or allotment, then the total areas of Crown waste lands in the Lower Jhelum and Lower Chenab Canal Colonies in Jhang district are 10,888 and 111,528 acres, respectively.

## CIVIL SURGEONS AND MEDICAL OFFICERS.

**1640. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) the total number of Civil Surgeons and medical officers of the same status in this province ;
- (b) their numbers community-wise ;
- (c) how many of them belong to the statutory agricultural tribes irrespective of their community ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan Noon :** I regret the answer to this question is not ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## ASSISTANT AND SUB-ASSISTANT SURGEONS IN GOVERNMENT SERVICE.

**1641. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable the Minister for Local Self-Government please lay on the table a statement showing—

- (a) the number of Assistant-Surgeons and Sub-Assistant Surgeons taken into Government service since 1927 up to date ;
- (b) their numbers community-wise ;
- (c) how many of them belong to the statutory agriculturist tribes ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** A statement giving the information required by the honourable member is laid on the table.

*Statement showing the number of Assistant Surgeons and Sub-Assistant Surgeons taken into Government service since 1927.*

Community.	Members belonging to notified agricultural tribes.	Others.	Total.	REMARKS.
<i>Assistant Surgeons.</i>				
No Assistant Surgeons have been recruited since 1927.				
<i>Sub-Assistant Surgeons.</i>				
Muslims .. ..	16	8	19	
Sikhs .. ..	7	8	10	
Hindus .. ..	..	17	17	
Total .. ..	23	23	46	

#### ROADS IN JHANG DISTRICT.

**1642. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable the Minister for Agriculture please lay on the table a statement showing—

- the total length of pucca roads constructed and maintained by the Public Works Department in Jhang District ;
- the length of kutchha roads taken over from the District Board, Jhang, and maintained by the Public Works Department ;
- improvements in the Jhang District, if any, done to the kutchha and pucca roads in charge of the Public Works Department since they were taken over ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

#### INSPECTORS OF CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETIES.

**1643. Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Honourable the Minister for Agriculture please state—

- the total number of inspectors of Co-operative Societies in this province ;
- the total number of such inspectors recruited directly to this post ;
- the number of statutory Muslim agriculturists of the Jhang district that were taken directly for these posts, since the establishment of this department in the province, and their postings at present ;
- what steps does the Government intend to take to give the statutory agriculturist Muslims of Jhang district their just share and proper representation in this branch of public service intended for the uplift of the rural classes ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The number of sanctioned posts is 125.

(b) Seventy-one of those serving are directly recruited candidates who have been finally confirmed.

(c) Four.

(d) The position does not appear to call for any special action.

**HAKIM ABDUL AZIZ—GUN-LICENCE—CANCELLATION OF.**

**1644. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that Hakim Abdul Aziz, Senai, General Secretary, City Congress Committee, Sialkot, has been given a licence for keeping a gun ;

(b) whether it is a fact that on 18th February 1980, the police suddenly appeared on his shop and demanded the gun and the licence saying that the licence had been cancelled ?

(c) The reasons leading to the cancellation of the licence and whether any explanation was called for from him before this step was taken ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Hussain :** (a) and (b) Yes.

(c) The District Magistrate had received reliable information to justify the cancellation of the licence.

**EXCISE INSPECTORS.**

**1645. Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

(a) the number of Excise Inspectors in the Punjab ; and

(b) how many of these are Muslims and how many are non-Muslims ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Thirty-four excluding one unfilled vacancy.

(b) Muslims fourteen : non-Muslims twenty.

**EXCISE SUB-INSPECTORS IN THE SPECIAL GRADE.**

**1646. Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

(a) the number of Excise Sub-Inspectors in the special grade ; and

(b) how many of these are Muslims and how many of them are non-Muslims ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Five.

(b) Muslims none : non-Muslims five.

**SITE OF BHAKRA DAM.**

**1647. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

(a) whether the site of Bhakra Dam is situated in British territory or outside ;

(b) if outside, what is the name of the State ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) and (b). The Bhakra Dam is situated on the Sutlej river at a site where one bank is in British territory and the other in Bilaspur State.

## CANALS IRRIGATING AREAS IN BRITISH TERRITORY.

**1648. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) how many canals are there, and what are their names, whose waters irrigate wholly or in part areas in British territory, but whose heads are situated outside British territory ;
- (b) how far in each such case the canal has to run before it enters British territory ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Two, the Upper Jhelum and the Mailsi canals.

(b) The Upper Jhelum runs for about 18 miles before it enters the British territory and the Mailsi canal for about  $1\frac{1}{2}$  miles.

## CANALS IRRIGATING AREAS IN NATIVE STATES.

**1649. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) how many canals are there and what are their names whose waters irrigate wholly or in part areas in Native States, but whose heads are situated in British territory ;
- (b) how far in each such case the canal has to run before it enters the Native State ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) & (b) Six.

(1) Sirhind Canal	..	..	14 $\frac{1}{2}$	miles.
(2) Bikaner Canal	..	..	7 $\frac{3}{4}$	"
(3) Sadiqia Canal	..	..	1	"
(4) Fordwah Canal	..	..	1	"
(5) Abbassia Canal	..	..	1 $\frac{1}{2}$	"
(6) Panjnad Canal	..	..	2	"

## HIRE FROM MOTOR VEHICLES FOR USE OF STANDS.

**1650. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that district boards are entitled to establish vehicle stands ;
- (b) if so, are they authorised to charge hire from motor vehicles plying for hire and using their stands ; if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) There is nothing to prevent a district board establishing vehicle stands on lands in its possession.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to part (b) of his own question No. 1070<sup>1</sup>, asked in the March 1929 session of the Council.

## LICENCES FOR THE SUPPLY OF ELECTRICAL ENERGY.

**1651. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state the names of local bodies that have applied for and have secured licences for the supply of electrical energy ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The municipal committees of Amritsar and Simla are the only municipal committees that hold licences for the supply of electricity.

**POLICE STATION AT MEHNA, IN DISTRICT FEROZEPUR.**

**1652. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state if the police station at Mehna in Ferozepur district is temporary or permanent ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** Mehna is a permanent police station.

**MOTOR VEHICLES AND DISTRICT BOARD ROADS.**

**1653. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state what authority is empowered to regulate the speed of motor vehicles plying for hire on district board roads ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The regulation of the speed of motor vehicles plying for hire on all public roads, including district board roads, is entrusted to the District Magistrate by the Punjab Motor Vehicles Plying for Hire Rules, 1922, made under section 11 (2) (e) of the Indian Motor Vehicles Act, 1914.

**AREA TO BE IRRIGATED BY THE BHAKRA DAM.**

**1654. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state what is the area expected to be irrigated under the Bhakra Dam project, in what districts and Native States and how much in each district or Native State ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The attention of the honourable member is drawn to the *Communiqué*, which was issued in July 1929, and of which a copy is attached.

*Press Communiqué from the Punjab Government regarding the future programme of Irrigation Development in the Punjab.*

At the meeting of the Indus Discharge Committee held in March last agreement was reached on the following points :—

- (1) No more water should be withdrawn by the Punjab from the Main Indus for 10 years ; but a volume not exceeding 1,250 cubic feet per second may be withdrawn by the Punjab during the winter months and approximately 7,500 cubic feet a second during the *khari* season, from the tributaries of the Indus, for further development of irrigation in the province.
- (2) The quantity of water required for the Bhakra Project is available the only consideration being the effect of these withdrawals upon the water surface levels of the Indus at the heads of the inundation canals from the Sind boundary to Sukkur. Accordingly a Superintending Engineer from Bombay and the Punjab are to be appointed to submit a joint report on this matter.



The Punjab Government have as a result of these decisions arrived at the following conclusions :—

- (6) The Thal Project for the irrigation of the Sind Sagar Doab will be held in abeyance for at least ten years. A Bill is before the Punjab Legislative Council for the repeal of the Sind Sagar Colonization Act of 1902, a Select Committee has been appointed to report on this Bill, and their report will be considered at the next meeting of the Legislative Council.
- (7) The Jalalpur Project for the irrigation of the tract between the Salt Range and the right bank of the river Jhelum from Rasul to Khushab is definitely abandoned on account of engineering difficulties.
- (8) The Haveli Project with a Headworks at Trimmu just below the junction of the Chenab and Jhelum will be re-prepared for submission to Government of India and Secretary of State for sanction. The Haveli Project involves the construction of canals on both banks of the Chenab: that on the right bank will provide non-perennial irrigation in approximately four hundred thousand acres of land from the Headworks to below Muzaffargarh, and the area commanded by the existing Karam, Ganesh and Taliri inundation canals will be included in this area. On the left bank the canal will pass supplies into the Ravi river above the Sidhnai head irrigation *en route* the area at present unirrigated in that Doab lying outside the irrigation limits of the Lower Chenab Canal west of the railway line from Jhang to Khanewal. With the water that will reach the Sidhnai Headworks, the existing Sidhani series of canals, which are at present only semi-perennial, will be converted into perennial canals. A non-perennial canal will be constructed from the Sidhnai Headworks to command the whole area between the Sidhani Canals, Lower Bari Doab Canal, Sutlej Valley Project and the river Chenab. The area at present commanded by the Multan series of inundation canals will be included in the area commanded by this canal. The areas to be commanded by the left bank canal will be about 700,000 acres for perennial and 500,000 acres for non-perennial irrigation, respectively. The total area commanded by the Project will, therefore, be some 1,600,000 acres.
- (9) The Bhakra Dam Project will be prepared for submission to the Government of India and Secretary of State for sanction, due consideration being given to the decision by the Government of India on the report of the two Superintending Engineers alluded to above. This project now involves the construction of a dam 500 feet high on the Sutlej with a storage capacity of over  $4\frac{1}{2}$  million foot acres of water the equivalent of a discharge of 12,500 cubic feet a second for six months. The water will be utilized in increasing the intensity of irrigation on the Sirhind and Western Jumna Canals and extending the irrigation from these canals up to the physical limit of command from Delhi.

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

via Hissar to the limit of irrigation from the Sutlej Valley Project. The area commanded by the Grey Canals not already absorbed in the Sutlej Valley Project will be converted from inundation into non-perennial irrigation.

The total area in which it is hoped that irrigation will be affected under the Bhakra Project is nearly 12 million acres and into  $4\frac{1}{2}$  million acres of this area irrigation will be introduced for the first time.

The preparation of both the projects—Haveli and Bhakra—is now being undertaken.

#### STORM WATER DRAIN IN FEROZEPUR TAHSIL.

**1655. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that near the villages Karyan, Suba Kahanchand and Hastake in the Ferozepore tahsil there runs a natural storm water drain in the direction of village Hassan Dhoot ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Bikaner and Eastern canals have cut across this drain ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that no syphon has been provided under these canals for the outflow of storm water ;
- (d) if answers to (a), (b) and (c) be in the affirmative, what action they propose taking in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) There is no drain but a shallow natural depression only.

(b) The Bikaner and Eastern canals cross this depression.

(c) Yes.

(d) Action is being taken by the Superintendent, Grey Canals, to control the volume of water in the Butewah Canal, which at present floods this area.

#### COLLECTION OF WATER NEAR THE BIKANER CANAL EMBANKMENT.

**1656. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that since the Bikaner canal has been constructed, water from villages of Karyan, Suba Kahanchand and neighbouring villages comes and collects near the Bikaner Canal embankment ;
- (b) if so, what is the area of the land in which water collects, what villages are concerned, and how much land of each village is affected ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) The area varies with seasons and years. There is much rice cultivation in this part of the country and it is difficult to determine what portion of flooding due to rainfall and what portion is due to escape from rice fields.

## BIKANER CANAL.

**1657. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in or about September 1928, there was a heavy rainfall and much water collected near the embankment of the Bikaner canal near the villages Sooba Kahanchand and Karian ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the Revenue Assistant had to ask the Canal Department to cut the canal embankment in order to give the collected water a chance to be drained into the canal ;
- (c) if so, was a cut made in the canal, if so, for how many days was the water allowed to drain into the canal ?
- (d) what was the area in which the water was standing at the time, what villages were concerned and what was the area in each case ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes. Some water had collected, partly due to heavy local rainfall of 31st August and partly due to excessive supply brought down by the Butewah Canal of the Grey System.

(b) The Executive Engineer concerned had allowed a cut in the canal to drain off the surplus water before he received the Revenue Assistant's request to do so.

(c) All water drained off into the canal within 24 hours.

(d) Enquiries have been made and the details will be supplied to the honourable member as soon as available.

## SOUNDINGS OF WATER TABLES, VILLAGES OF KARIAN, ETC.

**1658. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in the neighbourhood of villages Karian, Sooba Kahanchand and other villages near the Bikaner Canal, the Canal Department has been taking soundings of the water table, whether it is rising or not ;
- (b) if so, a statement showing the rise or fall as the case may be, in the case of lands of the following villages may kindly be laid on the table :—Hastake, Soother, Sooba Kahanchand, Karian, Sooba Jadeed, Sooba Kadim.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, detailed observations are being made in villages along the Bikaner Canal.

(b) No clear results can be determined yet from them as the observations have not been continued for sufficiently long period, and it does not appear, therefore, that laying on the table the statement asked for would, at the present time, serve a useful purpose.

## ACCUMULATION OF WATER NEAR BIKANER CANAL.

**1659. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that when water has been accumulating near the Bikaner Canal, the Canal Department have employed pumps to pump the water into the canal ;
- (b) if so, how many times, on what occasions and with what results ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) On one occasion, during September 1929, with very good results.

#### CANAL ZILLADARS.

**1660. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) what is the total number of canal zilladars ;
- (b) how many amongst them are Christians ;
- (c) when were zilladars recruited last and how many were taken ;
- (d) amongst the applicants were there any Christians, if so, how many ;
- (e) was any Christian taken, if no Christian was taken, what were the reasons for not taking any of them ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) 218.

(b) 2.

(c) The last selection made was in 1929 when 59 were selected.

(d) None.

(e) No. None were recommended.

#### GOVERNMENT HIGH SCHOOLS FOR GIRLS.

**1661. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) in what places are Government High Schools for Girls accommodated in rented buildings ;
- (b) what is the amount of rent paid in each case ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The required information is as follows :—

<i>Places where Government High Schools for Girls are accommodated in rented buildings.</i>				<i>Amount of rent paid in each case.</i>
				Per mensem.
				Rs.
1. Ambala	..	..	..	.. 100
2. Jhang	..	..	..	.. 135
3. Hissar	..	..	..	.. 120
4. Amritsar	..	..	..	.. 150
5. Moga	..	..	..	.. 100
6. Ludhiana	..	..	..	.. 130
7. Hoshiarpur	..	..	..	.. 100

Ambala and Hoshiarpur schools will, however, be shifted to Government buildings in the near future.

#### DESTRUCTION OF LOCUSTS.

**1662. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that during the recent winter month locusts have visited many districts in the Punjab ;
- (b) if so, what instructions were issued by Government for their destruction ;
- (c) in how many districts these instructions were acted upon and with what results ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) A copy of Financial Commissioner's letter No. 805-D., dated 25th February, 1930, is laid on the table.

(c) Action is being taken in all districts as indicated in this letter ; but it is too early as yet to make any definite statement as to the results of the action taken.

Copy of Letter No. 805 L, dated 25th February, 1930, from A. C. MACNABE, Esq., I.C.S., Senior Secretary to the Financial Commissioners, Punjab, to all Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners in the Punjab.

I AM directed to address you on the threat to the province arising from the plague of locusts which have been seen in most districts in recent months. The insects have been seen in such large numbers and over so large an area that there is serious danger of a disastrous amount of damage being inflicted unless steps are taken, adequate to meet the needs of the case. It seems probable that nothing short of combined action by the people and by Government servants of all departments will suffice, and I am accordingly directed to request you to take measures as early as possible to arrange for such combined action on a thoroughgoing scale.

2. The measures advocated in appendix V to the Land Administration Manual are, in general, sufficient, and, although drafted some years ago, are almost in every way up-to-date. A few minor suggestions are here added, but the all-India Committee, which recently sat in Delhi to discuss the position, has in the main supported the measures described in Appendix V. Since that appendix was written, the chief change has been the recruitment of the staff of the Agricultural Department.

3. It seems clear that the officers of the Revenue Department must take the lead ; no other department has the organization, the information, or the intimate relation with the people required to combat the present danger. In each district an officer should be placed in control of locusts work ; usually the Revenue Assistant will be found most suitable, but where there is a sub-division the Sub-Divisional Officer should be made responsible. All information concerning flights of locusts should be sent to this officer as soon as possible and it should be his duty to pass on all the available information to the officials and the committees mentioned below. He should at once without waiting for the appearance of locusts take measures to ensure that these instructions in Appendix V are thoroughly well known and understood by the revenue staff, and should instruct the Tahsil staffs to take all possible steps to teach the people the means of meeting the peril. Every effort should be made to utilize the short time still available to organize these preparatory measures. Information as to the presence of locusts should also be forwarded with the least possible delay to the Deputy Director of Agriculture of the circle affected, and also directly to the Entomologist, Agricultural College, Lyallpur. If the Deputy Commissioner can arrange this, it would probably be useful if post cards containing information could be sent direct by the Patwaris to these officers.

4. Deputy Commissioners should review the resources at their disposal and should invite the assistance of officers of all the departments in the campaign. Without desiring in any way to interfere with the discretion of Deputy Commissioners, the Financial Commissioners suggest that advantage would be gained by organizing executive committees for as many local areas

[ Hon'ble Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh.]

as may be practicable, compatible with the existence of suitable presidents. Better work will probably be secured if the officials available are distributed amongst these committees, so that each will have a definite area to deal with in case of a visitation. The fact that an officer has been made responsible for executive work in a particular local area will not absolve him from responsibility for rendering all assistance within his power in the district generally; for instance, an Assistant Registrar may be placed on a committee for a small area, but he should still be responsible for organizing co-operators throughout his charge to join in the campaign. The Financial Commissioners are of opinion that if work against locusts be decentralized to the extreme limit permitted by the existence of efficient presidents of committees, and if each available officer and committee is made responsible for protecting a definite area, it should be possible to take immediate effective action wherever and whenever the danger arises. The mere fact that touring may be restricted or routine work interrupted during the danger period should not be allowed to interfere with the emergent task of combating the threatened plague. If such committees are at once constituted, it should be possible for the official member to ensure that the instructions for action are known throughout his area and to arrange for immediate effective action.

5. It must be clearly understood that there is no short and easy method of destroying locusts, and that nothing less than the whole-hearted co-operation of everyone concerned is necessary. For flying locusts there is no measure short of killing the individuals wherever found, and this can best be done at night when they collect on trees or bare ground. Apart from the measures advocated in Appendix V, effort is being made to procure a supply of *sodium fluosilicate*, which, when mixed with bran makes a bait attractive to the hopper and the adult. It has been found that this bait is practically harmless to cattle; cattle allowed to graze on land baited with this poison have been found to suffer no ill effects, and a fairly large dose must be given to an animal before it becomes affected. The use of this poison will be controlled by the staff of the Agricultural Department if a sufficient supply can be obtained in time. About three annas worth of this poison suffices for one acre of land.

6. The most effective measure against locusts is to discover where eggs have been laid and to destroy them. For this reason great importance must be attached to the supply of regular and prompt information of flights. Breeding grounds must be found and notified with the least possible delay, and rewards may be offered and paid for information as to these. When a breeding ground has been discovered, it should be at once ringed round with a trench to prevent the hoppers from escaping; some authorities consider that this alone may be sufficient, but it will be safer to have the eggs dug up and destroyed by burying them in deep holes. As, however, it is generally found that a considerable number of eggs are left in the ground to produce hoppers, the search for and destruction of eggs should not be held to render unnecessary the digging of a trench around a breeding ground, as it will help to prevent the spread of any hopper that may emerge.

7. Where a breeding ground contains crops or other food, the hoppers may find enough to last them until they can fly away, so that a trench by itself may prove ineffective. Thus, both trenching and destruction should be taken in hand.

8. Instructions for the destruction of hoppers are given in Appendix V of the Manual and there is little to add. The poison baits already described can be used when available. The trenches should be so deep that the hoppers cannot creep out; it has been found useful to provide the trenches with side screens so as to guide the hoppers into them; this may be made of ordinary cloth or of corrugated iron, both of which can be used over and over again or 'Sirki'. If every committee were provided with rods or pegs about 18 inches long for holding the side screens in position, these could be easily carried to the place of action and would make possible the immediate erection of the screens. It has been suggested that in order to prevent the hoppers from jumping out of the trench a strip of slippery oil-cloth should be placed on the side of the trench away from the advancing hoppers; it is doubtful whether sufficient of this oil-cloth is readily obtainable or if its use is really practicable on a large scale.

9. Whether the large number of canals of all descriptions in the province will prove useful is yet to be proved; hoppers can survive in water for some time, and usually a little oil has to be put on to the water before they can be killed.

10. As trenches are so effective against hoppers, it follows that it is easy to protect crops by digging trenches around them. This measure can be adopted at once wherever the cultivators are prepared to take the trouble and it should be impressed on their attention.

11. The Agricultural Department have some flame throwers, but the value of these has yet to be proved; they will be used whenever circumstances appear favourable.

12. A grant of Rs. 3,000 is being placed at the disposal of each Commissioner for distribution to the Deputy Commissioners in his division. The Department of Agriculture will make arrangements for the free supply of poison, help in the way of flame showers, and the dissemination of advice on old and new method of control and destruction. The main agency, however, for the collection of intelligence and the organization of concerted action must still be the Deputy Commissioner. The grants now being allotted to Commissioners are designated, in the main, subject to each Deputy Commissioner's discretion, (a) to encourage the discovery of breeding grounds especially in uncultivated areas, (b) to provide the necessary contingencies for an organized campaign. If concerted action is needed as between the various departments of Government, it is even more necessary to engender in the mind of the countryside a lively apprehension as to the gravity of the present threatened plague and to secure its co-operation and its informed co-operation in its own interests. In this connection paragraph 3 of Appendix V, Land Administration Manual, still holds good. Locusts in the cycle of their coming only emphasize the increasing importance of the war man is doomed to wage against insects microscopic and obtrusive.

18. Copies of this letter are being sent to the Heads of all Departments under authority of the Punjab Government, and it is hoped that every one will do whatever he can to assist in protecting the province from the danger that threatens it.

#### CHILD MARRIAGE (RESTRAINT) ACT, 1929.

1663. **Mr. E. Maya Das:** Will the Honourable Finance Member please state what steps has Government taken to give publicity to the Child Marriage (Restraint) Act, 1929?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** Deputy Commissioners have been asked to explain what the Act actually enacts, and what it does not enact, where they find that misunderstanding prevails as regards the scope of its provisions.

#### PHYSICAL TRAINING FOR WOMEN IN COLLEGES.

**1664. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education please state—

- (a) what steps Government is taking for introducing up-to-date methods for giving physical training in colleges for women;
- (b) has an instructress with suitable qualifications been engaged, what are her qualifications;
- (c) if no qualified instructress has so far been engaged, what action does Government propose taking in the matter?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Temporary arrangement has been made with the Y. W. C. A., whereby an instructress gives some two hours' work a day in our schools and colleges for women;

- (b) this lady is very highly qualified in physical training;
- (c) does not arise.

#### MUNICIPALITIES AND TEMPERANCE PROPAGANDA.

**1665. Mr. E. Maya Das :** (a) Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Municipality of Amritsar is spending any money on temperance propaganda, if so, how much;
- (b) is any other municipality doing the same;
- (c) if so, what is its name and what is the amount spent?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) No. Such a proposal, however, is under consideration.

- (b) No.
- (c) Does not arise.

#### REPAIRS OF GRAND TRUNK ROAD.

**1666. Mr. E. Maya Das :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that on the Grand Trunk Road when the road is under repairs, the vehicles have to use the berms;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the berm on one side is kept for motors and the one on the other for lorries and carts;
- (c) whether it is a fact that in many places the road berm is so narrow as to allow only one vehicle to go and two vehicles cannot pass each other;
- (d) if this be so, what action does Government propose taking in the matter?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) and (c) Yes.

(b) This is the general practice.

(d) The matter is not one which appears to call for special action, as the inconvenience only occurs for a very brief period.



## ROLLS OF EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS, JHANG.

1667. **Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah :** Will the Chief Secretary please state—

- (a) the number of rolls community-wise (for the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioners in Register "C"), sent up by the Deputy Commissioner, Jhang, this year to the Commissioner, Multan Division, for consideration and submission to the Local Government ;
- (b) the number of such rolls actually received by the Local Government through the Commissioner, Multan Division ;
- (c) the number of the rolls of the Statutory Agriculturist Muslims of Jhang district received by the Local Government from the Commissioner, Multan Division ;
- (d) if no rolls referred to in part (c) have been received, the reasons for ignoring the claims of the Statutory Agriculturist Muslims of the Jhang district, notwithstanding their overwhelming preponderance in population ;
- (e) any special reasons for considering the names of Non-Agriculturist Non-Muslims from the purely Agriculturists and Muslim district like Jhang ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a), (b) and (c) The information which the honourable member desires is confidential and Government is therefore not prepared to disclose it.

(d) and (e) Do not arise.

## TEACHING STAFF, MACLAGAN ENGINEERING COLLEGE, MOGHALPURA.

1668. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state the total number of Muhammadans on the teaching staff of the MacLagan Engineering College, Moghalpura, excluding the Laboratory Assistants who do not do any teaching work ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## STAFF OF THE MACLAGAN ENGINEERING COLLEGE, MOGHALPURA.

1669. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state the number, qualifications, pay, other emoluments and duties of each of the members of the staff of the MacLagan Engineering College, Moghalpura ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## RECREATION FEE, MACLAGAN ENGINEERING COLLEGE, MOGHALPURA.

1670. **Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state the total amount of the Recreation fee which the Principal of the MacLagan Engineering College has handled since the beginning of the college and whether any account of this money has been furnished to the Accountant-General, Punjab ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

SUPERINTENDENT, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER'S OFFICE, GURDASPUR.

**1671. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to unstarred question No. 1524<sup>1</sup> asked on 27th February 1930, will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether Ram Dial was not the outgoing Superintendent of the Deputy Commissioner's office, Gurdaspur, and whether he was not a Hindu ;
- (b) for how many years had Ram Dial been the Superintendent of the Deputy Commissioner's office, Gurdaspur ;
- (c) whether any Muhammadan clerk from the Punjab Civil Secretariat or the Legal Remembrancer's office applied in 1927-28 for the post of the Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Gurdaspur ;
- (d) whether the newly appointed Superintendent was not serving as Superintendent of Deputy Commissioner's office at Dera Ghazi Khan, and if so, why he was imported from that office ;
- (e) what action, if any, does Government propose to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes, but he was a Sikh not a Hindu.

(b) 18 years and 4 months.

(c) Government has no record—ephemeral papers of this kind are annually destroyed.

(d) Yes, but there are no orders prohibiting transfers from one division to another or from one district to another.

(e) Does not arise.

EXTERNAL EXAMINERS AT THE PUNJAB VETERINARY COLLEGE.

**1672. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to lay down a statement showing the qualifications both academic and veterinary of Messrs. Qurke, Egan, Garewal, Nanda and Preston, who have been the external Examiners at the Punjab Veterinary College ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** All are members of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons.

Details about the academic qualifications of the other officers except Mr. Nanda were forwarded to the Secretary of State prior to their appointment, and are not at present available.

## PROFESSORS AT THE PUNJAB VETERINARY COLLEGE.

**1673. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that some of the professors at the Punjab Veterinary College do not deliver lectures themselves in their respective subjects and that their Assistants deliver such lectures ;
- (b) whether he is aware that this practice does not prevail in any other college or institution, e.g., Agricultural College, Lyallpur, MacLagan Engineering College or the Punjab Medical College ;
- (c) whether he has received any complaints from the students of the Punjab Veterinary College to that effect ;
- (d) if the answers to the above are in the affirmative, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) It is not a fact that some of the Professors do not deliver lectures, but it is a fact that some Assistants have been delivering lectures.

(b) Each institution has to have the arrangements best suited to its particular needs.

(c) No.

(d) Does not arise.

## GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—CONTD.

## GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (TRANSFERRED)—continued.

**Mr. President :** The Council will now resume discussion on the General Administration (Transferred) Grant.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Sir, before you call on the Honourable Minister to speak, I should like to raise a point of order. Article 66 of the Constitutional Manual clearly lays down that when a closure motion has been carried the original question shall forthwith be put without any amendment or debate. The provisions of this Article are imperative and leave no discretion at all to the Chair or to the House. So, I submit that the debate cannot continue now and must be closed and the question put.

**Mr. President :** That is what I pointed out myself the day before yesterday. Will the honourable member please refer to the proviso to paragraph 66 ?

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Under the proviso the mover of the amendment may be allowed an opportunity to reply, but when he does not wish to exercise that right, the Government member has no right of reply.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** May I invite your attention to Article 64 (2) which says :

“ Except in the exercise of a right of reply or as otherwise provided by the rules or the standing orders, no member shall speak more than once to any motion.”

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

It clearly shows that after the closure motion is put and passed only those members who have the right of reply can speak and none else. That, is not all. I must also invite your attention to Article 66 (1) which runs as follows :—

“At any time after a motion has been made any member may move ‘That the question be now put’ and unless it appears to the President that the motion is an abuse of the rules or standing orders, or an infringement of the right of reasonable debate, the President shall then put the motion ‘That the question be now put.’”

We all know that if the question ‘that the question be now put’ is put and passed, then absolutely no debate can proceed. We are all aware that a reasonable opportunity for debate has been given by the Chair to all parties and to all sections of the House. So if I do not give my reply, no one can claim, not even the Government Member, that he has any right of reply. The Government Member has absolutely no option, and the House is aware that the Government benches are in the majority and we are in the minority. *The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Hussain*: How?) There is a difference in the Parliamentary procedure and the procedure of this honourable House. So far as the Parliamentary practice is concerned the difference is this that there, a closure motion is put “unless it appears to the Chair that the motion is an abuse of the rules of the House or an infringement of the right of the minority.”

**Mr. President**: Is not the procedure of this House exactly the same?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: No, Sir. What I want to say is that you must protect the right of the minority. In our rules and in the rules of the Parliament there is a difference. Our rule lays down that the “right of reasonable debate... ..”

**Mr. President**: These words are borrowed from May’s Parliamentary Practice.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: No, Sir, the words are different and different interpretations may be put on them.

**Mr. President**: However, the paragraph referred to by the honourable member relates to the motion for closure which has been carried already.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: I do not want to give a reply, and after the closure motion the debate should be closed absolutely and no member, neither official nor non-official, has any right of reply.

**Mr. President**: Two honourable members of this House, one representing the Hoshiarpur district and the other from Gujranwala, expressly requested the Chair to hear the Minister. I declared more than once that the Minister had no right of reply, as the mover of the amendment had not made any reply. But, in deference to the wish of the above mentioned members, I gathered the sense of the House informally and the whole House, including the mover himself, was in favour of the Minister being called for a reply. That was the stage at which the business of the Council was interrupted on the 18th. Is the honourable member aware of this?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: You are perfectly aware that, from the very beginning when the debate was closed.....

**Mr. President :** Will the honourable member please say whether it is a fact or not that two honourable members requested the Chair that the Honourable Minister should be heard? Was it not at their request that I collected the sense of the House informally? The honourable mover was present at the time and he too did not object. There was not a single dissentient voice. Is that a fact or not?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With due respect.....

**Mr. President :** Is it or is it not a fact? Please answer that question first.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Both are facts. From the very beginning I protested against the right of reply.

**Mr. President :** I do not deny that.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** In the heat of the moment I did not hear what fell from your lips. So far as I can see from the report which is provided to me you have ruled that this question will be decided later on.

**Mr. President :** May I refer the honourable member to the official report? Pandit Nanak Chand suggested that I might re-open the whole thing and allow a fresh debate. I declared that I could not do that. Then Mr. Labh Singh urged that the Honourable Minister should be heard. It was on this that I agreed that, if the House wished to hear the Honourable Minister, I would have no objection. I gathered the sense of the House and found it unanimous. The official Report says :—

“The President then gathered the sense of the House which was for hearing the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government.”

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** The whole House which without a dissentient voice voted for the closure cannot at the next moment say that it wants to hear the reply of the Honourable Minister.

**Mr. President :** Perhaps the honourable members did not know at first that the closure motion would deprive the Honourable Minister of his right of reply.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Then, I respectfully submit that the reasonable right of debate has not been exercised by this honourable House. The position is this. Really no time or opportunity has been provided to the official benches to make a reply to the criticisms that have been levelled against the Honourable Minister. But.....

**Mr. President :** The request that the Minister for Local Self-Government should be allowed to make a speech did not emanate from the official benches. It was from other quarters. Some honourable members thought that the Honourable Minister should be given an opportunity to explain his position; and the whole House, including the honourable mover, approved of that course.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** My question is whether the wish or the suggestion of the House or of a few members ascertained informally by the Chair can override the express provisions of the law on this subject.

**Mr. President :** Technically speaking, the Honourable Minister has no right of reply. But the whole House unanimously desired that the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government should be called upon.

[Mr. President.]

to make a reply and not a single member protested or raised a dissentient voice. So, in pursuance of the wishes of the House I agreed to give him an opportunity. However, if the Council is inclined to undo what it did on the 18th instant, it is welcome to do so.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** My objection still stands unanswered. My question is whether our rules or standing orders do allow the practice or procedure that, after a debate has been closed, the Minister can be allowed to make a reply without the mover giving the reply himself.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is repeating his technical objection.

**Rana Firoz-ud-Din Khan :** Yes.

**Mr. President :** Standing orders are made by this House to regulate its procedure. No doubt, they require the formal sanction of His Excellency the Governor, but they are passed by the House. I do not think that the House is breaking or violating any standing order in asking the Chair to allow the Honourable Minister to explain the charges made against him. If he is not allowed to explain his conduct today, he may stand up tomorrow after the questions to make a personal explanation regarding the charges made against him and I do not think that it will be legal or just to refuse him an opportunity. It is open to the Honourable Minister to make a statement or a personal explanation. (A voice : At any time ?) Yes, at any time after or before questions with the permission of the Chair and there shall be no debate or discussion on that statement.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** May I point out that it was just after the closure that I submitted to the House that it would be unfair if the Honourable Minister was not allowed to make a reply at all ? There were so many charges against him and it would have been much better if he had got up earlier and made his reply so that other members might have criticised his points. It was only then that you gave the honourable mover the right of reply, because under the rules the President may allow any member any right of reply and in the exercise of that right of reply, Government benches have a right to make a statement. In consequence of that, the honourable mover started to speak but then changed his mind and did not proceed with his reply. Since he exercised that right of reply, it was of course in the fitness of things that the Government benches, or rather the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government, had a right to make a statement. Consequently the House said that it would be better if he made a statement.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Provided we had a right to reply.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** Yes, the right to discuss that statement. Under the rules we cannot do so. That is how this matter came about.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** May I suggest a compromise ? We do not want to be unfair to the Honourable Minister. So many speeches have been made against him and they contain very serious allegations. In fact, very serious charges have been brought against him which amount practically to an impeachment with respect to this matter. It is, therefore, equitable that he ought to be given an opportunity to explain his version of the matter. It is unfortunate that he did not get up early enough during the course of

the debate. If he had got up, then some other members might have had an opportunity to reply to him. But at the same time, I think, it would be fair even now to give him a chance to have his say and also to give a chance to other members of the House to have their say, if they so desire. That would be fair to both parties.

**Mr. President :** The honourable members are aware that, like the mover of a substantive motion, a Minister has the right of a second speech. Paragraph 64 clearly says that the Member of Government to whose department the subject relates has the right of speaking after the mover has replied. Dr. Gokul Chand Narang's suggestion is open to two objections. In the first place, it would take the House back to the moment immediately before the closure motion was put. In the second place, it shall deprive the Government member of his final say which he has a right to have. What difference would it make if the Honourable Minister got up and made a speech, then the honourable mover replied and again the Honourable Minister gave a reply?

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** May I submit that there is really not much to dread in these two objections that you have been pleased to urge against my proposal? With respect to the technical aspect of the objection, I would submit that it really does not infringe any statutory provisions of the law. This is after all a rule of procedure and if the whole House agrees and—on the analogy of the House of Commons we are really the arbiters of the procedure which should be followed,—then for the moment, you may permit the Minister to have his reply. That would mean that you may for all practical purposes ignore or suspend the rules of procedure. And if you can so ignore or suspend the rules of procedure in the case of the Honourable Minister, I do not see any great objection in ignoring or suspending the rules of procedure in the case of other members also. My submission in this respect is that this objection should not stand in our way.

The second objection is that the Honourable Minister will not have an opportunity for a final say. I personally have no objection to the Honourable Minister having his final say. Let him have his first say and after other honourable members have spoken, let him have his final say also.

**Mr. President :** I am here to enforce the rules, not to ignore them.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** Then, do not ignore the rule at all, but kindly proceed to put the question straight away.

**Mr. President :** It was the House which asked me with one unanimous voice that I should give the Minister an opportunity to speak. I clearly informed the House that according to our Rules and Standing Orders he had no right of reply. Now, I am asked to re-open the whole debate by allowing the Minister, the mover, the other members and the Minister to speak again to the question.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** Not necessarily the mover, but other members also who have not spoken already.

**Mr. President :** How can that be done?

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** 'How can that be done' is the question which you have been pleased to put to me. You were pleased to say that you were prepared to ignore the rules at the request of the whole House.

**Mr. President :** But does the whole House approve of that procedure ?

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** If the sense of the House is that the permission may be given to other members also to speak with the proviso that the Minister may be given a second chance to have his final say, then this technical objection will not stand in our way.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** It is half past two now and you will see that this demand ceases to be discussed sometime about 5 o'clock today, if I am not mistaken.

I am sure, after the carrying of the closure, not by a division but unanimously, Sir, we on this side of the House do not see how the debate can be continued and thus request you to consider this debate closed with regard to this cut. Moreover, Sir, I am sure there is another part of the House which wishes not to be deprived of the right of discussing other matters.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Sir, the compromise suggested.....

**Mr. President :** The honourable member need not discuss the compromise.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** We cannot set at naught the rules.....

**Mr. President :** Certainly not.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Sir, it was I think, settled day before yesterday and the sense appears to be the same today, that the majority of the House is in favour of hearing what the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government has to say in reply to the charges levelled against him.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** It is obvious, Sir, I was responsible for the request that the Minister should be permitted to have his say in the matter, although I was perfectly conscious that he had no good reasons to urge in his defence. He failed to exercise his right at the proper time and in the proper way, but my submission is that if you are permitting the Honourable Minister to reply, then it is but fair that we should insist that whatever he says in his reply should have a chance of being replied to by such other members of the House as have not so far taken part in this debate. If he is not prepared to comply with this compromise or if you are not pleased to approve of it, then, Sir, my submission is that the rules should have their way, and the debate should be closed. Otherwise, if the Minister introduces fresh matter, it will go unanswered.

**Mr. President :** Those gentlemen who do not wish the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government to make a reply to the charges made against him, would please say so.

As there is no dissentient voice I allow the Honourable Minister to make his reply.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon** (Minister for Local Self-Government): Sir, I am extremely indebted to the House for having given me this opportunity to speak.....

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I am very sorry that I cannot continue to sit here in the House. As this is an infringement of the right of the minority, I must walk out of the Chamber. *(The honourable member then walked out.)*



**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I was saying, Sir, that I was indebted to the House for having granted me this opportunity of answering some of the points that have been raised against the action the Government has taken in this case against the senior vice-president of the Gujranwala Municipal Committee. I am also indebted to the honourable member for Gujranwala non-Muslim constituency who, the day before yesterday like a sportsman, came forward and said that I should be given a chance to answer the speech that he had made. I certainly thank him for the generosity he showed on that day. Even though he has tried to go back on that spirit this morning, (*Mr. Labh Singh* : No, I have not), yet, I thank him for the kindness and generosity which I value in exactly the same way as I did the day before yesterday.

It was suggested that I should have got up and spoken earlier. The fact of the matter is that the honourable member from Gujranwala (*Mr. Labh Singh*) was speaking the other day in such a delicate and mellow voice that it was impossible for me to listen to his speech from my seat here and I had to move nearer to catch his points so that I could explain them in my speech. And the moment he had sat down I rushed into my seat in order to be able to get up to speak. But when I got back here and rose up in my seat, the honourable member, *Chaudhri Afzal Haq*, also rose simultaneously. In the short interval when I was moving to my seat, closure was proposed and carried, and I was deprived of my right of speech.

It was then suggested as to why I did not get up earlier to make my speech on this matter. There again, the fact of the matter has been this. In the discussion three main points were at issue and they were the ones which I had discussed in the general discussion. My honourable friend from Gujranwala (*Mr. Labh Singh*) took exactly those three points and based his speech on them. It is, therefore, hardly fair to say that the Minister had not placed the facts in possession of the House and deprived the House of an opportunity of commenting upon his conduct. Furthermore, throughout the debate, there were only three speeches made. The mover proposed the cut and the honourable member for urban Muslim constituency followed. Neither of them came from Gujranwala and so neither was well aware of the facts of the case. Then the honourable member for East and West Central Towns, Muhammadan, Urban, continued the discussion and the moment that he sat down I tried to speak. But there had been only three speeches made so far in support of the motion. Is it unfair for a Government Member to wait and see what further criticism was levelled against him in order to be able to base his speech on the facts further put before the House? What was the use of my getting up at the beginning soon after the mover finished his speech without having the full facts to go upon? It is for that reason that the delay had occurred in my rising to speak.

To take up the points raised one by one, let me first place before the House that the creed of the Indian National Congress up to the 31st December 1929 was different from the creed adopted after that date. During the close of that year the creed of the Congress was changed. With your permission,

[ Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan, Noon. : ]

Sir, I shall read a few extracts to make the point clear. The new creed runs as follows :—

" This Congress therefore in pursuance of the resolution passed at its session at Calcutta last year declares that the word 'Swaraj' in Article 1 of the Congress constitution shall mean complete independence, and further declares that the entire scheme of the Nehru Committee's report has lapsed and hopes that all Congressmen will henceforth devote their exclusive attention to the attainment of complete independence for India. As a preliminary step towards organising a campaign for independence and in order to make the Congress policy as consistent as possible with the change of the creed, this Congress resolves upon a complete boycott of the Central and Provincial legislatures and committees constituted by Government, and calls upon the Congressmen and others taking part in the national movement to abstain from participating directly or indirectly in future elections, and directs that the present Congress members of the legislatures and committees resign their seats."

This is also the spirit of the speeches made after the passing of this resolution, and I will only refer to a few in order to show as to what change had been brought about in the Congress creed. I may quote here from Mr. Gandhi's speech as reported in *The Tribune* on January the 3rd. I will only quote a few lines. He says :

" In Madras we declared that independence was our ideal. To-day we are going one definite step forward. We declare that independence is not only the ideal, but it is also our immediate objective."

Then, I will read out to you some of the speeches which were made on January 2nd. There was Maulana Atta Ullah Shah Bukhari who made the following observation :—

" It was a matter of great pride that after 200 years the flag of complete independence had been hoisted on the banks of the Ravi. The Punjab was the last province whose conquest completed the subjugation of India, and it is a matter of congratulation that in that very province the flag of independence has first of all been hoisted. For keeping that flag flying they look to the young men. It was their young men's duty to see that it was not lowered. Therefore, the youth of the country should come forward not only to protect the independence flag but to realise the great objects that Mahatama Gandhi had placed before them. For that purpose let them be prepared to have their breasts perforated by bullets. It was the time of making sacrifices."

Similar is the tone of the speech made by other gentlemen on that occasion, and I shall quote a few lines from Pandit Jawahar Lal's speech on the same occasion. He says :

" A day after the session of the Congress is over I congratulate you on the success of the Congress at Lahore. I also congratulate you for having proclaimed independence on the 1st January 1930. The time is fast approaching when you will be called upon to work as soldiers in the battle of freedom."

Then I shall read to the House how *The Tribune* interprets the passing of that resolution. In its leading article, dated the 3rd January, *The Tribune* says :

" In the first place, as Mahatama Gandhi pointed out in the speech, while the Madras resolution only made complete independence the goal of the Congress, the Lahore resolution makes it its immediate objective. Secondly, the words 'complete independence' which were left undefined in Madras have now been virtually, though not in so many words, defined as meaning isolated independence."

Later on, the leading article says :

" The definite rejection of Dominion Status by the Lahore Congress therefore can mean nothing else except the severance of the British connection."

I do not wish to take the House into details as to how the whole of this trouble has been raised by this change of the Congress creed and by the

explanatory speeches that have been made thereafter, and by the further fact that in pursuance of that resolution of independence passed by the Congress, it was decided by the Congress authorities to celebrate the independence day of India on a certain day. January 26th, 1930, was fixed as the date on which the independence of India was to be celebrated. When that was celebrated, one of the ceremonies to be performed was the hoisting of the independence flag and, along with that hoisting of the flag, was to be read a circular resolution drafted by Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru to the effect that India had severed its connection with Britain, and that India was completely independent. It was in pursuance of this change of creed in the Congress and it was in pursuance of that resolution which was to be read on the 26th of January that the Congress Committee in Gujranwala organised a show in order to hoist the flag of independence. In the morning of the 26th January the Congress Committee held a meeting at the Congress office and at that place the independence flag had been hoisted in the morning between 8 and 10. Therefore there was absolutely no necessity even according to the mandate of the Congress to hold another meeting in the evening and hoist the flag again over the municipal hall. As far as the wishes of the Congress were concerned, they had been already fulfilled by the hoisting of the flag on the Congress office, when the prescribed resolution was read followed by public speeches. Moreover, the Congress had intentionally left alone the local bodies where there is complete Swaraj already under a responsible Minister, and the Congress had not ordered the boycott of local bodies as it had done in the case of the Legislative Councils. Therefore, if there was to be a procession in the afternoon and it was to be led by certain gentlemen who were interested in the celebration of the day, it was evident that that procession did not have its objective as the fulfilment of the Congress resolution, but they probably had some other motive in their mind, probably the taking possession of the municipal building in order to put up the flag there and proclaim through the Press that the flag had been hoisted over the building and that the building belonged to the municipal committee no longer. They must have had a sort of idea like that in their minds. Otherwise, where was the object in taking out a second procession when the flag hoisting ceremony had already taken place in the morning, except that the procession was arranged in order to create trouble which probably they also realised might well lead to the breaking of law? The Senior Vice-President knows that, in the morning, revolutionary speeches had been made at the flag hoisting occasion at the Congress office. He knows that it was a mob of revolutionaries infuriated by the speeches of their leaders, who were marching together in the afternoon, in order to go and hoist the flag on the municipal building. Can he in the face of this knowledge put himself at the head of this crowd and order the secretary of the municipal committee in writing to allow the hoisting of the flag on the municipal building and yet say that he was a peaceful and loyal subject of His Majesty the King Emperor? But that is a point with which I shall deal later. But for the fact that the Deputy Commissioner got timely notice of this mob moving on to take possession of the Town Hall and hoist the flag there, but for the fact that the police were able to go there and stop them from doing so, I have not the least doubt that they would have achieved their object, in spite of the fact that the president of the municipal committee had ordered the Sec-

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

retary, two days before, to lock the municipal building so that the Congress Committee of Gujranwala could not force their way into the building and hoist the flag. In spite of the fact that to their knowledge the president of the municipal committee had had the doors of the municipal committee locked and did not want any one to proceed there, yet the Congress workers and all the crowd combined together to march on the building. When, therefore, in spite of the fact that they knew they were not permitted by the President to hoist the flag, if they attempted to do so, what could they have in their mind except an attempt at breaking the law? The honourable member from Gujranwala (Mr. Labh Singh) was pleased to say that this poor and innocent crowd had no intention of using any force, that there was nothing going to happen and asked why the authorities worried themselves so much about the affair. I ask him, where was he in the year 1918-19 when this very law-abiding and peace-loving population of Gujranwala, unarmed and innocent people, led by their leaders went and burnt the railway station and brought about a condition of things in the Province which led to the declaration of martial law in order to restore law and order? Can any leader of a mob say that the mob were proceeding very peacefully but that the authorities got excited? It is one thing to excite a mob and it is quite another thing to be able to control them. And, when the honourable member was saying that the mob was a peaceful one, he was only trying to hide things. A mob may be quite peaceful at the start, but when it hears the inflammatory speeches of its leaders and gets out of control, it gets prepared to do things over which the leaders themselves have no control.

That, Sir, will give you the facts as they stood up to the time when this flag hoisting ceremony was to take place. When this crowd reached the municipal office, they were confronted by the Police who said: 'You will not be allowed to do that?' The senior vice-president, who has been removed, was with this crowd, and he seemed to act as their leader and tried to force the crowd on to the building of which he was a trustee. The Deputy Commissioner then sent for him and asked him as to why he wished to do so. He said: I have the power to do it, and I have ordered it under section 35 of the Municipal Act, and I will, therefore, see that the flag is hung there. But by the time he returned from the Deputy Commissioner, the flag had been hung on a peepul tree outside the municipal buildings and the crowd had dispersed. Now, the only fact on which the removal of the vice-president is based was the fact that he gave the order in writing to the Secretary asking him to hoist the flag on the building. That order in writing has been construed by Government as meaning that he had broken his oath of allegiance. (*Dr. Gokul Chand Narang*: Kindly read that order). I am not prepared to answer that question. The honourable member will please wait. I am not going to keep any information from the House. He need not get excited.

**Mr. President**: If the Honourable Minister has got a copy of that order, it is only fair that he should read it, if he has no objection.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain**: The Minister will, no doubt, follow the parliamentary practice, but will it not altogether disturb other people who are following the speech and following the sequence of events?

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** If it comes to that, my submission is that every member of this House, whether he happens to be a Member of the Executive Council or only a humble private individual like myself, has the right to put questions for eliciting certain information which he considers necessary in connection with the context of the speech which is going on. And if the Honourable Member Revenue is so sensitive that he gets disturbed when he is listening, it is nobody's fault.

**Mr. President :** If the Minister for Local Self-Government does not consider it in the interests of the public that that document should be made public, he may refuse to read it on that ground. But on no other ground can he decline to answer the question put to him through the Chair. When a member of the House asks a question, it is common courtesy that it should be answered except when, in public interest, the Minister does not deem it proper to give publicity to the information or document asked for.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I understand that you have not ruled that the Minister should be disturbed in the arrangement of the various heads of his speech in order to answer questions as soon as they are put to him and thereby sacrifice the continuity of his speech.

**Mr. President :** Had I considered the question as an abuse of the right or, as one put with the object of disturbing the Honourable Minister in his arguments, I would not have allowed it. I thought and still think that the question was *bona fide*.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** May I be permitted to make a submission on the point? When I started my practice as a lawyer—(An honourable member : When was it ?)—it was in 1917—one of the things that struck me at the beginning was this, that when a counsel was arguing a case and it so happened that his opponent found that the former's argument was having its effect on the judge or becoming interesting, he would immediately interrupt and prevent that impression being made on the judge which the lawyer was making by means of his argument. Sir, one of the most important and best qualities of an advocate is to listen quietly to the argument of his adversary. When the honourable member was making his speech, did I interrupt him with questions? And I hope that the same privilege will be shown to me.

**Mr. President :** I think the Honourable Minister should not lose sight of the fact that no other member of the House has any right of reply hereafter, and that if there are any points about which there may be any doubt, I shall allow the honourable members to ask questions to clear their doubts.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** Sir, with your permission, I would submit that it seems that the professional experience of my learned friend as an advocate has been rather very unfortunate. That may be the practice at Shahpur where probably the Honourable Minister practised for some time. But, surely, I will give him that assurance that nothing was farther from my mind than any intention to interrupt him for the sake of making him miss his points or to feel upset. He was referring to a particular order which I consider to be absolutely important because he referred to the

[Dr. G. C. Narang.]

burning of railway station and certain other things, to the ghost of anarchy being roused and so on. I wanted to know what horrible order Malik Lali Khan had passed. I wanted him to read that order out. I have not seen it yet.

**Mr. President :** I would ask the Honourable Minister to place that order on the table of the House.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Sir, I have prepared my speech according to the speech made by the honourable member from Gujranwala, and I have taken up each one of his points. I have tabulated them in my own way, and I am going to deal with them in their proper place.

**Mr. President :** May I just call upon the honourable member from Gujranwala to place on the table all documents from which he quoted on the 18th ?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I handed them to the Secretary yesterday, but they were returned to me. I have no hesitation in giving them back.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Sir, what I was going to submit was this, that there is no point which I am going to leave unanswered, and there is nothing, written or oral, which I am going to conceal from the House. Everything will be placed before them, the only difference being that I have arranged them in my own order according to my lights, and I shall place them before the House in their sequence. If Honourable members are impatient and wish me to take up a point now which I intend to take up later, it only puzzles the man who is trying his best to place his case before the House.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** If it puzzles the Honourable Minister I would certainly allow him to go on in his own way. I never thought that a Minister would be puzzled over one single question most innocently asked.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Provided the honourable member keeps the promise for the rest of the time.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** No, I shall ask questions whenever I think necessary.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** If any honourable member finds at the end of my speech that I have not answered any particular point, I shall be only too glad to answer any question that he may choose to put to me. I am sure that honourable members who wish to ask me questions will find, when I have finished my speech, that all their points had been answered by me. If any point remains unanswered, I shall be too glad to give an answer.

Sir, to proceed with my narrative of the events. What has happened is this, that on the 24th of January the President, so he informed me, had ordered the Secretary of the Municipal Committee to lock up the doors of the hall for, he feared that the Congress Committee in Gujranwala would try to force their way into the municipal building on the 26th and would try to forcibly hoist the flag. Having done that on the 24th, on the morning of the 25th he happened to come to Lahore for a few hours in order to rent a

few tents which he wanted for a certain ceremony on the 3rd February at Gujranwala. In his absence, this momentary absence, for a few hours, the senior vice-president considered it his duty to say that, now that the president was absent the whole burden of the administration lay upon him, and he took this opportunity of giving an order in writing to the Municipal Secretary to allow the hoisting of the flag on the municipal building.

The honourable member from Gujranwala tried to make a great point by suggesting that as the president was absent there the vice-president *ipso facto* has the right to give that order. There is no doubt that section 85 of the Municipal Act says that, in the absence of the President, the Vice-President can give such an order if it is meant for the safety or service of the public. Sir, may I ask what the honourable member understands by the word 'absence' there? Does he mean that even if the president goes out of the town in order to visit a garden half a mile away, it lies in the vice-president to step into his place and then write an order to the secretary asking him to do this thing or that thing? If the president is absent for a few hours, does the honourable member make us believe that the vice-president can give any order he likes during such absence? The word, absence, here can mean only one thing and that is "inability to work." A president may be in the town, but if he is ill or busy in a marriage party for several days, he may say, I am unable to work and let the vice-president work. It is absence from duty and not bodily absence from the place for a short time, and at such hours when the municipal committee is not supposed to be having any meeting. Mr. Labh Singh has not at all grasped the meaning of "absence"; else he would have seen that the vice-president had no *locus standi* at all.

Then the honourable member laid great stress on the word 'service' and said that he was giving this order for the service of mankind. May I ask, Sir, how could it be for the service of the public, when he knew that the president who is senior to him had had the doors locked, and knowing that this was a thing which was illegal and disloyal, he, the vice-president, led the crowd on to the municipal hall. If this is service, then I ask what disservice can be.

Now the honourable member from Gujranwala was pleased to remark in his speech that it was perfectly open to the president or to the vice-president or the junior vice-president to make such use of the property which is under their control as they, according to their judgment, think proper. So, the honourable member makes us believe that the senior and the junior vice-presidents are, in the absence of the president, the sole masters of the municipal property, and can make use of it in such manner as they like. I will leave it to the House to imagine how municipal funds could be dissipated under section 85 by the vice-president, specially this vice-president, if the law were to receive the interpretation that Mr. Labh Singh would make us believe. May I draw his (Mr. Labh Singh's) attention to section 57 of the Municipal Act. This learned member from Gujranwala who has been a Municipal Commissioner and an *ex-president* of the committee is not unaware of the section. The section reads thus: 'The management, control and administration of every public institution maintained out of the municipal fund shall vest in the committee.' The property is vested in

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

the municipal committee, and it is the municipal committee who are masters of it and not the vice-president. Therefore, the honourable member was quite wrong in saying that the senior vice-president had every right to dispose of the municipal property as he liked. That is not the law.

Then, I shall refer also to section 52 of the Municipal Act where are laid down the various duties which are to be performed by a municipal committee. The activities of the municipal committee are to be within the limits of that section. It is not up to the municipal committee to spend a pie of its income on anything which is not laid down in this section 52.

**Mr. President :** That section relates to the application of municipal funds.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I am reading out the powers of the municipal committee in regard to the property under its charge. One section in regard to property I have just read, and you did not object to that, and there is no better authority on municipal law than yourself. Consequently I am encouraged to believe I was right in this interpretation. As far as the income is concerned it cannot be spent except on the objects given in section 52. Now in the order which I will place on the table of the House what does the vice-president say? He issues an order to the secretary to provide a pole for the flag, if one is available. May I ask whether the law authorizes such expenditure of municipal funds by the senior or junior vice-president? Therefore the senior vice-president had actually no authority to pass that order under section 35; firstly, because the president could not be said to be absent and secondly, because it was not for safety or service of the public. He had no jurisdiction at all, thirdly, because the property which includes municipal buildings is in charge of the municipal committee and not of the vice-president; and, fourthly, because section 52 does not allow the vice-president to spend municipal money on such items, e.g., the pole. The order was made by the vice-president on an application from the secretary of the Congress Committee at Gujranwala addressed to the president of the municipal committee, asking the president to allow the flag to be hoisted on the municipal building. It is alleged to be dated 25th of January. There are other discrepancies in it; but I do not wish to take the House into them because the honourable member from Gujranwala was pleased not to refer to them; and I think that it is best for his friends that I should keep quiet about it. The order of the vice-president runs as follows :

”بیرون پبل مال پر قومی مہندرا ہوا جائے اور سیکرٹری ہونسل کیونسی مناسب انتظام

کرے اور اگر کوئی بہرل مردود ہو تو قومی مہندرا — لے لیا گیا جائے۔“

So he wanted the municipal property to be used for this purpose. I will try to avoid going into controversies; specially those which are likely to make my friend unhappy and uneasy in his seat. He has rightly kept quiet over the matter, because the allegations, if true, are serious. The allegation being that Lal Khan under the advice and instigation of his lawyer friends forged this so-called order, dated 25th January 1930, after the event, and that the order did not reach the municipal office till after the 26th, he having either marched the mob at his own instigation or having delivered the order to the Congress workers and not to the municipal secretary. These facts



have only come to light now and were not in my possession when Lal Khan was removed from membership. Leave alone this allegation of forgery and for the moment pursue facts as alleged by Lal Khan himself that he gave the order in writing on January 25th to the secretary of the municipal committee. I do not wish to take the House into it any further because the honourable member who is the legal adviser of the vice-president, and the vice-president himself know what is best for them and are able to defend themselves. I place this order on the table of the House<sup>1</sup>.

Now, let me take the House for a minute into the internal working of the Gujranwala municipal committee. At one time the honourable member from Gujranwala (Mr. Labh Singh) was a president of the municipal committee, but somehow or other he could not win the confidence of the majority and could not again be elected president. The members chose to elect someone else. So, when I took office Mr. Din Muhammad was the president and not Mr. Labh Singh. But when Din Muhammad's time expired and new elections took place what was said to me was this, that there was a tussle between Mr. Din Muhammad and the honourable member from Gujranwala who spoke last. But the honourable member realised perhaps that elections are not so easy as debates on the floor of this House, and he thought that the safest thing for him to do was to try to put up Lal Khan. I do not know what friendship he has with him, nor do I know the particular reasons why he and his all nationalistic friends selected this honourable gentleman to be their spokesman, because amongst that educated and highly cultured Hindu community at Gujranwala they could find many better men than Lal Khan. Anyhow, they chose Malik Lal Khan as their representative in the municipal committee, and put him up as the president candidate against Din Muhammad, and the honourable member put himself in the background and tried to pull the wires and run the show. Lal Khan was not put up for being the ablest and most efficient person for this post, but he was put up simply because he was the only person who could possibly defeat a most capable and popular Muslim leader namely Shaikh Din Muhammad. This is the manner, Sir, in which the nationalist workers promote efficiency in this country. This was the position in the municipal committee. I do not wish to take the House into the internal arrangements of the municipal committee nor do I wish to suggest that any of their actions were affected by internal dissensions. But this much was clear that Mr. Labh Singh finding himself unable to get elected as president put up Lal Khan against Din Muhammad and himself preferred to remain behind the scene. I have no doubt there is someone in this House besides Shaikh Din Muhammad—who are unfortunately in the same boat and not able to hold that exalted office. But the honourable member suggested that this senior vice-president is such a simpleton that he does not know English; and that he could not understand the Deputy Commissioner when the latter asked for his explanation under section 16 (c) of the Municipal Act, and that supposing Government order was read to him in Urdu still he could not understand it because he is such a simple fellow; therefore he was incapable of thinking for himself and that when the Deputy Commissioner called upon him to explain his conduct he should have had the benefit of the advice of his lawyer friends before he gave his explanation. Do I understand, Sir, that the honourable member when

<sup>1</sup> Vide Appendix I.

[ Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan, Noon. ]

he put up Lal Khan as the president of the municipal committee, realised that he was such a simpleton, and that he did not know English, and he was incapable of acting independently, and these were the qualities which fitted him for the exalted office ?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Does the Honourable Minister mean that a person who is not conversant with the English language is a simpleton, or that a person who has only an indifferent knowledge of the English language is a simpleton ? There are good many members in this House who do not know English.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I was just asking if the honourable member really believed that this gentleman was such a simpleton, that he was not able to make up his own mind and did not know what is good for him. May I ask whether that is the only qualification for a candidate for the presidency of Gujranwala municipal committee, or were the honourable member and his other Congress friends in Gujranwala moved by other considerations (which are best not said) in putting up Lal Khan for the presidential election ?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** May I ask if the Honourable Minister is disclosing the secret of the ballot ? How does he know that I voted or somebody else voted for him ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I think the honourable member does not wish me to press that point any further. (*Laughter*). I will go on to new grounds.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Do go on.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I do not want to be interesting to the extent of being unpleasant.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** Do your best.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Now, Sir, I will mention the point about the breach of the oath of allegiance. Sir, it was in the year 1923 that this honourable House passed an Act which embodied the oath of allegiance in our Municipal Act. In the year 1923, that is, three years after the Reformed Councils came into existence, this very House passed an Act, section 12 (a) of which is to the following effect :—

"Notwithstanding anything contained in the Indian Oaths Act, 1873, every person who is elected or appointed to be a member of a municipal committee shall before taking his seat take or make at a meeting of the said committee an oath or affirmation of allegiance to the Crown in the following form, viz., I being elected a member of this committee do solemnly swear or affirm that I will be faithful and bear true allegiance to His Majesty the King Emperor of India, his heirs and successors, and I will faithfully discharge the duty upon which I am about to enter, provided that if any such person omits or refuses to take or make such oath or affirmation his election or appointment, as the case may be, shall be deemed to be invalid."

Now, Sir, it is clearly laid down by this law itself that if a person does not make an oath of allegiance he is not to be allowed to take his seat in the municipal committee. It was suggested that the legislature of course intended that the man should take or make oath of allegiance, but once he has taken it, there is no obligation on him to try and follow it, and after he has taken it he was quite at liberty to go against it, and the oath

of allegiance will not be breached. Now, Sir, the manner in which they argue is this, that supposing that this Council had intended that the breach of the oath should disentitle the member to the membership of the municipality, this Council should have made a special provision to the effect that if after taking an oath of allegiance a member commits a breach of the same he should be removed from the committee. This is a very reasonable question to ask, and if the Legislative Council had omitted to provide for that contingency certainly they could have argued in that way. But, Sir, may I draw your attention to sections 14 and 16 of the Municipal Act which give the Government very wide powers of removing him, and when the intention of legislature is known in this Act that only those persons can sit in the municipality who owe allegiance to the Crown, it was open to Government to use these two sections against any municipal commissioner and remove him. There is no need for any special section being put in the Municipal Act in order to authorise or arm the Government to remove a man. Therefore the law as it stands is perfectly clear and perfectly intelligible, and no amendment is needed in order to arm the Government with those powers. Now, if the law is that the oath of allegiance is essential for a man before he can take his seat in the House and if you have passed that Act and if I am a Minister responsible to the House, is it not a fact that if I do not enforce the wishes of this House the honourable members will be quite entitled to come forward and say that they passed such and such a law, why did I not enforce it? I would then have been answerable to the House. All I have done is that I have tried to enforce the law which this House has passed and which has been broken by this member. Then, if the House does not wish that law to be obeyed, it should repeal it to-morrow and I will be able to say that the law does not exist, or do anything else which is constitutional, but having passed this law you want a Minister to do the dirty work, I say, least of all it is not fair. You will see from the very wording of the oath of allegiance itself that the allegiance is not a thing which is necessary only before the taking of the oath of allegiance. It is essential and should continue even after that has been taken because, look at the wording. It runs thus:—

"I do solemnly swear that I will be faithful...", By means of that oath he is promising that he will be faithful to the King-Emperor in future, it is not his fidelity at the moment which is necessary. What is required is that his honest fidelity should continue in future also.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** Is there any dishonest fidelity also?

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Yes.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The honourable member said that the senior vice-president was called upon to explain and in his explanation, while admitting that he hoisted the flag, he stated that he had not breached his oath of allegiance. To say that he has not breached the oath of allegiance is to argue in such a way as this. A thief has put his hand into the pocket of A and stolen his watch. A sees it done, but the thief uses his lips, and says "No, I am an honest fellow and am your friend." B comes along and says to A "when the thief says he is your friend why should you believe he is not". It is argued that even though Lal Khan has breached his oath, the fact that he says he has not breached

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

should be enough to show that he has not breached it. The actual fact is to be ignored and the thief's statement is to be taken as correct. The removal of the president does not depend upon the fact as to what he says, but it depends on the Government and its opinion as to whether the oath of allegiance has been breached or not. It is for that reason that he was removed.

Now, Sir, let me take you to one or two definite charges, so-called charges, which the honourable member from Gujranwala was pleased to lay against me. I hope that I shall in a few minutes be able to show to this House that that house of cards made of tissue paper is nothing else than a castle built in the air, not even on sand, and will not stand an examination even for a minute. First of all, let me draw your attention to the statement of one fact that he made. He said that the Local Government had called upon the municipal committee to fill the seats of the 6 persons who had resigned as a protest against the action of the local Government, but the local Government had not yet called upon the local municipal committee to fill the seat which has been vacated by the senior vice-president who has been removed. Having got these facts where does he go? He jumps at once to the conclusion that the Government has got some very nefarious intentions in their minds, and they want to fill that seat by nomination and by nomination of some member whom the Government wish to come in because Government think that if the seat is filled by election then somebody whom Government do not like would come in. May I ask that if the Government is willing to allow the municipal committee to elect 6 members who are likely to come according to the Congress wishes why should the Government try and keep one other similar fellow out of it? What harm is there to Government? The honourable member was pleased to say that the ward which stands vacated by the dismissal from office of membership of Malik Lal Khan does not figure in this list; he says: "So, what will happen is this. I told you that the whole thing is dirty in the extreme." He thinks that the words "dirty in the extreme" are very parliamentary, but I shall not use them myself. He is welcome to do so. He continued "I am going to say that the word dirty is perfectly parliamentary, and I am going to give you my reasons to say that the whole thing is managed and done in a way which will do no credit to anybody and least of all to a Minister responsible to Government." "It is not going to be filled by election and for what reasons?" He is making a definite allegation and he says that "the seat is not going to be filled by election. The reason is this...."

**Mr. Labh Singh:** How did this copy of my speech come into the hands of the Honourable Minister?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon:** If it is not so he can deny.

**Mr. Labh Singh:** What I want to submit is that you will kindly enquire as to how my uncorrected speech came into the hands of the Honourable Minister. He is reading from my speech which is uncorrected and I would like to enquire how it came into his hands.

**Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan:** Does the honourable member deny?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** If there is anything which is incorrect I can be challenged. I know these statements are correct. He says "the reason is this. The local authorities....."

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I am waiting for a reply to my question.

**Mr. President :** Does not the honourable member wish the Minister for Local Self-Government to make a reply to all the charges made against him ?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I do wish, Sir, but I was only putting this question in the interests of the procedure which governs the conduct of business in this House and under which we are deprived of the right of making use of the uncorrected speeches of the official members.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Cannot a member take down notes of a speech ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** May I submit that if the honourable member in his speech yesterday could quote the letters which I wrote officially to the Deputy Commissioner and marked confidential, can I not quote a public speech of the member ? (*Louhter*).

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** The Honourable Minister has misunderstood the object of the question. The question is whether this privilege is open to all the members of the House.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The honourable member went on to say that it was the Minister for Local Self-Government who is trying to keep this seat vacant, and it was he who was going to fill it—and he knew it as a gospel truth—that the Minister was going to fill it by nomination. Now I ask, where did the gentleman get this information from ? Did he dream of it, did he get a confidential letter from me, did he imagine it ? I can state it openly that the whole of this statement is based on no facts.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I gathered this from the notice that has been published under the authority of the Deputy Commissioner from Gujranwala.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** He made a long speech and he could have explained all these things then.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I was going to tell him that I gathered this information from a notice which has been issued under the authority of the Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala, and it is dated 10th March 1930, and this says that the non-Muslim wards numbers 1, 3, 4, 5 and 8 and Muslim ward No. 8 would be put to election and that nomination papers are invited therefor. The ward which has been vacated by the expulsion of Malik Lal Khan does not figure in this list and if a bye-election is going to take place for as many as 6 seats and one seat is not included in that bye-election the only inference which can be drawn from this is that the ward vacated by the dismissal of Malik Lal Khan is not going to be put to election.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Sir, can the honourable member make another speech ?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Sir, he put a question and I am just replying to it.

**Mr. President :** Order, order, will the honourable member please resume his seat?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** If you want me to do so, I will.

**Mr. President :** Please do.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Sir, that is exactly what I am speaking about. He says because six seats have been notified to be filled by election and no notification has yet appeared about the seventh, and as the law authorises Government to fill any seat by nomination, therefore the Government has already decided to fill it by nomination. Look at the logic. What he says amounts to this that if the Secretary of the Legislative Council issues a notice to X and Z to attend a meeting of the Finance Committee, and therefore, because Y is not there, it is to be presumed that Y is dead, or, take another example, he might as well say, that Mr. A. does not like me, he has a pistol in his house which he has the power to use, therefore take it for granted that he has shot me, and therefore A should be hanged. He says that the seats of the six members who resigned in protest are now going to be filled and that a notification has issued calling for nominations, but that the ward represented by Malik Lal Khan does not figure in the list. From the fact that no nominations have been invited for the constituency of Malik Lal Khan he concludes that it is intended to fill that place by nomination. What reason is there in the world that while six of these seats are going to be filled by election, this seventh one should be filled by nomination? Why does the honourable member draw inferences? Why does he not come and ask me as to what the intention of Government is?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** You simply deny it.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** When you do not know facts, then why make definite and false allegations? If the honourable member had come to me and said, 'please tell me what you want to do,' I would have told him. Under the Municipal Act all second class municipalities are under the Commissioner and the honourable member is a member of the committee. (Mr. Labh Singh: No, that was another Labh Singh). Anyhow if he is not now, he certainly has been a member of the municipal committee for some time and its president also. Does he not know that so far as the election of members in second class municipalities is concerned and so far as the notification of wards is concerned, the Minister does not see the papers? Does he not know that the Commissioner is the final authority under the Act in the case of second class municipal committees? May I know why in spite of that knowledge he still tried to make in this House statements which were absolutely incorrect? May I tell him that the moment I heard that the election for the ward vacated by Malik Lal Khan had not been notified, I made enquiries, and have had a letter written to the Commissioner asking him at once to notify the election for that ward and to have the place filled by election. Let me tell him that we have no intention whatever of filling this place by nomination. If Government intends to fill six seats by election, why should it fill the seventh seat by nomination? I will explode one by one all the charges made by the honourable member against me. I do not wish to quote his own words and say that those charges were nothing but the result of a diseased mind. As I

"Have told you, I had no knowledge of the fact that the election for Malik Lal Khan's seat had not been notified, and that as soon as I came to know about it, I issued orders to Commissioner to notify the election. There was absolutely no intention of filling the place by nomination. Is this the kind of charges that you wish to bring against your workers? (*Cheers*). How is anybody going to work if honourable members of this House without any foundation and without any basis come up and lay the charge that the Minister for Local Self-Government is responsible for the thing? As I have showed you the charge is absolutely incorrect. I will try to pull these houses of cards down one by one and show how very incorrect the charges against me are.

Another argument brought forward by the honourable gentleman was that the removal of the vice-president from his vice-presidency is not wholly unconnected with the fact that the election of the same person as president some time ago was disapproved of by Government, and that as the Minister for Local Self-Government is a great friend of Mr. Din Muhammad he was probably in league with him, and he has abused his powers and he was actuated by motives which were not very laudable, first of all, in removing Malik Lal Khan from his vice-presidency and, secondly, in trying to remove him from his membership. I will take up the charges one by one. I am glad to say that the honourable member was frank enough to admit that he was the lawyer who was advising the senior vice-president (*Mr. Labh Singh*: No, I never said that. All that I said was that had Malik Lal Khan come to me I would have given him advice). I am quoting from *Mr. Labh Singh's* speech. *Mr. Labh Singh* says that he asked Malik Lal Khan, "why did you not consult me?" Self-imposed and honorary advice, I think, is not allowed by professional lawyers. (*Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang*: Is that so?). But, that being a very delicate matter, I would not like to go into it. Asking for work or trying to create work for oneself is undesirable and sometimes amounts to touting.

The honourable member said that the Minister was actuated by undesirable motives in both the cases, but, *Mr. Labh Singh* was astute enough to say that he would only make a passing reference to the disapproval of Malik Lal Khan as president because he thought I might have something to say against him. There must have been some weak spot in this case which he wanted to hide from this House. He asked, why was not that election of Lal Khan as president approved of? But again he said I do not want to answer because the Minister might get a chance of saying something on the subject. I should like to take the House into confidence and tell it what the honourable member has tried to hide. Sir, the fact of the matter is this that Lal Khan had been convicted of cheating and twice dismissed from Government service, and when he was elected president, the Commissioner who alone had the power to approve of his election under the Municipal Act sent the papers to us to see as it was an important case. I did not feel justified in preventing the Commissioner from discharging his duties under the Municipal Act to the best of his lights. At first I was inclined to ask him to approve of the election of Lal Khan as president, but later, when the facts about his conviction for cheating, and his dismissal were brought to my notice, I felt, it would be wrong on my part to force a man to be put in charge of lakhs of rupees of municipal income, who had been convicted of cheating, so, I allowed the Commissioner to do as he intended



[Hon. Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

to do. I entirely agreed with him in his resolve, and he did it with my full concurrence. Let me just see how much the Minister for Local Self-Government had to do with the disapproval. The honourable members know fully well that the Gujranwala Municipal Committee is a second class committee, and the Commissioner has all the powers which the local Government has in the case of the first class municipalities. Therefore the responsibility for disapproving the election rested with the Commissioner. If the Commissioner thinks that a man who has been convicted of cheating and is undesirable in other ways, and if under the Act he has power to disapprove of his election, would the honourable member expect me as Minister responsible to this House to force the hands of my executive officer and say that even though he has the power under the Act to disapprove of this election that he should not disapprove of it? Would any one tolerate a thing of that nature? But this was an important matter and the Commissioner sent the papers to us. In the beginning I was inclined, as I have said, to suggest that it was rather a harsh punishment to disapprove of his election, but when further facts were brought to my notice that this gentleman had such and such a history behind him, I could not say that I was discharging my duties to this House in allowing such a gentleman to be declared as an elected president of the committee. Therefore, the election of that gentleman as president was not confirmed. I have been blamed for this. May I ask, Sir, if there is any reason on earth as to why I should remove a poor fellow who has been elected president of the municipal committee? Does the honourable member realise that when I took over office in 1927 a gentleman of this Honourable House came to me and said, "This gentleman (Lal Khan) has been convicted of certain criminal offences. (This was a recent conviction and long after the one for cheating), but things have now changed, please remove his disqualifications, and let him go into the municipal committee"? Does he realise that it was this humble servant of yours who removed his disqualification in order to enable him to seek election and be elected to the committee, and to enable him to be elected president of that municipal committee? (Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang: *Al badi-i-saba in hamán awurda-i-tust.*) Why then should there be any anxiety on my part to remove him from the vice-presidency? If I have disappointed my honourable friend from Gujranwala it is his own fault, he should have selected a better candidate for the office. It will be seen therefore that I have a perfectly clear conscience. I hope the House will agree with me that no one is to blame for this disapproval of Lal Khan's election as president, and there is absolutely no connection between his election as president being not confirmed about two years ago and his removal from membership for a breach of his oath of allegiance.

It was also suggested by the honourable member in his speech that if the senior vice-president had been given a chance to consult his legal advisers before he made his statement before the Deputy Commissioner they might have given him the advice and induced him to say that he was very sorry for what he had done and to ask for forgiveness. Well, Sir, as far as Government is concerned it is always willing to consider the case of anybody who says: "I am sorry for what I have done, I will not do it again."



I can assure you that Government will reconsider any such request. As a matter of fact I have no hesitation in saying that a suggestion was made to me by one or two members of this House that they are bringing forward this cut, but that if I made some sort of consideration to this gentleman and promised to restore him to his seat that the cut would not be moved. I said it out of fear of a cut I am not going to perform my duties, I am not worthy of the place that I hold. I said, cut or no cut, censure or no censure, the Minister must perform his duties according to his best lights, and that if he does not do that he is not fit to be there. Sir, if the Ministers responsible to this Honourable House are to discharge their duties justly and fearlessly they must be given full protection by this House against all threats of this sort. I said to these gentlemen: you have moved your cut, after the thing is all over, I will forget all about it, and even then the offer is open to you, and I will still be prepared to consider the case of this gentleman. Let him say that he has made a mistake, that he is not in favour of independence movement, that he owes his allegiance to the Crown, and that he will not take any part in any of those disloyal demonstrations in future and thereby try to ruin the future of the municipal committee, I shall again be prepared to consider his case. How can I be blamed for the thing, when I am prepared to go to that extent even now? Therefore you will see, Sir, that the disapproval of Malik Lal Khan's election as president was based on strong facts, and had nothing to do with the case under discussion, namely, his removal from membership for breach of his oath of allegiance. That disapproval was thoroughly justified by facts.

Now, Sir, another great attack was made on me, that this gentleman was not given a chance of giving an explanation under section 16 of the Municipal Act, and therefore having not been given a chance under section 16 he should not be removed. Let me point out first of all that his removal is under two sections of the Municipal Act, that is to say, sections 14 and 16. He could have been removed under either of these sections. We have put both of the sections in the notification, and under section 14 no explanation is necessary. Under section 14, Government simply removes a man without calling upon him to furnish an explanation. But in spite of this power in our hands and in spite of the fact that we need not have used or mentioned section 16 of the Act, we felt that it was right that the man should be given the chance to explain his conduct. We wrote to the Deputy Commissioner and asked him to call upon the vice-president to explain his conduct. He was to be asked definite questions, and the Deputy Commissioner was requested to ask him further questions according to his own lights, as he knew all the facts.

What has happened? We asked the Deputy Commissioner to call upon this gentleman to say as to whether he took part in the demonstration or not, whether he gave his order in writing permitting the hoisting of the flag or not, and if he had any explanation to offer in the matter. The Deputy Commissioner sent for him and got a statement from him. That statement is with me here, and it answers each one of three queries, and I shall lay it on the table. After that statement is made, my honourable

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

friend from Gujranwala (Mr. Labh Singh) happens to meet him and says to him "You have made a great mistake, you ought to have taken counsel. I would have given you some tips. Very well, let me file a suit for you." But in the case of filing a suit there is the question of court fees and counsel's fees. I do not like to ask such a delicate question whether the honourable member was prepared to take up the brief on payment or honorarily. If he was willing to serve honorarily, I should certainly like to go to him for some of my cases in the future. But I know that in Gujranwala there is a lot of litigation, and I do not think he has time to go in for this kind of litigation honorarily. If there was unemployment amongst the legal profession then he would have welcomed any opportunity to try to pass his time in law courts honorarily, and he would certainly have come forward and volunteered to advise the vice-president. What does the honourable gentleman say to the vice-president? He says, you have been tricked by Government into giving an explanation." I know that lawyers are very obliging in the beginning, but when it comes to lodging a complaint in the court, they say, *hamara paisa lao*. Then the client is between the devil and the deep sea. To come to the point, that is how the honourable member called that statement as being tricked into by Government. I submit that the senior vice-president has had the benefit of this valuable, I should say invaluable, legal advice day and night, and not only now, but had this advice from the time he was elected vice-president of the municipal committee.

Perhaps it is not advisable to carry this delicate point much further. One of the grave charges that were laid against me was that this honourable gentleman was not given a chance to explain his conduct. I think I have made it perfectly plain to the House that this senior vice-president was called by the Deputy Commissioner and he was asked to explain his conduct. The vice-president gave his explanation in writing, and that explanation was in the hands of Government before any action was taken against him. Therefore it is not up to the honourable member now to say that the vice-president was not given a chance to explain his conduct.

Now, Sir, these were the three grave charges against me as far as this thing was concerned, namely, (1) the disapproval of the election of Malik Lal Khan, (2) the intention to fill his vacancy by nomination and (3) my not having given a chance to him for explanation. It has been clearly proved to the House that all these charges of the honourable member were based on facts which did not exist. It is possible that in the heat or excitement of the occasion he probably imagined things which did not exist. If he had only cared to consult me I would have given him all the explanation in my office and all this excitement and trouble of a long speech and the loss of two hours of his valuable time would have been spared. It would also have spared me the trouble of standing here and offering an explanation as to how each of those charges were based on no facts. If arguments like those which were brought forward by the honourable member were brought forward in ordinary courts by one counsel and if another counsel was opposing him, what would that counsel say except that the former was arguing on manufactured facts, and that they were big volumes of untruths manufactured in order to mislead the court and in order to bring about miscarriage of justice. But far from me to suggest that the

honourable member was trying to base his arguments on incorrect facts or on facts which did not exist because that will be rude, nor do I suggest that the honourable member wanted to mislead the House into coming to a wrong conclusion. All that I say is that it is a pity he did not know the facts, and yet argued a case.

Now, let me come to another charge that he brought forward. That charge was this. Here is a Minister who had written a letter,—confidential letter—I do not like to ask awkward questions because there is such a thing as Official Secrets Act. If I wrote a confidential letter to the Deputy Commissioner, it was meant to be confidential, and I do not know whether anybody volunteered that information to the honourable member of this House or whether the honourable member undertook all the trouble to find out what was contained in it. But there is nothing confidential in it, and I shall lay all the facts before the House so that it may know exactly what took place. The charge is that I had written to the Deputy Commissioner asking him to haul up before him each member of the municipal committee, and that in pursuance of that letter or order he asked all the members to go to his place, cajoled them and threatened them and forced them to affix their signatures to a document which they would not otherwise have done. May I ask the honourable member why he did not immediately go to me and ask for an explanation? That would have saved all this trouble. I, as a Minister of Government do not stand in need of the support of a local body for the carrying out of my duties which are imposed on me by law. Do you mean to say that no Minister can take action unless beforehand he goes before the municipal committee and asks their consent or approval for that action? This will amount to this that every judge has to say to a murderer, 'Please, murderer, Sir, have I your willing support in ordering you to be hanged so that God may help your soul?' Municipalities are administered under the Municipal Act, and there are certain responsibilities placed by the Act on the local Government and they have to be discharged, however, unpleasant they may be. The discharge of those responsibilities are not contingent on the consent of the municipal committee. Therefore let this impression be removed from the mind of the honourable members that the Minister stands in need of the support of the municipal committee. The action of the Minister does not depend on the consent of the municipal committee nor does it depend on the support of the Deputy Commissioner.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Will the Honourable Minister please come to the main issue?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** As the honourable member is so impatient, I am coming to the issue. The issue is that the honourable member suggested that the Minister tried through the Deputy Commissioner to force the signature of 12 persons on a protest which they signed to the effect that they did not agree with what Malik Lal Khan did, and that if a resolution had been brought before the municipal committee they would not have supported that resolution. That was the protest about which the honourable member for Gujranwala was commenting at such great length. The whole trend of his commentary on this subject was that I had forced the poor members of the municipal committee against

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

their wish to put their signature on a document. I will read the exact words of the honourable member on this point so that there may be no mistaking. The honourable member said—

"If one has got to talk he should talk straight away and have done with it..."

I also shall certainly talk straight.

"Can the Minister deny that he wrote the letter to the Deputy Commissioner asking for help for securing certain signatures to certain propositions...."

I openly say I did write the letter. There is no question of help at all. No doubt, it was an urgent letter, probably the honourable member had seen the word 'urgent' written on the letter.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Will the Honourable Minister please tell us the contents of that letter?

**Mr. President :** Every paper shall be laid on the table.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The honourable member then went on to say—

"Can he deny that in pursuance of that letter the District Magistrate called the people to his house or office and secured their signatures—(A Voice : Shame)"

I think that voice was that of the honourable gentleman sitting behind him.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I shall ask for an opportunity to reply to the Honourable Minister.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The honourable member said that the Deputy Commissioner called the people to his house in order to secure their signatures. That statement is not true, (*Hear, hear.*) What happened was this. Mr. Din Muhammad on the 3rd February when I was at Gujranwala said to me that this order under section 85 by Malik Lal Khan had been passed without consulting anybody, at least his section of the municipal committee, and that they were protesting against it, and that they were going to protest against it. From the wording of the resignation of the six honourable gentlemen of the municipal committee who are friends of Lal Khan and who have resigned as a protest against my action, it appears that the resignations must have been drafted by some eminent lawyer, like Mr. Labh Singh, because it is very well written and because it is very lengthy—I think it must have been drafted by a lawyer in an honorary capacity, because paid people generally cut their work very short—from the wording of the resignation it will be seen that all sorts of things are said about the poor Minister for Local Self-Government, but not a word is said therein as to whether they were consulted by the vice-president before he passed his order. Therefore the allegation made by Mr. Din Muhammad to me that nobody in the municipal committee had been consulted by the senior vice-president before he issued that order stand correct and uncontradicted, and all that this document and the 12 signatures prove is that the vice-president never consulted any one before he passed such an important order. Beyond this nothing is claimed for the written protests.

It is said that the Deputy Commissioner forced those people to sign that document. How many are there on that document? There are 12 signatories. May I

4 P.M.

tell the honourable member that 10 of them had placed their signatures at the request of Sheikh Din Muhammad and the Deputy Commissioner never approached any one of them, never even saw any of them, nor had he any need to call them. Who are these ten members? They are those very people, six of whom form Sheikh Din Muhammad's party and who walked out of the municipal committee, when M. Lal Khan was elected president, in protest. So it goes without saying that those six persons stand by Sheikh Din Muhammad through thick and thin and require no threats or cajoling in opposing Lal Khan. As far as the document is concerned they did not require any persuasion to make them sign it. In addition to those six, there are three nominated people, Mr. Whitfield, the Civil Surgeon, and Mr. Balwant Singh. The honourable member from Gujranwala probably thinks that as these are nominated members they were probably forced by the Deputy Commissioner. But let me make it perfectly clear that not one of these three gentlemen was even seen by the Deputy Commissioner. They placed their signatures on that document because Sheikh Din Muhammad approached them on the subject. That accounts for 10, out of the 12 gentlemen whose faces had never been seen by the Deputy Commissioner, nor were they ever called by him to his house as the honourable member alleges. There was no need at all for their being so called as they had signed this document at the request of Sheikh Din Muhammad. Sheikh Din Muhammad said to me that there were certain members of the municipal committee with whom he was not on speaking terms, and that he was not prepared to ask them to express their wishes on the point. Under those circumstances, if I wanted to find out the wishes of the public what am I to do? Am I to ask the gentleman who is not on speaking terms with him, or ask the gentlemen who had already gone out of the committee to find out the wishes of the public, or am I to ask a neutral, an official to try and find out the wishes of the members? It was for this reason that I wrote the letter under discussion to the Deputy Commissioner. As I said, ten out of these 12 are persons who have never seen the Deputy Commissioner's face, had never been summoned by him, but who had put their signatures at the request of Sheikh Din Muhammad. The 11th is the President, Sardar Bahadur Sundar Singh who wrote to me a separate letter by himself saying that he did not agree to what Malik Lal Khan had done. Let us then think of the 12th member. He is an elected Hindu member of the municipal committee if you please. Can the honourable member maintain that an elected Hindu member of a place like Gujranwala can be forced into doing anything against his wishes which anybody else in the world wishes him to do? He may be forced by the local Congress Committee to do things against his will, he may be forced by the local Congress Committee to go out of the municipal committee, but he is not the likely person to be forced by poor officials to do anything which he or his constituency does not require. My honourable friend was pleased to refer to the probability that there are people whose acts were guided by ulterior motives. He said that if certain members had signed a protest they must have been moved by ulterior motives. Why should the honourable member imagine that one elected member who

[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

signs one kind of protest does it from ulterior motives and that another elected member who protests by resigning has no ulterior motives? I submit that each elected member of the municipal committee, whether he is a member of the Congress Committee or whether he is its enemy should be treated with equal respect and should be given equal weight in the public. That, Sir, is the position regarding the signatures.

May I now ask, why should I try and force the people to record this protest against the vice-president? My action is not based on any resolution of the municipal committee against the action of Malik Lal Khan. I do not want such a resolution to enable me to pass that order. That order has been passed beforehand, and it is finished. This is what took place subsequently when Sheikh Din Muhammad told me that what I had done was also the wish of the majority of the members of the committee whom Lal Khan had not chosen to consult. I then said, if that was the wish of the majority, why not let them record their wishes? This is the manner in which their wishes came to be recorded. If six members of the committee had the right to resign, why not 14 others on the other side be allowed the right to exercise their wish in another way?

It has been tried to make out in the Press and in this House that the whole of Gujranwala is against the action, and that the whole public is this and that. What has happened? Out of a municipal committee of 21, six elected people have resigned, the seventh has been removed. If those six people who have resigned can claim to be representatives of the whole public of Gujranwala cannot the other twelve members out of whom at least seven are elected members and who are standing by Sheikh Din Muhammad in the municipal committee, cannot they claim the same privilege of representing the public? They are equally respectable members, they have come in by the same means of election, and I ask, why cannot they be treated with the same respect as those six gentlemen?

The honourable member was pleased to call the present municipal committee a Rump committee. I ask him in return whether in a committee of 21, six people go out and disappear into the blue, whether it is the six people that are at the tail end or whether it is the remaining 15 that are still in the committee that are the tail end or the Rump. I should like to ask the honourable member the question—he can answer it for himself—whether it is the 14 that remain or it is the six that have gone out of the committee that form the Rump. There is absolutely no motive in the mind of Government in securing these signatures. Whether those signatures were got or were not got, it makes very little difference in my position. A member of the committee suggested to me that the majority of the committee were against the action taken by the vice-president, and they wanted to assert this. I said, why not assert it in writing? What offence have I committed in asking them to put in black and white their feelings on the subject.

The next charge brought against me was that I had forced the Deputy Commissioner and that the Deputy Commissioner called those gentlemen to his house to force them to affix their signatures on the document. What basis had the honourable member for making that statement before this

House when he knows it for a fact that he did not call at least 10 of them to his house? (Mr. Labh Singh: Does the Honourable Minister want me to answer the question here and now?) I do not. I know there can be no answer to it. From the very beginning the whole of this case has been based on misstatement of facts. I do not wish to impute any motives, but the honourable member characterised it as a dirty thing, a nefarious intention on my part, and so on. I do not want to use those terms because they are very hard words. I ask him, Sir, if he were in my position and if these were the imaginary charges brought against him, what would he have thought of me, what the public would have thought of me. Is it necessary for me to reply at present to trash of that kind? I think the honourable member has wasted the time of the House in prolonging the debate on this matter for two complete days. If this is the manner in which the future administration is to run, I cannot say what it will be. The honourable member suggested that it was very difficult for a poor man living in the town of Gujranwala to resist the force of the District Magistrate. May I ask the House another question: How far is it possible for the unarmed, peaceful citizens of Gujranwala to resist the so-called non-violence of the mob that is infuriated by inflammatory speeches at the Congress office and at the procession, who simply bully the honest and quiet people sitting in their own houses? Is it not a fact that this so-called non-violence mob, peaceful workers of the Congress, led by their leaders and incited to violence by them went to the house of the president, Sardar Bahadur Sundar Singh, and so besieged him that the poor gentleman had to lock himself inside with his womenfolk while all the time the furious mob lay waiting for him outside, and hurling on him and his family abuses of all kinds? Is that the way in which the peaceful and unarmed mob is to be led to bully and worry the innocent people of the locality? Is it not further a fact that the mob proceeded from the president's house to the house of his sister whose husband was away, and the poor unprotected woman was all alone shut up in her house, and the infuriated mob, under the guidance of the so-called nationalists and Congress leaders hurled all kinds of abuses on her. Is it not a fact that even innocent women were thus attacked for no fault of theirs except their being the sisters of the president of the municipal committee whose views did not coincide with those of the mob or of the so-called national workers? Is this the kind of independence that they are going to establish in this country? If that is so, I should think that the Congress Committee at Gujranwala has set a very bad example to the public in making them bent upon breaking the law. (An honourable member: Is this all relevant, Sir?) They are all unpleasant, I admit, and I shall leave them there. I suggest that it is not at all possible for any honourable member to allege that the Deputy Commissioner used force. There are other people than the Deputy Commissioner who are alleged to have used force in an unlawful manner in order to coerce people into action which they would not otherwise have done. I ask, how many political workers there are in some of these towns who do not by sheer pressure of their non-violent mob force compel other citizens to follow them? Do we not know that mere payment of a rupee a day produces very ardent nationalist workers who prawl the streets and sing funny songs every day and who hoist flags or wave them about in busy streets? Are there not others who are driven to do those



[Hon'ble Malik Firoz Khan Noon.]

things by force of pressure immoral or otherwise brought to bear on them by the so-called political workers? I suggest that this movement of peaceful persuasion which is called.....

**Mr. President :** That question is not before the House now.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** Very well, Sir. I now come to the third charge. What was stated was this, that on the 2nd February there were 18 gentlemen who had sent a document to the effect that Sardar Bahadur Sunder Singh should be removed from the municipal committee and on that document was the signature of Malik Lal Khan and also that of Sheikh Din Muhammad, and that therefore the Minister for Local Self-Government realised that this vote of censure would be carried through because there was one gentleman who was in Allahabad who had been called for by telegram—I am glad to say for once he did not say I had issued the telegram, I will deal with that later—and who was expected to be present, and that with him, the required number of 14 to form the two-thirds majority for the purpose was assured. It was further stated that as the Minister did not want the Chairman to be ousted, therefore he forthwith removed Malik Lal Khan from his seat on the committee, in order to reduce the number to 18 (out of 21). Let me assure you that this poor Minister knew absolutely nothing of that intrigue that was being carried on by one party or another in the committee on the 2nd of August. The honourable member wanted the House to believe that because Malik Lal Khan and Sheikh Din Muhammad had signed that particular document, therefore they were agreed in all matters, and that it was certain that the resolution would be carried. What does that document state? All that it states is this: 'We the following 18 members have no confidence in Sardar Bahadur Sunder Singh.' That is a perfectly legitimate thing to understand. Malik Lal Khan and Sheikh Din Muhammad may have a common enemy whom they wanted to get rid of and so joined hands. Sheikh Din Muhammad might have thought of getting rid of Sardar Bahadur Sunder Singh as the former thought that something had happened at the elections which in his opinion was due to the latter. Thus he has a grouse of his own. Malik Lal Khan thinks that because Sardar Bahadur Sunder Singh is not sharing his views, he should get rid of him, and being the senior vice-president succeed him to his place. Therefore is it a strange phenomenon that should pass one's comprehension that two gentlemen who may be absolutely inimical to each other should join hands and compose their differences as against a third person and a common foe? If these 18 signatures were secured in that manner there is nothing strange in it, and it is a mistaken view to hold that all these 18 shared the same views on all other political matters and were united for ever. They may be of one view on a particular issue, but on the next they may quarrel with one another. And it is nothing improbable in the case of the members of this committee because very serious agreements are entered into by some of its members during a night conference, and before day-break the sacred agreements are thrown to the winds, because one gentleman, who was a party to that contract was tempted by the offer of better terms from the other parts of the House in connection with the presidential elections. Therefore much importance should not be attached to this agreement. There are these two



gentlemen who to fight against a common foe put their signatures over this document, and somehow or other they thought better of it the next day and it may be that an eminent counsel from Gujranwala (Mr. Labh Singh) might have used his influence to persuade or win over one or two of those gentlemen and on that day the expected thing did not happen. It means really nothing more than that. The poor Minister does not even know that that writing was there, nor is he concerned with as to who gets into the municipal committee or who gets out of it. So far as I am concerned I want to see that the municipal administration is run on sound and honest lines, and so long as the public interests are well protected my duty is done. It little matters to me whether X is there or Y or Z. Therefore the allegation regarding the 13 or so signatures which the honourable member tried to make a flourish about cannot furnish him a good basis for argument. The magistrate knew nothing about it; I knew nothing about it. I do not care in the least as to who remains president of the municipal committee of Gujranwala, whether the 13 were to pass the Resolution or 14 the position of the Government would have been the same. Lal Khan was not removed in order to avoid a vote of censure against the president. But he was removed for the breach of his oath of allegiance, and I do not see any connection between the two points nor do I see how this argument affects me as a Minister.

I do not wish to go further into the other points which the honourable member raised, but I believe I have shown how the house of cards made of tissue paper falls to the ground, and I trust I have been able to satisfy the House on the facts of the case.

It is hardly necessary for me to say that there is no national flag. A Sikh member has just said that the Sikh colour is not there (yellow) nor are the Sikhs behind this flag. Every one knows that Muslims are not with the Congress nor with its flag. You can call it Congress flag, but certainly not national flag.

I now come to one more point raised by an honourable member of this House sitting opposite that in a certain paper he had read that I had given donation to a certain organisation. When I said I had not, he replied: 'It is so stated in the *Inqilab*; how can you say you have not?' It amounts to this: If any paper by mistake or inadvertence issues an obituary notice that such and such a poor or rich honourable member or lawyer has died while that is not a fact, will my honourable friend then assert that he is dead? How can he be here when the *Inqilab* has already published his obituary notice of I ask, is that the sort of argument to be used? As far as donations are concerned, we poor Ministers are meant to give donations. Our salaries are public property. Every month, indeed every day some donation or other has to be paid. And this is the only consolation that a Minister can have that he is thereby able to do good to some charitable institutions. And if we are to go on paying like this, no matter how rich a Minister is, I assure you he will find no money left. He has got already his financial liabilities. He may serve as Minister till Domesday, but he will never have enough money. Therefore I do not think our lot is an enviable one.

**Mr. President :** The Honourable Minister is wandering away from the point.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The honourable member from Gujranwala had suggested that we had to please some masters, thereby hinting that we had a lucrative post in our view when we took any action as a Minister. I was only trying to show that there was no money to be made in this office. Let the honourable member come here and try. I have nothing more to say except to express my extreme indebtedness to the House for having given me this opportunity of explaining my conduct, and I trust that my action will meet with the approval of the House. (*Loud and prolonged cheers*).

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I did not rise to interrupt the honourable minister because he said he would be puzzled. I have noted down a few questions which you were pleased to say you would allow us to put. I have them here, and I will put them with your permission and the Honourable Minister may answer them if he cares to do so. In fact he undertook to reply to them on the condition that he is not interrupted in the course of his speech, which appeared to be his first serious forensic effort. My first question is this : With whom did the proposal to remove Malik Lal Khan originate, with the Minister or with the Deputy Commissioner ? If it is the latter, would the Honourable Minister be pleased to read the recommendation and place it before the House ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I am not prepared to read an official document. There may be other things in that official documents which I do not wish should be placed on the table of the House.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Very well, I will then put this question, was it at the initiative of the Minister or of the Deputy Commissioner, that this action was taken ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I have nothing to add to what I have said.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** It is with reference to this very aspect that I wished to invite the Chair's attention. If a debate has come to a sudden end on account of closure how far it would be right for this House to start the convention that after the close of the speech there should be a cross-examination on the basis of the speech that has been made. Any convention of this sort laid down would be very difficult to depart from later on. As a member of the reserved half of the Government I had not the slightest intention to intervene between the House and the Minister but I thought it was my duty to invite the attention of the Chair to this aspect of the case.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** It was only on the assurance that I shall be allowed to put my questions at the end of the Minister's speech that I did not get up to correct the Honourable Minister then and there. I believe I am within my rights if I rise to ask just two questions which necessarily arise from the statement made to us by the Honourable Minister and which are intended to correct, supplement and explain it.

**Mr. President :** Cannot one member of the House ask a question through the Chair of another member of the House with respect to a matter under discussion ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I do not desire to lead you to an academic controversy but I only want to make sure that the privilege of asking questions does not develop into a cross-examination.

**Mr. President :** May I refer the honourable member to paragraph 54 of our Business Manual? It runs as follows :—

“ When for the purposes of explanation during discussion or for any other sufficient reason, any member has occasion to ask a question of another member on any matter then under the consideration of the Council, he shall ask the question through the President.”

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Sir, my next question is this. The Honourable Minister was pleased to say that the president of the committee ordered that the hall be locked up. Was this order by the president to his secretary a written one or an oral one?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I shall have to find it out from the president.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** My next question is this. Was not the president absent on Saturday, the 25th and Sunday, the 26th, and was he not called from a village seven miles away after the flag had been hoisted or about that time?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I think the best person to answer that question is the president himself. As far as my recollection goes, from the conversation that I had with the president, he was absent for a part of the day on the 25th, and that on the night of the 25th he was back in Gujranwala. The next morning he might have gone out to a village to get a little tea and after a few hours have returned. But I am speaking from my recollection of a personal conversation that I had with the president, and I do not say that I remember correctly what he said.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I will ask this further question.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** May I ask whether the honourable member is putting these questions so that he may use the information given in replies thereto in any prosecution before a court of law?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I am not concerned in the case, neither as prosecutor nor as accused.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** This is a matter *sub judice*. There are certain prosecutions going on in Gujranwala in connection with this meeting on that day and in those prosecutions these facts will be taken into consideration. And I think it is not right that the honourable member should use the privilege of asking questions here in order to be able to use the replies I may give, especially when they do not concern me directly and when they concern the conduct of the people there.

**Mr. President :** The Honourable Minister has stated that the president of the Gujranwala municipal committee had ordered that the doors of the hall should be kept locked and that no one should be allowed to take possession of it. The honourable member wants to know whether that order, to the knowledge of the Minister, was given in writing or verbally.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I do not know.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I may explain that no prosecution is at all taking place on which these questions have any bearing.

**Mr. President :** I hope the honourable member will not ask any question but for the purpose of eliciting facts with regard to the matter under discussion.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Quite so, Sir. My next question is this. Is it a fact that the conviction of Malik Lal Khan to which reference was made was a matter of twenty years ago?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** It may be.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Is it a fact that no copy of the charge has so far been supplied to Malik Lal Khan although he applied for it in writing, I mean the explanation which he was asked to submit under section 16 of the Municipal Act?

**Mr. President :** The section says—

“ Provided that when the Local Government proposes to take action under the foregoing provisions of this section, an opportunity of explanation shall be given to the member concerned.”

The only question that can arise is whether that opportunity was given. There is no question of any charge.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** With reference to the points on which he was asked to give his explanation, I wish to know whether he was given a copy of those points before action was taken under this section.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I have no knowledge as to what the Deputy Commissioner did.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** Is it a fact that no copy of the charge has so far been supplied to Malik Lal Khan although he applied for it in writing?

**Mr. President :** What charge the honourable member is referring to?

**Mr. Labh Singh :** The matter in respect of which he was asked to give an explanation; the charges so to speak, with reference to which he was asked to submit an explanation.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** I can throw no further light on the matter.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I wish to ask whether a censure motion against the Minister was taken up in the local municipal committee and it was not passed only because the president had illegally adjourned the meeting.

**Mr. President :** This matter was not referred to either by the honourable mover or by the Honourable Minister.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** As a matter of fact it escaped my notice, and even if they had passed it I do not care; and they are welcome to pass it even to-morrow.

**Mr. President :** The Honourable Minister is not responsible to the Municipal Commissioners; he is responsible to the members of this House. (*Hear, hear.*)

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I am not suggesting that. I wanted to know whether such a thing had happened, and whether the Minister had taken any action with respect to the high handed illegality committed on the occasion by the Chairman.

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** My attention was drawn to it by the honourable gentleman himself.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member may give notice of this question in the next session of the Council.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** If action had already been taken, for what reasons were the signatures needed after the removal order, I mean the signatures of the 12 gentlemen ?

**Mr. President :** The Honourable Minister has, I think, given his reasons.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Through you I desire to put a question to my friend, inasmuch as the matter with regard to which I want to put a question has left me in a bewildering state of mind. A certain document has been referred to and the contents of it have been described to be confidential by the Honourable Minister. I should like to know how the honourable member got to know the contents of that letter.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I have not seen the confidential letter. My information was derived through a gentleman who was spoken to by the confidential messenger through whom the Honourable Minister was pleased to send the message. And I may mention for the information of the House that the message is by now public property. The Honourable Minister has himself told us that he did write that letter, although for reasons best known only to himself he has concealed its contents. Moreover, the best and direct source of the information were the victims themselves of the letter.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** It was because I apprehended that this would take place under the ruling which you gave in pursuance of the standing order that I rose to intervene. It was not my object to challenge the possibility of putting questions through the Chair. I want the matter to be considered in the interests of the future working of the Council so that this precedent might not come into use hereafter as it may give you and the House trouble in future.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** A very small question Sir. In his speech, the honourable member from Gujranwala referred to an exalted errand boy who had been used by the Minister for taking his letter or message to the Deputy Commissioner of Gujranwala. I want to ask him whether that exalted errand boy was a member of this Council.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Do you, Sir, intend to permit this question ?

**Mr. President :** He has not named any member.

**Mr. Labh Singh :** I did not name him, but the Honourable Minister has.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration. The question is—

“ That the demand be reduced by Rs. 1, with respect to the item of Rs. 60,000, Pay of Officers—Minister for Local Self-Government.”

The motion was lost.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, I wished to say a few words on the main demand but, within the short time at my disposal I cannot do justice to the subject and criticise the policy of either the Minister for Education or any other Minister.

**Lala Kesho Ram, Sekhri :** Sir, the honourable member having failed in his attempts to attack the Minister for Education by means of his cut motions is now trying to take this opportunity to stab him from behind.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** I had made it quite clear that I was going to attack the Minister for Education who has been following a wrong-headed policy.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** On a point of order. In his opening sentence, the honourable member, the *ex*-Minister, has been pleased to express a sort of uncertainty and disappointment that having very little time at his disposal he does not know whether he can do justice to his criticism of the Honourable Minister for Education, or the working of the transferred department under some other Honourable Minister, thereby giving an indication that it is within the range of possibility that he may criticise the policy of the Honourable Minister for Education. I respectfully submit that the point raised by my honourable friend from Amritsar was a sound point of order, *viz.*, that having failed in his frontal attack on the Honourable Minister he wants to attack him from behind. I won't say stab in the back or anything of the kind. I want to bring to your notice that it would be quite out of order to attack now, at this stage, the policy of the Honourable Minister for Education, because he had moved two cuts, and both of them proved infructuous.

**Mr. President :** For any reasons, which may not be irrelevant to the Grant now before the House, the honourable member can oppose the grant. His reasons may include criticism of any Minister or officer of Government.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** In view of the attempts that have been made to prevent me from making the criticisms I wanted to make, I do not want to say anything more than this, namely, that this section of the House (*pointing to the National Unionist benches*) has been entirely dissatisfied with the policy that has been pursued by the Honourable Minister for Education.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** There is yet a minute and-a-half, Sir, and I just want to say a few words with your permission.

Sir, the working of the department of Local Self-Government has been defective in this sense, that whereas communal representation is allowed in municipal towns where Muslim community is expected to have a fair amount of representation, it is not allowed in the district boards where my community is not expected to have in general electorates a decent representation. Either the principle of communal representation must go or it should be introduced elsewhere. I also want to draw the attention of the Minister for Local Self-Government to the fact that the water works at Pind Dadan Khan are still in a state of incompleteness and early attention should be paid to them.

Nothing substantial has been done for the propagation of the Ayurvedic system of medicine.

There is another thing. It has been given out that in the new appointments of assistant surgeons out of 14 only 3 are Hindus, one Sikh and the rest are Muhammadans. I have no grudge against Muhammadans, but I condemn the policy by which appointments are being made, because this principle has produced a great deal of heart burning amongst candidates for the posts of assistant surgeons in this province. The British General Council of Medicine has declared that Indian degrees would not be recognised. This is intolerable and some measures should be taken to establish a reciprocity if nothing can be done by way of retaliation.

The notified area of Sheikhpura is still waiting for a municipality and even election has not been held there for a long time. The whole town of Pindigheb has practically been transferred to certain individuals.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 2,10,600 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of general administration (Transferred)."

The motion was carried.

#### ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow.** (Finance Member) : Sir, I beg to move :

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 47,57,100 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Administration of Justice."

**Mr. President :** The demand moved is :—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 47,57,100 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Administration of Justice."

(*Shaikh Abdul Ghani rose to speak.*)

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's amendment does not appear to be in order.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** My object is to impress upon the Government the desirability of having one Muslim as permanent judge of the Punjab High Court.

**Mr. President :** According to the note appended to the amendment the object of the honourable member is to urge upon the Government that one post of a permanent judge be reduced.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Surely, if they do not give us one permanent judge.

**Mr. President :** Who can appoint a permanent judge? Your object is to criticise the policy of the local Government.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** It is a non-voted item.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** My object would be served if the Government is prepared to give us an assurance.

**Mr. President :** The item is non-voted.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** At the time I put this amendment I failed to find out anything to indicate that one item was voted and another non-voted.

**Mr. President :** Apparently the honourable member does not understand the difference between the italic and Roman figures used in the budget ?

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Certainly, at the time I did not understand the significance of the italics.

**Mr. President :** I think the amendment is out of order. The number of judges is fixed by the Government of India Act and His Majesty can appoint up to that number.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, I beg to move—

“ That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 27,900—Pay of Officers—24-A.”

**Mr. President :** How is this in order ? It relates to a non-voted subject.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** This item is voted.

**Mr. President :** Yes, it is, but the point is whether it is in the power of the local Government to appoint judges ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** It is in the power of the local Government to make recommendations.

**Mr. President :** Then move a resolution inviting the attention of the local Government to that fact. But now you are discussing the budget.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** The local Government has limited powers so far as appointment is concerned.

**Mr. President :** May I invite the honourable member's attention to section 101 of the Government of India Act. The appointment of permanent judges is in the hands of His Majesty the King Emperor. The appointment of additional judges is in the hands of His Excellency the Governor-General, while the appointment of temporary judges is in the hands of the local Government.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** This head includes the Registrar, Deputy Registrar and Assistant Registrar.

**Mr. President :** Right, and the honourable member is welcome to criticise them, but how can he argue that the judges should be agriculturists ? If he wants the Registrar to be an agriculturist he is at liberty to say so.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** What would the judges do without the Registrar ?

**Mr. President :** Then he can say that the Registrar should go.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Surely that is how we can comment upon the administrative side of the High Court.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member's note may not be complete, but so far as it goes, it is quite clear that his intention is to draw attention to the fact that no agriculturist is a Judge of the High Court.



But whose attention does he wish to draw, Of the local Government, of the Government of India, of the Parliament, or of His Majesty the King ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** The attention of the local Government.

**Mr. President :** It is not in the hands of the local Government to appoint agriculturists to the High Court Bench.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** The local Government can take steps to see that agriculturists are appointed judges of the High Court.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is welcome to move a resolution to that effect.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Why can it not be done in the course of this motion ? Can I not draw the attention of the local Government to the absence of agriculturists in the High Court in order to urge that they should take steps to have agriculturists appointed.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member proposes to omit the salary of certain officers with the object of having agriculturists appointed as judges.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Yes, that is my object.

**Mr. President :** How can the omission of the subordinate officers' salary result in the appointment of an agriculturist as a judge ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** This item relates to the salary of their establishment. If there is no establishment how can they carry out their duties ?

**Mr. President :** That might result in the abolition of judges. But the honourable member's object is to draw attention of the local Government to the fact that there are no agriculturists on the High Court Bench.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** Can we not make a protest ?

**Mr. President :** The object with which the amendment is proposed must be directly relevant to the item to which it relates.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** May I remind you of your ruling....

**Mr. President :** I anticipate what the honourable member is going to refer to. There the object was to have the Commissioners abolished. Does the honourable member mean that the High Court should be abolished ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** I think it is one of the recognised methods in which this House or individual member of the House can express their dissatisfaction with a certain state of things in any department of Government. Now I proposed this cut to express my dissatisfaction with the personnel of the High Court.

**Mr. President :** Are High Courts under local Governments ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** The local Government has a hand, and a substantial hand, in the making of appointments.

**Mr. President :** That is so. The local Government does recommend the appointment of judges ; and that is the reason why the honourable

[ Mr. President. ]

member will be in order if he were to move a resolution inviting the attention of the Government to this complaint of the agriculturists of the province.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** That is a different thing. Whether I have a right to move a resolution or not, the question is whether or not this motion is in order or not.

**Mr. President :** The amendment of the honourable member relates to the salary of the officers of the High Court, while his attack is against the High Court itself.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** If there is any attack, the attack is on the policy of the Government which has been systematically....

**Mr. President :** But the Local Government is not directly responsible for the appointment of judges. It is the Governor who makes recommendations, and not the local Government.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** His Excellency the Governor is not mentioned in section 101. So far as I understand it is His Majesty the King who is....

**Mr. President :** Please refer to section 105.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** That is local Government.

**Mr. President :** If the object of the honourable member is to urge why no agriculturist has been appointed a temporary judge of the High Court, he may move his amendment.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Sir, I think you are perfectly right, and if you will kindly turn to page 206 of the Budget Estimates you will find that the item No. 2 mentioned on that page which is voted is Rs. 27,900 and if you come to the details of it you will find that this is made up of 3 items. These 3 items are Rs. 11,520, on account of pay of the Deputy Registrar, Rs. 8,610 on account of the pay of the Assistant Registrar, Rs. 7,770 on account of the pay of the Assistant Deputy Registrar. These are the 3 officers whose salaries taken together form the item which my honourable friend wants to be reduced by Re. 1. Now let us assume that this cut is carried. What would be the effect of it? The salaries of these 3 gentlemen would be reduced by Re. 1. It is they who are affected and not the High Court. They will probably not resign their jobs because their pay has been reduced by Re. 0-5-4 per annum.

Then, secondly, even if they resign, there would be many and probably a large number of agriculturists who would like to go into their places as well as non-agriculturists, and the High Court will still stand. Thirdly, if no one cares to stand as a candidate for less than the complete sum of Rs. 27,900, I am sure the honourable members of this House will agree that the High Court will still continue to stand and will not tumble down because Mr. Roblin resigns and the High Court can find no successor or Mr. Nihal Chand resigns and the High Court cannot find any successor or Mr. Webb, who is the Assistant Deputy Registrar, resigns and the High Court cannot find anyone to succeed him. If the object were to attack the policy followed by these officers, then the motion would be perfectly in order. If this is his object, certainly

5 P.M.

he can move the motion, but if the object is to make an indirect attack upon the policy of the High Court, then my respectful submission is that this motion is absolutely out of order. And the honourable member has made it perfectly clear that his object is not to attack either Mr. Roblin or Mr. Nihal Chand or Mr. Webb, but his object is to attack the Honourable judges of the High Court. (*Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram*: No.) He wants agriculturists to be appointed, but that involves an attack on the policy of Government that this Government to whom my honourable friend has rendered such splendid services has not seen its way up to this time to appoint a member of his own tribe, and an attack on the policy of the judges inasmuch as they have not framed a recommendation in favour of a member of his tribe. This is his professed object and if that is the whole object then my submission is that he cannot move his amendment.

**Mr. President**: The debates on the budget must be relevant to the grant or item under consideration, that is to say, they must be confined to the particular vote then before the House and the conduct of the Government connected therewith. Now the reduction proposed to be moved relates expressly to the salary of three officers. Therefore, the criticism of the honourable member must be confined to these three officers and the responsibility of the Local Government also may be discussed so far as these three officers are concerned, and not with respect to the judges.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram**: I thought that this token cut had been a well recognised method of attacking the policy of Government in general and not necessarily.....

**Dr. Gokul Chend Narang**: Sir, the honourable member is repeating himself. He said exactly the same words five minutes ago.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram**: And if this practice has been allowed to continue undisturbed for such a length of time, then, unless there is anything definite to overrule my motion, I should like to move my amendment.

**Mr. President**: I have given my ruling.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram**: If it is your ruling that a token cut can only be discussed in relation to the particular item against which it has been directly made, then of course I have nothing to say, but a token cut has been allowed to be made the basis of attack on the policy of Government in general.

**Mr. President**: I know that in the case of an amendment for reducing the clerical and ministerial staff of the Commissioners the object of the mover was, if I remember aright, to render the Commissioners unable to carry on their duties. Had the honourable mover moved a reduction of the whole staff, whose salary is Rs. 27,900 with the object of making it impossible for the High Court to perform their judicial duties, I would have allowed the amendment. How can the honourable member attack the local Government?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram**: Under the Government of India Act it is the local Government which appoints acting judges.

**Mr. President**: Which section is the honourable member referring to?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sections 101 and 105.

**Mr. President :** Section 101 of the Government of India Act reads as follows :—

“Each high court shall consist of a chief justice and as many other judges as His Majesty may think fit to appoint.”

Provided as follows :—

(i) the Governor-General in Council may appoint persons to act as additional judges of any high court, for such period, not exceeding two years, as may be required :

(ii) the maximum number of judges of a high court, including the chief justice and additional judges, shall be twenty.”

Now the appointment of additional judges is in the hands of the Governor-General, that of permanent judges is in the hands of His Majesty the King, and the total number of judges is twenty. Where does the local Government come in ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** The appointment of acting judges has been dealt with in one of these sections.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is probably referring to sub-section (2) of section 105. According to that sub-section only acting judges can be appointed by the local Government.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Acting judges have as much right to sit on the bench as any other judge. That is also a class of appointment which in a way goes to establish.....

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** It is the object of the honourable member to attack the acting judges.

**Mr. President :** But how can the cut relate to acting judges only ?

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** I would submit that even the pay of the temporary additional judges is non-voted. How can it be made the subject of discussion here on a token cut ?

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** In that case this cut should have referred to that item, but it refers to a different item. It pains me to think that Government has not been able to train this gentleman while he was there on Government benches. He does not even know this ordinary thing, and he has been dealing with the budget as a Minister. He is really wanting to attack the temporary judges while he is pretending to discuss the policy and draw attention to the absence of agriculturists from the High Court Bench.

**Mr. President :** If the object of the honourable member is to abolish the posts of Registrar, Deputy Registrar and the Assistant Registrar, he is welcome to move the amendment.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** That obviously is not his object.

**Mr. President :** Then I declare the amendment to be out of order. Amendment No. 8.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** In this case Chaudhri Chhotu Ram wants to discuss the policy of the High Court on the administration side in relation to the item of Rs. 27,900, pay of officers. This again is out of order as it relates to the appointment of these three gentlemen.

**Mr. President :** If the honourable member wishes to criticise the policy of the High Court on the administrative side, he may table a resolution and if the ballot favours him he will achieve his objects.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani** [West Punjab Towns, (Muhammadan), Urban] : Sir, I beg to move—

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 2,86,200—pay of Public Prosecutors."

I need not take a great deal of time of the Council over this subject. The question is a very simple and very clear one. It cannot be said at this hour that there is paucity of competent and eminent legal practitioners so far as Muhammadans are concerned in this province and yet they are not sufficiently represented in the cadre of public prosecutors. Nor can it be said that Muhammadan lawyers are not willing to take up the job. It appears to me that there has been a monopoly of a particular community throughout and that community has been able to keep the Mussalmans out of this cadre. I admit, no doubt, that efforts have been made in recent years to take in a certain number of Muslims as public prosecutors, but out of a total of 31 public prosecutors—I suppose I am right in that figure—there are only 8 Muslim public prosecutors serving in this province. On this point I am speaking subject to correction, because so often additional public prosecutors are being taken in order to conduct particular cases and so I am not in a position to know the exact number actually working as public prosecutors and how many of them are Muslims.

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** The book which has been placed in our hands shows that there are 12 Muslim public prosecutors.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** My information is that there are only 8 Muslim public prosecutors. However, that shows that the Muslims are poorly represented in that service. If we take the population basis, of course the percentage of Muslims among public prosecutors must be 50 and there is absolutely no reason why that number should not be made up. I commend this to the Government and the Honourable the Legal Remembrancer who is, I think, already taking action in the matter to make up the deficiency as soon as it is possible.

**Mr. President :** Demand under consideration, amendment moved—

"That the demand be reduced by Rs 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 2,86,200 pay of Public Prosecutors."

**Mr. S. L. Sale** (Legal Remembrancer) : Sir, the honourable mover supported his motion in a commendably short speech and I propose to make an equally brief speech in reply. I should, before coming to facts and figures, like to explain for the information of the honourable mover that public prosecutors are not Government servants, but bear the same relation to Government as that of a counsel to a client. Just as private clients would go to a counsel of proved capacity and efficiency, so Government when they, in the capacity of client, wish to employ counsels, have no regard to the community to which counsel belongs, but consider rather his professional capacity as proved by his legal practice and by the work which he has done on behalf of Government in previous cases. But, so far as possible, other things being equal, Government are anxious to see that there should be no undue preponderance of any one community among their standing counsel.

[Mr. S. L. Sale.]

I think the figures which I have prepared will show that there is no undue preponderance of any one community. In point of fact the percentage of Muslims in the cadre of public prosecutors has been gradually increasing since 1921. In that year there were 26 public prosecutors of whom 16 were Hindus, 9 Muslims and one Christian. In other words, 61 per cent. were Hindus, 34 per cent. Muhammadans and the remainder Christians. Since that time we have appointed a certain number of Sikhs. In 1921 there were none, now we have three Sikhs. The present figures are—I am speaking of permanent public prosecutors—out of a total of 30 public prosecutors there are 14 Hindus, 12 Muslims, 3 Sikhs and 1 Christian. In other words, the percentages are, 46 per cent. Hindus, 40 per cent. Muslims, 10 per cent. Sikhs and 3 per cent. Christians. I have not gone into the percentages of the intervening years, but I can assure the honourable mover that the percentage has never been so favourable to Muslims as it is at present.

There is one more remark which I think is very relevant. I quite agree with the honourable mover that there are plenty of well-qualified Muslims practising in the districts who are ready and willing to become public prosecutors. But he said, if I understood him rightly, that the appointments should be made on the population basis, that is to say, on the basis of 50-50. I think, however, that we should take into account not the total number of Muslims in the province but the number of practising lawyers on the rolls of the High Court. (*Hear, hear*). For that purpose I have collected some figures from the recent lists issued by the High Court and I find that out of 4,123 practising lawyers in this province, 2,844 are Hindus, while there are only 797 Muslims, 444 Sikhs and 38 Christians and 5 Parsis. The percentages are as follows: 68·98 per cent. Hindus, 19·33 per cent. Muslims, 10·77 per cent. Sikhs and ·80 per cent. Christians and ·12 per cent. Parsis. Now, I venture to suggest that having regard to these percentages among practising lawyers in the province, it is not unfavourable to Muslims that they have as high a percentage as 40 in the cadre of public prosecutors as against 46 per cent. Hindus and 10 per cent. Sikhs. The honourable mover may rest assured that the claims of any Muslim candidates who may come forward will receive due consideration.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq** [Amritsar City (Muhammadan), Urban]: Sir, in my budget speech I said that it would be useless to discuss such subjects at present. It is useless to request the Government at present to lay down a policy for the future. It is much better that we raise such questions after eighteen months or two years. I say this is the hope that after two years the reforms will come in and the new situation will permit the House to settle such questions of policy. The policy of the present Government has always been—if I am not insulting them—one of divide and rule. The Government wants to keep its power and so it will not change its policy. That is why instead of giving an assurance to this Council the Government has given a more unsatisfactory answer. This has made the position worse than it was before. Up to this time the Government used to say, 'Yes, we will look after your interest.' But now, they have changed their policy and instead of taking the percentage on the population basis,

they say, 'Take the percentage of people who are practising lawyers.' If the Government had said "We want to select the best persons, that would have been sensible. Instead of that they have taken an attitude which is absolutely ridiculous. They say that in future the proportion of public prosecutors of different communities will be in accordance with the proportion of practising lawyers among the different communities.

**Mr. S. L. Sale :** I am sorry I have been misunderstood. I repudiate that statement.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I am very glad he repudiates that statement. That is distinctly what I wanted.

Now, Sir, there is no doubt that every community wants some share in the administration of the country. As regards posts of Extra Assistant Commissioners or Sub-Judges or other such offices there is competition examination for filling them and enough number of Hindus and Muhammadans may come in by the open door. But for the office of public prosecutors, there is no competition examination and everything is left to the sweet will of the Government. If a Deputy Commissioner is gracious enough to recommend a person or if the Legal Remembrancer is pleased with any candidate he is nominated as public prosecutor irrespective of his merits, irrespective of whether he is earning Rs. 800 a month or Rs. 18-4-0 a month. He is simply appointed because the Deputy Commissioner or somebody else has pushed him up. I do not, however, like to pursue this subject any further. I hope my honourable friend will withdraw this amendment. I think this question should not be raised at this stage.

**Lala Mukand Lal Puri [Lahore City (Non-Muhammadan), Urban] :** Sir, after hearing the speech of the honourable the Legal Remembrancer with regard to the principle which the Punjab Government is following in the selection of the Public Prosecutors, I had no intention to participate in the debate, but for the last sentence which the honourable the Legal Remembrancer has been pleased to say. There is a danger, Sir, of this discussion of the Legislative Council being used to canvass for individual appointments, and I want to record my protest as emphatically as possible that these discussions on cuts and that the assurances given by the Government should not be used as a support for any possible vacancy that may come up in the near future. It may be that a certain proportion of appointments in certain public services have to be reserved for a certain community. It may be that one community ought not to be given monopoly in a public service, whether it is Muhammadan, whether it is Hindu or whether it is Sikh. Sir, having brought to the notice of the Government that certain community is not properly represented and the assurance of the Government given in that connection, that assurance should not be used to canvass for the appointment of a candidate of that community if that candidate happens to be inferior to the members of the other communities.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow (Finance Member) :** Sir, I think the few points on which misapprehension has arisen would have been cleared if the honourable member from Amritsar had fully heard the explanation of Mr. Sale, who, when winding up his remarks asked the honourable the mover of this cut to withdraw it. That is what I should like to do myself, and will appeal to the honourable member to do. I think the honourable

[Hon'ble Sir Alexander Stow.]

member from Amritsar was perhaps confused, and took as a principle what was really an illustration.....

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I apologize, Sir.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** It is also quite plain that as regards these appointments efficiency and the matter in hand, that is to say, the case which has to be conducted, are the principal things to be considered. As Mr. Sale has pointed out there are also other considerations, which have to be, and are constantly being, borne in mind. I think Mr. Sale has given a fair indication of the method employed by Government in making these appointments, and I, therefore, appeal to the honourable member from Shahpur to withdraw his amendment.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** Sir, I am quite prepared to withdraw the out proposed by me after the assurance given by the honourable the Legal Remembrancer and by the Honourable Finance Member, but I cannot help remarking that I cannot possibly agree with the arguments advanced by the Honourable Legal Remembrancer. He said that as the number of Muslim lawyers in the province is 797 and the number of other communities is much greater, therefore, that fact has to be taken into consideration ; but the question is that if he is going to have half a dozen more public prosecutors from amongst the Muslim, whether he would be in a position to select even half a dozen out of these 797 or that the Muslim lawyers are so incompetent that even half a dozen cannot be selected for performing the duties of public prosecutors.

**Mr. Sale :** I never said that the Muslim lawyers are incompetent.

**Shaikh Abdul Ghani :** I am sorry that I misunderstood the honourable the Legal Remembrancer. Sir, as the number of Muslim lawyers is 797, and they are in a minority, they should not be lost sight of and the fact that they are in a minority, they should be given an opportunity with other communities. My point is simply this that there are competent Muslim lawyers and there is a sufficient number of them coming forth for these posts and that their claims should not be ignored. Sir, after the assurance given by the honourable the Legal Remembrancer and the Honourable the Finance Member I withdraw my amendment.

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 47,57,100 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Administration of Justice."

The motion was carried.

#### JAILS AND CONVICT SETTLEMENTS.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow (Finance Member) :** Sir, I beg to move—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 41,69,100 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Jails and Convict Settlements."

The motion was carried.



**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** Sir, I beg to move—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,13,64,500 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931, in respect of Police.”

**Mr. President :** The demand moved is—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,13,64,500 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931, in respect of Police.”

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** [South-East Rohtak (non-Muhammadan), Rural] : Sir, I beg to move—

“That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 9,81,000 Sub-Inspectors.”

Sir, the object of this motion is that I should draw the attention of the Government to the fact that Hindu agriculturists are very much under-represented in this branch of public service. The latest figures are given in the Consolidated List, which was issued on the 1st of January 1930, on page 2. The total number of Sub-Inspectors in the province is 840. Out of this number 352 are Muhammadan agriculturists, 120 Muhammadan Non-agriculturists ; 71 are Hindu agriculturists, 176 are Hindu non-agriculturists ; 76 are Sikh agriculturists and 40 are Sikh non-agriculturists.

The distribution obviously seems to be very uneven. While among the Muhammadans the number of agriculturists is fairly large, the same number among the Hindus is very low, it is only 71. Among the Sikhs the number is fairly high though not commensurate with the strength of the agricultural element in the Sikh population. The general percentage of all agriculturists is 59.5. If I can remember correctly, the percentage of agriculturists among Sub-Inspectors of Police should be 66. So, the present general percentage of agriculturists falls short of that prescribed by 6 or 7. Sir, it cannot reasonably be contended that men with sufficient education cannot be forthcoming from among the ranks of agriculturists even for this branch of the service. Nor can it be reasonably contended that the agriculturists would be less fitted for the police Department than the non-agriculturists. But somehow or other the preponderance of agriculturists has not been established to the same extent as it was the intention of the resolution of 1919.

After all the Police department is a semi-Military department. The duties of a policeman require courage which is likely to be possessed in a greater measure by agriculturists, who belong to the martial classes than by non-agriculturists who have had not much to do with risks and dangers in life. They may be very good officers in spheres where pure intellect is required, but where physical courage, initiative and capacity to handle or control men are required, I do not think a non-agriculturist will prove half so good as an agriculturist. Consequently I beg to submit that there being no lack of men with good education and sound physique amongst agriculturists, there is no reason why in this department agriculturists should not preponderate to a larger extent than they do now.

[ R. S. Ch. Chhotu Ram. ]

Now, with respect to Hindu agriculturists I find that there is a very marked inadequacy in representation. There are only 71 Hindu agriculturists. The percentage of Hindus in the aggregate is 29·4. Thus it falls short of the proper Hindu share by 2·5 per cent. Hindus roughly form 82 per cent. of the total population and their total share thus falls short of that which is in accordance with their strength in population, but of this share Hindu agriculturists get 71 posts in all as against 176 which go to non-agriculturists. This means a little less than 29 per cent. of the share which falls to the Hindus.

*(At this stage Mr. President left the Chair and it was occupied by the Deputy President.)*

In view of these clear facts I think I have a very strong case to bring to the notice of the Honourable the Finance Member and I hope he will be able to do something substantial in the course of the next two or three years to do justice to the claims of the Hindu zamindars.

**Deputy President :** Demand under consideration. Amendment moved—

“ That the grant be reduced by Re. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 2,81,600—Sub-Inspectors. ”

**Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie** (Home Secretary): Sir, the honourable member for Rohtak has relied largely upon the figures which are provided to show that Hindu agriculturists have not got their due representation in the ranks of sub-inspectors of police. I regret to say that he is right, but there are reasons, many of them, why up to the present that has been the case. I think that he will find that a fair representation of the Hindu agriculturists of Kangra and of the North Punjab probably exists in the ranks of the police. But people from the great stronghold of the Hindu agricultural tribes of the south-eastern Punjab have up to the present not enlisted in the police with any freedom and where you find a small, in this case a lamentably small, number of constables, you cannot expect to find many officers. The reason, I believe, was that many years ago the Muslims of the south-eastern Punjab took readily to the police service and the Jat was content to serve in the army. It is only in comparatively recent years that the Jat too has thought that he might like the police service as well. He has done amazingly well in the army. Why should he not be equally well in the police? I answer, there is no reason at all. And when he does enter the police in sufficient numbers, he will be as famous in the annals of that splendid force as many of the tribes who have made it their business to join it in large numbers. The honourable mover also said that non-agriculturists occupied too large a position in the police and that as police officers they could not be expected to have the same qualities as the agriculturists. Though I would agree with him in saying that the agriculturists of the Punjab possess in a high degree all those qualities which go to making a good soldier or a good policeman, I would not for a moment agree to the proposition that courage is a monopoly of any one community. I think that here in the Punjab all classes and communities are most fully endowed with it, and as far as that excellent quality goes there is no reason why agriculturists and non-agriculturists should not go side by side and work together in perfect amity in the police force. The conditions, moreover, of the police

force have been in the past—I do not say so much now but they have been in the past—somewhat difficult for the Hindu agricultural tribes. I think the honourable member from Rohtak will agree with me when I say, without meaning the slightest disparagement to these magnificent people, that they are to a certain extent clannish and like to stay together. Jats in the army like to serve along with their brothers and no doubt in the police they would like to do the same, but where they find a very great number of people of other communities there before them they feel rather out of their element, rather strange. That feeling is, I believe, decreasing and I have every reason to hope that recruitment in all ranks of the force will improve from the tribes in which the honourable mover is interested. I must say that the Inspector-General of Police and his officers have been of recent years extremely interested in the problem of how to increase recruitment from this most valuable source and I hope that with the assistance of the honourable member and others interested in the matter they will be more successful than in the past. In order to encourage them still further I understand the Inspector-General has taken the unprecedented step of actually reserving some appointments as Assistant Sub-Inspectors for Hindu Jats so as to give them an encouraging start. I am sure that the honourable mover will realise that Government does view this problem with the greatest solicitude and sympathy and that they will welcome a further addition to recruitment from the very fine peoples for whose cause he has made himself responsible. On receiving this assurance I trust that he will see his way to not pressing the cut he has moved.

**Chaudhri Baldev Singh** [North-West Rohtak, (non-Muhammadan,) Rural ], (Urdu): Sir, I am very glad that the honourable Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram has at last put forward the claims of the Hindu zamindars for the police department. The House is aware that it was in 1919 that it was decided for the first time to increase the proportion of zamindars in public service. In order to give effect to that decision zamindars have been given preference over the non-zamindars in all the branches of public service since 1919 and their number has been steadily increasing. If I remember aright in 1926 the number of the zamindars in various branches of public service had reached the proportion fixed for them as it was stated to the House in 1927 or 1928 by the Chief Secretary. Their number amongst the Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars had also reached the proportion except in the south-eastern portion of the Punjab. I am very sorry to point out that amongst the zamindars only one particular community has been favoured. My honourable friend Rai Sahib, who is a representative of my district, has always been pleading the cause of the zamindars, but he has so far kept silence with regard to the Hindu zamindars. He and in fact none other can say with any show of reason that non-zamindar Hindus have usurped the right of the Hindu zamindars or have taken the share that should have gone to the latter. The figures which have been quoted by the mover of the cut clearly point out that non-zamindars can rather reasonably complain that they have not been given their due share not to speak of their having usurped the share of any other class or community. Where the total Hindu population is 32 per cent., their proportion in the rank of sub-inspectors of police does not exceed 29 per cent. Therefore the Hindu zamindars have no complaint against the non-zamindar

[ Ch. Baldev Singh. ]

Hindus. Their share has been usurped by their brothers in profession, i.e., by the Muhammadan zamindars. I really wonder why the Muhammadan zamindars have always been given preference over the Hindu zamindars. I hope that the Government will see that this inroad on the rights of the Hindu zamindars is stopped in future. I would never have made such a request but for the fact that Government has itself admitted the principle of communal representation. It will be recalled that in my first speech that I made as a member of the Council I said that Government should not see whether the candidate for a particular appointment is a Hindu or a Muhammadan, an agriculturist or a non-agriculturist and whether he belongs to the rural or urban area but should only judge him on the merits that he possesses. But since the principle of communal representation has been admitted I see no reason why the claims of the Hindu zamindars should be ignored. I have just been told that amongst the Deputy Superintendents of Police there is only one Hindu agriculturist out of 22 agriculturists. The remaining 21 Deputy Superintendents are all Muhammadan agriculturists. Now this is position that no reasonable man should tolerate. I take this opportunity to enter a strong protest against the policy of Government of giving preference to the Muslim zamindars over the Hindu zamindars and I request the honourable mover not to withdraw his motion but to press it to division. With these words I strongly support the motion.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh** [Kangra, (non-Muhammadan), Rural] (Urdu): Sir, I had no intention to speak on this cut but for the last remark which the honourable Home Secretary made in his speech. He was pleased to say that a large share of the posts on the police department or a comparatively large share of these posts had gone to the people of the Kangra district. But it is not a fact and it is to repudiate that statement that I have risen to speak. There are only ten or fifteen Sub-Inspectors and Inspectors of police in the whole of the force who belong to that district and who are agriculturists, and if we were to take into consideration the fact that the people of Kangra district are by nature honest, and hardy, and these are qualifications which make a man best fitted for the police department, and then the population of the zamindars in that district, it will appear that this number is very small. I have met these Sub-Inspectors and Inspectors on several occasions and I know from my personal experience that each one of them is working very hard and very honestly in this department which is known to be a corrupt department. But inspite of that none of them has been promoted to the post of Deputy Superintendent of Police. If I may say so their right has been usurped.

**Deputy President:** After the Council stands adjourned to-day, the non-official member will proceed to hold elections to the standing committees.

The Council then adjourned till 2 P.M. on Friday, the 21st March 1930.

# PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

5TH SESSION OF THE 3RD PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

Friday, the 21st March 1930.

The Council met at the Council Chamber at 2 P. M. of the clock. Mr. President in the Chair.

## STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

### NON-GRADUATE SENIOR CLERK IN THE SECRETARIAT.

**\*2956. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that no non graduate senior clerk was promoted to section A in any of the five vacancies which occurred in the Civil Secretariat during the months of December and January last ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that by restricting the promotion to graduate clerks only two men who were yet officiating in the lower grade and were not ripe for promotion have been unduly benefited ;
- (c) if so, what action Government intend to take to protect the interests of the experienced non-graduate senior clerks in the Secretariat ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) The statutory rules framed under the Government of India Act provide that the minimum qualifications for section A shall, in the case of Indian, be a University Degree, but discretion is given to the Chief Secretary to appoint officers of special ability or aptitude to this class of appointment. This discretion will be exercised in the future as in the past.

### CHANDAR KISHORE, PRISONER.

**\*2957. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** With reference to the answer to question No. 2644 (starred) put on 2nd December 1929, will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether any representation has been made by the ex-civil prisoner to refer the matter to Criminal Investigation Department for enquiry ;
- (b) if so, whether the matter has been so handed over ;
- (c) if the answer to (b) be in the negative will he kindly state reasons or not referring it to the Criminal Investigation Department for enquiry ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) Because there appeared to be no necessity for so doing.

**RATES CHARGED FOR JUNGLE WOOD ON THE SUTLEJ VALLEY  
PROJECT FROM THE TEMPORARY LEASE HOLDERS.**

**\*2958. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** (a) Will the Honourable the Revenue Member be pleased to state the date on which the Forest Department charged rates for jungle wood on the Sutlej Valley Project from temporary lease-holders ?

(b) Will he kindly give the figures showing the Forest Department's earning from such fuel wood on any area dealt with directly by them on the Sutlej Valley Project ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The information required by the honourable member has been called for from the local officers, and a reply will be sent to him as soon as it is ready.

**VALUE OF WOOD CHARGED TO TEMPORARY LEASE-HOLDERS ON THE  
SUTLEJ VALLEY CANAL.**

**\*2959. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable the Revenue Member please state whether the Government is aware that the Forest Department's assessment of value of wood charged to temporary lease-holders on Sutlej Valley Canal were much higher than the amount actually realised by the department in similar conditions ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The comparison sought by the honourable member entails the collection of statistics which are not immediately available. Enquiries are being made, and the result will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

**ACREAGE RATE ON THE LOWER CHENAB CANAL.**

**\*2960. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

(a) whether the collection of the acreage rate is discontinued (in parts at least) on the Lower Bari Doab Canal ;

(b) if so, will the Government be pleased to state the exact position about the acreage rate on the Lower Chenab Canal ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The information is not available at headquarters and has necessitated enquiry being made from the local officers and the result is awaited. The information when received will be communicated to the honourable member.

**PANDIT SIRI RAM SHARMA OF JHAJJAR.**

**\*2961. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Finance Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether the name of Pandit Siri Ram Sharma of Jhajjar, member of the All-India Congress Committee, has been entered in the Police Register No. 10 ;

- (b) if the answer to (a) be in the affirmative, what are the reasons for this action ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

COMPLAINT AGAINST THE PRESIDENT, MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE,  
HANSI.

**\*2962. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that in last summer some citizens of Hansi in the Hissar district complained in writing to the Deputy Commissioner, Hissar, against the President, Municipal Committee, Hansi, for misappropriation of money from municipal funds by showing his *Mukhtar-i-am* as a municipal servant : if so, a copy of the complaint may kindly be laid on the table ;
- (b) whether any enquiry was made into the matter by the Deputy Commissioner, Hissar ;
- (c) whether the allegations made in the complaint were held proved or not ;
- (d) what was the action taken by the Deputy Commissioner against the president on the report of the officer deputed to make an enquiry ;
- (e) whether the complainants were informed of the action taken ; if not, why not ;
- (f) whether it is a fact that there are several other complaints of misappropriation against the said president yet pending with the Deputy Commissioner ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes. A copy of the complaint received in the Deputy Commissioner's office on the 8th August 1929 is laid on the table<sup>1</sup>.

(b) The Deputy Commissioner caused an enquiry to be made into the matter by Khan Sahib Mian Hakim Din, Extra Assistant Commissioner.

(c) Yes.

(d) The president of the committee was warned to be careful in future. As the *Mukhtar-i-am* had been dismissed no further action was considered necessary by the then Deputy Commissioner.

(e) For reasons which are not apparent the complainants were not informed of the action taken by the Deputy Commissioner. The warning was, however, conveyed to the president, and the Commissioner, Ambala Division, was also informed accordingly.

(f) Yes. Some complaints are being enquired into by the Revenue Assistant from whom a final report is still awaited.

<sup>1</sup>Kept in the Library.

## UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

## PUNJAB VETERINARY COLLEGE.

**1674. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to answer to part (b) of Question No. 2585<sup>1</sup> of November 28th, 1929, will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether the Professor is paid for lecturing and teaching the students or for training his Assistant only at the students' expense ;
- (b) how many more years will he require to train his Assistant, and whether it is intended to promote the Assistant to Professorship when he becomes proficient ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The duties of the Professor include those named in the first part of the question, but there is no question of the students' expense ;

(b) The Assistant is trained, his future prospects will come under consideration in due course.

MESSRS. S. M. A. SHAH, S. I. A. SHAH AND S. M. SARWAR OF THE  
PUNJAB CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT.

**1675. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** With reference to the reply given by him to part (2) of unstarred question No. 1832<sup>2</sup> asked on 25th November, 1929, will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Messrs. S. M. A. Shah, S. I. A. Shah and S. M. Sarwar of the Punjab Civil Veterinary Department are fully qualified surgeons holding M. R. C. V. S. Diplomas ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that Mr. S. M. A. Shah is a B. Sc. (Punjab) also ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that the qualifications of these gentlemen are equal to, if not better than, that of the external examiners of the Punjab Veterinary College ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) They are equal in qualifications, but not equal in experience.

MR. READ OF THE GOVERNMENT CATTLE FARM, HISSAR.

**1676. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the case referred to by him in reply to part (b) of starred question No. 2587<sup>3</sup> is that of Mr. Read of the Government Cattle Farm, Hissar ;

<sup>1</sup>Volume XIV, page 399.

<sup>2</sup>Volume XIV, page 282.

<sup>3</sup>Volume XIV, page 409.



- (b) whether is a fact that Mr. Read is not a qualified veterinarian ;
- (c) whether it is also a fact that his promotion has caused great dissatisfaction among the provincial veterinary service officers ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

- (b) Yes. Mr. Read is not engaged on veterinary work.
- (c) Government has no information on this point.

**1677-81. Cancelled.**

#### AREAS RESERVED FOR FOREST AFFORESTATION IN S. V. COLONY.

**1682. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable the Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that lot of areas are being reserved for forest afforestation in S. V. Colony ;
- (b) the relative returns obtained *now* in canal areas in S. V. Colony on the trees as compared with crops in similar areas.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes. Areas of 9,980 acres at Ariwala, 9,845 acres in Divalpur Tahsil and 10,007 acres at Miranpur, all in the non-perennially irrigated area, have recently been allotted to the Forest department.

(b) The comparison asked for is difficult, but it may safely be assumed that the return from forests is less than from agriculture. However, these plantations have as their objects a provision against a threatened paucity of firewood and other wood in the plains owing to the extension of colonization and cultivation and also for meteorological reasons.

#### LOWER BARI DOAB CANAL AND THE LOWER CHENAB CANAL.

**1683. Mian Ahmad Yar Khan, Daultana :** Will the Honourable the Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that when the Lower Bari Doab Canal was started it was intended to supply 1 cusec for 275 acres ;
- (b) whether the Chief Engineer issued any orders some years ago raising the irrigation to 800 acres per cusec ;
- (c) the number of acres required to be irrigated in 1 cusec in the Lower Chenab Canal ;
- (d) whether there is any difference in the land revenue and water-rates charged on the Lower Bari Doab Canal and the Lower Chenab Canal ;
- (e) if so, will he kindly give the figures of the land revenue and the water-rate charged both on the Lower Bari Doab Canal and the Lower Chenab Canal, respectively ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) The Lower Bari Doab Canal was based on a capacity allowance equivalent to 296 acres of gross area per cusec of distributary head capacity.

(b) The present basis of design, excluding special allowances, is 270 acres of culturable commanded area per cusec of distributary head capacity.

(c) On the Lower Chenab Canal the capacity allowance varies; a mean figure for the whole canal is 288 acres of culturable commanded area per cusec of distributary head capacity.

(d) With a few minor differences to meet special circumstances the schedules of rates on the Lower Bari Doab Canal and Lower Chenab Canal are the same. Regarding land revenue reply is in the affirmative.

(e) Does not arise in respect of water-rates. As regards land revenue the necessary statement is placed on the table.

FLUCTUATING LAND REVENUE RATES OF CANAL IRRIGATION AS SANCTIONED.

Name of Canal.	District.	Tahsil.	Amount.	WHETHER ON AREAS	
				Matured.	Sown.
Lower Bari Doab.	Lahore ..	Chunian ..	Rs. A. P. 2 4 0	Matured	..
	Montgomery ..	Okara (Montgomery) ..	2 0 0	Matured	..
	Multan ..	Khanewal ..	2 0 0	Matured	..
Lower Chenab Canal.	Sheikhupura ..	Nankana Sahib—			
		Bar Circle Colony areas ..	5 1 5	..	Sown.
		Rest old estate.. ..	3 1 0	..	..
		Sheikhupura—			
		Old estate Bar Circle ..	3 1 0	..	Sown.
	Gujratwala ..	Colony area, Rakh (Branch) Circle ..	4 12 0	..	Mostly on sown areas and in special cases on matured areas.
		Gogera Branch ..	4 9 5	..	Sown.
		Wazirabad Bangar Circle ..	2 8 0	..	Sown.
		Hafizabad —			
		Bar Circle ..	2 10 0	..	Sown.
	Lyallpur ..	Banjar Circle ..	2 4 0	..	Sown.
		Rakh Branch ..	4 9 0	..	..
		Jhang Branch, Circle I ..	4 15 0	..	..
		Jhang Branch, Circle II ..	4 7 0	..	..
		Jhang Branch, Circle III ..	3 8 3	..	..
		Gogera Branch, Circle I ..	5 1 9	..	..
		Gogera Branch, Circle II ..	4 13 4	..	..
		585-G. B. (Gogera Branch, Circle II).	6 0 0	..	..
		Gogera Branch, Circle III ..	4 5 7	..	..

Name of Canal.	District.	Tahsil.	Amount.	WHETHER OR ARRAS	
				Matured.	Sown.
Lower Chenab Canal— <i>cond.</i>	Lyallpur— <i>cond.</i>	Extensions—	Rs. A. P.		
		(1) Nabra .. ..	4 15 6	..	Mostly sown areas and in special cases on matured areas.
		(2) Nupervali .. ..	4 1 4	..	..
		(3) Dangall .. ..	4 15 2	..	..
		(4) 686-G. B. .. ..	6 0 0	..	..
		(5) 6 Chaks formed out of Rakh Mona.	4 0 0	..	..
		(6) Bahlak .. ..	4 0 10	..	..
		(7) Khillanwala .. ..	4 5 2	..	..
		Proprietary villages ..	3 8 6	..	..
		Gangapur (591)-G. B. ..	6 0 0	..	..
		293-G. B. .. ..	5 8 0	..	..
	Jhang ..	Chinlot—			
		Jhang Branch, Circle I ..	3 1 6	..	..
		Jhang Branch, Circle II ..	3 2 8	..	..
		Jhang—			
		Jhang Branch, Circle II ..	3 2 8	..	..
		Jhang Branch, Circle III ..	2 6 9	..	..
		Shorkot—			
		Jhang Branch, Circle III ..	2 6 9	..	..
		Extension .. ..	3 7 6	..	..

LOWER BARI DOAB CANAL AND THE LOWER CHENAB CANAL.

1634. **Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- whether Rai Sahib Labhu Ram, Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala, is an *ex-officio* President of the Gujranwala Central Co-operative Bank, Gujranwala, as well as that of the Red Cross Society, the Soldiers' Board and the Station Club ;
- whether it is a fact that the three latter institutions have, during his regime, withdrawn their deposits from the Central Co-operative Bank ;
- if so, whether he was present at the time when resolution for withdrawal of the deposits were passed by these institutions ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

LOWER BARI DOAB CANAL AND THE LOWER CHENAB CANAL.

**1685. Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state—

- (a) whether Rai Sahib Labhu Ram, Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala, is the President of the Gujranwala Mortgage Bank, Limited, Gujranwala ;
- (b) whether the entire funds of the said bank are supplied by Government ;
- (c) how many meetings of the Directors were held during his time ;
- (d) how many meetings has he attended ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

GUJRAWALA CENTRAL CO-OPERATIVE BANK, LIMITED, GUJRAWALA,

**1686. Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Agriculture please state the amount of—

- (i) (a) share money ;
- (b) deposits communitywise ;
- (c) Loan due to other banks ;
- (d) profits ; and
- (e) working capital of the Gujranwala Central Co-operative Bank, Limited, Gujranwala ; in the years 1926-27, 1927-28 and 1928-29 ;
- (ii) the number of shareholders communitywise of both societies and individuals of the Gujranwala Central Co-operative Bank, Limited, Gujranwala, and
- (iii) the opinion of the Financial Adviser of the Co-operative Department as regards the working of the said Bank ?

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (i) (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e). The figures required are given in statement (H) of the annual returns furnished to Government at the end of the Annual Report on the Working of the Co-operative Department each year.

Sub-clause (b) of clause (i). The information is not available, and cannot be given as all banks regard as confidential the names, etc., of their depositors.

(ii) The information is not available. It is not communicated to Government.

(iii) The latest opinion of the Financial Adviser was to the effect that the financial condition and the working of the bank are satisfactory.

LAND SOLD BY GOVERNMENT IN THE NEW COLONIES.

**1687. Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) how much land has been sold by Government in all the new colonies from 1921 to 1929 :

(b) how much land has been purchased by non-agriculturists?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) It is not clear what the honourable member actually means by the words "new colonies." However, the total area of Crown waste land sold from 1921 to 1929 in the various canal colonies in the Punjab was 207,152 acres.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer given to part (c) of Council Question No. 1848<sup>1</sup> (unstarred) asked by Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram on the 26th November 1929.

**"ID FESTIVAL" HOLIDAYS OBSERVED IN THE PUNJAB JAILS.**

**1638. Mr. Din Muhammad :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member please state whether the "Id Festival" holidays are observed in the Punjab Jails?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** No.

**MEMORIALS OF COMPOSITORS OF THE GOVERNMENT PRESS, LAHORE.**

**1639. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** With reference to the answer to unstarred question No. 930<sup>2</sup> dated 27th February 1929, will the Honourable the Revenue Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether the Government has since come to any decision;

(b) if so, to what decision has it come;

(c) the reasons for the delay in coming to it?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) and (b) Partly. Certain leave concessions similar to those obtaining in Government of India Presses have been sanctioned.

(c) Government of India Press rules have been undergoing revision. A copy of the revised rules was received less than two months ago and is under examination.

**"NO WORK ALLOWANCE" TO THE PIECE-HAND COMPOSITORS OF THE PUNJAB GOVERNMENT PRINTING PRESS, LAHORE.**

**1630. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable the Revenue Member be pleased to state—

(a) whether any "no work allowance" is paid to the piece-hand compositors of the Punjab Government Printing Press, Lahore;

(b) if not, the reasons for the non-payment of the allowance?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** No.

(b) The honourable member is referred to the answer against (c) of his question No. 1689 above.

<sup>1</sup>Volume XIV, page 349.

<sup>2</sup>Volume XII, page 748.

**GOVERNMENT QUARTERS FOR THE WORKERS OF THE PUNJAB GOVERNMENT PRINTING PRESS, LAHORE.**

**1691. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable the Revenue Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether there are any Government quarters for the workers of the Punjab Government Printing Press, Lahore ;
- (b) if not, whether any house rent is paid to them ;
- (c) if answer to (b) be in the negative, the reasons for the non-payment of the allowance ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) There are no Government quarters for technical employees of the Punjab Government Printing Press.

(b) No.

(c) Because house rent allowance are not paid in any department. If such allowances were given, a corresponding reduction would have to be made in pay.

**ANJUMAN ARA BEGUM FROM THE KINNAIRD HIGH SCHOOL FOR GIRLS, LAHORE.**

**1692. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that one Anjuman Ara Begum won a High School Scholarship from the Kinnaird High School for Girls, Lahore, in 1928 ;
- (b) when was the fact of her so winning the scholarship communicated to her ;
- (c) whether the scholarship was paid to her regularly every month ;
- (d) if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) 1st March 1929. The delay was due to the fact that before sanction for payment of scholarships is issued the middle school results have to be awaited, and the lists of names of those students who have joined a high school have to be scrutinised, and it is frequently necessary to return these lists for further correction.

(c) No.

(d) The honourable member is referred to the reply given to part (b) above.

**ANJUMAN ARA BEGUM, A STUDENT OF IV HIGH CLASS IN THE KINNAIRD HIGH SCHOOL FOR GIRLS, LAHORE.**

**1693. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

- (a) whether one Anjuman Ara Begum, a student of IV High Class in the Kinnaird High School for Girls, Lahore, who is a scholarship holder applied for a School Leaving Certificate ;

(b) if so, whether it is not a fact that scholarship holders' columns in the certificate were left blank so as to show that she was not a scholarship holder ;

(c) the reasons for leaving them blank ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) and (c) The column was so left by an oversight.

#### REVENUE PATWARIS.

**1694. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

(a) whether a revenue patwari is a " Government servant " or a " village servant ; "

(b) if he is a " Government servant," whether he is given all the rights and privileges under the Civil Service Regulations ;

(c) if not, why not ?

(d) if he is a " village servant," then is he allowed (i) to trade, (ii) to raise loan from the people of his own Naqa and (iii) to enjoy all the amenities enjoyed by other village servants, e. g., zaildars, lambardars, etc. ;

(e) if answer to (d) be in the negative, the reasons for it ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) A revenue patwari is a village servant. But some of the rules applicable to Government servants also apply to him.

(b) and (c). Does not arise.

(d) No, he is a whole time village servant.

(e) Because it is in public interest.

#### PROVIDENT FUND FOR THE REVENUE PATWARIS.

**1695. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

(a) when was the Provident Fund for the revenue patwaris sanctioned ;

(b) when were the rules of the Fund sanctioned by the Government of India ;

(c) whether the rules have been brought in force ;

(d) if not, reasons for not bringing them in force ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) 21st January 1930.

(b) 9th August 1927.

(c) Will be brought into force with effect from the 1st April 1930.

(d) Does not arise.

## REGISTRATION OF THE PUNJAB REVENUE PATWARIS' UNION.

**1696. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) when did the Punjab Revenue Patwaris' Union apply for registration under the Indian Trade Union Act ;
- (b) when was the certificate issued ;
- (c) reasons for the delay in issuing it ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) 2nd September 1927.

(b) 7th November 1928.

(c) It was necessary to make certain enquiries in the matter which caused delay.

ALLAH RAKHA, A CLERK IN THE SIMLA DIVISION OF THE PUNJAB  
FOREST DEPARTMENT.

**1697. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that the services of one Allah Rakha, a clerk in the Simla Division of the Punjab Forest Department, were terminated on medical grounds ;
- (b) if so, whether the said Allah Rakha submitted several certificates of fitness by different I. M. S. Civil Surgeons before and after his examination by the Punjab Medical Board ;
- (c) if so, what action has been taken on his submission of those certificates ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) No, Allah Rakha submitted only one certificate of fitness before and one after the examination by the Standing Medical Board.

(c) The decision of the Medical Board is final, and the production of a certificate of fitness does not entitle the producer to further consideration.

ALLAH RAKHA, A CLERK IN THE SIMLA DIVISION OF THE PUNJAB  
FOREST DEPARTMENT.

**1698. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that one Allah Rakha, a clerk in the Simla Division of the Punjab Forest Department, was a permanent hand ;
- (b) if so, whether he was entitled to a long sick leave in accordance with the Fundamental Rules ;
- (c) if so, whether such leave was granted to him ;
- (d) if not, why not ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) and (d) Do not arise.



## PUNITIVE POLICE AT KHEWRA.

**1699. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that a punitive police has been ordered to be located at Khewra, district Jhelum ;

(b) if so, what are the reasons ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Yes.

(b) The misconduct of the inhabitants as shown by the number of crimes committed in the village, of crimes traced to the village and of persons whom it has been necessary to place under police surveillance.

## HAISIAT TAX ON THE MINERS OF THE KHEWRA SALT MINE.

**1700. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that Haisiat Tax has been levied on the miners of the Khewra Salt Mine ;

(b) if so, whether (i) the General Manager of the mines, (ii) the Labour Union, Khewra Salt, have protested against the levying of the tax ;

(c) if so, what action has been taken on their representations ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The necessary information is being collected, and will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

## REVENUE PATWARIS.

**1701. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing the number of the revenue patwaris of (i) first grade, (ii) second grade, (iii) third grade, (iv) fourth grade in each of (a) the tahsils and (b) districts of the Punjab on the first of January of each of the last 5 years ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Information is not readily available. Inquiries are being made and a complete answer will be submitted when ready.

## REVENUE PATWARIS.

**1702. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing the number of the revenue patwaris promoted to (i) Girdawarship, (ii) Wasil Baqi Nawisship, (iii) Siyah Nawisship, (iv) Moharrir Judicialship, (v) Sub-Inspectorship of Co-operative Societies and (vi) other Zilla posts in each of the districts of the Punjab during each of the last 5 years ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** The information is not collected in the usual course, and the amount of time and labour involved in its collection will not be commensurate with the advantages to be gained by it.

## REVENUE PATWARIS.

**1703. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Member for Revenue be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing the percentage of the candidates in the Tahsil and Zilla offices taken from the Revenue Patwaris in each of the districts of the Punjab during each of the last 5 years ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## REVENUE PATWARIS.

**1704. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** With reference to the answer to question No. 2644<sup>1</sup> (starred) put on the 2nd December 1929, will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is not a fact that the history ticket of the *ex-civil* prisoner bore—

(i) an entry, dated 15th July 1929, in the handwriting of the Superintendent, Jail, Multan, to the effect that the applications to Deputy Commissioners, Multan and Lahore, were allowed ;

(ii) an entry, dated 24th July 1929, to the effect that the applications were despatched ;

(iii) an entry, dated 2nd September 1929, to the effect that reminders as regards the applications to the Deputy Commissioners, Multan and Lahore were allowed ;

(iv) an entry, dated 7th September 1929 to the effect that the reminders were despatched ;

(b) if answer to (a) be in the affirmative, will he be pleased to lay on the table copies of the applications and reminders ;

(c) what action has been taken on the applications ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** I regret that the answer to this question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member when ready.

## GOVERNMENT AND QUASI-GOVERNMENT SERVANTS.

**1705. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Chief Secretary be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that all Government and *quasi-Government* servants have been ordered not to approach any member of the Punjab Legislative Council with a view to put their grievances before him or to bring to his notice any irregularity or injustice done by any officer or to supply him any information even if it is of a non-confidential nature ;

(b) if so, what are the reasons for this order ;

(c) will he be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the order ?

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) In 1923 it was brought to the notice of members of the clerical and ministerial establishments that the disclosure

to non-officials of information obtained from official sources or which has come into the possession of a Government servant in the course of his official duties is a breach of rule 17 of the Government Servants' Conduct Rules, and that such a breach would be severely dealt with. In 1928 similar notice was given to members of all services.

(b) In the interests of the public service.

(c) No.

---

MISS UMAR BAKHSH, DISTRICT INSPECTRESS OF SCHOOLS OF SIALKOT DISTRICT.

**1706. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that one Miss Umar Bakhsh has been appointed as District Inspectress of Schools of Sialkot district ;

(b) if so, what are her educational qualifications ;

(c) whether it is not a fact that she is merely a Vernacular Middle Pass ;

(d) whether it is not a fact that she does not know English ;

(e) reasons for her appointment ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) and (c) She has passed the Middle School Examination and holds a Senior Vernacular Certificate. She also knows Urdu, Hindi and Punjabi.

(d) No.

(e) It is not in the public interest to state the reasons for any particular appointment.

---

LIST OF THE DISTRICT INSPECTRESSES OF SCHOOLS IN THE PUNJAB.

**1707. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to lay on the table a list of the District Inspectresses of Schools in the Punjab together with their qualifications, dates of appointment and their salaries ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** The requisite information is being collected, and will be supplied to the honourable member when received.

---

GRANT-IN-AID TO THE KINNAIRD HIGH SCHOOL FOR GIRLS, LAHORE.

**1708. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

(a) whether the Kinnaird High School for Girls, Lahore, is given grant-in-aid by the Government ;

(b) if so, what is the amount of the grant ;

(c) since when the grant is given to the school ;

(d) what is the total amount of the grant paid to it so far ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) Rs. 7,739 (from provincial revenues for the current financial year). The amount varies from year to year.

(c) and (d) The information is being collected and will be supplied to the honourable member when ready.

---

**FEES FROM THE NON-CHRISTIAN STUDENTS OF THE KINNAIRD HIGH SCHOOL FOR GIRLS, LAHORE.**

**1709. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Education be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the non-Christian students of the Kinnaird High School for Girls, Lahore, are charged fees at a much higher rate than the Christian ones ;

(b) if so, will he kindly lay a statement on the table showing the rates of fees charged from (i) the Christian and (ii) the non-Christian students of each of the classes of the school ;

(c) the reasons for the disparity of the rates of the fees ?

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) Yes.

(b) The required information is being collected, and will be supplied to the honourable member when received.

(c) The school is supported by mission funds, as well as by the grant, so charges extra for non-Christian students, who are freely admitted, but for whom the school was not primarily started.

---

**HAIKIAT TAX IN THE MUNICIPAL COMMITTEES AND DISTRICT BOARDS.**

**1710. Mr. M. A. Ghani :** Will the Honourable Minister for Local Self-Government be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing the names of—

(a) the Municipal Committees, and

(b) the District Boards of the Punjab which have levied the HaiKIAT Tax on—

(i) Government servants drawing less than Rs. 40 a month ;

(ii) Quasi-Government servants drawing less than Rs. 40 a month ;

(iii) Factory workers ;

(iv) Tailors ;

(v) Barbers ; and

(vi) other professional men ?

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** A statement giving the required information is attached :—

A (Municipal Committee).	B (District Boards).
(i) and (ii) None ..	<div style="display: flex; align-items: center;"> <div style="flex: 1;"> <p>(i) Ambala, Attock, Dera Ghazi Khan, Karnal, Montgomery, Sialkot, Gurdaspur, Amritsar, Jhang,</p> <p>(ii) to (vi) as against (i) above, <i>plus</i> Mianwali.</p> </div> <div style="flex: 1; font-size: 3em; padding: 0 10px;">}</div> <div style="flex: 1;"> <p>But only in cases in which the annual income of the persons concerned exceeded Rs. 400.</p> </div> </div>
(iii) to (vi) Gujrat ..	

**PROCEEDINGS AGAINST AN HONORARY MAGISTRATE OF AMRITSAR.**

**1711. Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Will the Honourable the Finance Member be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that an Honorary Magistrate of Amritsar had been proceeded with departmentally for corrupt practices and his magisterial powers were withdrawn ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that the said Honorary Magistrate still holds certain other Honorary jobs, and he is also a sub-registrar ;
- (c) if so, will the honourable member be pleased to state the reasons for taking action against him as referred to in part (a) ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a), (b) and (c) The powers of one Honorary Magistrate have not been renewed pending the result of certain enquiries which have been instituted by Government.

**DISMISSAL OF GAJJAN SINGH, SUFEDPOSH.**

**1712. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Revenue Member please state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that some of the cases were *sub judice* when the order of dismissal of Gajjan Singh, sufedposh, tahsil Sirsa, district Hissar, was passed ;
- (b), if the answer to (a) be in the affirmative, what were the findings of the original and the appellate courts in respect of these charges ?

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** It is regretted that the reply to this Council question is not yet ready. It will be communicated to the honourable member in due course.

## HONORARY MAGISTRATES.

**1713. Lala Joti Parshad :** Will the Honourable Member for Finance be pleased to state—

- (a) whether it is a fact that Government have issued any instructions forbidding Honorary Magistrates to exercise powers in areas in which they own property or have relations ;
- (b) whether it is a fact that certain Honorary Magistrates in the Karnal district exercise magisterial powers in Ilakas in which they own property or have relations ;
- (c) if so, what action Government intend to take in the matter ?

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

(b) Yes.

(c) None.

APPRECIATION OF THE SERVICES OF THE HONOURABLE  
MIAN SIR FAZL-I-HUSAIN.

**Mr. President :** Gentlemen, all of you are aware that the distinguished Leader of this House, the Honourable Sir Fazl-i-Husain, is going to lay down the reins of his high office after a few days. Perhaps this is the last day on which he is sitting in this House as a member of this Council. The great ability and tact with which he has guided, not only this Council but, if I may say so, the destinies of the reformed Punjab for the last nine years are too well known to require any mention from me. As Minister for Education for the long period of five years, and thereafter, as the Revenue Member, Punjab, and as the Leader of this House, he has proved, even to his critics, that he is a statesman of high order and a politician of great merit and distinction. Now that he is being translated to a higher sphere of service to the country, I am sure all of you would wish to express your appreciation of the services of your parting friend and distinguished leader. I have no doubt that all of you will pay tribute to the best and the ablest Punjabee who has worked and run the reforms in the Land of the Five Rivers so successfully and efficiently. (*Hear, hear*).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh** (Minister for Agriculture) : Sir, I wish to associate myself, on behalf of myself and my colleagues, with all that you have said in regard to Sir Fazl-i-Husain. He came to the helm of affairs just when the new Government was started aiming at the transference of power to the elected representatives of the people. It was a great adventure and a new experiment which required high statesmanship in its earlier stages to make that transfer of power a reality. Sir Fazl-i-Husain, and his friend Lala Harkishan Lal, made the best use of their opportunities and were able to lay down the foundations; this House can now go on gathering power and attain provincial autonomy. I have no hesitation in saying that the foundations of our representative institution have now been well and truly laid. This House has, under the guidance of Sir Fazl-i-Husain, established conventions and traditions and done constructive work which is the envy of other provinces. Government on the transferred

side has been engaged in giving people a better education, organizing Agriculture, Industries, Co-operation, and Medical relief; a start has been made, and I hope in no remote time, it will solve our economic problems: not only solve our economic problems, but also fulfil all the high aspirations which inspire our most advanced politicians that our Province should become self-governing knitting all the communities together into a united nation. I need hardly dwell in detail on the work which Sir Fazl-i-Husain has accomplished from day to day. The high encomiums that he has received from many quarters need no repetition from me. All that I need say on behalf of myself and my colleagues is that we wish him Godspeed and a period of great usefulness in the Government of India which, I am sure, he will adorn as he had adorned this Council. (*Cheers*).

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** (Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana (Muhammadan), Rural) (Urdu) : Sir I, as a member of the opposition party, feel, and in fact, have been feeling from the very beginning, that it was a matter of great pride for the Council to have a very able and very capable member in the person of the Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain. You will come across with very few men of his ability (*Hear, hear*). He is the first Punjabi on whom the heavy responsibility of the reformed Government and the reformed Council had fallen, and I need hardly say that he proved more than equal to the occasion. The beginning of a thing is always very difficult and more so, of important things, but in spite of the difficulties of his position, Sir Fazl-i-Husain discharged his duties very creditably as if he was already trained in parliamentary procedure and had been conversant with parliamentary tactics. Now, when the precedents have been established and the way has been cleared, even a man of ordinary intelligence can do all that appeared to be very difficult in the beginning. We are very much indebted to the very valuable lead that he has been giving us. To his credit will also stand, besides other things, the coming into existence of the Unionist Party of the Council which, I have no hesitation in admitting, has its very sound and very useful principles, although some of us cannot agree to them under the present circumstances of the country and the province. Time will come when these principles will have to be followed. The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain has been a true leader of the House, and has chalked out the best way for us. I shall be failing in my duty if I do not admit that his predecessors too have done us a great service, although there have been differences of opinion between them and the opposition. I am sure that those differences of opinion will continue for some time to come. I am particularly grateful to them all for the encouragement which the opposition has been receiving at their hands. Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain has been more liberal in this respect and he, on one occasion, was pleased to say that no parliamentary Government can satisfactorily work without the help of a strong and honest opposition. There have been occasions when hot words have been exchanged between the Government and the opposition, but, if I may say so, such breezes are necessary to drive away the dull monotony of the debates and to keep our interest alive in them. Without them the gall-ries will also remain vacant. I and my friends are sorry over his departure from amongst us, but we are also happy that he is going to occupy a more exalted position in the central legislature where, I am sure, his

[ Ch. Afzal Haq.]

presence will be more useful to the country in general, and to the Punjab in particular.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** [South East Rohtak, (non-Muhammadan) Rural] : Sir, Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain has been associated with the Punjab Government and with this House since the introduction of the Reforms. For the last ten years he has led a very vigorous political life, a life which has been full of usefulness to his province and to his country. He is a very practical politician and a very successful administrator. He is not only a politician and an administrator, he is a far-sighted statesman. He has given ample proofs of possessing all these qualities to which I have made a reference just now. So far as this House is concerned, and so far as his activities in this House are concerned, I think that all will agree without any dissentient voice that he is one of the most finished speakers and a perfect parliamentarian. We who have listened to his speeches, who have heard him speak in this House, know full well how he can use the art of speaking in a most effective manner. Sometimes he would cajole you, sometimes he would adopt a stern attitude, and, if necessary, he would again drop into the mode of sweet reasoning. I think there is nobody in this House who knows better than himself the art of persuading to his own view the exceptionally intelligent audience which has to be tackled in this House. On many occasions when the vote of the House seemed to be going one way, it has been brought right round to the other side in consequence of his masterly speeches. Now, he is leaving the province, he is leaving this House. In a way we are glad that he is being translated to a higher sphere of life, to a much wider field. But his departure really causes a gap not only on Government benches, not only in this House, but in the province as a whole which it will be very, very difficult indeed to fill. To be frank, there do not seem to be any reasonable prospects of this gap being filled in the near future, and it is from this point of view that his departure is a source of great grief and a source of great embarrassment to all his friends. I have known him for the last six years. I have worked with him as his colleague, and I have worked under him as a follower in the party. I have always found him to be a most skilful leader and a most reliable guide in all spheres of life where business of the greatest possible importance has to be transacted. Whether you apply to him the test of friendship or the test of leadership or any other test with reference to which a public man could be judged, you would find that he is one of the rarest specimens of publicists produced by this province. We are all proud of him, and we pray that when he goes to a higher sphere in the central Government he will shine just as brightly as he has done here and even more brightly than he has done here.

**Pandit Nanak Chand** [Hoshiarpur (non-Muhammadan), Rural] : Sir, I must confess that we are taken by surprise by your suddenly starting speeches on this occasion to bid farewell to Sir Fazl-i-Husain. Had we got information on this point perhaps our party would have come to some conclusion whether to stay here and listen to the praises of Sir Fazl-i-Husain or whether we should have been well advised to keep away from this function as well, as we have kept away from other functions of political nature arranged in his honour. Sir, it is an unpleasant thing to say unpleasant things on the occasion of a farewell. I whole-heartedly associate myself



with the gentlemen who have praised the great ability, the eminent and high intellectual powers which Sir Fazl-i-Husain possesses. There is not the least doubt, not even his bitterest enemy will say, that he is not a man of high intellectual calibre, and that his powers of speech and debate are unequalled and unrivalled in this House. We, Sir, sitting on opposition benches, criticising his policy, when he was a Minister of Education and when he was holding portfolios of different transferred departments, we have felt the vigour of his logic and the marshalling of his facts; and he has been able to advance arguments which very often put us in very great disadvantage. Therefore, when I have to say something with regard to his policy as a Minister or a Member in charge of the Revenue department, when I have to criticise his policy and dissociate ourselves from the policy that he has pursued, it should not be understood that I am underrating the intellectual and other powers which have really made him a great figure in the history of the Punjab during the last ten years. But, Sir, I would be untrue to my community and to the various protests that have, on more occasions than one, been made by that community here in the Council and outside, protesting against the policy which was either the painful or the pleasant duty of Sir Fazl-i-Husain to follow if I did not at this time also strike a note of difference. You would be pleased to remember that in the first Council the Hindus and the Sikh members joined in a vote of censure against him because they did not approve of his policy. In the second Council, the Hindus and the Sikh members walked out as a protest when His Excellency the Governor came to give his address here on the opening of the second Council. I was one of those who had to join in that protest because I wanted to be true to the party to which I belonged and true to the community which I have the honour to represent. Sir, you are also aware that in the Punjab, on various occasions, *hartals* took place because the Hindus did not see eye to eye with him in matters of policy. You are also aware that here when it was thought by some members to organise a farewell dinner party on behalf of the members of the Council, the Hindu members refused to join to give such a farewell party lest any political significance be attached to that function. Sir, if the Hindus of this province have got a grudge, it is on account of the policy which has been the misfortune of Sir Fazl-i-Husain to follow. It may be due to the constitution of the Council, Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs being represented by separate electorates, it may be that it was forced on him and he was compelled to follow this policy on account of the present constitution. It may be that he felt that he could serve his community better by following his communal policy. It is not for me to go into the motives of these questions at this time and on this occasion. But I can tell you openly and frankly that the Hindus of this province, and especially the members of our party, have held many consultations and have tried to give expression to their feelings of resentment and annoyance at the policy pursued by Sir Fazl-i-Husain, and if they had been nervous then, they are nervous even now when he is being translated to a higher sphere and when we are on the eve of great Reforms, that this outlook of Sir Fazl-i-Husain may not in any way injure the great national cause when he and other members of the Executive Council of His Excellency the Viceroy will be called upon to debate and ponder over the proposals regarding constitutional changes. We are nervous, the Hindus of the province are nervous, and there is no use hiding the

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

fact. This matter has been debated by us on various occasions. We pray, Sir, that somehow or other, in this unfortunate country, divided as it is, on religious and sectional basis of caste and religion, that there may come some light, some sort of inspiration, to those who feel communally and think communally, that they will give up this communal outlook when they are dealing with the great problems that are coming before India. Sir, as I have said already, we have been forced to give utterance to these unpleasant words mainly because it is my duty as a Hindu and as a member of the party. We cannot possibly endorse his communal policy. We must record our dissent. But, as I have said, I join with all the members who have spoken before me in paying a tribute to his great intellectual powers and the manner in which he has dealt with the members of his own party or other parties in debate and in discussion. That tribute he rightly deserves and, I and my party have not the least hesitation in paying it to him.

**Sardar Sahib Sardar Ujjal Singh** [Sikh, (Urban)]: Sir, it is rather a pity that my honourable friend Pandit Nanak Chand has sought an occasion like this to give expression to his difference of opinion on the policy of Sir Fazl-i-Husain (*Hear, hear*). That difference of opinion he and his party have been expressing time without number, and I should have thought that this would not have been an occasion on which he should have given vent to his views. Sir Fazl-i-Husain is admittedly a unique personality (*Hear, hear*). He is an intellectual giant, and a formidable debater. He is by far the best parliamentarian on this side of India, and during the last eight or nine years, he has proved himself a most powerful administrator as well. However one may differ from his policy, and difference of opinion there must always be, admittedly there is no single individual in this province who has anything but admiration for his statesmanship, for his great gifts of oratory, for his parliamentary gifts and many other gifts which are not combined in any single individual in this province. We wish him godspeed in the great work that is entrusted to him in the Government of India, and we do hope that he will not forget his own province which he has tried to serve to the best of his ability. (*Applause*).

**Mr. V. F. Gray** [Punjab Chamber of Commerce and Trades Association, Commerce]: Sir, I wish to associate myself with the appreciation of various members who have already spoken of the work of Sir Fazl-i-Husain, the Leader of the House, and offer him my best wishes in his future activities. Last night he attributed most of his success to luck. I have often heard Dame Fortune being either lauded for success or condoned for want of success. Luck everybody has, some appear to have more than others, but I myself consider luck is generally the ability or faculty of seizing one's opportunities, and I think the Leader of the House is a past master in that. He is one of the few, if not the foremost, of Indians who have taken advantage of the reforms and seen some good in them, however small they are, and has worked them whole-heartedly with a view to increasing the power and prosperity of his country and province, and I have every confidence that he will continue to do so when he goes to still higher spheres, and I feel sure he will continue to help this province to hold its own with any other province in India in consequence of his increased opportunities. I once more associate

myself with every word of appreciation already offered him and wish him the best of luck, as years roll on.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan** [Sialkot (Muhammadan, Rural)]: Sir, I have no desire to repeat the high words of praise that have been bestowed from all quarters of the House upon Sir Fazl-i-Husain, both with regard to the very high qualifications that he possesses and the work that he has done for the province during the last ten years, which he more than fully deserves. All that has been said before brings out but insufficiently the outstanding merits possessed by Sir Fazl-i-Husain in such an unequalled, unrivalled and unprecedented degree. The keenness of the pain that one already feels at the impending separation is such that one is unable to put in coherent language all the emotions that are stirred up in one's mind over the approaching loss. Perhaps the highest compliment that I can pay to Sir Fazl-i-Husain from the purely personal point of view is, that for the first time during the last three years, I feel myself at a loss as to how to choose my words and in what manner to express the emotions that I feel. To me, Sir, when I entered this Council as a novice at a comparatively young age, Sir Fazl-i-Husain has constantly furnished a bright and shining example of the highest sense of and devotion to duty. That is perhaps the outstanding feature of his manifold and brilliant qualities that has appealed to me most, to put duty above every personal consideration of comfort, convenience, and everything else that might contribute to happiness and pleasure. Sir, the irony of the situation is that it is those very qualities which have won for Sir Fazl-i-Husain the devoted attachment and the sincere affection of so many, that are now taking him away from us. One feels, perhaps, that if he had not possessed those qualities in such a high degree, we might still have been able to retain him. That is, no doubt, an uncharitable thing to say from the public point of view, but perhaps that is a natural feeling from the purely personal and individual and, in a sense, selfish point of view. Sir, at this moment, I at least feel no consolation in the fact that in being separated from us, Sir Fazl-i-Husain will have opened to him wider fields of activity and higher spheres of work in which his qualities are bound to shine more brilliantly than they have done in this province. At present, the sense of personal loss overshadows every other consideration of a brighter nature which might perhaps be involved in the situation. As time goes on, one might be able to derive consolation from a contemplation of the brilliant series of successes which are certainly in store for Sir Fazl-i-Husain in the Government of India. At present, all that I have to submit is that our sense of loss is too keen for expression in ordinary words.

**Mr. Owen Roberts** [Non-official, nominated]: I desire to associate myself, on behalf of the community that I represent, with all the appreciation of Sir Fazl-i-Husain that we have heard to-day. It was for the first time two or three days ago that I heard fall from his lips a statement of his policy and the aims and ambitions that he had for the province, and I desire to take this opportunity of stating in public something that I should like to have stated in a previous session of this Council, that is, that, having been given an opportunity of carefully weighing the policy of his party, I found that I could only side with those whom Sir Fazl-i-Husain represents. He has thrown a new complexion into our politics if only his opponents

[Mr. Owen Roberts.]

would look at it fairly. This new complexion was noted by no less an observer than Sir John Maynard who forecasted that, in future, political divisions in this province would take on the character of rural and urban divisions, and as I claim to be a practical person, I saw no other way then, and I see none now, since subsequent reflection has confirmed my previously formed views, than to side with the party that he has led. I can add no more, Sir, than to say that these views are the result of conviction and on behalf of the community that I represent, I express my appreciation of his services to this province.

**Mr. E. Maya Das** [Non-official, nominated]: Sir, as has been remarked, on an occasion like this it is extremely difficult to find suitable words in which to express one's thoughts. I fully associate myself with all that has been spoken in praise of Sir Fazl-i-Husain. I sometimes ask myself, in what does greatness lie. Sir, I think greatness consists in being humble, in being patient, in politeness, and in being willing to see the other man's point of view. Sir Fazl-i-Husain has always, on all occasions, when I had anything to do with him, shown himself to be a great man to me. There are at times small matters such as a letter which is written, and he has always been very prompt in taking notice of it and replying to letters. I cannot help thinking of the many occasions during the past 6½ years that I have sat here when the Council was in difficulties. Sometimes the difficulty was one of excitement, and it was Sir Fazl-i-Husain who poured oil over troubled waters. Sometimes the difficulty was of darkness, and we could not see our way and he brought light and showed us the way in which we should walk. For all his services, on behalf of the community that I have the honour to represent, I congratulate him most sincerely. In the English language we find certain names ending in son, for instance such names as Gregson and Polson. With your permission, I would like to say that our Sir Fazl-i-Husain is Punjab's son. He is the son of the Punjab and we are all of us proud of this great son of our land. Our prayer is that he may recover his health completely, that he may receive strength, that his life may be spared for many years to come to guide the country, and specially our province, in the days to come.

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow** [Finance Member]: Sir, on behalf of Government and of the official benches I should like to voice our most sincere appreciation of the services rendered to this province by Sir Fazl-i-Husain, the Leader of the House, who is all too soon to leave this Council. As Leader of the House, as Revenue Member of this Government, as a patriot and statesman, as a worker of untiring energy and unshaken judgment, and as a friend to all of us, we shall miss him more than words can say. We know, however, that though he will soon be no longer working with us, he will follow all we do with his old keen interest. His place can best be filled by his return, if that were possible. (*Hear, hear*). But, if that is not possible, it can next best be filled by that interest of his in this House and in this province which we all know will never slacken. (*Cheers*).

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain** (Revenue Member): Sir I find some difficulty in responding to the good wishes that have been expressed on this occasion from every part of the House. I am fully conscious of my shortcomings and of my failings. I must have more than once swerved

from the course which I ought to have pursued, and I trust any member who may have had an occasion to feel that I have not been fair to him will forgive me for that lapse.

As regards this Council's work, I may say that I was a member of the Punjab Legislative Council of the pre-reform days, and then constituted a very insignificant and poor little opposition to the then Government. There were occasions when my vote was the only vote recorded in opposition (*Hear, hear*). So, naturally I have had a soft heart for the opposition in this Council (*Laughter*). I believe, even though I constituted a very small and insignificant opposition in those days, still I did my duty. I believe there is but one non-official member and perhaps one official member present who were members of the pre-reform Council. All others, whether officials or non-officials, have gradually left the scene of their legislative activities.

It is really remarkable that, within the space of ten years, if I may say so, a revolution has been effected in the deliberations of the Legislative Council. His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor used to occupy the chair, Sir, that you are occupying now. We are really, no doubt, very much subject to the authority of your rulings, but honourable members can easily realise, especially those who took part in the debate relating to district boards, that it did require some nerve to constitute an opposition in those days. Now, this Council has powers, authority, privileges and rights which the non-official members of those days, most of them, hardly dreamt of. I trust that in the new legislative council after the next reforms the rights and privileges of members would be even greater than those enjoyed by this Council.

Sir, it is really this subject that is taking me away from the scene of my activities where I have been perfectly happy in my work and which I leave with very great regret indeed. I am grateful, I repeat once more, for the very kind words that fell from the members to-day. I am most thankful for the very kind words that my friend, Pandit Nanak Chand, expressed about me personally. He thought it necessary to safeguard the interests of his party, lest his appreciation of my person may be construed as giving up the opposition to certain views or policies of mine. I assure him that in politics no institution like a Legislative Council can exist wherein different persons will not take different views. The very essence of representative institutions, the very essence of parliamentary form of government, is that there must be parties. There must be two schools of thought, and if they do not exist, we will go back to the benevolent despotism or benevolent autocracy or the wonderful age of the past when the Badshahs or the Maharajas were supreme and omnipotent. I have, however, to point out to Pandit Nanak Chand that although he has said that his party has been opposed to my policy, still, if the division lists in the proceedings of this Legislative Council of the last four or five years are examined, it will be found that he and I went into the same lobby more often than not (*Hear, hear*). So, after all, there are more points in common between us than there are on which we differ. Moreover, I have in the past, before the reforms, had the confidence of the entire Hindu community of the province, and it is but natural that I cannot now be quite satisfied.

[Hon'ble Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain.]

with having the confidence of only a part of it. I, however, look forward to the day when I will once more enjoy that confidence even though it may be after leaving the work that I have to do in the Government of India (*Hear, hear*). Once more, Sir, I wish, if you permit me, to repeat my gratefulness to you for the great consideration you have invariably shown to me in the discharge of my duties. I wish I could have remained in this Council to usher forth the new council and to take my place in that council. But, as I say, if I can be of more assistance to the province in giving it a better council than it has at present, I trust honourable members will not attribute my departure to any selfish considerations on my part.

#### GOVERNMENT'S DEMANDS FOR GRANTS.

POLICE—(*continued*).

**Chaudhri Ram Singh** (Kangra, Non-Muhammadan, Rural), (Urdu): Sir, I was saying when the Council adjourned yesterday that some Sub-Inspectors and Inspectors who are residents of the Kangra district have not received the promotions which they deserved and that their rights have been usurped. Now I come to the Deputy Superintendents of Police. There are 52 incumbents in that cadre, but the number of Hindus amongst them is no more than 8, out of which only one happens to be an agriculturist. I beg to submit, Sir, that those people of my district to whom the honourable member Mr. Ogilvie was pleased to refer are fully competent to discharge the duties of not only Deputy Superintendent, but higher offices as well and, therefore, there is no earthly reason why they should not get the same chances as are offered to other people. There is no gainsaying the fact that not only the Hindu agriculturists but the whole Hindu community is very poorly represented in the police department.

Now my honourable friend Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram champions the cause of agriculturists, and I also claim the same honour. But, Sir, there is a big difference in our view-points with regard to the means of attaining our object. He wants that Hindu non-agriculturists should be deprived of what they have got in order to make room for agriculturists while, in my opinion, the right course is to claim back the rights of Hindus that have been usurped by other communities and then, to give the Hindus as a whole agriculturists their due share out of them. The consolidated statements showing the representation of various communities in different departments shows that in the police department there are 4,529 officers above the rank of constables, out of which only 1,095 happen to be Hindus and 2,915 are Mussalmans. This means that Mussalmans have got nearly 65 per cent. of posts in those cadres. And then, as regards constables, there are 18,085 of them in the province, out of which 18,531 are Musalmans while the number of Hindus is no more than 3,473. These figures show that here the Mussalmans enjoy more than 75 per cent. representation. It may be said that non-agriculturist Hindus do not care to apply for the posts of constables, but I can say without any fear of contradiction that Hindu agriculturists are quite prepared to work as constables and you can get as many candidates from amongst them as may be required without much difficulty. Therefore, my honourable friend should press on the Government the claims

of Hindus and thus try to get for Hindu agriculturists their due share in the police department. May I ask, Sir, whether he has ever cared to look upon the matter from that point of view?

Then, coming to direct recruitment for the posts of Inspectors of Police, we find that during the last seven years not a single Hindu has been given that benefit. Here, again, I must say that my honourable friend has never drawn the attention of the Government to the injustice that is being done to Hindus in general, and to Hindu agriculturists in particular.

A reference has been made to the Kangra district and, therefore, I may be allowed to draw your attention to the services rendered by the people of that district to the Crown and country during the Great War. No fair-minded person can deny the fact that they helped the Government with men and money to the utmost of their capacity. To get a clear and exact idea of their services you have only to go to our post offices and there you will find thousands of young widows coming to get their pensions. But, in spite of that, no attention is paid to the claims of these people at the time of direct recruitment for the posts of Inspectors of Police, etc. When His Excellency Sir Malcolm Hailey paid a visit to Dharmasala, an address was presented to him by the Rajput Asthaniya Sabha in which his attention was drawn to the fact that, Rajputs of Kangra were not getting their due share of Government services. In reply to that His Excellency was pleased to remark that it would be the most unfortunate day when the services of those brave people would be forgotten or ignored, and he promised to accord due consideration and weight to their claims in future. But I regret to say, Sir, that that promise has not been redeemed up to this day.

Now, I draw your attention to another situation. My remarks may prove unpalatable to some honourable members as well as to some others outside the Council, but I can say without any fear of contradiction that their veracity is beyond dispute. It cannot be denied, Sir, that Mussalmans are the most favoured community in this province. They are enjoying the patronage of the Government while other communities have to be contented with as much as may conveniently fall to their share. First, they get the greater part of every benefit on the basis of their population and then come to demand a good bit of the Hindu's share as agriculturists. In this way Hindus are being ousted from a good many departments. Therefore, while strongly supporting the amendment moved by the honourable member for South-East Rohtak (Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram) I would draw his attention to this glaring injustice.

Every one of us is aware that wherever there was paucity of Mussalmans special arrangements were made to make up the deficiency in their representation. For some time, the doors of some departments were closed upon other communities and in others, the Government went so far as to dispense with the services of non-Muslim officials in order to make room for Mussalmans. Not only that. Even in connection with admission to the Medical College special facilities were provided to Mussalmans and the lot of the non-Muslim candidates was made even harder than before. Nay, even a good many Hindu doctors were dismissed from service. Now, Sir, if that was a wise and just policy, then why not follow it in the police department as well? In view of the special privileges given to the Mussalmans in other



[Ch. Ram Singh.]

departments where they were not properly represented, it is but just and fair that the recruitment of Mussalmans should be stopped until the deficiency in the Hindu representation is made up in the police department. Let my honourable friend, the mover of this amendment, urge upon the Government the necessity and advisability of following that policy in the police department if he really wants to do something for Hindu agriculturists. There is no use raising the agriculturist *versus* non-agriculturist controversy with regard to a department in which we Hindus, as a whole, have not got any adequate representation. Let us first try to get our due share which has been usurped by others and then we will see that we agriculturists get our own share out of it. With these remarks, I support the amendment moved by Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram although, as I have already stated, there is a great difference in our view-points with regard to the matter.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq** (Hoshiarpur-cum-Ludhiana, Muhammadan, Rural), (Urdu): Sir, I am really very glad to see that the honourable member from Kangra has rightly emphasised the point that all communities should be properly represented in various branches of Government service and where a community is not so represented, steps should be taken to provide for its reasonable representation. Certainly there can be no two opinions on that point. In fact, it is not at all advisable that at this juncture, when the country is confronted with a very serious situation, we should be at daggers drawn with each other only on the question of the distribution of loaves and fishes. Of course, there can be no objection if one moves an amendment with a view to bring to the notice of the Government the grie-

3 P.M.  
vances which a community or a section of the people have got against the administration. But, on the other hand, it is most objectionable for one to avail oneself of this opportunity for directing attacks against another community. So far as the question of proper representation of each community in public services is concerned, I think all communities are agreed that the present inequitable and unjust distribution of services should no longer be permitted to continue. Obviously, there can be no objection to this reasonable request. But it appears that Government prefers to do things half way so that inter-communal warfare and jealousy may still continue and it may also be able to act upon its old policy of divide and rule. If that were not the case, the Government would have at once complied with our request. In fact, it does not like to heal the running sore. The honourable member on the other side of the House has complained of the paucity of Hindus in the police department. I think he has not seen this statement. If he had seen it, he would not have remarked that during the last seven years no Hindu was appointed as an Inspector of Police.

**Pandit Nanak Chand**: Yes, no direct appointment was made.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq**: In my opinion, direct or indirect appointment makes no difference. Let us look to the actual facts and figures. I think the honourable member is either ignorant of the real facts and figures or else, he has not chosen to be tolerant in his attitude. Sir, if we look at this statement, we find that the number of Muhammadan Inspectors is 31.8 per cent. while their population is 56 per cent. and the number of Hindu Inspec-



tors is 84 per cent. while their population is 80 per cent. This shows that Hindus have got more than what is their due and that it is the Muhammadans, not the Hindus, who ought to have complained of their inadequate representation in the rank of Inspectors of Police. Again, Sir, the number of Muhammadan Deputy Superintendents of Police is 50 per cent., that is, six per cent. less than what the Muhammadans are entitled on the basis of their population. I think that the rights of the Hindus have not been usurped by Muhammadans but by those who are their kith and kin and who are near to them.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** But, at present, they are nearer to you and are sitting beside you.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** Well, Sir, the number of Muhammadan Sub-Inspectors does not exceed 56 per cent. Seven years back their number was 60 per cent. but now their number has come down to 56 per cent. Sir, the number of Hindus in the ranks of Sub-Inspectors, Head Constables and Constables has been steadily increasing since the inauguration of reforms in the country. Under these circumstances I think it was not proper for the honourable member on the other side of the House to have attacked the Muhammadan community without any cause. Perhaps, he is not aware of the fact that promotions of some deserving Muhammadan Inspectors have been stopped in order to promote certain Hindu Inspectors with no experience of investigation work to the rank of Deputy Superintendent of Police. But, I do not mind that, for, I know that they will have the requisite experience if they have not had that before. This clearly goes to show how far the Government is anxious to encourage the Hindus in the police department. Sir, I am fully acquainted with the working of various government departments especially with that of the police department. As I have already said, inefficient Hindu Inspectors have been promoted to the rank of Deputy Superintendent of Police, while the claims of efficient Muhammadan Inspectors have been totally ignored. Besides, we must not lose sight of the fact that this is being done in a department where inefficiency cannot be tolerated for a moment.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Is this the reason why the honourable member has always been complaining of the inefficiency of the police ?

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I have also been complaining of the inefficiency of other departments including the Canal department. In fact, the police and the canal departments are equally inefficient. Anyhow, I would submit that the allegations made by the honourable member are altogether unfounded.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** On a point of order, Sir, this is a cut that has been moved by the honourable member Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram with reference to a single item, namely Sub-Inspectors, to urge the unsatisfactory representation of Hindu agriculturists. Hence any reference to Superintendents, Inspectors and Deputy Superintendents of Police would be hardly relevant. The honourable member may oppose the demand as a whole, if he so likes.

**Chaudhri Afzal Haq :** I am sorry that it was the honourable member who wanted me to explain that item. Well, Sir, I have complete sympathy with my honourable friend, the mover of the amendment, so far as the object underlying it is concerned. I would ask the Government with all the force

[Ch. Afzal Haq.]

at my command to remove at once the injustice that is being done to different communities in the distribution of services. Sir, for this, no community is to blame, and it is the Government which is solely responsible for it. I think we should refrain from attacking one another when, in fact, none of us is responsible for this state of affairs. With these words, I support the amendment and hope that the House would unanimously urge upon Government the advisability of doing away with the present system of inequitable distribution of services.

**Pandit Nanak Chand** (Hoshiarpur, Non-Muhammadan, Rural) : Sir, I agree with some of the remarks made in the speech which has just been delivered by my honourable friend Chaudhri Afzal Haq, a member from my own district. My honourable friend, Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram has raised a very important principle with regard to recruitment of services. With your permission, I wish to examine that principle at some length, the principle on which Government professedly has been acting in the recruitment to the various services under its control. Before I actually proceed to examine this principle, I wish to pay a tribute to the speech delivered by Mr. Ogilvie who said, in replying to the remarks of the honourable mover of this amendment that courage was not the monopoly of any particular class or community and that, so far as the Punjab was concerned, every class and every community, every sub-caste even, possessed that quality in a remarkable degree. Mr. Ogilvie is one of those few officials who take a long view of things and have tried to deal fairly between one community and the other. We, the members of the Hindu community, have, on more than one occasion, expressed our gratitude to him while he was dealing with the disturbances in Lahore as Deputy Commissioner. But the thing of which we are afraid and of which he also should be afraid is that certain policies are initiated by the Government in the Secretariat which are neither rational nor based on any fair principle. And if Mr. Ogilvie could only protest and make a bold stand that only those policies which are based on fairness and justice will be pursued, he will have earned the gratitude of the Hindu community at large.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** : May I rise to a point of order? Is an examination of the principle underlying the division of posts between communities and classes relevant to this cut in any way?

**Pandit Nanak Chand** : I should ask, what else is relevant? Hindu agriculturists are asked to be recruited to the police because they are Hindu agriculturists. It is a question of policy and nothing else. I am discussing whether this principle must be accepted, and if it were to be, I wish to point out the logical consequences thereof and its effect on the services at large.

**Mr. President** : I ruled, I think, only yesterday that debates on the budget must be relevant to the grant under consideration, that is to say, they must be confined to the particular item then before the House and the conduct of the Government connected therewith. So, if the debate relates to the item under discussion, the honourable member's speech is relevant. What is under discussion is the reduction of Re. 1 from the grant itself and everything that is relevant to the grant is in order.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Thank you, Sir. I was submitting that, so far as my party is concerned, we are of opinion that all Government appointments must be filled on the basis of merit and merit alone. (Shahid Muhammad Sadiq: With the exception of Chaudhri Ram Singh?) That principle has been repeatedly stated in this Council by myself and by my honourable friend, Chaudhri Ram Singh, also on various occasions. If that principle were accepted by Government and if all the posts were to go to Muhammadans, even the higher posts, we would not have the slightest objection to that. Even if cent per cent of the posts go to the members of the same community we shall not protest against that. I said this at the Simla session and it was endorsed by my party. Have open competition for all the places. Have literary competition, have riding competition if you like, have any competition which is not communal or sectional in its nature. Let no person be recruited to the services of this province merely because of his community.

**Mr. President :** Order, order. The honourable member is not in order in discussing all services of the province.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** These remarks apply *a fortiori* to the police. The police department is called the security department; on it depends law and order of the province, and its importance you may realise from the fact that various reports were made before the Statutory Commission from various provinces, not only from this province, but from other provinces also, which showed what importance the people attached to this department. The cry was that the department should not be transferred to the provincial governments when the province attains provincial autonomy. The Bengal provincial committee went so far as to say that this department should be kept a reserved department. A similar report was made, if I mistake not, by the Bombay committee. What I mean to imply by stating all these facts is this: that this department is a very important department. It is the department which is responsible for the security and peace of the country. So, Sir, when we ask for any innovation or change in the policy we must adduce reasons which are convincing and acceptable to reasonable men.

Now, Sir, one suggestion I would make to Government so far as improvement of services in this department is concerned, namely, that Government should take a census of those people who are imprisoned in jails as dacoits, burglars, robbers and cheats among the various communities. In whichever community these people, i.e., the criminals, abound that community should be excluded from the police service. You cannot take people from that community for the purpose of maintaining law and order. It is most unfortunate that throughout this province the cry is being raised not only by this section of the House but by all sections of the House that communal bias is invading the services, that, as a result, the services are becoming inefficient and there is not the same standard of efficiency observed as prevailed some years ago when communal policy was not pursued by the Government. So, my suggestion will be that those persons, or those tribes or those followers of any religion, who contribute largely to the jail population and amongst whom robbers, murderers or breakers of law are to be found in large numbers should not be taken into the police department and other security services. An instance was cited before a Home Secre-

[ Pandit Nanak Chand. ]

tary where allegations were made that a relation of a police official was amongst the robbers. But proper steps were not taken in pursuance of the information given to bring the robbers to book. The robbery of Rs. 25,000 in Gurdaspur district still remains undetected. If you really want to have efficiency in the police department you will have to rule out those persons who belong to those tribes or castes which contribute largely to the jail population. I do not know who they are; I have not got a census of them. But I ask the Government to act on the suggestion that I have made.

Now, Sir, in this very hall, His Excellency Sir Geoffrey deMontmorency, who was then the Finance Member, said that the services could not be recruited on communal principle and that percentages could not be fixed on that principle. The main argument that he gave then was that if you recruited public servants on the basis of caste or religion, there was a great danger of those public servants considering themselves the servants of the particular community to which they belonged. I submit that, so far as the Punjab Government's expression of policy is concerned, it is different from the policy actually pursued by it. People are kept out not because they are incompetent, not because they lack courage or strength, not because they cannot satisfy any of the tests required of them, but because they do not happen to belong to a particular community. Once I had a talk with a very high official, and he told me that the number of sub-inspectors among Hindus was not large because constables and head constables belonging to the Hindu community were not as numerous as those belonging to other communities, and Hindus would not come in large numbers to enlist themselves as constables. This was the argument which a very high official advanced in order to explain the paucity of Hindu sub-inspectors when I was sent by my party to make a complaint in regard to certain matters relating to the police department. I told him that if he would give me an order then and there for 500 constables from my community I would undertake to produce 500 men to be recruited as constables. I am still waiting for that order. So it is wrong to say that Hindus would not come forward to be recruited as constables. The real reason is that those from other communities which have got the monopoly of the services and are entrenched in this department as inspectors and sub-inspectors, they make the life of the Hindu constables and head constables too hot for them. This allegation had been made not by my party only, but by Chaudhri Chhotu Ram himself. I am subject to correction. That is a very serious cause for Hindus keeping back from the police department. If there is any doubt in the minds of those officials responsible for recruitment to the police department, they can just give me an order: 'We require so many men as constables or head constables or inspectors or sub-inspectors, men of necessary calibre and courage'. I am prepared to produce the required number. Is the Government prepared to accept this offer?

This is the charge that the Hindus have been levelling against the policy pursued by the department. Let them fix the percentage or adopt some definite policy so that we might know where we stand. But the Government's policy is so elastic, its conscience, if it has a conscience at all, is so elastic, that it gives expression to one policy and acts upon another.

We want to know exactly where the Hindus stand. There is a deep feeling of resentment among the Hindus of all classes that the policy pursued by Government is an anti-Hindu policy in all sections of the police establishment. Reasons are being given by Government officials sometimes that Hindus are in a majority in the Congress, they are in a majority in the NanJawan Bharat Sabha, they are in a majority in the other Sabhas; therefore, the Hindus of the Punjab, who are in a minority, must be put down. That is the underlying policy of the Punjab Government. Every sensible Hindu in the province feels that he is paying a price for the wrong impression which the Government officials are labouring under. As a matter of fact, so far as the Hindus of this province are concerned, they stand for good government, for fair treatment and for justice for all. The Government knows that they are not non-co-operators and the Government knows that though they are fearless critics of Government they are law-abiding and opposed to policies which are calculated to upset law and order. The Government acts upon wrong information. What are the eyes of the Government? The eyes of the Government are the police and the criminal investigation department. Who are persons recruited in the criminal investigation department which makes complaints against the Hindus? They belong to other communities. Who are in the press bureau? Majority of them Mussalmans. All these people go to the Government and create wrong impression. I ask Government to open their eyes and see that all communities should be treated alike. It has been their boast that they hold the balance even between the different communities and that, if they were not there, the Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs will fight with one another. I, Sir, after having carefully scrutinised the policy pursued by the Government, cannot but say that their policy is a policy of divide and rule.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is again discussing the general policy of the Government. He is requested to restrict his remarks only to the policy of the Government in the police department.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I am submitting this with regard to the police department. I am only saying that the police department is overcrowded by a particular community in pursuance of this policy. I agree with Chaudhri Afzal Haq when he said that all people must be treated alike, and if there is a preponderance of the Hindus in any department, then the Hindus must give place to Muslims, and *vice versa*. This principle, I submit, should be applied throughout the country. It should not be a matter for application to the Punjab only. (*Shaiikh Muhammad Sadiq* : Why not the whole of Asia?) If that principle is followed you will find, Sir, that the members of my community will be the foremost to give their adherence to this principle. I accept whole-heartedly this suggestion made by Chaudhri Afzal Haq, though it is not the right policy.

Now, Sir, just look how this principle works with regard to the depressed classes who are agriculturists by profession. According to Chaudhri Chhotu Ram, only certain classes are agriculturists—Jats, Pathans, Moghuls—and these have been notified by Government as agriculturists. According to me, an agriculturist is a person who follows the profession of agricul-

[Pandit Nanak Chand.]

ure. There are a large majority of these depressed classes who pursue the profession of agriculture. Whenever the Government has been asked to give posts of constables and head constables and other posts in the police department to these depressed classes what is the reply of the Government? If you are pursuing the policy of agriculturist and non-agriculturist as defined in that circular to which reference has been made on more than one occasion, then these depressed classes should be taken in the police department. But the Government says the higher caste Hindus will not allow them to enter their houses and they will not be allowed to make arrests and searches and therefore, these depressed classes cannot be employed. Is it a fair argument? There are members of the depressed classes holding very high social position. I know one member of the depressed classes who is in charge of a college and I used to go and dine with him. We in the Punjab are not accustomed to regard these untouchables as persons who cannot perform their duty efficiently. Yet, what a disappointing reply was given by the Government to this demand of ours? Then, Chaudhri Chhotu Ram's complaint is that Hindu agriculturists of his division have not been taken in the police department.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** This has got nothing to do with it.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I know this is your intention. Why is it that these Hindu agriculturists have not been taken while the agriculturists of other communities have been taken? The reason for that is that Chaudhri Chhotu Ram has allied himself to a party which is agriculturist in one sense and Muhammadan in another sense. It is agriculturist in name and Muhammadan in the working of it. That is the reason why Chaudhri Chhotu Ram has not taken his courage in both his hands and not criticised the policy pursued by the Government. Look at this. Who represents the Ambala division where the Hindu agriculturists predominate? Chaudhri Chhotu Ram, Chaudhri Dali Chand, Chaudhri Chhaju Ram, Chaudhri Baldeo Singh and Rao Balbir Singh. Three of them sit on benches where Muhammadans sit. How can they put forward the grievances of the Hindus?

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** There are some Muhammadans sitting on Hindu benches.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member will please speak to the motion.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I am just explaining why Hindu agriculturists are not taken in sufficient numbers and why their grievances are not put forward before the Government with sufficient force in order to direct the attention of the Government. The reason is that Chaudhri Chhotu Ram has allied himself to a party which is not sympathetic to the claims of the Hindu agriculturists.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** To-day's vote will show.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** This was so in the last Council and this is so in this Council. Fortunately we have, in this Council, been able to get in our party certain representatives of the Hindu agriculturists from

Ambala division, namely, Chaudhri Baldeo Singh and Chaudhri Balbir Singh, and they have been agitating for the rights of the Hindu zamindars.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan :** Is it an election speech or is it relevant to the motion before the House? If you, Sir, allow him to make mention of these things it will invite reference and I hope that any reply thereto will not be ruled out of order.

**Shaikh Faiz Muhammad :** This is an election propaganda.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Election propaganda or no election propaganda, we must face facts.

**Mr. President :** What the honourable member is now saying is: why the representative of Rohtak is not a member of a particular party and why he belongs to another party?

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I am very sorry that I did not make myself quite clear. I will make myself absolutely clear. The point that I am developing is the reason why the claims of Hindu agriculturists are ignored is that the representatives of the Hindu agriculturists have not put forward their claims.

**Mr. President :** I cannot allow the honourable member to make such reflections. No reflection of any sort should be made against any honourable member of this House.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I will not make any reflection. Now, the representatives of the Ambala division are justified in saying that the claims of the Hindu agriculturists should be considered very favourably by the Government. They are Hindu agriculturists of the Ambala division and they have proved their valour in many a battle. They have contributed very largely to the army, they have shown of what mettle they are made and I see absolutely no justification why these people should not be treated with greater consideration.

**Mr. President :** I must request the honourable member not to pursue this strain.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I am speaking of the Hindu agriculturists whether of Ambala, Hoshiarpur or Kangra, of Hoshiarpur in particular, whom I have the honour to represent and whose claims I would like to place before the Government—Brahmins, Senis, Mahtons, Rajputs and Jats living in its area. I submit and I hope that you will permit me to say this, that they also have proved their mettle as regards valour, bravery and courage on more than one occasion. I see no justification for practically shutting the doors of the police department to these various people and with your permission, I whole-heartedly support the motion brought forward by Chaudhri Chhotu Ram.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq (Amritsar City, Muhammadan, Urban) :** Sir, this is the most novel speech that I have heard in this House. A gentleman stands up to support a motion, and he tries to humiliate the gentleman who has proposed that motion. He comes from his constituency to advocate their cause and yet this is the way how he fritters away his energy by attacking the Government in a queer way, in a way telling them that at heart he loves them but only shows that he attacks them. After this kind of attacking he sits quietly and says that he whole-heartedly supports the motion. Where is the whole heart in it? There is not even half a heart.



[ Sh. Muhammad Sadiq.]

in the speech. He also referred to the Home Secretary and I am sorry that the Home Secretary did not have the courage to check him from making a statement which implied that the Home Secretary or the Chief Secretary or somebody else was pursuing the policy of pushing one community .....

**Mr. C. M. G. Ogilvie :** That statement was not worth answering.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I am glad that the disclaimer has come though very tardily (*Laughter*).

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I did not hear that answer.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** You ought to have special electric megaphones. Here is an amendment to have more Hindu agriculturists in the police department. But what was the trend of the debate? Attack after attack was made on the Muhammadan benches. I have always tried not to take, as far as possible, a communal view of things. We know how much communal tension there is in the country. We have never tried to indulge in such a thing. But it was left to the honourable member representing the Hoshiarpur agriculturists not to utter a single word on behalf of his constituents; though he has tried to speak of sweepers and untouchables, he has not uttered a word of sympathy for agriculturists from whom he begs his votes. He wants a sweeper to be appointed as a constable in the police department. But what will happen if a Brahmin is cooking his food and the sweeper constable gets into his house and arrests him. The whole party of the Hindu members will howl, that a Brahmin, a high-caste Khatri or someone else has been arrested by a sweeper. Where will be the Government in future? The honourable member would be the first man to howl and cry that an untouchable has been allowed to arrest a pure high-caste Brahmin or a Kshatriya. How many Hindu friends have employed sweepers in their homes? This is left to Europeans to employ Hindus, Muslims or sweepers, without distinction so far as they are clean. How many sweepers has the honourable gentleman from Hoshiarpur non-Muhammadan constituency employed even in these days when untouchables are so much talked of.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I have employed them twice.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** What does he mean by rising and disappearing over and over again like a jack in the box (*Laughter*)? I think that these untouchables are our brethren and have a right equal to ours. They have the same rights and privileges as a high-caste Brahmin has. But if they are tried to be exploited and their name is sought to be used for political purposes, I say this whole system is wrong. The object of such gentlemen is to have political power; then these poor untouchables will be kicked mercilessly. They are being raised to be oppressed down once again. What is the question? The question is to have more agriculturists in the police department, and here my friend from Hoshiarpur starts talking of the whole Muslim force. He says, we must have equal proportion of Hindus and Muslims in the police and, when another friend says that we must have merit alone, he shakes his head. What are we to believe? His tongue or his head? There is a lot of difference between his head and his tongue (*Laughter*). Is this the way to argue? The public will have no respect for such speeches delivered in this House. The gentleman should come prepared from his house and not in a half-hearted way place ideas before



the House. If he wants that, all over the Punjab, Hindus and Muslims should have equal proportion subject to a minimum qualification, I am at one with him. But it must be subject to a minimum qualification. I do not want to have an idiot as an Inspector-General of Police or a fool as a sub-inspector of police. There should be a minimum qualification that he should be a graduate or an F.A. My friend always raises the bogey of capacity. Muhammadans are in no way less capable. But it is only a question of opportunity. Sikhs and Muslims are poor and they have no opportunities. Let us extend this principle of having equal distribution to all services. Let us, once for all, remove this bogey of communalism which has been raised in this province. No one will be happier than myself and my companions, Sikhs and Muslims—I am sorry we have no Hindus on this bench. There is not a Sikh or a Muslim who will not be willing to have this question of ratio settled, subject of course to a minimum qualification. I do not see what is the difference between a man who passes his entrance getting 480 marks and the man who passes by getting 470 marks. He might have been given more marks by a pandit or a maulvi. We know many people have passed in the first class because their teachers have given them more marks than to others. So it is a question of a few marks this way or that. What does efficiency in a policeman mean?

4 P.M.

The question, in his case, is not how many marks he obtained in English or how many marks in Mathematics. In his case it is the question of a strong fist and a strong heart. Pandit Nanak Chand wants that cowards should not be recruited because they will prove inefficient and will not be able to approach thieves and when they will not do their work properly they will be hauled up before the Home Secretary on a charge of cowardice. What has competition to do in this case? Suppose you want a chaprasi. There are two candidates for the post, one Hindu and one Muhammadan. How are you going to judge the comparative merits of the two? You do not want a B.A. for the post, and it is impossible to hold a competition for the job. The question of education does not come in at all in a case like this. It is not that we do not want Hindus to be recruited for the police. We shall welcome them. In fact, so long as there are not enough Hindus in that line, this trouble will go on. But the fact is that very few Hindus who want such jobs are forthcoming, and it is not that Government does not want them. The reason simply is that they can earn more money outside. A Hindu takes to selling roasted *channa* and he earns as much as a rupee a day. A Hindu who sells *alu kaachalu* earns as much as Rs. 2 in four or five hours. Why should he then care for the job of a constable who gets only Rs. 15 a month? We would ask Government to have more Hindus; but we should not ask for Paharis from Hoshiarpur to be recruited. We do not want people to be rushing from all sides to get recruited in the police department simply because they have nothing else to do. We do want suitable men from Murree and Sukkur and from Hoshiarpur and Gurgaon. By all means, Government should take more Hindus. They should extend to the Hindus the principle that is applied to other classes.

My friend Pandit Nanak Chand said: Look at the list and see who are greater thieves? He said: do not take men from that class. Sir, he is a barrister and he knows English. He knows the well-known proverb:

[Sh. Muhammad Sadiq.]

'Set a thief to catch a thief.' It is a very old saying that to tackle thieves you should employ another thief, and not one who has never seen a thief or one who, on the sight of a thief, trembles and cries, 'help, help, save me, there is somebody at the door.' How can a man like that ever be expected to become a good policeman?

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Are you talking of Kashmiris?

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** Yes, of Kashmiri Brahmins (*Laughter*). I am sorry to find, Sir, that the honourable member is insulting Raja Narendra Nath (*Laughter*). Is that the loyalty he owes to his chief? I have always thought that there was no loyalty on those benches and it is not a surprising thing to me (*Laughter*). As we are talking of Kashmiris, does Pandit Nanak Chand not know that Gama, the greatest wrestler in the world, is a Kashmiri? Does he not know that Ghulam, another great wrestler, was also a Kashmiri? So, it will be seen that even Kashmiris are capable of producing such strong men. I am not going into personalities, but what I was saying was that it is important to set a thief to catch a thief. My friend should know that Government is following the same principle here as well as in the Frontier province. It appoints the heads of badmashes as sardars so that they may help Government by keeping other badmashes under control. The man who is the biggest badmash in the Frontier province is also the biggest sardar over there. These men are not cowards and that is because they are in touch with thieves and are not afraid of dacoits.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** We will be able to understand the honourable member better if he please speaks a little lower and slower.

**Shaikh Muhammad Sadiq :** I know that the rural classes have been very backward. I think the rural areas have every right to be properly represented in the services. The prosperity of the country depends on the rural population, and I know we will have no progress unless they come up. It is no use just trying to stop the progress of rural areas. I have genuine sympathy for these men and not just the lip sympathy which my friends show, and I hope that these bickerings will soon cease. The rural classes are going to come into power in this province and they must have their due share in these services.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan [Sialkot (Muhammadian), Rural] :** I shall not take up much of the time of the House in making one or two submissions that I have to make and which I have been prompted to make by the speech of my honourable friend representing Hindu Hoshiarpur.

The hollowness of the criticism which he has levelled against the reasoning advanced by some of the honourable members of this House has been sufficiently exposed by my friends representing Muslim Amritsar and Muslim Hoshiarpur. It is with reference to the suggestion that he has put forward for the consideration of Government with regard to the recruitment to the ranks of the police that I wish to make one or two observations. He started by saying that recruitment should go by pure merit and I am certain that nobody would have a quarrel with that principle as set out in those words. The difference arises the moment you begin

to define merit. So far as recruitment to the police department is concerned, it is sufficient to say that one would ordinarily think that merit would consist in possessing a good physique, a trained or trainable power of observation, a readiness to obey orders faithfully, a certain amount of courage, qualities of honesty and similar other things together with the necessary amount of education. If that suggestion had been put forward, if the suggestion had been limited to that, I would have understood the suggestion, but my learned friend went on to put forward a very novel suggestion for the consideration of Government that they must not recruit either men or officers to the police department who come from certain classes. I do not know what classes he meant, but he said that there were some classes in this country from which murderers and rioters and other such persons are usually or normally drawn. If he meant the criminal tribes or classes that are known as criminal tribes in this province, then his suggestion was entirely redundant inasmuch as so far as I know, ordinarily recruitment to the ranks of the police is not made from among the members of the criminal tribes. If he meant anything further, then I presume he meant to say that if certain members of a class or tribe had been guilty of committing murders or thefts or riots then the members of those classes or tribes should be debarred from being recruited to the police department. I am sure that would be an impracticable suggestion to adopt for reasons the detailing of which would take too much time and would at this stage not be desirable. But not knowing what value might be attached to the suggestion which the honourable member has made, I wish to add only this: that he should have completed the list of those offences the commission of which by the members of a particular class or community should debar them from being recruited to the police department. He should have included among his list forgers and cheats, bomb-throwers and political assassins, conspirators and traitors, wagers of war against His Majesty the King and disseminators of sedition.

**Pandit Nanak Chand:** I quite agree.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram** [South-East Rohtak (Non-Muhammadan), Rural]: Sir, I am most grateful to the honourable the Home Secretary who spoke on behalf of Government. He expressed the sympathy of Government for the classes whose cause I was pleading in very generous terms. He did not confine his sympathy only to words but he gave an indication of the definite steps which the Inspector-General had already taken to see that Hindu agriculturists got their proper share in the police service.

There was just one remark which he made and made, I think, under a misapprehension, which I desire to clear up. He said that every Punjabi was full of courage. Perhaps he thought that I had made a statement to the effect that some Punjabis were wanting in courage. What I meant was that, normally speaking, man for man, a zamindar would possess more courage than a non-zamindar. I stick to that proposition and I believe no man can reasonably and honestly deny the truth of that proposition. A Hindu Jat of the South-East Punjab would certainly be more courageous than a *bania* from the South-East Punjab. A Majha Jat would certainly be more courageous than a Khatri of the Central Punjab. A Pathan would be more

[R. S. Ch. Chhotu Ram.]

courageous than an *Arora* of the North-West and South-West Punjab. That is a statement to which I think no exception can be taken. However, what I meant to convey was that courage should be one of the qualities to be taken into consideration when recruiting men for the police. Man for man, a zamindar is more courageous than a non-zamindar and there should, therefore, be no obstacle in the proper number of Hindu zamindars being taken into the police service.

Now, I would come to some of the criticisms that were made by certain friends occupying these Hindu Sabha benches. My reply is first addressed to the honourable member who represents the rural Hindu Hoshiarpur constituency. It is an unfortunate thing that a rural constituency should be represented by a gentleman who has not one good word to say about the rural classes or the agricultural classes whose votes have sent him to this Council. Whenever there is any matter in which the Hindu agricultural classes or Hindu rural classes are concerned, he comes out with filthy language.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** The honourable member has used the expression 'filthy language' in reference to my speech. That is unparliamentary and I request you to get it withdrawn.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** I shall substitute the expression 'offensive language.'

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** But he has not withdrawn the original expression.

**Mr. President :** He has withdrawn that expression by substituting another for it.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Not very long ago this House was discussing the question whether Hindu agriculturists were or were not under-represented in the Education department in the inspecting branch, and my friend came out with the argument that it would be very undesirable to employ men with the qualities of thieves in the education department in its inspecting branch. That was one type of help that he rendered to the agriculturists.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** I never said that.

**Mr. President :** Order, order, please. I have on several occasions requested the honourable members of this House not to offer their personal explanations unless the member who is in possession of the House gives way and resumes his seat. It is not proper for one member to get up and offer his explanation if the other member does not give way. In such a case he should wait till the speaker has finished.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** If the honourable member makes a misstatement, when am I to correct it? I want your ruling on that point.

**Mr. President :** A misstatement or a misquotation may be corrected as soon as it is made or subsequently. Similarly, when a statement made by a member of the House is misunderstood or misinterpreted, the maker of the statement may offer a personal explanation at once or subsequently.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** To-day there was another motion under discussion which obviously seeks to secure the good of Hindu agriculturists. What help does my honourable friend from Hoshiarpur render to them? He says that Government should take care that criminals are not recruited for departments which have to look after criminals and which have to counteract the activities of criminals. This is what we have received from the honourable member from Hoshiarpur in favour of the Hindu agriculturists; he has nothing better to give.

Now, I would reply to my friends Chaudhri Baldev Singh and Chaudhri Ram Singh. They also profess extreme sympathy with Hindu agriculturists and profess that they are whole-heartedly and entirely with me; only they want that my angle of vision should change. The only difference they say is that I look at things from one point of view and they, from another point of view. They have not, however, explained what the difference is. I believe the difference is this; that I look at things from a pro-zamindar point of view and they look at them from an anti-Muslim point of view. That is the only difference. Now, my friend Chaudhri Baldev Singh made a most incoherent, a most self-contradictory speech. Nobody could understand what he meant. As a matter of fact, I do not know whether he succeeded in saying what he meant or whether he meant what he said. One sentence of his speech contradicted his previous sentence. He began by saying that this was the first time I had made a motion which was calculated to be beneficial to Hindu agriculturists. This criticism was news to me, a most surprising criticism. As a matter of fact, his leader and his party make a grievance that I barely speak of anything but Hindu agriculturists and yet, my friend has the audacity to say that this is the first time I have spoken for Hindu agriculturists. Again, my friend suggested that certain proportions were laid down for the recruitment of agriculturists in 1919 and that since the promulgation of that resolution, those proportions had been maintained and that Government had seen that Hindus and Muhammadans, agriculturists and non-agriculturists, were recruited in the proportions which had been prescribed in that resolution. My friend either did not know what he was saying or wanted to avoid giving offence to Government Members by telling the truth. My complaint is that those proportions have not been maintained. To clinch the point, I may draw the attention of my friend to the consolidated list issued on the 1st January 1929 wherein he will observe that out of 24 posts of assistant sub-inspectors held by Hindus only one has gone to a Hindu agriculturist. Can it be said, then, that the proportions have been maintained in the case of Hindu agriculturists? Again, my friend said that a much larger proportion of these posts went to Muslims and that if I found that Hindu zamindars had not got their due share, the inequality should be set right by my demanding that some of the posts given to Muhammadan zamindars should be taken away from them and given to Hindu zamindars. I think I made it perfectly clear in my speech that the excess that had gone to Muhammadans ought to be recovered and made over to Hindus. But let us see what has actually gone to Hindus and out of that what share has gone to Hindu agriculturists. Take one example. Among inspectors Hindus have distinctly 2 per cent. more than their share. The Hindus in this particular cadre are represented to the extent of 34.1 per cent., that is, something more than what they are

[**R. S. Ch. Chhotu Ram.**]

entitled to on the population basis. What have the Hindu agriculturists got out of this? They have got 11 out of 61 posts, that is, about 18 per cent. Is that a reasonable share which the Hindu agriculturists should expect out of what fell to the Hindus in general? Then, again, take the case of Deputy Superintendents. Here, I admit the Hindus as such have not received anything like their share. They have got about 15·4 per cent. A large number of the posts have gone to Europeans and Anglo-Indians. But I find that there are 8 Hindu Deputy Superintendents. Out of these 8, only one is a Hindu agriculturist. Now, how can it be said that Hindu agriculturists have received their proper share out of what fell to the share of the Hindus? Is there any guarantee that the Hindu agriculturists will get a proper share in any other branch of public service? Take the case of sub-judges. What is our representation there? Only two or three per cent. Therefore the argument of my honourable friend has really no substance in it.

Now, I think I may express genuine sympathy with my friends Chaudhri Baldev Singh and Chaudhri Ram Singh. They find it very difficult to reconcile the inner promptings of their conscience with what they have said. They represent Hindu agriculturists and they are not taking up their cause; their party allegiance really stands in the way of their doing real service to the people who have sent them to the Council. (*A voice: What about yourself?*) I have been doing my level best and will continue to do my level best. My principles are perfectly sound (*Interruption*). I have stuck to them, I am sticking to them, and I will continue to stick to them. There is nothing which makes my position on these benches irreconcilable with my conscience, or my principles or my allegiance to my constituency. There is nothing in my party allegiance which militates against the best interests of my constituency as there is in the party allegiance of these friends.

Sir, those gentlemen who could have said something in favour of Hindu agriculturists have gone to the *bania* group and have now no sympathy with Hindu agriculturists.

**Pandit Nanak Chand:** Sir, is that not a reflection on this party or the members of this party? The honourable Chaudhri Sahib has been speaking in this strain for the last five minutes.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram:** Sir, it is a reply to a reflection and nothing more. (*Interruptions*).

**Mr. President:** I will request both the honourable gentlemen not to make any personal reflections.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan:** Sir, the reflections which were made against the Chaudhri Sahib must be answered.

**Mr. President:** If one honourable member says an unpleasant thing in the heat of excitement it does not follow that he should be paid in the same coin.

**Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan:** Sir, the honourable member uttered very objectionable words and attacked the Chaudhri Sahib, his policy and tactics for a long time, and if you will refer to the speech of the honourable member you will find several pages covered with this matter. Chaudhri Chhotu Ram must be allowed to reply to those charges.

**Mr. President :** If that expression was unparliamentary, attention of the Chair should have been invited to it there and then.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, I was saying that certain members belonging to agricultural tribes have left us and have gone to the *bania* group.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, he is again insulting this party by calling it a *bania* group ; this is not a *bania* group.

**Mr. President :** As there is no *bania* group in this House, this expression cannot apply to any group.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, the word "*bania*" is used as a word of contempt by him and we take objection to that. He must withdraw it. He is insulting the whole party. I record my emphatic protest against the use of this term. The honourable member should withdraw it and apologize to the members of this party.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** The honourable member Chaudhri Chhotu Ram has no right to speak of the other party in this way.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I was, Sir, at about 12 o'clock looking at the proceedings of this Council of December 1925 ; that was the occasion when my great predecessor, Sir John Maynard, was vacating his office. Sir, at that time a large number of the members of this House called him, not once but many times, a *bania*, and further, he and his class of Europeans concerned with financial affairs have been called more than once *banias*. As a matter of fact, I am sure my honourable friend to my left (Sir Alexander Stow) too will have no objection to be termed as a *bania*.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Well, this is the last kick you are giving to this party. This is most unfair.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** I am sure, Sir, the expression used in this Council has never been used in any other sense than this, that the people who were interested in a particular work. . . . (Interruptions).

**Mr. President :** I think the Honourable the Finance Member (Sir John Maynard) was called a *bania* because he was very economical.

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** Exactly ; that is the point, Sir, why he was called a *bania*. (Interruptions).

**Mr. President :** However, such terms should not be used by one member for another member or a group of members.

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Sir, he must withdraw that expression.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** I am not going to withdraw my remarks unless the honourable member withdraws his remarks.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, I did not say anything objectionable which I should withdraw now.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member said that he (Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram) belonged to the Muhammadan party, that he was the member of a Muhammadan group and that he had become a Muslim.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Well, I remember, Sir, I said nothing of the sort.

**Mr. President :** Well, this is not proper ; the honourable member (Chaudhri Chhotu Ram) should also withdraw his words.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, first he must withdraw.

**Mr. President :** Yes, I will ask him to withdraw first.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Nobody took exception to my remarks when I was speaking.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member for Rohtak has taken objection to the remarks of the honourable member for Hoshiarpur. Therefore, I request the honourable member to withdraw those remarks.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, I never said that he was a Muhammadan and I never said that he has changed his religion. I said no such things at all. I simply said that he sits on Muhammadan benches and sides with them, and if he takes that to be an insult, I withdraw it.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member (Chaudhri Chhotu Ram) will also withdraw his remarks.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** I never said, Sir, that all the members of those benches are *banias*.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member will please withdraw. Pandit Nanak Chand has withdrawn his remarks.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, he has not withdrawn his words unconditionally. He must do it. He must withdraw his remarks unconditionally. Unless he does so, I will not withdraw my remarks even if I have to withdraw from the Council.

**Mr. President :** As he has withdrawn his remarks, as you say, conditionally, you also may withdraw yours conditionally.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, I never said that all the members occupying those benches are *banias*. I simply said that a few of the members who belong to agricultural tribes have gone to the *bania* group in this House.

*(At this stage Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri, stood up and began to interrupt the speaker.)*

**Mr. President :** The honourable member from Amritsar should not interrupt the honourable speaker.

**Lala Kesho Ram Sekhri :** Sir, he must withdraw the expression.

**Mr. President :** Yes, he will withdraw.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, he has withdrawn his remarks conditionally ; I also withdraw conditionally any remarks or any comment which....

**Dr. Gokul Chand, Narang :** Sir, I would submit that this unpleasant discussion should be expunged from the official report—I mean from the proceedings of the House.

**Lala Mukand Lal Puri :** No, Sir, in my opinion this discussion should remain on the official record. These offensive remarks were made and withdrawn. This record will show that we took objection to such remarks and the President ordered the honourable member to withdraw them.



**Mr. President :** Chaudhri Chhotu Ram will please proceed.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, one of the charges that Chaudhri Baldev Singh made against me was that the share of the Hindu agriculturists went to other agriculturists and that I made no attempt to recover that part of the share from other agriculturists. Sir, I have done all I could to bring to the notice of Government the inadequate representation of the Hindu agriculturists in almost every branch of Government service. I have done this not only in this session, not only during the last 12 months, but ever since I entered this House as a private member. I have systematically and repeatedly put questions with regard to the share of Hindu agriculturists. Now I challenge my friend, Pandit Nanak Chand, who claims to be a representative of Hindu agriculturists, whether he has put any question drawing the attention of the authorities to the inadequate share which is given to Hindu agriculturists in public employment.

**Mr. President :** May I ask the honourable member not to refer to another honourable member by name ?

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Sir, I was asking the honourable representative of the Hindu rural constituency from Hoshiarpur.....

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, he put me a question ; may I reply to him ?

**Mr. President :** Order, order. How can the honourable member answer a question ? The honourable member for South-East Rohtak is in possession of the House and has not given way.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Sir, there is a misstatement of fact.

**Mr. President :** Order, order.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Now, Sir, I would ask the honourable member who represents one-half of the Rohtak District (Chaudhri Baldev Singh) whether he has put any questions in order to bring to the notice of Government the inadequate representation which the Hindu agriculturists hold in any branch of the Government service.

I was saying, Sir, that Chaudhri Baldev Singh, the honourable representative of North-West Rohtak and the honourable representative of the Hindu rural constituency of Kangra (Chaudhri Ram Singh) forgot that they were representatives of the agriculturists and have joined a party which does not recognise a distinction between agriculturists and non-agriculturists. Whatever the reasons may be, they do not speak freely that the Hindu agriculturists are not getting their share, their proper share. Sometimes they speak as Hindus and sometimes they speak as nationalists. They have to take shelter behind such catchwords as nationalism, patriotism, interests of the Hindu community, undesirability of emphasising the distinction between agriculturists and non-agriculturists and so on. Otherwise, I am sure they also realise the inadequate share that has gone to Hindu agriculturists in almost every branch of the public service. Reference was also made by the honourable member who represents North-West Rohtak that the share which went to Hindu agriculturists in the posts of tahsildars was inadequate.

**Mr. President :** Tahsildars are not under discussion. So the honourable member should not refer to that branch of the provincial service even by way of reply.

**Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram :** Very well, Sir. This motion has reference only to sub-inspectors. Let us analyse the relevant figures. My honourable friend who represents North-West Rohtak made the complaint that Hindus did not receive their proper share in this cadre. The population of Hindus in the British Punjab is 31·8 per cent. of the total population of the province, and the share which they have received in the sub-inspectors' posts is 29·4 per cent. Their share falls short of that to which they are entitled to on the basis of population by something like 2·4 per cent. If their due share is given to the Hindus in this cadre, another 20 posts would be added to the general share of the Hindus. At the rate at which Hindu agriculturists have received their share out of the existing general share of Hindus they will get another 6 posts out of these 20 and the total number of Hindu agriculturists in the cadre would rise to 77. The share of Hindu agriculturists would then be no more than 28·5 per cent. Is that a just share to which Hindu agriculturists are entitled? And will the recovery of these lost posts out of which my friends are making so much capital put an end to the grievances of Hindu agriculturists as such? I beg to submit that the myth of the share of Hindu zamindars going somewhere else, that is, to Moslem or Sikh zamindars, really exists in the imagination of these few deluded persons only. They have allowed themselves to be misled by those with whom they associate and, without analysing the figures in which this suggestion is based, they have accepted that statement for gospel truth. If only they had cared to go through the various figures which are being supplied to us in Government reports, they would have found that, in nine cases out of ten, Hindus are in possession of more posts than they are entitled to on the basis of their population and yet, nowhere have Hindu agriculturists got even one-fifth of the share which they are entitled to on the basis of their population. I would therefore warn my friends against this myth of the share of Hindu agriculturists having gone somewhere else, either to Muhammadan or Sikh agriculturists. That is an absolutely groundless suggestion which should never be accepted, by any agriculturist whether he occupies those benches or these. Let my zamindar friends in the Hindu Sabha group use their brains, let them exercise their own judgment. Let them study these consolidated lists for, they would then find that if the share of Hindu agriculturists has gone anywhere, it has gone to non-agriculturist Hindus themselves.

With these words, I beg leave to withdraw my motion.

**Pandit Narak Chand :** On a point of personal explanation, Sir. My honourable friend, Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram, has made three misstatements regarding me. The first one is that I have never represented the case of the Hindu agriculturists of the Hoshiarpur district.

**Mr. President :** The honourable member is proceeding to make a second speech which he is not entitled to do.

**Pandit Narak Chand :** No, Sir. I am just pointing out that that statement is wrong. There have been misstatements made about me by

the honourable member who spoke last and should I not be allowed to correct them now?

**Mr. President :** But the honourable member cannot be allowed to make a second speech.

**Pandit Nanak Chand :** Very well, Sir. I shall just mention them to contradict them. The second statement that my honourable friend made was that, in speaking of the education department, I stated that the zamindars were thieves, dacoits, robbers and so on. The honourable member has misunderstood my speech entirely. What I stated was that, if the qualities enunciated then in the course of his speech by Chaudhri Duli Chand, namely, remaining in jungles at night time and crossing rivers and so on, were the qualifications required, then those would be found more in thieves and robbers and that zamindars did not possess those qualifications. The third statement that zamindars were thieves and robbers and filled the jails which is attributed to me is also based on a complete misunderstanding. What I stated in fact was that the Government should be pleased to take a census of the population in the jails and find out the respective communities to which they belonged. (*Rai Sahib Chaudhri Chhotu Ram*, What was the insinuation?) I submit that there was no insinuation at all. I have definitely stated that the claims of the zamindars of Hoshiarpur district who possessed courage and the other necessary qualifications should be sympathetically considered.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh** (Kangra, Non-Muhammadan, Rural), (Urdu) : Sir, I would like to say a few words in reply to the remarks made by my friend the mover of the amendment.....

**Mr. President :** That is a closed chapter now and should not be reopened.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** Sir, I want to offer a word of personal explanation.

**Mr. President :** Very well.

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** In the first place it was stated that I belonged to the *tania* party while, in fact, there was no such party in the Council.

**Mr. President :** Is this a personal explanation?

**Chaudhri Ram Singh :** In the second place it was said that being always under the influence of my party, I never sympathised with the cause of the zamindars. Sir, I would refer the honourable member to the proceedings of the Council.

**Mr. President :** Order, order. That is not a personal explanation.

Is it the pleasure of the House that the amendment may be withdrawn? (*Voices : No, no.*) Then I shall put it to the vote of the House.

Demand under consideration, amendment moved is—

"That the grant be reduced by Rs. 1 with respect to the item of Rs. 9,81,600 Sub-Inspectors.

The question is that that amendment be made.

The motion was carried.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,13,64,499 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Police.”

The motion was carried.

#### EDUCATION (RESERVED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

3 P.M.

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 7,68,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Education (Reserved).”

The motion was carried.

#### EDUCATION (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,71,77,500 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Education) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Education (Transferred).”

The motion was carried.

#### MEDICAL (RESERVED AND TRANSFERRED) AND PUBLIC HEALTH (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 75,02,200 be granted to the Governor in Council and the Punjab Government (Ministry of Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Medical (Reserved and Transferred) and Public Health (Transferred).”

The motion was carried.

#### AGRICULTURE (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 57,02,700 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Agriculture (Transferred).”

The motion was carried.

#### INDUSTRIES.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“ That a sum not exceeding Rs. 10,88,600 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture and Education) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Industries.”

The motion was carried.

## CAPITAL OUTLAY ON INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 55,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Education) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Capital Outlay on Industrial Development."

The motion was carried.

## MISCELLANEOUS (RESERVED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 9,68,200 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Miscellaneous (Reserved)."

The motion was carried.

## SCIENTIFIC AND MISCELLANEOUS DEPARTMENTS (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is —

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 18,91,500 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments (Transferred)."

The motion was carried.

## CIVIL WORKS (RESERVED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,02,400 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Civil Works (Reserved)."

The motion was carried.

## CIVIL WORKS (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,12,47,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Civil Works (Transferred)."

The motion was carried.

## BUILDINGS AND ROADS BRANCH ESTABLISHMENT CHARGES.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 18,88,800 be granted to the Governor in Council and the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Buildings and Roads Branch Establishment Charges."

The motion was carried.

## HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME WORKING EXPENSES.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 2,50,600 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Hydro-Electric Scheme Working Expenses."

The motion was carried.

## CIVIL WORKS (CAPITAL EXPENDITURE).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 13,23,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Civil Works (Capital Expenditure)."

The motion was carried.

## HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME (CAPITAL EXPENDITURE).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 98,57,900 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Hydro-Electric Scheme (Capital Expenditure)."

The motion was carried.

## FAMINE.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,50,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Famine."

The motion was carried.

## SUPERANNUATION ALLOWANCES AND PENSIONS.

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 23,22,300 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Superannuation Allowances and Pensions."

The motion was carried.

## COMMUTED VALUE OF PENSIONS (CAPITAL EXPENDITURE).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 6,36,800 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Commuted Value of Pensions (Capital Expenditure)."

The motion was carried.

## STATIONERY AND PRINTING (RESERVED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 11,43,500 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Stationery and Printing (Reserved)."

The motion was carried.

## STATIONERY AND PRINTING (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,00,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministry of Agriculture) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Stationery and Printing (Transferred)."

The motion was carried.

## LOANS BY PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS (RESERVED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 27,04,000 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Loans by Provincial Governments (Reserved)."

The motion was carried.

## LOANS BY PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 13,38,000 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Loans by Provincial Governments (Transferred)."

The motion was carried.

## REFUNDS (RESERVED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 4,18,500 be granted to the Governor in Council to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Refunds (Reserved)."

The motion was carried.

## REFUNDS (TRANSFERRED).

**Mr. President :** The question is—

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 6,90,100 be granted to the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Refunds (Transferred)."

The motion was carried.

**EXPENDITURE IN ENGLAND (OTHER THAN STORES) UNDER THE CONTROL  
OF THE HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR INDIA.**

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 6,15,680 be granted to the Governor in Council and the Punjab Government (Ministries of Agriculture, Education and Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Expenditure in England (other than Stores) under the control of the High Commissioner for India.”

The motion was carried.

**EXPENDITURE IN ENGLAND UNDER THE CONTROL OF THE SECRETARY  
OF STATE.**

**Mr. President :** The question is—

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 27,000 be granted to the Governor in Council and the Punjab Government (Ministry of Local Self-Government) to defray the charges that will come in course of payment for the year ending the 31st of March 1931 in respect of Expenditure in England under the control of the Secretary of State.”

The motion was carried.

**NOMINATIONS OF THE RAILWAY ADVISORY COMMITTEE.**

**Mr. President :** May I invite the attention of the honourable members to the fact that three representatives of this Council have to be nominated to act on the Railway Advisory Committee? The present members are Captain Sardar Sikander Hyat Khan, Sayad Mubarik Ali Shah and Rai Bahadur Lala Mohan Lal. If the House approves I may to nominate the following gentlemen :—

Lala Mukand Lal, Puri,

Mr. Din Muhammad, and

Chaudhri Zafrulla Khan.

Are these names approved?

**Dr. Gokul Chand Narang :** I would have liked if the name of some Sikh gentleman were suggested.

*The nominations were agreed to by the House.*

The Council then adjourned *sine die*.



# PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

## APPENDIX I.

**Papers referred to or laid on the table in the course of the debate on the salary of the Minister for Local Self-Government.**

*Application from the vice-president of City Congress Committee, Gujranwala, asking for permission to hoist the national flag on the municipal buildings and the orders of the vice-president of the municipal committee, Gujranwala, thereon.*

(Vide page 739 ante).

بخدمت جناب پریذیڈنٹ صاحب میونسپل کمیٹی  
گوجرانوالہ۔

جناب من۔ تسلیم۔ یہ تو آپکو معلوم ہی ہوگا کہ ۲۶ ماہ حال کو یوم آزادی ہندوستان کے ایک سرے سے دوسرے تک منایا جانا قرار پایا ہے۔ گوجرانوالہ کانگریس کمیٹی نے بھی اس بات کا فیصلہ کیا ہے کہ یہاں بھی یوم آزادی شان کے ساتھ منایا جاوے۔ عوام الناس کی زبردست خواہش ہے کہ قومی جھنڈا ٹاؤن ہال کی عمارت پر لگایا جاوے۔ اس زبردست خواہش کو مدنظر رکھتے ہوئے منجانب کانگریس کمیٹی گوجرانوالہ جناب سے گزارش ہے کہ ۲۶ جنوری بعد دوپہر کانگریس کمیٹی گوجرانوالہ کو اجازت دیجائے کہ قومی جھنڈا لہرانے کی متبرک رسم ٹاؤن ہال کی عمارت میں ادا کی جاوے اور قومی جھنڈا عمارت مذکور پر لہرایا جاوے نہ صرف اس سے گوجرانوالہ کے شہر کی عزت اور شان دنیا کی نگاہ میں بلند ہوگی۔ بلکہ سلف گورنمنٹ کا ملتہائے مقصود یعنی عوام کی خواہش و دلی جذبات کی ترجمانی بھی حاصل ہوگا۔

گزارش مودبانہ ہے کہ عملہ میونسپل کمیٹی کے نام ہدایات جاری فرمائی جاوےں کہ ۲۶ تاریخ کو رسم مذکور کے متعلق کارپردازان کانگریس کو جملہ سہولتیں ہم پہونچا دیں۔ کانگریس کمیٹی مشکور و ممنون ہوگی۔

نیاز مند

غلام حسین

(وائس پریذیڈنٹ سٹی کانگریس کمیٹی ایڈووکیٹ)۔

## آرڈر زیو دفعہ ۳۵ میونسپل کمیٹی

میونسپل کمیٹی ہال پر قومی جھنڈا لہرایا جاوے اور سیکریٹری میونسپل کمیٹی مناسب انتظام کرے اور اگر کمیٹی میں کوئی پول وغیرہ موجود ہو تو قومی جھنڈا کیلئے مہیا کیا جاوے۔ ۲۵ جنوری سنہ ۱۹۳۰ ع

*Explanation of Malik Lal Khan, vice-President, Municipal Committee, Gujranwala, to the Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala.*

(Vide bottom of page 747 ante).

## جناب صاحب ڈپٹی کمشنر بہادر

چونکہ آپ نے مجھ سے دریافت کیا ہے کہ باوجود حلف لینے کے بحیثیت میونسپل ممبر میں نے مورخہ ۲۵ جنوری سنہ ۱۹۳۰ ع کو سیکریٹری میونسپل کمیٹی کے نام قومی جھنڈا عمارت کمیٹی پر نصب کرنے کے لئے تحریری حکم دیا وہ میں نے اس لئے کیا کہ میرے خیال میں ایسا کرنا اُس حلف کے قطعاً خلاف نہ تھا اور اب بھی میری یہی رائے ہے۔

(۱) جو جھنڈا پینل کے درخت پر نصب کیا گیا۔ اُس وقت میں وہاں موجود نہ تھا۔ صاحب ڈپٹی کمشنر اور سپرنٹنڈنٹ پولیس نے مجھے بلایا تھا اس لئے میرے واپس پہنچنے سے پہلے لوگ منتشر ہو چکے تھے۔

(۲) ۲۷ جنوری سنہ ۱۹۳۰ ع کی شام کالکرس کمیٹی نے جلسہ کیا جس میں مجھ سے تقویٰ کے لئے مطالبہ کیا گیا میں نے جن وجوہ پر جھنڈا نصب کرنا حکم دیا تھا۔ وہ بیان کیں۔

ملک لال خان

S. V. P.

*Requisition referred to at page 695 of the debates ante.*

**The President,**

**Municipal Committee,**

**Gujranwala.**

WE, the following members of the Committee, requisition under section 25 (2), Municipal Act, that a meeting of the Municipal Committee be called on the 8th February or on any other day as is found convenient, at which we hereby give notice that the following resolution will be moved :—

“ Resolved that Sardar Bahadur Sunder Singh, M.B.E., be removed from the Office of the President, Municipal Committee, Gujranwala.

We beg to remain,

SIR,

Your most obedient servants,

1. DIN MUHAMMAD, M.L.O.
2. GHULAM QADIR, J.V.P.
3. GHULAM BASUL, M.O.
4. INAYAT ULLAH, M.O.
5. MELA RAM.
6. BHIMSEN, SACHAR.
7. BHAGA MAL.
8. MUHAMMAD MUFI'ULLAH.
- 9.
10. M. R. ILAHI, M.O.
11. MUHAMMAD ABDULLA, M.O.
12. LAL KHAN, S.V.P.
- 13.
14. MOTI RAM, CHAWLA.

## PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

### APPENDIX.

Answers received after the publication of the debates of the dates on which the questions were put.

#### ANSWERS TO STARRED QUESTIONS.

##### MONEY COLLECTIONS BY MR. BRAYNE, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER.

(Answer to Question No. 2665, page 14 ante.)

**Mr. D. J. Boyd :** (a) No.

(b) to (d) Do not arise.

##### QUALIFICATIONS OF SUPERINTENDENTS OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER'S OFFICES AT SHEIKHUPURA, AMRITSAR AND GURDASPUR.

(Answer to Question No. 2811, page 105 ante.)

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) A statement giving the required information by districts is laid on the table.

(b) There were a few men with longer service and in receipt of more pay.

(c) The post is an important one, and length of service and rate of pay drawn are not the only qualifications for it. The appointments at Sheikhupura and Amritsar were made after carefully considering the merits of all the aspirants. In the case of Gurdaspur it was only a case of transfer from one district to another :—

District.	Qualifications.	Pay which the Superintendents were getting before appointment to the present posts.
Gurdaspur ..	Has been holding the post of Superintendent, permanently since the 24th February 1924.	Rs. 350.
Sheikhupura ..	Was in the Financial Commissioners' office.	Rs. 200 in the grade of 150—10—300.
Amritsar ..	Was in the Commissioner's office	Rs. 100.

##### ARRESTS IN CONNECTION WITH DELHI BOMB OUTRAGE.

(Answer to Question No. 2825, page 111 ante.)

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) The Honourable Member is incorrect in assuming that arrests were made in connection with the Delhi

Bomb Outrage of 28rd December 1929. He presumably refers to certain arrests made under section 151, Criminal Procedure Code, read with section 107, Criminal Procedure Code, for the prevention of the occurrence of cognizable offences. The names of the persons so arrested are Ram Kishan, Ihsan Ilahi, Sukh Dev, Dhanwantri, Vir Indar, Kiron Chandra Das, Milkhi Ram and Benarsi Das. The information laid under section 107, Criminal Procedure Code, in respect of the above-named persons is the subject of proceedings which are now pending in one of the magisterial courts of the Lahore District.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) No.

(d) Does not arise.

**SARDAR RANDHIR SINGH, PROSECUTION UNDER SECTION 380,  
INDIAN PENAL CODE.**

(Answer to Question No. 2845, page 181 ante).

**The Honourable Sir Henry Craik :** (a) Yes.

(b) A complete chalan was presented on August 5th 1929. Judgment was pronounced on 21st February 1930.

(c) Yes.

(d) The delay was due to a large number of adjournments several of which were granted in the interest of the accused.

**HYDRO-ELECTRIC ESTABLISHMENT CHARGES.**

(Answer to Question No. 2883, page 247 ante).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) (i) Rs. 88,872.

(ii) Rs. 20,487.

(b) Gazetted Officers—

				Per cent.
Hindus	..	..	..	14.61
Sikhs	..	..	..	0.66
Muslims	..	..	..	2.83
Subordinate Staff—				
Hindus	..	..	..	86.28
Sikhs	..	..	..	12.84
Muslims	..	..	..	48.48

The above averages are for three months for the period ended 31st December 1929.

**LOCAL BODIES—SEPARATE ELECTORATES FOR MUSLIMS—DATE  
OF INSTITUTION.**

(Answer to Question No. 2890, page 250 ante).

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) In 1891 communal electorates were introduced in Lahore by fixing the number of members to be

elected by Muslim and non-Muslim voters, respectively, but the members to be elected might belong to any community.

In 1895 communal electorates electing members confined to the same community as the electors were introduced in Amritsar.

(b) The decisions in each case were reached after full consideration of all the local considerations reported by the local officers after consulting representatives of all communities; but it is not possible to trace any single representation of any particular organised body of Muslims as being the main factor responsible for the introduction of the particular constitution eventually decided on.

(c) The first Legislative Council in the Punjab came into existence on the 1st May 1897, two years after the introduction of separate electorates in Amritsar.

Paragraph 7 of chapter I of the Memorandum prepared for the use of the Statutory Commission.

(d) As explained in the answer to part (b) above local representatives of all communities were consulted as to the particular form of constitution under consideration, but it is not possible to say whether the abstract question of the principle involved was formally referred to representative bodies of the communities concerned for opinion.

(e) The system referred to was in force in Amritsar from 1888 to 1895.

For further information in connection with this subject the honourable member is referred to Section D of Chapter VII of Volume I of the Memorandum prepared for the use of the Indian Statutory Commission by the Government of the Punjab, in which all the information on this subject available to Government has been collected and discussed.

#### AZAM CONTROVERSY IN ZAFFARWAL.

(Answer to Question No. 2893, page 252 ante.)

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow:** (a) Yes—mainly by the efforts of the district authorities and local non-officials who interested themselves in securing a settlement.

(b) No, and if the public hold this view, it is mistaken.

(c) The district authorities followed this principle with success.

#### STUDENTS' STRIKE IN ENGINEERING COLLEGE, MOGHALPURA.

(Answer to Question No. 2894, page 253 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh:** (a) Yes, that a few students had stayed out.

(b) No.

(c) No. One student was fined for disobeying the acting Principal's order not to wear a representation of a flag with the words "Down with Union Jack," printed on it within the College precincts. All other students had obeyed the order.

(d) No.

## PRINCIPAL, AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE.

*(Answer to Question No. 2899, page 378 ante.)***The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) No exact figures can be given.

(c) Three special lectures in Engineering.

(d) The Principal is in charge of the general administration of the College in all its branches.

He is not required to visit class rooms and therefore no record is kept of the actual number of visits paid ; but he supervises the administration of the College as a whole paying visits to class rooms, laboratories and other portions of the institution as occasion requires.

(e) In the same manner in which heads of similar institutions carry out their duties.

*(Answer to part (d) of Question No. 2900, page 378 ante.)*

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** In some villages of the Kangra and Hissar districts the cost of Chaukidars' uniforms is being realised, with the consent of the villagers, from the shamilat income. There is no village *malba* in the Kangra district and the common expenses of the village are met from shamilat income where it exists. In a few villages in that district, where this income was sufficient, the cost of chaukidars' uniforms has been met with the consent of the zamindars from it.

## SHANAN GENERATING STATION.

*(Answer to Question No. 2913, page 388 ante.)***The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) 38,250 K.Ws.

## HOLIDAYS FOR SUB-REGISTRARS.

*(Answer to Question No. 2916, page 385 ante.)*

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) and (b) Under paragraph 195 of the Punjab Registration Manual Sub-Registrars observe the same holidays as are authorised by the High Court for Civil Courts with the exception of the autumn vacation. Before October 1924 in some districts they were permitted the autumn vacation also, but the concession was subsequently withdrawn.

(c) Because it was considered unnecessary that Sub-Registrars should have a regular vacation.

## LAND REVENUE—IRREGULARITIES IN RECOVERY.

*(Answer to parts (i) (b) and (ii) of Q. 2920, page 584 ante.)*

**The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** (i) (b) In only two districts of the province.

(ii) The Deputy Commissioners of those two districts are being instructed to afford the same facilities as are offered in other districts of the province.

MR. MUHAMMAD SAID, MAGISTRATE.

(Answer to Question No. 2922, page 585 ante.)

**Mr. H. W. Emerson :** (a) Government is aware of the complaints mentioned in (c) and (d) of the question.

(b) Yes.

(c) Three complaints to the High Court were made by one member of the Karnal Bar—Lala Makhan Lal—against this Magistrate : No. 1 is dated the 16th October 1929, No. 2 is dated the 31st December 1929, and No. 3 is dated the 26th January 1930.

No. 1 concerns a case in which the said counsel applied twice to the District Magistrate for a transfer of the case, and his application was rejected. It was further rejected by a Judge of the High Court who remarked in his order " This application is devoid of all merit, and in fact I do not consider it a *bona fide* application."

With regard to Nos. 2 and 3 no report has yet been received.

(d) Yes.

(e) The matter is still under enquiry.

CIVIL SURGEON, JHANG DISTRICT.

(Answer to Question No. 2941, page 596 ante.)

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes, except for a short period.

(b) There were no particular reasons for not appointing a Muslim to this post. The posting of medical officers depends on the men on the cadre after they have reached a certain stage of seniority. Very few Muslim Civil Surgeons are available owing to shortage of Muslims in the cadre of Assistant Surgeons.

RATES CHARGED FOR JUNGLE WOOD ON THE SUTLEJ VALLEY PROJECT  
FROM THE TEMPORARY LEASE-HOLDERS.

(Answer to Question No. 2958, page 776 ante.)

**The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** (a) In 1927.

(b) The forest department extracted wood departmentally only from a part of Sahuka Reserve and realized Rs. 3,10,590 for 3,922,500 cubic feet at the rate of Rs. 8 per cubic foot. Deducting the cost of cutting and carrying the wood to the sale depôt the net amount realized was Rs. 2-4-0 per 100 cubic feet.

ASSESSMENT OF VALUE OF WOOD CHARGED TO TEMPORARY LEASE-  
HOLDERS ON SUTLEJ VALLEY CANAL.

(Answer to Question No. 2959, page 776 ante.)

**The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** No. The lessees were charged Rs. 2 per 100 cubic feet for Jhand and Re. 0-8-0 per 100 cubic feet for Farash wood, as against Rs. 2-4-0 per 100 cubic feet realized by departmental exploitation both for Jhand and Farash, and Rs. 2 normally charged to the Public Works Department, Buildings and Roads and Irrigation Branches.



## ACREAGE RATE ON THE LOWER CHENAB CANAL.

(Answer to Question No. 2960, page 776 ante).

**The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** (a) Yes.

(b) The acreage rate on the Lower Chenab Canal was discontinued in 1925.

PANDIT SURI RAM SHARMA OF JHAJJAR.

(Answer to Question No. 2961, page 776 ante).

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

## ANSWERS TO UNSTARRED QUESTIONS.

HARGOLAL, KANAYA MAHAVIDYALAYA, AMBALA CANTONMENT.

(Answer to Question No. 1197, page 24 ante).

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :**

(a) No.

(b) No. The Inspectress has inspected the school.

(c) No. Office records are confidential.

(d) Yes.

(e) No. (As in (a) above).

(f) No reply has been given.

(g) Yes.

## PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION IN AMBALA DISTRICT.

(Answer to Question No. 1978, page 85 ante).

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :***Statement showing annual cost of primary and secondary education by all different resources for the year 1927-28, 1928-29 of the Ambala District.*

Name of District.	Government Funds.	Board Funds.	Municipal Funds.	Fees.	Other sources.	Totals.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
<b>AMBALA.</b>						
1927-28—						
Males ..	2,71,994	38,355	14,229	1,18,853	93,831	5,37,259
Females ..	22,778	2,922	2,044	158	19,592	48,094
Total ..	2,94,772	41,277	16,273	1,19,011	1,13,423	5,83,353
1928-29—						
Males ..	2,39,066	65,346	14,436	1,15,863	82,169	5,16,882
Females ..	23,726	2,832	3,132	175	24,522	54,388
Total ..	2,62,792	68,180	17,568	1,16,038	1,06,691	5,71,270

## MOTOR ACCIDENTS.

(Answer to Question No. 1362, page 36 ante.)

**The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikander Hyat Khan :** (a) The figures for the year 1928 are 92 accidents resulting in 98 deaths and 157 accidents in which serious injuries resulted. In 1929 there were 139 fatal accidents resulting in 149 deaths and 183 accidents resulting in serious injuries.

Figures for the financial year 1928-29 are not available.

(b) 187 in 1928 and 254 in 1929. The punishments inflicted were fine up to Rs. 500 and imprisonment with or without fine, ranging from 2½ years to one month.

## RAJA MUHAMMAD HASSAN, P. A. S.

(Answer to Question No. 1475, page 122 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) No. M. Muhammad Hassan got permission to purchase gram on 2nd October 1928 from his superior officer and passed the bania's-bill for it at market rate on that date. Evidence indicated that the gram had been conveyed to the farms some days earlier when M. Muhammad Hassan was on leave, and the market rate was lower.

(b) M. Muhammad Hassan was called upon to pay the difference in rates of the dates concerned.

(c) It would not be fair to officers concerned to compare the cases, for no two incidents are altogether similar.

(d) Does not arise.

## COMPOSITION OF THE LAHORE IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE.

(Answer to Question No. 1494, page 133 ante.)

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) The Committee is at present composed as follows :—

Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, Buildings and Roads Branch—*President*.

Superintending Architect, Architectural Circle—*Secretary*.

Deputy Commissioner, Lahore.

Secretary, Municipal Committee, Lahore.

(b) The Lahore Improvement Committee is an advisory body consulted by the Municipal Committee from time to time when applications are received for permission to construct buildings on the Mall and other principal thoroughfares. The procedure is governed by the Municipal bye-laws and the responsibility rests with the Municipal Committee.

## PROCEDURE re SUBMISSION OF BUILDING PLANS ON THE LAHORE MALL.

(Answer to Question No. 1495, page 134 ante.)

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** The rules are contained in the building bye-laws of the Lahore Municipal Committee published with

Punjab Government Notification No. 18654, dated the 18th August 1919. It is understood that in considering applications to construct buildings on the Mall, the Municipal Committee consults the Lahore Improvement Committee, an advisory body which has been established to help the municipal committee in improving the appearance of the more important thoroughfares.

#### SALTA CASES.

(Answer to Question No. 1501, page 194 ante.)

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :**

*Statement showing the number of cases challaned in each district of the Punjab, under the Public Gambling (Punjab Amendment) Act I of 1929.*

Name of District.				Number of cases chal- laned.
Hissar	..	..	..	27
Rohtak	..	..	..	1
Karnal	..	..	..	1
Ambala	..	..	..	11
Hoshiarpur	..	..	..	11
Ludhiana	..	..	..	20
Ferozepore	..	..	..	16
Lahore	..	..	..	4
Amritsar	..	..	..	32
				<hr/> 128

*Note.*—No case under the Public Gambling (Punjab Amendment) Act I of 1929 has yet been challaned in any other district of the Punjab.

#### MATRICULATION RESULTS AND REDUCTION OF GRANTS.

(Answer to Question No. 1528, page 254 ante.)

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (a) The statement giving the required information is attached.

(b) Yes. It was slightly less in the case of two schools, but it may be noted that the matric. results taken into consideration at the time of assessing grants payable in 1929-30 were those of 1928 and not of 1929 examination. It may also be mentioned that the matriculation result is only one of the many considerations kept in view at the time of assessing grants.

(c) The attention of the honourable member is invited to the conditions laid down under articles 13 and 18, Chapter III of the Punjab Education Code, 11th Edition. Reasons for cutting down grants in the case of individual schools are treated as confidential. The question of conditions under which assessments take place is now being examined again by Director of Public Instruction with the help of Divisional Inspectors and other chosen officers.

## MATRICULATION EXAMINATION RESULTS.

Name of School.	1928.		Per-centage.	1929.		Per-centage.
	Number sent.	Number passed.		Number sent.	Number passed.	
1. D. A.-V. High School, Shahabad (District Karnal).	23	21	91%	15	15	100%
2. A. S. High School, Ambala.	76	62	82%	74	61	82%
3. A. S. High School, Pundri.	28	24	86%	35	29	83%
4. C. A.-V. High School, Hissar.	34	24	71%	37	26	70%
5. Jat High School, Hissar.	27	6	22%	22	14	64%

## CRIMINAL APPEALS IN SOME SESSIONS COURTS.

(Answer to Question No. 1593, page 257 ante.)

The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow : A statement is laid on the table.

## NUMBER OF SESSIONS CASES AND CRIMINAL APPEALS CONDUCTED BY THE PUBLIC PROSECUTORS IN SESSIONS COURTS.

Serial No.	District.	1927.		1928.		1929.		Pay of Public Prosecutor.
		Sessions cases.	Criminal appeals.	Sessions cases.	Criminal appeals.	Sessions cases.	Criminal appeals.	
1	Hissar ..	28	262	26	224	28	333	Rs. 650
2	Hoshiarpur ..	8	165	11	116	10	124	750
3	Ambala ..	14	179	16	186	13	113	650
4	Karnal* ..	31	316	20	341	13	277	650
5	Rohtak* ..	8	10	13	55	21	110	500
6	Ludhiana ..	17	130	31	276	16	245	750
7	Gujrat ..	21	186	20	168	22	239	750
8	Gujranwala ..	18	181	21	145	25	154	750
9	Sheikhupura ..	30	213	25	73	22	126	900
10	Montgomery ..	28	122	21	144	22	217	1,050

- \*1. Cases shown against Rohtak for 1927, 1928 and for the first three months of 1929 were conducted by Public Prosecutor, Karnal, who was in combined charge of Rohtak and Karnal districts up till 7th April 1929.
- \*2. Public Prosecutor, Karnal's pay as Public Prosecutor for combined districts of Karnal and Rohtak was Rs. 750.
- \*3. On the appointment of a separate Public Prosecutor for Rohtak on Rs. 600 per mensem with effect from 8th April 1929, the pay of Public Prosecutor, Karnal, was reduced from Rs. 750 to Rs. 650 with effect from the termination of the period of his appointment which expired on 12th October 1929. The pay of Public Prosecutor, Karnal, is now fixed at Rs. 650 per mensem.
- \*4. This statement which is compiled from the Public Prosecutor's diaries, shows only the Sessions cases and criminal appeals actually conducted by the Public Prosecutors; but does not show the total number of Sessions cases and criminal appeals decided by the Sessions Judges concerned during the period in question. Nor does the statement give a complete account of the work done by Public Prosecutors. Section 30 cases and important cases tried by 1st class magistrates (in which Public Prosecutor usually appears) are, for example, omitted from the statement.

## COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION IN THE LAHORE CO-OPERATIVE UNION.

(Answer to question No. 1539, page 261 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The total number of members comprising the Punjab Co-operative Union is 157 ; of these 131 are co-operative institutions and the rest officials.

These co-operative institutions have elected as their representatives 219 persons who appear from their names to consist of —

- 2 Christians.
- 48 Hindus.
- 52 Sikhs.
- 117 Muslims.

These persons elected the executive committee who from their names appear to be :—

- 1 Christian.
- 4 Hindus.
- 8 Sikhs.
- 21 Muslims.

(b) There is no standard of communal representation ; each co-operative institution affiliated to the Union elects its own representatives in its own general meeting according to its own lights.

(c) Government has no information, but three Sikh representatives resigned.

(d) As in (a) above.

## GRANT-IN-AID TO SCHOOLS—MUSLIM'S SHARE.

(Answer to Question No. 1541, page 261 ante.)

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** 1. Some representations of nature by Islamic bodies particularly by the Anjuman-i-Himayat-i-Islam, Lahore, have been made to His Excellency the Governor.

2. In reply to the address by the Anjuman-i-Himayat-i-Islam His Excellency the Governor said as follows in December 1928 :—

“As regards grants-in-aid to privately-managed secondary schools, I believe that during the last three years grants to Muslim Schools have varied between 21·8 per cent. and 19·1 per cent. of the total. Under the present rules the ordinary system of grant is based on the approved expenditure of the body applying for it ; and the figures of the share indicate the degree of support which a community has given to the establishment and maintenance

of schools. I have not had opportunity of discussing your precise suggestion with the Ministry as the draft of your address only reached me at a time when we were busy with preparations for the session of the Legislative Council. I cannot therefore at the moment give an indication of the final view which may be taken regarding the suggested change, which, you will admit, would constitute a reversal of the principle of help in proportion to the amount of approved expenditure hitherto followed".

8. Recently it was represented to His Excellency the Governor by a Muslim deputation that the existing rules with regard to grants-in-aid could be amended in various ways with a view specially to help Muslim schools, without departing from the principle that assistance must bear a relation to the effort and expenditure made by the body applying for aid, but no suggestions for such amendments that were promised have been yet received. When these suggestions are received they will be duly considered by the Ministry.

#### THE ATTOCK OIL COMPANY.

(Answer to Question No. 1548, page 262 ante.)

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Hussain :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes. Only one piece to Arya Samaj free for a temple.

(c) No, reference was made to Government.

(d) Yes.

(e) Attention is invited to the agreement which is to be executed between Government and the Company (copy laid on the table), the provisions of which are that the Company shall perpetually hold, use and enjoy the land transferred to it for the following purpose and no other, to wit that it shall make legitimate use of the land as may be necessary or requisite for the purposes of winning petroleum or for purposes subservient thereto.

This agreement made this                      day of                      19                      Between the Secretary of State for India in Council (hereinafter called the Secretary of State) of the one part and the Attock Oil Company, Limited (who had their successors and assigns) are hereinafter called the Company of the other part.

Whereas the said Company having been incorporated in England has made an application to the Punjab Government to acquire under the provisions of the Land Acquisition Act land in Attock District containing by admeasurement 265.31 acres or thereabouts of area situated in Khaur and Ahmdal villages in the Pindigheb Tahsil of the Attock District and bounded as described in the schedule and delineated in the map annexed thereto.

And whereas the Punjab Government is satisfied after considering the report of the Collector under section 5-A, sub-section 2 of Land Acquisition Act, No. 1 of 1894, that the proposed acquisition is needed for the develop

ment of mineral operation and that such development is likely to prove useful to the public and whereas the Punjab Government has called upon the said Company to enter into an agreement with the said Secretary of State regarding the matters laid down in section 41 of the Land Acquisition Act.

Now this agreement witnesseth that in consideration of the premises the said Company does hereby agree and covenant with the said Secretary of State as follows, that is to say :—

- (1) That the said Company shall pay to the Punjab Government or to such person whom the said Government may appoint in this behalf all such sum or sums of money as shall be awarded under the provisions of the Land Acquisition Act, as compensation to any person or persons who may be found on enquiry held under the provisions of the said Act to be interested in the land hereinbefore mentioned as required by the said Company; and also shall defray and pay to the said Government all charges of and incidental to and the cost of the acquisition of the aforesaid land under the provisions of the said Act.
- (2) That on transfer by the said Secretary of State to the said Company of the aforesaid land the said Company shall perpetually hold, use and enjoy the same for the purposes following and no others that is to say :—The said Company shall on being put in proprietary possession of the aforesaid land make legitimate use of the land as may be necessary or requisite for the purposes of winning petroleum or for purposes subservient thereto but always subject to such laws, rules and conditions as may be in force now or hereafter regulating the establishment and maintenance of oilfields of the character aforesaid.
- (3) That the said Company shall at all times hereafter expose, offer and sell all oil which may be the product of the said oilfields at market rates prevailing at the time of such exposure, offer or sales, respectively, to the public at Khaur and elsewhere.
- (4) That the said Company does hereby acknowledge and recognise the right now and hereafter of the said Secretary of State to and in all mines, minerals, coals, gold washings and quarries of every description and earth-oils other than petroleum in or under the land aforesaid and also the right to do all such acts, deeds or things by the said Secretary of State as may be necessary or requisite to be done for the purposes of enjoyment thereof.
- (5) That the said Company shall always provide a right of way for the owners of the fields which lie between the village site and the agricultural lands within the distance of 150 yards of the present path.

And the said Secretary of State does hereby agree and covenant with the said Company that on payment aforesaid having been made and defrayed

by the said Company to the said Secretary of State, the said Secretary of State shall forthwith in consideration of the repayment of the compensation money and cost of acquisition aforesaid convey and grant to the said Company all that land aforesaid free from all encumbrances together with all rights, easements and appurtenances belonging or reputed to belong thereto, to have and to hold the same in full proprietary possession unto and to the said Company but subject to the conditions hereinbefore mentioned.

In Witnesses Whereof the parties to this Agreement have hereunto respectively subscribed their names on the dates and at the places herein-after in each case specified:—

For and on behalf of the Secretary of State for }  
India in Council, and by order of the Governor } Deputy Commissioner,  
of the Punjab, on 19 . ) Attock District.

Signed by—

for and on behalf of and under authority from  
the Company in the presence of—

1.

2.

} Witnesses.

Dated

19 .

DRINKING WATER SUPPLY, BEIT, GARHSHANKAR.

(Answer to Question No. 1546, page 275 ante.)

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) It is a fact that throughout the Beit ilaqa (comprising 31 revenue estates in the Garhshankar and Una Tahsils) there is a serious shortage of pure water and that the people have to rely largely (and in some villages entirely) on the water of tanks and ponds. It is believed that the people are attacked by guinea-worm (*filaria medinensis*) owing to the impurity of the water.

(c) A scheme is under consideration between the Rural Sanitary and Improvement Board, Punjab, and the District Board, Hoshiarpur.

(d) The possibility of levying a fee under section 33 read with section 20 (1) (e) of the District Boards Act is under consideration locally. The matter has been discussed with the people by the Deputy Commissioner and public opinion is being further ascertained through non-official members of the District Board. The District Board is well aware of conditions in the Beit ilaqa. The charging of a water tax and its rates is a matter which will be dealt with by the Rural Sanitary and Improvement Board, the local District Board and the public that will benefit by the water scheme. It is difficult to imagine a scheme where even the working and maintenance expenses are not to be raised by means of a water tax.

CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT SOCIETY OF CHAK No. 118-G. B.

(Answer to Question No. 275 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) Only members and creditors of the society are entitled to see such reports.



- (c) These societies are independent self-governing bodies and no one has any right to issue orders to them.
- (d) Government has no information.
- (e) None. I trust that the House will see that it is not possible for me to give detailed information about all of these 20,000 societies.

**CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT SOCIETY OF CHAK No. 118-G. B.**

(Answer to Question No. 1548, page 275 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

- (b) In some cases, yes.
- (c) This is the rule in cases of societies with unlimited liability.
- (d) This is a matter which the society itself decides.
- (e) Government cannot interfere with private property.

**FOREST GUARDS.**

(Answer to Question No. 1557, page 280 ante.)

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) 49.

(b) 23 distributed as under :—

- 19 resigned for private affairs.  
 2 resigned for ill-health.  
 1 resigned for insufficient pay.  
 1 resigned while under suspension before completion of enquiry into charges against him.

(c) The pay of I grade guards is Rs. 20.

The pay of II grade guards is Rs. 18.

The pay of III grade guards is Rs. 16.

On transfer they are allowed travelling allowance at tour rates fixed for XII grade officials,—vide rule 2.90 of the Travelling Allowance Rules.

(d) No.

**COST OF FIREWOOD AT CHHANGA MANGA RAILWAY STATION.**

(Answer to Question No. 1560, page 387 ante.)

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :**

**Cost of delivery of 100 maunds of firewood at Chhanga Manga Railway Station.**

*By bullock tramway before 1915.*

Rs. A. P.

2 10 6

*By Steam tramway.*

Rs. A. P.

4 5 6

It may be noted, however—

- (a) that it is impossible to compare pre-war and post-war rates, and
- (b) that the old bullock tramway, assisted by local carts, could never carry more than 3rds of the firewood cut annually, after fellings had started.

## FLOOD AFFECTED LANDS IN KHAIRAN AND ANDAURA TALUQAS.

(Answer to Question No. 1569, page 891 ante.)

The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain: A statement giving the required information is attached.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE INFORMATION ASKED FOR IN COUNCIL.  
QUESTION No. 1569 WITH REGARD TO THE VILLAGES LYING ON  
EITHER BANK OF THE RIVER BEAS IN THE KHAIRAN AND  
ANDAURA TALUQAS OF TAHSIL NURPUR, DISTRICT KANGRA.

Taluka.	Serial No.	Village.	(a).		(b).	
			Total area under cultivation in the Settlement, 1891-92.	Total area under cultivation in the Settlement, 1917-18.	Total area under cultivation now.	Total cultivated area swept away during the last six years.
			Acres.	Acres.	Acres.	Acres.
Andaura	1	Beli Jattan ..	344	291	270	17
	2	Beli Bajjalan ..	64	2	1	1
	3	Bela Ludhianphar ..	403	370	344	12
	4	Bela Thakran ..	161	165	182	30
	5	Sanaur ..	395	244	201	16
	6	Andaura ..	621	455	400	44
	7	Tanda ..	170	96	137	3
	8	Ban Andorian ..	57	32	98	..
	9	Kath Gach ..	454	265	298	27
	10	Ghandran ..	992	669	578	84
	11	Surarwan ..	1,533	1,200	1,272	57
	12	Dhamota ..	354	103	72	22
	13	Tora ..	237	325	311	..
	14	Tamota ..	244	197	112	41
	15	Basantpur ..	438	595	386	..
	16	Melwa ..	265	137	131	..
	17	Ushrian ..	511	552	602	..
	18	Khampur ..	410	327	282	37
	19	Miani ..	104	1	29	1
	20	Manjwah ..	320	111	147	22
	21	Thakardawra ..	692	586	560	2

STATEMENT SHOWING THE INFORMATION ASKED FOR IN COUNCIL QUESTION  
No. 1539 WITH REGARD TO THE VILLAGES LYING ON EITHER BANK  
OF THE RIVER BEAS IN THE KHAIRAN AND ANDAURA TALUQAS  
OF TAHSIL NURPUR, DISTRICT KANGRA—CONSOL.

Taluka.	Serial No.	Village.	(a).		(b).	
			Total area under cultivation in the Settlement, 1901-02.	Total area under cultivation in the Settlement, 1917-18.	Total area under cultivation now.	Total cultivated area swept away during the last six years.
Andaura— consol.	22	Parli .. ..	620	563	543	37
	23	Bela Andaura ..	389	297	329	41
	24	Palath .. ..	66	18	17	1
	25	Gagwal .. ..	302	308	317	..
	26	Barota .. ..	541	412	411	6
	27	Bakrawan .. ..	187	140	138	2
	28	Gathota .. ..	329	336	353	15
		Total .. ..	11,270	8,745	8,478	490
Khairan	1	Palath .. ..	424	551	536	1
	2	Bhogarwan .. ..	360	399	445	56
	3	Pind Padhian ..	208	196	196	4
	4	Makli .. ..	86	198	142	7
	5	Halle .. ..	11	49	34	22
	6	Rajgr .. ..	357	280	278	..
	7	Bhatoli .. ..	134	70	76	..
	8	Badala .. ..	149	72	94	6
	9	Deothi .. ..	223	184	203	3
	10	Beli Bhorian ..	7	..	..	..
	11	Bahadpur .. ..	430	465	466	17
	12	Dhaulpur .. ..	321	306	316	..
	13	Rajpalwan .. ..	143	126	145	3
	14	Riall .. ..	602	565	537	25
	15	Be .. ..	778	744	764	31
		Total .. ..	4,291	4,095	4,221	177
GRAND TOTAL FOR BOTH THE TALUQAS.			15,567	12,840	12,699	667

## AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE, LYALLPUR, EXPULSIONS.

(Answer to Question No. 1573, page 392 ante).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** A statement giving the required information is laid on the table.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER AND NAMES OF THE STUDENTS WHO HAVE EITHER BEEN EXPELLED OR HAVE DISCONTINUED THEIR STUDIES IN THE PUNJAB AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE, LYALLPUR, DURING THE LAST SIX YEARS.

Names.	Struck off.	Expelled.	Left.
1924-25.			
1. Ahmad Khan ..	Continued absence	..	..
2. J. Mir Muhammad ..	Ditto	..	..
3. Ghulam Abbas Shah ..	Ditto	..	..
4. Sardari Lal, Mehta ..	..	..	Ill-health.
5. Ram Datta ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
6. Balwant Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.
7. Abdul Rahman ..	..	..	Ditto.
8. Roop Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.
9. Aziz Din ..	..	..	Ditto.
1925-26.			
1. Muhammad Husain ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
2. Ali Ahmad ..	..	..	Ditto.
3. Ghulam Shabbir ..	..	..	Ditto.
4. Kunden Lal ..	..	..	Ditto.
5. Ude Chand ..	..	..	Ditto.
6. Dayal Chand ..	..	..	Ditto.
7. Ramji Das ..	..	..	Ditto.
8. Thakar Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.
9. Sita Ram ..	..	..	Ditto.
10. Autar Singh ..	..	For breach of discipline.	..
11. Muhammad Anwar ..	..	..	For unsatisfactory results.
12. Gian Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.
13. Des Raj ..	..	..	Ditto.
14. Rajindar Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.

	Names.	Struck off.	Expelled.	Left.
	1925-26—(conold.)			
15.	Ahmad Khan ..	..	..	For unsatisfactory results.
16.	Francis William ..	..	..	Ditto.
17.	Barkat Ram ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
18.	Jiwan Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.
	1926-27.			
1.	Mulk Raj ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
2.	Kapoor Singh ..	Continued absence	..	..
3.	Rahmat Ali ..	Ditto	..	..
4.	Aftab Ahmad ..	Ditto	..	..
5.	Zahar Ahmad ..	Ditto	..	..
6.	Hakim Ullah ..	Ditto	..	..
7.	Khan Ahmad Shah ..	Ditto	..	..
8.	Ram Sarup ..	Ditto	..	..
9.	Amar Nath ..	Ditto	..	..
10.	Het Ram, Nahra ..	Ditto	..	..
11.	Wali Husain Shah ..	Ditto	..	..
12.	Atma Ram ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
13.	Kauser Ali ..	..	..	Ditto.
14.	Fazl-ur-Rahman ..	..	..	For unsatisfactory results.
15.	Earnest S. Singh ..	Continued absence	..	..
16.	Muhammad Ata Ullah ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
	1927-28.			
1.	Gul Muhammad ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
2.	Niranjan Das ..	..	..	Ditto.
3.	Raghu Nath, Malhotra ..	..	..	Ditto.
4.	Sardari Lal ..	..	..	Ditto.
5.	Muhammad Khan ..	..	..	Ditto.
6.	Ikram Ali Khan ..	..	..	Ditto.
7.	Attar Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.
8.	Abdul Auwal ..	..	..	Ditto.
9.	Gurbirat Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.

Names.	Struck off.	Expelled.	Left.
1927-28 — (concl'd).			
10. Parkash Chand ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
11. Ram Parkash ...	..	..	Ditto.
1928-29.			
1. K. Durga Das ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
2. Fazl-i-Haq ..	..	..	Ditto.
3. Tehsin Ullah ..	..	..	Ditto.
4. Allah Bakhsh ..	Continued absence	..	..
5. Sundar Singh ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
6. P. P. Ghansham Dass ..	..	..	Ditto.
7. Narinder Singh ..	..	..	Ditto.
8. Santa Singh ..	..	..	..
9. Ahmed Hayat ..	..	Breach of discipline.	..
10. Dani Chand ..	Continued absence	..	..
11. Abdul Aziz ..	Ditto	..	..
12. A. E. Thomas ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
13. Ramji Das ..	..	Copying in examination.	..
14. Khem Singh ..	..	Ditto	..
15. Audesh Saran ..	Continued absence	..	..
16. Ajit Singh ..	..	Misconduct ..	..
17. Prem Nath ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
1929-30.			
1. Khem Singh ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
2. Abdul Latif ..	..	..	Ditto.
3. Muhammad Sharif ..	..	..	Ditto.
4. Raghbir Singh ..	..	Misconduct ..	..
5. E. H. Ghosh ..	..	..	Withdrawn.
6. Muhammad Niwaz ..	..	..	Ditto.
7. Mubarak Khan ..	..	..	Ditto.
8. Ram Singh, Fogat ..	Irregular ..	..	..
9. Amir Habib Ullah ..	Ditto ..	..	..
10. Jai Singh ..	..	..	Withdrawn.

Year	Struck off.	Expelled.	Left.	GRAND TOTAL.
1924-25	8	..	0	9
1925-26	..	..	17	18
1926-27	11	..	8	16
1927-28	..	..	11	11
1928-29	4	..	9	17
1929-30	2	..	7	10
GRAND TOTAL	20	..	55	81

## WATER-LIFTING BRANCH, AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT.

(Answer to Question No. 1574, page 892 ante).

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh:** (a) There is a temporary Lift Irrigation Section in the Agricultural Engineering division of the Department of Agriculture.

(b) Two Engineers are employed in this Section. One of them is an Executive Engineer on Rs. 825 per mensem plus £25 overseas pay. He is a Civil Engineer on deputation from the Irrigation Branch. The other is a temporary Assistant Engineer on Rs. 775 per mensem. He is a qualified Mechanical and Electrical Engineer.

(c) The Lift Irrigation Section was opened in December, 1926 only, and the Assistant Engineer joined in December, 1927. The enclosed statement laid on the table gives the details of the journeys made by these officers together since January, 1928, the Travelling Allowance drawn for these journeys and the object of each tour. The combined touring was necessary in the interest of Government work, and had the previous approval of their immediate superior officer.

(d) Both Engineers visited the Kangra District (*vide* items 10 and 18 of the statement), but not the hilly parts of Gurdaspur District.

(e) The possibilities of Lift Irrigation in certain parts of the Kangra District were investigated. Preliminary rough estimates for certain schemes have been drawn up and are under examination. Various landowners were given advice regarding the irrigation of their estates. The existence of rights owned by numerous persons in each stream and spring made it a matter of practical impossibility to carry out any schemes of improvement. The result was that no scheme could be put into operation.



**STATEMENT SHOWING THE DATES ON WHICH BOTH THE ENGINEERS OF LIFF IRRIGATION DIVISION TRAVELLED TOGETHER AND ALSO SHOWING THE OTHER INFORMATION ASKED FOR IN PARAGRAPH (c).**

11

Serial No.	Date.	Particulars.	NUMBER OF MILES TRAVELLED BY MOTOR.		Number of miles travelled by train.	TOTAL AMOUNT OF TRAVELLING ALLOWANCE DRAWN.		Object of the journey.
			Number of miles for which Railway fare is charged.	Number of miles for which mileage allowance is charged.		By Executive Engineer.	By Assistant Engineer.	
APPENDIX.								
1	7-1-28	Lyalpur to Bhavana Branch, H. D. 35,000 and back.	..	70	..	Rs. 30 0 0	Rs. 28 8 0	To inspect sites of water falls.
2	29-1-28	Lyalpur to Minarwala and back.	..	84	..	37 0 0	36 8 0	To inspect Tube-Well being installed.
3	28-3-28	Lyalpur to Chak No. 474 and back.	..	53	..	36 0 0	34 8 0	To inspect land for Tube-Well irrigation.
4	31-3-28	Lyalpur to Chakur and back.	..	95	..	27 6 0	26 0 0	To inspect Chakur area if suitable for irrigation.
5	24-4-28	Lyalpur to Rao Bagh Mall and back.	..	80	..	35 0 0	33 8 0	To inspect land for Lift irrigation and inspection of falls at Chindot District-hary.

APPENDIX.

## APPENDIX.

xlii

6	23-5-28	Lyalpur to Minarwala and back.	..	84	--	37	0	0	35	8	0	Inspection of Tube-Well.
7	2-6-28	Lyalpur to Minarwala and back.	..	84	--	37	0	0	35	8	0	Inspection of Tube-Well.
8	18-9-28	Lyalpur to villages Mathroma, Raafida, Buthari, Durratke, Kharan and Kirk Mohammad and back.	..	102	..	48	0	0	44	8	0	To inspect land suitable for lift irrigation.
9	24-9-28	Lyalpur to Minarwala and back.	..	84	..	37	0	0	35	8	0	To inspect Tube-Well in station.
10	10-10-28 to 18-10-28	Lyalpur to various places in Kangra District and back.	380	215	--	283	3	0	209	1	0	To inspect various sites for Lift Irrigation Schemes.
11	3-12-28	Lyalpur to Minarwala and back.	..	84	--	37	0	0	35	8	0	To carry out experiments on Tube-Well.
12	15-3-29	Ditto	..	84	..	37	0	0	35	8	0	To inspect tube-well.
13	12-7-29 to 22-7-29	Lyalpur to various places in Kangra District and back.	380	487	..	388	3	0	360	11	0	To inspect various sites for lift irrigation schemes and to advise the zamindars on points of lift irrigation and installation of machinery.
14	28-1-30	Lyalpur to Fandi Rustian and back.	--	88	--	39	0	0	37	2	0	To inspect land for lift irrigation.

Note.—A tube-well was installed at Minarwala by the Agricultural Department. To watch its installation and when installed to carry out various experiments, it was necessary to make occasional visits to Minarwala.

## JATHAS OF EX-MILITARY MEN.

(Answer to Question No. 1575, page 398 ante).

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :** (a) Two.

(b) They were sent to the judicial lock-up on the same day and remained there from 27th December 1929 to 5th January 1930.

(c) and (d) A statement is appended.

Division.	Name of districts.	Number of ex-military men arrested under section 107, Criminal Procedure Code.	Number of ex-military men who are still in jail.
Jullundur Division	Hoshiarpur .. ..	19	None.
	Jullundur .. ..	4	None.
Lahore Division	Lahore .. ..	7	7
	Amritsar .. ..	6	None.
	Gurdaspur .. ..	21	None.
	Sheikhpura .. ..	6	None.
Multan Division	Lyallpur .. ..	6	None.
	All other districts ..	None.	None.

## OFFICERS IN THE HYDRO-ELECTRIC BRANCH.

(Answer to Question No. 1578, page 394 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) and (b). A statement giving the information on which the answer to Council Question No. 1246 was based is attached.

It is regretted that in the above statement through an error, percentages were calculated on a wrong basis. The correct percentages are as follows :—

(i) Percentage of Indian Officers to total number of officers .. ..	21.73
(ii) Percentage of salary paid to Indian Officers to total salary paid—	
(a) including S. O. P. paid to European Officers ..	14.51
(b) excluding S. O. P. paid to European Officers ..	17.15

## COUNCIL QUESTION No. 1246.

Serial No.	EUROPEANS.			Serial No.	INDIANS.	
	Name of officer.	Pay including S. O. S. pay.	Pay excluding S. O. S. pay.		Name of officer.	Pay.
		Rs.	Rs.			Rs.
1	Col. B. C. Battye ..	3,178	3,000	1	Mr. N. N. Iengar ..	1,275
2	Mr. W. N. McLeod ..	2,228	2,050	2	S. Kirpal Singh ..	925
3	Mr. N. B. MacMillan ..	1,775	1,375	3	Mr. B. Paul ..	1,075
4	Mr. H. P. Thomas ..	2,228	2,050	4	Mr. R. L. Narayanan ..	775
5	Mr. A. T. Arnall ..	1,775	1,375	5	Mr. B. K. Sibou ..	825
6	Mr. C. E. Jefferis ..	1,928	1,750		Total ..	4,875
7	Mr. D. S. McPhail ..	1,375	975			
8	Mr. R. N. Ayiward ..	1,775	1,375			
9	Mr. S. J. Bruford ..	1,575	1,175			
10	Mr. G. H. Hunt ..	1,425	1,025			
11	Maj. A. Sanderson ..	1,775	1,375			
12	Capt. R. D. Keane ..	1,108	775			
13	Capt. H. A. Kenyon ..	1,050	1,050			
14	Mr. D. P. O'Kelly ..	1,325	925			
15	Lt. N. Boddington ..	775	575			
16	Maj. A. G. Wheeler ..	1,275	875			
17	Capt. A. Guthrie ..	1,058	725			
18	Mr. N. V. Dorofeeff ..	1,100	1,100			
	Total ..	28,728	23,550			

(i) Percentage of Indian Officers .. .. . 27.77

(ii) Percentage of the total amount paid in salaries to Indian Officers :—

(a) Including S. O. S. pay paid to European Officers .. .. . 16.98

(b) Excluding S. O. S. pay paid to European Officers .. .. . 20.70

## UHL RIVER.

*(Answer to Question No. 1579, page 394 ante.)*

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) 100 cusecs : this has occurred twice only for a few hours during the last 7 years.

(b) 150 cusecs. During the last 6 years this has been available for 95.6 per cent. of the total time.

(c) 12,000 kilowatts for 100 per cent. of the time and 18,000 kilowatts for 95.6 per cent. of the time.

---

**MR. MCLEOD, SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER.**

*(Answer to Question No. 1580, page 394 ante.)*

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes, he was selected for the charge of the Administrative Circle.

(b) Mr. Mcleod was recommended by Mr. Sangster. No application was received in the Public Works Department from Mr. Mcleod for the post.

(c) Mr. Mcleod was selected on account of his knowledge and experience of administrative matters.

---

**COMMISSION ALLOWED TO SUB-REGISTRARS.**

*(Answer to Question No. 1583, page 395 ante.)*

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) The question does not appear to have been raised before and will be now examined on its merits, though the rules governing their remuneration were fixed having in view the whole of the duties they are expected to perform.

---

**POSTING OF CLERKS IN SUB-REGISTRAR'S OFFICE.**

*(Answer to Question No. 1584, page 396 ante.)*

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) The circular letter in question was not specifically brought to the notice of Government prior to the asking of the present question.

(b) The Inspector-General of Registration is satisfied that his instructions in this circular are generally followed in the offices of Registrars and Sub-Registrars.

---

**REPRESENTATION OF SIKHS IN THE STAFF OF CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT SOCIETIES.**

*(Answer to Question No. 1604, page 604 ante.)*

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The total

number of clerks confirmed in the Co-operative Department since October 1928 is as follows :—

Sikhs .. .. .	10
Hindus .. .. .	17
Muslims .. .. .	28

(b) No. Out of the total number of clerks in the Co-operative Department, 17 per cent. are Sikhs.

(c) Does not arise.

#### SHRINE OF DIUT SIDHHA.

(Answer to Question No. 1609, page 607 ante.)

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) From Barsar to the shrine in question there is no road but only a bridle path, portions of which are negotiated with difficulty.

(d) Government have no intention of constructing such a road. The matter would appear to be one for the district board to consider.

#### DIPALPUR AND EASTERN CANALS.

(Answer to Question No. 1614, page 609 ante.)

**The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) As per Schedule of Occupier's rates sanctioned by the Government.

(d) Dipalpur Canal .. .. . 30,199 acres.

Eastern Canal .. .. . 3,152 acres.

\*(e) Dipalpur Canal .. .. . Rs. 62,840.

Eastern Canal .. .. . Rs. 7,841.

\*On account of Abiana (occupier's rates).

#### TUBE-WELL IN LUDHIANA.

(Answer to Question No. 1638, page 655 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes. The Locomotive Department of the North-Western Railway has a tube-well in the Engine Shed at Ludhiana.

(b) Yes.

(c) No. The wells within quarter of a mile are only slightly affected. The well is 370 feet deep and most of its supplies are artesian.

(d) No, but the local officers are considering the possibility of extending *kharif* irrigation to the civil station because the spring level in the local wells has sunk.

(e) None at present.

## INCOME FROM SHAMILAT FORESTS, KANGRA DISTRICT.

(Answer to Question No. 1688, page 710 ante.)

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :**

- (a) STATEMENT SHOWING ZAMINDARI SHARE PAID FOR THE YEARS 1927-28 AND 1928-29 FROM THE INCOME DERIVED FROM THE PRODUCE OF THE SHAMILAT FORESTS OF THE KANGRA DISTRICT.

Tahsil.	DISTRIBUTION OVER		
	Rakhas.	Khewatdars.	Lambardars.
		1927-28.	
Nurpur .. .. .	157	219	221
Kangra .. .. .	133	354	133
Palampur .. .. .	197	528	198
Dehra .. .. .	205	269	286
Hamirpur .. .. .	21	60	21
Total .. .. .	713	1,428	859
		1928-29.	
Nurpur .. .. .	80	196	84
Kangra .. .. .	183	433	163
Palampur .. .. .	266	708	266
Dehra .. .. .	108	111	163
Hamirpur .. .. .	9	24	9
Total .. .. .	626	1,474	685

- (b) STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF TREES GIVEN FREE OF COST TO ZAMINDARS FOR IMPLEMENTS DURING 1927-28 AND 1928-29.

Name of Tahsil.	1927-28.	1928-29.
Kangra .. .. .	67	182
Palampur .. .. .	240	432
Dehra .. .. .	34	60
Nurpur .. .. .	52	15
Hamirpur .. .. .	3,272	7,213
Total .. .. .	3,665	7,882

## CIVIL SURGEONS.

(Answer to Question No. 1640, page 710 ante.)

**The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :**

- (a) Civil Surgeons (excluding I. M. S. and I. M. D. officers) 9  
 Assistant Directors and District Medical officers of Health 42
- (b) Civil Surgeons :—
- |                 |   |
|-----------------|---|
| Muslims .. .. . | 8 |
| Hindus .. .. .  | 5 |
| Sikhs .. .. .   | 1 |

## Assistant Directors and District Medical officers of Health :—

Muslims..	..	..	..	12
Hindus ..	..	..	..	22
Sikhs ..	..	..	..	8
(c) Civil Surgeons	..	..	..	3
Assistant Directors and District Medical officers of Health.				7

## PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT ROADS, IN JHANG DISTRICT.

(Answer to Question No. 1642, page 711 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) The Public Works Department has constructed no pucca road in Jhang District, but maintain 14.6 miles taken over from the District Board as part of the Reclassification Schemes.

(b) 109.87 miles.

(c) General improvements, gradually raising the standard of maintenance.

All these roads were in a deplorable condition when they were taken over by the Public Works Department—in some places being mere tracks, while in others the alignment could only be traced with difficulty. The roads have now been improved so that they are all tolerably fit for motor traffic.

## BIKANER CANAL.

(Answer to part (d) of Question No. 1657, page 777 ante.)

**The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** (d) Detail of area, by villages, flooded in September 1928, is as below :—

Village.	Area,
Kahan Chand Wala ..	160 acres.
Haji Chhimba ..	68 "
Karian ..	846 "
Khilehi Jadid ..	70 "
Kalu Wara ..	96 "
Hasteke ..	130 "
Luther ..	46 "
Nauranzeke Laili ..	24 "
Total ..	940 "

## TEACHING STAFF OF THE MACLAGAN ENGINEERING COLLEGE, MOGHALPURA.

(Answer to Question No. 1668, page 728 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** The total number of Mohammadans on the teaching staff of the MacLagan Engineering College is six.

## STAFF OF THE MACLAGAN ENGINEERING COLLEGE, MOGHALPURA.

(Answer to Question No. 1669, page 728 ante.)

**The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** A statement is laid on the table.



Duties.	Pay and other allowances.	Qualifications.
	Rs.	
Principal .. .. .	2,000 plus 2 13-6-8 S. O. P.	B.Sc. (Engg.), London, A.E.C.Sc., A.M.I.E.E., A.M.I.C.E., Mem. Soc. Ing. Civ. de France, F.R.S.A.
Professor of Electrical Engineering.	1,275 plus 2 30 S.O.P.	M. Engg. (Liverpool) M.I.E.E.
Professor of Mathematics ..	1,075 plus £30 S.O.P.	Assoc. Mac. Coll. of Tech. (Hons. Bd. of Ed.).
Professor of Science .. ..	925	M.A. (Economics), M.Sc. Chem. (Punjab), Ph. D. (Cantab).
Junior Professor of Mechanical Engineering.	800	B.Sc. (Engg.), London, A.M. Inst. C.E.A.M.I. Mech., E. A.C.G.I., D.I.C., A.M.Am. Soc. C.E.
Assistant Professor of Mechanical Engineering.	800	A.M.I.E.E.
Assistant Professor of Electrical Engineering.	500	M.E. (B.T.L.), E.E. (B.T.L.).
Assistant Professor of Chemistry ..	On study leave	M.Sc. (Chemistry), Pb.
Officiating Assistant Professor of Chemistry.	325	M.Sc. Phys. (Punjab).
Assistant Professor of Physics ..	400	M.Sc. Phys. (Punjab), Ph. D. (London), D.I.C., A.I.P., F.P.S.L.
Assistant Professor of Mathematics	400 plus Rs. 50 hotel allowance.	M.A. (Mathematics), Pb.
Assistant Professor of Appl. Mechanics.	800 plus Rs. 50 hotel allowance.	B.A. (Punjab).
Lecturer .. .. .	235	A.M.I.E.E., M. & E.E. (Roorkee), D.F.H. (London).
Officiating Lecturer .. ..	235	A.M.I.E.E., M. & E.E. (Roorkee).
Lecturer .. .. .	235	M. & E.E. (Roorkee).
Do. .. .. .	235	B.A., B.Sc. (Engg.).
Do. .. .. .	235	M.A., M.Sc.
Do. .. .. .	235	A.M.Tech.I. (London), D.F.H. (London).

Duties.	Pay and other allowances.	Qualifications.
	Rs.	
Assistant Demonstrator ..	120	M.A.
Ditto Ditto ..	120	..
Ditto ditto ..	120	L.M.E. (Benares).
Ditto ditto ..	120	B.Sc.
Ditto ditto ..	120	L.M.E. (Benares).
Head Lecture Assistant ..	88	B.Sc. (Benares).
Lecture Assistant ..	60	..
Ditto ..	60	..
Ditto ..	60	..
Mechanic ..	250	..
Mechanical Electrician ..	250	Matric. 2nd Grade, Elect. Engg. C. & G. (London).
Carpenter ..	100	..
Boiler Room Attendant ..	50	Certificate under Boiler Act.
Draftsman ..	120	Senior Certificate, Mayo School of Arts.
2 Lab. Bearers ..	25 each	..
Head Clerk ..	160	B.A.
Clerk ..	105	Matric.
Do. ..	105	Do.
Do. ..	50	Do.
Do. ..	48	Do.
Daftri ..	20	..
5 Peons ..	14 each	..
Head Mali ..	30	..
Assistant Mali ..	23	..
2 Dressing Coolies ..	20 each	..
Bahishti ..	16	..
Sweeper Bahishti ..	16	..
4 Chowkidars ..	13 each	..
6 Sweepers ..	13 each	..

## RECREATION FEE IN THE MACLAGAN ENGINEERING COLLEGE.

*(Answer to Question No. 1670, page 723 ante.)***The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (1) Rs. 41,400.

(2) No. The fund is subject to the audit of the Local Fund Examiners.

RAI SAHIB LABHU RAM, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER, GUJRANWALA.

*(Answer to Question No. 1684, page 781 ante.)***The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Rai Sahib Labhu Ram, Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala, is the Ex-officio President of the :—

(i) Central Co-operative Bank, Gujranwala,

(ii) Red Cross Society, Gujranwala.

(iii) Soldiers Board, Gujranwala.

Government has no knowledge of the affairs of the station club.

(b) and (c) Yes, in the case the Red Cross Society and Soldiers Board as the Accountant-General, Punjab, had invited attention to the Rules contained in Appendix A. to Appendix 8-C., of the Civil Account Code.

RAI SAHIB LABHU RAM, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER, GUJRANWALA.

*(Answer to Question No. 1685, page 782 ante.)***The Honourable Sardar Sir Jogendra Singh :** (a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) 18.

(d) None.

## HAISIYAT TAX ON THE MINERS OF THE KHEWRA SALT MINE.

*(Answer to Question No. 1700, page 787 ante.)***The Honourable Malik Firoz Khan, Noon :** (a) Haisiyat Tax used in the past to be levied from the miners of the Khewra Salt Mines in the Jhelum district among others, but the tax was abolished in 1928, and replaced by a Profession Tax which is now in force in the area subject to the authority of the district board of Jhelum.

(b) and (c) The General Manager of the Mines protested against the imposition of the Haisiyat Tax, but the Salt Department eventually withdrew the protest. No protest has been received from the General Manager or the Labour Union, Khewra, against the imposition of the Profession Tax.

## REVENUE PATWARIS.

*(Answer to Question No. 1701, page 787 ante.)***The Honourable Khan Bahadur Captain Sardar Sikandar Hyat Khan :** The required information will be found in the attached statement.

---

STATEMENT.

---

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF PATWARIS AND ASSISTANT PATWARIS IN EACH TAHSIL ON 1st JANUARY OF EACH YEAR FROM 1924-25.

xxxi

## APPENDIX.

DISTRICT.	Taluk.	FIRST GRADE.					SECOND GRADE.					THIRD GRADE.					ASSURANT PAYABLE.				
		1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.
Hissar.	Bhiwani ..	5	5	8	10	12	19	19	19	20	17	25	25	22	19	20	4	4	4	4	4
	Hansi ..	17	17	15	16	16	27	27	30	29	31	31	31	30	30	38	6	6	6	6	6
	Hisar ..	20	20	15	14	14	33	33	31	32	30	25	25	32	31	34	6	6	6	6	6
	Fatehabad ..	7	7	9	14	9	21	21	21	25	27	35	35	33	24	27	4	4	4	4	4
	Sirsa ..	19	19	17	16	17	36	36	35	33	33	32	32	35	33	37	5	5	5	5	5
	Total ..	68	68	64	70	68	136	136	136	140	138	148	148	152	142	146	25	25	25	25	25
ROHTAK.	Rohtak ..	14	14	14	14	14	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	6	6	6	6	6
	Jhajjar ..	20	20	20	20	20	40	40	40	40	40	41	41	41	41	41	4	4	4	4	4
	Gohana ..	14	14	14	14	14	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	10	10	10	10	10
	Sonepat ..	19	19	19	19	19	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	5	5	5	5	5
	Total ..	67	67	67	67	67	134	134	134	134	134	134	134	134	134	134	25	25	25	25	25

[illegible]

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF PATWARIS AND ASSISTANT PATWARIS IN EACH TAHSIL ON 1st JANUARY OF EACH YEAR FROM 1925-29—CONTINUED.

DISTRICT.	Tahsil.	FIRST GRADE.					SECOND GRADE.					THIRD GRADE.					ASSISTANT PATWARIS.				
		1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.
SIMLA	Kot Khel ..	..	..	..	..	..	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	2	2	2	..	..	..	..	..
	Simla ..	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	2	2	..	..	..	..	..
	Total ..	1	1	1	1	1	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	..	..	..	..	..
KANGRA	Kangra ..	9	9	9	10	10	19	19	19	19	20	18	18	18	17	16	3	3	3	3	3
	Nurpur ..	9	9	9	8	8	17	17	17	17	17	17	17	17	17	18	3	3	3	3	3
	Dehra ..	13	13	13	13	13	23	23	23	23	26	27	27	27	27	27	3	3	3	3	3
	Hamirpur ..	18	18	18	18	18	40	37	37	35	36	32	32	32	35	37	5	5	5	5	5
	Palampur ..	13	13	12	12	12	24	25	25	24	23	23	23	23	23	24	3	3	3	3	3
	Kulu ..	5	5	5	5	5	10	10	10	11	10	11	11	11	11	11	..	..	..	..	..
SARAJ	Saraj ..	4	4	4	4	4	8	8	8	7	8	7	7	7	7	7	..	..	..	..	..
	Total ..	71	71	70	70	70	144	142	142	139	140	135	135	136	141	140	17	17	17	17	17

APPENDIX.

## APPENDIX.

xxxvii

Hoshierpur ..	24	24	24	24	24	48	48	48	48	48	49	49	49	7	7	7	7	7	7
Dasuya ..	26	26	26	26	26	51	51	51	51	51	51	51	51	8	8	8	8	8	8
Garh Shanker	24	24	24	24	24	47	47	47	47	47	48	48	48	6	6	6	6	6	6
Una ..	23	23	23	23	23	47	47	47	47	47	47	47	47	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total ..	97	97	97	97	97	193	193	193	193	195	195	195	195	29	29	29	29	29	29
Jullundur ..	23	23	23	23	23	47	47	47	47	46	46	46	46	4	4	4	4	4	4
Nikodar ..	20	20	20	20	20	40	40	40	40	40	40	40	40	4	4	4	4	4	4
Phillaur ..	19	19	19	19	19	38	38	38	38	39	39	39	39	4	4	4	4	4	4
Nawanshehr	20	20	20	20	20	40	40	40	40	40	40	39	39	4	4	4	4	4	4
Total ..	82	82	82	82	82	165	165	165	165	165	165	164	164	16	16	16	16	16	16
Ludhiana ..	25	25	29	30	36	60	58	58	58	65	65	63	62	3	3	3	3	3	3
Jagraon ..	17	17	17	17	17	36	35	34	34	31	31	32	33	2	2	2	2	2	2
Samrala ..	14	14	13	13	13	28	26	26	26	24	24	26	27	2	2	2	2	2	2
Total ..	56	56	59	60	60	124	119	118	120	120	120	121	122	7	7	7	7	7	7



STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF PATWARIS AND ASSISTANT PATWARIS IN EACH TAHSIL ON 1st JANUARY OF EACH YEAR FROM 1925-26—CONTINUED.

DISTRICT.	Tahsil.	FIRST GRADE.					SECOND GRADE.					THIRD GRADE.					ASSISTANT PATWARIS.				
		1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.
PUNJAB.	Ferozepore ..	16	16	16	16	16	30	30	30	30	30	31	31	31	31	31	5	5	5	5	5
	Zira ..	16	16	16	16	16	33	33	33	34	33	32	32	32	31	32	5	5	5	5	5
	Moga ..	18	18	18	18	18	37	37	36	37	37	37	37	38	37	37	6	6	6	6	6
	Muktsar ..	15	15	14	14	14	28	28	27	27	27	25	25	27	27	27	4	4	4	4	4
	Razilka ..	14	14	16	15	16	27	27	29	27	32	39	39	35	38	32	5	5	5	5	5
PUNJAB.	Total ..	79	79	80	79	80	155	155	155	155	159	164	164	163	164	159	25	25	25	25	25
	Chumian ..	20	20	20	20	20	41	40	40	40	40	39	40	40	40	40	2	2	2	2	2
	Kahtir ..	16	19	18	18	18	33	34	35	35	35	36	35	35	35	35	4	3	3	3	3
	Lahore ..	15	15	15	15	15	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	1	1	1	1	1
	Total ..	53	54	53	53	53	103	103	104	104	104	104	104	104	104	104	10	9	9	9	9



STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF PATWARIS AND ASSISTANT PATWARIS IN EACH TAHSIL ON 1st JANUARY  
OF EACH YEAR FROM 1926-29—CONTINUED.

M

APPENDIX.

DISTRICT.	FIRST GRADE.					SECOND GRADE.					THIRD GRADE.					ASSISTANT PATWARIS.				
	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.
Tahsil.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.															
Gujranwala..	26	26	25	25	26	47	53	56	55	54	60	54	52	53	53	5	4	3	3	3
Wazirabad ..	12	12	12	11	11	26	24	23	24	25	22	24	25	25	24	4	4	4	4	4
Hafizabad ..	18	18	18	18	18	35	35	34	34	33	36	36	37	37	38	5	5	5	5	5
Total ..	56	56	55	54	55	108	112	113	113	112	118	114	114	115	115	17	17	17	17	17
Sheikhpura	14	14	14	14	14	28	28	28	28	28	29	29	29	29	29	5	5	5	5	5
Shabdara ..	20	20	20	20	20	39	39	39	39	39	40	40	40	40	40	4	4	4	4	4
Nankana Sahib	15	15	15	15	15	29	29	28	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	3	3	3	3	3
Total ..	49	49	49	49	49	96	98	98	96	96	98	98	98	98	98	12	12	12	12	12

Gujrat.	Gujrat ..	18	18	17	16	17	27	35	37	38	32	43	35	34	34	29	4	4	4	4	4
	Kharan ..	15	15	10	13	14	26	25	20	26	25	29	30	40	31	31	4	4	4	4	4
	Phalia ..	18	18	18	18	21	36	36	36	36	41	36	36	36	36	42	4	4	4	4	4
	Total ..	51	51	45	47	52	89	96	93	100	98	108	101	110	101	112	12	12	12	12	12
Sargodha.	Bhalwal ..	15	15	15	15	15	29	29	28	28	28	32	32	33	33	33	3	3	3	3	3
	Shabpur ..	18	18	17	17	17	30	30	30	26	30	25	25	26	30	26	3	3	3	3	3
	Khusab ..	11	11	8	11	8	27	27	35	32	35	37	37	32	32	32	8	8	8	8	8
	Sargodha ..	12	12	16	13	16	26	26	19	26	19	19	19	22	18	22	3	3	3	3	3
Jhelum.	Total ..	56	56	56	56	56	112	112	112	112	112	113	113	113	113	113	17	17	17	17	17
	Jhelum ..	15	15	15	15	15	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	4	4	4	4	4
	Pind Dadan Khan.	13	13	13	13	13	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	5	5	5	5	5
	Chakwal ..	14	14	14	14	14	28	28	28	28	28	29	29	29	29	29	5	5	5	5	5
Jhelum.	Total ..	42	42	42	42	42	82	82	82	82	82	83	83	83	83	83	14	14	14	14	14



Mianwali.	17	17	16	14	16	37	38	33	32	33	28	29	33	36	33	7	7	7	7	7	7
Mianwali ..	17	17	16	14	16	16	37	38	33	32	33	28	29	33	36	33	7	7	7	7	7
Iskhel ..	8	7	7	7	7	15	15	15	15	15	13	15	16	15	16	15	6	5	5	5	5
Bhakhar ..	12	11	12	10	16	25	23	24	32	32	23	26	44	32	44	32	3	3	6	6	6
Total ..	37	35	35	37	39	77	74	71	79	80	64	70	93	83	93	80	16	15	18	18	18
Montgomery	..	29	29	29	29	55	55	55	55	55	55	55	55	55	55	55	3	3	3	3	3
Okara ..	15	15	15	15	15	30	30	30	38	30	30	30	30	30	30	30	3	3	3	3	3
Dipalpur ..	18	18	18	18	18	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	6	6	6	6	6
Pakpattan ..	12	12	12	22	22	25	25	25	25	42	25	25	25	25	25	44	5	5	5	5	5
Total ..	74	74	74	84	84	147	147	147	147	164	147	147	147	147	147	166	17	17	17	17	17
Lahore.	12	12	12	12	12	24	24	24	24	24	25	25	25	25	25	25	5	5	5	5	5
Toba Tek Singh.	12	12	12	12	12	25	25	25	25	25	25	26	26	26	26	26	4	4	4	4	4
Samundri ..	11	11	11	11	11	22	22	22	22	22	22	22	22	22	22	22	5	5	5	5	5
Lyallpur ..	11	11	11	11	11	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	4	4	4	4	4
Jaranwala ..	11	11	11	11	11	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	4	4	4	4	4
Total ..	46	46	46	46	46	94	94	94	94	94	96	96	96	96	96	96	18	18	18	18	17

STATEMENT SHOWING THE NUMBER OF PATWARIS AND ASSISTANT PATWARIS IN EACH TAHSIL ON 1st JANUARY  
OF EACH YEAR FROM 1925-29—CONCLUDED.

kliv

APPENDIX.

District.	Tahsil.	First Grade.					Second Grade.					Third Grade.					Assistant Patwaris.				
		1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.	1925.	1926.	1927.	1928.	1929.
Jhang.	Jhang ..	21	21	20	19	21	43	43	39	37	42	35	35	40	69	56	8	8	8	10	9
	Chiniot ..	15	16	10	16	18	30	30	26	30	35	30	31	42	44	37	7	7	7	7	7
	Shorkot ..	11	11	11	12	12	23	22	22	21	23	20	21	21	31	30	2	3	3	4	4
	Total ..	47	48	41	47	51	96	95	87	88	100	85	87	103	123	123	17	18	18	21	20
Muzar.	Multan ..	21	20	20	16	16	29	29	29	32	32	32	32	33	34	34	5	5	5	5	5
	Shujabad ..	25	19	15	14	14	25	17	16	14	11	13	27	32	35	38	6	6	6	6	6
	Lodhran ..	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	24	25	16	16	16	16	16	5	5	5	5	5
	Mailsi ..	21	21	21	13	18	23	23	23	25	33	30	20	20	26	26	5	5	5	5	5
	Kabirwala ..	22	20	16	13	14	27	27	27	26	28	22	24	28	32	29	5	5	5	5	5
	Khanewal ..	3	10	16	17	16	3	29	27	29	29	6	32	34	31	32	5	5	5	5	5
	Total ..	117	121	113	98	103	132	150	147	160	168	109	152	163	174	185	31	31	31	31	31

MUZAFFARGARH.																
Muzaffargarh	23	23	23	23	46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46	6	6	6
Kot-Adu ..	13	13	13	13	26	26	26	26	26	26	26	26	26	4	4	4
Laloh ..	12	12	12	12	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	3	3	3
Alipur ..	18	18	18	18	36	36	36	36	36	36	36	36	36	5	5	5
Total ..	66	66	66	66	132	132	132	132	132	132	132	132	132	18	18	18
DERA GHAZI KHAN.																
Sanghar ..	13	13	12	10	9	15	15	14	14	14	14	14	15	6	6	6
Dere Ghazi	19	19	19	19	16	29	29	28	28	28	28	28	23	9	9	9
Khan.	16	16	12	13	13	15	15	16	15	15	15	15	12	7	6	6
Jampur ..	16	16	12	12	8	17	16	20	17	17	17	17	13	10	10	10
Bejanpur ..	15	16	12	12												
Total ..	63	64	55	54	46	76	75	78	74	74	74	72	63	32	31	31



## CHANDAR KISHORE, A CIVIL PRISONER.

(Answer to Question No. 1704, page 788 ante).

**The Honourable Sir Alexander Stow :**— (a), (2) and (3) It is not possible to reply since the initial history ticket of this prisoner is not traceable.

(iii) A continuation history ticket which was stolen by the ex-civil prisoner, Chandar Kishore, has since been recovered from him and shows the entry referred to.

(iv) It is not possible to reply since the last history ticket is not traceable.

(b) No such applications or reminders have been traced or were despatched from the jail.

(c) Does not arise.

## LIST OF THE DISTRICT INSPECTRESSES OF SCHOOLS IN THE PUNJAB.

(Answer to Question No. 1707, page 789 ante).

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :**

Name of the District Inspectress.	Qualifications.	Date of appointment.	Salary.
1. S. Gujar Mal, Lady Supervisor, District Board Girls' Schools, Jullundur District.	Senior Vernacular ...	4-11-1924	Rs. 75 per mensem plus Rs. 30 fixed travelling allowance.
2. A. Swift, District Inspectress of Schools, Gujranwala.	Passed the highest examination of the Wood Stook Girls' School, London. Has a thorough knowledge of Persian, Hindi and Punjabi.	1-8-03	Rs. 200 per mensem.

## GRAND-IN-AID TO THE KINNAIRD HIGH SCHOOL FOR GIRLS, LAHORE.

(Answer to parts (c) and (d) of Question No. 1708, page 789 ante.)

**The Hon'ble Mr. Manohar Lal :** (c) It has not been possible to trace the exact date from which grant is given to the school, but it appears that the school was in receipt of grant-in-aid as far back as 1888.

(d) Does not arise.

**FEES FROM THE NON-CHRISTIAN STUDENTS OF THE KINNAIRD HIGH SCHOOL FOR GIRLS, LAHORE.**

*(Answer to Question No. 1709 (b), page 790 ante).*

**The Honourable Mr. Manohar Lal :** (b) A statement giving the required information is appended :—

**TUITION FEES.**

	<i>For Indian Christians with an income less than Rs. 150 a month.</i>			<i>For all others.</i>		
	Rs. A. P.			Rs. A. P.		
(i) Kindergarten and Lower Primary.	1	12	0	2	8	0
(ii) Upper Primary IV and V ..	2	8	0	8	0	0
(iii) Middle Department, I, II, III	3	0	0	4	0	0
(iv) IV High .. ..	3	8	0	5	0	0
(v) V High.. ..	4	0	0	6	0	0
(vi) Music .. ..	10	0	0	per month.		

**DISMISSAL OF GAJJAN SINGH, SUFEDPOSH.**

*(Answer to Question No. 1712, page 791 ante).*

**The Honourable Mian Sir Fazl-i-Husain :** (a) Yes. The following three cases were *sub judice* when the order of dismissal of Gajjan Singh, *Sufedposh* was passed :—

(b) (i) First Information Report No. 18. Case under sections 457-511 Indian Penal Code. This case was brought by one Katar Singh and remained untraced.

(ii) First Information Report No. 113, under sections 452-325, Indian Penal Code. In this case Gajjan Singh's cousin Kehar Singh was involved and was sentenced to undergo six months' rigorous imprisonment by the lower court and to pay a fine of Rs. 50. This order was reversed by the appellate court.

(iii) First Information Report No. 134 of 26th December 1927, under section 448, Indian Penal Code. In this case Gajjan Singh and his relative Kehar Singh, etc., were involved. They were acquitted by the trying court.

PRINTED BY  
THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.  
18 PLC-600-14-7-30-SGPP Lahore.

INDEX  
TO  
**DEBATES**  
OF THE  
**PUNJAB LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.**  
Vol. XV.

A.

ABDUL AZIZ, HAKIM—	
Question <i>re</i> cancellation of gun license of — ..	712
ABDUL GHANI, KHAN BAHADUR MAULVI—	
Oath of office .. .. .	1
ABDUL GHANI, SHAIKH—	
Budget. General discussion of — ..	297-99
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards .. .. .	579-581
Budget motion. Public Prosecutors, Muhammadan representation among — ..	767, 770
Budget motion. Zamindars, declaration of, as criminal tribes .. .. .	551-52
Discussion <i>re</i> convention of President addressing the House in vernacular .. .. .	911
ABDUL HAFIZ, MIAN—,	
Question <i>re</i> permission to — to return to Punjab ..	203
ABDUL KHALIQ, SHAHZADA—	
Question <i>re</i> acquisition of landed property of — and others in Ludhiana City .. .. .	135
ABDUR RAHMAN, KHWAJA, GHAZI—	
Question <i>re</i> health of — and supply of newspapers and writing materials to — .. .. .	202
ABIANA—	
Budget motion <i>re</i> reduction of — on cotton crop ..	508—24
Question <i>re</i> — levied and collected on the Upper Bari Doab Canal .. .. .	387
ACCIDENTS—	
Question <i>re</i> bomb — and outrages in the province ..	330
Question <i>re</i> motor — in 1928-29 .. .. .	36
Question <i>re</i> motor — in Hissar, Gurgaon, Karnal and Rohtak districts .. .. .	257
Question <i>re</i> motor — near Verka railway Phatak ..	17

## ACCOUNTS—

- Question *re* submission of — under Mussalman Waqf Act .. .. . 2

## ACREAGE RATES—

- Question *re* — on Lower Chenab Canal .. . 776

## ACT(S)—

- Question *re* Child Marriage (Restraint) —, 1929, publicity to the .. . 721

- Question *re* Mussalman Waqf —, prosecutions, convictions and acquittals under .. . 2

- Question *re* Mussalman Waqf —, submission of accounts under .. . 2

- Question *re* Village Patrol —, exemption of Lahore District from .. . 644

## ADDITIONAL GRANTS, DEMANDS FOR — 400—423

## ADJOURNMENT—

- of the House for want of agenda .. . 498

## ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE—

- Demand for grant *re* — .. . 761-70

- Demand for supplementary grant *re* — .. . 401

## ADMINISTRATIVE CIRCLE—

- Question *re* charge of — held by Mr. McLeod.. .. 395

## ADVERTISEMENTS—

- Question *re* newspapers and Government — .. . 112, 263

## ADVISORY COMMITTEE—

- Nominations to Railway — .. . 826

## AERATED WATER—

- Question *re* — sellers on the Kangra Valley Railway .. . 43

## AERIAL SURVEY—

- Question *re* — of Bhakra Dam Project .. . 242

## AFFORESTATION—

- Question *re* area reserved for — in Sutlej Valley Colony .. . 779

## AFZAL HAQ, CHAUDHRI—

- Adjournment of House for want of agenda, discussion *re* — .. . 497

- Budget. General discussion of — .. . 291—93

- Budget motion. Corruption in Government Departments 628, 624—26, 628-29.

- Budget motion. Exemption of sword from Arms Act .. 618-20, 621-22: 628.

- Budget motion. Hindu agriculturist representation among Sub-Inspectors of Police .. . 802-804

- Budget motions involving legislation, point of order *re* admissibility of — .. . 472

- Budget motion. Land revenue assessment on income-tax principles .. . 480—83

- Budget motion. Minister for Local Self-Government, censure of, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala municipality .. . 687—89, 655—61

## PAGES.

## AFZAL HAQ, CHAUDHRI—CONCLUDED—

Budget motion. Ministerial responsibility, discussion <i>re</i> — .. .. .	686
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards .. .. .	571—73
Budget motion. Re-afforestation including <i>chos</i> areas ..	482
Circulars of departmental heads to be circulated among members, or else halting allowance for some days before commencement of sitting should be allowed to members .. .. .	138, 139
Closure, discussion <i>re</i> right of reply of Government Member and mover after application of — .. .. .	700, 701, 702
Closure, discussion <i>re</i> Minister's reply after application of — when mover has not chosen to speak.. .. .	725, 726, 727
Demand for supplementary grant — Police .. .. .	401-405, 414—18, 422.
Fazl-i-Husain, the Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of services of — .. .. .	793-94
Resolution <i>re</i> total prohibition .. .. .	211—14
Walk out of — .. .. .	730
AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE—	
Question <i>re</i> communal representation in <i>re</i> admission to — .. .. .	104
Question <i>re</i> death of a student in the —, Lyallpur ..	377, 597
Question <i>re</i> expulsion of students of —, Lyallpur ..	392
Question <i>re</i> Principal of the —, Lyallpur .. .. .	378
Question <i>re</i> water-supply in the boarding houses attached to the —, Lyallpur .. .. .	646
AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT—	
Question <i>re</i> engineers of the water lifting branch of the —..	392
AGRICULTURAL IMPLEMENTS—	
Question <i>re</i> number of trees granted to zamindars of Kangra District for making — .. .. .	710
AGRICULTURAL PRODUCE—	
Question <i>re</i> fall in the price of — .. .. .	381, 599
AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH COUNCIL—	
Question <i>re</i> nominations to the Punjab — .. .. .	190
AGRICULTURAL TRIBES—	
Question <i>re</i> — for competitive examination for Sub-Judges .. .. .	12
Question <i>re</i> number of Sub-Judge candidates belonging to — .. .. .	12
AGRICULTURE—	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — (Transferred) .. .. .	322
AGRICULTURISTS—	
Budget motion <i>re</i> representation of Hindu — among Sub-Inspectors of Police.. .. .	771-74, 800-21
Question <i>re</i> — confined in reformatories .. .. .	194
Question <i>re</i> exemption of — of Shahpur District from tuition fee .. .. .	641

AGRICULTURISTS—*concluded*—

- Question *re* half tuition fees for — and *hamins* in Government Secondary Schools .. .. . 277

*See* Statutory Agriculturists.

## AHMAD YAR KHAN, DAULTANA, MIAN—

- Resolution *re* committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists .. .. . 69-70

## AKBAR ALI, PIR—

- Resolution *re* school fee concessions .. .. . 95-101

## ALLA DIN, MAULVI—

- Question *re* insolvency of — and removal from Hoshiarpur Municipal Committee .. .. . 202

## ALLAH RAKHA—

- Question *re* —, clerk of Simla Division of the Forest Department .. .. . 786

## ALLOWANCE(S)—

- Question *re* — of Forest guards .. .. . 280

- Question *re* — to Secretary, Municipal Committee, Ferozepore, for supervision of sanitation .. .. . 654

- Question *re* no work — to piece hand compositors of Government Press, Lahore .. .. . 788

- Travelling and halting —, discussion *re*, grant of, to members of Legislative Council some days before Council meets .. .. . 140

## AMENDMENT—

- to resolution *re* school fee concessions, discussion *re* want of notice .. .. . 137-40

## A. S. V. HIGH SCHOOL—

- Question *re* matriculation results in —, Ambala, and reduction of grants .. .. . 254

- Question *re* matriculation results in —, Pundri, and reduction of grants .. .. . 254

- Question *re* reduction of grant -in-aid to —, Ambala .. .. . 204

- Question *re* reduction of grant-in-aid to —, Pundri .. .. . 204

## A.-V. MIDDLE SCHOOL—

- Question *re* raising of District Board —, Dera Gopipur, to high standard .. .. . 588

## ANJUMAN ARA BEGUM—

- Question *re* high school scholarship for — .. .. . 784

## APPEALS—

- Question *re* criminal — in certain sessions courts .. .. . 257

## APPRENTICE ENGINEERS—

- Question *re* — in the Hydro-Electric Branch of the Public Works Department .. .. . 390

## AQALA-HAYATA BALOCHES—

- Question *re* grant of land to — of Jhang District .. .. . 595

## ARA TRACT—

- Budget motion. Irrigation to — .. .. . 506—08

**ARMS ACT—**

Budget motion <i>re</i> exemption of sword from — ..	618-23
Question <i>re</i> exemption of sword from — ..	116, 202, 245
Question <i>re</i> exemption of sword from — in Rawalpindi .. .. .	110

**ARMS LICENSES—**

Question <i>re</i> number of — in the Ambala Division ..	258
--	-----

**ARRESTS—**

Question <i>re</i> — and release in connection with Delhi Bomb outrage .. .. .	111
Question <i>re</i> number of — made in connection with bombs .. .. .	380

**ASHTON, MR. H. F.—**

Budget. General discussion of — .. .. .	303-05
Budget motion. Canal telegraph offices, use of, by public .. .. .	508-04
Budget motion. Irrigation of Ara tract .. .. .	507
Budget motion. Reduction of <i>abiana</i> on cotton crop ..	510
Budget motion. Re-modelling of rajbahar Kohali and Jama Rai, Upper Bari Doab Canal .. .. .	500-02
Oath of Office .. .. .	1
Resolution <i>re</i> committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists .. .. .	74

**ASSISTANT DISTRICT INSPECTORS OF SCHOOLS—**

Question <i>re</i> communal representation among —, Ambala Division .. .. .	63
---	----

**ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE ENGINEERS—**

Question <i>re</i> appointment of Indian — for Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme .. .. .	384
--	-----

**ASSISTANT REGISTRARS—**

Question <i>re</i> — of Co-operative Department .. .. .	45
---	----

**ASSISTANT SUB-INSPECTORS OF POLICE—**

Question <i>re</i> number of — recruited from Statutory Agriculturists of Jhang District .. .. .	596
Question <i>re</i> recruitment of — .. .. .	40, 198

**ASSISTANT SURGEONS—**

Question <i>re</i> — in Simla .. .. .	126
Question <i>re</i> number of — community-wise .. .. .	710
Question <i>re</i> selection of Civil — .. .. .	588

**ATTOCK OIL COMPANY—**

Question <i>re</i> acquisition of land for — and alienation of land by — .. .. .	262
Question <i>re</i> placing the — area under a notified area ..	263

**AUCTION—**

Question <i>re</i> — of lands in the Nili Bar .. .. .	388
---	-----

**AZAN—**

Question <i>re</i> — controversy in Zafarwal .. .. .	244, 252
Question <i>re</i> villages in which Muslims do not enjoy freedom of — .. .. .	248



## B.

## BALDEV SINGH, CHAUDHRI—

Budget motion. Land Revenue policy — difficulties of zamindars in South-East Punjab .. ..	489
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards .. ..	559-60
Budget motion. Police Sub-Inspectors, Hindu Agriculturalist representation among .. ..	778-74
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. ..	584-85

## BAND—

Question re — attached to high schools .. ..	125
--	-----

## BAR ROOM—

Question re construction of a — at Hissar .. ..	14
---	----

## BED LEVEL—

Question re rise of — in the river Jhelum .. ..	262
---	-----

## BEGGARY COMMITTEE—

Question re report of the .. ..	182
---------------------------------	-----

## BHAGAT SINGH, SARDAR—

Question re treatment of — and others according to the recommendations of the Jails Enquiry Committee .. ..	112
---	-----

## BHAJRA DAM—

Question re aerial survey of — Project .. ..	242
Question re area to be irrigated by — in British territory and Native States .. ..	714
Question re site of the — .. ..	712

## BHAJRA DAM SCHEME—

Question re — .. ..	185
Question re progress made in connection with — .. ..	191

## BIHAR POLICE ENQUIRY COMMITTEE—

Question re report of — .. ..	113
-------------------------------	-----

## BIKANER CANAL—

Question re collection of water near — .. ..	716, 717
Question re soundings of water table near — .. ..	717

## BILL—

Registration Validating —, the Punjab .. ..	424
---	-----

## BLASCHECK, MR. A. D.—

Oath of office .. ..	108
Resolution re income from resin in <i>Shamilat</i> forests .. ..	178-74

## BOARD—

Question re constitution of a — to consider measures for development of industries .. ..	178
--	-----

## BOARD OF STUDIES—

(See School Board of Studies.)

## BOARDING HOUSE(S)

Question re scale of school and — contingencies .. ..	1
Question re water-supply to the — attached to Agricultural College, Lyallpur .. ..	646

## BOAT BRIDGE—

Question re — material stored at Ghazi Ghat and washed away by floods of the Indus .. ..	25
--	----

	PAGES.
<b>BOMB(S)—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> number of — accidents and number of — recovered in the province .. .. .	380
<b>BOOKS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> proscription of — for exciting communal hatred .. .. .	279
Question <i>re</i> restrictions on the publication or import of Vatsayana's Kama Sutras .. .. .	583
Question <i>re</i> text — written by officers of the Education Department .. .. .	589, 591
Question <i>re</i> text — written by Members of School Board of Studies of the Punjab University .. .. .	592
Question <i>re</i> — written by Khan Bahādur Shaikh Nur Elahi .. .. .	396
<b>BRAYNE, MR.—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> money collections by —, Deputy Commissioner, Gurgaon .. .. .	14
<b>BREACHES—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> compensation for damages due to — in Suleimanke Canal .. .. .	705
<b>BRIDGE—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> pucca — over the Beas in the Kangra District .. .. .	709
<b>BUDGET—</b>	
General discussion of — .. .. .	291-328, 329-75.
Presentation of — for 1930-31 .. .. .	281-90
Time limit of speeches during general discussion of — ..	298
<b>BUDGET MOTIONS—</b>	
— involving legislation are admissible by convention ..	472, 473, 476
— for attacking or criticising a Minister, discussion <i>re</i> —	680-86
— <i>re</i> non-voted items are not in order .. .. .	762
— should relate to objects relevant to the grant or item under consideration. (A token cut for reduction of salary of officers to urge agriculturist representation on High Court bench is out of order). .. .. .	765
— to raise discussion on policy of Government, point of order <i>re</i> putting to vote of — .. .. .	486
<b>BUILDING PLANS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> procedure <i>re</i> submission of — on the Mall ..	134
<b>BUILDINGS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> primary school — of District Boards ..	607
<b>BUILDINGS AND ROADS—ESTABLISHMENT—</b>	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — .. .. .	828
<b>BULLETS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> shikar licences and restriction on the purchase of — .. .. .	377
<b>BUNDS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> construction of a — at Dholbaha ..	391
Question <i>re</i> construction of a — over the Beas at Padsa ..	391

**BUTA SINGH, SARDAR—**

Budget, General discussion of — .. .. .	367-69
Budget motion. Declaration of zamindars as criminal tribes .. .. .	547-49
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. .. .	529

**C.****C. A.-V. HIGH SCHOOL—**

Question re matriculation results in —, Hissar, and reduction of grants .. .. .	254
Question re reduction of grant-in-aid to —, Hissar, .. .. .	204

**CALVERT, MR. H.—**

Budget motion. Colonisation operations .. .. .	488-89
Budget motion. Hindu Rajputs, representation of, among tahsildars and naib-tahsildars .. .. .	494
Budget motion. Land distribution in Nili Bar .. .. .	498-94
Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crop .. .. .	516-18
Resolution re committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists .. .. .	78-82
Resolution re income from resin in Shamilat forests .. .. .	167-70

**CANAL(S)—**

Question re acreage rates on the Lower Chenab — .. .. .	776
Question re — whose waters irrigate Native States and whose headworks are in British territory .. .. .	718
Question re — whose waters irrigate in British territory and whose heads are outside British territory .. .. .	718
Question re Christians among — zilladars .. .. .	718
Question re collection of water near Bikaner — .. .. .	716, 717
Question re compensation for damages due to breaches in the Suleimanke — .. .. .	705
Question re Darakhtpal grants in Lower Bari Doab — .. .. .	587
Question re date of construction and cost of Sirhind — .. .. .	608
Question re discharge of water from and area irrigated by the Upper Bari Doab — .. .. .	387
Question re distribution of water of Sirhind — between Native States and British territory .. .. .	608
Question re grievances of Ghoripals of Lower Jhelum — Colony .. .. .	594
Question re half-remissions on Lower Jhelum and Lower Chenab — .. .. .	191
Question re irrigation by Khadir — .. .. .	642
Question re irrigation in winter by the Dipalpur and Eastern — .. .. .	609
Question re levy of a tax on matured crop on the Upper Chenab — .. .. .	250
Question re Lower Bari Doab and Lower Chenab — .. .. .	779
Question re water failure on Mailsi — .. .. .	18

## PAGES.

## CANAL TELEGRAPH OFFICES—

Budget motion *re* —, throwing open to public .. 502-06

## CAPITAL OUTLAY ON INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT—

Demand for grant *re* — .. .. . 823

## CART TRAFFIC—

Question *re* — on the Kalka-Simla Road .. 25

## CARTRIDGES—

Question *re* shikar licences and restriction on the purchase of Groves— .. .. . 877

## CATTLE—

Question *re* income from — impounded in Hissar .. 185

## CATTLE FAIR—

Question *re* abolition of — of *Chet Chaudash* day .. 201

## CATTLE FARM—

Question *re* Mr. Read of Hissar Government — .. 778

## CATTLE-LIFTING—

Question *re* — in Karnal District .. .. . 585

## CATTLE-TAX—

Budget motion *re* — in Kangra District .. .. . 492

Question *re* *pachotra* to lambardars for collection of — .. 587

## CENSORSHIP—

Question *re* — of Congressite papers .. .. . 882

## CENTRAL BANK(S)—

Question *re* application of Hindus and Sikhs of Gujranwala for recognition of a Co-operative— .. .. . 604

Question *re* non-Muslim representation in the directorates of Co-operative — .. .. . 604

Question *re* representation of minority communities in elections to Co-operative — .. .. . 643

## CESSES—

Question *re* collection of — by lambardars and payment of *pachotra* .. .. . 190

## CHAIRMEN—

Panel of — .. .. . 101

## CHAKKI—

Question *re* compensation for land eroded by — .. 187

## CHANDAR KISHORE—

Question *re* — .. .. . 775, 788

## CHARGES—

Question *re* establishment — on the gazetted and subordinate staff of the Hydro-Electric Branch of the Public Works Department .. .. . 247

## CHAUKIDARA TAX—

Question *re* collection of — by lambardars and payment of *pachotra* .. .. . 190

## CHAUKIDARS—

Question *re* source from which pay and uniforms of — are met .. .. . 87

## CHETAN ANAND, LALA—

Budget. General discussion on — .. .. 293

Oath of office .. .. 281

## CHHOTU RAM, RAI SAHIB CHAUDHRI—

Budget. General discussion on — .. .. 330-33

Budget. Demand *re* General Administration (Transferred),  
policy of Education Minister .. .. 760

Budget motion. High Court Judges, agriculturist re-  
presentation among, discussion *re* admissibility of — .. 762, 763, 764,  
765, 766.

Budget motion. Hindu agriculturist representation  
among Police Sub-Inspectors .. .. 813, 814, 815-  
16, 817, 818,  
819, 820.

Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district  
boards .. .. 609-10

Budget motion. Police Sub-Inspectors, Hindu agricul-  
turist representation among — .. .. 771-72

Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects  
of — .. .. 458-60

Fazl-i-Husain, the Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of  
services of — .. .. 794

Resolution *re* committee to enquire into grievances of  
Government and quasi-Government servants .. .. 146-47

Unparliamentary expression in debate, discussion *re* with-  
drawal of — .. .. 817, 18

## CHILD MARRIAGE (RESTRAINT) ACT—

Question *re* publicity to the —, 1929 .. .. 721

## "CHOS" AREAS—

Budget motion *re* re-afforestation including — .. .. 425-36

## CHRISTIANS—

Question *re* — among canal zilladars .. .. 718

Question *re* Indian — in Government Departments .. .. 24

## CIRCULARS—

Relating to resolutions coming before Council should be  
circulated to Members by Secretary with printed copies  
of resolutions .. .. 137-38

Relating to resolutions may be asked for by Members from  
Secretary, and where there is time for doing so, notice  
period in *re* amendments to such resolutions will not be  
waived; departmental — need not be so circulated .. .. 139, 140

## CIVIL SECRETARIAT—

Question *re* appointment of a non-graduate to section A  
post in the — .. .. 775

## CIVIL SURGEON(S)—

Question *re* — being Member of Ferozepore District  
Board .. .. 602

## PAGES.

CIVIL SURGEON(S)—CONCLUDED—	
Question <i>re</i> — community-wise in the province ..	710
Question <i>re</i> — in Jhang District ..	596
Question <i>re</i> inspection of rural dispensaries by — ..	25
CIVIL WORKS (CAPITAL EXPENDITURE)—	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — ..	824
CIVIL WORKS (RESERVED)—	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — ..	823
Demand for supplementary grant <i>re</i> — ..	422
CIVIL WORKS (TRANSFERRED)—	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — ..	823
CLERK(S)—	
Question <i>re</i> appointment of a non-graduate — for section A post in the Civil Secretariat ..	775
Question <i>re</i> — for the Girls' High School, Amritsar ..	390
Question <i>re</i> communal representation among — recruited for the Public Works Department (Buildings and Roads Branch) ..	118
Question <i>re</i> communal representation in clerical branch of the Judicial Department ..	197
Question <i>re</i> filling of vacancies among — in the office of the Director of Industries ..	120
Question <i>re</i> number of — in the offices of the Registrar, Deputy Registrar and Circle Registrars of Co-operative Credit Societies ..	604
Question <i>re</i> posting of — in the Sub-Registrar's, etc., office ..	396
Question <i>re</i> quarters for Indian — in Lahore ..	119
CLOSURE—	
Discussion <i>re</i> President's discretion to allow Minister's reply after — ..	725—30
Right of reply of Government Member and of mover after — ..	700-02
COLLEGE(S)—	
Question <i>re</i> external examiners at the Punjab Veterinary — ..	724
Question <i>re</i> lectures by professors of the Punjab Veterinary — ..	725
Question <i>re</i> number of intermediate — for Girls ..	388
Question <i>re</i> physical training for women in — ..	722
Question <i>re</i> professor of Punjab Veterinary — ..	778
Question <i>re</i> provision of science classes in the Intermediate —, Shahpur ..	642
See Agricultural College.	
See Engineering College.	
COLONISATION OPERATIONS—	
Budget motion <i>re</i> — ..	486-39
COLONY(IES)—	
Question <i>re</i> area reserved for afforestation in Sutlej Valley — ..	729

## COLONY(IES)—CONCLUDED—

Question re grievances of Ghoripals of Lower Jhelum Canal —	594
Question re half-remissions in Lower Bari Doab Canal —	191
Question re land sold by Government in the new —	782

## COLONISTS—

Resolution re committee to enquire into grievances of — of Nili Bar	65-88
---	-------

## COMMISSION(S)—

Question re — to Sub-Registrars	995
Question re expenses incurred by Punjab Government on —	48

## COMMITTEE(S)—

Nomination to Railway Advisory —	826
Question re action on the report of the Punjab Jails Enquiry —	186
Question re appointment of a — to go into the grievances of Ghoripal zamindars	879
Question re — to carry propaganda against Congress activities	583
Question re — to devise means to make primary education free and compulsory	245
Question re — to enquire into the grievances of the Ghoripals of Lower Jhelum Canal Colony	594
Question re composition, etc., of Lahore Improvement—	193
Question re expenses incurred by Punjab Government on —	48
Question re Government help to Congress Exhibition —	187
Question re report of the Beggary—	182
Question re recommendations of the Jails Enquiry —	112
Question re report of the Bihar Police Enquiry —	118
Resolution re — to enquire into grievances of low-paid Government servants	141—65
Resolution re — to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists	65-88
(See Municipal Committees.)	

## COMMUNAL FEELING—

Question re proscription of books for exciting —	279
--	-----

## COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION—

Question re — among apprentice engineers in the Hydro-Electric Branch of the Public Works Department	390
Question re — among candidates for posts of Extra Assistant Commissioners	117
Question re — among clerical staff recruited for the Public Works Department (Buildings and Roads)	118

## PAGES.

## COMMUNAL REPRESENTATION—CONCLUDED—

Question <i>re</i> — among directly recruited tahsildars ..	392
Question <i>re</i> — among Excise Inspectors ..	712
Question <i>re</i> — among Excise Sub-Inspectors in the special grade ..	712
Question <i>re</i> — among Assistant District Inspectors of Schools, Ambala Division ..	68
Question <i>re</i> — among certain gazetted posts in the Public Works Department, Hydro-Electric Branch ..	246
Question <i>re</i> — in the Clerical Branch of the Judicial Department ..	197
Question <i>re</i> — among Honorary Magistrates, Darbaris and Jagirdars in the province ..	708
Question <i>re</i> — among Honorary Magistrates, Darbaris and Jagirdars of Sheikhpura District ..	708
Question <i>re</i> — among Inspectors of Co-operative Societies ..	278
Question <i>re</i> — among Inspectors, Sub-Inspectors and camp clerks in the Gujranwala and Sialkot Divisions of the — ..	608
Question <i>re</i> — in the Lahore Co-operative Union ..	261
Question <i>re</i> — in regard to admission to Agricultural College ..	104
Question <i>re</i> — among stenographers in the Financial Commissioners' office ..	108
Question <i>re</i> — in the Provincial Civil Service (Executive Branch) ..	108
Question <i>re</i> — among Sub-Judges ..	197
Question <i>re</i> — in the recruitment of zilladars ..	198
Question <i>re</i> — among zilladars of Western Jumna Canal Circles ..	199
Question <i>re</i> — in filling up posts in the Provincial Educational Service or special posts carrying a pay of Rs. 250 or more ..	64
Question <i>re</i> list showing — in services ..	115
COMMUNICATION(S)—	
Question <i>re</i> conversion of Kot-Kapura Railway line into broad gauge ..	200
Question <i>re</i> railway line between Kot Kapura and Jalalabad via Muktsar ..	200
COMMUTED VALUE OF PENSIONS—	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — (Capital Expenditure) ..	824
COMPENSATION—	
Question <i>re</i> — for damages due to breaches in the Suleimanke Canal ..	705
Question <i>re</i> — for land eroded by the Chakki.. ..	187
COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION—	
<i>See</i> Examination.	



## PAGES.

## COMPLAINTS—

Question re — against Mr. Muhammad Said, Magistrate, Karnal .. .. .	585
Question re — against Municipal Health Officer, Feroze- pore City .. .. .	121

## COMPOSITORS—

Question re Memorials of — of Government Press, Lahore	788
Question re no-work-allowance to piece-hand — of Gov- ernment Press, Lahore .. .. .	788

## COMPULSORY EDUCATION—

Question re — in the Ambala District .. .. .	80
--	----

## CONCESSIONS—

Resolution re school fee — .. .. .	95-101, 185-40
------------------------------------	----------------

## CONFERENCE—

Question re representatives for the Round Table .. .. .	382
---	-----

## CONGRESS—

Question re Censorship of Congressite papers.. .. .	382
Question re propaganda against the activities of — .. .. .	588

## CONGRESS EXHIBITION COMMITTEE—

Question re Government help to — .. .. .	187
--	-----

## CONSTABLES—

Question re prosecution of certain — and head constables at Rohtak .. .. .	240
---	-----

## CONTINGENCIES—

Question re scale of school and boarding house — .. .. .	1
--	---

## CONVENTIONS—

Discussion re — of President addressing the House in Vernacular .. .. .	810-11
--	--------

## CONVEYANCE—

Question re — for girls of the Girls' High School, Amrit- sar .. .. .	890
--	-----

## CONVICT SETTLEMENTS—

Demand for Grant re Jails and — .. .. .	770
---	-----

## CONVICTS—

Question re Political — of 1929 .. .. .	184
---	-----

## CO-OPERATIVE BANK(S)—

Question re Gujranwala Central — .. .. .	782
Question re Rai Sahib Labhu Ram, Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala and Central — .. .. .	781
Question re representation of minority communities in the elections to Central — .. .. .	648

## CO-OPERATIVE CENTRAL BANKS—

Question re non-Muslim representation in the directorates of — .. .. .	604
---	-----

## CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT SOCIETY—

Question re — of chak No. 118 G. B. .. .. .	275
Question re enquiry into the constitution, working and fin- ancial condition of — of chak No. 118 G. B. .. .. .	275

## PAGES.

## CO-OPERATIVE DEPARTMENT—

Question re Deputy Registrars, Assistant Registrars and Inspectors of the — .. .. .	45
Question re Inspectors, Sub-Inspectors and Camp Clerks in the Gujranwala and Sialkot Divisions of the — ..	608

## CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETIES—

Question re clerks appointed in the offices of Registrar, Deputy Registrar, and Circle Registrar of — ..	604
Question re Inspectors of — .. .. .	278
Question re number of Inspectors of — .. .. .	711

## CO-OPERATIVE UNION(S)—

Question re communal representation in the Lahore — ..	261
Question re representation of minority communities in — ..	648

## CORRUPTION—

Budget motion re — in Government Departments ..	623-29
Question re charges of — against gazetted police officers ..	400
Question re — among subordinate judicial establishment .. .. .	586
Question re measures to combat — in Government Departments .. .. .	189
Question re proceedings against an Honorary Magistrate of Amritsar for — .. .. .	790
Question re steps taken to check — in the Government Departments .. .. .	879
Question re stoppage of — in police and district administration .. .. .	195

## COTTON—

Question re average price of unginned — .. .. .	26
---	----

## COTTON CROP—

Budget motion re reduction of <i>abiana</i> on — ..	508-24
---	--------

## COUNCIL—

See Legislative Council.

## COUNCIL OF AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH—

Question re nominations to the Punjab — .. .. .	190
---	-----

## COURT(S)—

Question re accommodation for litigants in law — ..	586
Question re establishment of a Sub-Judge's — at Hamirpur .. .. .	883

## COWAN, MR. H. M.—

Oath of office .. .. .	291
------------------------	-----

## CREMATION GROUNDS—

Question re removal of Hindu —, Sheikhpura ..	127
---	-----

## CRIMINAL APPEALS—

Question re — in certain sessions courts .. .. .	257
--	-----

## CRIMINAL PROCEDURE CODE—

Question re cases under sections 107 and 109 of the — in Hoshiarpur and Jullundur .. .. .	181
---	-----

## CRIMINAL TRIBES—

Budget motion re declaration of zamindars as — ..	546-54
---	--------

<b>CROPS—</b>	
Question re damages to — by hailstorms in Kangra Dis-	
trict .. .. .	16
Question re damage to <i>rabi</i> — by locusts in the Jhang	
District .. .. .	596
Question re failure of — in the province .. .. .	599
Question re levy of a tax on matured — on the Upper	
Chenab Canal .. .. .	250
<b>CROWN WASTE LANDS—</b>	
Question re irrigation by wells and distribution of — ..	381
<b>CULTIVATION—</b>	
Question re area under — in Khairan and Andura	
taluks .. .. .	391
<b>CYCLING—</b>	
Question re — on inspection roads along the banks of	
Canals .. .. .	381
<b>D.</b>	
<b>DAIS—</b>	
Question re — trained by Lady Health Visitors ..	597
<b>DALPAT SINGH, SARDAR BAHADUR CAPTAIN—</b>	
Budget motion: Non-official presidents of district boards	576-77
Resolution re stadium at Lahore .. .. .	91
<b>DARAKHTPAL GRANTS—</b>	
Question re — in Lower Bari Doab Canal .. .. .	597
<b>DARBARIS—</b>	
Question re communal representation among provincial,	
divisional and district — in the province .. .. .	708
Question re communal representation among provincial,	
divisional and district — in Sheikhpura District ..	708
<b>D. A. V. HIGH SCHOOL—</b>	
Question re matriculation results in —, Shahabad and	
reduction of grants .. .. .	254
Question re reduction of grant-in-aid to —, Shahabad ..	204
<b>DEBATE—</b>	
Member should rise to correct misstatement or misquota-	
tion as soon as it is made but should clear misunderstan-	
ding or misinterpretation by a personal explanation at	
once or subsequently .. .. .	814
Personal reflections will not be allowed even by way of	
reply .. .. .	816, 817
<b>DEBT SERVICES—</b>	
Demand for grant re — .. .. .	525
<b>DEFALCATIONS—</b>	
Question re — in Municipal Committee, Ferozepore ..	654
<b>DELHI BOMB OUTRAGE—</b>	
Question re arrests and release in connection with — ..	111
<b>DELHI-MONTGOMERY ROAD—</b>	
Question re kind of <i>kankar</i> used on the Hissar-Hansi and	
Hansi-Fatehabad sections of the — .. .. .	255

## PAGES.

## DEMANDS FOR ADDITIONAL GRANTS—

Miscellaneous (transferred) .. .. .	422
-------------------------------------	-----

## DEMAND(S) FOR GRANTS—

Administration of Justice .. .. .	761-70
Agriculture (Transferred) .. .. .	822
Buildings and Roads Branch, Establishment charges .. .. .	823
Capital outlay on Industrial development .. .. .	823
Civil Works (Capital Expenditure) .. .. .	824
Civil Works (Reserved) .. .. .	823
Civil Works (Transferred) .. .. .	823
Commuted value of Pensions (Capital expenditure) .. .. .	824
Debt Services .. .. .	525
Education (Reserved) .. .. .	822
Education (Transferred) .. .. .	822
Excise .. .. .	494-95
Expenditure in England .. .. .	826
Famine .. .. .	824
Forests .. .. .	496
Forest (Capital expenditure) .. .. .	496
General Administration (Reserved) .. .. .	525, 541-81
General Administration (Transferred) .. .. .	655-702, 725-61.
Hydro-Electric Scheme (Capital Expenditure) .. .. .	82
Hydro-Electric Scheme Working Expenses .. .. .	824
Industries .. .. .	822
Irrigation .. .. .	496, 499-524
Irrigation Establishment, open canals .. .. .	525
Irrigation Establishment, Sutlej Valley Project .. .. .	525
Jails and Convict Settlements .. .. .	770
Land Revenue .. .. .	425-67
	469-94
Loans by Provincial Governments (Reserved) .. .. .	825
Loans by Provincial Governments (Transferred) .. .. .	825
Medical (Reserved and Transferred) .. .. .	822
Miscellaneous (Reserved) .. .. .	823
Police .. .. .	771-774
	800-822
Public Health (Transferred) .. .. .	822
Refunds (Reserved) and Refunds (Transferred) .. .. .	825
Registration .. .. .	496
Scientific and miscellaneous departments (Transferred) .. .. .	823
Stamps .. .. .	496
Stationery and Printing (Reserved) .. .. .	825
Stationery and Printing (Transferred) .. .. .	825
Superannuation allowances and pensions .. .. .	824
Time-limit for discussion of a — .. .. .	617

	PAGES.
<b>DEMANDS FOR SUPPLEMENTARY GRANTS—</b>	
Administration of Justice .. .. .	401
Expenditure in England under the control of Secretary of State .. .. .	428
Famine .. .. .	428
Forest capital expenditure .. .. .	400
General Administration (Reserved) .. .. .	401
Industries .. .. .	422
Irrigation (Capital expenditure) .. .. .	400
Irrigation Expenditure .. .. .	400
Land Revenue .. .. .	400
Payments for commuted value of pensions .. .. .	428
Police .. .. .	401-22
Refunds (Reserved) .. .. .	428
Refunds (Transferred) .. .. .	428
Superannuation allowances and pensions .. .. .	428
<b>DEPRESSED CLASSES—</b>	
Question re — .. .. .	1
Question re Government High Schools and students of — .. .. .	48
Question re opening of wells in Government buildings for use of — .. .. .	15
<b>DEPUTY COMMISSIONER(S)—</b>	
Question re qualifications of Superintendents of the offices of certain — .. .. .	105
<b>DEPUTY PRESIDENT—</b>	
Adjournment of the House for want of agenda, discussion re .. .. .	497-98
<b>DEPUTY REGISTRARS—</b>	
Question re — of Co-operative Department .. .. .	45
<b>DHANPAT RAI, B. B. LALA—</b>	
Budget, General discussion of— .. .. .	388-85
<b>DIET—</b>	
Question re special — to political prisoners in Mianwali Jail .. .. .	184
<b>DIET MONEY—</b>	
Question re — for civil prisoners .. .. .	111
<b>DIN MUHAMMAD, MR.—</b>	
Budget. General discussion of — .. .. .	849-52
Budget motions involving legislation, point of order re admissibility of — .. .. .	475-76
Budget motion. Minister for Local Self-Government, censure on, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala municipality .. .. .	672-81
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of, .. .. .	444-45
Demand for Supplementary Grant, Police .. .. .	405-08
Nominated to Panel of Chairmen .. .. .	101
Nominated to Railway Advisory Committee .. .. .	826
Resolution re income from resin in <i>Shamlat</i> forests .. .. .	171-72

	PAGES.
DIN MUHAMMAD, MR.—CONCLUDED—	
Resolution <i>re</i> school fee concessions .. ..	96, 97-99
Resolution <i>re</i> total prohibition .. ..	237
DIPALPUR CANAL—	
Question <i>re</i> irrigation in winter by — .. ..	609
DIRECTOR OF INDUSTRIES—	
Question <i>re</i> filling of vacancies in the clerical staff of the office of — .. ..	120
DISMISSAL—	
Question <i>re</i> representation of Sardar Gajjan Singh, ex-Sufedposh, against — .. ..	605
DISPENSARIES—	
Question <i>re</i> inspection of rural — by Civil Surgeons ..	25
DISTRICT BOARD(S)—	
Budget motion <i>re</i> non-official presidents of — ..	554-81, 609-17
Question <i>re</i> — levying <i>haisiyat</i> tax .. ..	790
Question <i>re</i> District Medical Officer of Health and Civil Surgeon being members of Ferozepore — .. ..	602
Question <i>re</i> educational grants to certain — .. ..	609
Question <i>re</i> election of Vice-Presidents of Ludhiana ..	598
Question <i>re</i> establishment by — of vehicle stands and charging of hire from motor vehicles .. ..	713
Question <i>re</i> introduction of system of election of presidents of — .. ..	398
Question <i>re</i> lists of voters of Legislative Council and — ..	27
Question <i>re</i> maintenance of road between Ferozepore City Mall Road and Ferozepore Cantonment Mall Road by the — .. ..	647
Question <i>re</i> non-official presidents of — .. ..	398
Question <i>re</i> persons drawing <i>pachotra</i> from — and standing for election to membership of same .. ..	21
Question <i>re</i> primary school buildings of — .. ..	607
Question <i>re</i> regulation of speed of motor vehicles plying for hire on — roads .. ..	714
Question <i>re</i> representation of Mamdot Estate in the Ferozepore — .. ..	601
Question <i>re</i> representation of Muslims in the Ferozepore — .. ..	601
DISTRICT BOARD SCHOOL—	
Question <i>re</i> provincialisation of —, Nakodar ..	192
DISTRICT INSPECTOR OF SCHOOLS—	
Question <i>re</i> visit of Schools by the —, Rohtak ..	13
DISTRICT INSPECTRESS(ES) OF SCHOOLS—	
Question <i>re</i> appointment of Miss Umar Bakhsh as —, Sialkot District .. ..	789
Question <i>re</i> list of — with qualifications, date of appointment and salary .. ..	789
DIUT SIDDHA—	
Question <i>re</i> road to shrine — in Hamirpur .. ..	607

<b>DIVISION—</b>	
Should be demanded before declaration of result by President .. .. .	628
<b>DOGRA RAJPUTS—</b>	
Budget motion. Representation of — among tahsildars and naib-tahsildars .. .. .	493
<b>DORMAN, MR. W. S.—</b>	
Oath of office .. .. .	1
<b>DRAIN—</b>	
Question re storm water — in Ferozepore tahsil .. .. .	716
<b>DULI CHAND, CHAUDHRI—</b>	
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. .. .	588
Resolution re Committee to enquire into grievances of low paid Government and quasi-Government servants .. .. .	145
Resolution re school fee concessions .. .. .	96-97
<b>DUNI CHAND, LALA—</b>	
Question re conduct of special magistrate in the Lahore Conspiracy Case towards — .. .. .	180
<b>DURGIANA (TEMPLE) AUTHORITIES—</b>	
Question re encroachment upon <i>nazul</i> lands in Amritsar by — .. .. .	2
<b>DUST NUISANCE—</b>	
Question re steps to avoid — in dry season and mud nuisance in rainy season .. .. .	182
<b>E.</b>	
<b>EASTERN CANAL—</b>	
Question re irrigation in winter by — .. .. .	609
<b>EDUCATION—</b>	
Question re compulsory free — in the Ambala District .. .. .	90
Question re cost of primary and secondary — in the Ambala District .. .. .	35
Question re — in Rupar and Kharar .. .. .	37
(See Primary Education)	
<b>EDUCATION (RESERVED)—</b>	
Demand for grant re — .. .. .	822
<b>EDUCATION (TRANSFERRED)—</b>	
Demand for grant re — .. .. .	822
<b>EDUCATION DEPARTMENT—</b>	
Question re employment of statutory agriculturists in the — .. .. .	241
Question re representation of Muslims in the — .. .. .	21
Question re text books written by officers of the — .. .. .	589-591
<b>EDUCATION GRANT—</b>	
Question re — to certain district boards .. .. .	609
<b>ELECTION(S)—</b>	
— to Standing Committees .. .. .	539
— to Standing Committees, postponement of .. .. .	499
Question re — of Vice-Presidents of Ludhiana District Board .. .. .	593

## PAGES.

**ELECTION(S)—CONCLUDED—**

Question <i>re</i> introduction of the system of —, of presidents of District Boards .. .. .	393
Question <i>re</i> revision of electoral wards of Narowal Municipal Committee and fresh — thereto .. .. .	125

**ELECTORAL WARDS—**

Question <i>re</i> revision of —, Narowal Municipal Committee and elections for the Committee .. .. .	125
---	-----

**ELECTORATES—**

Question <i>re</i> institution of separate — for Muslims in local bodies .. .. .	250
--	-----

**ELECTRICITY—**

Question <i>re</i> capacity of Shanan generating station .. .. .	388
Question <i>re</i> cost per unit of —, under Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme and Mysore State Durbar Schemes .. .. .	602
Question <i>re</i> licenses to local bodies for supply of electric energy .. .. .	713

**EMERSON, MR. H. W.—**

Amendment to Resolution <i>re</i> school fee concession, — discussion <i>re</i> want of notice of .. .. .	139
Budget Motion. Corruption in Government departments .. .. .	626-28
Budget Motion. Legislative Council establishment .. .. .	526-27
Discussion <i>re</i> convention of President addressing the House in vernacular .. .. .	311
Oath of office .. .. .	1

**EMPLOYEES—**

Question <i>re</i> — of over 55 years of age in the Municipal Committee, Perozepore .. .. .	654
---	-----

**ENGINEER(S)—**

Question <i>re</i> apprentice — in the Hydro-Electric Branch of the Public Works Department .. .. .	390
Question <i>re</i> — in the water lifting branch of the Agricultural Department .. .. .	392
Question <i>re</i> Indian — in the Hydro-Electric Branch .. .. .	394

**ENGINEERING COLLEGE—**

Question <i>re</i> Muhammadans on the teaching staff of the Maclagan — .. .. .	723
Question <i>re</i> pay, qualifications, etc., of the staff of the Maclagan — .. .. .	723
Question <i>re</i> recreation fee in the Maclagan — .. .. .	723
Question <i>re</i> students' strike in the —, Mughalpura .. .. .	253

**ENGLISH—**

Question <i>re</i> abolition of optional — classes in middle schools in Gurgaon District .. .. .	40
Question <i>re</i> teaching of — in vernacular middle schools .. .. .	11

**ESTABLISHMENT CHARGES—**

Demand for grant <i>re</i> Buildings and Roads Branch — .. .. .	823
---	-----



**ESTATE—***See* Mamdot Estate.**ESTIMATES—**Question *re* revised — of the Bhakra Dam Project .. 242**EXAMINATION(S)—**Question *re* nature of — for Sub-Judges .. 114Question *re* results of Matriculation — in certain schools 254Question *re* second division LL.Bs., for — for Sub-Judgeship .. 12Question *re* statutory agriculturist candidates for —, for Sub-Judges .. 114, 196**EXAMINERS—**Question *re* external — of the Punjab Veterinary College 724**EXCISE—**Demand for grant *re* — .. 494-95**EXCISE INSPECTORS—**Question *re* number of Muslim and Non-Muslim — in the Punjab .. 712Question *re* selection for grade of — from special grade Sub-Inspectors .. 707**EXCISE LICENSEES—**Question *re* — in certain districts who are related to the Excise Assistant to the Financial Commissioner .. 707**EXCISE STAFF—**Question *re* inadequacy of — in Hissar District to cope with prevention of smuggling of opium from Bikaner .. 250**EXCISE SUB-INSPECTORS—**Question *re* number of Muslim and non-Muslim — in special grade .. 707Question *re* promotion of — to special grade .. 707Question *re* selection for grade of Excise Inspectors from special grade — .. 707**EXECUTION—**Question *re* number of persons executed in jails .. 195**EXEMPTION—**Question *re* — of agriculturists of Shahpur District from tuition fee .. 641Question *re* — of Lahore District from Village Patrol Act 644**EXILES—**Question *re* return of Panjabi — .. 208**EX-MILITARY MEN—**Question *re* arrests of men and women in connection with the *Jathas* of — .. 398**EXPENDITURE IN ENGLAND—**Demands for grants *re* — .. 826**EX-SOLDIERS—**Question *re* arrest of — under Sections 107 and 109 of Criminal Procedure Code in Hoshiarpur and Jullundur 181

## PAGES.

## EXTENSION—

Question re — of term of members of Multan municipality	705
EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS—	
Question re appointment of non-graduates as — ..	607
Question re communal representation among candidates for posts of — .. .. .	117
Question re rolls for posts of — .. .. .	129
Question re rolls for posts of — sent by Deputy Commissioner, Jhang .. .. .	723

## F.

## FACTORIES—

Question re closing of — .. .. .	201
Question re employment of boys in glass — .. .. .	178
Question re — for manufacture of glassware .. .. .	201

## FAMINE—

Demand for grant re — .. .. .	824
Demand for supplementary grant re— .. .. .	423

## FAMINE CODE (PUNJAB)—

Question re rate of wages under the — .. .. .	277
---	-----

## FAMINE RELIEF—

Question re — test works in Hissar District .. .. .	276
Question re measures of — in Hissar .. .. .	240

## FARM(S)—

Question re value of produce in Government — .. .. .	194
--	-----

## FATEH SINGH, SARDAR SAHIB, SARDAR —

Budget Motion. Non-official Presidents of District Boards	581
---	-----

## FAZL ALI, KHAN BAHADUR, CHAUDHRI—

Budget motion. Revenue Patwaris, pay and prospects of—	461-65
Resolution re committees to enquire into grievances of low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants .. .. .	147-48
Resolution re total prohibition .. .. .	214-16

## FAZL-I-HUSAIN, THE HONOURABLE MIAN SIR—

Adjournment of House for want of Agenda, discussion re	497
Appreciation of services of — .. .. .	792-800
Appreciation of services of, reply to .. .. .	798-800
Budget. General discussion of — .. .. .	369-71
Budget Motion. Canal telegraph offices, use of, by public .. .. .	505, 506
Budget motion for censuring policy of Minister, discussion re admissibility of — .. .. .	630, 631, 632, 633, 634, 635, 636
Budget Motion. Corruption in Government departments	629
Budget motions involving legislation, point of order re admissibility of .. .. .	472, 473
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards	614-17

## FAZL-I-HUSAIN, THE HONOURABLE MIAN SIR—

## CONTINUED.—

Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards, point of order <i>re</i> discussion of, under General Administration (Reserved) demand .. .. .	554, 555, 556
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. .. .	545
Budget motions to raise discussion on policy of Government, point of order <i>re</i> putting to vote of .. .. .	486
Budget motion. Re-afforestation including <i>chos</i> areas .. .. .	485-86
Budget motion. Reduction of <i>abiana</i> on cotton crops .. .. .	521-24
Budget Motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of .. .. .	454-57
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay of, point of order how far it offends the rule against repetition of resolutions .. .. .	445-46
Budget motion. Zamindars, declaration of, as criminal tribes .. .. .	552, 553, 554
Closure, discussion <i>re</i> right of reply of Government member and mover after application of — .. .. .	700, 701
Debate, convention of allowing questions through the Chair in <i>re</i> Government Member's speech, after closure has been applied .. .. .	756, 757, 759
Demand for grant. Forests .. .. .	496
Demand for grant. Forest (capital expenditure) .. .. .	496
Demand for grant. Irrigation .. .. .	496
Demand for grant. Irrigation Establishment, open canals .. .. .	525
Demand for grant. Irrigation Establishment, Sutlej Valley Project .. .. .	525
Demand for grant. Land Revenue .. .. .	425
Demands for supplementary grants—	
Famine .. .. .	423
Forest Capital expenditure .. .. .	400
General Administration (Reserved) .. .. .	401
Irrigation expenditure .. .. .	400
Irrigation Capital expenditure .. .. .	400
Land Revenue .. .. .	400
Police .. .. .	418-21
Refunds (Reserved) .. .. .	423
Discussion <i>re</i> Inaccuracies in Press Reports .. .. .	280
Discussion <i>re</i> obligation of member who has made a speech to stay in the House to listen to reply thereto .. .. .	156, 157
Ministerial responsibility, discussion <i>re</i> .. .. .	684, 685, 686
Resolution <i>re</i> committee to enquire into grievances of colonists of Nili Bar .. .. .	70, 74, 75
Resolution <i>re</i> committee to enquire into grievances of low paid Government and quasi-Government servants .. .. .	148-51
Resolution <i>re</i> stadium at, Lahore .. .. .	94-5
Resolution <i>re</i> total prohibition .. .. .	237

**FAZL-I-HUSAIN, THE HONOURABLE MIAN SIR—****CONCLUDED—**

Time-limit for discussion of Demand, General Administration (Reserved) .. .. 617

Unparliamentary expressions — "bania" discussion *re*, whether offensive term .. .. 817

**FEE(S)—**

Question *re* exemption of agriculturists of Shahpur District from tuition— .. .. 641

Question *re* — from non-Christian students of Kinnaird High School for Girls, Lahore .. .. 790

Question *re* patwaries' share of mutation — .. .. 597

Question *re* recreation — in the MacLagan Engineering College .. .. 728

**FEE CONCESSIONS—**

Question *re* — in Lahore District .. .. 648

**FERRIES—**

Question *re* stationing of police at — .. .. 36

**FERRY TOLLS—**

Question *re* — on motor vehicles on the bridges over the Jhelum and the Chenab .. .. 258

**FILTH DEPÔT—**

Question *re* location of municipal —, Sheikhpura .. .. 127

**FINANCIAL COMMISSIONERS—**

Question *re* communal representation among stenographers in the office of — .. .. 108

**FIREWOOD—**

Question *re* cost of — at Chhanga Manga railway station .. .. 387

**FIROZ KHAN, NOON, THE HONOURABLE MALIK—**

Bill. Registration Validating Bill, the Punjab .. .. 424

Budget. General discussion *re* — .. .. 361-66

Budget motion. Censure of, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala Municipality .. .. 781-56, 787, 758, 759.

Budget motions, involving legislation, point of order *re* admissibility of .. .. 478

Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards .. .. 564-68, 618

Budget motion. Re-afforestation (including *chos* areas) .. .. 480-81, 485

Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crop .. .. 520, 521

Demand for grant. Registration .. .. 496

**FIROZ-UD-DIN KHAN, RANA—**

Adjournment of House for want of agenda, discussion *re* .. .. 497, 498

Budget. General discussion of— .. .. 348-46

Budget motion. Minister for Local Self-Government, censure on, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala Municipality .. .. 669-72

**FIROZ-UD-DIN KHAN, RANA—CONCLUDED—**

Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards	610-14
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas ..	542
Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crops ..	513-16
Closure, point of order <i>re</i> discretion of President to allow Minister's reply after application of — .. ..	725, 727, 728
Resolution <i>re</i> committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists .. ..	74-77
Resolution <i>re</i> total prohibition .. ..	228-32

**FLOODS—**

Question <i>re</i> area affected by — in Khairan and Andaura taluks .. ..	391
--	-----

**FOREST DEPARTMENT—**

Question <i>re</i> excess of officers in the — .. ..	249
Question <i>re</i> Forest area under the control of — and the number of gazetted officers .. ..	387
Question <i>re</i> forest divisions held by officers of the Imperial and Provincial — .. ..	386
Question <i>re</i> head-quarters of the Upper Bushahr Division of the — .. ..	249
Question <i>re</i> "Working plan circle" in the — .. ..	249

**FOREST GUARDS—**

Question <i>re</i> pay, allowances, etc., of — .. ..	280
--	-----

**FOREST SERVICE—**

Question <i>re</i> vacancies in provincial and imperial — ..	248
--	-----

**FORESTS—**

Demand for grant <i>re</i> — .. ..	496
------------------------------------	-----

**FORESTS (CAPITAL EXPENDITURE)—**

Demand for grant <i>re</i> — .. ..	496
------------------------------------	-----

**FRONTIER CRIMES REGULATIONS—**

Question <i>re</i> exemption of Hindus of Mianwali District from — .. ..	598
---	-----

**G.****GAJJAN SINGH—**

Question <i>re</i> dismissal of —, Sufedposh, Hissar District ..	791
Question <i>re</i> representation of —, <i>ex</i> -Sufedposh, against dismissal .. ..	605

**GANGA RAM, RAI BAHADUR, LALA—**

Budget Motion. Non-official presidents of district boards	560
---	-----

**GAZETTED OFFICERS—**

Question <i>re</i> forest area under the Forest department and the number of — .. ..	387
---	-----

**GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (RESERVED)—**

Demand for grant <i>re</i> — .. ..	525, 541-81
Demand for supplementary grant <i>re</i> — .. ..	401

	PAGES.
<b>GENERAL ADMINISTRATION (TRANSFERRED)—</b>	
Demand for grant re — .. .. .	690-89, 655-702, 725-61.
<b>GHANI, MR. M. A.—</b>	
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of Resolution re Committee to enquire into grievances of low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants ..	457-58 141-45, 147, 155, 164.
<b>GHAZI GHAT—</b>	
Question re boat bridge material stored at — and washed away by floods .. .. .	25
<b>GHORIPAL ZAMINDARS—</b>	
Question re grievances of — .. .. .	879
<b>GHORIPALS—</b>	
Question re grievances of —, of Lower Jhelum Canal Colony	598
<b>GILL, COLONEL, C.A.—</b>	
Oath of office .. .. .	1, 177
<b>GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOL(S)—</b>	
Question re accommodation of Government High Schools for girls in rented buildings .. .. .	718
Question re clerk for the —, Amritsar .. .. .	890
Question re conveyance for girls of the —, Amritsar ..	890
Question re head mistresses of — in provincial and subordinate services and provision of free quarters ..	889
Question re provincialisation of —, Amritsar .. .. .	889
Question re staff of the —, Amritsar .. .. .	890
<b>GLASS—</b>	
Question re employment of boys in —, factories .. ..	178
Question re encouragement of — industry in the Punjab	117, 177
Question re training in manufacture of —, in the Punjab	178
<b>GLASSWARE—</b>	
Question re factories for manufacture of — .. .. .	201
<b>GOKUL CHAND, NARANG, DR.—</b>	
Budget. General discussion re — .. .. .	858-61
Budget. Demand re General Administration (Transferred), policy of Local Self-Government Minister .. .. .	760-61
Budget Motions involving legislation, point of order re admissibility of .. .. .	474, 475
Budget motion re High Court Judges, Agriculturists representation among, discussion re admissibility of ..	764, 765
Budget motion. Land revenue policy of Government (assessment on non-agricultural lands) .. .. .	486-89
Budget motion. Pay of Revenue patwaris, point of order how far it offends the rule against repetition of resolutions	445-46
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of Closure — discussion re Minister's reply after application of Discussion re convention of President addressing the House in vernacular .. .. .	728, 729, 780 810, 811

<b>GOKUL CHAND, NARANG, DR.—CONCLUDED—</b>	
Ministerial responsibility, discussion re .. ..	685
Nominations to Railway Advisory Committee .. ..	826
Resolution re Committee to enquire into grievances of low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants .. ..	159-68
Resolution re Income from resin in <i>Shamilat</i> forests .. ..	172-73
<b>GOPAL DAS, LALA—</b>	
Budget. General discussion of — .. ..	329-30
<b>GOVERNMENT HIGH SCHOOLS—</b>	
Question re accommodation of — for girls in rented build- ings. .. ..	718
Question re — and depressed class students .. ..	48
<b>GOVERNMENT PRESS—</b>	
Question re memorials of composers of —, Lahore .. ..	788
Question re 'no work allowances' to piece hand composi- tors of —, Lahore .. ..	788
Question re quarters or house rent allowances for the workers of the —, Lahore .. ..	784
<b>GOVERNMENT SERVANT(S)—</b>	
Question re approach of members of Legislative Council by —, and quasi — .. ..	788
Question re Revenue Patwaris, whether — .. ..	785
Resolution re Committee to enquire into grievances of low paid — .. ..	141-65
<b>GRANT(S)—</b>	
Question re allotments for local — in Kheeka, Pir Mahal and Burala Projects .. ..	645
Question re Darakhtpal — in Lower Bari Doab Canal .. ..	587
Question re Government — to certain district boards .. ..	609
Question re non-registration of Kamins for local — .. ..	645
Question re reduction of — to certain schools .. ..	254
<i>See Grant(s) -in-aid.</i>	
<b>GRANT(S)-IN-AID—</b>	
Question re curtailment of —, in the Ambala Division .. ..	18
Question re details of — to aided schools .. ..	289
Question re — to aided high schools, Ambala Division .. ..	29
Question re — to Kinnaird High School for girls, Lahore .. ..	789
Question re — for muslim orphanage and hostel, Mianwali .. ..	258
Question re — to schools, share for Muslims .. ..	261
Question re reduction of — to certain private schools .. ..	204
Question re reduction of — of certain high schools of back- ward communities in the Ambala Division .. ..	15
Question re Rules regarding the method of calculating — .. ..	289
<b>GRAY, MR. V. F.—</b>	
Fazl-i-Husain, The Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of services of — .. ..	796-97
Resolution re Total prohibition .. ..	227-28

## GRAZING—

Question re area of land reserved for — of cattle in Hissar District ..	276
Question re reservation of Tikka Tiloo Forests for purposes of — ..	709

## GUN LICENCE—

Question re cancellation of — of Hakim Abdul Aziz ..	712
--	-----

## H.

## HAIL-STORMS—

Question re damage by — and relief to zamindars ..	383
Question re damages to crops by — in the Kangra District	16

## HAISIYAT TAX—

Question re. — in Hissar District ..	186
Question re levy of — on miners of Khewra salt mines ..	787
Question re Municipal committees and district boards levying — ..	790
Question re pachotra to lambardars for collection of — ..	587

## HANDCUFFING—

Question re — of special class prisoners ..	111
---	-----

## HARBAKESH SINGH, SARDAR—

Budget motion. Minister for Local Self-Government, censure on, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala Municipality ..	666-69
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards	575-76

## HARGOLAL GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOL—

Question re recognition of —, Ambala Cantonment ..	24
--	----

## HEAD MISTRESSES—

Question re free quarters for — of girls' high schools ..	889
Question re — of girls high schools in provincial and subordinate services ..	889

## HEADQUARTERS—

Question re — of the upper Bushahr Division of the Forest Department ..	249
---	-----

## HEALTH OFFICER—

Question re complaint against Municipal —, Ferozepore City ..	121
Question re — being member of Ferozepore District Board	602

## HEALTH VISITORS—

Question re lady — in the province ..	597
---------------------------------------	-----

## HIGH COURT JUDGES—

Agriculturist representation among, discussion re admissibility of budget motion re — ..	762-86
--	--------



## HIGH SCHOOL(S)—

Question re accommodation of Government — for girls in rented buildings .. .. .	718
Question re band attached to — .. .. .	125
Question re clerk for the girls' —, Amritsar .. .. .	390
Question re conveyance for girls of the girls' —, Amritsar .. .. .	390
Question re fall in the strength of — in the Ambala Division .. .. .	18
Question re grants-in-aid to aided —, Ambala Division .. .. .	29
Question re head mistresses of girls' — provincial service .. .. .	389
Question re head mistresses of girls' — in subordinate service .. .. .	389
Question re — maintained by Government and local bodies in Rohtak and teachers employed therein .. .. .	11
Question re list of — in Jullundur District .. .. .	644
Question re number of — for girls .. .. .	388
Question re provincialisation of girls' —, Amritsar .. .. .	389
Question re recognition of the Hargolal Girls' — (Hargolal Kanya Mahavidyalaya), Ambala Cantonment .. .. .	24
Question re reduction of grant-in-aid to certain — of backward communities in the Ambala Division .. .. .	15
Question re staff of the Girls' —, Amritsar .. .. .	390
See Government High Schools	

## HINDU(S)—

Question re exemption of — of Mianwali District from Frontier Crimes Regulations .. .. .	598
--	-----

## HINDU AGRICULTURISTS—

Budget motion re representation of —, among Sub-Inspectors of Police .. .. .	771-74, 800-21.
--	--------------------

## HINDU SABHA—

Question re memorial from —, Ambala, re preponderance of Muhammadan officers .. .. .	586
--	-----

## HIRA SINGH, NARLI, SARDAR—

Budget. General discussion of .. .. .	308-12.
Budget motion. Canal post offices .. .. .	496
Budget motion. Canal telegraph offices, use of by public .. .. .	502, 503, 506
Budget motion. Land revenue, assessment of on income-tax principles .. .. .	471, 476-77
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards .. .. .	554, 556, 557 617.
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. .. .	533-34
Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crop .. .. .	508-09 521, 522.
Budget motion. Re-modelling of rajbahar Kohali and Jama Rai .. .. .	499-502
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of — .. .. .	460-61
Budget motion. zamindars, declaration of as criminal tribes .. .. .	546, 547, 552
Resolution re Committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists .. .. .	65-8.

## PAGES.

## HOLIDAY(S)—

Question *re* curtailment of — of Sub-Registrars .. 885

Question *re* observance of 'Id' festival in Punjab Jails .. 783

## HONORARY MAGISTRATE(S)—

Question *re* communal representation among — in province 708

Question *re* communal representation among — in Sheikhupura District .. 708

Question *re* — exercising power over areas where they own property or have relations .. 792

Question *re* proceedings against an — of Amritsar for corruption .. 791

## HOUSE RENT ALLOWANCE—

Question *re* — for workers in Government Press, Lahore 784

## HOUSE TAX—

Question *re* — in Multan .. 703, 704, 705

Question *re* non-payment of — in Multan City .. 253

## HUNGER STRIKE—

Question *re* punishments to political prisoners for — or other political agitation .. 112

Question *re* threat of — of conspiracy case prisoners .. 180

## HYDRO-ELECTRIC BRANCH—

Question *re* apprentice engineers in the — of the Public Works Department .. 390

Question *re* communal representation among certain gazetted posts in the Public Works Department, — .. 246

Question *re* establishment charges on gazetted and subordinate staff of the — of the Public Works Department 247

Question *re* Indian Engineers in the — .. 394

## HYDRO-ELECTRIC SCHEME—

Demand for grant *re* — (Capital expenditure) .. 824

Demand for grant *re* — (Working expenses) .. 824

Question *re* gazetted staff employed in the Mandi — .. 3

Question *re* progress of work and expenditure on — .. 13

## I.

## 'ID'—

Question *re* observance of — holidays in Punjab Jails .. 783

## ILAM DIN, B.—

Question *re* case against —, Sub-Inspector of Police, village Nowshehra Virkan .. 134

## ILLEGAL GRATIFICATION—

Question *re* measures to stop — .. 135

## IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE—

Question *re* Forest divisions held by officers of the — .. 386

Question *re* vacancies in the — .. 248

## IMPERIAL SERVICES—

Question *re* provincial services, members of which can rise to — .. .. .

44

## INDEPENDENCE DAY—

Question *re* behaviour of police in Batala on — ..

110

Question *re* Municipal Commissioners, and — celebration

249

Question *re* Municipal Commissioners, participating in the celebration of — .. .. .

584, 600

## INDIAN PENAL CODE—

Question *re* prosecution of Sardar Randhir Singh, under Section 380 of the — .. .. .

181

## INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT—

Demand for grant *re* Capital outlay on — .. ..

828

## INDUSTRY(IES)—

Demand for grant *re* — .. ..

822

Demand for supplementary grant *re* — .. ..

422

Question *re* constitution of a board to consider measures for development of — .. ..

178

Question *re* encouragement to glass — in the Punjab ..

117, 177

## INSPECTION—

Question *re* — of rural dispensaries by Civil Surgeons ..

25

## INSPECTORS—

Question *re* communal representation among — of Co-operative Societies. .. ..

278

Question *re* — of Co-operative Department .. ..

45

Question *re* number of — of Co-operative Societies ..

711

## INTERMEDIATE COLLEGE(S)—

Question *re* opening of an — at Jullundur .. ..

644

Question *re* number of — for girls .. ..

388

Question *re* provisions for science classes in the — Shahpur

642

## INTERPRETERS—

Question *re* appointment of — in the Lahore Conspiracy Case .. ..

108

## INTERVIEWS—

Question *re* complaint about — of accused with the attorneys in the Lahore Conspiracy Case ..

109

## IRRIGATION—

Budget motion *re* — to Ara tract .. ..

506-08

Demand for grant *re* — .. ..

496, 499-524

Demand for supplementary grant, — (Capital) Expenditure

400

Demand for supplementary grant, — expenditure ..

400

Question *re* area to be irrigated by Bhakra Dam in British territory and native states .. ..

714

Question *re* diminution of water supply for — in certain villages caused by tube-well at Ludhiana ..

655

Question *re* — of Crown waste lands by wells ..

381

## PAGES.

## IRRIGATION ESTABLISHMENT—

Demand for grant re —, open canals ..	525
Demand for grant re —, Sutlej Valley Project ..	525

## J.

## JAGAT RAM, PANDIT—

Question re release of — of Hoshiarpur District ..	598
--	-----

## JAGIRDARS—

Question re communal representation among — in province ..	708
Question re communal representation among — in Shikharpara District .. .. .	708

## JAIL(S)—

Demand for grant re — and convict settlements ..	770
Question re number of persons executed in — ..	195
Question re number of political prisoners in Punjab —, and number among them not classed special ..	393
Question re number of prisoners in Jullundur — await- ing trial .. .. .	181
Question re observance of 'Id' holidays in Punjab — ..	783

## JAILS ENQUIRY COMMITTEE—

Question re action on the report of the — .. .. .	186
Question re recommendations of the — .. .. .	112

## JAIL OFFICIALS—

Question re complaint of maltreatment of accused in the Lahore Conspiracy Case by — .. .. .	109
--	-----

## JAMA RAI—

Budget motion re re-modelling of — rajbaha ..	499-502
---	---------

## JAT(S)—

Question re Hindu — holding the post of Deputy Superin- tendent or Inspector of Police or retired in either of these capacities .. .. .	14
---	----

## JAT HIGH SCHOOL—

Question re matriculation results in the —, Hissar and reduction of grants .. .. .	54
Question re reduction of grant-in-aid to —, Hissar ..	204

## JATHAS—

Question re arrest of men and women in connection with the — of ex-military men .. .. .	393
--	-----

## JHELUM—

Question re rise of bed level in the river — .. .. .	262
--	-----

JOGENDRA SINGH, THE HONOURABLE SARDAR,  
SIR—

Budget. General discussion of — .. .. .	353-55
Budget motion. Excise Sub-Inspectors .. .. .	495
Demand for additional grant —, Miscellaneous (transferred)	422
Demand for grant re Excise .. .. .	494

## PAGES.

<b>JOGENDRA SINGH, THE HONOURABLE SARDAR,</b>	
<b>SIR—CONCLUDED—</b>	
Demand for supplementary grant — Civil Works (Reserved) .. .. .	422
Demand for supplementary grants — Refunds (transferred)	423
Fazl-i-Husain, The Honourable Mian, Sir, appreciation of services of — .. .. .	792-93
Resolution re total prohibition .. .. .	223-26
<b>JUDICIAL ESTABLISHMENT—</b>	
Question re corruption among subordinate — .. .. .	586
<b>JUDICIAL OFFICERS—</b>	
Question re police interference with — .. .. .	243
<b>K.</b>	
<b>KALK A-SIMLA ROAD—</b>	
Question re cart traffic on the — .. .. .	25
<b>KAMA SUTRAS—</b>	
Question re Sanskrit text of Vatsayana's — .. .. .	583
<b>KAMINS—</b>	
Question re half tuition fees for agriculturists and — in Government Secondary Schools .. .. .	277
Question re non-registration of — for local grants .. .. .	645
<b>KANGRA VALLEY RAILWAY—</b>	
Question re effect of the construction of — on the cost per unit of power under Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme .. .. .	384
Question re — .. .. .	603
Question re level-crossing and bridge at miles 44/7 and 44/8 on the — line .. .. .	186
See Railways.	
<b>KANKAR—</b>	
Question re kind of — used on the Hissar-Patchabad Road .. .. .	255
Question re kind of — used on the Hissar-Hansi section of the Delhi-Montgomery Road .. .. .	255
<b>KESHO RAM, SEKHRI, LALA—</b>	
Budget. General discussion of — .. .. .	313-15
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards	563-71
Closure, discussion re Minister's reply after, .. .. .	728
<b>KHADIR CANAL—</b>	
Question re irrigation by — .. .. .	642
<b>KINNAIRD HIGH SCHOOL—</b>	
Question re fees from non-Christian students of — for girls, Lahore .. .. .	790
Question re grant in aid to — for girls, Lahore .. .. .	789
<b>KOHALI—</b>	
Budget motion re re-modelling of — rajbaha .. .. .	499-502

## L.

## LABH SINGH, MR.—

Budget motions involving legislation, point of order <i>re</i> admissibility of .. .. .	474
Budget Motion. Minister for Local Self-Government, censure on, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman Gujranwala municipality .. .. .	681-700, 756, 757, 758, 759.
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas ..	586-88
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay of ..	446-48
Closure, discussion <i>re</i> Minister's reply after application of—	780
Quotations from uncorrect speeches made in Council, privilege of members to make .. .. .	742, 743

## LABHU RAM, RAI SAHIB—

Question <i>re</i> —, Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala, and Central Co-operative Bank .. .. .	781
Question <i>re</i> —, Deputy Commissioner, Gujranwala and Gujranwala-Mortgage Bank .. .. .	782

## LADIES—

Question <i>re</i> safety of — travelling alone in trains ..	128
--	-----

## LAHORE—

Question <i>re</i> conversion of — into a presidency town ..	204
--	-----

## LAHORE CONSPIRACY CASE—

Question <i>re</i> appointment of interpreters in the — ..	108
Question <i>re</i> cellular confinement to prisoners of the — ..	189
Question <i>re</i> complaint about interviews of accused with their attorneys in the — .. .. .	109
Question <i>re</i> complaint against maltreatment of accused in the —, by jails and police officials .. .. .	109
Question <i>re</i> conduct of the Special Magistrate in the — towards Lala Duni Chand .. .. .	180
Question <i>re</i> punishments to prisoners of — by jail or judicial authorities .. .. .	112
Question <i>re</i> supply of vernacular newspapers to — prisoners ..	118
Question <i>re</i> threat of hunger strike of prisoners in the — ..	180

## LAHORE IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE—

Question <i>re</i> composition, etc., of — .. .. .	183
--	-----

## LAL KHAN, MALIK—

Budget motion to censure Minister for unseating —, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala Municipality .. .. .	687-39, 655-700 725-59.
---	----------------------------

## LAMBARDARS—

Question <i>re</i> collection of local rates, cesses, etc., by —, and payment of <i>pachotra</i> .. .. .	190
Question <i>re</i> <i>pachotra</i> to — for collection of cattle and <i>haisiyat</i> taxes .. .. .	587

## LAND(S)—

Budget motion <i>re</i> distribution of — in Nili Bar ..	491-94
Question <i>re</i> acquisition and alienation of — by the Attock Oil Company ..	262
Question <i>re</i> acquisition of landed property of Shahzada Abdul Khaliq and others in Ludhiana ..	185
Question <i>re</i> area of Government waste — in the Jhang District ..	710
Question <i>re</i> area of — reserved for grazing of cattle in Hissar ..	276
Question <i>re</i> area of — sold or mortgaged by small land-holders to big land-holders ..	599
Question <i>re</i> auction of — in the Nili Bar ..	888
Question <i>re</i> auction of waste — in Jhang District ..	260
Question <i>re</i> compensation for — eroded by the Chakki ..	187
Question <i>re</i> damage to — by collection water near Bikaner Canal Embankment ..	716, 717
Question <i>re</i> distribution of — to landed gentry ..	595
Question <i>re</i> encroachments upon <i>nazul</i> — in Amritsar by Durgiana temple authorities ..	2
Question <i>re</i> extension of period and number of instalments due on Government — purchased by zamindars of the Jhang District ..	594
Question <i>re</i> grant of — to Noor-Maharram and Aqula-Hayata Baloches of Jhang District ..	595
Question <i>re</i> irrigation by wells and distribution of Crown waste — ..	381
Question <i>re</i> — affected by floods in Khairan and Andaura Taluks ..	391
Question <i>re</i> — purchased by non-agriculturist in the new colonies ..	782
Question <i>re</i> — sold by Government in the new colonies ..	782
Question <i>re</i> realisation of the cost of chaukidars' uniforms from the income of <i>shamilat</i> — ..	378
Question <i>re</i> sale of <i>Nazul</i> — in Mauza Sheesh Mahal ..	706
Question <i>re</i> waste — in Shahpur Colony area ..	609

## LAND ALIENATION ACT—

Question <i>re</i> area of land sold or mortgaged by small land-holders to big land-holders since — came into force ..	599
--	-----

## LANDED GENTRY—

Question <i>re</i> distribution of lands to — ..	595
--	-----

## LAND-HOLDERS—

Question <i>re</i> area of land sold or mortgaged by small — to big — ..	599
--	-----

## LAND-LORDS—

Question <i>re</i> compromise between tenants and — of Ohhu-chakwas, District Rohtak ..	605
Question <i>re</i> struggle between tenants and — of village Ohhuchakwas, Rohtak District ..	601

## PAGES.

## LAND REVENUE—

Budget motion <i>re</i> assessment of — <i>like</i> income-tax ..	471-88
Budget motion <i>re</i> land revenue policy ..	488-90
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — ..	425-67
	469-94
Demand for supplementary grant <i>re</i> ..	400
Question <i>re</i> payment of — into the treasury ..	584

## LATHIS—

Question <i>re</i> use of — by police ..	184
--	-----

## LEASE HOLDERS—

Question <i>re</i> rates charged for jungle wood on the Sutlej Valley Project from temporary — ..	776
Question <i>re</i> value of wood charged to temporary — on Sutlej Valley Project ..	776

## LECTURES—

Question <i>re</i> — by professors of Punjab Veterinary College ..	725
--	-----

## LEGISLATION—

Budget motions involving —, discussion <i>re</i> admissibility of ..	472-76
--	--------

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL—

Budget motion <i>re</i> establishment of — ..	525-27
Question <i>re</i> approach of members of — by Government and quasi-Government servants ..	788
Question <i>re</i> lists of voters for Punjab — and District Boards ..	27

## LICENCE—

Question <i>re</i> cancellation of gun — of Hakim Abdul Aziz ..	712
Question <i>re</i> — issued for plying motor vehicles on hire and irregularities against the — ..	128
Question <i>re</i> — to local bodies for supply of electric energy ..	713
Question <i>re</i> number of arms — in the Ambala Division ..	258
Question <i>re</i> Shikar — and restrictions on the purchase of bullets and Groves cartridges ..	377

## LICENSEES—

Question <i>re</i> excise — in certain districts who are related to Excise Assistant to the Financial Commissioners ..	707
--	-----

## LISTS—

Question <i>re</i> — showing communal representation in services ..	115
---	-----

## LITIGANTS—

Question <i>re</i> accommodation for — in law courts ..	586
---	-----

## LOANS BY PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS—

Demand for grant <i>re</i> — (Reserved) ..	825
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — (Transferred) ..	825

## LOCAL BODIES—

Question <i>re</i> high schools maintained by — in Rohtak District ..	11
Question <i>re</i> institution of separate electorates for Muslims in — ..	250



## LOCAL BODIES—CONCLUDED—

Question re licenses to — for supply of electric energy ..	718
Question re non-official presidents for — ..	19

## LOCAL GRANTS—

Question re allotment for — in Kheeka Pirmahal and Burala Projects ..	645
Question re non-registration of Kamins for — ..	645

## LOCAL RATES—

Question re collection of — by lambardars and payment of pachotra ..	190
Question re — charged on well revenue, Multan District ..	18
Question re pachotra to lambardars for collection of — ..	587

## LOCUST(S)—

Question re damage to rabi crops by — in Jhang District ..	596
Question re destruction of — ..	718
Question re — pest in Ludhiana District ..	654

## LORRIES—

Question re prohibition against running of — at nights on certain roads ..	27
--	----

## LOWER BARI DOAB CANAL—

Question re Darakhtpal grants in — ..	587
Question re half-remissions in — colony ..	191
Question re — ..	779

## LOWER CHENAB CANAL—

Question re acreage rates on the — ..	776
Question re half-remissions on — ..	191
Question re — ..	779

## LOWER JHELUM CANAL—

Question re grievances of gharipals of — Colony ..	594
Question re half-remissions on the — ..	191

## M.

## MACLAGAN ENGINEERING COLLEGE—

Question re Muhammadans on the teaching staff of the — ..	728
Question re number, pay, qualifications, etc., of the staff of the — ..	728
Question re recreation fee in the — ..	728

## MCLEOD, MR.—

Question re appointment of — as Superintending Engineer, Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme ..	394
Question re charge held by — ..	395

## MACNABB, MR. A. C.—

Oath of office ..	377
-------------------	-----

## MAILSI CANALS—

Question re water failure on — ..	18
-----------------------------------	----

**MAMDOT ESTATE—**

Question <i>re</i> representation of — in the Ferozepore District Board .. .. .	601
---	-----

**MANDI HYDRO ELECTRIC SCHEME—**

Question <i>re</i> appointment of Indian Assistant Engineers for the — .. .. .	383
Question <i>re</i> appointment of Mr. Meleod as Superintending Engineer, Punjab .. .. .	394
Question <i>re</i> cost of power under the — .. .. .	384, 395
Question <i>re</i> cost per unit of electricity under — and the Mysore State Durbar Scheme.. .. .	602
Question <i>re</i> machinery for the — .. .. .	106

**MANKA CANAL—**

Question <i>re</i> water for irrigating the area commanded by the — .. .. .	29
---	----

**MANOHAR LAL, THE HON'BLE MR.—**

Budget. General discussion of — .. .. .	346-49
Budget motions involving legislation, point of order <i>re</i> admissibility of .. .. .	474-75
Demands for supplementary grant, industries .. .. .	422
Ministerial responsibility, discussion <i>re</i> — .. .. .	634
Resolution <i>re</i> school fee concessions .. .. .	99-101
Resolution <i>re</i> school fee concessions, amendment to, objected for want of notice .. .. .	185-87
Resolution <i>re</i> school fee concessions, amendment to, objected for want of notice .. .. .	187-188

**MAQBOOL MAHMOOD, MR.—**

Budget motion. Minister for Local Self-Government, censure on, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala Municipality .. .. .	663-66
--	--------

**MATRICULATION—**

Question <i>re</i> results of — examination in certain schools .. .. .	254
--	-----

**MAYA DAS, MR. E.—**

Budget. General discussion of .. .. .	301-03
Budget motion. Minister for Local Self-Government, censure on, for unseating M. Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala Municipality .. .. .	661-63
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards .. .. .	571
Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crop .. .. .	519-11
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay of .. .. .	448-49
Demand for supplementary grant, police .. .. .	408-09
Fazl-i-Husain, the Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of services of .. .. .	793
—, nominated to the panel of chairmen .. .. .	101
Resolution <i>re</i> committee to enquire into grievances of low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants .. .. .	159, 163-64
Resolution <i>re</i> stadium at Lahore .. .. .	92-3
Resolution <i>re</i> total prohibition .. .. .	208-10

	PAGES.
<b>MEDICAL—</b>	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> — (Reserved and Transferred) ..	822
<b>MEDICAL OFFICERS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> number of — community-wise in the province ..	710
<b>MEHAR CHAND, PANDIT—</b>	
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards ..	578-74
Resolution <i>re</i> stadium at Lahore ..	98-94
<b>MEMORIALS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> — from Hindu Sabha, Ambala, <i>re</i> preponderance of Muhammadan officers ..	586
Question <i>re</i> — of compositors of Government Press, Lahore ..	783
<b>MERCY—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> petitions for — ..	133
<b>METALLED ROADS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> mileage of — in the province ..	255
<b>MIDDLE SCHOOL(S)—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> abolition of optional English Classes in — in Gurgaon District ..	40
Question <i>re</i> number of — for girls ..	388
Question <i>re</i> raising of the District Board Anglo-Vernacular —, Deragopipur, to high standard ..	588
Question <i>re</i> teaching of English in vernacular ..	11
Question <i>re</i> visit of Vernacular — at Kanhaur by the District Inspector of Schools, Rohtak ..	13
<b>MILITARY PENSIONERS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> preparation of list of — ..	600
<b>MINISTER—</b>	
Methods of criticising a — open to the Council, budget motion being one of them ..	633
<b>MINISTER FOR LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT—</b>	
Budget motion censuring — for unseating Malik Lal Khan, Vice-Chairman, Gujranwala Municipality ..	637-39, 655-700, 725, 759
<b>MINORITY COMMUNITIES—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> representation of —, in Central Co-operative Banks and Unions ..	643
<b>MISAPPROPRIATION—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> alleged — of Government money by Raja Muhammad Hassan ..	122
<b>MISCELLANEOUS (RESERVED)—</b>	
Demand for grant <i>re</i> ..	828
<b>MODEL TOWN—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> building of a — at Palampur ..	24

## PAGES.

<b>MOHAN LAL, RAI BAHADUR LALA,—</b>	
Budget. General discussion of — .. ..	299-301
Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crop ..	511-12
Resolution re income from resin in Shamlat forests ..	170-71
Resolution re total prohibition .. ..	205-08, 234-36.
<b>MOHARRAM—</b>	
Question re — procession, Kaithal .. ..	19
<b>MOEINDAR SINGH, SARDAR—</b>	
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas ..	581-82
Resolution re stadium at Lahore .. ..	89, 95
<b>MONEY COLLECTION(S)—</b>	
Question re — by Mr. Brayne, Deputy Commissioner, Gurgaon .. ..	14
<b>MONGI MINOR—</b>	
Question re distribution of water to land commanded by — and Mongi Rajbaha .. ..	107
Question re reduction of size of outlets of — ..	108
<b>MONGI RAJBABA—</b>	
Question re distribution of water to land commanded by Mongi Minor and — .. ..	107
Question re size of outlets of — .. ..	108
<b>MORTGAGE BANK—</b>	
Question re Rai Sahib Lala Labhu Ram, Deputy Commis- sioner, Gujranwala and Gujranwala — .. ..	782
<b>MOTOR ACCIDENTS—</b>	
Question re — in Hissar, Gurgaon, Karnal and Rohtak Districts .. ..	257
Question re — near Verka railway phatak .. ..	17
Question re number of — in 1928-29 .. ..	86
<b>MOTOR LORRIES—</b>	
Question re carrying capacity of — plying for hire in Sheikhupura and Gujranwala districts .. ..	127
<b>MOTOR VEHICLES—</b>	
Question re check on over-loading of — .. ..	105
Question re ferry tolls for — at the Jhelum and Chenab bridges .. ..	258
Question re hire from — for use of stands .. ..	713
Question re licenses for plying of — and irregularities against the licences .. ..	128
Question re — plying for hire in Hamirpur tahsil ..	709
Question re regulation of speed of — plying for hire on district board roads .. ..	714
Question re restrictions on plying of — in Kangra District ..	105
<b>MUHAMMAD ABDUL RAHMAN KHAN, CHAUDHRI—</b>	
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards ..	557-59
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas ..	535-86

**MUHAMMAD HASSAN, RAJA—**

Question, *re* alleged misappropriation of Government money by .. .. 122

**MUHAMMAD HAYAT, QURESHI, KHAN BAHADUR, MIAN, MUHAMMAD —**

Budget. General discussion of .. .. 323-26

Budget motion. Irrigation of Ara tract .. .. 506-07, 508

Resolution *re* school fee concessions, amendment to .. 137, 138

**MUHAMMAD HUSSAIN, SAYAD—**

Budget motion. Canal telegraph offices, use of, by public 504, 505

Budget motion. Colonisation operations .. .. 436-38, 439

Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crops .. 512-13

Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of 449-50

**MUHAMMAD IQBAL, DR. SIR—**

Budget. General discussion of —, .. .. 335-37

**MUHAMMAD SADIQ, SHAIKH—**

Budget. General discussion *re* .. .. 321-23

Budget motion. Hindu agriculturists representation among Sub-Inspectors of Police .. 809-12

Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards 560-64

Budget motion. Public Prosecutors, Muhammadan representation among .. .. 768-69

Demand for supplementary grant, Police .. .. 412-14

—, nominated to Panel of Chairmen .. .. 101

Resolution *re* stadium at Lahore .. .. 89-91

**MUHAMMAD SAID, MR.—**

Question *re* complaints against —, Magistrate, Karnal .. 585

**MUHAMMADANS—**

Budget motion *re* representation of — among public prosecutors .. .. 767-70

Question *re*— in the teaching staff of the Madrasan Engineering College .. .. 723

Question *re* preponderance of —, officers in the Ambala District .. .. 586

See Muslim(s).

**MUHARRIRS—**

Question *re* period of stay of Police —, at one thana .. 203

**MUKAND LAL, PURI, LALA—**

Budget. General discussion .. .. 340-43

Budget motion. Public Prosecutors, Muhammadan representation among .. .. 769

Discussion *re* convention of President addressing the House in Vernacular .. .. 310

—, nominated to the Panel of Chairmen .. .. 101

—, nominated to Railways Advisory Committee .. .. 826

Resolution *re* stadium at Lahore .. .. 91-2

Standing Committees, discussion *re* postponement of elections to — .. .. 499

## PAGES.

## MUNICIPAL COMMISSIONER(S)—

Question re — and Independence Day celebration ..	248
Question re participation of —, in Independence Day celebrations .. .. .	584, 600

## MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE(S)—

Question re allowance to the Secretary of —, Ferozepore, for supervision of sanitation .. .. .	654
Question re complaint against President of Hansi — ..	777
Question re defalcations in —, Ferozepore .. .. .	654
Question re employees over 55 years of age in the —, Ferozepore .. .. .	654
Question re financial condition of —, Multan .. .. .	385
Question re finances of —, Kasur .. .. .	20
Question re imposition of water and house tax by Multan — .. .. .	385, 709, 704, 705.
Question re insolvency of Maulvi Alla Din and his removal for Hoshiarpur — .. .. .	202
Question re — levying haisiyat tax .. .. .	790
Question re retrenchment of staff by —, Ferozepore .. .. .	647
Question re revision of electoral wards of Narowal — and elections thereto .. .. .	125

## MUNICIPALITY(IES)—

Question re controversy in Rawalpindi — over hoisting National flag on its buildings .. .. .	254
Question re extension of the term of members of Multan — .. .. .	705
Question re—spending money on temperance propaganda .. .. .	722
Question re resignation of Muslim members of Montgomery— .. .. .	248

## MUSLIM OFFICIALS—

Question re appointment of — in Mianwali .. .. .	259
--	-----

## MUSLIM ORPHANAGE—

Question re grant-in-aid to — and hostel, Mianwali .. .. .	258
--	-----

## MUSLIMS—

Question re grant-in-aid to schools, share for — .. .. .	261
Question re institution of separate electorates for — in local bodies .. .. .	250
Question re representation of — in the Education Department .. .. .	21
Question re representation of — in the Ferozepore District Board .. .. .	601
Question re resignation of — members of Montgomery Municipality .. .. .	243
Question re villages in which — do not enjoy freedom of Azan .. .. .	248

## MUTATION FEES—

Question re collection of — by lambardars and payment of pachotra .. .. .	190
Question re patwaris' share of — .. .. .	587

## N.

<b>MUZAFAR KHAN, KHAN BAHADUR, NAWAB—</b>	
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas ..	580-81
<b>NAIB-TAHSILDARS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> Hindu statutory agriculturists among ..	242
<b>NANAK CHAND, PANDIT—</b>	
Adjournment of House for want of agenda, discussion <i>re</i>	497
Budget Motion. Hindu agriculturist representation among Police Sub-Inspectors ..	804-09
Budget motion. Hindu agriculturists representation among Police Sub-Inspectors, personal explanation of — ..	820
Budget motions involving legislation, point of order <i>re</i> admissibility of ..	472, 478
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas ..	538-89, 541-42
Budget motion. Re-afforestation (including <i>chos</i> areas)	425, 426-27, 482, 484, 485.
Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of	489-44, 445, 465-67, 469-71.
Closure, discussion <i>re</i> reply of Government Member after application of — ..	701, 702
Discussion <i>re</i> convention of President addressing the House in vernacular ..	810
Fazl-i-Husain, The Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of services of ..	794-96
Ministerial responsibility, discussion <i>re</i> ..	694
Unparliamentary expressions in debate, discussion <i>re</i> withdrawal of ..	817, 818
<b>NARAIN SINGH, SARDAR—</b>	
Budget motion. Non-official presidents of district boards	577-79
<b>NARENDRANATH, DIWAN BAHADUR, RAJA—</b>	
Budget. General discussion ..	805-08
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas ..	588
Budget motion. Re-afforestation (including <i>chos</i> areas)	429-30
Resolution <i>re</i> committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists ..	68-9
<b>NATIONAL FLAG—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> controversy over hoisting — on Rawalpindi Municipal buildings ..	254
Question <i>re</i> Indian students of Engineering College, Mughalpur, putting on — on their coats on Independence Day ..	253
<b>NAZUL LANDS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> encroachments upon — in Amritsar by Durgiana temple authorities ..	2
Question <i>re</i> sale of — in Mauza Sheesh Mahal ..	706

## PAGES.

## NEWSPAPERS—

Question re censorship of Congressite — ..	382
Question re dailies, weeklies, etc., — in the province ..	263
Question re names of — supplied to political prisoners ..	279
Question re — and Government advertisements ..	112, 263
Question re supply of — to Ghazi Abdur Rahman, Khwaja	202
Question re supply of — to political prisoners in Mianwali	
jail .. .. .	184
Question re supply of — to prisoners .. .. .	110
Question re supply of vernacular — to Lahore conspiracy	
case prisoners .. .. .	113

## NILI BAR—

Budget motion re distribution of land in — ..	491-94
Question re auction of lands in the — .. .. .	388
Resolution re committee to enquire into grievances of	
colonists of — .. .. .	65-88

## NOMINATION(S)—

— to Railway Advisory Committee .. .. .	826
Question re — to the Punjab Council of Agricultural Re-	
search .. .. .	190

## NON-GRADUATE(S)—

Question re appointment of a — to section A, post in the	
Civil Secretariat .. .. .	775

## NON-OFFICIAL PRESIDENTS—

Budget motion re — of district boards .. .. .	554-581, 609-17.
---	---------------------

## NON-VOTED ITEM—

Budget motion relating to — is out of order .. .. .	762
---	-----

## NOOR MAHARRAM BALOCHES—

Question re grant of lands to — of Jhang District ..	595
--	-----

## NOTICE—

A matter being raised in questions, how far it amounts	
to notice thereof, so that the usual period of notice	
re amendments, etc., could or could not be waived ..	139

## NOTIFIED AREA—

Question re placing of Attock Oil Co. area under a — ..	263
---	-----

## NUR ELAHI, KHAN BAHADUR SHAIKH—

Question re books written by — .. .. .	396
--	-----

## NUR KHAN, KHAN SAHIB RISALDAR BAHADUR—

Resolution re committee to enquire into grievances of	
Nili Bar Colonists .. .. .	77-8
Resolution re school fee concessions .. .. .	99



## NURSES—

Question re appointment of trained — in big villages of the province 699

## NURULLAH, MIAN—

Budget. General discussion 298

Budget motion. Land revenue policy 433-36

Oath of office 1

## O

## OATH OF OFFICE—

Abdul Ghani, Khan Bahadur, Maulvi 1

Ashton, Mr. H. F. 1

Blascheck, Mr. A. D. 108

Chetan Anand, Lala 231

Cowan, Mr. H. M. 291

Dorman, Mr. W. S. 1

Emerson, Mr. H. W. 1

Gill, Colonel, C.A. 1, 177

Macnabb, Mr. A. C. 377

Nurullah, Mian 1

Ogilvie, Mr. C. M. G. 425

Penny, Mr. J. D. 1

Sanderson, Mr. R. 1

Wilson, Mr. W. R. 425

## OFFICERS—

Question re excess of —, in the Forest department 249

## OFFICIALS—

Question re appointment of Muslim —, in Mianwah 259

## OGILVIE, MR. C. M. G.—

Budget motion. Exemption of sword from Arms Act 620-21

Budget motion. Police Sub-Inspectors. Hindu agricultural representation among 772-73

Budget motion. Zamindars, declaration of — as criminal tribes 349-51

Oath of office 425

## OPIUM—

Question re inadequacy of excise staff in Hissar District to cope with prevention of — smuggling from Bikaner 250

## ORPHANAGE—

Question re grant-in-aid to Muslim — and hostel, Mianwah 258

## OUTLETS—

Question re sizes of — of Mongi Minor and Mongi Rajbaha 108

## OWEN ROBERTS, MR.—

Budget. General discussion of 315-18

Fazl-i-Husain, The Honourable, Mian Sir, appreciation of services of — 797-98

## P.

## PACHOTRA—

Question *re* collection of local rates, cesses, etc., by lambardars and payment of — .. .. 190

Question *re* — to lambardars for collection of cattle and *hasiyat* taxes .. .. 587

Question *re* persons drawing — from district boards and standing for elections to membership of same .. 21

## PALAMPUR-SUJANPUR ROAD—

Question *re* condition of — .. .. 709

## PANEL—

— of Chairmen .. .. 101

## PARTAP SINGH, SARDAR—

Budget. General discussion of .. .. 818-21

Budget motion. Illicit distillation and Excise Sub-Inspectors .. .. 494-95

## PATWARIS—

Budget motion. Pay and prospects of Revenue — .. 489-67

Question *re* candidates in tahsil and zilla offices taken from Revenue — .. .. 788

Question *re* members of Revenue — in various grades .. 787

Question *re* promotions of Revenue — to higher offices .. 787

Question *re* provident fund for Revenue — .. .. 785

Question *re* Revenue —, whether a Government servant or village servant .. .. 785

Question *re* share of mutation fees to — .. .. 587

## PATWARIES' UNION—

Question *re* registration of Revenue — .. .. 736

## PAY—

Question *re* increase of — of District Treasurers .. 185

Question *re* — of Forest guards .. .. 280

Question *re* — of public prosecutors in certain districts .. 257

Question *re* source from which — of chaukidars is met .. 378

## PENNY, MR. J. D.—

Budget, general discussion of — .. .. 337-40

Budget motion. Reduction of abiana on cotton crop .. 518-19

Oath of office .. .. 1

Resolution *re* committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar colonists .. .. 85-7

## PENSIONERS—

Question *re* preparation of list of military — .. 600

## PENSIONS—

Demand for grant *re* commuted value of — (Capital expenditure) .. .. 824

Demand for grant *re* superannuation allowances and — .. 824

Demand for supplementary grant — payments of commuted value of .. .. 423

Demand for supplementary grant *re* superannuation allowances and — .. .. 423

## PETITIONS—

Question *re* — for mercy .. .. 133

## PHYSICAL TRAINING—

Question *re* — for women in colleges .. .. 722

## POINT OF ORDER—

Budget motion *re* pay of patwaris, how far it offends the rule against repetition of resolutions .. .. 445-46

— *re* admissibility of budget motions involving legislation .. .. 472-76

— *re* Budget motion to raise discussion on policy of Government, putting to vote of .. .. 486

— *re* criticism or censure of Minister by a budget motion .. .. 630-36

— *re* discussion under General Administration (Reserved) demand, budget motion relating to non-official presidents of district boards .. .. 554-56

See Rulings.

## POLICE—

Budget motion *re* Hindu agriculturist representation among — Sub-Inspectors .. .. 771-74,  
800-21.

Demand for grant *re* — .. .. 771-74,  
800-22.

Demand for supplementary grant *re* — .. .. 401-22

Question *re* Assistant Sub-Inspectors of — recruited from among statutory agriculturists of Jhang District .. .. 596

Question *re* behaviour of — in Batala on Independence Day .. .. 110

Question *re* case against B. Ilam Din, Sub-Inspector of —, village Nowshetra Virkan .. .. 134

Question *re* charges of corruption against gazetted — officers .. .. 400

Question *re* complaint against the officer in charge of Bhiwani City — Station .. .. 606

Question *re* complaint of maltreatment of accused in the Lahore Conspiracy case by — officials .. .. 109

Question *re* Hindu Jats holding the post of Deputy Superintendent or Inspector of Police or retired in either of these capacities .. .. 14

Question *re* interference of — with judicial officers .. .. 243

Question *re* punitive — at Khewra .. .. 787

Question *re* recruitment of Assistant Sub-Inspectors of — .. .. 40

Question *re* stationing of — at ferries .. .. 36

Question *re* statutory Hindu agriculturists in the — service .. .. 198

Question *re* stoppage of corruption in — administration .. .. 195

Question *re* use of lathis by — .. .. 184

Question *re* villages where punitive — posts have been sanctioned .. .. 192

## POLICE INSPECTORS—

Question *re* — serving in the same thanas for more than five years and their transfer. .. .. 129

**POLICE MUHARRIRS—**

- Question re period of stay of — at one thana .. .. 203

**POLICE REGISTER—**

- Question re entry of name of Pandit Sri Ram Sharma of  
Jhajjar in — No. 10 .. .. 776

**POLICE STATION—**

- Question re — at Mehna, Ferozepore District .. 714

**POLITICAL AGITATION—**

- Question re punishments to political prisoners for hunger  
strike or other — .. .. 112

**POLITICAL CONVICTS—**

- Question re — of 1929 .. .. 181

**POLITICAL PRISONERS—**

- Question re newspapers supplied to — .. .. 279  
Question re number of — in Punjab jails and number  
among them not classed special .. .. 398  
Question re — in Mianwah Jail and supply of newspapers  
and special diet .. .. 184  
Question re punishments to — for hunger strike or  
political agitation .. .. 112  
Question re release of — .. .. 882

**POLLING ARRANGEMENTS—**

- Budget motion re — in rural areas .. .. 527-89,  
541-46

**PRESIDENCY TOWN—**

- Question re conversion of Lahore into a — .. 204

**PRESIDENT(S)—**

- Budget motion re non-official — of district boards .. 554-81,  
609-17

- Question re complaint against — of Hansi Municipal  
Committee .. .. 777

- Question re introduction of system of election of — of  
district boards .. .. 393

- Question re non-official — for district boards .. 398

- Question re non-official — for local bodies .. 19

**PRESIDENT, Mr.—**

- Allowances, travelling and halting, should be allowed by  
Government to members of Council a few days before  
beginning of Council so as to enable them to prepare  
for business .. .. 140

- Budget. Time-limit of speeches during general discussion  
of — .. .. 293

- Budget motion re agriculturist representation among  
High Court Judges, admissibility of .. .. 762-66

- Budget motions for criticising or attacking a Minister,  
discussion re admissibility of .. .. 680-86

	PAGES.
<b>PRESIDENT, MR.—CONCLUDED.</b>	
Circular, etc., bearing on resolutions should be circulated along with the printed resolutions ..	187-88
Closure. Discussion <i>re</i> right of reply of Government member and mover after application of — ..	700-02
Demands for grants —, time-limit for discussion of a demand ..	617
Departmental circulars are not supposed to be circulated among members of Council ..	188-89
Discussion <i>re</i> convention of — addressing the House in vernacular ..	810-11
Discussion <i>re</i> discretion of — to allow Ministers' reply after closure has been applied and mover does not reply ..	725-80
Discussion <i>re</i> inaccuracies in Press reports ..	281
Elections to Standing Committees ..	589
Fazl-i-Husain, The Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of the services of — ..	792
Member who has spoken should be in the House to listen to others in reply ..	155-57
Ministerial responsibility, discussion <i>re</i> — ..	634-86
Nominations to Railways Advisory Committee ..	826
Panel of Chairmen ..	101
Point of order <i>re</i> budget motions involving legislation, admissibility of ..	472-78
Point of order <i>re</i> discussion of budget motions relating to non-official presidents of district boards under demand General Administration, Reserved ..	554-56
Standing Committees, discussion <i>re</i> postponement of elections to — ..	499
<b>PRESS—</b>	
See Government Press.	
<b>PRESS REPORTS—</b>	
Discussion <i>re</i> inaccuracies in — ..	280-81
<b>PRIMARY EDUCATION—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> committee to devise means to make — free and compulsory ..	245
See Education.	
<b>PRIMARY SCHOOL BUILDINGS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> — of district boards ..	607
<b>PRIMARY SCHOOLS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> introduction of Punjabi in Persian script as medium of instruction in — ..	606
Question <i>re</i> — in Beit area, Jullundur District ..	44
<b>PRINCIPAL—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> — of the Agricultural College, Lyallpur ..	378

## PRISONERS—

Question re cellular confinement to Lahore conspiracy case — .. .. .	189
Question re diet money for civil — .. .. .	111
Question re handcuffing of special class — .. .. .	111
Question re number of — in Jullundur Jail awaiting trial .. .. .	181
Question re punishments to Lahore conspiracy — by jail or judicial authorities .. .. .	112
Question re supply of newspapers to — .. .. .	110
Question re supply of vernacular newspapers to Lahore conspiracy case — .. .. .	113
Question re threat of hunger strike of — in the Lahore conspiracy case .. .. .	180
See Political Prisoners—	

## PROCESSIONS—

Question re Moharram and Ram Lila—in Kaithal ..	19
---	----

## PRODUCE—

Question re value of — in Government farms ..	194
---	-----

## PROFESSORS—

Question re lectures by — in the Punjab Veterinary College .. .. .	725
Question re — of the Punjab Veterinary College .. .. .	778

## PROHIBITION—

Resolution re total — .. .. .	205-88
-------------------------------	--------

## PROPAGANDA—

Question re — against Congress activities .. .. .	588
---	-----

## PROVIDENT FUND

Question re — for revenue patwaris .. .. .	785
--	-----

## PROVINCIAL CIVIL SERVICE—

Question re communal representation in the — (Executive Branch) .. .. .	108
---	-----

## PROVINCIAL EDUCATIONAL SERVICE—

Question re communal representation in filling of vacancies in the — or special posts carrying Rs. 250 or more ..	64
---	----

## PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE—

Question re forest divisions held by officers of the — ..	986
Question re vacancies in the — .. .. .	248

## PROVINCIAL SERVICES—

Question re — members of which can rise to Imperial Services .. .. .	44
--	----

## PUBLIC HEALTH—

Demand for grant re — (Transferred) .. .. .	822
---	-----

## PUBLIC PROSECUTORS—

Budget motion re Muhammadan representation among —	767-70
Question re pay of — in certain districts .. .. .	257

## PUBLIC SERVICES—

Budget motion re corruption in — .. .. .	623-29
--	--------

**PUNITIVE POLICE—**

Question re — at Khewra .. .. . 787

Question re villages where — posts have been sanctioned .. .. . 192

**PUNJAB EDUCATIONAL SERVICE—**

See Provincial Educational Service.

**PUNJABI—**

Question re introduction of — in Persian script as medium of instruction in primary schools .. .. . 600

**Q.****QUARTERS—**

Question re free—for head mistresses of girls' high schools 389

Question re — for Indian clerks in Lahore .. . 119

Question re — for workers of Government Press, Lahore 784

**QUASI-GOVERNMENT SERVANTS—**

Question re approach of members of Legislative Council by Government servants and — .. . 788

Resolution re committee to enquire into grievances of low-paid — .. . 141-65

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—****ABDUL GHANI, SHAIKH—**

Question re acquisitions of landed property in Ludhiana .. 135

Question re Attock Oil Company .. . 262-63

Question re grant-in-aid to schools —, Muslims' share .. 261

Question re house-and water-rates in Multan .. . 258

Question re Jhelum river, rise of bed-level .. . 262

Question re Montgomery Municipality, resignation of Muslim members of — .. . 248

Question re national flag over municipal buildings at Rawalpindi .. . 254

**AFTAL HAQ, CHAUDHRI—**

Question re Abdul Aziz, Hakim, cancellation of gun license .. . 712

Question re Abdur Rahman, Ghazi, Khwaja, prisoner in Rawalpindi Jail .. . 202

Question re agriculturists in reformatories .. . 194

Question re Arms Act. Exemption of swords from — 116, 202, 245

Question re Arms Act. Exemption of swords from — in Rawalpindi .. . 110

Question re Azan controversy in Zafarwal .. . 244, 252

Question re band attached to high schools .. . 125

Question re Beggary Committee .. . 182

Question re Bihar Police Enquiry Committee, report of the — .. . 118

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED,****AFZAL HAQ, CHAUDHRI—continued.**

Question re bomb accidents .. .. .	380
Question re compulsory primary education .. .. .	245
Question re Congress Exhibition Committee, Government help to the — .. .. .	187
Question re corruption .. .. .	195
Question re corruption among police officers .. .. .	400
Question re corruption in Government departments .. .. .	189, 379
Question re cremation grounds, Hindu, Sheikhpura .. .. .	127
Question re Criminal Procedure Code, sections 107 and 109, in Hoshiarpur and Jullundur .. .. .	181
Question re Delhi bomb outrage, arrests in re — .. .. .	111
Question re diet money for civil prisoners .. .. .	111
Question re dust nuisance in Lahore .. .. .	132
Question re electoral wards, revision of — .. .. .	125
Question re Engineering College, Mughalpura, students' strike in — .. .. .	253
Question re Extra Assistant Commissioner's, rolls for the post of — .. .. .	129
Question re Ghoripal zamindars .. .. .	379
Question re Government Farm, produce in .. .. .	194
Question re handcuffing special class prisoners .. .. .	111
Question re Honorary Magistrate of Amritsar, proceedings against — .. .. .	791
Question re illegal gratification .. .. .	185
Question re Independence Day celebration in Batala, behaviour of police .. .. .	110
Question re jails, executions in — .. .. .	195
Question re Jails Enquiry Committee, recommendations of — .. .. .	112
Question re Jathas of ex-military men .. .. .	393
Question re ladies travelling alone in trains, safety of .. .. .	128
Question re Lahore conspiracy case, appointment of interpreters .. .. .	108
Question re Lahore conspiracy case, conduct of the Special Magistrate towards Lala Duni Chand .. .. .	180
Question re Lahore conspiracy case, interviews with accused .. .. .	109
Question re Lahore conspiracy case, maltreatment by jail and police officials .. .. .	109
Question re Lahore conspiracy case prisoners, supply of vernacular newspapers to .. .. .	113
Question re Lahore conspiracy case prisoners .. .. .	112, 189
Question re Lahore conspiracy case prisoners and hunger-strike .. .. .	180
Question re lathis, indiscreet use of, by police .. .. .	184



## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.

AFZAL HAQ, CHAUDHRI—continued.

Question re MacLagan Engineering College, Muslim representation .. .. .	723
Question re MacLagan Engineering College, recreation fee .. .. .	723
Question re MacLagan Engineering College, staff of the .. .. .	723
Question re Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme .. .. .	8-10
Question re motor accident near Verka Railway Phatak .. .. .	17
Question re motor lorries plying in Sheikhpura District .. .. .	127
Question re motor lorries plying in Sheikhpura and Gujranwala Districts .. .. .	127
Question re motor vehicles, licenses for plying for hire .. .. .	128
Question re motor vehicles, overloading of .. .. .	105
Question re Municipal Commissioners and Independence Day celebration .. .. .	243
Question re Municipal Committee, Multan .. .. .	385
Question re municipal filth depot, Sheikhpura .. .. .	127
Question re nazul lands, Amritsar .. .. .	2
Question re newspapers and Government advertisements .. .. .	112, 263
Question re newspapers, supply of, to prisoners .. .. .	110
Question re petitions for mercy .. .. .	183
Question re Police Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors .. .. .	129
Question re police interference with judicial officers .. .. .	243
Question re political convicts .. .. .	184
Question re political prisoners in Mianwali Jail .. .. .	181
Question re political prisoners, newspapers supplied to .. .. .	279
Question re prisoners in Jullundur Jail .. .. .	181
Question re proscription of books exciting communal hatred .. .. .	279
Question re punitive police in villages .. .. .	192
Question re Punjabi exiles .. .. .	208
Question re Sardar Randhir Singh, prosecution under section 380, Indian Penal Code .. .. .	181
Question re Rattan Singh bomb case .. .. .	252
Question re Read, Mr., of the Hissar Cattle Farm .. .. .	779
Question re road, metalling of katcha, between Narowal and Zafarwal .. .. .	128
Question re satta cases .. .. .	194
Question re scouts rally in Lahore .. .. .	183
Question re Secretariat, non-graduate senior clerk in the .. .. .	775
Question re superintendents of Deputy Commissioners' offices .. .. .	105
Question re Superintendent of Deputy Commissioner's office, Gurdaspur .. .. .	724
Question re Surgeons, Assistant and Sub-Assistant, in Simla .. .. .	126
Question re Veterinary College, Punjab .. .. .	773
Question re Veterinary College, Punjab, external examiners .. .. .	724

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.

## AFZAL HAQ, CHAUDHRI—concluded.

Question re Veterinary College, Punjab, professors in ..	725
Question re Veterinary Department, qualifications of Surgeons in the .. .. .	778
Question re water scarcity in Hoshiarpur and Jullundur Districts .. .. .	195
Question re Zul Kernain, Sub-Inspector of Police ..	125

## AHMAD YAR KHAN, DAULTANA, MIAN—

Question re acreage rate on the Lower Chenab Canal ..	776
Question re afforestation in Sutlej Valley Colony ..	779
Question re Darakhtpal grant in Lower Bari Doab Canal .. .. .	587
Question re Honorary Magistrates, etc., and Muslim representation .. .. .	708
Question re Honorary Magistrates, Sheikhpura District ..	708
Question re jungle, wood, rates on, in Sutlej Valley Project .. .. .	776
Question re Kamins of Kheeka, etc. .. .. .	645
Question re Khadir Canal .. .. .	642
Question re allotments for local grants in the Kheeka, etc., projects .. .. .	645
Question re local rates in Multan District .. .. .	18-19
Question re Lower Bari Doab Canal and Lower Chenab Canal .. .. .	779
Question re Mailsi Canal .. .. .	13
Question re Sutlej Valley Canal, value of wood charged to temporary lease-holders in .. .. .	776

## AKBAR ALI, PIR—

Question re Ferozepore District Board .. .. .	602
Question re Ferozepore District Board, maintenance of roads .. .. .	647
Question re Ferozepore Municipal Committee, defalcations .. .. .	654
Question re Ferozepore Municipal Committee, employees over 55 years of age .. .. .	654
Question re Ferozepore Municipal Committee, retrenchment in staff .. .. .	647
Question re Ferozepore Municipal Officer of Health, complaint against the .. .. .	121
Question re Kot Kapura-Fazilka branch line .. .. .	200
Question re Mamdot Estate .. .. .	601
Question re Muslim representation in Ferozepore District Board .. .. .	601
Question re railway line between Kot Kapura and Jalalabad via Muktsar .. .. .	200
Question re Tahsildar, Muktsar .. .. .	200

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED—****BALBIR SINGH, RAO BAHADUR CAPTAIN RAO—**

- Question re English classes in middle schools in Gurgaon District .. .. . 40

**BALDEV SINGH, CHAUDHRI—**

- Question re landlords and tenants in Chhuchakwas, disputes between .. .. . 601

- Question re Municipal Commissioners and Independence Day .. .. . 600

**CHETAN ANAND, LALA—**

- Question re Multan Municipality, extension of the term of members .. .. . 705

- Question re water-and house-tax in Multan Municipality .. 708-04,785

- Question re water-and house-tax in Multan Municipality, conference of leading citizens .. .. . 704

**CHHOTU RAM, RAI SAHIB CHAUDHRI—**

- Question re Bhakra Dam Project .. .. . 242

- Question re Civil Assistant Surgeons, selection of .. .. . 588

- Question re communal representation among sub-judges .. .. . 197

- Question re communal representation among zilladars .. .. . 198

- Question re communal representation among zilladars of Western Jumna Canal Circle .. .. . 199

- Question re communal representation in clerical branch of Judicial Department .. .. . 197

- Question re communal representation in services, list re .. .. . 115

- Question re Co-operative Societies, Inspectors of .. .. . 278

- Question re half tuition fees in Government secondary schools .. .. . 277-78

- Question re high schools in Rohtak .. .. . 11

- Question re Hindu Jats in Police Department .. .. . 14

- Question re Inspector of Schools, Rohtak .. .. . 18

- Question re Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme .. .. . 13

- Question re Police Assistant Sub-Inspectors .. .. . 40-42

- Question re prices of unginned cotton and wheat .. .. . 26

- Question re rural representation on the Punjab University .. .. . 241

- Question re statutory agriculturists, employment of .. .. . 241

- Question re statutory agriculturists as Naib-Tahsildars .. .. . 242

- Question re statutory agriculturists candidates at Sub-Judges' examinations .. .. . 114

- Question re statutory agriculturist candidates for Sub-Judges' examinations .. .. . 196

- Question re statutory Hindu agriculturists among zilladars .. .. . 115

- Question re statutory Hindu agriculturists in police service .. .. . 198

- Question re Sub-Judges' candidates .. .. . 12

- Question re Sub-Judges' competitive examination .. .. . 12

- Question re Sub-Judges' examination .. .. . 114

- Question re selection for Sub-Judges .. .. . 195

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.****CHHOTU RAM, RAI SAHIB CHAUDHRI—concluded.**

Question re vernacular middle schools .. ..	11
Question re war scholarships .. ..	240
Question re zilladars .. ..	278

**DAULAT RAM, KALIA, RAI BAHADUR PANDIT—**

Question re Kasur Municipal Committee .. ..	20
---	----

**DHANPAT RAI, RAI BAHADUR LALA—**

Question re machinery for Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme	106
---	-----

**DIN MUHAMMAD, MR.—**

Question re Co-operative Department, officers in the ..	45-68
Question re Gujranwala Co-operative Bank .. ..	782
Question re 'Id' festival in jails .. ..	788
Question re Labhu Ram, Rai Sahib, Deputy Commissioner	781-82
Question re land sold in new colonies .. ..	782-88
Question re text-books written by Boards of Studies ..	592
Question re text-books written by Education Department officers .. ..	589-91

**DULI CHAND, CHAUDHRI—**

Question re contingencies, boarding-house and school ..	1
Question re grants-in-aid to aided high schools, Ambala Division .. ..	29-30
Question re grants-in-aid in Ambala Division .. ..	18
Question re high schools in Ambala Division .. ..	18
Question re high schools of backward communities ..	15-16
Question re Pachotra and district board members ..	21

**FAIZ MUHAMMAD, SHAIKH—**

Question re boat bridge material stored at Ghazighat ..	25-26
Question re Muslim representation in Education Department .. ..	21-23

**FAZL ALI, KHAN BAHADUR CHAUDHRI—**

Question re local boards, non-official presidents ..	19-20
--	-------

**FIROZ-UD-DIN, KHAN, RANA—**

Question re Agricultural College, Lyallpur, death of a student .. ..	597
Question re Agricultural Research Council, Punjab, nomination to the .. ..	190
Question re Bhakra Dam Scheme .. ..	191
Question re Lahore, conversion of, into a presidency town .. ..	204
Question re Mongi Minor and Mongi Rajbaha .. ..	107-08
Question re police muharrirs .. ..	203
Question re Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Gurdaspur .. ..	203
Question re Warabandi for Chak No. 633 .. ..	192

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.

GANGA RAM, RAI BAHADUR LALA—

Question re compulsory education in Ambala ..	80-85
Question re education, primary and secondary, in Ambala District ..	85
Question re education in Rupar and Kharar tahsils ..	87-40

GHANI, MR. M. A.—

Question re Allah Rakha, Forest Department, Simla ..	786
Question re Anjuman Ara Begum, high school scholarship ..	784-85
Question re Chandar Kishor, ex-civil prisoner ..	775, 788
Question re compositors in Lahore Government Press, memorials from ..	789
Question re non-Christian students, Kinnaird High School for Girls ..	790
Question re District Inspectresses of Schools, list of ..	789
Question re Government and quasi-Government servants ..	788
Question re Government Press, Lahore, "no work allowance" in ..	788
Question re grant-in-aid to Kinnaird High School for Girls ..	789
Question re haisiat tax, Khewra Salt Mines ..	787
Question re haisiat tax in district boards and municipal committees ..	790
Question re provident fund for revenue patwaris ..	785
Question re punitive police at Khewra ..	787
Question re quarters for employees in Government Press, Lahore ..	784
Question re revenue patwaris ..	785, 787-88
Question re Revenue Patwaris' Union, Punjab ..	786
Question re Umar Bakhsh, Miss, Inspectress of Schools ..	789
Question re Wakf Act ..	2

GOPAL DAS, LALA—

Question re Khan Bahadur Shaikh Nur Elahi's literary works ..	396
---	-----

HIRA SINGH, NARLI, SARDAR—

Question re agricultural produce, prices of ..	381
Question re Congress activities, propaganda against ..	383
Question re Congressite papers, censorship of ..	382
Question re Central Co-operative Banks and Unions, elections to ..	348
Question re crops, failure of, and fall of prices ..	399
Question re Crown waste lands, irrigation of ..	381
Question re cycling on inspection roads ..	381
Question re district boards, non-official presidents of ..	393
Question re fee concessions ..	343
Question re hailstorms ..	383

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.

## HIRA SINGH, NARLI, SARDAR—concluded.

Question re military pensioners, list of .. ..	600
Question re Nili Bar, auction of lands in the .. ..	388
Question re political prisoners .. ..	393
Question re political prisoners release of .. ..	382
Question re Punjabi, introduction of in Persian script .. ..	600
Question re Round Table Conference .. ..	382
Question re trained nurses, appointment of—in big villages .. ..	599
Question re Upper Bari Doab Canal, irrigation under .. ..	387
Question re Village Patrol Act in Lahore District .. ..	644
Question re zaildars and sufedposhes .. ..	381

## JOTI PARSHAD, LALA—

Question re Anglo-Vernacular Middle School, District Board Deragopipur .. ..	588
Question re arms licenses in Ambala District .. ..	258
Question re Bar Room, Hissar .. ..	14
Question re Bhakra Dam Scheme .. ..	185
Question re Bhiwani police officer .. ..	606
Question re Brayne, Mr. (Deputy Commissioner) .. ..	14
Question re cattle-lifting and thefts in Karnal District .. ..	585
Question re Co-operative Credit Society of Chak No. 118-G.B. .. ..	275-76
Question re corruption among subordinate judicial establishment .. ..	586
Question re criminal appeals in some sessions courts .. ..	257
Question re depressed classes .. ..	1
Question re district treasurers, pay of .. ..	185
Question re excise staff, Hissar District .. ..	250
Question re Famine Code (Punjab), wages .. ..	277
Question re Famine Relief in Hissar District .. ..	240, 276-77
Question re Sardar Gajjan Singh .. ..	605
Question re Gajjan Singh, Sufedposh .. ..	791
Question re grants-in-aid to private schools .. ..	204
Question re grazing, area of land reserved for, in Hissar .. ..	276
Question re haisiyat tax in Hissar District .. ..	186
Question re Hansi Municipal Committee, complaint against the President .. ..	777
Question re Honorary Magistrates .. ..	792
Question re impounding of cattle, income from .. ..	185
Question re Independence Day celebration .. ..	584
Question re Jails Enquiry Committee, report of the .. ..	186
Question re kankar used on the Delhi-Montgomery Road .. ..	255
Question re landlords and tenants of Chhuchakwas .. ..	605
Question re litigants in law courts .. ..	586

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED—****JOTI PARSHAD, LALA—concluded.**

Question re matriculation results and reduction of grants..	254
Question re metalled roads .. .. .	255
Question re motor accidents .. .. .	257
Question re Mr. Muhammad Said, Magistrate.. .. .	585
Question re Muharram procession, Kaithal .. .. .	19
Question re prosecution of certain constables and head constables .. .. .	240
Question re road from Hansi to Bhiwani .. .. .	257
Question re Siri Ram, Sharma Pandit of Jhajjar .. .. .	776

**KESHO RAM, SEKHRI, LALA—**

Questions re Girls' High School, Amritsar .. .. .	389-91
Question re head mistresses of Girls' high schools .. .. .	389
Question re schools and colleges for girls .. .. .	388
Question re stamps, purchase of .. .. .	36
Question re Sub-Registrar's office, posting of clerks in .. .. .	396
Question re Sub-Registrars, commission allowed to .. .. .	395-96
Question re Sub-Registrars, holidays for .. .. .	385
Question re Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Amritsar .. .. .	124

**LABH SINGH, MR.—**

Question re Hydro-Electric Branch, Indian engineers in — .. .. .	394
Question re Kangra Valley Railway .. .. .	603
Question re McLeod, Mr., Superintending Engineer .. .. .	894-95
Question re Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme .. .. .	895, 602
Question re Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme, Indian Assistant Engineers in .. .. .	384
Question re Mandi Hydro-Electric Scheme and Kangra Valley Railway .. .. .	384
Question re Shanan Generating Station .. .. .	383
Question re Uhl river, discharge in the .. .. .	394

**MAYA DAS, MR. E.—**

Question re aerated water-sellers on the Kangra Valley Railway.. .. .	49
Question re Agricultural College, Lyallpur, shortage of water-supply to .. .. .	664
Question re Agricultural College, Lyallpur, water-supply to boarding-house of .. .. .	646
Question re Bhakra Dam, irrigation under .. .. .	714
Question re Bhakra Dam, site of .. .. .	712

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.

## MAYA DAS, MR. E.—CONCLUDED.

Question re Bikaner Canal .. .. .	717
Question re Bikaner Canal, accumulation of water near ..	717
Question re Bikaner Canal, soundings of water-table near ..	717
Question re Bikaner Canal embankment, collection of water near the .. .. .	716
Question re bullock cart traffic on the Kalka-Simla Road ..	25
Question re canal zilladars .. .. .	718
Question re canals irrigating areas in British territory ..	718
Question re canals irrigating areas in Native States ..	718
Question re Child Marriage (Restraint) Act .. .. .	721
Question re Dipalpur and Eastern Canals .. .. .	609
Question re district boards and primary school buildings .. .. .	607
Question re education grant .. .. .	609
Question re non-graduate Extra Assistant Commissioners ..	607
Question re ferries, stationing of police constables at ..	36-37
Question re Grand Trunk Road .. .. .	722
Question re high schools for girls .. .. .	718
Question re Indian Christians in Government departments .. .. .	24
Question re licenses for supply of electrical energy ..	718
Question re locusts, destruction of .. .. .	718
Question re model town at Palampur .. .. .	24-25
Question re motor accidents .. .. .	86
Question re motor vehicles, tax for use of stands ..	718
Question re motor vehicles and district boards roads ..	714
Question re municipalities and temperance propaganda ..	722
Question re physical training for women in colleges ..	722
Question re police station at Mehna, Ferozepore ..	714
Question re rural dispensaries, inspection of .. .. .	25
Question re Sirhind Canal .. .. .	608
Question re storm water drain in Ferozepore tahsil ..	716
Question re voters' lists, preparation of .. .. .	27-29
Question re water stand post at Pathankot Railway Station .. .. .	48

## MEHAR CHAND, PANDIT—

Question re depressed classes and Government-owned wells .. .. .	15
Question re depressed class students in Government high schools .. .. .	48
Question re Hargo Lal Girls' High School .. .. .	24

## MOHAN LAL, RAI BAHADUR LALA—

Question re Chet Chaudash Cattle Fair .. .. .	201
Question re glass industry .. .. .	177-78



**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.****MOHAN LAL, RAI BAHADUR LALA—concluded.**

Question re glass industry, encouragement of ..	117, 201
Question re glass manufacture, training in ..	178
Question re Hindu Sabha, Ambala, memorial from, re preponderance of Muhammadan officers ..	586
Question re Industrial Development Board, constitution of ..	178
Question re Jagadhri Town Hall ..	179
Question re Jagat Ram Pandit of Hoshiarpur District ..	598
Question re Land Alienation Act, area alienated under ..	599
Question re Maulvi Alla Din, insolvency of ..	202
Question re Provincial and Imperial Services ..	44-45
Question re Sanskrit text of Vatsayana's Kama Sūtras ..	583

**MOHINDAR SINGH, SARDAR—**

Question re irrigation in Ludhiana ..	655
Question re locust pest in Ludhiana ..	654
Question re lorries, prohibition of, on certain roads at night ..	27
Question re Ludhiana District Board, vice-presidents of ..	593

**MUBARIK ALI SHAH, SAYAD—**

Question re Assistant and Sub-Assistant Surgeons in Government service ..	710
Question re Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police in Jhang ..	596
Question re Civil Surgeon, Jhang District ..	596
Question re Civil Surgeons and Medical Officers ..	710
Question re Co-operative Societies, Inspectors of ..	711
Question re Extra Assistant Commissioners, Jhang, rolls of ..	723
Question re Ghoripals of Lower Jhelum Canal Colony ..	594
Question re lands, distribution of, to landed gentry ..	595
Question re locusts in Jhang District ..	596
Question re Noor Moharram and Hakala-Hayata, Baloches ..	595
Question re road between Lyallpur, Bhakkar and Jhang ..	596
Question re roads in Jhang District ..	711
Question re waste lands in Jhang ..	710
Question re zamindars of Jhang District ..	594

**MUHAMMAD ABDUL RAHMAN KHAN, CHAUDHRI—**

Question re committees and commissions, expenses of Government ..	49-44
Question re primary schools in Beit area, Jullundur District ..	44

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.****MUHAMMAD HAYAT QURESHI, KHAN BAHADUR, MIAN—**

Question re Intermediate College, Shahpur .. ..	642
Question re tuition fee, exemptions .. ..	641
Question re waste lands in Shahpur Colony .. ..	609

**MUHAMMAD HUSAIN, SAYAD—**

Question re waste land in Jhang .. ..	260
---------------------------------------	-----

**MUHAMMAD IQBAL, DR. SIR—**

Question re "Azan" disability in villages .. ..	248
Question re Hydro-Electric Branch, Apprentice Engineers .. ..	390
Question re Hydro-Electric Branch, communal representation in .. ..	246
Question re Hydro-Electric Establishment charges .. ..	247

**MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN, KHAN BAHADUR NAWAB—**

Question re Manka Canal .. ..	29
-------------------------------	----

**MUHAMMAD SAIFULLAH KHAN, KHAN BAHADUR KHAN—**

Question re ferry tolls on motor vehicles .. ..	258
Question re Frontier Crimes Regulations, exemption of Hindus of Mianwali from operation of .. ..	598
Question re grant-in-aid to the Muslim Orphanage at Mianwali .. ..	258
Question re Muslim officials in Mianwali .. ..	259

**NARENDRA NATH, DIWAN BAHADUR RAJA—**

Question re local bodies, separate electorates for Muslims, date of institution .. ..	250
Question re Upper Chenab Canal, levy of tax .. ..	250

**NUR KHAN, KHAN SAHIB RISALDAR BAHADUR—**

Question re Lady Health Visitors .. ..	597
--	-----

**OWEN ROBERTS, MR.—**

Question re building plans on the Mall, procedure for resubmission of .. ..	134
Question re Lahore Improvement Committee, composition of the .. ..	133

**PARTAP SINGH, SARDAR—**

Question re Agha Yusuf Ali of the Punjab Agricultural Service .. ..	121
Question re Agricultural College, Punjab, percentage of Sikhs admitted to the .. ..	104
Question re clerical staff in the Public Works Department (Buildings and Roads Branch) .. ..	118
Question re vacancies in the clerical staff of the Director of Industries office .. ..	120
Question re Co-operative Central Banks, non-Muslim representation in .. ..	604
Question re Co-operative Credit Societies, representation of Sikhs .. ..	604

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONTINUED.

PARTAP SINGH, SANDAR—*concluded.*

Question re Co-operative Department, communal representation .. ..	608
Question re Extra Assistant Commissioners .. ..	117
Question re high schools, Jullundur District .. ..	644
Question re Ilam Din, B., Sub-Inspector of Police .. ..	184
Question re Muhammad Hasan, Raja, of the Punjab Agricultural Service .. ..	122-24
Question re Provincial Civil Service (Executive) .. ..	108
Question re quarters for Indian clerks .. ..	119
Question re stenographers in the Financial Commissioners' office .. ..	104
Question re Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Amritsar .. ..	119

## RAM SINGH, CHAUDHRI—

Question re construction of a bund at Dholbaha .. ..	391
Question re construction of a bund over the Beas at Padsa .. ..	391
Question re chankidars and shamilat lands .. ..	878
Question re communal representation among Tahsildars .. ..	892
Question re communal representation in Co-operative Societies .. ..	261
Question re communal representation in Lahore Co-operative Union .. ..	261
Question re compensation for land eroded by the Chakki .. ..	187
Question re District Board School, Nakodar .. ..	192
Question re Diut Siddha's shrine .. ..	607
Question re drinking water supply in Beit Garshankar .. ..	275
Question re flood-affected lands in Khairan and Andaura Taluqs .. ..	891
Question re hailstorms in Kangra District .. ..	16-17
Question re Indaura, telegraph office for .. ..	604
Question re Kangra Valley Railway line .. ..	186
Question re land revenue, irregularities in recovery .. ..	584
Question re local rates, collection of, by lambardars .. ..	190, 587
Question re motor vehicles on hire in Tahsil Hamirpur .. ..	709
Question re motor vehicles, plying of, in Kangra District .. ..	105
Question re patwaris' share of mutation fees .. ..	587
Question re shikar licenses .. ..	377
Question re income from shamilat forests, Kangra District .. ..	710
Question re Sub-Judge's court at Hamirpur .. ..	383
Question re Tikka Tilloo Forest .. ..	709
Question re zaildars of Saraj, increase in remuneration of .. ..	106

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS—CONCLUDED—****UJJAL SINGH, SARDAR SAHIB SARDAR—**

Question re firewood, cost of, at Chhanga Manga Railway Station .. .. .	387
Question re Forest Department .. .. .	249, 387
Question re Forest Department, headquarters of Upper Bashahr Division .. .. .	249
Question re forest guards .. .. .	280
Question re Forest Service, Imperial and Provincial .. .. .	248, 386
Question re grant-in-aid rules .. .. .	239
Question re grants-in-aid to aided schools .. .. .	239
Question re half-remissions in Lower Bari Doab Canal Colony .. .. .	191
Question re half-remissions on Lower Jhelum and Chenab Canals .. .. .	191
Question re recognition of schools .. .. .	12
Question re Working Plans Circle in the Forest Department .. .. .	249

**YASIN KHAN, CHAUDHRI—**

Question re communal representation among Assistant District Inspectors of Schools, Ambala Division .. .. .	63-64
Question re Provincial Educational Service, filling up of vacancies in .. .. .	64

**ZAFRULLA KHAN, CHAUDHRI—**

Question re Agricultural College, Lyallpur, death of a student .. .. .	377
Question re Agricultural College, Lyallpur, expulsions .. .. .	392
Question re Agricultural College, Principal of .. .. .	378
Question re Excise Inspectors .. .. .	707, 712
Question re Excise Sub-Inspectors in the special grade .. .. .	712
Question re Excise Sub-Inspectors, promotion to special grade .. .. .	707
Question re excise licensees in Lahore, etc., districts .. .. .	707
Question re nazul land, sale of, in Mauza Sheesh Mahal .. .. .	706
Question re Suleimanke Canal, breaches in .. .. .	706
Question re water-lifting branch, Agricultural Department .. .. .	392

**QUOTATIONS—**

Privilege of members to make — from uncorrected speeches of members in Council .. .. .	743
--	-----

**R.****RAILWAY—**

Question re aerated water-sellers on the Kangra Valley — .. .. .	43
Question re conversion of Kot Kapura-Fazilka — into broad gauge .. .. .	200

	PAGES.
<b>RAILWAY—CONCLUDED—</b>	
Question re line between Kot Kapura and Jalalabad via Muksar .. .. .	200
Question re water stand post at Pathankot on the Kangra Valley Railway platform .. .. .	43
See Kangra Valley Railway	
<b>RAILWAY ADVISORY COMMITTEE—</b>	
Nominations to — .. .. .	826
<b>RAJBAHAS—</b>	
Budget motion re remodelling of —, Kohali and Jama Rai .. .. .	499-502
<b>RAM DIAL—</b>	
Question re —, Superintendent, Deputy Commissioner's office, Gurdaspur .. .. .	724
<b>RAMLILA—</b>	
Question re — procession, Kaithal .. .. .	19
<b>RAM SINGH, CHAUDHRI—</b>	
Budget motion. Cattle tax in Kangra District .. .. .	492
Budget motion. Distribution of land in Nili Bar .. .. .	491
Budget motion. Police Sub-Inspectors, Hindu agriculturists, representation among .. .. .	774, 800-02
Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. .. .	529-30
Resolution re income from resin in shamilat forests .. .. .	165-67
<b>RANDHIR SINGH, SARDAR—</b>	
Question re prosecution of — under section 180, Indian Penal Code .. .. .	181
<b>RATES—</b>	
Question re — for junglewood on the Sutlej Valley Project from temporary lease-holders .. .. .	776
See Acreage Rates.	
See Local Rates.	
<b>RATTAN SINGH BOMB CASE—</b>	
Question re prosecutions in connection with — .. .. .	252
<b>READ, Mr.—</b>	
Question re — of the Hissar Government Cattle Farm .. .. .	778
<b>RECREATION FEE—</b>	
Question re — in the MacLagan Engineering College .. .. .	723
<b>RECRUITMENT—</b>	
Question re — of Assistant Sub-Inspectors .. .. .	40
<b>REFORMATORIES—</b>	
Question re agriculturists confined in — .. .. .	194
<b>REFUNDS—</b>	
Demand for grant re — (Reserved) .. .. .	825
Demand for grant re — (Transferred) .. .. .	825
Demand for supplementary grant re — (Reserved) .. .. .	423
Demand for supplementary grant re — (Transferred) .. .. .	423
<b>REGISTRATION—</b>	
Demand for grant re — .. .. .	496

## PAGES.

<b>REGISTRATION (VALIDATING) BILL, THE PUNJAB—</b>	
Motion for taking into consideration .. ..	424
Discussed .. ..	424
Passed into law .. ..	424
<b>REGULATIONS—</b>	
Question re exemption of Hindus of Mianwali from the Frontier Crimes — .. ..	598
<b>REMISSION(S)—</b>	
Question re half — in Lower Bari Doab Canal Colony ..	191
<b>RE-MODELLING—</b>	
Budget motion re — of rajbahas Kohali and Jama Rai ..	499-502
<b>REMUNERATION—</b>	
Question re increase in — of zaildars of Saraj ..	106
<b>REPLY, RIGHT OF—</b>	
Discussion re — of Minister when mover of motion has not spoken after closure has been applied .. ..	725-90
Mover's — is in the discretion of the Chair when debate closes on a closure motion .. ..	164
<b>REPORT(S)—</b>	
Discussion re inaccuracies in Press — .. ..	230-81
Question re action on the — of the Jails Enquiry Committee .. ..	186
Question re — of the Bihar Police Enquiry Committee ..	113
Question re — of the Beggary Committee .. ..	182
Question re — of stoppage of corruption in police and district administrations .. ..	195
<b>RESIN—</b>	
Resolution re income from — in <i>Shamilat</i> forests ..	165-75
<b>RESOLUTIONS—</b>	
Re committee to enquire into grievance of low-paid Government servants .. ..	141-65
Re committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists .. ..	65-88
Re income from the resin in <i>Shamilat</i> forests .. ..	165-75
Re school fee concessions .. ..	95-101, 135-40
Re stadium at Lahore .. ..	89-95
Re total prohibition .. ..	205-38
<b>RETRENCHMENT—</b>	
Question re — of staff by municipal committee, Ferozepur. .. ..	647
<b>REVENUE PATWARIS—</b>	
Budget motion. Pay and prospects of — .. ..	439-67
Question re candidates for tahsil and zilla offices taken from — .. ..	788
Question re number of — in various grades .. ..	787
Question re promotion of — to higher offices .. ..	787
Question re provident fund for — .. ..	785
Question re —, whether a Government servant or village servant .. ..	785

## REVENUE PATWARIS' UNION—

- Question re registration of — .. .. 786

## ROAD(S)—

- Question re cart traffic on the Kalka-Simla — .. 25  
 Question re condition of Palampur-Sujanpur — .. 709  
 Question re cycling on inspection — along the banks of  
 Canals .. .. 381  
 Question re kind of Kankar used on the Hissar-Hansi  
 section of Delhi-Montgomery, — and Hissar-Fateh-  
 abad section .. .. 255  
 Question re maintenance by district board of — between  
 Ferozepore city Mall Road and Ferozepore Canton-  
 ment Mall Road .. .. 647  
 Question re metalling of — between Lyallpur and Bhak-  
 har .. .. 596  
 Question re metalling of — between Lyallpur and Jhang .. 596  
 Question re metalling of katcha — between Narowal and  
 Zafarwal .. .. 128  
 Question re mileage of metalled — in the province .. 255  
 Question re prohibition against running of lorries at nights  
 on certain — .. .. 27  
 Question re provision of a *pacca* — between Hansi and  
 Bhiwani .. .. 257  
 Question re regulation of speed of motor vehicles plying  
 for hire on district board — .. .. 714  
 Question re — in the Jhang District .. .. 711  
 Question re — to Shrine Dint Siddha, in Hamirpur .. 607  
 Question re traffic during repairs to Grand Trunk — .. 722

## ROLLS—

- Question re — for posts of Extra Assistant Commis-  
 sioners .. .. 129  
 Question re — for posts of Extra Assistant Commis-  
 sioners sent by Deputy Commissioner, Jhang .. 723

## ROUND TABLE CONFERENCE—

- Question re representatives for the — .. .. 382

## RULES—

- Question re — regarding method of calculating grant-in-  
 aid .. .. 289

## BULING(S)—

- Budget, motions on, relating to non-voted item is out  
 of order .. .. 762  
 Budget motions, one of the ways in which a member may  
 attack or criticise a Minister .. .. 693-84  
 Budget motion relating to two Heads of Demands can be  
 discussed under either — .. .. 556

## RULING(S)—CONTINUED—

Budget motions should relate to objects relevant to the grant or item under consideration. (A token cut in the reduction of officers of the High Court with the object of urging appointment of agriculturists as High Court Judges is out of order) .. ..	765
A budget motion with a specific suggestion (re insufficiency of pay of patwaris) is not debarred by a resolution for the appointment of a committee to go into the same question, discussed in the same year .. ..	446
Budget motions to raise discussion on policy of Government will also be put to the vote of the House .. ..	486
Budget motions. Note indicating the object of token cuts is not part of the motion so as to determine the demand to which it relates .. ..	556
Budget motion. On a token reduction motion under a demand, everything that is relevant to the demand can be discussed .. ..	804
Debate. Member who has made his remarks should be in the House when those remarks are replied to .. ..	156
Debate. Member may correct mis-statement or misquotation as soon as it is made but may clear misunderstanding or misinterpretation by a personal explanation at once or subsequently .. ..	814
Debate. Reflections on any member of the House not allowed .. ..	809
Debate. Unparliamentary expressions or personal reflections must be objected to then and there, other unparliamentary expressions or personal reflections by way of reply are not allowed .. ..	816, 817
Demands for grants. A day, for purposes of discussions of a demand for grant, is one of four hours .. ..	617
Demands for grants. Services not included in a — should not be discussed under it .. ..	624
Division should be claimed before President declares his opinion on collecting Ayes and Noes .. ..	623
Questions. No question put to a member need be answered unless it is asked through the Chair .. ..	68
Reply, right of. Mover of a motion may be allowed to reply if he has the right, after application of closure .. ..	701
Reply, right of. When a debate closes on a closure motion, it is within the discretion of the Chair to allow mover the right of reply .. ..	164
Unparliamentary expressions. "Boss" — withdrawn .. ..	852
Unparliamentary expressions. "Filthy language" — withdrawn .. ..	814
Unparliamentary expressions. Charge that a Hindu Member sits on Muhammadan benches and sides with them — withdrawn .. ..	818



**RULING(S)—CONCLUDED—**

Unparliamentary expressions. Charge that some agriculturist members have sided with "bania" group in the House — withdrawn .. .. .	818
Unparliamentary expressions. Statement that an honourable member "poses" as a nationalist — withdrawn .. .. .	856

**RURAL AREAS—**

Budget motion re polling arrangements in .. .. .	527-89, 541-46
--	----------------

**S.****SALE, MR. S. L.—**

Budget motion. Public Prosecutors, Muhammadan representation among .. .. .	767-68
--	--------

**SANDERSON, MR. R.—**

Budget. General discussion of .. .. .	866-67
Oath of office .. .. .	1

**SANITATION—**

Question re allowance to Secretary, Municipal Committee, Ferozepore, for supervision of .. .. .	654
---	-----

**SARWAR, MR. S. M.—**

Question re qualifications of —, of the Punjab Civil Veterinary Department .. .. .	778
--	-----

**SATTA CASES—**

Question re number of — challaned .. .. .	194
---	-----

**SCHOLARSHIPS—**

Question re award of war — .. .. .	240
Question re High School, — for Anjuman Ara Begum .. .. .	784

**SCHOOL(S)—**

Question re details of grant-in-aid to aided — .. .. .	239
Question re grant-in-aid to —, share for Muslims .. .. .	261
Question re primary — in Beit area, Jullundur District .. .. .	44
Question re provincialisation of District Board, —, Nakodar .. .. .	192
Question re recognition of — .. .. .	12
Question re reduction of grants-in-aid to certain private — .. .. .	204
Question re results of Matriculation examination in certain — and reduction of grants .. .. .	254
Question re scale of — and boarding house contingencies .. .. .	1
Question re visit of —, by District Inspectors of Schools, Rohtak .. .. .	18

See High Schools.

See Middle Schools.

See Primary Schools.

See Secondary Schools.

## SCHOOL BOARD OF STUDIES—

Question *re* text books written by members of the — .. 592

## SCHOOL FEE—

Resolution *re* — concessions .. 95-101, 135-40

## SCIENCE—

Question *re* provision of — classes in the Intermediate College, Shahpur .. 642

## SCIENTIFIC AND MISCELLANEOUS DEPARTMENTS—

Demand for grant *re* — (transferred) .. 828

## SCOUTS RALLY—

Question *re* — in Lahore .. 183

## SECONDARY EDUCATION—

*See* Education.

## SECONDARY SCHOOLS—

Question *re* half tuition fees in Government — for agriculturists and *Kamins* .. 277

## SERVICES—

Question *re* list showing communal representation in — .. 115

*See* Forest Service.

*See* Imperial Service.

*See* Provincial Educational Service.

*See* Provincial Service.

## SESSIONS CASES—

Question *re* number of — in certain Sessions Courts .. 257

## SEWAK RAM, RAI BAHADUR, LALA—

Budget. General Discussion of — .. 826-28

Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. 532-33

Discussion *re* convention of President addressing the House in vernacular .. 811

Resolution *re* committee to enquire into grievances of low paid Government servants .. 151-58

Standing Committees, discussion *re* postponement of elections to .. 499

## SHAH, MR. S. I. A.—

Question *re* qualifications of — of the Punjab Civil Veterinary Department .. 778

## SHAH, MR. S. M. A.—

Question *re* qualifications of — of Punjab Civil Veterinary Department .. 778

## SHAMILAT FORESTS—

Question *re* distribution to zamindars of income from the produce of —, Kangra District .. 710

Resolution *re* income from resin in — .. 165-75

## SHAMILAT LANDS—

Question *re* realisation of the cost of Chaukidars' uniforms from the income of — .. 978

## SHANAN GENERATING STATION—

Question *re* capacity of — .. 383

**SHIKAR LICENCES—**

Question re — and restrictions on the purchase of bullets  
and groves cartridges .. .. .

377

**SHRINE—**

Question re road to — Dint Siddha in Hamirpur ..

607

**SIKANDAR HYAT KHAN, KHAN BAHADUR, CAPTAIN  
SARDAR—**

Demand for supplementary grant, Police .. .. .

409-12

**SIKHS—**

Question re percentage of — admitted to the Agricultural  
College .. .. .

104

Question re percentage of — recruited for the clerical staff  
of the Public Works Department (Buildings and Roads  
Branch) .. .. .

118

Question re representation of — among candidates for posts  
of Extra Assistant Commissioners .. .. .

117

Question re representation of — in the clerical staff of the  
office of Director of Industries .. .. .

120

Question re representation of — in the staff of offices of  
Registrar, Deputy Registrar and circle Registrars of  
Co-operative Credit Societies .. .. .

604

**SIRHIND CANAL—**

Question re date of construction and cost of — ..

608

Question re distribution of water of — between Native  
States and British territory .. .. .

608

**SPECIAL MAGISTRATES—**

Question re conduct of — in the Lahore conspiracy case  
towards Lala Duni Chand .. .. .

180

**SRI RAM SHARMA, PANDIT—**

Question re entry of the name of — in police Register No. 10

776

**STADIUM—**

Resolution re — at Lahore .. .. .

89-95

**STAFF—**

Question re communal representation among clerical —,  
recruited for the Public Works Department (Buildings  
and Roads Branch) .. .. .

118

Question re gazetted— employed in the Mandi Hydro-  
Electric Scheme .. .. .

3

Question re Muhammadans in the teaching — of the Mac-  
lagan Engineering College .. .. .

723

Question re number, pay, qualifications etc., of —, of Mac-  
lagan Engineering College .. .. .

723

Question re retrenchment of — by Municipal Committee,  
Ferozepore .. .. .

647

Question re — for the Girls' High School, Amritsar ..

390

**STAMPS—**

Demand for grant re — .. .. .

496

Question re inconvenience in the purchase of — in Amrit-  
sar City .. .. .

36

## STANDING COMMITTEE—

Elections to — .. .. .	539
Elections to —, postponement of .. .. .	499

## STATIONERY AND PRINTING (RESERVED)—

Demand for grant <i>re</i> — .. .. .	325
--------------------------------------	-----

## STATIONERY AND PRINTING (TRANSFERRED)—

Demand for grant <i>re</i> — .. .. .	325
--------------------------------------	-----

## STATUTORY AGRICULTURIST(S)—

Question <i>re</i> employment of—in the Education Department	241
Question <i>re</i> Hindu — among Naib-tahsildars .. .. .	242
Question <i>re</i> Hindu — among zilladars .. .. .	115, 278
Question <i>re</i> Hindu — in the Police service .. .. .	198
Question <i>re</i> Hindu — in the recruitment of zilladars .. .. .	198
Question <i>re</i> number of Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police recruited from among — of Jhang District .. .. .	596
Question <i>re</i> number of Hindu — nominated for the post of zilladars of the Western Jumna Canal Circle .. .. .	199
Question <i>re</i> number of Muslim — among Inspectors of Co-operative Societies .. .. .	711
Question <i>re</i> number of — among Assistant and Sub-Assistant Surgeons .. .. .	710
Question <i>re</i> number of — among Civil Surgeons and Medical officers .. .. .	710
Question <i>re</i> number of — among Sub-Judges .. .. .	197
Question <i>re</i> selection of Hindu — for posts of Sub-Judges .. .. .	114
Question <i>re</i> — among Inspectors of Co-operative Societies .. .. .	278
Question <i>re</i> — candidates for Sub-Judge's examination .. .. .	114, 196
Question <i>re</i> — in the clerical branch of the Judicial Department .. .. .	197

## STENOGRAPHERS—

Question <i>re</i> communal representation among — in the Financial Commissioner's office .. .. .	103
---	-----

## STORM WATER DRAIN—

Question <i>re</i> — in Ferozepore tahsil .. .. .	716
---	-----

## STOW, THE HONOURABLE SIR ALEXANDER—

Budget. General discussion of — .. .. .	371-75
Budget (for 1930-31). Presentation of — .. .. .	281-90
Budget Motion. Exemption of swords from Arms Act .. .. .	622-23
Budget Motion. Public Prosecutors, Muhammadan representation among— .. .. .	769-70
Demand for grant, Administration of Justice .. .. .	761
Demand for grant, Debt Services .. .. .	525
Demands for grant, General Administration (Reserved) .. .. .	525
Demand for grant, Jails and Convict Settlements .. .. .	770
Demand for grant, Police .. .. .	771
Demand for grant, Stamps .. .. .	496
Demands for supplementary and additional grants .. .. .	400, 401, 423

	PAGES.
STOW, THE HONOURABLE SIR ALEXANDER—	
CONCLUDED—	
Demand for supplementary grant, administration of Justice ..	401
Fazl-i-Husain, The Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of services of ..	798
STRIKE—	
Question re students' — in the Engineering College, Mughalpura ..	259
STUDENT(S)—	
Question re death of a — of the Agricultural College, Lyallpur ..	377, 597
Question re expulsion of —, of Agricultural College, Lyallpur ..	392
Question re Government High Schools and depressed class — ..	48
Question re strike of — in the Engineering College, Mughalpura ..	259
SUB-ASSISTANT SURGEONS—	
Question re number of — communitywise ..	710
Question re — in Simla ..	126
SUB-INSPECTORS—	
Budget motion re Hindu agriculturist representation among — of Police ..	771-74 800-21
Question re — serving in the same thanas for more than five years and their transfer ..	129
SUB-JUDGE CANDIDATES—	
Question re names requisitioned for being included among —	12
SUB-JUDGES—	
Question re communal representation among — ..	197
Question re establishment of — Court at Hamirpur ..	383
Question re nature of examination for —, and selection of statutory Hindu agriculturists for posts of ..	114
Question re second division L.L.B.s., for competitive examination ..	12
Question re selection for appointment as — ..	195
Question re statutory agriculturists candidates for — examinations ..	114, 196
SUB-REGISTRARS—	
Question re commission to — ..	395
Question re curtailment of holidays of — ..	385
Question re posting of clerks in the offices of — ..	396
SUFEDPOSHES—	
Question re appointment of — by election ..	381
Question re declaration of — as Government servants ..	381
Question re dismissal of Gajjan Singh, —, Hissar District ..	791
SULEIMANKE CANAL—	
Question re compensation for damages due to breaches in —	705

## SUPERANNUATION ALLOWANCES—

Demand for grant <i>re</i> — and pensions .. ..	824
Demand for supplementary grant <i>re</i> — and pensions ..	423

## SUPERINTENDENT(S)—

Question <i>re</i> filling up of the vacancy of —, in the Deputy Commissioner's office, Amritsar .. ..	119, 124
Question <i>re</i> qualifications of — of certain Deputy Commissioner's office .. ..	105
Question <i>re</i> — of Deputy Commissioner's office, Gurdaspur ..	203, 724
Question <i>re</i> — of Deputy Commissioner's office, Mianwali ..	259
Supplementary grants, demands for — .. ..	400-23

## SURGEONS—

Question <i>re</i> — communitywise in the province ..	710
<i>See</i> Civil Surgeons.	

## SURVEYS—

Question <i>re</i> arial — of Bhakra Dam Project ..	242
---	-----

## SUTLEJ VALLEY COLONY—

Question <i>re</i> area reserved for afforestation in — ..	179
--	-----

## SWORDS—

Exemption of — from Arms, Act, Budget motion <i>re</i> ..	618-23
Question <i>re</i> exemption of — from the operation of the Arms Act .. ..	116, 202, 245
Question <i>re</i> exemption of — from the Arms Act in Rawalpindi .. ..	110

## T.

## TAHSILDARS—

Question <i>re</i> appointment of a Muslim —, at Muktsar ..	200
Question <i>re</i> number of — directly recruited and communal representation among them .. ..	392

## TAX(ES)—

Question <i>re</i> <i>haisiyat</i> — in Hissar District .. ..	186
Question <i>re</i> levy of <i>haisiyat</i> — on miners of Khewra Salt mines .. ..	787
Question <i>re</i> levy of — on matured crop on the Upper Chenab Canal .. ..	250
Question <i>re</i> Municipal Committees and District Boards levying <i>haisiyat</i> — .. ..	790
Question <i>re</i> non-payment of house and water — in Multan City .. ..	253
Question <i>re</i> <i>pachotra</i> to lambardars for collections of cattle and <i>haisiyat</i> — .. ..	587
Question <i>re</i> water and house — in Multan .. ..	703, 704, 705
Question <i>re</i> water — in <i>ilaga</i> Beit, tahsils Una and Garhshankar for supply of drinking water .. ..	275

## TEACHERS—

Question <i>re</i> — employed in high schools maintained by Government and local bodies in Rohtak District ..	11
---	----

	PAGES.
<b>TELEGRAPH OFFICES—</b>	
Budget motion <i>re</i> throwing open to public of canal —	502-06
Question <i>re</i> provision of a — in Indaura, Kangra District	605
<b>TEMPERANCE—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> municipalities spending money on — pro- paganda .. .. .	722
<b>TENANTS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> compromise between — and landlords of Chhuchakwas, Rohtak District .. .. .	605
Question <i>re</i> struggle between — and landlords of village Chhuchakwas, Rohtak District .. .. .	601
<b>TEST WORKS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> famine relief — in Hissar District ..	276
<b>TEXT BOOKS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> — written by members of School Board of Studies of Punjab University .. .. .	592
Question <i>re</i> — written by officers of the Education De- partment .. .. .	589, 591
<b>THEFT(S)—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> — in Karnal District .. .. .	585
<b>TIKKA TILLOO FORESTS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> reservation of — for grazing purposes ..	709
<b>TIME-LIMIT—</b>	
— to speeches at general discussion of Budget ..	298
<b>TOLLS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> ferry — on motor vehicles at the bridges over the Jhelum and Chenab .. .. .	258
<b>TOWN HALL—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> use of Jagadhari — for Independence Day meeting .. .. .	179
<b>TOWNSEND, MR. C. A. H.—</b>	
Budget motion. Excise Sub-Inspectors and illicit distil- lation .. .. .	494-95
Budget motion. Land revenue assessment on income-tax principles .. .. .	477-80
Budget motion. Re-afforestation including <i>chos</i> areas	431-32
Resolution <i>re</i> committee to enquire into grievances of low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants	145-46
Resolution <i>re</i> total prohibition .. .. .	232-34
<b>TRAFFIC—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> cart — on the Kalka-Simla Road ..	25
Question <i>re</i> — during repairs to Grand Trunk Road ..	722
<b>TRAINS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> safety of ladies travelling alone in — ..	128
<b>TREASURERS—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> increase of pay and staff of district — ..	185
<b>TRIAL—</b>	
Question <i>re</i> number of prisoners in Jullundur Jail await- ing — .. .. .	181

## TRIBES—

See Criminal Tribes.

See Agricultural Tribes.

## TUBE-WELL—

Question re diminution of water supply for irrigation in certain villages caused by a — at Ludhiana .. 655

## TUITION FEE(S)—

Question re exemption of agriculturists of Shahpur District from — .. 641

Question re half — in Government Secondary Schools to agriculturists and Kamins .. 277

## U.

## UHL RIVER—

Question re discharges in the — .. 394

## UJJAL SINGH, SARDAR, SAHIB, SARDAR—

Budget. General discussion on — .. 295-97

Budget motion. Revenue patwaris, pay and prospects of .. 449

Fazl-i-Husain, The Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of services of .. 796

## UMAR BAKSH, MISS—

Question re appointment of — as District Inspectress of Schools, Sialkot District .. 789

## UNIFORMS—

Question re sources from which the cost of chaukidars' — is met .. 878

## UNION JACK—

Question re Anglo-Indian Students of Engineering College, Mughalpura, putting on — on their coats on Independence Day .. 253

## UNIVERSITY—

Question re rural representation in the governing bodies of the Punjab — .. 241

## UNPARLIAMENTARY EXPRESSION(S)—

"Boss" — withdrawn; .. 352

"Filthy language" — withdrawn .. 314

Statement that an honourable member "poses" as a nationalist — withdrawn .. 356

Proceedings re — used in debate, expunging of from official reports .. 818

## UPPER BARI DOAB CANAL—

Budget motion re re-modelling of rajbahas Kohali and Jama Rai .. 499-502

Question re discharge of water from and area irrigated by — .. 387

## UPPER CHENAB CANAL—

Question re levy of tax on matured crops on the — .. 250



## UPPER INDIA GLASS WORKS—

Question re help to — Ambala .. 177

## V.

## VACANCIES—

Question re filling up of — in the clerical staff of the office  
of Director of Industries .. 120

## VATSYAYANA —

Question re Sanskrit text of Kama Sutras of — .. 538

## VERNACULAR—

Discussion re convention of President addressing the House  
in — .. 310-11

## VERNACULAR MIDDLE SCHOOLS—

Question re visit of — at Kanhan by the District Inspector  
of Schools, Rohtak .. 18

## VETERINARY COLLEGE—

Question re Professors of Punjab — .. 778

Question re Professors of the Punjab — and delivery of  
lectures .. 725

Question re qualifications of external examiners of  
Punjab — .. 725

## VICE-PRESIDENT(S)—

Question re election of — of Ludhiana District Board .. 598

## VILLAGE PATROL ACT—

Question re exemption of Lahore District from — .. 644

## VILLAGES—

Question re — in which Muslims do not enjoy freedom of  
Azan .. 248

Question re — where punitive police posts have been sanc-  
tioned .. 192

## VOTERS—

Question re lists of — for Punjab Legislative Council  
and District Boards .. 27

## W.

## WAGES—

Question re — under the Punjab Famine Code .. 277

## WAFQ ACT—

Question re prosecutions, convictions and acquittals under  
Mussalman — .. 2

Question re submission of accounts under the Mussal-  
man — .. 2

## WAR SCHOLARSHIP—

Question re award of — .. 240

## WARABANDI —

Question re — for Chak No. 638, Upper Gugera Branch .. 192

## WARDS—

- Question re revision of electoral — of Narowal Municipal Committee and elections thereto .. .. 125

## WASTE LANDS—

- Question re irrigation by wells and distribution of Crown — 381  
 Question re total area of Government — in Jhang District 710  
 Question re — in Jhang District .. .. 260  
 Question re — in Shahpur Colony area .. .. 609

## WATER—

- Question re distribution of — to land commanded by Mongi Minor and Mongi Rajbaha .. .. 107  
 Question re failure of — on the Mailsi canals .. .. 18

## WATER LIFTING BRANCH—

- Question re Engineers of the — of the Agricultural Department .. .. 392

## WATER RATES—

- Question re non-payment of — in Multan City .. .. 253

## WATER SCARCITY—

- Question re — in Hoshiarpur and Jullundur Districts .. 195

## WATER STAND POST—

- Question re — at Pathankot in the Kangra Valley Railway platform .. .. 43

## WATER SUPPLY—

- Question re drinking — in ilaqa Beit, Tahsils Una and Garhshankar .. .. 275  
 Question re — to boarding houses attached to the Agricultural College, Lyallpur .. .. 646

## WATER TABLES—

- Question re soundings of — near Bikaner Canal .. .. 717

## WATER-TAX—

- Question re imposition of — by Municipal Committee, Multan .. .. 385  
 Question re levy of — in ilaqa Beit, Tahsils Una and Garhshankar, for supply of drinking water .. .. 275  
 Question re — in Multan .. .. 703, 704, 705

## WELLS—

- Question re Government High Schools in which — are open to students of depressed classes .. .. 43  
 Question re local rates charged on — in Multan District .. 18  
 Question re opening of — in Government buildings for use of depressed classes .. .. 15  
 Question re water scarcity in — in Hoshiarpur and Jullundur Districts .. .. 195

## WHEAT—

- Question re average price of — .. .. 26

## WILSON, MR. W. R.—

- Budget motion. Re-afforestation (including chos areas) .. 427-29, 433  
 Oath of office .. .. 425

## WOOD—

Question *re* rates charged for jungle — on the Sutlej Valley Project from temporary lease holders .. .. 776

Question *re* value of — on the Sutlej Valley Project charged to temporary lease holders .. .. 776

## WORKING PLAN CIRCLES—

Question *re* — in the Forest Department .. .. 249

## WRITING MATERIALS—

Question *re* supply of — to Gazi Abdur Rahman, Khwaja .. .. 202

## Y.

## YUSAF ALI, AGHA—

Question *re* — of the Punjab Agricultural service .. .. 121

## Z.

## ZAFRULLA KHAN, CHAUDHRI—

Budget. General discussion of .. .. 555-58

Budget motion. Hindu agriculturist representation among Sub-Inspectors of Police .. .. 812-18

Budget motion. Legislative Council establishment .. .. 525-26, 527

Budget motion. Polling arrangements in rural areas .. .. 527-28

542, 545, 546

Discussion *re* convention of President addressing the House in vernacular .. .. 811

Discussion *re* inaccuracies in press reports .. .. 291

Fazl-i-Husain, the Honourable Mian Sir, appreciation of services of— .. .. 797

Ministerial responsibility, discussion *re* — .. .. 684-85, 686

—nominated to Railway Advisory Committee .. .. 826

Notice *re* amendment, whether matter being raised in a question in Council should be taken as notice thereof .. .. 189

Resolution *re* committee to enquire into grievances of low-paid Government and quasi-Government servants .. .. 153-55

157-59

Resolution *re* committee to enquire into grievances of Nili Bar Colonists .. .. 82-85

Resolution *re* total prohibition .. .. 210, 211,

216-23.

## ZAILDARS—

Question *re* appointment of — by election .. .. 381

Question *re* declaration of — as Government servants .. .. 381

Question *re* increase in remuneration of — of Saraj .. .. 106

## ZAMINDARS—

Budget motion *re* declaration of — as criminal tribes .. .. 546-54

Question *re* extension of period and numbers of instalments due on Government lands purchased by — of Jhang District .. .. 594

## PAGE.

## ZAMINDARS—CONCLUDED.

Question <i>re</i> financial condition of — of Jhang District ..	594
Question <i>re</i> financial condition of — owing to failure of crops and fall in prices of agricultural produce ..	599
Question <i>re</i> grievances of Ghoripal — ..	879
Question <i>re</i> relief to — affected by hail storms ..	883
Resolution <i>re</i> — of Kangra to be given a share of income from resin in <i>Shamilat</i> forests ..	165—75

## ZILLADARS—

Question <i>re</i> Christians among canal — ..	718
Question <i>re</i> communal representation among — of Western Jumna Canal Circle ..	199
Question <i>re</i> communal representation in the recruitment of — ..	198
Question <i>re</i> statutory Hindu agriculturists among — ..	115, 278

## ZULKERNAIN—

Question <i>re</i> approval of the Deputy Inspector-General of Police for extension of stay of — Sub-Inspector of Police at Narowal ..	125
--	-----

PRINTED BY  
THE SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, PUNJAB.  
16 PLC-600-14-7-30-SGPP Lahore.